

# Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)

## The National Assembly for Wales

(The Official Record)

**Dydd Mawrth, 8 Mehefin 2004**

**Tuesday, 8 June 2004**

**Cynnwys  
Contents**

[Sefydlu Pwyllgor ar Ysmygu mewn Mannau Cyhoeddus](#)  
[Establishment of a Committee on Smoking in Public Places](#)

[Cynnig i Ohirio Rheolau Sefydlog](#)  
[Motion to Suspend Standing Orders](#)

[Cynnig i Ethol Aelodau i'r Pwyllgor ar Ysmygu mewn Mannau Cyhoeddus](#)  
[Motion to Elect Members to the Committee on Smoking in Public Places](#)

[Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog](#)  
[Questions to the First Minister](#)

[Cwestiwn Brys](#)  
[Urgent Question](#)

[Datganiad Busnes](#)  
[Business Statement](#)

[Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 \(Cychwyn Rhif 5\) \(Cymru\) 2004](#)  
[Approval of the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 \(Commencement No. 5\)](#)  
[\(Wales\) Order 2004](#)

[Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Tirlenwi \(Blwyddyn y Cynllun a'r Uchafswm Tirlenwi ar gyfer Cymru\) 2004,](#)  
[Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Lwfansau Tirlenwi \(Cymru\), a Gorchymyn Deddf Masnachu Gwastraff ac Allyriadau 2003](#)  
[\(Cychwyn\)](#)  
[\(Cymru\) 2004](#)

[Approval of the Landfill \(Scheme Year and Maximum Landfill Amount for Wales\) Regulations 2004, the Landfill](#)  
[Allowances Scheme \(Wales\) Regulations 2004, and the](#)

Y Comisiwn a fydd yn Adolygu Adroddiad Terfynol Cynllun y Sector Gwirfoddol  
The Commission to Review the Voluntary Sector Scheme Final Report

Adroddiad y Grwp Gorchwyl a Gorffen ar Weithgynhyrchu  
The Manufacturing Task and Finish Group Report

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber.  
In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.*  
*The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Sefydlu Pwyllgor ar Ysmygu mewn Mannau Cyhoeddus**  
**Establishment of a Committee on Smoking in Public Places**

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw  
Kirsty Williams, Michael German a Mick Bates.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1  
in the names of Kirsty Williams, Michael German  
and Mick Bates.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose  
that

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly establish a committee in  
accordance with Standing Order No. 8.1 to advise the  
Assembly on the banning of smoking in public places.  
The title of the committee shall be the Committee on  
Smoking in Public Places. Membership of the  
committee shall comprise five Assembly Members,  
two from the Labour Party, and one each from Plaid  
Cymru, the Conservative Party and the Liberal  
Democrat Party. A member of the Labour Party to  
chair the Committee.*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn sefydlu pwyllgor yn unol  
â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.1 i gynghori'r Cynulliad ar  
wahardd ysmygu mewn mannau cyhoeddus. Teitl y  
pwyllgor fydd y Pwyllgor ar Ysmygu mewn Mannau  
Cyhoeddus. Bydd pump Aelod o'r Cynulliad ar y  
Pwyllgor, dau o'r Blaid Lafur ac un yr un o Blaid  
Cymru, Ceidwadwyr Cymru a Democratiaid  
Rhyddfrydol Cymru. Bydd aelod o'r Blaid Lafur yn  
cadeirio'r Pwyllgor.*

*The terms of reference for the Committee on Smoking  
in Public Places will be to:*

*Cylch gorchwyl y Pwyllgor ar Ysmygu mewn Mannau  
Cyhoeddus fydd:*

<p><i>i) consider current evidence on relevant issues, including the health risks of environmental tobacco smoke and the economic impact of restrictions on smoking in public places;</i></p>	<p><i>i) ystyried tystiolaeth gyfredol ar faterion perthnasol, gan gynnwys y peryglon i iechyd o fwg tybaco yn yr amgylchedd a'r effaith ar yr economi o gyfyngu ar ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus;</i></p>
<p><i>ii) review developments in the UK and Ireland relating to the introduction of restrictions on smoking in public places (including the debates on Baroness Finlay's and Lord Faulkner's Private Member's Bills, the response to the UK Government consultation on devolving powers to local authorities to introduce smoking bans at work and in public places, the outcome of the Scottish Executive consultation on smoking in public places, and the experience of implementing the workplace smoking ban in Ireland).</i></p>	<p><i>ii) adolygu'r datblygiadau yn y DU ac Iwerddon sy'n ymwneud â chyflwyno cyfyngiadau ar ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus (gan gynnwys y trafodaethau ar Fesurau Aelod Preifat y Farwnes Finlay a'r Arglwydd Faulkner; yr ymateb i ymgynghoriad Llywodraeth y DU ar ddatganoli pwerau i awdurdodau lleol i gyflwyno gwaharddiad ar ysmegu yn y gwaith ac mewn mannau cyhoeddu,; canlyniad ymgynghoriad Llywodraeth yr Alban ar ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus, a'r profiad o roi'r gwaharddiad ar ysmegu yn y gweithle ar waith yn Iwerddon).</i></p>
<p><i>iii) consider the experiences in other countries where a ban has been introduced; and</i></p>	<p><i>iii) ystyried y profiadau mewn gwledydd eraill lle mae gwaharddiad wedi'i gyflwyno; a</i></p>
<p><i>iv) report to the Assembly by 25 May 2005 on its conclusions.</i></p>	<p><i>iv) rhoi adroddiad ar ei gasgliadau i'r Cynulliad erbyn 25 Mai 2005.</i></p>
<p><i>The committee shall cease to exist on the 25 May 2005 or on the date it reports to the Assembly if this is earlier. (NDM1974)</i></p>	<p><i>Bydd y pwyllgor yn dod i ben ar 25 Mai 2005 neu ar y diwrnod y bydd yn cyflwyno ei adroddiad i'r Cynulliad os yw hynny'n gynharach. (NDM1974)</i></p>
<p><b>The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):</b> I propose amendment 1 in my name and in the names of Kirsty Williams and Mick Bates.... Insert new clause, iii) and renumber accordingly:</p>	<p><b>Arweinydd Grwp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):</b> Cynigiau welliant 1 yn fy enw i ac yn enwau Kirsty Williams a Mick Bates.... Ychwanegu cymal newydd, iii) ac ailrifo'r pwyntiau sy'n weddill:</p>
<p><i>review the existing powers of the National Assembly with regard to smoking in public places, and the case for an extension of those powers.</i></p>	<p><i>adolygu pwerau presennol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol mewn perthynas ag ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus, a'r achos o blaid ymestyn y pwerau hynny.</i></p>
<p>The reason for our proposing this amendment is to extend the work of this committee to looking at powers to ensure that it can cover the whole remit. It would be a great shame if the committee were to come back with a report that found that we would need an extension of powers. It seems sensible therefore to try to ensure that the committee has an all-encompassing remit to look at our powers. Certainly, it should not be excluded from considering issues related to the smoking debate because we do not have powers over them. It is to make that explicit that we have proposed this amendment, so that it can review our powers and so that if we have to go beyond our existing powers, we can do so.</p>	<p>Ein bwriad wrth gynnig y gwelliant hwn yw ymestyn gwaith y pwyllgor hwn er mwyn iddo ystyried pwerau i sicrhau y gall ymdrin â'r cylch gwaith hwn yn ei gyfanrwydd. Byddai'n drueni mawr pe byddai'r pwyllgor yn cyflwyno adroddiad sy'n dod i'r casgliad bod angen pwerau ychwanegol arnom. Gan hynny, ymddengys mai synhwyrol yw ceisio sicrhau y bydd gan y pwyllgor gylch gwaith hollgynhwysol i ystyried ein pwerau. Yn sicr, ni ddylai gael ei rwystro rhag ystyried materion sy'n ymwneud â'r ddadl ar ysmegu am nad ydym yn meddu ar bwerau drostynt. Er mwyn gwneud hynny'n fwy eglur y cynigiwyd y gwelliant hwn, fel y gallwn adolygu ein pwerau a mynd tu hwnt i'n pwerau presennol os oes rhaid.</p>

**Peter Law:** I will not support this motion. I think that it is a political stunt and I am concerned that we are in the region of political correctness, when we do not have legislative powers over this. Members may recall that I spoke against this proposal when we previously discussed a ban on smoking in public, in restaurants, public houses and cafes. I am concerned that the upshot will be that a small minority of poor and deprived people will be penalised, particularly in constituencies such as mine, where sometimes people's only pleasure, given the stress and unemployment that they suffer from, is to have a cigarette and a cup of tea in a local cafe. This is a civil liberty, and it should not be taken away. Will it be chocolate next? What are we doing about alcohol? I am not hearing much about that. I think that we should adopt a self-regulatory approach. Having smoking and non-smoking areas in public places such as restaurants is much more reasonable than forcing people to lose the civil liberty to have a cigarette in a public place.

**David Lloyd:** Plaid Cymru supports the establishment of an ad hoc committee to consider banning smoking in public buildings. We also share the concerns expressed about the Assembly's lack of power to legislate on this matter. Members will recall that we passed a resolution calling for the powers necessary to ban smoking in public buildings in Wales on 22 January 2003. I do not want a re-run of that debate. We look at the experience of Ireland, where a ban on smoking in public buildings is already in force and has been successfully implemented. We look at the experience of New York, where 100,000 New Yorkers have given up smoking in the year since a ban on smoking in public buildings was introduced there. It is not a matter of civil liberties, because passive smoking kills. Inhaling someone else's smoke gives you lung cancer and heart disease, when you are a non-smoker. Therefore, it is not a matter of civil liberties. There is much evidence for this committee to garner and collate. We need to move forward and address this vital issue, assess the evidence and legislate to turn the vision into reality.

**Peter Law:** Ni chefnogaf y cynnig hwn. Credaf mai st?nt wleidyddol ydyw a phryderaf ein bod yn camu i dir cywirdeb gwleidyddol, a ninnau heb bwerau deddfwriaethol yn y cyd-destun hwn. Efallai y bydd Aelodau'n cofio imi siarad yn erbyn y bwriad hwn pan gawsom drafodaeth o'r blaen ar wahardd ysmegu'n gyhoeddus, mewn bwytai, tafarnau a chaffis. Pryderaf y bydd hyn yn arwain at gosbi lleiafrif bach o bobl dlawd a difreintiedig, yn enwedig mewn etholaethau fel fy un i, lle mai'r unig bleser sydd gan bobl weithiau, yn wyneb y straen a'r diweithdra a brofant, yw cael sigarét a chwpanaid o de mewn caffi lleol. Un o'n hawliau sifil yw hon, ac ni ddylid ei diddymu. Ai siocled fydd hi nesaf? Beth yr ydym yn ei wneud ynghylch alcohol? Ni chlywaf lawer am hynny. Credaf y dylem reoleiddio ein hunain. Mae pennu lleoedd lle caniateir a ni chaniateir ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus fel bwytai yn llawer mwy rhesymol na gorfodi pobl i ildio'r hawl ddinesig i gael sigarét mewn man cyhoeddus.

**David Lloyd:** Mae Plaid Cymru o blaid sefydlu pwyllgor *ad hoc* i ystyried gwahardd ysmegu mewn adeiladau cyhoeddus. Yr ydym ninnau'n rhannu'r pryderon a fynegwyd ynghylch diffyg gallu'r Cynulliad i ddeddfu ar y mater hwn. Bydd Aelodau'n cofio ein bod wedi derbyn cynnig ar 22 Ionawr 2003a oedd yn galw am inni gael y pwerau sydd eu hangen i wahardd ysmegu mewn adeiladau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.... Nid wyf am weld ailadrodd y ddadl honno. Edrychwn ar brofiad Iwerddon, lle y mae gwaharddiad ar ysmegu mewn adeiladau cyhoeddus mewn grym eisoes ac wedi'i roi ar waith yn llwyddiannus. Edrychwn ar brofiad Efrog Newydd, lle y mae 100,000 o bobl wedi rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu yn y flwyddyn ers cyflwyno gwaharddiad ar ysmegu mewn adeiladau cyhoeddus yn y fan honno. Nid mater o hawliau sifil ydyw, gan fod ysmegu goddefol yn lladd. Mae anadlu mwg rhywun arall yn rhoi canser yr ysgyfaint a chlefyd y galon i chi, er nad ydych yn ysmegu eich hun. Felly, nid mater o hawliau sifil ydyw. Mae llawer o dystiolaeth i'w chasglu a'i chymharu gan y pwyllgor hwn. Rhaid inni symud ymlaen ac ymdrin â'r mater hollbwysig hwn, asesu'r dystiolaeth a chyflwyno deddfwriaeth i gyflawni'r weledigaeth.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** The Labour group feels strongly that the issues raised in the amendment have been allowed for under the terms of reference agreed to by all four parties. We will therefore not support the amendment.

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Mae'r grwp Llafur yn teimlo'n gryf fod cyfle i ystyried y materion a godir yn y gwelliant fel rhan o'r cylch gorchwyl a gytunwyd gan bob un o'r pedair plaid. Gan hynny, ni chefnogwn y gwelliant.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 34.  
Amendment 1: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 34.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Janet  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM1974): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.  
Motion (NDM1974): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Law, Peter  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cynnig i Ohirio Rheolau Sefydlog  
Motion to Suspend Standing Orders**

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 37.5, agrees to suspend Standing Order No. 5.4 and that part of Standing Order No. 8.4 which states, 'following consultation in the Business Committee with the political groups represented in the Assembly', to allow the no named day motion (NNDM1973) tabled on Friday 28 May to be taken in Plenary this afternoon. (NDM1986)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 37.5, yn cytuno i ohirio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4 a'r rhan o Reol Sefydlog Rhif 8.4 sy'n nodi 'yn sgil ymgynghori yn y Pwyllgor Busnes â'r grwpiau gwleidyddol a gynrychiolir yn y Cynulliad', i ganiatáu i gynnig heb ddyddiad trafod (NNDM1973), a gyflwynwyd ddydd Gwener 28 Mai gael ei drafod yn y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw. (NDM1986)*

*Cynnig (NDM1986): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1986): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cynnig i Ethol Aelodau i'r Pwyllgor ar Ysmygu mewn Mannau Cyhoeddus  
Motion to Elect Members to the Committee on Smoking in Public Places**

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 8.4, elects the following Members to the Committee on Smoking in Public Places: Val Lloyd (Labour); Jeff Cuthbert (Labour); David Lloyd (Plaid Cymru); Jonathan Morgan (Conservative); Peter Black (Liberal Democrat), and elects Val Lloyd (Labour) to be the Chair of the Committee. (NNDM1973)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 8.4, yn ethol yr Aelodau canlynol i'r Pwyllgor ar Ysmygu mewn Mannau Cyhoeddus: Val Lloyd (Llafur); Jeff Cuthbert (Llafur); David Lloyd (Plaid Cymru); Jonathan Morgan (Ceidwadwyr); Peter Black (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol), ac yn ethol Val Lloyd (Llafur) i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor. (NNDM1973).*

*Cynnig (NNDM1973): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NNDM1973): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David



Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

## Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

### Llywodraeth Leol Local Government

**Q1 Leighton Andrews:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the future of local government in Wales? (OAQ35796)

**C1 Leighton Andrews:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ddyfodol llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru? (OAQ35796)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** This close to an election, I should only give a factual response. It is important that people have the right to exercise democratic choice on Thursday. I would like to encourage everyone to use their democratic right, so that we have a healthy turnout and a high vote, and that whoever is elected has a real mandate. I hope that people will also take note of the plea signed by the four party leaders: when they read the ballot paper people will see that there are a handful of candidates who will be standing for a party which represents race hatred, racism and fascism; I hope that they will not support a party that incites racial hatred.

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Gan fod etholiad mor agos, dim ond ymateb ffeithiol y dylwn ei roi. Mae'n bwysig bod gan bobl yr hawl i ddewis yn ddemocrataidd ddydd Iau. Carwn annog pawb i ddefnyddio'i hawl ddemocrataidd, fel y cawn nifer dda o bleidleiswyr a phleidlais fawr, ac y bydd gwir fandad gan bwy bynnag a etholir. Gobeithiaf y bydd pobl hefyd yn cymryd sylw o'r apêl a lofnodwyd gan y pedwar arweinydd plaid: pan ddarllenent y papur pleidleisio, bydd pobl yn gweld bod llond dynaid o ymgeiswyr yn sefyll dros blaid sy'n cynrychioli casineb hiliol, hiliaeth a ffasgaeth; gobeithiaf na fyddant yn cefnogi plaid sy'n annog casineb hiliol.

**Leighton Andrews:** Would you agree that partnership is central to the relationship between the Assembly and local Government? Would you also agree that the future interests of local government in Rhondda Cynon Taf would be best served by a council committed to working with the National Assembly by applying and bidding for Assembly schemes such as the free school breakfasts pilots, rather than a council led by an incompetent Plaid Cymru group now in its dying days?

**Leighton Andrews:** A gytunech fod lle canolog i bartneriaeth yn y berthynas rhwng y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol? A gytunech hefyd y byddai llywodraeth leol yn Rhondda Cynon Taf yn cael y budd mwyaf yn y dyfodol o gael cyngor sydd wedi ymrwmo i weithio gyda'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol drwy ymgeisio ar gyfer cynlluniau o eiddo'r Cynulliad fel y cynlluniau rhagbrofol ar gyfer brecwastau am ddim yn yr ysgol, yn hytrach na chyngor a arweinir gan grwp Plaid Cymru analluog sydd bellach yn dod i ddiwedd ei oes?

2.10 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I thought that we might stray onto that question. There have been some recent allegations that it was difficult to access the special school funding that Jane Davidson made available. People will note that some councils appear to have mastered the technique of accessing the special allocation of £9 million to encourage people to rebuild large schools, which could otherwise only be done through PFI. They now have that choice. Some councils have mastered that technique; others, which might be of particular interest to Leighton Andrews, have not. However, they were all treated in a non-discriminatory way, despite allegations to the contrary. There will, of course, be opportunities to enter the programme at a later stage, whoever is in control of Rhondda Cynon Taf on Friday.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr oeddwn yn amau y byddem yn crwydro i'r cwestiwn hwnnw. Bu rhai cyhuddiadau'n ddiweddar i'r perwyl ei bod yn anodd cael gafael ar y cyllid arbennig ar gyfer ysgolion y mae Jane Davidson wedi'i ddarparu. Bydd pobl yn sylwi yr ymddengys bod rhai cynghorau wedi meistroli'r dechneg o gael y dyraniad arbennig o £9 miliwn i annog ailadeiladu ysgolion mawr, na ellid ond ei wneud fel arall drwy fenter cyllid preifat. Mae'r dewis hwnnw ganddynt yn awr. Mae rhai cynghorau wedi meistroli'r dechneg honno; mae eraill, a allai fod o ddiddordeb neilltuol i Leighton Andrews, nad ydynt. Er hynny, cawsant oll eu trin yn deg, er gwaethaf cyhuddiadau i'r gwrthwyneb. Wrth gwrs, bydd cyfleoedd i ymuno â'r rhaglen yn ddiweddarach, waeth pwy fydd yn rheoli Rhondda Cynon Taf ddydd Gwener.

**David Lloyd:** Brif Weinidog, a fyddech yn fodlon canmol cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf ar ei lwyddiant hyd yma yn gwrthdroi perfformiad Llafur yn yr ardal cyn 1999, ac edrych ymlaen at ragor o lywodraethu Plaid Cymru yn y dyfodol?

**David Lloyd:** First Minister, would you be willing to praise Rhondda Cynon Taf council for its success to date in reversing Labour's performance in the area before 1999, and look forward to more Plaid Cymru governance in the future?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wn pam eich bod wastad yn ceisio canmol un o dri chyngor Plaid Cymru, ac yn ceisio gwneud i mi ei ganmol hefyd. Pam mae ar gyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf angen eich help yn fwy na chyngor Caerffili a Gwynedd? Efallai y gallech egluro i'r bobl sy'n cefnogi eich plaid chi yng Nghaerffili a Gwynedd pam eich bod yn esgeuluso eu gofynion hwy. Mae'n bwysig i bob un sy'n pleidleisio wneud hynny ar ôl mesur perfformiad eu cynghorau. Dyna pam mae Leighton Andrews a minnau yn gwneud y pwyntiau hyn. Bydd hyn yn arwain at bleidleisio yn y ffordd iawn ddydd Iau.

**The First Minister:** I do not know why you always try to praise one of Plaid Cymru's three councils, and try to get me to do the same. Why does Rhondda Cynon Taf council need your help more than Caerphilly or Gwynedd councils? You could explain, perhaps, to your party's supporters in Caerphilly and Gwynedd why you are neglecting their needs. It is important that all those who vote weigh up the performance of their council before doing so. That is why Leighton Andrews and I make these points. This will lead to making the right choice in the polling booth on Thursday.

**Glyn Davies:** I will ask you a question about local government funding in the future. Both your party and mine have expressed concern at many levels about the balance of funding: council tax only raises about 20 per cent of funding. There are several ways in which that can be changed. Would you support any ways of doing that?

**Glyn Davies:** Gofynnaf gwestiwn i chi ynghylch cyllido llywodraeth leol yn y dyfodol. Mae'ch plaid chi a'm plaid innau wedi mynegi pryder ar sawl lefel ynghylch cydbwysedd y cyllido: nid yw'r dreth gyngor ond yn codi tua 20 y cant o'r cyllid. Mae sawl modd y gellid newid hynny. A fyddech o blaid unrhyw fodd i wneud hynny?

**The First Minister:** The figure is 20 per cent in England, but it is 10 per cent in Wales, so there is already a big difference in the balance of funding. Our revenue support grants and specific grants cover 90 per cent of expenditure, with council tax covering the remainder; the figure is 80 per cent in England, where there is, on average, much greater property wealth. If you re-examine that position, it must be done in a way that does not disbenefit people in Wales. There are arguments about the future of property-based taxation, of which we are all aware. It causes problems for widows or widowers living in large houses which, for sentimental reasons, they do not wish to leave. Because of the stigma attached, such people do not always want to access the benefit relief to which they may be eligible, so they do not always avail themselves of the relief that they could receive. That is sad, but we must find ways of dealing with it. That would be one way of dealing with the situation. If you are thinking about local income tax, how do you distinguish it from regular income tax? Do you also consider other issues, such as sales tax and tourism tax, which are common in some other countries which use property tax, such as the USA. All options are open at the moment.

**Michael German:** As I travel around Wales, three issues come up time after time—council tax, war and secrecy in town halls. You do not need to travel far to find members of the public and councillors from all political parties who believe that the present council structure is basically a secret structure. The cabinet scrutiny system introduced with great fanfare to open up government does not seem to have worked. The so-called fourth option that local authorities have before them currently requires verification from the Minister. In other words, if a local authority wants to convert to a more open system of government—the fourth option—they have to go to the Minister. The recommendation from the committee is that local authorities should be able to make their own decisions in the future. Do you support the call for local authorities in Wales to be able to decide for themselves which of the options for government they want to follow, without having to resort to the National Assembly?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ugain y cant yw'r ffigur yn Lloegr, ond 10 y cant ydyw yng Nghymru, felly mae gwahaniaeth mawr eisoes yng nghydbwysedd y cyllido. Mae ein grantiau cynnal refeniw a'n grantiau penodol yn cwmpasu 90 y cant o'r gwariant, ac mae'r dreth gyngor yn cwmpasu'r gweddill; 80 y cant yw'r ffigur yn Lloegr, lle y mae llawer mwy o gyfoeth o ran eiddo, ar gyfartaledd. Pe baech yn ailystyried y sefyllfa honno, byddai'n rhaid gwneud hynny mewn modd nad yw er anfantais i bobl yng Nghymru. Gwyddom oll am y dadleuon ynghylch dyfodol trethi sy'n seiliedig ar eiddo.. Mae'n creu problemau i wyr neu wragedd gweddw sy'n byw mewn tai mawr nad ydynt yn dymuno'u gadael, am resymau sentimental. Oherwydd y stigma sydd ynghlwm wrth hynny, nid yw pobl o'r fath bob amser am gael y cymorth budddal y gallent fod yn gymwys i'w gael, felly nid ydynt bob amser am fanteisio ar y cymorth y gallent ei dderbyn. Mae hynny'n beth trist, ond rhaid inni gael modd o ymdrin ag ef. Byddai hwnnw'n un modd o ymdrin â'r sefyllfa. Os ydych yn ystyried treth incwm leol, sut y gwahaniaethir rhyngddi a'r dreth incwm arferol? A ystyrir materion eraill hefyd, fel treth ar werthiant a threth dwristiaeth, sy'n gyffredin mewn rhai gwledydd eraill sy'n defnyddio treth ar eiddo, megis UDA. Mae pob dewis ar gael ar hyn o bryd.

**Michael German:** Wrth imi fynd o gwmpas Cymru, mae tri mater yn codi dro ar ôl tro—y dreth gyngor, rhyfel a chyfrinachedd mewn neuaddau tref. Nid oes raid mynd ymhell i ddarganfod aelodau o'r cyhoedd a chynghorwyr o bob plaid wleidyddol sydd o'r farn mai trefn gyfrinachol yn y bôn yw un y cynghorau ar hyn o bryd. Nid yw'r system o graffu gan gabinet a gyflwynwyd gyda'r fath orchest yn gweithio i bob golwg. Mae'r pedwerydd dewis, fel y'i gelwir, sydd gerbron awdurdodau lleol ar hyn o bryd, yn un y mae'n rhaid i'r Gweinidog ei ddilysu. Mewn geiriau eraill, os yw awdurdod lleol am droi at system lywodraeth fwy agored—y pedwerydd dewis—rhaid iddo fynd at y Gweinidog. Argymhelliad y pwyllgor yw y dylai awdurdodau lleol allu gwneud eu penderfyniadau eu hunain yn y dyfodol. A ydych yn cefnogi'r alwad am roi'r gallu i awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru benderfynu drostynt eu hunain o ran pa un o'r dewisiadau ar gyfer llywodraeth y maent am ei ddilyn, heb orfod troi at y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol?

**The First Minister:** I am assuming that the fourth option is the one that is currently in use in Powys, but not in any other Welsh local authority. Powys has kept an adapted version of the old six-weekly cycle. [Interruption.] I was not aware of the case of Merthyr as well. We all understand the arguments. Under the new system you get speed of decision, you do not have to wait for the monthly or six weekly cycles of committee meetings and council confirmation. On the other hand, we all recognise that there is also a degree of dissatisfaction with the new structures because backbenchers frequently feel that they do not have enough to do and that they have not adapted as well to this new scrutiny mode. We face some of those problems over the Assembly's corporate body status, so we have a degree of sympathy with it. I do not believe that anyone would want to go back to the old system. However, I will talk to Sue Essex about this specific question of whether you should require ministerial authority to go for the fourth option or whether it should be left open, and either Sue or I will write to you on that.

**Michael German:** I turn to the other local government issue, which is the council tax. The consultation period has now ended and there will be a chance for us to debate the options that you may put forward as being the changes—you have already referred to them. Do you believe that it is important at this stage that you as the Labour leader in Wales and as First Minister should put your party's view on record in terms of what changes should now come forward? Since we have had the consultation period, and since we face local elections on Thursday, is it not appropriate that we should hear from the Labour Party, and from you as First Minister, how you believe the council tax should change, or should that be kept a secret as well?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cymryd mai'r pedwerydd dewis yw'r un sydd ar waith ym Mhowys ar hyn o bryd, ond nid yn yr un arall o awdurdodau lleol Cymru. Mae Powys wedi glynu at fersiwn addasedig o'r hen gylich chwe wythnos. [Torri ar draws.] Ni wyddwn fod Merthyr Tudful yn gwneud hynny hefyd. Yr ydym oll yn deall y dadleuon. O dan y system newydd gwneir penderfyniadau yn gyflym, nid oes raid disgwyl am y cylchoedd misol neu chwewythnosol o gyfarfodydd pwyllgor a chadarnhad gan y cyngor. Ar y llaw arall, yr ydym oll yn cydnabod bod rhywfaint o anfonlonrwydd hefyd ar y trefniadau newydd gan fod meincwyr cefn yn aml yn teimlo nad oes ganddynt ddigon i'w wneud ac nad ydynt wedi addasu cystal i'r dull craffu newydd hwn. Wynebwn rai o'r problemau hynny ynghylch statws y Cynulliad fel corff corfforaethol, felly mae gennym beth cydymdeimlad â hyn. Nid wyf o'r farn y byddai neb am fynd yn ôl i'r hen system. Er hynny, siaradaf â Sue Essex ynghylch y cwestiwn penodol hwn o ran pa un a ddylid gorfod cael caniatâd gan Weinidog i gymryd y pedwerydd dewis neu a ddylid ei adael yn agored, a bydd Sue neu fi ysgrifennu atoch ynghylch hynny.

**Michael German:** Trof at y mater arall sy'n ymwneud â llywodraeth leol, sef y dreth gyngor. Mae'r cyfnod ymgynghori wedi dod i ben bellach a bydd cyfle inni gael dadl ar y dewisiadau y gallech eu cynnig fel y newidiadau—yr ydych eisoes wedi cyfeirio atynt. A ydych o'r farn ei bod yn bwysig yn awr i chi fel arweinydd Llafur yng Nghymru a'r Prif Weinidog ddatgan barn eich plaid am y newidiadau y dylid eu cyflwyno'n awr? Gan fod y cyfnod ymgynghori wedi dod i ben, a chan ein bod yn wynebu etholiadau lleol ddydd Iau, onid yw'n briodol inni glywed gan y Blaid Lafur, a chennych chi fel y Prif Weinidog, ynghylch pa newid a ddylai fod yn y dreth gyngor yn eich barn chi, neu a ddylid cadw hynny'n gyfrinach hefyd?

**The First Minister:** It is not a secret at all. It is simply a question of whether it is appropriate to do the fairyland politics that your party can accurately be accused of, namely persuading voters that, if they decide to vote for the Liberal Democrats on Thursday, somehow they are voting to bring in local income tax, when they are not. That is not an issue at these elections. It is wrong to engage in these fairyland politics. We have a system, which may be changed in all sorts of different ways, because, as I have said, everything is up for grabs in these reviews, that may take place on a Wales-only, England-only or England and Wales basis, or a part of both, which will relate to that in part, or could relate to the non-domestic rate. They could relate to the direct funding of services, which are currently funded through the rate support grant or other services. However, to pretend that somehow that will be an issue in the local government elections would be wrong and misleading. What is at stake in the local government elections is what the political colour of your local councillor or council will be under the current system, and not under some new system that may come in and which will be voted on here and in Westminster.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw'n gyfrinach o gwbl. Y cyfan ydyw yw mater o ba un a yw'n briodol ymhel â'r wleidyddiaeth dylwyth teg y mae'n gywir cyhuddo'ch plaid o ymhel â hi, sef perswadio etholwyr, os penderfynant bleidleisio dros y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ddydd Iau, y byddant rywsut yn pleidleisio dros gyflwyno treth incwm leol, er na fyddent yn gwneud hynny.... Nid yw'r mater hwn yn codi yn yr etholiadau hyn. Camgymeriad yw ymhel â gwleidyddiaeth dylwyth teg o'r fath. Mae gennym system, y gellir ei newid mewn sawl modd gwahanol, oherwydd, fel y dywedais, mae popeth ar gael i'w gipio yn yr adolygiadau hyn, a allai ymdrin â Chymru'n unig, Lloegr yn unig neu Gymru a Lloegr, neu'r naill a'r llall, gan ymwneud â hynny'n rhannol, neu gallent ymwneud â threthi busnes. Gallent ymwneud â chyllid uniongyrchol i wasanaethau, sy'n cael eu cyllido ar hyn o bryd drwy'r grant cynnal trethi neu wasanaethau eraill. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n anghywir a chamarweiniol cymryd arnoch y bydd hyn yn bwnc llosg yn etholiadau llywodraeth leol. Yr hyn sydd yn y fantol yn etholiadau llywodraeth leol yw beth fydd lliw gwleidyddol eich cynghorydd lleol neu'ch cyngor o dan y system bresennol, ac nid o dan rhyw system newydd a allai ddod i rym ac y pleidleisir arni yma ac yn San Steffan.

**Prifysgol Ffederal Cymru  
The Federal University of Wales**

**Q2 Michael German:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the federal University of Wales?  
(OAQ35815)

**C2 Michael German:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar Brifysgol Ffederal Cymru?  
(OAQ35815)

**The First Minister:** The University of Wales currently governs the vast bulk of higher education in Wales, with the exception of the University of Glamorgan. We have a policy to encourage higher education institutions in Wales to merge in order to bring down the numbers of separate institutions, while increasing the number of students, so as to reduce overheads. We have 13 institutions, which is about to be reduced to 12 with the merger of Cardiff University and the University of Wales College of Medicine on 1 August. However, that is still far too many when you compare it with Scotland, which has 60 per cent-odd more students with the same number of higher education institutions. On that basis, we should be down to about eight. There has been a failed merger between the University of Wales Institute, Cardiff and the University of Glamorgan, partially on the issue that it must cross the line

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Prifysgol Cymru sy'n rheoli'r rhan fwyaf o addysg uwch yng Nghymru, heblaw am Brifysgol Morgannwg. Ein polisi yw annog sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru i gyfuno er mwyn cael llai o sefydliadau ar wahân, tra'n cynyddu nifer y myfyrwyr, er mwyn lleihau gorbenion. Mae gennym 13 o sefydliadau, ac mae hynny ar fin gostwng i 12 drwy gyfuno Prifysgol Caerdydd a Choleg Meddygaeth Prifysgol Cymru ar 1 Awst. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n parhau i fod yn ormod o lawer os gwneir cymhariaeth â'r Alban, sydd â thua 60 y cant yn fwy o fyfyrwyr a'r un nifer o sefydliadau addysg uwch. Ar y sail honno, dylem gael cyn lleied ag wyth. Methwyd â chyfuno Athrofa Prifysgol Cymru Caerdydd a Phrifysgol Morgannwg, yn rhannol oherwydd y bydd yn rhaid iddi groesi'r llinell rhwng bod y tu mewn i Brifysgol Cymru a thu allan iddi. Fodd bynnag, mater i Brifysgol Cymru yw hyn.

between being inside and outside the University of Wales. However, it is a matter for the University of Wales. Dafydd Wigley, as its Pro-chancellor, is conducting a review of the future of the University of Wales, especially in light of the merger that is going through between Cardiff University and the University of Wales College of Medicine.

Mae Dafydd Wigley, fel ei Dirprwy Ganghellor, yn cynnal adolygiad o ddyfodol Prifysgol Cymru, yn enwedig yng ngolwg y cyfuno sy'n mynd rhagddo rhwng Prifysgol Caerdydd a Choleg Meddygaeth Prifysgol Cymru.

**Michael German:** A major issue to be considered is the provision of higher education through the medium of Welsh. Do you believe that the review being conducted on the structure of the University of Wales will help or hinder the process of ensuring that there is appropriate provision, at a higher level, of higher education through the medium of Welsh?

**Michael German:** Un mater pwysig i'w ystyried yw darparu addysg uwch drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Yn eich barn chi, ai hwyluso ynteu llesteirio'r broses o sicrhau darpariaeth briodol o addysg uwch, ar lefel uwch, drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg y bydd yr adolygiad a gynhelir o drefniadaeth Prifysgol Cymru?

**The First Minister:** One of the most fascinating questions that we must face over the next 10 or 15 years is how widely you can provide higher education subjects through the medium of Welsh to degree level. Traditionally, the liberal arts subjects, such as theology, Welsh, history and geography, have been taught through the medium of Welsh. How much further can you take that? Can you take it into nuclear physics, engineering, meteorology, marine science, and so on? How far and how quickly can you do that? How do you ensure that the demand is there as well as the competence, the textbooks, and so on? This needs to be considered closely on the basis of demand, competence, textbook and CD-Rom backup as well as teaching material backup.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Un o'r cwestiynau mwyaf diddorol y bydd yn rhaid inni ei wynebu dros y 10 neu 15 mlynedd nesaf fydd i ba raddau y gellir cynnig pynciau addysg uwch drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg hyd at lefel gradd. Yn draddodiadol, mae pynciau'r celfyddydau breiniol, fel diwinyddiaeth, y Gymraeg, hanes a daearyddiaeth, wedi'u dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Pa faint ymhellach na hynny y gellir mynd? A oes modd mynd cyn belled â ffiseg niwclear, peirianeg, meteoroleg, gwyddorau'r môr, ac yn y blaen? Pa mor bell a pha mor gyflym y gellir gwneud hynny? Sut y sicheir y bydd digon o alw yn ogystal â'r gallu angenrheidiol, y gwerslyfrau, ac yn y blaen? Rhaid ystyried hyn yn fanwl ar sail y galw, y gallu, cymorth ar ffurf gwerslyfrau a CD-Rom yn ogystal â chymorth o ran deunydd dysgu.

2.20 p.m.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Another important issue regarding higher education that the federal university and other higher education institutions in Wales have raised relates to the Higher Education Bill and the clause regarding the office for fair access offer. In England, the office's role will be limited to access. In Wales, however, far greater powers will be given to the National Assembly, and, therefore, the Assembly Government, regarding designation of courses, standards of marking and general interference with academic freedom. Why is that felt to be necessary?

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Mater pwysig arall sy'n gysylltiedig ag addysg uwch y mae'r brifysgol ffederal a sefydliadau addysg uwch eraill yng Nghymru wedi'i godi yw hwnnw sy'n ymwneud â'r Mesur Addysg Uwch a'r cymal ynghylch cynnig swyddfa mynediad teg. Yn Lloegr, bydd rôl y swyddfa wedi'i chyfyngu i fynediad. Yng Nghymru, fodd bynnag, rhoddir pwerau mwy o lawer i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac, felly, i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, mewn cysylltiad â dynodi cyrsiau, safonau marcio ac ymyrraeth gyffredinol â rhyddid academiaidd. Pam y teimlir bod angen hynny?

**The First Minister:** I am not aware that it involves greater interference in Wales. There are two objectives in Wales, namely wider access and excellence. At one level, you could see them as cutting across each other. There is a question regarding whether you can have greater quantity and improved quality. We believe that that is possible and that it is partially down to institutions, student intake and the quality of teaching and research. OFA's influence regarding how you achieve wider access and greater excellence seems quite limited. I would be interested to hear in greater detail about your concerns, or the concerns of those in higher education who have spoken to you, so that I or Jane Davidson can respond to them in detail.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol y bydd yn golygu mwy o ymyrraeth yng Nghymru. Mae dau amcan yng Nghymru, sef mynediad ehangach a rhagoriaeth. Ar un lefel, gellid ystyried eu bod yn torri ar draws ei gilydd. Mae cwestiwn ynghylch a ellir cael niferoedd mwy a gwell ansawdd. Credwn fod modd cael hynny a bod hynny'n fater yn rhannol i sefydliadau, y myfyrwyr a dderbynnir ac ansawdd y dysgu a'r ymchwil. Ymddengys fod dylanwad y swyddfa mynediad teg yn eithaf cyfyngedig o ran y modd i sicrhau mynediad ehangach a mwy o ragoriaeth. Byddai o ddiddordeb imi glywed yn fwy manwl am eich pryderon, neu bryderon y rhai mewn addysg uwch sydd wedi siarad â chi, fel y gallaf fi neu Jane Davidson ymateb iddynt yn fanwl.

**Nick Bourne:** You are quite right that this is a concern for universities and higher education institutions in Wales and throughout the UK. In England, the Government has undertaken that OFA's role, although I do not agree with it, will be limited to access. In Wales, the Government will have the ability to interfere on issues of designation and marking of courses and matters that should rightly be left to the higher education institutions as part of their fundamental academic freedom, with which successive Governments have not interfered. Why does the Welsh Assembly Government want to do that? This issue is being discussed in the House of Lords today.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth ddweud bod hyn yn destun pryder i brifysgolion a sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru a ledled y DU. Yn Lloegr, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ymgymryd i ofalu y bydd rôl y swyddfa mynediad teg, er nad wyf yn cytuno â hi, wedi'i chyfyngu i fynediad. Yng Nghymru, bydd y Llywodraeth yn gallu ymyrryd â materion sy'n ymwneud â dynodi a marcio cyrsiau a materion y dylid eu gadael i'r sefydliadau addysg uwch fel rhan o'u rhyddid academaidd sylfaenol, y mae'r naill Lywodraeth ar ôl y llall heb ymyrryd ag ef. Pam y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n dymuno gwneud hynny? Trafodir y mater hwn yn Nhy'r Arglwyddi heddiw.

**The First Minister:** I am interested to hear the vigorous way in which you are putting forward this theory, but I am more interested in the vigorous way it is being denied point blank by the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, Jane Davidson—you may not be able to see her. I will ensure that Jane or I write to you to attempt to put your concerns, and those who have spoken to you, at rest.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae o ddiddordeb imi glywed y modd grymus yr ydych yn cyflwyno'r ddamcaniaeth hon, ond mae gennyf fwy o ddiddordeb yn y modd grymus y gwrthodir hynny'n blwmp ac yn blaen gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, Jane Davidson—efallai na allwch ei gweld. Sicrhaf y bydd Jane neu fi'n ysgrifennu atoch i geisio tawelu'ch pryderon chi a'r rhai sydd wedi siarad â chi.

### Y Gyllideb Addysg The Education Budget

**Q3 Janet Ryder:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the National Assembly education budget? (OAQ35788)

**C3 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar gyllideb addysg y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? (OAQ35788)

**The First Minister:** The education and lifelong learning portfolio will receive over £1.2 billion in 2004-05. This represents an increase of 3.4 per cent, or £40 million, on funding in 2003-04. In addition, local authorities receive funding for education through their revenue settlement. Assuming that authorities allocate a similar level of resources to education in 2004-05 as they did in 2003-04, overall funding for education will have risen by nearly 5 per cent.

**Janet Ryder:** When the new pay framework for lecturers in further education was first introduced to committee, it was understood that it would be paid for using additional money, and it received all-party support. However, in committee on 19 May, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning posed a challenge of either funding the pay framework or growth in the sector. Do you not agree that the sector needs the new pay framework and growth in the sector and that the Minister is creating a difficult financial situation for FE colleges, causing them to cut back on courses and make lecturers redundant by failing to fund the growth in the sector that your Government is desperate to see?

**The First Minister:** I understand that Education and Learning Wales, using our funding, has increased funding of further education by 13.8 per cent during 2003-04. That is a pretty big slab of money. However, that does not mean that there are no corners of the FE world where there has, for some reason, been a slump in student demand even though the general level of student demand is rising rapidly. That means that sometimes tough decisions must be made to switch resources from low demand corners to high demand corners, which may mean discussions about redundancies, which are usually voluntary. There may also occasionally be non-voluntary redundancies, although I am not aware of that. However, part of the changing FE world is the question of adapting to the labour, employment and student-demand markets. We know that there is a rapid rise in some subject areas, but levels are flatlining or decreasing in other areas even though we would like to see the demand in those areas, such as engineering, improving.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd y portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes yn derbyn mwy nag £1.2 biliwn yn 2004-05. Mae hynny'n gynydd o 3.4 y cant, neu £40 miliwn, ar gyllid 2003-04. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae awdurdodau lleol yn derbyn cyllid ar gyfer addysg drwy eu setliad refeniw. Gan gymryd y bydd awdurdodau'n dyrannu lefel debyg o adnoddau i addysg yn 2004-05 i'r hyn a wnaethant yn 2003-04, bydd y cyllid cyffredinol ar gyfer addysg wedi codi o ymron i 5 y cant.

**Janet Ryder:** Pan gyflwynwyd y fframwaith cyflogau newydd ar gyfer darlithwyr addysg bellach i'r Pwyllgor am y tro cyntaf, deallwyd y byddid yn talu amdano drwy ddefnyddio arian ychwanegol, ac fe'i cefnogwyd gan yr holl bleidiau. Fodd bynnag, yn y Pwyllgor ar 19 Mai, cynigiodd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yr her o un ai cyllido'r fframwaith cyflogau neu gael twf yn y sector. Oni chytunwch fod ar y sector angen y fframwaith cyflogau newydd a thwf yn y sector a bod y Gweinidog yn creu sefyllfa ariannol anodd i golegau addysg bellach, gan beri iddynt gwtogi ar gyrsiau a diswyddo darlithwyr drwy fethu â chyllido'r twf yn y sector y mae'ch Llywodraeth mor daer am ei weld?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Deallaf fod Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru, drwy ddefnyddio ein cyllid, wedi rhoi 13.8 y cant yn fwy o gyllid i addysg bellach yn ystod 2003-04. Mae hwnnw'n swm sylweddol iawn. Er hynny, nid yw hynny'n golygu nad oes unrhyw gonglau ym myd addysg bellach lle na fu gostyngiad yn y galw gan fyfyrwyr, am ryw reswm, er bod maint cyffredinol y galw gan fyfyrwyr yn codi'n gyflym. Oherwydd hynny, rhaid gwneud penderfyniadau anodd weithiau i droi adnoddau oddi wrth gonglau lle y mae'r galw'n fach at gonglau lle y mae galw mawr, a gall hynny olygu cael trafodaethau ynghylch diswyddiadau, sy'n rhai gwirfoddol fel arfer. Er hynny, gellir cael diswyddiadau nad ydynt yn wirfoddol weithiau, er nad wyf yn ymwybodol o hynny. Fodd bynnag, un rhan o fyd cyfnewidiol addysg bellach yw'r cwestiwn o ymaddasu i'r marchnadoedd llafur a chyflogaeth a'r rhai sy'n dilyn galw'r myfyrwyr. Gwyddom fod cynnydd cyflym mewn rhai meysydd pwnc, ond mae lefelau'n gwastatáu neu'n gostwng mewn meysydd eraill er y carem weld mwy o alw yn y meysydd hynny, fel peirianeg.



