



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Mercher, 9 Mawrth 2005

Wednesday, 9 March 2005

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol
Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services
- 17 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon
Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport
- 32 Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ
Questions to the House Committee
- 33 Datganiad ar Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adroddiad y Comisiynydd Plant
Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's response to the Children's
Commissioner Report
- 47 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order
- 48 Cymeradwyo Cyfarwyddiadau Pwerau Creu Incwm Awdurdodau Iechyd Arbennig
2005
Approval of the Income Generation Powers of Special Health Authorities Directions
2005
- 50 Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 3
Approval of Changes to Standing Order No. 3
- 51 Cymeradwyo Penderfyniadau ynglŷn ag Argymhellion y Corff Adolygu Cyflogau
Uwch-Swyddogion
Approval of Determinations in Respect of the Senior Salaries Review Body
Recommendations
- 54 Adolygiad Polisi'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar y Berthynas
rhwng Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol
The Health and Social Services Committee's Policy Review Report on the Interface
between Health and Social Care
- 72 Dadl Fer: Pwy sy'n Rhedeg y Gwasanaeth Iechyd yng Nghymru?
Short Debate: Who Runs the Health Service in Wales?

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services

Lefelau Staffio yn y GIG Staffing Levels in the NHS

Q1 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Will the Minister make a statement on staffing levels in the NHS?
OAQ0086(HSS)

C1 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar lefelau staffio yn y GIG? OAQ0086(HSS)

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): The latest available Government statistics, to 30 September 2003, showed that the number of directly employed staff in NHS Wales was 85,544. This is an increase of 24.6 per cent since 1997.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Dangosodd ystadegau diweddaraf y Llywodraeth sydd ar gael, hyd 30 Medi 2003, fod 85,544 o staff yn cael eu cyflogi'n uniongyrchol yn GIG Cymru, sef cynnydd o 24.6 y cant ers 1997.

Nick Bourne: Does the Minister think that there are enough people working at the sharp end in the health service? Just today, I heard from a constituent who lives just outside Llandrindod Wells, who had to wait three months just to get a scan at Brecon hospital, which revealed cardiac problems. He has now been told by staff at Nevill Hall Hospital that he must wait at least seven to nine months before seeing a heart specialist. Therefore, it will take him a year to see a heart specialist after being referred. Is that not totally unacceptable, and what are you doing about it?

Nick Bourne: A gred y Gweinidog fod digon o bobl yn gweithio ar y rheng flaen yn y gwasanaeth iechyd? Dim ond heddiw, clywais gan etholwr sy'n byw ar gyrion Llandrindod, a oedd yn gorfod aros am dri mis dim ond i gael sgan yn ysbyty Aberhonddu, sgan a ddatgelodd broblemau ar y galon. Mae staff yn Ysbyty Neville Hall wedi dweud wrtho bellach fod yn rhaid iddo aros am saith i naw mis cyn gweld arbenigwr ar y galon. Felly, bydd yn cymryd blwyddyn cyn iddo weld arbenigwr ar y galon ar ôl cael ei atgyfeirio. Onid yw hynny yn gwbl annerbyniol, a beth ydych yn ei wneud yn ei gylch?

Brian Gibbons: You may be aware that, in my department, work is ongoing on developing the diagnostic strategy, which will address several of these bottlenecks. It has been pointed out on several occasions that, very often, the big problem is the delay in getting the investigation performed, whether it is an x-ray or a scan. Therefore, I hope that the diagnostic strategy will give us an overview of how we need to address these diagnostic bottlenecks. Then, in the next capital budget, I hope that we can put some additional money behind the measures outlined in the strategy, to make it happen on the ground.

Brian Gibbons: Fe wyddoch o bosibl fod gwaith yn mynd rhagddo, yn fy adran, i ddatblygu'r strategaeth ddiagnostig a fydd yn mynd i'r afael â sawl un o'r tagfeydd hyn. Dywedwyd wrthyf ar sawl achlysur mai'r broblem fawr, yn amlach na pheidio, yw'r oedi cyn cael ymchwiliad, boed yn belydr-x neu'n sgan. Felly, gobeithiaf y bydd y strategaeth ddiagnostig yn rhoi trosolwg inni o'r ffordd y mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â'r tagfeydd hyn yn y broses ddiagnostig. Yna, yn y gyllideb gyfalaf nesaf, gobeithiaf y gallwn neilltuo arian ychwanegol ar gyfer y mesurau a nodir yn y strategaeth, er mwyn sicrhau ei bod yn llwyddiannus ar lawr

gwlad.

Nick Bourne: It is a bit more than a bottleneck for poor Mr Downes; by the time he gets to see the heart specialist, it will have been at least a year since his referral by his GP.

Nick Bourne: Mae'n fwy difrifol na thagfa i Mr Downes druan; erbyn iddo weld yr arbenigwr ar y galon, bydd wedi aros o leiaf flwyddyn ers i'w feddyg teulu ei atgyfeirio.

We hear, although the First Minister appears to be denying this at least in part, that you are about to announce that you will follow some of the better practices seen in England. That has been said by both the Secretary of State for Wales and the Prime Minister. Will that be the case? If so, it is good news—although it is bad news that it has had to be foisted upon you by England.

Fe glywn, er yr ymddengys bod y Prif Weinidog yn gwadu hyn, yn rhannol o leiaf, eich bod ar fin cyhoeddi y byddwch yn dilyn rhai o'r arferion gwell a geir yn Lloegr. Dywedwyd hynny gan Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru a Phrif Weinidog y DU. A yw hynny'n wir? Os felly, mae'n newyddion da—ond mae'n newyddion drwg y bu'n rhaid iddo gael ei orfodi arnoch gan Loegr.

Brian Gibbons: I would not use the words 'about to', because several of the best experiences in England have already been implemented in the national health service in Wales, particularly with the innovations in care team, both initially and now with the innovations agency. There is an ongoing practice of reviewing what is happening in England, Scotland, and elsewhere and trying to implement it here. We are already doing that, and it is certainly our intention to continue to do so in future.

Brian Gibbons: Ni ddefnyddiwn y geiriau 'ar fin', oherwydd mae sawl un o'r profiadau gorau yn Lloegr eisoes wedi cael eu rhoi ar waith yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru, yn enwedig gyda'r tîm arloesi mewn gofal, ar y cychwyn ac yn awr gyda'r asiantaeth arloesi. Adolygir yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr, yr Alban ac mewn gwledydd eraill yn barhaus ac yr ydym yn ceisio ei weithredu yma. Yr ydym eisoes yn gwneud hynny, ac yn sicr bwriadwn barhau i wneud hynny yn y dyfodol.

You may also be aware that several of those appointed recently as senior officials in my department are people with considerable managerial experience in the NHS in England. Therefore, we are trying to learn from best practice, but this is an ongoing process, and has not happened within the last week or month.

Fe wyddoch hefyd o bosibl fod sawl un o'r bobl a benodwyd yn ddiweddar yn uwch swyddogion yn fy adran yn meddu ar gryn brofiad rheoli yn y GIG yn Lloegr. Felly, yr ydym yn ceisio dysgu o arfer gorau, ond proses barhaus ydyw, ac nid yn ystod yr wythnos neu'r mis diwethaf y mae wedi dechrau.

Nick Bourne: I am still not sure, Minister, whether this indicates a change of course, as indicated by the Prime Minister, who said that some of the changes and reform programmes already in use in England were about to be signalled to be adopted in Wales. Will that be the case, so that we do not see these year-long waits for people before seeing a specialist, like poor Mr Downes with his heart trouble? Things are not perfect in England, but that situation would not arise there. Are we to have these changes or not?

Nick Bourne: Nid wyf yn siŵr, Weinidog, a yw hyn yn awgrymu newid cyfeiriad, fel yr awgrymwyd gan Brif Weinidog y DU, a ddywedodd fod rhai o'r newidiadau a rhaglenni diwygio sydd eisoes ar waith yn Lloegr ar fin cael eu nodi fel rhai sydd i'w mabwysiadu yng Nghymru. A yw hynny'n wir, fel na fydd pobl yn gorfod aros am flwyddyn cyn gweld arbenigwr, fel Mr Downes druan â'i broblem ar y galon? Nid yw pethau yn berffaith yn Lloegr, ond ni fyddai'r sefyllfa honno yn codi yno. A fyddwn yn gweld y newidiadau hyn ai peidio?

Brian Gibbons: If you look at the election pledges that the Labour Party launched two or three weeks ago, you will see that one of the top pledges is on our determination to make further progress in improving waiting times in Wales. Therefore, having built on the success of reducing waiting times for in-patients—18 months to 12 months, and, hopefully, 12 months this year for out-patients—we will continue to press down on waiting times as part of our election commitment. Therefore, the answer to your question is ‘yes’.

Carl Sargeant: Minister, will you take this opportunity to assure the Assembly of this Government’s continued commitment to meeting the Labour objective of putting into service 700 more doctors and 6,000 more nurses by 2010? The additional staff will be critical in securing further progress for patients across Wales. In light of this, Minister, will you also join me, and, I am sure, the people of Wales, in rejecting Tory proposals to cut £0.5 billion off the Assembly budget, which would devastate our plans to recruit and train the additional staff needed in Wales?

Brian Gibbons: I certainly think that the patient passport, announced by the Conservative Party, is a passport to nowhere as far as the health service in Wales is concerned. If you look at the profile of staff working in the NHS since a Labour Government was elected in 1997, you will see that, in virtually every professional discipline, there have been increases of between 20 and 40 per cent in staff. That is only possible because of the commitment of a Labour Government to public expenditure. We all know that a Tory Government will never replicate that record of commitment to public services.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: What Tory Government? The Tory Government after 5 May?

The Presiding Officer: Order. I know that there is pre-electoral excitement, but it does not affect us here.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Un rheswm pam mae morâl staff yn

Brian Gibbons: Os edrychwch ar yr addewidion etholiadol a lanswyd gan y Blaid Lafur ddwy neu dair wythnos yn ôl, fe welwch mai un o’r addewidion pennaf yw ein penderfyniad i wneud rhagor o gynnydd i wella amseroedd aros yng Nghymru. Felly, ar ôl adeiladu ar y llwyddiant o leihau amseroedd aros i gleifion mewanol—18 mis i 12 mis, a, gobeithio, 12 mis eleni i gleifion allanol—byddwn yn parhau i ymdrechu i leihau amseroedd aros fel rhan o’n hymrwymiad etholiadol. Felly, yr ateb i’ch cwestiwn yw ‘byddwn’.

Carl Sargeant: Weinidog, a fanteisiwch ar y cyfle hwn i roi sicrwydd i’r Cynulliad ynglŷn ag ymrwymiad parhaus y Llywodraeth hon i gyflawni amcan Llafur o gyflogi 700 yn fwy o feddygon a 6,000 yn fwy o nyrsys erbyn 2010? Bydd y staff ychwanegol yn allweddol i sicrhau mwy o gynnydd i gleifion ledled Cymru. Yng ngoleuni hyn, Weinidog, a ymunwch â mi hefyd, a phobl Cymru, yr wyf yn siŵr, i wrthod cynigion y Torïaid i dorri £0.5 biliwn yng nghyllideb y Cynulliad, a fyddai’n difetha ein cynlluniau i recriwtio a hyfforddi’r staff ychwanegol sydd eu hangen yng Nghymru?

Brian Gibbons: O ran y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru, credaf yn sicr mai pasbort i unman yw’r pasbort i gleifion, a gyhoeddwyd gan y Blaid Geidwadol. Os edrychwch ar broffil y staff sy’n gweithio yn y GIG ers yr etholwyd Llywodraeth Lafur yn 1997, fe welwch, ym mhob disgyblaeth broffesiynol bron, fod cynnydd o rhwng 20 a 40 y cant yn nifer y staff. Dim ond oherwydd ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Lafur i wariant cyhoeddus y mae hynny yn bosibl. Gwyddom oll na fydd Llywodraeth Dorïaidd byth yn efelychu’r record honno o ymrwymiad i wasanaethau cyhoeddus.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Pa Lywodraeth Dorïaidd? Y Llywodraeth Dorïaidd ar ôl 5 Mai?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Gwn fod cyffro cyn yr etholiad, ond nid yw’n effeithio arnom ni yma.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): One reason why staff morale in the

y gwasanaeth iechyd yn isel yw bod y Llywodraeth wedi methu dod â rhestrau aros i lawr yn ystod y chwe blynedd diwethaf. Mae'n rhaid i chi gydnabod hynny. Yr ydych yn dweud bod addewidion yn cael eu gwneud mewn maniffesto arall, ond yr ydych wedi methu â chadw'r addewidion a wnaethpwyd yn eich maniffesto 1999. Yr wyf wedi gofyn y cwestiwn hwn i'r Prif Weinidog a heb gael ateb, felly gofynnaf yr un gwestiwn i chi: pa mor gyfforddus yr ydych fel Gweinidog fod y nifer ar restrau aros yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu 140,000 ers 1999, ac mai dim ond 56 y cant o gleifion Cymru sy'n gweld meddyg fel cleifion allanol o fewn chwe mis, tra bod 99.9 y cant o gleifion yn Lloegr yn gwneud hynny? Beth a wnewch i newid y sefyllfa? A ydych yn derbyn cyfrifoldeb am y sgandal hon?

Brian Gibbons: As I have said previously, the key issue for patients is not how many other patients are waiting on a list, but how long they are waiting. If you have been following the debates in the Assembly, you will know that we are determined to ensure that, from the end of this month onwards, all patients waiting over 12 months either have an offer of treatment or have been treated. That is substantial progress that is being made by NHS Wales, and it is a great tribute to the staff who are contributing to that achievement. Contrary to what you said in your question, between 66 and 70 per cent of patients on out-patient waiting lists are seen within six months. Therefore, we are performing much better than you stated.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Even if the figure is something over 60 per cent, that is still substantially below the percentage in England, of 99.9 per cent. I am worried about your complacency, Minister. We have heard nothing, either today or previously, to suggest that you really understand the nature of the problem that you face in health. Let me give you some other statistics. In the whole of England, out of a population of 49 million, 117 patients are waiting over five months as orthopaedic out-patients; in Wales, 29,689 people are waiting over six months, out of a population of 3 million. The number of people waiting for ear, nose and throat treatment in England is 138; in Wales, it is

health service is low is that the Government has failed to bring waiting lists down during the last six years. You must acknowledge that. You say that pledges are being made in another manifesto, but you have failed to honour the pledges that you made in your 1999 manifesto. I have asked this question of the First Minister and not had an answer, so I will ask you the same question: how comfortable are you as a Minister that waiting lists in Wales have risen by 140,000 since 1999, and that only 56 per cent of Welsh patients see a doctor on an out-patient basis within six months, while 99.9 per cent of patients in England do so? What are you doing to change the situation? Do you accept responsibility for this scandal?

Brian Gibbons: Fel y dywedais o'r blaen, y mater allweddol i gleifion yw nid faint o gleifion eraill sydd ar restr, ond pa mor hir y maent hwythau'n aros. Os ydych wedi bod yn dilyn y dadleuon yn y Cynulliad, fe wyddoch ein bod yn benderfynol o sicrhau, o ddiwedd y mis hwn ymlaen, y bydd pob claf sy'n aros dros 12 mis wedi cael cynnig o driniaeth neu wedi cael ei drin. Dyna gynnydd sylweddol gan GIG Cymru, ac mae'n glod mawr i'r staff sy'n cyfrannu at gyflawni hynny. Yn wahanol i'r hyn a ddywedasoich yn eich cwestiwn, caiff rhwng 66 a 70 y cant o gleifion ar restr iros cleifion allanol eu gweld o fewn chwe mis. Felly, yr ydym yn perfformio'n llawer gwell nag a ddywedasoich chithau.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Hyd yn oed os yw'r ffigur ychydig dros 60 y cant, mae hynny'n dal i fod dipyn yn is na'r ganran yn Lloegr, sef 99.9 y cant. Pryderaf am eich hunanfodlonrwydd, Weinidog. Nid ydym wedi clywed dim, heddiw nac yn y gorffennol, i awgrymu eich bod yn wir yn deall natur y broblem a wynebwch ym maes iechyd. Gadewch imi roi rhai ystadegau eraill ichi. Yn Lloegr gyfan, o blith poblogaeth o 49 miliwn, mae 117 o gleifion yn aros dros bum mis fel cleifion allanol orthopedig; yng Nghymru, mae 29,689 o bobl yn aros dros chwe mis, o blith poblogaeth o 3 miliwn. Mae 138 o bobl yn aros am driniaeth clust, trwyn a gwddf yn Lloegr; yng Nghymru, mae

nearly 10,000. In England, 13 people are waiting for neurosurgery; 1,165 are waiting in Wales. For general surgery, the figure is 168 in England, while it is 6,500 in Wales. The scale of the problem is enormous, and all we get from you are fine words about hoping to do this, that or the other. When will you get to grips with this crisis in the health service?

Brian Gibbons: I think that the 5,000 to 7,000 patients who have been treated under the second offer guarantee scheme would have a different view as to the priority that we are giving to tackling waiting times and lists. If you do not acknowledge the increasingly tough targets that we are setting on waiting times and lists in Wales, then you are not seriously looking at what is going on in the service.

bron 10,000 yn aros. Yn Lloegr, mae 13 o bobl yn aros am niwrolawdriniaeth; mae 1,165 yn aros yng Nghymru. O ran llawdriniaeth gyffredinol, 168 yw'r ffigur yn Lloegr, ond 6,500 yw'r ffigur yng Nghymru. Mae maint y broblem yn enfawr, a'r cyfan a glywn gennych chi yw geiriau teg am obeithio gwneud fel hyn neu fel arall. Pryd y byddwch yn mynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng hwn yn y gwasanaeth iechyd?

Brian Gibbons: Credaf y byddai'r 5,000 i 7,000 o gleifion sydd wedi cael triniaeth o dan gynllun gwarantu'r ail gynnig yn anghytuno â chi o ran y flaenoriaeth a roddwn i fynd i'r afael ag amseroedd a rhestri aros. Os nad ydych yn cydnabod y targedau cynyddol anodd yr ydym yn eu pennu ar gyfer amseroedd a rhestri aros yng Nghymru, nid ydych yn edrych o ddifrif ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn y gwasanaeth.

Damweiniau yn y Cartref Accidents in the Home

Q2 Rosemary Butler: Will the Minister report on how many admissions to Welsh hospitals are the result of accidents in the home? OAQ0141(HSS)

C2 Rosemary Butler: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi adroddiad ar nifer y bobl sy'n cael eu derbyn i ysbytai Cymru yn sgîl damweiniau yn y cartref? OAQ0141(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: The latest figures that we have, for 2003, show that there were 11,066 admissions to Welsh hospitals as a result of accidents in the home.

Brian Gibbons: Dengys y ffigurau diweddaraf sydd gennym, ar gyfer 2003, i 11,066 o bobl gael eu derbyn i ysbytai yng Nghymru yn sgîl damweiniau yn y cartref.

Rosemary Butler: Every year, some 3,900 people die as a result of accidents at home and, as you said, Minister, almost 12,000 will visit emergency departments following accidents. In Wales, there are around 4,200 hip fractures each year, many resulting from an accident in the home. I believe that accidents at home are a hidden epidemic, with many accidents never becoming part of the statistics, as the data available are based on hospital admissions only, and do not include accidents treated by GPs. I am pleased that the Assembly Government's Health Challenge Wales campaign includes accident and injury prevention as one of its five priorities, but can you tell us, Minister, whether you will allocate resources for serious research into the true number of accidents in the home, and the cost to the health service?

Rosemary Butler: Bob blwyddyn, mae tua 3,900 o bobl yn marw o ganlyniad i ddamweiniau yn y cartref ac, fel y dywedaso, Weinidog, bydd bron 12,000 yn mynd i adrannau achosion brys ar ôl cael damwain. Yng Nghymru, mae tua 4,200 o bobl yn torri eu clun bob blwyddyn, llawer ohonynt drwy ddamwain yn y cartref. Credaf mai epidemig cudd yw damweiniau yn y cartref, ac ni fydd llawer o ddamweiniau byth yn dod yn rhan o'r ystadegau, gan fod y data sydd ar gael yn seiliedig ar dderbyniadau i'r ysbyty yn unig, ac nad yw'n cynnwys damweiniau y mae meddygon teulu yn eu trin. Yr wyf yn falch bod ymgyrch Her Iechyd Cymru Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cynnwys atal damweiniau ac anafiadau fel un o'i phum blaenoriaeth, ond a allwch ddweud wrthym, Weinidog, a fyddwch yn dyrannu adnoddau ar gyfer ymchwil ddifrifol i'r nifer

wirioneddol o ddamweiniau yn y cartref, a'r gost i'r gwasanaeth iechyd?

2.10 p.m.

Brian Gibbons: The ones treated in a general practice setting would probably be difficult to capture at the moment, because, even though a tremendous amount of investment has gone into the computerisation of general practices, I would not think that the level of recording would be sufficiently accurate to give you the precise figure that you are seeking. It is worth noting that, to a certain extent, we lull ourselves into a false sense of security by using the word 'accident'. 'Accident' almost implies that it is an act of God or something similar. Implicit in what you are saying is a recognition that most accidents are not really accidents, but are events that could be prevented if there was a proper prevention strategy in place. A lot of work is being done to identify risk factors through schemes such as care and repair, which involves information on risk factors being provided by health visitors following visits to people's homes, and through the fire service's visits to people's homes to assess the fire risk profile.

If you look at the social profile of areas where these accidents occur, you will see that, generally, they tend to occur in the most disadvantaged communities or involve people in the most disadvantaged personal circumstances. The Assembly's wider social justice agenda should hopefully start to address these priorities also.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Bydd llawer o bobl sy'n cael damweiniau yn y cartref yn cael eu cyfeirio at adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys ysbytai ledled Cymru. Byddwch yn gyfarwydd â'r ffaith bod Syr John Bourn wedi nodi bod 25 y cant o gleifion mewn ysbytai yn ddiangen. O ystyried bod prif weithredwyr tri o ymddiriedolaethau iechyd—Abertawe, Caerdydd a'r Fro a Bro Morgannwg—wedi dweud wrth y Pwyllgor Archwilio wythnos diwethaf eu bod yn wynebu gorfod cwtogi ar wasanaethau am nad oes ganddynt ddigon o gyllid i'w cynnal, a fydd y sefyllfa mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn gwaethygu? A fydd y

Brian Gibbons: Byddai manylion am y bobl a driniwyd mewn meddygfa yn anodd eu casglu ar hyn o bryd yn fwy na thebyg, oherwydd, er i gryn dipyn o fuddsoddiad gael ei wneud mewn cyfrifiaduro systemau meddygfeydd, ni chredaf y byddai'r lefel o gofnodi yn ddigon manwl i roi ichi'r union ffigurau a geisiwch. Mae'n werth nodi ein bod yn twyllo ein hunain i ryw raddau drwy ddefnyddio'r gair 'damwain'. Braidd na bod 'damwain' yn awgrymu mai gweithred Duw neu rywbeth cyffelyb ydyw. Ymhlyg yn yr hyn a ddywedwch yw'r gydnabyddiaeth nad damwain mewn gwirionedd yw'r rhan fwyaf o ddamweiniau, ond digwyddiadau y gellid bod wedi'u hosgoi pe bai strategaeth atal damweiniau briodol wedi bod ar waith. Gwneir llawer o waith i nodi ffactorau risg drwy gynlluniau megis gofal a thrwsio, sy'n golygu bod ymwelwyr iechyd yn darparu gwybodaeth ar ffactorau risg ar ôl ymweld â chartrefi pobl, a thrwy ymweliadau'r gwasanaeth tân â chartrefi pobl i asesu risgiau tân.

Os edrychwch ar broffil cymdeithasol ardaloedd lle y digwydd y damweiniau, fe welwch, yn gyffredinol, eu bod yn tueddu i ddigwydd yn y cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig neu i bobl yn yr amgylchiadau personol mwyaf difreintiedig. Dylai agenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ehangach y Cynulliad ddechrau mynd i'r afael â'r blaenoriaethau hyn hefyd, gobeithio.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Many people who have accidents in their homes will go to the accident and emergency departments of hospitals throughout Wales. You will know that Sir John Bourn has reported that 25 per cent of patients are admitted to hospital unnecessarily. Given that the chief executives of three health trusts—Swansea, Cardiff and the Vale, and Bro Morgannwg—stated at last week's meeting of the Audit Committee that they face having to cut services due to a funding shortfall, will the situation in accident and emergency departments continue to deteriorate? Will the situation as regards finding hospital beds for patients

sefyllfa o ran sicrhau bod cleifion yn cael gwelyau mewn ysbytai yn gwaethygu, ac a yw hyn oll yn ganlyniad uniongyrchol diffyg cyllid oddi wrth Lywodraeth Cymru?

Brian Gibbons: If you were to talk to accident and emergency staff, you would hear that something in the order of 15 to 20 per cent of the people they treat present following minor accidents. It would be more appropriate to treat many of these patients in an alternative clinical setting. In the best departments, they are assessed by nurse practitioners or extended-role nurses. This practice is not universal across the NHS in Wales. A lot can be done through dealing more efficiently with patients as they present. The challenge to various health bodies is that they must look at their own organisations to see how efficiently they are operating. There will be a tougher financial climate next year, and the whole point of putting this discipline on the trusts is to make them look at their efficiencies so that clinical services are not cut. The disciplines are there to make sure that trusts are under notice to maintain clinical services as their priority.

continue to deteriorate, and is this a direct consequence of the Government of Wales's failure to provide sufficient funding?

Brian Gibbons: Pe baech yn siarad â staff adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, byddech yn clywed bod tua 15 i 20 y cant o'r bobl y maent yn eu trin yn dod i'w hadran ar ôl mân ddamweiniau. Byddai'n fwy priodol trin llawer o'r cleifion hyn mewn lleoliad clinigol amgen. Yn yr adrannau gorau, cânt eu hasesu gan ymarferwyr nyrsio neu nyrsys a chanddynt rôl estynedig. Nid yw'r arfer hwn yn gyffredin i bob rhan o'r GIG yng Nghymru. Gellir gwneud llawer drwy ymdrin â chleifion yn fwy effeithlon wrth iddynt ddod i adrannau. Yr her i gyrff iechyd amrywiol yw bod yn rhaid iddynt edrych ar eu sefydliadau eu hunain i weld pa mor effeithlon y maent yn gweithredu. Bydd hinsawdd ariannol fwy llym y flwyddyn nesaf, a'r rheswm dros osod disgyblaeth o'r fath ar yr ymddiriedolaethau yw sicrhau eu bod yn edrych ar eu heffeithlonrwydd fel na chaiff gwasanaethau clinigol eu cwtdgi. Rhoddir disgyblaeth i sicrhau bod ymddiriedolaethau wedi cael rhybudd mai cynnal gwasanaethau clinigol yw eu blaenoriaeth.

Gwariant ar Iechyd ym Merthyr Tudful a Rhymni Health Spending in Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney

Q3 Huw Lewis: Will the Minister make a statement on health spending in Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney? OAQ0131(HSS)

C3 Huw Lewis: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynghylch gwariant ar iechyd ym Merthyr Tudful a Rhymni? OAQ0131(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: In 2004-05, funding for Merthyr Tydfil Local Health Board totalled £67.5 million. A further £0.513 million has been allocated to implement the recommendations of the Wanless review. The LHB is expected to receive £73.3 million in 2005-06.

Brian Gibbons: Yn 2004-05, cyfanswm cyllid Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Merthyr Tudful oedd £67.5 miliwn. Dyrannwyd £0.513 miliwn arall i weithredu argymhellion adolygiad Wanless. Disgwyllir i'r BILl gael £73.3 miliwn yn 2005-06.

Huw Lewis: You are right to point out that spending and investment have increased. As you know, the south Wales Valleys still have the highest concentration of unmet health needs in England and Wales. Last month's report by the chief medical officer highlighted the fact that if you live in Merthyr, your life expectancy is the worst in Wales, some five years below that in

Huw Lewis: Yr ydych yn gywir i nodi bod gwariant a buddsoddiad wedi cynyddu. Fel y gwyddoch, yng Nghymoedd y De y mae'r gyfradd fwyaf o anghenion iechyd nas diwellir yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Nododd adroddiad y prif swyddog meddygol y mis diwethaf y ffaith mai pobl Merthyr sydd â'r disgwyliad oes gwaethaf yng Nghymru, ryw bum mlynedd yn llai na'r disgwyliad oes yng

Ceredigion. She also highlighted the fact that mortality rates are 50 higher in Merthyr than in the more affluent areas, which tend to be rural, and that nearly a third of people in the borough of Merthyr report a limiting long-term illness, which is also the highest level in Wales. Given the severity of Merthyr's position, do you agree that funding should be directed, as a priority, to this area of greatest need? What assurances can you give my constituents that the long-talked-of reconfiguration of primary care services will be delivered as a matter of urgency, and with the maximum possible capital investment?

Brian Gibbons: The fact that men living in more affluent parts of Wales can expect to live five years longer than men living in Merthyr—the difference is three years for women—is challenging. It is a horrifying and unacceptable state of affairs and we, the Assembly Government, feel that urgent action should be taken to address it. The Townsend reallocation money has brought Merthyr Tydfil Local Health Board within 2 per cent of the allocation on its parameters. A review of the Townsend formula is ongoing, and we will take stock of it when we receive the report. As you know, as we both attended the meeting, Merthyr LHB is engaged in a major reconfiguration exercise, in consultation with the Merthyr Forum, to look at the real priorities to meet the healthcare needs in the town. We must start looking at this issue creatively and imaginatively, in order to put the services in place to address the challenge.

Another point worth mentioning is the good work done by my colleague, Andrew Davies, on the Heads of the Valleys regeneration. Unless we regenerate the Heads of the Valleys communities in socio-economic terms, we will never crack the legacy of ill health that exists in communities such as Merthyr.

William Graham: On your infamous whistle-stop tour of Welsh hospitals, you described the situation in Merthyr as being 'calm', yet patients still had to wait five hours in the accident and emergency

Ngheredigion. Nododd hefyd fod cyfraddau marwolaethau 50 yn uwch ym Merthyr nag yn yr ardaloedd mwy cyfoethog, sy'n fwy tebygol o fod yn wledig, a bod bron draean o bobl ym mwrdeistref Merthyr yn nodi bod arnynt salwch hirdymor cyfyngol, sydd hefyd y lefel uchaf yng Nghymru. O gofio difrifoldeb sefyllfa Merthyr, a gytunwch y dylai cyllid gael ei gyfeirio, fel blaenoriaeth, at yr ardal hon lle mae'r angen mwyaf? Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi i'm hetholwyr y caiff y broses o ailgyflunio gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol y bu sôn amdani ers tro, ei gweithredu fel mater o frys, a chyda'r buddsoddiad cyfalaf uchaf posibl?

Brian Gibbons: Mae'r ffaith bod dynion sy'n byw yn y rhannau mwyaf cyfoethog o Gymru yn gallu disgwyl byw pum mlynedd yn hwy na dynion sy'n byw ym Merthyr—tair blynedd yw'r gwahaniaeth i fenywod—yn un heriol. Mae'n sefyllfa erchyll ac annerbyniol ac yr ydym ni, Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn teimlo y dylid cymryd camau brys i fynd i'r afael â hi. Mae arian ailddyrrannu Townsend wedi dod â Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Merthyr Tudful o fewn 2 y cant o'r dyraniad o ran ei derfynau. Parheir i adolygu fformiwla Townsend, a byddwn yn ei chloriannu pan ddaw'r adroddiad i law. Fel y gwyddoch, gan i'r ddau ohonom fynychu'r cyfarfod, mae BILl Merthyr yn ymgymryd ag ymarfer ailgyflunio mawr, mewn ymgynghoriad â Fforwm Merthyr, i edrych ar y blaenoriaethau gwirioneddol i ddiwallu anghenion gofal iechyd yn y dref. Rhaid inni ddechrau edrych ar y mater hwn mewn ffordd greadigol a dychmygus, er mwyn rhoi'r gwasanaethau ar waith i fynd i'r afael â'r her.

Un pwynt arall y mae'n werth ei grybwyll yw'r gwaith da a wneir gan fy ngyd-Weinidog, Andrew Davies, ar adfywio Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Oni bai inni adfywio cymunedau Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn economaidd-gymdeithasol, ni fyddwn byth yn gallu cael gwared â'r afiechyd traddodiadol sy'n bodoli mewn cymunedau megis Merthyr.

William Graham: O ran eich gwibdaith drwgenwog drwy ysbytai Cymru, dywedasoed fod y sefyllfa ym Merthyr yn 'dawel', ac eto yr oedd cleifion yn gorfod aros am bum awr yn yr adran damweiniau ac

department. Is this a good way of spending taxpayers' money? How will you address this problem?

Brian Gibbons: I do not know if you are asking whether or not my visit to Merthyr was a good use of taxpayers' money; the jury may be out on that. It just so happens that, on the day that I visited Merthyr, it was quiet. However, having visited the accident and emergency department there, I know that it needs major refurbishment. People are working hard there, and, having spoken to them, I know that they are engaging widely in improving the quality of their service. The physical infrastructure of their place of work is in serious need of being upgraded. As part of the regeneration programme of health services in Merthyr, the problems faced in the accident and emergency services will be tackled.

achosion brys. Ai dyna ffordd dda o wario arian trethdalwyr? Sut y byddwch yn mynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon?

Brian Gibbons: Ni wn a ydych yn gofyn pa un a oedd fy ymweliad â Merthyr yn ddefnydd da o arian trethdalwyr; efallai ei bod yn rhy gynnar i farnu. Fel y mae'n digwydd, ar y diwrnod yr ymwelais â Merthyr, yr oedd yn dawel. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl ymweld â'r adran damweiniau ac achosion brys yno, gwn fod angen gwaith adnewyddu mawr arni. Mae pobl yn gweithio'n galed yno, ac ar ôl siarad â hwy, gwn eu bod yn cymryd rhan helaeth yn y gwaith o wella ansawdd eu gwasanaeth. Mae angen uwchraddio seilwaith ffisegol eu gweithle yn ddybryd. Fel rhan o'r rhaglen adfywio gwasanaethau ieched ym Merthyr, eir i'r afael â'r problemau a wynebwr yn y gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys.

Gwella Mynediad at Ddeintyddion y GIG Improving Access to NHS Dentists

Q4 Eleanor Burnham: What is the Assembly Government doing to improve access to NHS dentists in Wales? OAQ0120(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: In addition to the Welsh dental initiative, we have announced £5.3 million over the next three years to improve access to NHS dentistry, and to support the implementation of the new dental contract and associated reforms. In addition, from October 2004, the number of dental undergraduate places in Wales increased by 17 per cent.

Eleanor Burnham: I understand that those negotiations have stalled. However, leaving that aside, the *Daily Post* reported a few weeks ago that only one dental practice was available in north Wales to NHS patients, namely that in Ruthin. The leader of the British Dental Association has warned that this is just the start of the crisis, and that there is no light at the end of the tunnel. As I asked yesterday, what is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to address the immediate availability of dental services? Do you not agree that the fact that, at present, dental students graduate with debts of £45,000, with the possibility that those debt levels will

C4 Eleanor Burnham: Beth y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i wella mynediad at ddeintyddion y GIG yng Nghymru? OAQ0120(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: Yn ogystal â menter ddeintyddol Cymru, yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi y byddwn yn darparu £5.3 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf i wella mynediad at ddeintyddion y GIG ac i ategu'r broses o weithredu'r contract newydd i ddeintyddion a diwygiadau cysylltiedig. Yn ogystal, o Hydref 2004, cynyddodd nifer y lleoedd i israddedigion deintyddol 17 y cant.

