



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Mercher 9 Gorffennaf 2003

Wednesday 9 July 2003

Cynnwys Contents

- 4 Anerchiad gan y Gwir Anrhydeddus Helen Clark AS, Prif Weinidog Seland Newydd
Address by the Right Honourable Helen Clark MP, Prime Minister of New Zealand
- 7 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid
Questions to the Finance Minister
- 18 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad
Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside
- 27 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order
- 29 Datganiad ar Adroddiad Wanless
Statement on the Wanless Report
- 48 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order
- 49 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2003 a
Rheoliadau Deddf Addysg 2002 (Darpariaethau Trosiannol a Diwygiadau Canlyniadol)
(Cymru) 2003
Approval of the Education Act 2002 (Commencement No. 2) (Wales) Order 2003
and the Education Act 2002 (Transitional Provisions and Consequential Amendments)
(Wales) Regulations 2003
- 56 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Cynlluniau Trefniadaeth Ysgolion) (Cymru) 2003
Approval of the Education (School Organisation Plans) (Wales) Regulations 2003
- 63 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Lles Anifeiliaid a Ffermir (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2003
Approval of the Welfare of Farmed Animals (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2003
- 68 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Ychwanegion Bwyd (Cymru) 2003
Approval of the Food Supplements (Wales) Regulations 2003
- 74 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Diogelu'r Amgylchedd (Dyletswydd Gofal) (Diwygio)
(Cymru) 2003
Approval of the Environmental Protection (Duty of Care) (Amendment) (Wales)
Regulations 2003
- 77 Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ynghylch Effeithlonrwydd Ynni
The Economic Development Committee's Report on Energy Efficiency
- 94 Dadl Fer: Methiant y Llywodraeth i Sicrhau Addysg o Safon Uchel i Ddysgwyr cyn ac
ar ôl 16 Oed
Short Debate: The Government's Failure to Deliver a High Standard of Education for
pre and post-16 Learners

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

**Anerchiad gan y Gwir Anrhydeddus Helen Clark AS,
Prif Weinidog Seland Newydd
Address by the Right Honourable Helen Clark MP,
Prime Minister of New Zealand**

Y Llywydd: Estynnaf groeso cynnes i'r Gwir Anrhydeddus Helen Clark, Prif Weinidog Seland Newydd, i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae'n bleser eich croesawu yma, a'ch gwahodd i annerch Aelodau.

The Prime Minister of New Zealand: Mr Presiding Officer, Assembly Members, it is a great honour for me to address Members of the Assembly on my first official visit to Wales. The welcome I have received from the First Minister and the Assembly has been very warm and much appreciated—with the warmth not only to be seen in the weather. My programme for the day has been full and fascinating, and has given me a good opportunity to understand more about Wales and its future prospects.

Devolution has already enabled Wales to take greater responsibility for its own destiny and to project its unique national identity within the UK and beyond. I hope that in the years ahead the benefits of devolution will increase and that Wales will be able to increase its connections with countries as far afield as New Zealand.

Despite the great geographical distance between us—and it is impossible to get further away from Wales than New Zealand—our two countries have much in common. Our shared rugby heritage springs immediately to mind. We have enjoyed many wonderful contests in the past, both in New Zealand and in Wales. I am sure that we will see more such contests in the future. I was born in Hamilton, but I will say no more about that recent encounter.

However, the range of our common interests is much wider than rugby. At the most fundamental level, we enjoy many people-to-people links through family connections. Many Welsh people migrated to New Zealand, and they have made a huge

The Presiding Officer: I warmly welcome the Right Honourable Helen Clark, Prime Minister of New Zealand, to the National Assembly for Wales. It is a pleasure to welcome you here, and to invite you to address Members.

Prif Weinidog Seland Newydd: Lywydd, Aelodau'r Cynulliad, mae'n anrhydedd fawr imi annerch Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar fy ymweliad swyddogol cyntaf â Chymru. Mae'r croeso yr wyf wedi'i gael gan y Prif Weinidog a'r Cynulliad wedi bod yn gynnes iawn ac yr wyf yn ei werthfawrogi'n fawr—nid y tywydd yn unig a fu'n gynnes. Bu fy rhaglen am y diwrnod yn llawn ac yn ddiddorol, ac mae wedi rhoi cyfle da imi ddeall mwy am Gymru a'i rhagolygon ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Mae datganoli eisoes wedi galluogi Cymru i gymryd mwy o gyfrifoldeb dros ei thynged ei hun a hyrwyddo ei hunaniaeth genedlaethol unigryw o fewn y DU a'r tu hwnt. Gobeithiaf y bydd manteision datganoli yn cynyddu yn y blynyddoedd i ddod ac y gall Cymru gynyddu ei chysylltiadau gyda gwledydd mor bell i ffwrdd â Seland Newydd.

Er gwaethaf y pellter daearyddol mawr sydd rhngom—ac mae'n amhosibl mynd ymhellach o Gymru na Seland Newydd—mae llawer yn gyffredin yn ein dwy wlad. Daw'r dreftadaeth rygbi a rannwn i'm meddwl ar unwaith. Yr ydym wedi mwynhau sawl cystadleuaeth wych yn y gorffennol, yn Seland Newydd ac yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwelwn fwy o gystadlaethau o'r fath yn y dyfodol. Cefais fy ngeni yn Hamilton, ond ni ddywedaf ragor am yr ornest ddiweddar honno.

Fodd bynnag, mae ystod ein diddordebau cyffredin yn fwy eang o lawer na dim ond rygbi. Ar y lefel fwyaf sylfaenol, yr ydym yn mwynhau llawer o gysylltiadau rhwng pobl drwy gysylltiadau teuluol. Ymfudodd llawer o Gymry i Seland Newydd, ac maent wedi

contribution to building our country. We still welcome skilled migrants from the United Kingdom, and I am sure that Welsh people will be among those who continue to migrate to New Zealand in the twenty-first century.

Wales, like New Zealand, has faced very big challenges in rebuilding its economic base. You have had to move beyond your traditional coal and steel industries, and we have had to move beyond reliance on commodity trade and primary produce. Now we are both working to build new economies based on the knowledge industries, services and new technology. We can both learn from each other's experiences. While our agricultural economies may be different, there are ways we can work together to promote common, generic products to the benefit of us both. One example is the current ongoing discussion between New Zealand Wool Testing Authority Ltd and the British Wool Marketing Board about establishing a wool testing facility in north Wales. That would use leading-edge technology, developed in New Zealand, and would be of benefit to Welsh farmers as well as creating jobs locally.

Culturally, Wales has an ancient history. New Zealand is a much newer land, with Maori settlement dating back only around 1,000 years, and European settlement of any significance scarcely dating back 150 years. However, what both countries have in common is our custodianship of unique languages and cultures. We can each benefit from an understanding of how each promotes that: the Welsh language and heritage in your case and the Maori language and heritage in ours. We are presently establishing a Maori television service, following closely the experience of original language television in Wales.

In our electoral systems we have much in common; we, too, have a mixed member proportional representation system for electing our Parliament. The mechanisms and details are a little different, but the effect and the challenges are much the same. We should

gwneud cyfraniad enfawr tuag at adeiladu ein gwlad. Yr ydym yn parhau i groesawu ymfudwyr medrus o'r Deyrnas Unedig, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Cymry ymhlith y rhai sy'n parhau i ymfudo i Seland Newydd yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain.

Mae Cymru, fel Seland Newydd, wedi wynebu heriau mawr iawn wrth ailadeiladu ei sylfaen economaidd. Yr ydych chi wedi gorfod symud y tu hwnt i'ch diwydiannau glo a dur traddodiadol, ac yr ydym ni wedi gorfod symud y tu hwnt i ddibyniaeth ar fasnach nwyddau a chynnyrch sylfaenol. Bellach, mae ein dwy wlad yn gweithio i adeiladu economïau newydd yn seiliedig ar y diwydiannau gwybodaeth, gwasanaethau a thechnoleg newydd. Gallwn ddysgu o brofiadau ein gilydd. Er bod ein heconomïau amaethyddol yn wahanol, gallwn gydweithio mewn rhai ffyrdd er mwyn hyrwyddo cynnyrch cyffredin, generig a fydd yn fuddiol i'r ddwy wlad. Un enghraifft yw'r drafodaeth bresennol rhwng Awdurdod Profi Gwlân Seland Newydd Cyf a Bwrdd Marchnata Gwlân Prydain ynglŷn â sefydlu cyfleuster profi gwlan yng ngogledd Cymru. Byddai'r cyfleuster yn defnyddio technoleg arloesol, a ddatblygwyd yn Seland Newydd, a byddai'n fuddiol i ffermwyr Cymru yn ogystal â chreu swyddi lleol.

Yn ddiwylliannol, mae hanes hynafol i Gymru. Mae Seland Newydd yn dir mwy newydd o lawer, gyda dim ond tua 1,000 o flynyddoedd ers gwladychiad y Maori, a phrin 150 o flynyddoedd ers gwladychiad Ewropeaidd o unrhyw arwyddocâd. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sydd gan y ddwy wlad yn gyffredin yw ein gwarchodaeth o ieithoedd a diwylliannau unigryw. Gall y naill elwa ar ddeall sut y mae'r llall yn hyrwyddo hynny: yr iaith Gymraeg a threftadaeth Cymru yn eich achos chi a'r iaith a'r dreftadaeth Maori yn ein hachos ni. Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn sefydlu gwasanaeth teledu Maori, gan ddilyn yn agos brofiad teledu iaith frodorol yng Nghymru.

Yn ein systemau etholiadol, mae gennym lawer yn gyffredin; mae gennym ninnau, hefyd, system cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol o aelodau cymysg ar gyfer ethol ein Senedd. Mae'r dulliau o weithredu a'r manylion ychydig yn wahanol, ond mae'r effaith a'r

continue to talk about ways of adjusting to these new electoral systems. We have found new ways in each of the three parliamentary terms since we have had this system, and I am sure that you will find that it is a dynamic system.

A striking feature of this Assembly, Mr Presiding Officer, and one that I wholeheartedly approve of, is the very strong representation of women. We in New Zealand pride ourselves on the extent to which women have risen to positions of authority not only in government, but in the judiciary, in academia and in business too. That is appropriate for our country, which was the first in which women gained the right to vote. However, I am afraid that our Parliament cannot yet match the proportion of women achieved in this Assembly. I congratulate you on that.

Thank for allowing me this opportunity to address Assembly Members. Please accept my warmest wishes for the Assembly's future endeavours, and for the continuing advancement and prosperity of Wales and all its people. I hope that we can continue to build a strong relationship between Wales and New Zealand, based not only on past shared heritage and values, but on the future as well. Thank you. [*Applause.*]

The Presiding Officer: You are the third Prime Minister to address the Assembly, but the first woman Prime Minister to do so. We appreciate your comments in endorsing our gender equality, of which we are proud. Thank you.

heriau yn debyg iawn. Dylem barhau i siarad am ffyrdd o addasu i'r systemau etholiadol newydd hyn. Canfuwyd ffyrdd newydd gennym ym mhob un o'r tri thymor seneddol ers inni gael y system hon, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gwelwch ei bod yn system ddeinamig.

Un o nodweddion trawiadol y Cynulliad hwn, Lywydd, ac un yr wyf yn ei chymeradwyo'n llwyr, yw'r gynrychiolaeth gref iawn o blith merched. Yn Seland Newydd, ymfalchïwn yn y graddau y mae merched wedi codi i safle o awdurdod nid yn unig yn y Llywodraeth, ond yn y meysydd cyfreithiol, academiaidd a busnes hefyd. Mae hynny'n briodol ar gyfer ein gwlad, sef y wlad gyntaf i roi'r hawl i ferched bleidleisio. Fodd bynnag, ofnaf na all ein Senedd, hyd yn hyn, gyfateb â chyfran y merched a sicrhawyd yn y Cynulliad hwn. Fe'ch llongyfarchaf ar hynny.

Diolch am roi'r cyfle hwn imi annerch Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Hoffwn dymuno'r gorau i ymdrechion y Cynulliad yn y dyfodol, ac ar gyfer datblygiad a ffyniant parhaus Cymru a'i phobl i gyd. Gobeithiaf y gallwn barhau i ffurfio perthynas gref rhwng Cymru a Seland Newydd, yn seiliedig nid yn unig ar dreftadaeth a gwerthoedd cyffredin y gorffennol, ond ar y dyfodol hefyd. Diolch. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

Y Llywydd: Chi yw'r trydydd Prif Weinidog i annerch y Cynulliad, ond y Prif Weinidog benywaidd cyntaf i wneud hynny. Gwerthfawrogwn eich sylwadau wrth gymeradwyo ein cydraddoldeb rhyw, yr ymfalchïwn yn fawr ynddo. Diolch.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions to the Finance Minister

Prosiectau'r Fenter Cyllid Preifat Private Finance Initiative Projects

Q1 Peter Black: What plans does the Minister have to review private finance initiative projects in Wales? (OAQ26688)

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I have no plans either to review private finance initiative projects in Wales or to announce a further bidding round for local authority private finance initiative credits. The introduction of prudential borrowing next April will allow authorities the freedom to pursue many different forms of procurement, including PFI, from the same level playing field.

Peter Black: I welcome the fact that you are not opening another round of credits. However, in terms of prudential borrowing as a substitute for PFI, is it not the case that this will still include limits with regard to what local councils can borrow? Is it not also the case that, as a result, councils will still find themselves unable to carry out the capital projects that they require, given the restrictions of the public sector borrowing requirement on the capital borrowing of local councils?

Sue Essex: I accept your last point, but I do not believe that prudential borrowing is a substitute for PFI; it is still up to local authorities if they wish to pursue this. I appreciate that there will be limits in terms of local authorities ensuring that their revenue stream repays capital debts. However, it would be fair to say that local authorities have widely welcomed the prudential borrowing scheme, regardless of their political complexion. Once that scheme is in place, local authorities will have greater freedom than is presently the case.

Mark Isherwood: I am informed that your Government, in its first term, stated that the

C1 Peter Black: Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i adolygu prosiectau'r fenter cyllid preifat yng Nghymru? (OAQ26688)

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Nid oes gennyf gynlluniau i adolygu prosiectau'r fenter cyllid preifat yng Nghymru nac i gyhoeddi cylch ceisiadau arall ar gyfer credydau'r fenter cyllid preifat. Bydd cyflwyno benthycia darbodus fis Ebrill nesaf yn rhoi rhyddid i awdurdodau fynd ar drywydd sawl ffurf wahanol ar gaffael, gan gynnwys y fenter cyllid preifat, o dan yr un amodau teg.

Peter Black: Croesawaf y ffaith nad ydych yn agor cylch arall o gredydau. Fodd bynnag, yn nhermau defnyddio benthycia darbodus i ddisodli PFI, onid yw'n wir y bydd hyn yn parhau i gynnwys terfynau o ran yr hyn y gall cynghorau lleol ei fenthycia? Onid yw hefyd yn wir y bydd cynghorau, o ganlyniad, yn parhau i fethu â chyflawni'r prosiectau cyfalaf sydd eu hangen arnynt, o gofio cyfyngiadau gofyniad benthycia'r sector cyhoeddus mewn perthynas â benthycia cyfalaf gan gynghorau lleol?

Sue Essex: Derbyniaf eich pwynt olaf, ond ni chredaf fod benthycia darbodus yn disodli PFI; cyfrifoldeb yr awdurdodau lleol yw penderfynu a ydynt am fynd ar drywydd hyn o hyd. Gwerthfawrogaf y bydd cyfyngiadau yn nhermau awdurdodau lleol yn sicrhau bod eu ffrydiau refeniw yn ad-dalu dyledion cyfalaf. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n deg dweud bod awdurdodau lleol wedi croesawu'r cynllun benthycia darbodus, waeth beth fo'u lliw gwleidyddol. Pan fydd y cynllun hwnnw ar waith, bydd gan awdurdodau lleol fwy o ryddid nag sydd ganddynt ar hyn o bryd.

Mark Isherwood: Fe'm hysbysir bod eich Llywodraeth, yn ei thymor cyntaf, wedi

main obstacle to improvements on the north-south road route was the high cost per mile of such improvements. Has your Government considered funding mechanisms other than the taxpayer to address this urgent need, such as the prudent use of PFI? Do you agree that we must put the needs of the people before any ideological or dogmatic objections?

Sue Essex: I am confused, Mark. If you are asking about north-south connections, I am not sure if you are talking about improvements on the road—I assume that that is the case, as you referred to PFI—or about other transport links. We have already invested a considerable amount of money to support the north-south railway, and my colleague, Andrew Davies, is giving further consideration to air links. However, I will assume that you are referring in particular to roads. In line with the way in which work is set out within the trunk road programme, for improving the A470 in particular, small chunks of improvement work are carried out, mainly to skirt around small market towns along the route. I suspect that that would not appeal to PFI bidders, but it is a matter for Andrew Davies to consider. Within our transport programme, this is to be secured through straightforward funding; I suspect that that is the most profitable method of dealing with this issue.

Alun Ffred Jones: Barn Plaid Cymru yw nad yw'r fenter cyllid preifat yn rhoi gwerth am arian yn y tymor hir, ac felly nad yw'n ddull cynaliadwy o ariannu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Dyna hefyd yw barn Cyngor Gwynedd. A yw'r Gweinidog wedi ystyried dulliau eraill o gyllido gwariant cyfalaf, ar wahân i PFI a'r dulliau traddodiadol?

Sue Essex: People have different views about PFI—we must be honest about that—and every report that I read contains a different view. We have a small group that has been traditionally working on PFI, that is now considering a range of methods that might support capital programmes. It is also considering whether some innovative partnerships might help. I repeat the point that I made to Peter: for local authorities, there will be a capital allocation in the

datgan mai'r prif rwystr i wella'r ffordd rhwng y Gogledd a'r De oedd cost uchel gwelliannau o'r fath fesul milltir. A yw eich Llywodraeth wedi ystyried dulliau ariannu heblaw'r trethdalwr er mwyn ymdrin â'r angen taer hwn, fel y defnydd darbodus o PFI? A gytunwch fod yn rhaid inni roi mwy o flaenoriaeth i anghenion y bobl nag i unrhyw wrthwynebiadau ideolegol neu ddogmataidd?

Sue Essex: Yr ydych wedi'm drysu, Mark. Os ydych yn holi am gysylltiadau rhwng y Gogledd a'r De, nid wyf yn siŵr a ydych yn siarad am welliannau i'r ffordd—tybiaf mai dyna'r achos, gan ichi gyfeirio at PFI—neu am gysylltiadau trafniadaeth eraill. Yr ydym eisoes wedi buddsoddi swm sylweddol o arian yn y rheilffordd o'r Gogledd i'r De, ac mae fy nghyd-Aelod, Andrew Davies, yn ystyried cysylltiadau awyr ymhellach. Fodd bynnag, tybiaf y cyfeiriwch yn benodol at ffyrdd. Yn unol â'r modd y trefnir gwaith o fewn y rhaglen gefnffyrdd, ar gyfer gwella'r A470 yn arbennig, cyflawnir darnau bach o waith gwella, yn bennaf i osgoi trefi marchnad bach ar hyd y llwybr. Tybiaf na fyddai hynny'n apelio at rai sy'n gwneud ceisiadau PFI, ond mae'n fater i Andrew Davies ei ystyried. O fewn ein rhaglen drafniadaeth, dylid sicrhau hyn drwy ariannu syml; tybiaf mai hwnnw yw'r dull mwyaf proffidiol o ddelio â'r mater hwn.

Alun Ffred Jones: Plaid Cymru believes that PFI does not provide value for money in the long term, and that it is not, therefore, a sustainable method of funding public services. That is also the view of Gwynedd Council. Has the Minister given consideration to methods of funding capital expenditure other than PFI and traditional methods?

Sue Essex: Mae gan bobl farn wahanol ar PFI—rhaid inni fod yn onest am hynny—ac mae pob adroddiad a ddarllenaf yn cynnwys barn wahanol. Mae gennym grŵp bach a fu'n gweithio'n draddodiadol ar PFI, sydd bellach yn ystyried amrywiaeth o ddulliau a allai gefnogi rhaglenni cyfalaf. Mae hefyd yn ystyried a allai rhai partneriaethau arloesol helpu. Ailadroddaf y pwynt a wneuthum i Peter: ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol, bydd dyraniad cyfalaf yn y setliad ar gyfer y

settlement for the prudential borrowing system to allow for that support.

system fenthycy ddarbodus er mwyn galluogi darparu'r cymorth hwnnw.

