



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mercher 2 Gorffennaf 2003**

**Wednesday 2 July 2003**

**Cynnwys  
Contents**

- 3 Ethol i'r Pwyllgorau Rhanbarth  
Elections to the Regional Committees
- 5 Cynnig Trefniadol  
Procedural Motion
- 6 Ethol i Bwyllgor y Mesur Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru)  
Elections to the Public Audit (Wales) Bill Committee
- 7 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth  
Questions to the Minister for Economic Development and Transport
- 19 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio  
Questions to the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration
- 29 Datganiad ar Negodiadau ar Ddiwygio'r Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin  
Statement on the Common Agricultural Policy Reform Negotiations
- 42 Pwynt o Drefn  
Point of Order
- 47 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Porthiant (Samplu a Dadansoddi), Porthiant (Gorfodi) a  
Phorthiant (Sefydliadau a Chyfryngwyr) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003  
Approval of the Feeding Stuffs (Sampling and Analysis), the Feeding Stuffs  
(Enforcement) and the Feeding Stuffs (Establishments and Intermediaries)  
(Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003
- 56 Caffael Cynnyrch o Gymru yn y Sector Cyhoeddus  
The Procurement of Welsh Produce in the Public Sector
- 80 Cynigion i Wella Diogelwch ar y Ffyrdd ger Ysgolion  
Proposals to Improve Road Safety around Schools
- 97 Dadl Fer: Cynllun Trafnidiaeth Caerdydd  
Short Debate: Cardiff's Transport Plan

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

### **Ethol i'r Pwyllgorau Rhanbarth Elections to the Regional Committees**

**Y Llywydd:** Os yw Aelodau yn gytûn, byddwn yn delio â'r mater hwn yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.4A, sy'n caniatáu i'r Cynulliad bleidleisio ar y cynigion gyda'i gilydd heb ddadl. Gan nad oes gwrthwynebiad, gweithredwn felly.

**The Presiding Officer:** If Members agree, we will deal with this matter in accordance with Standing Order No. 8.4A, which allows the Assembly to vote on the motions together without debate. Given that there are no objections, we will proceed in that manner.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under section 61(5)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 10.3, elects the following Assembly electoral region Members, Eleanor Burnham, Mark Isherwood, Janet Ryder and Brynle Williams, to its North Wales Regional Committee. (NDM1521)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under section 61(5)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 10.3, elects the following Assembly electoral region Members, Nicholas Bourne, Glyn Davies, Lisa Francis, and Helen Mary Jones, to its Mid Wales Regional Committee. (NDM1522)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under section 61(5)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 10.3, elects the following Assembly electoral region Members, Nicholas Bourne, Peter Black, Alun Cairns, Glyn Davies, Janet Davies, Lisa Francis, Helen Mary Jones and David Lloyd, to its South West Wales Regional Committee. (NDM1523)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under section 61(5)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 10.3, elects the following Assembly electoral region*

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol ag adran 61(5)(b) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 10.3, yn ethol aelodau rhanbarthol a ganlyn y Cynulliad, Eleanor Burnham, Mark Isherwood, Janet Ryder, Brynle Williams, ar Bwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd. (NDM1521)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol ag adran 61(5)(b) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 10.3, yn ethol aelodau rhanbarthol a ganlyn y Cynulliad, Nicholas Bourne, Glyn Davies, Lisa Francis, Helen Mary Jones, ar Bwyllgor Rhanbarth y Canolbarth. (NDM1522)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol ag adran 61(5)(b) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 10.3, yn ethol aelodau rhanbarthol a ganlyn y Cynulliad, Nicholas Bourne, Peter Black, Alun Cairns, Glyn Davies, Janet Davies, Lisa Francis, Helen Mary Jones a Dai Lloyd, ar Bwyllgor Rhanbarth y De-orllewin. (NDM1523)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol ag adran 61(5)(b) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 10.3, yn ethol aelodau rhanbarthol a ganlyn y Cynulliad,*

*Members, Peter Black, Alun Cairns, Janet Davies, Jocelyn Davies, William Graham, Michael German, Laura Anne Jones, David Lloyd, David Melding, Jonathan Morgan, Owen John Thomas and Leanne Wood, to its South East Wales Regional Committee. (NDM1524)*

*Peter Black, Alun Cairns, Janet Davies, Jocelyn Davies, William Graham, Michael German, Laura Anne Jones, Dai Lloyd, David Melding, Jonathan Morgan, Owen John Thomas, Leanne Wood, ar Bwyllgor Rhanbarth y De-Ddwyrain. (NDM1524)*

*Cynnig (NDM1521): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1521): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

## Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 34.4, agrees to suspend Standing Order No. 6.12 to enable no named day motion NNDM1535, tabled on 1 July 2003, to be debated in Plenary today. (NDM1545)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 34.4, yn cytuno i ohirio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.12 er mwyn caniatáu i gynnig heb ddyddiad trafod NNDM1535, a gyflwynwyd ar 1 Gorffennaf 2003, gael ei drafod yn y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw. (NDM1545)*

**Y Llywydd:** Atgoffaf y Cynulliad fod angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair i basio'r cynnig hwn.

**The Presiding Officer:** I remind the Assembly that a two-thirds majority is required to carry this motion.

*Cynnig (NDM1545): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM1545): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri

Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Ethol i Bwyllgor y Mesur Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru)  
Elections to the Public Audit (Wales) Bill Committee**

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I **Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cyngiaf fod propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 8.1, elects the following Members to the Public Audit (Wales) Committee: Leighton Andrews (Labour), Ann Jones (Labour), Janet Davies (Plaid Cymru), Alun Cairns (Conservative), Mick Bates (Liberal Democrat), and elects Janet Davies (Plaid Cymru) to be the Chair of the Committee. (NNDM1535)*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 8.1, yn ethol yr Aelodau a ganlyn i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru): Leighton Andrews (Llafur), Ann Jones (Llafur), Janet Davies (Plaid Cymru), Alun Cairns (Ceidwadwyr), Mick Bates (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol), ac yn ethol Janet Davies (Plaid Cymru) yn Gadeirydd ar y Pwyllgor. (NNDM1535)*

*Cynnig (NNDM1535): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NNDM1535): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise

James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth Questions to the Minister for Economic Development and Transport**

### **Mentrau Marchnata Twristiaeth Tourism Marketing Initiatives**

**Q1 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on tourism marketing initiatives introduced by the Wales Tourist Board? (OAQ26432) [R]

**C1 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y mentrau marchnata twristiaeth a gyflwynwyd gan Fwrdd Croeso Cymru? (OAQ26432) [R]

**The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies):** The Wales Tourist Board delivers a number of marketing campaigns, in the UK and overseas, aimed at increasing the awareness of Wales as a tourism destination and increasing tourism growth in Wales. Most of the board's marketing activity is aimed at the vital UK market, from where over 90 per cent of visitors to Wales come.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies):** Mae Bwrdd Croeso Cymru yn cyflwyno nifer o ymgyrchoedd marchnata, yn y DU a thramor, sydd â'r nod o gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth o Gymru fel cyrchfan twristiaeth a chynyddu twf twristiaeth yng Nghymru. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o weithgaredd marchnata'r bwrdd wedi'i anelu at farchnad hollbwysig y DU, sy'n cyfrif am fwy na 90 y cant o'r bobl sy'n ymweld â Chymru.

**Lisa Francis:** You will be aware of the destination management system, or DMS, which was set up last year by the Wales Tourist Board as an online booking service for accommodation providers in Wales. Information from last February reveals that £2 million was spent on the system; an uptake of only 200 or so participants meant

**Lisa Francis:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r system rheoli cyrchfannau, neu'r DMS, a sefydlwyd y llynedd gan Fwrdd Croeso Cymru fel gwasanaeth archebu ar-lein ar gyfer darparwyr llety yng Nghymru. Mae gwybodaeth o fis Chwefror diwethaf yn datgelu bod £2 miliwn wedi'i wario ar y system; yr oedd y ffaith mai dim ond tua 200

that the initiative was an expensive failure—it cost around £10,000 per business. In addition, the system was not up and running until 17 June 2002, which was well after the start of the tourism season. That is scandalous in the year following the foot and mouth disease outbreak and 11 September. What steps will the Government take to ensure that these money-wasting failures are not repeated?

**Andrew Davies:** The destination management system was, as you rightly said, a huge and complex project, which involved a great deal of investment. Clearly, concerns have been raised with me, by the industry, the British Hospitality Association and others. I raised those issues with the Wales Tourist Board at one of our regular meetings, and I will continue to do so.

**Christine Chapman:** Would you join me in congratulating the community of Cefn Pennar which, in conjunction with Groundwork, is regenerating its environment—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Welsh Conservative group appears to be causing consternation on the Minister's left wing.

**Christine Chapman:** The community is regenerating its environment, developing activity tourism and promoting itself as a gateway to mountain-based leisure activities. Do you also agree that there is huge potential and an economic opportunity to develop tourism in the Valleys, as the recent Bevan Foundation report concluded? Will you press the Wales Tourist Board to strengthen its development plan for the area, which is unique?

**Andrew Davies:** I give that commitment. There is a huge opportunity to develop tourism in the Valleys. As you know, the Wales Tourist Board has launched a new initiative—the First Minister, in fact, launched it some months ago—and we will seek to maximise the opportunities tourism offers in the Valleys.

**Elin Jones:** Gan fod Awdurdod Twristiaeth Prydain a Bwrdd Twristiaeth Lloegr wedi'u

o ddarparwyr a ddefnyddiodd y system yn golygu bod y fenter yn fethiant costus—costiodd tua £10,000 fesul busnes. Yn ogystal, nid oedd y system ar waith tan 17 Mehefin 2002, a oedd ymhell ar ôl dechrau'r tymor twristiaeth. Mae hynny'n warthus yn y flwyddyn yn dilyn argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau a 11 Medi. Pa gamau y bydd y Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i sicrhau nad yw'r methiannau hyn, sy'n wastraff arian, yn digwydd eto?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr oedd y system rheoli cyrchfannau, fel y dywedaso, yn brosiect enfawr a chymhleth, a oedd yn golygu llawer iawn o fuddsoddiad. Yn amlwg, codwyd pryderon gyda mi, gan y diwydiant, Cymdeithas Lletygarwch Prydain ac eraill. Codais y materion hynny gyda Bwrdd Croeso Cymru yn un o'n cyfarfodydd rheolaidd, a byddaf yn parhau i wneud hynny.

**Christine Chapman:** A wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch cymuned Cefn Pennar sy'n adfywio ei hamgylchedd mewn cydweithrediad â Groundwork—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ymddengys bod grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn peri dryswch ar adain chwith y Gweinidog.

**Christine Chapman:** Mae'r gymuned yn adfywio ei hamgylchedd, yn datblygu twristiaeth gweithgareddau ac yn hyrwyddo ei hun fel porth i weithgareddau hamdden yn y mynyddoedd. A gytunwch hefyd fod potensial enfawr a chyfle economaidd i ddatblygu twristiaeth yn y Cymoedd, fel y nododd casgliadau adroddiad diweddar Sefydliad Bevan? A wnewch bwysu ar Fwrdd Croeso Cymru i gryfhau ei gynllun datblygu ar gyfer yr ardal, sy'n unigryw?

**Andrew Davies:** Ymrwymaf i hynny. Mae cyfle enfawr i ddatblygu twristiaeth yn y Cymoedd. Fel y gwyddoch, mae Bwrdd Croeso Cymru wedi lansio menter newydd—yn wir, fe'i lanswyd gan y Prif Weinidog rai misoedd yn ôl—a byddwn yn ceisio manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd a gynigir gan dwristiaeth yn y Cymoedd.

**Elin Jones:** With the merging of the British Tourist Authority and the England Tourist



cyfuno, pa drefniadau sydd wedi'u gwneud i sicrhau bod Cymru'n cael ei marchnata'n effeithiol dramor gan y corff newydd?

**Andrew Davies:** When the new Visit Britain arrangements were made we had concerns, as did the Scottish Executive, and our concerns were accepted. I will meet with the senior manager of Visit Britain, as well as with the Department for Culture, Media and Sport, to see how arrangements are progressing. The work of Visit Britain is vital. When I visited America and Dublin last year I saw at first hand what the then British Tourist Authority was doing to market Wales. Its commitment was exemplary and we want to ensure that that activity is, if anything, stepped up.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Despite the fact that we have been lagging behind for years, I understand that our marketing budget is now the same as Scotland's. Should we not be doing more to market cultural tourism and should we not look to market to high-spending tourists, such as Americans and Japanese, who have a great deal of money? We should attract those kind of tourists to Wales rather than those who do not have much to spend.

**Andrew Davies:** Cultural tourism is vital and that is why we have developed a cultural tourism strategy. In conjunction with my colleague Alun Pugh, the Minister for Culture, the Welsh Language and Sport, I am considering developing a national events strategy, in which cultural events will clearly play a leading role.

Board, what arrangements have been made to ensure that Wales is marketed abroad effectively by the new body?

**Andrew Davies:** Pan wnaethpwyd y trefniadau Visit Britain newydd yr oedd gennym bryderon, ac felly hefyd Weithrediaeth yr Alban, a derbyniwyd ein pryderon. Byddaf yn cwrdd ag uwch reolwr Visit Britain, yn ogystal â chyda'r Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon, er mwyn gweld sut y mae'r trefniadau yn mynd rhagddynt. Mae gwaith Visit Britain yn hollbwysig. Pan ymwelais ag America a Dulyn y llynedd cefais weld yr hyn yr oedd Awdurdod Twristiaeth Prydain bryd hynny yn ei wneud i farchnata Cymru. Yr oedd ei ymrwymiad yn rhagorol ac yr ydym am sicrhau bod y gweithgaredd hwnnw, os rhywbeth, yn cynyddu.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Er gwaethaf y ffaith inni fod ar ei hôl hi ers blynyddoedd, deallaf fod ein cyllideb marchnata bellach yr un faint â chyllideb yr Alban. Oni ddylem wneud mwy i farchnata twristiaeth ddiwylliannol ac oni ddylem ystyried marchnata ar gyfer twristiaid sy'n gwario llawer, fel Americanwyr a phobl o Siapan, sydd â llawer iawn o arian? Dylem ddenu'r math hwnnw o dwristiaid i Gymru yn hytrach na'r rhai nad oes ganddynt lawer i'w wario.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae twristiaeth ddiwylliannol yn hollbwysig a dyna pam yr ydym wedi datblygu strategaeth twristiaeth ddiwylliannol. Mewn cydweithrediad â'm cyd-Weinidog Alun Pugh, y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon, yr wyf yn ystyried datblygu strategaeth ddigwyddiadau genedlaethol, y bydd digwyddiadau diwylliannol yn amlwg yn chwarae rhan flaenllaw ynddi.

### Gwasanaethau Rheilffyrdd Rail Services

**Q2 Laura Anne Jones:** Could the Minister explain why rail services in Wales are getting worse? (OAQ26492)

**Andrew Davies:** I do not accept that they are. The Strategic Rail Authority publishes performance figures every six months. The

**C2 Laura Anne Jones:** A all y Gweinidog egluro pam mae gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd Cymru'n gwaethygu? (OAQ26492)

**Andrew Davies:** Ni dderbyniaf eu bod yn gwaethygu. Mae'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol yn cyhoeddi ffigurau perfformiad

latest data show that, although the performance of First Great Western is poorer, the regional operators First North Western and Wales and Borders, which operate the majority of the services in Wales, now have more trains arriving on time than they did a year ago. Customer satisfaction with punctuality, reliability and the quality of the journey on each of these operators' services has also improved over the past year. In addition, we have succeeded in securing five Virgin Trains a day in each direction between Holyhead and London, and are pressing for delivery of the original promise of seven trains each way.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Last week, Network Rail announced enormous pay-outs for its directors, yet, this week said that train punctuality could not reach 90 per cent until 2010. Rail services have been worsening under Labour. Taxpayers and passengers have to pay more for a lower standard of service. [*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Members should not seek to intervene when a Member is about to ask a question.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Customer complaints are soaring, as are service cuts. What is the Minister doing to reverse the current trend of worsening rail services in Wales?

**Andrew Davies:** Massive investment is being made in the railways in the UK, after decades of under-investment under the previous Conservative administration. We also have to deal with the system resulting from the privatisation of British Rail.

2.10 p.m.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** It is unclear whether Laura's question was motivated by complaints about the train operating companies or about the infrastructure maintenance companies, or both. Does the Minister agree that one of the principal reasons for public concern about the

bob chwe mis. Dengys y data diweddaraf, er bod perfformiad First Great Western yn waeth, fod mwy o drenau y gweithredwyr rhanbarthol First North Western a Wales and Borders, sy'n gweithredu mwyafrif y gwasanaethau yng Nghymru, yn cyrraedd yn brydlon nag a wnâi flwyddyn yn ôl. Mae boddhad cwsmeriaid mewn perthynas â phrydlondeb, dibynadwyedd ac ansawdd y daith ar bob un o wasanaethau'r gweithredwyr hyn wedi gwella dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf hefyd. Yn ogystal, yr ydym wedi llwyddo i sicrhau bod pump o drenau Virgin Trains y dydd yn rhedeg i'r ddau gyfeiriad rhwng Caerdybi a Llundain, ac yr ydym yn pwysu arno i gadw'r addewid wreiddiol o redeg saith trên y dydd i'r ddau gyfeiriad.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Yr wythnos diwethaf, cyhoeddodd Network Rail daliadau enfawr i'w gyfarwyddwyr, ond yr wythnos hon, dywedodd na allai prydlondeb trenau gyrraedd 90 y cant tan 2010. Bu gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd yn gwaethgu o dan Lafur. Rhaid i drethdalwyr a theithwyr dalu mwy am wasanaeth o safon is. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni ddylai Aelodau geisio ymyrryd pan fydd Aelod ar fin gofyn cwestiwn.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Mae cwynion gan gwsmeriaid yn codi'n ddychrynlyd, fel y mae nifer y toriadau i wasanaethau. Beth mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i wyrdroi'r duedd bresennol o wasanaethau rheilffyrdd yn gwaethgu yng Nghymru?

**Andrew Davies:** Gwneir buddsoddiad enfawr yn rheilffyrdd y DU, ar ôl degawdau o danfuddsoddi o dan weinyddiaeth flaenorol y Ceidwadwyr. Rhaid inni ddelio hefyd â'r system sy'n deillio o breifateiddio British Rail.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae'n aneglur a ysgogwyd cwestiwn Laura gan gwynion am y cwmnïau gweithredu trenau neu am y cwmnïau cynnal a chadw seilwaith, neu'r ddau. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno mai un o'r prif resymau dros bryder y cyhoedd ynghylch y

services provided by the train network is the way in which the rail service was denationalised by the former Conservative Government? This led to confusion and conflict between train operating companies and the infrastructure maintenance companies about responsibility.

**Andrew Davies:** Members will not be surprised that I agree with the thrust of your question. Together with the UK Government, we must manage the system. The Assembly Government has shown its commitment to the development of rail services in Wales by substantially investing over and above the existing commitment, by investing in the Vale of Glamorgan line, the Valleys lines, and the Ebbw valley line.

**Janet Davies:** You have already mentioned the lack of investment over more than 30 years that led to the parlous state of these railways. The National Assembly can only tinker at the edges. When will you call for, and fight for this Assembly to have powers over the railways in Wales?

**Andrew Davies:** We are already doing a great deal within our existing powers. Shortly, the SRA will announce the winner of the new Wales and borders franchise. We are working closely with the SRA. One of my first meetings after the election was with the chair and chief executive of the SRA, Richard Bowker. We are doing a great deal to improve the rail infrastructure and rail services in Wales.

**Peter Law:** Minister, you know that I and the people of Blaenau Gwent greatly appreciated the work of your predecessor, Sue Essex, and that we appreciate the work that you are doing to reopen the Ebbw Vale to Cardiff passenger rail service. I am concerned that the opening date of late 2005 is slipping. Have you had, or will you have, discussions with Network Rail and with the SRA to ensure that this line opens on time as promised by the Assembly Government?

gwasanaethau a ddarperir gan y rhwydwaith trenau yw'r modd y cafodd y gwasanaeth rheilffyrdd ei ddadwladoli gan y cyn Lywodraeth Geidwadol? Arweiniodd hyn at ddryswch a gwrthdaro rhwng cwmnïau gweithredu trenau a'r cwmnïau cynnal a chadw seilwaith mewn perthynas â chyfrifoldeb.

**Andrew Davies:** Ni fydd Aelodau yn synnu fy mod yn cytuno â byrdwn eich cwestiwn. Ynghyd â Llywodraeth y DU, rhaid inni reoli'r system. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi dangos ei hymrwymiad i ddatblygu gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru drwy fuddsoddi'n sylweddol uwch na'r ymrwymiad presennol, drwy fuddsoddi yn lein Bro Morgannwg, rheilffyrdd y Cymoedd, a lein glyn Ebwy.

**Janet Davies:** Yr ydych eisoes wedi crybwyll y diffyg buddsoddi dros fwy na 30 blynedd a arweiniodd at gyflwr enbyd y rheilffyrdd hyn. Dim ond mân welliannau y gall y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol eu gwneud. Pryd y byddwch yn galw am roi pwerau dros y rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru i'r Cynulliad hwn, ac yn brwydro dros hynny?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr ydym eisoes yn gwneud llawer iawn o fewn ein pwerau presennol. Yn fuan, bydd yr SRA yn cyhoeddi enillydd masnachfaint newydd Cymru a'r gororau. Yr ydym yn cydweithio'n agos â'r SRA. Un o'm cyfarfodydd cyntaf ar ôl yr etholiad oedd cyfarfod gyda chadeirydd a phrif weithredwr yr SRA, Richard Bowker. Yr ydym yn gwneud llawer iawn i wella'r seilwaith rheilffyrdd a gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru.

**Peter Law:** Weinidog, gwyddoch fy mod i a phobl Blaenau Gwent wedi gwerthfawrogi gwaith eich rhagflaenydd, Sue Essex, yn fawr a'n bod yn gwerthfawrogi'r gwaith a wneir gennych i ailagor y gwasanaeth rheilffordd i deithwyr o Lynebwy i Gaerdydd. Yr wyf yn pryderu na fydd yn barod erbyn y dyddiad agor a osodwyd, sef diwedd 2005. A ydych wedi cynnal, neu'n bwriadu cynnal, trafodaethau gyda Network Rail a chyda'r SRA er mwyn sicrhau bod y lein hon yn agor mewn pryd yn unol ag addewid Llywodraeth y Cynulliad?

**Andrew Davies:** You were the greatest champion of this project and I commend your commitment. We are committed to developing the line from Ebbw Vale to Cardiff. We have made a substantial investment and are working with all the partners to ensure delivery. I will be meeting Ian McAllister, the chair of Network Rail, in the near future, and this will be one of the major items that I will discuss with him.

**Jenny Randerson:** Minister, you will be aware of today's announcement that the National Union of Rail, Maritime and Transport Workers is switching its financial support to Plaid Cymru. Do you think that this will help to ensure that trains run on time?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. As far as I am aware the Minister for Economic Development and Transport has no responsibility for any other political group in the Chamber.

**Andrew Davies:** As a member of the Transport and General Workers Union, I would be loath to comment on the actions of another trade union.

**Andrew Davies:** Chi oedd yr eiriolwr mwyaf brwd dros y prosiect hwn a chymeradwyaf eich ymrwymiad. Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i ddatblygu'r lein o Lynebwy i Gaerdydd. Yr ydym wedi gwneud buddsoddiad sylweddol ac yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'r holl bartneriaid i sicrhau y caiff hyn ei gyflawni. Byddaf yn cwrdd ag Ian McAllister, cadeirydd Network Rail, yn y dyfodol agos, a dyma fydd un o'r prif bynciau a drafodaf gydag ef.

**Jenny Randerson:** Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r cyhoeddiad heddiw bod Undeb Cenedlaethol y Gweithwyr Rheilffyrdd, y Gweithwyr Morwrol a'r Gweithwyr Cludiant yn trosglwyddo ei gymorth ariannol i Blaid Cymru. A gredwch y bydd hyn yn helpu i sicrhau bod trenau yn rhedeg yn brydlon?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Hyd y gwn, nid yw'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yn gyfrifol am unrhyw grŵp gwleidyddol arall yn y Siambr.

**Andrew Davies:** Fel aelod o Undeb y Gweithwyr Trafnidiaeth a Chyffredinol, byddwn yn anfodlon gwneud sylwadau ar weithredoedd undeb llafur arall.

### **Economi Gogledd-orllewin Cymru The Economy of North-west Wales**

**C3 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i wella cefnogaeth y Llywodraeth i economi gogledd-orllewin Cymru? (OAQ26498)

**Andrew Davies:** 'A Winning Wales' identifies how we intend to support economic development throughout Wales, including north-west Wales. We will continue to build on the successes that these policies have delivered. The Assembly Government has, since 1999, supported 135 regional selective assistance and Assembly investment grant projects, with grant values of over £45 million in north-west Wales. These projects are expected to create and safeguard almost 3,800 jobs. European Objective 1 funding is making a real difference in north-west Wales: 106 local projects have been awarded

**Q3 The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** What steps is the Minister taking to increase the Government's support for the economy of north-west Wales? (OAQ26498)

**Andrew Davies:** Mae 'Cymru'n Ennill' yn nodi'r modd y bwriadwn gefnogi datblygu economaidd ledled Cymru, gan gynnwys yng ngogledd-orllewin Cymru. Byddwn yn parhau i adeiladu ar y llwyddiannau a gafwyd yn sgîl y polisiau hyn. Er 1999, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cefnogi 135 o brosiectau cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a phrosiectau grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, gyda grantiau gwerth dros £45 miliwn yng ngogledd-orllewin Cymru. Disgwylir i'r prosiectau hyn greu a diogelu bron 3,800 o swyddi. Mae arian Amcan 1 Ewrop yn gwneud gwir wahaniaeth yng ngogledd-

funding of almost £58 million, representing nearly £155 million investment. These projects have created almost 2,700 new jobs and safeguarded almost 3,500 others.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae'n debyg bod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod lefel cyflogau yng ngogledd-orllewin Cymru, ac yn y Gorllewin yn gyffredinol, yn is nag mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru a'r Deyrnas Gyfunol. Ar hyn o bryd, gosodir lefel cyflogau ar gyfer pob rhan o'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae lefel cyflogau yn y sector cyhoeddus tua'r un lefel â chyflogau yn y sector preifat. A yw'r Gweinidog yn rhannu fy mhryder, pe bai'r Llywodraeth yn Llundain yn rhanbartholi cyflogau yn y sector cyhoeddus, y byddai hynny yn niweidio'r economi yn y rhannau hynny o Gymru ymhellach? A all y Gweinidog fy argyhoeddi y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwrthwynebu unrhyw gynllun gan y Llywodraeth yn Llundain i ranbartholi cyflogau yn y sector cyhoeddus?

**Andrew Davies:** I am aware of the concerns and the arguments for and against the proposals. As you have indicated, there are concerns that introducing regional pay levels could adversely affect people in some parts of the UK, such as Wales. However, I take issue with any assertion that employment and development in north-west Wales and other parts of the country are lagging behind. One of the greatest problems that we face in terms of the Objective 1 areas is raising the level of demand because of previous high levels of unemployment. North-west Wales has probably seen the fastest fall in unemployment in the whole of Wales.

**Brynle Williams:** Do you agree that closing small schools is having an adverse effect on the rural economy, with local post offices and small shops going out of business? What are you, as the Minister for Economic Development and Transport, doing to protect smaller schools so that those communities can enjoy the economic benefits?

**Andrew Davies:** School closures is an issue for local authorities. The issue is not within

orllewin Cymru: dyfarnwyd bron £58 miliwn i 106 o brosiectau lleol, sef buddsoddiad o bron £155 miliwn. Mae'r prosiectau hyn wedi creu bron 2,700 o swyddi newydd ac wedi diogelu bron 3,500 o swyddi eraill.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The Minister is probably aware that wage levels in north-west Wales, and in west Wales in general, are lower than in other parts of Wales and the United Kingdom. Currently, wage levels are set for all parts of the public sector. Wage levels in the public sector correspond roughly to wages in the private sector. Does the Minister share my concern that, if the Government in London regionalises wages in the public sector, that would further damage the economy in those parts of Wales? Can the Minister assure me that the Assembly Government will oppose any plans by the Government in London to regionalise public sector wages?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon a'r dadleuon o blaid ac yn erbyn y cynigion. Fel yr ydych wedi nodi, mae pryderon y gallai cyflwyno cyflogau rhanbarthol gael effaith andwyol ar bobl mewn rhai rhannau o'r DU, fel Cymru. Fodd bynnag, anghytunaf ag unrhyw haeriad bod cyflogaeth a datblygiad yng ngogledd-orllewin Cymru a rhannau eraill o'r wlad ar ei hôl hi. Un o'r problemau mwyaf a wynebwn o ran ardaloedd Amcan 1 yw cynyddu'r galw oherwydd lefelau uchel o ddiweithdra yn y gorffennol. Yn ôl pob tebyg, gogledd-orllewin Cymru sydd wedi gweld y cwmp cyflymaf mewn diweithdra yng Nghymru gyfan.

**Brynle Williams:** A gytunwch fod cau ysgolion bach yn cael effaith andwyol ar yr economi wledig, gyda swyddfeydd post lleol a siopau bach yn mynd i'r wal? Beth yr ydych chi, fel y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, yn ei wneud i ddiogelu ysgolion llai er mwyn i'r cymunedau hynny allu manteisio ar y buddiannau economaidd?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae ysgolion yn cau yn fater i awdurdodau lleol. Nid yw'r mater hwn

my portfolio. However, in terms of education and training in rural areas, the Government has committed increasing levels of public investment to upskill our children and young people to ensure that, when employers move to an area, or when employers in an area wish to expand, there is a highly-skilled and adaptable workforce available.

o fewn fy mhorthffolio i. Fodd bynnag, o ran addysg a hyfforddiant mewn ardaloedd gwledig, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi neilltuo lefelau cynyddol o fuddsoddiad cyhoeddus er mwyn gwella sgiliau ein plant a'n pobl ifanc er mwyn sicrhau bod gweithlu hyfedr a hyblyg ar gael pan fydd cyflogwyr yn symud i ardal neu pan fydd cyflogwyr mewn ardal yn dymuno ehangu.

### **Gwasanaethau Rheilffyrdd Rail Services**

**Q4 Janet Davies:** What steps is the Minister taking to put in place a strong overarching rail strategy in Wales? (OAQ26487)

**Andrew Davies:** The Assembly Government is working closely with the Strategic Rail Authority and Network Rail to ensure that the operator of the new Wales and borders franchise will, over time, be able to introduce improved services. We have made it clear to the SRA that our strategy is based on a commitment to secure an efficient and reliable rail service for Wales over the lifetime of the franchise.

**Janet Davies:** As the Assembly has no say in awarding that franchise, how would your strong, overarching rail strategy cope should there be reductions in services, frequency of services and so on, under the new rail franchise?

**Andrew Davies:** As I made clear in my reply to an earlier question on railways, we have a good, close working relationship with the SRA. It has taken on board our input into the scope of the franchise, it has closely involved us in its delivery and has kept us informed. I am sure that that relationship will continue to develop, as will the relationship with Network Rail, as I indicated earlier.

**Alun Cairns:** Is the Minister concerned that, according to data in the House of Commons library, the Conservative Government, during its last 10 years in power, spent more on transport than the amount proposed by the UK Government for the next 10 years? Is the

**C4 Janet Davies:** Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i sefydlu strategaeth reilffyrdd gadarn a chynhwysol yng Nghymru? (OAQ26487)

**Andrew Davies:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydweithio'n agos â'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol a Network Rail i sicrhau y gall gweithredwr masnachfrait newydd Cymru a'r gororau gyflwyno gwell gwasanaethau dros amser. Yr ydym wedi egluro i'r SRA bod ein strategaeth yn seiliedig ar ymrwymiad i sicrhau gwasanaeth rheilffyrdd effeithlon a dibynadwy i Gymru dros gyfnod y fasnachfrait.

**Janet Davies:** Gan nad oes gan y Cynulliad unrhyw ddylanwad ar y broses o ddyfarnu'r fasnachfrait honno, sut y byddai eich strategaeth reilffyrdd gadarn a chynhwysol yn ymdopi pe bai gostyngiadau mewn gwasanaethau, amllder gwasanaethau ac ati, o dan y fasnachfrait reilffyrdd newydd?

**Andrew Davies:** Fel yr eglurais yn fy ateb i gwestiwn cynharach ar reilffyrdd, mae gennym berthynas waith agos, dda gyda'r SRA. Mae wedi gwrandao ar ein sylwadau ar gwmpas y fasnachfrait, wedi ein cynnwys yn y broses o'i darparu ac wedi'n hysbysu o ddatblygiadau. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y berthynas honno yn parhau i ddatblygu, yn yr un modd â'r berthynas â Network Rail, fel y nodais yn gynharach.

**Alun Cairns:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn pryderu bod y Llywodraeth Geidwadol, yn ôl data yn llyfrgell Tŷ'r Cyffredin, wedi gwario mwy ar drafnidiaeth yn ystod ei 10 mlynedd olaf mewn grym na'r swm y mae Llywodraeth y DU yn bwriadu ei wario dros y 10 mlynedd

Minister equally troubled by the report published yesterday by the Confederation of British Industry, which states that we are about to experience a decade of transport misery?

**Andrew Davies:** Commentators across the political divide have accepted that there has been underinvestment in our transport infrastructure for many years. I am not denying that non-Labour Governments have secured investment. However, the issue is the scale of that investment. The present UK Government and the Assembly Government are increasing the level of support, which is largely needed to upgrade what was a crumbling infrastructure. That is one reason why it is, and will be, a long job.

nesaf? A yw'r Gweinidog yn bryderus hefyd ynghylch yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd ddoe gan Gyd-ffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, sy'n nodi ein bod ar drothwy degawd o ddiflastod mewn perthynas â thrafnidiaeth?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae sylwebwyr ar draws y rhaniad gwleidyddol wedi derbyn y bu tanfuddsoddi yn ein seilwaith trafndiaeth ers blynnyddoedd lawer. Nid wyf yn gwadu bod Llywodraethau nad ydynt yn rhai Llafur wedi sicrhau buddsoddiad. Fodd bynnag, maint y buddsoddiad hwnnw sy'n bwysig. Mae Llywodraeth bresennol y DU a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cynyddu lefel y gefnogaeth, sydd ei hangen yn bennaf i ddiweddarau seilwaith a oedd mewn cyflwr gwael. Dyna un rheswm pam ei bod, a pham y bydd, yn dasg hir.

#### **Ffordd Liniaru'r M4 M4 Relief Road**

**Q5 William Graham:** Will the Minister make a statement on the need for an M4 relief road? (OAQ26493)

**C5 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar yr angen am ffordd liniaru'r M4? (OAQ26493)

**Andrew Davies:** The M4 relief road is one of a range of options, which can contribute to alleviating the congestion on the motorway at Newport. That is in the 'on hold' category of the trunk road forward programme announced in March 2002 because, before making a decision, we must consider all the factors, including the economic, environmental and social effects.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae ffordd liniaru'r M4 yn un opsiwn o amrywiaeth o opsiynau a all gyfrannu at leihau'r tagfeydd ar y draffordd yng Nghasnewydd. Mae'r opsiwn hwnnw yn un elfen o'r flaenraglen cefnffyrdd a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Mawrth 2002 nad ydym yn gweithredu arno ar hyn o bryd oherwydd bod rhaid inni ystyried yr holl ffactorau, gan gynnwys yr effeithiau economaidd, amgylcheddol a chymdeithasol, cyn gwneud penderfyniad.

2.20 p.m.

**William Graham:** Thank you for your reply, Minister, but you must know from your own journeys along the M4 that the road creates misery for everybody. Last Tuesday, seven and eight-mile queues prevented people from getting to work or completing their journeys. This is a vital economic tool for south-east Wales. When will you insist that the road be built?

**William Graham:** Diolch am eich ateb, Weinidog, ond mae'n rhaid eich bod yn gwybod o'ch teithiau eich hun ar hyd yr M4 bod y ffordd yn peri diflastod i bawb. Ddydd Mawrth diwethaf, rhwystrwyd pobl rhag mynd i'r gwaith neu gyrraedd pen eu taith oherwydd tagfeydd o saith ac wyth milltir. Mae hwn yn arf economaidd hollbwysig i dde-ddwyrain Cymru. Pryd y byddwch yn mynnu bod y ffordd yn cael ei hadeiladu?

**Andrew Davies:** I am aware of the congestion problems and we are doing all that we can to manage traffic flows during

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r problemau o ran tagfeydd ac yr ydym yn gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i reoli llif

peak hours. There are issues to be addressed. We are preparing a scheme to widen the M4 between Castleton and Coryton but, as I said in my initial response, the M4 relief road in Newport raises huge and complex economic, environmental and social issues.

**John Griffiths:** Far too many accidents still occur on the M4 around Newport, particularly in the area of the Brynglas tunnels. Work has been done and is ongoing to address those problems. Will you assure me that an effective system of signage and road safety measures will be put in place as speedily as possible, to stop that terrible toll of accidents?

**Andrew Davies:** Yes, John. Accidents do occur on that stretch of motorway, which have a disproportionate effect given the volume of traffic on that road. I will visit the new traffic management centre soon to see how the system operates and what more can be done to manage that process.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Minister, is there not also a danger that, over time, this development may attract other developments and increase congestion in the coastal area? Would it not be better to improve the infrastructure in the Valleys?

**Andrew Davies:** We are doing that. Your basic thrust is right; evidence shows that building more roads or bigger roads increases capacity which, in turn, increases usage of those roads. That is an argument against widening the M25, for example, and was an argument against building it in the first place. We are improving the infrastructure in the Valleys; an extensive dualling programme of the A465, the Heads of the Valleys road, is underway. We are also investing in rail infrastructure, particularly the Ebbw Vale and the Mountain Ash train lines. By supporting public transport, we are encouraging people to get out of their cars and use more trains and buses.

traffig yn ystod oriau brig. Mae materion y mae'n rhaid ymdrin â hwy. Yr ydym yn paratoi cynllun i ledu'r M4 rhwng Cas-bach a Coryton ond, fel y dywedais yn fy ymateb gwreiddiol, mae ffordd liniaru'r M4 yng Nghasnewydd yn codi materion economaidd, amgylcheddol a chymdeithasol enfawr a chymhleth.

**John Griffiths:** Mae gormod o ddamweiniau o lawer yn digwydd o hyd ar yr M4 o amgylch Casnewydd, yn enwedig yn ardal twnneli Brynglas. Gwnaethpwyd gwaith ac mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo o hyd i ymdrin â'r problemau hynny. A wnewch chi roi sicrwydd imi y caiff system effeithiol o arwyddion a mesurau diogelwch ffyrdd eu rhoi ar waith cyn gynted â phosibl, er mwyn lleihau'r nifer uchel o ddamweiniau, sy'n ofnadwy?

**Andrew Davies:** Gwnaf, John. Mae damweiniau yn digwydd ar y rhan honno o'r draffordd, sy'n cael effaith anghymesur o ystyried faint o draffig sydd ar y ffordd honno. Byddaf yn ymweld â'r ganolfan rheoli traffig newydd yn fuan er mwyn gweld sut y mae'r system yn gweithredu a beth arall y gellir ei wneud i reoli'r broses honno.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Weinidog, onid oes perygl hefyd y gallai'r datblygiad hwn, dros amser, ddenu datblygiadau eraill a chynyddu tagfeydd yn yr ardal arfordirol? Oni fyddai'n well gwella'r seilwaith yn y Cymoedd?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr ydym yn gwneud hynny. Mae prif fyrddwn eich pwynt yn gywir; dengys tystiolaeth fod adeiladu mwy o ffyrdd neu ffyrdd mwy yn cynyddu'r capasiti sydd, yn ei dro, yn cynyddu'r defnydd o'r ffyrdd hynny. Mae hynny yn ddadl yn erbyn lledu'r M25, er enghraifft, ac yr oedd yn ddadl yn erbyn ei hadeiladu yn y lle cyntaf. Yr ydym yn gwella'r seilwaith yn y Cymoedd; mae rhaglen ddeuoli helaeth yr A465, sef ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd, yn mynd rhagddi. Yr ydym hefyd yn buddsoddi yn y seilwaith rheilffyrdd, yn arbennig yn rheilffyrdd Glynebwy ac Aberpennar. Drwy gefnogi trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, yr ydym yn annog pobl i adael eu ceir a defnyddio mwy o drenau a bysiau.



**Rosemary Butler:** The M4 relief road is a vital piece of the jigsaw of transportation, not only for south-east Wales but further on, towards west Wales. I am pleased with the progress of the southern distributor road: another piece of that jigsaw. However, you referred to the Ebbw valley rail line, which is a vital piece of my jigsaw analogy. Can you give us a progress report on when the Ebbw Vale to Newport railway line will open?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. That supplementary might have been designed for an earlier question.

**Rosemary Butler:** No, it was not.

**The Presiding Officer:** The M4 is not directly related to the Ebbw valley railway line, although they may cross each other at some point.

**Andrew Davies:** I will write to the Member on that point.

**Rosemary Butler:** Mae ffordd liniaru'r M4 yn elfen hollbwysig o'r rhwydwaith trafniadaeth, nid unig i dde-ddwyrain Cymru ond ymhellach tuag at orllewin Cymru hefyd. Yr wyf yn fodlon ar y cynnydd a wneir ar y ffordd ddsbarthu ddeheuol: darn arall o'r rhwydwaith hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, bu ichi gyfeirio at linell reilffordd glyn Ebwy, sy'n elfen hollbwysig o'r rhwydwaith. A allwch roi adroddiad cynnydd inni ar ba bryd y bydd y rheilffordd o Lynebwy i Gasnewydd yn agor?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Efallai fod y cwestiwn ategol hwnnw wedi'i gynllunio ar gyfer cwestiwn cynharach.

**Rosemary Butler:** Nac oedd.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid yw'r M4 yn unionyrchol gysylltiedig â rheilffordd glyn Ebwy, er ei bod yn bosibl y byddant yn croesi ei gilydd mewn rhyw fan.

**Andrew Davies:** Byddaf yn ysgrifennu at yr Aelod mewn perthynas â'r pwynt hwnnw.

### **Deuli Ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd Dualling the Heads of the Valleys Road**

**Q6 Huw Lewis:** What plans does the Minister have to study the potential economic spin-offs from the dualling of the Heads of the Valleys road? (OAQ26418)

**Andrew Davies:** As with all major transport projects, a broad assessment of the potential economic benefits associated with the scheme was made as part of the appraisal process. The economic development strategies of the Welsh Development Agency and local authorities will naturally seek to exploit the potential economic benefits unlocked by the progressive improvement of the route.

**Huw Lewis:** You will know of the great anticipation in the northern Valleys concerning the potential economic spin-offs of that work. It was one of the suggestions of a study conducted by the Bevan Foundation, outlined in its report 'Ambitions for the Future'. It is one of the foundation's most important suggestions regarding the future of

**C6 Huw Lewis:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i astudio manteision economaidd posibl deuli ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd? (OAQ26418)

**Andrew Davies:** Fel gyda phob prosiect trafniadaeth mawr, gwnaed asesiad bras o fanteision economaidd posibl sy'n gysylltiedig â'r cynllun fel rhan o'r broses arfarnu. Bydd strategaethau datblygu economaidd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a'r awdurdodau lleol yn naturiol yn ceisio elwa ar y manteision economaidd posibl a ddaw yn sgîl y gwelliant cynyddol i'r ffordd.

**Huw Lewis:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r disgwyl mawr yn y Cymoedd gogleddol ynglŷn â manteision economaidd posibl y gwaith hwnnw. Yr oedd yn un o awgrymiadau astudiaeth a gynhaliwyd gan Sefydliad Bevan, a amlinellir yn ei adroddiad 'Ambitions for the Future'. Mae'n un o awgrymiadau pwysicaf y sefydliad ynglŷn â

the upper and northern Valley communities. Will you undertake to meet representatives from the Bevan Foundation to discuss how the study might be taken forward?