Eleanor Burnham: Deallaf fod y negodiadau hynny wedi mynd i anawsterau. Fodd bynnag, gan anghofio am hynny am y tro, nododd y *Daily Post* ychydig wythnosau yn ôl mai dim ond un ddeintyddfa a oedd ar gael i gleifion y GIG yn y Gogledd, sef yn Rhuthun. Mae arweinydd Cymdeithas Ddeintyddol Prydain wedi rhybuddio mai dim ond dechrau y mae'r argyfwng ac na welir dim goleuni ym mhen draw'r twnnel. Fel y gofynnais ddoe, beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod gwasanaethau deintyddol ar gael yn awr? Oni chytunwch fod y ffaith bod myfyrwyr deintyddol, ar hyn o bryd, yn

increase to £60,000, is a real deterrent? What will you do to address this impossible situation?

Brian Gibbons: I do not think that there is any evidence that dental student places in Wales—which have increased by 17 per cent—are undersubscribed. People are choosing a career in dentistry. I know that there is a cost involved, but people realise that dentists have a good professional career, and that investing in that career will probably pay dividends. You are right to say that negotiations with the BDA and the Department of Health in London seem to have stalled. That is why I had a meeting, about 10 days ago, with the BDA in Wales to see whether we can move the agenda forward in Wales.

2.20 p.m.

Previously, the BDA wanted to link its negotiations with those taking place in London. As I say, the meeting that I had with the BDA some 10 days ago was constructive. Hopefully, we will be able to explore ways in which we can make progress in Wales without being unduly delayed by the difficulties with the national contract.

Elin Jones: Byddwch yn gwybod bod y system ffioedd bresennol yn rhoi rhai practisiau deintyddol bach yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol o dan bwysau sylweddol. Bu i'ch rhagflaenydd gyhoeddi cynllun peilot yn dwyn yr enw y gwasanaeth deintyddol personol, a fyddai'n rhoi taliadau uniongyrchol i ddeintyddion yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol ac yn fodd i'w cadw o fewn cyfundrefn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae rhai deintyddion GIG yn fy etholaeth i, yng Ngheredigion, wedi datgan diddordeb yn y cynllun hwn ac yn awyddus i symud ymlaen oddi tano. Pryd wnewch chi gyhoeddiad ar ddechrau'r cynllun peilot hwn?

Brian Gibbons: That was an issue that we discussed with the BDA. We discussed the role that the personal dental service could play in helping to modernise the present

graddio gyda dyledion o £45,000, gyda'r posibilrwydd y bydd y dyledion hynny yn cynyddu i £60,000, yn wir yn atal pobl rhag mynd yn ddeintyddion? Beth fyddwch yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r sefyllfa amhosibl hon?

Brian Gibbons: Ni chredaf fod unrhyw dystiolaeth bod lleoedd i fyfyrwyr deintyddol yng Nghymru—sydd wedi cynyddu 17 y cant—yn mynd heb eu llenwi. Mae pobl yn dewis gyrfa mewn deintyddiaeth. Gwn fod cost ynghlwm wrth hynny, ond mae pobl yn sylweddoli bod deintyddion yn cael gyrfa broffesiynol dda, ac y bydd buddsoddi yn yr yrfa honno siŵr o fod yn talu ar ei ganfed. Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud yr ymddengys bod y negodiadau gyda Chymdeithas Ddeintyddol Prydain a'r Adran Iechyd yn Llundain wedi mynd i anawsterau. Dyna pam y cyfarfûm â'r gymdeithas yng Nghymru, ryw 10 diwrnod yn ôl, i weld a allwn symud yr agenda yn ei blaen yng Nghymru.

O'r blaen, yr oedd y gymdeithas am gysylltu ei negodiadau â'r rhai a gynhelir yn Llundain. Fel y dywedaf, yr oedd fy nghyfarfod â'r gymdeithas ryw 10 diwrnod yn ôl yn adeiladol. Gobeithiaf y byddwn yn gallu ystyried sut y gallwn wneud cynnydd yng Nghymru heb i'r anawsterau gyda'r contract cenedlaethol fod yn ormod o rwystr inni.

Elin Jones: You will know that the present fees system is putting some small dental practices in the national health service under considerable pressure. Your predecessor announced a pilot scheme called the personal dental service, which would make direct payments to national health service dentists and would be a means of keeping them within the health service framework. Some NHS dentists in my constituency of Ceredigion have expressed an interest in this scheme, and are keen to move forward with it. When will you make an announcement about the commencement of this pilot scheme?

Brian Gibbons: Dyna fater a drafodwyd gennym gyda'r gymdeithas. Bu inni drafod y rôl y gallai'r gwasanaeth deintyddol personol ei chwarae i helpu i foderneiddio'r contract

dental contract. As you say, the present fee-per-item contract is a treadmill. Dentists who work within that system often try to cope with a fee system that has over 400 fee-per-item payments; it is a bureaucratic nightmare. The dentists who wish to move towards a personal dental service type of system want to get away from this treadmill of incessant demands. For the poor clinical practice, the fee system very often seems to impose on them in terms of the way in which they work. We want a type of contract that will allow dentists to work in line with current best practice in the dental profession. In fairness, it would be a mistake to say that dentists' concern for a new contract is driven by their wanting to obtain more money, and so forth. Having met dentists, their biggest frustration is that the present contract does not allow them to work to good professional standards.

I was next door to your constituency, Elin, in Milford Haven last Friday to launch the first salaried dentist of his kind in Wales, who is employed by Pembrokeshire Local Health Board. Hopefully, through such innovative schemes, as well as looking at issues such as the personal dental service and the community dental scheme, we can also consider options in relation to employing salaried dentists. Hopefully, we will be in a position over the next few months, at the latest, to make a statement on progress.

David Melding: About 50 per cent of the population now has access to an NHS dentist. Do you aim to make this service comprehensive, so that about 95 per cent have that access, or will we be like most of the industrial world in not being able to provide NHS dental services?

Brian Gibbons: We are committed to discussing fairly openly with the profession how we can move the dental agenda forward, but, at this stage, we are looking to provide a dental service in Wales in which all people who want NHS dental provision can have it. This is a formidable challenge, as you say, although approximately half of the patients in Wales are registered with a dentist. Wales is

presennol i ddeintyddion. Fel y dywedwch, mae'r contract presennol, sy'n talu fesul eitem, yn ddiflas. Mae deintyddion sy'n gweithio o fewn y system honno yn aml yn ceisio ymdopi â system ffioedd sydd â thros 400 o daliadau fesul eitem; mae'n hunllef fiwocrataidd. Mae'r deintyddion sydd am symud tuag at system o wasanaeth deintyddol personol am symud i ffwrdd o'r system ddiflas hon gyda'i gofynion di-baid. O ran y practis clinigol tlawd, mae'r system ffioedd yn aml iawn yn faich arno o ran y ffordd y mae'n gweithio. Yr ydym am gael math o gontract a fydd yn rhoi cyfle i ddeintyddion weithio yn unol â'r arfer gorau presennol ym maes deintyddiaeth. A bod yn deg, byddai'n gangymeriad dweud mai rhagor o arian, ac ati, sydd wrth wraidd awydd y deintyddion i gael contract newydd. Ar ôl cwrdd â deintyddion, eu rhwystredigaeth fwyaf yw nad yw'r contract presennol yn eu galluogi i weithio yn unol â safonau proffesiynol da.

Ddydd Gwener diwethaf, yr oeddwn yn Aberdaugleddau, mewn etholaeth gyfagos i'ch etholaeth chi, Elin, i lansio'r deintydd cyflogedig cyntaf o'i fath yng Nghymru, a gyflogir gan Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Sir Benfro. Gobeithiaf, drwy gynlluniau arloesol o'r fath, a thrwy ystyried materion megis y gwasanaeth deintyddol personol a'r cynllun deintyddol cymunedol, y gallwn hefyd ystyried opsiynau o ran penodi deintyddion cyflogedig. Gobeithiaf y byddwn yn gallu gwneud datganiad ar hynt y cynlluniau yn ystod yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf, fan bellaf.

David Melding: Mae gan tua 50 y cant o'r boblogaeth fynediad at un o ddeintyddion y GIG ar hyn o bryd. A ydych yn anelu at wneud y gwasanaeth hwn yn un cynhwysfawr, fel y bydd gan tua 95 y cant y mynediad hwnnw, neu a fyddwn ni, fel y rhan fwyaf o'r byd diwydiannol, yn methu â darparu gwasanaethau deintyddol y GIG?

Brian Gibbons: Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i drafod yn eithaf agored gyda'r proffesiwn ynghylch sut y gallwn symud yr agenda ddeintyddol yn ei blaen, ond, ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn disgwyl darparu gwasanaeth deintyddol yng Nghymru lle y gall pawb sydd am gael darpariaeth ddeintyddol o dan y GIG gael hynny. Mae hon yn her enbyd, fel y dywedwch, er bod tua hanner y cleifion yng

every bit as good as Scotland in that regard, and probably a good bit better than England in terms of the number of patients registered with a dentist. However, at this stage, we are not currently aiming to curtail the potential universality of a dental service within the NHS. As I say, we are committed to engaging with the dental profession in Wales on a blank-sheet-of-paper basis. Nothing is included or excluded.

Nghymru wedi'u cofrestru gyda deintydd. Mae Cymru yn llawn cystal â'r Alban yn hynny o beth, ac yn well o dipyn siŵr o fod na Lloegr o ran nifer y cleifion sydd wedi'u cofrestru gyda deintydd. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd, nid ydym yn anelu at gyfyngu ar y posibilrwydd o ddarparu gwasanaeth deintyddol yn y GIG a fydd ar gael i bawb. Fel y dywedaf, yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i drafod gyda'r proffesiwn deintyddol yng Nghymru gyda meddwl hollol agored. Yr ydym yn fodlon ystyried popeth.

Her Iechyd Cymru Health Challenge Wales

Q5 Christine Gwyther: Will the Minister give an update on Health Challenge Wales? OAQ0125(HSS)

C5 Christine Gwyther: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am Her Iechyd Cymru? OAQ0125(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: The response so far to Health Challenge Wales from organisations and individuals has exceeded our expectations. By 1 March, over 5,000 action packs had been requested and numerous calls from organisations had been received. We now have an excellent basis on which to build upon the momentum that this excellent start has promised us.

Brian Gibbons: Bu'r ymateb hyd yma i Her Iechyd Cymru gan sefydliadau ac unigolion y tu hwnt i bob disgwyl. Erbyn 1 Mawrth, cafwyd dros 5,000 o geisiadau am becynnau gweithredu a nifer fawr o alwadau gan sefydliadau. Bellach mae gennym sylfaen ardderchog ac o'r sylfaen honno gallwn adeiladu ar y momentwm y mae'r dechrau ardderchog hwn wedi argoeli inni.

Christine Gwyther: Will you join me in congratulating the National Federation of Women's Institutes, which is running an educational programme for young people on how to cook basic food well? We are told that good, healthy food is expensive, but that is not always the case. I urge you to back this sort of initiative.

Christine Gwyther: A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch Ffederasiwn Cenedlaethol Sefydliadau'r Merched, sy'n cynnal rhaglen addysgol i bobl ifanc ar sut i goginio bwyd syml yn dda? Dywedir wrthym fod bwyd da, iachus yn ddud, ond nid yw hynny'n wir bob tro. Fe'ch anogaf i gefnogi'r math hwn o fenter.

Brian Gibbons: That is exactly the type of initiative that we want, by which we challenge the people of Wales to engage actively in promoting a healthy culture and personal lifestyle. The National Federation of Women's Institutes, as you highlighted, has responded to that challenge. There is also recognition that many young people have been de-skilled both in terms of understanding food nutrition and preparing nutritional food. Hopefully, within the next couple of months, we will be presenting a food and fitness strategy report, which will consider, among other issues, how we can do something concrete to improve the cooking skills of young people in Wales.

Brian Gibbons: Dyna'r union fath o fenter yr ydym am ei chael, lle yr ydym yn herio pobl Cymru i fynd ati i hybu diwylliant a ffordd o fyw iach. Mae Ffederasiwn Cenedlaethol Sefydliadau'r Merched, fel y bu ichi nodi, wedi ymateb i'r her honno. Cydnabyddir hefyd fod llawer o bobl ifanc wedi colli sgiliau o ran deall maeth bwyd a pharatoi bwyd maethlon. Gobeithiaf, o fewn yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf, y byddwn yn cyflwyno adroddiad strategaeth bwyd a ffirwydd, a fydd yn ystyried, ymhlith materion eraill, sut y gallwn wneud rhywbeth pendant i wella sgiliau coginio pobl ifanc yng Nghymru.

David Melding: Minister, you are quite right to say that people have lost the skills that they used to have in terms of preparing food. It is the same with exercise. We now sit down for around seven times longer than our ancestors did four or five generations ago. Do you agree that we need community effort to get people back into a regular, effective and lifelong exercise routine?

David Melding: Weinidog, yr ydych yn hollol iawn i ddweud bod pobl wedi colli'r sgiliau yr oedd ganddynt yn y gorffennol o ran paratoi bwyd. Mae'r un peth yn wir am ymarfer corff. Yr ydym bellach yn eistedd i lawr am tua saith gwaith yn hwy nag a wnâi ein hynafiaid bedair neu bum cenhedlaeth yn ôl. A gytunwch fod angen ymdrech gymunedol i gael pobl unwaith eto i wneud ymarfer corff rheolaidd ac effeithiol drwy gydol eu hoes?

Brian Gibbons: Yes. I mentioned the food and fitness strategy earlier, in response to Christine, and the importance of engaging with young people. Some of the information that has been provided states that it is not that young people are unwilling to engage in physical activity, but that we are not giving them the opportunity to do so. To change that, we must ensure access to public places, improve road safety and provide home zones and youth clubs. Unless, as an adult society, we provide a framework within which young people can become more active, it is simply not good enough just to blame them for being couch potatoes, computer addicts, or whatever.

Brian Gibbons: Cytunaf. Cyfeiriais at y strategaeth bwyd a ffitrwydd yn gynharach, mewn ymateb i Christine, a phwysigrwydd ennyn diddordeb pobl ifanc. Mae peth o'r wybodaeth a roddwyd yn nodi nad amharodrwydd ar ran pobl ifanc i ymgymryd â gweithgarwch corfforol yw'r broblem, ond y ffaith nad ydym yn rhoi'r cyfle iddynt wneud hynny. Er mwyn newid hynny, rhaid inni sicrhau mynediad i fannau cyhoeddus, gwella diogelwch ar y ffyrdd a darparu parthau cartref a chlybiau ieuentid. Oni ddarparwn ni, fel oedolion, fframwaith lle y gall pobl ifanc ymgymryd â mwy o weithgareddau egniol, nid yw'n ddigon da rhoi'r bai arnynt am wyluo gormod o deledu, bod ar y cyfrifiadur drwy'r amser, neu beth bynnag.

Anghenion Gofal Pobl Hŷn yn y Gogledd The Care Needs of Older People in North Wales

Q6 Brynle Williams: What action is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to support the care needs of older people in north Wales? OAQ0143(HSS)

C6 Brynle Williams: Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i fodloni anghenion gofal pobl hŷn yn y Gogledd? OAQ0143(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: The legal responsibility for assessing needs and commissioning local care services for older people in north Wales rests with local government and local health boards. It is the Assembly Government's responsibility, here and throughout Wales, to ensure that a proper policy framework, and guidance and regulatory mechanisms, are in place to ensure that there is the necessary support to deliver a quality service.

Brian Gibbons: Llywodraeth leol a byrddau iechyd lleol sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb cyfreithiol dros asesu anghenion a chomisiynu gwasanaethau gofal lleol i bobl hŷn yn y Gogledd. Cyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yma a ledled Cymru, yw sicrhau bod fframwaith polisi priodol, a systemau ar gyfer rhoi canllawiau a rheoleiddio, ar waith er mwyn sicrhau y rhoddir y cymorth sydd ei angen i ddarparu gwasanaeth o safon.

Brynle Williams: You will be aware, Minister, that, by April 2005, 70 per cent of nursing home rooms must be single occupancy. The director of regional nursing

Brynle Williams: Fe wyddoch, Weinidog, erbyn Ebrill 2005, y bydd yn rhaid i 70 y cant o ystafelloedd mewn cartrefi nyrsio fod yn ystafelloedd sengl. Mae cyfarwyddwr cartrefi

homes in Wales is concerned about that. There is a feeling of fear and trepidation in many homes, with more closures being a stark possibility. Will you support the managers and homes, and review this policy urgently?

Brian Gibbons: The target date that you mentioned was not announced overnight. People should have been aware of its existence for many years and should have been working towards these standards. They are standards that you would reasonably expect as an individual, in terms of privacy and so forth, so I do not think that the standards themselves are wrong or undesirable, and I hope that you would agree with that. However, in implementing them, we have made it clear to the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales that the needs of individual residents must always be at the forefront of its considerations, and that bureaucratic requirements should not become the prime focus above the needs of residents. Therefore, individual cases will always be taken into account. However, that does not remove the responsibility from care home owners to look to the standards that we are setting, because time and notice was given. I am sure that they are standards that you would expect for yourself.

nyrsio rhanbarthol yng Nghymru yn pryderu ynglŷn â hynny. Mae llawer yn y cartrefi yn teimlo'n ofnus, ac mae posibilrwydd gwirioneddol y bydd mwy yn gorfod cau. A wnewch gefnogi'r rheolwyr a'r cartrefi, ac adolygu'r polisi hwn ar fyrder?

Brian Gibbons: Nid dros nos y cyhoeddwyd y dyddiad targed a nodwyd gennych. Dylai pobl fod wedi bod yn ymwybodol ohono ers blyneddau lawer a dylent fod wedi bod yn gweithio tuag at y safonau hyn. Maent yn safonau y byddech yn rhesymol yn eu disgwyl fel unigolyn, o ran preifatrwydd ac ati, felly ni chredaf fod y safonau ynddynt hwy eu hunain yn anghywir neu'n rhywbeth na ddylid ei ddymuno, a gobeithiaf y cytunwch â hynny. Fodd bynnag, wrth eu gweithredu, yr ydym wedi egluro i Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru fod yn rhaid i anghenion preswylwyr unigol bob amser gael y flaenoriaeth yn ei hystyriaethau, ac na ddylid canolbwyntio ar ofynion biwrocraidd ar draul anghenion preswylwyr. Felly, caiff achosion unigol eu hystyried bob amser. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny yn golygu nad oes cyfrifoldeb ar berchenogion cartrefi gofal i ystyried y safonau yr ydym yn eu pennu, oherwydd rhoddwyd amser a rhybudd. Yr wyf yn siŵr eu bod yn safonau y byddech chithau'n yn eu disgwyl i chi eich hun.

Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn A Commissioner for Older People

Q7 Christine Gwyther: Will the Minister give an update on proposals to establish a commissioner for older people in Wales? OAQ0126(HSS)

C7 Christine Gwyther: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cynigion i sefydlu comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru? OAQ0126(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: In December 2004, the UK Government gave its approval to the drafting of a Bill to establish a commissioner for older people in Wales. Work on the draft Bill is in progress and we still hope that it will be published for the purposes of scrutiny before any general election, should it occur in the relatively near future.

Brian Gibbons: Ym mis Rhagfyr 2004, rhoddodd Llywodraeth y DU ganiatâd i ddrafftio Mesur i sefydlu comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Mae gwaith ar y Mesur drafft yn mynd rhagddo ac yr ydym yn dal i obeithio y caiff ei gyhoeddi at ddibenion craffu cyn unrhyw etholiad cyffredinol, pes cynhelid yn y dyfodol gweddol agos.

2.30 p.m.

Christine Gwyther: Thank you for that answer, Minister. Do you accept that, in

Christine Gwyther: Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. A dderbyniwch y gall

today's commercial terms, 'older people' can mean those aged 50 plus when people are looking for employment? Will you work with the Minister for Economic Development and Transport to ensure that people who are economically inactive at the moment, and who could be economically active, are encouraged to get back into work?

Brian Gibbons: The Minister for Economic Development and Transport has a number of relevant projects, for example, a scheme to encourage entrepreneurs aged over 50, which is well supported. In non-devolved terms, the Department for Work and Pensions, through Jobcentre Plus, has a number of programmes to engage with older people. The general approach that we are adopting through the Assembly Government and the older people's strategy will also address that. The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning also plays a part in terms of training to improve the skills of older people and ensuring that there are not any upper age barriers to individual learning allowances. As a result, older people will be in a better position to actively engage with the workplace and to be full, active and independent citizens.

'pobl hŷn', yn nhermau masnachol heddiw, olygu pobl dros 50 oed pan fydd pobl yn chwilio am waith? A wnewch chi weithio gyda'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth i sicrhau y caiff pobl sy'n economaidd anweithgar ar hyn o bryd, a allai fod yn economaidd weithgar, eu hannog i ddychwelyd i'r gwaith?

Brian Gibbons: Mae gan y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth nifer o brosiectau perthnasol, er enghraifft, cynllun i annog entrepreneuriaid dros 50 oed, sy'n boblogaidd. O ran materion nas datganolwyd, mae gan yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau, drwy'r Ganolfan Byd Gwaith, nifer o raglenni i ymgysylltu â phobl hŷn. Bydd yr ymagwedd gyffredinol yr ydym yn ei mabwysiadu drwy Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn hefyd yn mynd i'r afael â hynny. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes hefyd yn chwarae rhan o ran hyfforddiant i wella sgiliau pobl hŷn a sicrhau nad oes unrhyw rwystr ar sail oedran i gael lwfansau dysgu unigol. O ganlyniad, bydd pobl hŷn mewn sefyllfa well i fod yn rhan o fyd gwaith ac yn ddinasyddion llawn, gweithgar ac annibynnol.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport

Adeiladau o Bwysigrwydd Lleol Buildings of Local Importance

C1 Owen John Thomas: Pa sylw a roddwyd gan Cadw i roi statws adeilad rhestredig i adeiladau sydd o bwysigrwydd lleol? OAQ0118(CWS)

The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh): All communities in Wales have been, or are being, surveyed, but legislation requires buildings to be listed only if they are of special architectural or historic interest. The emphasis in the published listing criteria is on buildings in an all-Wales context.

Owen John Thomas: Mae cyfyngu statws rhestredig i adeiladau o arwyddocâd

Q1 Owen John Thomas: What consideration has Cadw given to giving listed building status to buildings of local importance? OAQ0118(CWS)

Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh): Cynhaliwyd arolwg o bob cymuned yng Nghymru, neu mae arolwg yn cael ei gynnal, ond, o dan y ddeddfwriaeth, dim ond os yw adeiladau o ddiddordeb pensaernïol neu hanesyddol arbennig y mae'n ofynnol iddynt gael eu rhestru. Ar adeiladau yng nghyd-destun Cymru gyfan y mae'r pwyslais yn y meini prawf rhestru cyhoeddedig.

Owen John Thomas: Limiting listed status to buildings of national importance is

cedlaethol yn afresymol ac mae wedi arwain at golli llawer o adeiladau o bwysigrwydd lleol ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Onid ydych yn meddwl ei bod yn hen bryd newid y rheol a ddefnyddia Cadw?

Alun Pugh: This is entirely a matter of legislation and I repeat that the legislation states clearly that buildings can be listed only if they are of special architectural or historic interest, in an all-Wales context.

Glyn Davies: We all agree on the importance of a holistic approach towards urban development and everyone understands the importance of carefully planned public access and access to services, but I believe that a link with the history of an area can create real benefits in terms of developing an identity and a sense of pride in local communities. Do you accept that Cadw, through its power to maintain and protect historical buildings, has the potential to serve a community in a much wider sense than only in protecting its buildings? It could also develop that community.

Alun Pugh: You make a reasonable point. Cadw has important statutory responsibilities in respect of the 30,000 listed buildings that we are fortunate to enjoy in Wales. The historic environment has a big part to play not only in safeguarding the past, but in terms of future economic development.

Mick Bates: I listened to your responses to my colleagues, but we are looking for your commitment that you will take on board the important concept that local buildings have an important part to play in our heritage. Will you make that commitment to carry this cause forward and try to get the rules changed? Do you also agree that the availability of funds to restore these buildings is often as important as the process of listing?

Alun Pugh: I will not give any commitment in terms of changes in the law. However, I think that the owners of listed buildings have important responsibilities. I will be a bit parochial for a minute and say that there are two major historical grade I structures in north Wales that I know that many people the

unreasonable and has led to the loss of many buildings of local importance in all parts of Wales. Do you not think that it is high time that the rule used by Cadw is changed?

Alun Pugh: Mater o ddeddfwriaeth yn unig yw hwn yn unig ac ailadroddaf fod y ddeddfwriaeth yn nodi'n glir mai dim ond os yw adeiladau o ddiddordeb pensaernïol neu hanesyddol arbennig, yng nghyd-destun Cymru gyfan, y gellir eu rhestru.

Glyn Davies: Cytunwn oll ar bwysigrwydd ymagwedd gyfannol tuag at ddatblygu trefol ac mae pawb yn deall pwysigrwydd mynediad cyhoeddus wedi'i gynllunio'n ofalus a mynediad i wasanaethau, ond credaf y gall cysylltiad â hanes ardal arwain at fanteision gwirioneddol o ran meithrin hunaniaeth a balchder mewn cymunedau lleol. A dderbyniwch fod gan Cadw, drwy ei phŵer i gynnal a diogelu adeiladau hanesyddol, y cyfle i wasanaethu cymuned ar ystyr lawer ehangach na diogelu ei hadeiladau yn unig? Gallai hefyd ddatblygu'r gymuned honno.

Alun Pugh: Mae eich pwynt chi yn un rhesymol. Mae cyfrifoldebau statudol pwysig ar Cadw o ran y 30,000 o adeiladau rhestredig sydd gennym yng Nghymru, yn ffodus inni. Mae gan yr amgylchedd hanesyddol ran fawr i'w chwarae nid yn unig o ran diogelu'r gorffennol, ond o ran datblygu economaidd yn y dyfodol.

Mick Bates: Gwrandewais ar eich ymatebion i'm cyd-Aelodau, ond yr ydym am gael ymrwymiad gennych y byddwch yn ystyried y cysyniad pwysig bod gan adeiladau lleol ran bwysig i'w chwarae yn ein treftadaeth. A wnewch chi yr ymrwymiad hwnnw i gefnogi'r achos hwn a cheisio sicrhau bod y rheolau yn cael eu newid? A gytunwch hefyd fod cyllid i adfer yr adeiladau hyn yn aml yr un mor bwysig â'r broses o restru?

Alun Pugh: Ni wnaf unrhyw ymrwymiad o ran newid y gyfraith. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod ar berchenogion adeiladau rhestredig gyfrifoldebau pwysig. Yr wyf am fod ychydig yn blwyfol am eiliad a dweud bod dau adeilad gradd I hanesyddol pwysig yn y Gogledd y gwn y bydd llawer o bobl ym

length and breadth of the region will have been disappointed to lose. One was Hafodunos Hall, where there was a dreadful arson attack, and the other one is Gwrych Castle, the complete neglect of which is visible to the tens of thousands of people who travel along the A55 and the north Wales railway line every day.

mhob cwr o'r rhanbarth wedi bod yn siomedig i'w colli. Un oedd Neuadd Hafodunos, a ddifrodwyd yn enbyd wedi iddo gael ei llosgi'n fwriadol, a'r llall yw Castell Gwrych, y mae ei gyflwr truenus yn weladwy i'r degau ar filoedd o bobl sy'n teithio ar hyd yr A55 a llinell rheilffordd y Gogledd bob dydd.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I wish to apologise to Members following our business electronically on the internet, that the English-language page for our Assembly written questions is not available. I very much regret this further inadequacy in our ICT system. We will seek to have it rectified urgently. I will also report it to the House Committee and have this matter dealt with.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Hoffwn ymddiheuro i'r Aelodau sy'n dilyn ein busnes yn electronig ar y rhyngwrwyd, nad yw'r dudalen Saesneg ar gyfer cwestiynau ysgrifenedig y Cynulliad ar gael. Gresynaf yn fawr at yr enghraifft arall eto o annigonolrwydd ein system TGCh. Ceisiwn unioni'r broblem fel mater o frys. Byddaf hefyd yn hysbysu Pwyllgor y Tŷ o'r broblem a sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â hi.

Ymarfer Corff Physical Exercise

Q2 Kirsty Williams: Will the Minister make a statement on encouraging people in Wales to take up more physical exercise? OAQ0125(CWS)

C2 Kirsty Williams: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar annog pobl yng Nghymru i wneud mwy o ymarfer corff? OAQ0125(CWS)

Alun Pugh: Wales is one of the least physically-active parts of western Europe. The strategic response of the Assembly Government is set out in 'Climbing Higher', which we launched in Swansea on 31 January. We want participation in sport and active recreation—not just watching it—to be an integral part of the lives of people throughout Wales.

Alun Pugh: Mae Cymru yn un o'r rhannau o orllewin Ewrop lle y ceir y lefel isaf o weithgarwch corfforol. Nodir ymateb strategol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn 'Dringo'n Uwch', a lanswyd gennym yn Abertawe ar 31 Ionawr. Yr ydym am i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon a gweithgareddau hamdden egnïol—ac nid eu gwyllo'n unig—fod yn rhan annatod o fywydau pobl ledled Cymru.

Kirsty Williams: Fortunately, participation levels in Powys are relatively good, compared with those in the rest of Wales. However, would you agree that that will be threatened if Powys County Council persists in considering closing leisure centres as part of its cost-cutting exercises? Most recently, the facilities at Knighton, Gwernyfed and Crickhowell have been under threat, and while the axe has been lifted for this financial year, my constituents are very concerned that these facilities will continue to be the target of a cost-cutting council. What can you do to ensure that councils take seriously their responsibility to provide opportunities for people to participate in sports and physical

Kirsty Williams: Yn ffodus, mae cyfranogiad ym Mhowys yn eithaf da, o'i chymharu â'r lefelau yng ngweddill Cymru. Fodd bynnag, a gytunwch y caiff hynny ei beryglu os bydd Cyngor Sir Powys yn mynnu ystyried cau canolfannau hamdden fel rhan o'i ymarfer cwtogi ar gostau? Yn fwyaf diweddar, bu'r cyfleusterau yn Nhrefyclo, Gwernyfed a Chrucywel o dan fygythiad, ac er eu bod wedi cael eu harbed am y flwyddyn ariannol hon, mae fy etholwyr yn pryderu'n fawr y bydd y cyfleusterau hyn yn parhau i gael eu targedu gan gyngor sydd â'i fryd ar gwtogi ar gostau. Beth a allwch ei wneud i sicrhau bod cynghorau yn cymryd o ddifrif eu cyfrifoldeb i roi cyfleoedd i bobl gymryd

exercise?

Alun Pugh: Facilities are important and a good local authority will always keep its complete pattern of provision, in terms of formal leisure centres, constantly under review. Good local authorities will open new centres, and facilities which are obsolete should be closed down, to be replaced by more appropriate provision. If you are identifying a problem whereby a local authority is engaged in a wholesale reduction of the facilities available, then that is a matter for concern.

John Griffiths: The Underwood Local Authority Leisure Centre in Newport East is under threat of closure, largely because of the necessary major repairs that have been identified. The centre is a tremendous resource for a community on the periphery of the Newport City Council area; it is vital for fitness, health and quality of life. Do you agree that it is vital to retain such facilities if our strategies for fitness, activity and health in Wales are to succeed, and will you join with me in supporting the strong community campaign to retain this badly-needed facility?

Alun Pugh: This is the second time that you have raised this issue with me. Newport has a fine record of investment in sporting facilities. The Wales National Velodrome—which is not just a cycling facility—immediately springs to mind. I can understand why your constituents are concerned about that development.

Laura Anne Jones: I am sure that you will agree with Kirsty and me that it is important for all communities in Wales to be able to access sporting facilities. Do you share my concern that increases in the licensing fees for small sports clubs and village and community halls, as part of the Licensing Act 2003, could lead to the closure of some facilities? What action are you taking to prevent this?

Alun Pugh: I have not received a huge amount of correspondence on this, but one or two organisations, particularly golf clubs, have raised the issue of licensing fees with

rhan mewn chwaraeon ac ymarfer corff?

Alun Pugh: Mae cyfleusterau yn bwysig a bydd awdurdod lleol da bob amser yn adolygu ei holl batrwm o ddarpariaeth o ran canolfannau hamdden ffurfiol yn barhaus. Bydd awdurdodau lleol da yn agor canolfannau newydd, a dylai cyfleusterau sydd ar ddiwedd eu hoes gael eu cau, a dylid cyflwyno darpariaeth fwy priodol yn eu lle. Os ydych yn nodi problem, lle y mae awdurdod lleol yn mynd ati i leihau nifer y cyfleusterau sydd ar gael yn gyffredinol, yna mae hynny yn achos pryder.

John Griffiths: Mae Canolfan Hamdden Underwood yr Awdurdod Lleol yn Nwyrain Casnewydd o dan fygythiad, yn bennaf oherwydd y gwaith atgyweirio mawr angenrheidiol sydd wedi cael ei nodi. Mae'r ganolfan yn adnodd gwych i gymuned sydd ar gyrion ardal Cyngor Dinas Casnewydd; mae'n hollbwysig i ffitrwydd, iechyd ac ansawdd bywyd. A gytunwch ei bod yn hollbwysig cadw cyfleusterau o'r fath er mwyn i'n strategaethau ar gyfer ffitrwydd, gweithgarwch ac iechyd yng Nghymru lwyddo, ac a ymunwch â mi i gefnogi'r ymgyrch gymunedol gryf i gadw'r cyfleuster hwn sydd ei angen yn ddybryd?

Alun Pugh: Dyma'r ail dro ichi godi'r mater hwn gyda mi. Mae gan Gasnewydd record wych o fuddsoddi mewn cyfleusterau chwaraeon. Daw Felodrom Cenedlaethol Cymru—sy'n fwy na chyfleuster seiclo—i'm meddwl ar unwaith. Gallaf ddeall pam y mae eich etholwyr yn pryderu am y datganiad hwnnw.

Laura Anne Jones: Fe gytunwch, mae'n siŵr, â Kirsty a minnau ei bod yn bwysig i bob cymuned yng Nghymru allu cael mynediad i gyfleusterau chwaraeon. A rannwch fy mhryder y gallai'r cynnydd yn ffioedd trwyddedu clybiau chwaraeon bach a neuaddau pentref a chymuned, fel rhan o Ddeddf Trwyddedu 2003, beri i rai o'r cyfleusterau gau? Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i atal hyn?

Alun Pugh: Nid wyf wedi cael ryw lawer o ohebiaeth ar hyn, ond mae un neu ddau o sefydliadau, yn enwedig clybiau golff, wedi codi'r mater ffioedd trwyddedu gyda mi. Nid

me. It does not seem to be a huge problem affecting our whole sporting infrastructure, but I will keep the matter under review.