**Jeff Cuthbert:** Do you agree that it is a shame that Caerphilly County Borough Council spends less per pupil than neighbouring councils? Do you also agree that it is important that we do our best to ensure that funding is used to encourage the promotion of good practice among educational and training institutions and, in particular, the greatest amount of collaboration between institutions, where this is right for the learner?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn drueni bod Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili yn gwario llai y pen ar ddisgyblion nag y mae cynghorau cyfagos? A ydych hefyd yn cytuno ei bod yn bwysig inni wneud cymaint ag y gallwn i sicrhau y defnyddir cyllid i hyrwyddo arferion da mewn sefydliadau addysgu a hyfforddi ac, yn benodol, i sicrhau'r cydweithio mwyaf rhwng sefydliadau, os yw hynny'n briodol i'r dysgwr?

**The First Minister:** Absolutely. Wasteful competition and duplication are not in the interests of learners in Wales. As I recall it, wasteful duplication was one of the reasons for the considerable, though not universal, cross-party support for establishing ELWa and getting rid of the Training and Enterprise Councils, and for giving ELWa control over the allocation of funding for sixth forms and further education colleges. There was a battle for bums on seats in post-16 education. However, this was not done because it was in the best interests of the learner but because it was reflected in the budgets of schools or FE colleges. We had to put a stop to this, as supported by at least three quarters of Assembly Members. Implementation at an individual level is more difficult, but we are forging ahead, as is ELWa. The odd squeal of complaint is bound to happen when you are trying to improve value for money, but this has to be based on avoiding duplication, encouraging and incentivising collaboration, and then trying to handle individual complaints that may arise about pastoral care and all the other issues with which you and I and Jane are more than familiar.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn hollol. Nid yw cystadlu a dyblygu gwastraffus er budd i ddysgwyr yng Nghymru. Yn ôl yr hyn a gofiaf, dyblygu gwastraffus oedd un o'r rhesymau dros y gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol sylweddol, er nad unfrydol, i sefydlu ELWa a chael gwared â'r Cynghorau Hyfforddi a Menter, a rhoi rheolaeth i ELWa dros ddyrannu cyllid ar gyfer cyfleusterau chweched dosbarth a cholegau addysg bellach. Bu ymgiprys am fyfyrwyr mewn addysg ôl-16. Er hynny, ni wnaed hynny am ei fod er budd i'r dysgwr ond am ei fod yn cael ei adlewyrchu yng nghyllidebau ysgolion neu golegau addysg bellach. Yr oedd yn rhaid inni roi pen ar hynny, a chawsom gefnogaeth gan o leiaf dri chwarter o Aelodau'r Cynulliad i wneud hynny. Mae gweithredu ar lefel yr unigolyn yn fwy anodd, ond yr ydym yn gyrru ymlaen, fel y mae ELWa. Mae ambell gwyn yn sicr o godi wrth geisio gwella gwerth am arian, ond rhaid gwneud hynny drwy osgoi dyblygu, hybu a rhoi anogaeth i gydweithio, ac wedyn ceisio trafod cwynion neilltuol a allai godi ynghylch gofal bugeiliol a'r holl faterion eraill yr ydych chi a Jane yn gyfarwydd iawn â hwy.

**Bryn Gelligron, Pontardawe  
Gelligron Hill, Pontardawe**

**Q4 Gwenda Thomas:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the discussions that he has had with Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council regarding Gelligron hill, Pontardawe? (OAQ35798)

**C4 Gwenda Thomas:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y trafodaethau rhyngddo a Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot ynghylch Bryn Gelligron, Pontardawe? (OAQ35798)

**The First Minister:** It is Brian Gibbons, the Deputy Minister, not I, who has had discussions with Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council on this issue. He visited the site on the road between Pontardawe and Gwauncaegurwen on 15 May, and I am aware that there has been correspondence with the council regarding our contribution to the A474 Gelligron hill scheme under the severe weather capital grant scheme.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Brian Gibbons, y Dirprwy Weinidog, nid myfi, a gafodd drafodaethau â Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot ynghylch y mater hwn. Ymwelodd â'r safle ar y ffordd rhwng Pontardawe a Gwauncaegurwen ar 15 Mai, a gwn y bu gohebu â'r cyngor ynghylch ein cyfraniad at gynllun bryn Gelligron ar yr A474 o dan y cynllun grant cyfalaf tywydd garw.

**Gwenda Thomas:** The perilous state of this site is causing grave public concern. Can you confirm, in light of Neath Port Talbot council's limited resources, that funding will be made available to meet all additional costs arising from the current remedial works contract, which has received partial funding from a severe weather grant?

**Gwenda Thomas:** Mae cyflwr peryglus y safle hwn yn peri pryder mawr i'r cyhoedd. A allwch gadarnhau, gan mai prin yw adnoddau cyngor Castell-nedd Port Talbot, y darperir cyllid i dalu am yr holl gostau ychwanegol sy'n codi o'r contract presennol ar gyfer gwaith adfer, a gyllidwyd yn rhannol drwy grant tywydd garw?

**The First Minister:** You make a persuasive case, but I cannot set a precedent here and now. We pay 85 per cent of costs under the severe weather capital grant. If there is an overspend, and provided that it is justified, we will pay 50 per cent of the costs. I understand that we are still considering this payment. I am sorry, but 100 per cent of any overspend is not paid, and I do not want to set a precedent today in Plenary.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae eich dadl yn argyhoeddi, ond ni allaf osod cynsail yn awr. Talwn 85 y cant o'r costau o dan y grant cyfalaf tywydd garw. Os oes gorwario, ac os oes cyfiawnhad dros hynny, talwn 50 y cant o'r costau. Deallaf ein bod yn dal i ystyried y taliad hwn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond ni thelir am y cyfan o gostau unrhyw orwariant, ac ni ddymunaf osod cynsail heddiw yn y Cyfarfod Llawn.

### Llosgi Bwriadol Arson

**Q5 Peter Black:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's actions in tackling arson? (OAQ35800)

**C5 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y camau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â thanau sy'n cael eu cynnu'n fwriadol? (OAQ35800)

**The First Minister:** Arson poses a significant problem to our communities. For this reason, Edwina Hart commissioned the community fire safety working group to examine the problem. Its report, 'Up in Flames', was published in February 2003, and has been discussed by the Assembly on several occasions. We are now taking forward the report's recommendations, recently announcing £1.25 million to fund anti-arson projects in the current financial year. The profile of this activity will increase enormously following devolution of the fire and rescue service to the Assembly on 1 April next year from the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister and the Westminster Government.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae llosgi bwriadol yn peri cryn broblem i'n cymunedau. Oherwydd hynny, comisiynodd Edwina Hart y gweithgor ar ddiogelwch tân cymunedol i ymchwilio i'r broblem. Cyhoeddwyd ei adroddiad, 'Up in Flames', yn Chwefror 2003, ac fe'i trafodwyd gan y Cynulliad sawl gwaith. Yr ydym yn bwrw ymlaen ag argymhellion yr adroddiad yn awr, ac wedi cyhoeddi'n ddiweddar y rhoddir £1.25 miliwn i gyllido prosiectau i fynd i'r afael â llosgi bwriadol yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Bydd y gweithgarwch hwn yn fwy amlwg o lawer ar ôl datganoli'r gwasanaeth tân ac achub ar 1 Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf o Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a Senedd San Steffan i'r Cynulliad.

**Peter Black:** I welcome the important work being undertaken by the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration on arson. It is far too early to try to draw conclusions from the tragic incident in Cardiff a few weeks ago, but given that there are lessons to be learned, do you think that one relates to the need for better co-operation between the police and the fire brigade in terms of classifying fires and of how they deal with arson? Will you take this forward in relation to your Government's review?

**Peter Black:** Croesawaf y gwaith pwysig a wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ar losgi bwriadol. Mae'n rhy fuan o lawer i geisio dod i gasgliadau ar sail y digwyddiad trist yng Nghaerdydd rai wythnosau'n ôl, ond gan fod gwersi i'w dysgu, a ydych o'r farn bod un ohonynt yn ymwneud â'r angen am well cydweithredu rhwng yr heddlu a'r frigâd dân o ran dosbarthu mathau o danau a'r modd y maent yn delio â llosgi bwriadol? A wnewch ymdrin â hyn mewn cysylltiad ag adolygiad eich Llywodraeth?

**The First Minister:** I do not like to discuss questions relating to my constituency when answering Plenary questions but, as you have raised the subject, I made the same point in the immediate aftermath of the tragic incident in the pensioners' hall in Caerau. Given its legal implications, I do not want to go into the case. There have been two major fires in recent weeks in Cardiff West, one of which involved a fatality and the other major commercial losses. I am conscious of how co-ordination of the immediate public services response to fires is important, as are education programmes to try to persuade miscreant youths that it is not funny to start a fire deliberately and to see fire engines, the police and ambulances arriving with blue lights flashing, and that they must make better use of their time.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn hoffi trafod cwestiynau sy'n ymwneud â'm hetholaeth wrth ateb cwestiynau yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ond, gan eich bod wedi codi'r mater, gwneuthum yr un pwynt yn union ar ôl y digwyddiad trist yn neuadd y pensïynwyr yng Nghaerau. Oherwydd y goblygiadau cyfreithiol, nid wyf am fanylu ar yr achos. Bu dau dân mawr yn yr wythnosau diwethaf yng Ngorllewin Caerdydd, y cafwyd marwolaeth yn sgîl un ohonynt a cholledion masnachol mawr yn sgîl y llall. Gwn pa mor bwysig yw cydlynu ymateb cyntaf y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i danau, fel ag y mae rhaglenni addysg i geisio darbwylllo drwgweithredwyr ifanc nad peth doniol yw cynnau tân yn fwriadol a gweld injans tân, yr heddlu ac ambiwlansys yn cyrraedd â'u goleuadau glas yn fflachio, a bod rhaid iddynt ddefnyddio'u hamser yn well.

2.30 p.m.

**Ann Jones:** Arson is a mindless act of the minority but its actions affect the majority in our communities and often, tragically, the ultimate price is paid. Therefore, unlike Peter, will you join me in congratulating all those agencies that work together to rid our communities of arson, and, in particular, welcome the good work being undertaken in my area of Rhyl and Prestatyn, between the police, fire service, and the local authority? The local authority has now been invested with powers to remove abandoned cars, which are often the targets of arson. Do you agree that we need to work on these partnerships and develop them further across Wales? What further mechanisms can the Assembly implement to assist these partnerships and, hopefully, one day ensure that we all work together to rid communities of arson?

**Ann Jones:** Gweithred ddisynnwyr gan leiafrif yw llosgi bwriadol ond mae ei ganlyniadau yn effeithio ar y mwyafrif yn ein cymunedau ac, yn aml, gwaetha'r modd, telir y pris eithaf. Felly, yn wahanol i Peter, a wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch yr holl asiantaethau hynny sy'n cydweithio i ddileu llosgi bwriadol yn ein cymunedau, ac, yn enwedig, i groesawu'r gwaith da a wneir yn fy ardal i yn y Rhyl a Phrestatyn, rhwng yr heddlu, y gwasanaeth tân, a'r awdurdod lleol? Rhoddwyd pwerau i'r awdurdod lleol i symud ceir a adawyd, sy'n aml yn cael eu llosgi'n fwriadol. A gytunwch fod rhaid inni weithio ar y partneriaethau hyn a'u datblygu ymhellach ledled Cymru? Pa ddulliau ychwanegol y gall y Cynulliad eu defnyddio i hybu'r partneriaethau hyn a sicrhau y byddwn oll yn cydweithio rywbryd, gobeithio, i ddileu llosgi bwriadol mewn cymunedau?

**The First Minister:** I would expect such a comprehensive question from someone with your background in the fire service. The 'Up in Flames' report recommends joint working in north Wales, paralleling the system that is already in place in south Wales. We all accept that arson starts with abandoned cars being set on fire, which is how people get the taste for this sort of mindless activity. Encouraging local authorities to rapidly remove the cars will prevent people from torching them, thinking it is fun and going on to set buildings on fire—for example, their old school, which they never liked very much. We all know that that can happen. The removal of abandoned cars will, therefore, be of major service in

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddwn wedi disgwyl cael cwestiwn cynhwysfawr o'r fath gan rywun sydd â'i gefndir yn y gwasanaeth tân fel chi. Mae'r adroddiad 'Up in Flames' yn argymhell gweithio ar y cyd yn y Gogledd, i gyd-fynd â'r system sydd eisoes ar waith yn y De. Yr ydym oll yn derbyn mai drwy roi ceir a adawyd ar dân y mae llosgi bwriadol yn dechrau, ac mai hynny sy'n peri i rai gael blas ar weithgarwch disynnwyr o'r fath. Drwy annog awdurdodau lleol i symud y ceir yn gyflym, ni fydd pobl yn eu llosgi, gan dybio bod hynny'n beth difyr, ac yn mynd ymlaen i roi adeiladau ar dân—eu hen ysgol, er enghraifft, nad oeddent erioed wedi'i hoffi ryw lawer. Yr ydym oll yn gwybod y gall hynny ddigwydd. Gan

terms of preventing people from developing that first taste for arson, which can lead to dreadful incidents when it escalates.

hynny, bydd symud ceir a adawyd yn gymwynas fawr o ran atal pobl rhag cael y blas cyntaf hwnnw ar losgi bwriadol, a all arwain at ddigwyddiadau ofnadwy pan aiff ar gynnydd.

### **Y Mesur Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd Drafft The Draft Disability Discrimination Bill**

**Q6 Christine Chapman:** What discussions has the First Minister had with Westminster colleagues about the draft Disability Discrimination Bill? (OAQ35791)

**C6 Christine Chapman:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael â'i gymheiriaid yn San Steffan ynghylch y Mesur Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd drafft? (OAQ35791)

**The First Minister:** This Bill will transform the rights and opportunities of disabled people by extending the Disability Discrimination Act 1995. The draft Bill is not a devolved function of the Assembly, but the Department for Work and Pensions regularly consults with all other Government departments regarding its content and it also consults with us.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd y Mesur hwn yn trawsnewid hawliau a chyfleoedd pobl anabl drwy ymestyn Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar sail Anabledd 1995. Nid yw'r Mesur drafft yn swyddogaeth a ddatganolwyd i'r Cynulliad, ond mae'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau'n ymgynghori'n rheolaidd â holl adrannau eraill y Llywodraeth ynghylch ei gynnwys ac mae hefyd yn ymgynghori â ni.

**Christine Chapman:** Last summer, I launched a campaign with a local Cynon Valley disability rights campaigner, who has come up against many barriers, particularly in accessing local transport services. For example, it has been difficult to find local taxis that cater for wheelchair users. More recently, the campaigner had to cancel a hospital appointment when the ambulance to transport him was not suitably equipped with wheelchair access facilities. Do you agree that this legislation is a vital step forward to extending and improving civil rights and access to services for disabled people, and will you ensure that disabled people have equal access and an equal service from the public sector in Wales, with the Assembly setting the tone for more than just a minimalist compliance with the legislation?

**Christine Chapman:** Yr haf diwethaf, lansiais ymgyrch gydag ymgyrchydd lleol dros hawliau anabledd yng Nghwm Cynon, sydd wedi wynebu sawl rhwystr, yn enwedig wrth ddefnyddio gwasanaethau trafnidiaeth lleol. Er enghraifft, bu'n anodd canfod tacsis lleol sy'n darparu ar gyfer rhai sy'n defnyddio cadeiriau olwynion. Yn fwy diweddar, ni fu modd i'r ymgyrchydd gadw apwyntiad mewn ysbyty gan nad oedd cyfarpar addas yn yr ambiwlans a oedd i'w gludo i roi mynediad i gadeiriau olwynion. A gytunwch fod y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn gam hollbwysig ymlaen i ymestyn a hyrwyddo hawliau sifil a mynediad i wasanaethau ar gyfer pobl anabl, ac a wnewch sicrhau y caiff pobl anabl fynediad cyfartal a gwasanaeth cyfartal gan y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, ac y bydd y Cynulliad yn gosod esiampl drwy fynd ymhellach na chydymffurfio â gofynion lleiaf y ddeddfwriaeth yn unig?

**The First Minsiter:** You have described two of the major planks of the legislation in your plea. When the Act comes in, it will introduce a new positive duty on public bodies to promote equality of opportunity for disabled people and will require public bodies to consider the needs of disabled people at the earliest opportunity in planning new facilities and in their decision-making process, thereby paralleling the content of the Race Relations Amendment Act 2000. Those requirements will also cover transport, in the way that you described. I cannot detail accurately the issues relating to wheelchair taxis, although there are many of them in our streets, towns and cities now. However, this extension is intended to cover that category of circumstances.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych wedi disgrifio dwy o brif elfennau'r ddeddfwriaeth yn eich apêl. Pan ddaw'r Ddeddf i rym, bydd yn rhoi cyrff cyhoeddus o dan ddyletswydd gadarnhaol newydd i hybu cyfle cyfartal ar gyfer pobl anabl a bydd yn mynnu bod cyrff cyhoeddus yn ystyried anghenion pobl anabl cyn gynted ag y bo modd wrth gynllunio cyfleusterau newydd ac yn eu proses o wneud penderfyniadau, gan efelychu cynnwys Deddf Cysylltiadau Hiliol (Diwygio) 2000. Bydd y gofynion hynny'n cynnwys trafniadaeth hefyd, yn y modd y disgrifiasoch. Ni allaf ymdrin yn fanwl gywir â'r materion sy'n ymwneud â thacsis ar gyfer cadeiriau olwynion, er bod llawer ohonynt bellach ar ein strydoedd ac yn ein trefi a'n dinasoedd.... Fodd bynnag, pwrpas yr estyniad hwn yw ymdrin ag amgylchiadau o'r fath.

**David Melding:** Many disabled people will have great difficulty accessing polling stations on Thursday. Do you share my concern about this and the consequent reliance on postal voting, where the error rate is massively greater than in polling stations.

**David Melding:** Bydd llawer o bobl anabl yn cael cryn anhawster mynd i mewn i orsafoedd pleidleisio ddydd Iau. A ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder ynghylch hynny a'r ddibyniaeth oherwydd hynny ar bleidleisio drwy'r post, lle y mae gwallau'n llawer mwy cyffredin nag mewn gorsafoedd pleidleisio.

**The First Minister:** My polling station is a caravan, as I live in a small hamlet, and disabled access is an issue around the use of caravans in remote, isolated villages, hamlets, small council estates and so on. Frequently, at the top of hills, where there are no big buildings or community halls, the facilities for disabled people will be quite dreadful. The situation is better than it was, but it is still pretty dreadful. The answer is postal voting—there is no doubt about that. Although you make a fairly massive claim about the potential for personation or misrepresentation in postal voting, I am not as sure as you are that the distinction between the level of personation in voting by post or in person is as great as you say.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Carafán yw'r orsaf bleidleisio yr af fi iddi, gan fy mod yn byw mewn pentrefan bach, ac mae mynediad i bobl anabl yn fater sy'n codi ynghylch y defnydd o garafanau mewn pentrefi anghysbell, pentrefannau, ystadau cyngor bach ac yn y blaen. Yn aml, ar ben bryniau, lle nad oes unrhyw adeiladau mawr na neuaddau cymunedol, bydd y cyfleusterau ar gyfer pobl anabl yn wael iawn. Mae'r sefyllfa'n well nag yr oedd, ond mae'n eithaf gwael o hyd. Yr ateb yw pleidleisio drwy'r post—nid oes amheuaeth am hynny. Er yr honiad eithaf ysgubol a wnewch am y posibilrwydd o bersonadu neu gamgynrychioli drwy bleidleisio drwy'r post, nid wyf mor sicr â chi fod cymaint o wahaniaeth ag y dywedwch rhwng graddau'r personadu wrth bleidleisio drwy'r post a'r hyn a geir wrth bleidleisio'n bersonol.

**Janet Davies:** The Auditor General has recently expressed grave concern about the need for an additional £7 million or so to achieve adequate disabled access to further education colleges. Are you considering any action, in consultation with the Westminster Government perhaps, to address that situation?

**Janet Davies:** Mae'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol wedi mynegi cryn bryder yn ddiweddar ynghylch yr angen am tua £7 miliwn ychwanegol i sicrhau mynediad digonol i bobl anabl i golegau addysg bellach. A ydych yn ystyried cymryd unrhyw gamau, drwy ymgynghori â Llywodraeth San Steffan efallai, i ymdrin â'r sefyllfa honno?

**The First Minister:** I am not aware of that figure or report, but I will consider that matter and write to you, following consultation with Jane Davidson and other appropriate Ministers.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o'r ffigur na'r adroddiad hwnnw, ond ystyriaf y mater hwnnw ac ysgrifennu atoch, ar ôl ymgynghori â Jane Davidson a Gweinidogion perthnasol eraill.

### **Y Diwydiant Twristiaeth The Tourism Industry**

**Q7 John Griffiths:** Will the First Minister make a statement on progress in developing the tourism industry in Wales? (OAQ35822)

**C7 John Griffiths:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar hynt y gwaith o ddatblygu diwydiant twristiaeth Cymru? (OAQ35822)

**The First Minister:** The most recent figures released by the Wales Tourist Board show that Wales's tourism industry is building on the great successes of last year. Last year, tourism in Wales clearly outperformed tourism in the rest of the UK. This year, following the recent Easter bank holiday, 90 per cent of those businesses asked reported the holiday period as being as good as, or better than, 2003.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf a gyhoeddwyd gan Fwrdd Croeso Cymru yn dangos bod y diwydiant ymwelwyr yng Nghymru'n adeiladu ar sail y llwyddiannau mawr a gafwyd y llynedd. Y llynedd, gwnaeth twristiaeth yng Nghymru'n well o lawer nag yng ngweddill y DU. Eleni, ar ôl gwyl banc y Pasg yn ddiweddar, dywedodd 90 y cant o'r busnesau hynny a holwyd fod cyfnod y gwyliau wedi bodystal neu'n well nag yr oedd yn 2003.

**John Griffiths:** Since devolution, we have seen a substantial and impressive growth in tourism and in tourism spend in Wales. Substantial additional Assembly Government funding for the WTB and tourism has obviously produced impressive results. Will you join me in congratulating all those responsible and in looking forward to further substantial growth, given the great potential in Wales, in niche tourism for example, to take advantage of the great Welsh outdoors?

**John Griffiths:** Ers dyfodiad datganoli, gwelsom dwf sylweddol a nodedig mewn twristiaeth ac yn y gwariant gan ymwelwyr yng Nghymru. Mae'n amlwg bod y gwariant ychwanegol sylweddol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer Bwrdd Croeso Cymru a thwristiaeth wedi sicrhau canlyniadau nodedig. A wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch pawb sy'n gyfrifol, ac i edrych ymlaen at weld twf sylweddol pellach, yng ngolwg y posibilïadau mawr a geir yng Nghymru, mewn twristiaeth arbenigol, er enghraifft, i fanteisio ar gyfleusterau awyr agored yng Nghymru?

**The First Minister:** Yes. Niche and activity tourism have great expansion potential. Although not every tourism operator in Wales will accept it, it is probably the future. The bucket-and-spade fortnight family holiday by the sea has migrated to cheap, sea, sun and sand countries in southern Europe for obvious weather-related reasons. There is a huge market for activity-related holidays. One way or another, the WTB is promoting that strongly, and it now has funds, including the Objective 1 money, totalling £2.5 million for it, which is a record. It is using those European Union funds, our match funding, ring-fenced funds and so on, and it is therefore able to help our tourism industry to provide the basic standards, such as ensuite bathrooms and so on, which will attract visitors and ensure repeat business from tourists who have previously decided against visiting

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaf. Mae cyfle mawr i ehangu twristiaeth arbenigol a thwristiaeth weithgareddau. Er na fydd pob gweithredwr twristiaeth yng Nghymru yn derbyn hynny, dyma'r dyfodol, yn ôl pob tebyg. Mae'r gwyliau pythefnos teuluol gyda bwced a rhaw ar lan y môr wedi symud i wledydd rhad y môr, yr haul a'r tywod yn ne Ewrop, am resymau amlwg sy'n ymwneud â'r tywydd. Mae marchnad enfawr ar gyfer gwyliau sy'n ymwneud â gweithgareddau. Drwy sawl dull a modd, mae Bwrdd Croeso Cymru yn rhoi hwb mawr i hynny, a bellach mae ganddo gyllid ar gyfer hynny sy'n dod i gyfanswm o £2.5 miliwn, gan gynnwys arian Amcan 1, sef y swm mwyaf erioed. Mae'n defnyddio cyllid yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, cyllid cyfatebol oddi wrthym ni, cyllid a glustnodwyd ac yn y blaen, ac mae felly'n gallu helpu ein diwydiant ymwelwyr ni i gynnig y safonau sylfaenol, fel

Wales because the accommodation has not been of the required standard. The WTB programme to upgrade accommodation is a great success.

ystafelloedd ymolchi *en suite* ac yn y blaen, a fydd yn denu ymwelwyr ac yn llwyddo i ddenu ymwelwyr eilwaith a benderfynodd beidio â dod i Gymru o'r blaen am nad oedd y llety gystal â'r gofyn. Mae rhaglen Bwrdd Croeso Cymru i wella llety yn llwyddiant mawr.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr ydych wedi cyfeirio at gyfraniad Llywodraeth Cymru i Fwrdd Croeso Cymru, ac at arian Amcan 1. A dderbyniwch fod cyfraniad Llywodraeth Iwerddon yn arbennig, ond hefyd Lywodraeth yr Alban, tuag at dwristiaeth a'r byrddau sy'n gyfrifol amdani, llawer yn fwy, a bod hefyd strategaeth ganolog i hybu twristiaeth yn y gwledydd hynny, nad yw'n bodoli yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd? Beth ydych am ei wneud i sicrhau ein bod yn elwa ar y manteision sydd gan Gymru i'w cynnig fel man i ddenu ymwelwyr?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You have referred to the Government of Wales's contribution to the Wales Tourist Board and to Objective 1 money. Do you accept that the Irish Government's contribution in particular, but also the Scottish Government's contribution, towards tourism and the boards responsible for it are far greater, and that there is also a central strategy to promote tourism in those countries, which does not exist here in Wales? What will you do to ensure that we draw on the benefits that Wales has to offer as a place to attract visitors?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Na, nid wyf yn derbyn yr honiad hwnnw. Yr wyf wedi clywed y feirniadaeth bod man gwyn man draw yr ochr arall i'r bryn, neu bod gwell strategaethau twristiaeth yn Iwerddon neu'r Alban. Os edrychwch ar y ffigurau, fe welwch bod y twf yn y diwydiant twristiaeth llawer yn fwy yng Nghymru nag y bu yn yr Alban yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf.

**The First Minister:** No, I do not accept that assertion. I have heard the criticism that the grass is greener on the other side of the hill, or that there are better tourism strategies in Ireland or Scotland. If you look at the figures, you will see that growth in the tourism industry was much greater in Wales than in Scotland over the past two years.

2.40 p.m.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Do you not agree that Llandudno, in my constituency of Conwy, has acknowledged that high-quality tourism is the key to attracting visitors? Llandudno's conference centre and ski slope, its new improved tram system up the Great Orm, and its natural beauty, offer a variety of attractions for young and old.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Oni chytunwch fod Llandudno, yn fy etholaeth i yng Nghonwy, wedi cydnabod mai twristiaeth o ansawdd da yw'r modd i ddenu ymwelwyr? Mae'r ganolfan gynadledda a'r llethr sgïo yn Llandudno, a'i system dramiau newydd well i fyny'r Gogarth, a'i harddwch naturiol, yn cynnig amryw o atyniadau i'r hen a'r ifanc.

**The First Minister:** Llandudno is a classic example of tourism. It is the queen of the north—a Victorian holiday resort with a fantastic parade of Victorian buildings on the sea front, 99 per cent of which are hotels. However, you must go further to get modern, long-season tourism and establish conference centres and some hotels that are, perhaps, not on the sea front in the middle of the Victorian parade, and which are of a different design. You could secure more conference business by extending the north Wales conference centre to attract bigger and more numerous conferences over nine or 10 months of the season, rather than six or seven. That is the key to modernising, while conserving the attractions on the sea front in Llandudno and the natural beauty of the

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Llandudno yn enghraifft glasurol o dwristiaeth. Hi yw brenhines y Gogledd—tref wylliau Fictoraidd a chanddi gyfoeth o adeiladau Fictoraidd ar lan y môr, y mae 99 y cant ohonynt yn westai. Er hynny, rhaid mynd ymhellach i ddenu twristiaeth fodern dros dymor hir a sefydlu canolfannau cynadledda a rhai gwestai nad ydynt, efallai, ar lan y môr ar ganol y rhodfa Fictoraidd, ac iddynt ddyluniad gwahanol. Gellid sicrhau mwy o fusnes ar ffurf cynadleddau drwy ehangu canolfan gynadledda gogledd Cymru er mwyn denu cynadleddau mwy, a hynny'n amlach, dros naw neu 10 mis o'r tymor, yn hytrach na chwech neu saith. Dyna'r modd i foderneiddio, tra'n cadw'r atyniadau ar lan y môr yn Llandudno a harddwch naturiol y

Great Orm and its surroundings.

Gogarth a'i gyffiniau.

**Lisa Francis:** On the Ryder cup and its obvious importance to the tourism industry, and engagements associated with similar sporting events, how does the Government decide whether the First Minister or the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport should attend such engagements, especially if they clash with other events of extreme national and historic importance?

**Lisa Francis:** Ynghylch cwpan Ryder a'i phwysigrwydd amlwg i'r diwydiant ymwelwyr, a chyfarfodydd sy'n gysylltiedig â digwyddiadau chwaraeon tebyg, sut y mae'r Llywodraeth yn penderfynu ai'r Prif Weinidog ynteu'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon a ddylai fynd i gyfarfodydd o'r fath, yn enwedig os ydynt yn gwrthdaro â digwyddiadau cenedlaethol a hanesyddol pwysig iawn eraill?

**The First Minister:** To tap in to the potential for the Ryder cup, we must implement the change in the course design, which has been agreed, but not yet carried out. We are now hopeful that the work will start shortly, funded entirely by private money from the owners of the Celtic Manor resort. We expect that it will be completed by mid to late 2006 and then we will be able to say to golfers world-wide, 'Come to Wales to play the Ryder cup course', rather than the half to two-thirds of it that you can play today. Once we can say that, and put it on the website of every golf-tourism magazine in the world, our ability to attract golf tourism from all over the world will be hugely enhanced.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Er mwyn manteisio ar bosibiliadau cwpan Ryder, rhaid inni weithredu'r newid yng nghynllun y cwrs, y cytunwyd arno, ond sydd heb ei gyflawni eto. Yr ydym yn hyderus yn awr y bydd y gwaith yn dechrau cyn hir, wedi'i ariannu'n gwbl breifat gan berchnogion canolfan Celtic Manor. Disgwyliwn y caiff ei gwblhau erbyn canol neu ddiwedd 2006 ac wedyn byddwn yn gallu dweud wrth golffwyr ledled y byd, 'Dewch i Gymru i chwarae ar gwrs cwpan Ryder', yn hytrach na'r hanner neu ddwy ran o dair o hynny y gellir chwarae arno heddiw. Pan allwn ddweud hynny, a'i roi ar wefan pob cylchgrawn twristiaeth golff yn y byd, bydd gennym lawer mwy o allu i ddenu ymwelwyr o golffwyr o bob rhan o'r byd.

**Jenny Randerson:** The Ryder cup and its course design are important to Wales. I particularly appreciate the cup's importance, but it is six years off. What discussions and decisions were made this weekend in your meeting with Terry Matthews, which made it so important for you to meet him rather than attend the D-day commemorations in Normandy?

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae cystadleuaeth cwpan Ryder a chynllunio'r cwrs ar ei chyfer yn bwysig i Gymru. Yr wyf yn derbyn bod y gystadleuaeth yn bwysig dros ben, ond mae chwe blynedd tan hynny. Pa drafodaethau a phenderfyniadau a gafwyd y penwythnos hwn yn eich cyfarfod â Terry Matthews, a barai iddi fod mor bwysig ichi gwrdd ag ef yn hytrach na mynd i gyfarfodydd coffa D-day yn Normandi?

**The First Minister:** The course works, costing some £10 million or £15 million, are not six years off, they are only a few weeks off. The importance of the meeting was to understand exactly when the works would take place. That will happen shortly. The preparations are being made, as soon as the Wales open tournament is over, to get ready for the commencement of the major investment by the Celtic Manor resort so that, in 2006, we will have the Ryder cup course, which includes almost half a new golf course—eight holes and a clubhouse. That major investment will then enable us to say all over the world, 'Come and play the actual course on which the Ryder cup of 2010 will be played'. The work will

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ychydig wythnosau, yn hytrach na chwe blynedd, sydd tan ddechrau'r gwaith ar y cwrs, a fydd yn costio rhyw £10 miliwn neu £15 miliwn. Yr oedd y cyfarfod yn bwysig er mwyn cael gwybod pa bryd yn union y byddai'r gwaith yn digwydd. Bydd yn digwydd cyn hir. Gwneir paratodau, cyn gynted ag y daw twrnamaint agored Cymru i ben, i ddechrau ar y buddsoddi mawr gan ganolfan Celtic Manor fel y cawn gwrs ar gyfer cwpan Ryder, yn 2006, a fydd yn cynnwys bron hanner cwrs golff newydd—wyth twll a chlwb. Bydd y buddsoddiad mawr hwnnw'n ein galluogi i ddweud wedyn ledled y byd, 'Dewch i chwarae ar yr union un cwrs y cynhelir cystadleuaeth cwpan Ryder arno yn 2010'. Bydd y gwaith yn



start in a few weeks' time.

dechrau ymhen rhai wythnosau.

### Tryloywder Busnes y Llywodraeth Transparency in Government Business

**Q8 Nick Bourne:** Will the First Minister make a statement on what he is doing to ensure transparency in Government business? (OAQ35827)

**C8 Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar yr hyn y mae'n ei wneud i sicrhau bod busnes y Llywodraeth yn dryloyw? (OAQ35827)

**The First Minister:** We continue to work closely with the Department for Constitutional Affairs, the Information Commissioner's Office and other departments across Government in preparation for January 2005, when the Freedom of Information Act 2000 comes into full force. We have held quarterly workshops for representatives of Assembly sponsored public bodies, or quangos—to use the common language—and carried out detailed work with the NHS. We are currently reviewing the content and operation of the Assembly's Code of Practice on Public Access to Information.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Parhawn i gydweithio'n agos â'r Adran Materion Cyfansoddiadol, Swyddfa'r Comisiynydd Gwybodaeth ac adrannau eraill drwy'r Llywodraeth i baratoi ar gyfer Ionawr 2005, pan ddaw Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000 i rym yn llawn. Cynaliasom weithdai chwarterol ar gyfer cynrychiolwyr cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, neu gwangos—a defnyddio'r gair cyffredin—a gwneud gwaith manwl gyda'r GIG. Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn adolygu cynnwys a gweithrediad Cod Ymarfer y Cynulliad ar Ganiatáu i'r Cyhoedd Weld Gwybodaeth.

**Nick Bourne:** I am sure that the First Minister agrees that one part of the important work of ensuring transparency is ensuring that Ministers answer correspondence within the target time set by Assembly procedures and the Government. In that regard, he should be aware—because it was in an answer that he gave to a written question that I tabled—that, between January and May 2004, the Minister for Health and Social Services only succeeded in answering 56 per cent of her correspondence within the target time. That is, nearly half was answered outside the target time. What is he doing to put that right?

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn siwr bod y Prif Weinidog yn cytuno mai un rhan o'r gwaith pwysig o sicrhau tryloywder yw gofalu y bydd Gweinidogion yn ateb llythyrau o fewn y cyfnod a bennwyd o dan weithdrefnau'r Cynulliad a'r Llywodraeth. Yn hynny o beth, dylai fod yn ymwybodol—gan ei fod mewn ateb ganddo i gwestiwn ysgrifenedig a gyflwynais i—nad yw'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, rhwng mis Ionawr a mis Mai 2004, ond wedi llwyddo i ateb 56 y cant o'r llythyrau a anfonwyd ati o fewn y cyfnod targed. Hynny yw, atebwyd bron eu hanner y tu allan i'r cyfnod targed. Beth y mae'n ei wneud i gywiro hynny?

**The First Minister:** The problem is the sheer volume. Jane Hutt receives a greater volume of correspondence than any other Minister and that is why it is more difficult for her to hit the target.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nifer y llythyrau sy'n peri'r broblem. Mae Jane Hutt yn cael mwy o lythyrau na'r un Gweinidog arall a dyna pam y mae'n fwy anodd iddi gyrraedd y targed.

**Nick Bourne:** That is not an adequate response. She had a far higher record before January, and it has steadily declined. One probable reason why nearly everyone is on a waiting list these days—not least those waiting for a reply to letters—is that she is clearly not up to the job. Do not give any feeble excuses this time; let us have a proper answer.

**Nick Bourne:** Nid yw hwnnw'n ateb digonol. Yr oedd ei record yn uwch o lawer cyn mis Ionawr, ac mae wedi dirywio'n gyson. Un o'r rhesymau tebygol y mae bron bawb ar restr aros y dyddiau hyn—a'r rhai sy'n disgwyl am ateb i lythyrau yn anad neb—yw nad ydyw'n gallu gwneud ei gwaith, fel y gwelir yn amlwg. Peidiwch â chynnig unrhyw esgusion tila y tro hwn; gadewch inni gael ateb iawn.

**The First Minister:** We are not complacent about the issue, but the figure for the health department and its Minister is lower than that of other departments because of sheer volume, and neither we nor Jane Hutt are complacent about that. The issue is one of ensuring adequate resources to answer those letters within the approved time.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid ydym yn ddifater ynghylch y mater hwn, ond mae'r ffigur ar gyfer yr adran iechyd a'i Gweinidog yn is na'r ffigurau ar gyfer adrannau eraill oherwydd y niferoedd o lythyrau, ac nid ydym ni na Jane Hutt yn ddifater ynghylch hynny. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw sicrhau bod digon o adnoddau ar gael i ateb y llythyrau hynny o fewn yr amser a gymeradwywyd.

**Carl Sargeant:** I am sure that you agree with me that transparency in local government and Government is desirable, and I welcome all Welsh Assembly Government initiatives to promote this worthwhile cause. I hope that Wales, as a result of this, will not end up with a situation like the disgraceful situation in Lincolnshire, where a Tory council leader was jailed after being found guilty of misconduct—

**Carl Sargeant:** Yr wyf yn siwr y cytunwch â mi bod tryloywder mewn llywodraeth leol a Llywodraeth yn ddymunol, a chroesawaf yr holl fentrau o eiddo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i hybu'r achos buddiol hwn. Gobeithiaf na fydd Cymru, o ganlyniad i hyn, yn mynd i sefyllfa debyg i'r sefyllfa warthus yn swydd Lincoln, lle y carcharwyd arweinydd cyngor Toriaidd ar ôl ei gael yn euog o gamymddwyn—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I know that the First Minister has wide responsibilities, but they do not include Lincolnshire.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gwn fod cyfrifoldebau'r Prif Weinidog yn rhai pellgyrhaeddol, ond nid ydynt yn cynnwys swydd Lincoln.

**The First Minister:** No, they do not include Lincolnshire.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nac ydynt, nid ydynt yn cynnwys swydd Lincoln.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Gall eich Llywodraeth fod yn dryloyw ac yn agored drwy fod yn agored i syniadau newydd, yn arbennig o ran y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae tuedd i'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru gael ei redeg mewn ffordd draddodiadol. Gwyddoch fod ffordd fwy arloesol o ddefnyddio nyrsys, parafeddygon, fferyllwyr, a phroffesiynau eraill o fewn y gwasanaeth iechyd. A ydych chi a'r Gweinidog iechyd yn fodlon edrych o ddifrif ar ffordd fwy arloesol o ddefnyddio proffesiynau eraill yn y gwasanaeth iechyd?

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Your Government can be more transparent and open by being open to new ideas, especially with regard to the health service. The health service in Wales tends to be run in a traditional way. You know that there is a more innovative way of deploying nurses, paramedics, pharmacists and other professions in the health service. Are you and the health Minister prepared to look seriously at a more innovative way of using other professions in the health service?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dyna oedd thema seremoni wobrwyo neithiwr lle, am y tro cyntaf y gallaf ei gofio, ni oedd yn derbyn y wobwr yn hytrach na'i rhoi. Rhoes y Gymdeithas Optegyddion wobwr i Jane Hutt am fod yn arloesol o ran defnyddio proffesiynau sy'n gysylltiedig â meddygaeth. Mae'r gymdeithas yn gweld hynny yn gam ymlaen gan nad ydym mor draddodiadol ag yr oeddem yn arfer bod, ond ein bod yn fwy arloesol na gweddill y DU. Credaf fod yr un egwyddor i'w gweld gyda fferyllwyr yn cymryd peth o'r baich oddi ar ysgwyddau meddygon teulu, ac yn yr un modd yn y ffordd yr ydym yn awr yn defnyddio ffisiotherapyddion a nyrsys mewn ysbytai i godi peth o'r baich oddi ar feddygon, yn union fel y bu ichi sôn.

**The First Minister:** That was the theme of an awards ceremony last night where, for the first time that I can recall, we received, rather than presented, an award. The Association of Optometrists presented Jane Hutt with an award for being innovative in the use of professions allied to medicine. The association sees that as a step forward since we are not as tradition-bound as we used to be but are more innovative than the rest of the UK. I believe that the same principle can be seen in the case of pharmacists relieving general practitioners of some of their burden, and also in the way in which we now use physiotherapists and hospital-based nurses to remove some of the strain from doctors exactly as you mentioned.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn synnu eich bod yn canmol yr hyn sy'n digwydd gan fy mod wedi ceisio cael cytundeb rhwng y bwrdd iechyd lleol, Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r Ymddiriedolaeth Ambiwlans. Deuthum ar draws y broblem nad oes digon o nyrsys arbenigol yn cael eu hyfforddi a bod y gost mor uchel na all byrddau lleol fforddio hynny. Yn achos yr Ymddiriedolaeth Ambiwlans, pan ddywedaf fod angen parafeddygon â'r sgiliau priodol, dywed nad oes arian i'w hyfforddi gan fod y cyrsiau mor ddrud a'u bod yn para dwy i dair blynedd. A chithau'n honni bod pethau mor dda, a wnewch gytuno bod yr adran iechyd yn cyllido hyfforddiant ar gyfer pobl i wneud y math hwn o waith? Dywed Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys nad oes yr un ganolfan cerdded-i-mewn yng Nghymru, er bod 43 yn Lloegr gyda 21 arall ar y gweill. A wnewch edrych ar yr opsiwn hwnnw gan ei bod yn amlwg bod prinder darpariaeth o'r fath?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am surprised that you praise what is happening since I have been trying to obtain an agreement between the local health boards, the Assembly Government and the Ambulance Trust. I came across the problem that insufficient special nurses are being trained and the cost is so high that local health boards cannot afford to pay. In the case of the Ambulance Trust, when I say that more paramedics with the appropriate skills are needed, it says that the money to train them is not available as the courses are so expensive and last two to three years. Since you have been claiming that everything is so good, do you agree that the health department should fund training for people to undertake such work? The Royal College of Nursing says that there is not one call-in centre in Wales, even though there are 43 in England with a further 21 proposed. Will you look at that kind of option as there is an obvious lack of such provision?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credaf ein bod ni ar yr un tir mewn egwyddor gan ein bod oll yn derbyn ei bod yn bwysig nad yw meddygon yn cael eu gordefnyddio tra bo proffesiynau sy'n gysylltiedig â meddygaeth yn gallu ysgwyddo llawer o'r baich heb unrhyw ddirywiad yn safon y gwasanaeth a ddarperir. Soniasoch hefyd am rai problemau ymarferol o ran cyllido a hyfforddi ac ati nad ydynt wedi codi hyd yn hyn, efallai oherwydd problemau ariannol ac, ambell waith, am nad oes cyrsiau ar gael yn ein colegau neu am reswm arall. Fodd bynnag, credaf ein bod oll yn siarad ar hyd yr un llinellau o ran dyfodol y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, sef defnyddio'r gallu sydd ym mhob un o'r proffesiynau i gyfrannu'n fwy ac felly codi'r baich oddi ar y sector sydd dan y straen mwyaf, sef y meddygon eu hunain.

**The First Minister:** I believe that we are on the same ground in principle as we all accept that it is important that doctors are not overused while professions allied to medicine could lift much of the burden without any deterioration in the standard of service provided. You also mentioned some of the practical problems with regard to funding and training and so on that have not arisen yet, perhaps because of financial problems and, occasionally, because the courses are not available in our colleges or for other reasons. However, I believe that we are all following the same line with regard to the future of the national health service, namely to utilise the capacity in each profession to make an increased contribution and thereby lift the burden from the sector under the greatest strain, namely the doctors themselves.

2.50 p.m.

### Swyddfeydd Tramor Overseas Offices

**Q9 Brian Gibbons:** What role do Assembly-supported overseas offices play in supporting prosperity in Wales? (OAQ35823)

**C9 Brian Gibbons:** Pa rôl y mae'r swyddfeydd y mae'r Cynulliad yn eu cynnal dramor yn ei chwarae i helpu Cymru i ffynnu? (OAQ35823)

**The First Minister:** Overseas offices assist Welsh business to pursue a wide range of export and trade opportunities and are vital to attracting foreign direct investment to Wales. They were started under the Conservatives; we have expanded them. They also have a role to play in attracting tourism, students and film-makers.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae swyddfeydd mewn gwledydd tramor yn helpu busnes yng Nghymru i ddilyn amrywiaeth mawr o gyfleoedd i allforio a masnachu ac maent yn hollbwysig i ddenu buddsoddiad uniongyrchol i Gymru o wledydd tramor. Fe'u sefydlwyd o dan y Ceidwadwyr; yr ydym ni wedi'u heangu. Mae iddynt ran i'w chwarae hefyd wrth ddenu ymwelwyr, myfyrwyr a gwneuthurwyr ffilmiau.