**Andrew Davies:** Yes, I am more than happy to do that, as well as consider the wider issues of economic development and regeneration.

**David Davies:** Minister, do you realise that many residents in that area have suffered years of delays in receiving compensation after their property was compulsorily purchased to build that road? Do you agree that the economic benefits of the scheme will not be realised if people feel that they have been ripped off?

**Andrew Davies:** As I said in response to William Graham, major road schemes always have an impact, be it environmental, social—as is the case here—or economic. All these issues must be taken into account. If you know of any compensation problems that Sue Essex, as the Minister previously responsible, or I have not addressed, please inform me and I will follow them up.

**Leanne Wood:** We welcome the dualling of the Heads of the Valleys road, providing that it will result in jobs and prosperity being spread throughout the Valleys. Will you commit to ensuring that the road is effectively integrated with existing road networks in the Valleys, such as those in the Rhondda valley, so that more businesses will be attracted to the area? Such a move would also take pressure away from the M4 corridor.

**Andrew Davies:** The A465 Heads of the Valleys road is a crucial route in and out of Wales, and of the Valleys in particular. Too much emphasis has been placed in the past on considering the road in terms of the M4. The road has huge potential, as it means that heads of the Valleys communities, such as Merthyr Tydfil, Blaenau Gwent and Ebbw Vale, are placed on a direct strategic route into the midlands, rather than simply being placed at the head of a valley. This relates to the point raised by Huw Lewis. One major

dyfodol cymunedau'r Cymoedd uchaf a gogleddol. A wnewch addo cwrdd â chynrychiolwyr o Sefydliad Bevan i drafod sut y gellir gweithredu ar yr astudiaeth?

**Andrew Davies:** Gwnaf, byddaf yn fwy na pharod i wneud hynny, yn ogystal ag ystyried materion ehangach datblygu economaidd ac adfywio.

**David Davies:** Weinidog, a ydych yn sylweddoli bod llawer o drigolion yn yr ardal honno wedi dioddef blynyddoedd o oedi cyn cael iawndal ar ôl i'w heiddo gael ei brynu'n orfodol i adeiladu'r ffordd honno? A gytnwch na wireddir manteision economaidd y cynllun os bydd pobl yn teimlo eu bod wedi cael eu twyllo?

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedais mewn ymateb i William Graham, caiff cynlluniau ffyrdd o bwys effaith bob amser, boed yn amgylcheddol, yn gymdeithasol—fel yn yr achos hwn—neu'n economaidd. Rhaid i'r holl faterion hyn gael eu hystyried. Os gwyddoch am unrhyw broblemau iawndal nad yw Sue Essex, fel y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb yn flaenorol, na minnau wedi mynd i'r afael â hwy, rhowch wybod imi, a byddaf yn ymchwilio iddynt.

**Leanne Wood:** Croesawn ddeuoli Ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd, ar yr amod y bydd yn arwain at wasgaru swyddi a ffyniant ledled y Cymoedd. A wnewch ymrwymo i sicrhau bod y ffordd wedi'i hintegreiddio yn effeithiol gyda rhwydweithiau ffyrdd presennol yn y Cymoedd, megis y rhai yng nghwm Rhondda, fel y bydd mwy o fusnesau yn cael eu denu i'r ardal? Byddai yn lleihau'r pwysau ar goridor yr M4.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae Ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd, yr A465, yn ffordd hollbwysig i mewn ac allan o Gymru, ac o'r Cymoedd yn enwedig. Rhoddwyd gormod o bwyslais yn y gorffennol ar ystyried y ffordd mewn perthynas â'r M4. Mae gan y ffordd bosibiliadau enfawr, gan ei bod yn golygu bod cymunedau yn y Cymoedd, megis Merthyr Tudful, Blaenau Gwent a Glynebwy ar lwybr strategol uniongyrchol i ganolbarth Lloegr, yn hytrach na bod ar ben uchaf cwm. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r pwynt a godwyd

challenge that we face is to enable those communities to see themselves as being well placed strategically, rather than being at the end of a valley. The point raised by the Bevan Foundation was well made, and I agree with it.

gan Huw Lewis. Un her fawr a wynebwn yw galluogi'r cymunedau hynny i weld eu hunain fel cymunedau mewn lleoliad da yn strategol, yn hytrach na bod ar ben cwm. Gwnaed y pwynt yn dda gan Sefydliad Bevan, a chytunaf ag ef.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio Questions to the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration**

### **Gosod Tai yng Nghefn Gwlad Cymru Letting Houses in Rural Wales**

**Q1 Glyn Davies:** Will the Minister make a statement on the letting policy of local authorities and housing associations in rural Wales? (OAQ26464)

**C1 Glyn Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar bolisi'r awdurdodau lleol a'r cymdeithasau tai ar gyfer gosod tai yng nghefn gwlad Cymru? (OAQ26464)

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** Councils must take account of the statutory code of guidance when letting properties. Housing associations must comply with regulatory requirements, which are currently under review and will be reissued as a regulatory code later this year.

**Y Gweinidog Dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Rhaid i gynghorau ystyried y cod cyfarwyddo statudol wrth osod tai. Rhaid i gymdeithasau tai gydymffurfio â gofynion rheoleiddiol, sydd ar hyn o bryd yn cael eu hadolygu ac a gânt eu hailgyflwyno fel cod rheoleiddio yn ddiweddarach eleni.

**Glyn Davies:** My supplementary question relates to a sensitive issue. Do you accept that social housing can become unwelcome in communities where letting policy is based wholly on need, which often creates great social disruption? Do you agree that social housing providers must consider the link between applicants and the area where the social housing is located in order to prevent the creation of social housing that begets ghettos, social problems and local resentment?

**Glyn Davies:** Mae fy nghwestiwn atodol yn ymwneud â mater sensitif. A dderbyniwch y gall tai cymdeithasol ddod yn rhywbeth annerbyniol mewn cymunedau lle mae polisi gosod wedi'i seilio'n llwyr ar angen, sydd yn aml yn creu tarfu cymdeithasol mawr? A gytnwch fod rhaid i ddarparwyr tai cymdeithasol ystyried y cyswllt rhwng ymgeiswyr a'r ardal lle mae'r tai cymdeithasol wedi'u lleoli er mwyn peidio â chreu tai cymdeithasol sy'n arwain at ghettos, problemau cymdeithasol a drwgdeimlad lleol?

**Edwina Hart:** The code of guidance and the regulatory requirements currently contain sufficient flexibility to enable social landlords to work in partnership to develop letting policies to suit the areas in which they operate. However, the wider issues that you raised must also be taken into account. I think that all Members are in favour of social housing, but we all understand that there are wider issues. One example is priority being given to the children of elderly parents in terms of social housing needs. If you want to raise specific issues, please write to me and I will be delighted to follow them up.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r cod cyfarwyddo a'r gofynion rheoleiddio ar hyn o bryd yn cynnwys digon o hyblygrwydd i alluogi landlordiaid cymdeithasol i weithio mewn partneriaeth i ddatblygu polisiau gosod sy'n addas i'r ardaloedd y maent yn gweithredu ynddynt. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ystyried y materion ehangach a godwyd gennych hefyd. Credaf fod yr holl Aelodau o blaid tai cymdeithasol, ond yr ydym i gyd yn deall bod materion ehangach yn gysylltiedig â hyn. Un enghraifft yw rhoi blaenoriaeth i blant rhieni hŷn o ran anghenion cymdeithasol penodol. Os hoffech godi materion penodol,

ysgrifennwch ataf a byddaf yn falch o'u codi ymhellach.

**Brian Gibbons:** I am sure that you are aware of the draft housing Bill currently being considered. Do you agree that this Bill goes some way to address the issues raised by Glyn, particularly in relation to the private sector, which is equally problematic? There is provision in the Bill for action to be taken in areas of particular difficulty. Such action includes registering landlords and asking them to demonstrate their competence in managing their facilities and so on.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r Mesur tai drafft sy'n cael ei ystyried ar hyn o bryd. A gytunwch fod y Mesur hwn yn mynd rhan o'r ffordd i fynd i'r afael â'r materion a godwyd gan Glyn, yn arbennig mewn perthynas â'r sector preifat, sydd yr un mor anodd? Mae darpariaeth yn y Mesur i gymryd camau mewn ardaloedd lle mae anhawster arbennig. Mae camau o'r fath yn cynnwys cofrestru landlordiaid a gofyn iddynt ddangos eu cymhwysedd i reoli eu cyfleusterau ac yn y blaen.

**Edwina Hart:** Wide-ranging issues arise from the draft housing Bill, and we have discussed these issues in Committee.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae materion eang yn codi o'r Mesur tai drafft, ac yr ydym wedi trafod y materion hyn yn y Pwyllgor.

**Janet Ryder:** Some areas in England have moved away from waiting lists and are experimenting with a system of advertising properties as they become available, and setting criteria for applicants. That is one way to ensure greater choice for tenants. Will you consider establishing such pilot schemes in Wales?

**Janet Ryder:** Mae rhai ardaloedd yn Lloegr wedi rhoi'r gorau i restrau aros ac maent yn arbrofi â system o hysbysebu eiddo wrth iddynt fod ar gael, a gosod meini prawf i ymgeiswyr. Mae hynny yn un ffordd o sicrhau mwy o ddewis i denantiaid. A wnewch ystyried sefydlu cynlluniau peilot o'r fath yng Nghymru?

**Edwina Hart:** One local authority is currently considering this issue. I would be delighted to update the Committee on issues arising from that.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae un awdurdod lleol yn ystyried y mater hwn ar hyn o bryd. Byddwn yn fwy na pharod i roi'r diweddaraf i'r Pwyllgor ar faterion sy'n codi o hynny.

2.30 p.m.

### **Strategaeth ar gyfer Adfywio Cymunedau The Community Regeneration Strategy**

**Q2 Lynne Neagle:** Will the Minister make a statement on the community regeneration strategy of the Assembly Government? (OAQ26460)

**C2 Lynne Neagle:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar strategaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer adfywio cymunedau? (OAQ26460)

**Edwina Hart:** There is a range of approaches to community regeneration in Wales, some of which I am reviewing.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae nifer o ffyrdd o adfywio cymunedau yng Nghymru, ac yr wyf yn adolygu rhai ohonynt ar hyn o bryd.

**Lynne Neagle:** Are you aware of the success of community groups in my constituency in accessing funding from the Communities First trust fund? Examples of this success include the expansion of neighbourhood watch schemes in Trevechin and the building of gardens for older people in residential

**Lynne Neagle:** A ydych yn ymwybodol o lwyddiant grwpiau cymunedol yn fy etholaeth i gael arian o gronfa ymddiriedolaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf? Mae enghreifftiau o'r llwyddiant hwn yn cynnwys ehangu cynlluniau gwarchod cymdogol yn Nhreffdyn a chreu gerddi i bobl

homes. Do you agree that initiatives like these make a real difference in Communities First areas across Wales? Will you give a commitment to continuing the trust fund in the long term, and will you consider whether more resources could be made available to the fund during the next budget planning round?

**Edwina Hart:** The Communities First trust fund has been an enormous success, and such small-scale local projects are the proof. I am reviewing the fund, but I have been pleased with the projects that have emerged from it.

**Owen John Thomas:** Last week, Cardiff County Council claimed in writing that it had not received Communities First funding from the Assembly. However, in answer to written questions, you advised me that the council has received almost £0.75 million: £320,000 for 2002-03 and £409,000 for 2003-04. Of the £320,000 allocated for 2002-03, only £16,000 has been spent, and this was on a consultation exercise in Ely. In view of Cardiff County Council's inexplicable handling of the National Assembly's funding and the delay suffered by people in deprived wards such as Butetown, which have been waiting a long time to develop their community centre, what action will you take to put the financial record straight and speed up the use of the much-needed Communities First funding?

**Edwina Hart:** I stand by my answer to your written questions in respect of the allocation of funds to Cardiff council. I am mindful of the way in which all local authorities spend their money, and I am regularly updated on local authorities' progress on Communities First projects. I will pursue these matters. The Social Justice and Regeneration Committee asked me this morning to consider the issue of Communities First funding, and the Deputy Minister for Communities, Huw Lewis, will prepare a detailed report for the Committee when he undertakes the review of Communities First.

hŷn mewn cartrefi preswyl. A gytunwch fod mentrau fel y rhain yn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol yn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ledled Cymru? A roddwch ymrwymiad i barhau â'r gronfa ymddiriedolaeth yn yr hirdymor, ac a wnewch ystyried a ellid rhoi mwy o adnoddau i'r gronfa yn ystod y cylch cynllunio cyllideb nesaf?

**Edwina Hart:** Bu cronfa Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn llwyddiant enfawr, ac mae prosiectau lleol bach o'r fath yn brawf o hynny. Yr wyf yn adolygu'r gronfa, ond yr wyf wedi fy modloni gan y prosiectau sydd wedi deillio ohoni.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr wythnos diwethaf, honnodd Cyngor Sir Caerdydd mewn llythyr nad oedd wedi cael arian Cymunedau yn Gyntaf gan y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, mewn ateb i gwestiynau ysgrifenedig, dywedasoeh wrthyf fod y cyngor wedi cael bron £0.75 miliwn: £320,000 ar gyfer 2002-03 a £409,000 ar gyfer 2003-04. O'r £320,000 a ddyrannwyd ar gyfer 2002-03 dim ond £16,000 a wariwyd, a hynny ar ymgynghoriad yn Nhrelái. O ystyried y ffordd anesboniadwy y mae Cyngor Sir Caerdydd wedi trafod arian y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a'r oedi a ddioddefodd pobl mewn wardiau difreintiedig megis Butetown, sydd wedi bod yn aros am amser maith i ddatblygu eu canolfan gymunedol, pa gamau a gymerwch i gadarnhau beth yw'r sefyllfa ariannol yn union a sicrhau bod arian Cymunedau yn Gyntaf y mae angen mawr amdano yn cael ei ddefnyddio'n gyflymach?

**Edwina Hart:** Glynaf at fy ateb i'ch cwestiynau ysgrifenedig mewn perthynas â dyrannu arian i gyngor Caerdydd. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r ffordd y mae'r holl awdurdodau lleol yn gwario eu harian, a chaf y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf yn gyson ar gynnydd awdurdodau lleol ar brosiectau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Byddaf yn mynd ar drywydd y materion hyn. Gofynnodd y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio imi y bore yma ystyried arian Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, a bydd Huw Lewis, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Gymunedau, yn paratoi adroddiad manwl ar gyfer y Pwyllgor pan fydd yn cynnal adolygiad o Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

**John Griffiths:** Just as politicians are not always recognised as the fine, upstanding, loveable people we undoubtedly are, it is not fully realised that lawyers, solicitors and barristers are keen to give freely of their time and expertise without charge. Will you attempt to ensure that all community regeneration groups in Wales are aware of the pro bono scheme, which offers free legal advice and assistance?

**Edwina Hart:** I am happy to take your point forward and to ask officials to send appropriate information to Communities First areas.

**Mick Bates:** Minister, I am sure that we all share your good intentions with regard to community regeneration in Wales. Lynne Neagle gave examples of the good work that has been done in her constituency; there are many such projects throughout Wales. However, many voluntary community groups face significant problems in accessing the funding that you tell us is available. Will you undertake to ensure that the application process is as simple as possible and remove the red tape and bureaucracy that is a barrier to these groups' accessing the money that you are making available?

**Edwina Hart:** In terms of my current portfolio, with regard to applications for Communities First grants, I have some of the most accessible arrangements. Accessing funds is a wider issue and Huw Lewis will consider it as part of the Communities First review, as well as whether we can establish a helpline or other arrangements for community groups. My portfolio also includes the voluntary sector, to which you alluded, and I will be making a statement on funding for this sector. However, I am concerned that small voluntary-sector groups do not seem to be able to access the funds properly.

**John Griffiths:** Yn union fel na fydd gwleidyddion bob amser yn cael eu cydnabod fel y bobl wych, union, hoffus yr ydym yn ddi-ddadl, ni sylweddolir yn llawn fod cyfreithwyr a bargyfreithwyr yn awyddus i roi o'u hamser a'u harbenigedd am ddim. A wnewch ymdrechu i sicrhau bod pob grŵp adfywio yng Nghymru yn ymwybodol o'r cynllun pro bono, sy'n cynnig cyngor a chymorth cyfreithiol am ddim?

**Edwina Hart:** Byddaf yn falch o weithredu ar eich pwynt, a gofyn i swyddogion anfon y wybodaeth briodol i ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

**Mick Bates:** Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr bod pob un ohonoch yn rhannu eich bwriadau da mewn perthynas ag adfywio cymunedol yng Nghymru. Rhoddodd Lynne Neagle enghreifftiau o'r gwaith da a wnaed yn ei hetholaeth; mae llawer o brosiectau o'r fath ledled Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o grwpiau cymuned gwirfoddol yn wynebu problemau sylweddol o ran cael gafael ar yr arian sydd ar gael meddech chi. A wnewch addo sicrhau bod y broses gwneud cais yn un mor syml â phosibl a dileu'r fiwrocratiaeth sy'n rhwystro'r grwpiau hyn rhag cael gafael ar yr arian yr ydych yn ei ddarparu?

**Edwina Hart:** O ran fy mhortffolio presennol, ynglŷn â cheisiadau am grantiau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, mae fy nhrefniadau i gyda'r trefniadau mwyaf hygyrch. Mae cael gafael ar arian yn fater ehangach a bydd Huw Lewis yn ei ystyried fel rhan o'i adolygiad o Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, yn ogystal ag a allwn sefydlu llinell gymorth neu wneud trefniadau eraill ar gyfer grwpiau cymuned. Mae fy mhortffolio hefyd yn cynnwys y sector gwirfoddol, y bu ichi gyfeirio ato, a byddaf yn gwneud datganiad ar arian ar gyfer y sector hwn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn pryderu nad yw grwpiau bach yn y sector gwirfoddol fel petaent yn gallu hawlio'r arian yn gywir.

### **Cau Gorsafoedd Tân yng Nghefn Gwlad The Closure of Rural Fire Stations**

**Q3 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement about the closure of rural fire stations? (OAQ26379)

**C3 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynghylch cau gorsafoedd tân yng Nghefn gwlad? (OAQ26379)

**Edwina Hart:** Policy responsibility for the fire service in Wales, including the location of rural and other fire stations, is currently a non-devolved matter, which falls within the remit of the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister. I refer you to the statement I made yesterday about future arrangements.

**Lisa Francis:** I note what you said yesterday. It seems possible, or highly likely, that the UK Government will still seek power to order fire authorities to dispose of assets. As this could mean the transfer of assets from one fire authority to another, which could lead to the sale of rural fire stations, what steps will the Welsh Assembly Government take to ensure that this does not happen? We need more fire officers in rural areas, and to retain our fire stations there, particularly during the summer months when the population expands because of tourists.

**Edwina Hart:** I am mindful of the points that were made in yesterday's debate as well as those you raise today. When the responsibility for the fire service is devolved to Wales, I will discuss these issues with fire officers and authorities. I made it clear yesterday that I look for a quality service for the people of Wales and for all the wonderful tourists who visit Wales and enhance our economy.

**Leanne Wood:** I asked you yesterday to commit to not reducing fire cover or closing fire stations. While I accept your answer, in that we can never say never, are you prepared to undertake not to implement the Bain proposals on downsizing the fire service?

**Edwina Hart:** I will be advised in all these matters by the people who have operational control of the fire service, namely the fire officers.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r cyfrifoldeb polisi dros y gwasanaeth tân yng Nghymru gan gynnwys lleoliad gorsafoedd tân yng nghefn gwlad a gorsafoedd tân eraill ar hyn o bryd, yn fater nas datganolwyd, sy'n rhan o gylich gwaith Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at y datganiad a wneuthum ddoe am y trefniadau at y dyfodol.

**Lisa Francis:** Nodaf yr hyn a ddywedwyd gennych ddoe. Mae'n ymddangos yn bosibl, neu'n debygol iawn, y bydd Llywodraeth y DU yn ceisio'r pŵer i orchymyn awdurdodau tân i waredu asedau. Gan y gallai hyn olygu trosglwyddo asedau o un awdurdod tân i'r llall, a allai arwain at werthu gorsafoedd tân yng Nghefn Gwlad, pa gamau y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i sicrhau na fydd hyn yn digwydd? Mae angen inni gael rhagor o swyddogion tân mewn ardaloedd gwledig, a chadw ein gorsafoedd tân yno, yn enwedig yn ystod misoedd yr haf pan fydd y boblogaeth yn chwyddo oherwydd ymwelwyr.

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r pwyntiau a wnaed yn y ddadl ddoe ynghyd â'r rhai a godwch heddiw. Pan gaiff y cyfrifoldeb dros y gwasanaeth tân ei ddatganoli i Gymru, byddaf yn trafod y materion hyn gyda swyddogion tân ac awdurdodau tân. Eglurais ddoe fy mod am gael gwasanaeth o safon i bobl Cymru ac i'r holl ymwelwyr gwych sy'n ymweld â Chymru ac yn ychwanegu at ein heconomi.

**Leanne Wood:** Gofynnais ichi ddoe ymrwymo i beidio â lleihau darpariaeth gwasanaethau tân na chau gorsafoedd tân. Er y derbyniaf eich ateb, yn yr ystyr na allem fyth ddweud na all rhywbeth byth ddigwydd, a ydych yn barod i roi addewid i beidio â gweithredu argymhellion Bain ar leihau maint y gwasanaeth tân?

**Edwina Hart:** Byddaf yn cael cyngor ar yr holl faterion hyn gan y bobl sydd â rheolaeth weithredol dros y gwasanaeth tân, sef y swyddogion tân.

### Cam-drin Cyffuriau ac Alcohol Drug and Alcohol Abuse

**Q4 Kirsty Williams:** Will the Minister make

**C4 Kirsty Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog

a statement on plans to tackle drug and alcohol abuse in mid Wales? (OAQ26384)

**Q6 Alun Cairns:** What new initiatives is the Minister planning to combat drug abuse? (OAQ26395)

**Q7 Peter Black:** What discussions has the Minister had with the UK Government on the Welsh Assembly Government's policy on substance misuse? (OAQ26398)

**Edwina Hart:** I will continue to press ahead with the work I started last year. My main focus will remain on the delivery of the four key aims of the Welsh substance misuse strategy: children, young people and adults; families and communities; treatment; and availability. The new substance misuse advisory regional teams will work closely with community safety partnerships to develop local strategies to help achieve these aims. Both myself and other Assembly officials are represented on a number of UK-wide substance misuse groups.

**Kirsty Williams:** Do you agree with me, and officials at the British Medical Association, that the new provisions for local enhanced services under the GP contract offer an opportunity to improve aspects and the availability of care in the primary care sector and could potentially lead to a consistent all-Wales strategy on prescribing methadone? What discussions have you had with Jane Hutt to ensure that that money is invested in primary care?

**Edwina Hart:** Your point is well made. I have ongoing discussions with the Minister for Health and Social Services, and I will return to this issue after the development of this policy agenda is discussed in Committee in September.

**Alun Cairns:** Are you concerned that, under the current regime, those who are convicted of drug offences have the option of immediate treatment whereas those who seek help out of their own motivation are forced to

ddatganiad ar gynlluniau i fynd i'r afael â cham-drin cyffuriau ac alcohol yn y Canolbarth? (OAQ26384)

**C6 Alun Cairns:** Pa fentrau newydd y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cynllunio i fynd i'r afael â cham-drin cyffuriau? (OAQ26395)

**C7 Peter Black:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cynnal gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gam-drin sylweddau? (OAQ26398)

**Edwina Hart:** Byddaf yn parhau i fwrw ymlaen gyda'r gwaith a ddechreuais y llynedd. Byddaf yn dal i ganolbwyntio'n bennaf ar gyflwyno pedwar nod allweddol strategaeth camddefnyddio sylweddau Cymru: plant, pobl ifanc ac oedolion; teuluoedd a chymunedau; triniaeth; ac argaeledd. Bydd y timau rhanbarthol ymgynghorol newydd ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau yn gweithio'n glôs gyda phartneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol i ddatblygu strategaethau lleol i helpu i gyrraedd y nodau hyn. Yr wyf fi a swyddogion eraill yn y Cynulliad wedi ein cynrychioli ar nifer o grwpiau ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau i'r DU gyfan.

**Kirsty Williams:** A gytunwch â mi, a swyddogion yn y Gymdeithas Feddygol Brydeinig, fod y darpariaethau newydd ar gyfer gwasanaethau lleol gwell o dan y cynnig contract i feddygon teulu yn gyfle i wella agweddau a sicrhau bod mwy o ofal ar gael yn y sector gofal sylfaenol ac y gallent o bosibl arwain at strategaeth gyson ac addas i Gymru gyfan ar gyfer rhagnodi methadon? Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gyda Jane Hutt i sicrhau y bydd yr arian hwnnw'n cael ei fuddsoddi mewn gofal sylfaenol?

**Edwina Hart:** Gwnewch eich pwynt yn dda. Caf drafodaethau parhaus gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, a byddaf yn dychwelyd at y mater ar ôl i ddatblygiad yr agenda polisi hon gael ei drafod yn y Pwyllgor ym mis Medi.

**Alun Cairns:** A ydych yn pryderu bod gan y rhai a gollfernir o droseddau yn ymwneud â chyffuriau y dewis, o dan y drefn bresennol, o gael triniaeth ar unwaith, ond bod yn rhaid i'r rhai sy'n gofyn am gymorth o'u gwirfodd



join a waiting list? Do you agree that, of all the treatments in the NHS and social services, this should not be subject to a waiting list because of the enormous social cost of drug abuse?

**Edwina Hart:** I made it clear when I took over responsibility for this that my aim is that, if anyone wants treatment, they should receive it immediately. As part of my ongoing review of the service, on which I will report to the Committee in September, I will address some of these issues in terms of funding needs and requirements across Wales.

**Peter Black:** When you report to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee in September, will you place particular emphasis on the shortage of rehabilitation beds for substance misusers? This situation is acute in large parts of Wales and requires urgent attention.

**Edwina Hart:** Hopefully, the report will draw out these issues for us to consider, because needs across Wales often vary. Some people raise concerns relating to a lack of beds, whereas some professionals say that that is not the issue. We need to get the right balance and we need a proper discussion, which can only take place when I deliver this report.

**Leighton Andrews:** Are you aware that there are rumours in the Rhondda that the local council has changed its view on whether additional detox beds are needed for drug treatment? Do you have a view on those rumours?

**Edwina Hart:** The rumours have come to my attention. I have asked officials to liaise with Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council, because I have had many representations from council members, and Assembly Members, on issues relating to Rhondda Cynon Taf. When I receive a formal response, I will place it in the Library.

**Helen Mary Jones:** When you report to the Committee in September, will you ensure that the strategy that you propose includes

ymuno â rhestr aros? A gytunwch, o blith holl driniaethau'r GIG a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, na ddylai neb orfod bod ar restr aros oherwydd cost gymdeithasol anferth camddefnyddio cyffuriau?

**Edwina Hart:** Eglurais pan ymgymerais â'r cyfrifoldeb dros hyn mai fy nod yw y dylai unrhyw rai, os oes angen triniaeth arnynt, ei chael ar unwaith. Fel rhan o'm hadolygiad parhaus o'r gwasanaeth, y byddaf yn rhoi adroddiad arno i'r Pwyllgor ym mis Medi, byddaf yn mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion hyn o ran anghenion ariannu a gofynion ledled Cymru.

**Peter Black:** Pan fyddwch yn rhoi adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ym mis Medi, a roddwch bwyslais arbennig ar brinder gwelyau ailsefydlu ar gyfer y rhai sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau? Mae'r sefyllfa hon yn ddwys mewn rhannau helaeth o Gymru ac mae'n gofyn am sylw brys.

**Edwina Hart:** Bydd yr adroddiad, gobeithio, yn codi'r materion hyn inni eu hystyried, gan fod anghenion ar draws Cymru, yn aml, yn amrywio. Bydd rhai pobl yn codi pryderon yn ymwneud â diffyg gwelyau, tra bydd rhai gweithwyr proffesiynol yn dweud nad yw hynny'n broblem. Mae angen inni gael cydbwysedd iawn ac mae angen inni gael trafodaeth iawn, na all ddigwydd ond pan gyflwynaf yr adroddiad hwn.

**Leighton Andrews:** A ydych yn ymwybodol bod sibrydion yn y Rhondda bod y cyngor lleol wedi newid ei farn pa un a oes angen gwelyau diddyfnu ar gyfer triniaeth cyffuriau? A oes gennych farn ar y sibrydion hynny?

**Edwina Hart:** Daeth y sibrydion i'm sylw. Gofynnais i swyddogion gydlynw â Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf gan imi gael llawer o sylwadau gan aelodau'r cyngor, a chan Aelodau'r Cynulliad, ar faterion yn ymwneud â Rhondda Cynon Taf. Pan gaf ateb ffurfiol, byddaf yn ei osod yn y Llyfrgell.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Pan fyddwch yn rhoi adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor ym mis Medi, a wnewch sicrhau bod y strategaeth a

services and treatment for dealing with those who become inappropriately dependent on prescription drugs like tranquillisers? That often happens to people who have undergone treatment for illegal drug use or alcohol abuse.

gynigiwch yn cynnwys gwasanaethau a thriniaeth ar gyfer delio â'r rhai sy'n dod yn amhriodol ddibynnol ar gyffuriau wedi'u rhagnodi fel tawelyddion? Bydd hynny'n digwydd yn aml i bobl sydd wedi cael triniaeth am ddefnyddio cyffuriau anghyfreithlon neu gamddefnyddio alcohol.

2.40 p.m.

**Edwina Hart:** I will certainly consider that, Helen. I will not make any promises, because the report is wide ranging. I will consider what I can do in terms of discussions, possibly with the Minister for Health and Social Services as well.

**Edwina Hart:** Byddaf yn sicr yn ystyried hynny, Helen. Ni roddaf unrhyw addewidion, oherwydd bod yr adroddiad yn eang ei gwmpas. Byddaf yn ystyried yr hyn y gallaf ei wneud o ran trafodaethau, o bosibl gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ogystal.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** I thank the Minister for her undoubted commitment, but she has previously mentioned the need for rehabilitation centres and beds. There is a dire shortage of both in mid Wales. Will the Minister consider that, as there is a crying need for it?

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei hymrwymiad diamheuol, ond mae yn flaenorol wedi sôn am yr angen am ganolfannau a gwelyau ailsefydlu. Mae prinder mawr o'r ddau yn y Canolbarth. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried hynny, gan fod angen dybryd am hyn?

**Edwina Hart:** I would be happy to consider that. I am considering the whole issue across Wales. We must get this right for future generations. It is important that, when people make the decision that they no longer want to take drugs, or be an alcoholic, the appropriate treatment facilities are available to them.

**Edwina Hart:** Byddwn yn barod i ystyried hynny. Yr wyf yn ystyried y mater cyfan ar draws Cymru. Rhaid inni gael hyn yn iawn ar gyfer cenedlaethau'r dyfodol. Mae'n bwysig bod y cyfleusterau triniaeth addas ar gael i bobl pan fyddant yn gwneud y penderfyniad nad ydynt bellach am gymryd cyffuriau, na bod yn alcoholig.

**Leanne Wood:** The sum of £1.4 billion is spent on enforcement on a UK level. That money goes towards police, prisons, customs and courts. Around 70 per cent of all drugs offences relate to cannabis. Do you agree that, if we decriminalised cannabis, the money currently spent on enforcement could be ploughed into securing more rehabilitation beds, which are so badly needed in Wales?

**Leanne Wood:** Mae'r swm o £1.4 biliwn yn cael ei wario ar orfodi ar lefel y DU. Gwerir yr arian hwnnw ar yr heddlu, carchardai, y tollau a'r llysoedd. Mae tua 70 y cant o'r holl droseddau cyffuriau yn ymwneud â chanabis. A gytunwch, pe baem yn cyfreithloni canabis, y gellid defnyddio'r arian a werir ar orfodi ar hyn o bryd i sicrhau rhagor o welyau ailsefydlu, y mae dirfawr angen amdanynt yng Nghymru?

**Edwina Hart:** I do not agree with the decriminalisation of cannabis.

**Edwina Hart:** Ni chytunaf â chyfreithloni canabis.

#### **Gweithgor Diogelwch Tân Fire Safety Working Group**

**Q5 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the forward work programme of

**C5 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar flaenraglen waith gweithgor

the Assembly Government's fire safety working group? (OAQ26381)

**Edwina Hart:** The community fire safety working group has now fulfilled its remit with the publication of 'Wired for Safety' and 'Up in Flames', which considered the issue of domestic fires and arson respectively. There are no further plans for the group to undertake additional work. However, it is due to meet again shortly to discuss how best to take forward the recommendations contained in 'Up in Flames' and the composition of a strategic steering group to oversee that development.

We continue to foster close working relationships with the fire services and others working in the field and, with the establishment of the Wales community fire safety trust, that will be much easier. That means that we will be able to effectively take forward our fire policy objectives in the future on the back of those reports.

**Ann Jones:** Will you join me in praising the work that the North Wales Fire Service is currently undertaking with the Young Firefighters Association? Another scheme has opened recently in Prestatyn. It brings the whole community together, including the industrial fire services, such as Warwick International Group Ltd, which are sometimes forgotten. More importantly, those schemes involve young people. Do you agree that such schemes are vital to promoting fire safety among young people, and also to highlighting the dangers of the actions of a small minority in our society who take pleasure in committing arson and making hoax calls? Will you ask the fire safety working group to consider how such schemes can be rolled out across Wales?

**Edwina Hart:** I welcome the North Wales Fire Service's initiatives; it is an excellent scheme. I have also seen some wonderful examples in south Wales. It is a positive development in making young people aware of fire safety issues. I will not ask the groups concerned, but I will ask my officials to discuss with the fire service how we can further assist with the development of these schemes. The fact that young people are

diogelwch tân Llywodraeth y Cynulliad? (OAQ26381)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r gweithgor diogelwch tân cymunedol bellach wedi cyflawni ei gylch gwaith gyda chyhoeddiad 'Wired for Safety' a 'Up in Flames', a ystyriodd danau yn y cartref a chynnau tân yn fwriadol yn y drefn honno. Nid oes cynlluniau pellach i'r grŵp ymgymryd â gwaith ychwanegol. Fodd bynnag, bydd y gweithgor yn cyfarfod eto yn fuan i drafod y ffordd orau o ddatblygu'r argymhellion a geir yn 'Up in Flames' ac aelodaeth grŵp llywio strategol i arolygu'r datblygiad hwnnw.

Parhawn i feithrin perthynas waith agos â'r gwasanaethau tân ac eraill sy'n gweithio yn y maes a, phan gaiff ymddiriedolaeth diogelwch tân cymunedol Cymru ei sefydlu, bydd hynny yn llawer haws. Golyga hynny y byddwn yn gallu datblygu ein hamcanion polisi tân yn effeithiol yn y dyfodol ar sail yr adroddiadau hynny.

**Ann Jones:** A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch y gwaith a wna Gwasanaeth Tân Gogledd Cymru ar hyn o bryd gyda'r Gymdeithas Diffoddwyr Tân Ifanc? Agorodd cynllun arall yn ddiweddar ym Mhrestatyn. Mae'n dwyn y gymuned gyfan ynghyd, gan gynnwys y gwasanaethau tân diwydiannol megis y Warwick International Group Cyf, a anghofir weithiau. Yn bwysicach na hynny, mae'r cynlluniau hynny yn cynnwys pobl ifanc. A gytunwch fod cynlluniau o'r fath yn hollbwysig i hyrwyddo diogelwch tân ymhlith pobl ifanc, a hefyd i danlinellu peryglon gweithredoedd lleiafrif bach yn ein cymdeithas, sy'n mwynhau cynnau tanau yn fwriadol a gwneud galwadau ffug? A wnewch ofyn i'r gweithgor diogelwch tân ystyried sut y gall cynlluniau o'r fath gael eu cyflwyno ledled Cymru?

**Edwina Hart:** Croesawaf fentrau Gwasanaeth Tân Gogledd Cymru; mae'n gynllun ardderchog. Yr wyf hefyd wedi gweld enghreifftiau ardderchog yn y De. Mae'n ddatblygiad cadarnhaol i wneud pobl ifanc yn ymwybodol o faterion diogelwch tân. Ni ofynnaf i'r grwpiau perthnasol, ond gofynnaf i'm swyddogion drafod gyda'r gwasanaeth tân sut y gallwn gynorthwyo ymhellach gyda datblygiad y cynlluniau hyn.

becoming involved with the fire service, which provides excellent role models, is good news for communities.

**Mark Isherwood:** I support all practical proposals for cohesive and sustainable north Wales transport links. However, coaches need a modern and efficient road network. Given Alun Cairns's comments—sorry, I am asking the wrong question. How will the Minister involve voluntary, charitable and private stakeholders as true partners in the delivery of public education on fire safety and fire prevention, so that practical measures may be taken on the frontline to prevent fire-related deaths and injuries?

**Edwina Hart:** The community fire safety trust will deal with many of those issues. Now that responsibility for the fire service will be devolved, the Assembly will have a more hands-on approach to these issues. I know that my colleagues in education also reiterate that. You only need to consider the number of arson attacks on schools to realise that this is also a key education issue. I am also hopeful that our policies regarding sprinklers in schools will move forward.

**Brian Gibbons:** You will be aware that the school holidays are approaching. Hopefully, we will have a long, hot summer, but that increases the risks of mountain and forest fires. Will you ensure that the prevention group considers this issue, as it is important in many communities, particularly the upper-valley communities across south Wales?

**Edwina Hart:** I know that the fire service is concerned about that, and I will take the matter up. Schoolchildren must be educated about the dangers of fire. Anyone who sees at first hand the consequences of a fire would understand that it is not a matter of idly playing with matches or creating havoc; it can cause grief and death.

Mae'r ffaith bod pobl ifanc yn ymwneud â'r gwasanaeth tân, sy'n batrwm ardderchog iddynt, yn newyddion da i gymunedau.

**Mark Isherwood:** Cefnogaf bob cynnig ymarferol ar gyfer cysylltiadau trafniadaeth cydlynus a chynaliadwy yn y Gogledd. Fodd bynnag, mae angen rhwydwaith ffyrdd modern ac effeithlon ar fysiau. O gofio sylwadau Alun Cairns—mae'n ddrwg gennyf, yr wyf yn gofyn y cwestiwn anghywir. Sut y bydd y Gweinidog yn cynnwys rhanddeiliaid gwirfoddol, elusennol a phreifat fel gwir bartneriaid yn y gwaith o addysgu'r cyhoedd ar ddiogelwch tân ac atal tân, fel y gellir cymryd camau ymarferol ar y rheng flaen i atal marwolaethau ac anafiadau sy'n gysylltiedig â than.

**Edwina Hart:** Bydd yr ymddiriedolaeth diogelwch tân cymunedol yn ymdrin â llawer o'r materion hynny. Gan fod y cyfrifoldeb dros y gwasanaeth tân yn cael ei ddatganoli bellach, bydd y Cynulliad yn ymdrin yn fwy uniongyrchol â'r materion hyn. Gwn fod fy nghydweithwyr mewn addysg hefyd yn ategu hynny. Nid oes ond rhaid ichi ystyried nifer yr achosion o gynnuau tân yn fwriadol mewn ysgolion i sylweddoli bod hyn hefyd yn fater addysgol allweddol. Yr wyf hefyd yn obeithiol y bydd ein polisiau ynglŷn â thaenellwyr mewn ysgolion yn datblygu.

**Brian Gibbons:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod y gwyliau ysgol yn dynesu. Gobeithiaf y cawn haf hirfelyn tesog, ond mae hynny'n cynyddu'r risg o danau mynydd a choedwig. A wnewch sicrhau bod y grŵp atal yn ystyried y mater hwn, gan ei fod yn bwysig mewn sawl cymuned, yn enwedig cymunedau blaenau'r cymoedd ar draws y De?

**Edwina Hart:** Gwn fod y gwasanaeth tân yn pryderu am hynny, a byddaf yn codi'r mater. Rhaid i blant ysgol gael eu haddysgu am beryglon tân. Bydd unrhyw un sy'n cael profiad personol o ganlyniadau tân yn deall nad mater o chwarae yn ddi-hid gyda matsys neu greu llanastr ydyw; gall achosi galar a marwolaeth.

## **Datganiad ar Negodiadau ar Ddiwygio'r Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin** **Statement on the Common Agricultural Policy Reform Negotiations**

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** The common agricultural policy was originally framed in the decades after the second world war, when the goal was to increase domestic food production to avoid food shortages. However, the globalisation of world trade and earlier attempts to reform the CAP have left European Union farmers more exposed to global competition, dependent upon subsidies for their income, isolated from consumers and hide-bound by red tape and bureaucracy.

In November 2001, we launched the Welsh Assembly's strategy document, 'Farming for the Future: A New Direction for Farming in Wales'. One of its key objectives was to influence the UK Government and the EU to secure a trading and subsidy framework that would develop a sustainable agricultural industry for Wales. The CAP reforms that were agreed in Luxembourg last week meet that objective and will benefit the industry and rural communities in Wales. The centrepiece of the new package is the decoupling of subsidies from production based payments. From January 2005 member states, and regions of member states such as ourselves, will have the opportunity to break the link between farm subsidies and production. The plethora of existing CAP direct subsidy schemes, including the arable, cattle and sheep schemes, will be replaced by a single farm payment. Whereas farmers currently have to maintain a particular level of production, such as a certain number of animals or the area of land that is under crop, and comply with rules and regulations on retention periods, quotas and so on, decoupling means that farmers will no longer have to do this. They will be free to focus on what consumers and the markets want. Farmers will no longer be caught in the trap of having to chase subsidies to secure an income. Instead, they will be able to concentrate on further improving the quality of their produce and the environment.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Lluniwyd y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin yn wreiddiol yn y degawdau wedi'r ail ryfel byd. Bryd hynny y nod oedd cynyddu lefelau cynhyrchu bwyd mewnwladol er mwyn osgoi prinder bwyd. Fodd bynnag, yn sgîl globaleiddio masnach y byd a'r ymdrechion cynharach i ddiwygio'r PAC mae ffermwyr yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn fwy agored i gystadleuaeth fyd-eang, yn dibynnu ar gymorthdaliadau am eu hincwm, wedi'u hynysu oddi wrth y defnyddwyr ac wedi'u llyffetheirio gan fïwrocratiaeth.

Ym mis Tachwedd 2001, lanswyd dogfen strategaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gennym: 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol: Cyfeiriad Newydd i Ffermio yng Nghymru'. Un o'i phrif amcanion oedd dylanwadu ar Lywodraeth y DU a'r UE i sicrhau fframwaith masnach a chymhorthdal a fyddai'n datblygu diwydiant amaethyddol cynaliadwy i Gymru. Mae'r diwygiadau i'r PAC y cytunwyd arnynt yn Lwcsembwrg yr wythnos diwethaf yn cyflawni'r amcan hwnnw a byddant o fudd i'r diwydiant ac i gymunedau gwledig yng Nghymru. Conglfaen y pecyn newydd yw datgysylltu cymorthdaliadau oddi wrth daliadau sy'n seiliedig ar gynhyrchu. O fis Ionawr 2005 bydd gan aelod wladwriaethau, a rhanbarthau o fewn aelod wladwriaethau fel ni, y cyfle i dorri'r cysylltiad rhwng cymorthdaliadau i ffermwyr a chynhyrchu. Bydd un taliad i ffermwyr yn disodli'r lluo o gynlluniau cymhorthdal uniongyrchol, gan gynnwys cynlluniau tir â'r, gwartheg a defaid, o dan y PAC presennol. Tra bod yn rhaid i ffermwyr ar hyn o bryd gynhyrchu lefel benodol, megis nifer benodol o anifeiliaid neu'r arwynebedd o dir y tyfir cnwd arno, a chydymffurfio â'r rheolau a'r rheoliadau ar gyfnodau cadw, cwotâu ac yn y blaen, o ganlyniad i ddatgysylltu ni fydd yn rhaid i ffermwyr wneud hyn mwyach. Bydd rhyddid ganddynt i ganolbwyntio ar yr hyn y mae'r defnyddwyr a'r marchnadoedd am ei gael. Ni fydd ffermwyr mwyach yn y fagl o orfod mynd ar drywydd cymorthdaliadau er mwyn cael incwm. Yn hytrach, gallant ganolbwyntio ar wella ansawdd eu cynnyrch

a'r amgylchedd ymhellach.