Lorraine Barrett: As this Labour Assembly Government has increased the opportunities available for people to participate in sporting activities, which will make us healthier as a nation, do you agree that it is a retrograde step for Cardiff's Liberal Democrat council, supported by the Conservatives, to reduce the opening hours of leisure centres in this city?

Alun Pugh: We could not support mass closures and all-round reductions in availability; as a Welsh Assembly Government we are proud of our investment in free swimming for young people and for senior citizens. [*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. I will not tolerate these additional sedentary questions—[*Interruption.*] Order. That includes those from Jonathan Morgan.

2.40 p.m.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You make the case for facilities, but people have opportunities within their working day for exercise—they can use the stairs rather than the lift, for example. Given that you are so supportive of sports facilities, will you support the call for a gym in this building when we have the new building?

Alun Pugh: I am always looking for alternative uses for the smoking room, and putting a gym there might be a positive step forward. You are right to say that you do not always need formal gym facilities. Climbing the steps, or cycling or walking to work, all have a powerful health benefit and, in Wales, we have the benefit of having a fantastic natural environment.

ymddengys ei bod yn broblem enfawr sy'n effeithio ar ein seilwaith chwaraeon gyfan, ond parhaf i adolygu'r mater.

Lorraine Barrett: Gan fod y Llywodraeth Cynulliad Lafur hon wedi rhoi mwy o gyfleoedd i bobl gymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau chwaraeon, a fydd yn ein gwneud yn iachach fel cenedl, a gytunwch ei bod yn gam yn ôl i gyngor Caerdydd o dan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, wedi'u cefnogi gan y Ceidwadwyr, leihau oriau agor canolfannau hamdden yn y ddinas hon?

Alun Pugh: Ni allem gefnogi unrhyw gynlluniau i gau nifer fawr o gyfleusterau neu leihau oriau agor yn gyffredinol; fel Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yr ydym yn ymfalchïo yn ein buddsoddiad mewn nofio am ddim i bobl ifanc ac i bensiywyr. [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni oddefaf y cwestiynau ychwanegol hyn gan aelodau tra ar eu heistedd—[*Torri ar draws.*] Trefn. Mae hynny'n cynnwys y rhai gan Jonathan Morgan.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr ydych yn rhoi'r ddadl dros gyfleusterau, ond caiff pobl gyfleoedd yn ystod eu diwrnod gwaith ar gyfer ymarfer corff—gallant ddefnyddio'r grisiau yn hytrach na'r lifft, er enghraifft. O gofio eich bod mor gefnogol i gyfleusterau chwaraeon, a gefnogwch yr alwad am gampfa yn yr adeilad hwn pan fydd yr adeilad newydd gennym?

Alun Pugh: Yr wyf bob amser yn edrych am ddefnyddiau amgen ar gyfer yr ystafell ysmegu, a gallai cael campfa yno fod yn gam cadarnhaol ymlaen. Yr ydych yn iawn i ddweud nad oes angen cyfleusterau campfa ffurfiol bob amser. Mae dringo i fyny'r grisiau, neu feicio neu gerdded i'r gwaith, oll yn fuddiol iawn o ran iechyd ac, yng Nghymru, mae gennym y fantais o amgylchedd naturiol gwych.

Adolygiad Ofcom o Adroddiad Darlledu Gwasanaeth Cyhoeddus Ofcom's Review of Public-service Broadcasting Report

Q3 Leighton Andrews: What role did the

C3 Leighton Andrews: Pa rôl oedd gan

Assembly Government play in influencing the Welsh findings of Ofcom's review of public-service broadcasting report? OAQ0099(CWS)

Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i'w chwarae o ran dylanwadu ar ganfyddiadau Cymreig adroddiad Ofcom ar yr adolygiad o ddarlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus? OAQ0099(CWS)

Q5 Leighton Andrews: What are the implications for Wales of Ofcom's review of public-service broadcasting report? OAQ0090(CWS)

C5 Leighton Andrews: Beth mae adroddiad Ofcom ar yr adolygiad o ddarlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn ei olygu i Gymru? OAQ0090(CWS)

Alun Pugh: Broadcasting is not devolved to the National Assembly for Wales. However, the Assembly Government has responded vigorously, and will continue to do so, on the full range of issues that affect Wales at every stage of Ofcom's review of public-service broadcasting.

Alun Pugh: Nid yw darlledu yn fater sydd wedi'i ddatganoli i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymateb yn gryf, a bydd yn parhau i wneud hynny, o ran yr holl faterion sy'n effeithio ar Gymru ar bob cam o adolygiad Ofcom o ddarlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus.

Leighton Andrews: Do you agree that the most recent report is a step forward from the threat contained in the previous report of September that we might see a significant reduction in the hours of ITV Wales programming? In making a submission to this review, will you stress the need for Welsh programmes and for Welsh producers to be considered in the context of Ofcom's proposal for a public-service publisher?

Leighton Andrews: A gytunwch fod yr adroddiad diwethaf yn gam ymlaen o'r bygythiad a gafwyd yn yr adroddiad blaenorol ym mis Medi y gallai fod gostyngiad sylweddol yn oriau rhaglenni ITV Wales? Wrth gyflwyno sylwadau i'r adolygiad hwn, a wnewch chi bwysleisio'r angen am raglenni Cymreig ac i gynhyrchwyr o Gymru gael eu hystyried yng nghyd-destun cynnig Ofcom ar gyfer cyhoeddwr gwasanaeth cyhoeddus?

Alun Pugh: You make a fair point. In terms of the Ofcom report, it was good to see Wales being treated differently from the English regions. That was a clear recognition of the devolved nature of the United Kingdom. There are enormous opportunities in that report for Welsh producers to make a bigger contribution to the network than they currently do. It is good to see Welsh programmes making it not only onto Welsh screens but onto UK screens, and, in that context, I congratulate BBC Wales on a triumphant showing last night of the first episode of the new *Dr Who*.

Alun Pugh: Mae eich pwynt chi yn un teg. O ran adroddiad Ofcom, yr oedd yn braf gweld Cymru yn cael ei thrin mewn ffordd wahanol i ranbarthau Lloegr. Yr oedd hynny'n gydnabyddiaeth glir o natur ddatganoledig y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae cyfleoedd enfawr yn yr adroddiad hwnnw i gynhyrchwyr o Gymru wneud mwy o gyfraniad i'r rhwydwaith nag a wnânt ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n braf gweld rhaglenni Cymreig nid yn unig yn cael eu darlledu yng Nghymru ond drwy'r DU ac, yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, llongyfarchaf BBC Cymru ar gyflwyniad llwyddiannus neithiwr o'r rhifyn cyntaf o'r gyfres newydd o *Dr Who*.

Leighton Andrews: One of the other issues raised in the Ofcom review is the future of S4C. Do you agree that it is important that S4C and BBC Wales work together to ensure that we have a strong Welsh-language television service? Do you also agree that it is important that at least one broadcaster in Wales broadcasts in both the national

Leighton Andrews: Un o'r materion eraill a godwyd yn adolygiad Ofcom yw dyfodol S4C. A gytunwch ei bod yn bwysig bod S4C a BBC Cymru yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd i sicrhau bod gennym wasanaeth teledu cyfrwng Cymraeg cryf? A gytunwch hefyd ei bod yn bwysig bod o leiaf un darlledwr yng Nghymru yn darlledu yn y ddwy iaith

languages of Wales?

Alun Pugh: This is a small market in terms of the world-wide stage that is broadcasting in the twenty-first century. We need to have co-operation to maximise the benefits for Welsh-language broadcasting. Also, we all need to be clear that the development and availability of Welsh-medium broadcasting is a fundamental plank in the Assembly Government's support for the creation of a bilingual future for the Welsh nation.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Af â chi yn ôl at eich sylwadau ar ITV1 Cymru. Wrth gwrs ein bod yn croesawu'r ffaith bod yr adroddiad yn well nag oedd rhai wedi'i ofni, gyda naw awr a hanner o raglenni rhanbarthol yn mynd i lawr i wyth awr a hanner pan fydd y newid i ddigidol yn digwydd. A ydych yn cytuno, er mwyn i hynny fod yn dderbyniol, fod yn rhaid i'r oriau hynny fod yn oriau brig neu'n agos at oriau brig? Gwyddoch fod gan y Llywodraeth hawl i gymryd rhan yn y broses ymgynghorol, felly, a fyddwch chi yn pwysu am i'r oriau hynny fod yn oriau brig neu'n agos atynt?

Alun Pugh: The question of peak hours, and the point at which these programmes are transmitted, is crucial. There is little point in having guarantees if the net effect of that is to confine Welsh programmes to graveyard slots, which carry graveyard budgets. I do not think that anybody would be happy with that.

Lisa Francis: Given what you have just said, that the non-news programming requirement in Wales will be reduced to four hours, and then to three hours, what are you asking for in your response to Ofcom in terms of ensuring that that figure is frozen and that it does not come about?

Alun Pugh: I am glad to see the Conservatives accept what would happen if market forces were allowed to run unchecked. This is a market in which we need to intervene. No-one is in a position to offer guarantees that run into the distant future, with the move from an analogue broadcasting environment, where spectrum is scarce and, therefore, valuable, to a digital

genedlaethol?

Alun Pugh: Mae hon yn farchnad fach o ran y llwyfan byd-eang sy'n darlledu yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Mae angen inni gael cydweithrediad er mwyn manteisio i'r eithaf o ran darlledu cyfrwng Cymraeg. Hefyd, mae angen inni oll fod yn glir bod datblygiad ac argaeledd darlledu cyfrwng Cymraeg yn elfen hanfodol yng nghefnogaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i greu dyfodol dwyieithog i'r genedl.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I will take you back to your comments on ITV1 Wales. We of course welcome the fact that the report was better than some had feared, with nine and a half hours of regional programming being reduced to eight and a half hours when digital switch-over occurs. Do you concur that, in order for that to be acceptable, those hours must be peak hours or close to peak hours? You will know that the Government has the right to participate in the consultation process, therefore, will you press for those hours to be peak hours or close to peak hours?

Alun Pugh: Mae mater oriau brig a phryd y caiff y rhaglenni hyn eu darlledu yn hollbwysig. Nid oes fawr o ddiben mewn cael sicrwydd os mai'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn y diwedd yw bod rhaglenni Cymraeg yn cael eu darlledu yn hwyr yn y nos, a chydychyllidebau sy'n adlewyrchu hynny. Ni chredaf y byddai neb yn fodlon ar hynny.

Lisa Francis: O gofio'r hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud, y caiff y gofyniad o ran rhaglenni nad ydynt yn rhaglenni newyddion yng Nghymru ei leihau i bedair awr, ac yna i dair awr, am beth yr ydych yn ei ofyn yn eich ymateb i Ofcom o ran sicrhau bod y ffigur hwnnw yn cael ei rewi ac na fydd hynny'n digwydd?

Alun Pugh: Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod y Ceidwadwyr yn derbyn yr hyn a fyddai'n digwydd pe na bai dim llyffethair ar rymoedd y farchnad. Dyma farchnad lle y mae angen inni ymyrryd. Nid oes neb yn gallu cynnig sicrwydd ymhell i'r dyfodol, ar ôl symud o amgylchedd darlledu analog, lle y mae'r sbectrum yn brin ac, felly, yn werthfawr, i oes ddigidol lle y mae'n bosibl cynnig mwy a

age where it is possible to slot in more and more channels. We cannot offer guarantees for Welsh content into the distant future.

Jenny Randerson: I refer you back to your earlier answer to Leighton Andrews. Will you tell us specifically which of Ofcom's proposed models for the future of S4C you are putting forward as your preferred option? What representations have you made on this issue to Ofcom and the UK Government? Will you give us your commitment today that you will work with Ofcom and the UK Government to secure the future of a strong and varied range of public-sector broadcasting services in the Welsh language?

Alun Pugh: All our responses to date have been published on the web, and I understand that they are available from the Members' Library. Tempting though it is to say something this afternoon, you will have to wait a few more weeks for the Assembly Government's response to the latest consultation.

The Presiding Officer: Order. A few moments ago, my attention was drawn—and I am grateful to Carl Sargeant for doing so—to the absence on the Chamberweb of the English-language version of our questions. It is now available and Members may access it by logging off and logging back on.

mwy o sianeli. Ni allwn gynnig sicrwydd ynglŷn â chynnwys Cymreig ymhell i'r dyfodol.

Jenny Randerson: Fe'ch cyfeirïaf yn ôl at eich ateb cynharach i Leighton Andrews. A wnewch chi ddweud wrthym yn benodol pa un o'r modelau a gynigiwyd gan Ofcom ar gyfer dyfodol S4C yr ydych yn ei nodi fel eich hoff ddewis? Pa sylwadau yr ydych wedi'u cyflwyno ar y mater hwn i Ofcom a Llywodraeth y DU? A wnewch chi addo heddiw y byddwch yn gweithio gydag Ofcom a Llywodraeth y DU i sicrhau amrywiaeth gyfoethog a helaeth o wasanaethau darlledu sector cyhoedus yn Gymraeg yn y dyfodol?

Alun Pugh: Mae pob un o'n hymatebion hyd yma wedi cael eu cyhoeddi ar y we, a deallaf eu bod ar gael yn Llyfrgell yr Aelodau. Er ei fod yn demtasiwn dweud rhywbeth y prynhawn yma, bydd yn rhaid ichi aros ychydig wythnosau eto am ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r ymgynghoriad diweddaraf.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ychydig eiliadau yn ôl, tynnwyd fy sylw—ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Carl Sargeant am wneud hynny—at y ffaith nad oedd fersiwn Saesneg o'n cwestiynau ar we'r Siambr. Mae bellach ar gael a gall Aelodau ei weld drwy ddatgysylltu ac ailgysylltu eto.

Ariannu Pêl-droed ar Lefel Gymunedol yn y Gogledd The Funding of Grass-roots Football in North Wales

Q4 Karen Sinclair: Will the Minister make a statement on the funding of grass-roots football in north Wales? OAQ0100(CWS)

Alun Pugh: Since 2002, the Assembly Government has invested over £2 million to help develop grass-roots football throughout Wales via the Sports Council for Wales. Since 1995, north Wales has received over £1 million in lottery-funded programmes to construct new pitches, improve changing rooms and provide new kit and equipment for starter teams.

Karen Sinclair: As you know, football in north Wales is as important to the local community as rugby is in south Wales.

C4 Karen Sinclair: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ariannu pêl-droed ar lefel gymunedol yn y Gogledd? OAQ0100(CWS)

Alun Pugh: Ers 2002, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi buddsoddi dros £2 filiwn i helpu i ddatblygu pêl-droed ar lefel gymunedol ledled Cymru drwy Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru. Ers 1995, cafodd y Gogledd dros £1 filiwn mewn rhaglenni wedi'u hariannu gan y loteri i adeiladu caeau newydd, gwella ystafelloedd newid a darparu dillad ac offer chwaraeon newydd i dimau cychwynnol.

Karen Sinclair: Fel y gwyddoch, mae pêl-droed yn y Gogledd yr un mor bwysig i'r gymuned leol ag yw rygbi yn y De. O

Consequently, the future development of the game needs to be protected. The knock-on effects of the difficulties experienced by Wrexham Association Football Club, and the recent speculation in north Wales about playing fields being sold off, have put the game's progression under a cloud. Will you take this opportunity to reaffirm our Government's commitment to investing in football development in north Wales?

Alun Pugh: I am happy to confirm that we will continue to invest in developing facilities for football, and we would certainly not wish to see the mass disposal of playing fields. That would not be in the interests of football in Wales, or the long-term health of the Welsh nation. You made an important statement: football is important in north Wales. You need not look any further than the reaction of local supporters' clubs to developments at Wrexham to know how much it means to that community.

Janet Ryder: The development of any sport relies on developing young players and helping them to progress. Therefore, the work done in schools to support football is important. What financial support have you made available to the Wales schoolboys' football team?

Alun Pugh: We channel financial support for football through the Sports Council for Wales. The package for Welsh schools would be part of the £2 million investment that we have made available since 2002.

Ann Jones: Football at grass roots is important. It is also important that communities have the proper facilities that you mentioned. However, it is also important that players can aspire to play at places such as Wrexham's Racecourse ground and Rhyl's Belle Vue stadium. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] Rhyl is the Welsh premiership champion, whether you like it or not, and it will retain that title. Can you assure me, Minister, that you will seek protection for grounds such as the Racecourse, Belle Vue and others—my colleague has just reminded me that Cardiff City Football Club is currently facing difficulties—so that we retain these grass-roots facilities to ensure

ganlyniad, mae angen diogelu datblygiad y gêm yn y dyfodol. Mae effeithiau canlyniadol yr anawsterau a gafodd Clwb Cymdeithas Bêl-droed Wrecsam, a'r dyfalu diweddar yn y Gogledd ynghylch meysydd chwarae yn cael eu gwerthu, wedi golygu bod datblygiad y gêm dan gwmwl. A fanteisiwch ar y cyfle hwn i ailddatgan ymrwymiad ein Llywodraeth i fuddsoddi yn natblygiad pêl-droed yn y Gogledd?

Alun Pugh: Mae'n bleser gennyf gadarnhau y byddwn yn parhau i fuddsoddi mewn datblygu cyfleusterau ar gyfer pêl-droed, ac yn sicr ni fyddem am weld nifer fawr o feysydd chwarae yn cael eu gwerthu. Ni fyddai hynny er budd pêl-droed yng Nghymru, nac iechyd hirdymor y genedl. Fe wnaethoch ddatganiad pwysig: mae pêl-droed yn bwysig yn y Gogledd. Nid oes angen ichi edrych ymhellach nag ymateb clybiau cefnogwyr lleol i'r datblygiadau yn Wrecsam i wybod pa mor bwysig ydyw i'r gymuned honno.

Jane Ryder: Mae datblygiad unrhyw fath o chwaraeon yn dibynnu ar feithrin chwaraewyr ifanc a'u helpu i ddatblygu. Felly, mae'r gwaith a wneir mewn ysgolion i gefnogi pêl-droed yn bwysig. Pa gymorth ariannol yr ydych wedi'i roi i dîm pêl-droed bechgyn Cymru?

Alun Pugh: Yr ydym yn rhoi cymorth ariannol i bêl-droed drwy Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru. Byddai'r pecyn ar gyfer ysgolion Cymru yn rhan o'r buddsoddiad o £2 filiwn yr ydym wedi'i wneud ers 2002.

Ann Jones: Mae pêl-droed ar lefel gymunedol yn bwysig. Mae'n bwysig hefyd fod gan gymunedau y cyfleusterau priodol a grybwyllwyd gennych. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig hefyd y gall chwaraewyr anelu at chwarae mewn lleoedd megis y Cae Ras yn Wrecsam a stadiwm Belle Vue yn y Rhyl. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.'] Y Rhyl yw pencampwyr Uwch Gynghrair Cymru, pa un a ydych yn hoffi hynny ai peidio, a bydd yn cadw'r teitl hwnnw. A allwch roi sicrwydd imi, Weinidog, y byddwch yn ceisio diogelwch ar gyfer meysydd megis y Cae Ras, Belle Vue ac eraill—mae fy nghyd-Aelod newydd fy atgoffa bod Clwb Pêl-droed Dinas Caerdydd yn wynebu anawsterau ar

that people can continue to enjoy football, even if it is only to participate from the terraces?

Alun Pugh: You are right to point out that Rhyl is indeed Welsh champion. One of the things that I like about Rhyl is that it is seriously committed to developing community football. It is good to see Rhyl supporting so many youth teams and it deserves all our praise for that.

2.50 p.m.

We need to protect grounds, but, ultimately, the professional game is a competitive business—it can sometimes be a competitive, cut-throat private business—and I know that many people are deeply concerned about events currently taking place. Wrexham has already been mentioned this afternoon and I know that many Cardiff City Football Club supporters are deeply concerned about what is happening at Ninian Park.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I do not think that Cardiff is in north Wales.

Mark Isherwood: The Boys' and Girls' Clubs of Wales are not receiving the support they need from the Football Association of Wales for a training strategy or for girls' football. Clubs have stated that provision for the whole of youth soccer appears to have been delegated to the south Wales FAW. What action will you take to remedy this and to ensure fair funding for youth soccer in north Wales?

Alun Pugh: I have regular discussions with colleagues in the FAW and I know that they take seriously their responsibilities both geographically and in terms of gender. It is good to see a great deal of investment in girls' football, which is a terrific sport.

hyn o bryd—fel y byddwn yn cadw'r cyfleusterau cymunedol hyn er mwyn sicrhau y gall pobl barhau i fwynhau pêl-droed, hyd yn oed os mai dim ond drwy fod yn rhan o'r dorf yw hynny?

Alun Pugh: Yr ydych yn iawn i nodi mai'r Rhyl yw pencampwyr Cymru. Un o'r pethau yr wyf yn ei hoffi ynglŷn â'r Rhyl yw'r ffaith ei bod yn gwbl ymrwymedig i ddatblygu pêl-droed cymunedol. Mae'n braf gweld bod y Rhyl yn cefnogi cynifer o dimau ieuentid ac mae'n haeddu pob clod am wneud hynny.

Mae angen inni ddiogelu meysydd, ond, yn y pen draw, busnes cystadleuol yw'r gêm broffesiynol—mae'n gallu bod yn fusnes preifat cystadleuol didrugaredd weithiau—a gwn fod llawer o bobl yn poeni'n arw ynglŷn â'r hyn sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd. Cyfeiriwyd at Wrecsam eisoes y prynhawn yma a gwn fod llawer o gefnogwyr Clwb Pêl-droed Dinas Caerdydd yn poeni'n arw ynglŷn â'r hyn sy'n digwydd ym Mharc Ninian.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni chredaf fod Caerdydd yn y Gogledd.

Mark Isherwood: Nid yw Clybiau Bechgyn a Merched Cymru yn cael y cymorth sydd ei angen arnynt oddi wrth Gymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru ar gyfer strategaeth hyfforddi nac ar gyfer pêl-droed i ferched. Mae'r clybiau wedi nodi yr ymddengys bod y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer pêl-droed ieuentid i gyd wedi'i dirprwyo i'r gymdeithas yn y De. Pa gamau y byddwch yn eu cymryd i unioni hyn a sicrhau bod cyllid teg ar gyfer pêl-droed ieuentid yn y Gogledd?

Alun Pugh: Caf drafodaethau rheolaidd â swyddogion Cymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru a gwn eu bod yn cymryd eu cyfrifoldebau o ddifrif yn ddaeryddol ac o ran darpariaeth i'r ddau ryw. Mae'n braf gweld cryn dipyn o fuddsoddiad mewn pêl-droed i ferched, sy'n gêm wych.

Goblygiadau i Gymru o Gais y DU am Gemau Olympaidd 2012 The Implications for Wales of the UK's 2012 Olympics Bid

Q6 Nick Bourne: What discussions has the Minister had with UK Government Ministers

C6 Nick Bourne: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda Gweinidogion

on the implications for Wales of the UK's 2012 Olympics bid? OAQ0152(CWS)

Alun Pugh: The bid for London to host the 2012 Olympic Games is a standing item on the agenda at the sports Cabinet meeting, which is attended by Ministers with responsibility for sports from the four home nations.

Nick Bourne: I am sure that we all hope that that bid will be successful. We are blessed with the Millennium Stadium, which will be used for football in the event of a successful bid, but are you pushing other possible venues in Wales, such as the Wales National Velodrome for cycling, possible shooting events and sailing almost anywhere around the coast? Could you update us on what in particular you are pressing the UK Government for?

Alun Pugh: Thank you for your support. We all hope that Britain will be able to pull off that bid for 2012. On the games themselves, the Millennium Stadium will be the only Welsh venue, but it will play an important part in the football competition. Beyond that, Wales has a great deal to offer in terms of accommodating training camps, which can be powerful vehicles for sporting and economic development. You are right to point out that the velodrome in Newport would be a terrific training facility, as would the national pool in Swansea and some whitewater venues in north Wales.

Carl Sargeant: Do you agree that it is important that we make good representation to the UK Government on this, and make appropriate use of buildings such as the Millennium Stadium and the indoor athletics stadium in my constituency of Alyn and Deeside? Do you agree that the Millennium Stadium should be discouraged from hosting events such as last weekend's Punch and Judy show, focusing instead on sporting events?

Alun Pugh: The Millennium Stadium is entitled to raise money from all sorts of

Llywodraeth y DU ar yr hyn y mae cais y DU am Gêmau Olympaidd 2012 yn ei olygu i Gymru? OAQ0152(CWS)

Alun Pugh: Mae cais Llundain i gynnal Gemau Olympaidd 2012 yn eitem sefydlog ar agenda cyfarfod y Cabinet ar chwaraeon, a fynychir gan y Gweinidogion sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros chwaraeon o bedair gwlad y Deyrnas Unedig.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn siŵr bod pob un ohonom yn gobeithio y bydd y cais hwnnw yn llwyddo. Yr ydym yn ffodus bod gennym Stadiwm y Mileniwm, a gaiff ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer pêl-droed os bydd y cais yn llwyddo, ond a ydych yn hybu lleoliadau posibl eraill yng Nghymru, megis Felodrom Cenedlaethol Cymru ar gyfer seiclo, digwyddiadau saethu posibl a hwylio bron unrhyw le ar yr arfordir? A allech roi'r diweddaraf inni ynghylch beth yn arbennig yr ydych yn pwysu amdano gyda Llywodraeth y DU?

Alun Pugh: Diolch ichi am eich cefnogaeth. Mae pob un ohonom yn gobeithio y bydd cais Prydain ar gyfer 2010 yn llwyddo. O ran y gemau eu hunain, Stadiwm y Mileniwm fydd yr unig leoliad yng Nghymru, ond bydd yn chwarae rhan bwysig yn y gystadleuaeth bêl-droed. Y tu hwnt i hynny, mae gan Gymru gryn dipyn i'w gynnig o ran bod yn lleoliad ar gyfer gwersylloedd hyfforddi, a all fod yn gyfrwng grymus i ddatblygu chwaraeon a datblygu economaidd. Yr ydych yn iawn i nodi y byddai'r felodrom yng Nghasnewydd yn gyfleuster hyfforddi gwych, a hefyd y pwll nofio cenedlaethol yn Abertawe a rhai lleoliadau dŵr gwyn yn y Gogledd.

Carl Sargeant: A gytunwch ei bod yn bwysig ein bod yn gwneud sylwadau cryf i Lywodraeth y DU ar hyn, a gwneud defnydd priodol o adeiladau, megis Stadiwm y Mileniwm a'r stadiwm athletau dan do yn fy etholaeth i, sef Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy? A gytunwch y dylid annog rheolwyr Stadiwm y Mileniwm i beidio â chynnal digwyddiadau megis y sioe Pwnsh a Jwdi y penwythnos diwethaf, a'u hannog yn hytrach i ganolbwyntio ar ddigwyddiadau chwaraeon?

Alun Pugh: Mae hawl gan Stadiwm y Mileniwm i godi arian o bob math o

activities. The more money it raises, the better for the stadium, so I cannot agree with you on that, Carl. However, on the Deeside facility, you are right to point out that that is a first-rate training facility, which could be included as part of the pitch for training camps if London manages to defeat the strong bid from Paris for the 2012 games.

weithgareddau. Po fwyaf yr arian a gwyd, gorau i gyd i'r stadiwm, felly ni allaf gytuno â chi ar hynny, Carl. Fodd bynnag, o ran y cyfleuster yng Nglannau Dyfrdwy, yr ydych yn iawn i nodi bod hwn yn gyfleuster hyfforddi o'r radd flaenaf, a allai gael ei gynnwys fel rhan o'r ymgyrch i ddenu gwersylloedd hyfforddi os bydd Llundain yn llwyddo i drechu cais cryf Paris ar gyfer gemau 2012.

Celfyddydau Cymunedol yn y Gogledd Community Arts in North Wales

Q7 Brynle Williams: Will the Minister make a statement on support for community arts in north Wales? OAQ0146(CWS)

C7 Brynle Williams: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y cymorth a roddir i gelfyddydau cymunedol yn y Gogledd? OAQ0146(CWS)

Alun Pugh: In 2004-05, over £550,000 was spent on supporting the vibrant and varied community arts sector in north Wales. That money supported such diverse events as north Wales's International Bluegrass Music and Dance Festival, and organisations such the North Wales Potters Association and the north Wales branch of the Embroiderers' Guild.

Alun Pugh: Yn 2004-05, gwariwyd dros £550,000 ar gefnogi'r sector celfyddydau cymunedol bywiog ac amrywiol yn y Gogledd. Drwy'r arian hwnnw cefnogwyd digwyddiadau mor amrywiol â Gŵyl Ryngwladol Cerddoriaeth a Dawns Bluegrass gogledd Cymru, a mudiadau megis Cymdeithas Crochenwyr Gogledd Cymru a changen Urdd y Brodwyr yn y Gogledd.

Brynle Williams: Due to the rebanding exercise imposed on taxpayers throughout Wales, many councils are having to slash vital funds from community arts groups to keep council tax as low as possible. In the light of that, what additional funds are you planning to allocate from your budget to ensure that groups are supported and are able to continue?

Brynle Williams: Oherwydd yr ymarfer ailfandio a orfodwyd ar drethdalwyr ledled Cymru, mae llawer o gynghorau yn gorfod torri cyllid hollbwysig i grwpiau celfyddydau cymunedol i sicrhau bod y dreth gyngor mor isel â phosibl. Yng ngoleuni hynny, pa gyllid ychwanegol yr ydych yn bwriadu ei ddyrannu o'ch cyllideb i sicrhau y caiff y grwpiau gymorth ac y gallant barhau?

Alun Pugh: You will understand that funding comes from two sources: the Arts Council of Wales, in terms of grant aid, and the lottery. After a number of years when lottery receipts were in structural decline, recent sales figures seem to be reasonably buoyant. The arts council has also had a substantial increase in its budget for this year.

Alun Pugh: Fe ddeallwch fod cyllid yn dod o ddwy ffynhonnell: Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, o ran cymorth grant, a'r loteri. Ar ôl nifer o flynyddoedd pan oedd derbyniadau'r loteri yn gostwng, ymddengys bod ffigurau gwerthiannau diweddar yn weddol dda. Mae cyngor y celfyddydau hefyd wedi cael cynnydd sylweddol yn ei gyllideb ar gyfer eleni.

Hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg yng Nghaernarfon Promoting the Welsh Language in Caernarfon

C8 Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar hyrwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg yng Nghaernarfon?

Q8 Alun Ffred Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on promoting the Welsh language in Caernarfon? OAQ0089(CWS)

OAQ0089(CWS)

Alun Pugh: Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithio'n galed i greu Cymru ddwyieithog a hynny drwy hybu'r Gymraeg ym mhob rhan o Gymru, gan gynnwys Caernarfon. Yr oedd yn bleser agor swyddfa ranbarthol Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yng Nghaernarfon yr haf diwethaf i gyfrannu at y gwaith hwnnw.

Alun Ffred Jones: Yn 'Iaith Pawb', ceir adran ar strategaeth adleoli swyddi y tu allan i Gaerdydd. Mae brawddeg yn y ddogfen honno yn dweud:

'Mae'n debyg y bydd ardaloedd Cymraeg eu hiaith...yn elwa'.

Cyfeiriasioch at fwrdd yr iaith, sydd wedi sefydlu tua pum swydd yn y dref. Fodd bynnag, mae strategaeth adleoli y Cynulliad yn symud 20 o swyddi o Gaernarfon i Gyffordd Llandudno. Sut mae hynny'n cyfrannu at fuddsoddiad yn yr economi leol yng Nghaernarfon?

Alun Pugh: You are correct in saying that a relatively small number of jobs will be moved from Caernarfon to Llandudno Junction. A much greater number of jobs will be moved from Cardiff to north Wales. As a north Wales Assembly Member, I am happy to see that.

A small number of jobs will be moved from Caernarfon to Llandudno Junction, but you must also look at investment by the Welsh Language Board. I was happy to open the language board's office in Caernarfon. Currently, there are five jobs in the office, but that number may well grow in the future.

Alun Pugh: The Assembly Government is working hard to create a bilingual Wales by promoting the Welsh language in all parts of Wales, including Caernarfon. It was a pleasure to open the Welsh Language Board's regional office in Caernarfon last summer to contribute to this work.

Alun Ffred Jones: In 'Iaith Pawb', there is a section on a strategy to relocate jobs outside Cardiff. A sentence in the document states:

'Welsh speaking areas are likely to be among the beneficiaries'.

You referred to the language board, which has created approximately five jobs in the town. However, the Assembly's relocation strategy is to relocate 20 jobs from Caernarfon to Llandudno Junction. How does that contribute to an investment in the local economy in Caernarfon?

Alun Pugh: Yr ydych yn iawn i ddweud y caiff nifer cymharol fach o swyddi eu symud o Gaernarfon i Gyffordd Llandudno. Caiff llawer mwy o swyddi eu symud o Gaerdydd i'r Gogledd. Fel Aelod Cynulliad sy'n cynrychioli etholaeth yn y Gogledd, yr wyf yn falch o weld hynny.

Caiff nifer fach o swyddi eu symud o Gaernarfon i Gyffordd Llandudno, ond rhaid ichi ystyried hefyd fuddsoddiad Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Yr oedd yn bleser gennyf agor swyddfa bwrdd yr iaith yng Nghaernarfon. Ar hyn o bryd, mae pum swydd yn y swyddfa, ond mae'n ddigon posibl y bydd y nifer hwnnw yn tyfu yn y dyfodol.

Codi Lefelau Cyfranogi o Chwaraeon Raising Levels of Participation in Sports

Q9 Denise Idris Jones: Will the Minister make a statement about raising levels of sports participation in Wales?
OAQ0091(CWS)

Alun Pugh: 'Climbing Higher', our integrated strategy for sport and physical

C9 Denise Idris Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gynyddu'r lefelau cyfranogi o chwaraeon yng Nghymru?
OAQ0091(CWS)

Alun Pugh: Mae 'Dringo'n Uwch' sef ein strategaeth integredig ar gyfer chwaraeon a

activity, is integral to the aims and delivery of Health Challenge Wales. It commits this Government to raising levels of participation in sport and physical activity so that, within 20 years, we can match the best global standards.

Denise Idris Jones: I am sure you agree that community centres such as that in Llandudno's Tudno ward, alongside Ysgol John Bright, encourage young people to play sports, and also encourage mutual respect for older people. There is a similar example in Maesgeirchen with the healthy living centre. You were with me when we were raising money for a new boxing centre in that area.

Alun Pugh: Areas such as Maesgeirchen and the Tudno ward in Llandudno, with which I am particularly familiar, are deprived communities. A strong and clear theme in the 'Climbing Higher' process is ensuring that communities with the lowest levels of participation in sport receive the greatest help.

gweithgarwch corfforol, yn hanfodol i nodau a gweithrediad Her Iechyd Cymru. Drwyddi, mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn ymrwymo i gynyddu nifer y bobl sy'n cymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon a gweithgarwch corfforol fel y gallwn, ymhen 20 mlynedd, efelychu'r safonau gorau yn y byd.