**Brian Gibbons:** You will be aware that outreach overseas activities by the Assembly Government have produced almost £300 million worth of orders in recent years. Do you believe that it is in the interest of business in Wales that we continue to vigorously promote these overseas activities through offices such as our overseas offices, and that attempts to denigrate these efforts work against the interests of the Welsh economy and show how out of touch some parties in the Assembly are with regard to marketing Wales?

**Brian Gibbons:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod gwasanaethau allanol mewn gwledydd tramor o eiddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi creu gwerth bron £300 miliwn o archebion yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf. A gredwch ei bod er budd i fusnes yng Nghymru inni barhau i hyrwyddo'r gweithgareddau tramor hynny'n egniol drwy swyddfeydd fel y rhai sydd gennym dramor, a bod ymdrechion i fychanu'r gwaith hwnnw'n mynd yn groes i fuddiannau economi Cymru ac yn dangos y graddau y mae rhai pleidiau yn y Cynulliad wedi colli cysylltiad â'r angen i farchnata Cymru?

**The First Minister:** Inward investment and outward trade can be assisted by a presence on the ground, and the feedback received from such a presence on market conditions is invaluable. We also seek additional value from such a presence—although this is not its main job—in attracting tourism, film-makers and so on. You are right. This is why Conservative Secretaries of State set up these offices in the past and why we have expanded them and tried to give them a more holistic feel so that they cover exports and tourism as well as inward investment.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gellir hybu mewnfuddsoddi a masnach â gwledydd tramor o gael presenoldeb yn y fan a'r lle, ac mae'r adborth a geir gan rai sy'n bresennol ar gyflwr y farchnad yn amhrisiadwy. Yr ydym hefyd yn ceisio gwerth ychwanegol o bresenoldeb o'r fath—er nad hyn yw ei brif waith—drwy ddenu ymwelwyr, gwneuthurwyr ffilmiau ac yn y blaen. Yr ydych yn iawn. Dyna pam y sefydlodd Ysgrifenyddion Gwladol Ceidwadol y swyddfeydd hyn yn y gorffennol a pham yr ydym ni wedi'u heangu a cheisio rhoi gwedd fwy cyfannol arnynt fel eu bod yn ymwneud ag allforion a thwristiaeth yn ogystal â mewnfuddsoddi.

**Brynle Williams:** In light of the horrendous council tax increases of recent years, the mini-embassies abroad are a gross waste of time and taxpayers' money, and the Welsh people do not want them. I have spoken to many people in north Wales and no-one could see the benefit of these embassies. It was thought that they serve only to boost the ego of members of the Labour Party. Do you agree?

**Brynle Williams:** Yng ngolwg y codiadau arswydus yn y dreth gyngor yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae'r llysgenadaethau bach mewn gwledydd tramor yn wastraff ofnadwy ar amser ac arian y trethdalwyr, ac nid yw pobl Cymru am eu cael. Yr wyf wedi siarad â llawer yn y Gogledd ac ni allai neb weld pa fudd a oedd yn y llysgenadaethau hyn. Tybiwyd mai eu hunig bwrpas oedd chwyddo balchder aelodau'r Blaid Lafur. A ydych yn cytuno?

**The First Minister:** That might be so if we had such embassies. You must ask yourself, Brynle, whether you were around and whether you were a member of the same party when David Hunt and Peter Walker set up these offices. I do not believe that we have as many offices now as when David Hunt and Peter Walker were Conservative Secretaries of State. We have rationalised the offices rather than expand them. They now have more functions, but I do not believe that we have as many now as there were during that period. When the Conservatives set them up, many of your people probably thought that it was a good thing. Somehow, because Labour is rationalising them and giving them more functions, they have decided that it is a bad thing. They are not embassies and no foreign policy or consulate functions are carried out in them; they are strictly for the promotion of Welsh exports and for promoting inward investment and tourism into Wales. Is that a bad thing, Brynle?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gallai hynny fod yn wir pe byddai gennym lysgenadaethau o'r fath. Rhaid ichi ymholi, Brynle, a oeddech yno ac a oeddech yn aelod o'r un blaid pan wnaeth David Hunt a Peter Walker sefydlu'r swyddfeydd hyn. Ni chredaf fod gennym gynifer o swyddfeydd yn awr â'r adeg yr oedd David Hunt a Peter Walker yn Ysgrifenyddion Gwladol Ceidwadol. Yr ydym wedi rhesymoli'r swyddfeydd yn hytrach na'u heangu. Mae ganddynt fwy o swyddogaethau'n awr, ond ni chredaf fod gennym gynifer yn awr ag yn y cyfnod hwnnw. Pan wnaeth y Ceidwadwyr eu sefydlu, yr oedd llawer o'ch pobl yn tybio siwr o fod mai peth da oedd hynny. Am ryw reswm, gan fod Llafur yn eu rhesymoli ac yn rhoi mwy o swyddogaethau iddynt, penderfynasant mai peth drwg ydyw. Nid llysgenadaethau ydynt ac ni chyflawnir unrhyw swyddogaethau polisi tramor neu gonswliaeth ynddynt; eu hunig bwrpas yw hyrwyddo allforion o Gymru a hybu mewnfuddsoddi a thwristiaeth yng Nghymru. A yw hynny'n beth drwg, Brynle?

### **Y Gronfa Cyfleoedd Newydd The New Opportunities Fund**

**Q10 Jeff Cuthbert:** Will the First Minister make a statement about the role of the new opportunities fund in promoting physical education and sport in Wales? (OAQ35793)

**C10 Jeff Cuthbert:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar rôl y gronfa cyfleoedd newydd o ran hyrwyddo addysg gorfforol a chwaraeon yng Nghymru? (OAQ35793)

**The First Minister:** New opportunities fund programmes are making a positive contribution to building a healthier and fitter Wales. For example, the physical education and sport in schools programme is providing over £55 million to promote sport and active recreation in Wales. To date, £22 million has been awarded to 63 projects, including £3 million in Caerphilly.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae rhaglenni'r gronfa cyfleoedd newydd yn cyfrannu'n gadarnhaol at greu Cymru sy'n fwy iach a heini. Er enghraifft, mae'r rhaglen addysg gorfforol a chwaraeon mewn ysgolion yn darparu mwy na £55 miliwn i hybu chwaraeon ac adloniant gweithredol yng Nghymru. Hyd yma, dyfarnwyd £22 filiwn i 63 o brosiectau, gan gynnwys £3 miliwn yng Nghaerffili.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Would you join me in welcoming the news that two schools in my constituency, Lewis Girls Comprehensive School in Ystrad Mynach and St Cenydd Comprehensive School in Caerphilly, have benefited from over £3 million in funding? The money announced last month will enable St Cenydd Comprehensive school to build a four-court sports hall, dance studio and multi-gym and will enable a centre of excellence in either netball or hockey to be established at Lewis Girls Comprehensive School. The provision of state-of-the-art equipment will also encourage young people to take a lifelong-learning approach to physical activity. Do you think that this is

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A wnewch ymuno â mi i groesawu'r newydd bod dwy ysgol yn fy etholaeth, Ysgol Gyfun Lewis i Ferched yn Ystrad Mynach ac Ysgol Gyfun Cenydd Sant yng Nghaerffili, wedi cael budd o fwy na £3 miliwn o gyllid? Bydd yr arian a gyhoeddwyd y mis diwethaf yn galluogi Ysgol Gyfun Cenydd Sant i godi neuadd chwaraeon â phedwar cwrt, stiwdio dawns a champfa amlbwrpas a bydd yn hwyluso sefydlu canolfan ragoriaeth mewn un ai pêl-rwyd neu hoci yn Ysgol Gyfun Lewis i Ferched. Bydd darparu'r offer diweddaraf yn fodd hefyd i gymell pobl ifanc i ymgymryd â gweithgarwch corfforol drwy ddysgu gydol oes. A ydych yn credu bod hyn yn

excellent news for parents and pupils of these schools and that the educational professionals who manage the schools should be congratulated?

newydd rhagorol i rieni a disgyblion yr ysgolion hyn ac y dylid llongyfarch y gweithwyr addysg proffesiynol sy'n rheoli'r ysgolion?

**The First Minister:** I do. This is excellent news for the parents and pupils of those schools in the Caerphilly constituency, and, as far as we are aware, it will enable St Cenydd to build a four-court sports hall, dance studio and multi-gym, which is great, and it will also provide outdoor facilities for netball and hockey. This is exactly what we need. There is a competitive market for the attention of young people. They will not change or play if the facilities are old-fashioned and look out of date and too traditional. It is therefore important to make these facilities attractive so that we develop the heart and lung functions of our young people, and combat the obesity problem among our young people and, therefore, the diabetes type 2 time bomb that is waiting to hit us in 10 or 20 years time if we do not intervene and do something about it now. That is what the new opportunities fund is for.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ydwyf. Mae hyn yn newydd rhagorol i rieni a disgyblion yr ysgolion hynny yn etholaeth Caerffili, a, hyd y gwyddom, bydd yn galluogi ysgol Cenydd Sant i godi neuadd chwaraeon â phedwar cwrt, stiwdio dawns a champfa amlbwrpas, sy'n beth gwych, a bydd hefyd yn fodd i gael cyfleusterau awyr agored ar gyfer pêl-rwyd a hoci. Dyma'r union beth y mae arnom ei angen. Rhaid cystadlu am sylw pobl ifanc. Ni wnânt newid neu chwarae os yw'r cyfleusterau'n hen ffasiwn ac yn ymddangos eu bod ar ôl yr oes ac yn rhy draddodiadol. Peth pwysig, felly, yw peri i'r cyfleusterau hyn fod yn ddeniadol fel y gallwn ddatblygu gweithrediadau'r galon a'r ysgyfaint yn ein pobl ifanc, ac ymladd yn erbyn problem gordewdra ymysg ein pobl ifanc a, thrwy hynny, y bygythiad o ddiabetes math 2 sy'n debygol o'n taro ymhen 10 neu 20 mlynedd os nad ymyrrwn a gwneud rhywbeth yn ei gylch yn awr. Dyna bwrpas y gronfa cyfleoedd newydd.

**Owen John Thomas:** What was the effect of merging the new opportunities fund with the community fund?

**Owen John Thomas:** Beth oedd effaith cyfuno'r gronfa cyfleoedd newydd a'r gronfa gymunedol?

**The First Minister:** It will produce a more streamlined and accessible application process, making it easier to apply, especially for small community groups in deprived areas. It will also provide a single point of entry for applicants who are a little unsure about exactly where to seek advice and guidance.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd yn creu proses ymgeisio sy'n symlach ac yn haws ei defnyddio, fel y bydd yn haws ymgeisio, yn enwedig yn achos grwpiau cymunedol bach mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig. Bydd hefyd yn rhoi un pwynt mynediad ar gyfer ymgeiswyr sydd braidd yn ansicr ynghylch pa le'n union y dylent fynd iddo i geisio cyngor ac arweiniad.

**Eleanor Burnham:** That is all very well, however, can you tell us what your Government is doing to fund the training force so that there are sufficiently qualified people to ensure that everyone is able to make the most of sports activities, particularly when you consider what happened with swimming last year, when many people reported that young people were just messing around and not doing anything constructive?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Hawdd dweud hynny, fodd bynnag, a allwch ddweud wrthym beth y mae'ch Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i gyllido hyfforddwyr fel y bydd rhai sy'n ddigon cymwys i sicrhau y bydd pawb yn cael y cyfle i wneud y gorau o weithgareddau chwaraeon, yn enwedig o ystyried yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn achos nofio y llynedd, pan ddywedodd llawer mai'r cwbl yr oedd pobl ifanc yn ei wneud oedd chwarae, heb wneud unrhyw beth adeiladol?

**The First Minister:** I heard the allegation that there was a lot of splashing around and not much swimming. However, every time we looked into it we found that it was balderdash, invented by critics of the scheme. Therefore, something more factual might be in order from you, Eleanor, the next time you ask a question on that.

**Laura Anne Jones:** While we welcome the money being given to improve the sporting facilities in some schools, do you agree that we must consider increasing the time set aside for sport in schools so that children can benefit from these improved facilities?

**The First Minister:** That is a big issue. It is the quart in the pint pot issue of how many hours there are in the school week. Whereas it would be nice to have an hour a day of physical education, at the moment it is not possible to have more than about two hours a week, and many schools are struggling to provide that. If you increase it, what goes? How much other national curriculum activity can go? This must be reviewed in the light of all the priorities, namely getting all the traditional academic subjects in, as well as the new subjects such as IT, and design, craft and technology, which are essential for the modern world, and combating this impending diabetes type 2 time bomb. We must combat that by getting better PE in schools and fuller use of schools, especially among 13 to 14-year-old plus girls, who can find 10 reasons not to take part in PE. It is vital to try to encourage them to consider it. It is an essential part of the curriculum and of pupils' lives and health for the long term.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Clywais y cyhuddiad bod llawer o chwarae yn y dwr a dim llawer o nofio. Er hynny, bob tro yr ymchwliasom i hynny, cawsom mai dwli ydoedd a ddyfeisiwyd gan feirniaid y cynllun. Gan hynny, byddai'n dda cael rhywbeth mwy ffeithiol gennych, Eleanor, y tro nesaf y gofynnwch gwestiwn am hynny.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Er ein bod yn croesawu'r ffaith bod arian yn cael ei roi i wella cyfleusterau chwaraeon mewn rhai ysgolion, a ydych yn cytuno bod rhaid inni ystyried neilltuo mwy o amser ar gyfer chwaraeon mewn ysgolion fel y gall plant elwa o'r cyfleusterau gwell hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hwnnw'n bwnc pwysig. Mater o roi chwart mewn pot peint ydyw o ran nifer yr oriau yn yr wythnos ysgol. Er mai braf fyddai cael awr y diwrnod o addysg gorfforol, ni ellir cael mwy na thua dwyawr yr wythnos ar hyn o bryd, ac mae sawl ysgol yn ei chael yn anodd cynnig hynny. Os neilltuir mwy o amser, pa beth a gollir? Pa faint o'r gweithgarwch arall yn y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol y gellir ei gollu? Rhaid adolygu hyn yng ngoleuni'r holl flaenoriaethau, sef cynnwys yr holl bynciau academaidd traddodiadol, yn ogystal â phynciau newydd fel TG, a chreffft, dylunio a thechnoleg, sy'n hollbwysig ar gyfer y byd modern, ac ymladd yn erbyn y bygythiad o ddiabetes math 2. Rhaid inni ymladd yn erbyn hynny drwy gael gwell addysg gorfforol mewn ysgolion a thrwy wneud defnydd llawnach o ysgolion, yn enwedig ymysg merched 13 i 14 blwydd oed a hyn, a rhai hyn, sy'n gallu meddwl am sawl rheswm dros beidio â chymryd rhan mewn addysg gorfforol. Rhaid ceisio'u hannog i'w hystyried. Mae'n rhan annatod o'r cwricwlwm ac o fywyd ac iechyd disgyblion ar gyfer y tymor hir.

### Hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg Promoting the Welsh Language

**Q11 Glyn Davies:** How does the First Minister ensure that responsibility for promoting the Welsh language extends over all Assembly activities? (OAQ35824)

**C11 Glyn Davies:** Sut y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn sicrhau bod y cyfrifoldeb dros hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg yn rhan o holl weithgareddau'r Cynulliad? (OAQ35824)

**The First Minister:** We do so by reflecting our policies in documents such as 'Iaith Pawb' and the Assembly Government's Welsh language scheme. Overall responsibility for mainstreaming the Welsh language into all Assembly Government activities is a matter for Alun Pugh, the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnawn hynny drwy adlewyrchu ein polisiau mewn dogfennau fel 'Iaith Pawb' a chynllun iaith Gymraeg Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'r cyfrifoldeb cyffredinol dros gynnwys y Gymraeg yn y brif ffrwd yn holl weithgareddau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn fater i Alun Pugh, y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon.

**Glyn Davies:** When the appropriate committee considered this issue at great length, which led to 'Iaith Pawb', it was decided that the committee would oversee the issue and that we would not set up a specific cross-cutting committee as happens with other cross-cutting issues. Do you agree that the only way that this will be effective is if all Ministers and all other committees are required to report annually to the appropriate committee to ensure that something is done, which focuses opinions, and makes a real difference?

**Glyn Davies:** Pan roddodd y pwyllgor priodol ystyriaeth hirfaith i'r mater hwn, a arweiniodd at gyhoeddi 'Iaith Pawb', penderfynwyd y byddai'r pwyllgor yn goruchwyllo hyn ac na sefydlem bwyllgor trawsbynciol penodol fel a ddigwydd yn achos materion trawsbynciol eraill. A ydych yn cytuno mai'r unig fodd i wneud hynny'n effeithiol yw mynnu y bydd yr holl Weinidogion a'r holl bwyllgorau eraill yn adrodd yn flynyddol i'r pwyllgor priodol i sicrhau y gwneir rhywbeth, sy'n crynhoi'r farn, ac yn gwneud gwir wahaniaeth?

**The First Minister:** That is a matter for the committee Chairs. I would encourage them when they meet to consider how such a reporting mechanism could be achieved.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n fater i Gadeiryddion y pwyllgorau. Byddwn yn eu hannog, pan gyfarfyddant, i ystyried sut y gellid sicrhau dull adrodd o'r fath.

### Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

### Dathliadau D-day D-day Celebrations

**Nick Bourne:** Will the First Minister make a statement on Wales's representation at the sixtieth anniversary celebrations of the D-day landings? (EAQ36164)

**Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y gynrychiolaeth o Gymru yn nathliadau trigeinmlwyddiant y glanio ar D-day? (EAQ36164)

**The First Minister:** I have the utmost respect for those who fell or were wounded, or took part, in the Normandy landings 60 years ago, as I do for those of our armed forces in other theatres of war. I apologise to all of those veterans who feel snubbed or slighted by my not attending at Arromanches. That snub or slight was utterly unintended. The decision that Edwina Hart, and not I, should represent Wales was made out of respect and not disrespect for the veterans. Edwina's father served throughout the second world war and her mother was a member of the Women's Royal Naval Service. When it was considered who should represent the Assembly Government, she was the first to ask for her name to be considered. That was deemed more important than

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gennyf y parch mwyaf tuag at y rhai a fu farw neu a glwyfwyd, neu a gymerodd ran, yn y glanio yn Normandi 60 mlynedd yn ôl, fel y mae gennyf tuag at y rhai o'n lluoedd arfog a fu ar faes y gad mewn mannau eraill. Ymddiheuraf i bob un o'r cyn-filwyr hynny sy'n teimlo eu bod wedi'u hanwybyddu neu'u bychanu am na fîm yn bresennol yn Arromanches. Yr oedd yr anwybyddu neu fychanu hwnnw'n gwbl anfwriadol. Penderfynwyd mai Edwina Hart, ac nid myfi, a ddylai gynrychioli Cymru o ran parch ac nid amarch at y cyn-filwyr. Gwasanaethodd tad Edwina drwy gydol yr ail ryfel byd a bu ei mam yn aelod o Wasanaeth Llyngesol Brenhinol y Menywod. Wrth ystyried pwy a ddylai gynrychioli Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, hi oedd y



me representing Wales on the grounds of my rank as First Minister. I hope that our ex-servicemen and ex-servicewomen will accept that that decision was made in good faith.

gyntaf i ofyn am i'w henw gael ei ystyried. Barnwyd bod hynny'n bwysicach nag i mi gynrychioli Cymru yn rhinwedd fy safle fel Prif Weinidog. Gobeithiaf y bydd ein cyn-filwyr yn derbyn bod y penderfyniad hwnnw'n un didwyll.

3.00 p.m.

**Nick Bourne:** I thank the First Minister for his reply, such as it was. The opportunity to represent our nation in Arromanches should be viewed as a privilege and not a chore. I believe that it was essential that the First Minister represented our nation in France last weekend. We should have been represented at the highest level. However, that is no reflection on Edwina Hart. Her Majesty Queen Elizabeth, Prime Minister Blair, President Bush, President Chirac, President Putin and Chancellor Schröder were there, and, at the eleventh hour, Scotland's First Minister attended. This was perhaps the last great opportunity to thank our world war veterans in this way for the continuing debt that we and future generations owe to our courageous and proud forebears, many of whom made the ultimate sacrifice on those beaches 60 years ago in the defence of freedom and against fascism and Nazism. Your reasons for not going to Arromanches, which were not referred to in the statement but have been often repeated over the weekend to an incredulous nation, were insensitive and crass. You said that you wanted to spend time with your family. Did it not occur to you that the reason why we can enjoy these freedoms is because of the sacrifice made that summer? That is why you should have been there to represent our nation. Those people fighting for freedom 60 years ago did not have the choice to be with their friends and families. You also said that you needed time for electioneering. I wonder if it occurred to you when you said that that the fight against the tyranny of Nazism 60 years ago secured our freedoms, our democracy and our way of life. That is why you should have been at Arromanches last weekend.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolchaf i'r Prif Weinidog am hynny o ateb a gafwyd ganddo. Dylid ystyried y cyfle i gynrychioli ein cenedl yn Arromanches yn frainc ac nid yn orchwyl. Credaf ei bod yn hollbwysig i'r Prif Weinidog fod wedi cynrychioli ein cenedl yn Ffrainc y penwythnos diwethaf. Dylem fod wedi cael ein cynrychioli ar y lefel uchaf. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n feirniadaeth ar Edwina Hart. Bu Ei Mawrhydi'r Frenhines Elizabeth, y Prif Weinidog Blair, yr Arlywydd Bush, yr Arlywydd Chirac, yr Arlywydd Putin a'r Canghellor Schröder yno, ac, ar yr unfed awr ar ddeg, daeth Prif Weinidog yr Alban yno. Mae'n bosibl mai hwn oedd y cyfle mawr olaf i ddiolch i'n cyn-filwyr yn y rhyfel byd yn y modd hwn am y ddyled barhaus sydd arnom ni a chenedlaethau'r dyfodol i'n hynafiaid dewr ac anrhydeddus, y gwnaeth llawer ohonynt gyflawni'r aberth eithaf ar y traethau hynny 60 mlynedd yn ôl wrth amddiffyn rhyddid ac ymladd yn erbyn ffasgaeth a Natsiaeth. Yr oedd y rhesymau a roesoich dros beidio â mynd i Arromanches, nas cyfeiriwyd atynt yn y datganiad ond a ailadroddwyd yn aml dros y penwythnos i genedl anghrediniol, yn rhai ansensitif a thwp. Dywedasoich eich bod am dreulio amser gyda'ch teulu. Oni ddaeth i'ch meddwl mai'r rheswm y gallwn fwynhau rhyddid o'r fath yw'r aberth a wnaed yr haf hwnnw? Dyna pam y dylasech fod yno i gynrychioli ein cenedl. Nid oedd y rhai a fu'n ymladd dros ryddid 60 mlynedd yn ôl wedi cael y dewis i fod gyda'u ffrindiau a'u teuluoedd. Dywedasoich hefyd fod arnoch angen amser ar gyfer ymgyrchu. Tybed a ddaeth i'ch meddwl pan ddywedasoich hynny mai'r frwydr yn erbyn gormes y Natsiaid a sicrhoedd ein rhyddid, ein democratiaeth a'n ffordd o fyw. Dyna pam y dylasech fod yn Arromanches y penwythnos diwethaf.

You also said, incredibly, that the date was not in your diary but that the Ryder Cup talks were. This event should have been in your diary. We have known for 60 years about the sacrifice and the debt that we owe. Compared to that, a meeting on the Ryder Cup does not amount to a row of beans. I have specific questions regarding your reply and the comments made over the weekend. Why was it not appropriate for the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport, or another Minister, to represent Wales at the Ryder Cup meeting? Did you have any discussions with Terry Matthews, or those organising the Ryder Cup, regarding whether they would be offended if you put your national duty, as I see it, to Wales before the do in Newport? You gave your apology somewhat grudgingly. You owe it to the Welsh people and to our nation not to say that you are sorry if they took offence but to give a no-holds-barred, unqualified sorry for letting them, and all of us, down. Many people feel that you have demonstrated that you are unfit to hold office because of your lack of judgment, your lack of grace in failing to give an unqualified apology and your insensitivity to those who serve, or have served, our nation. If you fail to give an unqualified apology today—and I have not heard and—many more will feel that you should go. I have stopped short of calling for your resignation, but only because, in this week of elections, to do so would politicise what is actually a national shame and disgrace. However, I call for an unqualified apology to the Welsh nation. That is the least that you can do.

**The First Minister:** I do not know what your problem is regarding the wording of my reply. I certainly did not say the words that you repeated. There was no 'if' in my reply. I said that I wished to take this opportunity to apologise to the veterans who feel snubbed or slighted by my not attending the event at Arronanches. There were no conditions in that. The 'if' that you inserted is a matter for you and your conscience.

Dywedaso ch hefyd, er mai anodd coelio hyn, nad oedd y dyddiad yn eich dyddiadur ond bod y trafodaethau ar gyfer cystadleuaeth Cwpan Ryder yno. Dylasai'r digwyddiad hwn fod yn eich dyddiadur. Gwyddom er 60 mlynedd am yr aberth a'r ddyled sydd arnom. Peth pitw, wrth ymyl hynny, yw cyfarfod ynghylch cystadleuaeth Cwpan Ryder. Mae gennyf gwestiynau penodol am eich ateb a'r sylwadau a wnaed dros y penwythnos. Pam nad oedd yn briodol i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon, neu Weinidog arall, gynrychioli Cymru yn y cyfarfod ynghylch cystadleuaeth Cwpan Ryder? A gawsoch unrhyw drafodaethau â Terry Matthews, neu'r rhai sy'n trefnu'r gystadleuaeth, ynghylch a gaent eu tramgwyddo pe rhoddech eich dyletswydd genedlaethol i Gymru, fel yr wyf fi'n ei gweld, o flaen y digwyddiad yng Nghasnewydd? Yr oeddech braidd yn grintachlyd wrth ymddiheuro. Nid ymddiheuro i bobl Cymru ac i'n cenedl os oeddent wedi'u tramgwyddo y dylech wneud, ond ymddiheuro'n llaes ac yn ddiamod am eu siomi hwy, a phob un ohonom. Mae llawer yn teimlo eich bod wedi dangos eich bod yn anaddas i ddal eich swydd oherwydd eich diffyg crebwyll, eich amharodrwydd i ymddiheuro'n ddiamod a'ch diffyg sensitifrwydd tuag at y rhai sy'n gwasanaethu, neu sydd wedi gwasanaethu, ein cenedl. Os methwch â chynnig ymddiheuriad diamod heddiw—ac nid wyf wedi clywed hynny—bydd llawer mwy'n teimlo y dylech fynd. Ymateliais rhag galw am eich ymddiswyddiad, ond dim ond am y byddai gwneud hynny mewn wythnos o etholiadau'n gwleidyddoli rhywbeth sydd mewn gwirionedd yn warth ac yn gywilydd i'r genedl. Er hynny, galwaf am ymddiheuriad diamod i genedl y Cymry. Dyna'r peth lleiaf y gallwch ei wneud.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wn pam yr ydych yn cael geiriau fy ateb yn annerbyniol. Yn sicr, ni ddywedais y geiriau a ailadroddasoch. Nid oedd unrhyw 'os' yn fy ateb. Dywedais fy mod yn dymuno achub ar y cyfle hwn i ymddiheuro i'r cyn-filwyr sy'n teimlo eu bod wedi'u hanwybyddu neu'u bychanu am na fûm yn bresennol yn y digwyddiad yn Arronanches. Nid oedd unrhyw amodau ar hynny. Mae'r 'os' a roeso ch i mewn yn fater i chi a'ch cydwybod.

Let us begin, if possible, with an area of agreement. It was certainly a privilege for all those who attended the event at Arromanches and not a chore. We agree on that. However, we perhaps disagree on whether this is about rank and the question whether I, as First Minister, should attend rather than a Minister who has personal reasons for attending. When the invitation arrived in April, we decided that Edwina's reasons for attending were greater and more relevant than mine. The only reason why I should attend relates to rank, which you noted, and the fact that I am of higher rank than Edwina Hart. Is that as relevant as you claim, when compared with the relevance of family history and a link with the world war two veteran generation, which Edwina has par excellence? All of your other points were irrelevant, and you almost suggested that it would have been okay for Edwina Hart to go provided that I did not go to Newport. I do not understand that argument. Once we had made the decision that it was more relevant for Edwina Hart to be present than me, anything that I then did on this occasion was not strictly relevant. The points about it being possible for Terry Matthews to have seen me at another time or for Alun Pugh to have gone in my place are irrelevant. We decided that the pros of Edwina being present were her family link with the world war two generation and veterans, who were the focus of this occasion, while the pros of my being present were rank and status alone. If you are obsessed with rank and status, you will believe that I should have gone, but if you believe that the occasion was about the veterans and their families, you will understand the strong case in favour of Edwina Hart being present. Nevertheless, I accept that I have to apologise to all the veterans who felt snubbed and slighted. The decision not to attend was not intended as a snub or a slight, and I apologise unreservedly if it was seen as thus.

Gadewch inni ddechrau, os oes modd, â rhywbeth y cytunir arno. Yr oedd yn sicr yn fraint i bawb a fu'n bresennol yn y digwyddiad yn Arromanches ac nid yn orchwyl. Cytunwn ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, gallem anghytuno ynghylch a yw hyn yn ymwneud â safle ac a ddylaswn i, fel Prif Weinidog, fod yn bresennol yn hytrach na Gweinidog sydd â rhesymau personol dros fynd. Pan ddaeth y gwahoddiad ym mis Ebrill, penderfynasom fod y rhesymau a oedd gan Edwina dros ymbresenoli'n fwy ac yn fwy perthnasol na'r rhai a oedd gennyf fi. Mae'r unig reswm y dylaswn i fod yn bresennol yn ymwneud â safle, y gwnaethoch ei nodi, a'r ffaith fy mod mewn safle uwch nag Edwina Hart. A yw hynny mor berthnasol ag yr honnwch, o'i gymharu â pherthnasedd hanes teuluol a'r cysylltiad cryf â chenedlaeth cyn-filwyr yr ail ryfel byd, sydd gan Edwina? Yr oedd yr holl bwyntiau eraill a wnaethoch yn amherthnasol, a bu bron ichi awgrymu y buasai'n iawn i Edwina fynd ar yr amod nad aethwn i i Gasnewydd. Nid wyf yn deall y ddadl honno. Unwaith ein bod wedi penderfynu ei bod yn fwy perthnasol i Edwina Hart fod yn bresennol nag i mi, nid oedd dim a wnawn wedyn ar yr achlysur hwn yn berthnasol o gwbl. Mae'r pwyntiau ynghylch y posibilrwydd y gallasai Terry Matthews fy ngweld rywbyrd arall neu y gallasai Alun Pugh fynd yn fy lle yn rhai amherthnasol. Penderfynasom mai'r ddadl dros bresenoldeb Edwina oedd ei chysylltiad teuluol â chenedlaeth yr ail ryfel byd a'r cyn-filwyr, sef y rhai a oedd dan sylw yn yr achlysur hwn, tra mai safle a statws oedd yr unig ddadl dros fy mhresenoldeb i. Os oes gennych obsesiwn â safle a statws, credwch mai myfi a ddylasai fynd, ond os credwch fod yr achlysur yn ymwneud â'r cyn-filwyr a'u teuluoedd, deallwch y ddadl gryf o blaid presenoldeb Edwina Hart. Er hynny, derbyniaf fod rhaid imi ymddiheuro i'r holl gyn-filwyr a deimlai eu bod wedi'u hanwybyddu a'u bychanu. Nid anwybyddu neu fychanu oedd y bwriad wrth benderfynu peidio â bod yn bresennol, ac ymddiheuraf yn llaes os barnwyd mai hynny a wnaed.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The Welsh veterans who attended the events in Arromanches last weekend expected to see the First Minister at their side representing Wales. This is not about rank or the pecking order in your Cabinet; it is about who should have represented Wales at this event, which should unquestionably have been the First Minister. This is the view held by the veterans, the people of Wales and Assembly Members. I was deeply disappointed, not by your apology, but by the fact that you have not acknowledged that the decision was a clear error of judgment on your part. You must at least accept that this is the case and, in apologising, admit to the veterans who put their lives on the line in Normandy that you made a grave error of judgment

You must also accept that you gave a reason for not attending by drawing a parallel, as to the importance of your time, between two things that do not exist on the same planet—golf and the events at Arromanches. There is no question about where you should have been. You should have sent someone in your place to the golfing event and you should have attended the commemoration in Arromanches. You had a duty and responsibility to do that. I say in all sincerity, First Minister, that the people of Wales expect you to say ‘sorry, I made a mistake, I should have gone to Arromanches and I will now apologise to you accordingly’.

**The First Minister:** When you say that I should have unquestionably been present, I say to you that you did not address the issue that we considered when we received the invitation in April. We considered the pros and cons of Edwina Hart attending the event and the pros and cons of my going. The latter related to my rank and status as First Minister, while the former related to Edwina’s closer connection with the generation of world war two veterans in which her family was prominent. Your failure to address this point means that I cannot respond in great detail to your other points. You did not accept that we made the decision in good faith. I believe that the ex-servicemen and ex-servicewomen of Wales accept that this decision—I apologise for the fact that they thought ill of it—was made in good faith. Being represented by Edwina Hart was believed to be the best way to associate the Assembly, its Cabinet and its political leadership with the veterans, for whom this occasion was held. I ask you, Ieuan, to reflect on

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr oedd y cyn-filwyr o Gymru a aeth i’r digwyddiadau yn Arromanches yr wythnos diwethaf yn disgwyl gweld y Prif Weinidog wrth eu hochr yn cynrychioli Cymru. Nid yw hyn yn ymwneud â safle neu flaenoriaeth yn eich Cabinet; mae’n ymwneud â phwy a ddylai fod wedi cynrychioli Cymru yn y digwyddiad hwn, sef y Prif Weinidog, heb unrhyw amheuaeth. Dyma farn y cyn-filwyr, pobl Cymru ac Aelodau’r Cynulliad. Fe’ m siomwyd yn fawr, nid yn eich ymddiheuriad, ond yn y ffaith nad ydych wedi derbyn mai camfarn bendant ar eich rhan oedd y penderfyniad hwn. Rhaid ichi o leiaf dderbyn mai felly y mae ac, wrth ymddiheuro, gyfaddef i’r cyn-filwyr a fentrodd eu bywyd yn Normandi eich bod wedi camfarnu’n ddybryd.

Rhaid ichi hefyd dderbyn eich bod wedi cynnig rheswm dros beidio â bod yn bresennol drwy gymharu dau beth, o ran pwysigrwydd eu galw ar eich amser, nad ydynt yn perthyn i’r un byd—golff a’r digwyddiadau yn Arromanches. Nid oes amheuaeth ynghylch y man y dylasech fod. Dylech fod wedi anfon rhywun arall yn eich lle i’r digwyddiad golffio a dylech fod wedi ymbresenoli yn y cyfarfod coffa yn Arromanches. Yr oedd yn ddyletswydd ac yn gyfrifoldeb ichi wneud hynny. Dywedaf yn gwbl ddidwyll, Brif Weinidog, fod pobl Cymru’n disgwyl ichi ddweud ‘mae’n ddrwg gennyf, gwneuthum gangymeriad, dylwn fod wedi mynd i Arromanches ac ymddiheuraf ichi’n awr yn unol â hynny.’

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn ateb i’r hyn a ddywedwch i’r perwyl y dylaswn fod yn bresennol heb unrhyw amheuaeth, dywedaf wrthy ch na wnaethoch ymdrin â’r mater a ystyriasom pan gawsom y gwahoddiad ym mis Ebrill. Gwnaethom ystyried y dadleuon o blaid ac yn erbyn presenoldeb Edwina Hart yn y digwyddiad a’r dadleuon o blaid ac yn erbyn fy mhresenoldeb i. Yr oedd yr olaf yn ymwneud â’ m safle a’ m statws fel Prif Weinidog, tra oedd y cyntaf yn ymwneud â’r cysylltiad agosach sydd gan Edwina â chenhedlaeth cyn-filwyr yr ail ryfel byd y bu ei theulu’n amlwg yn eu plith. Mae’ch methiant i ymdrin â’r pwynt hwn yn golygu na allaf ymateb yn fanwl iawn i’r pwyntiau eraill a wnaethoch. Ni wnaethoch dderbyn ein bod wedi gwneud y penderfyniad yn ddidwyll. Credaf fod cyn-filwyr Cymru’n derbyn bod y penderfyniad hwn—ymddiheuraf am y ffaith nad oedd ganddynt feddwl da ohono—wedi’i wneud yn ddidwyll. Barnwyd mai cael eu cynrychioli gan Edwina Hart oedd y modd gorau i gysylltu’r Cynulliad, ei Gabinet

your words in order to see whether I am being fair or unfair to you by saying that some of your remarks were verging on political opportunism.

a'i arweinwyr gwleidyddol â'r cyn-filwyr, y cynhaliwyd yr achlysur hwn ar eu cyfer. Gofynnaf ichi fyfyrto ynghylch eich geiriau, Ieuan, i weld a wyf yn deg neu'n annheg â chi wrth ddweud bod rhai o'ch sylwadau'n ymylu ar gyflegarwch gwleidyddol.

3.10 p.m.

**Michael German:** I rise to speak more in regret than in anger, but it has been easy to see the anger on the faces of the veterans that I have met during the last few days. They were clearly distressed by your absence. The issue here is that you represent me, the Assembly and the people of Wales. Therefore, your presence at Arromanches would also have been that of the people of Wales, which is why I regret your absence. Will you reflect on the fact that you are the most senior person in Wales, and that this was the most senior of occasions? Tony Blair wrote eloquently on how important he felt it was for him to be there, personally, and in terms of representing the Government.

**Michael German:** Codaf i siarad gan deimlo mwy o ofid nag o ddicter, ond bu'n hawdd gweld y dictter yn wynebaw'r cyn-filwyr y cyfarfûm â hwy yn ystod y dyddiau diwethaf. Yr oedd yn amlwg bod eich absenoldeb yn peri gofid iddynt. Y mater dan sylw yma yw eich bod yn fy nghynrychioli i, y Cynulliad a phobl Cymru. Gan hynny, buasai'ch presenoldeb yn Arromanches yn bresenoldeb ar ran pobl Cymru hefyd, a dyna pam y mae'ch absenoldeb yn peri gofid i mi. A wnewch fyfyrto ynghylch y ffaith mai chi yw'r un uchaf ei safle yng Nghymru, ac mai hwn oedd yr achlysur uchaf ei safle? Ysgrifennodd Tony Blair yn deimladwy am y ffaith ei fod yn teimlo ei bod yn bwysig iddo fod yno, yn bersonol, ac o ran cynrychioli'r Llywodraeth.

You could have attended your golfing event and the commemoration, if the former was held on Saturday. Can you tell me if that was the case? If so, you could have arrived in Arromanches in time. It was possible for you to have done both. I was distressed to hear you on the radio, stating your reasons for not attending, which were the golfing event, family commitments—you had just been to Finland—and campaigning issues for your party in Wales. If you put all those together alongside the sacrifice that many veterans made—and recognised by their colleagues—to ensure that we have the freedom to be here today, they pale into insignificance. The anger felt by the veterans extends to their families and to the armed forces. I met members of the armed forces who were deeply distressed, particularly given that their colleagues are in Iraq fighting a war that many of us find to be unjust in order to protect the freedoms that they believe to be important. That distress has reached a level which I have not felt in Wales for many years.

Gallech fod wedi mynd i'r digwyddiad golffio a'r cyfarfod coffa, os cynhaliwyd y cyntaf ddydd Sadwrn. A allwch ddweud wrthyf ai felly yr oedd? Os hynny, gallech fod wedi cyrraedd Arromanches mewn pryd. Yr oedd modd ichi fynd i'r ddau. Yr oeddwn yn pryderu eich clywed ar y radio yn datgan eich rhesymau dros beidio â mynd, sef y digwyddiad golffio, ymrwymadau teuluol—yr oeddech newydd fod yn y Ffindir—a materion a oedd yn ymwneud ag ymgyrchu gan eich plaid yng Nghymru. Os cymharwch bob un o'r rhain â'r aberth a wnaeth llawer o gyn-filwyr—ac a gydnabuwyd gan eu cymheiriaid—i sicrhau inni'r rhyddid i fod yma heddiw, maent yn ddibwys mewn cymhariaeth. Mae'r dictter a deimlwyd gan y cyn-filwyr yn ymestyn i'w teuluoedd ac i'r lluoedd arfog. Cyfarfûm ag aelodau o'r lluoedd arfog a oedd yn pryderu'n fawr, yn enwedig yng ngolwg y ffaith bod eu cymheiriaid yn Irac yn ymladd mewn rhyfel y mae llawer ohonom yn ei ystyried yn anghyfiawn er mwyn amddiffyn y rhyddid y credant ei fod yn bwysig. Mae'r pryder hwnnw wedi cyrraedd lefel nas teimlais yng Nghymru ers blynyddoedd lawer.

Like the stalwarts they are, these veterans will take it on the chin and they will accept an apology, although they are distressed by the fact that that apology is not as fulsome as many of them would like. I hope that you agree that your decision was an error of judgment and that if you had known, in advance, the strength of feeling and reaction to your absence this weekend, then you would have made a different decision. I hope, at least, that given the current state of feeling in Wales, you can recognise that your decision was wrong. I also hope that the people of Wales know that you now feel that you made the wrong decision and that if such an event were to occur again—and there will never be another occasion like the one in Arromanches—the First Minister of Wales would represent the people of Wales at such an event.

**The First Minister:** I can only repeat the utmost respect that I have for those who fell, were wounded, or took part in the Normandy landings as well as in other theatres of war. You seem to be trying to extract something from me, and I am not sure what the exact purpose of that is. Your questions on exact details of when arrangements were made, and could something have been done on Saturday, are not relevant. We made the decision in April in good faith. Again, you have only given me one reason for attending the commemoration, namely status or rank. That is not how we read the invitation that we received in April. We believed that it was right to send the Minister with the closest associations with the veterans and world war two. With hindsight, following this weekend, I see that it has caused a terrible upset. I believe that many people are genuinely upset, for which I apologise unreservedly. I wish it had not happened in that way. However, you have to give me a reason, other than status or rank, which you have not yet done, why we should have made a different decision in April when we received the invitation. We made the decision to send Edwina Hart in good faith because she had the right claims given her association with world war two veterans. I regret that it turned out the way that it did and I regret the upset. I will do my best to ensure that the upset is remedied in the best way that I can.

A hwythau'n rhai mor gadarn, bydd y cyn-filwyr yn dygymod â hyn a byddant yn derbyn ymddiheuriad, er mai testun pryder iddynt yw nad yw'r ymddiheuriad hwnnw mor llawn ag y byddai llawer ohonynt yn dymuno. Gobeithiaf y cytunwch mai camfarn oedd eich penderfyniad a phe gwybuasech ymlaen llaw am gryfder y teimlad a'r ymateb i'ch absenoldeb y penwythnos hwn, y byddech wedi penderfynu'n wahanol. Gobeithiaf, o leiaf, yng ngolwg maint y teimlad yng Nghymru, y gallwch dderbyn bod eich penderfyniad yn anghywir. Gobeithiaf hefyd fod pobl Cymru'n gwybod eich bod yn teimlo'n awr eich bod wedi penderfynu'n anghywir ac os ceid digwyddiad o'r fath eto—ac ni fydd byth achlysur arall fel yr un yn Arromanches—y byddai Prif Weinidog Cymru'n cynrychioli Cymru mewn digwyddiad o'r fath.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni allaf ond dweud eto fod gennyf y parch mwyaf tuag at y rhai a fu farw, a glwyfwyd, neu a gymerodd ran yn y glanio yn Normandi yn ogystal â brwydrau eraill. Ymddengys eich bod yn ceisio fy nghael i ddweud rhywbeth, ac nid wyf yn sicr beth yw union bwrpas hynny. Mae'ch cwestiynau am ba bryd yn union y gwnaed y trefniadau, ac a fuasai modd gwneud rhywbeth ddydd Sadwrn, yn amherthnasol. Gwnaethom y penderfyniad ym mis Ebrill a hynny'n ddiwyll. Unwaith eto, nid ydych ond wedi rhoi un rheswm imi dros fynd i'r cyfarfod coffa, sef statws neu safle. Nid felly y deallasom y gwahoddiad a gawsom ym mis Ebrill. Credasom mai priodol oedd anfon y Gweinidog a chanddo'r cysylltiadau agosaf â'r cyn-filwyr a'r ail ryfel byd. Gyda synnwyr trannoeth, ar ôl y penwythnos hwn, gwelaf fod hynny wedi peri gofid ofnadwy. Credaf fod llawer wedi digio'n wirioneddol, ac ymddiheuraf yn llaes am hynny. Byddai'n dda gennyf pe na fyddai wedi digwydd fel hyn. Er hynny, rhaid ichi roi rheswm i mi, heblaw am statws neu safle, na wnaethoch eto, i ddangos pam y dylem fod wedi penderfynu'n wahanol ym mis Ebrill pan gawsom y gwahoddiad. Penderfynasom anfon Edwina Hart gyda phob ewylls da gan fod ganddi reswm dros fynd oherwydd ei chysylltiadau â chyn-filwyr yn yr ail ryfel byd. Gresynaf fod y sefyllfa wedi diweddu fel hyn ac mae'n ddrwg gennyf am y gofid a achoswyd. Gwnaf fy ngorau i sicrhau y gwneir iawn am y gofid hwnnw.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** Do you agree that Wales was well represented in Arromanches by those people who mattered most, namely the veterans? I was proud to see them in such numbers at the commemorations and celebrations on Sunday, and I felt enormously humbled by their presence.