The single farm payment will be based on historic CAP claims in the three-year period from 2000 to 2002. A national reserve of 3 per cent will be established to cover payments for farmers who otherwise might not be able to demonstrate their entitlement in relation to this period. The new payment will be subject to farmers meeting minimum standards, referred to as cross compliance. The standards must be met in key areas such as the environment and animal health and welfare. Farmers will also have to keep the land in good agricultural and environmental condition.

There is a provision relating to a national envelope, which enables member states, or regions such as Wales, to retain up to 10 per cent of payments to develop targeted schemes to promote sustainable and environmentally-friendly farming. For example, this could be used to encourage the retention of suckler cows in the less favoured areas of Wales. It will also be open to member states to choose, at a national or regional level, to maintain payments coupled to production for up to 25 per cent of arable payments, for up to 50 per cent of sheep annual premium and the less favoured area supplement, and, for beef, for up to 100 per cent of the suckler cow premium and 40 per cent of the slaughter premium, or 100 per cent of the slaughter premium, or 75 per cent of the beef special premium payments.

It has been agreed to retain milk quotas until 2014, but there is a commitment to review future milk quota allocation in 2008. Some market support price cuts were agreed, but at a lower rate than expected. The dairy premium scheme, due to commence in 2004, will remain as a production-linked payment until the dairy reforms are fully implemented in 2008. However, if member states opt for the single farm payment to be implemented on a regional basis, the dairy premium could be decoupled before 2008.

There will also be EU-wide compulsory modulation commencing in 2005, switching some support away from production-based

Bydd un taliad i ffermwyr yn seiliedig ar geisiadau PAC hanesyddol yn y cyfnod o dair blynedd rhwng 2000 a 2002. Caiff cronfa wrth gefn genedlaethol o 3 y cant ei sefydlu ar gyfer taliadau i ffermwyr na allent fel arall brofi eu hawl mewn perthynas â'r cyfnod hwn. Bydd yn rhaid i ffermwyr fodloni safonau gofynnol, y cyfeirir atynt fel trawsgydymffurfio, cyn cael y taliad newydd. Rhaid cyrraedd y safonau mewn meysydd allweddol megis yr amgylchedd ac iechyd a lles anifeiliaid. Bydd yn rhaid i ffermwyr hefyd gadw'r tir mewn cyflwr da yn amaethyddol ac yn amgylcheddol.

Mae amod sy'n ymwneud ag amlen genedlaethol, sy'n galluogi aelod wladwriaethau, neu ranbarthau megis Cymru, i gadw hyd at 10 y cant o daliadau er mwyn datblygu cynlluniau wedi'u targedu i hyrwyddo dulliau ffermio cynaliadwy sy'n ystyriol o'r amgylchedd. Er enghraifft, gellid defnyddio hyn i annog ffermwyr i gadw buchod sugno yn ardaloedd llai ffafriol Cymru. Bydd rhyddid hefyd gan aelod wladwriaethau, ar lefel genedlaethol neu ranbarthol, i ddewis parhau â thaliadau sy'n gysylltiedig â chynhyrchu am hyd at 25 y cant o daliadau tir â'r, am hyd at 50 y cant o'r premiwm blynyddol defaid a'r taliad atodol i ardaloedd llai ffafriol, ac, ar gyfer cig eidion, am hyd at 100 y cant o'r premiwm buchod sugno a 40 y cant o'r premiwm lladd, neu 100 y cant o'r premiwm lladd, neu 75 y cant o'r taliadau premiwm arbennig eidion.

Cytunwyd i gadw'r cwotâu llaeth tan 2014, ond mae ymrwymiad i adolygu'r ffordd y caiff cwotâu llaeth eu dyrannu yn y dyfodol yn 2008. Cytunwyd i dorri ar rai prisiau cymorth i'r farchnad, ond ar gyfradd is na'r disgwyl. Bydd y cynllun premiwm llaeth, a fydd yn dechrau yn 2004, yn parhau'n daliad sy'n gysylltiedig â chynhyrchu hyd nes y caiff y diwygiadau llaeth eu gweithredu'n llawn yn 2008. Fodd bynnag, os bydd aelod wladwriaethau yn dewis gweithredu un taliad i ffermwyr yn rhanbarthol, gellid datgysylltu'r premiwm llaeth cyn 2008.

Bydd modiweiddio gorfodol ar draws yr UE cyfan yn dechrau yn 2005 hefyd, gan droi cymorth o gymorthdaliadau sy'n seiliedig ar

subsidies towards support for environmental and rural development measures across the EU. The introduction of a new financial discipline is another key change, which will trigger action to reduce subsidies if CAP expenditure looks as if it is in danger of exceeding the agreed ceiling. Some additional optional measures have been included in the rural development regulation, such as providing income support to farmers who are facing new legislative requirements. The commission's commitment to simplifying the administration of that regulation is particularly welcome.

2.50 p.m.

Overall, the package is a complex one, which we will need to digest in detail. For example, to avoid land abandonment, the Luxembourg agreement includes provision for the regional implementation of coupled payments to support the sectors previously outlined. I am keen to hear the views of key stakeholders on the various options, and will consult widely over the coming months before any decisions are taken. My objective is to achieve the best possible outcome for Welsh farmers.

We now have a framework for the long-term sustainability of farming in Wales, as the reform package will run through to 2013. However, much of the detail that fleshes out this framework will not be available until the autumn, or even later, when we receive the implementing regulations from the European Commission. Secondary legislation will follow on from that to underpin the new regime in Wales. We will make information available to the industry as soon as possible, as I know that farmers need to be able to plan ahead. The key point to remember is that there will be no change to direct subsidy schemes in 2004—it is business as usual next year.

I will brief the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee on 16 July and will seek a further opportunity for a full debate on the reforms in Plenary at the appropriate time. I look forward to working with the Committee, the industry, and countryside

gynhyrchu i gymorth i fesurau amgylcheddol a datblygu gwledig ar draws yr UE. Newid allweddol arall yw cyflwyno disgyblaeth ariannol newydd, a fydd yn ysgogi camau i leihau cymorthdaliadau os ymddengys bod perygl bod gwariant PAC yn mynd yn uwch na'r nenfwd y cytunwyd arno. Cynhwyswyd rhai mesurau dewisol ychwanegol yn y rheoliad datblygu gwledig, megis rhoi cymorth incwm i ffermwyr sy'n wynebu gofynion deddfwriaethol newydd. Rhaid croesawu'n arbennig ymrwymiad y comisiwn i symleiddio'r ffordd y caiff y rheoliad hwnnw ei weithredu.

Mae'r pecyn, at ei gilydd, yn un cymhleth, y bydd angen inni ei ystyried yn fanwl. Er enghraifft, er mwyn osgoi sefyllfa lle mae ffermwyr yn gadael y tir, mae cytundeb Lwcsembwrg yn cynnwys darpariaeth ar gyfer gweithredu taliadau cysylltiedig i roi cymorth i'r sectorau a amlinellwyd yn flaenorol yn rhanbarthol. Yr wyf yn awyddus i glywed barn rhanddeiliaid allweddol ar yr amrywiol opsiynau, a byddaf yn ymgynghori'n eang dros y misoedd nesaf cyn i unrhyw benderfyniadau gael eu gwneud. Fy amcan yw sicrhau'r canlyniad gorau posibl i ffermwyr Cymru.

Bellach mae gennym fframwaith ar gyfer cynaliadwyedd ffermio yng Nghymru yn y tymor hir, gan y bydd y pecyn diwygio yn weithredol tan 2013. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd llawer o fanylion y fframwaith hwn ar gael tan yr hydref, neu hyd yn oed ar ôl hynny, pan ddaw rheoliadau gweithredu'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i law. Bydd is-ddeddfwriaeth wedi hynny i ategu'r drefn newydd yng Nghymru. Byddwn yn rhoi gwybodaeth i'r diwydiant mor fuan â phosibl, gan fy mod yn gwybod bod angen i ffermwyr allu cynllunio ymlaen llaw. Y pwynt allweddol i'w gofio yw na fydd y cynlluniau cymhorthdal uniongyrchol yn newid yn 2004—ni fydd dim newid y flwyddyn nesaf.

Byddaf yn briffio Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ar 16 Gorffennaf ac yn ceisio cael cyfle arall i gynnal dadlawn ar y diwygiadau mewn Cyfarfod Llawn ar yr adeg gywir. Edrychaf ymlaen at weithio gyda'r Pwyllgor, y diwydiant, a'r rhai yng

interests to implement this new common agricultural policy in Wales. It provides a real opportunity for simplification and for farmers to run their businesses based on market need, rather than having to chase subsidies, as they have had to do for so long. In this way, farmers have been set free.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dod i'r casgliad y bydd y newidiadau hyn o fudd i'r diwydiant yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, dywed hefyd fod y setliad yn hynod o gymhleth ac y bydd angen amser maith i fynd i'r afael â'r holl fanylion. Efallai y byddai'n well felly fynd i'r afael â'r manylion hynny cyn dod i gasgliad ynglŷn â pha mor fuddiol i'r diwydiant y bydd y setliad.

Mae rhai agweddau ar y cytundeb sydd ymhell o fod yn glir. Bydd y taliad sengl ar gael i ffermwyr yng Nghymru ar 1 Ionawr 2005. Fodd bynnag, mae modd i rai aelod wladwriaethau ohirio'r taliad sengl tan 1 Ionawr 2007. A yw'r Gweinidog yn pryderu y gallai gwledydd sy'n dewis gohirio'r taliad hwnnw achosi anfantais i ffermwyr Cymru, gan arwain at elfen o gystadleuaeth annheg? Hefyd, cyfeiriodd at yr amlen genedlaethol ac at yr elfen o drawsgydymffurfio. A yw'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu cymryd cyfrifoldeb llawn am y materion hynny yng Nghymru? Nid yw wedi datgan hynny hyd yn hyn.

Mae gennyf gwestiynau ynglŷn â phobl sydd wedi prynu tir ers gwanwyn 2002. Beth fydd yn digwydd iddynt, gan bydd y taliadau yn cael eu seilio ar daliadau hanesyddol rhwng 2000 a 2002? Beth sy'n digwydd yn achos pobl sydd wedi prynu tir, neu ei rentu, er 2002? A yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn bod trafodaeth bellach yn Ewrop ynglŷn â'r taliadau Ewropeaidd traddodiadol i Gymru a Phrydain? Mae ganddo gyfle yn awr i aildrafod gyda'r Undeb Ewropeaidd faint o arian y gellir ei dynnu i lawr yn y taliadau hyn i Gymru. A yw'n ymrwymo i wneud hynny, yn enwedig yng ngoleuni'r ffaith y bydd ad-daliad i Brydain yn gorfod cael ei gadarnhau bellach gan Senedd Ewrop yn ogystal â'r cyngor, a bod posibilrwydd cryf na fydd Prydain yn derbyn ad-daliadau yn y dyfodol? A fydd y Gweinidog yn manteisio

nghefn gwlad â diddordeb i weithredu'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin newydd hwn yng Nghymru. Mae'n gyfle gwirioneddol i symleiddio ac yn gyfle i ffermwyr gynnal eu busnesau yn ôl anghenion y farchnad, yn hytrach na gorfod mynd ar drywydd cymorthdaliadau, fel y bu'n rhaid iddynt ei wneud ers cyhyd. Yn y ffordd hon y mae ffermwyr wedi cael eu rhyddhau.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The Minister has concluded that these changes will benefit the industry in Wales. However, he also says that the settlement is extremely complex and that we will need a great deal of time to get to grips with all the detail. Perhaps, therefore, it would be better to get to grips with that detail before reaching a conclusion on how beneficial this settlement will be to the industry.

Some aspects of the agreement are far from clear. This single payment will be available to farmers in Wales on 1 January 2005. However, some member-states can delay the single payment until 1 January 2007. Is the Minister concerned that countries that choose to delay that payment could disadvantage the farmers of Wales, leading to an element of unfair competition? Also, he referred to the national envelope and to the element of cross-compliance. Does the Minister intend to take full responsibility for these matters in Wales? He has not announced that so far.

I have questions about those who have bought land since the spring of 2002. What will happen to them, given that the payments will be based on historic payments between 2000 and 2002? What will happen in the case of people who have bought, or rented, land since 2002? Does the Minister accept that there is further discussion in Europe about the traditional European payments to Wales and Britain? He now has the opportunity to discuss again with the European Union the amount of money that can be drawn down in these payments to Wales. Will he commit to doing that, especially in light of the fact that the British rebate must now be ratified by the European Parliament as well as the council, and that there is a strong possibility that Britain will not receive rebates in future? Will the Minister take advantage of the



ar y cyfle i drafod ag Ewrop y posibilrwydd o gael llawer iawn mwy o arian Ewrop i Gymru, ac i gael pwll mwy o arian? Bydd hynny'n rhoi cyfle iddo sicrhau mwy o arian ar gyfer rhaglenni datblygu gwledig. A ddywed wrthym faint o arian fydd ar gael ar gyfer y rhaglenni hynny? A ydym yn sôn am filiynau o bunnoedd neu ddegau o filiynau o bunnoedd?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yn gyntaf, ar y taliad sengl, mae rhai amgylchiadau lle y byddai'n bosibl cario ymlaen hyd at 2007. Fodd bynnag, tybiaf y byddai'r rhan fwyaf o wledydd Ewrop eisiau symud yn gyflym tuag at ddatgysylltu taliadau oddi wrth gynhyrchu. Dyna yw nod y rhan fwyaf o bobl a'r rhan fwyaf o wledydd yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, yn ogystal â'r rhan fwyaf o undebau ffermio Ewrop. Gwêl llawer o bobl gymaint rhwyddach fydd y system newydd hon a manteision y ffaith mai'r farchnad fydd yn rheoli faint o anifeiliaid sydd yn cael eu cynhyrchu ac na fydd yn rhaid mynd ar ôl taliadau.

Ar drawsgydymffurfio, rhaid aros i weld beth fydd hyn yn ei olygu. Gwyddom beth yw'r egwyddor, ond bydd yn rhaid inni weld beth yn union fydd y sefyllfa pan ddaw'r rheoliadau o Ewrop. Bydd yn rhaid cael diffiniad ynglŷn â beth fydd hynny yn ei olygu. Ar ffermwyr nad sydd wedi ffermio ers 2000, pwrpas y gronfa wrth gefn genedlaethol yw sicrhau bod arian ar gael i sicrhau nad yw pobl yn colli allan oherwydd nad ydynt wedi ffermio ers 2000. Yr ydym yn ystyried y manylion ynglŷn â sut y bydd hynny'n gweithio.

Ar y taliadau datblygu gwledig, mae'n wir mai dim ond 3.5 y cant o gyllideb Ewrop y mae'r Deyrnas Unedig yn ei dderbyn. Mae hynny'n hanesyddol oherwydd nad oedd arian yn cael ei wario ar ddatblygu gwledig yn ystod blynyddoedd y Torïaid. Cyfran fechan a gawsom o'r herwydd o gyllideb Ewrop.

Ar fodiwleiddio, er enghraifft, rhoddwn 13 y cant o arian i Ewrop, a chawn 11 y cant yn ôl. Nid yw hynny'n swnio'n wych. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd, rhoddwn 12 y cant i mewn a chawn 3 y cant yn ôl ar gyfer datblygu gwledig. Felly, mae'r egwyddor

opportunity to discuss with Europe the possibility of obtaining much more European money for Wales, and to obtain a greater pool of money? That would give him the opportunity to secure more money for rural development programmes. Will he tell us how much money will be available for those programmes? Are we talking about millions of pounds or tens of millions of pounds?

**Carwyn Jones:** First, on the single payment, there are some circumstances where it would be possible to continue until 2007. However, I assume that most European countries would wish to move quickly towards decoupling payments from production. That is the aim of most people and most European Union countries, as well as most European farming unions. Many people see how much easier this new system will be and the advantages of the fact that the market will determine how many animals are produced and that they will not have to chase payments.

On cross-compliance, we must wait to see what this will mean. We know what the principle is, but we will have to see what exactly the situation will be when the regulations come from Europe. We will have to have a definition as to what that means. On farmers that have not farmed since 2000, the purpose of the national reserve is to ensure that money is available to ensure that people do not lose out because they have not farmed since 2000. We are considering the details of how that will work.

On the rural development payments, it is true that the United Kingdom only receives 3.5 per cent of the European budget. That is historic because money was not spent on rural development during the Tory years. As a result, we only received a small share of the European budget.

On modulation, for example, we contribute 13 per cent of the European funding, and we receive 11 per cent back. That does not sound wonderful. However, at present, we contribute 12 per cent and we receive 3 per cent back for rural development. Therefore,

wedi ei sefydlu. Pan ailysytyrir hyn—y flwyddyn nesaf, fe dybiwn—golyga'r egwyddor honno y bydd yn rhaid i Brydain Fawr gael cyfran o 10 y cant neu 11 y cant o'r arian. Yn yr un modd, yr ydym wedi cael cyfran o arian modiweiddio. Felly, yr ydym mewn sefyllfa dda i ddadlau o fewn egwyddor y dylem efallai gael dwywaith, deirgwaith neu bedair gwaith yr arian a gawn ar hyn o bryd. Mae hyn yn cryfhau sefyllfa'r Deyrnas Unedig i'r dyfodol.

Ar y manylion, mae'n wir bod llawer o fanylion i'w hystyried o hyd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid cofio bod y cyfeiriad a'r egwyddorion yn iawn. Ar ffermio yng Nghymru, yr wyf yn hyderus dros ben y bydd pethau'n gwella'n fawr, ac y gwêl ffermwyr sefyllfa lawer rhwyddach o ran y system daliadau a llanw ffurflenni.

**Lynne Neagle:** I welcome the UK Government's efforts to try to secure a fair deal on the CAP reform. However, this deal is a missed opportunity. We now have a messy compromise that the developing world cannot afford. Payments for sugar were not addressed, and the big decisions about dairy farming have been deferred. While governments and farmers haggled over how to make the subsidy regime slightly less obscene, the developing world is falling further into poverty. Do you share Oxfam's concerns, Minister, that this reform will not stop the dumping of surplus products on developing world markets? Do you also share the concern that the degree of decoupling has been exaggerated, that it has been excessively deferred, and that it will only apply to a few sectors? Finally, will you give an assurance that, where the Assembly and the UK Government have the power to do so, you will push for reforms that deliver the maximum possible benefit for farmers in the developing world as soon as possible?

3.00 p.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** There is no doubt that, where you have production subsidies and overproduction, there is a temptation, as there has been in the past, to dump it on other, far poorer countries. Where production is decoupled from subsidies, the incentive to

the principle has been established. When this is reconsidered—next year, we believe—that principle will mean that Great Britain must have a 10 per cent or 11 per cent share of the funding. In the same way, we have had a share of modulation funding. Therefore, we are in a good position to argue in principle that we should maybe receive twice, three times or four times the money that we currently receive. This strengthens the United Kingdom's position for the future.

On the details, it is true that there are still many details to be considered. However, we must remember that the direction and the principles are right. On farming in Wales, I am extremely confident that things will improve greatly, and that farmers will see a far simpler situation in terms of the payments system and form filling.

**Lynne Neagle:** Croesawaf ymdrechion Llywodraeth y DU i geisio taro bargaen deg o ran y diwygiadau i'r PAC. Fodd bynnag, mae'n gyfle a gollwyd. Bellach mae gennym gyfaddawd dryslyd na all y byd datblygol ei fforddio. Nid aed i'r afael â thaliadau am siwgr, a gohiriwyd y penderfyniadau mawr ar ffermio llaeth. Tra bod llywodraethau a ffermwyr wrthi'n bargeinio sut i wneud y drefn gymhorthdal ychydig yn llai afiach, mae'r byd datblygol yn mynd yn fwyfwy tlawd. A rennwch bryderon Oxfam, Weinidog, na fydd y diwygiadau hyn yn atal gwledydd rhag gwaredu cynhyrchion dros ben ar farchnadoedd y byd? A rennwch y pryder hefyd bod y graddau y caiff taliadau eu datgysylltu wedi'u gorliwio, bod y broses honno wedi'i gohirio'n ormodol, ac mai dim ond i ychydig o sectorau y bydd yn gymwys? Yn olaf, a roddwch sicrwydd y byddwch yn pwysu am ddiwygiadau sy'n arwain at y budd mwyaf posibl i ffermwyr yn y byd datblygol mor fuan â phosibl, lle mae gan y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y DU y pŵer i wneud hynny?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid oes amheuaeth, lle mae gennych gymorthdaliadau cynhyrchu a gorgynhyrchu, bod temtasiwn, fel y bu yn y gorffennol, i waredu cynnyrch mewn gwledydd eraill, llawer tlotach. Pan ddatgysylltir cynhyrchu oddi wrth

overproduce disappears. That is good news for farmers in the third world as it puts an end to the situation whereby Europe produces more than it can sell and dumps goods on the third world. The United States are also a major culprit as agriculture there is heavily subsidised, although not as much through production subsidies. It is subsidised in many other ways, particularly through the wheat sector. Much of that wheat is dumped on the third world. While it is fair to say that Europe should play its part, which I believe it is doing in terms of decoupling subsidies, there is a great deal that could be done in terms of what is happening in the US. On the other hand, countries such as Australia and New Zealand have no subsidies and compete solely in terms of market prices. The Cairns group would take a different view on the issue.

In terms of this system, we must accept that most farmers in Europe cannot compete in the current market. There are certain trade-offs that take place. For example, a great deal of produce that comes from the third world is produced at a level of welfare that is much lower than that which exists within the European Union. Questions have arisen regarding whether we should consider welfare standards and so on, and many of those questions remain unanswered. While I know that many believe that farming subsidies are not the way forward, the package that we have is good news as farmers no longer have to chase subsidies but are governed instead by the market. The overproduction seen in Europe for so long at the expense of many third world countries has now been mitigated, which is probably the greatest step forward taken on that policy in over 40 years.

**Brynle Williams:** CAP reform is one of the most significant issues currently facing the rural community. I welcome the opportunity to speak and to ask questions on this important issue. It is essential that the people of Wales have a voice and a policy that is applicable to their specific needs. The Conservative Party feels that agriculture ministers from across Europe have caved in

gymorthdaliadau, mae'r cymhelliad i orgynhyrchu yn diflannu. Mae hynny'n newyddion da i ffermwyr yn y trydydd byd gan ei fod yn rhoi terfyn ar y sefyllfa lle mae Ewrop yn cynhyrchu mwy nag y gall ei werthu ac yn gwaredu nwyddau yn y trydydd byd. Mae'r Unol Daleithiau hefyd yn euog iawn yn hyn o beth, gan fod amaethyddiaeth yno yn cael llawer o gymorthdaliadau, er nad cymaint drwy gymorthdaliadau cynhyrchu. Caiff gymhorthdal mewn sawl ffordd arall, yn enwedig drwy'r sector gwenith. Gwaredir llawer o'r gwenith hwnnw yn y trydydd byd. Er ei bod yn deg dweud y dylai Ewrop chwarae ei rhan, a chredaf ei bod yn gwneud hynny, i ddatgysylltu cymorthdaliadau, gellid gwneud cryn dipyn o ran yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn yr UD. Ar y llaw arall, nid oes cymorthdaliadau mewn gwledydd megis Awstralia a Seland Newydd ac maent hwy yn cystadlu yn ôl y prisiau ar y farchnad yn unig. Byddai barn wahanol gan grŵp Cairns ar y mater.

O ran y system hon, rhaid inni dderbyn na all y rhan fwyaf o ffermwyr yn Ewrop gystadlu yn y farchnad gyfredol. Mae rhywfaint o gyfaddawdu. Er enghraifft, mae llawer o'r cynnyrch a ddaw o'r trydydd byd wedi'i gynhyrchu yn ôl lefel lles sy'n llawer is na'r lefel a geir yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Cododd cwestiynau pa un a ddylem ystyried safonau lles ac ati, ac erys llawer o'r cwestiynau hynny heb eu hateb. Er y gwn fod llawer yn credu nad cymorthdaliadau i ffermwyr yw'r ffordd ymlaen, mae'r pecyn sydd gennym yn newyddion da gan nad oes rhaid i ffermwyr fynd ar drywydd cymorthdaliadau mwyach ond cânt eu rheoli gan y farchnad yn lle hynny. Mae'r gorgynhyrchu a welwyd yn Ewrop ers cyhyd ar draul llawer o wledydd y trydydd byd bellach wedi'i leihau, sef y cam mwyaf a gymerwyd, fwy na thebyg, ar y polisi hwnnw ers dros 40 mlynedd.

**Brynle Williams:** Mae diwygio'r PAC yn un o'r materion pwysicaf a wyneba cefn gwlad ar hyn o bryd. Croesawaf y cyfle i siarad a gofyn cwestiynau ar y mater pwysig hwn. Mae'n hanfodol bod gan bobl Cymru lais a pholisi sy'n gymwys i'w hanghenion penodol. Teimla'r Blaid Geidwadol fod gweinidogion amaethyddiaeth ar draws Ewrop wedi ildio i bwysau gan y Ffrancwyr,

to pressure from the French, which has allowed them major concessions over CAP reform. It appears that the strong-armed tactics of the French have won the day again. They appear to have vetoed arrangements and managed to severely weaken overall reform. We have missed an important opportunity to implement compulsory decoupling. Individual member states can choose when to implement the changes. There is a danger that that is an uncommon approach, which could lead to Welsh farmers being placed at a competitive disadvantage. By following the member states in opting-out of decoupling, the EU has missed the opportunity to end the bureaucratic system of subsidies, which has led to the overproduction of certain goods for profit. The new reforms will not save the taxpayer a penny. Farmers must have the opportunity to grow what customers want and require, and not what pays the largest subsidy.

Will you make representations on behalf of the people of Wales to the UK Government on making it mandatory for the decoupling payment system to be implemented? If that were imposed, it would encourage farmers to get closer to the market. Will the Government undertake that all food entering the UK is produced to the same welfare and hygiene standards as those which Welsh producers must adhere to? Do you not agree that making concessions to the French will severely handicap the EU's negotiating hand at the next World Trade Organisation conference and that developing countries will continue to suffer due to Europe's protected market? I am concerned about what is happening in terms of the US gaining access to our market. Many products that are entering the UK should not be doing so.

**Carwyn Jones:** Implementing the decoupling system is mandatory and it must happen by 2007. The National Assembly can influence negotiations as it can determine the speed at which decoupling is implemented in certain areas. The Welsh Assembly Government and the National Assembly will make that decision, particularly in terms of arable aid, sheep and beef payments. That decision was reached because, in

sydd wedi rhoi consesiynau mawr iddynt o ran y diwygiadau i'r PAC. Ymddengys i dactegau cyhyrog y Ffrancwyr fod yn drech unwaith eto. Ymddengys iddynt nacáu trefniadau a llwyddo i wanhau'r broses ddiwygio gyffredinol yn ddifrifol. Yr ydym wedi colli cyfle pwysig i weithredu datgysylltu gorfodol. Gall aelod wladwriaethau unigol ddewis pryd y maent am weithredu'r newidiadau. Mae perygl na fydd pawb yn gweithredu yn yr un ffordd, a allai beri i ffermwyr Cymru fod o dan anfantais wrth gystadlu. Drwy ddilyn yr aelod wladwriaethau a pheidio â dewis datgysylltu, mae'r UE wedi colli'r cyfle i roi terfyn ar y system fiwrocraidaidd o gymorthdaliadau, sydd wedi arwain at orgynhyrchu nwyddau penodol er mwyn gwneud elw. Ni fydd y diwygiadau newydd yn arbed yr un geiniog i'r trethdalwr. Rhaid i ffermwyr gael y cyfle i dyfu yr hyn y mae'r cwsmer am ei gael ac sydd ei angen arno, ac nid yr hyn sy'n talu'r cymhorthdal mwyaf.

A wnewch sylwadau ar ran pobl Cymru i Lywodraeth y DU ynglŷn â'r cynnig i'w gwneud yn orfodol i'r system datgysylltu taliadau gael ei gweithredu? Pe bai honno'n cael ei gorfodi, byddai'n annog ffermwyr i ddod yn agosach at y farchnad. A wnaiff y Llywodraeth addo bod yr holl fwyd sy'n dod i mewn i'r DU wedi'i gynhyrchu i'r un safonau lles a hylendid â'r safonau y mae'n rhaid i gynhyrchwyr Cymru lynu atynt? Oni chytunwch y bydd rhoi consesiynau i'r Ffrancwyr yn llesteirio'r EU wrth iddo negodi yng nghynhadledd nesaf Corff Masnach y Byd ac y bydd gwledydd datblygol yn parhau i ddiodef oherwydd bod marchnad wedi'i diogelu yn Ewrop? Pryderaf am yr hyn sy'n digwydd o ran mynediad yr UD i'n marchnad. Ni ddylid caniatáu i lawer o'r cynnyrch sy'n dod i mewn i'r DU wneud hynny.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'n orfodol rhoi'r system ddatgysylltu ar waith a rhaid i hynny ddigwydd erbyn 2007. Gall y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ddylanwadu ar negodiadau gan y gall benderfynu pa mor gyflym y caiff taliadau eu datgysylltu mewn meysydd penodol. Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fydd yn gwneud y penderfyniad hwnnw, yn enwedig o ran taliadau cymorth tir â'r defaid ac eidion.

Luxembourg on Thursday morning, at about 4 a.m., Scotland and Wales pressed Margaret Beckett that that power should be devolved to regions and should not be decided by member states. She accepted our view and expressed it to the conference chamber, where it was agreed upon by other EU states. Wales now has control over aspects of decoupling that it would not otherwise have had.

Secondly, France's negotiating position was that it did not want any decoupling. Had France had its way, the system would have remained the same. My view was that the French wanted to keep decoupling in order to get more money into the EU agriculture budget—already almost half of the EU's budget—and possibly cast a jealous eye over the Fontainebleau agreement in so doing. That much, at least, did not happen. Having twice been to Luxembourg, it was clear to me that the French had no friends in the negotiations, which was why they were forced to compromise. Therefore, that is why we have decoupling. Had Germany, in particular, supported France, our position would have been different, but the French were isolated and did not get what they wanted. This solution is, in fact, far closer to the UK's standpoint.

On producing food to agreed standards, we have such standards in Europe and we keep to them. However, foodstuffs that are not of the same standard do manage to enter the UK and European markets, but they are cheaper. We do not want to compete in a cheap market, because we will always be undercut. We want the high standard of our food to be its selling point and, consequently, to be able to sell it at a higher price. That is an advantage to us.

On our position regarding the World Trade Organisation, Brynle, I was surprised to hear you say that Europe exists in a protected market. If that is the case, you present an argument for abolishing all subsidies, because a protected market means paying subsidies. I am sure that that is not what you meant, but that was my impression.

Gwnaed y penderfyniad hwnnw am fod yr Alban a Chymru, yn Lwcsembwrg fore dydd Iau, tua 4 a.m., wedi pwyso ar Margaret Beckett i'r pŵer hwnnw gael ei ddatganoli i'r rhanbarthau ac i'r mater hwn beidio â chael ei benderfynu gan aelod wladwriaethau. Derbyniodd ein barn a'i mynegi yn siambr y gynhadledd, lle y cytunwyd arni gan aelod wladwriaethau eraill yr UE. Mae gan Gymru erbyn hyn reolaeth dros agweddau ar ddatgysylltu na fyddai ganddi fel arall.

Yn ail, safbwynt negodi Ffrainc oedd nad oedd am gael unrhyw ddatgysylltu. Pe bai Ffrainc wedi llwyddo, ni fyddai'r system wedi newid. Fy marn i oedd bod Ffrainc am gadw datgysylltu er mwyn cael mwy o arian o gyllideb amaethyddiaeth yr UE—sydd eisoes bron hanner cyllideb yr UE—a bwrw golwg genfigennus efallai ar gytundeb Fontainebleau wrth wneud hynny. O leiaf, ni ddigwyddodd hynny. Ar ôl bod i Lwcsembwrg ddwywaith, yr oedd yn amlwg i mi nad oedd gan y Ffrancwyr ffrindiau yn y negodiadau, a dyna pam y bu'n rhaid iddynt gyfaddawdu. Felly, dyna pam mae datgysylltu gennym. Pe bai'r Almaen, yn arbennig, wedi cefnogi Ffrainc, byddai ein sefyllfa wedi bod yn wahanol, ond yr oedd Ffrainc wedi'i hynysu ac ni lwyddodd i gael yr hyn yr oedd yn ei ddymuno. Mae'r ateb hwn, yn wir, yn llawer nes at safbwynt y DU.

O ran cynhyrchu bwyd i safonau y cytunwyd arnynt, mae gennym safonau o'r fath yn Ewrop ac yr ydym yn cadw atynt. Fodd bynnag, mae bwydydd nad ydynt o'r un safon yn llwyddo i ddod i mewn i farchnadoedd y DU ac Ewrop, ond maent yn rhatach. Nid ydym am gystadlu mewn marchnad rad, oherwydd bydd rhywun arall bob amser yn gwerthu'n rhatach na ni. Yr ydym am i safon uchel ein bwyd ddenu prynwyr ac, o ganlyniad, bod mewn sefyllfa i'w werthu am bris uwch. Mae hynny'n fantais i ni.

O ran ein safbwynt tuag at Gorff Masnach y Byd, Brynle, synnais eich clywed yn dweud bod Ewrop yn bodoli mewn marchnad wedi'i diogelu. Os yw hynny'n wir, yr ydych yn rhoi dadl o blaid diddymu pob cymorthdal, gan fod marchnad wedi'i diogelu yn golygu talu cymorthdaliadau. Yr wyf yn siŵr nad dyna'r hyn yr oeddech yn ei olygu, ond dyna'r argraff a gefais.

You rightly raised the question of the WTO negotiations in Cancun. The European Union needed to reform the common agricultural policy to have a coherent and credible position particularly vis-à-vis the US and the negotiations with the Cairns group in Cancun. Our settlement puts the European Union in an extremely strong position. Franz Fischler is happy with the agreement. He will go to Cancun to press the EU's position before he retires a month later. The ball is now in the US's court. We must wait and see what the US's trading provisions are. Whereas previously the EU was the guilty party, we have turned the tables on them and, as a result, it is an excellent deal for Wales and the rest of Europe.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you, Minister, for coming forward with this statement and committing yourself to a debate on this matter. However, it is premature for you to say that it is good news for Welsh farmers because, as you rightly said, we do not yet know the full details of the settlement. I am pleased that you are satisfied that this settlement is acceptable for the forthcoming world trade talks in Cancun. Will you reiterate that, because that important point must be emphasised?

Secondly, I am concerned about the amount of flexibility regarding decoupling. How can the system be reformed effectively if countries are entitled to return to previous payment regimes? What happens if land is abandoned? You have clearly discussed that. As an aside, I am pleased that you attended the discussions in Brussels, and hope that you can attend all such discussions, to represent Wales during this important and sensitive period.

I am also still concerned about degressivity. Although it has been thrown out, I believe that the council will return to that issue, which means cutting these payments in 2007. Can you confirm that? It is important to understand that that may be the case, so I am not sure that this is a good settlement. There is only a short time when it may be stable but, after 2007, cuts may well occur.

Bu ichi godi mater negodiadau Corff Masnach y Byd yn Cancun a hynny'n gwbl briodol. Yr oedd angen i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ddiwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin i sicrhau bod ganddo safbwynt cydlynol a chredadwy yn enwedig ynglŷn â'r UD a'r negodiadau gyda grŵp Cairns yn Cancun. Mae ein setliad yn rhoi'r Undeb Ewropeaidd mewn sefyllfa gryf iawn. Mae Franz Fischler yn fodlon ar y cytundeb. Bydd yn mynd i Cancun i bwysleisio safbwynt yr UE cyn ymddeol fis yn ddiweddarach. Yr UD sy'n gorfod ymateb yn awr. Rhaid inni aros i weld beth yw darpariaethau masnach yr UD. Er mai'r UE oedd yn euog o'r blaen, yr ydym wedi troi'r fantol yn ei herbyn ac, o ganlyniad, mae'n gynnig ardderchog i Gymru a gweddill Ewrop.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch ichi, Weinidog, am gynnig y datganiad hwn ac am ymrwymo i ddadl ar y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhy gynnar ichi ddweud bod hyn yn newyddion da i ffermwyr Cymru, gan na wyddom eto, fel y dywedasoeh yn gywir, fanylion llawn y setliad. Yr wyf yn falch o nodi eich bod yn fodlon bod y setliad hwn yn dderbyniol ar gyfer y trafodaethau arfaethedig ar fasnach y byd yn Cancun. A wnewch nodi hynny eto, gan fod yn rhaid pwysleisio'r pwynt pwysig hwnnw?

Yn ail, pryderaf am faint o hyblygrwydd sydd o ran datgysylltu. Sut y gellir diwygio'r system yn effeithiol os oes hawl gan wledydd i ddychwelyd at gyfundrefnau talu blaenorol? Beth fydd yn digwydd os yw ffermwyr yn gadael y tir? Yn amlwg yr ydych wedi trafod hynny. Gyda llaw, yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi mynychu'r trafodaethau ym Mrwsel, a gobeithiaf y byddwch yn gallu mynychu pob trafodaeth o'r fath, er mwyn cynrychioli Cymru yn ystod y cyfnod pwysig a sensitif hwn.

Pryderaf hefyd am y lleihad cyson fesul blwyddyn yn y cymhorthdal. Er i hynny gael ei wrthod, credaf y bydd y cyngor yn dychwelyd at y mater hwnnw, sy'n golygu torri'r taliadau hyn yn 2007. A allwch gadarnhau hynny? Mae'n bwysig deall y gall hynny ddigwydd, felly nid wyf yn siŵr bod hwn yn setliad da. Efallai mai dim ond am gyfnod byr y bydd yn sefydlog ond, ar ôl

2007, mae'n ddigon posibl y bydd toriadau.

There has always been concern that modulation is just top-slicing. Are you, Minister, happy with the 80 per cent return for member states? Will that provide sufficient funding to implement the broad and shallow scheme that is essential if we are to offset the impact on Welsh agriculture—there will certainly be an impact—of removing production subsidies?

Bu pryder o'r dechrau mai brigdorri yn unig yw modiwlleiddio. A ydych chi, Weinidog, yn fodlon ar y 80 y cant o dderbyniadau a gaiff aelod wladwriaethau? A fydd hynny yn rhoi digon o arian i weithredu'r cynllun eang a bas sy'n hanfodol er mwyn inni wrthbwysu'r effaith—a bydd effaith yn sicr—o ddileu cymorthdaliadau cynhyrchu ar amaethyddiaeth Cymru?

3.10 p.m.

On eliminating red tape, I know that this is a slimmed-down approach. The settlement refers to 18 directives. How will we in the Welsh farming industry see a reduction in red tape? Eliminating red tape has been an aspiration for many years but, like many others, I have not seen it realised. How will it be realised?

O ran cael gwared ar fiwrocratiaeth, gwn fod y ffordd hon o wneud taliadau yn symlach. Cyfeiria'r setliad at 18 o gyfarwydddebau. Sut y bydd biwrocratiaeth yn lleihau i ni yn y diwydiant ffermio yng Nghymru? Bu dyhead i gael gwared ar fiwrocratiaeth ers blynyddoedd maith ond, fel llawer o ddyheadau eraill, nid wyf wedi gweld y dyhead hwnnw yn cael ei wireddu. Sut y caiff ei wireddu?

You said in your statement that the cuts would not take place until 2005, so it will be business as usual in 2004. Does that mean that we will be subject to inordinately late payments, as seen this year?

Dywedasoch yn eich datganiad na fyddai'r toriadau yn digwydd tan 2005, felly ni fydd dim yn newid yn 2004. A yw hynny'n golygu y bydd ein taliadau yn llawer rhy hwyr, fel y digwyddodd eleni?

**Carwyn Jones:** The answer to your last question is 'no'. When I said that it will be business as usual in 2004, I was not implying that it has been business as usual over the last year. However, we have been successful in making payments in the past. As there will be a single farm payment, the amount of paperwork for farmers on retention periods and so on will be greatly reduced. Therefore, this will be a much easier system for farmers.

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr ateb i'ch cwestiwn olaf yw 'nac ydyw'. Pan ddywedais na fydd dim yn newid yn 2004, nid oeddwn yn awgrymu na fu dim anawsterau y llynedd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi llwyddo i wneud taliadau yn y gorffennol. Gan y bydd un taliad i ffermwyr, bydd llawer llai o waith papur i ffermwyr o ran cyfnodau cadw ac ati. Felly, bydd hon yn system llawer haws i ffermwyr.

You are right that we will now be in a much stronger situation in terms of the world trade talks in Cancun. I look forward to representing Wales in Brussels and Luxembourg in future, and I would welcome any offers to pair, if that is possible.

Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud y byddwn mewn sefyllfa llawer cryfach o ran trafodaethau masnach y byd yn Cancun. Edrychaf ymlaen at gynrychioli Cymru ym Mrwsel a Lwcsembwrg yn y dyfodol, a chroesawaf unrhyw gynigion i baru, os yw hynny'n bosibl.

On financial management, it is probably true to say that degressivity has been kicked into touch in the short term, as a financial structure is in place. However, this will be reconsidered in 2007. The fundamental

O ran rheolaeth ariannol, mae'n siŵr o fod yn wir dweud na fydd lleihad cyson fesul blwyddyn yn y cymhorthdal yn y byrdymor, gan fod strwythur ariannol ar waith. Fodd bynnag, caiff hyn ei ailystyried yn 2007. Y

reason for the pressure on the European Union's budget is the accession of 10 member states next year. That could place severe pressure on the budget for the common agricultural policy, which already accounts for 48 per cent of the total EU budget.

On modulation, receiving 80 per cent of receipts is certainly an improvement on the 25 per cent of receipts that we now receive for rural development. The big question is whether the amount that we receive will be larger than that which we now receive in Welsh modulation receipts. The UK will receive 80 per cent of receipts, and it must then work out the allocations for each country in the UK to ensure a fair distribution of modulated receipts. We must ensure that our position is protected. We may be able to access east Anglia's modulation receipts, which we have not been able to do previously. In the past we have been able to spend the modulated funds raised in Wales but we could not access funds elsewhere in the UK. There is a potential for that to happen now, but much more work needs to be done before the outcome is known. The fact that a large country such as the UK will receive 80 per cent of modulated receipts is an immense improvement on what has happened in the past.

**The Presiding Officer:** I inform Members that we are almost out of time for this statement. This is a complicated issue in which I have a great interest, but I will not abuse my position by extending the time available for the statement by more than a few minutes. However, I will call Christine Gwyther, Glyn Davies, and the Chair of the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee.

**Christine Gwyther:** I welcome the statement and I share your hope that this reform will provide clarity and surety and will allow farmers to operate on a firm business footing. We have all wanted that for many years. You mentioned the dairy premium scheme, which is due to start next year. You mentioned that the premium will remain as a production-linked payment until reforms are

rheshw m sylfaenol dros y pwysau ar gyllideb yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yw'r ffaith bod 10 o wledydd yn ymuno â'r undeb y flwyddyn nesaf. Gallai hynny roi pwysau mawr iawn ar y gyllideb o ran y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin, sydd eisoes yn cyfrif am 48 y cant o gyllideb gyfan yr UE.