Denise Idris Jones: Fe gytunwch, mae'n siŵr, fod canolfannau cymunedol megis honno yn ward Tudno yn Llandudno, wrth ymyl Ysgol John Bright, yn annog pobl ifanc i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon, ac yn ennyn parch tuag at bobl hŷn ymhlith pobl ifanc. Ceir enghraifft debyg ym Maesgeirchen gyda'r ganolfan byw'n iach. Yr oeddech gyda mi pan oeddem yn codi arian ar gyfer canolfan baffio newydd yn yr ardal honno.

Alun Pugh: Mae ardaloedd megis Maesgeirchen a ward Tudno yn Llandudno, yr wyf yn gyfarwydd iawn â hwy, yn gymunedau difreintiedig. Un o themâu cryf, clir ym mhroses 'Dringo'n Uwch' yw sicrhau bod cymunedau lle y ceir y cyfranogiad lleiaf mewn chwaraeon yn cael y cymorth mwyaf.

Cyfleusterau Chwaraeon yn y De-orllewin Sporting Facilities in South-west Wales

Q10 Janet Davies: Will the Minister make a statement on sporting facilities in south-west Wales? OAQ0082(CWS)

Alun Pugh: South-west Wales has a range of first-class facilities, not least the 50m national swimming pool. By working with partners in the public, private and voluntary sectors, I aim to further enhance the sport and leisure infrastructure across Wales.

Janet Davies: You mentioned Swansea, which is Wales's second city, and a significant regional capital. It will cost the council £25 million to make Swansea's leisure centre serviceable to modern standards. In view of the widespread client base for this centre, are you considering offering financial or other assistance to Swansea City and County Council?

Alun Pugh: That is matter for the local

C10 Janet Davies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gyfleusterau chwaraeon yn y De-orllewin? OAQ0082(CWS)

Alun Pugh: Mae nifer o gyfleusterau o'r radd flaenaf yn y De-orllewin, yn bennaf y pwll nofio cenedlaethol 50 metr. Drwy weithio gyda phartneriaid yn y sector cyhoeddus, y sector preifat a'r sector gwirfoddol, fy nod yw gwella seilwaith chwaraeon a hamdden ymhellach ledled Cymru.

Janet Davies: Bu ichi gyfeirio at Abertawe, sef ail ddinas Cymru, a dinas ranbarthol o bwys. Bydd yn costio £25 miliwn i'r cyngor wneud canolfan hamdden Abertawe yn addas at ei diben yn ôl safonau modern. O gofio sylfaen cleientiaid eang y ganolfan hon, a ydych yn ystyried cynnig cymorth ariannol neu gymorth arall i Gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe?

Alun Pugh: Mater i'r awdurdod lleol yw

authority. My colleague, Sue Essex, has made substantial quantities of public expenditure available for capital projects. However, specific local priorities are a matter for the locally elected authority.

hwnnw. Mae fy ngyd-Weinidog, Sue Essex, wedi rhyddhau symiau mawr o wariant cyhoeddus ar gyfer prosiectau cyfalaf. Fodd bynnag, mater i'r awdurdod a etholwyd yn lleol yw blaenoriaethau lleol penodol.

Darpariaeth Ddawns Dance Provision

Q11 Mark Isherwood: Will the Minister make a statement on dance provision in Wales? OAQ0086(CWS)

C11 Mark Isherwood: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer dawns yn y Gogledd? OAQ0086(CWS)

Alun Pugh: In my remit letter this year, I require the Arts Council of Wales to complete a dance strategy. The strategy will cover the spectrum of dance organisations, from companies such as Diversions and Earthfall to community dance groups and regional dance venues. It will take account of the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee's review of dance, which Rosemary Butler is ably leading.

Alun Pugh: Yn fy llythyr cylch gwaith eleni, yr wyf wedi'i gwneud yn ofynnol i Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru gwblhau strategaeth ddawns. Bydd y strategaeth yn rhychwantu pob sefydliad dawns, o gwmnïau megis Diversions ac Earthfall i grwpiau dawns cymunedol a lleoliadau dawns rhanbarthol. Bydd yn ystyried adolygiad Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon o ddawns, o dan arweiniad medrus Rosemary Butler.

Mark Isherwood: Can you comment on the disparity of local authority support and funding, in respect of regionally based dance organisations, which are funded by the arts council in Wales? Will the Minister ensure that the current dance review being undertaken by the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee will seek to ensure the sustainability of organisations such as North East Wales Dance, which you visited recently?

Mark Isherwood: A allwch wneud sylwadau ar y gwahaniaeth rhwng cymorth a chyllid awdurdodau lleol, o ran sefydliadau dawns rhanbarthol, sydd wedi'u hariannu gan gyngor y celfyddydau yng Nghymru? A wnaiff y Gweinidog sicrhau bod yr adolygiad o ddawns a gynhelir gan Bwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon ar hyn o bryd yn ceisio sicrhau cynaliadwyedd sefydliadau megis Dawns Gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru, y bu ichi ymweld ag ef yn ddiweddar?

Alun Pugh: I did visit that organisation, which does some fine work. However, the issue of parity of funding will be a matter that will exercise the committee in its review.

Alun Pugh: Do, ymwelais â'r sefydliad hwnnw, sy'n gwneud gwaith gwych. Fodd bynnag, mater i'w ystyried gan y pwyllgor yn ei adolygiad yw ariannu cyfartal.

Dyfodol Hirdymor yr Iaith Gymraeg The Long-term Future of the Welsh Language

Q12 Glyn Davies: What discussions has the Minister had on the long-term future of the Welsh language with the chair of the Welsh Language Board? OAQ0079(CWS)

C12 Glyn Davies: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda Chadeirydd Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg am ddyfodol hirdymor yr iaith Gymraeg? OAQ0079(CWS)

Alun Pugh: I meet regularly with the chair of the Welsh Language Board, both formally and informally, to discuss the Assembly

Alun Pugh: Cyfarfyddaf yn rheolaidd â chadeirydd Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, yn ffurfiol ac yn anffurfiol, i drafod nod

Government's aim of a bilingual Welsh nation.

Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o gael cenedl ddwyieithog.

3.00 p.m.

Glyn Davies: Bilingual education in Powys has progressed well in recent years, largely as a result of a supportive financial regime, certainly in terms of the schools. This is now being abandoned, which means that bilingual education in Powys will be put under a very serious threat and that the language's position will undoubtedly go backwards. Will you discuss this matter with the Welsh Language Board and develop some strategy whereby education authorities in Wales are encouraged to give the language their full support and not to withdraw support that has been successful in the past?

Glyn Davies: Mae addysg ddwyieithog ym Mhowys wedi datblygu'n dda yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, yn bennaf o ganlyniad i gyfundrefn ariannol gefnogol, yn sicr o ran yr ysgolion. Bwriedir rhoi'r gorau i honno yn awr, sy'n golygu y bydd addysg ddwyieithog ym Mhowys o dan fygythiad mawr ac y bydd sefyllfa'r iaith yn ddi-au yn dirywio. A wnewch chi drafod y mater hwn gyda Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg a datblygu rhyw strategaeth lle yr anogir awdurdodau addysg yng Nghymru i roi pob cefnogaeth i'r iaith a pheidio â thynnu'n ôl gymorth a fu'n llwyddiannus yn y gorffennol?

Alun Pugh: I am not entirely sure from where you got all that; if you would like to write to me with detailed evidence, I will take that into account in future meetings with the board and in my regular discussions with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning.

Alun Pugh: Nid wyf yn hollol siŵr o ble y cawsoch yr holl wybodaeth hynny; os hoffech ysgrifennu ataf gyda thystiolaeth fanwl, ystyriaf hynny mewn cyfarfodydd â'r bwrdd yn y dyfodol ac yn fy nhrafodaethau rheolaidd gyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes.

Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ Questions to the House Committee

Parlwr Te yr Aelodau The Members' Tearoom

Q1 Mark Isherwood: Will the representative of the House Committee make a statement on local procurement for the Members' tearoom? OAQ0003(HC)

C1 Mark Isherwood: A wnaiff cynrychiolydd o Bwyllgor y Tŷ roi datganiad ar gaffael nwyddau'n lleol ar gyfer parlwr te yr Aelodau. OAQ0003(HC)

The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek): Procurement for the Members' tearoom is carried out as part of the overall catering contract for the Assembly building. A range of products are procured from local suppliers as part of that contract on the basis of using fresh, locally obtained produce. The range of products includes bread, dairy products, vegetables, fruits, sandwiches, meat and fish, as well as a number of Welsh wines and beers.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek): Caiff nwyddau eu caffael ar gyfer ystafell de yr Aelodau fel rhan o'r contract arlwyio cyffredinol ar gyfer adeilad y Cynulliad. Caiff nifer o gynhyrchion eu caffael oddi wrth gyflenwyr lleol fel rhan o'r contract hwnnw ar sail defnyddio cynnyrch ffres wedi'i brynu'n lleol. Mae'r cynhyrchion yn cynnwys bara, cynnyrch llaeth, llysiau, ffrwythau, brechdanau, cig a physgod, yn ogystal â nifer o winoedd a gwahanol fathau o gwrw o Gymru.

Mark Isherwood: Since I questioned you on this last year, Welsh real ale has become available in the Members' tearoom, but only

Mark Isherwood: Ers imi eich holi ynglŷn â hyn y llynedd, dechreuwyd darparu cwrw go iawn o Gymru yn ystafell de yr Aelodau, ond

on a restricted and sporadic basis, without much variety. What action will you take to ensure that the Members' tearoom is used as a showcase for Welsh products?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: If you have any suggestions, raise them with me, and I will ensure that they are given careful consideration. However, Welsh lager, for example, was recently trialled in the Members' tearoom, but was not successful. A product has to sell for us to stock it in the tearoom or any other food outlet in the Assembly.

dim ond yn achlysurol, a heb fawr o amrywiaeth. Pa gamau y byddwch yn eu cymryd i sicrhau y caiff ystafell de yr Aelodau ei defnyddio i ddangos cynnyrch o Gymru?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Os oes gennych unrhyw awgrymiadau, a wnewch chi godi hwy gyda mi, a sicrhaf y cânt eu hystyried yn ofalus. Fodd bynnag, dechreuwyd gwerthu lager Cymreig, er enghraifft, am gyfnod prawf yn ystafell de yr Aelodau, ond nid oedd yn llwyddiant. Rhaid i gynnwch werthu er mwyn inni ei gynnig yn yr ystafell de neu mewn unrhyw fan arall yn y Cynulliad lle y gwerthir bwyd.

Datganiad ar Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adroddiad y Comisiynydd Plant Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's response to the Children's Commissioner Report

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I welcome Peter Clarke's third annual report, which marks the halfway stage of his seven-year term as Children's Commissioner for Wales, and demonstrates once again the significant impact that he is making on behalf of children and young people in Wales. The report comes at an important time for children's services, with the passage into law of the Children Act 2004, and moves to establish a children's commissioner in England.

The commissioner identified five key areas that gave him particular cause for concern during 2003-04. The first is bullying, complaints and advocacy. Advice for schools was provided in 'Respecting Others: Anti-bullying Guidance', published in September 2003. Central to the guidance was the need for all schools to have bullying policies and for these to be drawn up in full consultation with staff, pupils, parents and governors. I have asked all schools to submit a copy of their policies, so that we can assess how well they fit in with the guidance. We consulted on 22 February on guidance for school governing bodies on dealing with complaints involving pupils, and, later this year, we will distribute information setting out how children and young people can deal with

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Croesawaf drydydd adroddiad blynyddol Peter Clarke, sy'n nodi'r cam hanner ffordd drwy ei dymor saith mlynedd fel Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, ac sy'n dangos unwaith eto yr effaith fawr a gaiff ar ran plant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Daw'r adroddiad ar adeg bwysig i wasanaethau plant, wrth basio Deddf Plant 2004, a'r camau i sefydlu comisiynydd plant yn Lloegr.

Nododd y comisiynydd bum maes allweddol a berodd bryder arbennig iddo yn ystod 2003-04. Y cyntaf yw bwlio, cwynion ac eiriolaeth. Rhoddwyd cyngor i ysgolion yn 'Parchu Eraill: Canllawiau Gwrth-fwlio', a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Medi 2003. Rhan ganolog o'r canllawiau oedd yr angen i bob ysgol feddu ar bolisi bwlio a'r angen iddynt lunio'r polisi hwn drwy ymgynghori'n llawn â staff, disgyblion, rhieni a llywodraethwyr. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i bob ysgol gyflwyno copi o'i pholisi, er mwyn inni allu asesu pa mor dda y maent yn cyd-fynd â'r canllawiau. Bu inni ymgynghori ar 22 Chwefror ar y canllawiau i gyrff llywodraethu ysgolion o ran ymdrin â chwynion yn ymwneud â disgyblion, ac, yn ddiweddarach eleni, byddwn yn dosbarthu gwybodaeth yn nodi

bullying.

In respect of advocacy, following the publication of 'Telling Concerns', we pledged to ensure that children and young people have access to advocacy services in health, social care and education settings. From June this year, children in need, looked-after children and care-leavers will have a statutory right to an advocate when making a complaint. Each local authority has a contract with an advocacy provider for children. The Assembly funds ChildLine Cymru/Wales to operate a national helpline. This work will be informed by the results of a major study we commissioned last year from Cardiff University. We aim to develop complaints and advocacy systems that win the confidence of children and young people, and that are accessible and straightforward to use.

Increasing staffing within the social care workforce remains a challenge, but one that we are working with our partners to address. The Care Council for Wales has introduced measures to put social work and social care onto a proper professional footing, improving the protection of vulnerable people and raising the status of the work being done. Work to increase numbers in social work training in higher education in Wales includes the introduction of new degree-level training in September 2004, and bursaries for students not supported by an employer. We support employers to implement grow-your-own schemes, and to raise the profile of social work, including the publication of the careers and recruitment pack, 'Faces of Care'. Overall numbers of social workers, social work assistants and home-care staff continue to rise.

We are committed to ensuring that Wales makes provision for asylum seeking families. For the past four years, we have run an asylum seeker education grant scheme for local authorities, supporting the education costs of asylum seekers dispersed to Wales. The level of provision has increased significantly, with £2.1 million allocated to Cardiff, Swansea, Newport and Wrexham local education authorities in 2003-04, and

sut y gall plant a phobl ifanc ymdrin â bwlio.

Mewn perthynas ag eiriolaeth, yn dilyn cyhoeddi 'Datgan Pryderon', bu inni addo sicrhau bod gwasanaethau eiriolaeth ar gael i blant a phobl ifanc mewn lleoliadau iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol ac addysg. O fis Mehefin eleni, bydd gan blant mewn angen, plant sy'n derbyn gofal a'r rhai sy'n gadael gofal hawl statudol i gael eiriolwr wrth gwyno. Mae gan bob awdurdod lleol gontract gyda darparwr gwasanaethau eiriolaeth plant. Mae'r Cynulliad yn ariannu ChildLine Cymru/Wales i redeg llinell gymorth genedlaethol. Bydd y gwaith hwn yn seiliedig ar ganlyniadau astudiaeth fawr a gomisiynwyd gennym y llynedd gan Brifysgol Caerdydd. Ein nod yw datblygu systemau cwyno ac eiriolaeth sy'n ennyn hyder plant a phobl ifanc, ac sy'n hygyrch ac yn hawdd eu defnyddio.

Mae cynyddu nifer y staff o fewn y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol yn parhau i fod yn her, ond yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'n partneriaid i ymdrin â'r her honno. Mae Cyngor Gofal Cymru wedi cyflwyno mesurau i roi statws proffesiynol priodol i waith cymdeithasol a gofal cymdeithasol, gan wella'r ffordd y caiff pobl ddiamddiffyn eu diogelu a chan godi statws y gwaith a wneir. Mae gwaith i gynyddu'r niferoedd sy'n dilyn hyfforddiant gwaith cymdeithasol mewn addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn cynnwys cyflwyno hyfforddiant lefel gradd newydd ym mis Medi 2004, a bwrsariau i fyfyrwyr na chânt gymorth cyflogwr. Cefnogwn gyflogwyr i weithredu cynlluniau penodol, ac i godi proffil gwaith cymdeithasol, gan gynnwys cyhoeddi'r pecyn gyrfaoedd a recriwtio, 'Wynebau Gofal'. Mae niferoedd cyffredinol gweithwyr cymdeithasol, cynorthwyywyr gwaith cymdeithasol a staff gofal cartref yn parhau i gynyddu.

Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i sicrhau bod Cymru yn gwneud darpariaeth ar gyfer teuluoedd sy'n ceisio lloches. Am y pedair blynedd diwethaf, yr ydym wedi cynnal cynllun grant addysg i geiswyr lloches ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol, sy'n cynnal costau addysg ceiswyr lloches a gaiff eu hanfon i Gymru. Mae'r ddarpariaeth wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol. Dyrannwyd £2.1 miliwn i awdurdodau addysg lleol Caerdydd,

£2.3 million available in the current financial year. We have commissioned research into Welsh attitudes towards asylum seekers, and await with interest its conclusions and recommendations.

Our proposals on parenting will be set out in a three-year parenting action plan, which I will launch for consultation on 15 March. I hope that Members will be able to join representatives of the voluntary organisations and service providers who advised us on the plan in the Norwegian Church Arts Centre on that date, and that they encourage parents and professionals in their constituencies to discuss our proposals and tell us what they think.

Since the commissioner's report was published, the Assembly has formally adopted the Wales spatial plan. We share the commissioner's view of the importance of this document in shaping a sustainable future for today's young people, and the impact that it will have on future generations. We will continue to ensure that children and young people are given the opportunity to contribute to the spatial plan's implementation.

Peter Clarke makes particular reference to the recommendations of his report on the Clywch inquiry. I share his understandable concern to see that progress is maintained, and the Assembly Government has already taken action in response. We are due to debate the report in Plenary on 13 April, when Members will be able to monitor the steps that have been taken. The commissioner also commented on issues highlighted in his previous annual reports. Among these were child poverty, which we are addressing through the child poverty strategy launched by the First Minister in February, and play, our strategy for which will be published in the spring.

We remain committed to our 10-year vision for child and adolescent mental health services, with an additional investment of £1.2 million in the services in 2004-05, including the implementation of 'New Ways

Abertawe, Casnewydd a Wrecsam yn 2003-04, a bydd £2.3 miliwn ar gael yn y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol. Yr ydym wedi comisiynu ymchwil i agweddau pobl Cymru tuag at geiswyr lloches, ac edrychwn ymlaen at weld y canlyniadau a'r argymhellion.

Caiff ein cynigion ar rianta eu nodi mewn cynllun gweithredu rianta tair blynedd, a byddaf yn lansio'r cynllun hwn a'r ymgynghoriad arno ar 15 Mawrth. Gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau yn gallu ymuno â chynrychiolwyr y cyrff gwirfoddol a'r darparwyr gwasanaeth a'n cynghorodd o ran y cynllun yng Nghanolfan Celfyddydau'r Eglwys Norwyaidd ar y dyddiad hwnnw, ac y byddant yn annog rhieni a gweithwyr proffesiynol yn eu hetholaethau i drafod ein cynigion a mynegi eu barn wrthym.

Ers cyhoeddi adroddiad y comisiynydd, mae'r Cynulliad wedi mabwysiadu cynllun gofodol Cymru yn ffurfiol. Cytunwn â barn y comisiynydd o ran pwysigrwydd y ddogfen hon i lywio dyfodol cynaliadwy i bobl ifanc heddiw, a'r effaith a gaiff ar genedlaethau'r dyfodol. Byddwn yn parhau i sicrhau y caiff plant a phobl ifanc y cyfle i gyfrannu at y broses o roi'r cynllun gofodol ar waith.

Mae Peter Clarke yn cyfeirio'n arbennig at yr argymhellion yn ei adroddiad ar ymchwiliad Clywch. Rhannaf ei bryder dealladwy i sicrhau cynnydd parhaol, ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cymryd camau eisoes mewn ymateb i hynny. Bwriedir cynnal dadl ar yr adroddiad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 13 Ebrill, pan fydd Aelodau yn gallu monitro'r camau a gymerwyd. Nododd y comisiynydd faterion a amlygwyd yn ei adroddiadau blynyddol blaenorol hefyd. Ymhlith y rhain yr oedd tlodi plant, yr ydym yn ymdrin ag ef drwy'r strategaeth tlodi plant a lansiwyd gan y Prif Weinidog ym mis Chwefror, a chwarae, yr ydym yn cyhoeddi ein strategaeth arno yn y gwanwyn.

Yr ydym yn parhau i fod yn ymrwymedig i'n gweledigaeth 10 mlynedd ar gyfer gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed, gyda buddsoddiad ychwanegol o £1.2 miliwn yn y gwasanaethau yn 2004-05,

of Working in Mental Health'. These services are emphasised in the national service framework for children, young people and maternity services in Wales, which will be published in its final form later this year. Above all, the national service framework will seek to address inequity in the uptake of services and in health outcomes, which are matters of particular concern.

We remain fully committed to the principle of respect and to promoting the participation of children and young people. The new participation unit, set up with Assembly Government funding, will promote good practice in participation across Wales, and will also work with the Assembly Government to ensure that our internal policy-making processes are fully participative.

Peter Clarke has issued clear challenges to the Assembly Government, and we will continue to take his views fully into account in reviewing and developing our policies for children and young people. We can be justifiably proud of the contribution that our commissioner is making to the realisation of children's rights in Wales, and also, with his appointment for this year as president of the European Network of Children's Ombudspersons, on a wider stage.

Janet Ryder: As you rightly underline, Minister, bullying was highlighted by the children's commissioner as a main concern. I recently visited Dyffryn High School in Newport, where I spoke to some of the young people who are operating the excellent Pupil Always Listening anti-bullying scheme there. They said that their main concern was an alternative, nasty kind of bullying that is emerging through e-mails and mobile phone text messages. They said that this is worse than physical bullying because, to use their words, it gets into your mind and messes you up. Will you take that up with the children's commissioner, Minister, because it is an issue of grave concern that needs to be pursued?

gan gynnwys gweithredu 'New Ways of Working in Mental Health'. Pwysleisir y gwasanaethau hyn yn y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant, pobl ifanc a'r gwasanaethau mamolaeth yng Nghymru, a gaiff ei gyhoeddi ar ei ffurf derfynol yn ddiweddarach eleni. Yn anad dim, bydd y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol yn ceisio ymdrin ag anghydraddoldeb o ran defnyddio gwasanaethau ac o ran canlyniadau iechyd, sy'n peri pryder arbennig.

Yr ydym yn parhau i fod yn gwbl ymrwymedig i'r egwyddor o barch ac i hyrwyddo cyfranogiad plant a phobl ifanc. Bydd yr uned gyfranogi newydd, a sefydlwyd gydag arian Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn hyrwyddo arferion da o ran cyfranogiad ledled Cymru, a byddwn hefyd yn cydweithio â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod ein prosesau llunio polisiau mewnol yn galluogi pobl i gymryd rhan lawn ynddynt.

Mae Peter Clarke wedi rhoi heriau clir i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, a byddwn yn parhau i ystyried ei sylwadau yn llawn wrth adolygu a datblygu ein polisiau ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc. Mae lle inni ymfalchïo yn y cyfraniad y mae ein comisiynydd yn ei wneud i wireddu hawliau plant yng Nghymru, a hefyd, yn ei benodiad fel llywydd Rhwydwaith Ombwdsmyn Plant Ewrop eleni, ar lwyfan ehangach.

Janet Ryder: Fel y nodwch, Weinidog, a hynny'n briodol, bwlio oedd y prif bryder a amlygwyd gan y comisiynydd plant. Ymwelais ag Ysgol Uwchradd Dyffryn yng Nghasnewydd yn ddiweddar, a siaradais â rhai o'r bobl ifanc sy'n rhedeg cynllun gwrth-fwlio ardderchog yno o'r enw 'Pupil Always Listening'. Dywedasant mai eu prif bryder oedd bod math annymunol arall o fwlio yn dod i'r amlwg drwy negeseuon e-bost a negeseuon testun ffonau symudol. Dywedasant fod hyn yn waeth na bwlio corfforol oherwydd, a defnyddio eu geiriau hwy, mae'n mynd i mewn i'ch meddwl ac yn eich drysu. A drafodwch hynny gyda'r comisiynydd plant, Weinidog, am ei fod yn fater sy'n peri pryder difrifol y mae angen ymdrin ag ef?

The commissioner also raised several concerns about unaccompanied asylum seeking children and young people in his report. One concern that bodies such as the National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children and others have raised is access to advocacy. Those children and young people are extremely vulnerable and have different needs to other looked-after young people, and perhaps, therefore, need a different kind of advocacy system. A recent Save the Children report highlighted 70 unaccompanied minors in Wales, which amounts to a significant group of young people with specific needs. There are grave concerns that those young people have no-one to advocate on their behalf through what is a complex legal process. Any development of advocacy services for those young people would need significant levels of funding. What discussions have taken place with key stakeholders to provide unaccompanied asylum seeking children and young people in Wales with access to specialised, independent and well-funded advocacy services?

3.10 p.m.

Jane Davidson: Bullying is an important issue. Looking at the children's commissioner's report, you will see that bullying is near or at the top of the list of concerns that children raised in terms of wanting to ensure that there are good policies and protection procedures in place. Clearly, the nature of bullying changes with the nature of technology, and, as a parent, I am highly aware of the emergence of computer bullying, or bullying through e-mails and text messaging, and I have talked to many other mothers about this matter. I know that the commissioner is interested in all the issues of how children bully each other, and that is why it is important that he will undertake casework this coming year to look at it from the child's or young person's perspective. I hope that you will recognise the Assembly Government's work in introducing the 'Respecting Others' guidance in 2003. This was done with the full support of the voluntary sector and with input from the dedicated anti-bullying unit in the University of Wales Institute, Cardiff. The guidance set

Cododd y comisiynydd sawl bryder hefyd yn ei adroddiad ynghylch plant a phobl ifanc ar eu pen eu hunain sy'n ceisio lloches. Un pryder y mae cyrff megis y Gymdeithas Genedlaethol er Atal Creulondeb i Blant ac eraill wedi'i godi yw'r gallu i fanteisio ar wasanaeth eiriolaeth. Mae'r plant a'r bobl ifanc hynny yn agored iawn i niwed ac mae ganddynt anghenion gwahanol i bobl ifanc eraill sy'n derbyn gofal, ac, efallai, felly, fod angen math gwahanol o system eiriolaeth arnynt. Amlygodd adroddiad diweddar gan Achub y Plant 70 o bobl ifanc dan oed ar eu pen eu hunain, sydd yn grŵp mawr o bobl ifanc ag anghenion penodol. Mae pryderon difrifol nad oes gan y bobl ifanc hyn unrhyw un i siarad drostynt drwy'r broses gyfreithiol gymhleth. Byddai angen lefelau sylweddol o arian i ddatblygu gwasanaethau eiriolaeth i'r bobl ifanc hynny mewn unrhyw ffordd. Pa drafodaethau sydd wedi'u cynnal gyda rhanddeiliaid allweddol i ddarparu gwasanaethau eiriolaeth arbenigol annibynnol a ariennir yn dda ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc ar eu pen eu hunain sy'n ceisio lloches yng Nghymru?

Jane Davidson: Mae bwlio yn fater pwysig. O edrych ar adroddiad y comisiynydd plant, fe welwch fod bwlio ar frig y rhestr o bryderon a gododd plant, neu'n agos at frig y rhestr honno, o ran ceisio sicrhau bod polisïau a gweithdrefnau diogelu da ar waith. Mae'n amlwg bod natur bwlio yn newid wrth i dechnoleg newid, ac, fel rhiant, yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn o'r achosion o fwlio cyfrifiadurol sy'n dod i'r amlwg, a bwlio drwy negeseuon e-bost a negeseuon testun, ac yr wyf wedi siarad â llawer o famau eraill ynghylch y mater hwn. Gwn fod gan y comisiynydd ddiddordeb yn yr holl faterion o ran sut mae plant yn bwlio ei gilydd, a dyna pam mae'n bwysig y bydd yn gwneud gwaith achos yn y flwyddyn i ddod i'w ystyried o safbwynt y plentyn neu'r person ifanc. Gobeithiaf y byddwch oll yn cydnabod gwaith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyflwyno canllawiau 'Parchu Eraill' yn 2003. Gwnaed hyn gyda chefnogaeth lawn y sector gwirfoddol a chyda chyfraniad gan yr uned gwrth-fwlio benodedig yn Athrofa Prifysgol Cymru, Caerdydd. Nododd y canllawiau

a framework in which schools could deliver their legislative obligations by creating their own policies. We are now assessing those policies, and have called them in for consideration. In addition, further good practice should be identified by the Estyn study, which will take place in 2005-06, and we will have an anti-bullying week in Wales. There are, therefore, several organisations across the piece working on the issue of bullying.

On unaccompanied asylum seeking children, it is important to remember that asylum issues are not devolved. We have looked specifically at the education grant, and the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, chaired by Gwenda, has taken a real interest in the issues of unaccompanied asylum seeking children. Also, Jane Hutt, as the Minister with the co-ordination responsibility, is meeting stakeholders to discuss this matter later this month.

Mark Isherwood: When we debated the report on 17 November, I stated that, as a father of six and grandfather of one, I welcomed an honest report from a principled commissioner and his team. His impartiality allowed him to tackle issues that have often remained unaddressed. However, I am concerned that the Welsh Assembly Government's response would not receive such fulsome praise.

On page 11 of the report, the commissioner mentions the need for better information for parents and carers of children with special educational needs, and that the Assembly Government had already taken steps to address this. How is it, then, that, in a meeting only last Monday with the parents of children with autism, the SEN officer present—who did not intend to cause any harm—stated that parent partnership was working because, when parents had a problem, he would go to meet them. He did not understand that parent partnership does not work unless problems and solutions are shared.

On bullying, the commissioner refers to it as being rampant in too many schools, and, as I

fframwaith i ysgolion gyflawni eu rhwymedigaethau deddfwriaethol drwy greu eu polisiau eu hunain. Yr ydym yn asesu'r polisiau hynny yn awr, ac yr ydym wedi gofyn amdanynt er mwyn eu hystyried. Yn ogystal, dylai'r astudiaeth gan Estyn, i'w chynnal yn 2005-06, nodi arferion da eraill, a bydd gennym wythnos gwrth-fwlio yng Nghymru. Felly, mae sawl sefydliad yn gweithio ym maes bwlio.

O ran plant ar eu pen eu hunain sy'n ceisio lloches, mae'n bwysig cofio nad yw materion o ran lloches wedi'u datganoli. Yr ydym wedi ystyried y grant addysg yn benodol, ac mae'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, a gaiff ei gadeirio gan Gwenda, wedi cymryd diddordeb gwirioneddol ym materion plant ar eu pen eu hunain sy'n ceisio lloches. Yn ogystal, mae Jane Hutt, yn rhinwedd ei swydd fel Gweinidog sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb cydgysylltu, yn cyfarfod â rhanddeiliaid i drafod y mater hwn yn ddiweddarach yn y mis.

Mark Isherwood: Pan gynhaliwyd dadl ar yr adroddiad ar 17 Tachwedd, nodais, a minnau'n dad i chwech o blant ac yn daid i un, fy mod yn croesawu adroddiad gonest gan gomisiynydd egwyddorol a'i dîm. Am ei fod yn ddiduedd, yr oedd yn gallu mynd i'r afael â materion nad ymdriniwyd â hwy yn aml yn y gorffennol. Fodd bynnag, pryderaf na fyddai ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yr un mor ganmoliaethus.

Ar dudalen 11 yr adroddiad, mae'r comisiynydd yn sôn am yr angen am wybodaeth well i rieni a gofalwyr plant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig, a bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eisoes wedi cymryd camau i ymdrin â hyn. Pam, felly, mewn cyfarfod ddydd Llun diwethaf gyda rhieni plant ag awtistiaeth, nododd y swyddog AAA a oedd yn bresennol—nad oedd yn bwriadu gwneud unrhyw niwed—fod y bartneriaeth rhieni yn gweithio oherwydd, pan oedd gan rieni broblem, byddai'n mynd i gyfarfod â hwy. Ni ddeallodd nad yw partneriaeth rhieni yn gweithio oni rennir problemau ac atebion.

O ran bwlio, mae'r comisiynydd yn cyfeirio at y ffaith bod llawer o achosion ohono

mentioned in this morning's committee meeting, the Wales regional officer for the Professional Association of Teachers stated that there is no doubting what teachers are telling us, in that there is a definite trend towards more violence in the playground and in the classroom. In his report, the children's commissioner states that, from what children, teachers and parents tell him, there is great variation in the seriousness with which the issue is treated in schools. Is it, therefore, good enough to impose anti-bullying policies that are not applied systematically? After all, as this report states, bullying makes children's lives a misery to the point of contemplating suicide.

On page 12 of the report, the children's commissioner refers to a review of complaints, advocacy and whistleblowing policies and procedures. What confidence can we have in those whistleblowing policies and procedures for young people when the Public Interest Disclosure Act 1998 has failed to protect adult whistleblowers from being victimised, while the guilty parties remain untouchable? I will not stress the point on whistleblowing, other than to remind you of my comments about a legal ruling a few weeks ago in Cardiff, concerning a victim of child abuse and a key witness in the Waterhouse inquiry who was cleared of charges brought against him by Flintshire county secretary and the chairman of North Wales Police Authority.

With regard to child poverty, page 33 of the report refers to the need to involve universal services in the delivery of programmes to tackle poverty and to meet the needs of individual children and young people living in poverty. The commissioner felt the need to include the comment:

'many of whom live outside the areas served by...Communities First'.

When I asked, during the cross-party committee meeting on this report, why this

mewn gormod o ysgolion, ac, fel y crybwyllais yng nghyfarfod y pwyllgor y bore yma, nododd swyddog rhanbarthol Cymru Cymdeithas Broffesiynol yr Athrawon bod yr hyn y mae athrawon yn ei ddweud wrthym yn glir, sef bod tuedd bendant i gael mwy o drais yn yr iard chwarae ac yn yr ystafell ddosbarth. Yn ei adroddiad, noda'r comisiynydd plant fod llawer o amrywiaeth o ran pa mor ddifrifol y caiff y mater ei drin mewn ysgolion, o'r hyn y mae plant, athrawon a rhieni yn ei ddweud wrtho. Felly, a yw'n ddigon da gosod polisïau gwrth-fwlio na chânt eu cymhwyso'n systematig? Wedi'r cyfan, fel y noda'r adroddiad hwn, mae bwlio yn peri cymaint o ddiflastod i blant fel bod rhai yn meddwl am eu lladd eu hunain.

Ar dudalen 12 yr adroddiad, mae'r comisiynydd plant yn cyfeirio at adolygiad o bolisïau a gweithdrefnau cwyno, eiriolaeth a chwythu'r chwiban. I ba raddau y gallwn ymddiried ym mholisïau a gweithdrefnau chwythu'r chwiban hynny i bobl ifanc pan nad yw Deddf Datgelu er Lles y Cyhoedd 1998 wedi diogelu oedolion sy'n chwythu'r chwiban rhag cael eu herlyn, tra na ellir cyffwrdd â'r rhai euog? Ni bwysleisïaf y pwynt o ran chwythu'r chwiban, heblaw am eich atgoffa o'm sylwadau ynghylch dyfarniad cyfreithiol ychydig wythnosau yn ôl yng Nghaerdydd, o ran plentyn a oedd wedi'i gam-drin a thyst allweddol yn ymchwiliad Waterhouse a gafwyd yn ddiuog o gyhuddiadau a ddygwyd yn ei erbyn gan ysgrifennydd sir y Fflint a chadeirydd Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru.