**The First Minister:** We would all agree that those were the sentiments of the whole ceremony. We were all humbled by it, because we were not on the battlefields, and therefore we were not at risk of losing our lives in the way that they were. They were tested—some survived and carried on until the end of the war, some were wounded and many fell. We must all reflect on their huge sacrifice. Insofar as there has been a great deal of ill-feeling about the decision that was made, I can only reiterate my apologies to them and my plea to them to understand that we made our decision in good faith at the time.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Brif Weinidog, yr wyf yn siwr y byddem i gyd yn cytuno â'r hyn a ddywedoch am y bobl a fu farw ar y traethau yn Normandi, ond yr hyn sy'n glir yw na chododd y cwestiwn hwn, a gododd ym mis Ebrill, mewn unrhyw wlad arall. Ym mhob gwlad arall, penderfynwyd mai'r prif weinidog neu'r arlywydd oedd y person addas i'w cynrychioli yn y digwyddiad hwn. Pam, Brif Weinidog, eich bod chi a'ch Cabinet wedi dewis mynd i gyfeiriad gwahanol?

Y camgymeriad gwleidyddol mawr a wnaethoch oedd hyd yn oed ystyried na ddylech fynd. Yr oedd pawb yn disgwyl ichi fynd fel Prif Wenidog Cymru, ac mae pawb yn dal i fethu â chredu na wnaethoch chi hynny i gynrychioli pobl Cymru. Nid wyf yn siarad am eich statws na'ch rôl, ond amdanoch chi yn cynrychioli pobl Cymru. Fel Prif Weinidog, eich cyfrifoldeb chi oedd bod yno.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae eich ffeithiau'n anghywir, Rhodri Glyn. Cyd-ddigwyddiad oedd hyn, ond fel mae'n digwydd, yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, yr Alban ac yng Nghymru, gwnaethpwyd yr un penderfyniad yn union.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Newidiodd Prif Weinidog yr Alban ei feddwl.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** A ydych yn cytuno bod Cymru wedi'i chynrychioli'n dda yn Arromanches gan y rhai pwysicaf, sef y cyn-filwyr? Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld cynifer ohonynt yn y cyfarfodydd coffa a dathlu ddydd Sul, a theimlais yn ostyngedig iawn yn eu gwydd.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddem oll yn cytuno mai teimladau felly a fynegwyd yn y seremoni drwyddi draw. Yr oeddem oll yn teimlo'n ostyngedig o'i herwydd, am na fuom ar feysydd y gad, ac felly nid oeddem mewn perygl o golli ein bywyd fel yr oeddent hwy. Fe'u profwyd—bu fyw rhai a dal ati tan ddiwedd y rhyfel, clwyfwyd rhai a bu farw llawer. Rhaid inni oll fyfyrion ynghylch eu haberth mawr. I'r graddau y bu llawer o ddrwgdeimlad ynghylch y penderfyniad a wnaed, ni allaf ond ailadrodd fy ymddiheuriadau iddynt a'm hapêl iddynt ddeall ein bod wedi gwneud ein penderfyniad yn ddidwyll ar y pryd.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** First Minister, I am sure that we would all agree with what you said about those who died on the beaches of Normandy, but what is clear is that this question, which arose in April, did not arise in any other country. In every other country, it was decided that the prime minister or the president was the appropriate person to represent them at this event. Why, First Minister, did you and your Cabinet choose to go in a different direction?

The big political mistake that you made was to even consider that you should not go. Everybody expected you, as the First Minister of Wales, to do so, and everybody is still incredulous that you did not do that to represent the people of Wales. I am not talking about your status or your role, but about you representing the people of Wales. As First Minister, it was your responsibility to be there.

**The First Minister:** Your facts are incorrect, Rhodri Glyn. It was a coincidence, but as it happens, the exact same decision was taken in Northern Ireland, Scotland and in Wales.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The First Minister of Scotland changed his mind.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Do, ar y funud olaf. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ceisio egluro pam y gwnaethpwyd yr un penderfyniad yn y dair rhan honno o'r Deyrnas Gyfunol. Cyd-ddigwyddiad ydoedd, ond nid yw'n cyd-fynd â'r ffeithiau a ddefnyddioch fel sylfaen i'ch cwestiwn.

**The First Minister:** Yes, at the last minute. However, I am trying to explain why the same decision was taken in those three parts of the United Kingdom. It was a coincidence, but that does not fit in with the facts that you used as the basis for your question.

**David Melding:** First Minister, do you yet understand that most people listening to you this afternoon, indeed most Members of your party, given their mortified silence, will believe that your explanation seems like mere sophistry? It sounds like an argument invented in desperation after the event and not like sound reason that was developed before it. To illustrate that, I would like a response to a simple question. When you and your Cabinet determined your means of representing the Welsh nation, did you, at that time, consult with the veterans and their organisations, and were they in agreement that your decision was appropriate and dignified for the Welsh nation and for those who risked and sacrificed their lives on our behalf?

**David Melding:** Brif Weinidog, a ydych yn deall eto y bydd y rhan fwyaf o bobl sy'n gwrando arnoch y prynhawn yma, a'r rhan fwyaf o Aelodau'ch plaid, yn wir, o ystyried eu distawrwydd siomedig, yn credu bod eich eglurhad yn ymddangos yn ddim mwy na thwyllresymu? Mae'n swnio fel petai'n ddadl a ddyfeisiwyd mewn anobaith ar ôl y digwyddiad ac nid yn rhesymu cadarn a ddatblygwyd o'i flaen. I ddangos hynny, carwn gael ateb i gwestiwn syml. Pan wnaethoch chi a'ch Cabinet benderfynu ar y modd y cynrychiolech genedl y Cymry, a wnaethoch, ar y pryd, ymgynghori â'r cyn-filwyr a'u sefydliadau, ac a oeddent yn cytuno bod eich penderfyniad yn briodol ac yn urddasol i genedl y Cymry ac i'r rhai a fentrodd ac a aberthodd eu bywyd ar ein rhan?

**The First Minister:** I clearly wish that I had done so. If I had set out the pros and cons of Edwina or myself attending, there is a 50:50 chance that they would have said that Edwina should go.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n amlwg y buasai'n dda gennyf pe byddwn wedi gwneud hynny. Pe byddwn wedi nodi'r dadleuon o blaid ac yn erbyn presenoldeb Edwina neu fi, mae yr un mor bosibl y byddent wedi dweud y dylai Edwina fynd.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** There are no changes to report to this week's business. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. However, I point out that, in addition to the changes to Standing Orders to allow joint working with Westminster, the motion will also include changes to Standing Orders Nos. 8 and 9 in order to address anomalies. Following this morning's Business Committee, the Deputy Presiding Officer has determined, under Standing Order No. 24.6, that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration. They are as follows: the Designation of Schools Having a Religious Character and Amendments (Wales) Order 2004, the Education (School Information) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004, the Schools Governors' Annual Reports (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004, the Adult Placement Schemes

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Nid oes unrhyw newidiadau i'w hadrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Mae busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad drafft, y gellir ei weld ar we'r Siambr o dan ddogfennau ategol. Er hynny, tynnaf sylw at y ffaith y bydd y cynnig hefyd yn cynnwys, yn ogystal â'r newidiadau i Reolau Sefydlog i ganiatáu gweithio ar y cyd â San Steffan, newidiadau i Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 8 a 9 er mwyn delio ag anghysonderau. Yn dilyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.6, nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau is-ddeddfwriaeth a ganlyn i bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach. Maent fel a ganlyn: Gorchymyn Dynodi Ysgolion sydd â Chymeriad Crefyddol a Diwygiadau (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau Addysg (Gwybodaeth Ysgolion) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2004, Rheoliadau Adroddiadau Blyneddol Llywodraethwyr Ysgol (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2004, Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Lleoli



(Wales) Regulations 2004, the Care Standards Act 2000 (Commencement No. 14) (Wales) Order 2004, the Children (Leaving Care) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004, the Wales Centre for Health (Constitution, Membership and Procedures) Regulations 2004.

Oedolion (Cymru) 2004, Gorchymyn Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 14) (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau Plant (Ymadael â Gofal) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau Canolfan Iechyd Cymru (Cyfansoddiad, Aelodaeth a Gweithdrefnau) 2004.

3.20 p.m.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 gwrthwynebiad, felly gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gynnog y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol ac, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4, galwaf un aelod o bob grwp gwleidyddol i ymateb yn fyr i'r cynnog.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are at least 10 objections, therefore I ask that the Minister formally moves the business statement and, under Standing Order No. 5.4, I call one member from each political group to respond briefly to the proposal.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.*

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Nid oeddem yn bwriadu gwrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes y prynhawn yma, fel y gwyddoch chi. Gwnaethom godi nifer o faterion y bore yma, ac yr ydym yn dal i obeithio y byddwch yn ystyried y materion hynny, ond nid oeddem yn credu eu bod yn faterion digonol i ni wrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes. Fodd bynnag, yn wyneb ymateb annigonol y Prif Weinidog i'r cwestiwn brys ynglyn â'i fethiant i gynrychioli pobl Cymru a Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn y digwyddiad neilltuol dros y penwythnos, mae'n rhaid i ni ei wrthwynebu. Mae'n rhaid i ni yn awr ofyn am ddadl llawn ar y mater hwn am ei fod yn glir nad yw'r Prif Weinidog yn deall ei rôl na'i gyfrifoldeb. Nid yw'n deall ei fod yn cynrychioli pobl Cymru ac mai ei gyfrifoldeb ef oedd bod yn bresennol. Os gwnaeth Llywodraethau Gogledd Iwerddon a'r Alban yr un camgymeriad, yna camgymeriad ydoedd ac ni ddylai'r dewis fod wedi codi. Dylai'r Prif Weinidog fod wedi bod yn bresennol, yr oedd pobl Cymru yn disgwyl iddo fod yno, ac os nad ydyw'n deall hynny, mae'n rhaid i ni gael dadl am y digwyddiad hwn a dealltwriaeth y Prif Weinidog o'i gyfrifoldeb at y genedl.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We did not intend to oppose the business statement this afternoon, as you know. We raised several matters this morning, and we still hope that you will consider them, but we did not think that those matters were sufficient for us to oppose the business statement. However, given the First Minister's insufficient response to the urgent question about his failure to represent the people of Wales and the National Assembly for Wales in the exceptional event on the weekend, we must oppose it. We must now ask for a full debate on this matter because it is clear that the First Minister does not understand his role or his responsibility. He does not understand that he represents the people of Wales, and that it was his responsibility to be present. If the Governments of Northern Ireland and Scotland made the same mistake, it was a mistake and that choice should never have arisen. The First Minister should have been present, the people of Wales expected him to be there, and if he does not understand that, we must have a debate on this matter and on the First Minister's understanding of his responsibility to the nation.

**David Davies:** The First Minister made the surprising announcement this afternoon that family circumstances and personal connections have more of a bearing on whether someone should represent Wales than rank. In which case, it begs the question of what steps the First Minister has taken to find out what family connections Assembly Members from opposition parties have, as rank is not involved in these big decisions about how Wales is represented. This is a surprising decision, which is probably unique in parliaments across the world. Therefore, I think that we need a full debate—I support Plaid Cymru on this—on the role that the First Minister played, or rather did not play, in commemorating the D-day landings, on how his diary is organised and on how he represents Wales.

**David Davies:** Gwnaeth y Prif Weinidog gyhoeddiad annisgwyl y prynhawn yma i'r perwyl bod amgylchiadau teuluol a chysylltiadau personol yn fwy perthnasol o ran a ddylai rhywun gynrychioli Cymru nag y mae safle. Os felly, rhaid gofyn pa gamau a gymerodd y Prif Weinidog i ddarganfod pa gysylltiadau teuluol sydd gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn y gwrthbleidiau, gan nad oes a wnelo safle â'r penderfyniadau pwysig hyn ynghylch y modd y cynrychiolir Cymru. Mae hwn yn benderfyniad annisgwyl, sy'n unigryw yn seneddau'r byd, yn ôl pob tebyg. Gan hynny, credaf y dylem gael dadl lawn—cefnogaf Blaid Cymru yn hyn o beth—ar y rhan a chwaraeodd y Prif Weinidog, neu'r rhan na chwaraeodd yn hytrach, wrth goffáu'r glanio ar D-day, ar sut y trefnir ei ddyddiadur a'r modd y mae'n cynrychioli Cymru.

**Peter Black:** I support the request made by Rhodri Glyn Thomas, and supported by David Davies, for a debate on this issue. After listening to the First Minister, I am not sure that he fully understands the anger that exists—many people approached me over the weekend and I have received many e-mails on this matter. There is a great deal of disgust and despair about the First Minister's decision, particularly among older people, but also among younger people who do not remember the events that led to D-day and the anniversary that was commemorated on Sunday. We must have a debate on this matter and a proper explanation from the First Minister about why he did not understand that his role was to be Wales's representative at that commemoration.

**Peter Black:** Cefnogaf y cais a wnaed gan Rhodri Glyn Thomas, ac a ategwyd gan David Davies, am gael dadl ar y mater hwn. A minnau wedi gwrandao ar y Prif Weinidog, nid wyf yn sicr a yw'n llawn ddeall y dicter a deimlir—mae llawer wedi dod ataf dros y penwythnos ac yr wyf wedi cael llawer o negeseuon e-bost ar y mater hwn. Mae llawer iawn o anniddigrwydd ac anobaith ynghylch penderfyniad y Prif Weinidog, yn enwedig ymysg pobl hyn, ond hefyd ymysg pobl iau nad ydynt yn cofio'r digwyddiadau a arweiniodd at D-day a'r pen blwydd a goffawyd ddydd Sul. Rhaid inni gael dadl ar y mater hwn ac eglurhad iawn gan y Prif Weinidog ynghylch pam na ddeallodd mai ei rôl oedd cynrychioli Cymru yn y cyfarfod coffa hwnnw.

**Carl Sargeant:** We welcome the business statement on this side of the Chamber. However, I would like your thoughts on discussing the Transport Bill, which is coming through to us, because an important decision will be made on the developments in Wales, and your thoughts on Communities First. I would also like to discuss hearing tests in Wales. The opposition parties would benefit from that, because they did not hear the unreserved apology from the First Minister a moment ago. Also on employment figures in Wales, Wales is working and we cannot let the Tories wreck that.

**Carl Sargeant:** Croesawn y datganiad busnes ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr. Er hynny, carwn glywed eich barn ynghylch trafod y Mesur Trafnidiaeth, sy'n dod drwodd atom, gan y gwneir penderfyniad pwysig ar y datblygiadau yng Nghymru, a'ch barn ynghylch Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Byddwn hefyd yn hoffi trafod profion clyw yng Nghymru. Byddai'r gwrthbleidiau'n cael budd o hynny, gan na chlywsant yr ymddiheuriad llaes gan y Prif Weinidog eiliad yn ôl. Hefyd, ynghylch ffigurau cyflogaeth yng Nghymru, mae Cymru'n gweithio ac ni allwn adael i'r Toriaid ddifetha hynny.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I will take your comments on board, Carl, and come back to you. Rhodri, and the other party business managers, I am sorry that the First Minister's response and apology did not satisfy you. However, I do not intend to schedule a debate on this matter, and I am sure—and if you listen, I will tell you why—that the people of Wales will have heard his apology, given in good faith, and an explanation of the circumstances that led to this situation.

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Ystyriaaf eich sylwadau, Carl, a deuaf yn ôl atoch. Rhodri, a rheolwyr busnes y pleidiau eraill, mae'n ddrwg gennyf nad oedd ymateb ac ymddiheuriad y Prif Weinidog yn eich bodloni. Er hynny, ni fwriadaf amserlennu dadl ar y mater hwn, ac yr wyf yn siwr—ac os gwrandewch, dywedaf wrthy ch y rheswm am hynny—y bydd pobl Cymru wedi clywed ei ymddiheuriad, a gynigiwyd yn ddidwyll, a'i eglurhad o'r amgylchiadau a arweiniodd at y sefyllfa hon.

*Cynnig: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 21.  
Motion: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 21.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000  
(Cychwyn Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2004  
Approval of the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000  
(Commencement No. 5) (Wales) Order 2004**

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

<p><b>The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):</b> I propose that</p>	<p><b>Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):</b> Cynigiau fod</p>
<p><i>the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:</i></p>	<p><i>Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:</i></p>
<p><i>1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 May 2004 on the draft Order, the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 (Commencement No. 5) (Wales) Order 2004; and</i></p>	<p><i>1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyn, ar 18 Mai 2004 ar y Gorchymyn drafft Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2004; ac</i></p>
<p><i>2. approves that the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 (Commencement No. 5) (Wales) Order 2004 is made in accordance with the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 11 May 2004. (NDM1975)</i></p>	<p><i>2. yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mai 2004. (NDM1975)</i></p>
<p><i>Cynnig (NDM1975): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7. Motion (NDM1975): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 7.</i></p>	
<p>Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: The following Members voted for:</p>	<p>Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn: The following Members voted against:</p>
<p>Andrews, Leighton Barrett, Lorraine Bates, Mick Black, Peter Bourne, Nick Burnham, Eleanor Butler, Rosemary Chapman, Christine Cuthbert, Jeff Davidson, Jane Davies, Andrew Davies, Janet Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin Essex, Sue German, Michael Gibbons, Brian Gregory, Janice Griffiths, John Gwyther, Christine Hart, Edwina Hutt, Jane Idris Jones, Denise James, Irene Jones, Alun Ffred Jones, Ann Jones, Carwyn Jones, Helen Mary Jones, Ieuan Wyn Law, Peter Lewis, Huw Lloyd, Val Mewies, Sandy Morgan, Rhodri Neagle, Lynne Pugh, Alun Randerson, Jenny Ryder, Janet</p>	<p>Davies, Glyn Francis, Lisa Graham, William Isherwood, Mark Jones, Laura Anne Melding, David Williams, Brynle</p>

Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Tirlenwi (Blwyddyn y Cynllun a'r Uchafswm Tirlenwi ar gyfer Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Lwfansau Tirlenwi (Cymru), a Gorchymyn Deddf Masnachu Gwastraff ac Allyriadau 2003 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2004**  
**Approval of the Landfill (Scheme Year and Maximum Landfill Amount for Wales) Regulations 2004, the Landfill Allowances Scheme (Wales) Regulations 2004, and the Waste and Emissions Trading Act 2003 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2004**

**Y Llywydd:** Cynigir y bydd y tair eitem nesaf yn cael eu trafod gyda'i gilydd, oni bai bod gwrthwynebiad. Gwelaf nad oes.

**The Presiding Officer:** It is proposed that the next three items be discussed together, unless there are any objections. I see that there are none.

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 26, agrees that the Secretary of State makes the Landfill (Scheme Year and Maximum Landfill Amount) Regulations 2004, which was laid in Table Office on 26 May 2004. (NDM1976)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 26, yn cytuno bod yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn gwneud Rheoliadau Tirlenwi (Blwyddyn Cynllun ac Uchafswm Tirlenwi) 2004, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Mai 2004. (NDM1976)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Landfill Allowances Scheme (Wales) Regulations 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 11 May 2004. (NDM1977)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Lwfansau Tirlenwi (Cymru) 2004 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mai 2004. (NDM1977)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 May 2004 in relation to the draft Order, the Landfill Allowances Scheme (Wales) Regulations 2004; and*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mai 2004 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Lwfansau Tirlenwi (Cymru) 2004; ac*

*2. approves that the Landfill Allowances Scheme (Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Lwfansau Tirlenwi (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r:*

*a) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 11 May 2004; and*

*a) rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mai 2004; a'r*

<p><i>b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 11 May 2004. (NDM1978)</i></p>	<p><i>b) arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mai 2004. (NDM1978)</i></p>
<p>I propose that</p>	<p>Cynigiau fod</p>
<p><i>the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Waste and Emissions Trading Act 2003 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 11 May 2004. (NDM1979)</i></p>	<p><i>Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Deddf Masnachu Gwastraff ac Allyriadau 2003 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2004 y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mai 2004. (NDM1979)</i></p>
<p>I propose that</p>	<p>Cynigiau fod</p>
<p><i>the National Assembly for Wales:</i></p>	<p><i>Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:</i></p>
<p><i>1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 May 2004 in relation to the draft Order, the Waste and Emissions Trading Act 2003 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2004; and</i></p>	<p><i>1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mai 2004 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Masnachu Gwastraff ac Allyriadau 2003 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2004; ac</i></p>
<p><i>2. approves that the Waste and Emissions Trading Act 2003 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2004 is made in accordance with the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 11 May 2004. (NDM1980)</i></p>	<p><i>2. yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Deddf Masnachu Gwastraff ac Allyriadau 2003 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mai 2004. (NDM1980)</i></p>
<p><b>Helen Mary Jones:</b> Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales welcomes these regulations and will support them. We are particularly pleased that there will be no trading in waste quotas in Wales, and we congratulate the Government on its stance on that issue. Two issues cause concern with regard to these regulations, the first of which is bio-degradable waste. It has been put to me from several quarters that we have not made sufficient investment yet in composting, which is not waste that can be recycled in the same way as glass, tin or aluminium. It has been put to me that there are currently not enough facilities. Minister, what is being done to spread existing good practice and what further investment do you plan to make through local authorities in composting facilities?</p>	<p><b>Helen Mary Jones:</b> Mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn a bydd yn eu cefnogi. Yr ydym yn arbennig o falch o weld na fydd masnachu ar gwtâu gwastraff yng Nghymru, a llongyfarchwn y Llywodraeth ar ei safiad ar y mater hwn. Mae dau fater yn peri pryder o ran y rheoliadau hyn, a'r cyntaf ohonynt yw gwastraff pydradwy. Awgrymwyd i mi gan rai mewn sawl cylch nad ydym wedi buddsoddi digon eto mewn compostio, nad yw'n wastraff y gellir ei ailgylchu yn yr un modd â gwydr, tun neu aliwminiwm. Awgrymwyd i mi nad oes digon o gyfleusterau ar hyn o bryd. Weinidog, beth a wneir i ledaenu'r arferion da presennol a pha fuddsoddi pellach y bwriadwch ei wneud drwy awdurdodau lleol mewn cyfleusterau compostio?</p>

The second concern is incineration. You will be aware of the comment made last month by Westminster Minister for Environment, Elliot Morely, who has said that there are now no reasons why local authorities should delay investing in a new generation of incineration plants. You are no doubt aware, Minister—you certainly should be—that that comment caused grave concerns in many communities in Wales that have had to live with the effects of old-fashioned incineration or are concerned that they may have to live with incineration in the future. I share those concerns. Will you acknowledge that incineration can skew waste disposal policy away from sustainable models such as reuse, recycling and composting? Also, will you acknowledge that the 25-year contract demanded by private incinerator providers are a disincentive to the development of the sustainable alternatives and could potentially reduce the flexibility available to local authorities to respond to change and advances in technology?

Yr ail fater sy'n peri pryder yw llosgi. Gwyddoch am y sylw a wnaed y mis diwethaf gan y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd yn San Steffan, Elliot Morely, a ddywedodd nad oes unrhyw reswm bellach i awdurdodau lleol oedi cyn buddsoddi mewn math newydd o weithfeydd llosgi. Mae'n sicr y gwyddoch, Weinidog—dylech wybod, yn sicr—fod y sylw hwnnw wedi peri pryderon dirfawr mewn sawl cymuned yng Nghymru sydd wedi gorfod dygymod ag effeithiau llosgi hen ffasiwn neu'n poeni y byddant yn gorfod dygymod â llosgi yn y dyfodol. Rhannaf y pryderon hynny. A wnewch gydnabod y gall llosgi droi polisi ar waredu gwastraff oddi wrth fodolau cynaliadwy fel aildddefnyddio, ailgylchu a chompostio? Hefyd, a wnewch dderbyn bod y contract 25 mlynedd a fyynnir gan ddarparwyr llosgwyr preifat yn wrthanogaeth i ddatblygu'r dewisiadau cynaliadwy ac y gallai beri bod llai o hyblygrwydd gan awdurdodau lleol i ymateb i newid ac i ddatblygiadau technolegol?

I hope that you find a way to agree with me that the way ahead is more investment in recycling, reuse and composting, and that incineration is not a long-term solution.

Gobeithiaf y gallwch gytuno â mi mai'r ffordd ymlaen yw mwy o fuddsoddi mewn ailgylchu, aildddefnyddio a chompostio, ac nad yw llosgi'n ateb tymor hir.

3.30 p.m.

**Glyn Davies:** We, too, will support the regulations. I do not believe that we have taken the issue of waste disposal sufficiently seriously for many years in Britain. The timetables creeping up on us that mean that we will have to take a significant step forward quickly.

**Glyn Davies:** Cefnogwn ninnau'r rheoliadau hyn. Ni chredaf ein bod wedi ystyried gwaredu gwastraff yn ddigon difrifol ym Mhrydain ers blynnyddoedd lawer. Mae'r amserlenni sy'n dod ar ein gwarthaf yn golygu y bydd yn rhaid inni gymryd cam mawr ymlaen yn fuan.

I do not know whether the reducing profile, referred to in the regulations, regarding the amount of biodegradable waste that can be disposed of by landfill, is an achievable or realistic target. Many environmental objectives have been agreed in principle in the past but have turned out not to be achievable. I do not know whether this is achievable, but I believe that it is right to have ambitious targets, and the Government and all of us who support such measures in the Assembly must do everything that we can to try to achieve those targets. We must also face up to and accept the cost implications of what we are agreeing today.

Ni wn a yw'n bosibl neu'n ymarferol cyrraedd y targed o leihau cyfran y gwastraff pydradwy y gellir ei waredu drwy dirlenwi, y cyfeirir ato yn y rheoliadau. Cytunwyd ar sawl amcan amgylcheddol mewn egwyddor yn y gorffennol ond cafwyd nad oedd modd eu cyrraedd. Ni wn a ellir cyflawni hyn, ond credaf ei bod yn iawn cael targedau uchelgeisiol, a rhaid i'r Llywodraeth a phawb ohonom sydd o blaid mesurau o'r fath yn y Cynulliad wneud popeth a allwn i gyrraedd y targedau hynny. Rhaid inni hefyd wynebu a derbyn goblygiadau o ran cost yr hyn yr ydym yn cytuno arno heddiw.

Following on, to some extent, from what Helen Mary Jones said, I raise the implications of these regulations for incineration. The reduction in the amount of waste going to landfill sites may well mean an increase in the amount of incineration. What assumptions have been made on the amount of incineration that the Minister anticipates bringing forward? This is a contentious issue. In many areas where incineration facilities are proposed, there is huge opposition and yet, in parts of Europe where incineration facilities exist, there is no opposition, even when they are in the middle of built-up areas. We need to know what level of incineration is assumed in the targets contained in the regulations.

Gan ddilyn, i ryw raddau, yr hyn a ddywedodd Helen Mary Jones, cyfeiriaf at oblygiadau'r rheoliadau hyn i losgi. Mae'n ddigon posibl y bydd lleihau maint y gwastraff a aiff i safleoedd tirlenwi yn golygu y bydd mwyn cael ei losgi. Pa ragdybiaethau a wnaed ynghylch maint y llosgi y mae'r Gweinidog yn rhagweld ei gyflwyno? Mae hyn yn fater dadleuol. Mewn sawl ardal lle y mae cynigion i gael cyfleusterau llosgi, mae gwrthwynebiad mawr yn codi ac eto, mewn rhannau o Ewrop lle y ceir cyfleusterau llosgi, nid oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad, hyd yn oed os ydynt ynghanol ardaloedd adeiledig. Rhaid inni gael gwybod pa faint o losgi a ragdybir yn y targedau a geir yn y rheoliadau.

Another point that Helen Mary raised, and which I will touch upon, is how we turn biodegradable waste into compost. Such waste can replace the use of peat in compost and this has become a professional industry. Over recent years, the great increase in interest in gardens and gardening—I am a great enthusiast myself—has led to a huge amount of environmental damage to peat bogs. We must make every effort to ensure that we use any way available to transform biodegradable waste into compost so that it can be used as an alternative to peat, in order to reduce the amount of damage that we are causing to the environment. The Minister should concentrate on that.

Pwynt arall a gododd Helen Mary, ac y cyfeiriaf ato, yw'r modd y trown wastraff pydradwy yn gompost. Gall gwastraff o'r fath ddisodli'r defnydd o fawn mewn compost ac mae hyn wedi dod yn ddiwydiant proffesiynol. Dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae'r cynnydd mawr yn y diddordeb mewn gerddi a garddio—ac yr wyf yn frwd iawn dros hynny fy hun—wedi peri difrod amgylcheddol mawr i fawnoydd. Rhaid inni wneud pob ymdrech i sicrhau y defnyddiwn unrhyw fodd sydd ar gael i droi gwastraff pydradwy yn gompost fel y gellir ei ddefnyddio yn lle mawn, fel y byddwn yn achosi llai o ddifrod i'r amgylchedd. Dylai'r Gweinidog ganolbwyntio ar hynny.

**Mick Bates:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats accept that these regulations will bring the UK scheme to Wales, and we welcome that. However, we are concerned about the monitoring of carbon emissions from landfill sites and want the Minister's assurance that that will be undertaken satisfactorily, as I am sure that he is aware that, last year, carbon emissions increased in Wales. The methane produced from landfill sites is not yet put to good use to provide energy in electricity production, direct heat and so on.

**Mick Bates:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn derbyn y bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn dod â chynllun y DU i Gymru, a chroesawn hynny. Er hynny, yr ydym yn pryderu am y monitro ar ollyngiadau carbon o safleoedd tirlenwi ac yr ydym am gael sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog y bydd hynny'n cael ei wneud yn foddhaol, gan fy mod yn sicr y gwyr fod gollyngiadau carbon wedi cynyddu yng Nghymru y llynedd. Ni wneir defnydd da eto o'r methan a geir o safleoedd tirlenwi i ddarparu ynni ar gyfer cynhyrchu trydan, gwresogi uniongyrchol ac yn y blaen.



The other major issue is biodegradable waste. We remain concerned that, given that there are not any hazardous waste landfill sites in Wales, there will be insufficient monitoring under these regulations to ensure that hazardous waste does not go into landfill sites. Will the Minister explain how he links this with other legislation that classifies hazardous waste, particularly biodegradable hazardous waste? Will that have an impact on householders who may dispose of meat, for example, in their household refuse, which then ends up in a landfill site? You are well aware, Minister, that, in the agricultural sector, under the Animal By-Products Regulations 2003, all dead stock must be disposed of in a hazardous waste site. That is causing that industry immense problems. Will this legislation mean that householders will have to sort out hazardous biodegradable waste so that that too can go to a registered hazardous waste landfill site?

Y pwnc pwysig arall yw gwastraff pydradwy. Yr ydym yn dal i fod yn bryderus, yng ngolwg y ffaith nad oes unrhyw safleoedd tirlenwi ar gyfer gwastraff peryglus yng Nghymru, na fydd digon o fonitro, o dan y rheoliadau hyn, i sicrhau nad aiff gwastraff peryglus i safleoedd tirlenwi. A wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro sut y mae'n cysylltu hyn â deddfwriaeth arall sy'n dynodi gwastraff peryglus, yn enwedig gwastraff peryglus pydradwy? A fydd hynny'n effeithio ar ddeiliaid tai a allai waredu cig, er enghraifft, yn eu hysbwriel ty, sydd wedyn yn mynd i safle tirlenwi? Gwyddoch yn dda, Weinidog, fod rhaid gwaredu pob anifail marw yn y sector amaethyddol, o dan Reoliadau Sgil-gynhyrchion Anifeiliaid 2003, mewn safle gwastraff peryglus. Mae hynny'n peri problemau aruthrol i'r diwydiant hwnnw. A fydd y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn golygu y bydd deiliaid tai'n gorfod didoli gwastraff pydradwy peryglus fel y gall hwnnw hefyd fynd i safle tirlenwi cofrestredig ar gyfer gwastraff peryglus?

**Brynle Williams:** I have three questions. Many people are asking where we will put our contaminated waste after July. I am reliably advised that there is capacity in the principality to accommodate contaminated waste, but has this been looked into? I am sure that there will be companies that have the expertise and the land to assist in solving this problem, but what have we done to investigate this? Tremendous costs will be put on industry in terms of developments for getting rid of this contaminated waste, which at present, I believe, travels as far as Swindon and will possibly have to go considerably further. Some landfill operators may have chosen the easy option in disposing of household waste only. However, we need contractors in place to deal with all levels of waste, including contaminated waste.

**Brynle Williams:** Mae gennyf dri chwestiwn. Mae llawer yn holi ym mhle y rhoddwn ein gwastraff halogedig ar ôl mis Gorffennaf. Cefais wybod o le da fod lle yn y dywysogaeth ar gyfer gwastraff halogedig, ond a ymchwiliwyd i hynny? Yr wyf yn siwr y bydd cwmnïau a chanddynt yr arbenigedd a'r tir sydd eu hangen i helpu i ddatrys y broblem hon, ond beth a wnaethom i ymchwilio i hyn? Bydd costau ofnadwy i ddiwydiant o ran datblygiadau i waredu'r gwastraff halogedig hwn, a aiff cyn belled â Swindon ar hyn o bryd, yr wyf yn credu, ac a fydd efallai'n gorfod mynd yn bellach o lawer. Mae rhai gweithredwyr tirlenwi a allai fod wedi dewis yr opsiwn hawdd o waredu gwastraff o dai'n unig. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni wrth gontractwyr i ddelio â phob lefel o wastraff, gan gynnwys gwastraff halogedig.

**Carwyn Jones:** I am constrained somewhat in what I can say about individual incineration plants as the Minister with responsibility for planning; it is possible that such applications will come before me for me to consider whether they should be called in in the future.

**Carwyn Jones:** Cyfyngir arnaf braidd o ran yr hyn y gallaf ei ddweud am weithfeydd llosgi penodol fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am gynllunio; mae'n bosibl y daw ceisiadau o'r fath i'm sylw er mwyn ystyried a ddylid eu galw i mewn yn y dyfodol.

We should remember that we should consider these regulations in the light of the Wales waste strategy, whereby money and resources have been provided to local authorities to reach certain targets on recycling and composting. The early indications are that Wales as a whole has exceeded the 15 per cent recycling and composting target for 2003-04. That must be the way forward. At present, the amount of biodegradable waste in municipal solid waste is deemed to be about 61 per cent in Wales. It will not be possible to recycle or compost everything, so there will still be a call for landfill, and there may be a call in the future for incineration. We are some way away from being able to say that we are moving towards what is sometimes called a zero-waste strategy, which is probably impossible to achieve in practice, although we can get as close as possible to zero over time.

Dylem gofio y dylem ystyried y rheoliadau hyn yng ngoleuni strategaeth wastraff Cymru, a fu'n gyfrwng i ddarparu arian ac adnoddau i awdurdodau lleol i gyrraedd targedau penodol ar gyfer ailgylchu a gwneud compost. Yr arwyddion cynnar yw bod Cymru yn ei chyfanrwydd wedi rhagori ar y targed o 15 y cant ar gyfer ailgylchu a gwneud compost ar gyfer 2003-04. Dyna'r ffordd ymlaen, yn sicr. Ar hyn o bryd, bernir mai tua 61 y cant yw cyfran y gwastraff pydradwy mewn gwastraff solid a gesglir gan gynghorau yng Nghymru. Ni fydd modd ailgylchu a gwneud compost o bob dim, felly bydd galw o hyd am gyfleusterau tirlenwi, ac efallai y bydd galw yn y dyfodol am losgi. Ni allwn ddweud eto ein bod yn symud tuag at yr hyn a elwir weithiau'n strategaeth dim gwastraff, y mae'n amhosibl ei chyflawni'n ymarferol, yn ôl pob tebyg, er y gallwn fynd mor agos â phosibl at ddim dros amser.

I have seen some good examples of composting. I visited the Wentloog site in Newport where a large amount of composting is carried out. It will not replace peat, which is an acidic compost, Glyn—it is good for growing blueberries and roses but not so good if you want to grow plants that do not like acid soils. I take your point that peat is a finite resource and that we must find acidic composts that are more sustainable than peat. That is a bit of gardening for you.

Gwelais rai enghreifftiau da o wneud compost. Ymwelais â safle Gwynllwg yng Nghasnewydd lle gwneir llawer o gompost. Ni wnaiff gymryd lle mawn, sy'n gompost asidig, Glyn—mae'n dda at dyfu llus a rhosod ond nid yw cystal os ydych am dyfu planhigion nad ydynt yn hoffi pridd asidig. Derbynïaf y pwynt a wnaethoch i'r perwyl mai adnodd cyfyngedig yw mawn a bod rhaid inni ddod o hyd i wrteithiau asidig sy'n fwy cynaliadwy nag ydyw mawn. Dyna ichi bwt am arddio.

On hazardous waste, we have known about this problem for a while. We do not anticipate an immediate problem in July because there are sites outside Wales that would be able to take hazardous waste. I would counsel caution in using the term 'contaminated waste', because we are not talking about contaminated waste here. Hazardous waste includes, for example, computers and electronic equipment that will have to be disposed of in hazardous waste sites. The decision as to whether to apply for a licence to operate as a hazardous waste site lies with the commercial operator. At present in Wales, no commercial operator has come forward with suggestions, but it is not anticipated that there will be a capacity problem this year in terms of disposing of hazardous waste. The fact that there is no site in Wales does not mean that nothing can leave Wales.

Ynghylch gwastraff peryglus, gwyddom am y broblem hon ers tro. Ni ragwelwn y ceir problem ar unwaith ym mis Gorffennaf gan fod safleoedd y tu allan i Gymru a allai gymryd gwastraff peryglus. Byddwn yn awgrymu y dylid bod yn ofalus ynghylch defnyddio'r term 'gwastraff halogedig', gan nad ydym yn sôn am wastraff halogedig yn awr. Mae gwastraff peryglus yn cynnwys, er enghraifft, cyfrifiaduron ac offer electronig y bydd yn rhaid eu gwaredu mewn safleoedd gwastraff peryglus. Y gweithredwr masnachol biau penderfynu a yw am ymgeisio am drwydded i redeg safle gwastraff peryglus. Ar hyn o bryd yng Nghymru, nid yw'r un gweithredwr masnachol wedi cynnig awgrymiadau, ond ni ragwelir y bydd problem o ran cael lle i waredu gwastraff peryglus eleni. Nid yw'r ffaith nad oes safle yng Nghymru'n golygu na all dim fynd o Gymru.

**Mick Bates:** I am grateful that you are attempting to answer the questions that I asked you about the complexities of this legislation. However, do you accept that it is possible now for biodegradable household waste to be classified as hazardous waste and that it could therefore end up in landfill? How does the householder then meet the law under the animal by-products regulations? In your cost-benefit analysis of this, did you cost for the fact that our hazardous waste will be sent to England rather than being landfilled in Wales?

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich ymgais i ateb y cwestiynau a ofynnais i chi ynghylch cymhlethdodau'r ddeddfwriaeth hon. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn derbyn bod modd yn awr ddynodi gwastraff pydradwy o dai'n wastraff peryglus ac y gallai felly gael ei roi mewn safle tirlenwi? Sut y bydd y deiliad ty yn ufuddhau i'r gyfraith wedyn o dan y rheoliadau ar sgil-gynhyrchion anifeiliaid? Yn y dadansoddiad cost a budd a wnaethoch o hyn, a roesoch gyfrif am y ffaith y bydd ein gwastraff peryglus yn cael ei anfon i Lloegr yn hytrach na'i roi mewn safleoedd tirlenwi yng Nghymru?

**Carwyn Jones:** It is difficult to have a cost-benefit analysis on that, because there may well be some sites in England that are geographically closer to certain parts of Wales than sites in other parts of Wales. Therefore it is difficult to give that estimate. On what householders must do, it is not a matter for the householder to take this forward; it would be a matter for those who seek to use the landfill sites. On monitoring, the Environment Agency will be required to monitor, and will be expected to keep an eye on, the sites to ensure that hazardous waste is not being deposited in sites where this has not been licensed.

**Carwyn Jones:** Anodd yw gwneud dadansoddiad cost a budd o hynny, gan ei bod yn ddigon posibl bod rhai safleoedd yn Lloegr sy'n agosach i rai rhannau o Gymru na safleoedd mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Felly, mae'n anodd rhoi amcangyfrif o'r fath. Ynghylch yr hyn y mae'n rhaid i ddeiliaid tai ei wneud, nid mater i'r deiliad ty fynd yn ei gylch yw hwn; byddai'n fater i'r rhai sy'n ceisio defnyddio'r safleoedd tirlenwi. Ynghylch monitro, bydd Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn gorfod monitro, a disgwylir iddi gadw golwg ar y safleoedd i sicrhau na waredir gwastraff peryglus mewn safleoedd nas trwyddedwyd i wneud hynny.

On considering the three items of legislation that are before us, this is a clear way forward in terms of ensuring—

O ystyried y tair eitem o ddeddfwriaeth sydd ger ein bron, mae hyn yn ffordd sicr ymlaen o ran sicrhau—

3.40 p.m.

**Brian Gibbons:** I feel that you have not quite answered Mick Bates's question. A great deal of household waste ends up on landfill sites, even though it can be composted, because of the animal by-products regulations. It is an issue on which we need a clear answer. Many local authorities are not totally clear as to whether it is possible to reuse all biodegradable household waste, which will inevitably include some meat products, and spread it, for example, on farm land or on roadsides. We need some clarity on this.

**Brian Gibbons:** Teimlaf nad ydych wedi llawn ateb y cwestiwn a ofynnodd Mick Bates. Mae llawer iawn o wastraff o dai yn mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi, er y gellid gwneud compost ohono, oherwydd y rheoliadau ar sgil-gynhyrchion anifeiliaid. Mae'n fater y mae'n rhaid inni gael ateb pendant arno. Nid yw sawl awdurdod lleol yn llawn ddeall a oes modd aildefnyddio'r holl wastraff pydradwy o dai, a fyddai'n sicr o gynnwys rhai cynhyrchion cig, a'i ledaenu, er enghraifft, ar dir fferm neu ar ochrau ffyrdd. Rhaid inni wrth rywfaint o eglurhad ar hyn.

**Carwyn Jones:** If waste is classified as hazardous, it must be taken to a hazardous waste site. It is a matter for local authorities, in running their civic amenities sites, for example, to monitor whether members of the public are placing waste in the right containers. That is done at sites run by my local authority in Bridgend. There is a responsibility there. What is regarded and classified as hazardous waste must be taken to hazardous waste sites. The Environment Agency is responsible for issuing guidelines and monitoring the situation to ensure that that happens.

**Carwyn Jones:** Os dynodir gwastraff yn wastraff peryglus, rhaid mynd ag ef i safle gwastraff peryglus. Mater i awdurdodau lleol, wrth redeg eu safleoedd cyfleusterau dinesig, er enghraifft, yw cadw golwg i weld a yw aelodau o'r cyhoedd yn rhoi gwastraff yn y cynwysyddion iawn. Gwneir hynny ar safleoedd sy'n cael eu rhedeg gan fy awdurdod lleol ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Mae cyfrifoldeb yn hyn o beth. Rhaid mynd â'r hyn a ystyrir ac a ddynodir yn wastraff peryglus i safleoedd gwastraff peryglus. Mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn gyfrifol am gyhoeddi canllawiau a chadw golwg ar y sefyllfa i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd.

**Brian Gibbons:** I do not wish to labour the point unduly, but if that is the situation, the message must be conveyed clearly to householders in Wales that if they choose to place meat products in black bin bags with a view to their being disposed of, they are creating hazardous waste. That is the conclusion that you are driving us to accept. If that is the situation, we have real problems in terms of how we address this issue.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni ddymunaf rygnu ar y pwynt hwn yn ormodol, ond os felly y mae, rhaid dweud yn glir wrth ddeiliaid tai yng Nghymru, os dewisant roi cynhyrchion cig mewn bagiau bin du gyda golwg ar eu gwaredu, eu bod yn creu gwastraff peryglus. Dyna'r casgliad yr ydych yn ein gorfodi i'w dderbyn. Os felly y mae, bydd yn wirioneddol anodd inni ymdrin â'r mater hwn.

**Carwyn Jones:** If there are doorstep collections, it is the responsibility of those who collect the rubbish, and not individuals, to ensure that the content of the black bags is taken to the right site. That is how rubbish is currently collected. It will be a matter then for those who—

**Carwyn Jones:** Os oes casgliadau o garreg y drws, cyfrifoldeb y rhai sy'n casglu'r ysbwriel, ac nid unigolion, yw sicrhau yr eir â chynnwys y bagiau du i'r safle iawn. Dyna'r modd y cesglir ysbwriel ar hyn o bryd. Bydd yn fater i'r rhai sydd—

**Eleanor Burnham:** Will you give way?

**Eleanor Burnham:** A wnewch ildio?

**Carwyn Jones:** I do not have time.

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid oes gennyf ddigon o amser.

These regulations represent an excellent way forward in terms of recycling and ensuring that we reduce our reliance on landfill sites.

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn cynnig ffordd ragorol ymlaen yng nghyd-destun ailgylchu a sicrhau ein bod yn dod yn llai dibynnol ar safleoedd tirlenwi.

*Cynnig (NDM1976): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1976): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1977): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1977): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1978): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1978): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1979): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1979): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1980): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1980): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:



Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.46 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.46 p.m.*

**Y Comisiwn a fydd yn Adolygu Adroddiad Terfynol Cynllun y Sector Gwirfoddol  
The Commission to Review the Voluntary Sector Scheme Final Report**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of William Graham and amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw William Graham a gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiau fod

*the Assembly notes the publication of the independent commission's report on the voluntary sector scheme and the intention of the Welsh Assembly Government to report the outcome of consultation upon it to Plenary in autumn 2004. (NDM1981)*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi cyhoeddi Adroddiad y Comisiwn Annibynnol ar y Cynllun Sector Gwirfoddol a bwriad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyflwyno adroddiad ar ganlyniad yr ymgynghoriad i'r Cyfarfod Llawn yn yr hydref 2004. (NDM1981)*

The motion before the Assembly invites Members to note the publication of the independent commission's report on the voluntary sector scheme and the intention of the Welsh Assembly Government to report the outcome of consultation upon it to Plenary in autumn 2004. I am disappointed that amendments to the motion have been tabled, as I thought that we had an understanding in committee that it would be best to table amendments when the final recommendations were made. I appreciate the content of the amendments and the various issues that they raise, but I ask Members to oppose them on the basis that consultation is ongoing and that I wish to receive all views before I make my final decisions on the report.