Cyfanswm Gwariant a Threth Total Expenditure and Taxation

C2 Elin Jones: Pa drafodaethau mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael ynglŷn â chynhyrchu dadansoddiad manwl o'r cyfanswm gwariant a threth yng Nghymru? (OAQ26785)

Q2 Elin Jones: What discussions has the Minister had regarding producing a detailed analysis of the total expenditure and taxation in Wales? (OAQ26785)

Sue Essex: I am responsible for the Welsh Assembly Government's expenditure, which represents just over a half of identifiable public expenditure in Wales. Taxation and the remainder of public spending in Wales are non-devolved issues. There are no plans to produce a detailed analysis of total public expenditure and taxation in Wales.

Sue Essex: Yr wyf yn gyfrifol am wariant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, sy'n cynrychioli ychydig dros hanner y gwariant cyhoeddus y gellir ei nodi yng Nghymru. Mae treth a gweddill y gwariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn faterion nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli. Nid oes cynlluniau i gynhyrchu dadansoddiad manwl o gyfanswm y gwariant cyhoeddus a threth yng Nghymru.

Elin Jones: Cyhoeddodd y Swyddfa Gymreig o dan William Hague yn Ionawr 1997 fod diffyg ariannol Cymru yn £5.7 biliwn. Ar y pryd, galwodd Rhodri Morgan y ffigurau hynny yn bropaganda gwrth-ddatganoli. Erbyn 1999, yr oedd Peter Hain yn defnyddio'r un ffigur at ddibenion propaganda go wahanol. Mae Adam Price wedi amgancysfrif bod diffyg o £1.5 biliwn erbyn hyn. A gredwch, yn sgîl datganoli, ei bod yn bryd i ffigurau blynyddol ar wariant a threthiant gael eu cyhoeddi gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol? Heb hynny, cawn bropaganda parhaus, nid ffigurau caled.

Elin Jones: In January 1997 the Welsh Office, under William Hague, announced that Wales's deficit was £5.7 billion. At the time, Rhodri Morgan dismissed those figures as anti-devolution propaganda. By 1999, Peter Hain was using the same figure for quite different propaganda ends. Adam Price has estimated that the deficit is now £1.5 billion. Do you believe that, following devolution, it is time that annual figures on expenditure and taxation were published by the UK Government? Without that, we will continue to receive propaganda, not hard figures.

Sue Essex: I would not necessarily endorse anything that William Hague did, and I cannot remember Peter Hain's comments. I suspect that your question might have been prompted by Ivan Massow's statement with regard to London, which has received prominent attention in the papers. I have thought hard, since you have asked the question, about the value of such an exercise and the work that would be involved in compiling an accurate estimate. My question would be: what would that tell you? I do not expect to get the value of my taxation back in expenditure for me. We are politically committed to the redistribution of wealth. I am not sure what drawing boundaries around expenditure on families, a person or a country would tell you. It is more important that we ensure that expenditure is delivered where it

Sue Essex: Ni fyddwn o anghenraid yn cymeradwyo unrhyw beth a wnaeth William Hague, ac ni allaf gofio sylwadau Peter Hain. Tybiaf mai datganiad Ivan Massow ynglŷn â Llundain, sydd wedi cael sylw amlwg yn y papurau, a ysgogodd eich cwestiwn. Yr wyf wedi meddwl yn ddwys, gan ichi ofyn y cwestiwn, am werth ymarfer o'r fath a'r gwaith a fyddai ei angen er mwyn dod i amcangyfrif cywir. Fy nghwestiwn fyddai: beth fyddai hynny'n ei ddweud wrthyhch? Ni ddisgwyliaf gael gwerth fy nhreth yn ôl mewn gwariant ar fy nghyfer. Yr ydym yn wleidyddol ymrwymedig i ailddosbarthu cyfoeth. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth fyddai tynnu ffiniau o amgylch gwariant ar deuluoedd, person neu wlad yn ei ddweud wrthyhch. Mae'n bwysicach inni sicrhau bod gwariant yn cael ei ddarparu lle y mae ei angen, a bod

is needed and is focused.

ffocws i'r gwariant.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): I know that you are aware of the proposals to repatriate regional aid to the UK from Europe. Have you made an assessment of the impact of that on expenditure in Wales? Many in the Chamber, and outside, are concerned that it would have an adverse impact on regional aid in Wales. Have you made an assessment, and will there be any guarantees that Wales will receive regional aid?

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Gwn eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r cynigion i ailwadoli cymorth rhanbarthol i'r DU o Ewrop. A ydych wedi asesu effaith hynny ar wariant yng Nghymru? Mae llawer o bobl yn y Siambr, a'r tu allan iddi, yn pryderu y byddai'n cael effaith andwyol ar gymorth rhanbarthol yng Nghymru. A ydych wedi gwneud asesiad, ac a fydd unrhyw sicrwydd y bydd Cymru yn derbyn cymorth rhanbarthol?

Sue Essex: Civil servants have been considering the issue, and Rhodri Morgan, as First Minister, gave a report on that recently. It is hard to make an accurate assessment of what that would mean: whether we would be better off with the existing system of European regional aid, in the way that we have benefited from structural funds, or whether we would be better off with repatriation, given the statistics on Wales and a Government with a strong commitment to regional policy. Work on that is ongoing and we will make a judgment on the basis of what is best for Wales.

Sue Essex: Bu gweision sifil yn ystyried y mater, a chyflwynodd Rhodri Morgan, fel y Prif Weinidog, adroddiad ar hynny yn ddiweddar. Mae'n anodd gwneud asesiad cywir o'r hyn y byddai'n ei olygu: pa un ai a fyddem yn well ein byd gyda'r system bresennol o gymorth rhanbarthol Ewropeaidd, yn y modd yr ydym wedi elwa yn sgîl arian strwythurol, neu a fyddem yn well ein byd yn sgîl ailwladoli, o gofio ystadegau Cymru a Llywodraeth sydd ag ymrwymiad cryf i bolisi rhanbarthol. Mae'r gwaith ar hynny'n mynd rhagddo a byddwn yn gwneud dyfarniad ar sail yr hyn sydd orau i Gymru.

Jenny Randerson: You say that expenditure should follow need, and I agree. However, with the probable advent of regional assemblies in England, do you still believe that it is credible to cling onto the discredited Barnett formula? Will you acknowledge that that formula has probably remained in place for so long because it was ineffective in producing convergence until the end of the 1990s? Do you agree that the fact that it is now effective in doing that, provides Wales with a strong case to argue for change as the pinch on our increases in expenditure become obvious?

Jenny Randerson: Dywedwch y dylai gwariant ddilyn angen, a chytunaf â hynny. Fodd bynnag, gan ei bod yn debygol y sefydlir cynullïadau rhanbarthol yn Lloegr, a gredwch fod glynu wrth fformiwla anhygred Barnett yn dal i fod yn ddewis dibynadwy? A gydnabyddwch fod y fformiwla honno, yn ôl pob tebyg, wedi aros ar waith cyhyd am ei bod yn aneffeithiol o ran cynhyrchu cydgyfeiriad hyd ddiwedd yr 1990au? A gytunwch fod y ffaith ei bod bellach yn effeithiol wrth wneud hynny yn rhoi achos cryf i Gymru ddadlau o blaid newid wrth i'r wasgfa ar ein cynnydd mewn gwariant ddod yn amlwg?

Sue Essex: In answering, I will follow on from the question that I think that Ieuan Wyn Jones asked during my previous question session. The general view, certainly from the officials who consider the matter carefully, is that we have benefited considerably from Barnett, and continue to do so. The issue is what would we move to if we did not have the Barnett formula. That is the big question.

Sue Essex: Wrth ateb, dilynaf ymlaen o'r cwestiwn a ofynnwyd gan Ieuan Wyn Jones, fe gredaf, yn ystod fy sesiwn gwestiynau flaenorol. Y farn gyffredinol, yn sicr ymhlith y swyddogion sy'n ystyried y mater yn ofalus, yw ein bod wedi elwa'n sylweddol yn sgîl Barnett, a'n bod yn parhau i wneud hynny. Y cwestiwn yw at beth y byddwn yn symud pe na bai gennym fformiwla Barnett.

If we make that leap into the dark, is there a system that could give us the financial benefits that everyone here would want? That is unknown. I am open to suggestions about alternative methods, and I think that a debate was held on that issue on Monday in Cardiff. However, to make that leap without guarantees with regard to an alternative formula would be dangerous, and that is why we are cautious about it.

Dyna'r cwestiwn mawr. Os gwnawn y naid honno i'r tywyllwch, a oes system a allai roi'r buddiannau ariannol inni y byddai pawb yma am eu cael? Nid yw hynny'n hysbys. Yr wyf yn agored i awgrymiadau am ddulliau amgen, a chredaf i ddadl ar y mater hwnnw gael ei chynnal yng Nghaerdydd ddydd Llun. Fodd bynnag, byddai gwneud y naid honno heb sicrwydd o ran fformiwla amgen yn beryglus, a dyna pam yr ydym yn betrus ynghylch gwneud hynny.

2.10 p.m.

Blaenoriaethau Cyllidebol y Cynulliad Assembly Budget Priorities

Q3 Jeff Cuthbert: Can the Minister make a statement on how she plans to set priorities for forthcoming Assembly budgets? (OAQ26796)

C3 Jeff Cuthbert: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y ffordd y mae'n bwriadu pennu'r blaenoriaethau ar gyfer cyllidebau arfaethedig y Cynulliad? (OAQ26796)

Q5 Carl Sargeant: Will the Minister make a statement on how she plans to set priorities for forthcoming Assembly budgets? (OAQ26795)

C5 Carl Sargeant: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y ffordd y mae'n bwriadu pennu'r blaenoriaethau ar gyfer cyllidebau arfaethedig y Cynulliad? (OAQ26795)

Q6 John Griffiths: Will the Minister make a statement on future Assembly budget policy? (OAQ26743)

C6 John Griffiths: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar bolisi cyllidebol y Cynulliad yn y dyfodol? (OAQ26743)

Sue Essex: In preparing the budget for the next three years, I shall work within the priorities for the Welsh Assembly Government that were set out in our manifesto, 'Working Together for Wales'. In addition, I will take account of the views of the Subject Committees and have asked Chairs to provide these to me as part of the budget planning round.

Sue Essex: Wrth baratoi'r gyllideb am y tair blynedd nesaf, byddaf yn gweithio o fewn y blaenoriaethau ar gyfer Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a nodwyd yn ein maniffesto, 'Wrthi'n Gweithio Gyda'n Gilydd Dros Gymru'. Yn ogystal, byddaf yn ystyried sylwadau'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc ac yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r Cadeiryddion roi'r rhain imi fel rhan o gylch cynllunio'r gyllideb.

Jeff Cuthbert: Will you confirm that there are no plans to introduce top-up fees in Wales during 2006-07?

Jeff Cuthbert: A wnewch gadarnhau nad oes cynlluniau i gyflwyno ffioedd ychwanegol yng Nghymru yn ystod 2006-07?

Sue Essex: I am happy to confirm that top-up fees will not be introduced. We will honour our manifesto commitment.

Sue Essex: Mae'n bleser gennyf gadarnhau na chyflwynir ffioedd ychwanegol. Byddwn yn anrhydeddu'r ymrwymiad yn ein maniffesto.

Carl Sargeant: Will you agree to hold a meeting with me and the other directly elected constituency Assembly Member for the area, Sandy Mewies, to discuss Assembly funding provided to Flintshire County

Carl Sargeant: A gytunwch i gynnal cyfarfod gyda mi a'r Aelod Cynulliad arall a etholwyd yn uniongyrchol ar gyfer yr ardal, Sandy Mewies, er mwyn trafod yr arian a roddwyd gan y Cynulliad i Gyngor Sir y

Council in respect of the council's budget commitments to education services? The local school budget expressed as a percentage of those services is 42 per cent. That is on a par with the rest of provision across Wales. That reinforces Flintshire council's view that the total resources provided via the revenue support grant through the formula arrangements are inadequate in the first instance and do not allow the authority to meet its aspirations and those of the schools and residents of Flintshire, unless that is to the detriment of other front-line services.

Sue Essex: I am in Flintshire tomorrow, and will meet representatives of the local authority. I am sure that they will make their own representations. The formula on which revenue support grant is based was agreed by all 22 local authorities and the Welsh Local Government Association. Mark Isherwood held a recent short debate on this. This relates to my answer on the Barnett formula: you meddle with such formulae at your peril because one person's gain is another person's loss. I am happy to have a meeting with you both. I suggest that, if your concern relates to education budgets, Jane Davidson should also attend the meeting.

John Griffiths: In line with the Welsh Assembly Government's pragmatic approach to PFI—which is that what counts is what works—if a PFI proves to be impractical in particular circumstances, would you look more favourably at a more traditional public financing route?

Sue Essex: I think that you may have a particular example in mind. I would be happy to sit down with you and your local government colleagues to discuss the matter.

David Davies: Do you agree that the NHS must be given extra priority at the moment? I have received a letter from a constituent who has been told that she will have to wait up to 12 months before receiving treatment to her wisdom teeth. For 12 months she will suffer pain and sleepless nights. She will be unable to work properly and she will cost the NHS

Fflint mewn perthynas ag ymrwymïadau cyllidebol y cyngor i wasanaethau addysg? Y gyllideb ar gyfer ysgolion lleol fel canran o'r gwasanaethau hynny yw 42 y cant. Mae hynny yr un fath â gweddill y ddarpariaeth ledled Cymru. Mae hynny'n ategu barn Cyngor Sir y Fflint bod cyfanswm yr adnoddau a ddarparwyd drwy'r grant cynnal refeniw drwy drefniadau'r fformiwla yn annigonol yn y lle cyntaf ac nad ydynt yn caniatáu i'r awdurdod gyflawni ei ddyheadau ei hun a dyheadau ysgolion a thrigolion sir y Fflint, oni bai bod hynny ar draul gwasanaethau rheng flaen eraill.

Sue Essex: Yr wyf yn sir y Fflint yfory, a byddaf yn cwrdd â chynrychiolwyr yr awdurdod lleol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddant yn gwneud eu sylwadau eu hunain. Cytunodd pob un o'r 22 awdurdod lleol a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ar y fformiwla y mae'r grant cynnal refeniw yn seiliedig arni. Cynhaliodd Mark Isherwood ddadl fer ar hyn yn ddiweddar. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â'm hateb ar fformiwla Barnett: gwae chi os ymyrrwch â fformiwla'u o'r fath gan fod yr hyn sydd o fantais i un person yn arwain at golled i berson arall. Yr wyf yn fodlon cael cyfarfod gyda'r ddau ohonoch. Os yw eich pryder yn ymwneud â chyllidebau addysg, awgrymaf y dylai Jane Davidson fynychu'r cyfarfod hefyd.

John Griffiths: Yn unol ag ymagwedd bragmataidd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru tuag at PFI—sef mai'r hyn sy'n gweithio sy'n cyfrif—os profir bod PFI yn anymarferol mewn amgylchiadau arbennig, a fydddech yn edrych yn fwy ffafriol ar lwybr ariannu cyhoeddus mwy traddodiadol?

Sue Essex: Credaf fod gennych enghraifft benodol mewn golwg o bosibl. Byddwn yn fodlon eistedd i lawr gyda chi a'ch cydweithwyr mewn llywodraeth leol i drafod y mater.

David Davies: A gytunwch fod yn rhaid rhoi blaenoriaeth ychwanegol i'r GIG ar hyn o bryd? Yr wyf wedi derbyn llythyr gan etholwraig sydd wedi clywed y bydd yn rhaid iddi aros am hyd at 12 mis cyn cael triniaeth i'w chefnuddedd. Bydd yn rhaid iddi ddioddef poen a nosweithiau digwsg am 12 mis. Ni fydd yn gallu gweithio'n iawn a bydd

money in antibiotics and painkillers. Is this not an unacceptable situation? Our health service is letting down the people of Wales and action must be taken as quickly as possible to address the lack of service under your administration.

Sue Essex: If you look at the figures, they are startling—

David Davies: Yes, they are.

Sue Essex: Well, they certainly stand comparison with those of the previous Tory Government any day of the week. There has been a huge increase in investment in the NHS. Figures were sent to me so that I could prepare for answering this question, and I sent them back to officials, thinking that they were surely too high. However, I was told that they were correct. They are startling in terms of the increase in investment in health and social services over the next years. We have made major changes—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. I have allowed David Davies to ask his supplementary because this is a general question about the proposed Assembly budget, but I would be grateful if he did not try to ask another supplementary and wave around pieces of paper.

Sue Essex: The proposed budget has been increased. That money is, increasingly, reaching everyone in Wales. You cannot turn the NHS around overnight, as Jane Hutt has said many times. However, we are turning it around. For every constituent who has a complaint, I am sure that we all have other constituents who are pleased with the service. We intend to ensure that all constituents of all Assembly Members are pleased with the service that they receive from the NHS in future.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): You will recall that one of the arguments during the first Assembly was to do with whether Objective 1 match funding would be taken from core budgets, or whether the Treasury would provide extra funding for it. Now that the mid-term review

yn rhaid i'r GIG dalu am ei gwrthfotigau a'i thabledi lladd poen. Onid yw hyn yn sefyllfa annerbyniol? Mae ein gwasanaeth iechyd yn siomi pobl Cymru a rhaid cymryd camau cyn gynted â phosibl er mwyn ymdrin â'r diffyg gwasanaeth o dan eich gweinyddiaeth.

Sue Essex: Os edrychwch ar y ffigurau, maent yn frawychus—

David Davies: Ydyn, yn wir.

Sue Essex: Wel, maent yn cymharu'n dda â ffigurau'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol ar unrhyw adeg. Bu cynnydd enfawr mewn buddsoddiad yn y GIG. Anfonwyd ffigurau ataf er mwyn imi allu paratoi ar gyfer ateb y cwestiwn hwn, ac anfonais hwy yn ôl at swyddogion, gan feddwl eu bod yn sicr o fod yn rhy uchel. Fodd bynnag, fe'm hysbyswyd eu bod yn gywir. Maent yn frawychus yng nghyd-destun y cynnydd mewn buddsoddiad ym maes iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol dros y blynyddoedd nesaf. Yr ydym wedi gwneud newidiadau pwysig—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf wedi caniatáu i David Davies ofyn ei gwestiwn atodol am fod hwn yn gwestiwn cyffredinol ynghylch cyllideb arfaethedig y Cynulliad, ond byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe na bai'n ceisio gofyn cwestiwn atodol arall a chwifio darnau o bapur.

Sue Essex: Cynyddwyd y gyllideb arfaethedig. Mae'r arian hwnnw, yn gynyddol, yn cyrraedd pawb yng Nghymru. Ni allwch wyrdroi'r GIG dros nos, fel y dywedodd Jane Hutt sawl gwaith. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn ei wyrdroi. Ar gyfer pob etholwr sydd â chŵyn, yr wyf yn siŵr bod gennym oll etholwyr eraill sy'n fodlon â'r gwasanaeth. Bwriadwn sicrhau fod holl etholwyr holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn fodlon â'r gwasanaeth a dderbyniant gan y GIG yn y dyfodol.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Byddwch yn cofio fod un o'r dadleuon yn ystod y Cynulliad cyntaf yn ymwneud â pha un ai a fyddai arian cyfatebol Amcan 1 yn cael ei gymryd o gyllidebau craidd, neu pa un a fyddai'r Trysorlys yn darparu arian ychwanegol ar ei gyfer. Gan

has been completed, we know that £475 million has been taken from core budgets and used for match funding, which has hit Assembly sponsored public bodies, higher and further education, and local government. In the partnership agreement with the Liberal Democrats, you made it clear that you would press the Treasury for match funding over and above the Welsh block for the second half of the Objective 1 programme. Are you still committed to that?

Sue Essex: Yes.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): I was interested in your reply to Jeff Cuthbert about top-up fees. The issue of top-up fees is crucial in Wales. In this morning's Education and Lifelong Learning Committee meeting, the Minister said that the Welsh block would be charged for buying out top-up fees in Wales. How much are you setting aside for that buy-out, how much will it cost the Welsh block, and when will that cost fall upon it?