O ran tlodi plant, mae tudalen 33 yr adroddiad yn cyfeirio at yr angen i gynnwys gwasanaethau cyffredinol wrth gyflwyno rhaglenni i fynd i'r afael â thlodi ac i ddiwallu anghenion plant a phobl ifanc unigol sy'n byw mewn tlodi. Yr oedd y comisiynydd o'r farn bod angen cynnwys y sylw:

'y mae llawer ohonynt yn byw y tu allan i'r ardaloedd a wasanaethir gan...Cymunedau'n Gyntaf.'

Pan ofynnais, yn ystod cyfarfod y pwyllgor trawsbleidiol ar yr adroddiad hwn, pam y

comment was included, the commissioner replied that:

‘it arises from an understanding that there are pockets of poverty in areas which are not Communities First areas, where the needs are the same. We are drawing attention to that.’

Therefore, how will we address that, when it is my understanding that some three-quarters of children living in poverty do not live in Communities First areas? Poverty can also be reflected—

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is in danger of becoming a speech. I would welcome a question for the Minister.

Mark Isherwood: How will we address the shortfall in children and adolescent mental health services when, last year, the commissioner commented that £700,000 was inadequate in the face of the continuing crisis in provision? I therefore suspect that £1.2 million will not address that much more this year. Can I ask one more question?

The Presiding Officer: I will allow a very brief and succinct question.

Mark Isherwood: At the end of the joint committee meeting, I asked the children’s commissioner whether he needed stronger legal powers, given the small number of cases overhanging from two or more years ago. The answer was a resounding ‘Yes’. I emphasise that one of those cases, to which I have previously referred—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I am sorry; you have run out of time.

Jane Davidson: This Assembly Government has taken a huge amount of action on special educational needs since the Assembly’s inception. We are acutely aware, as I have said several times, that the levels of support that you receive in different parts of Wales are very much a postcode lottery. There are good services in every area of special educational needs in different parts of Wales. Our challenge is to try to ensure that those services are more widely available. There are statutory arrangements in place in terms of

cynhwyswyd hyn, atebodd y comisiynydd:

‘mae’n deillio o ddealltwriaeth fod pocedi o dlodi mewn ardaloedd nad ydynt yn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, lle mae’r anghenion yr un fath. Yr ydym yn tynnu sylw at hynny.’

Felly, sut y byddwn yn ymdrin â hynny, a minnau ar ddeall nad yw tua thri chwarter o blant sy’n byw mewn tlodi yn byw mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf? Gall tlodi gael ei adlewyrchu hefyd—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae hyn mewn perygl o droi’n araith. Croesawn gwestiwn i’r Gweinidog.

Mark Isherwood: Sut y byddwn yn ymdrin â’r diffyg mewn gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a’r glasoed pan nododd y comisiynydd y llynedd nad oedd £700,000 yn ddigon yn sgîl yr argyfwng parhaus o ran darpariaeth? Felly tybiaf na fydd £1.2 miliwn yn ymdrin â llawer mwy eleni. A gaf ofyn cwestiwn arall?

Y Llywydd: Caniatâf gwestiwn byr iawn.

Mark Isherwood: Ar ddiwedd cyfarfod y cydbwyllgor, gofynnais i’r comisiynydd plant pa un a oedd angen pwerau cyfreithiol cryfach arno, o gofio’r nifer fach o achosion sydd wedi’u cario ymlaen o ddwy flynedd yn ôl neu fwy. Yr ateb pendant oedd ‘Oes’. Pwysleisiaf fod un o’r achosion hyn, yr wyf wedi cyfeirio ato o’r blaen—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae’n ddrwg gennyf; mae eich amser wedi dod i ben.

Jane Davidson: Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cymryd llawer o gamau ym maes anghenion addysgol arbennig ers sefydlu’r Cynulliad. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol iawn, fel y dywedais sawl gwaith, mai loteri cod post yw’r cymorth a gewch mewn rhannau gwahanol o Gymru. Mae gwasanaethau da ym mhob maes o ran anghenion addysgol arbennig mewn rhannau gwahanol o Gymru. Ein her yw ceisio sicrhau bod y gwasanaethau hynny ar gael yn ehangach. Mae trefniadau statudol ar waith o

support for families. We now have the tribunal in place, in terms of people taking those concerns forward in that setting. We continue to do the work, both in committee and as a Government, of looking at issues of early identification, statementing and transition, all of which we need to do.

It is important that you are under no misapprehension as to where the responsibility lies in terms of anti-bullying policies: it lies with the school. There is no notion of the Assembly Government imposing anti-bullying policies. In our 'Respecting Others' guidance, which was universally supported and which pre-dated your coming to the National Assembly, Mark, we encouraged schools, citing examples of good practice, to have good anti-bullying policies supported by pupils, staff and governing bodies. As stated in the report, like the commissioner, we do not want policies to sit on the shelf; we want matters to be followed up. Bullying is such a key issue for children that we are determined to follow this up. For this reason, I have commissioned work in the Assembly Government, which I know is supported by the committee, to consider those policies and to ensure that all schools in Wales have such policies in place. This will be backed up by work undertaken by the commissioner and Estyn alike.

As I said in my contribution, in terms of complaints and advocacy, from June 2004, children in need will have a statutory right to an advocacy service. Each local authority has a contract with an advocacy provider, and we fund ChildLine Cymru/Wales, the national children's helpline.

In terms of children in poverty, the Assembly Government has said on many occasions that one reason we cannot have a strategy that looks at child poverty only in terms of Communities First is that many children live in poverty outside Communities First areas. It is absolutely right that the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration should have responsibility for child poverty, as this is a social-justice issue. That is why this Assembly Government takes such issues

ran cymorth i deuluoedd. Mae gennym dribiwnlys ar waith bellach, lle mae pobl yn ymdrin â'r pryderon hynny. Parhawn i wneud y gwaith, yn y pwyllgor ac fel Llywodraeth, o ystyried materion o ran nodi anghenion yn gynnar, datganiadau a'r broses bontio, ac mae angen i bob un ohonom wneud y gwaith hwnnw.

Mae'n bwysig nad ydych o dan unrhyw gamargraff o ran pwy sy'n gyfrifol am bolisiau gwrth-fwlio: yr ysgol sy'n gyfrifol. Nid yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bwriadu gosod polisiau gwrth-fwlio. Yn ein canllawiau 'Parchu Eraill', a gafodd gefnogaeth gyffredinol ac a gyhoeddwyd cyn ichi gael eich ethol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, Mark, bu inni annog ysgolion, gan ddyfynnu enghreifftiau o arferion da, i lunio polisiau gwrth-fwlio da wedi'u cefnogi gan ddisgyblion, staff a chyrff llywodraethu. Fel y nodwyd yn yr adroddiad, yn yr un modd â'r comisiynydd, nid ydym am i bolisiau eistedd ar y silff; yr ydym am weithredu ar faterion. Mae bwlio yn fater mor allweddol i blant fel ein bod yn benderfynol o weithredu arno. Am y rheswm hwn, yr wyf wedi comisiynu gwaith yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, y gwn fod y pwyllgor yn ei gefnogi, i ystyried y polisiau hynny ac i sicrhau bod gan bob ysgol yng Nghymru bolisiau o'r fath ar waith. Ategir hyn gan waith a gyflawnir gan y comisiynydd ac Estyn.

Fel y dywedais yn fy nghyfraniad, o ran cwynion ac eiriolaeth, o fis Mehefin 2004, bydd gan blant mewn angen hawl statudol i gael gwasanaeth eiriolaeth. Mae gan bob awdurdod lleol gontract gyda darparwr gwasanaeth eiriolaeth, ac ariannwn ChildLine Cymru/Wales, y llinell gymorth genedlaethol i blant.

O ran plant mewn tlodi, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi dweud sawl gwaith mai un o'r rhesymau na allwn gael strategaeth sy'n ystyried tlodi plant o ran Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn unig yw bod llawer o blant yn byw mewn tlodi y tu allan i ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mae'n hollol briodol y dylai'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio fod yn gyfrifol am dlodi plant, am mai mater cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ydyw. Dyna pam mae'r Llywodraeth

seriously.

In terms of child and adolescent mental health services, we are also working with Cardiff University, looking at the future of independent counselling services in schools. We want to ensure that we put the right provision in place to support children in school. I will be saying more about that when I respond to issues relating to the Clywch inquiry, in April.

3.20 p.m.

Peter Black: I wish to raise three points with the Minister regarding this statement. First, the statement notes that there is an additional £1.2 million in the current financial year for child and adolescent mental health services, CAMHS, and the national service framework is also currently being rolled out. I am informed that that money will not be in any way adequate to implement that framework in full. Therefore, I am interested to know what additional money will be available next year and in subsequent years to deal with the concerns of the children's commissioner regarding CAMHS.

Secondly, I appreciate the work that the Government is doing to tackle bullying, and I am aware that schools are being asked to submit a copy of their anti-bullying policies, so that they can be assessed to see how well they fit in with the guidance. Does that assessment include how those policies deal with recording and tackling racist incidents, which often occur in schools and can come under the heading of bullying? That is important. The Swansea Bay Racial Equality Council has been in touch with me about its dissatisfaction regarding the way in which racist incidents are recorded in schools. It is important that we take a uniform approach across Wales to that particular issue.

Finally, the children's commissioner regularly raises the issue of school toilets. He is clearly concerned, as I think we all are, that this is one of the major issues that children always mention when they are asked

Cynulliad hon yn cymryd materion o'r fath o ddirif.

O ran gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed, yr ydym hefyd yn gweithio gyda Phrifysgol Caerdydd, gan ystyried dyfodol gwasanaethau cwnsela annibynnol mewn ysgolion. Yr ydym am sicrhau ein bod yn rhoi'r ddarpariaeth gywir ar waith i gynorthwyo plant yn yr ysgol. Byddaf yn dweud mwy am hynny pan fyddaf yn ymateb i'r materion sy'n gysylltiedig ag ymchwiliad Clywch, ym mis Ebrill.

Peter Black: Hoffwn godi tri phwynt gyda'r Gweinidog ynghylch y datganiad hwn. Yn gyntaf, noda'r datganiad fod £1.2 miliwn ychwanegol yn y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol ar gyfer gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed, CAMHS, a chaiff y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ei gyflwyno ar hyn o bryd hefyd. Cefais wybod na fydd yr arian hwnnw yn ddigon o bell ffordd i roi'r fframwaith hwnnw ar waith yn llawn. Felly, mae diddordeb gennyf wybod pa arian ychwanegol a fydd ar gael y flwyddyn nesaf ac mewn blynyddoedd dilynol i ymdrin â phryderon y comisiynydd plant o ran CAMHS.

Yn ail, gwerthfawrogaf y gwaith y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â bwlio, ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol y gofynnir i ysgolion gyflwyno copi o'u polisiau gwrthfwlio, fel y gellir eu hasesu i weld pa mor dda y maent yn cyd-fynd â'r canllawiau. A yw'r asesiad hwnnw yn cynnwys sut y mae'r polisiau hynny yn ymdrin â chofnodi a mynd i'r afael â digwyddiadau hiliol, sy'n digwydd yn aml mewn ysgolion ac a all ddod o dan bennawd bwlio? Mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae Cyngor Cydraddoldeb Hiliol Bae Abertawe wedi cysylltu â mi am ei fod yn anfodlon ar y ffordd y caiff digwyddiadau hiliol eu cofnodi mewn ysgolion. Mae'n bwysig inni fabwysiadu ymagwedd unffurf ledled Cymru tuag at y mater penodol hwnnw.

I gloi, mae'r comisiynydd plant yn codi'r mater o ran toiledau ysgolion yn rheolaidd. Mae'n amlwg ei fod yn pryderu, fel y mae pob un ohonom, fe gredaf, fod hwn yn un o'r prif faterion y mae plant bob amser yn eu

about their concerns. The Assembly Government is giving money to local authorities to improve school buildings, although toilets are not specifically mentioned in that regard. The children's commissioner specifically highlighted the need for an audit of the current condition of all school toilets in Wales within the next 12 months. What is the Assembly Government doing to facilitate that audit and to place pressure on local education authorities, particularly, to tackle that issue?

Jane Davidson: The CAMHS strategy, 'Everybody's Business', was fully accepted by stakeholders, including the children's commissioner, who, again, plainly praises it. It is important that we provide sufficient investment to make that work. Services for children in need and their families are supported by the Children First programme, which has made over £100 million available to local authorities since 1999. A further £40 million will be allocated under that programme this year. We are asking local authorities and their partners to strengthen services for children and their families, including those instances where mental health issues arise.

You made an important point about racist incidents. I will probably need to write to you on that. I recall that, in either April or May 2004, local authorities were required to have anti-racism policies in place. There was discussion at the time regarding how to record racist incidents. If there is a particular issue whereby one of your constituents is unhappy about that, I would be happy for you to contact me about it. It may well be that the kind of follow-up work on bullying that the Assembly Government is now undertaking will also need to be pursued in terms of how those anti-racism policies are being effected in schools. There is a close relationship between those two issues.

I make it my business to visit as many schools as possible across Wales; I think that I have visited well over half of them and am moving towards two thirds. I also make it my business to ensure that I see the toilets in all those schools. [*Laughter.*] I hope that all Assembly Members will do the same. The chief inspector of schools said that she does

crybwyll pan ofynnir iddynt ynghylch eu pryderon. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhoi arian i awdurdodau lleol wella adeiladau ysgolion, er na chyfeirir at doiledau'n benodol yn hynny o beth. Amlygodd y comisiynydd plant yn arbennig yr angen i gynnal archwiliad o gyflwr presennol holl doiledau ysgolion Cymru yn y 12 mis nesaf. Beth y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i hwyluso'r archwiliad hwnnw ac i roi pwysau ar awdurdodau addysg lleol, yn arbennig, i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw?

Jane Davidson: Derbyniwyd strategaeth CAMHS, 'Busnes Pawb', yn llawn gan randdeiliaid, gan gynnwys y comisiynydd plant, sy'n amlwg yn ei chanmol, unwaith eto. Mae'n bwysig inni roi digon o fuddsoddiad i sicrhau bod hynny'n gweithio. Cefnogir gwasanaethau i blant mewn angen a'u teuluoedd gan y rhaglen Plant yn Gyntaf, a neilltuwyd dros £100 miliwn i awdurdodau lleol ers 1999. Caiff £40 miliwn pellach ei ddyrranu o dan y rhaglen honno eleni. Gofynnwn i awdurdodau lleol a'u partneriaid atgyfnerthu gwasanaethau i blant a'u teuluoedd, gan gynnwys yr achosion hynny lle y mae materion o ran iechyd meddwl yn codi.

Gwnaethoch bwynt pwysig ynghylch digwyddiadau hiliol. Mae'n debyg y bydd angen imi ysgrifennu atoch ar hynny. Cofiaf ei bod yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol gael polisiau gwrth-hiliaeth ar waith, ym mis Ebrill neu fis Mai 2004. Cafwyd trafodaeth ar y pryd ynghylch sut i gofnodi digwyddiadau hiliol. Os oes mater penodol y mae un o'ch etholwyr yn anfodlon ag ef, byddwn yn fodlon ichi gysylltu â mi yn ei gylch. Efallai y bydd angen mynd i'r afael hefyd ar y math o waith dilynol ar fwlio a wna Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar hyn o bryd o ran sut y caiff y polisiau gwrth-hiliaeth hyn eu rhoi ar waith mewn ysgolion. Mae cydberthynas agos rhwng y ddau fater hynny.

Af ati i ymweld â chymaint o ysgolion â phosibl ledled Cymru; credaf fy mod wedi ymweld ag ymhell dros hanner ohonynt ac yn agos at ddwy allan o bob tair ohonynt. Af ati hefyd i sicrhau fy mod yn gweld y toiledau yn yr holl ysgolion hynny. [*Chwerthin.*] Gobeithiaf y bydd pob Aelod Cynulliad yn gwneud yr un peth. Dywedodd y prif

the same, as does the children's commissioner, so there is a strong agenda in terms of ensuring that school toilets are improved. Assembly Government capital expenditure can be, and often is, used to improve toilets. We will have a far better idea in terms of needs analysis when we draw together all the local authority asset management plans with our expenditure, as we look forward to how much money needs to go into the capital budget in future years to fulfil our objective of all schools being fit for purpose by 2010. I look forward to the work being undertaken by the children's commissioner to follow up this issue. In terms of his own statutory responsibilities, he can request this information from local authorities and schools across Wales.

Karen Sinclair: When the Welsh Assembly Government launched its strategy for child and adolescent mental health services, 'Everybody's Business', I welcomed wholeheartedly its aims and objectives. The introduction of the 10-year CAMHS plan aims to put in place the right treatment for young people who have emotional problems. However, casework that I receive suggests that, despite this positive framework for reform, funding problems still exist in the system that frustrate specialist CAMHS teams. Families whose children have been assessed as being in need of specialist one-to-one counselling cannot access appropriate services, due to the lack of specialist child psychiatrists, psychologists and counsellors.

Longitudinal research has proven that the closer the services are brought to children, to support their emotional wellbeing alongside education, the greater our chance of dealing successfully with their mental health problems. I welcome the additional £1.2 million that was announced by our Government for 2004-05, but we must invest more to allow local specialist CAMHS teams throughout Wales to have the correct tools with which to treat the emotional problems of our young people. The importance of this work was brought home in no uncertain terms in a programme on ITV Wales last night, which highlighted the suicides of three young people who were acknowledged to be mentally ill but who, due to failures in the

arolygydd ysgolion ei bod yn gwneud yr un peth, fel y mae'r comisiynydd plant, felly mae agenda gref o ran sicrhau y caiff toiledau ysgolion eu gwella. Gellir defnyddio gwariant cyfalaf Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i wella toiledau, ac mae hynny'n digwydd yn aml. Bydd gennym syniad llawer gwell o ran dadansoddi anghenion pan fyddwn yn dwyn holl gynlluniau rheoli asedau awdurdodau lleol a'n gwariant ynghyd, wrth inni edrych ymlaen at faint o arian y bydd angen ei neilltuo yn y gyllideb gyfalaf yn y dyfodol er mwyn cyflawni ein hamcan o sicrhau bod pob ysgol yn addas at y diben erbyn 2010. Edrychaf ymlaen at y gwaith a wneir gan y comisiynydd plant i gyflawni hyn. O ran ei gyfrifoldebau statudol ei hun, gall ofyn i awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion ledled Cymru am y wybodaeth hon.

Karen Sinclair: Pan lansiodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei strategaeth ar gyfer gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed, 'Busnes Pawb', croesawais ei nodau a'i hamcanion yn fawr. Nod cyflwyno'r cynllun CAMHS 10 mlynedd yw sefydlu'r driniaeth gywir i bobl ifanc sydd â phroblemau emosiynol. Fodd bynnag, er gwaethaf y fframwaith cadarnhaol hwn ar gyfer diwygio, awgryma'r gwaith achos a gaf fod problemau ariannu yn y system o hyd sy'n rhwystro timau CAMHS arbenigol. Ni all teuluoedd yr aseswyd bod angen gwasanaeth cwnsela personol arbenigol ar y plant gael gwasanaethau priodol, oherwydd prinder seiciatryddion, seicolegwyr a chynghorwyr plant arbenigol.

Mae ymchwil hydredol wedi profi po agosaf y mae gwasanaethau i blant, i gefnogi eu lles emosiynol ochr yn ochr ag addysg, y mwyaf tebygol ydyw y gallwn lwyddo i ymdrin â'u problemau iechyd meddwl. Croesawaf y £1.2 miliwn ychwanegol a gyhoeddwyd gan ein Llywodraeth ar gyfer 2004-05, ond rhaid inni fuddsoddi mwy i sicrhau bod gan dimau CAMHS arbenigol lleol ledled Cymru y dulliau cywir i drin problemau emosiynol ein pobl ifanc. Pwysleisiwyd pwysigrwydd y gwaith hwn mewn rhaglen ar ITV Wales neithiwr, a roddodd sylw i hunanladdiad tri pherson ifanc y gwyddid eu bod yn dioddef o salwch meddwl ond a aeth i'r carchar yn y pen draw, oherwydd methiannau yn y system iechyd meddwl. A gytunwch, heb gyllid

mental health system, ended up in the prison system. Do you agree that, without proper funding, we will fail young people in crisis?

Jane Davidson: I know that child and adolescent mental health services are important to all Assembly Members. One of the reasons that the children's commissioner included the recommendation on counselling in schools in the Clywch inquiry report was that he wanted to ensure that we are able to support young people before they need specialist services. You rightly outlined that there are issues in terms of the provision of specialist services, but that is not true of child and adolescent mental health services alone; I talked earlier about special educational needs, and we are short of educational psychologists and speech and language therapists. We are putting strategic workforce planning in place, particularly with the NHS—work that was started by Jane Hutt, in her role as Minister for Health and Social Services—to tackle these issues. However, that will take some time. I will ensure that Dr Brian Gibbons, who is unable to attend to hear this statement, sees your comments on this issue, and he will write to you accordingly.

Catherine Thomas: As you are aware, Minister, in his report, the commissioner addressed the importance of supporting parents and families, which is central to the new National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children campaign, 'Hit means lost it'. This campaign calls for increased funding for universal parental support, a mass-media campaign to encourage positive parenting, and specialist parenting and therapeutic support for particularly vulnerable parents, such as those affected by domestic abuse. With this in mind, Minister, will you ensure that the parenting action plan, to which you referred this afternoon, will seek to offer support to all parents, including the most vulnerable, who are often in need of the most support but who also have the most difficulty in accessing it, such as the parents whom I met yesterday at the twentieth anniversary celebrations of Llanelli Women's Aid?

priodol, na fyddwn yn darparu ar gyfer pobl ifanc mewn argyfwng?

Jane Davidson: Gwn fod gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed yn bwysig i bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Un o'r rhesymau y cynhwysodd y comisiynydd plant yr argymhelliad ar gwnsela mewn ysgolion yn adroddiad ymchwiliad Clywch oedd ei fod am sicrhau y gallwn gefnogi pobl ifanc cyn bod angen gwasanaethau arbenigol arnynt. Bu ichi nodi, a hynny'n briodol, bod problemau o ran darparu gwasanaethau arbenigol, ond nid yw hynny'n wir am wasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed yn unig; siaradais yn gynharach am anghenion addysgol arbennig, ond mae prinder o seicolegwyr addysg a therapyddion lleferydd ac iaith. Yr ydym wedi rhoi proses cynllunio'r gweithlu strategol ar waith, yn arbennig gyda'r GIG—gwaith a ddechreuwyd gan Jane Hutt, yn ei rôl fel Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol—i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn. Fodd bynnag, bydd hynny'n cymryd peth amser. Byddaf yn sicrhau bod Dr Brian Gibbons, na all fod yn bresennol i glywed y datganiad hwn, yn gweld eich sylwadau ar y mater hwn, a bydd yn ysgrifennu atoch amdano.

Catherine Thomas: Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, yn ei adroddiad, ymdriniodd y comisiynydd â phwysigrwydd cefnogi rhieni a theuluoedd, sy'n rhan ganolog o ymgyrch newydd y Gymdeithas Genedlaethol er Atal Creulondeb i Blant, 'Hit means lost it'. Mae'r ymgyrch hon yn galw am fwy o arian ar gyfer cymorth cyffredinol i rieni, ymgyrch yn y cyfryngau torfol i annog rhianta cadarnhaol, a chymorth rhianta a chymorth therapiwtig arbenigol i rieni sy'n arbennig o agored i niwed, megis y rhai sydd wedi cael eu cam-drin yn y cartref. O gofio hyn, Weinidog, a sicrhewch y bydd y cynllun gweithredu rhianta, y cyfeiriasoch ato y prynhawn yma, yn ceisio cynnig cymorth i bob rhiant, gan gynnwys y rhai sydd fwyaf agored i niwed, y mae angen y cymorth mwyaf arnynt yn aml ond sydd hefyd yn cael yr anhawster mwyaf i gael gafael arno, megis y rhieni y cyfarfûm â hwy ddoe yn y digwyddiad i ddathlu pen-blwydd Cymorth i Fenywod Llanelli yn ugain oed?

Jane Davidson: We remain fully committed to the abolition of punishment for children, and to encouraging and supporting parents in using non-violent forms of managing their children's behaviour. We share the NSPCC's view that the defence of 'reasonable chastisement' fails to give children equal legal protection from assault, and it sends out the wrong message. We base our approach on positive parenting, which underpins the parenting action plan that I will launch on 15 March.

3.30 p.m.

Denise Idris Jones: I am pleased to see that the report recognises that, just as adults need to be respected, so do young people. If we treat young people with respect, they respond in a positive way. Far too many of us have a negative stereotype of young people. Do you agree, Minister, that many young people in our communities are making a real contribution to improving our society? I see this in my constituency of Conwy, and I saw it at first hand last Saturday in one of my most deprived Communities First areas. Young people had come together with adults to perform at a rap concert, showing mutual respect. I am sure that you agree with the commissioner's words, that the children and young people of Wales are worthy of our best efforts.

Jane Davidson: The children's commissioner made sure that respect was a key theme outlined in each of his reports. I hope that we, as an Assembly Government, make sure that respect for young people is a key theme outlined in our policies. The policy is about extending entitlement, for example, in relation to what I said about the establishment of the participation unit, and looking at ways in which we can encourage young people to influence the work going on, not only in the Assembly Government, but, I hope, with other Assembly Members too. Also, the establishment of youth fora within each local authority area and the establishment of young people's partnerships require us to take account of young people's views. So, we are running a very solid

Jane Davidson: Yr ydym yn parhau i fod yn gwbl ymrwymedig i ddileu achosion o gosbi plant, ac i annog a helpu rhieni i ddefnyddio dulliau di-drais o reoli ymddygiad eu plant. Cytunwn â barn yr NSPCC nad yw amddiffyniad 'cosb resymol' yn rhoi diogelwch cyfreithiol cyfartal i blant rhag ymosodiad, ac mae'n cyfleu'r neges anghywir. Mae ein hymagwedd yn seiliedig ar rianta cadarnhaol, sy'n sail i'r cynllun gweithredu rhianta y byddaf yn ei lansio ar 15 Mawrth.

Denise Idris Jones: Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod yr adroddiad yn cydnabod bod angen i bobl ifanc gael eu parchu, yn yr un ffordd ag oedolion. Os ydym yn parchu pobl ifanc, maent yn ymateb yn gadarnhaol. Mae gan lawer gormod ohonom stereoteip negyddol o bobl ifanc. A gytunwch, Weinidog, fod llawer o bobl ifanc yn ein cymunedau yn gwneud cyfraniad gwirioneddol i wella ein cymdeithas? Gwelaf hyn yn fy etholaeth i, sef Conwy, ac fe'i gwelais yn uniongyrchol ddydd Sadwrn diwethaf yn un o'm hardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf mwyaf difreintiedig. Yr oedd pobl ifanc wedi dod at ei gilydd gydag oedolion i berfformio cyngerdd rap, gan ddangos parch y naill ochr at y llall. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn cytuno â geiriau'r comisiynydd plant, bod plant a phobl ifanc Cymru yn haeddu ein hymdrechion gorau.

Jane Davidson: Gwnaeth y comisiynydd plant yn siŵr fod parch yn un o'r themâu allweddol a amlinellwyd ym mhob un o'i adroddiadau. Gobeithiaf ein bod ni, fel Llywodraeth Cynulliad, yn sicrhau bod parch at bobl ifanc yn un o'r themâu allweddol a amlinellir yn ein polisiau. Mae a wnelo'r polisi ag ymestyn hawliau, er enghraifft, mewn perthynas â'r hyn a ddywedais am sefydlu'r uned gyfranogi, ac ystyried ffyrdd y gallwn annog pobl ifanc i ddylanwadu ar y gwaith a wneir, nid dim ond yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ond, gobeithiaf, gydag Aelodau Cynulliad eraill hefyd. Yn ogystal, mae'r dasg o sefydlu fforymau ieuenctid o fewn pob ardal awdurdod lleol a sefydlu partneriaethau pobl ifanc yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol inni ystyried barn pobl ifanc. Felly,

agenda of respect for young people. The most important point is that young people do not expect adults to respect them either. Following many of our constructive meetings with young people, a young person will often say to me,

‘I did not expect you to respect us.’

I hope that the cultural message is that young people who grow up in the Wales of the future will expect us to respect them.

mae agenda gadarn iawn gennym o barch at bobl ifanc. Y pwynt pwysicaf yw nad yw pobl ifanc yn disgwyl i oedolion eu parchu ychwaith. Ar ôl llawer o'n cyfarfodydd adeiladol gyda phobl ifanc, bydd person ifanc yn aml yn dweud wrthyf,

Nid oeddwn yn disgwyl ichi ein parchu.

Gobeithiaf mai'r neges ddiwylliannol yw y bydd pobl ifanc sy'n cael eu magu yng Nghymru'r dyfodol yn disgwyl inni eu parchu.

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Alun Cairns: I raise a point of order in relation to the Economic Development and Transport Committee this morning, in which it was alleged that I had used the word ‘illegal’ in an allegation against the Secretary of State for Wales. I did not use the word ‘illegal’—it was used twice by Andrew Davies, as Minister, and once by Leighton Andrews. I was asked to withdraw my use of the word ‘illegal’, despite my not having used it. I did withdraw it, in order to cooperate with the Chair of the committee, but feel that I was bounced into withdrawing a statement that I had not made in the first place.

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is not a matter for me to discuss in Plenary. I am happy to deal with it in my other capacity as Chair of the Panel of Chairs, should anyone wish to raise it in that forum, as that is the appropriate place for it. Chairs of committees exercise full authority—equivalent to that of the Presiding Officer—in their own committees, and that is clear from our Standing Orders.

Christine Gwyther: Further to that point of order, and for clarification, some Members were under the impression that the Member had used the word ‘illegal’. I had not heard the word myself, but I asked him to withdraw it, or to say that he had not used it. Alun could not remember whether or not he had used it; therefore, after taking legal advice—as it would have been a serious word to have

Alun Cairns: Codaf bwynt o drefn mewn perthynas â chyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth y bore yma, lle yr honnwyd fy mod wedi defnyddio'r gair ‘*illegal*’ mewn honiad yn erbyn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru. Ni ddefnyddiais y gair ‘*illegal*’—fe'i defnyddiwyd ddwywaith gan Andrew Davies, fel Gweinidog, ac unwaith gan Leighton Andrews. Gofynnwyd imi dynnu yn ôl fy nefnydd o'r gair ‘*illegal*’, er gwaethaf y ffaith nad oeddwn wedi'i ddefnyddio. Tynnais y gair yn ôl, er mwyn bodloni Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, ond teimlais imi gael fy ngwthio i dynnu datganiad yn ôl nad oeddwn wedi'i wneud yn y lle cyntaf.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw hyn yn fater imi ei drafod mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. Yr wyf yn fodlon ymdrin ag ef yn rhinwedd fy swydd arall fel Cadeirydd Panel y Cadeiryddion, pe bai unrhyw un am godi'r mater yn y fforwm hwnnw, am mai dyna'r lle priodol i'w drafod. Mae gan gadeiryddion pwyllgorau awdurdod llawn—sy'n cyfateb i awdurdod y Llywydd—yn eu pwyllgorau eu hunain, ac mae hynny'n eglur yn ein Rheolau Sefydlog.

Christine Gwyther: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, ac er mwyn eglurder, yr oedd rhai Aelodau o dan yr argraff bod yr Aelod wedi defnyddio'r gair ‘*illegal*’. Ni chlywais y gair fy hun, ond gofynnais iddo ei dynnu'n ôl, neu ddweud nad oedd wedi'i ddefnyddio. Ni allai Alun gofio pa un a oedd wedi'i ddefnyddio ai peidio; felly, ar ôl ceisio cyngor cyfreithiol—oherwydd byddai wedi

used—I again asked him to withdraw it and I am pleased to say that he co-operated. We have since played back the tape and it was clear that the word was not used. As a rider to that, I would like to say that, once we have a simultaneous note of proceedings, which we will have from, I think, next week or the week after, this type of unfortunate occurrence should not happen again.

The Presiding Officer: I am grateful to—*[Interruption.]* Order. I am replying to the Chair of the committee, who has a certain status in these matters.

I have, indeed, had cause for this matter to be investigated further. Digital tapes are wonderful devices, and verbatim records are even better, in that they will provide us with an authoritative version of the words. I look forward very much to being able to provide this service for all our committees, as befits any proper parliamentary body.

Alun Cairns: Further to that point of order, I did ask the Chair of the committee to reserve judgment until we had had the opportunity to review the matter and to watch the recording. The point of order is that I was told that unless I withdrew the word ‘illegal’ I would have been asked to leave the committee, which bounced me into withdrawing a word that I did not use, and it was only used by the Minister about the former Secretary of State.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I understand that there are events beyond our control that may influence the way in which we approach these things at the moment, but I cannot imagine anybody ‘bouncing’ you, Alun Cairns.

bod yn air difrifol i’w ddefnyddio—gofynnais unwaith eto iddo ei dynnu’n ôl ac yr wyf yn falch o ddweud iddo wneud hynny. Ers hynny yr wyf wedi gwranddo ar y tâp ac mae’n amlwg na ddefnyddiwyd y gair. Fel atodiad i hynny, hoffwn ddweud na ddylai’r math hwn o ddigwyddiad anffodus ddigwydd eto, pan fydd cofnod trafodion ar y pryd gennym, a fydd gennym yr wythnos nesaf neu’r wythnos ar ôl hynny, fe gredaf.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i—*[Torri ar draws.]* Trefn. Yr wyf yn ymateb i Gadeirydd y pwyllgor, sydd â statws penodol yn y materion hyn.

Yn wir, bu gennyf achos i ymchwilio ymhellach i’r mater hwn. Mae tapiau digidol yn ddyfeisiau gwych, ac mae cofnodion gair am air hyd yn oed yn well, oherwydd byddant yn rhoi fersiwn awdurdodol inni o’r geiriau. Edrychaf ymlaen yn fawr iawn at allu rhoi’r gwasanaeth hwn i’n holl bwyllgorau, fel sy’n addas i unrhyw gorff seneddol priodol.

Alun Cairns: Ymhellach i’r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, gofynnais i Gadeirydd y pwyllgor beidio â rhoi ei barn hyd nes inni gael y cyfle i adolygu’r mater a gwyllo’r tâp. Y pwynt o drefn yw i’r cadeirydd ddweud wrthyf y byddai’n gofyn imi adael y pwyllgor, pe na bawn yn tynnu’r defnydd o’r gair ‘illegal’ yn ôl, a’m gwthiodd i dynnu gair yn ôl nad oeddwn wedi’i ddefnyddio. Dim ond y Gweinidog a’i ddefnyddiodd i gyfeirio at y cyn-Ysgrifennydd Gwladol.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Deallaf fod llawer o ddigwyddiadau sydd y tu hwnt i’n rheolaeth a all ddylanwadu ar y ffordd yr ydym yn ymdrin â’r pethau hyn ar hyn o bryd, ond ni allaf ddychmygu neb yn eich gwthio chi, Alun Cairns.