Mae'r cynnig sydd gerbron y Cynulliad yn gwahodd Aelodau i nodi cyhoeddi adroddiad y comisiwn annibynnol ar gynllun y sector gwirfoddol a bwriad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyflwyno adroddiad ar ganlyniad yr ymgynghoriad arno i'r Cyfarfod Llawn yn yr hydref 2004. Yr wyf yn siomedig bod gwelliannau i'r cynnig wedi'u cyflwyno, gan fy mod yn tybio ein bod wedi dod i ddealltwriaeth yn y pwyllgor mai'r peth gorau fyddai cyflwyno gwelliannau ar ôl gwneud yr argymhellion terfynol. Gwerthfawrogaf gynnwys y gwelliannau a'r gwahanol faterion y maent yn eu codi, ond gofynnaf i Aelodau eu gwrthod gan fod ymgynghori'n mynd rhagddo a chan fy mod yn dymuno clywed pob barn cyn gwneud fy mhenderfyniadau terfynol ar yr adroddiad.

The voluntary sector scheme was established in July 2000 and has built significantly upon the arrangements in place under the previous Welsh Office compact agreement. There is broad agreement that our voluntary sector scheme represents a major step forward for the relationship between Government and the sector in Wales. There is nothing else like it in any other part of the UK or Europe, and many have looked at our scheme with envy. The scheme is crucial because it sets the framework for all of the Assembly Government's work with the voluntary sector. It covers the arrangements that we should have in place for consulting and working in partnership with the sector. It also deals with funding and formalises the role of the voluntary sector in formulating and delivering public policy and much more. The scheme is unique in the UK and places the voluntary sector on an equal footing with local government and the business sector in Wales as formal partners of the Assembly. Through the scheme, we have established the voluntary sector partnership council and a code of practice on funding the voluntary sector, and Ministers have formed strong relationships with the key voluntary organisations working within their portfolios.

Sefydlwyd cynllun y sector gwirfoddol ym mis Gorffennaf 2000 ac ychwanegodd yn sylweddol at y trefniadau a oedd ar waith o dan gytundeb compact blaenorol y Swyddfa Gymreig. Ceir cytundeb cyffredinol bod ein cynllun sector gwirfoddol yn gam mawr ymlaen yn y berthynas rhwng Llywodraeth a'r sector yng Nghymru. Nid oes dim tebyg iddo mewn unrhyw ran arall o'r DU neu Ewrop, ac mae llawer yn genfigennus o'n cynllun ni. Mae'r cynllun yn hollbwysig gan ei fod yn gosod fframwaith ar gyfer holl waith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gyda'r sector gwirfoddol. Mae'n ymdrin â'r trefniadau a ddylai fod ar waith gennym i ymgynghori a gweithio mewn partneriaeth â'r sector. Mae hefyd yn delio â chyllido ac yn ffurfioli rôl y sector gwirfoddol wrth lunio a chyflawni polisi cyhoeddus a llawer mwy. Mae'r cynllun yn unigryw yn y DU ac mae'n gwneud y sector gwirfoddol yn gydradd â llywodraeth leol a'r sector busnes yng Nghymru fel partneriaid ffurfiol i'r Cynulliad. Drwy'r cynllun, yr ydym wedi sefydlu'r cyngor partneriaeth sector gwirfoddol a chod ymarfer ar gyllido'r sector gwirfoddol, ac mae Gweinidogion wedi creu cysylltiadau cadarn â'r prif gyrff gwirfoddol sy'n gweithio o fewn eu portffolios.

The Government of Wales Act 1998, which established the voluntary sector scheme, requires that the voluntary sector scheme in the year following each ordinary election, after the first, shall consider whether it should be remade or revised. This ensures that the relationship between the sector and government in Wales adapts with time and changing demands. Accordingly, on 30 September 2003, I announced that I had appointed an independent commission, chaired by Simon Jones of the Wales Co-operative Centre, to examine the present scheme and to make recommendations as to how it might be remade or revised. I formally place on record my thanks to Simon Jones, Mutale Nyoni, Gaynor Richards, Fran Targett and Dafydd Wigley for their excellent work as commissioners. The commissioners and their staff are to be congratulated on the fact that they produced a high-quality report, written in plain English, working to a tight deadline. This should be a lesson to us all.

The review examined all aspects of the current scheme and, in particular, the way in which the Assembly Government and its partners in local government and other public agencies provide funding to the voluntary sector. The independent commission reported to me on 31 March, and, in the spirit of co-operation and partnership working, I put the commission's findings out to consultation for a period of 12 weeks, which is due to end on 28 June. The report has been widely distributed and is available in hard copy and on the internet. Members will have the opportunity to debate any proposed changes before the scheme is revised or remade. I am pleased that so many voluntary groups took the time to participate and comment on the voluntary sector scheme and its operation so far. It is important that we obtained a fully rounded picture of how well our current scheme has worked over the past three to four years and how we might develop it in future to strengthen our relationship with the voluntary sector, which the report succeeds admirably in reflecting.

Mae Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a sefydlodd gynllun y sector gwirfoddol, yn mynnu y bydd cynllun y sector gwirfoddol, yn y flwyddyn ar ôl pob etholiad arferol, wedi'r un cyntaf, yn ystyried a ddylai gael ei ail-wneud neu ei ddiwygio. Mae hyn yn fodd i sicrhau y bydd y berthynas rhwng y sector a llywodraeth yng Nghymru'n ymaddasu gydag amser ac yn ôl newidiadau yn y gofynion. Yn unol â hynny, ar 30 Medi 2003, cyhoeddais fy mod wedi penodi comisiwn annibynnol, a Simon Jones o Ganolfan Cydweithredol Cymru yn gadeirydd arno, i edrych ar y cynllun presennol a gwneud argymhellion ar y modd y gellid ei ail-wneud neu'i ddiwygio. Cofnodaf yn ffurfiol fy niolch i Simon Jones, Mutale Nyoni, Gaynor Richards, Fran Targett a Dafydd Wigley am eu gwaith rhagorol fel comisiynwyr. Dylid llongyfarch y comisiynwyr a'u staff ar gynhyrchu adroddiad o ansawdd da, a ysgrifennwyd mewn Saesneg syml, a'i gwblhau mewn cyfnod byr. Dylai hynny fod yn wers i ni i gyd.

Gwnaeth yr adolygiad ystyried pob agwedd ar y cynllun presennol ac, yn benodol, y modd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'i phartneriaid mewn llywodraeth leol ac asiantaethau cyhoeddus eraill yn darparu cyllid i'r sector gwirfoddol. Cyflwynodd y comisiwn annibynnol ei adroddiad i mi ar 31 Mawrth, ac, yn unol ag ysbryd o weithio mewn partneriaeth a chydweithredu, cynhaliais ymgynghoriad ar ganfyddiadau'r comisiwn am gyfnod o 12 wythnos, a ddaw i ben ar 28 Mehefin. Mae'r adroddiad wedi'i ddosbarthu'n eang ac mae ar gael ar ffurf copi caled ac ar y rhyngwrwyd. Caiff Aelodau gyfle i gael dadl ar unrhyw newidiadau a gynigir cyn diwygio neu ail-wneud y cynllun. Yr wyf yn falch i gynifer o grwpiau gwirfoddol neilltuo amser i gymryd rhan a gwneud sylwadau am gynllun y sector gwirfoddol a'r modd y mae wedi gweithredu hyd yma. Mae'n bwysig inni gael golwg cynhwysfawr ar y graddau y mae'r cynllun presennol wedi llwyddo dros y tair neu bedair blynedd diwethaf a'r modd y gallem ei ddatblygu yn y dyfodol i gryfhau ein perthynas â'r sector gwirfoddol, y mae'r adroddiad yn llwyddo'n rhagorol i'w hadlewyrchu.

3.50 p.m.

The main findings of the independent commission were that the scheme was a groundbreaking innovation, which is highly valued by the voluntary sector and the Assembly Government today. The scheme is still fit-for-purpose and should not be remade. However, the commission also found that the implementation of the scheme is very much a work in progress and there is more work to do be done.

Prif ganfyddiadau'r comisiwn annibynnol oedd bod y cynllun yn fenter arloesol, sy'n cael ei drysori'n fawr gan y sector gwirfoddol a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad heddiw. Mae'r cynllun yn dal i fod yn addas i'w ddiben ac ni ddylid ei ail-wneud. Er hynny, canfu'r comisiwn hefyd mai gwaith sydd ar y gweill yw gweithredu'r cynllun i raddau helaeth iawn a bod mwy o waith i'w wneud.

The commission has made recommendations that are out to consultation, and I will, therefore, refrain from commenting on those until the consultation is complete. However, it is worth considering the report's key themes and bringing them to your attention. Simon Morris, the chair, referred to them as the three Cs: clarity, consistency and communication.

Gwnaeth y comisiwn argymhellion y ceir ymgynghori arnynt, ac, felly, ymataliaf rhag gwneud sylwadau amdanynt hyd nes y daw'r ymgynghori i ben. Er hynny, mae'n werth ystyried prif themâu'r adroddiad a'u dwyn i'ch sylw. Yr enwau a roddwyd arnynt gan Simon Morris, y cadeirydd, oedd eglurder, cysondeb a chyfathrebu.

There is a need for clarity in terms of ownership and direction. The sector and the Assembly need to be clear who is responsible for the scheme's implementation and guardianship. There should be consistency regarding the application. We need to ensure that there is genuine evenness in applying the scheme between and across the Assembly functions, from individual divisions to the Assembly's agents, which is an important area. Communication is needed in terms of expanding the scheme's accessibility. The commission found that many local organisations did not know of the scheme, how to access it and how to benefit from its existence.

Mae angen eglurder o ran perchnogaeth a chyfeiriad. Rhaid i'r sector a'r Cynulliad ddeall pwy sy'n gyfrifol am weithredu'r cynllun a gofalu amdano. Dylid cael cysondeb o ran ei gymhwyso. Rhaid inni sicrhau y bydd y cynllun yn cael ei gymhwyso'n wirioneddol gyson cyd-rhwng ac ar draws swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad, o is-adrannau unigol i weithredwyr y Cynulliad, ac mae hynny'n faes pwysig. Mae angen cyfathrebu er mwyn peri i'r cynllun fod yn fwy hygyrch. Canfu'r comisiwn fod sawl corff lleol na wyddai am y cynllun, am y modd i'w ddefnyddio a'r modd i gael budd o'i fodolaeth.

The independent review has given us the evidence that we need to judge how effective the scheme has been. It has also enabled us to look at ways in which we can build on the success of the present scheme and move forward to a stronger, still more productive relationship with the voluntary sector.

Mae'r adolygiad annibynnol wedi rhoi inni'r dystiolaeth y mae arnom ei hangen i allu barnu ynghylch effeithiolrwydd y cynllun. Mae hefyd wedi ein galluogi i ystyried dulliau y gallwn eu defnyddio i ychwanegu at lwyddiant y cynllun presennol a symud ymlaen at berthynas gryfach a mwy cynhyrchiol byth â'r sector gwirfoddol.

Once the consultation is complete, I will report the results to the Assembly and will, at that stage, say which recommendations I accept and reject. I will provide full reasons for my actions. I thank the commission and all the Members involved in the voluntary sector partnership. Assembly Members take their roles and responsibilities regarding the voluntary sector very seriously; it is important that we continue to do so. I look forward to hearing Members' views today. There is much food for thought in the report. I am sure that we will have a good debate, in which Members will express their opinions. It has been a relief to have such an excellent commission reporting

Ar ôl cwblhau'r ymgynghoriad, cyflwynaf adroddiad ar y canlyniadau i'r Cynulliad, a dywedaf bryd hynny pa argymhellion yr wyf yn eu derbyn a'u gwrthod. Rhoddaf resymau llawn dros y camau a gymeraf. Diolchaf i'r comisiwn ac i'r holl Aelodau a fu'n ymwneud â'r bartneriaeth sector gwirfoddol. Mae Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn cymryd eu rolau a'u cyfrifoldebau mewn cysylltiad â'r sector gwirfoddol yn wirioneddol o ddifrif; mae'n bwysig inni ddal i wneud hynny. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed barn Aelodau heddiw. Mae llawer i gnoi cil arno yn yr adroddiad. Yr wyf yn sicr y cawn ddadl dda, lle bydd Aelodau'n mynegi eu barn. Rhyddhad i mi oedd cael

to me and to have the work done for me. It is often better for Government to have work undertaken externally, particularly when such work involves looking at itself.

comisiwn mor rhagorol i adrodd i mi a gwneud y gwaith drosof. Mae'n aml yn well i Lywodraeth beri i waith gael ei wneud yn allanol, yn enwedig os yw gwaith o'r fath yn golygu edrych arni hi ei hun.

**Willam Graham:** I propose amendment 1. Delete all after 'Assembly' and replace with:

**William Graham:** Cynigiau welliant 1. Dileu popeth ar ôl 'Cynulliad' a rhoi yn ei le:

*1. welcomes the publication of the final report of the independent commission to review the voluntary sector scheme;*

*1. yn croesawu cyhoeddi adroddiad terfynol y comisiwn annibynnol i adolygu cynllun y sector gwirfoddol;*

*2. notes that paragraph 4.2 (15) of the independent commission's review highlights concerns including short consultation periods, lack of co-ordination between Assembly divisions and complex and long consultation documents using obscure language;*

*2. yn nodi bod paragraff 4.2 (15) o adolygiad y comisiwn annibynnol yn tanlinellu pryderon gan gynnwys cyfnodau ymgynghori byr, diffyg cydgysylltu rhwng adrannau o'r Cynulliad a dogfennau ymgynghori hir a chymhleth sy'n defnyddio iaith astrus;*

*3. further notes the need to establish a procedure for sharing 'best practices' with all voluntary and community schemes;*

*3. yn nodi ymhellach yr angen i sefydlu gweithdrefn ar gyfer rhannu 'arferion gorau' gyda phob cynllun gwirfoddol a chymunedol;*

*4. seeks to promote a wider engagement with the independent sector to support the voluntary sector;*

*4. yn ceisio hybu ymglymiad ehangach â'r sector annibynnol i gefnogi'r sector gwirfoddol;*

*5. acknowledges that a report on the progress issues arising from the review will be presented to Plenary during autumn 2004.*

*5. yn cydnabod y cyflwynir adroddiad ar y materion cynnydd sy'n deillio o'r adolygiad i'r Cyfarfod Llawn yn ystod yr hydref 2004.*

I join the Minister in commending the members of the commission for the excellent and comprehensive report before us. The Welsh Conservative group welcomes the publication of the independent commission's final report. It highlights how much we rely on the voluntary sector, and the support that it provides to those who are less able than ourselves, enhancing the quality of their lives and providing opportunities for wider integration into communities generally. It identifies many everyday activities that we all enjoy, often without giving any thought for volunteers who oversee or provide a service. Most importantly, it highlights the education, ingenuity and skill demonstrated by so many throughout Wales, who seek, without any personal reward, to serve and provide for their neighbours and wider community.

Ategaf gymeradwyaeth y Gweinidog i aelodau'r comisiwn am yr adroddiad rhagorol a chynhwysfawr sydd ger ein bron. Mae grwp Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn croesawu cyhoeddi adroddiad terfynol y comisiwn annibynnol. Mae'n tynnu sylw at y graddau yr ydym yn dibynnu ar y sector gwirfoddol, a'r cymorth y mae'n ei roi i'r rhai sy'n llai abl na ni, gan wella ansawdd eu bywyd a chynnig cyfleoedd i integreiddio'n fwy helaeth â chymunedau'n gyffredinol. Mae'n nodi sawl gweithgarwch gyffredin y mae pawb ohonom yn ei fwynhau, a hynny'n aml heb ystyried o gwbl y gwirfoddolwyr sy'n goruchwylio neu'n darparu gwasanaeth. Yn bwysicaf oll, mae'n tynnu sylw at yr addysg, y dyfeisgarwch a'r medr a amlygir gan gynifer o bobl ledled Cymru, sydd, heb unrhyw elw personol, yn ceisio gwasanaethu a darparu ar gyfer eu cymdogion a'r gymuned ehangach.

The commission indicates that it discovered approximately 30,000 volunteers working throughout Wales, which is a splendid record. In welcoming this report, we need to accept that, in the midst of the successes, there are many problems that we need to address and consider. The voluntary sector is, after all, an enormously complex operation. In rectifying this situation, highlighted in paragraph 4.2 (15), the Assembly can begin to ease the pressure that it places on our voluntary organisations. We highlight this not to condemn, but to provide an opportunity to promote a best practice procedure that will reap the benefits beyond those identified for the voluntary sector.

Mae'r comisiwn yn dweud iddo ddarganfod tua 30,000 o wirfoddolwyr yn gweithio ledled Cymru, ac mae honno'n record wych. Wrth groesawu'r adroddiad hwn, rhaid inni dderbyn bod llawer o broblemau, yng nghanol y llwyddiannau, y mae'n rhaid inni ymdrin â hwy a'u hystyried. Wedi'r cwbl, mae'r sector gwirfoddol yn weithrediad cymhleth dros ben. Wrth gywiro'r sefyllfa hon, a amlygir ym mharagraff 4.2 (15), gall y Cynulliad ddechrau lleddfu'r pwysau y mae'n eu rhoi ar ein cyrff gwirfoddol. Nid er mwyn collfarnu y tynnwn sylw at hyn, ond er mwyn rhoi cyfle i hyrwyddo gweithdrefn arferion gorau a ddaw â manteision ar ben y rhai a nodir ar gyfer y sector gwirfoddol.

The Assembly can stop issuing consultation papers using distant, obscure language full of jargon, which require them to be translated to make them accessible to certain groups. The Assembly Government can stop Assembly divisions issuing several different consultations affecting the same group at the same time, causing logjams in these organisations that impede proper consideration of these issues. Yet again, this is a plea for plain English. The Assembly can begin to issue documents in a format that allows people of all abilities to contribute to these consultations or to understand the policy changes that will affect them. I trust that the Assembly's publications officer will meet, as this report strongly recommends, with representatives from the sector to discuss formats and how their availability may be more widely promoted.

Gall y Cynulliad roi'r gorau i gyhoeddi papurau ymgynghori sy'n defnyddio iaith astrus yn llawn jargon, y mae'n rhaid eu trosi fel y gall rhai grwpiau eu darllen. Gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad atal is-adrannau'r Cynulliad rhag cyhoeddi sawl ymgynghoriad gwahanol sy'n effeithio ar yr un grwp ar yr un pryd, gan orlwytho'r cyrff hynny sy'n amharu ar eu gallu i ystyried y materion hyn yn iawn. Unwaith eto, mae hyn yn apêl am Saesneg syml. Gall y Cynulliad ddechrau cyhoeddi dogfennau ar ffurf sy'n caniatáu i rai o bob gallu gyfrannu i'r ymgynghoriadau hyn neu ddeall y newidiadau i bolisi a fydd yn effeithio arnynt. Hyderaf y bydd swyddog cyhoeddiadau'r Cynulliad yn cwrdd â chynrychiolwyr y sector, fel y mae'r adroddiad hwn yn taer argymhell, i drafod fformatiau a'r modd y gellid eu hyrwyddo yn ehangach.

The commission indicated issues of concern, for example, the impact of Communities First on neighbouring wards. That is often discussed in committee, and I know that the Minister will give it her full consideration. However, it is possible to share best practice procedures with those communities, and we should note that showing such procedures is a universal recommendation of all consultations presented to this Assembly. This report indicates the impact of widely promoting these practices, and it is vitally important that we have an all-Wales approach to the voluntary sector, with equity in application and consistency with regard to funding. The commission indicated another issue of concern, namely the recruitment and training of suitably qualified staff. We have emphasised these concerns and have discussed them time and again in Plenary and in committee, particularly the poaching of qualified community workers by local authorities, taking them

Mae'r comisiwn wedi nodi materion sy'n peri pryder, er enghraifft, effaith Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ar wardiau cyfagos. Trafodir hynny'n aml yn y pwyllgor, a gwn y bydd y Gweinidog yn rhoi pob ystyriaeth iddo. Fodd bynnag, mae modd rhannu gweithdrefnau sy'n amlygu'r arferion gorau gyda'r cymunedau hynny, a dylem nodi bod dangos gweithdrefnau o'r fath yn argymhelliad cyffredinol o'r holl ymgynghoriadau a gyflwynwyd i'r Cynulliad hwn. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn dangos yr effaith a geir o hyrwyddo'r arferion hyn yn eang, ac mae'n hollbwysig inni ymdrin â'r sector gwirfoddol ar sail Cymru gyfan, gan ei drin yn deg ac yn gyson mewn cysylltiad â chyllido. Mae'r comisiwn wedi tynnu sylw at fater arall sy'n peri pryder, sef recriwtio a hyfforddi staff sydd â chymwysterau addas. Yr ydym wedi pwysleisio'r pryderon hyn ac wedi'u trafod dro ar ôl tro yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ac yn y pwyllgor, yn enwedig cipio gweithwyr cymunedol cymwys gan

from community service into administration and the implementation of these sometimes excellent schemes. After all, communities do not exist in isolation. They would not exist without the independent sector's contribution. We must all acknowledge that and ensure a wider engagement with the independent sector. Its contribution to our communities is reflected in the number of sports and social facilities that are provided for employees and their families and which are enjoyed by the wider community. As an aside, Minister, I condemn the loss of an excellent facility in Ebbw Vale, provided by the former steel company, which is now to be demolished and used for housing. That is an example of a first-rate facility suddenly disappearing.

awdurdodau lleol, gan eu tynnu oddi wrth wasanaeth cymunedol at weinyddu a gweithredu'r cynlluniau hyn, y mae rhai ohonynt yn rhagorol. Wedi'r cwbl, nid yw cymunedau'n bodoli ar wahân i'w gilydd. Ni fyddent yn bod heblaw am gyfraniad y sector annibynnol. Rhaid inni i gyd gydnabod hynny a sicrhau ymwneud ehangach â'r sector annibynnol. Adlewyrchir ei gyfraniad i'n cymunedau yn nifer y cyfleusterau chwaraeon a chymdeithasol a ddarperir ar gyfer gweithwyr a'u teuluoedd ac a fwynheir gan y gymuned ehangach. Wrth fynd heibio, Weinidog, gresynaf at golli un cyfleuster rhagorol yng Nglynebwy, a ddarparwyd gan y cwmni dur gynt, y mae bellach i'w ddymchwel a'i ddefnyddio ar gyfer tai. Dyna un enghraifft o gyfleuster o'r radd flaenaf sy'n diflannu'n sydyn.

The independent sector has made, and still seeks to make, continued investment to enhance the environment and quality of life throughout Wales. This report has analysed the complexity, and set out the procedures for, a continuing review of the voluntary sector scheme. It is therefore proper that we should also continue to scrutinise the progress made in implementing the findings of this report and acknowledge the commitment to further debate in the autumn.

Mae'r sector annibynnol wedi buddsoddi'n gyson i wella'r amgylchedd ac ansawdd bywyd ledled Cymru, ac mae'n dal i wneud hynny. Mae'r adroddiad hwn wedi dadansoddi'r cymhlethdod, ac wedi nodi gweithdrefnau ar gyfer adolygu parhaus ar gynllun y sector gwirfoddol. Mae felly'n briodol y dylem ninnau barhau i graffu ar y cynnydd a wneir wrth roi canfyddiadau'r adroddiad hwn ar waith a chydabod yr ymrwymiad i gael dadl bellach yn yr hydref.

**Peter Black:** I propose amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

**Peter Black:** Cynigiad welliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls on the Assembly Government to make it a priority to provide long-term core funding through a dedicated funding stream to local volunteer bureaux as called for in the report.*

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i roi blaenoriaeth i ddarparu cyllid craidd hirdymor, a hynny drwy ffrwd ariannu neilltuedig, i fiwros gwirfoddolwyr lleol, yn unol â'r gofynion yn yr adroddiad.*

I accept that this is a draft report and that it is open to consultation. In tabling our amendment, we are not seeking to short-circuit that consultation in any way. I do not recall an agreement that we should not table amendments, but we did so to highlight a particular aspect of this report, which is important with regard to how we take this review forward. The issue of funding remains. Whenever you talk to any voluntary sector organisation in Wales, that issue is of great concern. The need for core funding over the three-year period, particularly at a local level, is one which many voluntary sector organisations raise with me on a regular basis. It is well worth highlighting that issue as part of our amendment. I hope that the Minister, as part of her response to the report, takes on board the review's proposal to make it a priority to provide

Yr wyf yn derbyn mai adroddiad drafft yw hwn a'i fod yn agored i ymgynghori. Wrth gyflwyno ein gwelliant, nid ydym yn ceisio torri ar draws yr ymgynghori hwnnw mewn unrhyw fodd. Ni chofiaf gytundeb na ddylem gyflwyno gwelliannau, ond gwnaethom hynny er mwyn tynnu sylw at agwedd benodol ar yr adroddiad hwn, sy'n bwysig gyda golwg ar y modd y byddwn yn bwrw ymlaen â'r adolygiad hwn. Mae angen trafod mater cyllido o hyd. Pryd bynnag y siaredir ag unrhyw gorff yn y sector gwirfoddol yng Nghymru, mae'r mater hwnnw'n destun pryder mawr. Mae'r angen am gyllid craidd dros y cyfnod tair blynedd, yn enwedig ar lefel leol, yn un y mae llawer o gyrff yn y sector gwirfoddol yn ei godi gyda mi'n rheolaidd. Mae'n werth tynnu sylw at y mater hwnnw fel rhan o'n

long-term core funding through a dedicated funding stream to local voluntary bureaux. I hope, particularly with regard to local government and at a local level, that those local partnerships are also able to take that matter on board.

gwelliant. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog, wrth ymateb i'r adroddiad, yn derbyn awgrym yr adolygiad y dylid rhoi blaenoriaeth i ddarparu cyllid craidd tymor hir drwy ffrwd ariannu neilltuedig i ganolfannau gwirfoddoli lleol. Yr wyf yn gobeithio, gyda golwg ar lywodraeth leol yn benodol ac ar lefel leol, y bydd y partneriaethau lleol hynny'n gallu ystyried y mater hwnnw hefyd.

Although a huge amount of progress has been made by the Welsh Assembly Government and with regard to the long-term funding of the voluntary sector and in putting it on the map in Wales—and this scheme has blazed a trail for the rest of the United Kingdom—progress is not always reflected at a local level. The National Assembly for Wales must pick up more on that and talk to its partners in local government about dealing with that particular issue.

Er bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi gwneud cynnydd mawr mewn cysylltiad ag ariannu tymor hir ar gyfer y sector gwirfoddol ac wedi rhoi lle blaenllaw iddo yng Nghymru—ac mae'r cynllun hwn wedi torri cwys newydd ar gyfer gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig—ni welir cynnydd bob amser ar lefel leol. Rhaid i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru roi mwy o sylw i hynny a siarad â'i bartneriaid mewn llywodraeth leol ynghylch delio â'r mater penodol hwnnw.

I reiterate William's and the Minister's congratulations to the commission for its excellent report. As both of them said, it is well written and it focuses on the issues and highlights what must be done in the second Assembly to take this scheme forward. The voluntary sector scheme is one of the areas where the Assembly is leading governmental practice, and interest has been shown in the scheme from other parts of the UK, Europe and beyond. We can feel justifiably proud of our voluntary sector scheme. I am pleased, as was the Minister, that the commission found that the scheme is still fit for purpose and should not be redrafted, but I also note that its implementation is a work in progress. I acknowledge that the Minister has also noted that much work remains.

Ategap y llongyfarchion a estynnodd William a'r Gweinidog i'r comisiwn ar ei adroddiad rhagorol. Fel y dywedodd y ddau ohonynt, mae wedi'i ysgrifennu'n dda ac mae'n canolbwyntio ar y pynciau pwysig ac yn tynnu sylw at yr hyn y mae'n rhaid ei wneud yn yr ail Gynulliad i hyrwyddo'r cynllun hwn. Cynllun y sector gwirfoddol yw un maes lle y mae'r Cynulliad yn arwain o ran arferion llywodraeth, a mynegwyd diddordeb yn y cynllun mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU, Ewrop a thu hwnt. Mae gennym le i ymfalchïo yn ein cynllun sector gwirfoddol. Yr wyf yn falch, fel yr oedd y Gweinidog, fod y comisiwn wedi cael bod y cynllun yn dal i fod yn addas i'w ddiben ac na ddylid ei ailddrafftio, ond nodaf hefyd mai gwaith sydd ar y gwell yw ei weithredu. Cydnabyddaf fod y Gweinidog hefyd wedi nodi bod llawer o waith i'w wneud o hyd.

4.00 p.m.

One of the report's key recommendations, apart from the issue of the dedicated funding stream, the three-year period for grant awards and so on, is the strategic action plan. How we take that forward is important. We must have that action plan in place to implement the scheme, but we must ensure that it is not only a plan of well-meaning intentions, but that it also has specific targets and aims, and details about how they will be achieved during the second Assembly. Too many strategic action plans do not do what they claim, because they do not set out specific actions. We, as an Assembly, need to be concise and precise

Un o brif argymhellion yr adroddiad, ar wahân i fater y ffrwd ariannu neilltuedig, dyfarnu grantiau am gyfnod o dair blynedd ac yn y blaen, yw'r cynllun gweithredu strategol. Mae'r modd y bwriwn ymlaen â hynny'n bwysig. Rhaid inni gael y cynllun gweithredu hwnnw er mwyn rhoi'r cynllun ar waith, ond rhaid inni sicrhau nad cynllun o fwriadau da'n unig ydyw, a bod ynddo dargedau a nodau penodol hefyd, a manylion am y dull o'u cyflawni yn ystod yr ail Gynulliad. Ceir gormod o gynlluniau gweithredu strategol nad ydynt yn cyflawni eu hamcan, am nad ydynt yn nodi camau gweithredu penodol. Rhaid i ni,



about what actions we want to put forward and what targets we are seeking to meet in terms of this scheme.

fel Cynulliad, fod yn fanwl ac yn gryno ynghylch y camau y dymunwn eu cyflwyno a'r targedau yr ydym yn ceisio'u cyrraedd yng nghyd-destun y cynllun hwn.

The scheme and code do not apply to policy areas and funding that are not devolved. Although we can influence local government and say what we feel should be done in the areas for which we have responsibility, with which we can deal, we can only bring influence to bear in terms of Whitehall departments and Europe. I hope that the Welsh Assembly Government will take forward the review's recommendation that we enter discussions with relevant Whitehall departments and get some form of concordat in place, whereby they can take on board the principles of our scheme, so that we get a joined-up approach across Wales.

Nid yw'r cynllun a'r cod yn berthnasol i feysydd polisi a chyllid sydd heb eu datganoli. Er y gallwn ddylanwadu ar lywodraeth leol a nodi'r hyn y credwn y dylid ei wneud yn y meysydd yr ydym yn gyfrifol amdanynt, y gallwn ddelio â hwy, ni allwn ond dylanwadu ar adrannau Whitehall ac Ewrop. Gobeithiaf y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn dilyn argymhelliad yr adolygiad y dylem ddechrau trafodaethau ag adrannau perthnasol yn Whitehall a sefydlu rhyw fath o goncordat, fel y gallant ddeall egwyddorion ein cynllun, fel y cawn ddull gweithredu cydgysylltiedig ledled Cymru.

The report highlights the importance of community participation and consultation at a grass-roots level in the implementation of Communities First. I would endorse that as an important part of Communities First. We do not always get that grass-roots interest and participation in Communities First, therefore we need to take that forward.

Mae'r adroddiad yn dangos mor bwysig yw cyfranogiad cymunedol ac ymgynghori'n lleol wrth roi Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ar waith. Cymeradwywn hynny fel rhan bwysig o Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Nid ydym bob amser yn cael y diddordeb a'r cyfranogiad lleol hwnnw yn Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, felly rhaid inni fynd ynghylch hynny.

**Janice Gregory:** As Chair of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, I thank the commission for this report. I am pleased to be able to take part in this debate this afternoon, because this is one of the areas where the Assembly and the Assembly Government are making a difference to good government and public life in Wales.

**Janice Gregory:** Fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, diolchaf i'r comisiwn am yr adroddiad hwn. Yr wyf yn falch o allu cymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon y prynhawn yma, gan mai hwn yw un o'r meysydd lle y mae'r Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mewn llywodraethu da a bywyd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Our voluntary sector scheme is unique in the UK and possibly the world. The commission has recognised that it allows for an unprecedented relationship between Government and the voluntary sector, so much so that other Governments are looking to us and our partnership with the voluntary sector to emulate our success. The commission has said categorically that the voluntary sector scheme is working. It is good for the voluntary sector and for the Welsh Assembly Government, and therefore good for the people of Wales.

Mae ein cynllun sector gwirfoddol yn unigryw yn y DU ac yn y byd o bosibl. Mae'r comisiwn wedi cydnabod ei fod yn caniatáu perthynas ddigyffelyb rhwng Llywodraeth a'r sector gwirfoddol, a hynny i'r fath raddau fel bod Llywodraethau eraill yn troi atom ni a'n partneriaeth â'r sector gwirfoddol er mwyn efelychu ein llwyddiant. Mae'r comisiwn wedi dweud yn bendant fod cynllun y sector gwirfoddol yn llwyddo. Mae'n beth da i'r sector gwirfoddol ac i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ac felly'n beth da i bobl Cymru.

The scheme is fit for purpose and should not be re-made, and the suggestions for improvement must be seen in this context. The Minister has mentioned that the scheme is a work in progress and needs time, but this is not an excuse for complacency. It is most important to me that the Assembly Government works with the voluntary sector to bring about the best conditions for voluntary organisations to be able to deliver in our communities. From my constituency I know the hard work that is put in by countless local volunteers. I know how their work benefits the community and is appreciated by those it affects, who are sometimes the most vulnerable members of the community. However, I also know that many of those involved in running voluntary organisations locally feel that they need better and more appropriate support. They need clear and concise information on policies and funding, and they need funding delivered in an appropriate, stable and timely manner.

Mae'r cynllun yn addas i'w ddiben ac ni ddylid ei ail-wneud, a rhaid ystyried yr awgrymiadau i'w wella yn y cyd-destun hwnnw. Dywedodd y Gweinidog mai gwaith sydd ar y gweill yw'r cynllun a bod rhaid rhoi amser iddo, ond nid yw hynny'n esgus dros ddfaterwch. Mae'n bwysig iawn i mi fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithio gyda'r sector gwirfoddol i sicrhau'r amodau gorau i gyrff gwirfoddol allu fynd â'r maen i'r wal yn ein cymunedau. O'm profiad yn fy etholaeth, gwn am y gwaith caled a wneir gan wirfoddolwyr lleol dirifedi. Gwn am y budd y mae'r gymuned yn ei gael o'u gwaith ac fe'i gwerthfawrogir gan y rhai y mae'n effeithio arnynt, sef y rhai yn y gymuned sydd weithiau'n fwyaf agored i niwed. Er hynny, gwn hefyd fod llawer o'r rhai sy'n ymwneud â rhedeg cyrff gwirfoddol yn lleol yn teimlo bod arnynt angen cymorth gwell a mwy priodol. Mae arnynt angen gwybodaeth glir a chryno am bolisiau a chyllido, ac mae arnynt angen cyllid sy'n cael ei ddarparu mewn modd priodol, cyson ac amserol.

The challenge for the Assembly Government is to deliver this support with minimum bureaucracy and maximum effectiveness. There needs to be better communication, information and support for smaller organisations. The Assembly Government should promote and support volunteering in the most positive light, and consider maximising community participation in the Communities First programme.

Yr her i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yw iddi gynnig y cymorth hwn gyda'r lleiaf posibl o fiwrocratiaeth ac yn y modd mwyaf effeithiol. Rhaid wrth well cyfathrebu, gwybodaeth a chymorth i gyrff llai. Dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hyrwyddo a chefnogi gwirfoddoli yn y modd mwyaf ffaithiol, ac ystyried y modd i sicrhau'r cyfranogi mwyaf posibl gan y gymuned yn rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

We have made excellent progress in ensuring access to suitable and affordable community venues, through the community facilities and activities programme. Only last week I visited Maesteg town hall, which is a much loved and much used local facility, which is home to many groups and activities in the town, and has received a substantial grant from this programme. I welcome this progress, but we must also address the other key challenges for individual voluntary organisations, namely recruitment, training and development, and the retention of suitable staff and trustees or management committee members.

Gwnaethom gynnydd rhagorol wrth sicrhau mynediad i ganolfannau cymunedol addas a fforddiadwy, drwy'r rhaglen cyfleusterau a gweithgareddau cymunedol. Nid oes ond wythnos ers imi fod yn neuadd tref Maesteg, cyfleuster lleol poblogaidd a ddefnyddir yn aml, sy'n gartref i sawl grwp a gweithgarwch yn y dref, a chafodd grant sylweddol drwy'r rhaglen hon. Croesawaf y cynnydd hwn, ond rhaid inni ymdrin hefyd â'r heriau allweddol eraill i gyrff gwirfoddol unigol, sef recriwtio, hyfforddi a datblygu, a chadw staff addas ac ymddiriedolwyr neu aelodau pwyllgorau rheoli.

The guide to voluntary sector grants needs to be constantly updated, to include third party sources, and funding from non-devolved sources. For example, I know the impact that lottery funding can have, provided that it is accessible, in terms of the information provided to local groups and the support for groups during the application process. Therefore, it is vital that all organisations operating in Wales—such as the lottery, which is not a devolved function—are aware of the principles and practices under the voluntary sector scheme and, as far as possible, adhere to those same principles and practices themselves.

Rhaid diweddarau'r arweiniad i grantiau sector gwirfoddol yn gyson, i gynnwys ffynonellau trydydd parti, ac ariannu o ffynonellau sydd heb eu datganoli. Er enghraifft, gwn am effaith ddichonol cyllid y loteri, ar yr amod y gellir ei gyrraedd, drwy'r wybodaeth a roddir i grwpiau lleol a'r cymorth i grwpiau yn ystod y broses ymgeisio. Gan hynny, mae'n hollbwysig sicrhau bod yr holl gyrff sy'n gweithredu yng Nghymru—fel y loteri, sy'n swyddogaeth nas datganolwyd—yn gwybod am yr egwyddorion a'r arferion o dan gynllun y sector gwirfoddol a'u bod, hyd y bo modd, yn dal at yr un egwyddorion ac arferion eu hunain.

The Assembly Government must work in a concerted and proactive manner, across departments, third-party organisations and different levels of government to deliver resources and support to the front-line with minimum red tape and maximum effectiveness. I share the Minister's disappointment that two amendments have been tabled at this time, especially as the two Members who spoke to them had the opportunity, in committee, to question Simon Jones and make comments on the report. Neither Member took that opportunity, and I believe that this is a case of political posturing at its worst.

Rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad weithio'n gydunol ac yn rhagweithiol, ar draws adrannau, cyrff trydydd parti a gwahanol lefelau llywodraeth i roi adnoddau a chymorth yn y rheng flaen gyda'r lleiaf posibl o fiwrocratiaeth ac yn y modd mwyaf effeithiol. Yr wyf yr un mor siomedig â'r Gweinidog bod dau welliant wedi'u cyflwyno ar yr adeg hon, yn enwedig gan fod y ddau Aelod a'u trafododd wedi cael cyfle, yn y pwyllgor, i holi Simon Jones a gwneud sylwadau am yr adroddiad. Ni fanteisiodd y naill Aelod na'r llall ar y cyfle hwnnw, a chredaf mai ymagweddu gwleidyddol ar ei waethaf yw hyn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** As with other Members who have spoken on this matter, the Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales group is happy to welcome this report and we congratulate members of the commission on their report and on the manner in which they collected evidence. I feel that I got a jolly good grilling, appropriately, when I went before the Commission to give evidence, and I found the experience challenging and useful.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yn yr un modd ag Aelodau eraill sydd wedi siarad ar y mater hwn, mae grwp Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn falch o groesawu'r adroddiad hwn a llongyfarchwn aelodau'r comisiwn ar eu hadroddiad ac ar y modd y casglasant dystiolaeth. Teimlaf imi gael fy nghroesholi'n drwyadl, a hynny'n briodol, pan euthum gerbron y Comisiwn i roi tystiolaeth, a chefais y profiad yn un buddiol ac ymestynnol.

Like the Minister, we in the main opposition party were under the impression that there was a convention or agreement, if not a firm understanding, that documents to be released for consultation were not subject to amendment. It might be helpful for this matter to be clarified in the Business Committee. In the light of that understanding, we have not tabled amendments and we will abstain on those amendments tabled, although we share many of the concerns raised and look to support them at a future date. If this is the worst example of political posturing that Janice Gregory has ever seen, then she has obviously led a sheltered life as it did not feel like that to me. I thought it was a genuine attempt to raise serious points but, from the party's point of view, ill-

Yn yr un modd â'r Gweinidog, yr oeddem ni yn y brif wrthblaid o dan yr argraff bod confensiwn neu gytundeb, os nad dealltwriaeth bendant, nad oedd gwelliannau i'w cyflwyno mewn dadleuon ar ddogfennau a gyhoeddir ar gyfer ymgynghori. Gallai fod yn fuddiol egluro'r mater hwn yn y Pwyllgor Busnes. Yng ngoleuni'r ddealltwriaeth honno, nid ydym wedi cyflwyno gwelliannau ac ymataliwn rhag pleidleisio ar y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd, er ein bod yn rhannu llawer o'r pryderon a godwyd ac yn bwriadu eu cefnogi yn y dyfodol. Os mai hon yw'r enghraifft waethaf o ymagweddu gwleidyddol a welodd Janice Gregory, rhaid ei bod wedi byw yn y cysgodion gan nad felly yr oedd yn ymddangos i mi. Credais ei fod yn ymdrech ddilys i godi pwyntiau

timed.

difrif ond, o safbwynt y blaid, nid oedd yn amserol.

I will make some specific comments about some issues raised in the report, and I look forward to taking them further in a detailed response as part of the consultation process, in Plenary debates and in committee. My first comment is on the partnership council itself. I believe that the Assembly must make a decision about the partnership council and, indeed, the sector must contribute to that decision. Do we want it to be a symbolic gathering of Assembly Members and sector representatives around a table, meeting to congratulate each other, nod, smile pleasantly and then go away—which is how it too often feels at the moment—or do we want it to be a real and serious forum for debate between the Assembly, the Assembly Government and the sector? My view, and that of my party, is that we need it to be a real forum for debate, and some suggestions in the report—though there are some other items that I would like to see added—would help to make that a reality. For example, the report suggests that the partnership council should scrutinise Government practice much more, follow through on outcomes of ministerial meetings, and examine examples of non-compliance with the scheme that arise from the National Assembly Government. I would extend that to include Assembly sponsored public bodies.

Gwnaf rai sylwadau penodol am rai materion a godir yn yr adroddiad, ac edrychaf ymlaen at ymdrin â hwy ymhellach mewn ymateb manwl fel rhan o'r broses ymgynghori, mewn dadleuon yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ac yn y pwyllgor. Mae fy sylw cyntaf yn ymwneud â'r cyngor partneriaeth ei hun. Credaf fod rhaid i'r Cynulliad wneud penderfyniad ynghylch y cyngor partneriaeth ac, yn wir, rhaid i'r sector gyfrannu at y penderfyniad hwnnw. A ydym am iddo fod yn gasgliad symbolaidd o Aelodau Cynulliad a chynrychiolwyr y sector wrth y bwrdd, sy'n cwrdd i longyfarch ei gilydd, nodio, gwenu'n ddymunol ac wedyn mynd i ffwrdd—gan mai felly y teimlir ydyw'n rhy aml ar hyn o bryd—neu a ydym am iddo fod yn fforwm dilys a difrif ar gyfer dadlau rhwng y Cynulliad, Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r sector? Fy marn i, a barn fy mhlaid, yw bod arnom angen iddo fod yn fforwm dilys ar gyfer dadlau, ac mae rhai awgrymiadau yn yr adroddiad—er bod rhai eitemau eraill y carwn weld eu hychwanegu—a fyddai o gymorth i wireddu hynny. Er enghraifft, mae'r adroddiad yn awgrymu y dylai'r cyngor partneriaeth graffu'n helaethach o lawer ar arferion y Llywodraeth, dilyn canlyniadau cyfarfodydd gweinidogol, ac edrych ar enghreifftiau o ddiffyg cydymffurfio â'r cynllun sy'n codi o Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Byddwn yn ymestyn hynny i gynnwys cyrff cyhoeddus a noddur gan y Cynulliad.

I would also suggest that it needs to be an opportunity for National Assembly Members to scrutinise the sector—a practice that has been lacking. Issues of accountability have been raised in the report, and we need to make the dialogue more dynamic and more challenging. In order to achieve that, we will probably need an independent chair, but to achieve the connection with the Government, we also need the Minister in attendance. The Minister and the committee should consider those issues in more detail. I had my own concerns when that model was brought before the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, but those concerns have not been realised. It is more effective to have an independent chair, but we must ensure that a Minister is present.

Byddwn yn awgrymu hefyd y dylai fod yn gyfle i Aelodau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gael craffu ar y sector—arfer nas cafwyd. Codwyd materion sy'n ymwneud ag atebolrwydd yn yr adroddiad, a rhaid inni beri i'r ddeialog fod yn fwy deinamig ac ymestynnol. Er mwyn cyflawni hynny, mae'n debyg y bydd arnom angen cadeirydd annibynnol, ond er mwyn cael y cysylltiad â'r Llywodraeth, rhaid i'r Gweinidog fod yn bresennol hefyd. Dylai'r Gweinidog a'r pwyllgor ystyried y materion hynny'n fwy manwl. Yr oedd gennyf bryderon fy hun pan ddaethpwyd â'r model hwnnw gerbron y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, ond nid yw'r pryderon hynny wedi'u gwireddu. Mwy effeithiol yw cael cadeirydd annibynnol, ond rhaid inni sicrhau y bydd Gweinidog yn bresennol.