Sue Essex: I was not present at the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee meeting this morning, so I cannot confirm what Jane said. However, I would be happy to reply to you in writing, once I have discussed the points raised with Jane.

Alun Cairns: At this morning's Economic Development and Transport Committee meeting, we discussed budget allocations and the requests that the Committee may well make to you as Finance Minister. The gross domestic product per capita figures in Wales are due to be published in the next few weeks. If those figures have fallen significantly, or in any way, do you accept that the economic development budget will need an extra increase over and above the indicative figures that you have suggested?

Sue Essex: Again, I was not present at that Committee, as I was attending mine, but I will take your word for it that the matter was raised. You prefaced your question with the word 'if'—let us wait and see what happens.

fod yr adolygiad canol tymor wedi'i gwblhau bellach, gwyddom fod £475 miliwn wedi'i gymryd o gyllidebau craidd a'i ddefnyddio ar gyfer arian cyfatebol, sydd wedi taro cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, addysg uwch ac addysg pellach, a llywodraeth leol. Yn y cytundeb partneriaeth gyda'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, fe'i gwnaethoch yn glir y byddech yn pwysu ar y Trysorlys am arian cyfatebol uwchlaw bloc Cymru ar gyfer ail hanner y rhaglen Amcan 1. A ydych yn dal i fod yn ymrwymedig i hynny?

Sue Essex: Ydym.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Yr oedd gennyf ddiddordeb yn eich ateb i Jeff Cuthbert ynghylch ffioedd ychwanegol. Mae'r mater o ffioedd ychwanegol yn hanfodol i Gymru. Yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes y bore yma, dywedodd y Gweinidog y codir tâl ar floc Cymru am brynu ffioedd ychwanegol yng Nghymru. Faint ydych chi'n ei glustnodi ar gyfer y pryniant hwnnw, faint fydd y gost i floc Cymru, a phryd y bydd y gost honno'n dod i'w ran?

Sue Essex: Nid oeddwn yn bresennol yn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes y bore yma, felly ni allaf gadarnhau'r hyn a ddywedodd Jane Hutt. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn falch o anfon ateb ysgrifenedig atoch ar ôl imi drafod y pwyntiau a godwyd gyda Jane.

Alun Cairns: Yn ystod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth y bore yma, trafodasom ddyraniadau'r gyllideb a'r ceisiadau y gallai'r Pwyllgor eu gwneud i chi fel Gweinidog Cyllid. Caiff y ffigurau cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen yng Nghymru eu cyhoeddi yn yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf. Os bydd y ffigurau hynny wedi gostwng yn sylweddol, neu mewn unrhyw ffordd, a dderbyniwch y bydd angen cynnydd ychwanegol yn y gyllideb datblygu economaidd uwchben y ffigurau dynodol a awgrymwyd gennych?

Sue Essex: Eto, nid oeddwn yn bresennol yn y Pwyllgor hwnnw, am y bu'n rhaid imi fynychu fy mhwyllgor fy hun, ond cymeraf eich gair bod y mater wedi'i godi. Rhagflaenwyd eich cwestiwn gyda'r gair

Economic development has received major inputs, particularly cash inputs, and we are beginning to see the benefits of that throughout Wales. GDP per capita is not simply about traditional cash inputs; it is also about raising expectations and skills levels. Let us wait for the figures.

Janet Ryder: We heard from the Prime Minister of New Zealand earlier. The Maori language is prioritised through the provision of free adult classes in the language. In 'Iaith Pawb', you made a commitment to adult learning. Will you consider a similar course of action in Wales and make all Welsh-language courses for adults free?

Sue Essex: 'Iaith Pawb' sets a clear way forward, which has been matched with funding. I have not received the particular request that you make from Alun Pugh, who has responsibility for the Welsh language. 'Iaith Pawb' offers a clear way forward to support the language.

Tanwariant y Llywodraeth The Government's Underspend

C4 Owen John Thomas: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar danwariant y Llywodraeth ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol o fis Ebrill 2002 hyd fis Ebrill 2003? (OAQ26739)

Sue Essex: Due to a change in the budgeting procedure, from cash figures to resource accounting, accurate figures for 2002-03 will not be available until the end of July.

Owen John Thomas: Os darganfyddwch bod arian ar gael, a sicrhewch, heb oedi, ei fod yn cael ei wario mewn wardiau difreintiedig nad ydynt, hyd yn hyn, wedi derbyn arian Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, fel yr oeddent wedi disgwyl?

Sue Essex: In previous years, there has been a good match between actual and expected expenditure. An enormous amount of money—I see submissions regularly—is being distributed to Communities First areas across Wales. However, if you have

'os'—gadewch inni aros i weld a ddigwydd. Mae datblygu economaidd wedi derbyn llawer o fewnbwn, yn enwedig mewnbwn ariannol, ac yr ydym yn dechrau gweld buddiannau hynny ledled Cymru. Nid yw CMC y pen yn ymwneud â mewnbwn ariannol traddodiadol yn unig; mae hefyd yn ymwneud â chodi disgwyliadau a lefelau sgiliau. Gadewch inni aros am y ffigurau.

Janet Ryder: Clywsom gan Brif Weinidog Seland Newydd yn gynharach. Blaenoriaethir yr iaith Maori drwy ddarparu gwersi Cymraeg i oedolion am ddim. Yn 'Iaith Pawb', gwnaethoch ymrwymiad i addysg oedolion. A wnewch chi ystyried cymryd camau tebyg yng Nghymru a sicrhau bod pob cwrs Cymraeg i oedolion am ddim?

Sue Essex: Mae 'Iaith Pawb' yn nodi ffordd glir ymlaen, sydd wedi'i chyfateb ag arian. Nid wyf wedi derbyn y cais penodol a wnewch gan Alun Pugh, sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros yr iaith Gymraeg. Mae 'Iaith Pawb' yn cynnig camau clir ymlaen i gefnogi'r iaith.

Q4 Owen John Thomas: Will the Minister make a statement on the Government's underspend for the financial year April 2002 to April 2003? (OAQ26739)

Sue Essex: O ganlyniad i newid yn y weithdrefn gyllidebu, o ffigurau arian parod i gyfrifo adnoddau, ni fydd ffigurau cywir ar gyfer 2002-03 ar gael tan ddiwedd mis Gorffennaf.

Owen John Thomas: If you discover that funding is available, will you ensure, without delay, that it is spent in deprived wards that, to date, have not received Communities First funding, as they had expected?

Sue Essex: Yn y gorffennol, bu cyfatebiaeth dda rhwng gwariant gwirioneddol a gwariant disgwylidig. Dosberthir swm enfawr o arian—gwelaf gyflwyniadau yn rheolaidd—i ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ledled Cymru. Fodd bynnag, os oes gennyh

particular wards in mind, you could put that in writing and I will consider it.

2.20 p.m.

Mark Isherwood: Does the Minister agree that, if there is an underspend, it would illustrate the gap between the reality and the rhetoric of the Government's spending? Priority is given to public spending announcements rather than delivery. We desperately need money in many areas; the situation is exemplified in the agricultural sector, where there are problems with late payments and with unreleased modulation money. In north Wales, children's health services are inadequate, on which I am lobbied on a regular basis, while we spend billions of pounds on the most bureaucratic health service ever seen in Wales. Schools throughout Wales are not even covering their on-costs because of a situation that is exacerbated by issues such as those raised by Carl Sargeant. There is a funding crisis in care homes, the postcode lottery—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. I need no assistance from the Chamber in calling Members to order, but I welcome advice. *[Laughter.]* Could we have a question?

Mark Isherwood: Does the Minister concur that any underspend would confirm the fact that there is a gap between rhetoric and reality?

Sue Essex: Underspend? *[Laughter.]* Mark, I appreciate that you are a new Member but, if you had been here for as long as us, you would know that the Assembly has an exemplary record in matching projected spend with real spend. We are way ahead of other administrations. I do not accept the basic premise of your question.

Brian Gibbons: As mentioned in the social inclusion debate yesterday, one of the big barriers to getting Communities First money to the front line is the lack of capacity in many communities to be able to draw down the money that is available. The situation is not as Mark Isherwood described. Do you agree?

wardiau penodol mewn golwg, gallech nodi hynny yn ysgrifenedig a byddaf yn ei ystyried.

Mark Isherwood: A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno, os ceir tanwariant, y byddai'n dangos y bwlch rhwng realiti a rhyethreg gwariant y Llywodraeth? Rhoddir blaenoriaeth i gyhoeddiadau gwariant cyhoeddus yn hytrach na chyflawni. Mae angen arian yn daer arnom mewn sawl maes; ceir enghraifft o'r sefyllfa yn y sector amaethyddol, lle y ceir problemau gyda thaliadau hwyr ac arian modiwlleiddio nas rhyddhawyd. Yng ngogledd Cymru, mae gwasanaethau iechyd plant yn annigonol, ac mae pobl yn fy llobio'n rheolaidd ynghylch y mater, tra yr ydym yn gwario biliynau o bunnoedd ar y gwasanaeth iechyd mwyaf biwrocraidd a welwyd yng Nghymru erioed. Nid yw ysgolion ledled Cymru yn llwyddo i dalu eu costau hyd yn oed oherwydd sefyllfa a waethygir gan faterion fel y rhai a godwyd gan Carl Sargeant. Mae argyfwng ariannu mewn cartrefi gofal, y loteri codau post—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid oes angen cymorth o'r Siambr arnaf wrth alw Aelodau i drefn, ond croesawaf gyngor. *[Chwerthin.]* A allem gael cwestiwn?

Mark Isherwood: A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno y byddai unrhyw danwariant yn cadarnhau'r ffaith bod bwlch rhwng rhyethreg a realiti?

Sue Essex: Tanwariant? *[Chwerthin.]* Mark, gwerthfawrogaf eich bod yn Aelod newydd ond, pe baech wedi bod yma cyhyd â ni, byddech yn gwybod bod gan y Cynulliad hanes rhagorol o gyfateb gwariant arfaethedig â gwariant gwirioneddol. Yr ydym ymhell ar y blaen o gymharu â gweinyddiaethau eraill. Ni dderbyniaf gysail sylfaenol eich cwestiwn.

Brian Gibbons: Fel y crybwyllwyd yn y ddadl ar gymhwysiant cymdeithasol ddoe, un o'r rhwystrau mawr o ran sicrhau bod arian Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn cyrraedd y rheng flaen yw'r diffyg capasiti mewn llawer o gymunedau i allu defnyddio'r arian sydd ar gael. Nid yw'r sefyllfa fel ag y'i disgrifiwyd gan Mark Isherwood. A gytunwch?

Sue Essex: I have a background of working with communities in need and I have learned that you need capacity, in many forms—as you rightly said, Brian—in order for people to use money wisely and to use resources to the best effect. Capacity, skills and confidence are crucial to making the Communities First scheme work. I thank you for that comment.

Sue Essex: Mae gennyf gefndir o weithio gyda chymunedau mewn angen ac yr wyf wedi dysgu bod angen capasiti arnoch, mewn sawl ffurf—fel y dywedasoeh, a hynny'n gywir, Brian—er mwyn i bobl ddefnyddio arian yn ddoeth a defnyddio adnoddau yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol. Mae capasiti, sgiliau a hyder yn hanfodol i sicrhau bod y cynllun Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn gweithio. Diolchaf ichi am y sylw hwnnw.

Dyraniadau'r Gyllideb i Gymru Budget Allocations for Wales

Q7 Nick Bourne: What discussions has the Minister had with her Westminster counterparts about budget allocations for Wales? (OAQ26715)

C7 Nick Bourne: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda'i chydweithwyr yn San Steffan ynghylch dyraniadau'r gyllideb i Gymru? (OAQ26715)

Sue Essex: To date, I have had no discussions with my Westminster counterparts about budget allocations for Wales, although arrangements are in hand for the next ministerial quadrilateral meeting planned for this autumn. In the meantime, I may well contact my Whitehall counterparts should any issues require more timely discussion with them.

Sue Essex: Hyd yn hyn, nid wyf wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gyda'm cydweithwyr yn San Steffan ynghylch dyraniadau'r gyllideb i Gymru, er bod trefniadau yn cael eu gwneud ar gyfer y cyfarfod pedrochrog gweinidogol nesaf a drefnwyd ar gyfer yr hydref eleni. Yn y cyfamser, efallai y byddaf yn cysylltu â'm cydweithwyr yn Whitehall pe bai angen trafod unrhyw faterion yn fwy amserol gyda hwy.

Nick Bourne: When you have such discussions, you should remember that everyone in Wales is concerned about the impact of top-up fees. It seems scarcely credible that we will receive extra money, over and above the Barnett formula, to recompense Wales for top-up fees if no such recompense is provided for England. The situation is causing great concern in England. What assessment have you made of the likely cost of ensuring that there are no top-up fees in Wales when this policy kicks-in?

Nick Bourne: Pan fyddwch yn cael trafodaethau o'r fath, dylech gofio bod pawb yng Nghymru yn pryderu ynghylch effaith ffioedd ychwanegol. Prin ei bod yn gredadwy y byddwn yn derbyn arian ychwanegol, uwchlaw fformiwla Barnett, er mwyn ad-dalu Cymru am ffioedd ychwanegol os na ddarperir iawndal o'r fath yn Lloegr. Mae'r sefyllfa yn peri pryder mawr yn Lloegr. Pa asesiad a wnaethpwyd gennych o'r gost debygol o sicrhau nad oes ffioedd ychwanegol yng Nghymru pan ddaw'r polisi hwn i rym?

Sue Essex: My colleague, Jane Davidson, has assessed this situation. I repeat the answer that I gave to Jeff Cuthbert: it is a manifesto commitment, but we have made it clear that it is only a four-year programme. We cannot take it beyond that, but we have made assessments concerning those years.

Sue Essex: Mae fy nghyd-Weinidog, Jane Davidson, wedi asesu'r sefyllfa. Ailadroddaf yr ateb a roddais i Jeff Cuthbert: ymrwymiad maniffesto ydyw, ond yr ydym wedi nodi'n glir mai rhaglen bedair blynedd yn unig yw hon. Ni allwn fynd â hi y tu hwnt i hynny, ond yr ydym wedi gwneud asesiadau yn ymwneud â'r blynyddoedd hynny.

David Lloyd: Bydd creu ysbytai sefydledig

David Lloyd: The creation of foundation

yn effeithio ar gyllid iechyd Lloegr, a chan gofio bod cyllid iechyd Cymru yn seiliedig ar gyllid iechyd Lloegr, beth mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu ei wneud i ddiogelu cyllid iechyd Cymru?

Sue Essex: I am not sure what you mean by 'based on'. We determined our own financial priorities and decided that health is one of the most important, if not the most important, in terms of budget growth in block funding. I am confident that we have taken the financing of health service resources seriously in Wales. Jane Hutt will announce that this money is making a real difference to the health and social care of the people of Wales.

hospitals will impact upon the health budget in England, and bearing in mind that Wales's health budget is based on that of England, what does the Minister intend to do to safeguard Wales's health budget?

Sue Essex: Nid wyf yn siŵr beth a olygwch gan 'yn seiliedig ar'. Gwnaethom bennu ein blaenoriaethau ariannol ein hunain a phenderfynu mai iechyd yw un o'r rhai pwysicaf, os nad y pwysicaf, o ran twf y gyllideb mewn ariannu bloc. Yr wyf yn hyderus ein bod wedi ystyried y gwaith o ariannu adnoddau'r gwasanaeth iechyd o ddifrif yng Nghymru. Bydd Jane Hutt yn cyhoeddi bod yr arian hwn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth go iawn i iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol pobl Cymru.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside

Cyfarwyddebau'r UE ar Lygredd Aer EU Directives on Air Pollution

Q1 Peter Black: How is the Minister enforcing EU directives on air pollution in Wales? (OAQ26679)

C1 Peter Black: Sut y mae'r Gweinidog yn gorfodi cyfarwyddebau'r UE ar lygredd aer yng Nghymru? (OAQ26679)

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): Enforcement of directives on air pollution in Wales is taken forward through the UK air quality strategy, details of which were provided in my answer to you on 3 July.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Gorfodir cyfarwyddebau ar lygredd aer yng Nghymru drwy strategaeth ansawdd aer y DU, y darparwyd manylion amdani yn fy ateb ichi ar 3 Gorffennaf.

Peter Black: Do you accept that major concerns remain about air pollution around Wales, from which many respiratory illnesses arise? What collection and analysis of data on this matter is the Welsh Assembly Government undertaking, and what action do you propose to deal with the worst excesses of air pollution in Wales?

Peter Black: A dderbyniwch fod pryderon mawr o hyd ledled Cymru am lygredd aer, y cyfyd llawer o anhwylderau anadlol ohono? Pa fath o waith ar gasglu a dadansoddi data ar y mater hwn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymgymryd ag ef, a pha gamau y bwriedwch eu cymryd i ymdrin â'r digwyddiadau gwaethaf o lygredd aer yng Nghymru?

Carwyn Jones: The Environment Agency is the lead agency in the enforcement of environmental conditions. Some local authorities have declared pollutant levels in their areas. All local authorities have identified traffic as the major source of pollutants, apart from Neath Port Talbot, where it is airborne and industrial. However,

Carwyn Jones: Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yw'r asiantaeth arweiniol sy'n gyfrifol am orfodi amodau amgylcheddol. Mae rhai awdurdodau lleol wedi cyhoeddi'r lefelau llygredd yn eu hardaloedd. Mae pob awdurdod lleol wedi nodi traffig yn brif ffynhonnell llygrwyr, ar wahân i Gastell-nedd Port Talbot, lle mae yn yr aer ac yn

the air quality strategy that will be put in place will look at ways to improve air quality in Wales.

Brian Gibbons: A problem in addressing this issue for the ordinary person in the street is accessing easily understandable, comprehensive data. Will you ask your officials to look at the available websites so that people can access information on air quality without masses of computation, spreadsheets and so on?

Carwyn Jones: I have sympathy with your request given that we pride ourselves on the provision of understandable information. I will certainly consider that issue.

Jocelyn Davies: Are you aware of the increasing evidence of the harm caused by ozone to children's health? It is a significant cause of asthma. In view of the high ozone levels over south Wales, what consideration have you given to establishing an ozone action plan for south Wales in accordance with article 7 of the third daughter directive?

Carwyn Jones: The third daughter directive relating to ozone in ambient air will be transposed through the Air Quality (Ozone) (Wales) Regulations 2003, hopefully before the end of this term. Once that is in place, we must have robust systems to ensure that the regulations are met and that they have a lasting and visible effect on the levels of ozone in Wales.

Nick Bourne: You will be aware of a controversial planning proposal to reopen Llanfair quarry near Crickhowell, where one of the concerns relates to air quality in the sense discussed today. The problem is that an interim development Order from 1960 is already in place, before these directives came into being. Should not that interim development Order now be considered in the light of subsequent legal developments and more recent evidence so that this controversial proposal cannot proceed to the detriment of schoolchildren in the vicinity, people at the residential home at Crickhowell and the general population?

Carwyn Jones: Though I note your remarks

ddiwydiannol. Fodd bynnag, bydd y strategaeth ansawdd aer a sefydlir yn edrych ar ffyrdd i wella ansawdd aer yng Nghymru.

Brian Gibbons: Un anhawster i'r person cyffredin wrth fynd i'r afael â hyn yw cael gafael ar ddata cynhwysfawr, hawdd ei ddeall. A ofynnwch i'ch swyddogion edrych ar y gwefannau sydd ar gael er mwyn sicrhau y gall pobl gael gafael ar wybodaeth am ansawdd aer heb lwythi o gyfrifiannu, taenlenni ac yn y blaen?

Carwyn Jones: Cydymdeimlaf â'ch cais o gofio ein bod yn ymhyfrydu mewn darparu gwybodaeth ddealladwy. Byddaf yn sicr yn ystyried y mater.

Jocelyn Davies: A ydych yn ymwybodol o'r dystiolaeth gynyddol am y niwed a achosir gan osôn i iechyd plant? Mae'n un o brif achosion asthma. O gofio'r lefelau osôn uchel yn y De, pa ystyriaeth a roddwyd gennych i sefydlu cynllun gweithredu osôn ar gyfer y De yn unol ag erthygl 7 y drydedd epil gyfarwyddeb?