O ran modiwlleiddio, mae 80 y cant o dderbyniadau yn sicr yn welliant ar y 25 y cant o dderbyniadau a gawn ar hyn o bryd ar gyfer datblygu gwledig. Y cwestiwn mawr yw pa un a fydd y swm y byddwn yn ei gael yn fwy na'r swm a gawn ar hyn o bryd mewn derbyniadau modiwlleiddio i Gymru. Caiff y DU 80 y cant o dderbyniadau, ac yna bydd yn rhaid cyfrifo pob dyraniad ar gyfer pob gwlad yn y DU er mwyn sicrhau y caiff derbyniadau modiwlleiddio eu dyrannu'n deg. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod ein sefyllfa yn ddiogel. Efallai y bydd modd inni gael derbyniadau modiwlleiddio dwyrain Anglia na fu'n bosibl inni eu cael o'r blaen. Yn y gorffennol yr ydym wedi gallu gwario'r arian modiwlleiddio a godwyd yng Nghymru ond ni allem ddefnyddio arian o fannau eraill yn y DU. Mae posibilrwydd y gall hynny ddigwydd erbyn hyn, ond mae angen gwneud llawer mwy o waith cyn inni wybod a oes modd gwneud hynny. Mae'r ffaith y bydd gwlad fawr fel y DU yn cael 80 y cant o dderbyniadau modiwlleiddio yn welliant enfawr ar yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn y gorffennol.

**Y Llywydd:** Hoffwn hysbysu'r Aelodau fod yr amser ar gyfer y datganiad hwn bron ar ben. Mae hwn yn fater cymhleth y mae gennyf ddiddordeb mawr ynddo, ond ni wnaf gamddefnyddio fy safle i ymestyn yr amser sydd ar gael ar gyfer y datganiad drwy roi mwy nag ychydig o funudau. Fodd bynnag, galwaf ar Christine Gwyther, Glyn Davies, a Chadeirydd Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad.

**Christine Gwyther:** Croesawaf y datganiad a rhannaf eich gobaith y daw eglurder a sicrwydd yn sgîl y diwygiad hwn ac y bydd yn fodd i ffermwyr weithredu ar sylfaen fusnes gadarn. Mae pob un ohonom wedi dymuno hynny ers blynnyddoedd lawer. Bu ichi sôn am y cynllun premiwm llaeth, a fydd yn dechrau y flwyddyn nesaf. Bu ichi sôn bod y premiwm yn parhau'n daliad sy'n



implemented in 2008. You also mentioned that, if member states—

gysylltiedig â chynhyrchu hyd nes y caiff y diwygiadau eu rhoi ar waith yn 2008. Bu ichi sôn hefyd, os yw aelod wladwriaethau—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I requested brief questions.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gofynnais am gwestiynau byr.

**Christine Gwyther:** You mentioned that the single farm payment could be implemented on a regional basis, and that the dairy premium could be decoupled before 2008. Can you give us an early indication of your position on decoupling? As I have mentioned previously, dairy farmers operate on a capital-intensive basis, and they will need advance warning if decoupling occurs prior to 2008.

**Christine Gwyther:** Bu ichi sôn y gellid gweithredu un taliad i ffermwyr ar sail ranbarthol, ac y gellid datgysylltu'r premiwm llaeth cyn 2008. A allwch chi roi arwydd cynnar inni beth yw eich barn ar ddatgysylltu? Fel y soniais o'r blaen, mae ffermwyr llaeth yn gweithredu ar sail cyfalaf ddwys, a bydd angen iddynt gael rhybudd ymlaen llaw os caiff y premiwm llaeth ei ddatgysylltu cyn 2008.

**Carwyn Jones:** You are correct. No final decision has been taken as to when and how the partial decoupling will take place in Wales. However, my preliminary view is that we should move towards full decoupling. That is my starting position, as I believe that is right for farming in Wales. However, I emphasise that, if during the course of consultation, problems are identified that make it necessary for us to revise that view in some way, I will listen to any representations put forward by the industry. As a matter of principle, we should start with the view that full decoupling is a good thing for Welsh farming and that we should press ahead with it as quickly as possible.

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr ydych yn iawn. Ni wnaed penderfyniad terfynol ynghylch pryd a sut y caiff taliadau eu datgysylltu'n rhannol yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, fy marn gychwynnol yw y dylem symud tuag at ddatgysylltu llawn. Dyna fy safbwynt cychwynnol, gan y credaf mai dyna'r peth iawn i ffermio yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, pwysleisiaf y byddaf yn gwrandao ar unrhyw sylwadau a gyflwynir gan y diwydiant os nodir problemau, yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad, sy'n ei gwneud yn angenrheidiol inni adolygu'r farn honno mewn unrhyw ffordd. Fel mater o egwyddor, dylem ddechrau drwy fynegi'r farn bod datgysylltu llawn o fudd i ffermio yng Nghymru ac y dylem fwrw ymlaen â hynny mor fuan â phosibl.

**Glyn Davies:** I am surprised that you welcome this proposal so much, bearing in mind the detailed questions that remain. I do not share your confidence that you are properly armed to go into the WTO talks. I have an important question about partial decoupling. On the one hand, you seem proud of the fact that you retain some power to control the issue but, on the other, you say that you want to eliminate it. What will you do if France introduces partial decoupling? It has the potential to create a horrendous mess, but France, and other countries that follow suit, could gain some advantage from introducing it. What will you do if this greatly disadvantages Welsh agriculture?

**Glyn Davies:** Synnaf eich bod yn rhoi cymaint o groeso i'r cynnig hwn, o gofio'r cwestiynau manwl sydd heb eu hateb. Nid wyf yn ffyddiog fel chi eich bod yn barod i fynd i mewn i drafodaethau Corff Masnach y Byd. Mae gennyf gwestiwn pwysig ynglŷn â datgysylltu rhannol. Ar un llaw, ymddengys eich bod yn falch o'r ffaith eich bod yn cadw ychydig o bŵer i reoli'r mater ond, ar y llaw arall, dywedwch eich bod am gael gwared ohono. Beth a wnewch os bydd Ffrainc yn cyflwyno datgysylltu rhannol? Mae'r potensial ganddi i greu anhrefn llwyr, ond gallai Ffrainc, a gwledydd eraill sy'n ei dilyn, gael rhywfaint o fantais os cyflwynant hynny. Beth a wnewch os bydd amaethyddiaeth Cymru o dan anfantais fawr o'r herwydd?

**Carwyn Jones:** If France keeps partial

**Carwyn Jones:** Os bydd Ffrainc yn parhau â

decoupling for as long as it can, its own farmers will be greatly disadvantaged. French farming unions have moved from being dead against decoupling to a position where they are willing to accept it as long as it is full decoupling. That is the intelligence that we received last week. Partial decoupling creates phenomenal bureaucracy. The worst possible outcome would be partial decoupling across Europe, which would lead to confusion among farmers.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Gan y byddwn yn dychwelyd at y mater hwn yn y dyfodol, cyfeiriaf yn fyr at y cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol y bu ichi sôn amdanynt a'r pryderon yn eu cylch. Ni ddeallais eich sylwadau yn union—dywedasoeh y byddai mwy o arian yn dychwelyd i Brydain ar gyfer cynlluniau fel Tir Gofal, ond yr oeddech yn ansicr a fyddai'r swm a ddeuai i Gymru yn fwy neu yn llai. A allwch chi roi sicrwydd y byddwn yn denu'r swm mwyaf posibl o arian Ewropeaidd ar gyfer y cynlluniau hyn yn y dyfodol, neu a ydwyf yn iawn i gredu eich bod yn awgrymu bod y cyfan yn y gwynt?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'r holl beth yn dibynnu ar y mecanwaith a ddefnyddir i rannu'r cyfanswm a ddaw yn ôl i'r Deyrnas Unedig a'r gyfran y bydd pob gwlad yn ei derbyn. Bydd holl Weinidogion perthnasol Prydain Fawr yn ystyried ac yn dadlau'r mater. Unwaith y byddwn yn gwybod pa fecanwaith a ddefnyddir i ddosbarthu'r arian, gallaf ddweud faint y bydd Cymru'n ei dderbyn er mwyn inni allu symud ymlaen.

datgysylltu rhannol cyhyd ag y bo modd, bydd ei ffermwyr ei hun o dan anfantais fawr. Mae undebau amaethwyr Ffrainc wedi newid eu safbwynt o fod yn erbyn datgysylltu i sefyllfa lle maent yn barod i'w dderbyn ar yr amod bod datgysylltu llawn. Dyna'r wybodaeth a gawsom yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae datgysylltu rhannol yn creu biwrocratiaeth aruthrol. Y canlyniad gwaethaf posibl fyddai datgysylltu rhannol ar draws Ewrop, a fyddai'n peri dryswch ymhlith ffermwyr.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** As we will return to this issue in the future, I will refer briefly to the agri-environmental schemes that you mentioned and the concerns surrounding them. I did not fully understand your comments—you said that more money would be returned to Britain for schemes such as Tir Gofal, but that you could not be sure whether Wales would receive more or less funding. Can you give an assurance that we will attract the highest possible level of European funding for these schemes in future, or am I right in thinking that you are suggesting that this matter is still up in the air?

**Carwyn Jones:** The whole issue depends on the mechanism that will be used to distribute the total amount to be returned to the United Kingdom and the share allocated to each country. All the relevant Ministers in Great Britain will consider and debate the matter. As soon as we know what mechanism will be used to distribute funds, I will be able to tell you how much Wales will receive so that we can move forward.

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Kirsty Williams:** I raise a point of order under Standing Order No. 29.3, which states that

'If the Assembly resolves to instruct a Minister by way of a motion tabled under paragraph 29.2, that Minister shall as soon as may be prepare a draft Order'.

You will be aware that, on 4 February 2003, the Assembly resolved to instruct the

**Kirsty Williams:** Codaf bwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3, sy'n datgan

'Os yw'r Cynulliad yn penderfynu cyfarwyddo Gweinidog drwy gynnig a gyflwynir o dan baragraff 29.2, bydd y Gweinidog hwnnw, cyn gynted ag y bo modd, yn paratoi Gorchymyn drafft'.

Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod y Cynulliad, ar 4 Chwefror 2003, wedi penderfynu

Minister for Health and Social Services to bring forward a draft Order that would ensure that those suffering from chronic long-term illnesses would receive free prescriptions. The guidance accompanying Standing Order 29 states that

‘If the Assembly so resolves, the Assembly Minister shall bring forward the draft Order within a period of 3 months from the date of the Assembly resolution. If the Assembly Minister fails to meet this deadline then he or she must provide the Assembly with an explanation as to the delay and state when the draft Order will be ready.’

I am sure that you would agree that a period of more than three months, even with the Assembly elections, has passed since the Assembly made the resolution on 4 February. I have asked the Business Minister repeatedly to make time for the Minister for Health and Social Services to bring forward this Order. To date, that request has not been fulfilled. Will you rule on whether a breach of Standing Orders has occurred in this instance?

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to you for giving me advance notice of this point of order. As a result, I have been able to confirm that a no named day motion in accordance with Standing Order No. 29 was tabled on 20 December 2002 and was passed in Plenary on 4 February. Standing Orders prescribe that, if a motion under Standing Order No. 29 is approved by the Assembly,

‘that Minister shall as soon as may be prepare a draft Order (or other instrument),’

as appropriate. There is no definite timescale in the Standing Order, but the published guidance relating to Standing Order No. 29 goes further and specifies, as you have quoted, that the Minister should bring forward the Order within three months. The guidance was approved by myself as Presiding Officer in January 2000, following

cyfarwyddo’r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i gyflwyno Gorchymyn drafft a fyddai’n sicrhau y byddai pobl sy’n dioddef o salwch cronig hirdymor yn cael presgripsiynau am ddim. Noda’r canllawiau sy’n cyd-fynd â Rheol Sefydlog 29

‘Os bydd y Cynulliad yn penderfynu felly, bydd y Gweinidog Cynulliad yn dod â’r Gorchymyn drafft gerbron o fewn cyfnod o 3 mis o ddyddiad penderfyniad y Cynulliad. Os bydd y Gweinidog Cynulliad yn methu â gwneud hyn o fewn yr amser bydd rhaid i’r Gweinidog hwnnw esbonio i’r Cynulliad y rhesymau am yr oedi a dweud pryd fydd y Gorchymyn drafft yn barod.’

Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno bod cyfnod o fwy na thri mis, hyd yn oed gan gynnwys etholiadau’r Cynulliad, wedi mynd heibio ers i’r Cynulliad wneud y penderfyniad ar 4 Chwefror. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i’r Trefnydd dro ar ôl tro i neilltuo amser i’r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol gyflwyno’r Gorchymyn hwn. Hyd yma, ni chyflawnwyd y cais hwnnw. A wnewch chi ddyfarnu pa un a dorrwyd y Rheolau Sefydlog yn yr achos hwn?

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am roi rhybudd ymlaen llaw imi ynglŷn â’r pwynt hwn o drefn. O ganlyniad, yr wyf wedi gallu cadarnhau i gynnig heb ddyddiad trafod gael ei gyflwyno, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29, ar 20 Rhagfyr 2002, ac a dderbyniwyd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 4 Chwefror. Mae Rheolau Sefydlog yn pennu, os bydd y Cynulliad yn cymeradwyo cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29,

‘y bydd y Gweinidog cyn gynted ag y bo modd yn paratoi Gorchymyn drafft (neu offeryn arall),’

fel y bo’n briodol. Nid oes amserlen benodol yn y Rheol Sefydlog, ond mae’r canllawiau cyhoeddiedig sy’n ymwneud â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29 yn fanylach ac yn nodi, fel y bu ichi ddyfynnu ohoni, y dylai’r Gweinidog fod wedi cyflwyno’r Gorchymyn o fewn tri mis. Fel Llywydd cymeradwyais y canllawiau ym mis Ionawr 2000, ar ôl

consultations with the Business Committee. However, it has not been approved formally by Plenary. I confirm that that is the position.

ymgyngori â'r Pwyllgor Busnes. Fodd bynnag, nis cymeradwywyd yn ffurfiol mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. Cadarnhaf mai dyna yw'r sefyllfa.

3.20 p.m.

**Kirsty Williams:** Further to that point of order, do you agree therefore that there has been a breach of Standing Orders? I ask for your guidance on how I can ensure that the will of the Assembly, as stated on 4 February, is enacted.

**Kirsty Williams:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, a gytunwch felly i Reol Sefydlog gael ei thorri? Gofynnaf am eich arweiniad ar sut y gallaf sicrhau bod ewyllys y Cynulliad, fel y'i nodwyd ar 4 Chwefror yn cael ei rhoi ar waith.

**The Presiding Officer:** There is no breach of Standing Orders. As far as I can see, the guidance has not been complied with, but, as I made clear, that guidance has been approved by myself, and is therefore guidance, but has not been approved by Plenary. However, the position is as you have set it out.

**Y Llywydd:** Ni thorwyd y Rheolau Sefydlog. Hyd y gwelaf, ni chydymffurfiwyd â'r canllawiau, ond, fel yr eglurais, yr wyf wedi cymeradwyo'r canllawiau hynny, ac felly canllawiau ydynt, ond nis cymeradwywyd mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. Fodd bynnag, mae'r sefyllfa fel y'i nodwyd gennych.

**David Davies:** Further to that point of order, is it therefore in order for the Assembly to vote on whether or not that guidance that you set out should become the will of the Assembly? Clearly, the spirit of the Standing Orders has been broken, if not the letter.

**David Davies:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, a yw mewn trefn felly i'r Cynulliad bleidleisio pa un a ddylai'r canllawiau hynny ichi eu nodi ddod yn ewyllys y Cynulliad ai peidio? Yn amlwg, aethpwyd yn groes i ysbryd y Rheolau Sefydlog, os nad llythyren y rheolau.

**The Presiding Officer:** There is no difference—and I speak as a former literary scholar—between the spirit and the letter of anything. I go by the letter; that is the only way in which I can operate. If the Assembly wishes to approve guidance, then that must be done by means of a motion, which would be tabled by the Business Committee and proposed, normally under Standing Orders, by the Business Minister. If the Business Committee wishes to discuss this matter further, it can do so.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oes gwahaniaeth—a siaradaf fel cyn-ysgolhaig llenyddol—rhwng ysbryd a llythyren unrhyw beth. Ufuddhaf i'r llythyren; dyna'r unig ffordd y gallaf weithredu. Os hoffai'r Cynulliad gymeradwyo canllawiau, rhaid gwneud hynny drwy gynnig, a fyddai'n cael ei gyflwyno gan y Pwyllgor Busnes a'i gynnig, fel arfer o dan y Rheolau Sefydlog, gan y Trefnydd. Os hoffai'r Pwyllgor Busnes drafod y mater hwn ymhellach, gall wneud hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** Further to that point of order, this is a serious issue and I am sure that the Minister for Health and Social Services would not want to fall foul of the guidelines. Given that she is present, can she give us an idea of when she intends to bring this forward? Clearly, we are in danger of falling foul of our guidelines, which is not desirable. Can Jane Hutt give us an indication of her

**Nick Bourne:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, mae hwn yn fater difrifol ac yr wyf yn siŵr na hoffai'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithas fynd yn groes i'r canllawiau. O gofio ei bod yn bresennol, a all roi amcan inni pryd y bwriada gyflwyno hyn? Yn amlwg, yr ydym mewn perygl o fynd yn groes i'n canllawiau, ac nid ydym am wneud hynny. A all Jane Hutt roi amcan inni o'i

thoughts on this issue?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not wish to prolong this matter. However, given that the Business Committee has approved the guidance, I assume that it has the agreement of all parties represented on that Committee, which means all parties in the Assembly.

**Glyn Davies:** Further to that point of order, I also think that this is an important issue for all of us. I would like to clarify a matter in relation to your interpretation of the Standing Orders. Should the Government decide that a matter is so difficult that it will not bring it forward at any stage, can it, in contempt of us, and of guidelines, do that for an entire Assembly?

**The Presiding Officer:** We have rehearsed the point and established the facts. I cannot add much to that.

**Alun Cairns:** Further to that point of order, what action is available to Assembly Members when the Government fails to react to motions that are carried in Plenary, and when a vote has been cast and a mandate has been demanded of the Government? Surely this brings the Assembly into disrepute in that, when demands are placed on the Government, it is not prepared to act according to the vote.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. No-one is bringing the Assembly into disrepute yet.

**Brian Gibbons:** Further to that point of order, my comment will probably not be helpful, but Kirsty spoke about lifelong conditions, and one of the problems is that it is impossible to define what that means. The practicality—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It is not for me to reopen the debate on the substance of a motion that has been carried by the Assembly. I have been somewhat concerned during the first and second Assembly that this Standing Order does not provide as effective a means for private Members' motions, business and Bills—to use the equivalent Westminster terminology—as I would have liked. It is important, in that sense, that the

syniadau am y mater hwn?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid wyf am rygnu ar y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, o gofio bod y Pwyllgor Busnes wedi cymeradwyo'r canllawiau, tybiaf fod ganddo gytundeb pob plaid a gynrychiolir ar y Pwyllgor hwnnw, sy'n golygu pob plaid yn y Cynulliad.

**Glyn Davies:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, credaf innau hefyd fod hwn yn fater pwysig i bob un ohonom. Hoffwn gael eglurhad ynglŷn ag un mater yn ymwneud â'ch dehongliad o'r Rheolau Sefydlog. Pe bai'r Llywodraeth yn penderfynu bod mater mor anodd fel na fydd yn ei gyflwyno o gwbl, a all wneud hynny am dymor llawn y Cynulliad, gan ein dirmygu ni a'r canllawiau?

**Y Llywydd:** Yr ydym wedi trafod y pwynt ac wedi cadarnhau'r ffeithiau. Ni allaf ychwanegu llawer at hynny.

**Alun Cairns:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, pa gamau y gall Aelodau'r Cynulliad eu cymryd pan fydd y Llywodraeth yn methu ag ymateb i gynigion a dderbyniwyd mewn Cyfarfod Llawn, a phan fo pleidlais wedi'i bwrw a phan fo mandad wedi'i roi i'r Llywodraeth? Onid yw hyn yn dwyn anfri ar y Cynulliad, yn yr ystyr nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn barod i weithredu yn unol â'r bleidlais pan fo gofyn iddi.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes neb yn dwyn anfri ar y Cynulliad eto.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, ni fydd fy sylwadau o gymorth fwy na thebyg, ond soniodd Kirsty am gyflyrau gydol oes, ac un o'r problemau a gyfyd yw nad oes modd diffinio beth yw ystyr hynny. Y broblem ymarferol—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid mater i mi yw ailagor y ddadl ar sylwedd cynnig a dderbyniwyd gan y Cynulliad. Bûm yn bryderus braidd yn ystod y Cynulliad cyntaf, a'r ail, nad yw'r Rheol Sefydlog hon yn fodd mor effeithiol ag y byddwn wedi hoffi i ganiatáu i Aelodau gyflwyno cynigion, busnes a Mesurau preifat—â defnyddio terminoleg San Steffan. Mae'n bwysig, o ran hynny, y cydymffurfir â'r Rheol Sefydlog yn

Standing Order is complied with according to the guidance. I cannot say more at this stage.

**David Davies:** Further to that point of order, I also put on record that we have yet to see any legislation from the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning on—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. We are not discussing the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning.

**Michael German:** Further to that point of order, you have clearly ruled that guidance and Standing Orders which applied in the first Assembly still apply in the second. That being the case, and since the motion was carried in the first Assembly, a response from the Government is required. I ask you to rule on whether such an announcement is therefore required by the guidance, which has been agreed by all parties, whether or not the Government wanted to pursue the matter.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am able to respond—[*Interruption.*]. Order. It is not appropriate to interrupt when I am trying to provide a reasonable and balanced answer on this issue.

**Alun Cairns:** I apologise.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful.

I have ruled that guidance, motions relating to guidance, the actions of the previous Business Committee, and any relevant motions that have been carried by the first Assembly, are still in force in the second Assembly, unless there has been further discussion in the Business Committee and a further view taken. On issues such as this, where there is a carry over from one Assembly to the other, it is important that that carry over should happen.

**Leighton Andrews:** Point of order. I seek your guidance, as the enforcer of the right of Assembly Members to make representations on behalf of their constituents, on what is a reasonable time for Assembly Members to expect to wait for responses from local authorities or Assembly sponsored public

unol â'r canllawiau. Ni allaf ddweud rhagor ar hyn o bryd.

**David Davies:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, hoffwn hefyd gofnodi nad ydym wedi gweld unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes hyd yma ynglŷn â—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid ydym yn trafod y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes.

**Michael German:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, yr ydych yn amlwg wedi dyfarnu bod canllawiau a Rheolau Sefydlog a oedd yn gymwys yn y Cynulliad cyntaf, yn dal i fod yn gymwys yn yr ail. Gan mai dyna yw'r sefyllfa, a chan fod y cynnig wedi'i dderbyn yn y Cynulliad cyntaf, mae angen i'r Llywodraeth ymateb. Gofynnaf ichi ddyfarnu a oes angen cyhoeddiad o fath felly o dan y canllawiau, y cytunwyd arnynt gan bob plaid, pa un a yw'r Llywodraeth am weithredu ar y mater hwn ai peidio.

**Y Llywydd:** Gallaf ymateb—[*Torri ar draws*]. Trefn. Nid yw'n briodol torri ar draws a minnau'n ceisio rhoi ateb rhesymol a chytbwys ar y mater hwn.

**Alun Cairns:** Ymddiheuraf.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar.

Yr wyf wedi dyfarnu bod canllawiau, cynigion yn ymwneud â chanllawiau, gweithredoedd y Pwyllgor Busnes blaenorol, ac unrhyw gynigion perthnasol a dderbyniwyd yn ystod y Cynulliad cyntaf, yn dal mewn grym yn yr ail Gynulliad, oni bai bod y Pwyllgor Busnes wedi trafod ymhellach ac wedi dod i gasgliad arall. Ar faterion o'r fath, lle mae trosglwyddo o un Cynulliad i'r llall, mae'n bwysig i hynny ddigwydd.

**Leighton Andrews:** Pwynt o drefn. Gofynnaf am eich arweiniad, gan mai chi sy'n gorfodi hawl Aelodau'r Cynulliad i wneud sylwadau ar ran eu hetholwyr, ynghylch faint o amser sy'n rhesymol i Aelodau'r Cynulliad aros am atebion oddi wrth awdurdodau lleol neu gyrff cyhoeddus a

bodies. I have waited nearly two months for a reply from a senior officer of Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council, and in the case of one ASPB, nearly six weeks.

**The Presiding Officer:** I do not have direct authority over correspondence, but when an ASPB is contacted by an Assembly Member, I assume that that Member is contacting that body in the pursuance of his or her role of scrutiny, whether formally, as in Committee, or informally. I would therefore urge our ASPBs to show courtesy by responding as soon as possible, and, indeed, by giving priority to correspondence from Assembly Members. The same would apply to local authorities. I regularly e-mail Conwy County Borough Council and Gwynedd Council, and they respond quicker when I do so.

The Business Minister wished to speak on the previous point of order, but I did not see her. I call her now.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I wish to note that I will raise the guidance issue in the Business Committee next week.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you. We will move on.

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Porthiant (Samplu a Dadansoddi), Porthiant (Gorfodi)  
a Phorthiant (Sefydliadau a Chyfyngwyr) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003  
Approval of the Feeding Stuffs (Sampling and Analysis), the Feeding Stuffs  
(Enforcement) and the Feeding Stuffs (Establishments and Intermediaries)  
(Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Feeding Stuffs (Sampling and Analysis), the Feeding Stuffs (Enforcement) and the Feeding Stuffs (Establishments and Intermediaries) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 17 June 2003. (NDM1526)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

noddir gan y Cynulliad. Bu imi aros bron deufis am ateb gan un o uwch swyddogion Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf, ac yn achos un CCNC, bron chwe wythnos.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oes gennyf awdurdod uniongyrchol dros ohebiaeth, ond pan fydd Aelod Cynulliad yn cysylltu â CCNC, cymeraf fod yr Aelod yn cysylltu â'r corff hwnnw yng nghyd-destun ei rôl graffu, boed hynny yn ffurfiol, fel aelod o Bwyllgor, neu'n anffurfiol. Felly apelïaf ar y CCNC i fod yn gwrtais drwy ymateb mor fuan â phosibl, ac, yn wir, drwy roi blaenoriaeth i ohebiaeth gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Byddai hynny'n wir hefyd am awdurdodau lleol. Yr wyf yn anfon negeseuon e-bost at Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy a Chyngor Gwynedd yn rheolaidd, ac maent yn ymateb yn gyflymach pan wnaif hynny.

Yr oedd y Trefnydd am siarad ar y pwynt o drefn blaenorol, ond nis gwelais. Fe'i galwaf yn awr.

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Hoffwn nodi y byddaf yn codi mater y canllawiau yn y Pwyllgor Busnes yr wythnos nesaf.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch yn fawr. Symudwn ymlaen.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddorion Rheoliadau Porthiant (Samplu a Dadansoddi), Porthiant (Gorfodi) a Phorthiant (Sefydliadau a Chyfyngwyr) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Mehefin 2003. (NDM1526)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Feeding Stuffs (Sampling and Analysis), the Feeding Stuffs (Enforcement) and the Feeding Stuffs (Establishments and Intermediaries) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 24 June 2003; and

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 17 June 2003 and the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 17 June 2003. (NDM1527)

These regulations will implement European Commission directive 2002/70, and introduce community-wide criteria for the testing of animal feeding stuffs for the presence of dioxins and dioxin-like polychlorinated biphenyls. Dioxins are ever-present substances produced during various combustion and incineration processes. They are also unwanted by-products in the manufacture of certain chemicals. PCBs are man-made contaminants that have been used since the early 1930s, mainly in electrical equipment. Their manufacture and general use stopped in the 1970s and is no longer permitted in the UK. Both dioxins and PCBs are persistent organic pollutants that degrade slowly and are therefore widespread in the environment. They are known to accumulate in the food and feed chain. Current levels of dioxin and PCB contamination generally reflect historical emissions.

In 1998, elevated levels of dioxins were found in citrus pulp pellets imported from Brazil. In 1999, it was discovered that recovered vegetable oils intended for use in Belgian animal feed had been mixed with transformer oil. That prompted the European Commission to introduce maximum permitted levels for dioxins in a range of feed materials. In July 2002, the National Assembly approved legislation for Wales that

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Porthiant (Samplu a Dadansoddi), Porthiant (Gorfodi) a Phorthiant (Sefydliadau a Chyfyngwyr) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Mehefin 2003; ac sydd

2. yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Mehefin 2003 a'r Arfarniad Rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Mehefin 2003. (NDM1527)

Bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn gweithredu cyfarwydddeb 2002/70 y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, ac yn cyflwyno meini prawf i'r gymuned gyfan ar gyfer profi porthiant anifeiliaid i ganfod a oes diocsinau a biffenylau polyclorinedig tebyg i ddiocsinau yn bresennol. Mae diocsinau yn sylweddau sydd bob amser yn bresennol ac fe'u cynhyrchir yn ystod amryw brosesau hyllogi a llosgi. Maent hefyd yn is-gynnyrch nas dymunir wrth gynhyrchu rhai cemegolion. Mae biffenylau polyclorinedig yn ddifwynwyr gwneuthuredig a ddefnyddiwyd ers dechrau'r 1930au, a hynny yn bennaf mewn offer trydanol. Rhoddwyd y gorau i'w cynhyrchu a'u defnyddio'n eang yn yr 1970au ac ni chaniateir hynny mwyach yn y DU. Mae diocsinau a biffenylau polyclorinedig yn llygrwyr organig parhaus sy'n dirywio'n araf ac felly sydd ar gael yn gyffredin yn yr amgylchedd. Gwyddys eu bod yn cronni yn y gadwyn fwyd a phorthiant. Mae lefelau presennol difwyno o ganlyniad i ddiocsinau a biffenylau polyclorinedig yn gyffredinol yn adlewyrchu natur gollyngiadau yn y gorffennol.

Yn 1998, canfuwyd lefelau uchel o ddiocsinau mewn peledi mwydion sitrws a fewnforiwyd o Frasil. Yn 1999, canfuwyd bod olew llyisiau wedi'u hadfer y bwriadwyd eu defnyddio mewn porthiant anifeiliaid yng Ngwlad Belg wedi'u cymysgu ag olew trawsffurfwyr. Bu hynny'n ysgogiad i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd gyflwyno uchafswm lefelau o ddiocsinau a ganiateir mewn amrywiaeth o borthiant. Ym mis Gorffennaf



transposed the requirements of the European council directive setting these limits. The European Commission is also considering setting maximum limits for dioxin-like PCBs in feed.

2002, cymeradwywyd deddfwriaeth i Gymru gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a drawsosododd ofynion cyfarwyddeb y Cyngor Ewropeaidd sy'n pennu'r terfynau hyn. Mae'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd hefyd yn ystyried pennu terfynau ar gyfer lefel uchaf biffenylau polychlorinedig tebyg i ddiocsinau mewn porthiant.

3.30 p.m.

The regulations before you today implement an EC directive. These regulations complement existing legislation by introducing statutory procedures for how samples are to be prepared, analysed and reported upon. These regulations will help to reduce inconsistencies in the sampling and analysis of feeding stuffs for dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs and remove uncertainty or dispute in the interpretation of results, benefiting the industry and consumers. The measures set out in the proposed regulations relate to the enforcement of existing legislation and, as a consequence, businesses are unlikely to be directly affected by it.

Mae'r rheoliadau sydd ger eich bron heddiw yn gweithredu cyfarwyddeb y CE. Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn ategu'r ddeddfwriaeth bresennol drwy gyflwyno gweithdrefnau statudol ynghylch sut y dylid paratoi, dadansoddi a chyflwyno adroddiadau ar samplau. Bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn helpu i wneud y broses o samplu a dadansoddi porthiant i ganfod diocsinau a biffenylau polychlorinedig tebyg i ddiocsinau yn fwy cyson ac yn dileu ansicrwydd neu anghytuno wrth ddehongli canlyniadau, a fydd o fudd i'r diwydiant a'r defnyddiwr. Mae'r mesurau a nodir yn y rheoliadau arfaethedig yn ymwneud â gorfodi'r ddeddfwriaeth bresennol ac, o ganlyniad, mae'n annhebyg y bydd yn effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar fusnesau.

The main impact of compliance will be felt by enforcement authorities—the local authorities—and the laboratories. I am aware that the cost of analysis for dioxins is substantial, averaging £1,000 per sample. However, the number of samples and the frequency of sampling are not prescribed in the proposed legislation; that will be a matter for local authorities, depending upon circumstances. For example, an authority may have reason to believe that a batch of animal feedstuffs is worthy of further investigation. Some local authorities may rarely need to exercise these powers but, in recognition of the potential costs, we have made funds available to all local authorities in this year's revenue support grant. The £110,000 that has been made available roughly equates to the analysis of five samples per local authority per year. The Food Standards Agency monitors local authorities' enforcement of animal feeding stuffs legislation and it will keep under review the impact on local authorities of the requirements of this legislation.

Ar yr awdurdodau gorfodi—yr awdurdodau lleol—a'r labordai y bydd prif effaith cydymffurfio. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod y gost o ddadansoddi diocsinau yn sylweddol, sef, ar gyfartaledd, £1,000 fesul sampl. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r ddeddfwriaeth arfaethedig yn rhagnodi nifer y samplau na pha mor aml y dylid samplu; bydd hynny'n fater i'r awdurdodau lleol, yn dibynnu ar yr amgylchiadau. Er enghraifft, efallai fod gan awdurdod reswm dros gredu ei bod yn werth ymchwilio ymhellach i swp penodol o borthiant anifeiliaid. Efallai mai anaml y bydd angen i rai awdurdodau lleol arfer y pwerau hyn ond, gan gydnabod y costau posibl, yr ydym wedi neilltuo arian ar gyfer pob awdurdod lleol yng ngrant cynnal refeniw eleni. Mae'r £110,000 a sicrhawyd yn cyfateb yn fras i gostau pob awdurdod lleol yn dadansoddi pum sampl y flwyddyn. Mae'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd yn monitro sut y mae awdurdodau lleol yn gorfodi deddfwriaeth ar borthiant anifeiliaid a bydd yn parhau i adolygu effaith gofynion y ddeddfwriaeth hon ar awdurdodau lleol.

**Brynle Williams:** The motion before us this afternoon seeks Members' approval of the feeding stuffs regulations. It is a sensible proposal that states that there will be agreed European Community criteria for the testing of animal feeding stuffs for the presence of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs. It is important that the regulations lay out the requirements for laboratories, sample preparation, analytical procedures and the reporting of the results.

Until recently, there was no legal limit to the level of dioxins that could be present in animal feeding stuffs or food for human consumption, therefore analysis was not required. Everyone should welcome this change in policy. It will provide data that can be used to assess the levels of dioxins, with a view to possibly revising legislation in future if necessary. I note that no small businesses responded to the consultation. It is important to consult widely, using as many means as possible—the telephone, internet, post or face-to-face—to encourage more people to take part. This could perhaps be considered for future consultations.

Local authorities have stated that they are concerned about the lack of money available to undertake sampling. We need to liaise with local authorities to see whether they can exercise their duties within the funding that has been made available; if they cannot, then the National Assembly must reconsider the funding arrangements. I am content with the regulations, and hope that you will take my comments and suggestions on board.

**Mick Bates:** These regulations only apply in Wales, I believe. We all welcome this testing programme. However, no matter how good the regulation is and how much we welcome it, I would like you to confirm, Minister, that sufficient funding will be available to ensure that the tests take place. I am aware that the testing equipment is expensive—you mentioned a cost of £1,000 per sample—therefore you must assure us that testing will be done and that there is sufficient capital

**Brynle Williams:** Mae'r cynnig sydd ger ein bron y prynhawn yma yn gofyn i'r Aelodau gymeradwyo'r rheoliadau porthiant. Mae'n gynnig synhwyrol sy'n nodi y bydd meini prawf y cytunwyd arnynt gan y Gymuned Ewropeaidd ar gyfer profi porthiant anifeiliaid i ganfod a oes diocsinau a biffenylau polychlorinedig tebyg i ddiocsinau yn bresennol. Mae'n bwysig bod y rheoliadau yn nodi'r hyn a ddisgwylir gan labordai, a gofynion paratoi samplau, gweithdrefnau dadansoddi a rhoi adroddiadau ar y canlyniadau.

Tan yn ddiweddar, nid oedd terfyn cyfreithiol ar lefel y diocsinau a allai fod yn bresennol mewn porthiant anifeiliaid neu fwyd ar gyfer lluniaeth dynol, felly nid oedd angen dadansoddi samplau. Dylai pawb groesawu'r newid hwn i'r polisi. Bydd yn rhoi data y gellir ei ddefnyddio i asesu lefelau diocsinau, gyda'r bwriad o ddiwygio deddfwriaeth yn y dyfodol o bosibl yn ôl yr angen. Nodaf nad ymatebodd unrhyw fusnesau bach i'r ymgynghoriad. Mae'n bwysig ymgynghori'n eang, gan ddefnyddio cymaint o ffyrdd â phosibl—dros y ffôn, y rhyngwyd, drwy'r post neu wyneb yn wyneb—er mwyn annog mwy o bobl i gymryd rhan. Efallai y gellid ystyried hyn ar gyfer ymgynghoriadau yn y dyfodol.

Nododd awdurdodau lleol eu bod yn pryderu nad oes digon o arian ar gael i ymgymryd â'r gwaith samplu. Mae angen inni gysylltu ag awdurdodau lleol i weld a allant gyflawni eu dyletswyddau gyda'r arian sydd ar gael; os na allant, yna rhaid i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ailystyried y trefniadau ariannu. Yr wyf yn fodlon ar y rheoliadau, a gobeithiaf y byddwch yn ystyried fy sylwadau a'm hawgrymiadau.

**Mick Bates:** Credaf mai dim ond i Gymru y mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn gymwys. Mae pob un ohonom yn croesawu'r rhaglen brofi hon. Fodd bynnag, waeth pa mor dda y mae'r rheoliad, a waith faint o groeso a roddwn iddo, hoffwn pe baech yn cadarnhau, Weinidog, y bydd digon o arian ar gael er mwyn sicrhau y caiff y profion eu cynnal. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod yr offer profi yn gostus—bu ichi sôn am gost o £1,000 fesul sampl—felly rhaid ichi roi sicrwydd inni y

funding available to ensure that laboratories in Wales can undertake this work.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek):** I rise not to talk about the political impact of these regulations, but to talk about procedure. The Legislation Committee considers procedure and every statutory instrument, and I hope that it will consider regulatory appraisals, to ensure that they fulfil the requirements of the Government of Wales Act 1998. The Business Committee meets to consider the procedure to examine each statutory instrument in detail. Part of its job is to advise me on what route a statutory instrument should take before it comes before Plenary and is made. That has placed me in a quandary, because Standing Orders state that the Business Committee should meet in private. That does not necessarily mean that all papers or minutes must be private. Minutes are in fact published, but they are published six weeks after the meeting, and we are discussing this legislation two weeks after it was raised in the Business Committee, and therefore before the minutes are published. I would risk being ruled out of order if I were to quote from as yet unpublished minutes. I will raise that matter in the Business Committee next Tuesday because it is a dilemma. Standing Orders state that the Business Committee meets in private, therefore I cannot comment on documents that I do not think should be confidential, but which have been treated as confidential until now. Should we therefore be debarred from repeating anything that has been agreed in the Business Committee's final minutes before they are published? I think not: we must have all the information available to us in Plenary before we decide how to vote on any piece of legislation. That must be the principal concern.

I want to refer to this particular instrument, because there were irregularities in it. However, I will do so in such a way as to avoid being ruled out of order for divulging what happened in the Business Committee. Having said that, the Business Committee

caiff profion eu cynnal a bod digon o arian cyfalaf ar gael er mwyn sicrhau y gall labordai yng Nghymru ymgymryd â'r gwaith hwn.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek):** Codaf ar fy nhraed i siarad am weithdrefn yn hytrach nag effaith wleidyddol y rheoliadau hyn. Mae'r Pwyllgor Deddfau yn ystyried gweithdrefn a phob offeryn statudol, a gobeithiaf y bydd yn ystyried arfarniadau rheoliadol, er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn cyflawni gofynion Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Mae'r Pwyllgor Busnes yn cyfarfod i ystyried y weithdrefn ar gyfer archwilio pob offeryn statudol yn fanwl. Rhan o'i waith yw dweud wrthyf pa lwybr y dylai offeryn statudol ei ddilyn cyn iddo gael ei gyflwyno gerbron y Cyfarfod Llawn a'i dderbyn. Mae hynny wedi achosi penbleth imi, gan fod y Rheolau Sefydlog yn nodi y dylai'r Pwyllgor Busnes gyfarfod yn breifat. Nid yw hynny yn golygu o reidrwydd bod yn rhaid i bob papur a chofnod fod yn breifat. Yn wir, cyhoeddir y cofnodion, ond fe'u cyhoeddir chwe wythnos ar ôl y cyfarfod, ac yr ydym yn trafod y ddeddfwriaeth hon bythefnos ar ôl iddi gael ei chodi yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, ac felly cyn i'r cofnodion gael eu cyhoeddi. Byddai perygl o ddyfarniad yn fy erbyn am fod allan o drefn pe bawn yn dyfynnu o gofnodion nas cyhoeddwyd eto. Codaf y mater hwnnw yn y Pwyllgor Busnes ddydd Mawrth nesaf am ei fod yn achosi penbleth. Noda'r Rheolau Sefydlog fod y Pwyllgor Busnes yn cyfarfod yn breifat, felly, ni allaf wneud sylwadau ar ddogfennau na ddylent fod yn rhai cyfrinachol yn fy marn i, ond sydd wedi cael eu trin fel dogfennau cyfrinachol hyd yma. Felly a ddylem gael ein gwahardd rhag ailadrodd unrhyw beth y cytunwyd arno yng nghofnodion terfynol y Pwyllgor Busnes cyn iddynt gael eu cyhoeddi? Na ddylem, yn fy marn i: rhaid i'r holl wybodaeth fod ar gael inni mewn Cyfarfod Llawn cyn inni benderfynu sut i bleidleisio ar unrhyw ddarn o ddeddfwriaeth. Rhaid mai hynny yw'r prif fater.

Hoffwn gyfeirio at yr offeryn penodol hwn, am fod pethau afreoleidd ynddo. Fodd bynnag, gwnaf hynny yn y fath fodd fel na ellid dyfarnu fy mod allan o drefn am ddatgelu'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn y Pwyllgor Busnes. Wedi dweud hynny, mae angen i'r

needs to discuss this issue, and I will put the matter on the agenda for next Tuesday's meeting. After the recent meeting of the Business Committee, I had to decide what route this legislation should take. We have heard from Brynle and Mick that there is nothing wrong with this legislation. However, there is the matter of additional funding. The Government laid information before me to the effect that there were no additional costs to this legislation, when that was patently not true. A week later, that information changed slightly. The Government laid information before me to the effect that there were perhaps additional costs, but that they had been budgeted for. If Members read the regulatory appraisal, which is publicly available as it is published on the internet, they will see that it states in paragraph 11 that

'[t]he potential costs to enforcement authorities of sampling and analysing for dioxins, and the impact this could have on other feed enforcement work, could be significant.'

These costs could be significant, and money does not grow on trees. Any money spent by local authorities or any other body to this end, however worthy it may be, may deprive other worthy causes. It is important that Plenary and the Business Committee have accurate information before it to make the right judgment. The Government advice must not be misleading, incomplete or plainly wrong. It must be accurate, and it must be right.

I do not intend to ask Plenary to vote against these proposals. They have been passed and the Business Committee has not issued any advice other than to say that, if we so see fit, we should vote for these regulations. However, I am not happy about the procedure. I want better Government advice and, with your help, Presiding Officer, and the help of the Business Committee, we will ensure that on future occasions.