**Cymeradwyo Cyfarwyddiadau Pwerau Creu Incwm Awdurdodau Iechyd
Arbennig 2005
Approval of the Income Generation Powers of Special Health Authorities
Directions 2005**

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 25.13:

1. approves the draft Income Generation Powers of Special Health Authorities Directions 2005, a copy of which was laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 2 March 2005; and

2. notes the explanatory memorandum for these directions laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 2 March 2005. (NDM2342)

The Presiding Officer: As no-one wishes to speak to the motion, we will move straight to the vote.

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 25.13:

1. yn cymeradwyo'r drafft o Gyfarwyddiadau Pwerau Creu Incwm Awdurdodau Iechyd Arbennig 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 2 Mawrth 2005; a

2. yn nodi'r memorandwm esboniadol ar gyfer y cyfarwyddiadau hyn a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 2 Mawrth 2005. (NDM2342)

Y Llywydd: Am nad oes neb am siarad ar y cynnig, symudwn yn syth i bleidlais.

*Cynnig (NDM2342): O blaid 39, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2342): For 39, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine

Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 3 Approval of Changes to Standing Order No. 3

Jenny Randerson: I propose that

Jenny Randerson: Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly, acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 37:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan adran 46(6) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 37:

1. considers the report of the Business Committee which was e-mailed to Members and laid in the Table Office on 2 March; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at yr Aelodau ac a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Mawrth; a

2. approves the amendment to Standing Orders set out in the report of the Business Committee. (NDM2340)

2. yn cymeradwyo'r diwygiad a wnaed i'r Rheolau Sefydlog a nodir yn Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes. (NDM2340)

Y Llywydd: Mae angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair o blaid y cynnig er mwyn i'r cynnig hwn gael ei dderbyn.

The Presiding Officer: A two-thirds majority vote in favour is required for this motion to be carried.

*Cynnig (NDM2340): O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2340): For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene

Jones, Ann
 Law, Peter
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Penderfyniadau ynglŷn ag Argymhellion y Corff Adolygu
 Cyflogau Uwch-Swyddogion
 Approval of Determinations in Respect of the Senior Salaries Review Body
 Recommendations**

The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek): I propose that
Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 18 of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 3, and following a review undertaken by the Senior Salaries Review Body, determines that the National Assembly for Wales Members' pension scheme be amended in accordance with the revised terms and conditions of the scheme, which was e-mailed to Members on 1 March 2005. (NDM2338)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan adran 18 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 3, ac yn dilyn adolygiad a gynhaliwyd gan y Corff Adolygu Cyflogau Uwch-Swyddogion, yn penderfynu y dylid diwygio Cynllun Pensiwn Aelodau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn unol â'r amodau a'r telerau a ddiwygiwyd yn y Cynllun, a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at yr Aelodau ar 1 Mawrth 2005. (NDM2338)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under sections 16, 18 and 34A of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 3 and following a review undertaken by the Senior Salaries Review Body, approves the 'National Assembly for Wales (Assembly Members and Officers) (Salaries, Allowances etc.) Determination 2005' e-mailed to Members on 02 March 2005. (NDM2339)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan adrannau 16, 18 a 34A Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 3, ac yn dilyn adolygiad a gynhaliwyd gan y Corff Adolygu Cyflogau Uwch-Swyddogion, yn cymeradwyo 'Penderfyniad Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Aelodau'r Cynulliad a Swyddogion) (Cyflogau, Lwfansau ac ati)' a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at yr Aelodau ar 02 Mawrth 2005. (NDM2339)

I will say one or two words about this, but I will try to take up as little Plenary time as possible. The Senior Salaries Review Body

Dywedaf un neu ddau air am hyn, ond byddaf yn ceisio defnyddio cyn lleied o amser y Cyfarfod Llawn â phosibl.

recognised the increased responsibilities of Assembly Members relative to those of Members of Parliament, and it was recommended that the percentage differential between the salary of a Member of Parliament and that of an Assembly Member should be narrowed by some 2 per cent.

There has been a slight increase in the office-costs allowance, no change in the additional costs allowance and a reduction in the mileage allowance. The SSRB recognised that the existing staff salaries allowance was insufficient to provide AMs with sufficient staff to undertake their duties properly. It recommended significant increases, which go to the staff employed by Assembly Members, and that two and a half full-time equivalent staff should be available to each Assembly Member to enable him or her to do the job properly. The body also said that salary scales should be introduced if the increase in the staff salaries allowance was agreed. We have done that. The motion before us introduces salary scales which will give Assembly Member support staff more certainty about pay rises, subject to satisfactory performance, which should reduce staff turnover and will help to build experience.

Therefore, overall, this is a good settlement. The House Committee has accepted it; we have not varied it. The principles of the Senior Salaries Review Body recommendations, which are modest proposals that are manageable within the budget, have been accepted and are before you. In addition, a second motion on pensions is before us. For those Members who wish to have them, pensions will be available at an accrual rate of one-fortieth per year rather than one-fiftieth. That is a result of changes being implemented in the House of Commons, and our Standing Orders state that our pension scheme should be broadly comparable with that of the House of Commons. Those Members who wish to improve their pensions will have to pay for them through increased contributions, which broadly cover the extra benefit that will be thereby gained from the pensions. I hope that this settlement finds favour among all Members, and I recommend that you vote in favour of it.

Cydnabu'r Corff Adolygu Cyflogau Uwch-Swyddogion gyfrifoldebau cynyddol Aelodau Cynulliad o gymharu â chyfrifoldebau Aelodau Seneddol, ac argymhellwyd y dylid lleihau'r gwahaniaeth canrannol rhwng cyflog Aelod Seneddol a chyflog Aelod Cynulliad tua 2 y cant.

Bu cynnydd bach yn y lwfans costau swyddfa, ni newidiwyd y lwfans costau ychwanegol a bu gostyngiad yn y lwfans milltiroedd. Cydnabu'r corff nad oedd y lwfans cyflogau staff presennol yn ddigonol i roi digon o staff i ACau er mwyn iddynt gyflawni eu dyletswyddau'n briodol. Argymhellodd godiadau sylweddol, sy'n mynd i'r staff a gyflogir gan Aelodau Cynulliad, ac y dylai dau aelod a hanner o staff cyfwerth ag amser llawn fod ar gael i bob Aelod Cynulliad i'w alluogi neu ei galluogi i wneud y gwaith yn briodol. Dywedodd y corff hefyd y dylid cyflwyno graddfeydd cyflog os cytunwyd i godi'r lwfans cyflogau staff. Yr ydym wedi gwneud hynny. Mae'r cynnig sydd ger ein bron yn cyflwyno graddfeydd cyflog a fydd yn rhoi mwy o sicrwydd i staff cymorth Aelodau Cynulliad ynghylch codiadau cyflog, yn amodol ar berfformiad boddhaol, a ddylai leihau trosiant staff a helpu i feithrin profiad.

Felly, yn gyffredinol, mae hwn yn setliad da. Mae Pwyllgor y Tŷ wedi'i dderbyn; nid ydym wedi'i newid. Mae egwyddorion argymhellion y Corff Adolygu Cyflogau Uwch-Swyddogion, sef cynigion rhesymol y gellir eu rheoli o fewn y gyllideb, wedi'u derbyn ac maent ger eich bron. Yn ogystal, mae ail gynnig ar bensiynau ger ein bron. I'r Aelodau hynny sydd am eu cael, bydd pensiynau ar gael ar gyfradd groniadau o un rhan o ddeugain y flwyddyn yn hytrach nag un rhan o hanner cant. Canlyniad y newidiadau a gyflwynir yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin yw hynny, ac mae ein Rheolau Sefydlog yn nodi y dylai ein cynllun pensiwn fod yn debyg i gynllun pensiwn Tŷ'r Cyffredin yn gyffredinol. Bydd yn rhaid i'r Aelodau hynny sydd am wella eu pensiynau dalu amdanynt drwy gyfraniadau uwch, sy'n cwmpasu'r budd ychwanegol yn fras a geir o'r pensiynau yn sgîl hynny. Gobeithiaf fod y setliad hwn yn dderbyniol i bob Aelod, ac argymhellaf y dylech bleidleisio o'i blaid.

3.40 p.m.

Cynnig (NDM2338): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2338): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Cynnig (NDM2339): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2339): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.43 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.43 p.m.*

**Adolygiad Polisi'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar y
Berthynas rhwng Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol
The Health and Social Services Committee's Policy Review Report on the
Interface between Health and Social Care**

David Melding: I propose that

David Melding: Cynigiaf fod

that the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Orders Nos. 6.6 and 9.9, notes the Health and Social Services Committee Report, 'Review of The Interface Between Health and Social Care', which was laid in the Table Office on 1 March 2005. (NDM2337)

The Health and Social Services Committee has been working hard on this report, which was formally published last week. We commenced our deliberations in October 2003, and we decided upon the subject of the interface between health and social care following careful consideration of the Wanless report, which was published in June 2003. We were keen to look at the way in which health and social services co-operate, the good practice that exists, and how it could be improved. We looked at the nervous tissue, if you like, between the two organisations and how it could be strengthened. We invited public responses and we received over 70 of them, which was an excellent contribution to our work. I place on record my thanks, and that of the whole committee, to all the organisations and individuals who took the trouble to submit evidence, which was of a very high quality. We then took oral evidence from a smaller number of those 70 respondents, and held several sessions. During the oral evidence phase, we also took evidence from health and social care providers, service users and carers. Members also visited various projects around the country, such as those at Cimla, Port Talbot, Llandeilo and Blaenau Gwent, and saw some interesting work. I know that all Members who undertook those visits were appreciative of the work and the preparations made by various projects and services around Wales.

We were greatly assisted in our report by Professor Vivienne Walters, who is the committee's expert adviser. Professor Walters facilitated focus groups with service users and carers, front-line staff and volunteers. We were proud that we were trying to extend how we received evidence and got people to consult and take part in the committee's work; we thought that that was

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 6.6 a 9.9, yn nodi Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, 'Adolygiad o'r Rhyng-gysylltiad rhwng Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Mawrth 2005. (NDM2337)

Mae'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi bod yn gweithio'n galed ar yr adroddiad hwn, a gyhoeddwyd yn ffurfiol yr wythnos diwethaf. Bu inni ddechrau ein trafodaethau ym mis Hydref 2003, a phenderfynwyd ar bwnc y rhyng-gysylltiad rhwng iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn dilyn ystyriaeth ofalus o adroddiad Wanless, a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Mehefin 2003. Yr oeddem yn awyddus i edrych ar y ffordd y mae iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn cydweithio, yr arferion da sy'n bodoli, a sut y gellid eu gwella. Bu inni edrych ar y feinwe nerfol, os mynnwch chi, rhwng y ddau sefydliad a sut y gellid ei chryfhau. Gwahoddwyd y cyhoedd i ymateb a chawsom dros 70 o ymatebion, a oedd yn gyfraniad rhagorol i'n gwaith. Hoffwn gofnodi fy niolch i, a diolch y pwyllgor cyfan, i bob sefydliad ac unigolyn a aeth i'r drafferth o gyflwyno tystiolaeth a oedd o ansawdd uchel iawn. Yna cymerasom dystiolaeth lafar gan nifer lai o'r 70 o ymatebwyr hynny, a chynhaliwyd sawl sesiwn. Yn ystod y dystiolaeth lafar cymerwyd tystiolaeth hefyd gan ddarparwyr iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, defnyddwyr gwasanaethau a gofalwyr. Ymwelodd Aelodau hefyd â phrosiectau amrywiol ledled y wlad, megis y rhai yng Nghimla, Port Talbot, Llandeilo a Blaenau Gwent, a gwelwyd gwaith diddorol. Gwn fod pob Aelod a ymwelodd â'r lleoedd hynny wedi gwerthfawrogi'r gwaith a'r paratoadau a wnaed gan y prosiectau a'r gwasanaethau amrywiol ledled Cymru.

Cawsom gymorth mawr hefyd ar gyfer ein hadroddiad gan yr Athro Vivienne Walters, sef cynghorydd arbenigol y pwyllgor. Hwylusodd yr Athro Walters waith y grwpiau ffocws gyda defnyddwyr gwasanaethau a gofalwyr, staff rheng flaen a gwirfoddolwyr. Yr oeddem yn falch ein bod yn ceisio ehangu'r ffordd yr oeddem yn cael tystiolaeth ac yn cael pobl i ymgynghori a

valuable. You may be interested to know that Assembly Members are kept well away from focus groups, so that people get an opportunity to contribute without what may be our interference.

I also place on record the committee's thanks to the secretariat, particularly the clerk, Jane Westlake, and the deputy clerk, Claire Morris, who have worked with remarkable vigour, judgment and application. We were also helped greatly by the Assembly's research staff in preparing briefings and possible questions. As committee Chair, I appreciate the way in which the Members' Research Service is modelled on the committees' work and what they need.

The report was launched last week at Port Talbot's Forge Centre—one of the facilities that Members visited—and I am grateful for the warm welcome provided there. We also had an excellent audience, which contained many of the witnesses that had contributed to our work. I am grateful to all of them.

The purpose of this slot is to allow Members to talk about the report. I hope that some Members who are not on the committee will contribute to this debate. However, I will discuss some of the report's main findings. We were overwhelmingly impressed by the great expertise and commitment in the Welsh health service and in social care, which we must build upon. There is a great deal of good practice, which needs to be made common practice. It also needs to be accelerated and supported by structures and accountability arrangements, and by the commitment of politicians. Let us make no mistake: the staff are doing a good job, but they could do even better with our support and encouragement.

We were impressed that the dedicated staff, which we undoubtedly have, need to be supported by accountable and robust structures. Coterminosity—local health groups and local authorities having the same geographical dimensions—should help greatly to ensure effective joint working. We did not feel that there was any real appetite

chymryd rhan yng ngwaith y pwyllgor; yr oedd hynny'n werthfawr yn ein barn ni. Efallai y byddai diddordeb gennych wybod bod Aelodau Cynulliad yn cael eu cadw draw oddi wrth grwpiau ffocws, fel bod pobl yn cael cyfle i gyfrannu heb ein hymyrraeth ni o bosibl.

Hoffwn gofnodi hefyd ddiolch y pwyllgor i'r ysgrifenyddiaeth, yn arbennig y cler, Jane Westlake, a'r dirprwy glerc, Claire Morris, a weithiodd gyda chryn egni, doethineb ac ymroddiad. Cawsom ein helpu'n fawr iawn hefyd gan staff ymchwil y Cynulliad i baratoi briffiadau a chwestiynau posibl. Fel Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, gwerthfawrogaf y ffordd y caiff Gwasanaeth Ymchwil yr Aelodau ei fodelu ar waith y pwyllgorau a'r hyn sydd ei angen arnynt.

Lansiwyd yr adroddiad yr wythnos diwethaf yng Nghanolfan Forge Port Talbot—un o'r cyfleusterau yr ymwelodd Aelodau ag ef—ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y croeso cynnes a gafwyd yno. Cawsom gynulleidfa ragorol hefyd, a oedd yn cynnwys llawer o'r tystion a oedd wedi cyfrannu at ein gwaith. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i bob un ohonynt.

Diben yr amser hwn yw rhoi cyfle i Aelodau sôn am yr adroddiad. Gobeithiaf y bydd rhai Aelodau nad ydynt ar y pwyllgor yn cyfrannu at y ddadl hon. Fodd bynnag, trafodaf rai o brif ganfyddiadau'r adroddiad. Crëwyd argraff fawr iawn arnom gan yr arbenigedd a'r ymrwymiad mawr sydd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru, y mae'n rhaid inni adeiladu arnynt. Mae llawer iawn o arferion da, y mae angen eu troi yn arfer cyffredin. Mae angen eu cyflymu hefyd a'u hategu gan strwythurau a threfniadau atebolrwydd, a chan ymrwymiad gwleidyddion. Peidied neb â chamgymryd: mae'r staff yn gwneud gwaith da, ond gallent wneud hyd yn oed yn well gyda'n cefnogaeth a'n hanogaeth.

Cawsom ar ddeall bod angen i'r staff ymroddedig, sydd gennym yn ddi-au, gael eu cynnal gan strwythurau atebol a chadarn. Dylai'r ffaith bod ffiniau cyffredin—grwpiau iechyd lleol ac awdurdodau lleol â'r un dimensiynau daearyddol—helpu'n fawr iawn i sicrhau cydweithio effeithiol. Teimlwyd nad oedd unrhyw awydd gwirioneddol

among those who gave evidence for a move to a system of fines or punishment of those authorities and health organisations not considered to be working as effectively as they could be; rather, we need to reward and encourage good practice. In doing so, we need to recognise good practice and implement an award scheme so that it is given some imprimatur of approval, which others can emulate.

We did not feel that major restructuring was required. In fact, we feel strongly that we must work with the current structures and that further upheaval would not help. Therefore, we did not feel that we should, for example, experiment with some form of unified care council. We need to work with the structures as they are.

We also need to ensure, when we review the performance of health and social care organisations, that a central performance indicator measures how they undertake joint working, which is not always the case. In fact, there is a tendency to measure in a rather silo way how various organisations perform. If we do not set standards for, and reward, joint working, and acknowledge it as one of the key areas for judging the professional nature of the service, then we can hardly expect them, without such encouragement, to suddenly make joint working a priority. So, it is all-important that we have that as a clear aim in all the targets that we set.

We also felt that political leadership is important. The evidence showed that where local leaders and politicians were committed to moving this agenda forward, there was remarkable success. That needs to start in the Assembly and move right across organisations and local authorities.

We also thought that it was less a matter of joint funding and introducing certain specific methods to encourage joint working—although they can be helpful—and more a matter of needing to change the whole culture. If effective joint commissioning is to be undertaken, then it is a general issue,

ymhlith y rhai a roddodd dystiolaeth i newid i system o ddirwyon neu o gosbi'r awdurdodau a'r sefydliadau iechyd hynny nad oeddent yn gweithio mor effeithiol ag y gallent fod yn nhyb eraill; yn hytrach, mae angen inni wobrwyo ac annog arferion da. Wrth wneud hynny, mae angen inni gydnabod arferion da a gweithredu cynllun gwobrwyo fel eu bod yn cael rhywfaint o sêl bendith, y gall eraill eu hefelychu.

Ni themlem fod angen gwaith ailstrwythuro mawr. A dweud y gwir, teimlwn yn gryf bod yn rhaid inni weithio gyda'r strwythurau cyfredol ac na fyddai unrhyw newid mawr pellach yn helpu. Felly, nid oeddem yn teimlo y dylem, er enghraifft, arbrofi gyda rhyw fath o gyngor gofal unedig. Mae angen inni weithio gyda'r strwythurau fel ag y maent.

Mae angen inni sicrhau hefyd, pan adolygwn berfformiad sefydliadau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, fod dangosydd perfformiad canolog yn mesur sut y maent yn mynd ati i gydweithio, gan nad yw hyn yn digwydd bob amser. A dweud y gwir, mae tueddiad i fesur y ffordd y mae sefydliadau amrywiol yn perfformio yn unigol i ryw raddau. Os na osodwn safonau ar gyfer cydweithio, a'i wobrwyo, a chydabod cydweithio fel un o'r prif feysydd ar gyfer barnu natur broffesiynol y gwasanaeth, yna prin y gallwn ddisgwyl iddynt, heb anogaeth o'r fath, wneud cydweithio yn flaenoriaeth ar unwaith. Felly, mae'n hollbwysig bod hynny gennym fel nod clir ym mhob un o'r targedau a bennir gennym.

Teimlem hefyd fod arweinyddiaeth wleidyddol yn bwysig. Dangosodd y dystiolaeth fod cryn lwyddiant pan oedd arweinyddion lleol a gwleidyddion yn ymrwymedig i ddatblygu'r agenda hon. Mae angen i hynny ddechrau yn y Cynulliad a symud ar draws sefydliadau ac awdurdodau lleol.

Teimlem hefyd fod a wnelo hyn lai â chyd-ariannu a chyflwyno rhai dulliau penodol i annog cydweithio—er y gallant fod yn ddefnyddiol—a mwy â'r angen i newid y diwylliant cyfan. Er mwyn ymgymryd â chyd-gomisiynu effeithiol, yna mater cyffredinol ydyw, yn hytrach na meddwl am

rather than coming up with a new idea which would transform the situation overnight. We did not feel that there were magic answers to this issue. It was about the general application across the piste to encourage joint working and having the will to turn good practice into common practice.

3.50 p.m.

Inevitably, there were some specific items which we wanted to bring to the attention of health and social care providers and the Welsh Assembly Government, such as the modernisation of information and communications technology systems. It is important that they are compatible; they do not necessarily have to be the same systems, but should be able to talk to each other. We thought that this was essential to break down the barriers which often exist between professionals, which impairs their joint working.

The involvement of the voluntary and independent sectors in commissioning and planning services could be improved. That is not to say that it was absent, or that pockets of very good practice did not exist, but it needed to be worked on. There was particular evidence that this was weak in the area of domiciliary care, which is key to effective joint working.

We also felt that perhaps more work needs to be done on the way in which we anticipate need, and the way in which we involve the higher education sector, perhaps, and map out the likely shifts in social need for the future, and try to anticipate the way in which we may need to develop services. That kind of intelligence gathering is not done systematically, but it is done in pockets. We must build on the good practice which is out there.

We also felt that schemes such as special grant funding on a one-off basis were unlikely to entrench good developments in health and social care. Sometimes, evaluation was not effective—a project may be developed, but when the one, two or three-year funding ceases, there is no real

syniad newydd a fyddai'n trawsnewid y sefyllfa dros nos. Ni theimlwyd bod atebion parod i'r broblem hon. Yr oedd a wnelo â chymhwyso hyn yn gyffredinol i annog cydweithio a chael yr ewyllys i droi arferion da yn arfer cyffredin.

Yn anochel, yr oedd rhai eitemau penodol yr oeddem am eu dwyn i sylw'r darparwyr iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, megis moderneiddio'r systemau technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Mae'n bwysig eu bod yn gydweddol; nid oes rhaid cael yr un systemau o reidrwydd, ond dylent fod yn gallu cyfathrebu â'i gilydd. Yr oedd hyn yn hanfodol yn ein barn ni i chwalu'r rhwystrau sy'n bodoli'n aml rhwng gweithwyr proffesiynol, sy'n amharu ar eu cydweithio.

Gellid gwella'r broses o gynnwys y sectorau gwirfoddol ac annibynnol wrth gomisiynu a chynllunio gwasanaethau. Nid dweud yr ydym nad oedd yn bodoli, neu nad oedd arferion da iawn ar gael yma a thraw, ond mae angen gweithio arno. Yr oedd tystiolaeth benodol fod hyn yn wan ym maes gofal cartref, sy'n allweddol i gydweithio effeithiol.

Teimlem hefyd fod angen gwneud mwy o waith efallai ar y ffordd y rhagwelwn angen, a'r ffordd yr ydym yn cynnwys y sector addysg uwch, efallai, ac amlinellu'r newidiadau tebygol mewn angen cymdeithasol yn y dyfodol, a cheisio rhagweld y ffordd y bydd angen inni ddatblygu gwasanaethau efallai. Nid eir ati i wneud y math hwnnw o gasglu gwybodaeth yn systematig, ond fe'i gwneir yma a thraw. Rhaid inni adeiladu ar yr arferion da sydd ar gael.

Teimlem hefyd fod cynlluniau megis arian grant arbennig ar sail unigol yn annhebyg o greu datblygiadau da mewn iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Weithiau, nid oedd gwerthuso yn effeithiol—gellir datblygu prosiect, ond pan fydd y cyllid am flwyddyn neu ddwy neu dair yn dod i ben, ni chynhelir gwerthusiad

evaluation of whether it is successful or not. Successful schemes often come to an end because funding is no longer available. The Government has to be careful in using funding of that nature, and there must be a clear commitment to improving core services by developing certain areas. That was part of what needed to be done—if the projects were successful they would become a part of the core provision.

We also felt that joint working could be measured by certain key services. Those key services included support for carers, which can be excellent or very poor in some instances, effective hospital discharge, where practice ranges from excellent to mediocre in some places where effective joint working is not apparent, and unified assessment procedures, which are an excellent idea, but we await their successful application across the health and social care sectors. We also felt that intermediate care was an important service, as is the capacity which residential and nursing home services must develop in the future. These are key indicators in terms of whether we are effectively commissioning and planning services for the future. As I mentioned earlier, domiciliary care is a very important area, and if we are to avoid inappropriate emergency admissions to hospital, helping and sustaining people at home is key.

I look forward to contributions from Members, and I will respond to them at the end of the debate.

David Davies: I welcome today's debate on building an interface or, to put it in slightly more manageable jargon, a good working relationship between health and social services, because that is what this issue is about.

Unless my figures are wrong—and I will take being corrected by David Melding—it costs around £1,400 to keep someone in a hospital bed per week. The equivalent figure for keeping someone in a nursing home is

gwirioneddol i weld a fu'n llwyddiannus ai peidio. Yn aml daw cynlluniau llwyddiannus i ben gan nad oes rhagor o gyllid ar gael. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth fod yn ofalus wrth ddefnyddio'r fath gyllid, a rhaid cael ymrwymiad clir i wella gwasanaethau craidd drwy ddatblygu meysydd penodol. Yr oedd hynny'n rhan o'r hyn yr oedd angen ei wneud—os oedd y prosiectau yn llwyddiannus byddent yn dod yn rhan o'r ddarpariaeth graidd.

Teimlef hefyd y gellid mesur cydweithio yn ôl rhai gwasanaethau allweddol. Yr oedd y gwasanaethau allweddol hynny'n cynnwys cymorth i ofalwyr, a all fod yn rhagorol neu'n wael iawn mewn rhai enghreifftiau, rhyddhau cleifion o'r ysbyty yn effeithiol, lle y mae'r arfer yn amrywio o ragorol i weddol mewn rhai mannau lle nad yw cydweithio effeithiol yn amlwg, a gweithdrefnau asesu unedig, sy'n syniad rhagorol, ond arhoswn iddynt gael eu cymhwyso'n llwyddiannus ar draws y sectorau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Teimlem hefyd fod gofal canolraddol yn wasanaeth pwysig, yn yr un ffordd ag y mae'r adnoddau y mae'n rhaid i wasanaethau cartrefi preswyl a chartrefi nyrsio eu datblygu yn y dyfodol. Dangosyddion allweddol yw'r rhain i weld a ydym yn comisiynu ac yn cynllunio gwasanaethau yn effeithiol ar gyfer y dyfodol. Fel y soniais yn gynharach, mae gofal cartref yn faes pwysig iawn, ac er mwyn osgoi derbyn cleifion i'r ysbyty mewn achosion brys amhriodol, mae'n allweddol ein bod yn helpu ac yn cynnal pobl yn eu cartrefi.

Edrychaf ymlaen at gyfraniadau gan Aelodau, a byddaf yn ymateb iddynt ar ddiwedd y ddadl.

David Davies: Croesawaf ddadl heddiw ar greu rhyng-gysylltiad neu, i'w roi mewn iaith ychydig yn fwy dealladwy, perthynas waith dda rhwng iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, oherwydd dyna fyrdwn y mater hwn.

Oni bai fod fy ffigurau i yn anghywir—ac yr wyf yn fodlon cael fy nghywirow gan David Melding—mae'n costio tua £1,400 i gadw rhywun yn yr ysbyty am wythnos. Y ffigur cyfatebol ar gyfer cadw rhywun mewn

around £700, and for a residential home, the figure is around £400 per week. Those are approximate figures. It costs even less to treat or keep people who would otherwise need treatment in one of those three areas in their own homes. Therefore, it is in everyone's interest to try to ensure that people are in their own homes for as much time as possible, which is what this debate is all about.

In the minute or two that I have, I will draw the Chamber's attention to something that greatly concerns me and is likely to lead to much greater pressure on hospital beds and nursing home beds, namely the decision by the National Institute for Clinical Excellence to withdraw three drugs which cost around £2.50 a day and can prevent the onset of Alzheimer's disease for up to 12 months. That will take place around July this year and is an appalling decision. Can the Assembly do anything to prevent this? This is morally wrong. Alzheimer's disease is predominantly an illness that affects elderly people, but it can also occur in those who are much younger, even people in their 50s, and it places an enormous amount of pressure on them and their families, because sufferers will reach the stage where they cannot recognise their closest relatives. That causes terrible strain for everyone involved. We should do everything that we can do to prevent, or at least mitigate, some of the symptoms of this disease. The sum of £2.50 a day is not a lot of money to support people who created the society in which we are currently living.

Not only it is morally wrong to withdraw these drugs, but, having looked through this report, it does not make any financial sense. If, rather than pay £2.50 a day, we put people into residential or nursing homes at a cost of £400 to £700 a week, we are saving the NHS a little bit of money with the one hand, and taking it straight out of the social services budget with the other. I hate to put an argument like this in financial terms, because we should not be arguing about money when we are talking about £2.50 a day, but if that is the only argument that the Government will understand, those are the terms I will use. There is absolutely—

cartref nyrsio yw tua £700, ac ar gyfer cartref preswyl, mae tua £400 yr wythnos. Ffigurau bras yw'r rheini. Mae'n costio hyd yn oed yn llai i drin neu gadw pobl y byddai angen triniaeth arnynt fel arall yn un o'r tri maes hynny yn eu cartrefi eu hunain. Felly, mae ceisio sicrhau bod pobl yn aros yn eu cartrefi eu hunain am gymaint o amser â phosibl, sef byrdwn y ddadl hon, er budd pawb.

Yn y funud neu ddwy sydd gennyf, tynnaf sylw'r Siambr at rywbeth sy'n peri pryder mawr imi ac sy'n debygol o roi mwy o bwysau o lawer ar welyau ysbytai a gwelyau cartrefi nyrsio, sef penderfyniad y Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Ragoriaeth Glinigol i dynnu tri chyffur yn ôl sy'n costio tua £2.50 y dydd ac a all atal clefyd Alzheimer rhag dechrau am hyd at 12 mis. Bydd hynny'n digwydd tua mis Gorffennaf eleni ac mae'n benderfyniad gwarthus. A all y Cynulliad wneud unrhyw beth i atal hyn? Mae hyn yn foesol anghywir. At ei gilydd, salwch yw clefyd Alzheimer sy'n effeithio ar bobl oedrannus, ond gall ddigwydd hefyd ymhlith y bobl hynny sy'n iau o lawer, hyd yn oed bobl yn eu 50au, ac mae'n rhoi llawer iawn o bwysau arnynt hwy a'u teuluoedd, oherwydd daw adeg pan na fydd y rhai sy'n dioddef o'r clefyd yn gallu adnabod eu perthnasau agosaf hyd yn oed. Mae hynny'n rhoi straen enfawr ar bawb dan sylw. Dylem wneud popeth a allwn i atal, neu o leiaf, leddfu rhai o symptomau'r clefyd hwn. Nid yw'r swm o £2.50 y dydd yn llawer o arian i gynnal pobl a greodd y gymdeithas yr ydym yn byw ynddi ar hyn o bryd.

Mae tynnu'r cyffuriau hyn yn ôl yn foesol anghywir, ac nid yw ychwaith, ar ôl edrych drwy'r adroddiad hwn, yn gwneud unrhyw synnwyr yn ariannol. Os rhoddwn bobl mewn cartrefi preswyl neu gartrefi nyrsio ar gost o £400 i £700 yr wythnos, yn hytrach na thalu £2.50 y dydd, yr ydym yn arbed ychydig o arian i'r GIG ar y naill llaw, ac yn mynd ag ef o gyllideb y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ar y llaw arall. Mae'n gas gennyf roi dadl fel hyn mewn cyd-destun ariannol, oherwydd ni ddylem fod yn dadlau ynghylch arian pan soniwn am £2.50 y dydd, ond os mai dyna'r unig ddadl y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ei deall, yna dyna'r cyd-destun a ddefnyddiaf. Yn sicr—

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): Will you give way?

David Davies: Yes, I will happily give way.

Brian Gibbons: This matter is not quite as simplistic as David Davies would have the Chamber believe. First, NICE has given an indication that this is its intention—it has not yet implemented the decision, but it is inviting comments on it. Secondly, the problem with the drugs that David mentioned is their efficacy. If their efficacy was as clear-cut as David would have us believe, there would be no question as to their being readily available. The whole point of the NICE exercise is that the advantage the drugs offer may be border-line. That level of correct information is needed for an informed debate on the matter.

David Davies: The chief executive of the Alzheimer's Society has said that the organisation is stunned at the proposal that vulnerable people should not receive treatments that have been proven to work. The experts seem to be clear about what they think.

I appreciate that the decision has not yet been made, and will be made in July, but if, as the Minister says, NICE is looking for comment, then let us send one from the National Assembly. I cannot go into this in great detail in the few minutes that I have now, as we all know, so let us simply send comments, led by the Minister, saying that we are not prepared to see an elderly, vulnerable group of people being denied treatment that costs what, in NHS terms, is absolute peanuts. Let us make a strong moral and financial case for ensuring that they continue to receive those drugs, which have been proven—or at least demonstrated—to have a huge and positive impact on people with Alzheimer's disease.

Val Lloyd: I join the Chair of the committee in thanking those who took the time and trouble to give us evidence, and in particular to those who hosted committee members during our visits and gave so freely of their

Y Gweindog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): A wnewch chi ildio?

David Davies: Yr wyf yn hapus i ildio.

Brian Gibbons: Nid yw'r mater hwn mor syml ag y byddai David Davies am i'r Siambr ei gredu. Yn gyntaf, mae NICE wedi awgrymu mai dyma yw ei fwriad—nid yw wedi rhoi'r penderfyniad ar waith eto, ond mae'n gwahodd sylwadau arno. Yn ail, y broblem gyda'r cyffuriau y soniodd David amdanynt yw eu heffeithiolrwydd. Os oedd eu heffeithiolrwydd mor bendant ag y byddai David am inni ei gredu, byddent, yn ddi-au, ar gael yn hawdd. Holl bwynt ymarfer NICE yw y gall y fantais y mae'r cyffuriau yn ei chynnig fod yn fach iawn. Mae angen y lefel honno o wybodaeth gywir er mwyn cael dadl hyddysg ar y mater.

David Davies: Mae prif weithredwr Cymdeithas Alzheimer wedi dweud bod y sefydliad yn synnu at y cynnig na ddylai pobl fregus gael triniaethau y profwyd eu bod yn gweithio. Ymddengys fod yr arbenigwyr yn glir ynglŷn â'u barn ar hyn.

Gwerthfawrogaf nad yw'r penderfyniad wedi ei wneud eto, a chaiff ei wneud ym mis Gorffennaf, ond os yw NICE, fel y dywed y Gweinidog, am gael sylwadau, yna gadewch inni anfon sylwadau gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Ni allaf fanylu ar hyn yn yr ychydig funudau sydd gennyf yn awr, fel y gŵyr pawb, felly gadewch inni anfon sylwadau, o dan arweiniad y Gweinidog, yn dweud nad ydym yn barod i weld grŵp oedranus, bregus o bobl yn methu â chael triniaeth sy'n costio'r nesaf peth i ddim, yn nhermau'r GIG. Gadewch inni gyflwyno dadl foesol ac ariannol gref dros sicrhau eu bod yn parhau i gael y cyffuriau hynny, y profwyd—neu y dangoswyd o leiaf—eu bod yn cael effaith fawr a chadarnhaol ar bobl sy'n dioddef o glefyd Alzheimer.