On some of the recommendations with regard to the Assembly Government's own practice, it is essential to have consistency of approach across divisions. Some divisions in the Assembly Government side of the civil service have an effective relationship, while others, I submit politely, are disastrous and are simply not aware that they ought to have such a relationship. I put it strongly to the Minister that there must be some comeback on those Ministers and heads of division who are not taking their role in the scheme seriously. Again, that relates to what I have said about the role of the partnership council. The Government of Wales has to insist on a positive approach from all Assembly sponsored public bodies, and I am sure that the Minister would agree that the practice here is patchy. There is some good practice that can be built upon and there is some poor practice.

Ynghylch rhai o'r argymhellion sy'n ymwneud ag arferion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei hun, mae'n hollbwysig cael dull gweithredu cyson ar draws is-adrannau. Mae perthynas effeithiol gan rai is-adrannau ar ochr Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r gwasanaeth sifil, tra bo eraill, yr wyf yn awgrymu'n gwrtais, yn drychinebus ac ni wyddant o gwbl eu bod i gael perthynas o'r fath. Dywedaf yn bendant wrth y Gweinidog fod rhaid cael rhyw feirniadaeth ar y Gweinidogion a'r penaethiaid is-adrannau hynny nad ydynt yn cymryd eu rôl yn y cynllun o ddifrif. Unwaith eto, mae hynny'n ymwneud â'r hyn a ddywedais am rôl y cyngor partneriaeth. Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru fynnu ymagwedd gadarnhaol gan yr holl gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, ac yr wyf yn siwr y cytunai'r Gweinidog fod yr ymarfer yn anghyson yn hyn o beth. Mae rhai arferion da y gellir adeiladu ar eu sail ac mae rhai arferion gwael.

4.10 p.m.

I associate myself with many of Peter Black's comments on funding. We must move to a three-year funding cycle, and, as the report suggests, we need much more transparency on what resources are going to non-governmental organisations and how that is being done.

Cysylltaf fy hun â llawer o'r hyn a ddywedodd Peter Black am gyllido. Rhaid inni symud at gylch cyllido tair blynedd, ac, fel y mae'r adroddiad yn awgrymu, mae arnom angen llawer mwy o dryloywder ynghylch yr adnoddau a roddir i gyrff y tu allan i lywodraeth a'r modd y'u rhoddir.

On core services and how they are funded, I believe that the voluntary sector has a role in funding innovative, ground-breaking services. I have used the example of advocacy before; ten years ago, advocacy for children in care was an innovative, ground-breaking service, now it is a mainstream service. We must move to the point where those mainstream services are fully funded.

Ynghylch gwasanaethau craidd a'r dull o'u cyllido, credaf fod rôl i'r sector gwirfoddol wrth gyllido gwasanaethau newydd ac arloesol. Yr wyf wedi cyfeirio at eiriolaeth fel enghraifft o'r blaen; ddeng mlynedd yn ôl, yr oedd eiriolaeth ar gyfer plant mewn gofal yn wasanaeth newydd ac arloesol, ond mae bellach yn wasanaeth sydd yn y brif ffrwd. Rhaid inni symud tuag at gyllido'r gwasanaethau prif ffrwd hynny'n llawn.

As I said, there are issues of accountability for the sector that we will need to come back to, and there are issues of awareness of accountability, particularly for the smaller groups. This scheme is a good beginning for the National Assembly's relationship with the voluntary sector, but much more work needs to be done.

Fel y dywedais, mae materion sy'n ymwneud ag atebolrwydd yn y sector y bydd yn rhaid inni ddod yn ôl atynt, ac mae materion sy'n ymwneud ag ymwybyddiaeth o atebolrwydd, yn enwedig yn achos y grwpiau llai. Mae'r cynllun hwn yn fan cychwyn da ar gyfer perthynas y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol â'r sector gwirfoddol, ond mae angen llawer mwy o waith.

**Sandy Mewies:** As other Members have said, we discussed the report fully in the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, and I, like many others, have spoken to my local voluntary organisation to see what its needs are.

This report is important, as it has given everybody the opportunity to have an input into the existing scheme. I agree with the conclusion that the scheme should not be re-made, but certain matters need to go out to consultation and need to be addressed. Generally speaking, the commissioners have listened to the views of the voluntary sector, and I congratulate them for the work that they have done.

People have talked about funding, and I think that there is general consensus among Members on this issue. I make no apologies for returning to this point. Continuity of funding is important, because it is the only way to ensure that posts stay in place and that schemes continue. People need to know that they will have money for next year and so on, or staff will not stay in post. Core funding, particularly for strategic voluntary organisations, needs to be in place. As other Members have said, three-year funding is invaluable. We are asking voluntary and not-for-profit organisations to carry out many of the initiatives in which we strongly believe, and, therefore, we need to treat them as they deserve to be treated, namely as professional organisations.

I do not have much else to say except that communication can be improved. We must continue to fund through organisations such as Flintshire Local Voluntary Council, because it knows its local needs. It needs money so that it can recognise those local needs and come forward with the innovative schemes that we have come to expect from the voluntary sector.

Training and community development plays an ever-increasing role in the sector, and legal requirements make appropriate training more important than ever. We must also always look to the needs of trustees and make them aware of their responsibilities and enable them to carry them out. I had much more to say but most of it has already been said. I commend the scheme to you and look forward to getting the results of, and hearing about, the consultation process.

**Sandy Mewies:** Fel y dywedodd Aelodau eraill, yr ydym wedi trafod yr adroddiad yn llawn yn y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, ac yr wyf fi, fel sawl un arall, wedi siarad â'r corff gwirfoddol yn fy ardal i ganfod ei anghenion.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn un pwysig, gan ei fod wedi rhoi cyfle i bawb roi ei farn am y cynllun presennol. Cytunaf â'r casgliad na ddylid ail-wneud y cynllun, ond rhaid ymgynghori ar rai materion ac ymdrin â hwy. A siarad yn gyffredinol, mae'r comisiynwyr wedi gwrandao ar farn y sector gwirfoddol, ac fe'u llongyfarchaf ar y gwaith a wnaethant.

Mae rhai wedi sôn am gyllido, a chredaf fod consensws cyffredinol ymysg Aelodau ar y mater hwn. Nid ymddiheuraf am fynd yn ôl at y pwynt hwn. Mae'n bwysig cael parhad mewn cyllid, gan mai dim ond felly y gellir sicrhau y bydd swyddi a chynlluniau'n parhau. Rhaid i bobl gael gwybod y bydd arian ar eu cyfer y flwyddyn nesaf ac yn y blaen, neu nid erys staff yn eu swyddi. Rhaid cael cyllid craidd, yn enwedig ar gyfer cyrff gwirfoddol strategol. Fel y dywedodd Aelodau eraill, mae cyllido dros dair blynedd yn amhrisiadwy. Yr ydym yn gofyn i gyrff gwirfoddol a rhai nad ydynt yn bod er mwyn gwneud elw gyflawni llawer o'r mentrau y credwn yn gryf ynddynt, ac, felly, rhaid i ni eu trin yn ôl eu haeddiant, sef fel cyrff proffesiynol.

Nid oes gennyf fawr ddim arall i'w ddweud heblaw bod modd cyfathrebu'n well. Rhaid inni ddal i gyllido drwy gyrff fel Cyngor Gwirfoddol Lleol Sir y Fflint, gan ei fod yn gwybod am ei anghenion lleol. Mae arno angen arian fel y gall gydnabod yr anghenion lleol hynny a chynnig y cynlluniau arloesol y daethom i'w disgwyl gan y sector gwirfoddol.

Mae rôl gynyddol i hyfforddi a datblygu cymunedol yn y sector, ac mae hyfforddiant priodol yn bwysicach nag erioed oherwydd gofynion cyfreithol. Yn ogystal â hynny, rhaid inni ystyried anghenion ymddiriedolwyr bob amser a pheri iddynt fod yn ymwybodol o'u cyfrifoldebau a'u galluogi i'w cyflawni. Yr oedd gennyf lawer mwy i'w ddweud ond dywedwyd y rhan fwyaf ohono eisoes. Cymeradwyaf y cynllun i chi ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld canlyniadau'r broses ymgynghori a chlywed amdanynt.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That was a commendable speech.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr oedd honno'n araith gymeradwy.

**Mick Bates:** I join with the general remarks about how supportive the Assembly is of this process, and we look forward to hearing your response, Minister, to the large number of recommendations from the commission. It goes without saying that, as a great many of us have been involved in volunteering, we understand how highly it is valued in the community. I begin with that point because one of the recommendations is that we should make greater use of the national media to promote volunteering. It is often overlooked that, many years ago, volunteers could give much of their time to the voluntary sector, but the increasing pressures of life mean that five volunteers are now needed to fulfil the amount of work carried out by one volunteer 15 years ago. The concept must be promoted further.

**Mick Bates:** Ategaf y sylwadau cyffredinol am gefnogaeth y Cynulliad i'r broses hon, ac edrychwn ymlaen at glywed eich ymateb, Weinidog, i'r nifer mawr o argymhellion a gafwyd gan y comisiwn. Afraid dweud, gan fod cynifer ohonom wedi ymwneud â gwirfoddoli, ein bod yn deall cymaint y'i trysorir yn y gymuned. Dechreuaf ar y pwynt hwnnw gan mai un o'r argymhellion yw y dylem wneud mwy o ddefnydd o'r cyfryngau cenedlaethol i hyrwyddo gwirfoddoli. Anghofir yn aml fod gwirfoddolwyr yn gallu rhoi llawer o'u hamser i'r sector gwirfoddol flynyddoedd lawer yn ôl, ond oherwydd y pwysau cynyddol a geir mewn bywyd mae angen pum gwirfoddolwr bellach i gyflawni'r gwaith a wneid gan un gwirfoddolwr 15 mlynedd yn ôl. Rhaid hyrwyddo'r cysyniad hwn.

The key issue for me is embodied in recommendations 24, 25 and 26, namely core funding. Other people have raised this issue. All too often, we rely on goodwill to deliver statutory services. That is a risky business, and I want a greater examination of the requirement of core funding to many key operations. For example, the citizens advice bureaux deliver much good work but are not given core funding to fulfil that duty. I know the organisations well—they are separate organisations and charities—and there is a need, perhaps, to consider restructuring. However, through your good offices, Minister, you should take a more proactive role in considering how we can overcome the current barriers to core funding and consider those recommendations closely, so that we can get a vision from the WCVA of those organisations that deliver statutory requirements to ensure that they receive core funding.

Yn fy marn i, mae'r mater pwysicaf wedi'i ymgorffori yn argymhellion 24, 25 a 26, sef cyllido craidd. Mae eraill wedi codi'r mater hwn. Yn rhy aml o lawer, yr ydym yn dibynnu ar ewyllys da i ddarparu gwasanaethau statudol. Mae hynny'n golygu mentro, ac yr wyf am weld mwy o ymchwil i'r angen am gyllido craidd ar gyfer llawer o weithrediadau allweddol. Er enghraifft, mae'r canolfannau cyngor ar bopeth yn gwneud llawer o waith da ond ni chânt gyllid craidd i gyflawni'r ddyletswydd honno. Yr wyf yn gwybod am y cyrff yn iawn—cyrff ac elusennau ar wahân ydynt—ac efallai fod angen ystyried aildrefnu. Fodd bynnag, drwy eich cymwynasgarwch chi, Weinidog, dylech ymgymryd â rôl fwy rhagweithiol wrth ystyried y modd y gallwn chwalu'r rhwystrau presennol rhag cyllido craidd ac ystyried yr argymhellion hynny'n fanwl, fel y gall Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru gyfleu i ni pa gyrff sy'n cyflawni gofynion statudol er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn cael cyllid craidd.

Similarly, recommendation 25, I believe, refers to a manual so that everyone understands the process of bidding for money. Many of us involved in that process know of the anxiety and the disasters of trying to find your way through funder finder, lottery bids, and so on. A simpler process—a mantra that we have had for many years—would be of great assistance to many organisations.

Yn yr un modd, mae argymhelliad 25, yr wyf yn credu, yn cyfeirio at yr angen am lawlyfr fel y bydd pawb yn deall y broses ymgeisio am arian. Mae llawer ohonom sy'n ymwneud â'r broses honno'n gwybod am y pryder a'r troeon trwstan a geir wrth geisio darganfod cyllid, ymgeisio i'r loteri, ac yn y blaen. Byddai proses symlach—sy'n arwyddair gennym ers blynyddoedd lawer—yn gymorth mawr i lawer o gyrff.

<p>There are many quotes in the report. One of them, which is from an Assembly Government official, it appears, says:</p>	<p>Mae llawer o ddyfyniadau yn yr adroddiad. Un ohonynt, gan un o swyddogion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn ôl pob golwg, yw:</p>
<p>‘there is growing frustration...at the gap between the rhetoric and the reality’.</p>	<p>mae rhwystredigaeth gynyddol ynghylch y bwlch rhwng y rhethreg a’r realiti.</p>
<p>I find this quite often in voluntary organisations, because this whole process has raised expectations. We need to have a clear timetable of consultations. Many organisations do not have the capacity to respond to every consultation. It would help enormously if people were clearly designated in the WCVA to co-ordinate particular responses to consultations. We also need to consider the student sector, which is not funded well enough to embody all the enthusiasm and energy of young people in further and higher education. I have been contacted several times by the student volunteering group about its lack of funding to engage with its energy and to make use of it in Wales. I hope that you can get there through this process.</p>	<p>Gwelaf hynny’n eithaf aml mewn cyrff gwirfoddol, gan fod y broses hon wedi codi gobeithion. Rhaid inni gael amserlen bendant ar gyfer ymgynghoriadau. Mae sawl corff nad oes ganddo’r gallu i ymateb i bob ymgynghoriad. Byddai o gymorth mawr pe câi rhai eu dynodi yn CGGC i gydlynu ymatebion penodol i ymgynghoriadau. Rhaid inni hefyd ystyried y sector myfyrwyr, nad yw’n cael ei gyllido’n ddigon da i ymgorffori’r holl ynni a brwdfrydedd sydd gan bobl ifanc mewn addysg bellach ac uwch. Mae grwp gwirfoddoli’r myfyrwyr wedi cysylltu â mi sawl gwaith gan ddweud nad oes ganddo ddigon o gyllid i harneisio’r egni hwn a’i roi ar waith yng Nghymru. Gobeithiaf y gallwch gyflawni hynny drwy’r broses hon.</p>
<p>Finally, rurality has not been well examined. Providing services in mid Wales costs much more than in more heavily populated areas, where it can be done more economically. Some of the recent changes to lottery funding criteria have worked against rurality. What are you doing, Minister, to ensure that rural Wales will not be disadvantaged by changes in criteria? The recent changes in Sportlot funding favour Communities First areas. If that were a trend, lottery funding would be focused on urban areas, not rural ones.</p>	<p>Yn olaf, ni chafwyd ymdriniaeth dda â gwledigrwydd. Mae’n costio llawer mwy i ddarparu gwasanaethau yn y Canolbarth nag ydyw mewn ardaloedd mwy poblog, lle y gellir gwneud hynny’n fwy darbodus. Mae rhai o’r newidiadau diweddar i’r meini prawf ar gyfer cyllid y loteri wedi gweithio yn erbyn gwledigrwydd. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud, Weinidog, i sicrhau na fydd newidiadau i’r meini prawf yn rhoi Cymru wledig o dan anfantais? Mae’r newidiadau diweddar i’r cyllido gan Sportlot yn ffafrio ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Pe byddai hynny’n duedd, byddai arian y loteri’n mynd at ardaloedd trefol gan mwyaf, yn hytrach na rhai gwledig.</p>
<p><b>The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):</b> This has been an excellent debate, with valid contributions across the piste in response to the commission’s report.</p>	<p><b>Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):</b> Bu hon yn ddadl ragorol, a chafwyd cyfraniadau dilys gan bob ochr mewn ymateb i adroddiad y comisiwn.</p>



I thank Helen Mary for making the point about amendments, but we do not want to get bogged down in what we thought we had agreed. The important point is that we have had an excellent discussion today, but the Business Committee may want to consider that in terms of documents that form part of a consultation process. Your praise for the volunteers, William, of which there are over 30,000 across Wales, will be mirrored across all parties. Volunteers keep these organisations alive. Like me, you are probably concerned about the age profile of volunteers these days, and about what more we can do to encourage volunteering among a much younger age range to ensure that these valuable organisations are still in place. You also mentioned jargon, which comes across all the time. Our use of language, what we put into reports, and whether they are accessible are big issues for us to consider, and that has come out clearly in this voluntary sector report.

Diolchaf i Helen Mary am wneud y pwynt am welliannau, ond nid ydym am ymdroi ynghylch yr hyn yr oeddem yn tybio ein bod wedi ei gytuno. Y pwynt pwysig yw ein bod wedi cael trafodaeth ragorol heddiw, ond efallai y bydd y Pwyllgor Busnes yn dymuno ystyried hynny yng nghyd-destun dogfennau sy'n rhan o broses ymgynghori. Bydd eich canmoliaeth i'r gwirfoddolwyr, William, y ceir mwy na 30,000 ohonynt ledled Cymru, yn cael ei hategu gan yr holl bleidiau. Gwirfoddolwyr sy'n cadw'r cyrff hyn yn fyw. Fel minnau, mae'n debyg eich bod yn pryderu ynghylch proffil oedran y gwirfoddolwyr y dyddiau hyn, a'r hyn y gallwn ei wneud yn rhagor i hybu gwirfoddoli mewn amrediad oedran llawer iau er mwyn sicrhau parhad y cyrff gwerthfawr hyn. Cyfeiriasoch at jargon hefyd, a cheir hynny drwy'r amser. Mae ein defnydd o iaith, yr hyn a rown mewn adroddiadau, ac a ydynt yn ddarllenadwy, yn faterion o bwys i'w hystyried gennym, ac mae hynny wedi'i amlygu yn yr adroddiad hwn ar y sector gwirfoddol.

On the amendments, I understand why they have been tabled and the issues that they raise. I would disagree with little in this report, but I will have to take into account fully what we receive in the consultation, then decide on implementation. Some suggestions may be implemented immediately; others may include timescale considerations. The key issue that has come out of this, Peter, is the balance between national and local provision. This point comes across all the time in terms of the role of national organisations and how local organisations can access funding. That is a key area that we must address when we implement the report.

Ynghylch y gwelliannau, deallaf pam y maent wedi'u cyflwyno a'r materion a godir ynddynt. Nid oes fawr ddim yn yr adroddiad hwn yr anghytunwn ag ef, ond bydd yn rhaid imi roi pob ystyriaeth i'r hyn a gawn drwy'r ymgynghoriad a phenderfynu wedyn ar y camau a gymerir. Mae rhai awgrymiadau y gellid gweithredu arnynt ar unwaith; mae eraill y gallai fod angen eu hystyried dros amser. Y mater allweddol sydd wedi'i amlygu drwy hyn, Peter, yw'r cydbwysedd rhwng darpariaeth genedlaethol a lleol. Mae'r pwynt hwn yn codi drwy'r amser yng nghyd-desun rôl cyrff cenedlaethol a gallu cyrff lleol i gael cyllid. Mae hwnnw'n faes pwysig y bydd yn rhaid inni ymdrin ag ef wrth weithredu ar sail yr adroddiad.

4.20 p.m.

Helen Mary, I look forward to your detailed response. Your point regarding having an independent chair was well made, and how having different chairs has probably improved the working of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity. It is important that we consider this issue in future. Your point on ASPBs is a matter of concern to the voluntary sector. I have initiated a series of meetings with my ministerial colleagues and ASPBs, which I believe are leading to a greater understanding of the requirements and needs of the voluntary sector in its relationship with ASPBs. One of the most important points that you made during your contribution was about core services. There is fear within the public sector that voluntary

Helen Mary, edrychaf ymlaen at weld eich ymateb manwl. Gwnaethoch bwynt da ynghylch cael cadeirydd annibynnol, a bod cael gwahanol gadeiryddion wedi gwella gweithrediad y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, yn ôl pob tebyg. Mae'n bwysig inni ystyried y mater hwn yn y dyfodol. Mae'r pwynt a wnaethoch am gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad yn destun pryder i'r sector gwirfoddol. Yr wyf wedi dechrau cyfres o gyfarfodydd gyda'm cyd-Weinidogion a CCNC, a chredaf eu bod yn arwain at well dealltwriaeth o ofynion ac anghenion y sector gwirfoddol o ran ei berthynas â CCNC. Yr oedd un o'r pwyntiau pwysicaf a wnaethoch yn ystod eich cyfraniad yn ymwneud â gwasanaethau craidd. Mae

organisations might start to take over certain public sector jobs. Trade unions are particularly concerned about such issues across the border. I made it clear at the voluntary sector partnership meeting that the voluntary sector is there to enhance other services. As you said, it initially develops innovative services, which then become part of core programmes, and then the sector undertakes further innovation.

ofn yn y sector cyhoeddus y gallai cyrff gwirfoddol ddechrau gymryd drosodd rhai swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus. Mae undebau llafur yn arbennig o bryderus am faterion o'r fath y tu draw i'r ffin. Eglurais yng nghyfarfod y bartneriaeth sector gwirfoddol mai pwrpas y sector gwirfoddol yw hybu gwasanaethau eraill. Fel y dywedasoch, mae'n datblygu gwasanaethau arloesol ar y dechrau, sydd wedyn yn dod yn rhan o raglenni craidd, ac wedyn mae'r sector yn ymgymryd â gwaith arloesol pellach.

Janice and others also referred to issues regarding staff recruitment and training. How you maintain people, train them and deal with them are big issues within the voluntary sector. Sandy Mewies also covered those issues, particularly funding, and how we should deal with local organisations.

Mae Janice ac eraill wedi cyfeirio hefyd at faterion sy'n ymwneud â recriwtio a hyfforddi staff. Mae'r modd y cedwir staff a'u hyfforddi a'u trafod yn faterion o bwys yn y sector gwirfoddol. Gwnaeth Sandy Mewies ymdrin â'r materion hynny hefyd, yn enwedig cyllido, a'r modd y dylem ddelio â chyrff lleol.

**Mark Isherwood:** On funding and staff recruitment, you have announced that funding will be given for a minimum of three years. Will you also consider providing a minimum of six months' notice if there is to be any change in funding? Can you also assure voluntary organisations in north Wales that you will make a quick decision on the community facilities and activities programme?

**Mark Isherwood:** Ynghylch cyllido a recriwtio staff, yr ydych wedi cyhoeddi y rhoddir cyllid ar gyfer tair blynedd o leiaf. A wnewch hefyd ystyried rhoi o leiaf chwe mis o rybudd os oes unrhyw newid i fod mewn cyllido? A allwch hefyd sicrhau cyrff gwirfoddol yn y Gogledd y byddwch yn penderfynu'n fuan ynghylch y rhaglen cyfleusterau a gweithgareddau cymunedol?

**Edwina Hart:** I will make decisions within the timescales I have to make them, to ensure that they are proper decisions. On the community facilities and activities programme, I want to ensure that the criteria for subscribing to that scheme are thoroughly considered, as it was oversubscribed in many areas. On funding, we must seriously consider the report's recommendations. All the meetings that I have had with the voluntary sector since the report was published indicate that the funding issues that you raised are their key issues.

**Edwina Hart:** Byddaf yn gwneud penderfyniadau o fewn y cyfnodau gofynnol, i sicrhau eu bod yn benderfyniadau iawn. Ynghylch y rhaglen cyfleusterau a gweithgareddau cymunedol, dymunaf sicrhau y bydd y meini prawf ar gyfer tanysgrifio i'r cynllun hwnnw'n cael eu hystyried yn drwyadl, gan fod gormod wedi tanysgrifio iddo mewn sawl ardal. Ynghylch cyllido, rhaid inni ystyried argymhellion yr adroddiad o ddifrif. Mae'r holl gyfarfodydd a gefais â'r sector gwirfoddol ers cyhoeddi'r adroddiad yn dangos mai'r materion sy'n ymwneud â chyllido y gwnaethoch eu codi yw'r rhai pwysicaf yn eu golwg hwy.

Mick said that I perhaps needed to be more proactive. I cannot think of anything that is more proactive than having the guts to have an independent commission to consider our work. I could have had a nice, slick review undertaken by civil servants internally, with an element of consultation, which might not have raised any of the issues raised in the report. It is particularly important that you realise that consultation with the voluntary sector will be fairly detailed and that all organisations will be able to respond. There will be a special meeting of the voluntary sector partnership in July to discuss the report. I hope to tell the Assembly early in September what recommendations I intend to take forward. Your point on the National Lottery is well made, and I will refer to Alun Pugh the concerns of voluntary organisations regarding how money is dispersed. I know that it is an issue on his agenda. People are concerned, particularly in rural areas, about the impact of this, given how the situation is developing.

Dyweddodd Mick fod angen efallai imi fod yn fwy rhagweithiol. Ni allaf feddwl am ddim sy'n fwy rhagweithiol na bod â digon o blwch i gael comisiwn annibynnol i ystyried ein gwaith. Byddwn wedi gallu cael adolygiad twt a thacclus a wneid gan weision sifil yn fewnol, gyda rhywfaint o ymgynghori, na fyddai, o bosibl, wedi codi'r un o'r materon a godwyd yn yr adroddiad. Mae'n arbennig o bwysig ichi sylweddoli y bydd yr ymgynghori â'r sector gwirfoddol yn eithaf manwl ac y bydd yr holl gyrff yn gallu ymateb. Bydd cyfarfod arbennig o'r bartneriaeth sector gwirfoddol ym mis Gorffennaf i drafod yr adroddiad. Gobeithiaf allu dweud wrth y Cynulliad ddechrau Medi pa argymhellion yr wyf yn bwriadu eu dilyn. Gwnaethoch bwynt da am y Loteri Genedlaethol, a chyfeiriaf bryderon cyrff gwirfoddol ynghylch y dull o ddosrannu arian i Alun Pugh. Gwn ei fod yn ystyried y mater hwnnw. Mae pryder, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ynghylch yr effaith a gaiff hyn, yng ngolwg y modd y mae'r sefyllfa'n datblygu.

The key issues highlighted today relate to funding. We must recognise that we cannot fund everything. We must therefore be clear about how we fund, who we fund and why. Peter made a forceful point regarding the balance between local and national provision. That is important. We must consider how we slot in citizens advice bureaux and deal with local issues. There is also the big issue of capacity and training in the sector. William alluded to the poaching of workers by local government. This is an issue within the voluntary sector and Communities First. The accessibility of information is also important. It is quite easy for large voluntary organisations to access information, to make their bid and to make their contribution on a whole range of consultation documents. It is much more difficult for smaller organisations to do that. I have been exploring website provision and the possibility of having a portal that the voluntary sector can access to see what is available for consultation. I thank Members for the quality of the debate and I will read the Record and ensure that comments are taken into account. I look forward to individual comments by Members on the commission's report.

Mae'r prif faterion a godwyd heddiw'n ymwneud â chyllido. Rhaid inni dderbyn na allwn gyllido pob dim. Gan hynny, rhaid inni fod yn bendant ynghylch ein dull o gyllido, pwy yr ydym yn ei gyllido a pham. Gwnaeth Peter bwynt grymus ynghylch y cydbwysedd rhwng darpariaeth leol a chenedlaethol. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Rhaid inni ystyried y modd yr ydym yn cynnwys y canolfannau cyngor ar bopeth ac yn delio â materion lleol. Mae capasiti a hyfforddiant yn y sector yn fater pwysig hefyd. Cyfeiriodd William at gipio gweithwyr gan lywodraeth leol. Mae'r mater hwn yn codi yn y sector gwirfoddol a Cymunedau yn Gyntaf hefyd. Mae hefyd yn bwysig bod gwybodaeth ar gael yn rhwydd. Mae'n eithaf hawdd i gyrff gwirfoddol mawr gael gwybodaeth, gwneud cais a chyfrannu at amrywiaeth mawr o ddogfennau ymgynghori. Mae'n llawer mwy anodd i gyrff llai wneud hynny. Bûm yn ymchwilio i'r ddarpariaeth ar wefannau a'r posibilrwydd o gael porth y gall y sector gwirfoddol ei ddefnyddio i weld beth sydd ar gael ar gyfer ymgynghori. Diolchaf i Aelodau am ansawdd y ddatl a darllenaf y Cofnod a sicrhau yr ystyrir sylwadau. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld sylwadau gan Aelodau unigol ar adroddiad y comisiwn.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 11, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 29.*

*Amendment 1: For 11, Abstain 5, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 11, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 29.*  
*Amendment 2: For 11, Abstain 5, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene

Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM1981): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1981): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy

Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Adroddiad y Grwp Gorchwyl a Gorffen ar Weithgynhyrchu The Manufacturing Task and Finish Group Report**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 6 and 7 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Jonathan Morgan and amendments 4 and 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 6 a 7 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Jonathan Morgan a gwelliannau 4 a 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. recognises the significant contribution made by the manufacturing sector to economic prosperity in Wales;*

*1. yn cydnabod y cyfraniad sylweddol a wnaed gan y sector gweithgynhyrchu i ffyniant yr economi yng Nghymru;*

*2. welcomes the establishment, by the Minister for Economic Development and Transport, of a manufacturing task and finish group, with a remit to identify issues impacting on the competitive position of the manufacturing sector in Wales;*

*2. yn croesawu bod y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth wedi sefydlu grwp gorchwyl a gorffen ar weithgynhyrchu, gyda chylch gwaith o nodi'r materion sy'n effeithio ar sefyllfa gystadleuol y sector gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru;*

*3. welcomes the recommendations made by the group, for consideration by the Welsh Assembly Government, aimed at creating the conditions necessary to ensure that the manufacturing sector continues to play a vital role in ensuring the future prosperity of people in Wales. (NDM1982)*

*3. yn croesawu'r argymhellion a wnaed gan y grwp, ar gyfer eu hystyried gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, gyda'r nod o greu'r amodau sy'n angenrheidiol i sicrhau bod y sector gweithgynhyrchu yn parhau i chwarae rôl dyngedfennol wrth sicrhau ffyniant i bobl Cymru yn y dyfodol. (NDM1982)*

The manufacturing sector has been, and continues to be, one of the cornerstones of the Welsh economy. However, it is also a sector that, by its very nature, is open to global competitive pressures. We are all familiar with the manifestation of these global pressures, which present a real challenge. This challenge is well understood by the Welsh Assembly Government and by all those engaged in manufacturing. To some, there is an inevitability that the challenge of global competition is one our manufacturing sector cannot rise to, and that low-cost competition from emerging economies will erode our manufacturing sector until, ultimately, we have no manufacturing base at all. I do not believe in such fatalistic projections. Nevertheless, I believe that if we are to maintain and further develop a competitive edge in manufacturing, our manufacturing sector must innovate and change.

Bu'r sector gweithgynhyrchu'n un o gonglfeini economi Cymru, ac felly y mae o hyd. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn sector sydd, o'i hanfod, yn agored i bwysau cystadleuol byd-eang. Yr ydym oll yn gyfarwydd â chanlyniadau'r pwysau byd-eang hyn, sy'n cynnig her wirioneddol. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a phawb sy'n ymwneud â gweithgynhyrchu, yn deall yr her hon yn iawn. Yng ngolwg rhai, mae'n anochel na fydd ein sector gweithgynhyrchu'n gallu ymateb i her cystadlu byd-eang, ac y bydd cystadlu ar sail costau isel gan economïau sy'n datblygu'n erydu ein sector gweithgynhyrchu hyd nes y byddwn heb sylfaen gweithgynhyrchu o gwbl, yn y pen draw. Ni chredaf mewn darogan ffatalaidd o'r fath. Er hynny, os ydym i gadw mantais gystadleuol mewn gweithgynhyrchu, a'i datblygu ymhellach, credaf fod rhaid i'n sector gweithgynhyrchu arloesi a newid.

Just as manufacturing in Wales 20 years ago bears little resemblance to modern manufacturing, so the manufacturing sector in 20 years' time will be very different to how it is now. The changes taking place in this sector are part and parcel of those taking place in the wider global economy. These are changes that have seen us reinvent ourselves from an economy based on the heavy industry of the past to one geared to the modern knowledge-driven businesses of today and of the future.

Yn union fel nad oes fawr o debygrwydd rhwng gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru 20 mlynedd yn ôl a gweithgynhyrchu modern, felly y bydd y sector gweithgynhyrchu ymhen 20 mlynedd yn wahanol iawn i'r hyn ydyw'n awr. Mae'r newidiadau a geir yn y sector hwn yn rhan annatod o'r rhai a geir yn yr economi fyd-eang yn gyffredinol. Drwy'r newidiadau hyn, yr ydym wedi ein hailddyfeisio ein hunain o fod yn economi sy'n seiliedig ar ddiwydiant trwm y gorffennol i fod yn un sydd â'i gogwydd at y busnesau modern a ysgogir gan wybodaeth a geir heddiw ac yn y dyfodol.

In moving forward, the Assembly Government has a crucial responsibility to assist in creating the conditions within which the manufacturing sector can continue to evolve and prosper. To do this, we need to work with industry so that we can be responsive to its needs and can ensure it plays a full part in influencing our thinking and policy making. This can only be achieved if there is open dialogue between the manufacturing sector and the Welsh Assembly Government. This is why, in January of this year, I invited representatives of the manufacturing sector in Wales—employers, trade unions and business support organisations—to come together to form a manufacturing task and finish group.

Wrth symud ymlaen, mae cyfrifoldeb hollbwysig gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i helpu i greu'r amodau lle y gall y sector gweithgynhyrchu ddal i ddatblygu a ffynnu. I wneud hynny, rhaid inni weithio gyda diwydiant fel y gallwn ymateb i'w anghenion a sicrhau ei fod yn chwarae rhan lawn wrth ddylanwadu ar ein meddwl a'n gwaith o lunio polisi. Ni ellir ond sicrhau hynny drwy gael deialog agored rhwng y sector gweithgynhyrchu a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Dyna pam, ym mis Ionawr eleni, y gwahoddais gynrychiolwyr y sector gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru—cyflogwyr, undebau llafur a chyrrff cymorth busnes—i ddod at ei gilydd i ffurfio grwp gorchwyl a gorffen ar weithgynhyrchu.

The group was given a broad remit to debate the issues affecting the sector and, just as importantly, to consider how best the Welsh Assembly Government might assist in creating the conditions needed to support it. I was pleased to see so many stakeholders choosing to participate in this exercise, and I was delighted to be able to encourage Colin Johnson, who was until recently the plant manager of the Ford engine plant at Bridgend, to chair the task and finish group. It is a measure of the group's enthusiasm and commitment that it has reported its findings within a relatively short timescale. The findings were presented to me in the form of the group's report, 'Manufacturing in Wales', during my visit to INA Bearings in Llanelli on 27 May in the company of Catherine Thomas. Indeed, during the visit to INA Bearings, I saw for myself the challenges facing one particular company, and witnessed the exceptional progress made at its Llanelli plant. Where INA Bearings has led, other manufacturing companies can follow. The challenge that lies before us is to ensure that as many manufacturing companies as possible can emulate the success of companies such as INA Bearings. For that reason, I welcome the report of the task and finish group.

Rhodddwyd cylch gwaith cynhwysfawr i'r grwp i drafod y materion sy'n effeithio ar y sector a hefyd, yr un mor bwysig â hynny, i ystyried ym mha fodd y gallai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru helpu orau i greu'r amodau y mae eu hangen i'w gynnal. Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld bod cynifer o randdeiliaid wedi dewis cymryd rhan yn yr ymarfer hwn, ac yr oeddwn wrth fy modd o allu annog Colin Johnson, a fu hyd yn ddiweddar yn rheolwr gwaith motorau Ford ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, i gadeirio'r grwp gorchwyl a gorffen. Un arwydd o frwdfrydedd ac ymrwymiad y grwp yw ei fod wedi adrodd ar ei ganfyddiadau o fewn cyfnod cymharol fyr. Cyflwynwyd y canfyddiadau i mi ar ffurf adroddiad y grwp, 'Manufacturing in Wales', yn ystod fy ymweliad ag INA Bearings yn Llanelli ar 27 Mai yng nghwmni Catherine Thomas. Yn wir, yn ystod yr ymweliad ag INA Bearings, gwelais dros fy hun yr heriau sy'n wynebu un cwmni penodol, a thystio i'r cynnydd eithriadol a wnaed yn ei waith yn Llanelli. Lle y mae INA Bearings wedi arwain, gall cwmnïau gweithgynhyrchu eraill ddilyn. Yr her sy'n ein hwynebu yw sicrhau y bydd cynifer o gwmnïau gweithgynhyrchu ag y bo modd yn gallu efelychu llwyddiant cwmnïau fel INA Bearings. Oherwydd hynny, croesawaf adroddiad y grwp gorchwyl a gorffen.

4.30 p.m.

I will now turn to the report's key findings and highlight some of their implications. Encouragingly, the group identified training and development of the Welsh workforce as an issue that rests at the heart of moving up the manufacturing value chain. As it was explained to me at INA Bearings, if we are to be successful in the medium term then—to use the phrase expressed frequently in the presentation—'the rate of learning must exceed the rate of change'; L must be greater than C. I agree with that analysis. Within every economic sector, manufacturing, as much as services, value now comes less from raw materials and the physical processes of production and more from the knowledge and skill applied in products and services. I, therefore, welcome the stress that the task and finish group has placed upon training and development at all levels, from management development through to the development of basic skills. Training and development is a key issue underpinning our future success.

Trof yn awr at brif ganfyddiadau'r adroddiad a thynnu sylw at rai o'u goblygiadau. Yn galonogol, nododd y grwp fod lle canolog i'r gwaith o hyfforddi a datblygu gweithlu Cymru er mwyn codi'n uwch yn y gadwyn werth gweithgynhyrchu. Fel yr eglurwyd i mi yn INA Bearings, os ydym i lwyddo yn y tymor canolog—a defnyddio'r ymadrodd a fynegwyd yn aml yn y cyflwyniad—'rhaid i'r gyfradd ddysgu fod yn fwy na'r gyfradd newid'. Cytunaf â'r dadansoddiad hwnnw. Ym mhob sector economaidd, mewn gweithgynhyrchu'n gymaint ag mewn gwasanaethau, nid o'r defnyddiau crai a phrosesau cynhyrchu ffisegol y ceir gwerth yn ogymaint ag o'r wybodaeth a'r medr a gymhwysir at gynhyrchion a gwasanaethau. Gan hynny, croesawaf y pwyslais a roddodd y grwp gorchwyl a gorffen ar hyfforddi a datblygu ar bob lefel, o ddatblygu rheolaeth hyd at ddatblygu sgiliau sylfaenol. Mae hyfforddi a datblygu'n fater hollbwysig ar gyfer ein llwyddiant yn y dyfodol.



**Glyn Davies:** You talk about the importance of training but, in mid Wales, there is a shortage of trained apprentices and manufacturing is stuck for skilled people. The shared apprenticeship scheme has, for several years, been closing down, because ELWa is not responding to its requests. This is simply the result of a shortage of letters and lack of communication between ELWa and groups in mid Wales. It is closing down and shutting off the very resource that manufacturing in mid Wales needs. Your words about training will sound very empty in mid Wales.

**Andrew Davies:** One of the biggest problems facing employers in manufacturing and other sectors is the buoyancy of the current employment market. Employers are finding it difficult to recruit and retain staff precisely because there is such a competitive market for skilled labour. There may be problems relating to the delivery of particular skills packages, which the task and finish group identified. I will discuss with Jane Davidson how we, as Team Wales, can respond more actively and in a more focused way to the needs of the manufacturing sector in particular.

Significantly, the group recognised that the pursuit of best practice initiatives such as ‘lean manufacturing’, while important, is not sufficient to ensure long-term success. There is a need for individual companies to go beyond ‘lean’ in investigating opportunities to create and sustain competitive advantage. The group recommends that there is a need for the public sector to develop mechanisms to ensure that emerging strategic directions are properly understood and influence public policy making in a timely fashion. It is pleasing that the group has endorsed the potential of the current sector forums, such as the Wales Automotive Forum, as one vehicle through which to develop such dialogue.

**Glyn Davies:** Er eich sôn am bwysigrwydd hyfforddi, yn y Canolbarth mae prentisiaid hyfforddedig yn brin ac mae gweithgynhyrchwyr yn methu â chael gafael ar rai sydd â sgiliau. Mae’r cynllun prentisiaeth ar y cyd wedi dod i ben, mewn sawl blwyddyn, am nad yw ELWa yn ymateb i’w geisiadau. Yr unig reswm am hyn yw diffyg llythyru a chyfathrebu rhwng ELWa a grwpiau yn y Canolbarth. Mae’n rhoi pen ar yr union adnodd y mae ar weithgynhyrchwyr yn y Canolbarth ei angen. Bydd eich geiriau am hyfforddi’n swnio’n wag iawn yn y Canolbarth.

**Andrew Davies:** Un o’r problemau mwyaf y mae cyflogwyr mewn gweithgynhyrchu a sectorau eraill yn eu hwynebu yw bywiogrwydd y farchnad gyflogaeth ar hyn o bryd. Mae cyflogwyr yn ei chael yn anodd recriwtio a chadw staff a hynny, yn syml, am fod marchnad mor gystadleuol am weithwyr medrus. Efallai fod problemau sy’n gysylltiedig â darparu pecynnau sgiliau penodol, a nododd y grwp gorchwyl a gorffen. Trafodaf gyda Jane Davidson sut y gallwn ni, fel Tîm Cymru, ymateb yn fwy gweithredol a phenodol i anghenion y sector gweithgynhyrchu’n neilltuol.

Mae’n bwysig nodi bod y grwp wedi cydnabod nad yw dilyn mentrau ar yr arferion gorau fel ‘gweithgynhyrchu diwastraff’ yn ddigon, er eu pwysiced, i sicrhau llwyddiant tymor hir. Rhaid i gwmnïau unigol fynd ymhellach na hynny wrth ymchwilio i gyfleoedd i greu a chynnal eu mantais gystadleuol. Mae’r grwp yn argymhell y dylai’r sector cyhoeddus ddatblygu dulliau i sicrhau y llawn ddeallir cyfeiriadau strategol newydd ac i ddylanwadu’n amserol ar y gwaith o lunio polisi cyhoeddus. Braff yw nodi bod y grwp wedi cymeradwyo potensial y fforymau sector presennol, fel Fforwm Moduron Cymru, fel un modd inni ddatblygu deialog o’r fath.

While the group clearly acknowledges the value of the broad range of support already available from the public sector, it has made clear that there are opportunities to improve that support, as I said in response to Glyn Davies's intervention. Moreover, the group is calling for the pace at which reform of support measures is taken forward to be accelerated so that manufacturers in Wales have an early and clear indication of the framework of support available, against which they can plan their improvement activities. As I said earlier, I will take these matters up with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning and we will discuss the group's recommendations.

Er bod y grwp yn llawn gydnabod gwerth yr amrywiaeth eang o gymorth sydd eisoes ar gael oddi wrth y sector cyhoeddus, eglurodd fod cyfleoedd i wella'r cymorth hwnnw, fel y dywedais mewn ymateb i ymyriad Glyn Davies. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae'r grwp yn galw am ddiwygio'r mesurau cymorth yn gyflymach fel y bydd gweithgynhyrchwyr yng Nghymru'n gallu gweld yn glir ac yn gynnar y fframwaith cymorth sydd ar gael, a chynllunio eu gwelliannau yng ngoleuni hwnnw. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, codaf y materion hyn gyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes a thrafodwn argymhellion y grwp.

I am encouraged that the group highlighted the benefits associated with actively engaging the workforce in driving forward change programmes—a point forcibly made to me by INA Bearings. In this context, I am delighted that the recommendations of the former task and finish group on partnerships at work, also sponsored from within my department, are now being implemented, having secured funding from the Department of Trade and Industry's partnership fund. They represent an important avenue through which to make more companies aware of how to capitalise on this leading-edge practice.

Fe'm calonogwyd gan y ffaith bod y grwp wedi tynnu sylw at y manteision a geir o gynnwys y gweithlu wrth hyrwyddo rhaglenni newid—pwynt a gyflewyrdd yn gryf i mi gan INA Bearings. Yn y cyd-destun hwn, yr wyf wrth fy modd bod yr argymhellion a wnaed gan y grwp gorchwyl a gorffen blaenorol ar bartneriaethau yn y gwaith, a oedd hefyd wedi'i noddi gan fy adran, yn cael eu rhoi ar waith yn awr, ar ôl sicrhau cyllid o gronfa bartneriaeth yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant. Maent yn gyfrwng pwysig i hysbysu rhagor o gwmnïau am y modd i elwa ar yr arfer blaengar hwn.

It is significant that the group has confirmed the importance of ongoing support towards manufacturing investment, particularly in the context of competition for such investment across the globe. The group has indicated that there is scope to update features of the regional selective assistance scheme, particularly to reflect changes in investment patterns, and there is no doubt about the significance of RSA in providing investment support. Its importance cannot be underestimated. Nevertheless, the group's recommendation will be fed into the review of the RSA scheme which is currently underway and which I presented to the Economic Development and Transport Committee recently.

Mae'n arwyddocaol bod y grwp wedi cadarnhau pwysigrwydd y cymorth presennol ar gyfer buddsoddi mewn gweithgynhyrchu, yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun y cystadlu am fuddsoddi o'r fath ledled y byd. Mae'r grwp wedi nodi bod lle i ddiweddarau rhai agweddau ar y cynllun cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a hynny, yn benodol, er mwyn adlewyrchu newid mewn patrymau buddsoddi, ac nid oes amheuaeth nad yw cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yn bwysig o ran rhoi cymorth i fuddsoddi. Ni ddylid tanbrisie ei bwysigrwydd. Er hynny, bydd argymhelliad y grwp yn cael ei borthi i'r adolygiad o'r cynllun cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol sy'n mynd rhagddo ar hyn o bryd, a gyflwynais i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yn ddiweddar.