**Glyn Davies:** I wish to address the same point as the Deputy Presiding Officer. I am concerned to learn that costs are associated

Pwyllgor Busnes drafod y mater hwn, a byddaf yn rhoi'r mater ar agenda cyfarfod dydd Mawrth nesaf. Ar ôl cyfarfod diweddar y Pwyllgor Busnes, bu'n rhaid imi benderfynu pa lwybr y dylai'r ddeddfwriaeth hon ei ddilyn. Clywsom gan Brynle a Mick nad oes dim o'i le ar y ddeddfwriaeth hon. Fodd bynnag, cyfyd mater arian ychwanegol. Gosododd y Llywodraeth wybodaeth ger fy mron i'r perwyl nad oedd i'r ddeddfwriaeth hon gostau ychwanegol, er bod hynny'n amlwg yn anghywir. Wythnos yn ddiweddarach, newidiwyd y wybodaeth honno ychydig. Gosodwyd y Llywodraeth wybodaeth ger fy mron i'r perwyl bod costau ychwanegol o bosibl, ond bod cyllideb ar eu cyfer. Os darllena yr Aelodau yr arfarniad rheoliadol, sydd ar gael yn gyhoeddus gan y cyhoeddwyd ef ar y rhynggrwyd, gwelant ei fod yn nodi ym mharagraff 11

y gallai costau posibl samplu a dadansoddi diocsinau i awdurdodau gorfodi, a'r effaith y gallai hyn ei chael ar waith gorfodi arall mewn cysylltiad â phorthiant, fod yn sylweddol.

Gallai'r costau hyn fod yn sylweddol, ac nid yw'r arian yn ddiderfyn. Gall unrhyw arian a werir gan awdurdodau lleol neu unrhyw gorff arall i'r perwyl hwn, pa mor deilwng bynnag ydyw, amddifadu achosion teilwng eraill. Mae'n bwysig bod gan y Cyfarfod Llawn a'r Pwyllgor Busnes wybodaeth gywir ger eu bron er mwyn gwneud y penderfyniad cywir. Rhaid i gyngor y Llywodraeth beidio â bod yn gamarweiniol, yn anghyflawn nac yn anghywir. Rhaid iddo fod yn gywir, a rhaid iddo fod yn iawn.

Ni fwriadaf ofyn i'r Cyfarfod Llawn bleidleisio yn erbyn y cynigion hyn. Cawsant eu derbyn ac ni chyhoeddodd y Pwyllgor Busnes unrhyw gyngor heblaw dweud y dylem bleidleisio o blaid y rheoliadau hyn, os gwelwn yn dda. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn fodlon ar y weithdrefn. Yr wyf am gyngor gwell gan y Llywodraeth a, chyda'ch cymorth chi, Lywydd, a chymorth y Pwyllgor Busnes byddwn yn sicrhau hynny yn y dyfodol.

**Glyn Davies:** Hoffwn godi'r un pwynt â'r Dirprwy Lywydd. Mae'n achos pryder imi glywed bod costau yn gysylltiedig â'r

with this procedure and that we have not had sight of the full regulatory appraisal. However, the issue that has concerned me for some time, particularly since I became Chair of the Legislation Committee and began taking a keen interest in how we deal with legislation, is that we do not deal with it properly. We have dealt already with the issue of executive procedure, and its appallingly frequent use. There is also the issue of regulatory appraisals. The Government has been more than casual in not necessarily carrying out regulatory appraisals, or in going through the motions. There is a purpose to the requirement to have regulatory appraisals, which is to ensure that we all know the implications, not only of particular pieces of legislation, but for the opportunity cost elsewhere, to which John Marek referred. We need to see every piece of legislation that comes before us in order to go through the proper procedure; the executive procedure should only be used if it is absolutely necessary. There must be a full regulatory appraisal that we all know about before we take any decision. That should have applied in this case.

3.40 p.m.

**Jenny Randerson:** The Business Committee is aware of, and has been contacted by the Chair of the Legislation Committee about, the concerns regarding the practices adopted in relation to the various forms of legislation that come before us. There are different practices in different departments between different Ministers. We seek not only clarity and a clear set of rules, but also to ensure that the same rules and regulations are applied in every aspect of the Government's business. I know that the Minister has agreed to tackle this issue, which I am sure will be done as a matter of urgency. Some Ministers provide a regulatory appraisal; others do not. Once we have rules, we need to ensure that they are applied across the board. The Committee is considering this, and I am sure that the Minister will deal with it in the near future.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call on the Minister for Health and Social Services to reply on the

weithdrefn hon ac nad ydym wedi gweld yr arfarniad rheoliadol llawn. Fodd bynnag, y mater sy'n bryder i mi ers peth amser, yn enwedig ers imi ddod yn Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Deddfau a dechrau ymddiddori'n fawr yn y ffordd yr ydym yn ymdrin â deddfwriaeth, yw'r ffaith nad ydym yn ymdrin â hi yn gywir. Yr ydym eisoes wedi trafod y weithdrefn weithredol, a'r defnydd arswydus o fynych a wneir ohoni. Cyfyd mater arfarniadau rheoliadol hefyd. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi bod yn ddidaro wrth beidio â chynnal arfarniadau rheoliadol bob amser, neu wrth gymryd arni ei bod yn dilyn y weithdrefn. Mae diben i'r gofyniad i gynnal arfarniadau rheoliadol, sef sicrhau bod y goblygiadau yn hysbys i bawb ohonom, nid yn unig goblygiadau darnau penodol o ddeddfwriaeth, ond o ran y cyfle cost rywle arall, y cyfeiriodd John Marek ato. Mae angen inni weld pob darn o ddeddfwriaeth sy'n dod ger ein bron i sicrhau ei bod yn dilyn y weithdrefn gywir; dim ond os oes rhaid y dylid defnyddio'r weithdrefn weithredol. Rhaid cynnal arfarniad rheoliadol llawn sy'n hysbys i bawb ohonom cyn inni wneud unrhyw benderfyniad. Dylai hynny fod wedi digwydd yn yr achos hwn.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae'r Pwyllgor Busnes yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon ynglŷn â'r arferion a fabwysiadwyd o ran y gwahanol fathau o ddeddfwriaeth sy'n dod ger ein bron ac mae Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Deddfau wedi cysylltu â'r pwyllgor yn eu cylch. Ceir arferion gwahanol mewn adrannau gwahanol rhwng Gweinidogion gwahanol. Yr ydym nid yn unig am gael eglurder a rheolau pendant, ond hefyd sicrhau y caiff yr un rheolau a rheoliadau eu cymhwyso ym mhob agwedd ar fusnes y Llywodraeth. Gwn fod y Gweinidog wedi cytuno i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff hynny ei wneud ar fyrder. Mae rhai Gweinidogion yn darparu arfarniad rheoliadol; ni wna eraill. Unwaith y bydd gennym reolau, mae angen inni sicrhau y cânt eu cymhwyso yn yr un ffordd gan bawb. Mae'r Pwyllgor yn ystyried hyn, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog yn ymdrin â'r mater yn y dyfodol agos.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf ar y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i

substance of the Order, if possible, although I followed the debate on procedure with great interest.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I thank Members for their positive contributions, including those by Brynle Williams and Mick Bates. I take on board your points about small businesses and how we can reach them, Brynle. We had full consultation with the industry and with farming unions, and the enforcement authorities and local authority representatives were also fully consulted. On your concerns, Mick, about ensuring that local authorities implement their enforcement responsibilities, the £110,000 that I mentioned, which is in the revenue support grant in this financial year to enable them to undertake that sampling and testing, has come as a result of the Food Standards Agency convincing us of the importance of putting that money in with the enforcement authorities. That is crucial.

The Business Committee will respond more fully to John Marek's points. I hope that my opening speech gave a clear explanation of the financial issues. The regulatory appraisal is, and will be, available to the public, although the Business Committee is held in camera. I hope that my fuller explanation of the financial impact gave a proper explanation for appropriate scrutiny. It is not my place to dwell further on these issues. However, the Welsh Assembly Government is concerned to ensure that the full legislative procedure is carried out. We carefully scrutinise in Cabinet anything that comes before us that is deemed to need procedure through the executive route.

ymateb ar sylwedd y Gorchymyn, os oes modd, er imi ddilyn y ddadl ar weithdrefn gyda diddordeb mawr.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau cadarnhaol, gan gynnwys cyfraniadau Brynle Williams a Mick Bates. Derbyniaf eich pwyntiau ynglŷn â busnesau bach a sut y gallwn eu cyrraedd, Brynle. Bu inni ymgynghori'n llawn â'r diwydiant ac undebau'r amaethwyr, ac ymgynghorwyd yn llawn hefyd â'r awdurdodau gorfodi a chynrychiolwyr awdurdodau lleol. O ran eich pryderon, Mick, ynglŷn â sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn cyflawni eu cyfrifoldebau gorfodi, neilltuwyd y £110,000 y cyfeiriais ato, sydd yn y grant cynnal refeniw yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon i'w galluogi i gymryd samplau a chynnal profion, am fod yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd wedi ein hargyhoeddi o bwysigrwydd rhoi'r arian hwnnw i'r awdurdodau gorfodi. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig.

Bydd y Pwyllgor Busnes yn ymateb yn fanylach i bwyntiau John Marek. Gobeithiaf fod fy araith agoriadol wedi rhoi esboniad clir o'r materion ariannol. Mae, a bydd, yr arfarniad rheoliadol ar gael i'r cyhoedd, ond cynhelir y Pwyllgor Busnes yn y dirgel. Gobeithiaf i'm hesboniad llawnach o'r effaith ariannol roi eglurhad ar gyfer craffu priodol. Nid fy lle i yw ymhelaethu ar y materion hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn awyddus i sicrhau bod y weithdrefn ddeddfwriaethol lawn yn cael ei chynnal. Yn y Cabinet yr ydym yn craffu'n ofalus ar unrhyw beth sy'n dod ger ein bron y tybir bod angen iddo ddilyn y weithdrefn weithredol.

*Cynnig (NDM1526): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1526): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1527): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1527): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David

Davies, Glyn  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Caffael Cynnyrch o Gymru yn y Sector Cyhoeddus The Procurement of Welsh Produce in the Public Sector**

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.3(v), y mae'n rhaid i'r ddadl fer gychwyn hanner awr cyn diwedd y Cyfarfod Llawn. Oherwydd prinder amser heddiw, bydd cyfyngiad ar hyd areithiau yn y ddadl hon a'r ddadl sydd i ddilyn. Ac eithrio areithiau'r Aelodau sy'n agor a chau'r dadleuon ac yn cynnig gwelliannau, cyfyngir pob araith i dri munud.

Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 5 yn enw Jonathan Morgan, gwelliannau 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, a gwelliannau 6 a 7 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 6.3(v), the short debate must commence half an hour before the end of Plenary. Due to time restraints today, there will be a restriction on the length of speeches in this debate and in the next debate. Apart from speeches given by Members opening or closing the debates and proposing amendments, all speeches will be limited to three minutes.

I have selected amendments 1 and 5 in the name of Jonathan Morgan, amendments 2, 3 and 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, and amendments 6 and 7 in the name of Kirsty Williams.



**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. welcomes the collaboration between the Welsh procurement initiative teams and the Welsh Development Agency to explore measures aimed at strengthening local Welsh food supply to the public sector,*

*2. welcomes the progress being made towards helping small and medium-sized food producers win local public sector business; and*

*3. supports the development of pilot projects to test these measures and notes that the Minister will report back to the National Assembly. (NDM1528)*

Total public sector procurement expenditure in Wales is around £4 billion per year. That represents 11 per cent of Wales's gross domestic product. How that is spent is vital to our economy, environment and communities. Procurement has not generally, or traditionally, been seen as a key driver of change. However, that is what it should be. Our duty in terms of sustainable development requires us to place those principles at the core of public sector procurement while also complying with European law on the free movement of goods. That means encouraging local produce suppliers to compete more successfully for the business of schools and hospitals, and ensuring that their money is helping to create jobs and prosperity in our communities, thus making them cleaner and greener and improving health through better nutrition. Edwina Hart, in her previous role as Finance Minister, commissioned a review of public sector procurement in 2000. The resulting report, 'Better Value Wales', calls for improvements to the implementation of its 42 recommendations. Key issues included the need to improve the relationship between public sector procurement and the business sector, to reduce fragmentation through increased collaboration, to improve management data on what is spent and by whom, to increase the contribution of procurement to policies that support sustainable development, the need for the

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn croesawu'r cydweithio sy'n digwydd rhwng timau Menter Gaffael Cymru ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru i edrych ar fesurau i gryfhau'r cyflenwad bwyd Cymreig lleol i'r sector cyhoeddus;*

*2. yn croesawu'r camau a gymerwyd i helpu cynhyrchwyr bwyd bach a chanolig i ennill busnes lleol yn y sector cyhoeddus; ac*

*3. yn cefnogi datblygiad prosiectau peilot i brofi'r mesurau hyn ac yn nodi y bydd y Gweinidog yn adrodd yn ôl i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. (NDM1528)*

Mae cyfanswm gwariant caffael yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru oddeutu £4 biliwn y flwyddyn. Mae hynny'n 11 y cant o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth Cymru. Mae'r ffordd y gwerir hynny yn hanfodol i'n heconomi, ein hamgylchedd a'n cymunedau. Nid ystyriwyd caffael yn gyffredinol, nac yn draddodiadol, yn symbylydd allweddol ar gyfer newid. Fodd bynnag, dyna beth ddylai fod. Mae ein dyletswydd o ran datblygu cynaliadwy yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol inni osod yr egwyddorion hynny wrth wraidd caffael yn y sector cyhoeddus tra'n cydymffurfio hefyd â chyfraith Ewrop ar ryddid i symud nwyddau. Golyga hynny annog cyflenwyr cynnyrch lleol i gystadlu'n fwy llwyddiannus am fusnes ysgolion ac ysbytai, a sicrhau bod eu harian yn helpu i greu swyddi a ffyniant yn ein cymunedau, gan eu gwneud yn lanach ac yn wyrddach a gwella iechyd drwy faethiad gwell. Comisiynodd Edwina Hart, yn ei rôl flaenorol fel Gweinidog Cyllid, adolygiad o gaffael yn y sector cyhoeddus yn 2000. Geilw'r adroddiad dilynol, 'Gwell Gwerth Cymru', am welliannau i'r broses o weithredu ei 42 o argymhellion. Ymhlith y materion allweddol yr oedd yr angen i wella'r berthynas rhwng caffael yn y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector busnes, lleihau darnio drwy wella cydweithredu, gwella data rheoli ar yr hyn a werir a chan bwy, cynyddu cyfraniad caffael i bolisiau sy'n cefnogi

growth of professional skills in order to deal with the complex issues involved, and the need to develop an innovative approach to procurement. I am not suggesting that we institute a regime that ignores EU legislation, such as the EU treaty and procurement directives, which protect free trade within the EU and ensure that sourcing does not discriminate or limit competition. The directives also govern how tenders are formed and how suppliers are selected. It is not possible to comply with them and select suppliers on the basis of location. However, recent guidance has indicated a move towards recognising the importance of social and environmental factors as valid contract conditions, if drafted appropriately. Public sector procurement can fulfil many challenges and achieve value for money while acting to support policies to provide wider benefit to the community.

We established the Welsh procurement initiative to address those recommendations. It has been in operation since August 2002 and its role is to act as the catalyst to achieving those goals by improving the value for money obtained from procurement and supporting the delivery of public services while benefiting the Welsh economy, its environment and its communities. The initiative is running 21 pathfinder projects, which address the key issues identified. Those projects pilot innovative approaches and work closely with our agencies, such as the Welsh Development Agency, to provide real benefits to Welsh business and our small and medium-sized enterprise sector. These include the establishment of a national procurement website, building on the Assembly's 'Winning Our Business' website, the establishment of a central database of all public sector expenditure, which allows us to understand and track Welsh public sector spending, splitting collaborative cross-sector contracts into lots to allow the SME sector to bid for individual regions, and the production of best practice procurement guidance in dealing with SMEs based on the work in the food sector.

3.50 p.m.

datblygu cynaliadwy, yr angen am dwf sgiliau proffesiynol er mwyn delio â'r materion cymhleth dan sylw, a'r angen i ddatblygu ymagwedd arloesol tuag at gaffael. Nid wyf yn awgrymu ein bod yn sefydlu cyfundrefn sy'n anwybyddu deddfwriaeth yr UE, fel cytundeb yr UE a chyfarwyddebau caffael, sy'n diogelu masnach rydd o fewn yr UE ac sy'n sicrhau nad yw ffynonellu yn gwahaniaethu nac yn cyfyngu ar gystadleuaeth. Mae'r cyfarwyddebau hefyd yn rheoli'r modd y llunnir tendrau a sut y detholir cyflenwyr. Nid yw'n bosibl cydymffurfio â hwy a dethol cyflenwyr ar sail lleoliad. Fodd bynnag, mae canllawiau diweddar wedi awgrymu newid tuag at gydnabod pwysigrwydd ffactorau cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol fel amodau contract dilys, os cânt eu drafftio'n briodol. Gall caffael yn y sector cyhoeddus gyflawni sawl her, sicrhau gwerth am arian a gweithredu i gefnogi polisïau i ddod â budd ehangach i'r gymuned yr un pryd.

Bu inni sefydlu menter caffael Cymru i fynd i'r afael â'r argymhellion hynny. Bu'n weithredol er Awst 2002 a'i rôl yw gweithredu fel catalydd i gyflawni'r nodau hynny drwy wella'r gwerth am arian a geir o gaffael a chefnogi'r broses o ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gydag economi Cymru, ei hamgylchedd a'i chymunedau yn elwa arni yr un pryd. Mae'r fenter yn rhedeg 21 o brosiectau arloesol, sy'n mynd i'r afael â'r materion allweddol a nodwyd. Mabwysia'dr prosiectau hynny ymagwedd arloesol beilot a gweithiant yn agos gyda'n hasiantaethau, fel Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, i sicrhau buddiannau gwirioneddol i fusnesau Cymru a'n sector busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint. Yn eu plith mae sefydlu gwefan caffael genedlaethol, gan adeiladu ar wefan 'Gafael ar Gaffael' y Cynulliad, sefydlu cronfa ddata ganolog o holl wariant y sector cyhoeddus, sy'n caniatáu inni ddeall ac olrhain gwariant y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, rhannu contractau traws-sector cydweithredol yn gyfrannau i ganiatáu i'r sector busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint wneud cynnig am ranbarthau unigol, a chynhyrchu canllawiau caffael arfer gorau wrth ddelio â busnesau bach a chanolig yn seiliedig ar y gwaith yn y sector bwyd.

Pathfinder projects fully address today's motion. They are an innovative approach aimed at reducing perceived barriers between food suppliers and public-sector food buyers, while also linking policies for improved nutritional health with the use of fresh food. My predecessor launched these projects at a successful conference in Builth Wells in February. He reflected upon the huge step changes made in the pace of promotion and investment in the agri-food industry in Wales, and also our growing confidence in our produce. The conference also highlighted the need for public sector buyers and food suppliers to work together. The key findings were that, while there was considerable scope for progress, action was required by both buyers and suppliers. A different approach to procurement was required, to the extent permitted by EU legislation, to contribute positively to the health and environment of our people, as well as to social and economic development. An improved understanding of the Welsh food sector and product base was also felt to be beneficial. It was felt that suppliers would benefit from a better understanding of how to tender.

**John Griffiths:** Carwyn, do you accept that school meals provide a good example of the benefits that could be gained if we incorporated the changes outlined as being possible in this work? Far too often, school meals use poor-quality, cheap produce, which offers little nutritional value. Through implementing the changes outlined we could make real gains in improving the health and behaviour of pupils, not to mention the economic and environmental benefits.

**Carwyn Jones:** I agree, in tandem with giving suppliers the information that they need to find out how best to tender and what public-sector procurement obligations are. The situation you outline illustrates the discredited face of compulsory competitive tendering which, thankfully we no longer have.

To take the pathfinder programme forward, a programme of activities has begun. First, an improved database of Welsh food-sector

Mae prosiectau arloesol yn mynd i'r afael yn llawn â chynnig heddiw. Maent yn ymagwedd arloesol a anelir at leihau'r rhwystrau canfyddedig rhwng cyflenwyr bwyd a phrynwyr bwyd yn y sector cyhoeddus, gan gysylltu polisiau hefyd ar gyfer gwella iechyd maethol â'r defnydd o fwyd ffres. Lansiodd fy rhagflaenydd y prosiectau hyn mewn cynhadledd lwyddiannus yn Llanfair ym Muallt fis Chwefror. Ystyriodd y newidiadau sylweddol enfawr a wnaed yn hyrwyddo a buddsoddi yn y diwydiant bwyd-amaeth yng Nghymru, a'n hyder cynyddol hefyd yn ein cynnyrch. Amlygodd y gynhadledd hefyd yr angen i brynwyr yn y sector cyhoeddus a chyflenwyr bwyd gydweithio. Y canfyddiadau allweddol oedd bod angen i brynwyr a chyflenwyr fel ei gilydd weithredu, er bod cryn gyfle i wneud cynnydd. Yr oedd angen ymagwedd wahanol tuag at gaffael, i'r graddau a ganiatawyd yn ôl deddfwriaeth yr UE, i gyfrannu'n gadarnhaol at iechyd ac amgylchedd ein pobl, yn ogystal â chyfrannu at ddatblygiad cymdeithasol ac economaidd. Teimlwyd hefyd bod gwell dealltwriaeth o'r sector bwyd a chynnyrch yng Nghymru yn fuddiol. Teimlwyd y byddai cyflenwyr yn elwa ar well dealltwriaeth o sut i dendro.

**John Griffiths:** Carwyn, a dderbyniwch fod prydau ysgol yn enghraifft dda o'r buddiannau y gellid eu hennill pe baem yn ymgorffori'r newidiadau a amlinellwyd fel rhai posibl yn y gwaith hwn? Yn amlach na pheidio, mae prydau ysgol yn defnyddio cynnyrch rhad, o ansawdd gwael, heb fawr ddim gwerth maethol iddo. Drwy weithredu'r newidiadau a amlinellwyd gallem sicrhau manteision gwirioneddol i wella iechyd ac ymddygiad disgyblion, heb sôn am y buddiannau economaidd ac amgylcheddol.

**Carwyn Jones:** Cytunaf, ynghyd â rhoi'r wybodaeth sydd ei hangen arnynt i gyflenwyr i ddarganfod y ffordd orau o dendro a beth yw goblygiadau caffael yn y sector cyhoeddus. Mae'r sefyllfa a amlinellwyd yn dangos natur anffodus tendro cystadleuol gorfodol nad yw gennym bellach, diolch byth.

Er mwyn datblygu'r rhaglen arloesol, mae rhaglen o weithgareddau wedi cychwyn. Yn gyntaf, cynhyrchwyd cronfa ddata well o

suppliers has been produced, linked to the national procurement website. Secondly, a national supplier development programme has been established, which will address the development and change required in the supply base and supply chains operating in Wales. Thirdly, information on contract opportunities will be available nationally, linked to the national procurement website and the Wales euro information centre. Fourthly, activities have been arranged to examine the potential for co-operatives, working with the Wales Co-operative Centre and, fifthly, to bring suppliers and buyers together locally, such as 'meet-the-buyer events'. I attended such an event about two years ago, when suppliers—mainly in south Wales, but some from the North—met with representatives from Sainsbury's to discuss their requirements and how best to meet them. Sixthly, local pilot projects have been formed to develop exemplar best practice. Lastly, a public-sector procurement focus group will be established, made up of buyers and caterers, which will publish best practice guidance and will act as a consultation group to support the programme. If you want evidence of the benefits that this approach brings, you need only consider the excellent work of the Powys Food Links and the Powys public procurement partnership. They have worked together to pilot joined-up thinking on opportunities for local food supply.

The Welsh public sector spends at least £60 million per year on food produce. Over time, we aim to improve the quality and volume of bids received from local suppliers, and promote greater flexibility and innovation in the procurement approach taken by the Welsh public sector. I am pleased to report that we are ahead of our colleagues in other administrations. The Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs has cast jealous eyes towards Wales and, in Scotland, a recent report on sustainable development stated that

'the contrast between Scotland and Wales is stark. Despite far more limited powers, the Welsh Assembly has pioneered a coherent

gyflenwyr y sector bwyd yng Nghymru, wedi ei chysylltu â'r wefan gaffael genedlaethol. Yn ail, sefydlwyd rhaglen datblygu cyflenwyr genedlaethol, a fydd yn mynd i'r afael â'r datblygiad a'r newid sydd ei angen yn y sylfaen gyflenwi a'r cadwyni cyflenwi sy'n gweithredu yng Nghymru. Yn drydydd, bydd gwybodaeth am gyfleoedd contract ar gael yn genedlaethol, wedi ei chysylltu â'r wefan gaffael genedlaethol a chanolfan wybodaeth Ewrop Cymru. Yn bedwerydd, trefnwyd gweithgareddau i archwilio'r potensial ar gyfer cwmnïau cydweithredol, gan weithio gyda Chanolfan Gydweithredol Cymru ac, yn bumed, dod â chyflenwyr a phrynwyr at ei gilydd yn lleol, fel yn y digwyddiadau cyfarfod â'r prynwr. Mynychais ddigwyddiad o'r fath tua dwy flynedd yn ôl, pan gyfarfu cyflenwyr—yn bennaf o'r De, ond rhai o'r Gogledd—â chynrychiolwyr o Sainsbury's i drafod eu gofynion a'r ffordd orau o'u bodloni. Yn chweched, lluniwyd prosiectau peilot lleol i ddatblygu arfer gorau enghreifftiol. Yn olaf, caiff grŵp ffocws caffael yn y sector cyhoeddus ei sefydlu, yn cynnwys prynwyr ac arlwywyr, a fydd yn cyhoeddi canllawiau arfer gorau ac a fydd yn gweithredu fel grŵp ymgynghorol i gefnogi'r rhaglen. Os ydych am gael tystiolaeth o'r buddiannau a ddaw yn sgîl yr ymagwedd hon, nid oes ond rhaid ichi ystyried gwaith rhagorol Cysylltiadau Bwyd Powys a phartneriaeth gaffael gyhoeddus Powys. Maent wedi cydweithio i dreialu meddylfryd gydgyssylltiedig o ran cyfleoedd ar gyfer cyflenwi bwyd yn lleol.

Mae'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn gwario o leiaf £60 miliwn y flwyddyn ar gynnyrch bwyd. Dros amser, ein nod yw gwella ansawdd a nifer y cynigion a dderbynnir gan gyflenwyr lleol, a hyrwyddo mwy o hyblygrwydd ac arloesedd yn yr ymagwedd gaffael a fabwysiedir gan y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn falch o nodi ein bod ar y blaen i'n cydweithwyr mewn gweinyddiaethau eraill. Mae Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig wedi edrych yn genfigennus ar Gymru ac, yn yr Alban, nododd adroddiad diweddar ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy

fod y gwrthgyferbyniad rhwng yr Alban a Chymru yn amlwg iawn. Er gwaethaf pwerau mwy cyfyngedig o lawer, mae Cynulliad

and integrated approach to sustainable development.’

There is much still to do, but we can be confident that we are on the way to making change in this important area.

I now turn to the amendments. I oppose amendment 1, because there is no lack of progress on helping small and medium-sized enterprises in Wales. On amendment 2, substantial progress has been made in assisting small and medium-sized food producers, and we want to extend this support towards strengthening the links between public sector procurement and Welsh suppliers. On amendment 3, as I have explained, the Welsh procurement initiative is already working on best practice procurement guidance that will address these issues. On amendment 4, the WDA, under the agri-food partnership, is already working to develop local food supply chains. On amendment 5, in order to establish the success of the pilot schemes, we need to fully assess the impact and we anticipate doing so within 12 months; a deadline of 6 months is too short. On amendment 6, the WDA has already started work in this area, namely to establish the amount of local produce procured by the Welsh public sector. On amendment 7, the motion specifically focuses on strengthening the links between public sector procurement and all Welsh suppliers, including small family farms which, as stated in ‘Farming for the Future’, we believe to be the fundamental basis for farming in Wales.

Cymru wedi arloesi ymagwedd gydynol ac integredig tuag at ddatblygu cynaliadwy.

Mae llawer i'w wneud o hyd, ond gallwn fod yn hyderus ein bod ar y trywydd iawn i wneud newidiadau yn y maes pwysig hwn.

Trof yn awr at y gwelliannau. Gwrthwynebam welliant 1, gan nad oes diffyg cynnydd o ran helpu busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint. O ran gwelliant 2, gwnaed cynnydd sylweddol i helpu cynhyrchwyr bwyd bach a chanolig eu maint, ac yr ydym am ehangu'r cymorth hwn tuag at gryfhau'r cysylltiadau rhwng caffael yn y sector cyhoeddus a chyflenwyr Cymru. O ran gwelliant 3, fel yr eglurais, mae menter caffael Cymru eisoes yn gweithio ar ganllawiau caffael arfer gorau a fydd yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn. O ran gwelliant 4, mae'r WDA, o dan y bartneriaeth bwyd-amaeth, eisoes yn gweithio i ddatblygu cadwyni cyflenwi bwyd lleol. O ran gwelliant 5, er mwyn sefydlu llwyddiant y cynlluniau peilot, mae angen inni asesu'r effaith yn llawn a rhagwelwn y byddwn yn gwneud hynny o fewn 12 mis; mae terfyn amser o 6 mis yn rhy fyr. O ran gwelliant 6, mae'r WDA eisoes wedi dechrau gweithio yn y maes hwn, sef sefydlu swm y cynnyrch lleol a gaffaelir gan y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. O ran gwelliant 7, mae'r cynnig yn canolbwyntio'n benodol ar gryfhau'r cysylltiadau rhwng caffael yn y sector cyhoeddus a holl gyflenwyr Cymru, gan gynnwys ffermydd teuluol bach sef sail sylfaenol ffermio yng Nghymru yn ein barn ni, fel y nodwyd yn ‘Ffermio ar gyfer y Dyfodol’.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.56 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.56 p.m.*

**Brynle Williams:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 1: delete point 2 and replace with:

*notes with concern the lack of progress being made to help small and medium sized food producers in Wales.*

I propose amendment 5. In point 3 after ‘Assembly’ insert ‘within six months’.

**Brynle Williams:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 1: dileu pwynt 2 ac ychwanegu:

*yn nodi â phryder nad oes camau wedi'u cymryd i helpu cynhyrchwyr bwyd bach a chanolig yng Nghymru.*

Cynigiaf welliant 5. Ym mhwynt 3 ar ôl ‘Cynulliad Cenedlaethol’, ychwanegu ‘ymhen 6 mis’.

I declare an interest as a north Wales farmer. I support the amendments tabled by Plaid Cymru and the Liberal Democrats. I hope that the ruling Labour group will take the amendments on board and vote in favour of them all, irrespective of which party group tabled them. In discussing an important issue such as this, we should rise above party politics.

It is important that time and money are invested in promoting our wonderful Welsh produce. I agree with point 1 of the motion, although this should have been further promoted in the first National Assembly. The key to success will be to monitor the progress made, as well as for Assembly Members to consider progress made in their constituencies.

I am concerned about the lack of help at present for small and medium-sized businesses in Wales, hence the need for amendment 1. Many family businesses are suffering as a result of the lack of assistance from the Assembly. Many have suffered badly as a result of late payments, and many are still suffering as a result of the outbreak of foot and mouth disease. If Welsh produce is marketed correctly and people are made aware of the benefits of eating Welsh produce, I am sure that many businesses throughout the principality will benefit.

We must be provided with regular updates on progress, as this will motivate and encourage businesses. It would be good if an all-party working group monitored progress on a regular basis, ensured that everything was going to plan and consulted regularly with businesses to discover their views on how the situation is changing.

The Welsh Local Government Association states that the largest customer, the Welsh public sector, should be the smartest customer. However, in order to develop this, we need excellent marketing and excellent produce, which we have. I am aware that there are many examples of good practice in local government. One example is the Welsh purchasing consortium. We must use its research and knowledge to assist us in

Datganaf fuddiant fel ffermwr o'r Gogledd. Cefnogaf y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd gan Blaid Cymru a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Gobeithiaf y bydd y grŵp Llafur sydd mewn grym yn ystyried y gwelliannau ac yn pleidleisio o blaid pob un, waeth pa blaid a'u cyflwynodd. Wrth drafod mater pwysig fel hwn, dylem godi uwchlaw gwleidyddiaeth plaid.

Mae'n bwysig bod amser ac arian yn cael eu buddsoddi i hyrwyddo ein cynnyrch gwych yng Nghymru. Cytunaf â phwynt 1 y cynnig, er y dylai hyn fod wedi cael ei hyrwyddo ymhellach yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol cyntaf. Yr allwedd i lwyddiant fydd monitro'r cynnydd a wnaed, yn ogystal â sicrhau bod Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn ystyried y cynnydd a wnaed yn eu hetholaethau.

Pryderaf ynglŷn â'r diffyg cymorth ar hyn o bryd i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru, a dyna pam mae angen gwelliant 1. Mae llawer o fusnesau teuluol yn dioddef o ganlyniad i ddiffyg cymorth gan y Cynulliad. Dioddefodd llawer yn enbyd o ganlyniad i daliadau hwyr, ac mae llawer yn dioddef o hyd o ganlyniad i'r argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau. Os caiff cynnyrch Cymreig ei farchnata'n gywir ac os gwneir pobl yn ymwybodol o fuddiannau bwyta cynnyrch Cymreig, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd llawer o fusnesau ledled y wlad yn elwa ar hyn.

Rhaid inni gael y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf yn rheolaidd ar gynnydd, gan y bydd hyn yn ysgogi ac yn calonogi busnesau. Byddai'n dda o beth pe bai gweithgor pob plaid yn monitro cynnydd yn rheolaidd, gan sicrhau bod popeth yn mynd rhagddo yn ôl y bwriad ac yn ymgynghori'n rheolaidd â busnesau i ganfod eu barn ar sut y mae'r sefyllfa yn newid

Dywed Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru mai'r cwsmer mwyaf, sef y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, ddylai fod y cwsmer mwyaf craff. Serch hynny, er mwyn datblygu hyn, mae angen marchnata yn rhagorol a chael cynnyrch rhagorol, ac mae hynny gennym. Gwn fod sawl enghraifft o arferion da mewn llywodraeth leol. Un enghraifft yw consortiwm prynu Cymru. Rhaid inni ddefnyddio ei ymchwil a'i wybodaeth i'n

ensuring collaboration between the Welsh procurement initiative teams—

helpu i sicrhau cydweithrediad rhwng timau menter caffael Cymru—

**Janet Ryder:** Will you take an intervention on that point?

**Janet Ryder:** A dderbyniwch ymyriad ar y pwynt hwnnw?

**Brynle Williams:** I only have a paragraph of my speech left, after which you can intervene all you want, my dear.

**Brynle Williams:** Dim ond paragraff o'm haraith sydd ar ôl, ac wedyn gallwch ymyrryd faint bynnag a fynnoch, fy merch i.

**Janet Ryder:** So you will not give way?

**Janet Ryder:** Felly nid ildiwch?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Brynle Williams is not giving way.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw Brynle Williams am ildio.

**Brynle Williams:** I urge all Members to support the amendments, as this will send a message to the people of Wales.

**Brynle Williams:** Anogaf bob Aelod i gefnogi'r gwelliannau, gan y bydd hyn yn anfon neges at bobl Cymru.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 2: dileu pwynt 2 a rhoi'r pwynt a ganlyn yn ei le:

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 2: delete point 2 and replace with:

*yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i roi rhagor o gefnogaeth i helpu cynhyrchwyr bwyd bach a chanolig i ennill busnes lleol yn y sector cyhoeddus.*

*calls on the Government to provide greater support towards helping small and medium-sized food producers win local public sector business.*

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Rhoi pwynt 3 newydd a newid y rhifau'n unol â hynny:

I propose amendment 3. Insert as new point 3 and renumber accordingly:

*yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i bennu safonau caffael a fydd yn ffafrio cynnyrch ffres o safon uchel sydd wedi'i gynhyrchu'n lleol.*

*calls on the Government to set procurement standards that would favour fresh, high-quality products produced locally.*

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Rhoi pwynt 3 newydd a newid y rhifau'n unol â hynny:

I propose amendment 4. Insert as new point 3 and renumber accordingly:

*yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i ddatblygu seilwaith i sicrhau cadwyni cyflenwi lleol.*

*calls on the Government to develop infrastructure to ensure local supply chains.*

Nid oeddwn yn sylweddoli bod Sainsbury's yn rhan o'r sector cyhoeddus hyd y clywais y Gweinidog yn sôn amdano wrth agor y ddadl. O ran y cynnig, mae pawb yn cefnogi'r angen i gaffael cynnyrch lleol, nid yn unig er mwyn cefnogi busnesau lleol—sy'n dod â manteision economaidd i'r busnesau ac i'r economi leol—ond hefyd er mwyn sicrhau bod y cynnyrch a ddefnyddir yn y sector cyhoeddus o'r safon uchaf posibl. Gobeithiaf bod pob Aelod yn derbyn bod cynnyrch Cymru o'r safon uchaf, a'n bod hefyd yn cyrraedd y safonau uchaf posibl o ran glendid

I did not realise that Sainsbury's was part of the public sector until I heard the Minister mention it in his opening speech. On the motion, everyone supports the need to procure local produce, not only to support local businesses—which brings economic benefits to the businesses and to the local economy—but also to ensure that the produce used in the public sector is of the highest possible quality. I hope that all Members accept that Welsh produce is of the highest quality, and that we also reach the highest possible standards in terms of hygiene and

a diogelwch. Byddai caffael cynnyrch lleol yn sicrhau bod y bwyd a ddarperir i blant yn ein hysgolion o'r safon uchaf posibl. A yw'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn bwriadu sicrhau, pan fydd y Llywodraeth yn cyflwyno brecwast am ddim i blant ysgol, mai cynnyrch lleol a ddefnyddir i baratoi'r brecwast hwnnw? Byddai bwyd o'r safon uchaf yn helpu plant i ymateb yn well yn yr ysgol.

4.00 p.m.

Gallai bwyd o ansawdd da hefyd helpu cleifion yn ein hysbytai. Mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn gwario symiau aruthrol o arian ar ddarparu bwyd—gwerir hyd at £500 miliwn y flwyddyn. Pe bai'r arian hwnnw'n mynd i'r diwydiant yng Nghymru a Phrydain, byddai'n gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr iddo.

Pwrpas ein gwelliannau yw cryfhau'r cynnig a chyfeirio'n benodol at yr hyn sydd angen ei wneud. Yn anffodus, mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn hunanfodlon ynglŷn â phopeth a gyflawnir ganddi. Yr ydym yn croesawu'r hyn a ddywedwyd, ond mae'r Gweinidog ei hun yn cydnabod nad oes digon wedi'i wneud yn y maes hwn. Nid wyf yn deall, felly, pam nad yw'n derbyn y gwelliant sy'n galw am fwy o gydweithio. Bu i'r Gweinidog sôn am reoliadau a deddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd sy'n ein hatal rhag prynu cynnyrch lleol. Mae'r rheoliadau hynny dan drafodaeth yn Senedd Ewrop ar hyn o bryd ac maent yn debygol o gael eu newid. Pe baem yn rhoi pwyslais ar dendro sy'n sicrhau canlyniadau economaidd buddiol, yn hytrach na'r gost isaf, gallem sicrhau bod cynnyrch lleol yn cael ei gaffael. Mae'n bosibl gwneud hynny yn Ffrainc a'r Eidal, ac nid oes rheswm pam na ellid ei wneud yng Nghymru.

Cyfrifoldeb y Llywodraeth yw sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol ac asiantaethau sy'n atebol i'r Cynulliad yn dilyn polisi o gaffael bwyd ffres, maethlon ac o'r ansawdd gorau posibl a hynny yn lleol. Anogaf y Gweinidog i ailystyried ei benderfyniad i wrthod ein gwelliannau. Ni fyddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 1 o eiddo'r Torïaid gan ei fod yn gwneud y cynnig yn afresymegol; ar un llaw, maent yn croesawu'r cynnydd a wnaed ond, ar y llaw arall, yn condemnio'r ffaith na gymerwyd camau yn y maes hwn—nid oes modd

safety. Procuring local produce would ensure that the food provided for children in our schools would be of the highest possible standard. Does the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning intend to ensure, when the Government introduces free breakfast for schoolchildren, that local produce is used in the preparation of those breakfasts? Food of the highest quality would assist children's responsiveness in school.

Good quality food could also help hospital patients. The health service spends a phenomenal amount of money on the provision of food—up to £500 million a year. If that money went to the industry in Wales and Britain, it would make a big difference.

Our amendments aim to reinforce the motion and draw particular attention to what needs to be done. Unfortunately, this Government insists on being self-satisfied about its achievements. We welcome what we have heard, but the Minister has himself acknowledged that not enough has been done in this area. I do not understand, therefore, why he does not accept the amendment that calls for greater collaboration. The Minister referred to the European regulations and legislation that prevent us from buying local produce. The European Parliament is currently discussing these regulations, which are likely to be amended. Were we to place an emphasis on ensuring that tendering processes secure economically beneficial outcomes, rather than the lowest cost, we could ensure that local produce is procured. That is possible in France and Italy, and there is no reason why it cannot be done in Wales.

It is the Government's responsibility to ensure that local authorities and agencies accountable to the Assembly adhere to a policy of procuring food that is fresh, nutritious, of the highest possible quality and produced locally. I urge the Minister to reconsider his decision to reject our amendments. We will not support the Tories' amendment 1 as it makes the motion seem illogical; on the one hand, they welcome the progress made in this area but, on the other, they condemn the fact that no steps have been



gwneud y ddau beth.

**Mick Bates:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 6: add at the end of the motion as a new point:

*calls on the Minister to consider placing a duty on ASPBs and local authorities to report annually on the amount of local produce they have procured.*

I propose amendment 7. Add at the end of the motion as a new point:

*recognises local food procurement by the public sector as a vital means of support for the small family farms that are prevalent in the agricultural sector in Wales.*

I welcome much of the Minister's statement. However, there is an element of complacency about how these principles are put into practice and measured. We would do well to remind ourselves why it is important to relocalise food production. Food imports to the European Union have increased by 279 per cent in the past 30 years. The UK is a net importer of food and, in the 1980s, the UK trade gap in food and drink was £3.5 billion. In 1999, that gap was £8.3 billion.

World trade is rewarding a few large, wealthy farmers, supermarkets and multinational food companies, all at the expense of small and medium-sized farms in developing countries and Wales.

**Janet Ryder:** Will you take an intervention?

**Mick Bates:** I will in a moment; I wish to get going first.

It was the president of the National Farmers' Union, Ben Gill, who suggested that trade globalisation may have been responsible for the outbreak of foot and mouth disease in Britain. We need to reduce imports by increasing local production and use. This would result in safer food and better animal welfare, as well as a dramatic reduction in

taken—you cannot do both.

**Mick Bates:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 6: ychwanegu pwynt bwled newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*Yn galw ar y Gweinidog i ystyried ei gwneud yn ddyletswydd ar gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad ac awdurdodau lleol i roi adroddiad blynyddol ar faint o gynnyrch lleol y maent wedi'i gaffael.*

Cynigiaf welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt bwled newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cydnabod bod caffael bwyd lleol yn y sector cyhoeddus yn ffordd allweddol o gefnogi ffermydd teuluol bach sydd mor amlwg yn y sector amaethyddol yng Nghymru.*

Croesawaf lawer o ddatganiad y Gweinidog. Fodd bynnag, mae elfen o laesu dwylo ynglŷn â'r modd y rhoddir yr egwyddorion hyn ar waith a'r modd y cânt eu mesur. Byddai'n syniad atgoffa ein hunain pam mae'n bwysig cynhyrchu bwyd yn lleol eto. Mae mewnforyn bwyd i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd wedi cynyddu 279 y cant yn y 30 mlynedd diwethaf. Mae'r DU yn fewnforiwr bwyd net ac yn y 1980au, y bwlech masnachu yn y DU mewn bwyd a diod oedd £3.5 biliwn. Yn 1999, yr oedd y bwlech hwnnw yn £8.3 biliwn.