Carwyn Jones: Bydd y drydedd epil gyfarwyddeb sy'n ymwneud ag osôn mewn aer amgylchynol yn cael ei thrawsosod drwy Reoliadau Ansawdd Aer (Osôn) (Cymru) 2003, a hynny, gobeithio cyn diwedd y tymor hwn. Unwaith y bydd ar waith, bydd yn rhaid inni gael systemau cadarn i sicrhau bod y rheoliadau yn cael eu bodloni ac y cânt effaith barhaol a gweladwy ar y lefelau osôn yng Nghymru.

Nick Bourne: Byddwch yn ymwybodol o gynnig cynllunio dadleuol i ailagor chwarel Llanfair ger Crucywel, lle mae un o'r pryderon yn ymwneud ag ansawdd aer yn yr ystyr y'i trafodwyd heddiw. Y broblem yw bod Gorchymyn datblygu interim ers 1960 ar waith yn barod, cyn i'r cyfarwyddebau hyn ddod i fodolaeth. Oni ddylai'r Gorchymyn datblygu interim hwnnw gael ei ystyried bellach yng ngoleuni datblygiadau cyfreithiol diweddarach a thystiolaeth fwy diweddar fel na all y cynnig dadleuol hwn fynd yn ei flaen a niweidio plant ysgol yn y gymdogaeth, pobl yn y cartref preswyl yng Nghrucywel a'r boblogaeth yn gyffredinol?

Carwyn Jones: Er fy mod yn nodi eich

with interest, I cannot comment on individual planning applications.

sylwadau gyda diddordeb, ni allaf wneud sylw ar geisiadau cynllunio unigol.

Ailgylchu Recycling

Q2 Carl Sargeant: What plans does the Minister have to increase the level of recycling in Wales? (OAQ26760)

C2 Carl Sargeant: Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i ailgylchu mwy yng Nghymru? (OAQ26760)

Q3 Ann Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on progress in meeting recycling targets in Wales? (OAQ26725)

C3 Ann Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar hynt y gwaith o gyrraedd targedau ailgylchu yng Nghymru? (OAQ26725)

Carwyn Jones: Local authorities recycled and composted an average of 7 per cent of municipal waste in 2000-01, the third successive year of improvement. The Assembly Government has set local authorities a series of targets so that by 2009-10, at least 40 per cent of municipal waste will be recycled.

Carwyn Jones: Ailgylchodd a chompostiodd awdurdodau lleol 7 y cant o wastraff trefol ar gyfartaledd yn 2000-01, y drydedd flwyddyn o welliant yn olynol. Gosododd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gyfres o dargedau i awdurdodau lleol fel y caiff o leiaf 40 y cant o wastraff trefol ei ailgylchu erbyn 2009-10.

Carl Sargeant: Flintshire County Council is concerned that its current and planned recycling schemes are at risk from the funding shortfalls envisaged as a result of the uncertainty on the dissemination of landfill tax revenue via the Assembly. Has there been progress to determine the dissemination of landfill tax revenue, and if so, will that money be distributed to support all authorities and their environmental schemes?

Carl Sargeant: Mae Cyngor Sir y Fflint yn pryderu bod ei gynlluniau ailgylchu cyfredol ac arfaethedig o dan fygythiad yn sgîl y prinder arian a ragwelir o ganlyniad i ansicrwydd wrth ddsbarthu refeniw treth tirlenwi drwy'r Cynulliad. A fu unrhyw ddatblygiadau i benderfynu sut y caiff refeniw treth tirlenwi ei ddsbarthu, ac, os felly, a gaiff yr arian hwnnw ei ddsbarthu i gefnogi pob awdurdod a'i gynlluniau amgylcheddol?

Carwyn Jones: Thank you for raising this matter. I was not aware of this difficulty, but now you have raised it, I will consider it in detail.

Carwyn Jones: Diolch ichi am godi'r mater hwn. Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol o'r anhawster hwn, ond gan eich bod wedi ei godi, byddaf yn ei ystyried yn fanwl.

2.30 p.m.

Ann Jones: Most people would want to recycle household waste, and while there are some examples of best practice around Wales, until there is a more convenient system of collecting material for recycling, a major change in behaviour is unlikely to occur. Do you agree that we must keep up the momentum on tackling waste and take everyone forward, to encourage less landfill, more recycling, and a better environment for us all? Will you discuss with the Minister responsible for local government further

Ann Jones: Byddai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl am ailgylchu eu gwastraff cartref, ac er bod rhai enghreifftiau o arfer gorau ar hyd a lled Cymru, hyd nes y ceir system fwy cyfleus o gasglu deunydd i'w ailgylchu, mae'n annhebyg y gwelir newid mawr mewn ymddygiad. A gytunwch bod yn rhaid inni gadw'r momentwm ar fynd i'r afael â gwastraff, a sicrhau cydweithrediad, er mwyn annog llai o dirlenwi, mwy o ailgylchu, a gwell amgylchedd i bob un ohonom? A wnewch drafod ymhellach â'r Gweinidog

ways of persuading local authorities to increase the availability of doorstep recycling, including that of garden waste, as a means to making real progress toward meeting those targets to which we signed up?

Carwyn Jones: It is right that the easier it is for people to recycle, the more they will do so. We have the Wales waste strategy, which includes targets. Five exemplar authorities are involved in the waste strategy. I would be more than happy to explore making it easier for people to recycle, and where it may be possible to have increased doorstep collections.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Byddwch yn ymwybodol, Weinidog, bod Mesur preifat yn mynd drwy San Steffan ar hyn o bryd, yn galw ar awdurdodau lleol yn Lloegr i sicrhau bod adnoddau ar gael ar garreg y drws ar gyfer ailgylchu. Yr oedd y Mesur hwn yn cyfeirio at Gymru hefyd yn wreiddiol, ond dilëwyd y cyfeiriad hwnnw. Beth ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd yng Nghymru, a bod arferion da yn cael eu rhannu drwy Gymru? Mae gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf bolisi arbennig o dda ar ailgylchu. Beth ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau y caiff hynny ei ymestyn drwy Gymru?

Carwyn Jones: Mae gennym awdurdodau enghreifftiol, ac yr ydym am i'r awdurdodau hynny symud ymlaen yn gyflymach na'r awdurdodau eraill i ystyried polisiau ailgylchu. Yr ydym yn ystyried y Mesur sydd yn mynd drwy San Steffan i weld a ddylem gael cymalau ynddo sy'n berthnasol i Gymru. Mae gennym strategaeth wastraff, sy'n mynd â ni ymhellach na'r hyn sydd ar gael yn Lloegr, ac yr ydym yn ailystyried y strategaeth honno i weld a fyddai lles o gael mesurau arbennig i Gymru.

William Graham: Thank you for your answer to Rhodri Glyn Thomas's supplementary question, Minister—I was going to ask a similar question. Can you ensure that adequate funds will be made available as a result of this Bill so that the

sy'n gyfrifol am lywodraeth leol ffyrdd ychwanegol o ddarbwylllo awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau bod mwy o gynlluniau i gasglu defnyddiau ailgylchu ar garreg y drws, gan gynnwys gwastraff gardd, er mwyn gwneud cynnydd gwirioneddol tuag at fodloni'r targedau hynny yr ydym wedi cytuno arnynt?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n iawn dweud y bydd pobl yn ailgylchu mwy o ddeunydd os yw'n hawdd gwneud hynny. Mae gennym y strategaeth wastraff i Gymru gyfan, sy'n cynnwys targedau. Mae pum awdurdod enghreifftiol yn ymwneud â'r strategaeth wastraff. Byddwn yn fwy na bodlon ymchwilio i ffyrdd o'i gwneud yn haws i bobl ailgylchu, a lle y gellid cael mwy o gasgliadau ar garreg y drws.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You will be aware, Minister, that a private Bill is going through Westminster at present, which calls on local authorities in England to ensure that recycling resources are available on the doorstep. The Bill also referred to Wales originally, but that reference was deleted. What are you doing to ensure that that happens in Wales, and that best practice is disseminated throughout Wales? Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council has a particularly good policy on recycling. What are you doing to ensure that that is extended throughout Wales?

Carwyn Jones: We have exemplar authorities, and we are looking to those authorities to move forward more swiftly than the others to consider recycling policies. We are considering the Bill that is going through Westminster to see whether we should have clauses in it that are relevant to Wales. We have a waste strategy, which takes us further than what is available in England, and we are reconsidering that strategy to see whether there would be any benefit in having measures that are specific to Wales.

William Graham: Diolch ichi, Weinidog, am eich ateb i gwestiwn atodol Rhodri Glyn Thomas—yr oeddwn yn mynd i ofyn cwestiwn tebyg. A allwch sicrhau y bydd digon o arian ar gael o ganlyniad i'r Mesur hwn i'r Cynulliad fodloni'r targed yr ydym

Assembly can meet the target that we have already set for refuse recycling?

Carwyn Jones: The targets that we have set are not as a result of the Bill; they have been set as a result of the waste strategy. I am not aware of any funding difficulty regarding meeting those targets.

John Griffiths: On examples of best practice and supporting those exemplars, there are organisations such as Waste Savers in Newport, which has a kerb side collection. It may wish to expand in terms of the types of waste that it collects, and in terms of increasing the frequency of its collections from fortnightly to weekly, with perhaps general domestic waste collection going from weekly to fortnightly. Will you closely consider how you can support those ambitions and projects?

Carwyn Jones: I have already had a useful meeting with the community recycling sector, and those links still exist. I wish to assist that sector because of the good work that it has done in the past. The community sector must have a strong role to play in the future.

Kirsty Williams: I have listened closely to your answers, Minister. However, as you are aware, only five of the 22 local authorities in Wales are up to speed and already hitting the 15 per cent recycling target. What practical steps will you take to ensure that the other 17 authorities, which are in danger of missing their targets, will get there?

Carwyn Jones: We would expect those local authorities to inform us if there are difficulties. You are right that five local authorities are exemplars, one of which is Powys; Anglesey, Newport, Ceredigion, and Torfaen are the other authorities. On targets, we look to achieve at least 15 per cent recycling or composting by the end of 2004. By 2006-07, the target is 25 per cent and, as I have already mentioned, by 2009-10 it is 40 per cent. If local authorities have difficulties in meeting those targets, we would be more than happy to discuss those difficulties with

eisoes wedi'i osod ar gyfer ailgylchu gwastraff?

Carwyn Jones: Nid yw'r targedau a osodwyd gennym yn deillio o'r Mesur; fe'u gosodwyd o ganlyniad i'r strategaeth wastraff. Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw anhawster ariannu ynglŷn â bodloni'r targedau hynny.

John Griffiths: O ran enghreifftiau arferion gorau a chefnogi'r awdurdodau enghreifftiol hynny, ceir sefydliadau fel Waste Savers yng Nghasnewydd, sy'n casglu ar ymyl y ffordd. Efallai y bydd am ehangu o ran y mathau o wastraff a gesglir ganddo, ac o ran cynyddu amllder ei gasgliadau o bob pythefnos i bob wythnos, gan gasglu gwastraff cartref cyffredinol yn wythnosol yn hytrach na phob pythefnos. A wnewch ystyried yn fanwl sut y gallwch gefnogi'r dyheadau a'r prosiectau hynny?

Carwyn Jones: Yr wyf eisoed wedi cael cyfarfod defnyddiol gyda'r sector ailgylchu cymunedol, ac mae'r cysylltiadau hynny'n dal i fodoli. Hoffwn gynorthwyo'r sector hwnnw oherwydd y gwaith da a wnaeth yn y gorffennol. Rhaid bod gan y sector cymunedol rôl gadarn i'w chwarae yn y dyfodol.

Kirsty Williams: Gwrandewais yn astud ar eich atebion, Weinidog. Fodd bynnag, fel y gwyddoch, dim ond pump o'r 22 o awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru sydd yn gweithredu'n llawn ac yn bodloni eu targed ailgylchu o 15 y cant. Pa gamau ymarferol a gymerwch i sicrhau bod yr 17 awdurdod arall, sydd mewn perygl o fethu â chyrraedd eu targedau, yn eu cyrraedd?

Carwyn Jones: Byddem yn disgwyl i'r awdurdodau lleol hynny roi gwybod inni os oes unrhyw anawsterau. Yr ydych yn gywir bod pum awdurdod lleol yn rhai enghreifftiol, ac mae Powys yn un ohonynt; Ynys Môn, Casnewydd, Ceredigion a Thor-faen yw'r awdurdodau eraill. O ran targedau yr ydym yn anelu at ailgylchu neu gompostio o leiaf 15 y cant o wastraff erbyn diwedd 2004. Erbyn 2006-07, mae'r targed yn 25 y cant ac, fel y soniais eisoed, erbyn 2009-10 mae'n 40 y cant. Os caiff awdurdodau lleol anawsterau i fodloni'r targedau hynny, byddem yn fwy

them.

Laura Anne Jones: You have more or less answered my question, Minister. However, do you realise that a recent report from the Welsh Consumer Council states that Wales has the worst recycling rate in Europe? Only 5 per cent of household waste is recycled. That is a shameful record, and it is your duty and that of your Government to address that. Recycling is important to preserve the beautiful environment that we enjoy in Wales, as I am sure you will agree. However, many people do not have access—

The Presiding Officer: Order. You have been here long enough, Laura Anne, to know that I like to hear questions.

Laura Anne Jones: I am sorry. As John Griffiths has just said, do you agree that if you made recycling more convenient for people, the pitiful figure of 5 per cent would increase?

Carwyn Jones: That is why we have a waste strategy. The figure is 5 per cent and that is why we are developing and implementing the waste strategy.

Janet Davies: In order to increase recycling rates more quickly than is currently being achieved, will you set statutory targets for Wales, because the current targets are for the whole of the UK?

Carwyn Jones: Our agreed targets are set in the waste strategy. We prefer to use the carrot rather than the stick at this stage. If local authorities can meet those targets, it will be seen as a success. However, if local authorities are in difficulty, we will discuss their problems with them. Nevertheless, we have targets, which we expect local authorities to meet.

na pharod i drafod yr anawsterau hynny gyda hwy.

Laura Ann Jones: Yr ydych chi, Weinidog, fwy neu lai, wedi ateb fy nghwestiwn. Fodd bynnag, a sylweddolwch fod adroddiad diweddar gan Gyngor Defnyddwyr Cymru yn nodi mai gan Gymru y mae'r gyfradd ailgylchu waethaf yn Ewrop? Dim ond 5 y cant o wastraff cartref a gaiff ei ailgylchu. Mae'n record gywilyddus, ac mae'n ddyletswydd arnoch chi, a'ch Llywodraeth, i fynd i'r afael â hynny. Mae ailgylchu yn bwysig i gadw'r amgylchedd hardd a fwynhawn yng Nghymru, fel yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch. Fodd bynnag, nid oes gan lawer o bobl fynediad—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Buoch yma'n ddigon hir, Laura Anne, i wybod fy mod yn hoffi clywed cwestiynau.

Laura Ann Jones: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Fel y mae John Griffiths newydd ddweud, a gytunwch y byddai'r ffigur truenus o 5 y cant yn cynyddu pe baech yn gwneud ailgylchu yn fwy cyfleus i bobl?

Carwyn Jones: Dyna pam mae strategaeth wastraff gennym. Pump y cant yw'r ffigur a dyna pam yr ydym yn datblygu'r strategaeth wastraff a'i rhoi ar waith.

Janet Davies: Er mwyn cynyddu cyfraddau ailgylchu yn gyflymach nag a wneir ar hyn o bryd, a osodwch dargedau statudol ar gyfer Cymru, gan fod y targedau presennol yn rhai ar gyfer y DU gyfan?

Carwyn Jones: Nodir ein targedau cytûn yn y strategaeth wastraff. Mae'n well gennym wobrwyo awdurdodau yn hytrach na'u cosbu ar hyn o bryd. Os gall awdurdodau lleol gyrraedd y targedau hynny, fe'i gwelir fel llwyddiant. Fodd bynnag, os bydd awdurdodau lleol mewn trafferthion, byddwn yn trafod eu problemau gyda hwy. Serch hynny, mae gennym dargedau, y disgwyliwn i'r awdurdodau lleol eu bodloni.

Cyfarwydddeb Fframwaith Dŵr yr UE EU Water Framework Directive

C4 Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y **Q4 Alun Ffred Jones:** Will the Minister

Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gyfarwyddeb fframwaith dŵr yr Undeb Ewropeaidd? (OAQ26771)

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r gyfarwyddeb yn ddeddfwriaeth sylweddol a fydd yn mynnu pennu amcanion amgylcheddol ar gyfer dyfroedd mewndirol ac arfordirol.

Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ailystyried gosod rhan fawr o Gymru, sy'n cynnwys afonydd Hafren, Gwy a Thaf, o fewn ardal Severn Trent yn Lloegr a ffurfio cynllun ystyrlon yn seiliedig ar fuddiannau Cymru o dan y gyfarwyddeb?

Carwyn Jones: Mae gennym broblem o ran daearyddiaeth gan fod yr afonydd hynny yn llifo drwy Loegr. Felly, mae'n rhaid cael strwythurau sy'n croesi ffiniau i ddelio â hynny ac mae'n rhaid inni weithio gyda'n cymdogion yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid i farn Cymru ynglŷn â sut i symud ymlaen o dan y gyfarwyddeb yn y dyfodol gael ei chyfleu yn gryf.

Lisa Francis: Given that the EU water framework directive will apparently enable seven older directives to be repealed, including those that relate to information and measurements concerning fish water and shellfish water, do you anticipate that it will make a difference to the way in which Welsh shellfish waters are tested for pollutants? The statistically unreliable most-probable-number sampling method of testing British shellfish waters has resulted in a bizarre situation whereby Welsh mussel producers—

The Presiding Officer: Order. The same rule applies to you as to your Assembly colleague. I request short, sharp questions that will surprise the Minister to such an extent that he will have trouble answering them.

Lisa Francis: I thought that this question might be sufficiently surprising.

Will the directive affect the way in which waters in Wales are tested, and will that affect the situation for mussel producers in Wales?

make a statement on the European Union's water framework directive? (OAQ26771)

Carwyn Jones: The directive is a substantial piece of legislation that will require environmental objectives to be set for all inland and coastal waters.

Alun Ffred Jones: Will the Minister reconsider including a large area of Wales, which includes the Severn, Wye and Taff rivers, within the Severn Trent area in England and establish a coherent plan based on the interests of Wales under the directive?

Carwyn Jones: We have a geographical problem, as those rivers flow through England. Therefore, we must have cross-border structures in order to deal with that and we must work with our neighbours in England. However, Wales's view on how to move forward under the directive in future must be robustly conveyed.

Lisa Francis: O gofio y bydd cyfarwyddeb fframwaith dŵr yr UE mae'n debyg yn caniatáu i saith o gyfarwyddebau blaenorol gael eu diddymu, gan gynnwys y rhai sy'n ymwneud â gwybodaeth a mesuriadau ynglŷn â dŵr pysgod a dŵr pysgod cregyn, a ydych yn rhagweld y bydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i'r ffordd y profir dyfroedd pysgod cregyn Cymru am lygrwyr? Mae'r dull samplu y nifer mwyaf tebygol, sy'n annibynadwy yn ystadegol, a ddefnyddir i brofi dyfroedd pysgod cregyn Prydain wedi arwain at sefyllfa ryfedd lle y mae cynhyrchwyr cregyn glas Cymru—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r un rheol yn berthnasol i chi fel i'ch cyd-Aelod Cynulliad. Gofynnaf am gwestiynau byr, bachog a fydd yn peri syndod i'r Gweinidog i'r fath raddau fel y bydd yn cael anhawster i'w hateb.

Lisa Francis: Credais y gallai'r cwestiwn hwn beri digon o syndod.

A fydd y gyfarwyddeb yn effeithio ar y ffordd y caiff dyfroedd yng Nghymru eu profi, ac a fydd hynny'n effeithio ar y sefyllfa i gynhyrchwyr cregyn gleision yng Nghymru?