Val Lloyd: Ymunaf â Chadeirydd y pwyllgor i ddiolch i'r rhai a gymerodd yr amser ac a aeth i'r drafferth i roi tystiolaeth inni, ac yn arbennig i'r rhai a groesawodd aelodau o'r pwyllgor yn ystod ein

valuable time.

The interface between health and social care has to function effectively if we are to build an NHS that is both sustainable and responsive to modern need. Through this review, the committee has had the opportunity to learn a great deal about how social and healthcare services operate, and at a range of levels. Some of this was known to us already and some of it was new. There have been some excellent examples of partnership working, but there have also been many areas which have caused concern, which have rightly been highlighted in the report

In order to create an efficient structure, where service providers work in partnership for the benefit of the patient, an effective ICT strategy is a fundamental necessity. There has already been heavy investment in developing and implementing 'Informing Healthcare' and 'Informing Social Care', which are the Government's ICT strategies for health and social care services. However, it is vital that those two information and communication strategies are integrated to provide one holistic service and to ensure that the potential of innovations, such as the electronic patient record, are maximised.

4.00 p.m.

Across both care services, the free flow of information on patient need is essential if services are to be more responsive to that need. The harmonisation of those two ICT strategies must occur. The potential difficulties and limitations of such harmonisation must also be recognised, and the tension between providing individuals with better services while protecting patient confidentiality must be acknowledged.

I hope that an efficient ICT strategy will lead to improvements across other key areas, such as discharge planning, which features heavily in recommendations 6 and 10. Effective planning arrangements lead to a better patient pathway through the health and social service sectors. However, I am concerned that discharge planning still crops up as needing

hymweliadau ac a roddodd o'u hamser mor hael.

Rhaid i'r rhyng-gysylltiad rhwng iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol weithredu'n effeithiol os ydym am adeiladu GIG sy'n gynaliadwy ac yn ymatebol i anghenion y byd modern. Drwy'r adolygiad hwn, cafodd y pwyllgor y cyfle i ddysgu llawer iawn am y ffordd y mae gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a gofal iechyd yn gweithredu, ac ar amryw lefelau. Yr oedd peth o hyn yn hysbys inni eisoes a pheth ohono'n newydd. Bu rhai enghreifftiau rhagorol o waith partneriaeth, ond bu sawl maes hefyd a achosodd bryder, a amlygwyd yn briodol yn yr adroddiad.

Er mwyn creu strwythur effeithlon, lle y mae darparwyr gwasanaethau yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth er budd y claf, mae strategaeth TGCh yn hollol angenrheidiol. Eisoes buddsoddwyd llawer mewn datblygu a gweithredu 'Hysbysu Gofal Iechyd' a 'Hysbysu Gofal Cymdeithasol', sef strategaethau TGCh y Llywodraeth ar gyfer iechyd a gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n hollbwysig bod y ddwy strategaeth gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu hynny yn cael eu cyfuno yn un gwasanaeth cyfannol ac i sicrhau bod potensial dulliau arloesol, megis y cofnod electronig am gleifion, yn cael ei wireddu.

Ar draws y ddau wasanaeth gofal, mae sicrhau bod gwybodaeth ar gael yn hawdd am anghenion cleifion yn hanfodol er mwyn i wasanaethau fod yn fwy ymatebol i'r anghenion hynny. Rhaid cysoni'r ddwy strategaeth TGCh hynny. Rhaid cydnabod hefyd anawsterau a chyfyngiadau posibl proses gysoni o'r fath, a rhaid cydnabod y tensiwn rhwng rhoi gwasanaethau gwell i unigolion tra'n diogelu cyfrinachedd cleifion.

Gobeithiaf y bydd strategaeth TGCh effeithlon yn arwain at welliannau ar draws meysydd allweddol eraill, megis cynllunio ar gyfer rhyddhau cleifion o'r ysbyty, sy'n amlwg iawn yn argymhellion 6 a 10. Mae trefniadau cynllunio effeithiol yn arwain at lwybr gwell i gleifion drwy'r sectorau iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag,

attention. I was formerly a nurse educationist, and the reform of discharge planning has been on the agenda for over 20 years; I can give you examples. It is critical that we now put this to bed and that recommendation 10 in the report is implemented fully, as it has such a knock-on effect.

Recommendations 6, 10 and 11 set out further measures by which health and social care professionals may foster effective practices of joint working. Co-operation across disciplines is vital, and an increase in access to joint resources would allow the implementation of valuable structures. This is one time when professionals must not be precious—it is for the benefit of the patient, and there are excellent examples that should be built on. We must continue to develop the provision of intermediate care, and such facilities lead to the identification of several new options for patients.

I am, however, mindful of the ongoing reform in health and social care settings in Wales, but this report sets out the pathway that links into that reform and has the potential to strengthen it. Stronger partnership working will, and must, bring benefits to patients and professionals alike, and ensure that the patient experience is based on an efficient and responsive system.

Kirsty Williams: I also thank the expert adviser and all the organisations and individuals that responded to the consultation exercise. It is often said in the Chamber that, in carrying out such reviews, people see the Assembly working at its best and truly engaging with people in a way that allows them to bring forward their ideas of how services can be improved. I also thank David Melding, as Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee, for his ever-patient attitude in taking the meetings forward, and for the dedication that he has shown to this issue. He is a credit to the Assembly for the

pryderaf fod cynllunio ar gyfer rhyddhau cleifion o'r ysbyty yn dal i godi fel pwnc y mae angen rhoi sylw iddo. Arferwn fod yn addysgwyr nyrsio, ac mae diwygio'r gwaith cynllunio ar gyfer rhyddhau cleifion o'r ysbyty wedi bod ar yr agenda ers dros 20 mlynedd; gallaf roi enghreifftiau i chi. Mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn cau pen y mwdwl ar hyn a bod argymhelliad 10 yn yr adroddiad yn cael ei weithredu'n llawn, gan ei fod yn cael y fath effaith ganlyniadol.

Mae argymhellion 6, 10 ac 11 yn nodi mesurau pellach fel y gall gweithwyr proffesiynol ym meysydd iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol feithrin arferion effeithiol o gydweithio. Mae cydweithio ar draws disgyblaethau yn hollbwysig, a byddai sicrhau ei bod yn haws cael gafael ar adnoddau ar y cyd yn golygu y gellid rhoi strwythurau gwerthfawr ar waith. Mae hon yn adeg pan na ddylai gweithwyr proffesiynol fod yn anodd eu plesio—mae er budd y claf, a cheir enghreifftiau rhagorol y dylid adeiladu arnynt. Rhaid inni barhau i ddatblygu'r ddarpariaeth o ofal canolraddol, ac mae cyfleusterau o'r fath yn arwain at nodi sawl opsiwn newydd i gleifion.

Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r diwygiad parhaus mewn lleoliadau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru, ond nodar adroddiad hwn y llwybr sy'n cysylltu â'r diwygio hynny ac mae ganddo'r potensial i'w gryfhau. Bydd gwaith partneriaeth cryfach yn dod â manteision i gleifion a gweithwyr proffesiynol fel ei gilydd, a rhaid iddo wneud y manteision hynny, a sicrhau bod profiad y claf yn seiliedig ar system effeithlon ac ymatebol.

Kirsty Williams: Diolchaf innau hefyd i'r cynghorydd arbenigol a phob sefydliad ac unigolyn a ymatebodd i'r ymgynghoriad. Dywedir yn aml yn y Siambr, wrth gynnal adolygiadau o'r fath, fod pobl yn gweld y Cynulliad yn gweithio ar ei orau ac yn wirioneddol ymgysylltu â phobl mewn ffordd sy'n rhoi cyfle iddynt gyflwyno eu syniadau ar sut y gellir gwella gwasanaethau. Diolchaf hefyd i David Melding, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, am ei agwedd fythol amyneddgar wrth arwain cyfarfodydd, ac am yr ymroddiad a ddangosodd i'r mater hwn.

way in which the committee's work has been taken forward.

As Welsh Liberal Democrats, we fully support the report's recommendations. At the start of the review, I could perhaps have been accused of being zealous for further reform. However, the evidence that we received showed us that professionals do not relish further restructuring and change to where health and social care sit together in an organisation. That is perhaps an argument for another day.

One overwhelming issue that struck me about this report—and looking back over the last six years of my involvement with the committee—is that there are excellent examples of good practice in Wales, and the work in this field is no different. It is astonishing that, in an incredibly small country, where everyone knows each other, good practice still exists in pockets and that we have not cracked the problem of disseminating good practice and having it picked up in organisations across the principality. I do not understand why, in such a small country, we still have difficulty in acknowledging what we do well and ensuring that other people learn from that experience, and do not feel threatened by the fact that their practices may change, but can embrace good practice across the principality.

In this report yet again, we see plenty of examples of systems that work well within authority areas, while neighbouring authorities do not have those systems in place. I simply do not know what it is about our society's culture that prevents us from moving forward in this way.

I particularly endorse David Melding's remarks about performance management. There is evidence from across the field, not just from social care providers and the local education authorities, whom you would expect to say, 'Please, do not charge us or fine us when we do not get things right'; it was echoed by the health service too. There is a true desire among providers to work in co-operation with each other, but no desire, however, for the health service to blame

Mae'n dwyn clod i'r Cynulliad am y ffordd y mae gwaith y pwyllgor wedi mynd rhagddo.

Fel Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, cefnogwn argymhellion yr adroddiad yn llawn. Ar ddechrau'r adolygiad, gellid bod wedi fy nghyhuddo efallai o fod yn frwd dros ddiwygio ymhellach. Fodd bynnag, dangosodd y dystiolaeth a gawsom nad yw gweithwyr proffesiynol am weld rhagor o ailstrwythuro a newid yn y berthynas rhwng meysydd iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol mewn sefydliad. Mae hynny'n ddadl efallai i rywbyrd arall.

Un mater hollbwysig a'm trawodd ynglŷn â'r adroddiad hwn—ac wrth edrych yn ôl dros chwe blynedd diwethaf fy ymwneud â'r pwyllgor—yw bod enghreifftiau rhagorol o arferion da yng Nghymru, ac nid yw'r gwaith yn y maes hwn yn wahanol. Mae'n syndod, mewn gwlad anhygoel o fach, lle y mae pawb yn adnabod ei gilydd, fod ardaloedd o arferion da yma a thraw o hyd ac nad ydym wedi datrys y broblem o ledaenu arferion da a chael sefydliadau ledled y wlad i ddod yn ymwybodol ohonynt. Ni ddeallaf pam yr ydym, mewn gwlad mor fach, yn dal i gael anhawster i gydnabod yr hyn a wnawn yn dda a sicrhau bod pobl eraill yn dysgu o'r profiad hwnnw, ac nad ydynt yn teimlo dan fygythiad am fod eu harferion o bosibl yn newid, ond y gallant ymgorffori arferion da ledled y wlad.

Yn yr adroddiad hwn eto, gwelwn sawl enghraifft o systemau sy'n gweithio'n dda o fewn ardaloedd awdurdodau, tra nad yw'r systemau hynny ar waith mewn awdurdodau cyfagos. Beth sy'n bod ar ddiwylliant ein cymdeithas sy'n ein hatal rhag datblygu fel hyn?

Cymeradwyaf sylwadau David Melding ynglŷn â rheoli perfformiad yn arbennig. Ceir dystiolaeth ar draws y meysydd, nid gan ddarparwyr gofal cymdeithasol a'r awdurdodau addysg lleol yn unig, y byddech yn disgwyl iddynt ddweud, 'Peidiwch â chodi tâl neu ddirwy arnom pan na fyddwn yn llwyddo i wneud pethau'n iawn', fe'i hategwyd gan y gwasanaeth iechyd hefyd. Mae awydd gwirioneddol ymhlith darparwyr i gydweithio â'i gilydd, ond nid oes unrhyw

social services and for social services to blame the NHS. I was heartened by the fact that no organisation wanted to go down the route followed in England, where social services departments can, potentially, be fined or penalised for perceived failures in some of their dealings with the NHS. I completely endorse the evidence received by the committee on working up a reward scheme to ensure that their performance management systems are put in place and that those authorities and organisations that get it right and do well are rewarded for their work in that area. What better incentive for organisations to learn from each other than to know that they will be rewarded for that hard work and for the investment that they will make.

Val is absolutely right to focus on ICT. Again, it seems amazing that, in a world where we have embraced the opportunities and advantages that information technology can bring, the areas in which we have been slowest to harness those opportunities are health and social care. ICT is used to such a huge extent in every other aspect of our lives, but we have been slow to take advantage of its true potential in this setting. Despite the Minister's commitment during the course of the investigation and the committee's work on making computer systems compatible across the NHS and social care at some stage, I feel that a commitment to doing this some time in the future is not good enough. It has to be done as soon as possible, so that we have systems that can talk together, work together, and make a real difference for patients.

Jonathan Morgan: On behalf of the Welsh Conservative Party, I thank all those who contributed to this review. It was an important review in that we as an Assembly, and, often, as a committee, look at health and then look at social care, but seldom look at them together in terms of joint working arrangements. It is easy to fall into the trap of getting involved with health service-related issues and then consider separately issues that relate to social services. Often, however, there are issues and problems that can be resolved by organisations working in closer

awaydd, fodd bynnag, i'r gwasanaeth iechyd feio gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac i'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol feio'r GIG. Fe'm calonogwyd gan y ffaith nad oedd yr un sefydliad am ddilyn esiampl Lloegr, lle y gall adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, o bosibl, gael eu dirwyo neu eu cosbi am fethiannau canfyddedig yn eu hymwneud weithiau â'r GIG. Cymeradwyaf yn llwyr y dystiolaeth a roddwyd i'r pwyllgor ar lunio cynllun gwobrwyo i sicrhau y caiff eu systemau rheoli perfformiad eu rhoi ar waith a bod yr awdurdodau a'r sefydliadau hynny sy'n gwneud pethau'n iawn ac yn dda yn cael eu gwobrwyo am eu gwaith yn y maes hwnnw. Pa well cymhelliant i sefydliadau ddysgu oddi wrth ei gilydd na gwybod y cânt eu gwobrwyo am y gwaith caled hwnnw ac am y buddsoddiad y byddant yn ei wneud.

Mae Val yn hollol iawn i ganolbwyntio ar TGCh. Unwaith eto, ymddengys yn rhyfeddol, mewn byd lle yr ydym wedi croesawu'r cyfleoedd a'r manteision a ddaw yn sgîl technoleg gwybodaeth, mai'r meysydd lle y bu'r cynnydd arafaf o ran manteisio ar y cyfleoedd hynny yw iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Defnyddir TGCh i'r fath raddau ym mhob agwedd arall ar ein bywydau, ond buom yn araf i fanteisio ar ei photensial gwirioneddol yn y meysydd hyn. Er gwaethaf ymrwymiad y Gweinidog yn ystod yr ymchwiliad a gwaith y pwyllgor ar wneud systemau cyfrifiadurol yn gydweddol rywbyrd ar draws y GIG a gofal cymdeithasol, teimlaf nad yw ymrwymiad i wneud hyn rywbyrd yn y dyfodol yn ddigon da. Rhaid ei wneud cyn gynted â phosibl, fel bod gennym systemau lle y gallwn siarad â'n gilydd, gweithio gyda'n gilydd a gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i gleifion.

Jonathan Morgan: Ar ran Plaid Geidwadol Cymru, diolchaf i bawb a gyfrannodd at yr adolygiad hwn. Yr oedd yn adolygiad pwysig yn yr ystyr ein bod ni, fel Cynulliad, ac yn aml, fel pwyllgor, yn ystyried iechyd yn gyntaf ac wedyn yn ystyried gofal cymdeithasol, ond mai yn anaml yr ydym yn eu hystyried gyda'i gilydd o ran trefniadau cydweithio. Mae'n hawdd syrthio i'r fagl o ymdrin â materion sy'n gysylltiedig â'r gwasanaeth iechyd, gan ystyried materion sy'n gysylltiedig â gwasanaethau cymdeithasol wedyn ar wahân. Fodd bynnag,

proximity.

I also thank my good friend and colleague, David Melding, for the way in which he chairs the committee, which is, I must say, annoyingly impartial. It is a great shame, but that is what we expect from a man of great standing, who chairs meetings extremely well, and we often find ourselves in some difficulty in trying to persuade David to follow a certain line. I can tell Members, however, that he is equally unfair to all of us.

This review pointed to several interesting areas of good practice, and Kirsty Williams already pointed to the fact that, as a small nation, we are not very good at disseminating that practice. As part of our work in looking at the projects currently operating around Wales, I was the committee member who visited the Blaenau Gwent Assist Project, which is an exciting project that involves a variety of organisations, public and private, providing assistance to those who suffer dementia and who wish to live independently. It was interesting to see how technology could be utilised to make their homes safer. To be perfectly honest, it was not rocket science; it was fairly straightforward and it is amazing that this project has not been replicated elsewhere. The work was exciting, and it demonstrated a strong partnership between agencies in the public and private sectors.

4.10 p.m.

The Government should consider rolling out such a project across Wales to enable us to provide this type of assistance to those who wish to stay in their own homes.

In terms of this review, the project addressed one of the key areas for me, which is the role of health and social services in promoting the independence of patients, whether through securing rapid hospital discharge in terms of how health and social care interact, or the prevention of unnecessary hospital admission and readmission. The project had a particularly good record of ensuring that people with particular mental health

yn aml cyfyd problemau y gellir eu datrys drwy sicrhau bod sefydliadau yn cydweithio'n agosach.

Diolchaf hefyd i'm cyfaill a'm cyd-Aelod, David Melding, am y ffordd y mae'n cadeirio'r pwyllgor, sydd, rhaid imi ddweud, ac er annifyrrwch imi, yn ddiuedd. Mae'n drueni mawr, ond dyna'r hyn a ddisgwyliwn gan ddyn ac iddo enw da iawn, sy'n cadeirio cyfarfodydd yn eithriadol o dda, ac yn aml cawn beth anhawster i geisio perswadio David i ddilyn safbwynt penodol. Fodd bynnag, gallaf ddweud wrth Aelodau, ei fod yr un mor annheg wrth bob un ohonom.

Cyfeiriodd yr adolygiad hwn at sawl maes diddorol o arferion da, ac mae Kirsty Williams eisoes wedi nodi'r ffaith nad ydym, fel gwlad fach, yn dda iawn am ledaenu'r arferion hynny. Fel rhan o'n gwaith o edrych ar y prosiectau sy'n mynd rhagddynt yng Nghymru, fi oedd yr aelod o'r pwyllgor a ymwelodd â Phrosiect Cymorth Blaenau Gwent, sy'n brosiect cyffrous sy'n cynnwys amrywiaeth o sefydliadau, cyhoeddus a phreifat, sy'n rhoi cymorth i'r rhai sy'n dioddef o ddemensia ac sydd am fyw'n annibynnol. Yr oedd yn ddiddorol gweld sut y gellid defnyddio technoleg i wneud eu cartrefi'n fwy diogel. A bod yn onest, nid oedd yn anodd; yr oedd yn weddol syml ac mae'n rhyfeddol nad yw'r prosiect hwn wedi cael ei efelychu mewn mannau eraill. Yr oedd y gwaith yn gyffrous, a dangosodd bartneriaeth gref rhwng asiantaethau yn y sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat.

Dylai'r Llywodraeth ystyried cyflwyno prosiect o'r fath ledled Cymru i'n galluogi i roi'r math hwn o gymorth i'r rhai sydd am aros yn eu cartrefi eu hunain.

O ran yr adolygiad hwn, aeth y prosiect i'r afael ag un o'r meysydd allweddol i mi, sef rôl iechyd a'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol wrth hyrwyddo annibyniaeth cleifion, boed hynny drwy sicrhau eu bod yn cael eu rhyddhau'n gyflym o'r ysbyty o ran y ffordd y mae iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn rhyngweithio, neu drwy atal cleifion rhag cael eu derbyn a'u haillderbyn i'r ysbyty yn ddiangen. Yr oedd gan y prosiect record

problems were able to remain independent for as long as possible. This is something that the Government should examine.

The issue of ICT is a huge problem. Having two ICT strategies, which are not integrated, is not just a problem between health and social care, but a problem within the health service itself. We know, for example, that pharmacists are worried that their systems will not be compatible with the systems operated by the local health board and GPs. If we are to pioneer a proper, complete, single patient record, all of the health and social service agencies should have a compatible system that makes patient records accessible to all concerned.

The organisations with which we spoke expressed firmly their views about the problem of short-term funding. There are many projects throughout Wales that receive short-term funding to pioneer joint collaboration projects, but they collapse when that funding comes to an end. The organisations were asking for something more strategic and long-term in order to foster that greater collaboration.

I was struck by our visit to Wrexham more than anything else, where we spoke to representatives from the trust, the local health board and social services. During the visit, I got the impression that it was not about rearranging structures, and not necessarily about rearranging funding streams, but it was merely a change in the culture whereby three individuals, who clearly got on well as professionals, and by merely picking up the telephone, were able to sort out many of the problems that they faced in Wrexham.

Caerphilly was slightly different. It had a good way of reducing the bedblocking problems through having a larger number of smaller committees. I am not quite sure which system works better, but, for me, it was more about a change of culture than about an increase in the number of committees and bureaucracies.

arbennig o dda o sicrhau bod pobl â phroblemau iechyd meddwl penodol yn gallu parhau i fyw'n annibynnol am gymaint o amser â phosibl. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth y dylai'r Llywodraeth ymchwilio iddo.

Mae TGCh yn broblem fawr iawn. Mae cael dwy strategaeth TGCh, nad ydynt yn integredig, yn broblem nid yn unig rhwng iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, ond yn broblem yn y gwasanaeth iechyd ei hun. Gwyddom, er enghraifft, fod fferyllwyr yn gofidio na fydd eu systemau yn gydweddol â'r systemau a weithredir gan y bwrdd iechyd lleol a meddygon teulu. Er mwyn inni arloesi a cheisio cael un cofnod priodol a chyflawn am gleifion, dylai fod gan bob asiantaeth iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol system gydweddol sy'n golygu bod cofnodion cleifion ar gael i bawb dan sylw.

Mynegodd y sefydliadau y bu inni siarad â hwy eu barn yn bendant am broblem cyllid byrdymor. Ceir llawer prosiect ledled Cymru sy'n cael cyllid byrdymor i arloesi mewn prosiectau cydweithredol, ond maent yn methu pan ddaw'r cyllid hwnnw i ben. Yr oedd y sefydliadau'n gofyn am rywbeth mwy strategol a hirdymor er mwyn meithrin y cydweithrediad gwell hwnnw.

Creodd ein hymweliad â Wrecsam, lle y siaradasom â chynrychiolwyr o'r ymddiriedolaeth, y bwrdd iechyd lleol a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, fwy o argraff arnaf na dim byd arall. Yn ystod yr ymweliad, cefais yr argraff nad oedd a wnelo ag ail-drefnu strwythurau, ac nid o reidrwydd ag ail-drefnu ffrydiau ariannu, ond mai newid ydoedd yn y diwylliant lle yr oedd tri unigolyn a oedd yn amlwg yn cyd-dynnu'n dda yn broffesiynol, a thrwy godi'r ffôn, yn gallu datrys llawer o'r problemau a wynebant yn Wrecsam.

Yr oedd Caerffili ychydig yn wahanol. Yr oedd yno ffordd dda o leihau problemau blocio gwelyau drwy gael nifer fwy o bwyllgorau llai. Nid wyf yn siŵr pa system sy'n gweithio orau, ond, i mi, yr oedd a wnelo mwy â newid mewn diwylliant nag yr oedd â chynnydd yn nifer y pwyllgorau a'r biwrocratiaethau.

There is a lot to learn from this report and I hope that the Government looks on it favourably.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Fe fydd yn amlwg i bawb, o'r drafodaeth hon, fod llawer o dir cyffredin ymysg aelodau'r pwyllgor ynghylch y materion hyn a bod cydsynio ynghylch y prif argymhellion. Nid wyf am ailadrodd y dadleuon sydd eisoes wedi'u cyflwyno.

Mae hwn yn faes eithriadol o gymhleth. Ar y cychwyn, credaf fod llawer ohonom wedi meddwl bod atebion syml i rai o'r problemau. Er enghraifft, hwyrach mai'r broblem a gafodd y sylw mwyaf yw'r angen i drosglwyddo pobl o ysbytai i gael gofal mewn lleoliadau mwy priodol. Mae llawer o bobl wedi dweud bod ateb syml i hyn sef dwyn ynghyd y cyllid a sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â'r mater drwy un ffordd gyllidol. Wrth inni ystyried y mater, daeth yn glir nad oedd yr ateb mor syml â hynny, ac y byddai goblygiadau mawr i'r ffordd y cyflwynid gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a meddygol.

Er bod ewylllys da a dymuniad i gydweithio—mae llawer o siaradwyr wedi dweud hynny—mae'n deg dweud bod elfen o eiddigedd tiriogaethol sy'n golygu bod pobl yn amddiffynol o'u meysydd eu hunain ac yn amharod i weld unrhyw un yn ymyrryd ynddynt. Gall hyn, yn aml iawn, greu ffiniau diangen rhwng y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a'r sector meddygol. Felly, mae hwn yn fater o newid diwylliant, a chawsom rai enghreifftiau yn ymwneud â hynny. Byddwn yn cytuno â sylwadau Jonathan Morgan yn hyn o beth. Credaf fod yr hyn a glywsom am yr arferion yn Wrecsam yn galonogol, yn yr un modd â'r hyn a glywsom am Gaerffili, er bod arferion yno ychydig yn wahanol. Mae'r ardaloedd wedi ystyried eu sefyllfaoedd eu hunain ac wedi mynd i'r afael â'r problemau. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd Kirsty Williams, mae'n rhyfeddol mewn sawl ystyr nad yw'r arferion da hynny'n cael eu rhannu ac nad yw pobl yn dysgu oddi wrth ei gilydd.

Bûm yn feirniadol iawn o'r bwriad i sefydlu'r byrddau iechyd lleol, ac yr wyf yn dal i gredu mai'r syniad anghywir ar yr adeg anghywir oedd hwnnw a'i fod wedi costio gormod o lawer o arian. Fodd bynnag,

Mae llawer i'w ddysgu o'r adroddiad hwn a gobeithio bod y Llywodraeth yn edrych yn ffafriol arno.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: It will be clear to all from this debate that there is a lot of common ground among committee members on these issues and that there is consensus as regards the main recommendations. I will not repeat the arguments already outlined.

This is a complex area. At the outset, many of us thought that there were simple solutions to some of the problems. For example, perhaps the most talked-about problem is the need to transfer people from hospitals to more appropriate care settings. Many people have said that there is a simple solution to this, namely to amalgamate the various funding sources into one funding stream. Having considered the issue, it became quite clear that the solution was not that simple, and that this would have grave implications for the way in which social services, as well as medical services, are provided.

Although there is goodwill and a desire to work together—many speakers have referred to this—it is fair to say that there is an element of territorialism whereby people are protective of their own areas and do not want to see others interfering with them. This can often create unnecessary barriers between social services and the medical sector. Therefore, it is a matter of culture change, of which we have heard reference to some examples. I would agree with Jonathan Morgan's comments in this regard. His comments on practices in Wrexham were encouraging, as was the case with those in Caerphilly, despite the different approach taken there. These areas have considered their own circumstances and have tackled the problems. However, as Kirsty Williams said, in many respects, it is astonishing that good practice is not disseminated and that people are not learning from each other.

I was very critical of the proposal to establish local health boards, and I still believe that it was the wrong idea at the wrong time and that it cost far too much. However, as the local health boards and local authorities are

oherwydd bod tiriogaethau byrddau iechyd lleol ac awdurdodau lleol yn cyfateb, mae cyfle i gael mwy o gydweithredu, a byddai dyn yn gobeithio bod hynny'n digwydd. Mae angen sicrhau bod y systemau technoleg gwybodaeth yn cyd-fynd â'i gilydd, ond yr wyf fi, fel Kirsty Williams, yn dal i ddisgwyl sicrwydd ynghylch hynny.

Mae angen ystyried y systemau cyllido oherwydd bod pryderon nad ydynt yn dryloyw; mae angen iddynt fod yn gliriach. Rhaid sicrhau nad yw'r systemau cyllido unigol yn gweithio yn erbyn ei gilydd ond yn hytrach yn cyd-fynd â'i gilydd.

Rhaid sicrhau hefyd bod arferion rheoli yn cael eu sefydlu. Credaf fod cyfle i ddatblygu y rhain a sicrhau eu bod llawer yn fwy effeithiol.

Hoffwn gyfeirio yn olaf at rôl therapyddion, oherwydd dyma'r proffesiwn sy'n cwmpasu'r sector meddygol a'r sector gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn manteisio ar y cyfle i ddiogelu rôl therapyddion, gan sicrhau ein bod yn hyfforddi mwy ohonynt a bod lleoliadau ar eu cyfer er mwyn iddynt gyflawni eu proffesiwn. Mae perygl ein bod yn hyfforddi therapyddion ond nad ydynt yn cael eu penodi.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn agor drws ac yn rhoi cyfle i'r Gweinidog. Yn ddoeth, drwy arweiniad y Cadeirydd, yr ydym wedi penderfynu peidio â dilyn y llwybr o gynnig cynigion rhy benodol a fyddai'n clymu dwylo'r Gweinidog. Yn hytrach, mae'r adroddiad yn agor y drws iddo weithredu yn gadarnhaol yn y maes hwn.

David Melding: I thank all Members who have taken part in this interesting debate. I will try to respond to as many of the points as possible. David Davies, who has unfortunately left the Chamber, got us off to a typically vigorous start, which was delightfully tangential in places. He raised issues of some importance, which have an impact on the ability to keep people at home. He is certainly right to say that we can always work on hospital discharge. That needs to be as efficient as possible, so that people are in the most appropriate care

coterminous, there is greater opportunity for joint working, and one would hope that that is happening. We need to ensure that the information technology systems are compatible, but, like Kirsty Williams, I am still awaiting confirmation on that front.

We must consider the funding systems because there are concerns that they are not transparent; they need to be clearer. We must ensure that there is no conflict between funding systems and that they are compatible.

We must also ensure that management practices are established. I think that there is an opportunity to develop these and ensure that they become much more effective.

Finally, I wish to refer to the role of therapists, as this is the one profession that encompasses the medical and the social services sectors. I hope that the Minister will take this opportunity to safeguard the role of therapists, by ensuring that more are trained and that there are placements for them so that they are able to practise. There is a danger that we are training therapists without providing placements for them.

This report opens a door and gives the Minister an opportunity. Sensibly, with the Chair's guidance, we have decided not to go down the road of making overly specific recommendations that would tie the Minister's hands. Instead, the report opens the door for him to take positive action in this area.

David Melding: Diolchaf i bob Aelod a gymerodd ran yn y ddadl ddiddorol hon. Ceisiaf ymateb i gymaint o'r pwyntiau â phosibl. Yn anffodus, mae David Davies wedi gadael y Siambr, ond cychwynnodd y ddadl yn nodweddiadol o fywiog gan wro'n hyfryd o bryd i'w gilydd. Cododd faterion o gryn bwys, sy'n cael effaith ar y gallu i gadw pobl yn eu cartrefi. Yn sicr, mae'n iawn dweud y gallwn bob amser weithio ar weithdrefnau rhyddhau cleifion o'r ysbyty. Mae angen i hynny gael ei wneud mor effeithlon â phosibl, fel bod pobl yn cael y

setting. I think that we would all agree with that.

Val Lloyd, a most valuable member of the committee, referred to information and communications technology, and to 'Informing Healthcare' and 'Informing Social Care'. The committee is following that through with the Executive, and we will return to this issue in our scrutiny sessions; it is important. Val mentioned discharge planning, from her own personal view, and said that it has been on the agenda for more than 20 years. I think that we would all say amen to you, Val. We need to ensure that this is effective now and that we get it right.

Kirsty Williams emphasised that restructuring was not the answer. Witnesses gave us overwhelming evidence of that, and there is not much point conducting a review if you are going to fly in the face of comprehensive evidence. Those of us who may have been more open to the possibility of restructuring were perhaps dissuaded that that was the way forward.

There are many examples of good practice, as Kirsty mentioned. The key is to build on that and make it common practice throughout Wales. On performance management, there was no appetite for fines, but there was a real appetite for some form of recognition through reward schemes, perhaps.

4.20 p.m.

Jonathan Morgan made the point about disseminating good practice, as well as saying some kind things about me. That always makes me suspicious, but I assure you that it will not affect my performance. His visit to Blaenau Gwent's Assist Project obviously left a great impression on him. I did not visit that project, but I went to Llandeilo and was greatly impressed by the range of therapists there. Rhodri Glyn mentioned therapists and what they said about trying to deliver a unified service, and I agree with him; they are in a unique position to understand that situation.

lleoliad mwyaf priodol i gael gofal. Credaf y byddem oll yn cytuno â hynny.

Cyfeiriodd Val Lloyd, aelod gwerthfawr iawn o'r pwyllgor, at dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu, ac at 'Hysbysu Gofal Iechyd' a 'Hysbysu Gofal Cymdeithasol'. Mae'r pwyllgor yn trafod hynny gyda'r Weithrediaeth, a byddwn yn dychwelyd at y mater hwn yn ein sesiynau craffu; mae'n bwysig. Soniodd Val am gynllunio ar gyfer rhyddhau cleifion o'r ysbyty, o'i barn bersonol hi, a dywedodd ei fod wedi bod ar yr agenda am fwy nag 20 mlynedd. Credaf y byddai pob un ohonom yn cytuno â chi, Val. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod hyn yn effeithiol yn awr a'n bod yn ei gael yn iawn.

Pwysleisiodd Kirsty Williams nad ailstrwythuro oedd yr ateb. Rhoddodd tystion dystiolaeth ddiwrthdro o hynny inni, ac nid oes llawer o ddiben cynnal adolygiad os ydych yn mynd yn groes i dystiolaeth gynhwysfawr. Cafodd y rhai ohonom a fyddai wedi bod yn fwy agored efallai i'r posibilrwydd o ailstrwythuro ein darbwyllo efallai nad dyna oedd y ffordd ymlaen.

Ceir sawl enghraifft o arferion da, fel y soniodd Kirsty. Yr allwedd yw adeiladu ar hynny a'i wneud yn arfer cyffredin ledled Cymru. O ran rheoli perfformiad, nid oedd unrhyw awydd am ddirwyon, ond yr oedd awydd gwirioneddol am ryw fath o gydnabyddiaeth drwy gynlluniau gwobrwyo, efallai.