Mae masnach y byd yn gwobrwyo rhai ffermwyr, uwchfarchnadoedd a chwmnïau bwyd amlwladol mawr, cyfoethog, ar draul ffermydd bach a chanolig eu maint mewn gwledydd datblygedig ac yng Nghymru.

**Janet Ryder:** A dderbyniwch ymyriad?

**Mick Bates:** Gwnaf yn y funud; dymunaf ddechrau arni yn gyntaf.

Ben Gill, sef Llywydd Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Amaethwyr, a awgrymodd mai globaleiddio masnach fu'n gyfrifol efallai am yr argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau ym Mhrydain. Mae angen inni leihau mewnforyn drwy gynyddu cynhyrchiant a defnydd lleol. Byddai hyn yn arwain at fwyd mwy diogel a gwell lles anifeiliaid, yn

carbon emissions, which would help to tackle climate change. All of this fits in perfectly with our sustainable development duty embodied in clause 121 of the Government of Wales Act 1998.

**Janet Ryder:** As regards world trade, do you agree with the points put forward by the Trade Justice Movement in its attempts to secure fair prices for local traders? Do you welcome the fact that Wrexham County Borough Council was one of the first councils in Wales to sign a trade justice agreement and to acknowledge that that was backed by the National Farmers Union, which sees the advantage, through that agreement, of getting a fair price for local farmers' produce from the county council? Do you also look forward to other county councils signing similar agreements?

**Mick Bates:** You are right. All too often, free trade is not fair trade. That is why it is important to follow Wrexham's example.

I will now return to sustainable development, particularly how we can help tackle carbon emissions. Trade-related transportation is one of the fastest growing sources of carbon emissions and a significant factor in climate change. It is clear that the food chain contains too many hidden costs: significant environmental damage, economic decline of our rural communities and an increase in health bills. That dramatic impact is a consequence of so-called efficient methods of production and increase in competition. They may have driven down world food prices, but our customers are alienated from food production and our small Welsh farms continue to disappear.

The Liberal Democrats have long promoted rebuilding our local economies through better food procurement. That is central to increasing and improving local economies. A study in Cornwall showed that every £10 spent on local food results in £25.90 being

ogystal â gostyngiad dramatig mewn gollyngiadau carbon, a fyddai'n helpu i fynd i'r afael â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd. Mae hyn oll yn cydweddu'n berffaith â'n dyletswydd o ran datblygu cynaliadwy a ymgorfforir yng nghymal 121 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998.

**Janet Ryder:** O ran masnach y byd, a gytunwch gyda'r pwyntiau a gyflwynwyd gan y Mudiad Cyfiawnder Masnach yn ei ymdrechion i sicrhau prisiau teg i fasnachwyr lleol? A groesawch y ffaith mai Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam oedd un o'r cynghorau cyntaf yng Nghymru i lofnodi cytundeb cyfiawnder masnach ac i gydnabod bod hynny wedi ei ategu gan Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Amaethwyr, sy'n gweld y fantais, drwy'r cytundeb hwnnw, o gael pris teg am gynnyrch ffermwyr lleol gan y cyngor sir? A ydych hefyd yn edrych ymlaen at weld cynghorau sir eraill yn llofnodi cytundebau tebyg?

**Mick Bates:** Yr ydych yn iawn. Yn amlach na pheidio, nid yw masnach rydd yn fasnach deg. Dyna pam mae'n bwysig dilyn esiampl Wrecsam.

Dychwelaf yn awr at ddatblygu cynaliadwy, yn arbennig sut y gallwn helpu i fynd i'r afael â gollyngiadau carbon. Mae trawsgludo sy'n gysylltiedig â masnach yn un o'r ffynonellau o ollyngiadau carbon sy'n tyfu gyflymaf ac yn ffactor o bwys o ran newid yn yr hinsawdd. Mae'n amlwg bod y gadwyn fwyd yn cynnwys gormod o gostau cudd: difrod sylweddol i'r amgylchedd, dirywiad economaidd ein cymunedau gwledig a chynnydd mewn biliau iechyd. Canlyniad y dulliau effeithlon bondigrybwyll o gynhyrchiant a chynnydd mewn cystadleuaeth yw'r effaith ddramatig honno. Efallai eu bod wedi gorfodi prisiau bwyd y byd i ostwng, ond maent wedi dieithrio ein cwsmeriaid oddi wrth gynhyrchu bwyd ac mae ein ffermydd bach yng Nghymru yn parhau i ddiflannu.

Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi hyrwyddo'r gwaith o ailadeiladu ein heconomïau lleol ers amser maith drwy gaffael bwyd yn well. Mae hynny'n ganolog i gynyddu a gwella economïau lleol. Dangosodd astudiaeth yng Nghernyw fod

returned to the local economy. That compares with £14 for every £10 spent in a supermarket. Some of that money is returned to our Welsh farms, making them viable businesses to support families and sustain our communities. The Minister referred to his predecessor. Credit must go to Mike German, who announced these food procurement projects when he was the Minister responsible for rural development. I am particularly pleased with that since—although Janet Ryder referred to Wrexham—Powys has long led the way on this. Through our local agenda 21 and our Powys food links, we have the best examples of such projects. I will quote Antony Lewis, the chair of Powys Health Care NHS Trust, who ran a pilot project on procurement in Llanidloes hospital:

‘We are anxious to support our local agricultural economy wherever possible. We have to comply with legislation on procurement, but a strong local economy and high quality food is good for the health of local people and therefore is cost-effective for the NHS.’

The two main challenges for us are the procurement policies and continuity of supply. Many researchers have highlighted that we can find ways to assist local procurement. Cardiff University has shown that, by breaking down large contracts into smaller parts and by insisting on freshness, we can produce good local contracts.

**Ann Jones** *rose*—

**Mick Bates:** I do not have time to give way.

However, to ensure the security and continuity of our aspirations, which are embodied in this motion and the amendment, we need to ensure that we know what is happening out there and how much local food our local authorities and ASPBs provide. In response to amendment 6, the Minister stated that the Welsh Development Agency would undertake that. The poor old WDA has too much to do already—

bob £10 a werir ar fwyd lleol yn arwain at roi £25.90 yn ôl i'r economi leol. Mae hynny'n cymharu â £14 am bob £10 a werir mewn archfarchnad. Caiff peth o'r arian hwnnw ei ddychwelyd i'n ffermydd Cymreig, gan eu gwneud yn fusnesau dichonol i gefnogi teuluoedd a chynnal ein cymunedau. Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at ei ragflaenydd. Rhaid canmol Mike German, a gyhoeddodd y prosiectau caffael bwyd hyn pan oedd yn Weinidog dros ddatblygu gwledig. Yr wyf yn arbennig o fodlon ar hynny gan fod Powys—er i Janet Ryder gyfeirio at Wrecsam—wedi arwain y blaen ar hyn ers amser maith. Drwy ein hagenda 21 leol a'n cysylltiadau bwyd â Phowys, mae gennym yr enghreifftiau gorau o brosiectau o'r fath. Dyfynnaf Antony Lewis, cadeirydd Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gofal Iechyd Powys, a fu'n gyfrifol am brosiect peilot ar gaffael yn ysbyty Llanidloes:

Yr ydym yn awyddus i gefnogi ein heconomi amaethyddol leol lle bynnag y bo'n bosibl. Rhaid inni gydymffurfio â deddfwriaeth ar gaffael, ond mae economi leol gref a bwyd o safon yn dda i iechyd pobl leol ac felly yn gost effeithiol i'r GIG.

Y ddwy brif her i ni yw'r polisiau caffael a pharhad cyflenwadau. Mae sawl ymchwilydd wedi dangos y gallwn ddod o hyd i ffyrdd o helpu'r broses gaffael yn lleol. Dangosodd Prifysgol Caerdydd y gallwn gynhyrchu contractau lleol da, drwy rannu contractau mawr yn rhannau llai a thrwy fynnu cael bwyd ffres.

**Ann Jones** *a gododd*—

**Mick Bates:** Nid oes gennyf amser i ildio.

Fodd bynnag, er mwyn sicrhau diogelwch a pharhad ein dyheadau, a ymgorfforir yn y cynnig hwn a'r gwelliant, mae angen inni sicrhau ein bod yn gwybod beth sy'n digwydd a faint o fwyd lleol a ddarperir gan ein hawdurdodau lleol a'n cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Mewn ymateb i welliant 6, dywedodd y Gweinidog y byddai Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn ymgymryd â hynny. Mae gan y WDA ormod i'w wneud yn barod—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Mick, you must wind up. You have had six minutes.

**Mick Bates:** Let us give this responsibility to our ASPBs and local authorities. Only then will we be able to compare and set down benchmarks on local procurement. I urge the Minister to change his mind and support this amendment; it will make ASPBs and local authorities report annually on how much local food they buy.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have to call the Minister at 4:18 p.m., which gives us around eight and a half minutes to continue this debate. Not everyone will get the opportunity to speak given that I have received six requests to do so, but, clearly, the shorter your speeches, the better.

4.10 p.m.

**Peter Law:** I am pleased to have the opportunity to speak in this debate and support the Minister. I hope that he notes that after yesterday. These initiatives are excellent and we must encourage people to use Welsh produce as much as possible. I am pleased that Janet Ryder mentioned the Wrexham initiative. We are proud of what Wrexham does. I hope that such a scheme will be rolled out across Wales because it mirrors what the co-operative movement has done in its shops in terms of selling fair trade chocolate bars and so on. Although it is not Welsh produce, it gives producers a fair share. That has not happened often enough in the past. If our successful food-producing companies are to compete in the modern world—and we all support that—they must have the best equipment. I refer, unusually, to a procurement exercise. The National Assembly must set a good example in terms of procurement. A factory in my constituency, Desk Link, manufactures office equipment. We were pleased when the First Minister opened the factory in October 2001. It employs 140 staff, and it received a regional selective assistance grant of over £1 million. However, it cannot tender to supply office equipment to the Assembly. Some Members of the first Assembly will remember that the company wrote to us about that issue. It has been suggested that a two-

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mick, rhaid ichi ddirwyn i ben. Cawsoch chwe munud.

**Mick Bates:** Gadewch inni roi'r cyfrifoldeb hwn ar ein CCNC ac ar awdurdodau lleol. Dim ond wedyn y gallwn gymharu a phennu meincnodau ar gaffael yn lleol. Anogaf y Gweinidog i newid ei feddwl a chefnogi'r gwelliant hwn; bydd yn gwneud i CCNC ac awdurdodau lleol gyflwyno adroddiad yn flynyddol ar faint o fwyd lleol a brynant.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Rhaid imi alw'r Gweinidog am 4.18 p.m., sy'n rhoi tuag wyth munud a hanner inni barhau â'r ddatl hon. Ni chaiff pawb y cyfle i siarad o gofio fy mod wedi cael chwe chais i wneud hynny, ond, yn amlwg, po fyrraf fo'ch areithiau, gorau oll.

**Peter Law:** Yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfle i siarad yn y ddatl hon a chefnogaf y Gweinidog. Gobeithiaf ei fod yn nodi hynny ar ôl ddoe. Mae'r mentrau hyn yn rhagorol a rhaid inni annog pobl i ddefnyddio cynnyrch Cymreig gymaint â phosibl. Yr wyf yn falch i Janet Ryder sôn am fenter Wrecsam. Yr ydym yn falch o'r hyn a wna Wrecsam. Gobeithiaf y caiff cynllun o'r fath ei gyflwyno ledled Cymru oherwydd mae'n adlewyrchu'r hyn y mae'r mudiad cydweithredol wedi ei wneud yn ei siopau o ran gwerthu bariau siocled masnach deg ac yn y blaen. Er nad yw'n gynnyrch Cymreig, rhydd gyfran deg i gynhyrchwyr. Nid yw hynny wedi digwydd yn ddigon aml yn y gorffennol. Er mwyn i'n cwmnïau llwyddiannus sy'n cynhyrchu bwyd gystadlu yn y byd modern—ac yr ydym oll yn cefnogi hynny—rhaid iddynt gael yr offer gorau. Cyfeiriaf, yn anarferol, at ymarfer caffael. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol osod esiampl dda o ran caffael. Mae ffatri yn fy etholaeth i, Desk Link, yn gweithgynhyrchu offer swyddfa. Yr oeddem yn falch pan agorodd y Prif Weinidog y ffatri ym mis Hydref 2001. Mae'n cyflogi 140 o staff, a chafodd grant cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol o fwy nag £1 filiwn. Fodd bynnag, ni all dendro i gyflenwi offer swyddfa i'r Cynulliad. Bydd rhai o Aelodau'r Cynulliad cyntaf yn cofio i'r cwmni ysgrifennu atom

year extension would be allocated to the company that won the first tender. That is not setting a good example, and I hope that we will set a better examples in the future. That factory employs 140 staff in a highly deprived area, and the regional selective assistance was provided to establish it. People expect fair tendering opportunities.

I raise another point. Although it is not a cardinal sin, it is strange that people walk around the National Assembly for Wales carrying bottles of English water. I have nothing against English water, and I enjoy being part of the United Kingdom, but that would not happen in Scotland. This is a centre for democracy in Wales, and people visit this country because they want to see something of Wales. I hope that the House Committee will take that into account, as there are plenty of good bottled water suppliers in Wales. We need to be more aware of issues such as that. I support today's motion; it is important that we support Welsh companies and Welsh produce, and I look forward to the Minister's good work in the future.

**Glyn Davies:** I am pleased that this motion, which was tabled by a Labour Government, is broadly sympathetic to the countryside. That makes a change. I am becoming used to linking the word, 'Labour', with a total lack of understanding or sympathy for the countryside, for its traditions or the interests of country people, whether commercial or social. This week's shenanigans in the House of Commons over the Hunting with Dogs Bill exposed Labour for what it is—an enemy of the countryside and of country people. I spoke to Brynle Williams this morning, and we both agreed that the sooner a Conservative Government returns, the better off the population of the countryside will be.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** *rose—*

**Glyn Davies:** Wait a minute. Leighton Andrews made dismissive, contemptuous comments yesterday about 'old' farmers. It was deeply offensive, and it showed that a prejudice against rural people is at the heart of Labour. It is running through its veins to

ynglŷn â'r mater hwnnw. Awgrymwyd y byddai estyniad o ddwy flynedd yn cael ei roi i'r cwmni a enillodd y tendr cyntaf. Nid gosod esiampl dda yw hynny, a gobeithiaf y byddwn yn gosod esiampl well yn y dyfodol. Mae'r ffatri honno yn cyflogi 140 o staff mewn ardal ddifreintiedig iawn, a darparwyd y cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol i'w sefydlu. Mae pobl yn disgwyl cyfleoedd tendro teg.

Codaf bwynt arall. Er nad yw'n bechod marwol, mae'n rhyfedd bod pobl yn cerdded o amgylch Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cario poteli o ddŵr o Loegr. Nid oes gennyf ddim yn erbyn dŵr o Loegr, a mwyhaf fod yn rhan o'r Deyrnas Unedig, ond ni fyddai hynny'n digwydd yn yr Alban. Mae hon yn ganolfan ar gyfer democratiaeth yng Nghymru, ac mae pobl yn ymweld â'r wlad hon am eu bod am weld rhywfaint o Gymru. Gobeithiaf y bydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ yn ystyried hynny, gan fod digon o gyflenwyr dŵr potel da yng Nghymru. Mae angen inni fod yn fwy ymwybodol o faterion fel hynny. Cefnogaf y cynnig heddiw; mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cefnogi cwmnïau Cymreig a chynnyrch Cymreig, ac edrychaf ymlaen at waith da y Gweinidog yn y dyfodol.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr wyf yn falch bod y cynnig hwn, a gyflwynwyd gan Lywodraeth Lafur, yn cydymdeimlo'n gyffredinol â chefn gwlad. Mae hynny'n wahanol i'r arfer. Yr wyf yn dechrau arfer â chysylltu'r gair, 'Llafur', â diffyg dealltwriaeth neu ddiffyg cydymdeimlad llwyr â chefn gwlad, am ei draddodiadau neu fuddiannau pobl wledig, boed yn fasnachol neu'n gymdeithasol. Mae helynt yr wythnos hon yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin ynglŷn â'r Mesur Hela â Chŵn wedi dangos beth yn union yw Llafur—gelyn cefn gwlad a phobl y wlad. Siaradais â Brynle Williams y bore yma a chytunodd y ddau ohonom po gyflymaf y bydd Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn dychwelyd, y gorau eu byd fydd poblogaeth cefn gwlad.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** *a gododd—*

**Glyn Davies:** Arhoswch funud. Gwnaeth Leighton Andrews sylwadau diystyriol, dirmygus ddoe am 'hen' ffermwyr. Yr oedd yn dramgwyddus iawn, a dangosodd fod rhagfarn yn erbyn pobl wledig wrth wraidd y blaid Lafur. Mae'n rhedeg drwy ei

its heart—

**Leighton Andrews:** I am pleased to say that the farmers of Rhondda voted for Labour. I was probably unkind yesterday when I used the word ‘old’ in describing Glyn and Brynle. I withdraw that word and replace it with ‘middle-aged’.

**Glyn Davies:** Thank you. You must let me know about these Labour farmers in the Rhondda. Give me their telephone numbers and I will call them; and I am sure that they will not vote Labour again. I generally support today’s motion, but it could be much improved were we to support the amendments. The issue of local procurement is not new. It is a difficult issue for two reasons. First, a host of regulations are now in place, which were inspired by the European Union and the World Trade Organisation, and which discourage local procurement. The background to that is a desire to prevent unfair competition and to promote cross-border trade, but the impact is to undermine the principle of local procurement—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Do you recall competitive tendering legislation, and which Government introduced that? That legislation meant that you had to go for the cheapest option, which made it difficult to procure goods locally.

**Glyn Davies:** An intervention is poor if it depends on a comment made by another speaker. Rhodri Glyn Thomas cannot think for himself, he is just repeating what he heard Carwyn Jones say earlier. I shall treat it with the contempt that it deserves.

We must keep our eye on exports and remember how important Welsh lamb is to the Welsh economy. Exports are crucial and we do not want to create a situation whereby our competitors will start imposing restrictions on us, therefore this is a difficult issue.

Setting quality standards would be the most effective approach that we could take. We could use farm assurance schemes, words

gwythiennau i’w chalon—

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud i ffermwyr y Rhondda bleidleisio dros y blaid Lafur. Yr oeddwn yn annheg ddoe, mae’n siŵr, pan ddefnyddiais y gair ‘hen’ i ddisgrifio Glyn a Brynle. Tynnaf y gair hwnnw yn ôl a dywedaf ‘canol oed’ yn ei le.

**Glyn Davies:** Diolch ichi. Rhaid ichi ddweud wrthyf am y ffermwyr Llafur hyn yn y Rhondda. Rhowch eu rhifau ffôn imi ac fe’u ffoniaf; ac yr wyf yn siŵr na phleidleisiant dros y blaid Lafur eto. Yn gyffredinol, cefnogaf y cynnig heddiw, ond gellid ei wella llawer pe baem yn cefnogi’r gwelliannau. Nid yw caffael yn lleol yn fater newydd. Mae’n fater anodd am ddau reswm. Yn gyntaf, mae llu o reoliadau mewn grym yn awr, a ysbrydolwyd gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd a Chorff Masnach y Byd, ac sy’n annog peidio â chaffael yn lleol. Y cefndir i hynny yw dymuniad i atal cystadleuaeth annheg a hyrwyddo masnach ar draws ffiniau, ond ei effaith yw tanseilio egwyddor caffael yn lleol—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A gofiwch ddeddfwriaeth dendro gystadleuol, a pha Lywodraeth a’i cyflwynodd? Yr oedd y ddeddfwriaeth honno yn golygu bod yn rhaid ichi ddewis yr opsiwn rhataf, a oedd yn ei gwneud yn anodd caffael nwyddau yn lleol.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae ymyriad yn wael os yw’n dibynnu ar sylw a wnaed gan siaradwr arall. Ni all Rhodri Glyn Thomas feddwl drosto ei hun. Y cyfan a wna yw ailadrodd yr hyn y clywodd Carwyn Jones yn ei ddweud yn gynharach. Ymdriniaf ag ef gyda’r dirmyg a haedda.

Rhaid inni gadw llygad ar allforion a chofio pa mor bwysig yw cig oen Cymreig i economi Cymru. Mae allforion yn hollbwysig ac nid ydym am greu sefyllfa lle y bydd ein cystadleuwyr yn dechrau gosod cyfyngiadau arnom, felly mae hwn yn fater anodd.

Gosod safonau ansawdd fyddai’r ymagwedd fwyaf effeithiol y gallem ei mabwysiadu. Gallem ddefnyddio cynlluniau sicrwydd

such as 'fresh', or product of geographical indication status. The Minister suggested that it might be possible to use quality requirements to support local procurement. We must do this, because producers resent their market being taken away as a result of purchasing policies of local councils and bodies and of what they see as unfair competition from producers that do not meet the same standards or have to cope with the same costs. If that issue is taken on board then this debate has been worthwhile.

**Leanne Wood:** Kevin Morgan and Adrian Morley from Cardiff University have prepared an excellent report, 'Relocalising the Food Chain: The Role of Creative Public Procurement'. There are recommendations in the report about thinking global and buying local. I ask the Minister to consider implementing those recommendations because the potential knock-on effects are healthier diets, a reduction in food poverty, benefits for local economies and a cleaner environment because food travels fewer miles.

In terms of thinking globally, we must consider the impact of the fast food and soft drink industries. They have enormous vested interests that must be confronted at every political level. These large companies—which I will not name—have contracts with schools in the United States and are looking to have such contracts here, which fits in neatly with the privatisation agenda. We must make every effort to ensure that burger companies do not have logos on school sports wear and that the interests of these multinational corporations are not furthered through schools or other public bodies in Wales. Apart from the global consequences, the actions of multinationals also have a huge impact on obesity levels among school children. We must be aware of their potential impact and do all that we can to fight against the power that they wield.

**Janet Ryder:** Purchasing locally can bring many benefits. Carmarthenshire County Council has estimated that if it can buy and source locally then it can put over £210 million back into the local economy. Glyn,

fferm, geiriau fel 'ffres' neu gynnyrch sydd â statws nodi tarddiad daearyddol. Awgrymodd y Gweinidog y gallai fod yn bosibl defnyddio gofynion ansawdd i gefnogi caffael yn lleol. Rhaid inni wneud hyn, gan fod cynhyrchwyr yn mynd yn ddig pan fyddant yn colli eu marchnad o ganlyniad i bolisiau prynu cynghorau lleol a chyrrff a'r hyn sydd, yn eu barn hwy, yn gystadleuaeth annheg oddi wrth gynhyrchwyr nad ydynt yn bodloni'r un safonau neu nad ydynt yn gorfod ymdopi â'r un costau. Os ystyrir y mater hwnnw yna mae'r ddadl hon wedi bod yn fuddiol.

**Leanne Wood:** Mae Kevin Morgan ac Adrian Morley o Brifysgol Caerdydd wedi paratoi adroddiad rhagorol, 'Relocalising the Food Chain: The Role of Creative Public Procurement'. Mae argymhellion yn yr adroddiad ynglŷn â meddwl yn fyd-eang a phrynu'n lleol. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried gweithredu'r argymhellion hynny gan mai effeithiau dilynol posibl yw diet iachach, lleihad mewn tloidi bwyd, buddiannau i economïau lleol ac amgylchedd glanach am fod bwyd yn teithio llai o filltiroedd.

O ran meddwl yn fyd-eang, rhaid inni ystyried effaith y diwydiannau bwyd cyflym a diodydd meddal. Mae iddynt eu buddiannau enfawr eu hunain y mae'n rhaid ymdrin â hwy ar bob lefel wleidyddol. Mae gan y cwmnïau mawr hyn—nas enwaf—gontractau gydag ysgolion yn yr Unol Daleithiau ac maent yn gobeithio cael contractau o'r fath yma, sy'n cydweddu'n gyfleus â'r agenda breifateiddio. Rhaid inni wneud pob ymdrech i sicrhau nad oes gan gwmnïau byrgrgyr logos ar ddillad chwaraeon ysgolion ac na hyrwyddir buddiannau'r corfforaethau amlwladol hyn ymhellach drwy ysgolion neu gyrff cyhoeddus eraill yng Nghymru. Ar wahân i'r canlyniadau byd-eang, mae gweithredoedd cwmnïau amlwladol yn cael effaith enfawr ar lefelau gordewdra ymhlith plant ysgol. Rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol o'u heffaith bosibl a gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i ymladd yn erbyn y grym a feddant.

**Janet Ryder:** Gall prynu'n lleol greu llawer o fanteision. Mae Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin wedi amcangyfrif y gall roi mwy na £210 miliwn yn ôl i'r economi leol, os gall brynu a chael adnoddau'n lleol. Glyn, dywed

councils say that one of the strongest factors that stops them from buying locally is the negative impact of years of compulsory competitive tendering, which forced them to buy in bulk and to buy cheaply. Competitive tendering has destroyed the local firms that could have supplied councils with goods. Therefore, amendment 4 seeks to encourage the Assembly to ensure that the local supply chain is developed and maintained. Local authorities can provide a market but there must be a supply chain for them to buy in bulk, and that chain was destroyed under the Tory Government's compulsory competitive tendering. I am pleased to hear that the Tories might be changing their views. Councils can make a difference. Many councils still operate under tendered contracts and are having to take them out little by little, but Denbighshire County Council is piloting a scheme whereby three schools will each draw up their own menu and source it locally. All of its residential homes already source their own food locally. Local authorities can have a big impact, but they have to turn around the many negative years of Tory Government.

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** For the first time in many years, and possibly for the first time ever, this motion will enable local suppliers to supply their local schools and hospitals. The procurement initiative is designed to take that forward while recognising that European law applies. It is looking at ways of creating links between suppliers and buyers. While Rhodri Glyn is right to say that Sainsbury's is not yet part of the public sector in Wales, the same principle applies. It is important that producers and buyers get together to ensure that they understand each other's requirements. It is also important that we enable schools and hospitals to source produce such as meat, dairy products and so on locally.

4.20 p.m.

**Leighton Andrews:** On dairy produce, I draw your attention to the success of one supplier. Ice cream from Mr Creemy has now been procured by the staff coffee shop. It is

cynghorau mai un o'r ffactorau pennaf sy'n eu hatal rhag prynu'n lleol yw effaith negyddol blynyddoedd o dendro cystadleuol gorfodol, a'u gorfododd i brynu mewn crynswth ac i brynu'n rhad. Mae tendro cystadleuol wedi dinistrio'r cwmnïau lleol a allai fod wedi darparu nwyddau i gynghorau. Felly, ceisia gwelliant 4 annog y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod y gadwyn gyflenwi leol yn cael ei datblygu a'i chynnal. Gall awdurdodau lleol ddarparu marchnad ond rhaid cael cadwyn gyflenwi iddynt brynu mewn crynswth a dinistriwyd y gadwyn honno o dan dendro cystadleuol gorfodol y Llywodraeth Doriaidd. Yr wyf yn falch o glywed bod y Toriaid yn newid eu safbwynt o bosibl. Gall cynghorau wneud gwahaniaeth. Mae llawer o gynghorau yn parhau i weithredu o dan gontractau wedi eu tendro ac maent yn gorfod eu dileu fesul tipyn, ond mae Cyngor Sir Ddinbych yn treialu cynllun lle y bydd tair ysgol yn llunio eu bwydlen eu hunain ac yn prynu'r bwyd yn lleol. Mae pob un o'i gartrefi preswyl eisoes yn prynu eu bwyd eu hunain yn lleol. Gall awdurdodau lleol gael effaith fawr, ond rhaid iddynt wyrdroi blynyddoedd lawer o effaith negyddol Llywodraeth Doriaidd.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Am y tro cyntaf ers blynyddoedd lawer, ac o bosibl am y tro cyntaf erioed, bydd y cynnig hwn yn galluogi cyflenwyr lleol i gyflenwi eu hysgolion a'u hysbytai lleol. Cynlluniwyd y fenter caffael i ddatblygu hynny tra'n cydnabod bod cyfraith Ewrop yn gymwys. Mae'n edrych ar ffyrdd o greu cysylltiadau rhwng cyflenwyr a phrynwyr. Er bod Rhodri Glyn yn iawn i ddweud nad yw Sainsbury's eto yn rhan o'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, mae'r un egwyddor yn gymwys. Mae'n bwysig bod cynhyrchwyr a phrynwyr yn dod at ei gilydd i sicrhau eu bod yn deall gofynion ei gilydd. Mae'n bwysig hefyd ein bod yn galluogi ysgolion ac ysbytai i ddod o hyd i gynnyrch fel cig, cynnyrch llaeth ac yn y blaen, yn lleol.

**Leighton Andrews:** O ran cynnyrch llaeth, tynnaf eich sylw at lwyddiant un cyflenwr. Bellach prynwyd hufen iâ Mr Creemy gan staff y siop goffi. Fe'i gwneir gan Mike a



made by Mike and Kevin Jenkins of Penygraig. Their Sub Zero brand of ice cream is now on sale upstairs in the staff coffee shop, and I recommend the 'slam dunk crunch' variety particularly.

**Carwyn Jones:** I will try that, of course. It is important that the Assembly shop sets the standard for what is produced and bought in Wales. I am glad that a product from the Labour heartland of Rhondda has found its way to the coffee shop. It is also important that people understand that, where there are small suppliers, there are often opportunities for them to work together more closely to ensure they have more muscle in the market.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Will you consider how the Assembly can provide incentives, support and guidance to promote all forms of co-operatives to assist and strengthen the local food supply chain in addition to the procurement route?

**Carwyn Jones:** You are absolutely right; co-operatives are often a sound means for smaller companies to access markets that would otherwise be inaccessible. We want to encourage that approach, and we are doing so, as you will have heard in my opening speech.

The point made about free breakfasts and Welsh produce is interesting and I will take that up with Jane Davidson to see what we can do, subject to European Union law. On other speakers' remarks, I need only add this—

**Leanne Wood:** On the matter of European competition law, do you accept that we lag way behind France and Italy in local procurement? In placing a greater emphasis on quality food, as opposed to cheap food, for example, and arguing that the freshness of food be taken into consideration, we could ensure that fresh food would have to be procured locally. We could then work creatively around these European competition laws.

**Carwyn Jones:** As I understand it, the situation in France in particular is that contracts have generally been awarded for far smaller levels of supply. Therefore, the

Kevin Jenkins o Benygraig. Mae eu hufen iâ Sub Zero ar werth i fyny'r grisiau yn siop goffi'r staff, ac yr wyf yn argymhell y math 'slam dunk crunch' o hufen iâ yn arbennig.

**Carwyn Jones:** Rhoddaf gynnig ar hwnnw, wrth gwrs. Mae'n bwysig bod siop y Cynulliad yn gosod y safon ar gyfer hyn a gynhyrchir ac a brynir yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn falch bod cynnyrch o gadarnle'r blaidd Lafur yn y Rhondda wedi cyrraedd y siop goffi. Mae'n bwysig hefyd bod pobl yn deall, pan fo cyflenwyr bach ar gael, bod cyfleoedd yn aml iddynt gydweithio'n agosach i sicrhau bod ganddynt fwy o rym yn y farchnad.

**Lorraine Barrett:** A wnewch ystyried sut y gall y Cynulliad ddarparu cymhellion, cymorth ac arweiniad i hyrwyddo pob math o gwmni cydweithredol i helpu a chryfhau'r gadwyn cyflenwi bwyd leol yn ogystal â'r llwybr caffael?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr ydych yn hollol gywir; mae cwmnïau cydweithredol yn aml yn ffordd ragorol i gwmnïau llai fanteisio ar farchnadoedd a fyddai fel arall yn anhygyrch. Yr ydym am annog yr ymagwedd honno, ac yr ydym yn gwneud hynny, fel y byddwch wedi clywed yn fy araith agoriadol.

Mae'r pwynt ynglŷn â brecwast am ddim a chynnyrch Cymreig yn ddiddorol a byddaf yn trafod hynny gyda Jane Davidson i weld beth y gallwn ei wneud, yn amodol ar gyfraith yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. O ran sylwadau'r siaradwyr eraill, yr unig beth yr wyf am ei ychwanegu yw—

**Leanne Wood:** O ran cyfraith cystadlu Ewropeaidd, a dderbyniwch ein bod ar ei hôl hi o'n cymharu â Ffrainc a'r Eidal o ran caffael yn lleol? Wrth roi mwy o bwyslais ar fwyd o safon, o'i gyferbynnu â bwyd rhad, er enghraifft, a dadlau y dylid ystyried ffresni bwyd, gallem sicrhau y byddai'n rhaid i fwyd ffres gael ei gaffael yn lleol. Yna gallem weithio'n greadigol o amgylch y cyfreithiau cystadlu Ewropeaidd hyn.

**Carwyn Jones:** Fel y deallaf, y sefyllfa yn Ffrainc yn arbennig yw bod contractau wedi eu dyfarnu'n gyffredinol am lefelau llai o lawer o gyflenwadau. Felly, ni fyddai'r

normal rules would not apply. For example, instead of offering a catering contract to a big company, a local authority might look for contracts for the supply of potatoes and carrots, for example, as separate items. I want to look at that possibility because I am told that, in France, food can be sourced from local suppliers.

On the Conservatives' points, I do not accept that the Labour Party is prejudiced against the countryside. However, the Conservative Party's entire political philosophy is based on prejudice. Also, there was no greater disincentive to local suppliers accessing schools and hospitals than compulsory competitive tendering. Schools were forced to buy coal from Colombia instead of local coal. They were forced to buy from the suppliers with the cheapest possible goods. They were not allowed to source from local suppliers.

**David Davies:** Was it not the case that, prior to that, in certain Labour councils, local authorities simply bought from friends of the local Labour councillors?

**Carwyn Jones:** I would like you to make those allegations outside the comfort zone of the Chamber and name names.

**David Davies** *rose*—

**Carwyn Jones:** Go on, fire away.

**David Davies:** If the Minister casts his mind back a few years, Ron Davies, when he was Secretary of State for Wales, published a document on the opening page of which he drew attention to the problems of corruption in certain south Wales Valleys.

**Carwyn Jones:** There was no greater scam than that practised in Wandsworth where people were forced out of council houses that were then sold off to the highest bidder. That is prejudice and that is the Conservative Party's philosophy. They sit here and say—and I have heard Nick Bourne say this—that they encourage people to buy British, but it is a case of buying British as long as you are not in the public sector—in which case you have to buy cheap. At last, we are encouraging people to source locally. We are

rheolau arferol yn gymwys. Er enghraifft, yn lle cynnig contract arlwyo i gwmni mawr, gallai awdurdod lleol edrych am gcontractau i gyflenwi tatws a moron, er enghraifft, fel eitemau ar wahân. Yr wyf am edrych ar y posibilrwydd hwnnw oherwydd dywedir wrthyf, yn Ffrainc, y gellir prynu bwyd oddi wrth gyflenwyr lleol.

O ran pwyntiau'r Ceidwadwyr, ni dderbyniaf fod gan y Blaid Lafur ragfarn yn erbyn cefn gwlad. Fodd bynnag, seilir athroniaeth wleidyddol gyfan y Blaid Geidwadol ar ragfarn. Hefyd, nid oedd mwy o ddiffyg cymhelliant i gyflenwyr lleol ysgolion ac ysbytai na thendro cystadleuol gorfodol. Gorfodwyd ysgolion i brynu glo o Golombia yn lle glo lleol. Fe'u gorfodwyd i brynu oddi wrth y cyflenwyr â'r nwyddau rhataf posibl. Ni chaniatawyd iddynt brynu oddi wrth gyflenwyr lleol.

**David Davies:** Onid oedd yn wir bod awdurdodau lleol, cyn hynny, mewn rhai cynghorau Llafur, yn prynu oddi wrth ffrindiau'r cynghorwyr Llafur lleol?

**Carwyn Jones:** Hoffwn ichi wneud yr honiadau hynny y tu allan i ardal gysurus y Siambr ac enwi enwau.

**David Davies** *a gododd*—

**Carwyn Jones:** Ymlaen â chi.

**David Davies:** Bydd y Gweinidog yn cofio i Ron Davies, ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl pan oedd yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, gyhoeddi dogfen ac ar y dudalen agoriadol iddo dynnu sylw at broblemau llygredd yn rhai o gymoedd y De.

**Carwyn Jones:** Ni fu mwy o dwyll na'r hyn a wnaed yn Wandsworth lle y gorfodwyd pobl i adael tai cyngor a werthwyd wedyn am y cynnig uchaf. Rhagfarn yw hynny a dyna yw athroniaeth y Blaid Geidwadol. Eisteddant yno a dweud—ac yr wyf wedi clywed Nick Bourne yn dweud hyn—y byddent yn annog pobl i brynu nwyddau o Brydain, ond y gwir yw ei bod yn iawn prynu nwyddau o Brydain ar yr amod nad ydych yn rhan o'r sector cyhoeddus—ac os felly rhaid oedd prynu nwyddau rhad. O'r diwedd, yr

the friends of the countryside and we know who its enemies are. ydym yn annog pobl i brynu nwyddau yn lleol. Ni yw cyfeillion cefn gwlad a gwyddom pwy yw ei elynion.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 10, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 36.  
Amendment 1: For 10, Abstain 10, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Williams, Brynle

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Denise Idris  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 2: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Isherwood, Mark  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 3: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Isherwood, Mark  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn

Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 4: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 5: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary

Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 6: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine

Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 7: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Isherwood, Mark  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Cynnig (NDM1528): O blaid 56, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1528): For 56, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David

Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Cynigion i Wella Diogelwch ar y Ffyrdd ger Ysgolion Proposals to Improve Road Safety around Schools**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan and amendments 2, 3 and 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan a gwelliannau 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

We have half an hour for this debate, which should be enough time. However, the briefer the speeches, the more popular Members will be.

Hanner awr sydd gennym ar gyfer y ddadl hon, a dylai hynny fod yn ddigon o amser. Fodd bynnag, yr Aelodau sy'n traddodi yr areithiau byrraf fydd fwyaf poblogaidd.

4.30 p.m.



**The Deputy Minister for Transport (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales recognises the valuable contribution of the Welsh Assembly Government to improving road safety around schools and welcomes the views of Members on progressing this work through the partnerships of the Welsh Road Safety Forum and the aims and objectives of the road safety strategy for Wales. (NDM1529)*

I hope that I will be popular with you, Deputy Presiding Officer.

Improving road safety around schools is one of the Welsh Assembly Government's main priorities. The road safety strategy is particularly important to me because it was launched in my constituency by the Minister formerly responsible for transport, Sue Essex, at the Dalton Road Community Centre. Many Members will be familiar with the casualty reduction targets that the Welsh Assembly Government has set, but they do bear repeating. By 2010, we want to reduce the overall number of deaths and serious injuries in Wales by over 40 per cent. That means reducing the number of people killed or seriously injured from just over 2,000 per year to under 1,200 per year. We are determined to halve the number of children killed or seriously injured on roads from the present level of almost 290 per year. That target is even more challenging and is particularly important. Overall, the UK has a relatively good road safety record by European standards. However, it is among the worst in terms of child pedestrian safety. That is why the road safety strategy has a chapter on targets relating to children.

**John Griffiths:** There are still far too many accidents involving child pedestrians on our council estates and in inner urban areas. Do you believe that we should have a 15 or 20 mph speed limit in such areas? If so, do you believe that that would reduce those casualty figures?

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Drafnidiaeth (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cydnabod cyfraniad gwerthfawr Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'r gwaith o wella diogelwch ar y ffyrdd ger ysgolion, ac y mae'n croesawu barn yr Aelodau ar fwrw ati â'r gwaith hwn trwy bartneriaethau'r Fforwm Diogelwch ar y Ffyrdd yng Nghymru ac ar nodau ac amcanion y Strategaeth Diogelwch ar y Ffyrdd i Gymru. (NDM1529)*

Gobeithiaf y byddaf yn boblogaidd gyda chi, Ddirprwy Lywydd.

Mae gwella diogelwch ar y ffyrdd ger ysgolion yn un o brif flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae'r strategaeth diogelwch ar y ffyrdd yn arbennig o bwysig i mi oherwydd iddi gael ei lansio yn fy etholaeth gan y cyn-Weinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros drafnidiaeth, Sue Essex, yng Nghanolfan Gymunedol Dalton Road. Bydd llawer o Aelodau yn gyfarwydd â'r targedau i leihau damweiniau a bennwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ond mae'n werth eu hailadrodd. Erbyn 2010, yr ydym am leihau nifer gyffredinol y marwolaethau a'r anafiadau difrifol yng Nghymru fwy na 40 y cant. Golyga hynny leihau nifer y bobl a gaiff eu lladd neu eu hanafu'n ddifrifol o ychydig dros 2,000 y flwyddyn i lai na 1,200 y flwyddyn. Yr ydym yn benderfynol o haneru nifer y plant a gaiff eu lladd neu eu hanafu'n ddifrifol ar y ffyrdd o'r lefel bresennol o bron 290 y flwyddyn. Mae'r targed hwnnw hyd yn oed yn fwy heriol ac mae'n arbennig o bwysig. Yn gyffredinol, mae gan y DU record gymharol dda o ran diogelwch ar y ffyrdd o gymharu â safonau Ewropeaidd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r DU ymhlith y gwledydd gwaethaf o ran diogelwch cerddwyr sy'n blant. Dyna pam mae pennod ar dargedau yn ymwneud â phlant yn y strategaeth diogelwch ar y ffyrdd.

**John Griffiths:** Mae llawer gormod o ddamweiniau sy'n ymwneud â cerddwyr sy'n blant yn parhau i ddigwydd ar ein hystadau cyngor ac mewn ardaloedd yng nghanol trefi. A gredwch y dylem gael cyfyngiad cyflymder o 15 neu 20 milltir yr awr mewn ardaloedd o'r fath? Os felly, a gredwch y byddai hynny'n lleihau'r ffigurau hynny o

ran damweiniau?

**Brian Gibbons:** I will refer to that in detail later. However, we support the general thrust of your point.

Although our record in terms of child pedestrian safety is not particularly good by European standards, the road casualty figures for Wales for the past year show that the number of children killed or seriously injured was 34 per cent lower than it was on average between 1994 and 1998. That is excellent news, and shows that we should be on course to reach our 2010 target. However, we can never be complacent, not least because the figures for one year do not constitute a trend. There is still much more to be done to produce sustainable reductions. The chapter on children's road safety emphasises that, in order to achieve the target, several objectives need to be addressed. We need to analyse the causes of child casualties—which relates to John's comments—to address the road safety needs of children in different age groups, to encourage more young people to take up walking and cycling as part of their personal and social development, and to treat children as partners in improving road safety and not merely discuss the issue ourselves.

**Kirsty Williams:** On encouraging children to walk to school, while there is a 20 mph speed limit outside the Howey Church in Wales Primary School, children have to walk on a pavement along a trunk road to reach the school. Despite repeated calls from the community, the Minister has not seen fit to reduce the speed limit in the village from 50 mph to 40 mph. The same situation exists in Libanus, where the needs of trunk road users are seen as more important than those of the children, who have to walk along the trunk road to Libanus Primary School. Despite the Assembly's best efforts, it also cannot persuade Powys County Council to reduce the speed limit on the road by Coelbren School, although it is not a trunk road, to 20 mph. Will you agree, as the Deputy Minister responsible for these issues, to consider those three cases?