Carwyn Jones: This is primarily an issue for the Environment Agency. We have had difficulties in terms of shellfisheries in Wales over the past few years, especially following the temporary closure of the Bury inlet. It is important that we have robust systems in place and that people have confidence in the shellfish that they buy. Therefore, it is important that we consider new directives to be to our advantage rather than viewing them as being an additional burden.

Carwyn Jones: Mater i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yw hwn yn bennaf. Cawsom drafferthion o ran pysgodfeydd pysgod cregyn yng Nghymru dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, yn enwedig ar ôl cau cilfach Bury dros dro. Mae'n bwysig bod gennym systemau cadarn ar waith a bod gan bobl hyder yn y pysgod cregyn a brynant. Felly, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ystyried cyfarwydddebau newydd er mantais i ni yn hytrach na'u gweld fel baich ychwanegol.

Datblygu Cynaliadwy Sustainable Development

C5 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Pa gamau fydd y Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy? (OAQ26772)

Q5 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: What steps will the Minister take to promote sustainable development? (OAQ26772)

Carwyn Jones: Byddaf yn hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy drwy'r cynllun a thrwy adolygu'r cynllun hwnnw.

Carwyn Jones: I will promote sustainable development via the plan and by reviewing that plan.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod y rhan fwyaf o'r boblogaeth, a llawer o asiantaethau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r Cynulliad, yn cael peth trafferth deall beth yn union y mae datblygu cynaliadwy yn ei olygu. Pa gamau ymarferol y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod pobl yn deall beth yw datblygu cynaliadwy a'u bod yn ymateb i her datblygu cynaliadwy? Cyhoeddodd ei ragflaenydd lyfryn sy'n sôn am ddysgu sut i fyw yn wahanol. Sut y bydd yn sicrhau bod pobl Cymru yn cael y cyfle i fyw yn wahanol ac yn gynaliadwy?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: The Minister will be aware that the majority of the population, and many organisations associated with the National Assembly, are finding it difficult to understand what exactly sustainable development means. What practical steps is the Minister taking to ensure that people understand what sustainable development means and that they respond to the challenge of sustainable development? His predecessor published a booklet on learning to live differently. How will he ensure that the people of Wales have the opportunity to live in a different and sustainable way?

Carwyn Jones: Bydd yr arolwg yn ystyried y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy. Derbyniaf fod problem o ran delwedd datblygu cynaliadwy. Cred pobl ei fod yn fater sy'n ymwneud yn gyfan gwbl â'r amgylchedd. Cynhelir cynhadledd fawr ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yng Nghaerdydd yn ystod gwanwyn 2004 a gobeithiwn y caiff effaith o ran newid barn pobl am gysyniad datblygu cynaliadwy.

Carwyn Jones: The review will take account of the sustainable development plan. I accept that there is a problem in terms of the image of sustainable development. People believe that it is a wholly environmental matter. A major conference on sustainable development will be held in Cardiff in the spring of 2004 and we hope that it will have an impact in changing people's opinions of the concept of sustainable development.

2.40 p.m.

Brynle Williams: Having spoken with local authority representatives, I feel that the

Brynle Williams: Ar ôl siarad â chynrychiolwyr awdurdodau lleol, teimlaf y

Assembly could do much more to promote sustainable development. Local authorities need support as well as money. Unless the National Assembly tells them that a matter is urgent, important matters get overlooked due to political priorities. Minister, will you reconsider the strategy with a view to making more of its recommendations mandatory? That would enable officials to deliver the plan effectively and efficiently.

Carwyn Jones: That is why we are holding the review.

Mick Bates: Minister, it is difficult to get to grips with understanding sustainable development, so surely the best policy is to provide exemplar renewable energy projects throughout Wales. However, the technical advice notes, meant to encourage local authorities to undertake these projects, are still not ready for publication. The former Minister for Environment said that they would be ready before the end of this session, but you recently wrote to me saying that they will not be ready until the autumn. Why is there such a delay in providing them? They are meant to encourage renewable energy in Wales.

Carwyn Jones: Technical advice notes can take time to develop, given the length of consultation periods and so forth. However, I will write to you in response to your specific question, so that you are aware of the difficulties that are causing the delay.

gallai'r Cynulliad wneud llawer mwy i hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae angen cefnogaeth yn ogystal ag arian ar awdurdodau lleol. Os na ddywed y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wrthynt fod mater yn un brys, gall materion pwysig gael eu hanwybyddu o ganlyniad i flaenoriaethau gwleidyddol. Weinidog, a wnewch ailystyried y strategaeth gyda'r bwriad o wneud mwy o'i hargymhellion yn orfodol? Byddai hynny'n galluogi swyddogion i gyflwyno'r cynllun yn effeithiol ac yn effeithlon.

Carwyn Jones: Dyna pam yr ydym yn cynnal yr adolygiad.

Mick Bates: Weinidog, mae'n anodd mynd i'r afael â deall datblygu cynaliadwy, felly y polisi gorau mae'n siŵr yw darparu prosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy enghreifftiol ledled Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'r nodiadau cyngor technegol, y bwriedir iddynt annog awdurdodau lleol i ymgymryd â'r prosiectau hyn yn dal heb fod yn barod i'w cyhoeddi. Dywedodd y cyn-Weinidog dros yr Amgylchedd y byddent yn barod cyn diwedd y sesiwn hwn, ond bu ichi ysgrifennu ataf yn ddiweddar yn dweud na fyddant yn barod tan yr hydref. Pam y mae cymaint o oedi cyn eu darparu? Fe'u bwriadwyd i annog ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru.

Carwyn Jones: Gall nodiadau cyngor technegol gymryd amser i'w datblygu, o gofio hyd y cyfnodau ymgynghori ac yn y blaen. Fodd bynnag, ysgrifennaf atoch mewn ymateb i'ch cwestiwn penodol, er mwyn ichi fod yn ymwybodol o'r anawsterau sy'n achosi'r oedi.

Gorchmynion Datblygu Interim Interim Development Orders

Q6 Nick Bourne: Will the Minister make a statement on the number of interim development Orders in Wales? (OAQ26726)

Carwyn Jones: The provisions of the Planning and Compensation Act 1991 included the need to register permissions granted under the interim development Order legislation with the relevant local planning authority by 25 March 1992. The information on the number of sites registered was

C6 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar nifer y gorchmynion datblygu interim yng Nghymru? (OAQ26726)

Carwyn Jones: Yr oedd darpariaethau Deddf Cynllunio a Digolledu 1991 yn cynnwys yr angen i gofrestru caniatadau a roddwyd o dan ddeddfwriaeth y Gorchmynion datblygu interim gyda'r awdurdod cynllunio lleol perthnasol erbyn 25 Mawrth 1992. Casglwyd y wybodaeth am nifer y safleoedd

collected on behalf of the Planning Officers Society in 1996. That survey indicated that mineral planning authorities in Wales had registered interim development Order permissions for 68 sites. All other interim development Order permissions not registered by the due date ceased to have effect.

Nick Bourne: Without referring to any specifics, does the Minister accept the Environment Agency's position, namely that planning often proceeds on the basis of historic definitions, where planning legislation has subsequently been introduced? That is unsatisfactory. Will the Minister consider reviewing that procedure, as it causes concern to people throughout Wales?

Carwyn Jones: That is primarily a matter for mineral planning authorities, which have the power to make prohibition Orders extinguishing the Orders registered before 1992. It is for them to examine what needs to be done. In any event, the permissions will cease in 2042. That is clearly some time away, but mineral planning authorities must consider that when examining the situation locally.

a gofrestrwyd ar ran Cymdeithas y Swyddogion Cynllunio yn 1996. Nododd yr arolwg hwnnw fod awdurdodau cynllunio mwynau yng Nghymru wedi cofrestru caniatadau Gorchymyn datblygu interim ar gyfer 68 o safleoedd. Dirymwyd pob caniatâd Gorchymyn datblygu interim nas cofrestrwyd erbyn y dyddiad gofynnol.

Nick Bourne: Heb gyfeirio at unrhyw bwyntiau penodol, a yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn safbwynt Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, sef bod cynllunio yn aml yn mynd rhagddo ar sail diffiniadau hanesyddol, lle bo deddfwriaeth cynllunio wedi ei chyflwyno ar ôl hynny? Mae hynny'n anfoddfaol. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried adolygu'r weithdrefn honno, gan ei bod yn achosi pryder i bobl ar hyd a lled Cymru?

Carwyn Jones: Mater i awdurdodau cynllunio mwynau yw hwnnw'n bennaf. Hwy sydd â'r pwerau i wneud Gorchymynion gwahardd sy'n dileu'r Gorchymynion a gofrestrwyd cyn 1992. Hwy ddylai archwilio beth sydd angen ei wneud. Beth bynnag, daw'r caniatadau i ben yn 2042. Mae'n amlwg bod hynny dipyn o amser i'r dyfodol, ond rhaid i awdurdodau cynllunio mwynau ystyried hynny wrth archwilio'r sefyllfa yn lleol.

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Janet Ryder: Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 7.2, which relates to not using language in the Chamber that discriminates against any other Member. I seek your guidance on the language used by Carl Sargeant, when he asked the Minister to meet solely with directly elected Members. Does that discriminate against Members elected on regional lists? Will you offer us some guidance, Presiding Officer, on whether that constitutes discrimination against Members?

Jenny Randerson: Further to that point of order, Presiding Officer, will you confirm not only that no distinction exists between Assembly Members, but also that it follows

Janet Ryder: Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.2, sy'n ymwneud â pheidio â defnyddio iaith yn y Siambr sy'n gwahaniaethu yn erbyn unrhyw Aelod arall. Gofynnaf am eich arweiniad ar yr iaith a ddefnyddiwyd gan Carl Sargeant, pan ofynnodd i'r Gweinidog gyfarfod gydag Aelodau a oedd wedi eu hethol yn uniongyrchol yn unig. A ydyw hynny yn gwahaniaethu yn erbyn yr Aelodau a etholwyd drwy'r rhestrau rhanbarthol? A wnewch chi, Lywydd, gynnig arweiniad inni ynghylch a yw hynny yn gyfystyr â gwahaniaethu yn erbyn Aelodau?

Jenny Randerson: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, Lywydd, a wnewch gadarnhau nid yn unig nad oes unrhyw wahaniaeth rhwng Aelodau'r Cynulliad, ond hefyd ei bod

that all Assembly Members can expect equal treatment from Ministers in respect of constituency or regional business? Will you comment on why the Labour Party has only started this concerted campaign now that it no longer has a regional list Member?

Eleanor Burnham *rose—*

The Presiding Officer: Order. I will call Brian Gibbons and David Melding to speak, and then I will consider whether there is time to call another Liberal Democrat on this point of order, although I probably will call you, Eleanor Burnham.

Brian Gibbons: Further to that point of order, Carl Sargeant made a reasonable point. If I asked to meet a Minister, would that Minister also be obliged to invite all regional list Members to such a meeting?

David Melding: Further to that point of order, as far as I am concerned, all Assembly Members are directly elected, as I know of no corporate intermediary body that decides what constitutes an additional Member.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any other helpful comments on this?

Eleanor Burnham: Further to Janet Ryder's point of order, I ask for your guidance on the way in which local authorities view different types of Members.

David Davies: Further to this point of order, Carl Sargeant requested a meeting for himself and a colleague with the Minister. I cannot see what all the fuss is about.

Carl Sargeant: Further to this point of order, my exact words were 'hold a meeting with me and the other directly elected constituency Assembly Member'. What is the problem with that? I see nothing wrong with it.

Mark Isherwood: Further to this point of order, I am a directly elected Member for the north Wales region and I live in Flintshire. I have been personally involved in this matter

yn dilyn y gall pob Aelod Cynulliad ddisgwyl cael eu trin yn gyfartal gan Weinidogion o ran busnes etholaethol neu ranbarthol? A wnewch sylw ar pam mai dim ond yn awr y mae'r Blaid Lafur wedi dechrau'r ymgyrch fwriadol hon gan nad oes ganddi Aelod rhestr ranbarthol mwyach?

Eleanor Burnham *a gododd—*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Byddaf yn galw ar Brian Gibbons a David Melding i siarad, ac yna ystyriaf a oes amser i alw Democrat Rhyddfrydol arall ar y pwynt o drefn hwn, er y byddaf yn eich galw chi, Eleanor Burnham, fwy na thebyg.

Brian Gibbons: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, gwnaeth Carl Sargeant bwynt rhesymol. Pe bawn yn gofyn am gael cyfarfod â Gweinidog, a fyddai'n ddyletswydd ar y Gweinidog hwnnw i wahodd pob Aelod rhestr ranbarthol i gyfarfod o'r fath?

David Melding: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, o'm rhan i, etholir pob Aelod Cynulliad yn uniongyrchol, gan na wn am unrhyw gorff cyfryngol corfforaethol sy'n penderfynu beth yw ystyr Aelod ychwanegol.

Y Llywydd: A oes unrhyw sylwadau eraill sydd o gymorth ar hyn?

Eleanor Burnham: Ymhellach i bwynt o drefn Janet Ryder, gofynnaf am eich arweiniad ar y ffordd y mae awdurdodau lleol yn edrych ar wahanol fathau o Aelodau.

David Davies: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwn, gofynnodd Carl Sargeant am gyfarfod iddo'i hun a chyd-Aelod gyda'r Gweinidog. Ni allaf weld pam y mae angen yr holl ffwdan.

Carl Sargeant: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwn, fy union eiriau oedd 'cynnal cyfarfod â mi a'r Aelod Cynulliad arall a etholwyd yn uniongyrchol'. Beth yw'r broblem gyda hynny? Ni allaf weld dim o'i le arno.

Mark Isherwood: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwn, yr wyf yn Aelod a etholwyd yn uniongyrchol dros ranbarth y Gogledd ac yr wyf yn byw yn Sir y Fflint. Yr wyf wedi bod

for over a year. I have held meetings with the leader of Flintshire County Council, its director of education and the executive member for education, as well as with headteachers in Flintshire. Only this morning I fought this corner at the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee meeting. Given all of this, I would welcome the opportunity to be involved in such a meeting.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Ministers may meet whomsoever they wish. Before Members cheer too quickly, there is more to come. It is a matter for Ministers whom they decide to invite to meetings, and I am conscious of the fact that large meetings can be cumbersome. However, on the matter of election to this body, whatever members of other Governments may say, all Members are treated equally in this Chamber. All Members may contribute on an equal basis. I have on my desk at all times a list to remind me which Member represents which constituency or region and in which region constituencies fall. That is for the better guidance of my brain when I select Members to speak, be it to ask supplementary questions or during statements or debates. I suggest that directly elected local authorities should take the same approach. It is a matter for local authorities whom they choose to invite to an event, but were a local authority to discriminate against Assembly Members on the basis of the electoral system by which those Members were elected, I would advise it gently that it was going against the best practice established by the National Assembly. I think that that is enough on that issue.

Alun Cairns: Point of order.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I will take points of order after the statement. Janet Ryder's point of order arose directly from questions. I have noted that you wish to raise a point of order later.

yn ymwneud yn bersonol â'r mater hwn ers dros flwyddyn. Cynhaliais gyfarfodydd ag arweinydd Cyngor Sir y Fflint, ei gyfarwyddwr addysg ac aelod y weithrediaeth dros addysg, yn ogystal â phenaethiaid ysgolion yn sir y Fflint. Dim ond y bore yma bûm yn dadlau ar y pwnc yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. O gofio hyn i gyd, hoffwn gael y cyfle i gyfranogi mewn cyfarfod o'r fath.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Gall Gweinidogion gyfarfod â phwy bynnag a ddymunant. Cyn i Aelodau floeddio eu cymeradwyaeth yn rhy gyflym, mae rhagor i ddod. Mater i'r Gweinidogion yw pwy y maent yn penderfynu eu gwahodd i gyfarfodydd, ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith y gall cyfarfodydd mawr fod yn drwsgl. Fodd bynnag, ar fater ethol i'r corff hwn, beth bynnag a ddywed aelodau o Lywodraethau eraill, caiff pob Aelod ei drin yn gydradd yn y Siambr hon. Gall pob aelod gyfrannu ar sail gydradd. Mae gennyf restr ar fy nesg bob amser i'm hatgoffa pa Aelod sy'n cynrychioli pa etholaeth neu ranbarth ac ym mha ranbarth y mae'r etholaethau. Mae hynny er mwyn rhoi'r arweiniad gorau i mi fy hun pan fyddaf yn dewis Aelodau i siarad, boed i ofyn cwestiwn ategol neu yn ystod datganiad neu ddadl. Awgrymaf y dylai awdurdodau lleol a etholir yn uniongyrchol ymddwyn yn yr un ffordd. Mater i awdurdodau lleol ydyw pwy a ddewisant eu gwahodd i ddigwyddiad, ond pe bai awdurdod lleol yn gwahaniaethu yn erbyn Aelodau Cynulliad ar sail y drefn etholiadol yr etholwyd yr Aelodau drwyddi, byddwn yn eu hatgoffa eu bod yn mynd yn groes i'r arfer gorau a sefydlwyd gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Credaf fod hyn yn ddigon ar y mater hwnnw.

Alun Cairns: Pwynt o drefn.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Derbyniat bwyntiau o drefn ar ôl y datganiad. Cododd pwynt o drefn Janet Ryder yn uniongyrchol o'r cwestiynau. Yr wyf wedi nodi eich bod am godi pwynt o drefn yn ddiweddarach.

Datganiad ar Adroddiad Wanless Statement on the Wanless Report

The Minister for Health and Social Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau

Services (Jane Hutt): I welcome this opportunity to inform the Assembly of the publication of the review of health and social care in Wales. A copy of the review has today been placed in the Assembly Library and published on the internet. A summary version has been made available and will, I hope, be read widely by those who have an interest in the future of our health and social care services.

The review was established to provide assurance that the additional money invested in health and social care would be put to the most effective use. Work on the review began in October 2002. I am grateful to all those who contributed to the work, particularly Derek Wanless. He was the author of the 'Securing our Future Health: Taking a Long-term View' report, which led to the release by the Chancellor of the Exchequer of substantial new funding for health. He has provided advice on, and oversight of, the Welsh review and has significantly influenced the recommendations that will shape the future of health and social care in Wales.

2.50 p.m.

My intention this afternoon is to outline the Government's initial response to the recommendations. The Health and Social Services Committee will consider the review next week, and I will return to the Assembly in the autumn with a more detailed implementation plan. The Welsh Assembly Government has accepted the central conclusions of the review, many of which confirm the key policies we have set over the past four years. The review will enable us to take those policy directions further and at a quicker pace.

The report sets out a number of priority areas for action. It concludes that the solution to the pressures and problems experienced in our hospital services lies in a three-fold approach that involves making a reality of the preventative and primary-care led service, which has been the policy of this Government ever since I became a Minister. Accelerating alternatives to hospital admission is an essential part of creating the

Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Croesawaf y cyfle hwn i hysbysu'r Cynulliad fod yr adolygiad o iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru wedi ei gyhoeddi. Heddiw rhoddwyd copi o'r adolygiad yn Llyfrgell y Cynulliad ac fe'i cyhoeddwyd ar y rhyngwyd. Mae crynodeb ar gael a fydd, gobeithio, yn cael ei ddarllen yn eang gan y rhai sydd â diddordeb yn nyfodol ein gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol.

Sefydlwyd yr adolygiad er mwyn rhoi sicrwydd y gwneir y defnydd mwyaf effeithiol o'r arian ychwanegol a fuddsoddir mewn iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Dechreuodd y gwaith ar yr adolygiad ym mis Hydref 2002. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i bawb a gyfrannodd at y gwaith, yn arbennig Derek Wanless. Ef oedd awdur yr adroddiad 'Securing our Future Health: Taking a Long-term View', a arweiniodd at ryddhau cryn dipyn o arian newydd ar gyfer iechyd gan Ganghellor y Trysorlys. Rhoddodd gyngor ar yr adolygiad o Gymru, a'i oruchwylio, a dylanwadodd yn fawr ar yr argymhellion a fydd yn llywio dyfodol iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru.

Fy mwriad y prynhawn yma yw amlinellu ymateb cychwynnol y Llywodraeth i'r argymhellion. Bydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ystyried yr adolygiad yr wythnos nesaf, a dychwelaf i'r Cynulliad yn yr hydref gyda chynllun gweithredu manylach. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi derbyn canlyniadau canolog yr adolygiad, gyda nifer ohonynt yn cadarnhau'r polisiau allweddol a bennwyd gennym dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf. Bydd yr adolygiad yn ein galluogi i ddatblygu cyfeiriadau'r polisiau hynny ymhellach ac yn gyflymach.

Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi nifer o feysydd blaenoriaeth er mwyn gweithredu arnynt. Daw i'r casgliad mai ymagwedd driphlyg yw'r ateb i'r pwysau a'r problemau a brofir yn ein gwasanaethau ysbyty, sy'n golygu troi'r gwasanaeth ataliol a arweinir gan ofal sylfaenol yn realiti, sef polisi'r Llywodraeth hon ers i mi ddod yn Weinidog. Mae cyflymu dewisiadau amgen i anfon pobl i'r ysbyty yn rhan hanfodol o greu'r lle y gall ysbytai

space in which hospitals can perform the tasks for which they are intended. Making a reality of social care services that are strong enough to provide more appropriate care for people as soon as they are fit to leave hospital is also essential. Tackling delayed transfers of care is not susceptible to a single or simple solution, but finding alternatives for the care of patients who do not need to be in acute hospitals is a second essential step in freeing capacity.

Even with improvements in access to primary and social care, changes in demography and technology mean that a step change in the efficiency of health and social care services will be needed. Implicit in this finding is an understanding that the range of services provided in acute hospitals may have to change. Reform in managing demand for health services will always be difficult, and a mature consideration will be needed of the different courses of action to be adopted while consolidating our commitment to tackling health inequalities.

The report provides some hard messages for the future delivery of the service as those longer-term measures are put in place. As resources increase, so financial disciplines have to be tightened. Deficits have to be squeezed out of the system. There must be an emphasis on rewarding success with greater freedom to act. Where underperformance persists, delegation of responsibility will have to be narrowed until there is clear proven capacity to take it on again. Local government must also play its part in modernising services, by benchmarking spending and outcomes within an overall commitment to change.

Llywydd, today is not the occasion for announcing detailed proposals to put the review's conclusions into practice. That will follow. We do, however, already have some important levers in our hands that will allow us to move ahead. The general practitioner contract negotiations have come to a successful conclusion. We will use this in Wales to provide the strengthened primary care service we need, which will include

ymgymryd â'r tasgau y'u bwriedir ar eu cyfer. Mae gwireddu sefyllfa lle mae gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol yn ddigon cryf i ddarparu gofal mwy priodol i bobl cyn gynted ag y maent yn abl i adael yr ysbyty hefyd yn hanfodol. Nid yw mynd i'r afael ag oedi cyn trosglwyddo gofal yn rhywbeth y gellir ei ddatrys gydag un ateb neu ateb syml, ond mae dod o hyd i ddulliau amgen i ofalu am gleifion nad oes angen iddynt fod mewn ysbytai aciwt yn ail gam hanfodol yn y broses o ryddhau capasiti.

Hyd yn oed gyda gwelliannau mewn mynediad i ofal sylfaenol a chymdeithasol, mae newidiadau mewn demograffi a thechnoleg yn golygu y bydd angen newid sylweddol yn effeithlonrwydd gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Rhan annatod o'r canfyddiad hwn yw'r ddealltwriaeth y bydd yn rhaid, o bosibl, i'r ystod o wasanaethau a ddarperir mewn ysbytai aciwt newid. Bydd diwygio'r broses o reoli'r galw am wasanaethau iechyd bob amser yn anodd, a bydd angen ystyriaeth aeddfed o'r gwahanol gamau i'w mabwysiadu wrth gryfhau ein hymrwymiad i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd.

Mae rhai negeseuon caled yn yr adroddiad ar gyfer darparu'r gwasanaeth yn y dyfodol wrth i'r mesurau hirdymor hynny gael eu rhoi ar waith. Wrth i adnoddau gynyddu, rhaid tynhau disgyblaethau ariannol. Rhaid cael gwared ar ddyledion o'r system. Rhaid cael pwyslais ar wobrwyo llwyddiant gyda mwy o ryddid i weithredu. Lle bydd tanberfformiad yn parhau, bydd angen cyfyngu ar ddirprwyo cyfrifoldeb hyd nes y gellir profi'n amlwg fod y gallu yno i ymgymryd ag ef unwaith eto. Rhaid i lywodraeth leol hefyd chwarae ei rhan mewn moderneiddio gwasanaethau, drwy feincnodi gwariant a chanlyniadau o fewn ymrwymiad cyffredinol i newid.

Lywydd, nid heddiw yw'r amser i gyhoeddi cynigion manwl i roi casgliadau'r adolygiad ar waith. Daw hynny yn y maen. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym eisoes rai dulliau pwysig yn ein dwylo fydd yn ein galluogi i symud ymlaen. Daeth y negodiadau ynghylch contractau meddygon teulu i ben yn llwyddiannus. Byddwn yn defnyddio hyn yng Nghymru i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth gofal sylfaenol wedi ei gryfhau sydd ei angen

specialist GPs, nurse practitioners and a range of early interventions to reduce referrals to hospital care.

The review places great emphasis on improving the information and communications technology infrastructure in Wales, which we will take forward with Informing Healthcare, our strategy for the delivery of effective information management and technology in the NHS. The review calls for a new approach in managing and funding the continuum of health and social care. Our local health boards provide new structures within which partnership working can be actively pursued. The onus is also firmly on those involved to ensure that the public and patients are involved in shaping health and social care services and to manage and deliver services in a practical and innovative way.

In order to tackle the immediate priorities in the review, namely delayed discharges and alternatives to hospital admission, I am announcing today an additional £4 million this year. I do not intend for this money to be channelled through NHS trusts nor local authority social services departments, but through local health boards, where all health and social care interests will be represented. I intend to issue the funding in a way that ties our input more firmly to the outputs required, in a way that the review suggests.

Today I have welcomed publication of the review on behalf of the Assembly Government. It will provide an essential guide to ensure that we obtain maximum benefit from the investment we are making. The issues are not new—we are already addressing many of them, and the Health and Social Services Committee has discussed most of them at one time or another. What is new is that the analysis is being brought together in one place and, in doing so, it provides a powerful insight into the challenges and difficult choices we face. This should stimulate a debate that is embraced and owned by the public, our patients and staff who work in health and social care. The

arnom, fydd yn cynnwys meddygon teulu arbenigol, ymarferwyr nyrsio ac ystod o ymyriadau cynnar i leihau cyfeiriadau i ofal mewn ysbyty.

Rhydd yr adolygiad gryn bwyslais ar wella'r seilwaith technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu yng Nghymru, y byddwn yn ei datblygu gyda Hysbysu Gofal Iechyd, ein strategaeth ar gyfer darparu system rheoli gwybodaeth a thechnoleg yn y GIG. Mae'r adolygiad yn galw am ymagwedd newydd i reoli ac ariannu continwwm iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Mae ein byrddau iechyd lleol yn darparu strwythurau newydd y gellir eu defnyddio i fynd ar drywydd gweithio mewn partneriaeth. Mae'r cyfrifoldeb yn bendant ar y rhai sy'n gysylltiedig i sicrhau bod y cyhoedd a chleifion yn chwarae rhan wrth lunio gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol a rheoli a darparu gwasanaethau mewn ffordd ymarferol ac arloesol.

Er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r blaenoriaethau uniongyrchol yn yr adolygiad, sef oedi cyn rhyddhau pobl o'r ysbyty a gofal amgen i ofal ysbyty, cyhoeddaf heddiw £4 miliwn yn ychwanegol eleni. Ni fwriadaf i'r arian hwn gael ei sianelu drwy ymddiriedolaethau GIG na thrwy adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol awdurdodau lleol, ond yn hytrach drwy fyrdau iechyd lleol, lle y cynrychiolir pob buddiant iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Bwriadaf gyhoeddi arian mewn ffordd sy'n clymu ein mewnbwn yn fwy cadarn wrth yr allbwn sydd ei angen, mewn modd a awgrymir yn yr adolygiad.

Heddiw yr wyf wedi croesawu cyhoeddi'r adolygiad ar ran Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Bydd yn rhoi arweiniad hanfodol i sicrhau ein bod yn cael y budd mwyaf o'r buddsoddiad a wnawn. Nid materion newydd yw'r rhain—yr ydym eisoes yn mynd i'r afael â llawer ohonynt, ac mae'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi trafod y rhan fwyaf ohonynt ar ryw adeg neu'i gilydd. Yr hyn sy'n newydd yw dwyn y dadansoddiad ynghyd mewn un man ac, wrth wneud hynny, mae'n darparu dealltwriaeth rymus o'r heriau a'r dewisiadau anodd a wynebwn. Dylai hyn ysgogi dadl a groesewir gan y cyhoedd, ein cleifion a staff sy'n gweithio ym maes iechyd a gofal

National Health and Well-being Council will oversee our progress in implementing these recommendations in a way that is right for the people of Wales. As the review summary states, every person and organisation has a leadership role in taking this forward.

David Lloyd: Derek Wanless's comprehensive report is to be welcomed, as are all reports of this type. I have not yet managed to read all 97 pages because it arrived on my desk today at 1.40 p.m.. However, my initial response to the Cabinet's statement is that we need a proper debate on this. I realise that you have issued a statement today and that we will consider the report in Committee next week but, at some stage, we should all have the opportunity to debate these issues, because they affect all 60 Members, not just members of the Health and Social Services Committee. I could suggest a slot that is available next week; there is an hour going spare in the debate on seating arrangements.

There has been a significant increase in health expenditure, and the idea behind this report was to ensure that money reaches the grass roots, because there is a great deal of evidence that that has not been happening. We are still faced with the scenario of ever-increasing waiting lists, which are among the longest in western Europe. It is good that the report places an emphasis on preventative and primary care. I ask the Minister to address budget priorities for primary care vis-à-vis secondary care. The report emphasises that we need to move away from the acute hospital service system, the sole prerogative of which seems to be dealing with waiting lists. We have to move away from that scenario and get primary care more involved, which means more resources for a truly primary-care-led NHS.

At present 95 per cent of patients are dealt with in primary care, which has 10 per cent of the health budget. Can the budget be adjusted as a result of this report? If the primary care budget were increased to 11 per cent of the total health budget, that would be a significant uplift and help to develop the services that need to be developed in primary and community care. Ultimately, we need to

cymdeithasol, ac sy'n eiddo iddynt. Bydd y Cyngor Iechyd a Lles Cenedlaethol yn goruchwyllo ein cynnydd o ran rhoi'r argymhellion hyn ar waith mewn ffordd sy'n briodol i bobl Cymru. Fel y noda crynodeb yr adolygiad, mae gan bob person a sefydliad rôl arweinydd o ran datblygu hyn.

David Lloyd: Mae adroddiad cynhwysfawr Derek Wanless i'w groesawu, fel pob adroddiad o'r math hwn. Nid wyf eto wedi llwyddo i ddarllen pob un o'r 97 tudalen gan mai am 1.40 p.m. heddiw y cyrhaeddodd fy nesg. Fodd bynnag, fy ymateb cychwynol i ddatganiad y Cabinet yw bod angen dadl briodol ar hyn. Sylweddolaf ichi wneud datganiad heddiw ac y byddwn yn ystyried yr adroddiad yn y Pwyllgor yr wythnos nesaf ond, ar ryw adeg, dylem i gyd gael y cyfle i gael dadl ar y materion hyn, gan eu bod yn effeithio ar bob un o'r 60 Aelod, nid dim ond aelodau'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Gallaf argymhell amser sydd ar gael yr wythnos nesaf; mae awr rydd yn y ddadl ar drefniadau eistedd.

Bu cynnydd sylweddol mewn gwariant ar iechyd, a'r syniad y tu ôl i'r adroddiad hwn oedd sicrhau bod yr arian yn cyrraedd llawr gwlad, gan fod cryn dystiolaeth na fu hynny'n digwydd. Yr ydym yn dal i wynebu sefyllfa o restrau aros sy'n parhau i gynyddu, sydd ymhlith yr hiraf yng ngorllewin Ewrop. Mae'n beth da bod yr adroddiad yn rhoi pwyslais ar ofal ataliol a sylfaenol. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog fynd i'r afael â blaenoriaethau cyllidebol ar gyfer gofal sylfaenol o gymharu â gofal eilaidd. Pwysleisia'r adroddiad bod angen inni symud oddi wrth y system gwasanaeth ysbyty aciwt, yr ymddengys mai ei hunig ffrainc yw ymdrin â rhestrau aros. Rhaid inni symud i ffwrdd oddi wrth y sefyllfa honno a chynnwys gofal sylfaenol yn fwy, sy'n golygu mwy o adnoddau ar gyfer GIG sy'n cael ei arwain gan ofal sylfaenol.

Ar hyn o bryd ymdrinnir â 95 y cant o gleifion mewn gofal sylfaenol, a gaiff 10 y cant o'r gyllideb iechyd. A ellir addasu'r gyllideb o ganlyniad i'r adroddiad hwn? Pe câi'r gyllideb gofal sylfaenol ei chynyddu i 11 y cant o gyfanswm y gyllideb iechyd, byddai hynny'n hwb ac yn gymorth sylweddol i ddatblygu'r gwasanaethau sydd angen eu datblygu mewn gofal sylfaenol a

increase the capacity to deliver. That is not only about beds, nurses, doctors and secondary care, but about the capacity of primary care to deliver, which means that a huge raft of new services must be funded appropriately.

On the statement and priorities, can the Minister clarify what the additional £4 million that she has announced for the local health boards will be spent on? Has she just issued the funding, or has she given guidance on what she expects to be delivered using that £4 million?

As the Minister said, there is a raft of recommendations in this report. Most of them are not new to the Assembly nor to Health and Social Services Committee members. Around four years ago, we received an emergency pressures taskforce report, which included fine recommendations. 'A Question of Balance', published around 18 months ago, was another excellent report with many recommendations. We now have the Wanless report with its fine recommendations. We need to move on to implementing the recommendations and making a difference. Waiting lists are growing by the month and we need to move away from simply considering the figures every month and waiting for next month's figures. In winding up—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I feel a little wound up myself because this is not a debate, but a statement. Therefore, no-one should be winding up. However, I accept the importance of preambles from party spokespeople, followed by questions.

David Lloyd: I am grateful for your guidance, as always.

I will round off with a final question. What new action plans will the Minister bring into force as a result of this report? I realise that there are initiatives in the pipeline, but what new, additional plans does the Minister envisage introducing in the health and social care sector as a direct response to the Wanless report?

chymunedol. Yn y pen draw, mae angen inni gynyddu'r capasiti i ddarparu gofal. Mae mwy i hyn na gwelyau, nyrsys, meddygon a gofal eilaidd; mae'n ymwneud â chapasiti gofal sylfaenol i ddarparu gofal, sy'n golygu bod rhaid ariannu llu o wasanaethau newydd yn briodol.

O ran y datganiad a'r blaenoriaethau, a all y Gweinidog egluro ar beth y caiff y £4 miliwn ychwanegol a gyhoeddodd ar gyfer byrddau iechyd lleol ei wario? Ai dim ond rhyddhau'r arian a wnaeth, neu a roddodd arweiniad ar yr hyn y disgwylia iddo gael ei gyflawni drwy ddefnyddio'r £4 miliwn hwnnw?

Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae llu o argymhellion yn yr adroddiad hwn. Nid yw'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn newydd i'r Cynulliad nac i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Tua phedair blynedd yn ôl, cawsom adroddiad tasglu pwysau brys, a oedd yn cynnwys argymhellion gwych. Yr oedd 'Cadw Cydbwysedd', a gyhoeddwyd tua 18 mis yn ôl, yn adroddiad rhagorol arall gyda llawer o argymhellion. Yn awr mae gennym adroddiad Wanless gyda'i argymhellion gwych. Mae angen inni symud ymlaen i weithredu'r argymhellion ac i wneud gwahaniaeth. Mae rhestrau aros yn tyfu'n fisol ac mae angen inni symud i ffwrdd o ddim ond ystyried y ffigurau bob mis ac aros am ffigurau'r mis nesaf. Wrth ddirwyn i ben—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Teimlaf fel eich dirwyn i ben fy hun gan nad dadl yw hon, ond datganiad. Felly, ni ddylai neb fod yn dirwyn i ben. Fodd bynnag, derbyniaf bwysigrwydd rhagymadroddi gan lefarwyr pleidiau, wedi'i ddilyn gan gwestiynau.

David Lloyd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich arweiniad, fel arfer.

Gorffennaf gyda chwestiwn terfynol. Pa gamau gweithredu newydd y bydd y Gweinidog yn eu rhoi ar waith o ganlyniad i'r adroddiad hwn? Sylweddolaf fod mentrau ar y gweill, ond pa gynlluniau ychwanegol, newydd y mae'r Gweinidog yn rhagweld y bydd yn eu cyflwyno i'r sector iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol fel ymateb uniongyrchol i adroddiad Wanless?

3.00 p.m.

Jane Hutt: I detect a note of constructive and responsible opposition in your remarks, and I am grateful for your comments in welcoming the report. I am sure that there will be plenty of time for debate on this issue in the next term. The Health and Social Services Committee will give it adequate attention next week and ensure that we can have a debate at that level. The messages in my statement, which are reflected in the Wanless report's recommendations, clearly show the need for an emphasis on primary care and early intervention. The GP contract will help take that forward, as I am sure that you recognise. With that, there will be substantial increases in resources, which will also drive up quality and opportunities. That is a key cornerstone of the GP contract. As you say, 90 per cent of people's contact with the health service in Wales is with GPs in health centres and surgeries. However, those extra resources do not simply go into the practices, but into the working environment and the primary care estate, in which we have already invested £3.1 million. As you know from the presentation given by Rhondda Cynon Taf health group, a pilot project on how we can modernise the primary care estate is underway to ensure that primary care is at the forefront of our ambitions in the health service.

The extra £4 million that I have announced today is being routed on a different track. It will go to our local health boards. They are our new vehicles to bring together health and social care, in exactly the way that Wanless recognises. Derek Wanless's message to Gordon Brown last year was that we need better, joined-up health and social care, with integrated thinking, planning and provision of services. Our health boards have the opportunity now to grasp the nettle and ensure that those who do not need to be in hospital can move on, with funding, to social care, to their homes and so on. That may require a range of interventions, but it must follow the work that has already been achieved. We must work with each health

Jane Hutt: Clywaf arlliw o wrthwynebiad adeiladol a chyfrifol yn eich sylwadau, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich sylwadau wrth groesawu'r adroddiad hwn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd digon o amser i gynnal dadl ar y mater hwn yn ystod y tymor nesaf. Bydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn rhoi sylw digonol iddo yr wythnos nesaf ac yn sicrhau y gallwn gael dadl ar y lefel honno. Dengys y negeseuon yn fy natganiad, a adlewyrchir yn argymhellion adroddiad Wanless, yn glir yr angen am bwyslais ar ofal sylfaenol ac ymyrraeth gynnar. Bydd y contract meddygon teulu yn helpu i ddatblygu hynny, fel y sylweddolwch, mae'n siŵr. Law yn llaw â hynny, bydd cynnydd sylweddol mewn adnoddau, a fydd hefyd yn gwella ansawdd a chyfluoedd. Mae hynny'n un o gonglfeini allweddol y contract meddygon teulu. Fel y dywedwch, mae 90 y cant o gyswllt pobl â'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru drwy feddygon teulu mewn canolfannau iechyd a meddygfeydd. Fodd bynnag, nid dim ond i'r practisau yr â'r adnoddau ychwanegol hynny, ond i'r amgylchedd gwaith a'r ystad gofal sylfaenol, yr ydym eisoes wedi buddsoddi £3.1 miliwn ynddi. Fel y gwyddoch o'r cyflwyniad a roddwyd gan grŵp iechyd Rhondda Cynon Taf, mae prosiect peilot ar sut y gallwn foderneiddio'r ystad gofal sylfaenol ar y gweill i sicrhau bod gofal sylfaenol wrth wraidd ein dyheadau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd.