Gwnaeth Jonathan Morgan y pwynt ynghylch lledaenu arferion da, yn ogystal â dweud rhai pethau caredig amdanaf. Mae hynny'n fy ngwneud yn ddrwgdybus bob amser, ond fe'ch sicrhaf na fydd yn effeithio ar fy mherfformiad. Creodd ei ymweliad â Phrosiect Cymorth Blaenau Gwent argraff fawr arno, mae'n amlwg. Nid ymwelais â'r prosiect hwnnw, ond euthum i Llandeilo a chreodd yr amrywiaeth o therapyddion yno argraff fawr arnaf. Soniodd Rhodri Glyn am therapyddion a'r hyn a ddywedasant am geisio darparu gwasanaeth unedig, a chytunaf ag ef; maent mewn sefyllfa unigryw i ddeall y sefyllfa honno.

Jonathan also mentioned the need to maintain independence, which would underline all that we are about in seeking to provide effective health and social care. Jonathan also mentioned—and, Deputy Presiding Officer, you may be interested in this—that the committee took evidence in Wrexham. It was difficult, as we are in practically the most southerly point in Wales, but the committee was determined to get up to north Wales to receive evidence on at least one occasion, and we did that in Wrexham. I must say that the quality of the evidence that we heard there was exceptional. All of us who made the trip were glad that we had gone.

Rhodri Glyn also commended the consensus that emerged in the committee. To those who have commended my work as Chair, I say that the way that committee members worked was excellent, and that made my job easy. We have agreed on the main recommendations and it now falls to the Welsh Assembly Government to take them on board, because they have been agreed by consensus. Rhodri Glyn also said that we did not find magic answers—they are not in the report. This matter needs application, hard work, toil and continued interest, and we look forward to the Welsh Assembly Government's response in due course.

Soniodd Jonathan hefyd am yr angen i gynnal annibyniaeth, a fyddai'n ategu'r cyfan yr ydym yn ceisio ei wneud i ddarparu iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol effeithiol. Soniodd Jonathan hefyd—ac efallai y bydd gennych chi, Ddirprwy Lywydd, ddiddordeb yn hyn—fod y pwyllgor wedi cymryd tystiolaeth yn Wrecsam. Yr oedd yn anodd, gan ein bod fwy neu lai yn y man mwyaf deheuol yng Nghymru, ond yr oedd y pwyllgor yn benderfynol o fynd i'r Gogledd i gael tystiolaeth ar un achlysur o leiaf, a gwnaethom hynny yn Wrecsam. Rhaid imi ddweud bod ansawdd y dystiolaeth a glywsom yno yn eithriadol. Yr oedd pob un ohonom a ymwelodd â'r lle yn falch ein bod wedi mynd yno.

Canmolodd Rhodri Glyn hefyd y consensws a ddaeth i'r amlwg yn y pwyllgor. I'r rhai sydd wedi canmol fy ngwaith fel Cadeirydd, dywedaf fod aelodau'r pwyllgor wedi gwneud gwaith rhagorol, ac yr oedd hynny'n gwneud fy ngwaith i yn hawdd. Yr ydym wedi cytuno ar y prif argymhellion a chyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn awr yw gweithredu arnynt, oherwydd cytunwyd arnynt drwy gonsensws. Dywedodd Rhodri Glyn hefyd na ddaethom o hyd i atebion parod—nid ydynt yn yr adroddiad. Mae angen ymrwymiad, gwaith caled, ymdrech a diddordeb parhaol, ac edrychwn ymlaen at gael ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru maes o law.

*Cynnig (NDM2337): O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2337): For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, David
Davies, Janet
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John

Gwyther, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Pwy sy'n Rhedeg y Gwasanaeth Iechyd yng Nghymru? Who Runs the Health Service in Wales?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Before I call Ieuan Wyn Jones to speak, I ask Members who wish to leave the Chamber to do so quietly.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cyn imi alw ar Ieuan Wyn Jones i siarad, gofynnaf i Aelodau sydd am adael y Siambr wneud hynny'n dawel.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: O gofio'r setliad datganoli, rhaid ystyried pam mae angen gofyn y cwestiwn yr wyf wedi ei ddewis yn deitl i'r ddadl fer. Yr wyf wedi cael cais gan Jonathan Morgan, Kirsty Williams, a Rhodri Glyn Thomas i gyfrannu, ac yr wyf wedi caniatáu hynny, os bydd digon o amser iddynt wneud hynny. Yr wyf yn gobeithio cwblhau'r hyn yr wyf am ei ddweud o fewn 10 i 11 munud.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Given the devolution settlement, we must consider why we need to ask the question that I have chosen as the title for the short debate. Jonathan Morgan, Kirsty Williams and Rhodri Glyn Thomas have asked to contribute and I have agreed to that, if there is enough time for them to do so. I hope to finish what I have to say within 10 to 11 minutes.

Dywed y Papur Gwyn, 'Llais dros Gymru', a gyhoeddodd y Llywodraeth cyn refferendwm 1997, y byddai gan y Cynulliad gyfrifoldeb dros y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru ac am iechyd pobl Cymru. Yr oedd hynny'n ddatganiad diamwys. Yr oedd disgwyl, felly, unwaith y sefydlwyd y Cynulliad, mai Llywodraeth Cymru fyddai'n gyfrifol am redeg y gwasanaeth iechyd a'i gyllido, o fewn cyfyngiadau bloc Cymru.

The White Paper, 'A Voice for Wales', which the Government published prior to the 1997 referendum, stated that the Assembly would have responsibility for the national health service in Wales and for the health of the people of Wales. That was an unequivocal statement. It was expected, therefore, once the Assembly was established, that the Government of Wales would be responsible for running the health

service and for funding it, within the confines of the Welsh block.

Given that background, imagine our surprise at being told in the run-up to a UK general election that the Assembly Government has been ordered to copy England's health service. The headline in the newspaper was:

'Hain orders Wales to copy England's health service'.

The article goes on to say that this order came about not because Labour MPs are worried about the long waits that patients are experiencing, but because

'the dire state of the nation's health service will cost Labour seats in the looming general election'.

Therefore, the order did not come about in the interests of patients, but in the interests of Labour MPs in marginal seats. This really is playing politics with people's lives. It prompts the inevitable question, 'Who is running this show; is it Hain or is it Morgan?' Peter Hain asks Rhodri Morgan to jump, and Rhodri, of course, asks, 'How high, Peter?'

This not only concerns one article. I challenged Rhodri Morgan on this issue yesterday, and, of course, he denied anything of the sort. However, an hour and a half earlier, his boss in London, Tony Blair, was confirming that Wales would follow England's policies on health. He said that Rhodri Morgan would make an announcement within the next few days and was planning to adopt some of those changes in reform programmes already in place in England. Rhodri Morgan refuses to comment on these matters, but Peter Hain and Tony Blair are both forthcoming. What is that, other than London calling the shots? How does Tony Blair know what is going to be said unless he is running the show?

Yr hyn y mae'n rhaid inni ofyn i'n hunain yw sut y daethom i fod yn y stâd hwn. Gadewch inni edrych ar record y Llywodraeth.

O gofio'r cefndir hwnnw, dychmygwch ein syndod o glywed, yn y cyfnod yn arwain at etholiad cyffredinol yn y DU, fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cael ei gorchymyn i efelychu gwasanaeth iechyd Lloegr. Y pennawd yn y papur newydd oedd:

Mae Hain yn gorchymyn Cymru i efelychu gwasanaeth iechyd Lloegr.

Mae'r erthygl yn mynd yn ei flaen i ddweud bod y gorchymyn hwn wedi dod, nid am fod ASau Llafur yn gofidio am yr amser hir y mae'n rhaid i gleifion aros, ond oherwydd

bydd cyflwr gwarthus gwasanaeth iechyd y wlad yn golygu y bydd Llafur yn colli seddau yn yr etholiad cyffredinol sydd ar ddod.

Felly, ni ddaeth y gorchymyn er budd cleifion, ond er budd ASau Llafur mewn seddau ymylol. Chwarae gwleidyddiaeth â bywydau pobl yw hyn. Mae'n arwain at y cwestiwn anochel, 'Pwy sy'n rhedeg y sioe hon; ai Hain neu Morgan?' Mae Peter Hain yn gofyn i Rhodri Morgan neidio, ac mae Rhodri, wrth gwrs, yn gofyn, 'Pa mor uchel, Peter?'

Nid oes a wnelo hyn ag un erthygl yn unig. Heriais Rhodri Morgan ar y mater hwn ddoe, ac, wrth gwrs, gwadodd unrhyw beth o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, awr a hanner yn gynharach, yr oedd ei bennaeth yn Llundain, Tony Blair, yn cadarnhau y byddai Cymru yn dilyn polisiau Lloegr ar iechyd. Dywedodd y byddai Rhodri Morgan yn gwneud cyhoeddiad o fewn yr ychydig ddyddiau nesaf a'i fod yn bwriadu mabwysiadu rhai o'r newidiadau hynny mewn rhaglenni diwygio sydd eisoes ar waith yn Lloegr. Mae Rhodri Morgan yn gwrthod rhoi sylwadau ar y materion hyn, ond mae Peter Hain a Tony Blair ill dau yn barod i siarad. Beth yw hynny, ond Llundain yn gwneud y penderfyniadau? Sut mae Tony Blair yn gwybod beth fydd yn cael ei ddweud oni bai mai ef sy'n rhedeg y sioe?

We must ask ourselves how we came to be in such a state. Let us take a look at the Government's record.

Y mae 99.9 y cant o gleifion allanol yn Lloegr—cyn agosed ag y medrwch fod i 100 y cant—yn cael eu gweld o fewn pum mis. Dim ond 56 y cant o gleifion Cymru sydd yn cael eu gweld o fewn chwe mis.

Os edrychwch ar driniaeth orthopedig, gwelwch, fel y dywedais wrth y Gweinidog heddiw, tra bod 117 o gleifion yn disgwyl mwy na phum mis i weld arbenigwr mewn ysbyty yn Lloegr, mae bron i 30,000 yn disgwyl yng Nghymru. Ar sail poblogaeth, felly, nid 117 ddylai fod yn disgwyl yn Lloegr, ond 0.5 miliwn. Dyna raddfa'r broblem a wyneba'r Llywodraeth.

Yng nghyd-destun triniaethau orthopedig eto, os ydych yn disgwyl am driniaeth fel claf mewnol, mae 15 o bobl yn disgwyl mwy na 12 mis yn Lloegr. Yng Nghymru, 2,806 yw'r ffigur cyfatebol. Ar sail poblogaeth, nid 15 ddylai fod yn disgwyl yn Lloegr, ond 50,000.

It does not really matter which speciality you look at—apart from cataract services—Wales is well behind England. Let us look at more out-patient figures, some of which I have quoted to the Minister today. There are 138 people waiting more than five months for ear, nose and throat treatment in England, and 9,813 waiting more than six months in Wales. On neurosurgery, the figure is 13 in England, and 1,165 in Wales. On general surgery, it is 168 in England, and 6,472 in Wales. Most of these waiting lists are represented by three areas in Wales: Swansea, Cardiff and Newport.

Y mae'r problemau hyn yn rhai enfawr, a rhaid inni wneud rhywbeth yn eu cylch. Egluraf mewn ychydig yr hyn y teimlaf y dylid ei wneud. I wneud pethau'n waeth i'r Blaid Lafur, nid yw wedi cadw ei haddewidion ei hun, hyd yn oed. Dywedodd y Gweinidog wrthym heddiw fod gan Lafur addewidion, a sôn am etholiad San Steffan ydoedd, ac am addewidion i ddod â'r rhestrau aros i lawr. Fodd bynnag, pan ddaeth y Llywodraeth hon i rym yn 1999, yr oedd ganddi addewidion. Yr addewid cyntaf oedd na fyddai neb yn disgwyl mwy na chwe mis

In England, 99.9 per cent of out-patients—as close as you can possibly get to 100 per cent—are seen within five months. Only 56 per cent of Welsh out-patients are seen within six months.

If you look at orthopaedics, you will see that, as I said to the Minister today, while there are 117 patients waiting more than five months to see a specialist in hospitals in England, there are almost 30,000 waiting in Wales. On a per capita basis, the figure for England should not be 117, but 0.5 million. That is the scale of the problem facing this Government.

Again on orthopaedic services, if you are waiting for in-patient treatment, 15 people are waiting more than 12 months in England. In Wales, that figure is 2,806. On a per capita basis, that figure for England should not be 15, but 50,000.

A dweud y gwir, nid oes ots pa arbenigedd yr ydych yn ei ystyried—ar wahân i wasanaethau cataract—mae Cymru ymhell ar ei hôl hi o gymharu â Lloegr. Gadewch inni edrych ar fwy o ffigurau cleifion allanol, y dyfynnais rai ohonynt i'r Gweinidog heddiw. Mae 138 o bobl yn aros mwy na phum mis am driniaeth clust, trwyn a gwddf yn Lloegr, a 9,813 yn aros mwy na chwe mis yng Nghymru. O ran niwrolawdriniaeth, mae'r ffigur yn 13 yn Lloegr, ac yn 1,165 yng Nghymru. O ran llawdriniaeth gyffredinol, mae'n 168 yn Lloegr, ac yn 6,472 yng Nghymru. Cynrychiolir y rhan fwyaf o'r rhestrau aros hyn gan dair ardal yng Nghymru: Abertawe, Caerdydd a Chasnewydd.

These problems are huge, and we must do something to address them. I will explain in a moment what I think should be done. To make matters worse for Labour, it has not even kept its own promises. The Minister told us today that Labour has made pledges, but he was referring to the Westminster election, and to pledges to bring down waiting lists. However, when this Government came to power in 1999, it had its own pledges. The first was that no-one would wait more than six months for an out-patient appointment. That was said in May

am apwyntiad allanol. Dywedwyd hynny ym mis Mai 1999, ond yr ydym bellach bron ym mis Mai 2005—chwe blynedd yn ddiweddarach. Mae 74,000 o bobl yn disgwyl mwy na chwe mis yng Nghymru; dyna'r addewid hwnnw wedi ei chwalu'n rhacs. Dywedwyd hefyd na fyddai neb yn aros mwy na 18 mis am driniaeth fewnol; chwe blynedd yn ddiweddarach, mae mwy na 6,000 o bobl yn parhau i aros.

Yr wyf wedi rhestru'r ffigurau moel, ond rhaid cofio eu bod yn cynrychioli pobl, sydd, yn aml, yn dioddef mewn poen ac am amser hir. Gwyddom i gyd am enghreifftiau felly yn ein hetholaethau. Mae gennym broblem yn y Gogledd yn ysbyty Gobowen. Mae rhai o'm hetholwyr yn gorfod disgwyl tair blynedd ar ôl gweld meddyg teulu cyn cael triniaeth ysbyty, gan wybod bod cleifion o Loegr, yn yr un ysbyty, ddim ond wedi disgwyl naw mis.

4.30 p.m.

Heddiw, mae 301,000 claf ar restrau aros yng Nghymru, a bydd yn agos at ei hanner yn disgwyl dros chwe mis cyn cael apwyntiad a chwe mis wedyn cyn cael triniaeth. Mae'r mwyafrif llethol o gleifion yn aros yn llawer hwy nag y dylent. Mae hynny'n sgandal, a rhaid inni aiddweud hynny bob tro.

What is the Government's response to the crisis? Time after time, it panics and resorts to firefighting measures, throwing money at the problem in the hope that that will solve it, but it never does.

The Auditor General for Wales warned this Government that short-term initiatives, costing tens of millions of pounds, are poor value for money. He said in his report that

'the widespread use of waiting time initiatives using non-recurrent funding—treating over 40,000 patients at a cost of £36 million in 2002-03 and 2003-04—has provided neither good value for money nor sustainable reductions in waiting times.'

Therefore, the Auditor General for Wales

1999, but it is almost May 2005—six years later. There are 74,000 people in Wales waiting for more than six months; that pledge has therefore been smashed to smithereens. Labour also said that no-one would wait more than 18 months for in-patient treatment; six years later, over 6,000 people are still waiting.

I have listed the bare statistics, but we must remember that they represent people who are often in pain for a long time. We all know of such examples in our constituencies. In north Wales, we have a problem in Gobowen hospital. Some of my constituents have to wait three years from the time that they see their GP to the time that they receive hospital treatment, and they know that there are patients from England in the same hospital who only had to wait nine months.

Today, 301,000 patients are on waiting lists in Wales, and almost half of those will wait over six months for an appointment and another six months for treatment. The vast majority of patients wait far longer than they should have to. That is a scandal, and that needs to be emphasised time and again.

Beth yw ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r argyfwng? Dro ar ôl tro, mae'n ymateb yn fyrbwyll ac yn troi at fesurau i ddelio â phroblemau wrth iddynt godi, gan daflu arian at y broblem yn y gobaith y bydd hynny'n ei datrys, ond nid yw byth yn gwneud.

Rhybuddiodd Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru y Llywodraeth hon fod mentrau byrdymor, sy'n costio degau ar filiynau o bunnoedd, yn werth gwael am arian. Dywedodd yn ei adroddiad:

'nid yw'r defnydd eang o fentrau amseroedd aros sy'n defnyddio cyllid achlysurol—cafodd dros 40,000 o gleifion eu trin am gost o £36 miliwn yn 2002-03 a 2003-04—wedi darparu naill ai gwerth am arian nac ostyngiadau cynaliadwy mewn amseroedd aros.'

Felly, dywed Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru

says that that £36 million was wasted. Does this Government listen? Of course it does not; there is another election on the way, so here comes another £32 million to reduce waiting lists next year. Will this money be recurring? Will it be followed up? No. The Finance Minister, standing before the Assembly, was unable to commit the Government to providing this money in subsequent years. What good is it to the trusts and the local health boards to have this money injected without there being a strategy for reducing waiting lists, and when, at the end of the period, we have no idea at all whether it will assist? You do not solve one problem by creating another.

Yr oedd adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn ddamniol. Dywedodd, er bod y gwariant ar ieched wedi dyblu yng Nghymru dros 10 mlynedd, ac er ein bod yn gwario mwy o arian y pen nag a werir y pen yn Lloegr a bod gennym fwy o welyau y pen nag sydd yn Lloegr, mae'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru llawer yn waeth.

Gwyddom beth yw rhwystredigaethau Aelodau Seneddol Llafur; maent yn rhwystredigaethau i ni i gyd, gan gynnwys cleifion.

What needs to be done? It is not to be bullied by Peter Hain, or panicked into spending £32 million; we need a comprehensive strategy to reduce waiting lists. Introduce treatment centres and walk-in centres, protect your elective surgery, reduce bedblocking by increasing the fees of residential and nursing homes, and improve the working conditions of home carers. That is what should be done.

This Government has a poor record on health. It has now been bullied by London for electoral purposes, and that leaves it discredited and weaker. Friends, Wales deserves much better than this.

Jonathan Morgan: In bringing this debate before us, the leader of the opposition asks a straightforward question, the answer to which is also straightforward.

fod y £36 miliwn hwnnw wedi cael ei wastraffu. A yw'r Llywodraeth hon yn gwranddo? Wrth gwrs nad ydyw; mae etholiad arall ar y gweill, felly dyma £32 miliwn arall i leihau rhestrau aros y flwyddyn nesaf. A gaiff yr arian hwn ei roi yn rheolaidd? A fydd y swm hwn yn cael ei roi eto? Na fydd. Nid oedd y Gweinidog Cyllid, yn sefyll gerbron y Cynulliad, yn gallu ymrwymo'r Llywodraeth i ddarparu'r arian hwn ar gyfer blynyddoedd dilynol. Beth yw diben rhoi'r arian hwn i ymddiriedolaethau a byrddau ieched lleol heb gael strategaeth ar gyfer lleihau rhestrau aros, a phan nad oes syniad gennym o gwbl a fydd yn helpu, ar ddiwedd y cyfnod? Nid ydych yn datrys un broblem drwy greu un arall.

The Auditor General's report was damning. It said that, despite the fact that health spending had doubled in Wales over 10 years, and that we spend more per head on health than is spent in England, and have more beds per head than is the case in England, the situation in Wales is much worse.

We know of the frustrations of Labour Members of Parliament; they are frustrations that we all share, including patients.

Beth sydd angen ei wneud? Nid cael ein bwlio gan Peter Hain, na rhuthro i wario £32 miliwn; mae angen strategaeth gynhwysfawr arnom i leihau rhestrau aros. Cyflwynwch ganolfannau triniaeth a chanolfannau galw i mewn, diogelwch eich llawdriniaethau dewisol, ceisiwch leihau'r achosion o flocio gwelyau drwy gynyddu ffioedd cartrefi preswyl a chartrefi nyrsio, a gwella amodau gwaith gofalwyr cartref. Dyna'r hyn y dylid ei wneud.

Mae gan y Llywodraeth hon record wael ar ieched. Bellach, cafodd ei bwlio gan Lundain at ddibenion etholiadol, ac mae hynny'n dwyn anfri arni ac yn ei gwneud yn anhygred ac yn wannach. Gyfeillion, mae Cymru'n haeddu llawer gwell na hyn.

Jonathan Morgan: Wrth ddod â'r ddadl hon ger ein bron, mae arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn gofyn cwestiwn syml, ac mae'r ateb iddo yn syml hefyd.

We obviously have rather a fluid arrangement in Wales. Jane Hutt was the first Minister of the health service following devolution, that office was transferred to Brian Gibbons, and now, clearly, it has temporarily been transferred to Peter Hain until Friday 6 May, when I assume that it will revert back to Brian Gibbons, who will remain in charge until the next Assembly elections.

The public in Wales will take a dim view of what is happening. The public knows that it has been failed on health and that Peter Hain and the Labour Party are starting to panic about the health service, because of its effect on marginal constituencies in Wales. Patients are getting a raw deal and they cannot be bribed by any announcement that may be made before the Easter recess or before the Labour Party conference next week. The public is not daft; it knows that, since devolution, the health service in Wales has got worse, not better, and that the situation across the border is markedly improved compared with the situation here. You and your party will pay dearly for this at the ballot box.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae dau bwynt sylfaenol fan hyn. Os bydd newid mawr yn y polisi a chyhoeddiad pwysig yr wythnos nesaf, gobeithiaf y gallwch roi gwarant inni y prynhawn yma y gwneir y datganiad hwnnw yn y Siambr, ac na fyddwch yn disgwyl tan ddydd Iau nesaf a thoriad y Pasg i ruthro'r datganiad drwodd a pheidio â chaniatáu dadlgyhoeddus ar hyn. Mae'r ail beth y byddwch yn gorfod ei wynebu, Weinidog, yn gwestiwn sylfaenol. Os ydych yn awr am fabwysiadu'r math o bolisiau sydd wedi bod yn weithredol yn Lloegr am y pum mlynedd a hanner diwethaf, a chydnabod mai felly mae ymdrin â rhestrau aros ac amserau aros, beth mae Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru wedi bod yn ei wneud am y pum mlynedd a hanner diwethaf? A ydych am gyfaddef yn awr bod eich polisiau am y pum mlynedd a hanner diwethaf wedi bod yn fethiant llwyr, a'ch bod yn awr yn gorfod mynd yn ôl i dderbyn yr hyn a wnaethpwyd yn Lloegr flynyddoedd lawer yn ôl?

Kirsty Williams: Ieuan is right to ask who is

Mae gennym drefniant cyfnewidiol braidd yng Nghymru. Jane Hutt oedd Gweinidog cyntaf y gwasanaeth iechyd yn dilyn datganoli, trosglwyddwyd y swyddogaeth honno i Brian Gibbons, a, bellach, mae'n amlwg ei bod wedi cael ei throsglwyddo dros dro i Peter Hain tan ddydd Gwener 6 Mai, pan gaiff ei throsglwyddo, fe dybiaf, yn ôl i Brian Gibbons, a fydd yn parhau i fod yn gyfrifol tan etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad.

Ni fydd gan y cyhoedd yng Nghymru fawr o feddwl o'r hyn sy'n digwydd. Gwyr y cyhoedd fod y Llywodraeth wedi methu o ran iechyd a bod Peter Hain a'r Blaid Lafur yn dechrau dychryn ynglŷn â'r gwasanaeth iechyd, oherwydd ei effaith ar etholaethau ymylol yng Nghymru. Mae cleifion yn cael cam ac ni ellir eu prynu drwy unrhyw gyhoeddiad a wneir efallai cyn toriad y Pasg neu cyn gynhadledd y Blaid Lafur yr wythnos nesaf. Nid yw'r cyhoedd yn wirion; fe w'yr fod y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru, ers datganoli, wedi gwaethygu, nid gwella, a bod y sefyllfa yn Lloegr gryn dipyn yn well o'i chymharu â'r sefyllfa yma. Byddwch chi a'ch plaid yn talu'n hallt am hyn yn y blwch pleidleisio.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: There are two fundamental points here. If there is to be a significant change in the policy and an important announcement next week, I hope that you will give us a guarantee that that announcement will be made in the Chamber, and that you will not wait until next Thursday and the Easter recess to rush through this statement and deny us a public debate on it. The second thing that you will have to face, Minister, is a fundamental question. If you are now going to adopt the kind of policies that have been in place in England over the last five and a half years, and recognise that that is how you should tackle waiting times and waiting lists, what has the Welsh Labour Government been doing over the last five and a half years? Are you going to admit now that your policies for the last five and a half years have been an abject failure, and that you must now backtrack and adopt what was done in England many years ago?

Kirsty Williams: Mae Ieuan yn iawn i ofyn

running the health service in Wales. Whatever one thinks of Labour's record on health in the Assembly—and the patients of Wales who find themselves on waiting lists know what that record is, and one can make criticisms of it—the Labour Party should at least have had the courage of its own conviction, and been sure of the policy it was pursuing. The actions over the last week, and, I suspect, the actions of the Minister for Health and Social Services next week, demonstrate that it does not have the courage of its convictions and that it is willing to be bounced into policy changes by London. That is not only bad news for patients in Wales, it is bad news for the devolution project. You have let the patients of Wales down, and now you intend to let this institution and the devolution settlement down. If you think it will save you in Cardiff Central, the voters know better.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): There is an Irish folk singer called Christy Moore, and one of his greatest hits is 'Don't forget your shovel when you are going off to work'. Clearly, it is a big favourite of the leader of the opposition, who has taken the message of not forgetting his shovel too much to heart. Today's debate is about playtime politics and not about the health service and what matters to the people of Wales. Taking lessons on leadership from Plaid Cymru is like asking Napoleon if he knows a quick way to Moscow and back, and, as far as running things go, there are clear lessons to be learned from Plaid Cymru. Its latest gimmick, the 'vote once, get three leaders offer' will shortly be put to the electorate, and I am sure that it will not mistake quantity for quality. The question of who is in charge here remains even more of a mystery. Where was the leader of the Plaid Cymru when the party launched its pre-election manifesto? Was he still down his hole working hard with his shovel? Plaid Cymru's offer is not of three musketeers to lead Wales, but, rather, it is like the four Marx brothers, with Adam Price as Groucho, always looking to find a cloud no matter how sunny the day.

pwysu sy'n rhedeg y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. Beth bynnag yw'r farn ar record Llafur ar iechyd yn y Cynulliad—ac fe wŷr y cleifion yng Nghymru sydd ar y rhestrau aros beth yw'r record honno, a gallwch ei beirniadu—dylai'r Blaid Lafur o leiaf fod wedi bod yn barod i sefyll dros ei hegwyddorion, a bod yn sicr o'r polisi yr oedd yn ei ddilyn. Dengys y gweithredoedd yn ystod yr wythnos diwethaf, a gweithredoedd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yr wythnos nesaf, fe dybiaf, nad yw'n barod i sefyll dros ei hegwyddorion a'i bod yn fodlon cael ei gorfodi gan Lundain i wneud newidiadau i'r polisi. Mae hynny'n newyddion gwael nid yn unig i gleifion yng Nghymru, mae'n newyddion gwael i'r prosiect datganoli. Yr ydych wedi siomi cleifion Cymru, a bellach yr ydych yn bwriadu siomi'r sefydliad hwn a'r setliad datganoli. Os credwch y bydd yn eich arbed yng Nghanol Caerdydd, gŵyr y pleidleiswyr yn well.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Mae canwr gwerin Gwyddelig o'r enw Christy Moore, ac un o'i ganeuon enwocaf yw 'Don't forget your shovel when you are going off to work'. Yn amlwg, mae'n un o ffefrynnau arweinydd yr wrthblaid, sydd wedi derbyn y neges hon ormod o ddifrif. Mae a wnelo'r ddadl heddiw â chwarae gwleidyddiaeth ac nid oes a wnelo â'r gwasanaeth iechyd na'r hyn sydd o bwys i bobl Cymru. Mae cymryd gwersi ar arweinyddiaeth gan Blaid Cymru fel gofyn i Napoleon a yw'n gwybod am ffordd gyflym yn ôl ac ymlaen i Foscow, ac, o ran bod yn gyfrifol am bethau, mae gwersi amlwg i'w dysgu gan Blaid Cymru. Cyn bo hir, caiff ei gimig diweddaraf ei gyflwyno i'r etholwyr, sef os pleidleisiwch unwaith, fe gewch dri arweinydd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr na fyddant yn camgymryd nifer am ansawdd. Mae'r cwestiwn o bwy sy'n rheoli yma hyd yn oed yn fwy o ddirgelwch. Ble oedd arweinydd Plaid Cymru pan lansiodd y blaid ei manifestio cyn yr etholiad? A oedd i lawr yn y twll o hyd yn gweithio'n galed gyda'i raw? Nid yw cynnig Plaid Cymru yn golygu cael tri mysgedwr i arwain Cymru, ond yn hytrach, mae fel cael y pedwar brawd Marx, gydag Adam Price fel Groucho, bob amser yn chwilio am gwmwl waeth pa mor braf yw hi.

Turning to the specifics of health policy, the leadership lessons of Plaid Cymru do not give us much light. Time after time in the Chamber, we have heard about the evils of the private sector from Plaid Cymru. However hard it was to find any other single word of wisdom, this was a consistent theme. Following its recent conference, what is its policy now? Sadly, when the smoke of battle cleared, the only thing left standing in the Plaid Cymru corral was a signpost pointing to some obscure committee room where the policy was still being sorted out. We are still waiting for the white smoke with all the enthusiasm of a leaf of lettuce waiting for a snail, because we know that there is no policy and that Plaid Cymru has no solutions.

What is the reality? I apologise for being predictable and for stating the obvious, but the health services in Wales are run by the Welsh Assembly Government and by myself as Minister—[*Interruption.*] Well, if Plaid Cymru's research department has been so well resourced that the best it can do is quote from the *Western Mail*, it is a pretty dull day. What has Welsh Labour achieved?

4.40 p.m.

We have seen the budget double. There has been an increased budget for buildings and equipment, which will triple over the next three years. We have commissioned, published and implemented a radical programme of reform to tackle the inverse care law and to ensure that the healthcare resources go where the need is greatest. We have created a new public health service in Wales, linked to the health inequalities fund, which is a one-off in the UK. There are 5,000 more nurses, waiting lists have been cut from 6,000 to 600 in one year, there has been a reduction in delayed transfers of care in a 12-month period, and every patient who is waiting 12 months will have an offer of treatment.

That is how the health service is being run in Wales: in a way that is authentically meeting a Welsh agenda—it is made in Wales and being put into practice in Wales. It simply is not possible to transpose the English NHS

Gan droi at fanylion y polisi iechyd, nid yw gwersi arweinyddiaeth Plaid Cymru yn taflu llawer o oleuni ar y polisi. Clywsom dro ar ôl tro yn y Siambr am ddrygau'r sector preifat gan Plaid Cymru. Waeth pa mor anodd ydoedd i ddod o hyd i unrhyw air arall o ddoethineb, yr oedd hon yn thema gyson. Yn dilyn ei chynhadledd ddiweddar, beth yw ei pholisi erbyn hyn? Yn anffodus, ar ôl i bethau dawelu, yr unig beth a oedd yn weddill o du Plaid Cymru oedd arwydd yn dangos y ffordd i ryw ystafell bwyllgora dywyll lle yr oedd y polisi yn dal i gael ei lunio. Yr ydym yn dal i aros yn eiddgar i glywed ei fod wedi ei gwblhau, mor eiddgar â deilen letys sy'n aros am falwoden oherwydd gwyddom nad oes unrhyw bolisi ac nad oes gan Plaid Cymru unrhyw atebion.

Beth yw'r gwirionedd? Ymddiheuraf am fod yn Siôn 'run shwt ac am fynegi'r hyn sy'n amlwg, ond caiff y gwasanaethau iechyd yng Nghymru eu rhedeg gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a gennyf fi fy hun fel Gweinidog—[*Torri ar draws.*] Wel, os mai'r gorau y gall adran ymchwil Plaid Cymru ei wneud yw dyfynnu o'r *Western Mail*, mae'n ddiwrnod eithaf diflas. Beth mae Llafur Cymru wedi ei chyflawni?

Yr ydym wedi gweld y gyllideb yn dyblu. Bu cynnydd yn y gyllideb ar gyfer adeiladau ac offer, a fydd yn treblu dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Yr ydym wedi comisiynu, cyhoeddi a gweithredu rhaglen ddiwygio radical i fynd i'r afael â'r gyfraith gofal gwrthgyfartal ac i sicrhau bod yr adnoddau gofal iechyd yn mynd i lle mae'r angen mwyaf. Yr ydym wedi creu gwasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus newydd yng Nghymru, sy'n gysylltiedig â'r gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd, sef yr unig un o'i bath yn y DU. Mae 5,000 yn fwy o nyrsys, cwtogwyd rhestrau aros o 6,000 i 600 mewn blwyddyn, bu lleihad yn nifer yr achosion o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal mewn cyfnod o 12 mis, a chynigir triniaeth i bob claf sy'n aros 12 mis.

Dyna sut y mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn cael ei redeg yng Nghymru: mewn ffordd sy'n cyflawni agenda Gymreig mewn ffordd ddilys—caiff ei gwneud yng Nghymru a'i rhoi ar waith yng Nghymru. Nid yw'n bosibl

into Wales, because the nature of the challenge is different. Having said that, we can learn a great deal from England, Scotland and Northern Ireland. As we heard in the previous debate, we can also learn a great deal from work in Wales and we should be willing to learn from it. We must learn and extend best practice throughout the health and social care system in Wales. In that way, by addressing Welsh problems in Wales, we will deliver genuine Welsh solutions to our health service and our patients. Labour in Government created the health service, it delivered devolution and it will deliver healthcare for people in Wales.

trosglwyddo GIG Lloegr i Gymru, oherwydd mae natur yr her yn wahanol. Wedi dweud hynny, gallwn ddysgu llawer iawn o Loegr, yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon. Fel y clywsom yn y ddadl flaenorol, gallwn hefyd ddysgu llawer iawn o'r gwaith a wneir yng Nghymru a dylem fod yn barod i ddysgu ohono. Rhaid inni ddysgu ac estyn arferion gorau drwy'r system iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Yn y ffordd honno, drwy fynd i'r afael â phroblemau Cymreig yng Nghymru, deunw o hyd i atebion gwirioneddol Gymreig ar gyfer ein gwasanaeth iechyd a'n cleifion. Creodd Llywodraeth y Blaid Lafur y gwasanaeth iechyd, sicrhodd ddatganoli a bydd yn darparu gofal iechyd i bobl yng Nghymru.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That concludes today's proceedings.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 4.42 p.m.
The meeting ended at 4.42 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur – Labour)
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)

Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)