<p>These are just some of the task and finish group's key findings. The report also contains a series of additional recommendations, from transport infrastructure through to procurement practices, which shed further light on the real concerns of the sector. I welcome the group's report. It furthers our understanding of how the challenges that the sector faces are best addressed. It makes a valuable input to ensuring that we have a joined-up approach to taking forward this crucial component of our role in economic development. Above all, it helps us to ensure that manufacturing continues to play a vital role in ensuring the future prosperity of not only the economy of Wales, but the people of Wales.</p>	<p>Dim ond rhai o brif ganfyddiadau'r grwp gorchwyl a gorffen yw'r rhain. Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn cynnwys cyfres o argymhellion ychwanegol, sy'n cwmpasu'r seilwaith trafniadaeth ac arferion caffael, a ddylai daflu goleuni pellach ar wir bryderon y sector. Croesawaf adroddiad y grwp. Mae'n hyrwyddo ein dealltwriaeth o'r modd gorau i ymateb i'r heriau sy'n wynebu'r sector. Mae'n gyfraniad gwerthfawr at sicrhau y cawn ddull gweithredu cydgysylltiedig i hyrwyddo'r elfen hollbwysig hon yn ein rôl mewn datblygu economaidd. Yn fwy na dim, mae'n ein helpu i sicrhau y bydd gweithgynhyrchu'n dal i chwarae rhan hanfodol wrth sicrhau ffyniant economi Cymru, a phobl Cymru, yn y dyfodol.</p>
<p><b>Janet Davies:</b> I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: delete point 1 and replace with:</p>	<p><b>Janet Davies:</b> Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: dileu pwynt 1 a rhoi yn ei le:</p>
<p><i>regrets the sad decline of the manufacturing sector in Wales.</i></p>	<p><i>yn gresynu at ddirywiad trist y sector gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru.</i></p>
<p>I propose amendment 6. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:</p>	<p>Cynigiau welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig :</p>
<p><i>notes the lack of raw materials available to the manufacturing sector following the closure of the coal and iron mines under successive UK Governments.</i></p>	<p><i>yn nodi'r diffyg deunyddiau crai sydd ar gael i'r sector gweithgynhyrchu yn sgil cau'r pyllau glo a haearn o dan un Llywodraeth ar ôl y llall yn y DU.</i></p>
<p>I propose amendment 7. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:</p>	<p>Cynigiau welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig :</p>
<p><i>notes that local manufacturing is disadvantaged within the marketplace by low international freight costs supported by tax-free fuel.</i></p>	<p><i>yn nodi bod gweithgynhyrchu leol o dan anfantaes yn y farchnadle oherwydd costau cludo rhyngwladol isel a gefnogir gan danwydd rhydd rhag treth.</i></p>
<p>Plaid Cymru is pleased that this group was established and that it has been able to deliver recommendations so quickly. We note that it recognises that more work must be done. The report states that it has introduced no new support initiatives that could be counterproductive, but recommends fine-tuning of existing support mechanisms. Plaid Cymru supports this fine-tuning and fully understands concerns that more radical measures could create greater bureaucracy for business. However, there must be concern that the Welsh economy has recently been overtaken by Northern Ireland and north-east England, and the challenge to reach 90 per cent of average UK gross domestic product per capita by 2010 looks increasingly difficult to meet.</p>	<p>Mae Plaid Cymru yn falch bod y grwp hwn wedi'i sefydlu a'i fod wedi gallu cyflwyno ei argymhellion mor fuan. Nodwn ei fod yn cydnabod bod angen mwy o waith. Dywed yr adroddiad nad yw wedi cynnig unrhyw ddulliau cymorth newydd a allai fod yn wrthgynhyrchiol, ond mae'n argymhell y dylid manwl gyweirio'r dulliau cymorth presennol. Mae Plaid Cymru o blaid manwl gyweirio o'r fath ac yn llawn ddeall pryderon y gallai camau mwy radical greu mwy o fiwrocratiaeth i fusnes. Fodd bynnag, mae'n sicr o fod yn destun pryder bod economi Cymru wedi'i goddiweddyd yn ddiweddar gan Ogledd Iwerddon a gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr, ac mae'r her o gyrraedd 90 y cant o'r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth cyfartalog y pen yn y DU erbyn 2010 yn</p>

ymddangos yn fwyfwy anodd.

Is this Assembly Government sufficiently proactive in addressing the decline in the number of manufacturing jobs and the contribution of manufacturing to our economic prosperity? The strategic action that Scotland has taken to address its similar problems, with a fair degree of success, for example its science strategy, shows that there is a question mark over the Assembly Government. Does it possess a broad vision and the capability to act? Plaid Cymru's amendments address reality, and some of the factors that affect our global competitiveness are not being acknowledged. It is important to recognise a problem before it can be adequately addressed. Manufacturing has declined as a proportion of total employee jobs. Official statistics state that, in December 2002, it stood at 16.6 per cent in Wales, compared with 17.3 per cent a year earlier, and there has been decline in contribution to Welsh prosperity from 28 per cent in 1997 to 22 per cent by 2001.

A yw'r Llywodraeth Cynulliad hon yn ddigon rhagweithiol wrth ymdrin â'r dirywiad yn nifer y swyddi gweithgynhyrchu ac yng nghyfraniad gweithgynhyrchu i'n ffyniant economaidd? Mae'r camau strategol a gymerodd yr Alban i ymdrin â phroblemau tebyg, a hynny'n eithaf llwyddiannus, drwy ei strategaeth wyddoniaeth, er enghraifft, yn dangos bod lle i amau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. A yw'n meddu ar weledigaeth eang a'r gallu i weithredu? Mae gwelliannau Plaid Cymru yn ymdrin â'r sefyllfa fel y mae, ac ni chydabyddir rhai o'r ffactorau sy'n effeithio ar ein gallu i gystadlu drwy'r byd. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod problem cyn y gellir ymdrin â hi'n ddigonol. Mae cyfran y swyddi mewn gweithgynhyrchu wedi dirywio. Yn ôl ystadegau swyddogol, yn Rhagfyr 2002, yr oedd yn 16.6 y cant yng Nghymru, o'i gymharu â 17.3 y cant flwyddyn yn gynharach, a bu dirywiad yn ei gyfraniad i ffyniant Cymru o 28 y cant yn 1997 i 22 y cant yn 2001.

We are all aware of firms that have moved out of our areas, although, equally, there are some successes, particularly in the automotive industry, where Accelerate Wales has undoubtedly helped. That particular industry is supported by general skills in some areas. For example, British Avionics moved to Llantrisant in the early 1990s for that reason, and with great encouragement from the then Plaid Cymru Taff-Ely Borough Council. We must consider the losses in recent years in the steel industry and the recent upturn from the demands of the developing Chinese economy. It was too late to save much at Llanwern, but it came to the rescue of Margam. However, we would be much better off if we had the indigenous raw materials of coal and iron available to supply these industries instead of being at the mercy of global markets. While we cannot repair the damage that has been done, it is important to learn lessons for the future from the closure of the coal mines and the iron mines of Wales in recent years.

Gwyddom oll am fusnesau sydd wedi gadael ein hardaloedd, er bod rhai llwyddiannau hefyd, yn enwedig yn y diwydiant moduron, lle y mae Sbardun Cymru wedi bod o gymorth, yn sicr. Cynhelir y diwydiant hwnnw gan sgiliau cyffredinol mewn rhai ardaloedd. Er enghraifft, symudodd British Avionics i Lantrisant ar ddechrau'r 1990au oherwydd hynny, a chydag anogaeth fawr gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Taf-Elái, a oedd o dan reolaeth Plaid Cymru bryd hynny. Rhaid inni ystyried y colledion yn y blynyddoedd diweddar yn y diwydiant dur a'r cynnydd diweddar yn y galw gan economi ddatblygol Tsieina. Yr oedd yn rhy hwyr i achub llawer yn Llanwern, ond daeth i'r adwy ym Margam. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n well o lawer arnom pe byddai defnyddiau crai cynhenid ar ffurf glo a haearn ar gael i gyflenwi'r diwydiannau hyn yn lle bod ar drugaredd marchnadoedd byd-eang. Er na allwn ddad-wneud y difrod a wnaed, mae'n bwysig dysgu gwersi ar gyfer y dyfodol ar ôl cau'r pyllau glo a'r mwyngloddiau haearn yng Nghymru yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

On global competition, we recognise that the challenges of differential labour costs are outside our control, but, as the Minister said, we can take some action. In that, I would include lobbying the UK Government over the cost of freight transport. How fair is it to road hauliers that operate in the UK that aviation and, I think, shipping fuel, is free of tax, and therefore, how fair is it to local manufacturing? Environmentally, we should be doing everything to encourage procurement of product as close to the place of use as possible. A lack of tax for international haulage is a double whammy—one for Wales and one for the world.

Ynghylch cystadlu byd-eang, cydnabyddwn fod yr heriau o gostau llafur gwahanredol yn rhai sydd y tu hwnt i'n rheolaeth, ond, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae rhai camau y gallwn eu cymryd. Un o'r camau hynny yw lobio Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch cost cludo nwyddau. Pa mor deg ydyw â chcludwyr ar ffyrdd sy'n gweithredu yn y DU fod tanwydd awyrennau ac, yr wyf yn credu, tanwydd llongau, yn rhydd oddi wrth dreth, ac, felly, pa mor deg yw hynny â gweithgynhyrchu lleol? O ran yr amgylchedd, dylem wneud popeth a allwn i hybu caffael cynhyrchion mor agos ag y bo modd at fan eu defnyddio. Mae diffyg treth ar gludiant rhyngwladol yn ergyd ddwbl—un i Gymru ac un i'r byd.

4.40 p.m.

On amendment 3, there must be concern in the long term about the number of public sector jobs created. However, Plaid Cymru recognises their value as a means of stimulating the economy: help for new business and expansion depends on these public sector jobs, as well as their being a means for putting more money into the economy. In the long term, however, we must recognise that wealth is created from manufacturing or through providing services. To make Wales competitive and successful, a healthy manufacturing industry is needed. I find it difficult to support amendment 3, therefore we will vote against it.

Ynghylch gwelliant 3, mae'n sicr y bydd pryder yn y tymor hir ynghylch nifer y swyddi a greir yn y sector cyhoeddus. Er hynny, mae Plaid Cymru'n cydnabod y gwerth sydd iddynt fel modd i ysgogi'r economi: mae cymorth i fusnes newydd ac i ehangu'n dibynnu ar y swyddi hyn yn y sector cyhoeddus, ac maent hefyd yn fodd i roi mwy o arian yn yr economi. Yn y tymor hir, fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gydnabod mai drwy weithgynhyrchu neu ddarparu gwasanaethau y creir cyfoeth. Er mwyn peri i Gymru fod yn gystadleuol ac yn llwyddiannus, rhaid wrth ddiwydiant gweithgynhyrchu iach. Fe'i caf yn anodd cefnogi gwelliant 3, felly pleidleisiwn yn ei erbyn.

**Lisa Francis:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 2: delete points 2 and 3 and replace with new point 2:

**Lisa Francis:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 2: dileu pwyntiau bwled 2 a 3 a rhoi pwynt 2 newydd yn eu lle:

*notes that the creation of more civil service public sector jobs is not a sound method upon which to develop the Welsh economy and will ultimately lead to a greater burden for the tax payer.*

*yn nodi nad yw creu rhagor o swyddi'r gwasanaeth sifil yn y sector cyhoeddus yn ddull cadarn o ddatblygu economi Cymru a bydd yn arwain yn y pen draw at fwy o faich i'r trethdalwr.*

I propose amendment 3. Delete points 2 and 3 and replace with new point 2:

Cynigiau welliant 3. Dileu pwyntiau bwled 2 a 3 a rhoi pwynt 2 newydd yn eu lle:

*regrets the Welsh Assembly Government's failure to encourage IT jobs to Wales and notes that the Welsh economy will only fall further behind other western countries if this is not given urgent priority.*

*yn gresynu at fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddenu swyddi TG i Gymru ac yn nodi na fydd economi Cymru ond yn syrthio y tu ôl i wledydd eraill y gorllewin oni roddir sylw i hyn, a hynny ar frys.*

We are grateful for this report, which flags up the need for training that is easily accessible. Wales's manufacturing sector does not only cry out for management skills. The most common concern expressed in Wales is the lack of employability of a significant proportion of school leavers. As well as literacy and numeracy problems, the Confederation of British Industry states that many firms report that there is a larger group, which has wider communication and attitude problems. Of the craft and engineering apprentices that were taken on by a large engineering business in Wales, it was reported that 80 per cent failed the company's internal literacy and numeracy test. These issues must be addressed.

Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar am yr adroddiad hwn, sy'n tynnu sylw at yr angen am hyfforddiant y mae'n hawdd ei gael. Nid am sgiliau rheoli'n unig y mae sector gweithgynhyrchu Cymru'n galw. Y pryder mwyaf cyffredin a fynegir yng Nghymru yw bod cyfran helaeth o'r rhai sy'n gadael ysgol yn anghyflogadwy. Yn ogystal â phroblemau o ran llythrennedd a rhifogrwydd, dywed Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain fod llawer o fusnesau'n adrodd bod grwp mwy sydd â phroblemau mwy cyffredinol o ran cyfathrebu ac ymagwedd. O blith y prentisiaid mewn crefftau a pheirianneg a gyflogwyd gan un busnes peirianneg mawr yng Nghymru, adroddwyd bod 80 y cant ohonynt wedi methu prawf mewnol y cwmni ar lythrennedd a rhifogrwydd. Rhaid ymdrin â'r materion hynny.

Manufacturing needs a workforce that can adapt to new technologies, new concepts and market opportunities—a labour force that, in short, will be flexible. Electronics companies are calling for school and college leavers to receive more help to develop essential modern IT skills, which are needed for high-technology business. Manufacturing directly accounts for 200,000 jobs in this country, accounting for over 25 per cent of our GDP. However, the number of jobs in manufacturing in Wales fell by 3,000 between September 2002 and September 2003.

Mae ar weithgynhyrchwyr angen gweithlu sy'n gallu ymaddasu i dechnolegau newydd, cysyniadau newydd a chyfleoedd yn y farchnad—yn fyr, gweithlu a fydd yn hyblyg. Mae cwmnïau electroneg yn galw am roi mwy o gymorth i rai sy'n gadael ysgolion a cholegau i ddatblygu sgiliau modern mewn TG, y mae eu hangen ar gyfer busnes uwchdechnoleg. Mae gweithgynhyrchu yn cyflogi 200,000 yn uniongyrchol yn y wlad hon, ac yn rhoi 25 y cant o'n CMC. Fodd bynnag, disgynodd nifer y swyddi mewn gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru o 3,000 rhwng Medi 2002 a Medi 2003.

Job losses are keenly felt in Mid and West Wales, where the strength of the region's economy is dominated by smaller companies. It concerns me that this means that job losses in the region numbering between 54 and 100, which may not be important enough to be on the radar of the Minister's report to the Economic Development and Transport Committee, have a huge and devastating impact on communities within a radius of up to 30 miles, and they are just as important as the jobs lost in urban areas.

Mae colledion swyddi yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin yn brifo i'r byw, gan mai cwmnïau llai yw prif gryfder economi'r rhanbarth. Testun pryder i mi yw bod hyn yn golygu bod colli rhwng 54 a 100 o swyddi yn y rhanbarth, nad ydynt efallai'n ddigon pwysig i ymddangos yn adroddiad y Gweinidog i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, yn cael effaith enfawr a dinistriol ar gymunedau o fewn cylch o hyd at 30 milltir, ac maent yr un mor bwysig â swyddi a gollir mewn ardaloedd trefol.

Many firms have recently expressed concern about the increase in employment in the public sector. Public sector jobs do not create wealth and prosperity. Many new jobs in the economy are low-paid and part-time. We recognise that unemployment has gone down, but the jobs recently lost in manufacturing were often well paid, and jobs in flashy coffee shops do not make up for those lost in engineering. Employment in the public sector has risen by 10 per cent since 1998, following falls in the previous 15 years. Between 1998 and 2002, some 67,000 jobs were created in public administration, compared with 44,000 lost in the private sector. According to the Office for National Statistics, 129,000 jobs were lost in UK manufacturing in the last year alone.

Mae sawl busnes wedi mynegi pryder yn ddiweddar ynghylch y cynnydd mewn cyflogaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus. Nid yw swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus yn creu cyfoeth a ffyniant. Mae llawer o swyddi newydd yn yr economi'n isel eu tâl ac yn rhai rhan amser. Cydnabyddwn fod diweithdra wedi gostwng, ond yr oedd llawer o'r swyddi gweithgynhyrchu a gollwyd yn rhai â chyflog da, ac nid yw swyddi mewn siopau coffi crand yn gwneud iawn am y rhai a gollir mewn peirianeg. Mae cyflogaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus wedi codi o 10 y cant er 1998, ar ôl iddi ostwng yn y 15 mlynedd cyn hynny. Rhwng 1998 a 2002, crëwyd tua 67,000 o swyddi mewn gweinyddiaeth gyhoeddus, o'i gymharu â 44,000 a gollwyd yn y sector preifat. Yn ôl y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol, collwyd 129,000 o swyddi mewn gweithgynhyrchu yn y DU yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf yn unig.

The report recommends that the real challenge is to utilise Objective 1 money in ways that will make a real difference to manufacturing. This should be used to better improve the transport infrastructure and links. I stress that this should not only mean the M4 corridor.

Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi mai'r wir her yw defnyddio arian Amcan 1 mewn modd a wnaiff wir wahaniaeth i weithgynhyrchu. Dylid ei ddefnyddio i wella'r seilwaith a'r cysylltiadau ar gyfer trafndiaeth. Pwysleisiaf y dylai hynny gynnwys mwy na choridor yr M4.

I know that the Minister for Economic Development and Transport is keen that Welsh companies should get more contracts from the public sector, but the Government needs to realise that many small firms are now facing significant costs when they try to win business from local authorities. For example, accreditation companies, which are used by councils to vet firms interested in supplying goods and services, sometimes charge more than £500 in fees. It is also important to recognise that the cost of public procurement should not be passed on to the council tax payer or foster any kind of culture of protectionism.

Gwn fod y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yn awyddus i gwmnïau yng Nghymru gael mwy o gontractau gan y sector cyhoeddus, ond rhaid i'r Llywodraeth sylweddoli bod llawer o fusnesau bach yn wynebu costau sylweddol yn awr wrth geisio cael busnes gan awdurdodau lleol. Er enghraifft, mae cwmnïau achredu, a ddefnyddir gan gynghorau i archwilio hanes busnesau sy'n ymddiddori mewn cyflenwi nwyddau a gwasanaethau, yn codi ffioedd o fwy na £500 mewn rhai achosion. Mae hefyd yn bwysig cydnabod na ddylid trosglwyddo cost caffael cyhoeddus i dalwyr y dreth gyngor ac na ddylid meithrin unrhyw arferion diffyndollol.

With regard to grants, there must be greater flexibility in the support offered to existing businesses. Business is dynamic, but the grant regimes in place in Wales are not. While they describe it as 'welcome', the CBI says that it is still waiting to assess the impact of shifting the emphasis on grant assistance from purely capital investment to job targets. How this operates in practice will determine its effectiveness.

Gyda golwg ar grantiau, rhaid cael mwy o hyblygrwydd yn y cymorth a gynigir i'r busnesau presennol. Mae busnes yn ddeinamig, ond nid felly'r cyfundrefnau grant a geir yng Nghymru. Er ei fod yn dweud bod hynny i'w groesawu, dywed Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain ei fod yn dal i aros i asesu'r effaith o symud y pwyslais mewn cymorth grant oddi wrth fuddsoddi cyfalaf yn unig tuag at dargedau swyddi. Y modd y mae hyn yn gweithio'n ymarferol fydd yn pennu ei effeithiolrwydd.

Finally, it is still important to realise that business support must be demand-led—many firms report that they are suffering from initiative overload. However, demand-led support will not be achieved by cutting the WDA’s funding by 40 per cent, which will inevitably undermine the WDA. Money must be better spent and delivery needs to improve. Government policy has become focused on indigenous SMEs and the development of a business birth rate strategy. However, if we ignore or take for granted our larger companies, a large part of the SME sector will disappear with them as part of the supply chain. I hope, Minister, that you will acknowledge that fact.

Yn olaf, pwysig o hyd yw sylweddoli bod rhaid i gymorth i fusnes gael ei arwain gan y galw—dywed llawer o fusnesau eu bod yn dioddef gan ormodedd o fentrau. Fodd bynnag, ni sicrheir cymorth sy’n cael ei arwain gan y galw drwy dorri 40 y cant oddi ar gyllid y WDA, gan y bydd hynny’n sicr o danseilio’r WDA. Rhaid gwario arian yn well a chyflawni’r gwaith yn well. Mae polisi Llywodraeth yn canolbwyntio bellach ar fusnesau cynhenid bach a chanolig eu maint ac ar ddatblygu strategaeth ar gyfradd gychwyn busnesau. Fodd bynnag, os anwybyddwn ein cwmnïau mwy, neu eu cymryd yn ganiataol, bydd rhan helaeth o’r sector busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yn diflannu gyda hwy gan eu bod yn rhan o’r gadwyn gyflenwi. Yr wyf yn gobeithio, Weinidog, y cydnabyddwch y ffaith honno.

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 4: add a new point at the end of the motion:

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*regrets the decline in manufacturing jobs in Wales since 1997.*

*yn gresynu at y dirywiad mewn swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru ers 1997.*

I propose amendment 5. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*recognises that Wales’s manufacturing position would be strengthened by membership of the euro.*

*yn cydnabod y câi sefyllfa weithgynhyrchu Cymru ei chryfhau petai’n aelod o’r ewro.*

In measured tones, this is a hard-hitting report, and should be welcomed. It makes some trenchant observations and recommendations. The manufacturing sector is, of course, crucially important to our economy; attempts to replace manufacturing jobs with service sector jobs show that they are often fragile and a poor substitute.

Dylid rhoi croeso pwylllog i’r adroddiad deifiol hwn. Gwnaiff rai sylwadau ac argymhellion miniog. Wrth gwrs, mae’r sector gweithgynhyrchu’n hollbwysig i’n heconomi; gwelwyd yn sgîl ymdrechion i gael swyddi yn y sector gwasanaethau yn lle swyddi gweithgynhyrchu mai rhai gwael a disylwedd yw’r swyddi hynny’n aml.

Our amendment 4 highlights a worrying decline in manufacturing jobs in Wales since 1997. The net loss of manufacturing jobs between then and 2003 is over 36,000 according to the Office for National Statistics. Our amendment 5 notes that not being in the eurozone is hurting Welsh exports, particularly in the manufacturing sector. The EU is our biggest export market as 64 per cent of Welsh visible exports go there, with eight of the top 10 Welsh export destinations being located in the EU. However, exports to Germany in 2003, for example, which is Wales’s top export destination, were worth £236 million less than they were in 1999—it is a declining

Mae gwelliant 4 o’n heiddo’n tynnu sylw at ddirywiad yn nifer y swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru er 1997 sy’n peri pryder. Cafwyd colled net o fwy na 36,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu rhwng hynny a 2003 yn ôl y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol. Mae gwelliant 5 o’n heiddo’n nodi bod y ffaith nad ydym yn aelod o’r ewro yn gwneud drwg i allforion o Gymru, yn enwedig yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu. Yr UE yw’r farchnad fwyaf ar gyfer ein hallforion gan mai yno yr aiff 64 y cant o allforion gweledig Cymru, ac mae wyth o’r 10 prif gyrchfan i allforion Cymru yn yr UE. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd yr allforion i’r Almaen yn 2003, er enghraifft, sef y brif gyrchfan i



market. The euro is currently playing second fiddle to the EU constitution in current debates but, simply because the euro has strengthened against the pound, it is not as damaging as it was to industry. That could change, however, and we could quickly return to the situation that we were in a couple of years ago. It is the sheer volatility of currency fluctuations that hurts our manufacturers, and the majority now quote for business in euros, which they must do to compete with companies in the euro market. That means, however, that they have to absorb variations in the value of the pound. The Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that it would greatly benefit us all to be in the euro, but we accept and believe that this is a decision for the British people to make. Therefore, we should have the referendum on this issue sooner rather than later, and we will campaign for a 'yes' vote.

allforion Cymru, yn werth £236 miliwn yn llai nag yr oeddent yn 1999—marchnad sy'n dirywio ydyw. Mae'r ewro'n dod yn ail i gyfansoddiad yr UE yn y dadleuon a geir ar hyn o bryd, ond gan fod yr ewro'n gryfach o'i gymharu â'r bunt, nid yw'n gwneud cymaint o ddrwg i ddiwydiant. Gallai hynny newid, fodd bynnag, a gallem fynd yn ôl yn fuan i'r sefyllfa yr oeddem ynddi ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl. Anwadalwch yr amrywiadau mewn arian sy'n gwneud drwg i'n gweithgynhyrchwyr, ac mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt bellach yn cynnig dyfynbrisiau am fusnes mewn ewros, a rhaid iddynt wneud hynny i allu cystadlu â chwmnïau ym marchnad yr ewro. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n golygu bod rhaid iddynt ddygymod â newidiadau yng ngwerth y bunt. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn credu mai mantais fawr i bawb ohonom fyddai ymuno â'r ewro, ond yr ydym yn derbyn ac yn credu mai penderfyniad i'w wneud gan bobl Prydain yw hwnnw. Gan hynny, dylem gael refferendwm ar y mater hwn yn fuan, ac ymgyrchwn dros bleidlais o blaid.

We cannot support amendment 2. Of course there are more civil servants than there were at the end of the Tories' regime, but that is because we had to make up for the swingeing cuts made under John Redwood, and so on. We cannot support amendment 6 either. I am an economic historian, so I value history, but to blame the shortage of raw materials in our modern global economy on the closure of the iron mines is taking things a bit too far.

Ni allwn gefnogi gwelliant 2. Mae mwy o weision sifil nag yr oedd ar ddiwedd llywodraeth y Torïaid, wrth gwrs, ond y rheswm am hynny oedd bod rhaid inni wneud iawn am y toriadau diarbed a wnaed o dan John Redwood, ac yn y blaen. Ni allwn gefnogi gwelliant 6 ychwaith. Hanesydd economaidd ydwyf, felly gwelaf werth hanes, ond mae rhoi'r bai am brinder defnyddiau crai yn ein heconomi fyd-eang fodern ar gau mwyngloddiau haearn yn mynd yn rhy bell.

The report highlights the importance of training and the need to ensure that work-based learning has adequate resource allocation. This is a significant point at a time when FE colleges tell us that funding for their vocational training units is being cut. I highlight in particular paragraph 9, which states:

Mae'r adroddiad yn tynnu sylw at bwysigrwydd hyfforddi a'r angen i sicrhau dyrannu adnoddau digonol ar gyfer dysgu sy'n seiliedig ar waith. Mae hyn yn bwysig ar adeg y mae colegau addysg bellach yn dweud wrthym fod cyllid ar gyfer eu hunedau hyfforddiant galwedigaethol yn cael ei gwtogi. Tynnaf sylw'n benodol at baragraff 9, lle y dywedir:

'There is an urgent need for greater clarity of the public support available to manufacturers to assist with their training needs.'

Mae taer angen mwy o eglurhad ynglyn â'r cymorth cyhoeddus sydd ar gael i weithgynhyrchwyr i'w helpu gyda'u hanghenion hyfforddi.

4.50 p.m.

The current situation is complex and confused, and it needs urgent reform. An irony of our situation is that, despite the fact that we have a low gross domestic product per capita and pockets of high economic inactivity and unemployment, manufacturers report recruitment problems when offering relatively well-paid jobs. We do not only have to improve basic skills, we must also improve the image of manufacturing.

Mae'r sefyllfa bresennol yn gymhleth a dyrys, ac mae taer angen ei diwygio. Un agwedd eironig ar ein sefyllfa yw bod gweithgynhyrchwyr yn dweud eu bod yn profi problemau o ran recriwtio wrth gynnig swyddi â chyflog cymharol dda, a hynny er gwaethaf y ffaith bod ein cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen yn isel a bod llecynnau y ceir llawer o anweithgarwch economaidd a diweithdra. Yn ogystal â gwella sgiliau sylfaenol, rhaid inni hefyd wella delwedd gweithgynhyrchu.

**Christine Chapman:** It is still the case that far too few women enter into apprenticeships in manufacturing. I visited a company this week and was saddened to see that there has not been much change in 20 years. Manufacturing would benefit from greater diversity.

**Christine Chapman:** Mae'n dal i fod yn wir bod rhy ychydig o lawer o fenywod yn ymgymryd â phrentisiaethau mewn gweithgynhyrchu. Ymwelais â chwmmni yr wythnos hon ac fe'm digalonwyd o weld na fu llawer o newid mewn 20 mlynedd. Byddai gweithgynhyrchu'n elwa o gael mwy o amrywiaeth.

**Jenny Randerson:** There are important image stereotypes to overcome and, if we could do that, we would also go some way to overcoming the wage gap between men and women.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae stereoteipiau pwysig o ran delwedd y mae'n rhaid inni eu trechu ac, os gallem wneud hynny, aem rywfaint o'r ffordd hefyd tuag at gau'r bwlch cyflogau rhwng dynion a menywod.

State aid to industry is particularly important. The report points out that our manufacturers receive less than one third of the European Union average of state aid. The tendency elsewhere is to use a wider range of instruments, including tax exemptions and soft loans. What is the Minister doing to convey the urgency of levelling the playing field to the Westminster Government? Once again, the British Government is gold-plating EU regulations, which makes them more onerous here than elsewhere in the EU and contributes to the demonisation of that institution in many people's minds. There is scope for us to take our own view in terms of some EU regulations, and we should do that much more often, rather than simply following Westminster's lead.

Mae cymorth gwladol i ddiwydiant yn arbennig o bwysig. Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi bod ein gweithgynhyrchwyr yn cael llai nag un rhan o dair o'r cymorth gwladol a roddir ar gyfartaledd yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Y tuedd mewn manau eraill yw defnyddio amrywiaeth ehangach o offerynnau, gan gynnwys rhyddhad o dreth a benthyciadau hawdd eu had-dalu. Beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i gyfleu i Lywodraeth San Steffan fod taer angen sicrhau chwarae teg? Unwaith eto, mae Llywodraeth Prydain yn goreuro rheoliadau'r UE, gan eu gwneud yn fwy beichus yma nag mewn manau eraill yn yr UE a chyfrannu at ddemoneiddio'r sefydliad hwnnw yng ngolwg llawer o bobl. Mae lle inni ffurfio ein barn ein hunain ar rai o reoliadau'r UE, a dylem wneud hynny'n amlach o lawer, yn hytrach na dim ond dilyn arweiniad San Steffan.

What is the Minister doing to positively influence the current review of state aids by the European Commission, as suggested in paragraph 41? As we highlighted in a recent debate, there is still much to be done to make the public procurement initiative work, to make it more than just warm words, and there is still much to be done to genuinely open up the procurement process to local small and medium-sized businesses.

Beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i ddylanwadu'n gadarnhaol ar adolygiad presennol y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd o gymhorthion gwladol, fel yr awgrymir ym mharagraff 41? Fel y gwnaethom ddangos mewn dadl yn ddiweddar, mae llawer i'w wneud o hyd i beri i'r fenter caffael cyhoeddus lwyddo, a bod yn fwy na dim ond geiriau teg, ac mae llawer i'w wneud o hyd i agor y broses gaffael yn iawn i fusnesau lleol bach a chanolig eu maint.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Your time is running out.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'ch amser yn dod i ben.

**Jenny Randerson:** Finally, the report refers to the fact that Wales has one of the lowest levels of research funding in Europe, and yet the Labour Assembly Government has cut the amount of money for the knowledge exploitation fund, which is aimed at making that link between academia and business. Will the Minister also respond to that?

**Jenny Randerson:** Yn olaf, mae'r adroddiad yn cyfeirio at y ffaith mai yng Nghymru y ceir un o'r lefelau isaf o gyllido ar gyfer ymchwil yn Ewrop, ac eto mae Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad wedi cwtdogi ar y swm o arian ar gyfer y gronfa defnyddio gwybodaeth, sydd â'r amcan o greu'r cysylltiad hwnnw rhwng y byd academiaidd a busnes. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymateb i hynny hefyd?

**Carl Sargeant:** The manufacturing industry plays a considerable role in my constituency as well as in Flintshire as a whole—well over 20 per cent of the workforce relies on a strong, stable manufacturing sector. We have gone from 60 plants, employing 28,300 people in 1970 to 156 plants, employing 19,000 today. However, there have been fluctuations in that period, and stability cannot be taken for granted. From Airbus at Broughton to the businesses on Deeside industrial park, my small corner of Wales plays a significant role in the Welsh economy.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yn chwarae rhan bwysig yn fy etholaeth i ac yn sir y Fflint drwyddi draw—mae ymhell dros 20 y cant o'r gweithlu'n dibynnu ar sector gweithgynhyrchu cadarn a sefydlog. Aethom o fod â 60 o weithfeydd a oedd yn cyflogi 28,300 yn 1970 at fod â 156 o weithfeydd sy'n cyflogi 19,000 heddiw. Er hynny, bu amrywiadau yn y cyfnod hwnnw, ac ni ellir cymryd sefydlogrwydd yn ganiataol. Rhwng Airbus ym Mrychdyn a'r busnesau ym mharc diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy, mae fy nghornel fach i o Gymru'n chwarae rhan o bwys yn economi Cymru.

It is therefore important that we discuss the report of the manufacturing task and finish group. It is detailed, and a number of key issues have been identified. Other speakers have mentioned these. There are several challenges that need to be addressed to ensure the future prosperity of manufacturing in north-east Wales.

Mae'n bwysig, felly, inni drafod adroddiad y grwp gorchwyl a gorffen ar weithgynhyrchu. Mae'n un manwl, a nodwyd sawl mater allweddol. Mae siaradwyr eraill wedi sôn am y rhain. Mae sawl her y bydd yn rhaid eu hwynebu er mwyn sicrhau ffyniant gweithgynhyrchu yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain yn y dyfodol.

The task and finish group has highlighted skills, training and recruitment as three related areas linked to the future success of manufacturing. Far from the lumbering industries of the past, modern manufacturing has progressed to more advanced manufacturing techniques that cannot rely upon an unskilled or partially skilled workforce. Flintshire is fortunate: in 2003, a survey on employer opinions on skills in Wales stated that 905 employers said that their employees have sufficient skills to meet their business needs. However, as technology progresses, skills gaps can emerge, and 18 per cent of employers in Flintshire report skills gaps.

Mae'r grwp gorchwyl a gorffen wedi tynnu sylw at sgiliau, hyfforddiant a recriwtio fel tri maes cysylltiedig sy'n ymwneud â llwyddiant gweithgynhyrchu yn y dyfodol. Yn wahanol iawn i ddiwydiannau araf y gorffennol, mae gweithgynhyrchu modern wedi symud ymlaen at dechnegau gweithgynhyrchu mwy datblygedig na allant ddibynnu ar weithlu anfedrus neu rannol fedrus. Mae sir y Fflint yn ffodus oherwydd, yn ôl arolwg a wnaed yn 2003 o farn cyflogwyr am sgiliau yng Nghymru, dywedodd 905 o gyflogwyr fod eu gweithwyr yn meddu ar sgiliau digonol i fodloni eu hanghenion busnes. Fodd bynnag, wrth i dechnoleg ddatblygu, gall bylchau agor o ran sgiliau, a dywedodd 18 y cant o gyflogwyr yn sir y Fflint fod ganddynt fylchau o ran sgiliau.

To pick up on a point that Lisa made, the Welsh Assembly Government is at the forefront of encouraging companies to sign up to the basic skills employers' pledge. We are actively pursuing that.

Gan ddilyn pwynt a wnaeth Lisa, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n flaengar wrth annog cwmnïau i lofnodi addewid y cyflogwyr ar sgiliau sylfaenol. Yr ydym yn mynd ynghylch hynny.

The report calls for greater clarity regarding public support for training, noting the importance in allowing the industry to plan effectively. We should be proud to invest in our industries and, as the report states, support should be viewed as such, rather than just being viewed as a grant. In my constituency, exciting training developments are linked in with the manufacturing industry. Deeside College is working closely with the aviation industry and, as a result, skills can be identified and training can be appropriately sourced and provided. This is resource dependent, as is noted in the report, and I hope that adequate resources will be found.

Mae'r adroddiad yn galw am fwy o eglurder o ran cymorth cyhoeddus ar gyfer hyfforddi, gan nodi ei bod yn bwysig caniatáu i'r diwydiant gynllunio'n effeithiol. Dylem fod yn falch o fuddsoddi yn ein diwydiannau ac, fel y dywed yr adroddiad, dylid edrych ar gymorth fel yr hyn ydyw, yn hytrach na'i ystyried yn grant. Yn fy etholaeth i, ceir datblygiadau cyffrous mewn hyfforddi sy'n gysylltiedig â'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu. Mae Coleg Glannau Dyfrdwy yn cydweithio'n agos â'r diwydiant awyrennau ac, o ganlyniad i hynny, gellir dynodi sgiliau a sicrhau a darparu hyfforddiant yn ôl y gofyn. Mae hyn yn dibynnu ar adnoddau, fel y nodir yn yr adroddiad, a gobeithiaf y canfyddir adnoddau digonol.

Historically, infrastructure has played an important part in creating successful businesses. Materials need to reach the plant just as much as the finished product needs to leave, whether it is by train, truck, or in the hold of an aircraft or a ship—hopefully up and down the river Dee. Technological infrastructure is as important as traditional transport infrastructure. For example, information technology enables customers' orders and designs from across the planet to reach the plant within a day—the business world has been made much smaller. Unfortunately, the report does not note the potential benefits of improved IT infrastructures, nor does it mention improvements that could be made to north-south links in Wales. Traffic infrastructure improvements in north Wales, as well as control over the strategic future of our railways, could also be used to stimulate manufacturing growth. Unfortunately, the report does not recognise either.

Yn y gorffennol, bu seilwaith yn bwysig wrth greu busnesau llwyddiannus. Mae yr un mor angenrheidiol i ddefnyddiau gyrraedd y gwaith ag ydyw i'r cynnyrch gorffenedig ei adael, boed hynny ar drên, mewn lorri, neu yng nghrombil awyren neu long—i fyny ac i lawr afon Dyfrdwy, gobeithio. Mae seilwaith technolegol yr un mor bwysig â seilwaith trafniadaeth traddodiadol. Er enghraifft, mae technoleg gwybodaeth yn fodd i archebion a dyluniadau cwsmeriaid gyrraedd y gwaith o bedwar ban y byd o fewn diwrnod—mae byd busnes wedi mynd yn llai o lawer. Gwaetha'r modd, nid yw'r adroddiad yn nodi'r budd y gellir ei gael o well seilweithiau TG, ac nid yw'n sôn ychwaith am y gwelliannau y gellid eu cael mewn cysylltiadau rhwng y de a'r gogledd yng Nghymru. Yn ogystal â hynny, gellid defnyddio gwelliannau i'r seilwaith traffig yn y Gogledd, yn ogystal â rheolaeth strategol dros ein rheilffyrdd yn y dyfodol, i ysgogi twf mewn gweithgynhyrchu. Yn anffodus, nid yw'r adroddiad yn cydnabod y naill na'r llall.

I agree with the report that the pace at which manufacturing companies develop new strategies, products and services needs to accelerate when considered in the context of global competition. Progress will not be made standing still. I hope that the Welsh Assembly Government commitment—the knowledge bank—will help stimulate innovation, and I hope that the Government will continue to stress the importance of collaboration between industry and academic partners in Wales. I support several of the recommendations set out by the task and finish group. However, its omissions concern me. It makes little mention of the infrastructure that is so important to the future of manufacturing in north Wales, and in my constituency in particular. Despite that, I hope that the Government will seek to address these concerns and take on these challenges.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'n glir o'r hyn a glywsom eisoes bod consensws yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn, a bod y prif gasgliadau yn eithriadol o bwysig. Mewn gwirionedd, fodd bynnag, nid oes llawer o ddiben canolbwyntio ar hyfforddiant nac ar gynnal y sector nac ychwaith ar drafnidiaeth ac isadeiledd os nad oes swyddi yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru.

Fe'm syfrdanwyd a'm siomi gan agwedd y Gweinidog, a oedd fwy neu lai yn cyfaddef bod yn rhaid i'r sector gweithgynhyrchu fod yn agored i bwysau'r farchnad. Mae'n rhyfedd clywed Gweinidog o'r Blaid Lafur yn dadlau dros bolisi o beidio ag ymyrryd yn y farchnad, yn enwedig o ystyried bod llawer o'r pwysau ar weithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru yn ffactorau allanol. Cyfeiriwyd at y marchnadoedd arian rhyngwladol. Mae gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru wedi dioddef yn enbyd o'u herwydd ac wedi methu â chystadlu ar y farchnad ryngwladol.

Mewn sefyllfa o'r fath, felly, byddai rhywun yn disgwyl i Weinidog a Llywodraeth Lafur—ni fyddwn yn disgwyl i'r Blaid Geidwadol ymyrryd yn y farchnad mewn sefyllfa o'r fath—fod yn barod i ymyrryd yn y farchnad i gynnal y sector hollbwysig hon. Efallai fod hyn yn brawf pellach nad oes fawr o wahaniaeth o ran eu polisi datblygu economaidd rhwng y Blaid Lafur a'r Blaid Geidwadol erbyn hyn, ac mai'r un egwyddorion sydd yn eu gyrru.

Cytunaf â'r hyn a ddywed yr adroddiad i'r perwyl bod rhaid i gwmnïau gweithgynhyrchu ddatblygu strategaethau, cynhyrchion a gwasanaethau newydd yn gynt o ystyried hynny yng nghyd-destun cystadlu byd-eang. Ni wneir cynnydd wrth sefyll yn ein hunfan. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr ymrwymiad gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru—y banc gwybodaeth—yn gymorth i ysgogi arloesedd, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn dal i roi pwys ar gydweithio rhwng diwydiant a phartneriaid academiaidd yng Nghymru. Cefnogaf nifer o'r argymhellion a nodir gan y grwp gorchwyl a gorffen. Er hynny, mae'r hyn a adawodd allan yn peri pryder i mi. Nid oes fawr o sôn am y seilwaith sydd mor bwysig i ddyfodol gweithgynhyrchu yn y Gogledd, ac yn fy etholaeth i'n benodol. Er hynny, gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ceisio ymateb i'r pryderon a'r heriau hyn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** It is clear from what we have already heard that there is a consensus in welcoming this report, and that the main conclusions are exceptionally important. In reality, however, there is little point in concentrating on training nor on maintaining the sector nor on transport and infrastructure unless jobs are available in the manufacturing sector in Wales.

I was stunned and disappointed by the Minister's attitude, who more or less accepted that the manufacturing sector must be open to market pressures. It is strange to hear a Labour Party Minister arguing for a policy of non-intervention in the market, particularly considering that many of the pressures on manufacturing in Wales are external factors. References have been made to the international money markets. Manufacturing in Wales has suffered greatly because of them and has failed to compete on the international market.

In such a situation, therefore, one would expect a Labour Minister and Government—I would not expect the Conservative Party to intervene in the market in such a situation—to be ready to intervene in the market to support this all-important sector. Perhaps this is further proof that there is now little difference regarding their economic development policy between the Labour Party and the Conservative Party, and that the same principles are driving them.

5.00 p.m.

**Brian Gibbons:** Is it not the case that much of the constraints in terms of what can be done are a consequence of the European Union's competition rule? In view of Plaid Cymru's policy of independence in Europe, how will your party lead Wales to address these constraints that the EU puts on us? If you do not have a real answer to that question, it is only rhetoric.

**Brian Gibbons:** Onid yw'n wir bod llawer o'r cyfyngiadau ar yr hyn y gellir ei wneud yn ganlyniad i reol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar gystadlu? Yng ngolwg polisi Plaid Cymru o gael annibyniaeth yn Ewrop, sut y bydd eich plaid yn arwain Cymru i ymdrin â'r cyfyngiadau y mae'r UE yn eu gosod arnom? Os nad oes gennych ateb go iawn i'r cwestiwn hwnnw, nid yw ond rhethreg.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** It always amazes me how you, Brian, and some of your colleagues, manage to bring independence into every debate. We are now discussing the situation of manufacturing in Wales which, I hope that you will agree, is far more important to the Welsh economy than it is to the economy of any other part of the UK. The point that I was making was, why is a Labour Government, of all governments, not prepared to intervene in the market to ensure that that important sector within the Welsh economy can be supported? I do not know why you bring independence into that. There are constraints in terms of EU regulations, but you are then faced with a situation, Brian, where you have—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Byddaf yn rhyfeddu bob amser at y modd yr ydych chi, Brian, a rhai o'ch cyd-Aelodau, yn llwyddo i gynnwys annibyniaeth ym mhob dadl. Yr ydym yn trafod sefyllfa gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru sydd, fel y cytunwch yr wyf yn gobeithio, yn bwysicach o lawer i economi Cymru nag ydyw i economi unrhyw ran arall o'r DU. Y pwynt yr oeddwn yn ei wneud oedd, pam nad yw Llywodraeth Lafur, o bob llywodraeth, yn barod i ymyrryd yn y farchnad i sicrhau y gellir cynnal y sector pwysig hwnnw yn economi Cymru? Ni wn pam yr ydych yn cynnwys annibyniaeth yn hynny. Mae cyfyngiadau o ran rheoliadau'r UE, ond yr ydych yn wynebu sefyllfa wedyn, Brian, lle y mae gennych—

**Andrew Davies:** Do you have the answer?

**Andrew Davies:** A yw'r ateb gennych?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I have an answer, Andrew, and it is to do with you as Minister and whether you are prepared to challenge those regulations and to push boundaries in order to ensure that manufacturing in Wales is supported. You are clearly not prepared to do that, and this Government has not been prepared to do that over the past four years. As a result, we have seen the serious decline of the Welsh manufacturing industry.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae gennyf ateb, Andrew, ac mae'n ymwneud â chi fel Gweinidog a'ch parodrwydd i herio'r rheoliadau hynny a gwthio yn erbyn y cyfyngiadau er mwyn sicrhau cymorth i weithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru. Mae'n amlwg nad ydych yn barod i wneud hynny, ac ni fu'r Llywodraeth hon yn barod i wneud hynny dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf. O ganlyniad, gwelsom ddirywiad difrifol yn y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru.