Caiff y £4 miliwn ychwanegol a gyhoeddais heddiw ei roi tuag at nod gwahanol. Fe'i rhoddir i'n byrddau iechyd lleol. Dyma ein cyfryngau newydd i ddod ag iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol ynghyd, yn yr union ffordd a gydnabyddir gan Wanless. Neges Derek Wanless i Gordon Brown y llynedd oedd bod angen gofal iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol gwell, cydgyssylltiedig, gan feddwl, cynllunio a darparu gwasanaeth mewn modd integredig. Mae gan ein byrddau iechyd yn awr y cyfle i fynd i'r afael â hyn a sicrhau y gall y rhai nad oes angen iddynt fod yn yr ysbyty symud ymlaen, gydag arian, i ofal cymdeithasol, i'w cartrefi ac ati. Efallai y bydd angen ystod o ymyrraethau er mwyn gwneud hynny, ond rhaid iddynt ddilyn y

community to unblock the barriers between local government and the health service, to ensure that people can return to their homes and communities, or go to a care home setting, as appropriate. It is a specific task and challenge for our local health boards, and I know that they will welcome it.

We have paid great attention to 'A Question of Balance', and many of the helpful findings, analysis and recommendations of that report have been fed into the Wanless review. I announced £5 million when 'A Question of Balance' was published by Paul Williams, the chief executive of Bro Morgannwg NHS Trust. Work has continued on the issue of capacity. I was pleased to hear you say, Dai, that capacity is not simply about beds in hospitals, but about our whole approach to work at primary level and our workforce. It is also about ensuring that our services are delivered efficiently. There are many messages in this report about how to reward success, tackle waste and variations in service across Wales, and how to track the differences in day-case activity admission arrangements. There are also messages about how we can ensure that we modernise our workforce planning arrangements and redesign the service to take account of health and social care needs in the twenty-first century. An implementation group will take this forward, and I am sure that there will be plenty of opportunity to debate the report in the next session.

Ann Jones: I thank the Minister for her statement. As Dai said, the report requires some bedtime reading, or reading over the weekend. Looking at the summary that has been provided, I am pleased that primary care features largely in the report. That meets the aims of our NHS plan, 'Improving Health in Wales'. The report recommends that the Welsh Assembly Government should not fund any debts incurred by trusts or health boards. Will you give an assurance that that will not happen, and that we consider ways of recognising and giving incentive to those trusts and boards that have remained within

gwaith sydd eisoes wedi'i gyflawni. Rhaid inni weithio gyda phob cymuned iechyd i ddymchwel y rhwystrau rhwng llywodraeth leol a'r gwasanaeth iechyd, i sicrhau y gall pobl ddychwelyd i'w cartrefi a'u cymunedau, neu fynd i gartref gofal, fel y bo'n briodol. Mae'n dasg ac yn her benodol i'n byrddau iechyd lleol, a gwn y byddant yn ei chrosawu.

Yr ydym wedi talu sylw mawr i 'Cadw Cydbwysedd', a chafodd llawer o ganfyddiadau, dadansoddiadau ac argymhellion defnyddiol yr adroddiad hwnnw ei fwydo i adolygiad Wanless. Cyhoeddais £5 miliwn pan gyhoeddwyd 'Cadw Cydbwysedd' gan Paul Williams, prif weithredwr Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Bro Morgannwg. Mae'r gwaith wedi parhau ar gapasiti. Yr oeddwn yn falch o'ch clywed yn dweud, Dai, nad mater o welyau mewn ysbytai yn unig yw capasiti, ond ein hymagwedd gyfan tuag at waith ar lefel sylfaenol a'n gweithlu. Mae hefyd yn ymwneud â sicrhau bod ein gwasanaethau yn cael eu cyflawni'n effeithlon. Mae llawer o negeseuon yn yr adroddiad hwn ynghylch sut i wobrwyo llwyddiant, mynd i'r afael â gwastraff ac amrywiadau yn y gwasanaeth ledled Cymru, a sut i olrhain y gwahaniaethau mewn trefniadau derbyn achosion dydd. Mae negeseuon hefyd am sut y gallwn sicrhau ein bod yn moderneiddio ein trefniadau cynllunio'r gweithlu ac ailddylunio'r gwasanaeth i ystyried anghenion iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Bydd grŵp gweithredu yn datblygu hyn, ac mae'n siŵr y bydd digon o gyfle i gynnal dadl ar yr adroddiad yn y sesiwn nesaf.

Ann Jones: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad. Fel y dywedodd Dai, mae angen darllen yr adroddiad hwn yn y gwely, neu dros y penwythnos. Gan edrych ar y crynodeb a ddarparwyd, yr wyf yn falch bod gan ofal sylfaenol le amlwg yn yr adroddiad. Mae hynny'n cyflawni nodau ein cynllun ar gyfer y GIG, 'Gwella Iechyd yng Nghymru'. Mae'r adroddiad yn argymhell na ddylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ariannu unrhyw ddyledion a gronnwyd gan ymddiriedolaethau neu fyrddau iechyd. A roddwch sicrwydd na fydd hynny'n digwydd, a'n bod yn ystyried ffyrdd o gydnabod a rhoi

their budgets and delivered the services that we require of them? In doing so, can we consider ways—not necessarily financial ways—of recognising the good work of many of our trusts? I also ask that we consider health inequalities across Wales when we are planning investment. I welcome your commitment to providing an additional £4 million to the local health boards. Like you, I believe that they are the vehicles to provide joined-up health and social care for the future.

Jane Hutt: You recognise that one of the key messages in the report is that, while we should reward success, we should not punish failure. We should seek to act where there is weakness to improve performance throughout the health service. We need to reward success and acknowledge where innovations in clinical practice and management have enabled the health bodies—whether trusts or local health boards—to move forward. Many innovations are acknowledged through our innovations in care fund; health bodies can suggest a particular scheme and get additional funding. The work delivered can then be spread across Wales.

One of Derek Wanless's key messages to the Chancellor was the need to universalise best practice. We are a small nation and therefore we should be able to apply best practice across the trusts. One trust in north-west Wales has reached the top 10 in a list of the best-performing trusts in the UK, and we know that other trusts in Wales are also performing well. We must ensure that they can move forward by helping others, not at the expense of others. We need to reward success and strengthen those that are weak or failing and ensure that innovation can be carried through and acknowledged. That is a rounded approach to performance improvement.

This is also important in terms of our commitment to social justice and to tackling health inequalities. We must take the Townsend formula forward to ensure that the disadvantaged areas, with the poorest health, benefit. However, that should not be at the

cymhelliant i'r ymddiriedolaethau a'r byrddau hynny sydd wedi aros o fewn eu cyllidebau ac wedi darparu'r gwasanaethau yr ydym wedi gofyn iddynt eu darparu? Wrth wneud hynny, a allwn ystyried ffyrdd—nid rhai ariannol o anghenraid—o gydnabod gwaith da llawer o'n hymddiriedolaethau? Gofynnaf hefyd inni ystyried anghydraddoldebau iechyd ledled Cymru pan fyddwn yn cynllunio buddsoddi. Croesawaf eich ymrwymiad i ddarparu £4 miliwn yn ychwanegol i fyrdau iechyd lleol. Fel chithau, credaf eu bod yn gyfryngau i ddarparu gofal iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol cydgysylltiedig ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Jane Hutt: Yr ydych yn cydnabod mai un o negeseuon allweddol yr adroddiad yw, er y dylem wobrwyo llwyddiant, na ddylem gosbi methiant. Dylem geisio gweithredu lle ceir gwendid er mwyn gwella perfformiad drwy'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae angen inni wobrwyo llwyddiant a chydabod lle mae arloesedd mewn arfer a rheolaeth glinigol wedi galluogi cyrff iechyd—boed yn ymddiriedolaethau neu'n fyrdau iechyd lleol—i symud ymlaen. Cydnabyddir llawer o ddulliau arloesol drwy ein cronfa arloesi mewn gofal; gall cyrff iechyd awgrymu cynllun penodol a chael arian ychwanegol. Yna gall y gwaith a gyflawnir gael ei ledaenu ledled Cymru.

Un o negeseuon allweddol Derek Wanless i'r Canghellor oedd yr angen i gyffredinolli arfer gorau. Cenedl fechan ydym ac felly dylem allu cymhwyso arfer gorau ar draws yr ymddiriedolaethau. Mae un ymddiriedolaeth yng ngogledd-orllewin Cymru wedi cyrraedd y 10 uchaf ar restr yr ymddiriedolaethau sy'n perfformio orau yn y DU, a gwyddom fod ymddiriedolaethau eraill yng Nghymru hefyd yn perfformio'n dda. Rhaid inni sicrhau y gallant ddatblygu drwy helpu eraill, nid ar draul eraill. Mae angen inni wobrwyo llwyddiant a chryfhau'r rheini sy'n wan neu sy'n methu â sicrhau y gellir gweithredu arloesedd a'i gydnabod. Mae hynny'n ymagwedd gron tuag at wella perfformiad.

Mae hyn hefyd yn bwysig o ran ein hymrwymiad i gyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd. Rhaid inni ddatblygu fformiwla Townsend i sicrhau bod yr ardaloedd difreintiedig, gyda'r iechyd gwaethaf, yn elwa. Fodd bynnag, ni

expense of the rest of Wales; we must ensure that our health inequalities agenda is robust. The £10.1 million that is coming through the Townsend formula for direct-needs assessment will complement our £5 million for health inequalities projects, which can come from any part of Wales. There are pockets of poverty in every part of Wales and tackling health inequalities must override how we reward success and improvement.

Jonathan Morgan: We welcome the publication of the review, but I hope that the Government will allow opposition parties more time to consider these reviews after publication in future. The report landed on my desk, and those of other Members, at 1.40 p.m. today. No doubt you had sight of this report earlier than that, Minister, and, if you wish to engage with opposition parties in a meaningful way, it would be useful to give us more time to scrutinise these reports so that we can contribute more fully.

So far, what I have gleaned from the report does not make pleasant reading for the Government in many respects. The level of expenditure is referred to many times in the report. We know, from the figures that you have released, that health expenditure in Wales has increased by some 40 per cent in recent years. However, the report clearly states that Wales does not get as much out of its health spending as it should. That is a damning conclusion and, if you want to read between the lines, it means that you are not spending the money wisely and that you are not getting a good return for it. There has been a substantial increase in expenditure and, when you respond more fully to this report, you must demonstrate how you intend to ensure that we get value for money and delivery. When we are spending vast sums of taxpayers' money in an attempt to improve health and social care for the nation, we—or rather you—must demonstrate how you are ensuring value for money.

The report also refers to structures and relationships and states that clarification is needed as to national roles and local

ddylai hynny fod ar draul gweddill Cymru; rhaid inni sicrhau bod ein hagenda anghydraddoldebau iechyd yn gadarn. Bydd y £10.1 miliwn a ddaw drwy fformiwla Townsend ar gyfer asesiad anghenion uniongyrchol yn ategu ein £5 miliwn ar gyfer prosiectau anghydraddoldebau iechyd, a all ddod o unrhyw ran o Gymru. Mae ardaloedd o dlodi ym mhob rhan o Gymru a rhaid i'r broses o fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd fynd y tu hwnt i'r ffordd y gwobrwywn lwyddiant a gwelliant.

Jonathan Morgan: Croesawn gyhoeddi yr adolygiad, ond gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn caniatáu mwy o amser i'r gwrthbleidiau ystyried yr adolygiadau hyn ar ôl eu cyhoeddi yn y dyfodol. Am 1.40 p.m. heddiw y cyrhaeddodd yr adroddiad ar fy nesg i, a desgiau Aelodau eraill. Does dim dwywaith i chi weld yr adroddiad hwn yn gynharach na hynny, Weinidog, ac, os hoffech gysylltu â'r gwrthbleidiau mewn modd ystyrlon, byddai'n ddefnyddiol rhoi mwy o amser inni graffu ar yr adroddiadau hyn fel y gallwn gyfrannu'n llawnach.

Hyd yma, nid yw'r hyn yr wyf wedi'i ddeall o'r adroddiad yn bleserus i'r Llywodraeth mewn sawl ystyr. Cyfeirir at lefel y gwariant sawl gwaith yn yr adroddiad. Gwyddom, o'r ffigurau yr ydych wedi'u rhyddhau, fod gwariant ar iechyd yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu tua 40 y cant yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, noda'r adroddiad yn glir nad yw Cymru'n cael cymaint allan o'i gwariant ar iechyd ag y dylai. Mae hynny'n gasgliad damniol ac, os ydych am ddarllen rhwng y llinellau, golyga nad ydych yn gwario'r arian yn ddoeth ac nad ydych yn cael budd da ohono. Bu cynnydd sylweddol mewn gwariant a phan fyddwch yn ymateb yn llawnach i'r adroddiad hwn, rhaid ichi ddangos sut y bwriadwch sicrhau ein bod yn cael gwerth am arian ac y darperir y gwasanaethau. Pan fyddwn yn gwario symiau mawr o arian y trethdalwyr mewn ymdrech i wella iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol ar gyfer y genedl, rhaid i ni—neu chi, yn hytrach—ddangos sut yr ydych yn sicrhau gwerth am arian.

Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn cyfeirio at strwythurau a pherthnasau ac yn nodi bod angen egluro rolau cenedlaethol a rhyddid

freedoms. The structural changes of the first Assembly will be crucial in terms of how many of the recommendations in this review will be delivered.

3.10 p.m.

Will you comment on the report's reference to the full engagement of the public and the health services? That seems to suggest what I would certainly support, namely that the public must take more responsibility for its health. This is not just about health professionals and health agencies delivering healthcare, but about the public taking more responsibility for its wellbeing, and the report goes into detail on that aspect. The report also calls for an increase in primary care capacity: for example, with regard to specialist GPs, nurse practitioners and research centres. Will you set targets in any strategy that you may announce in the autumn to increase primary care capacity? I hope that you intend to respond to this particular challenge highlighted by the report. The report also refers to the current system of provision and workforce issues, and concludes that the current position is not sustainable in terms of the availability of healthcare professionals. It states that expertise is thinly spread across Wales.

Sadly, and the opposition parties have previously mentioned this, the report points to the need for immediate action to reduce delays in the transfer of care. This is a huge issue for the Government, as there have been increasing delays in transferring patients from hospital care into care homes. There are huge problems with regard to reductions in the number of domiciliary care packages and the fact that we are going backwards and losing the care home beds and care homes that we currently have. This report vindicates the concerns raised by opposition parties. I would be grateful if you would address those concerns in your response.

Do you accept the validity of these criticisms, which question the direction in which you

lleol. Bydd newidiadau strwythurol y Cynulliad cyntaf yn hollbwysig yn nhermau faint o argymhellion yr adolygiad hwn a gaiff eu cyflawni.

A wnewch sylw ar y cyfeiriad yn yr adroddiad at gysylltu'r cyhoedd a'r gwasanaethau iechyd yn llawn? Ymddengys fod hynny'n awgrymu'r hyn y byddwn yn sicr yn ei gefnogi, sef y dylai'r cyhoedd gymryd mwy o gyfrifoldeb dros ei iechyd. Mae mwy i hyn na gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol ac asiantaethau iechyd yn darparu gofal iechyd; mae'n ymwneud â'r cyhoedd yn cymryd mwy o gyfrifoldeb dros ei les, ac mae'r adroddiad yn manylu ar yr agwedd honno. Geilw'r adroddiad hefyd am gynydd mewn capasiti gofal sylfaenol: er enghraifft, mewn perthynas â meddygon teulu arbenigol, ymarferwyr nyrsio a chanolfannau ymchwil. A bennwch dargedau mewn unrhyw strategaeth y byddwch o bosibl yn ei chyhoeddi yn yr hydref i gynyddu capasiti gofal sylfaenol? Gobeithiaf y bwriadwch ymateb i'r her benodol a amlygir gan yr adroddiad. Cyfeiria'r adroddiad hefyd at faterion yn ymwneud â'r system bresennol o ddarpariaeth a'r gweithlu, a daw i'r casgliad nad yw'r sefyllfa bresennol yn gynaliadwy o ran argaeledd gweithwyr gofal iechyd proffesiynol. Noda fod yr arbenigedd wedi'i wasgaru'n denau ledled Cymru.

Yn anffodus, ac mae'r gwrthbleidiau eisoes wedi crybwyll hyn, mae'r adroddiad yn nodi'r angen i gymryd camau ar unwaith i leihau'r oedi o ran trosglwyddo gofal. Mae hwn yn fater o bwys mawr i'r Llywodraeth, gan y bu oedi cynyddol wrth drosglwyddo cleifion o ofal ysbyty i gartrefi gofal. Mae problemau enfawr o ran gostyngiadau yn nifer y pecynnau gofal cartref a'r ffaith ein bod yn cymryd cam yn ôl ac yn colli'r gwelyau cartrefi gofal a'r cartrefi gofal sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn cyfiawnhau'r pryderon a godwyd gan y gwrthbleidiau. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech fynd i'r afael â'r pryderon hynny yn eich ymateb.

A dderbyniwch ddilysrwydd y feirniadaeth hon, sy'n bwrw amheuaeth ar y cyfeiriad yr

have pointed the health service in the past four years, Minister? Do you accept the conclusions that the report has so starkly highlighted?

Jane Hutt: I thought that that was going to be a positive and constructive contribution; I am sorry that it tailed off in the final remarks. Derek Wanless clearly endorses the reforms of the past four years. He endorses the development of local health boards to ensure joined-up health and social care. He endorses our approach to performance management, and he endorses the fact that we are focusing on a primary care-led service, which has been my ambition since becoming Minister for Health and Social Services. However, you made some positive remarks and raised some positive questions, and I will deal with those immediately. I dealt with the issue of primary care in my answer to Dai, and I am glad that opposition spokespeople back the primary care-led approach. We must get that message across if we want to engage fully. If you are to be part of the solution, then it is good to have that message from you, Dai and Jonathan. However, in tracking waste and discovering variations, it is important that we bring healthcare organisations, which deliver the care, up to scratch. That comes through clearly in the Wanless review. It is about asking, across Wales, why there are variations in the number of day-case operations. Why are there variations in the length of stay? Why are there variations in transfers of care? Why are there variations in the percentage of admissions? Wales has 19 per cent higher attendance at accident and emergency and 40 per cent more emergency admissions than the rest of the UK does. We need to track and identify where there are failures to deliver and where there are variations. That is where our performance management arrangements come in.

We have a workforce planning system for the first time; your Government, Jonathan, never had that. Workforce planning was done on the basis of affordability, not need. Wanless was brought in by the Chancellor to examine health service funding and he has deemed it to be fair and efficient. However, he has

ydych wedi arwain y gwasanaeth iechyd iddo dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf, Weinidog? A dderbyniwch y casgliadau y mae'r adroddiad wedi'u hamlygu mor amlwg?

Jane Hutt: Credais y byddai hynny'n gyfraniad cadarnhaol ac adeiladol; trueni iddo fethu yn y sylwadau terfynol. Mae Derek Wanless yn amlwg yn cymeradwyo diwygiadau'r pedair blynedd diwethaf. Cymeradwya ddatblygiad byrddau iechyd lleol i sicrhau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol cydgysylltiedig. Cymeradwya ein hymagwedd tuag at reoli perfformiad, a chymeradwya'r ffaith ein bod yn canolbwyntio ar wasanaeth a arweinir gan ofal sylfaenol, sef fy uchelgais ers dod yn Weinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, gwnaethoch rai sylwadau cadarnhaol a chodwyd rhai cwestiynau cadarnhaol, ac ymdriniaf â'r rheini ar unwaith. Ymdriniais â gofal sylfaenol yn fy ateb i Dai, ac yr wyf yn falch fod llefarywyr y gwrthbleidiau yn cefnogi'r ymagwedd a arweinir gan ofal sylfaenol. Rhaid inni gyfleu'r neges honno os ydym am gysylltu'n llawn. Os ydych am fod yn rhan o'r ateb, yna mae'n dda o beth cael y neges honno gennych, Dai a Jonathan. Fodd bynnag, o ran olrhain gwastraff a darganfod amrywiadau, mae'n bwysig inni sicrhau bod y sefydliadau gofal iechyd, sy'n darparu'r gofal, yn cyrraedd y safon. Mae hynny'n neges glir yn adolygiad Wanless. Mae'n ymwneud â gofyn, ledled Cymru, pam bod amrywiadau yn nifer y llawdriniaethau dydd. Pam bod amrywiadau yn hyd yr arosiadau? Pam bod amrywiadau o ran trosglwyddo gofal? Pam bod amrywiadau yng nghanran y bobl a dderbynnir? Mae nifer y bobl sy'n mynychu'r adran damweiniau ac achosion brys yng Nghymru 19 y cant yn uwch na gweddill y DU, ac mae nifer y derbyniadau brys 40 y cant yn uwch. Mae angen inni olrhain a nodi ble mae methiannau i gyflawni a ble mae amrywiadau. Dyna yw pwrpas ein trefniadau rheoli perfformiad.