**Brian Gibbons:** Cyfeiriaf at hynny yn fanwl yn ddiweddarach. Fodd bynnag, cefnogwn bwyslais cyffredinol eich pwynt.

Er nad yw ein record o ran diogelwch cerddwyr sy'n blant yn arbennig o dda o gymharu â safonau Ewropeaidd, dengys y ffigurau o ran damweiniau ar y ffyrdd yng Nghymru ar gyfer y flwyddyn ddiwethaf fod nifer y plant a gafodd eu lladd neu eu hanafu'n ddifrifol 34 y cant yn is na'r cyfartaledd rhwng 1994 a 1998. Mae hynny'n newyddion ardderchog, a dengys y dylem fod ar y trywydd cywir i gyrraedd ein targed ar gyfer 2010. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn fyth fod yn hunanfodlon, nid lleiaf gan nad yw'r ffigurau am un flwyddyn yn golygu bod tuedd. Erys llawer mwy i'w wneud i sicrhau gostyngiadau cynaliadwy. Mae'r bennod ar ddiogelwch plant ar y ffyrdd yn pwysleisio bod angen mynd i'r afael â nifer o amcanion er mwyn cyrraedd y targed. Mae angen inni ddadansoddi'r hyn sy'n achosi damweiniau ymhlith plant—sy'n ymwneud â sylwadau John—er mwyn ymdrin ag anghenion plant mewn grwpiau oedran gwahanol o ran diogelwch ar y ffyrdd, er mwyn annog mwy o bobl ifanc i gerdded a seiclo fel rhan o'u datblygiad personol a chymdeithasol, ac er mwyn trin plant fel partneriaid wrth wella diogelwch ar y ffyrdd ac nid trafod y mater ein hunain yn unig.

**Kirsty Williams:** O ran annog plant i gerdded i'r ysgol, er bod cyfyngiad cyflymder o 20 milltir yr awr y tu allan i ysgol gynradd yr Eglwys yng Nghymru yn Hawau, rhaid i blant gerdded ar balmant ar hyd cefnffordd i gyrraedd yr ysgol. Er gwaethaf galwadau niferus gan y gymuned, ni welodd y Gweinidog yn dda i ostwng y cyfyngiad cyflymder yn y pentref o 50 milltir yr awr i 40 milltir yr awr. Ceir yr un sefyllfa yn Libanus, lle yr ystyrir bod anghenion y rhai sy'n defnyddio'r gefnffordd yn bwysicach nag anghenion y plant, sy'n gorfod cerdded ar hyd y gefnffordd i Ysgol Gynradd Libanus. Er gwaethaf ymdrechion gorau'r Cynulliad, ni all ddarbwylllo Cyngor Sir Powys i ostwng y cyfyngiad cyflymder ar y ffordd ger Ysgol Coelbren ychwaith, er nad cefnffordd ydyw, i 20 milltir yr awr. A gytunwch i ystyried y tri achos hynny, yn

rhinwedd eich swydd fel y Dirprwy Weinidog sy'n gyfrifol am y materion hyn?

**Brian Gibbons:** I will certainly consider those cases. The point that you raise is particularly important because we provide a special local road transport safety scheme, in addition to urban, towns and villages schemes, to address the problems that you highlighted. We have a holistic strategy for Wales.

**Brian Gibbons:** Byddaf yn sicr yn ystyried yr achosion hynny. Mae'r pwynt a godwch yn arbennig o bwysig gan ein bod yn darparu cynllun diogelwch trafnidiaeth ar y ffyrdd lleol arbennig, yn ogystal â chynlluniau ar gyfer trefi a phentrefi, er mwyn ymdrin â'r problemau a amlygwyd gennych. Mae gennym strategaeth gyfannol i Gymru.

I have been diverted to the wrong page of my notes by that intervention. [*Laughter.*]

Yr wyf wedi troi i'r dudalen anghywir yn fy nodiadau yn sgîl yr ymyriad hwnnw. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Alun Cairns:** Would you like to give my speech?

**Alun Cairns:** A hoffech draddodi fy araith i?

**Brian Gibbons:** If it comes from the Cairns Group in Australia, I would rather not.

**Brian Gibbons:** Os daw oddi wrth Grŵp Cairns yn Awstralia, byddai'n well gennyf beidio.

We need to analyse why accidents involving children take place. When Sue Essex launched the road safety strategy in Port Talbot, a highlight of the event was the active participation of up to 50 schools in the Neath Port Talbot area in the poster competition associated with the road safety strategy. Work on implementing the strategy will be undertaken and developed by the Welsh road safety forum, which has been established to advise the Assembly and its partners on road safety policy issues and to monitor the progress made on achieving that target. The forum comprises representatives of a diverse range of interest groups, from the Royal Society for the Prevention of Accidents, the Road Operators' Safety Council, and the Disabled Persons Transport Advisory Committee, to the British Heart Foundation, motorcycling interest groups, and Friends of the Earth. The forum has also established a sub-group to consider issues relating to children's safety.

Mae angen inni ddadansoddi pam fod damweiniau sy'n cynnwys plant yn digwydd. Pan lansiodd Sue Essex y strategaeth diogelwch ar y ffyrdd ym Mhort Talbot, un o uchafbwyntiau'r achlysur oedd cyfranogiad hyd at 50 o ysgolion yn ardal Castell-nedd Port Talbot yn y gystadleuaeth i lunio poster a oedd yn gysylltiedig â'r strategaeth diogelwch ar y ffyrdd. Caiff gwaith i roi'r strategaeth ar waith ei gyflawni a'i ddatblygu gan y fforwm diogelwch ar y ffyrdd yng Nghymru, a sefydlwyd i roi cyngor i'r Cynulliad a'i bartneriaid ar faterion polisi o ran diogelwch ar y ffyrdd ac i fonitro'r cynnydd a wnaed i gyrraedd y targed hwnnw. Mae'r fforwm yn cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o amrywiaeth eang o grwpiau diddordeb, o'r Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Atal Damweiniau, Cyngor Diogelwch Gweithredwyr y Ffyrrdd, a'r Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol ar Gludiant Pobl Anabl, i Sefydliad Prydeinig y Galon, grwpiau er budd motorbeicwyr, a Chyfeillion y Ddaear. Mae'r fforwm wedi sefydlu is-grŵp hefyd i ystyried materion sy'n ymwneud â diogelwch plant.

The use of cars for school runs has significantly increased nationally, at the expense of walking and cycling to school. That is reflected in the fact that 25 per cent of all car journeys are made for distances of less than two miles. Not only must we improve

Mae'r defnydd o geir i gludo plant i'r ysgol wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol yn genedlaethol, ar draul cerdded a seiclo i'r ysgol. Adlewyrchir hynny yn y ffaith bod 25 y cant o'r holl deithiau mewn ceir dros bellter sy'n llai na dwy filltir. Nid yn unig y mae'n rhaid

safety and reduce road casualties, we must also promote sustainable forms of transport. However, we must strike a balance between safety and sustainability, because any increase in walking and cycling can lead to greater traffic exposure, which increases the probability of a person's sustaining an injury. In an effort to strike that balance, we established our Safe Routes to School initiative in 1999.

**Peter Black:** I take your point about walking, but do you not think that there is a problem with the statutory three-mile limit which local authorities use to assess whether or not to provide transport to schools? School journeys are often just under three miles, resulting in a difficult situation for children. For example, pupils living in the west of Swansea who attend the Welsh comprehensive school in Penlan must walk to school via several busy roads. Do you not agree that the Welsh Assembly Government should consider that matter?

**Brian Gibbons:** I have a personal interest in this matter, because there is a similar situation in the upper Afan valley. You may remember that, towards the end of the first Assembly, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning made a commitment to consider this matter. I welcomed that announcement and, given your comments, you must also have welcomed it.

The Safe Routes to School initiative is key in encouraging children to cycle and walk to school. Since it started in 1999, we have allocated over £11 million to local authorities across Wales. It now supports over 68 projects, either completed or underway, and has resulted in 220 schools having safe routes in place. The initiative is important to improve road safety, to promote healthier lifestyles for children, and to reduce car usage. The scheme will fund road crossings, traffic-calming measures, improvements to school entrances, the construction of cycle-pathways and footpaths, and will provide secure cycle facilities, lockers and changing facilities.

inni wella diogelwch a lleihau damweiniau ar y ffyrdd, rhaid inni hyrwyddo mathau cynaliadwy o drafnidiaeth hefyd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng diogelwch a chynaliadwyedd, oherwydd gall unrhyw gynnydd mewn cerdded a seiclo arwain at fwy o gysylltiad â thraffig, sy'n cynyddu tebygolrwydd unigolyn o gael ei anafu. Er mwyn ceisio sicrhau'r cydbwysedd hwnnw, bu inni sefydlu ein menter Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol yn 1999.

**Peter Black:** Derbyniaf eich pwynt ynghylch cerdded, ond oni chredwch fod problem gyda'r cyfyngiad statudol o dair milltir a ddefnyddir gan awdurdodau lleol i asesu a fyddant yn darparu cludiant i ysgolion ai peidio? Mae teithiau i'r ysgol ychydig o dan dair milltir yn aml, sy'n arwain at sefyllfa anodd i blant. Er enghraifft, mae disgyblion sy'n byw yng ngorllewin Abertawe sy'n mynychu'r ysgol gyfun Gymraeg ym Mhenlan yn gorfod cerdded ar nifer o ffyrdd prysur er mwyn cyrraedd yr ysgol. Oni chytunwch y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ystyried y mater hwnnw?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae gennyf fuddiant personol yn y mater hwn, gan fod sefyllfa debyg yng nghwm Afan uchaf. Efallai y cofiwch i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wneud ymrwymiad tuag at ddiwedd y Cynulliad cyntaf i ystyried y mater hwn. Croesewais y cyhoeddiad hwnnw ac, o ystyried eich sylwadau, rhaid eich bod chithau wedi'i groesawu hefyd.

Mae'r fenter Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol yn allweddol o ran annog plant i seiclo a cherdded i'r ysgol. Ers iddi ddechrau yn 1999, yr ydym wedi dyrannu dros £11 miliwn i awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru. Erbyn hyn, mae'n cefnogi dros 68 o brosiectau, sydd naill ai wedi'u cwblhau neu ar y gweill, ac mae wedi sicrhau bod gan 220 o ysgolion llwybrau diogel. Mae'r fenter yn bwysig er mwyn gwella diogelwch ar y ffyrdd, hybu ffyrdd iachach o fyw ymhlith plant, a lleihau'r defnydd a wneir o geir. Bydd y cynllun yn ariannu croesfannau, mesurau tawelu traffig, gwelliannau i fynedfeydd ysgolion, adeiladu llwybrau seiclo a llwybrau troed, a bydd yn darparu cyfleusterau beiciau diogel, loceri a

chyfleusterau newid.

A recent example of good practice is at Rhymney Comprehensive School, which has provided a network of high-quality safe routes, giving a much-needed boost to an economically deprived community. That is particularly important, as deprived communities have a higher rate of pedestrian casualties. The risk of being involved in accidents is seven times greater for people living in the poorest wards than for those in the most affluent wards, while the risk for children from social class 5 is five times greater than that for children from social class 1.

Cafwyd enghraifft o arfer da yn ddiweddar yn Ysgol Gyfun Rhymni, sydd wedi darparu rhwydwaith o lwybrau diogel o safon, gan roi hwb yr oedd ei angen yn ddirfawr i gymuned sy'n ddifreintiedig yn economaidd. Mae hynny'n arbennig o bwysig, am fod cyfradd uwch o ddamweiniau ymhlith cerddwyr sy'n byw mewn cymunedau difreintiedig. Mae'r risg o fod mewn damwain saith gwaith yn fwy ar gyfer pobl sy'n byw yn y wardiau tlotaf nag ar gyfer y rhai sy'n byw yn y wardiau mwyaf cyfoethog, tra bod y risg i blant o ddsbarth cymdeithasol 5 bum gwaith yn fwy na'r risg i blant o ddsbarth cymdeithasol 1.

We cannot support the amendments tabled for this debate. Amendment 1 in the name of the Conservatives, a party committed to small government, would create an excess of bureaucracy. In allocating grants to local government, we have given them the discretion to decide upon their priorities. We have asked them for reports to monitor their progress. The Conservatives' proposal would reverse that process and would require a great increase in paperwork. Consequently, we will not support that amendment.

Ni allwn gefnogi'r gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd ar gyfer y ddadl hon. Byddai gwelliant 1 yn enw'r Ceidwadwyr, plaid sy'n ymrwymedig i lywodraeth fach, yn creu gormod o fiwrocratiaeth. Wrth ddyrannu grantiau i lywodraeth leol, yr ydym wedi rhoi'r rhyddid iddynt benderfynu ar eu blaenoriaethau. Yr ydym wedi gofyn iddynt am adroddiadau i fonitro eu cynnydd. Byddai cynnig y Ceidwadwyr yn gwyrdroi'r broses honno a byddai angen llawer mwy o waith papur. O ganlyniad, ni chefnogwn y gwelliant hwnnw.

Amendments 2 and 3 are very much of the cut-and-paste variety tabled for so many debates. They do not add anything substantial to the overall argument, and we will not support them.

Mae gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn debyg iawn i'r rhai a gyflwynir ar gyfer cymaint o ddadleuon. Nid ychwanegant ddim byd o sylwedd at y ddadl gyffredinol, ac ni fyddwn yn eu cefnogi.

Amendment 4 is not technically within the remit of today's debate, although it is important and many people are concerned about the issues that it raises. However, in the context of today's debate, it is premature to give the definitive commitment that this particular amendment seeks. Several ongoing matters require serious consideration, including the coroner's report into the recent school bus accident at Ystradowen, as well as the results of pilot studies in Wrexham and elsewhere on various ways of transporting children to school. Therefore, while we understand the importance of this issue, we feel that amendment 4 is not appropriate at this time.

Nid yw gwelliant 4 o fewn pwnc trafod y ddadl heddiw yn dechnegol, er ei fod yn bwysig ac er bod llawer o bobl yn pryderu am y materion a godir ganddo. Fodd bynnag, yng nghyd-destun y ddadl heddiw, mae'n rhy gynnar rhoi'r ymrwymiad pendant y mae'r gwelliant penodol hwn yn ei geisio. Mae angen rhoi ystyriaeth ddifrifol i sawl mater sy'n parhau, gan gynnwys adroddiad y crwner i'r ddamwain bws ysgol a ddigwyddodd yn ddiweddar yn Ystradowen, yn ogystal â chanlyniadau astudiaethau peilot yn Wrecsam ac mewn mannau eraill ar ffyrdd amrywiol o gludo plant i'r ysgol. Felly, er ein bod yn deall pwysigrwydd y mater hwn, teimlwn nad yw gwelliant 4 yn briodol ar hyn o bryd.

4.40 p.m.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** In order for this debate to be concluded before the short debate, which must begin at 5 p.m., I need to call the first vote at 4.58 p.m. As only 18 minutes remain for the debate itself, I ask Members not to speak for a second longer than necessary. Not all those who want to contribute will be able to do so.

**David Davies:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to scrutinise road safety improvement projects on the local road network, nominated by local authorities and funded by specific Assembly grants, before the allocation of funding.*

I will begin on a positive note by welcoming Brian's contribution to the debate. I think that this is the first time that he has spoken as a Deputy Minister in this Assembly. I pay tribute to Peter Law and Sue Essex, neither of whom are in the Chamber at the moment. I have discussed road safety with both of them on many occasions. It was easy to approach Peter Law as Secretary for the Environment and Local Government. One of our discussions resulted in the introduction of a speed limit in Llanover. Sue Essex was also willing to visit Monmouthshire to consider road safety problems in the vicinity of schools, and did so frequently. However, despite their willingness to help to address problems, there is a huge time lag between the recognition of a problem and the taking of the decisive action needed to address it. I do not hold any one person responsible for that, as I am sure that that has always been the case. However, I do not fully understand the reasons for the time lag. I believe that much of it can be put down to civil service bureaucracy.

There is no doubt that improvements can be made, and I hope that the Minister responsible will consider the amount of paperwork required to introduce speed restrictions on trunk roads through villages.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Er mwyn gorffen y ddadl hon cyn y ddadl fer, y mae'n rhaid iddi ddechrau am 5 p.m., mae angen imi alw'r bleidlais gyntaf am 4.58 p.m. Gan mai dim ond 18 munud sydd ar ôl ar gyfer y ddadl ei hun, gofynnaf i'r Aelodau beidio â siarad eiliad yn hwy nag sydd ei angen. Ni fydd pawb sydd am gyfrannu yn gallu gwneud hynny.

**David Davies:** Cynigïaf welliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i graffu ar brosiectau i wella diogelwch ar y ffyrdd ar y rhwydwaith ffyrdd lleol, a enwebwyd gan yr awdurdodau lleol ac a ariennir drwy grantiau penodol gan y Cynulliad, cyn dyrannu arian.*

Dechreuaf yn gadarnhaol drwy groesawu cyfraniad Brian i'r ddadl. Credaf mai dyma'r tro cyntaf iddo siarad fel Dirprwy Weinidog yn y Cynulliad hwn. Talaf deyrnged i Peter Law a Sue Essex, nad ydynt yn y Siambr ar hyn o bryd. Yr wyf wedi trafod diogelwch ar y ffyrdd gyda'r ddau droeon. Yr oedd yn hawdd siarad â Peter Law fel yr Ysgrifennydd dros yr Amgylchedd a Llywodraeth Leol. Yn sgîl un o'n trafodaethau cyflwynwyd cyfyngiad cyflymder yn Llanover. Yr oedd Sue Essex hefyd yn barod i ymweld â sir Fynwy i ystyried problemau diogelwch ar y ffyrdd ger ysgolion, a gwnaeth hynny'n aml. Fodd bynnag, er gwaethaf eu parodrwydd i helpu i ymdrin â phroblemau, ceir bwlch amser mawr rhwng cydnabod problem a chymryd y cam pendant sydd ei angen i ymdrin â hi. Ni ddaliaf unrhyw unigolyn yn gyfrifol am hynny, gan fy mod yn siŵr i hynny fod yn wir erioed. Fodd bynnag, ni ddeallaf y rhesymau dros y bwlch amser yn llwyr. Credaf y gellir priodoli llawer ohono i fiwrocratiaeth y gwasanaeth sifil.

Yn ddiamau, gellir gwneud gwelliannau, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol yn ystyried y gwaith papur sydd ei angen i gyflwyno cyfyngiadau cyflymder ar gefnffyrdd drwy bentrefi. Mae'r sefyllfa yn

The situation is improving. However, as someone who lives on the Welsh border and must drive through England to travel from Monmouth to Chepstow, it seems to me that English authorities are far more willing than the Assembly to introduce speed restrictions on trunk roads through villages. I hope that this will be addressed over the next few years.

Local authorities have implemented measures to introduce 20 mph speed limits around schools and, by and large, these seem to be successful, although complaints have been made about traffic humps. This work must continue, but we must be careful that the action taken does not undermine public confidence.

Much work remains to be done on school transport. I add my support to bus safety campaigns such as BUSK—Belt Up School Kids—and Stuart's Campaign, which have done much good work in highlighting concerns about the lack of safety belts on school buses. It is sad to note that Stuart's Campaign was formed after the tragic death of a pupil travelling by bus last year.

Even without safety belts, buses are a much safer mode of transport than cars. However, they could be safer still. I am sure that all Members would support the provision of safety belts on school buses, given that they are now mandatory on long-distance coaches.

We would be neglecting our duties if we did not recognise the problem and take steps to address it. I am not suggesting that we take all buses off the road immediately and fit them with belts. That would be a simplistic response to a complicated problem; it could make matters worse if we were to act without thinking matters through.

If safety belts are to be installed on school buses, it is important that the cost is borne by the Government. It would be counter-productive were operators to pass on the costs to consumers, as that could lead to

gwella. Fodd bynnag, fel rhywun sy'n byw ar y gororau ac sy'n gorfod gyrru drwy Loegr i deithio o sir Fynwy i Gas-gwent, ymddengys i mi fod awdurdodau yn Lloegr yn llawer mwy parod na'r Cynulliad i gyflwyno cyfyngiadau cyflymder ar gefnffyrdd drwy bentrefi. Gobeithiaf yr ymdrinnir â hyn yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf.

Mae awdurdodau lleol wedi rhoi mesurau ar waith i gyflwyno cyfyngiadau cyflymder o 20 milltir yr awr o amgylch ysgolion ac ymddengys bod y rhain yn llwyddiannus i raddau helaeth, er bod cwynion wedi codi ynghylch twmpathau traffig. Rhaid i'r gwaith hwn barhau, ond rhaid inni fod yn ofalus nad yw'r camau a gymerir yn tanseilio hyder y cyhoedd.

Mae llawer o waith i'w wneud o hyd o ran cludiant i ysgolion. Ychwanegaf fy nghefnogaeth i ymgyrchoedd diogelwch bysiau megis BUSK—Belt Up School Kids—ac Ymgyrch Stuart, sydd wedi gwneud llawer o waith da o ran amlygu pryderon ynghylch diffyg gwregysau diogelwch ar fysiau ysgol. Mae'n drist nodi i Ymgyrch Stuart gael ei sefydlu ar ôl marwolaeth drasig disgybl a oedd yn teithio mewn bws y llynedd.

Hyd yn oed heb wregysau diogelwch, mae bysiau yn llawer mwy diogel na cheir. Fodd bynnag, gallent fod hyd yn oed yn fwy diogel. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai pob Aelod o blaid darparu gwregysau diogelwch ar fysiau ysgol, o ystyried eu bod bellach yn orfodol ar fysiau pellter hir.

Byddem yn esgeuluso ein dyletswyddau pe na chydabyddem y broblem a chymryd camau i ymdrin â hi. Nid awgrymaf y dylem dynnu pob bws oddi ar y ffordd ar unwaith a gosod gwregysau ynddynt. Byddai hynny'n ymateb rhy syml i broblem gymhleth; gallai waethygu'r sefyllfa pe byddem yn gweithredu heb ystyried y materion yn ofalus.

Os bwriedir gosod gwregysau diogelwch mewn bysiau ysgol, mae'n bwysig i'r Llywodraeth dalu'r gost. Byddai'n wrthgynhyrchiol i gwmnïau drosglwyddo'r costau i ddefnyddwyr, oherwydd gallai hynny

parents opting to take their children to school by car, thus, according to statistics, increasing the danger that pupils face.

As time is short today, I simply ask the Minister to undertake a study as soon as possible to estimate the costs of fitting safety belts in buses, to consider whether it could be made compulsory for children to wear safety belts on buses, and, if so, to consider how that could be enforced and where liability would lie were a bus accident to take place.

There is no time for me to deal with all the issues. On some issues in politics, we can hold sharply contrasting opinions, which we should rightly express in the Chamber—that is what we are elected to do. However, this is not such an issue. Suggestions made by Members of all political parties should be considered constructively.

**Janet Davies:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 2: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Assembly Government to encourage local authorities to make maximum use of traffic calming measures in areas around school entrances.*

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*recognises the need for further improvement, with particular regard to the extension of the Safe Routes to School programme.*

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*supports the principle of adult supervision—in addition to the driver—on school transport provided by local authorities, and calls on the Assembly Government to conduct a review of existing provision to this effect.*

I note that the motion states that Members' views will be welcomed. I hope that that welcome extends to real consideration, and to the adoption of ideas if reasonable, and that

arwain at rieni yn dewis mynd â'u plant i'r ysgol yn y car, gan gynyddu'r perygl y mae disgyblion yn ei wynebu, yn ôl yr ystadegau.

Gan fod amser yn brin heddiw, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gynnal astudiaeth cyn gynted â phosibl i amcangyfrif costau gosod gwregysau diogelwch mewn bysiau, i ystyried a ellir ei gwneud yn orfodol i blant wisgo gwregysau diogelwch mewn bysiau ac, os felly, i ystyried sut y gellid gorfodi hynny a phwy fyddai'n atebol pe byddai damwain bws yn digwydd.

Nid oes amser gennyf i ddelio â'r holl faterion. Gall fod gennym safbwyntiau cwbl groes i'w gilydd ar rai materion gwleidyddol, ac mae'n briodol inni fynegi'r rhain yn y Siambr—fe'n hetholwyd i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hwn yn fater o'r fath. Dylid ystyried awgrymiadau a wneir gan Aelodau o bob plaid wleidyddol mewn modd adeiladol.

**Janet Davies:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i annog awdurdodau lleol i ddefnyddio i'r eithaf fesurau arafu traffig o amgylch mynedfeydd ysgolion.*

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cydnabod bod angen gwella ymhellach, yn arbennig o ran estyn y rhaglen Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol.*

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cefnogi egwyddor goruchwyliaeth gan oedolion—yn ogystal â'r gyrrwr—ar gludiant i ysgolion a ddarperir gan yr awdurdodau lleol, ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gynnal adolygiad o'r ddarpariaeth bresennol i'r perwyl hwnnw.*

Nodaf fod y cynnig yn datgan y croesewir barn Aelodau. Gobeithiaf yr ymestynnir y croeso hwnnw i gynnwys ystyriaeth wirioneddol, ac i fabwysiadu syniadau os



views will not be rejected just because they come from opposition parties.

The regulation of school buses is an important part of ensuring the safety of children in travelling to school. Several issues arise out of this regulation, where it exists—it needs tightening in some instances, and clearer guidelines need to be given in others. We must understand that children will behave as children. Very young children can be frightened on buses, while older children can be noisy and may play around and sometimes bully others. All of this can be exceedingly distracting to a driver and reducing this distraction is important. That could be achieved by making it mandatory to provide a seat for each child; there are still some instances of three children sharing two seats. Given the shortage of buses at the time of the school run, guidance alone is not providing the answer. Adult supervision is essential for the reasons that I have highlighted—when adults are present, children are quieter.

The use of double-decker buses also increases the potential for accidents. Although buses are regularly tested for fitness and drivers must be licensed, on occasion, standards can drop. It is possible that checks and monitoring may need to be reviewed. Last week, I heard of a school trip that could have ended in disaster but, fortunately, only a minor accident occurred. In that case, the company with which the school had a contract subcontracted the work, and the police are now involved in the investigation.

Safe Routes to School and walking bus schemes are important strategies in reducing accidents and improving the health of children through exercise. I am aware that take-up is increasing, but the overall percentage of schools following these schemes is still low. It is time that more effort was put into the schemes.

Traffic-calming measures around school entrances are crucial. Children are apt to run out of the school, and you have parents

dynt yn rhesymol, ac na chaiff safbwyntiau eu gwrthod am eu bod yn dod o'r gwrthbleidiau.

Mae rheoleiddio bysiau ysgol yn rhan bwysig o sicrhau diogelwch plant wrth iddynt deithio i'r ysgol. Mae nifer o faterion yn deillio o'r rheoleiddio hwn, lle y mae'n bodoli—mae angen ei dynhau mewn rhai achosion, ac mae angen rhoi canllawiau cliriach mewn achosion eraill. Rhaid inni ddeall y bydd plant yn ymddwyn fel plant. Gall plant ifanc iawn gael ofn ar fysiau, tra gall plant hŷn fod yn swnllyd a chwarae'n wirion a bwlio eraill weithiau. Gall hyn oll amharu'n fawr ar y gyrrwr ac mae'n bwysig lleihau hyn i'r eithaf. Gellid sicrhau hynny drwy ei gwneud yn orfodol i ddarparu sedd ar gyfer pob plentyn; ceir rhai achosion o hyd lle y mae tri phlentyn yn rhannu dwy sedd. O ystyried prinder bysiau i gludo plant i'r ysgol, nid canllawiau yn unig yw'r ateb. Mae goruchwyliaeth gan oedolion yn hanfodol am y rhesymau a amlygwyd gennyf—pan fydd oedolion yn bresennol, mae plant yn dawelach.

Mae'r defnydd o fysiau deulawr yn cynyddu'r perygl o ddamweiniau hefyd. Er y caiff bysiau eu profi'n rheolaidd er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn addas ac er bod angen i yrwyr gael trwydded, gall safonau ostwng ar adegau. Mae'n bosibl y bydd angen adolygu gwiriadau a gwaith monitro. Yr wythnos diwethaf, clywais am daith ysgol lle y gallai trychineb fod wedi digwydd ond, yn ffodus, dim ond damwain fach a ddigwyddodd. Yn yr achos hwnnw, yr oedd y cwmni yr oedd gan yr ysgol gontract ag ef wedi isgontractio'r gwaith, ac mae'r heddlu bellach yn ymchwilio i'r mater.

Mae cynllun Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol a'r cynllun bws cerdded yn strategaethau pwysig i leihau damweiniau a gwella iechyd plant drwy ymarfer corff. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod y nifer sy'n cymryd rhan yn cynyddu, ond mae'r ganran gyffredinol o ysgolion sy'n rhan o'r cynlluniau hyn yn parhau i fod yn isel. Mae'n bryd gwneud mwy o ymdrech gyda'r cynlluniau.

Mae'n hanfodol cael mesurau tawelu traffig o amgylch mynedfeydd ysgolion. Mae plant yn tueddu i redeg allan o'r ysgol, ac mae rhieni

parking cars and buses going past. That is a recipe for disaster unless firm action is taken on traffic-calming measures.

Finally—I am being brief in view of the time—having to send children to school without being sure that every effort has been made to keep them safe on the journey is not acceptable. Accidents will happen, but everything possible must be done to keep children safe. Children are legally obliged to attend school, and therefore government, in whatever form, has a duty to them.

**Alun Cairns:** Given the time constraints, I will try to be as brief as possible. I wish to speak to amendment 1. I am disappointed that Brian Gibbons said that its proposals would simply increase paperwork for the Assembly and local authorities. The impetus behind amendment 1 is a road scheme in the Bridgend constituency, for which a road transport grant was sought by the local authority. It is a ludicrous scheme, with a small roundabout surrounded by 20 sets of traffic lights. As funding for that was provided by the Assembly, I tabled questions to scrutinise the decision to support that scheme. Sue Essex—the Minister with responsibility for transport at the time—responded by saying that the Assembly Government does not scrutinise such applications. All that is required is that local authorities provide an annual report on how such road improvement grants have been used.

The situation in Bridgend is dangerous, and is close to a school. The facilities to aid visually impaired people to cross the road do not work, and we have been told that funding is not available to repair them. I make no apologies for speaking about a local issue, as it could arise elsewhere. It is an example of a stupid road traffic system—a so-called improvement—being introduced. It has done nothing other than to increase the number of accidents in the area. Someone will die at this junction unless action is taken either by the Minister or by the local authority. The problem is that the Minister has abdicated responsibility for this, because this was the work of the local authority. I ask the Minister to reconsider the Government's response to

yn parcio ceir a bysiau yn mynd heibio. Gall hynny arwain at drychineb oni chymerir camau cadarn o ran mesurau tawelu traffig.

I gloi—rhaid imi fod yn gryno oherwydd amser—nid yw'n dderbyniol gorfod anfon plant i'r ysgol heb fod yn siŵr bod pob ymdrech wedi'i wneud i'w cadw'n ddiogel ar y daith. Bydd damweiniau yn digwydd, ond rhaid gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i sicrhau bod plant yn ddiogel. Mae'n ofyniad cyfreithiol i blant fynd i'r ysgol, ac felly mae dyletswydd ar y llywodraeth, ym mha ffurf bynnag, i sicrhau hynny.

**Alun Cairns:** Oherwydd cyfyngiadau amser, ceisiaf fod mor gryno â phosibl. Hoffwn siarad am welliant 1. Yr wyf yn siomedig i Brian Gibbons ddweud mai'r unig beth y byddai'n ei wneud fyddai cynyddu'r gwaith papur i'r Cynulliad ac awdurdodau lleol. Yr hyn a ysgogodd welliant 1 yw cynllun ffordd yn etholaeth Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, lle y gwnaed cais am grant trafniadaeth ffyrdd gan yr awdurdod lleol. Mae'n gynllun hurt, gydag 20 set o oleuadau traffig o amgylch cylchfan fach. Oherwydd i'r Cynulliad ddarparu arian ar gyfer y cynllun hwnnw, cyflwynais gwestiynau i graffu ar y penderfyniad i gefnogi'r cynllun. Ymatebodd Sue Essex—y Gweinidog a oedd yn gyfrifol am drafnidiaeth ar y pryd—drwy ddweud nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn craffu ar geisiadau o'r fath. Y cyfan sydd ei angen yw i awdurdodau lleol gyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol ar sut y defnyddiwyd grantiau gwella ffyrdd o'r fath.

Mae'r sefyllfa ym Men-y-bont ar Ogwr yn beryglus, ac mae'n agos at ysgol. Nid yw'r cyfleusterau i helpu pobl â nam ar eu golwg i groesi'r ffordd yn gweithio, a dywedwyd wrthym nad oes arian ar gael i'w hatgyweirio. Nid ymddiheuraf am siarad am fater lleol, oherwydd gallai godi yn rhywle arall. Mae'n enghraifft o gyflwyno system draffig wirion—sef gwelliant honedig. Ni wnaeth unrhyw beth heblaw cynyddu nifer y damweiniau yn yr ardal. Bydd rhywun yn marw wrth y gyffordd hon oni chymerir camau naill ai gan y Gweinidog neu gan yr awdurdod lleol. Y broblem yw bod y Gweinidog wedi ymwrthod â'r cyfrifoldeb dros hyn, gan mai gwaith yr awdurdod lleol ydoedd. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ailystyried

this issue.

**Christine Chapman:** We need to give children and young people a sense of road safety. Drivers aged between 17 and 21 make up 7 per cent of licence holders but are involved in 13 per cent of crashes. Therefore, it is vital to develop positive attitudes towards driving, through pre-driving lessons, to teach the risk and responsibility of driving. This is a problem in our communities and I welcome the opportunity to contribute to this debate. Young, new drivers—sadly, boys in particular—are a danger to child pedestrians. I raised that issue last week with David Melding, and I hope that the education system will also pick up on it.

4.50 p.m.

I share the disdain that Alun Pugh expressed in March at a recent Maserati car advertisement that encouraged people to drive like there is no tomorrow across Snowdonia, in a car capable of 180 mph. I am pleased that Alun's complaint to the Advertising Standards Authority was upheld. Given the shocking fact that 70 people are killed each year in Wales as a result of driving at excessive speed, I ask the Welsh Assembly Government to send out a clear message that such corporate irresponsibility should not be tolerated.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you for being brief.

**Jenny Randerson:** If you travel on the roads at 8.50 a.m. in an urban area, you see that one in five of the cars on the road is being used to take children to school. That figure has doubled in the last 10 years. Given the relatively traffic-free holiday periods, it seems that that one in five cars is the main contributor to congestion. Taking children to school by car damages our environment and our children's health, but it is understandable because parents want their children to be safe. A vicious circle is developing as parents see the worsening congestion on the roads, which leads them to take their children to school by car for safety reasons, which makes the congestion worse.

ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r mater hwn.

**Christine Chapman:** Mae angen inni roi ymdeimlad o ddiogelwch ffyrdd i blant a phobl ifanc. Gyrwyr rhwng 17 ac 21 oed yw 7 y cant o ddeiliaid trwyddedau ond maent yn yn gysylltiedig â 13 y cant o ddamweiniau. Felly, mae'n hanfodol datblygu agweddau cadarnhaol tuag at yrru, drwy wersi cyn gyrru, i ddysgu am beryglon a chyfrifoldeb gyrru. Mae problem yn ein cymunedau a chroesawaf y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddaidl hon. Mae gyrwyr newydd ifanc—bechgyn yn benodol, yn anffodus—yn peri perygl i gerddwyr sy'n blant. Codais y mater hwnnw yr wythnos diwethaf gyda David Melding, a gobeithiaf y bydd y system addysg yn gwneud rhywbeth amdano.

Rhannaf y dirmyg a fynegwyd gan Alun Pugh ym mis Mawrth ynghylch hysbyseb ddiweddar am gar Maserati a anogodd bobl i yrru'n wyllt ar draws Eryri, mewn car a all gyrraedd cyflymder o 180 milltir yr awr. Yr wyf yn falch i gwyn Alun i'r Awdurdod Safonau Hysbysebu gael ei chadarnhau. O ystyried y ffaith frawychus y caiff 70 o bobl eu lladd bob blwyddyn yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i yrru'n rhy gyflym, gofynnaf i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gyfleu neges glir na chaiff anghyfrifoldeb corfforaethol o'r fath ei oddef.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Diolch am fod yn gryno.

**Jenny Randerson:** Os teithiwch ar y ffyrdd am 8.50 a.m. mewn ardal drefol, fe welwch y caiff un o bob pum car ei ddefnyddio i gludo plant i'r ysgol. Mae'r ffigur hwnnw wedi dyblu yn ystod y 10 mlynedd diwethaf. O ystyried cyfnodau gwyliau sy'n gymharol rhydd o draffig, ymddengys mai'r un car hwnnw o bob pump sy'n cyfrannu fwyaf at dagfeydd. Mae cludo plant i'r ysgol yn y car yn niweidio ein hamgylchedd ac iechyd ein plant, ond mae'n ddealladwy gan fod rhieni am i'w plant fod yn ddiogel. Mae cylch dieflig yn datblygu wrth i rieni weld tagfeydd yn gwaethygu ar y ffyrdd, sy'n peri iddynt gludo eu plant i'r ysgol yn y car am resymau diogelwch, sy'n gwaethygu'r tagfeydd.

Every parent has the right to know that their children are safe and, therefore, the Welsh Liberal Democrats strongly support this measure. Creating a change of attitude must be a crucial part of our work on this. I find inexplicable and unacceptable what I call ‘calming rage’—the anger, irritation and short temper of people who are held up for a few seconds at a road narrowing and get impatient. After all, they will then drive up to a junction where they will be held up for a few more seconds. The number of complaints that I have received about new road narrowing schemes defies belief.

We need to take Stuart’s campaign seriously and support the issues that his campaign’s supporters raise with us. I am a strong advocate of the American approach to school buses. They are sacrosanct; you do not pass them and they are purpose-built vehicles. We should not prescribe schemes for local authorities and then check them. After all, if a local council is knowledgeable about an issue, that issue is local roads. It might occasionally make mistakes, but that is no reason for us to take over its job. There should be strong guidance and I am mystified as to why our request for a 20 mph limit outside St Monica’s School in Cathays—in Cardiff’s inner city—was rejected. This morning, I was at St David’s School in Pentwyn, where they told me how much safer it was now that the road outside the school had been narrowed. I am concerned that the bus route in Lakeside has been moved recently onto a safe route to school. We need to support that kind of guidance, rather than prescribe for local authorities. We should not interfere in what is rightfully the job of local authorities. However, we need to provide full guidance on how these schemes should be implemented. With that in mind, I pledge the strong support of the Welsh Liberal Democrats to this initiative.

**The Deputy Minister for Transport (Brian Gibbons):** I thank Members for their constructive and helpful comments. The points that were made in relation to turnaround and requests for various schemes, and so on, are reasonable. We must always

Mae gan bob rhiant yr hawl i wybod bod eu plant yn ddiogel ac, felly, mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn cefnogi’r mesur hwn yn frwd. Rhaid sicrhau bod newid agwedd yn rhan hanfodol o’n gwaith yn hyn o beth. Ni allaf ddeall yr hyn a alwaf yn ‘llid arafu’—dicter, gwylltineb a byrbwylltra pobl sy’n gorfod aros ychydig eiliadau pan fydd ffordd yn culhau gan golli eu hamynedd. Wedi’r cyfan, byddant wedyn yn gyrru i gyffordd lle y bydd yn rhaid iddynt aros am ychydig eiliadau yn fwy. Mae’n amhosibl credu nifer y cwynion yr wyf wedi’u derbyn ynghylch cynlluniau newydd i gulhau ffordd.

Mae angen inni gymryd ymgyrch Stuart o ddifrif a chefnogi’r materion y mae cefnogwyr ei ymgyrch yn eu codi gyda ni. Yr wyf yn cefnogi ymagwedd America tuag at fysiau ysgol yn gryf. Maent yn gysegredig; nid ydych yn eu goddiweddyd ac maent yn gerbydau pwrpasol. Ni ddylem bennu cynlluniau ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol a’u gwirio wedyn. Wedi’r cyfan, un o’r materion y dylai cyngor lleol fod yn hyddysg amdano yw ffordd lleol. Gallai wneud camgymeriadau o bryd i’w gilydd, ond nid yw hynny’n rheswm inni wneud ei waith. Dylid cael canllawiau cryf ac ni ddeallaf pam i’n cais i gael gyfyngiad cyflymder o 20 milltir yr awr y tu allan i Ysgol St Monica yn Cathays—yng nghanol dinas Caerdydd—gael ei wrthod. Yr oeddwn yn Ysgol Dewi Sant ym Mhentwyn y bore yma, lle y dywedwyd wrthyf ei bod yn llawer mwy diogel erbyn hyn gan fod y ffordd y tu allan i’r ysgol wedi’i chulhau. Yr wyf yn pryderu bod y llwybr bws yn Lakeside wedi’i symud yn ddiweddar i gynnwys llwybr diogel i’r ysgol. Mae angen inni gefnogi’r math hynny o ganllawiau, yn hytrach na phennu cynlluniau ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol. Ni ddylem ymyrryd â gwaith cyfiawn awdurdodau lleol. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni ddarparu canllawiau llawn ar sut y dylid rhoi’r cynlluniau hyn ar waith. O gofio hynny, addawaf gefnogaeth frwd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru i’r fenter hon.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Drafnidiaeth (Brian Gibbons):** Diolchaf i’r Aelodau am eu sylwadau adeiladol a defnyddiol. Mae’r pwyntiau a wnaed mewn perthynas â gweithredu a cheisiadau am gynlluniau amrywiol, ac ati, yn rhesymol. Rhaid inni

monitor our performance in terms of the speed with which we can ensure that. The National Assembly provides a range of schemes, and that variety means that it is possible to have bespoke solutions in place for every local area. The issue of school transport was raised several times, and it must be considered. As David Davies said, it would be wrong to offer a simplistic, single solution on the way forward. It is a complicated issue, involving many factors, and there are technical issues, as well as the cost, to consider. David's suggestions were constructive, and that is how we should proceed. Ensuring safe routes to schools is important. In my constituency of Aberavon, the Safe Routes to School scheme on the Sandfields estate has resulted in a significant reduction in the number of accidents.

Christine Chapman mentioned speed and drivers' attitudes. Even on dangerous roads, 70 to 80 per cent of accidents occur as a result of driver errors. It is important that everybody respects the road and other road users, regardless of the road conditions. Finally, David Melding made a useful point about speed last week in the public health debate. If a vehicle travelling at 20 mph, injures a person, there is a 95 per cent chance that that person will not be killed or seriously injured. If a car travelling at 40 mph hits that person, there is only a 15 per cent that that person will survive the accident. Speed kills. Jenny Randerson effectively dealt with Alun Cairns's amendment 1, and we all know that a single case can make bad law.

fonitro ein perfformiad bob amser o ran pa mor gyflym y gallwn sicrhau hynny. Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn darparu amrywiaeth o gynlluniau, ac mae'r amrywiaeth hwnnw yn golygu ei bod yn bosibl cael atebion penodol ar gyfer pob ardal leol. Codwyd cludiant i'r ysgol sawl gwaith, a rhaid ei ystyried. Fel y dywedodd David Davies, byddai'n anghywir cynnig un ateb gor-syml ar y ffordd ymlaen. Mae'n fater cymhleth, sy'n cynnwys nifer o ffactorau, ac mae materion technegol i'w hystyried, yn ogystal â'r gost. Yr oedd awgrymiadau David yn adeiladol, a dyna'r ffordd y dylem fynd ati. Mae'n bwysig sicrhau llwybrau diogel i ysgolion. Yn fy etholaeth i, sef Aberafan, mae'r cynllun Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol ar ystad Sandfields wedi arwain at ostyngiad sylweddol yn nifer y damweiniau.

Crybwyllodd Christine Chapman gyflymder ac agweddau gyrwyr. Hyd yn oed ar ffyrdd peryglus, digwydd 70 i 80 y cant o ddamweiniau o ganlyniad i gamgymeriadau gan yrwyr. Mae'n bwysig bod pawb yn parchu'r ffordd a defnyddwyr eraill y ffordd, beth bynnag fo amodau'r ffordd. I gloi, gwnaeth David Melding bwynt defnyddiol ynghylch cyflymder yr wythnos diwethaf yn y ddadl ar ieched y cyhoedd. Os bydd cerbyd yn teithio ar gyflymder o 20 milltir yr awr yn anafu rhywun, mae posibilrwydd o 95 y cant na chaiff yr unigolyn hwnnw ei ladd neu ei anafu'n ddifrifol. Os bydd car yn teithio ar gyflymder o 40 milltir yr awr yn bwrw person, dim ond 15 y cant yw'r posibilrwydd y bydd yr unigolyn yn goroesi'r ddamwain. Mae cyflymder yn lladd. Ymdriniodd Jenny Randerson â gwelliant 1 Alun Cairns yn effeithiol, a gŵyr pob un ohonom y gall un achos wneud cyfraith wael.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.  
Amendment 1: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Jones, Alun Ffred

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane

Jones, Helen Mary  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Wood, Leanne

Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Denise Idris  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 2: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine

Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 3: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Isherwood, Mark  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 4: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Jones, Alun Ffred

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine

Jones, Helen Mary  
Isherwood, Mark  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Cynnig (NDM1529): O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1529): For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David



Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

5.00 p.m.