**Janet Davies:** Do you not think that it is extremely disturbing, given the lack of state intervention, that the report says that only 1 per cent of state aid is given in the UK whereas it is 8 per cent on average in other European states? What on earth is the UK Labour Government and the Welsh Assembly Labour Government playing at?

**Janet Davies:** Oni chredwch mai testun gofid mawr, yng ngolwg y diffyg ymyrryd gan y wladwriaeth, yw bod yr adroddiad yn dweud mai dim ond 1 y cant o gymorth gwladol a roddir yn y DU tra rhoddir 8 y cant ar gyfartaledd mewn gwladwriaethau eraill yn Ewrop? Beth ar y ddaear yw gêm Llywodraeth Lafur y DU a Llywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** That is exactly my point. There are opportunities where the Minister, if he so chooses—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Dyna'r union bwynt yr wyf yn ei wneud. Mae cyfleoedd gan y Gweinidog, os yw'n dewis—

**Andrew Davies:** Give an example.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** There is the use of regional selective assistance to support manufacturing in Wales. In 2001, we spent less than one third of the European average per capita on direct aid to firms. That is something specific that you can do. However, you choose not to do so because you do not want to intervene. Let us remind ourselves of the astonishing decline of Welsh manufacturing under New Labour. In 1997, manufacturing accounted for 28.1 per cent of Welsh GDP. This had reduced to 22.8 per cent by 2001, and during that period, one manufacturing job was lost every working second in the UK. Jobs were lost in Wales at an even sharper rate. You can sit back and smile, Minister, but we are talking about the foundation of the Welsh economy. You sit back and you will not intervene or do anything and then you ask your backbenchers to come up with irrelevant references to policies that have nothing to do with the situation that your Government currently faces. We welcome this report, but we would welcome far more a willingness on your part to do something to support this important sector.

**John Griffiths:** You talk about jobs and Conservative and Labour economic policies. The overwhelming reality that you must face is that Labour is working towards full employment. We are getting there and we have an impressive record in that regard whereas for the Tories, unemployment was a price worth paying. That is a stark difference.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You must accept that when you talk about full employment—no doubt Andrew will say that unemployment rates are at a record low—at the same time, the prosperity of Wales has declined. [*Interruption.*] Your own figures say that. You must explain why that has happened. There are more jobs but they do not pay as well and we are losing manufacturing jobs.

**Andrew Davies:** Rhowch enghraifft.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Dyna'r defnydd o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol i hybu gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru. Yn 2001, gwnaethom wario llai nag un rhan o dair o'r cyfartaledd y pen yn Ewrop ar gymorth uniongyrchol i fusnesau. Dyna rywbeth penodol y gallwch ei wneud. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn dewis peidio â gwneud hynny gan nad ydych yn dymuno ymyrryd. Gadewch inni ddwyn i gof y dirywiad syfrdanol a fu mewn gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru o dan Lafur Newydd. Yn 1997, yr oedd gweithgynhyrchu'n gyfrifol am 28.1 y cant o CMC Cymru. Yr oedd hynny wedi gostwng i 22.8 y cant erbyn 2001 ac, yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, collwyd un swydd gweithgynhyrchu bob eiliad waith yn y DU. Collwyd swyddi yng Nghymru'n gyflymach byth. Gallwch eistedd yn ôl a gwenu, Weinidog, ond yr ydym yn sôn am sylfaen economi Cymru. Yr ydych yn eistedd yn ôl ac ni wnewch ymyrryd neu wneud dim ac wedyn gofynnwch i'ch meincwyr cefn godi cyfeiriadau amherthnasol at bolisiâu nad oes a wnelont ddim â'r sefyllfa y mae'ch Llywodraeth yn ei hwynebu ar hyn o bryd. Croesawn yr adroddiad hwn, ond byddem yn croesawu llawer mwy o barodrwydd ar eich rhan chi i wneud rhywbeth i gefnogi'r sector pwysig hwn.

**John Griffiths:** Yr ydych yn sôn am swyddi a pholisiâu economaidd y Ceidwadwyr a Llafur. Y gwir plaen y mae'n rhaid ichi ei wynebu yw bod Llafur yn ceisio sicrhau cyflogaeth lawn. Yr ydym yn llwyddo ac mae gennym record glodwiw yn hynny o beth, tra oedd diweithdra'n bris yr oedd yn werth ei dalu yng ngolwg y Toriaid. Mae hynny'n wahaniaeth amlwg.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Rhaid ichi dderbyn, wrth sôn am gyflogaeth lawn—mae'n siwr y dywed Andrew fod y cyfraddau diweithdra ar eu hisaf erioed—fod ffyniant Cymru wedi dirywio, yr un pryd. [*Torri ar draws.*] Eich ffigurau'ch hun sy'n dweud hynny. Rhaid ichi egluro pam y digwyddodd hynny. Mae mwy o swyddi ond nid ydynt yn talu cystal ac yr ydym yn colli swyddi gweithgynhyrchu.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I wish to address my remarks to the section of the report that relates to skills, training and recruitment. I welcome the report as it adds yet further weight to the progress already made through ELWa and the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning's employment and skills action plan. The report affirms that the Assembly Government is on the right track and it also calls for further steps to be taken so that Wales can achieve a highly qualified workforce, which will enable manufacturing in Wales to meet the ever greater challenges of globalisation and emerging markets. A recent survey showed how big an impact a skilled workforce would have on the UK economy.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Dymunaf ymdrin yn fy sylwadau â'r adran yn yr adroddiad sy'n ymwneud â sgiliau, hyfforddiant a recriwtio. Croesawaf yr adroddiad gan ei fod yn ategu pwysigrwydd y cynnydd a wnaed eisoes drwy ELWa a chynllun gweithredu ar gyflogaeth a sgiliau y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Mae'r adroddiad yn cadarnhau bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dilyn y llwybr cywir ac mae hefyd yn galw am gymryd camau pellach fel y gall Cymru gael gweithlu tra chymwys, fel y gall gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru ymateb i'r heriau mwy byth sy'n codi o globaleiddio a marchnadoedd sy'n datblygu. Mae arolwg diweddar wedi dangos cymaint o effaith a gâi gweithlu medrus ar economi'r DU.

Research shows that over 85 per cent of companies estimate that having the right people with the right mix of skills would boost their productivity by more than 5 per cent. A 5 per cent increase in productivity is the equivalent of the UK annual spend on education, or of the UK having a £50 billion increase in GDP. Given such figures, businesses owe it to themselves to invest in skills. Welsh businesses appear to be leading the way, as over 50 per cent offer off-the-job training, compared with 35 per cent in England, and a survey undertaken by the Sector Skills Council for Science, Engineering and Manufacturing Technologies in 2003 showed that only 10 per cent of businesses in Wales felt that there was a skills gap, compared with 17 per cent in England. However, I accept Glyn's point that there is a significant skills gap in some parts of Wales and that this needs to be addressed. I am confident that this will be done.

Dengys ymchwil fod mwy na 85 y cant o gwmnïau'n amcangyfrif y byddai cael y gweithwyr iawn a chanddynt y cymysgedd sgiliau priodol yn hybu eu cynhyrchiant o fwy na 5 y cant. Mae cynnydd o 5 y cant mewn cynhyrchiant yn cyfateb i wariant blynyddol y DU ar addysg, neu gynnydd o £50 biliwn yn CMC y DU. Yng ngolwg ffigurau o'r fath, dylai busnesau fuddsoddi mewn sgiliau. Ymddengys fod busnesau yng Nghymru'n arwain y ffordd, gan fod mwy na 50 y cant ohonynt yn cynnig hyfforddiant oddi wrth y gwaith, o'i gymharu â 35 y cant yn Lloegr, ac yr oedd arolwg gan Gyngor Sgiliau Sector y Gwyddorau, Peirianeg a'r Technolegau Gweithgynhyrchu yn 2003 yn dangos mai dim ond 10 y cant o fusnesau yng Nghymru a deimlai fod bylchau o ran sgiliau, o'i gymharu â 17 y cant yn Lloegr. Er hynny, yr wyf yn derbyn y pwynt a wnaeth Glyn i'r perwyl bod bwch sylweddol o ran sgiliau mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru a rhaid ymdrin â hynny. Yr wyf yn ffyddiog y gwneir hynny.

We cannot afford to be complacent. The employment and skills action plan and ELWa's review of learning in the workplace are already addressing much of the report's recommendations. The action plan's key aim is to ensure that everyone has the generic skills to take up employment and to address the skills needs in, and between, key sectors of the economy. As the report says, effective partnership working between the private and public sector is at the heart of work-based learning. The public sector needs to be responsive and holistic, allowing the private sector more of a say in the services provided. However, the private sector must play its role in listening to its workers and providing skills support. As mentioned by Carl Sargeant, my directly elected colleague, the

Ni allwn fforddio bod yn ddifater. Mae'r cynllun gweithredu ar gyflogaeth a sgiliau ac adolygiad ELWa o ddysgu yn y gweithle eisoes yn rhoi sylw i lawer o argymhellion yr adroddiad. Prif nod y cynllun gweithredu yw sicrhau bod gan bawb y sgiliau cyffredinol i gymryd swydd ac ymdrin ag anghenion o ran sgiliau mewn sectorau allweddol yn yr economi. Fel y dywed yr adroddiad, gwaith effeithiol mewn partneriaeth rhwng y sector preifat a'r sector cyhoeddus yw hanfod dysgu sy'n seiliedig ar waith. Rhaid i'r sector cyhoeddus fod yn ymatebol ac yn gyfannol, gan roi mwy o lais i'r sector preifat yn y gwasanaethau a ddarperir. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i'r sector preifat chwarae ei ran wrth wrando ar ei weithwyr a darparu cymorth sgiliau. Fel y dywedodd



basic skills employers pledge, established by sector agreements through the sector skills councils, is a good start. It is important to bear in mind that having a large number of adults with poor literacy and numeracy skills makes it difficult to make skills training a reality for those people.

Carl Sargeant, fy nghyd-Aelod a etholwyd yn uniongyrchol, mae addewid y cyflogwyr ar sgiliau sylfaenol, a sefydlwyd drwy gytundebau sector drwy'r cynghorau sgiliau sector, yn ddechrau da. Mae'n bwysig cofio mai anodd, o gael nifer fawr o oedolion a chanddynt sgiliau llythrennedd a rhifogrwydd gwael, yw gwneud hyfforddiant mewn sgiliau yn realiti i'r bobl hynny.

Employers must continue to be the key driver in the provision of new skills for their workforces. As other Members have said, the skills needs of employers range from basic skills to management and high-end skills. These needs change quickly, and insufficient information can result in quickly emerging skills gaps. This is why the skills concordat was signed last year by ELWa, the Wales Trades Union Congress and the Confederation of British Industry, and why the employers forum arose from Future Skills Wales. I agree that skills training must be related to current jobs and anticipated jobs. We must not accept, particularly from work-based learning providers, modern apprenticeship and NVQ training in areas where the opportunity for future employment is limited or non-existent.

Rhaid i gyflogwyr barhau'n brif ysgogwyr ar gyfer dysgu sgiliau newydd i'w gweithluoedd. Fel y dywedodd Aelodau eraill, mae anghenion cyflogwyr o ran sgiliau'n amrywio o sgiliau sylfaenol i sgiliau rheoli a sgiliau uwch. Mae'r anghenion hyn yn newid yn gyflym ac, os na cheir digon o wybodaeth, gall bylchau o ran sgiliau ddatblygu'n gyflym. Oherwydd hynny y llofnodwyd y concordat ar sgiliau y llynedd gan ELWa, Cyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru a Chyddfederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, ac y cododd y fforwm cyflogwyr o Sgiliau Dyfodol Cymru. Cytunaf fod rhaid cysylltu hyfforddiant mewn sgiliau â swyddi sy'n bod ar hyn o bryd a rhai a ddisgwylir. Ni ddylem dderbyn hyfforddiant ar gyfer prentisiaethau modern neu gymwysterau NVQ, yn enwedig gan ddarparwyr dysgu sy'n seiliedig ar waith, mewn meysydd lle nad oes fawr ddim cyfle i gael gwaith yn y dyfodol.

The public and private sectors must do their bit to upskill Wales. I am happy to sponsor a CBI Cymru event next week in the Assembly, which will see the launch of a report into how companies in Wales are giving something back by using their employees' skills to better local communities. I hope to see many Members at the event.

Rhaid i'r sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat wneud eu rhan i uwchsgilio Cymru. Yr wyf yn falch o noddi digwyddiad o eiddo CBI Cymru yr wythnos nesaf yn y Cynulliad, lle y cyhoeddir adroddiad ar y modd y mae cwmnïau yng Nghymru yn rhoi rhywbeth yn ôl drwy ddefnyddio sgiliau eu gweithwyr i wella cymunedau lleol. Gobeithiaf weld llawer o Aelodau yn y digwyddiad hwnnw.

For the reasons I have mentioned, it is of crucial that we continue with our plans to achieve parity of esteem for vocational and academic learners. Such developments will help to seal a positive future for manufacturing in Wales.

Am y rhesymau yr wyf wedi'u crybwyll, mae'n hollbwysig inni barhau â'n cynlluniau i sicrhau parch cydradd i ddysgwyr galwedigaethol ac academiaidd. Bydd datblygiadau o'r fath o gymorth i sicrhau dyfodol cadarnhaol i weithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I will concentrate on two crucial issues highlighted in the report, namely transport and waste disposal. Transport is obviously crucial to manufacturing in Wales, not only to ensure the efficient and effective distribution of raw materials and finished products, but to facilitate the availability and movement of employees. Successful modern manufacturing processes are lean, do not hold stock and use the Japanese just-in-time system of daily in-and-out deliveries. This necessary modern phenomenon was highlighted during the fuel dispute.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Canolbwyntiaf ar ddau fater hollbwysig y mae'r adroddiad yn tynnu sylw atynt, sef trafndiaeth a gwaredu gwastraff. Mae'n amlwg bod trafndiaeth yn hollbwysig i weithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru, nid yn unig er mwyn dosbarthu defnyddiau crai a chynhyrchion gorffenedig yn effeithiol ac yn effeithlon, ond i sicrhau y bydd gweithwyr ar gael ac yn gallu symud o gwmpas. Mae prosesau gweithgynhyrchu modern llwyddiannus yn ddiwastraff, nid ydynt yn dal stoc ac maent yn defnyddio system mewn union bryd y Siapaneaid o ddanfon i mewn ac allan yn ddyddiol. Amlygwyd y ffenomen fodern angenrheidiol hon yn ystod yr anghydfod ynghylch tanwydd.

As Members have said, the report highlights that

Fel y dywedodd Aelodau, mae'r adroddiad yn nodi

'In the minds of manufacturers, resolving current infrastructure problems with the transport infrastructure ranks second only to resolving training, skills and recruitment problems'.

Ym marn gweithgynhyrchwyr, yr unig beth sy'n bwysicach na datrys y problemau presennol sy'n ymwneud â'r seilwaith trafndiaeth yw datrys problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â hyfforddiant, sgiliau a recriwtio.

The report also points out that

Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn nodi

'In particular there is a need to resolve congestion problems on the M4 motorway in South Wales.'

Yn benodol, rhaid datrys problemau o ran tagfeydd ar draffordd yr M4 yn y De.

5.10 p.m.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that we need to ensure better access as soon as possible and fund sensitive road improvements. The report urges that a greater proportion of Objective 1 funding be spent on the infrastructure that supports the manufacturing industry in Wales. The money should be used to improve rail infrastructure with roll-on, roll-off units to increase the use of rail freight in order to lessen road congestion. With primary legislative powers, we would have better direct control of that issue.

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn credu bod angen inni sicrhau gwell mynediad cyn gynted ag y bo modd a chyllido gwelliannau sensitif i ffyrdd. Mae'r adroddiad yn galw am wario cyfran fwy o gyllid Amcan 1 ar y seilwaith sy'n cynnal y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru. Dylid defnyddio'r arian i wella'r seilwaith rheilffyrdd gydag unedau i'w llwytho a'u dadlwytho fel y bydd mwy o gludiant ar reilffyrdd er mwyn lleihau tagfeydd ar ffyrdd. O gael pwerau deddfu sylfaenol, caem well rheolaeth uniongyrchol ar y mater hwnnw.

The report also highlights waste disposal, stating that, given the onset of new regulations, we need to address the availability of waste disposal facilities, particularly for hazardous waste. No such facilities exist in Wales, and the Welsh Liberal Democrats have been urging the Labour Assembly Government to rectify that situation for some time. The report recommends that the Government takes action, and works with local government, the waste disposal industry and the Environment Agency to identify two hazardous waste disposal facilities, in north and south Wales. The report further recommends that those sites be identified by autumn 2004, to be available from July 2005. I urge the Government and the Minister to act on this as a matter of urgency.

Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn rhoi sylw i waredu gwastraff, gan ddweud, yng ngolwg dyfodiad rheoliadau newydd, fod angen inni ystyried nifer y cyfleusterau gwaredu gwastraff sydd ar gael, yn enwedig ar gyfer gwastraff peryglus. Nid oes unrhyw gyfleusterau o'r fath yng Nghymru, ac mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi bod yn galw ar Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad i gywiro'r diffyg hwnnw ers tro. Mae'r adroddiad yn argymhell y dylai'r Llywodraeth gymryd camau, a gweithio gyda llywodraeth leol, y diwydiant gwaredu gwastraff ac Asiantiaeth yr Amgylchedd i ddynodi dau gyfleuster i waredu gwastraff peryglus, yn y De a'r Gogledd. Mae'r adroddiad yn argymhell ymhellach y dylid dynodi'r safleoedd hynny erbyn yr hydref 2004, fel y byddant ar gael o fis Gorffennaf 2005 ymlaen. Anogaf y Llywodraeth a'r Gweinidog i gymryd camau brys ar y mater hwn.

**Mark Isherwood:** While this report is welcome, I am concerned about the implicit message of its conclusions and whether that message will be heard by a Welsh Assembly Government that measures political virility as added expenditure rather than added value. I note in the conclusion a strong feeling that there are already too many initiatives and that rationalisation would be beneficial. The report goes on, in point 28, to state that, during the two months available to it, the group did not develop its thinking beyond the initial concept stage in a number of key areas. The group recognises that more needs to be done to convert the suggestions contained in this paper into practical measures to add value to the manufacturing sector in Wales. It is now for the Minister for Economic Development and Transport to consider how best to take forward the group's recommendations on the ongoing relationship with the sector itself. Clearly, we have an aspirational report, but not an action plan. Suffice it to say that relying on this Minister for Economic Development and Transport hardly inspires us with confidence.

**Mark Isherwood:** Er bod yr adroddiad hwn i'w groesawu, yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch y neges sydd ymhlwg yn ei gasgliadau ac a glywir y neges honno gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sy'n mesur cryfder gwleidyddol yn ôl gwariant ychwanegol yn hytrach na gwerth ychwanegol. Nodaf fod ymdeimlad cryf yn y diwedd glo fod gormod o fentrau eisoes ac mai buddiol fyddai eu rhesymoli. Aiff yr adroddiad ymlaen i ddweud, ym mhwynt 28, nad oedd y grwp, yn ystod y ddau fis a oedd ar gael iddo, wedi datblygu ei syniadau ymhellach na'r cysyniad gwreiddiol mewn sawl maes allweddol. Mae'r grwp yn cydnabod bod angen gwneud mwy i droi'r awgrymiadau a geir yn y papur hwn yn gamau gweithredu ymarferol i ychwanegu gwerth at y sector gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru. Lle'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yn awr yw ystyried pa fodd sydd orau i hyrwyddo argymhellion y grwp ynghylch y berthynas barhaus â'r sector ei hun. Mae'n amlwg mai adroddiad llawn dyhead yw hwn, ond nid cynllun gweithredu ydyw. Digon yw dweud nad yw gorfod dibynnu ar y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth hwn yn ennyn rhyw lawer o hyder ynom.

Part of the problem lies at the European level. It is, therefore, vital that decisions on the economic policies of Wales in Britain are taken in Britain according to the needs of Britain, rather than being taken in Brussels, despite the needs of Britain. Europe's leaders often talk tough about improving competitiveness, but their words are not matched by deeds.

Mae rhan o'r broblem ar lefel Ewropeaidd. Mae'n hollbwysig, felly, mai ym Mhrydain y gwneir penderfyniadau ar bolisiau economaidd Cymru ym Mhrydain, a hynny'n unol ag anghenion Prydain, yn hytrach nag ym Mrwsel, er gwaethaf anghenion Prydain. Mae arweinyddion Ewrop yn aml yn sôn yn benderfynol am hybu gallu cystadleuol, ond ni throir y geiriau hynny'n weithredoedd.

**Brian Gibbons:** I am impressed by Mark's patriotic gesture; presumably, he would adopt the same attitude towards an overseas investor that came to invest in Wales, and would state that its decisions should not be made in its headquarters, but in Wales. As part of the global economy, we need to adopt solutions that are relevant to a global situation.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn llawn edmygedd at yr arwydd gwlatgarol a roddodd Mark; mae'n debyg mai'r un fyddai ei agwedd at fuddsoddwr o wlad dramor a ddaeth i fuddsoddi yng Nghymrum ac y dywedai na ddylai wneud ei benderfyniadau yn ei bencadlys, ond yng Nghymru. A ninnau'n rhan o'r economi fyd-eang, rhaid inni ddilyn atebion sy'n berthnasol i sefyllfa fyd-eang.

**Mark Isherwood:** Only 12 per cent of our overall economy is traded in Europe, and that is done in numerous different currencies through all currency transactors every day. The key issue is that most monetary policy is set in this country according to interest rates set to meet the needs of Britain, and we have seen what happens when that fails. Furthermore, on fiscal policy, the growth and stability pact would have a major impact on UK decisions on tax and public spending, which I would have thought would concern you.

**Mark Isherwood:** Dim ond 12 y cant o'n heconomi gyfan a fasnachir yn Ewrop, ac ymgymerir â hynny mewn sawl arian gwahanol drwy'r holl fasnachwyr arian bob diwrnod. Y mater pwysig yw bod y rhan fwyaf o bolisi ariannol yn cael ei bennu yn y wlad hon yn ôl cyfraddau llog a osodwyd i ddiwallu anghenion Prydain, a gwelsom yr hyn sy'n digwydd pan yw hynny'n methu. At hynny, ynghylch polisi cyllidol, byddai'r cytundeb ar dwf a sefydlogrwydd yn cael effaith fawr ar benderfyniadau yn y DU ar dreth a gwariant cyhoeddus, a thybiais y byddai hynny'n peri pryder i chi.

Economic reform is proceeding slowly in many areas of Europe, and in others it is not proceeding at all. Labour Ministers pay lip service to Europe's competitive agenda, but their policies steadily erode the UK's competitive position through ever-increasing burdens of taxation, including fuel taxation, which is hitting business hard, as is red tape. In Brussels, Labour Members of the European Parliament are in the forefront of the pernicious quest for more and more anti-business European regulation.

Mae diwygiadau economaidd yn mynd rhagddynt yn araf mewn sawl rhan o Ewrop, ac nid oes cynnydd o gwbl mewn eraill. Mae Gweinidogion Llafur yn esgus cefnogi'r agenda Ewropeaidd ar gystadlu, ond mae eu polisiau'n cyson wanhau gallu cystadleuol y DU drwy osod beichiau treth cynyddol, gan gynnwys treth ar danwydd, sy'n taro busnes yn galed, fel y mae biwrocratiaeth. Ym Mrwsel, mae Aelodau Llafur Senedd Ewrop ar y blaen yn yr ymgais niweidiol i gael rhagor o reoleiddio Ewropeaidd yn erbyn busnes.

In north Wales, we have seen a worryingly high level of redundancies in pharmaceuticals, tissue production and other areas of manufacturing in recent months. We have seen a decline in the number of business start-ups, and a collapse in the number of VAT-registered companies. Last year, we saw construction fall by 2.2 per cent, production output by 5.3 per cent, manufacturing output by 4.9 per cent and unemployment among those aged under 24 rise by 6.9 per cent. In terms of economic inactivity in that critical group across north Wales—I do not have the figures for the south—we see a range of 24.1 per cent to 36.1 per cent. That is at crisis level.

Yn y Gogledd, mae'r nifer mawr o ddiswyddiadau ym maes fferylleg, cynhyrchu papur sidan a meysydd gweithgynhyrchu eraill yn y misoedd diwethaf yn peri pryder. Gwelsom ddirywiad yn nifer y busnesau a gychwynwyd, a gostyngiad yn nifer y cwmnïau sydd wedi'u cofrestru ar gyfer TAW. Y llynedd, gwelsom ostyngiad o 2.2 y cant mewn adeiladu, gostyngiad o 5.3 y cant mewn cynhyrchu, gostyngiad o 4.9 y cant mewn gweithgynhyrchu a chododd diweithdra ymysg rhai o dan 24 mlwydd oed o 6.9 y cant. O ran anweithgarwch economaidd yn y grwp hollbwysig hwnnw ledled y Gogledd—nid yw'r ffigurau ar gyfer y De gennyf—gwelwn amrediad o 24.1 y cant i 36.1 y cant. Mae hynny'n argyfyngus.

We talk about the education sector, but the reality of Team Wales is that we can only play with the ball if we join the team, and we are missing the huge potential in the private sector. Why not subsidise private sector consultants and further education and higher education consultants rather than have an army of Assembly sponsored public body consultants? Why not give research and development grants directly to private companies, as well as educational sectors, to spend in universities and further education colleges? Why is the knowledge exploitation fund funded by the Welsh Development Agency? Why not fund further education and higher education institutions directly to enable them to build capacity and encourage innovation and entrepreneurship? Why is Business North Wales complaining that ELWa aspires to supply quality education and qualifications to everyone, while little is said about involving the people who employ the students? That is what is happening in Wales today.

Soniwn am y sector addysg, ond y gwir am Dîm Cymru yw na allwn ond chwarae â'r bêl os ymunwn â'r tîm, ac yr ydym yn colli'r potensial aruthrol yn y sector preifat. Pam na ddylid rhoi cymhorthdal i ymgynghorwyr y sector preifat ac ymgynghorwyr mewn addysg bellach ac uwch yn hytrach na chael byddin o ymgynghorwyr yn y cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad? Pam na ddylid rhoi grantiau ymchwil a datblygu'n uniongyrchol i gwmnïau preifat, yn ogystal â sectorau addysgol, i'w gwario mewn prifysgolion a cholegau addysg bellach? Pam y mae'r gronfa defnyddio gwybodaeth yn cael ei chyllido gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru? Pam na ddylid cyllido sefydliadau addysg bellach ac uwch yn uniongyrchol i'w galluogi i ddatblygu capasiti a hybu arloesedd ac entrepreneuriaeth? Pam y mae Business North Wales yn cwyno bod ELWa yn dyheu am roi addysg a chymwysterau da i bawb, tra na ddywedir fawr ddim am gynnwys y rhai sy'n cyflogi'r myfyrwyr? Dyna sy'n digwydd yng Nghymru heddiw.

We heard reference earlier to relative prosperity figures. Those figures came out at the end of April and, as we have heard, Wales has now been overtaken by other regions of the UK, such as Northern Ireland, north-east England and the south-west of England, whose figures have grown to far higher rates since 2001-02. That is despite Wales having gained the unique competitive advantages of devolution, the record investment in Cardiff and its environment and billions of pounds of Objective 1 funding. So, why have we not seen a major increase in growth? The simple reason is the continuing decline in manufacturing, combined with a growth in lower paid jobs in the retail sector or call centres in general. Given that, policy makers in Wales should be extremely concerned that the most productive sector

Clywsom gyfeirio'n gynharach at y ffigurau ar ffyniant cymharol. Cyhoeddwyd y ffigurau hynny ddiwedd Ebrill ac, fel y clywsom, mae Cymru wedi'i goddiweddyd bellach gan ranbarthau eraill y DU, megis Gogledd Iwerddon, gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr a de-orllewin Lloegr, y mae eu ffigurau wedi codi'n uwch o lawer er 2001-02. Digwyddodd hynny er gwaethaf y fantais gystadleuol unigryw a gafodd Gymru drwy ddatganoli, y buddsoddi mwyaf erioed yng Nghaerdydd a'i hamgylchedd a biliynau o bunnoedd o gyllid Amcan 1. Felly, pam na welsom dwf mawr? Y rheswm syml yw'r dirywiad parhaus mewn gweithgynhyrchu, ynghyd â chynnydd yn nifer y swyddi â chyflogau is yn y sector adwerthu neu ganolfannau galwadau'n gyffredinol. Yng ngolwg hynny, dylai llunwyr polisi yng Nghymru fod yn

of the economy continues to become less important to our nation with regard to prosperity. For example, as we heard, in 1997, manufacturing was around 28.1 per cent of the Welsh economy, now it stands at 22.8 per cent, which is a far bigger decline than in the rest of the UK. In addition, the contribution of manufacturing to the Welsh economy has declined by nearly £0.5 billion since 1997, despite the contribution of the largest manufacturing plant in Europe, namely Airbus in Broughton.

It is therefore of paramount importance that the Assembly Government does everything that it possibly can over the next 12 months to get our manufacturing sector working productively again. Otherwise, there is more chance of the sun rising in the west than of Wales seriously closing the prosperity gap with the rest of the UK by 2010.

**The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies):** I am grateful for this afternoon's contributions. I am particularly grateful for an e-mail that I received from Janet Davies just now, although I suspect that she did not intend to send it to me. No, Janet, I am not going to waste my time criticising Plaid-run councils. I am sure that voters on Thursday will give their own verdict on Plaid-run councils. When they go to the polls on Thursday, the people of Wales, as throughout the UK, will know that the UK economy, and the Welsh economy in particular, has been in extremely good fettle for some time now. We have seen the longest sustained growth of economic development since the industrial revolution. We have an unemployment rate in Wales below that of most of the G7 countries.

You would believe, from the opposition amendments, that manufacturing was growing right up until Labour came to power in the UK in 1997 and here in the Assembly in 1999. That is not true, and they know that. While manufacturing employment has been in long-term historic decline in Wales, as in the rest of the UK, the major decreases were in the Tory recessions of the 1980s and early 1990s. Since Labour came to power, the decline has been slowed. We are working closely with the sector to ensure that it continues to play a central role in our diverse economy in the future. To answer Rhodri Glyn Thomas's point, since 1999, 500 RSA projects have been supported by the Assembly Government, which have created or safeguarded 27,000 jobs. That is an

bryderus dros ben bod sector mwyaf cynhyrchiol yr economi yn dal i fynd yn llai pwysig i'n gwlad o ran ffyniant. Er enghraifft, fel clywsom, yn 1997, yr oedd gweithgynhyrchu tua 28.1 y cant o economi Cymru, ac mae bellach yn 22.8 y cant, sy'n ddirywiad mwy o lawer nag a welwyd yng ngweddill y DU. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae cyfraniad gweithgynhyrchu i economi Cymru wedi dirywio o bron £0.5 biliwn er 1997, er gwaethaf cyfraniad y gwaith gweithgynhyrchu mwyaf yn Ewrop, sef Airbus ym Mrychdyn.

Mae o'r pwys mwyaf felly i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad wneud popeth a allo dros y 12 mis nesaf i beri i'n sector gweithgynhyrchu fod yn gynhyrchiol eto. Fel arall, mae mwy o obaith i'r haul godi yn y gorllewin nag i Gymru gau'r bwch ffyniant rhyngddi a gweddill y DU erbyn 2010.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies):** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfraniadau y prynhawn yma. Yr wyf yn arbennig o ddiolchgar am neges e-bost yr wyf newydd ei derbyn oddi wrth Janet Davies, er fy mod yn amau nad oedd yn bwriadu ei hanfon ataf. Na, Janet, ni wnaf wastraffu fy amser yn beirniadu cynghorau sy'n cael eu rhedeg gan Blaid Cymru. Yr wyf yn siwr y bydd etholwyr yn rhoi eu dyfarniad eu hunain ar gynghorau sy'n cael eu rhedeg gan Blaid Cymru ddydd Iau. Pan ânt i bleidleisio ddydd Iau, bydd pobl Cymru, a phawb yn y DU, yn gwybod bod economi'r DU, ac economi Cymru'n benodol, mewn cyflwr da iawn ers cryn amser. Gwelsom y twf parhaus hwyaf mewn datblygu economaidd ers y chwyldro diwydiannol. Mae'r gyfradd ddiweithdra yng Nghymru'n is nag yn y rhan fwyaf o wledydd G7.

Gallech gredu, yn ôl gwelliannau'r gwrthbleidiau, fod gweithgynhyrchu ar gynnydd hyd nes i Lafur ddod i rym yn y DU yn 1997 ac yma yn y Cynulliad yn 1999. Nid yw hynny'n wir, a gwyddant hynny. Er bod cyflogaeth mewn gweithgynhyrchu wedi dirywio dros y tymor hir yng Nghymru, a hynny ers amser maith, fel y gwnaeth yng ngweddill y DU, bu'r gostyngiadau mwyaf yn ystod y dirwasgiadau o dan y Torïaid yn y 1980au ac ar ddechrau'r 1990au. Ers i Lafur ddod i rym, mae'r dirywiad wedi arafu. Yr ydym yn cydweithio'n agos â'r sector i sicrhau ei fod yn dal i chwarae rhan ganolog yn ein heconomi amrywiol yn y dyfodol. Ac ateb pwynt Rhodri Glyn Thomas, er 1999, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cynorthwyo 500 o brosiectau cymorth rhanbarthol

example of state intervention and government support for a sector.

dewisol, sydd wedi creu neu ddiogelu 27,000 o swyddi. Dyna enghraifft o ymyrraeth wladol a chymorth llywodraeth i'r sector.

5.20 p.m.

The Tories' amendment would delete the whole motion on manufacturing, just like they tried to delete the whole of the manufacturing sector when they were in power. I will give you some figures. From 1979 to 1997, the Tories oversaw the loss of 365,989 manufacturing jobs in Wales. For every year that they were in power, 20,000 manufacturing jobs were lost over those 18 years of dismal failure. They claim that we only create—

Byddai gwelliant y Torïaid yn dileu'r cynnig ar weithgynhyrchu'n llwyr, yn union fel y ceisiasant ddileu'r sector gweithgynhyrchu yn ei gyfanrwydd pan oeddent mewn grym. Rhoddaf rai ffigurau i chi. Rhwng 1979 a 1997, collwyd 365,989 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu o dan law'r Torïaid yng Nghymru. Ym mhob blwyddyn y buont mewn grym, collwyd 20,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu dros y 18 mlynedd hynny o fethiant alaethus. Honnant nad ydym ond yn creu—

**Glyn Davies:** Minister, I am interested in your comments, but I know what the figures were in mid Wales during that period, and the manufacturing sector increased from about 10 per cent to 24 per cent. I know that you do not know much about mid Wales, but if you took the slightest notice, you would know that the Tory years were far better than the Labour years have been since.

**Glyn Davies:** Weinidog, caf eich sylwadau'n rhai diddorol, ond gwn beth oedd y ffigurau yn y Canolbarth yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, a bu cynnydd o tua 10 y cant i 24 y cant yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu. Gwn na wyddoch lawer am y Canolbarth, ond pe cymerech y sylw lleiaf, gwyddech fod blynyddoedd y Torïaid yn well o lawer na'r blynyddoedd o Lafur a fu ers hynny.

**Andrew Davies:** All I can say, Glyn, is that we have to deal with the mess left by the Tories. I quote the official figures: 20,000 jobs in manufacturing were lost every year that your party was in Government in the UK and in Wales. The Conservatives always bang on about the fact that we only create public sector or civil service jobs. That is not true, and official figures show that—80 per cent of the 53,000 jobs that were created last year were in the private sector.

**Andrew Davies:** Y cwbl y gallaf ei ddweud, Glyn, yw ein bod wedi gorfod delio â'r llanastr a adawodd y Torïaid. Dyma'r ffigurau swyddogol: collwyd 20,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu ym mhob blwyddyn y bu'ch plaid mewn Llywodraeth yn y DU ac yng Nghymru. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr wastad yn canu'r un hen dôn gron am y ffaith nad ydym ond yn creu swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus neu'r gwasanaeth sifil. Nid yw hynny'n wir, ac mae ffigurau swyddogol yn dangos hynny—yr oedd 80 y cant o'r 53,000 o swyddi a grëwyd y llynedd yn y sector preifat.

**Mark Isherwood** *rose*—

**Mark Isherwood** *a gododd*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Mark, the Minister is not giving way.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mark, nid yw'r Gweinidog yn ildio.

**Andrew Davies:** The majority of public sector jobs are in vital direct services in health and education—services that the Tories do not see as necessary. To be even handed, you can see that the Liberal Democrats get nervous when you talk about manufacturing. It is so far from their experience and knowledge that they immediately fall back onto the euro—it is their default position. When you do not know what the issues are, you talk endlessly about something else; that is the Lib Dem policy that we are seeing up and down the country during the election campaign. It will get them nowhere this Thursday, or in this debate.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae mwyafrif y swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus mewn gwasanaethau uniongyrchol hanfodol mewn iechedd ac addysg—gwasanaethau nad yw'r Toriaid yn eu hystyried yn angenrheidiol. Er mwyn bod yn deg â phawb, gallwch weld y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn anesmwytho pan soniwch am weithgynhyrchu. Mae mor ddieithr i'w profiad a'u gwybodaeth fel y byddant yn troi'n syth i sôn am yr ewro—am hynny y byddant yn sôn o hyd. Os na wyddoch am y materion sydd dan sylw, yr ydych yn sôn yn ddiwedd am rywbeth arall; dyna bolisi'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a welwn ledled y wlad yn ystod yr ymgyrch etholiad. Ni thycia ddim iddynt y dydd Iau yma, nac yn y ddadl hon.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I know about the manufacturing industry. My husband worked in manufacturing for most of his career, so you should withdraw that comment.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Gwn am y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu. Bu fy ngwr yn gweithio mewn gweithgynhyrchu y rhan fwyaf o'i yrfa, felly dylech dynnu'r sylw hwnnw'n ôl.

**Andrew Davies:** I do not think that any further comment is required.

**Andrew Davies:** Ni chredaf fod angen gwneud unrhyw sylw pellach.

I despair at the quality of thinking from the opposition when we discuss manufacturing. The supposed official opposition, Plaid Cymru, seems to think that we have forced thousands of workers kicking and screaming out of work in the iron mines. I ask you—iron mines? Next they will say that Labour has abandoned Welsh manufacturing because we have failed to continue state support to produce spinning jennies.

Anobeithiaf ynghylch ansawdd syniadau'r gwrthbleidiau pan drafodwn weithgynhyrchu. Ymddengys fod yr wrthblaid swyddogol dybiedig, Plaid Cymru, yn credu ein bod wedi gorfodi miloedd o weithwyr, dan weiddi a strancio, i adael eu gwaith yn y mwynloddiau haearn. A allwch goelio hynny—mwynloddiau haearn? Byddant yn dweud nesaf fod Llafur wedi troi'i gefn ar weithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru am ein bod wedi methu â pharhau â chymorth gwladol i gynhyrchu fframiau nyddu.

**Janet Davies:** I assume that you would be happy for me to tell the people in the village in which I live, who lost their jobs in the iron mine not that long ago, that that is your view. I am sure that they will be delighted to vote for you on Thursday if I do.

**Janet Davies:** Cymeraf y byddech yn fodlon imi ddweud mai honno yw eich barn wrth y bobl yn y pentref lle yr wyf yn byw a gollodd eu gwaith yn y mwynlawdd haearn yn weddol ddiweddar. Yr wyf yn siwr y byddant yn falch iawn o bleidleisio drosoch ddydd Iau os gwnaf hynny.



**Andrew Davies:** I think that that represents Plaid's thinking. I have always thought that Plaid lived in the past, and your amendment shows that you definitely do. Perhaps I need to inform the nationalists that, when I support alternative sources of wind power, I am not advocating a return to wind mills—they might find that disappointing. It is good that they will never have any influence over the economy of Wales, or they would throw Welsh tax money at support for cutting edge technologies such as the steam engine and the spinning jenny. It is time that Plaid Cymru Members woke up and realised that manufacturing has moved on, even if they have not; it has a bright future, even if they do not. The past is the past, and that is where Plaid is resigned to living.

**Andrew Davies:** Credaf fod hynny'n arwydd o feddwl Plaid Cymru. Bûm yn meddwl erioed fod Plaid Cymru'n byw yn y gorffennol, ac mae'ch gwelliant yn dangos hynny'n bendant. Efallai y dylwn hysbysu'r cenedlaetholwyr nad wyf, wrth gefnogi ffynonellau ynni gwynt amgen, yn dadlau dros adfer melinau gwynt—efallai fod hynny'n peri siom iddynt. Mae'n beth da na chânt byth unrhyw ddylanwad ar economi Cymru, neu byddent yn gwastraffu arian trethi Cymru ar gymorth i dechnolegau blaengar fel y peiriant ager a'r ffrâm nyddu. Mae'n bryd i Aelodau Plaid Cymru ddeffro a sylweddoli bod gweithgynhyrchu wedi symud ymlaen, hyd yn oed os nad ydynt hwy; mae dyfodol disglair iddo, hyd yn oed os nad oes dyfodol felly iddynt hwy. Mae'r gorffennol wedi mynd, ac mae Plaid Cymru wedi ymfodloni ar fyw yno.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will you therefore explain why we have lost 820 manufacturing jobs this year in Wales? Will you explain why the manufacturing sector has declined from 28.1 per cent of Welsh GDP in 1997, when Labour came to power, to 22.8 per cent? Will you explain why an independent economist, Professor Dylan Jones-Evans, calculates that the decline in manufacturing since 1997 equates to a loss of £0.5 billion per annum to the Welsh GDP? Is this your success story as a Minister since 1999, or of the Labour Party in Government since 1997?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnewch egluro, felly, pam yr ydym wedi colli 820 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu eleni yng Nghymru? A wnewch egluro pam y mae'r sector gweithgynhyrchu wedi dirywio o 28.1 y cant o CMC Cymru yn 1997, pan ddaeth Llafur i rym, i 22.8 y cant? A wnewch egluro pam y mae economegydd annibynnol, yr Athro Dylan Jones-Evans, wedi cyfrifo bod y dirywiad mewn gweithgynhyrchu er 1997 yn cyfateb i golled o £0.5 biliwn y flwyddyn i CMC Cymru? Ai hyn yw'ch hanes o lwyddiant fel Gweinidog er 1999, neu o lwyddiant y Blaid Lafur mewn Llywodraeth er 1997?

**Andrew Davies:** Prosperity has not fallen as you said in your previous intervention. You were quite wrong. Income is rising—

**Andrew Davies:** Nid yw ffyniant wedi gostwng fel y dywedasoch yn eich ymyriad blaenorol. Yr oeddech yn hollol anghywir. Mae incwm yn codi—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** *rose*—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** *a gododd*—

**Andrew Davies:** No, I am not taking any more interventions. [*Interruption.*]

**Andrew Davies:** Na, ni dderbyniaf ragor o ymyriadau. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister has only half a minute left.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Dim ond hanner munud sydd gan y Gweinidog ar ôl.

**Andrew Davies:** Prosperity has not declined in Wales. We also, apparently, have a cunning plan to fly in coal, iron and manufactured goods. Perhaps your researchers need a little help—less than 1 per cent of freight comes in by air. It is not an issue in the way that you present it. Perhaps the staff in your excellent research unit, who are clearly overpaid, read somewhere that a lot of ‘coke’ is being flown into Europe from South America, and you thought that it had something to do with the steel industry. Forget the nonsense that passes for debate from the opposition, I am interested in what employers and workers involved in Welsh manufacturing have to say. That is why I commissioned this group and that is why I welcome its report.

**Andrew Davies:** Nid yw ffyniant wedi dirywio yng Nghymru. Ymddengys hefyd fod gennym gynllun cyfrwys i ddod â glo, haearn a nwyddau gwneuthuriedig yma mewn awyrennau. Efallai fod angen ychydig o gymorth ar eich ymchwilyr—llai nag 1 y cant a gludir yma mewn awyrennau. Nid yw’n destun dadl fel yr ydych chi’n ei gyflwyno. Efallai fod staff eich uned ymchwil ragorol, sy’n amlwg yn cael gormod o dâl, wedi darllen yn rhywle fod llawer o ‘coke’ yn dod mewn awyrennau i Ewrop o Dde America, a’ch bod yn credu bod a wnelo hynny â’r diwydiant dur. Anghofiwch y nonsens sy’n cael ei ystyried yn ddadleuon gan y gwerthbleidiau, yr wyf fi’n ymddiddori yn yr hyn a ddywed cyflogwyr a gweithwyr sy’n ymwneud â gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru. Dyna pam y comisiynais y grwp hwn a dyna pam y croesawaf ei adroddiad.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before I call the vote, I remind Members that if amendment 2 is carried, amendment 3 will fall.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn imi alw’r bleidlais, yr wyf yn atgoffa Aelodau, os derbynnir gwelliant 2, y bydd gwelliant 3 yn methu.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 1: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 7, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 37.  
Amendment 2: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 37.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 11, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 33.  
Amendment 3: For 11, Abstain 0, Against 33.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 4: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val

Mewies, Sandy  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 9, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 35.  
Amendment 5: For 9, Abstain 0, Against 35.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Janet  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 4, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 35.  
Amendment 6: For 4, Abstain 5, Against 35.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Davies, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Randerson, Jenny

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 7: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM1982): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.  
Motion (NDM1982): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Member voted against:

Neagle, Lynne

Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That concludes this afternoon's business.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.28 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.28 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)



Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)  
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)  
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)