## **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

### **Cynllun Trafnidiaeth Caerdydd Cardiff's Transport Plan**

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am delighted to present this debate on Cardiff County Council's plans to develop our capital city's transportation network. In line with conventions, I note that I have allowed time for Lorraine Barrett, Jenny Randerson and Owen John Thomas to contribute.

I have chosen the county council's paper, 'Keeping Cardiff Moving', as the topic of this debate because Cardiff, as the capital city, has substantial problems in terms of its transportation network. This paper, which is significant for the future of transport in Cardiff, has already been the subject of much debate in the city, and its suggested outcomes have encountered support and condemnation. As the capital city grows, so does the importance of its transportation framework. No-one can deny that Cardiff is becoming one of the most exciting places in which to live and work; its development, in its various forms, places it firmly on the European map of cities to watch. This is not a new phenomenon—Cardiff has been growing in size and stature for years, but only now are its transportation needs being addressed. I am astonished that the development of our transport system is not already underway.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r ddadl hon ar gynlluniau Cyngor Sir Caerdydd i ddatblygu rhwydwaith trafndiaeth ein prifddinas. Yn unol â thraddodiad, nodaf imi ganiatáu amser i Lorraine Barrett, Jenny Randerson ac Owen John Thomas gyfrannu.

Yr wyf wedi dewis papur y cyngor sir, 'Keeping Cardiff Moving', fel pwnc y ddadl hon oherwydd bod gan Gaerdydd, fel y brifddinas, gryn broblemau o ran ei rhwydwaith trafndiaeth. Bu'r papur hwn, sy'n arwyddocaol o ran dyfodol trafndiaeth yng Nghaerdydd, eisoes yn destun cryn ddadlau yn y ddinas a chafodd ei ganlyniadau awgrymedig eu cefnogi yn ogystal â'u condemnio. Wrth i'r brifddinas dyfu, tyfu a wna pwysigrwydd ei rhwydwaith trafndiaeth hefyd. Ni all neb wadu bod Caerdydd yn dod yn un o'r lleoedd mwyaf cyffrous i weithio a byw ynddo; mae ei datblygiad, yn ei gwahanol ffurfiau, yn ei rhoi yn gadarn ar y map Ewropeaidd o ddinasoedd i gadw llygad arnynt. Nid ffenomenon newydd mo hyn—bu Caerdydd yn tyfu o ran maint a statws ers blynyddoedd, ond dim ond yn awr yr eir i'r afael â'i hanghenion trafndiaeth. Synnaf nad yw datblygiad ein system drafndiaeth eisoes ar y gweill.

I welcome the publication of the paper and some, but not all, of its suggestions. It contains some obvious improvements and project completions that are well overdue; some are innovative, but others could prove to be highly damaging to the city. Sadly, the paper exposes the county council's shameful lack of support for the motorist. By motorist, I do not just mean highly-paid executives in posh cars—such as the Assembly Cabinet—but also young couples starting out in life, families, pensioners on fixed incomes, and the business people that are considering Cardiff as a potential city for investment.

The county council highlights some of the major problems that face the city and acknowledges that certain road-building projects are necessary to ease the transport burden. The peripheral distributor road—the completion of which I have long argued for—is the final piece in the bay road network, but it has not been addressed for over eight years. With the completion of the opera house next door and the new Assembly building, we must see the completion of the road network. The failure to complete this project demonstrates that funding is stagnant and underlines the city's disjointed approach to investment. The paper confirms the importance of the peripheral distributor road in stating that

'the full potential of Cardiff Bay will not be realised until this important piece of transport infrastructure is completed.'

The local authority has calculated that the total capital investment deficit—not only for the peripheral distributor road, but also for other projects that Cardiff needs to undertake—is around £400 million. This funding gap does not take into account the likely investment that is needed in our rail and bus services, which is why a public-private partnership would be the sensible way to proceed.

The council's paper, and the previous paper, 'A Change of Gear: Implementing Cardiff's Transport Strategy Through Partnership', both point to some exciting improvements in

Croesawaf gyhoeddi'r papur a rhai, ond nid pob un, o'i awgrymiadau. Mae'n cynnwys rhai gwelliannau amlwg a phrosiectau i'w cwblhau sydd ymhell ar ei hôl hi; mae rhai yn arloesol, ond gallai eraill gael effaith andwyol iawn ar y ddinas. Yn anffodus, mae'r papur yn datgelu diffyg cefnogaeth eofn y cyngor sir i'r modurwr. Nid dim ond swyddogion ar gyflogau breision mewn ceir crand—fel Cabinet y Cynulliad—a olygaf pan gyfeiriaf at fodurwyr, ond hefyd barau ifanc sy'n dechrau ar daith bywyd, teuluoedd, pensïynwyr ar incwm sefydlog, a'r bobl fusnes sy'n ystyried Caerdydd yn ddinas bosibl i fuddsoddi ynddi.

Mae'r cyngor sir yn amlygu rhai o'r problemau mawr sy'n wynebu'r ddinas ac yn cydnabod bod rhai prosiectau adeiladu ffyrdd yn hanfodol er mwyn lleddfu'r baich trafniadaeth. Y ffordd ddosbarthu ymylol—yr wyf wedi hir ddadlau dros ei chwblhau—yw'r darn olaf yn rhwydwaith ffyrdd y bae, ond nid ymdriniwyd â hyn ers mwy nag wyth mlynedd. Gyda chwblhau'r tŷ opera y drws nesaf ac adeilad newydd y Cynulliad, rhaid inni weld y rhwydwaith ffyrdd yn cael ei gwblhau. Mae methu â chwblhau'r prosiect hwn yn dangos bod arian yn ddisymud ac yn tanlinellu ymagwedd ddi-drefn y ddinas tuag at fuddsoddi. Mae'r papur yn cadarnhau pwysigrwydd y ffordd ddosbarthu ymylol gan nodi

na fydd Bae Caerdydd yn cyflawni ei lawn botensial hyd nes i'r darn pwysig hwn o seilwaith trafniadaeth gael ei gwblhau.

Mae'r awdurdod lleol wedi cyfrifo bod cyfanswm y diffyg buddsoddiad cyfalaf—nid dim ond ar gyfer y ffordd ddosbarthu ymylol, ond hefyd ar gyfer prosiectau eraill y mae angen i Gaerdydd ymgymryd â hwy—oddeutu £400 miliwn. Nid yw'r bwlch ariannu hwn yn ystyried y buddsoddiad tebygol sydd ei angen yn ein gwasanaethau rheilffordd a bysiau, a dyna pahan mai partneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat fyddai'r ffordd synhwyrol ymlaen.

Mae papur y cyngor, a'r papur blaenorol, 'A change of Gear: Implementing Cardiff's Transport Strategy Through Partnership', ill dau yn cyfeirio at rai gwelliannau cyffrous

public transport: a rail loop around the city for light rail; the completion of a circle line from Coryton to Radyr and Morganstown; and the creation of a core bus network. These are exciting changes, but the reports shy away from outlining how much public transport operators, consumers and others will be expected to pay, which demonstrates the council's lack of confidence. Curiously, the county council is quick to identify others who would have to pick up a large chunk of the bill.

The council's recognition of the need to improve the road network sits merely as a platitude to the motorist, on whom it is about to launch an incredible assault. The plan searches for families, organisations and businesses that can dig deep into their pockets. Since 1997, those families, organisations and businesses have become somewhat adverse to a pick-pocketing Government that has enjoyed 53 tax alterations and a county council that has increased local council taxes by 100 per cent over the same period. Is it any wonder that the people of Cardiff view this plan with well-placed suspicion? The paper, however, identifies four specific new charges—or taxes, depending on your outlook—to tackle some of the cost implications.

There are taxes on the motorist, the first of which the council calls a congestion charge, which will be £1 per day. That does not immediately appear threatening, except that it will not entice people out of their cars and onto public transport, which is the document's central theme, as a single journey on public transport costs more than £1. It also fails to realise that many people take more than one journey in a day. It is not just a question of going to work and then back home. However, according to the council, such a scheme could net £27 million per annum. The basis for this is linked to London, and it suggests that the congestion charges would be applicable. Congestion charges might work in Cardiff were it a congested city. However, in comparison to many UK cities, it is not a congested city. Yes, it is busy at peak times, and certain other times of day, but it is not a congested

mewn trafndiaeth gyhoeddus: dolen reilffordd o amgylch y ddinas ar gyfer rheilffordd ysgafn; cwblhau lein gylch o Coryton i Radur a Phentre-poeth; a chreu rhwydwaith bysiau craidd. Mae'r rhain yn newidiadau cyffrous, ond nid yw'r adroddiadau yn amlinellu faint y bydd disgwyl i gwmnïau trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, defnyddwyr ac eraill ei dalu, sy'n dangos diffyg hyder y cyngor. Yn rhyfedd ddigon, mae'r cyngor sir yn ddigon parod i nodi eraill y byddai'n rhaid iddynt dalu cyfran fawr o'r bil.

Nid yw cydnabyddiaeth y cyngor o'r angen i wella'r rhwydwaith ffyrdd yn ddim ond ystrydeb i'r modurwr, y mae ar fin dechrau ymosodiad anhygoel arno. Mae'r cynllun yn chwilio am deuluoedd, sefydliadau a busnesau a all fynd yn ddwfn i'w pocedi. Er 1997, mae'r teuluoedd, sefydliadau a busnesau hynny wedi mynd ychydig yn wrthwynebus i Lywodraeth sy'n dwyn arian ganddynt ac sydd wedi mwynhau 53 o newidiadau i dreth, a chyngor sir sydd wedi cynyddu trethi cyngor lleol 100 y cant dros yr un cyfnod. A oes unrhyw syndod bod pobl Caerdydd, yn gwbl gyfiawn, yn amheus o'r cynllun hwn? Mae'r papur, fodd bynnag, yn nodi pedwar taliad newydd penodol—neu drethi, yn dibynnu ar eich safbwynt—i fynd i'r afael â rhywfaint o'r goblygiadau o ran cost.

Mae trethi i'r modurwr. Geilw'r cyngor y cyntaf o'r rhain yn dreth tagfeydd, a fydd yn £1 y dydd. Nid yw hynny'n ymddangos fel bygythiad ar yr olwg gyntaf, ond ni fydd yn denu pobl o'u ceir i ddefnyddio trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, sef thema ganolog y ddogfen, gan fod un daith ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn costio mwy na £1. Nid yw ychwaith yn sylweddoli bod llawer o bobl yn gwneud mwy nag un daith y dydd. Nid mater o fynd i'r gwaith a dychwelyd adref yn unig mohono. Fodd bynnag, yn ôl y cyngor, gallai cynllun o'r fath gynhyrchu £27 miliwn y flwyddyn. Mae'r sail ar gyfer hyn yn gysylltiedig â Llundain, ac awgryma y byddai'r taliadau tagfeydd yn berthnasol. Gallai taliadau tagfeydd weithio yng Nghaerdydd pe bai'n ddinas lle ceir llawer o dagfeydd. Fodd bynnag, o gymharu â nifer o ddinasoedd yn y DU, nid yw'n ddinas â thagfeydd. Ydy, mae'n brysur yn ystod oriau

city with the problem of the standstill that is experienced in London. To support the possible outcome, the paper points to the 20 per cent reduction in traffic as a result of London's congestion charge. However, comparing Cardiff to London, I have not noticed Cardiff's heavily used bus lanes or underground railway network. Forgive me if I have missed something, but it is foolish to assume that a massive reduction in congestion—as the document puts it—could occur without significant changes to our public transport system. It cannot be attained as easily as the council thinks by introducing a congestion charge of £1 per day.

Secondly, taxes on business are suggested. This is the main problem with the report. Cardiff County Council has estimated that charging businesses around £900 per car parking space per year will net the city's treasury about £900 million. However, contrary to popular myth, Cardiff is not exactly a booming city in terms of new business investment—you need only look at the number of empty buildings and business units, which are likely to remain so for some time. Like any other city, Cardiff must compete, and taxing businesses will not help to meet that end. Many companies can easily relocate or shift the burden of the tax onto their employees. Such an unacceptable tax would have a damaging impact.

Thirdly, the possibility of supplementary business rates means more money being taken from the pockets of businesses on top of the car parking space tax. Fourthly, the local authority has identified road tolls as a possibility—another tax on top of the congestion charge, which would also be payable by motorists. The local authority has calculated that this scheme could realise £12 million per annum. However one views the charges, families and businesses will see them as merely another tax. In total, Cardiff County Council has estimated that these taxes could provide at least £48 million per year in addition to any other funding identified by the council, provided by the Assembly, or found through the proposed public-private

brig ac adegau eraill o'r dydd, ond nid yw'n ddinas â thagfeydd lle nad yw traffig yn gallu symud o gwbl fel a geir yn Llundain. I gefnogi'r canlyniad posibl hwn, cyfeiria'r papur at y gostyngiad o 20 y cant mewn traffig o ganlyniad i dâl tagfeydd Llundain. Fodd bynnag, o gymharu Caerdydd â Llundain, nid wyf wedi sylwi ar lonydd bysiau Caerdydd y gwneir defnydd helaeth ohonynt na'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd tanddaearol. Maddeuwch imi os wyf wedi colli rhywbeth, ond annoeth yw tybio y gellid cyflawni gostyngiad enfawr mewn tagfeydd—fel y noda'r ddogfen—heb newidiadau sylweddol i'n system trafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Ni ellir cyflawni hynny mor hawdd ag y tybia'r cyngor drwy gyflwyno tâl tagfeydd o £1 y dydd.

Yn ail, awgrymir codi trethi ar fusnesau. Dyma brif broblem yr adroddiad. Mae Cyngor Sir Caerdydd wedi amcangyfrif y byddai codi tua £900 y flwyddyn fesul lle parcio ar fusnesau yn cynhyrchu tua £900 miliwn i drysorlys y ddinas. Fodd bynnag, yn groes i'r gred boblogaidd, nid yw Caerdydd yn ddinas lewyrchus o ran buddsoddiad gan fusnesau newydd—nid oes ond rhaid ichi edrych ar nifer yr adeiladau gwag a'r unedau busnes, sy'n debygol o barhau'n wag am beth amser. Fel unrhyw ddinas arall, rhaid i Gaerdydd gystadlu, ac ni fydd trethu busnesau yn helpu i gyflawni'r nod hwnnw. Gall llawer o gwmnïau adleoli yn ddirfferth neu symud baich y dreth ar eu cyflogaion. Byddai treth mor annerbyniol yn cael effaith andwyol.

Yn drydydd, mae'r posibilrwydd o drethi busnes atodol yn golygu cymryd mwy o arian o bocedi busnesau yn ogystal â'r dreth lleoedd parcio. Yn bedwerydd, mae'r awdurdod lleol wedi nodi tollau ffyrdd fel posibilrwydd—treth arall ar ben y tâl tagfeydd, a fyddai hefyd yn cael ei thalu gan fodurwyr. Mae'r awdurdod lleol wedi cyfrifo y gallai'r cynllun hwn godi £12 miliwn y flwyddyn. Beth bynnag fo eich barn am y taliadau, bydd teuluoedd a busnesau yn eu gweld fel dim mwy na threth arall. Gyda'i gilydd, mae Cyngor Sir Caerdydd wedi amcangyfrif y gallai'r trethi hyn ddarparu o leiaf £48 miliwn y flwyddyn yn ogystal ag unrhyw arian arall a nodir gan y cyngor, a ddarperir gan y Cynulliad, neu a geir drwy'r

partnership.

The paper clearly makes heavy demands of those least able to resist—motorists, families and businesses. They will, sadly, just have to pay what they are told to pay. They will find it difficult to resist these charges. Nobody tends to stick up for these groups, and it is easy for local authorities to tax families and businesses while ignoring the possibility of funding from Government and other sources. The paper is light on its demands on public transport users. It is one-sided in that it quickly identifies the easy route for fund raising, but it does not outline any strategy for how the council might persuade the Assembly Government of Cardiff's needs as a capital city. The recent ULTra debacle—the driverless Cardiff bay taxi scheme—which was to be built to the tune of some £20 million and is now, thankfully, shelved, demonstrated the ill-thought-out approach to our public transport system. Is it any wonder that the people of Cardiff view this paper with more than a little suspicion? However, I would not be doing my duty as a representative of the capital city if I failed to suggest a few alternatives.

5.10 p.m.

First, if we are serious about improving public transport, we should be serious about transport operators dipping into their bank accounts. They will benefit from having a more accessible, integrated and modern transport network, as people will be more inclined to use it. This might be covered by the work behind the public-private partnership, although that is not expressed and built upon in the document. Secondly, if people are to enjoy a better system of public transport, small increases in fares are only fair. One of the paper's deficiencies is that it fails to identify people who use public transport as possible contributors to the financial hole faced by the council. Again, this may happen, but it does not form part of a coherent strategy or of the underlying principles in the paper. It is only fair that those people who use public transport, and

bartneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat arfaethedig.

Mae'r papur yn amlwg yn rhoi baich trwm ar y rhai sy'n lleiaf abl i'w wrthsefyll—modurwyr, teuluoedd a busnesau. Yn anffodus, bydd rhaid iddynt dalu yr hyn y dywedir wrthynt am ei dalu. Byddant yn ei chael hi'n anodd i wrthsefyll y taliadau hyn. Nid oes neb yn tueddu i achub cam y grwpiau hyn, ac mae'n hawdd i awdurdodau lleol drethu teuluoedd a busnesau tra'n anwybyddu'r posibilrwydd o gael arian gan y Llywodraeth a ffynonellau eraill. Nid oes llawer o ofynion yn y papur o ran defnyddwyr trafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Mae'n unochrog yn yr ystyr ei fod yn gyflym i nodi'r llwybr hawdd ar gyfer codi arian, ond nid yw'n amlinellu unrhyw strategaeth ar gyfer sut y gallai'r cyngor argyhoeddi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o anghenion Caerdydd fel prifddinas. Dangosodd yr helynt ddiweddar gydag ULTra—y cynllun tacsï di-yrwr ym mae Caerdydd—y bwriadwyd ei adeiladu am gost o ryw £20 miliwn ac sydd bellach, diolch i'r drefn, wedi'i roi o'r neilltu, yr ymagwedd ddifeddwl tuag at ein system trafndiaeth gyhoeddus. A yw'n syndod bod gan bobl Caerdydd amheuan mawr ynghylch y papur hwn? Fodd bynnag, ni fyddwn yn cyflawni fy nyletswydd fel cynrychiolydd y brifddinas pe na bawn yn awgrymu ychydig o syniadau amgen.

I ddechrau, os ydym o ddifrif ynghylch gwella trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, dylem fod o ddifrif ynghylch sicrhau bod cwmnïau trafndiaeth yn defnyddio mwy o'u harian. Byddant yn elwa ar gael rhwydwaith trafndiaeth mwy hygrych, integredig a modern, gan y bydd pobl yn fwy tebygol o'i ddefnyddio. Efallai y cwmpesir hyn gan y gwaith y tu ôl i'r bartneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat, er na fynegir hynny ac na ddatblygir hynny yn y ddogfen. Yn ail, os yw pobl am fwynhau gwell system trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, byddai codi prisiau tocynnau ychydig ond yn deg. Un o ddiffygion y papur yw nad yw'n nodi pobl sy'n defnyddio trafndiaeth gyhoeddus fel cyfranwyr posibl i'r twll ariannol y mae'r cyngor ynddo. Unwaith eto, gall hyn ddigwydd, ond nid yw'n rhan o strategaeth gydlynol nac yn rhan o egwyddorion sylfaenol y papur. Mae ond

who will benefit from being able to get to the various parts of the city that cannot presently be reached, should be expected to help cover part of the cost—not much money, but small increases—as a contribution.

Thirdly, the council needs to convince the Assembly Government of Cardiff's needs as a capital city. The fact that Cardiff is a capital city is a trump card. There are more pressures on this city than on any other part of Wales as it represents the nation as the capital. Therefore, Cardiff County Council needs to present a coherent strategy to the Assembly Government for funding, because the document identifies the Assembly Government's neglect of its duty to support the council's role in representing the capital city. These suggestions have not been fully addressed by Cardiff council. Its admission is tantamount to accepting that only motorists should help to cover the cost. Why, after all, is the paper so thin on alternative options?

As the city of Cardiff approaches its centenary as a city, and its fiftieth anniversary as the nation's capital, we need a transport system that reflects the realities of life. The paper's dogmatic attack on families and businesses reflects the usual arguments supported by the beard-and-sandals brigade that taxing motorists and businesses is the way to develop public transport. It is not, and it will not work. People will always need their cars, but they also need convincing that trains and buses can be just as effective.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Thank you, Jonathan, for allowing me a minute in which to speak. On congestion, I spotted a few BMWs and Jaguars in the Assembly car park, which, I believe, belong to the Tory group.

I listened to Jonathan's somewhat predictable attacks on Cardiff County Council and its paper. However, I did not hear any suggestions from him about what he would do to deal with what Professor Begg, a transport professor at Robert Gordon University, Aberdeen, says is a worrying

yn deg disgwyl i'r bobl hynny sy'n defnyddio trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, ac a fydd yn elwa ar allu cyrraedd amrywiol rannau o'r ddinas na allant eu cyrraedd ar hyn o bryd, helpu i dalu rhan o'r gost—nid arian mawr, ond cynnydd bach—fel cyfraniad.

Yn drydydd, mae angen i'r cyngor argyhoeddi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o anghenion Caerdydd fel prifddinas. Mae'r ffaith bod Caerdydd yn brifddinas yn fantais fawr. Mae mwy o bwysau ar y ddinas hon nag ar unrhyw ran arall o Gymru gan ei bod yn cynrychioli'r genedl fel ei phrifddinas. Felly, mae angen i Gyngor Sir Caerdydd gyflwyno strategaeth gydlynol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer ariannu, gan fod y ddogfen yn nodi bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn esgeuluso ei dyletswydd i gefnogi rôl y cyngor i gynrychioli'r brifddinas. Nid yw cyngor Caerdydd wedi mynd i'r afael yn llawn â'r awgrymiadau hyn. Mae ei gyfaddefiad yn gyfystyr â derbyn mai dim ond modurwyr ddylai helpu i dalu'r gost. Wedi'r cyfan, pam mae cyn lleied o opsiynau amgen yn y papur?

Wrth i ddinas Caerdydd nesáu at ei chanmlwyddiant fel dinas, a'i hanner can mlwyddiant fel prifddinas y genedl, mae angen system drafnidiaeth arnom sy'n adlewyrchu realiti bywyd. Mae ymosodiad dogmataidd y papur ar deuluoedd a busnesau yn adlewyrchu'r dadleuon arferol a gefnogir gan y criw barfog a sandalog mai codi trethi ar fodurwyr a busnesau yw'r ffordd o ddatblygu trafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Nid felly y mae, ac ni fydd yn gweithio. Bydd pobl angen eu ceir bob amser, ond hefyd bydd angen eu darbwyllo y gall trenau a bysiau fod yr un mor effeithiol.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Diolch ichi, Jonathan, am ganiatáu munud imi siarad. O ran tagfeydd, sylwais ar ambell i BMW a Jaguar ym maes parcio'r Cynulliad sydd, mi gredaf, yn eiddo i grŵp y Toriaid.

Gwrandewais ar ymosodiadau Jonathan ar Gyngor Sir Caerdydd a'i bapur, a oedd braidd yn rhagweladwy. Fodd bynnag, ni chlywais unrhyw awgrymiadau ganddo ynghylch yr hyn y byddai'n ei wneud i ymdrin â'r duedd o dagfeydd yn y ddinas, sy'n destun pryder yn ôl yr Athro Begg, athro trafndiaeth ym

trend of congestion in the city. Professor Begg acknowledges that the council is right to consider options such as congestion charges. However, he also suggests that other action, such as increased pedestrianisation and more bus and cycle lanes, will help to control congestion problems. He believes that tough action needs to be taken now.

**Jenny Randerson:** I have no objection to a congestion charge in principle. However, it would not work in Cardiff, because the congestion is on the roads into Cardiff, far more so than in the city centre. Therefore, you would have to have some sort of reverse congestion charge working on a donut principle. In principle, it is entirely wrong to propose, as Cardiff council's paper does, using a public-private partnership as the source of money for that partnership. A charge on motorists will apparently be used to build more roads. However, if you are going to impose a congestion charge, that money should be used to improve public transport. Cardiff council cannot impose a congestion charge until we have a good public transport system. Cardiff Bus is currently consulting on new bus routes. Interestingly, it is more a case of moving routes around rather than a major increase in the number of routes.

Ten years ago, Sue Essex and I attended a conference in London about a light rapid transit system. We are still waiting for that.

**Owen John Thomas:** Nid yw Caerdydd yn ynys. Nid yw cynllun Cyngor Sir Caerdydd yn ymateb i'r ffaith bod Caerdydd yn brifddinas sydd yn gwasanaethu rhanbarth y ddinas, sy'n cynnwys 1,250,000 o bobl yn y Cymoedd, ym Mro Morgannwg ac yn y ddinas ei hun.

Nid oes dim yn y cynllun y mae yn ei roi gerbron sydd yn diwallu anghenion yr ardal honno, yn cadarnhau bod Caerdydd, fel prifddinas, yn uno'r genedl, nac yn ei gwneud yn bosibl i bobl deithio yma o bob rhan o Gymru i ymweld â'n sefydliadau cenedlaethol. Mae rhai pobl yn teimlo nad

Mhrifysgol Robert Gordon, Aberdeen. Mae'r Athro Begg yn cydnabod bod y cyngor yn iawn i ystyried opsiynau megis taliadau tagfeydd. Fodd bynnag, awgryma hefyd y bydd camau eraill, fel troi mwy o ardaloedd yn lleoedd i gerddwyr yn unig a mwy o lonydd ar gyfer bysiau a beiciau, yn helpu i reoli problemau tagfeydd. Cred fod angen cymryd camau llym yn awr.

**Jenny Randerson:** Nid oes gennyf unrhyw wrthwynebiad i dâl tagfeydd mewn egwyddor. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddai'n gweithio yng Nghaerdydd, gan mai ar y ffyrdd i mewn i Gaerdydd y mae'r tagfeydd gan amlaf, yn hytrach nag yng nghanol y ddinas. Felly, byddai'n rhaid cael rhyw fath o dâl tagfeydd gwrthdro yn gweithio ar egwyddor toesen. Mewn egwyddor, mae'n gwbl anghywir cynnig, fel y gwna papur cyngor Caerdydd, defnyddio partneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat fel ffynhonnell arian ar gyfer y bartneriaeth honno. Defnyddir tâl a godir ar fodurwyr yn ôl y sôn i adeiladu mwy o ffyrdd. Fodd bynnag, os codwch dâl tagfeydd, dylai'r arian hwnnw gael ei ddefnyddio i wella trafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Ni all cyngor Caerdydd godi tâl tagfeydd hyd nes bod gennym system trafndiaeth gyhoeddus dda. Mae Bws Caerdydd yn ymgynghori ar lwybrau bysiau newydd. Yn ddiddorol ddigon, mater o newid llwybrau ydyw yn hytrach na chynnydd mawr yn nifer y llwybrau.

Ddeng mlynedd yn ôl, mynychodd Sue Essex a minnau gynhadledd yn Llundain ar system gludo ysgafn a chyflym. Yr ydym yn dal i aros am hynny.

**Owen John Thomas:** Cardiff is not an island. Cardiff County Council's scheme does not take account of the fact that Cardiff is a capital city that serves the region of the city, which includes 1,250,000 people in the Valleys, the Vale of Glamorgan and the city itself.

There is nothing in the scheme that it is proposing to meet the needs of that area, nothing that confirms the fact that Cardiff, as the capital city, unites the nation, nor anything that makes it possible for people to travel here from all parts of Wales to visit our national institutions. Some people feel that

yw'r sefydliadau hynny'n perthyn iddynt hwy gan fod Caerdydd mor bell o lle y maent yn byw. Felly, ni chefnogaf y cynllun hwn.

**The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies):** I thank Jonathan for raising this issue as it gives me an opportunity to comment on Cardiff's transport plan, 'Keeping Cardiff Moving'. The paper sets out an interesting approach to implementing the vision set out in Cardiff County Council's statutory local transport plan, which it submitted to the Assembly Government in August 2000. The Government is always ready to support new approaches to funding transport development and it is happy to work with the county council in taking forward practical solutions. The development of a public-private partnership on this scale, as outlined in 'Keeping Cardiff Moving', will need careful appraisal to determine its value for money. Robin Shaw, the National Assembly's director of transport, has been invited to join the project panel. However, the council is responsible for making any decisions on the disposal of its assets as part of any partnership with the private sector. We cannot earmark any additional funding in anticipation of a partnership being established. The proposals, as Jonathan mentioned, are for developing a public-private partnership over the next 25 years in order to provide up to £400 million of transport infrastructure investment. Those are ambitious plans, and Cardiff County Council should be commended for considering innovative ways of delivering its transport agenda.

Reference has been made to the eastern bay link road and completion details of that key proposal are in the council's local transport plan. Given its current cost of around £180 million, it is not affordable within existing budgets. A great deal of money has been invested in Cardiff bay over the past 15 years, and the eastern bay link was part of a plan dating back to the 1970s, as indicated in the document.

**Nick Bourne:** The Plaid Cymru Member, having said how important this issue was for Cardiff, appears to have left the Chamber.

those institutions do not belong to them as Cardiff is so far from where they live. Therefore, I do not support this scheme.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies):** Diolchaf i Jonathan am godi'r mater hwn gan ei fod yn rhoi cyfle imi wneud sylwadau ar gynllun trafndiaeth Caerdydd, 'Keeping Cardiff Moving'. Mae'r papur yn nodi ymagwedd ddiddorol tuag at weithredu'r weledigaeth a nodir yng nghynllun trafndiaeth lleol statudol Cyngor Sir Caerdydd, a gyflwynodd i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn Awst 2000. Mae'r Llywodraeth bob amser yn barod i gefnogi ymagweddau newydd tuag at ariannu datblygiad trafndiaeth ac mae'n fodlon gweithio gyda'r cyngor sir i ddatblygu atebion ymarferol. Bydd angen arfarnu'r broses o ddatblygu partneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat ar y raddfa hon, fel yr amlinellir yn 'Keeping Cardiff Moving', yn ofalus er mwyn penderfynu ei werth am arian. Gwahoddwyd Robin Shaw, cyfarwyddwr trafndiaeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, i ymuno â phanel y prosiect. Fodd bynnag, y cyngor sy'n gyfrifol am wneud unrhyw benderfyniadau ar waredu ei asedion fel rhan o unrhyw bartneriaeth â'r sector preifat. Ni allwn glustnodi unrhyw arian ychwanegol rhag ofn i bartneriaeth gael ei sefydlu. Mae'r cynigion, fel y crybwyllodd Jonathan, yn ymwneud â datblygu partneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat dros y 25 mlynedd nesaf er mwyn darparu hyd at £400 miliwn o fuddsoddiad seilwaith trafndiaeth. Mae'r rheini'n gynlluniau uchelgeisiol, a dylid canmol Cyngor Sir Caerdydd am ystyried ffyrdd arloesol o gyflawni ei agenda trafndiaeth.

Cyfeiriwyd at ffordd gyswllt ddwyreiniol y bae ac mae manylion cwblhau'r cynnig allweddol hwnnw yng nghynllun trafndiaeth lleol y cyngor. O gofio ei gost bresennol o tua £180 miliwn, nid yw'n fforddiadwy o fewn y cyllidebau presennol. Buddsoddiwyd swm sylweddol o arian ym mae Caerdydd dros y 15 mlynedd diwethaf, ac yr oedd ffordd gyswllt ddwyreiniol y bae yn rhan o gynllun sy'n dyddio o'r 1970au, fel y nodwyd yn y ddogfen.

**Nick Bourne:** Ymddengys bod yr Aelod Plaid Cymru wedi gadael y Siambr, er iddo ddweud pa mor bwysig oedd y mater hwn i



Gaerdydd.

**Andrew Davies:** The Butetown link road was completed in 1995. The budget for local authority capital funding through transport grant was £83 million in 1995-96. However, Williams Hague, the then Secretary of State for Wales, planned to reduce it to £49 million in 1997-98, and to £34 million by 1999-2000. Therefore, William Hague faced the same issues of balancing demands and affordability. The provision for transport grant is £75 million, which increases to £91 million in two years' time. However, we must ensure a balanced approach that recognises the needs of the whole of Wales—I emphasised that in answers to earlier questions—in funding local authority roads and public transport infrastructure projects. The Assembly is continuing to fund the Wentloog to St Mellons road link scheme via the transport grant. The programme will be delayed this year because the council is seeking planning permission for the scheme and related works together. When completed, the scheme will provide a direct route between Wentloog and the strategic road network, including the new intermodal euro freight terminal, and will greatly improve local access between Wentloog and St Mellons. The scheme is estimated to cost £22 million.

I wholeheartedly reject Jonathan's allegation that the Assembly Government has neglected Cardiff's transport needs. As Jenny Randerson implied, travel in and out of Cardiff can only be considered in terms of the wider regional context. There is already sustained investment in the transport infrastructure of Cardiff and the surrounding area. The Assembly Government has provided over £28 million to Cardiff County Council in transport grant funding over the past five years, in addition to funding the Wentloog and St Mellons road link. Although Cardiff was allocated just over £3 million in transport grant for 2003-04, that does not represent the true level of benefit that Cardiff is receiving from our transport investment. I pay tribute to my predecessor, Sue Essex, for establishing the south Wales transport

**Andrew Davies:** Cwblhawyd ffordd gyswllt Butetown yn 1995. Y gyllideb ar gyfer ariannu cyfalaf awdurdod lleol drwy'r grant trafndiaeth oedd £83 miliwn yn 1995-96. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd William Hague, Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru bryd hynny, yn bwriadu ei gostwng i £49 miliwn yn 1997-98, ac i £34 miliwn erbyn 1999-2000. Felly, yr oedd William Hague yn wynebu yr un problemau o gydbwysu galw a fforddiadwyedd. Mae'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer grant trafndiaeth yn £75 miliwn, sy'n codi i £91 miliwn ymhen dwy flynedd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sicrhau ymagwedd gytbwys sy'n cydnabod anghenion Cymru gyfan—pwysleisiais hynny mewn atebion i gwestiynau cynharach—o ran ariannu prosiectau seilwaith ffyrdd a thrafnidiaeth gyhoeddus awdurdodau lleol. Mae'r Cynulliad yn parhau i ariannu cynllun ffordd gyswllt Gwynllŵg i Laneirwg drwy'r grant trafndiaeth. Bydd oedi gyda'r rhaglen eleni gan fod y cyngor yn ceisio cael caniatâd cynllunio ar gyfer y cynllun a gwaith cysylltiedig ar yr un pryd. Pan fydd wedi'i gwblhau, bydd y cynllun yn darparu llwybr uniongyrchol rhwng Gwynllŵg a'r rhwydwaith ffyrdd strategol, gan gynnwys yr orsaf ryngfoddol newydd ar gyfer nwyddau o Ewrop, a bydd yn gwella'r mynediad lleol rhwng Gwynllŵg a Llaneirwg yn sylweddol. Amcangyfrifir y bydd y cynllun yn costio £22 miliwn.

Gwrthodaf yn llwyr honiad Jonathan fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi esgeuluso anghenion trafndiaeth Caerdydd. Fel yr awgrymodd Jenny Randerson, dim ond yn y cyd-destun rhanbarthol ehangach y gellir ystyried teithio i mewn ac allan o Gaerdydd. Mae buddsoddiad cyson eisoes yn seilwaith trafndiaeth Caerdydd a'r cylch. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi darparu dros £28 miliwn i Gyngor Sir Caerdydd ar ffurf arian grant trafndiaeth dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf, yn ogystal ag ariannu ffordd gyswllt Gwynllŵg a Llaneirwg. Er i ychydig dros £3 miliwn gael ei ddyrannu i Gaerdydd mewn grant trafndiaeth ar gyfer 2003-04, nid yw hynny'n adlewyrchu'r budd gwirioneddol a gaiff Caerdydd o'n buddsoddiad mewn trafndiaeth. Talaf deyrnged i'm rhagflaenydd, Sue Essex, am sefydlu

consortia, including the South Wales Integrated Fast Transit consortium, of which Cardiff is a member. It has completed a detailed transportation study, resulting in a package of comprehensive and integrated improvements to public transport services and infrastructure measures along the transport corridors leading to Cardiff and the bay. This year, over £8 million was allocated to develop integrated transport solutions in south-east Wales. They include developing bus corridors, quality bus partnerships and improvements to rail and bus stations. Cardiff will also benefit greatly from the reopening of the Vale of Glamorgan railway and the Ebbw valley line, planned for 2005. The Assembly Government's support for improvements on the Valley lines is already showing a return and, taken together, these schemes will significantly reduce the amount of traffic that commutes into Cardiff daily.

5.20 p.m.

An estimated 30,000 people travel into Cardiff every day for work and shopping. At peak hours, around 30 per cent of those commuters currently travel into the city centre by train. Similar improvement on bus services has not taken place. While I appreciate the funding constraints, it should have been possible to make greater progress with the money provided by the Assembly Government and the council.

Giving priority to buses is the cornerstone of achieving our aim. For example, funding has been provided to plan improvements on the northern corridor, but specific projects have not yet emerged. Cities like Edinburgh, Leeds, Nottingham, Oxford and York have made incremental improvements over several years, and there is no reason why that should not happen in Cardiff. Therefore, I hope that the council does not concentrate solely on the long-term vision that it has outlined but also pursues an incremental approach.

The council has included several methods by which prospective partners may seek to raise funding, including road-user charging and

consortia trafnidiaeth de Cymru, gan gynnwys consortiwm Teithio Cyflym Integredig De Cymru, y mae Caerdydd yn aelod ohono. Mae wedi cwblhau astudiaeth trafnidiaeth fanwl, gan arwain at becyn o welliannau cynhwysfawr ac integredig i wasanaethau trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus a mesurau seilwaith ar hyd y coridorau trafnidiaeth sy'n arwain i Gaerdydd a'r bae. Eleni, dyrannwyd dros £8 miliwn i ddatblygu atebion trafnidiaeth integredig yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru. Maent yn cynnwys datblygu coridorau bysiau, partneriaethau bysiau o ansawdd a gwelliannau i orsafoedd trenau a bysiau. Bydd Caerdydd yn elwa'n fawr hefyd yn sgîl ailagor rheilffordd Bro Morgannwg a lein glyn Ebwy, a gynlluniwyd ar gyfer 2005. Mae cefnogaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i welliannau ar Valley lines eisoes yn dwyn ffrwyth ac, o'u cymryd gyda'i gilydd, bydd y cynlluniau hyn yn lleihau'n sylweddol y drafnidiaeth sy'n cymudo i Gaerdydd yn ddyddiol.

Amcangyfrifir bod 30,000 o bobl yn teithio i mewn i Gaerdydd bob dydd i weithio ac i siopa. Yn ystod oriau brig, mae tua 30 y cant o'r cymudwyr hynny yn teithio i mewn i ganol y dref ar drenau ar hyn o bryd. Ni welwyd gwelliant tebyg ar wasanaethau bysiau. Er fy mod yn gwerthfawrogi'r cyfyngiadau ariannu, dylai fod wedi bod yn bosibl gwneud mwy o gynnydd gyda'r arian a ddarparwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r cyngor.

Rhoi blaenoriaeth i fysiau yw congllfaen ein nod. Er enghraifft, darparwyd arian i gynllunio gwelliannau ar y coridor gogleddol, ond nid yw prosiectau penodol wedi dod i'r amlwg eto. Gwnaeth dinasoedd fel Caeredin, Leeds, Nottingham, Rhydychen a Chaerfrog welliannau graddol dros nifer o flynyddoedd, ac nid oes rheswm pam na ddylai hynny ddigwydd yng Nghaerdydd. Felly, gobeithiaf nad yw'r cyngor yn canolbwyntio ar y weledigaeth hirdymor a amlinellodd yn unig, ond ei fod hefyd yn mynd ar drywydd gwelliannau graddol.

Mae'r cyngor wedi cynnwys sawl dull y gall darpar bartneriaid ei ddefnyddio i geisio codi arian, gan gynnwys codi tâl ar ddefnyddwyr

workplace parking levies. The council maintains that these charges will not be introduced until the local transport infrastructure has significantly improved, and my colleagues and I agree wholeheartedly with that view. The Government will be responsible for approving any charging scheme and, before considering such a scheme, we want to see major improvements in bus and rail services into Cardiff. It would be essential to introduce park-and-ride schemes, dedicated bus lanes and quality bus partnerships agreed between local authorities and bus operators.

I am glad to have had the opportunity to present the Assembly Government's case. Cardiff, as the capital city, needs good transport facilities and services. We will work together to develop this scheme. The wider regional consortium, consisting of the 10 authorities making up the South East Wales Transport Board, has developed from the two existing consortia, the South Wales Integrated Fast Transit Consortium and the Transport Integration in the Gwent Economic Region Consortium. Cardiff is a large, metropolitan area and the Assembly's resources should be concentrated strategically. Supporting a mix of rail and bus services and infrastructure together with walking and cycling opportunities, and recognising the contribution of commuters, shoppers and other visitors from Valleys and other communities to the prosperity of the city is the way forward in developing a transport system that is fit for our capital.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That completes our business for this afternoon.

ffyrdd a thollau parcio yn y gweithle. Mae'r cyngor yn honni na chaiff y taliadau hyn eu cyflwyno hyd nes y bydd y seilwaith trafnidiaeth leol wedi gwella'n sylweddol, ac mae fy nghyd-Aelodau a minnau yn cytuno'n llwyr â'r farn honno. Y Llywodraeth fydd yn gyfrifol am gymeradwyo unrhyw gynllun codi tâl a, chyn ystyried cynllun o'r fath, yr ydym am weld gwelliannau mawr mewn gwasanaethau bysiau a rheilffordd i mewn i Gaerdydd. Byddai'n hanfodol cyflwyno cynlluniau parcio a theithio, lonydd bysiau penodedig a phartneriaethau bysiau o ansawdd y cytunir arnynt rhwng awdurdodau lleol a chwmnïau bysiau.

Yr wyf yn falch imi gael y cyfle i gyflwyno achos Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Fel y brifddinas, mae angen cyfleusterau a gwasanaethau trafnidiaeth da ar Gaerdydd. Cydweithiwn i ddatblygu'r cynllun hwn. Mae'r consortiwm rhanbarthol ehangach, sy'n cynnwys y 10 awdurdod sy'n ffurfio Bwrdd Trafnidiaeth De Ddwyrain Cymru, wedi datblygu o ddau gonsortiwm presennol, sef Consortiwm Teithio Cyflym Integredig De Cymru a Chonsortiwm Integreiddio Trafnidiaeth yn Rhanbarth Economaidd Gwent. Mae Caerdydd yn ardal fawr, fetropolitan a dylid canolbwyntio adnoddau'r Cynulliad yn strategol. Cefnogi cymysgedd o wasanaethau a seilwaith rheilffordd a bysiau ynghyd â chyfleoedd cerdded a seiclo, a chydabod cyfraniad cymudwyr, siopwyr ac ymwelwyr eraill o'r Cymoedd a chymunedau eraill i ffyniant y ddinas yw'r ffordd ymlaen o ran datblygu system drafnidiaeth sy'n addas i'n prifddinas.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.23 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.23 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)

Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)