Mae gennym system cynllunio'r gweithlu am y tro cyntaf, ni fu gan eich Llywodraeth chi, Jonathan, erioed mo hynny. Cynlluniwyd y gweithlu ar sail fforddiadwyedd, nid angen. Gofynnodd y Canghellor i Wanless archwilio cyllid y gwasanaeth iechyd a phenderfynodd ei fod yn deg ac yn effeithlon. Fodd bynnag,

stated that decades of underinvestment have left the health service in need of more financial investment and reforms to service provision. We are doing that. We have an all-Wales workforce development group. We need more sophisticated workforce planning. We have plans, but we need to consider them in relation to gaps and boundaries and the skills mix. Our GP contract and 'Agenda for Change' will help us to do that. It is about ensuring that we have a twenty-first century health workforce that can help take us forward.

It is clear that we could not progress faster and further as a result of Wanless's review if we had not had the reforms and the new structures that are now in place. We have a real platform and an opportunity in the Wanless report for joint working. However, that must be taken forward on the basis of an integrated approach, both locally and nationally.

Finally, Jonathan, we kept our independent community health councils in Wales. All parties backed that, because we feel that patients should have a strong, independent voice. We have carers and voluntary sector representatives on our local health boards. However, you are right to say that the people of Wales must take responsibility for their own health and wellbeing. That must be done in the context of every local health board's planning a health, social care and wellbeing strategy, in partnership with their communities. That will take the public health agenda forward. The need to do that is a strong message in this review.

Kirsty Williams: Minister, let us be completely clear about what this report tells you and the National Assembly for Wales. Its overall conclusion is that the current position is not sustainable. This report hardly endorses the status quo. It tells us clearly that the way that NHS Cymru is run at present is not sustainable. It realises that our present system is not configured to sustain safe specialist and acute services. We do not have a system that can sustain safe services, elective demands,

mae wedi nodi i ddegawdau o danfuddsoddiad arwain at yr angen am fwy o fuddsoddiad ariannol a diwygiadau i'r ffordd o ddarparu gwasanaeth yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Yr ydym yn gwneud hynny. Mae gennym grŵp datblygu'r gweithlu. Mae angen mwy o gynllunio gweithlu soffistigedig arnom. Mae gennym gynlluniau, ond mae angen inni eu hystyried mewn perthynas â bylchau a ffiniau a'r gymysgedd o sgiliau. Bydd ein contract meddygon teulu ac 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yn ein helpu i wneud hynny. Mae'n ymwneud â sicrhau bod gennym weithlu iechyd o'r unfed ganrif ar hugain a all helpu i'n tywys yn ein blaenau.

Mae'n amlwg na allem wneud cynnydd ynghynt nac ymhellach o ganlyniad i adolygiad Wanless oni bai inni wneud y diwygiadau ac oni bai am y strwythurau newydd sydd bellach ar waith. Mae gennym lwyfan gwirioneddol a chyfle i gydweithio yn adroddiad Wanless. Fodd bynnag, rhaid datblygu hynny ar sail ymagwedd integredig, yn lleol ac yn genedlaethol.

Yn olaf, Jonathan, gwnaethom gadw ein cynghorau iechyd cymuned annibynnol yng Nghymru. Cefnogodd bob plaid hynny, gan y teimlwn y dylai cleifion gael llais cryf, annibynnol. Mae gennym gynrychiolwyr sy'n ofalwyr ac o'r sector gwirfoddol ar ein byrddau iechyd lleol. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn iawn i ddweud bod yn rhaid i bobl Cymru gymryd cyfrifoldeb dros eu hiechyd a'u lles eu hunain. Rhaid i hynny gael ei wneud yng nghyd-destun pob bwrdd iechyd lleol yn cynllunio strategaeth iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a lles, mewn partneriaeth â'u cymunedau. Bydd hynny'n symud yr agenda iechyd cyhoeddus yn ei blaen. Mae'r angen i wneud hynny yn neges gref yn yr adolygiad hwn.

Kirsty Williams: Weinidog, gadewch inni fod yn gwbl glir ynghylch yr hyn y mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ei ddweud wrthyh chi a Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Ei gasgliad cyffredinol yw nad yw'r sefyllfa bresennol yn gynaliadwy. Prin bod yr adroddiad hwn yn cymeradwyo'r sefyllfa bresennol. Dywed yn glir wrthym nad yw'r ffordd y caiff GIG Cymru ei redeg ar hyn o bryd yn gynaliadwy. Sylweddola nad yw ein system bresennol wedi'i llunio i gynnal gwasanaethau

or support for critical care, or supply predicted consultant numbers. If ever there was sobering reading about the state of the NHS, and the challenges facing us in Wales, this is it.

I have several questions, Minister. First, on the use of community facilities, I have held two short debates that highlighted the failure to date to capitalise on community facilities and community hospitals. Will you now bring forward a strategy on how we can use those facilities better than we do at present? Do you agree with the report's statement that there is currently an over-reliance on targets, which distort priorities and do not accurately reflect the services that are currently being provided? Do you also agree that we are not getting the most out of the money that you have invested in the service? Furthermore, are you satisfied that the £5 million that you put into the system following the publication of 'A Question of Balance' has had any effect? It was invested to reduce bed occupancy levels, which are still at record levels and are nowhere near the 85 per cent target outlined in 'A Question of Balance', and now in this report. The numbers of delayed discharges have not come down. What confidence can we have that the £4 million that you have announced today will do any more good than the £5 million that you announced earlier this year? Will you attach to that £4 million the clear and explicit criteria that are called for in the report, but have not been associated with the one-off payments that have been made to the service in the past?

Can you clarify how the money will be divided among the local health boards? Will it be divided equally, or will you put more resources into those areas that have particular problems with high numbers of delayed transfers of care? You say that the new GP contract offers us a wonderful opportunity to take forward some of the report's challenges. I do not disagree with that. Therefore, what finances will be made available to support

arbenigol diogel ac aciwt. Nid oes gennym system a all gynnal gwasanaethu diogel, galwadau dewisol, neu gymorth ar gyfer gofal critigol, neu gyflenwi nifer ragweladwy o ymgynghorwyr. Os bu erioed rywbeth sy'n ddigon i'ch sobri ynghylch cyflwr y GIG, a'r heriau sy'n ein hwynebu yng Nghymru, dyma fe.

Mae gennyf sawl cwestiwn, Weinidog. Yn gyntaf, o ran defnyddio cyfleusterau cymunedol, yr wyf wedi cynnal dwy ddadl fer a amlygodd y methiant hyd yn hyn i fanteisio ar gyfleusterau cymunedol ac ysbytai cymuned. A wnewch chi yn awr gyflwyno strategaeth ar sut y gallwn ddefnyddio'r cyfleusterau hynny yn well nag a wnawn ar hyn o bryd? A gytunwch gyda datganiad yr adroddiad bod gorddibyniaeth ar dargedau ar hyn o bryd, sy'n ystumio blaenoriaethau ac nad ydynt yn adlewyrchiad cywir o'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir ar hyn o bryd? A gytunwch hefyd nad ydym yn cael y budd gorau o'r arian yr ydych wedi'i fuddsoddi yn y gwasanaeth? Ymhellach, a ydych yn fodlon bod y £5 miliwn y gwnaethoch ei roi i mewn i'r system yn dilyn cyhoedd 'Cadw Cydbwysedd' wedi cael unrhyw effaith? Fe'i buddsoddwyd i leihau nifer y gwelyau a ddefnyddir, sy'n parhau i fod ar y lefel uchaf erioed a heb fod yn agos at y targed o 85 y cant a amlinellwyd yn 'Cadw Cydbwysedd', ac yn awr yn yr adroddiad hwn. Nid yw nifer yr achosion o oedi cyn rhyddhau pobl o'r ysbyty wedi gostwng. Pa mor hyderus y gallwn fod y bydd y £4 miliwn y gwnaethoch ei gyhoeddi heddiw yn gwneud mwy o les na'r £5 miliwn a gyhoeddwyd gennych yn gynharach eleni? A wnewch gysylltu'r meini prawf clir a phendant y gelwir amdanynt yn yr adroddiad, ond sydd heb gael eu cysylltu â thaliadau untro a wnaed i'r gwasanaeth yn y gorffennol, â'r £4 miliwn hwnnw?

A allwch egluro sut y caiff yr arian ei rannu ymysg y byrddau iechyd lleol? A gaiff ei rannu'n gyfartal, neu a roddwch fwy o adnoddau yn y meysydd hynny sydd â phroblemau penodol gyda nifer fawr o achosion o oedi cyn trosglwyddo gofal? Dywedwch fod y contractau meddygon teulu newydd yn cynnig cyfle gwych inni ddatblygu rhai o heriau'r adroddiad. Nid anghytunaf â hynny. Felly, faint o arian a

locally enhanced services? That would be a sure-fire way to beef up capacity in the primary care sector, and perhaps avoid the potential use of the hospital sector. What resources will be made available under the local health service and how and when will you distribute them?

fydd ar gael i gefnogi gwella gwasanaethau'n lleol? Byddai hynny'n ffordd ddi-ffael o gynyddu capasiti yn y sector gofal sylfaenol, ac efallai osgoi'r defnydd posibl o'r sector ysbytai. Pa adnoddau fydd ar gael o dan y gwasanaeth iechyd lleol a sut a phryd y byddwch yn eu dosbarthu?

3.20 p.m.

The report challenges you to develop policies that you have steadfastly refused to develop in the past, particularly in terms of hypothecated funding for social services and charging local authorities for delayed transfers of care. The report states that you must consider those issues. However, you have said in the past that you would not do so. I would welcome your views on that.

Mae'r adroddiad yn eich herio i ddatblygu polisiau yr ydych wedi gwrthod yn gadarn eu datblygu yn y gorffennol, yn arbennig yn nhermau neilltuo arian ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a chodi tâl ar awdurdodau lleol am oedi cyn trosglwyddo gofal. Noda'r adroddiad bod yn rhaid ichi ystyried y materion hynny. Fodd bynnag, dywedasoeh yn y gorffennol na fydddech yn gwneud hynny. Byddwn yn croesawu eich barn ar hynny.

Jane Hutt: There are tough messages in the report. Going back to Jonathan's point, the Assembly has a health Minister who does not declare that it is business as usual following a huge increase in funding after decades of underinvestment, but who has asked instead for independent, credible, authoritative advice from Derek Wanless. A considerable amount of work was carried out for the Chancellor of the Exchequer before this huge increase in funding was announced. Derek Wanless recognised that investment and reform go hand in hand. It is not business as usual: there are tough messages in the report. There are also tough questions for Members to answer. Will you be part of the solution or will you stay on the sidelines? Will you join us in a constructive and responsible debate? All the key spokespeople have made some positive contributions.

Jane Hutt: Mae negeseuon anodd yn yr adroddiad. Gan gyfeirio'n ôl at bwynt Jonathan, mae gan y Cynulliad Weinidog iechyd nad yw'n datgan fod popeth yn gweithredu yn ôl yr arfer yn dilyn cynnydd enfawr mewn arian ar ôl degawdau o danfuddsoddi, ond sydd yn hytrach wedi gofyn am gyngor annibynnol, credadwy ac awdurdodol gan Derek Wanless. Gwnaed swm sylweddol o waith ar ran Canghellor y Trysorlys cyn cyhoeddi'r cynnydd enfawr hwn yn yr arian. Cydnabu Derek Wanless fod buddsoddiad a diwygio yn mynd law yn llaw. Nid yw popeth yn gweithredu yn ôl yr arfer: mae negeseuon anodd yn yr adroddiad. Mae cwestiynau anodd i Aelodau eu hateb hefyd. A fyddwch yn rhan o'r ateb neu a fyddwch yn aros ar yr ymylon? A ymunwch â ni mewn dadl adeiladol a chyfrifol? Mae pob un o'r llefarwyr allweddol wedi gwneud rhai cyfraniadau cadarnhaol.

On Kirsty's points, in terms of the way forward, Wanless says that we must take immediate action on delayed transfers of care. That has been on my agenda and we have allocated £17 million to local government. We now have people working in conjunction with the trusts and local authorities across Wales to try to solve difficulties in transferring patients. There are many reasons why some people experience a

O ran pwyntiau Kirsty, ynglŷn â'r ffordd ymlaen, dywed Wanless bod yn rhaid inni weithredu ar unwaith ar oedi cyn trosglwyddo gofal. Bu hynny ar fy agenda ac yr ydym wedi dyrannu £17 miliwn i lywodraeth leol. Yn awr mae gennym bobl yn gweithio ar y cyd â'r ymddiriedolaethau ac awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru i geisio datrys anawsterau o ran trosglwyddo cleifion. Mae sawl rheswm pam bod oedi gyda gofal

delay in their care. Some involve the choices made by patients and relatives, which is a significant factor. Some also involve problems regarding capacity, and that is why we announced funding of £4 million. Wanless also states that the Welsh Assembly Government should not micromanage the system and that we should consider, with his advice, how we can effectively identify the vehicles that can take this forward. The local health boards are now established. We are telling them that they have that £4 million, and that arrangements will be developed whereby they will receive funding according to the pressures and needs that exist, some of which you have identified; I will discuss those arrangements in more detail next week in the Health and Social Services Committee meeting. Local health boards will also deliver the outcomes that we want, so that people who do not need to be in hospital receive more appropriate care. They are some of the most vulnerable people in Wales and include people with mental health needs, as well as older people. We do not often discuss the fact that those needs exist and we must take action through our mental health national service framework. I hope that many Members will back my commitment to mental health being a key priority.

On the GP contract, enhancing local services is part of the opportunity that now exists. An implementation team is on board following the recent successful conclusion of the vote on the contract. GPs in Wales strongly support the new contract. General practitioners know that enhanced local services can enable us to provide key services. We have discussed out-of-hours cover in Committee. This is about having a quality agenda and tackling health inequalities. We know that enthusiasm exists to develop that. We must also acknowledge that no-one is being let off the hook. We must consider community hospitals and the variations in the delivery of services. Many community hospitals in Kirsty's constituency are doing a great deal. Some are breaking new ground in terms of the service provided and the way in which health and social care is delivered. Issues involving preventative and

ar gyfer rhai pobl. Mae rhai yn ymwneud â'r dewisiadau a wneir gan gleifion a pherthnasau, sy'n ffactor arwyddocaol. Mae rhai hefyd yn ymwneud â phroblemau o ran capasiti, a dyna pam y cyhoeddasom £4 miliwn o gyllid. Noda Wanless hefyd na ddylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru feicoreoli'r system ac y dylem ystyried, ochr yn ochr â'i gyngor, sut y gallwn nodi'r cyfryngau i fynd â hyn yn ei flaen yn effeithiol. Mae'r byrddau iechyd lleol wedi'u sefydlu bellach. Yr ydym yn dweud wrthynt bod ganddynt y £4 miliwn hwnnw, ac y datblygir trefniadau lle byddant yn derbyn arian yn unol â'r pwysau a'r anghenion sy'n bodoli, y nodwyd rhai ohonynt gennyh; trafodaf y trefniadau hynny yn fanylach yr wythnos nesaf yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Bydd byrddau iechyd lleol hefyd yn cyflawni'r canlyniadau yr ydym am eu gweld, er mwyn i bobl nad oes angen iddynt fod yn yr ysbyty dderbyn gofal mwy priodol. Y rhain yw rhai o'r bobl fwyaf diamddiffyn yng Nghymru ac maent yn cynnwys pobl ag anghenion iechyd meddwl, yn ogystal â phobl hŷn. Nid ydym yn trafod y ffaith bod yr anghenion hynny'n bodoli yn aml a rhaid inni gymryd camau drwy ein fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol iechyd meddwl. Gobeithiaf y bydd llawer o Aelodau yn cefnogi fy ymrwymiad i sicrhau bod iechyd meddwl yn flaenoriaeth allweddol.

O ran y contract meddygon teulu, mae gwella gwasanaethau lleol yn rhan o'r cyfle sydd bellach yn bodoli. Crewyd tîm gweithredu yn dilyn casgliad llwyddiannus diweddar y bleidlais ar y contract. Mae meddygon teulu yng Nghymru yn cefnogi'r contract newydd yn gryf. Gŵyr meddygon teulu y gall gwasanaethau lleol gwell ein galluogi i ddarparu gwasanaethau allweddol. Yr ydym wedi trafod darpariaeth wrth gefn y tu allan i oriau meddygfeydd yn y Pwyllgor. Mae â wnelo hyn â chael agenda o safon a mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd. Gwyddom fod brwdfrydedd i ddatblygu hynny. Rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod nad oes neb yn cael dihangfa. Rhaid inni ystyried ysbytai cymuned a'r amrywiadau o ran darparu gwasanaethau. Mae llawer o ysbytai cymuned yn etholaeth Kirsty yn gwneud cryn dipyn o waith. Mae rhai yn torri tir newydd o ran y gwasanaeth a ddarperir a'r ffordd y

diagnostic care, access to care and telemedicine are also addressed. There are fantastic developments taking place. We must universalise best practice in Wales. No-one is being let off the hook in terms of taking this agenda forward.

The Presiding Officer: We are out of time but, as Members will recollect, I am always anxious not to limit the time for statements to Ministers alone, however fine their rhetoric may be. Therefore, I extend the time by five minutes to allow another three Members to speak, if they can be as brief as possible.

Lynne Neagle: Jane, I welcome your initial response to the Wanless report and, like other Members, I look forward to reading the detail of the report in due course. I particularly welcome your stated commitment that tackling health inequalities must run in tandem with our response to the report. I also welcome your prompt announcement of £4 million to tackle immediate pressures on the health service, but that money must be targeted at areas with the greatest need. Gwent has the highest number of bedblockers in Wales and Torfaen has the highest number in Gwent. Gwent also has an ongoing problem with capacity, as the Edwards report highlighted, and it has the least beds per head in Wales. How will money be allocated? If it is to be effective in delivering the change needed, it must be allocated to the areas with the greatest pressures.

Jane Hutt: That follows on from Kirsty's point. I will talk in much greater detail about implementing the report and ensuring that the £4 million results in change and outputs. Focusing on areas with the greatest pressures will come into that. We now have intelligence that we did not have four or five years ago; we know where virtually every person is, in terms of delayed transfers of care. We know whether that is for healthcare or for social care reasons. We must know the causes of delay so that we can use the money wisely to tackle those difficulties. We will certainly consider your comments; it is helpful to have Members' views.

darperir gofal iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Ymdrinnir hefyd â materion yn ymwneud â gofal ataliol a diagnostig, mynediad i ofal a thelefeddygaeth. Mae datblygiadau gwych yn digwydd. Rhaid inni gyffredinoli arfer gorau yng Nghymru. Rhaid i bawb gyfrannu tuag at ddatblygu'r agenda hon.

Y Llywydd: Mae'r amser wedi dod i ben, ond, fel y cofia Aelodau, yr wyf bob amser yn awyddus i beidio â chyfyngu ar amser ar gyfer datganiadau i Weinidogion yn unig, er mor dda yw eu rhethreg. Felly, caniatâf bum munud ychwanegol i dri Aelod arall siarad, os gallant fod mor gryno â phosibl.

Lynne Neagle: Jane, croesawaf eich ymateb cychwynnol i adroddiad Wanless ac, fel Aelodau eraill, edrychaf ymlaen at ddarllen yr adroddiad manwl maes o law. Croesawaf yn arbennig eich ymrwymiad penodol y dylid mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd ochr yn ochr â'n hymateb i'r adroddiad. Croesawaf hefyd eich cyhoeddiad prydlon o £4 miliwn i fynd i'r afael â'r pwysau presennol ar y gwasanaeth iechyd, ond rhaid i'r arian hwnnw gael ei dargedu tuag at yr ardaloedd sydd â'r angen mwyaf. Gwent sydd â'r nifer fwyaf o floccwyr gwelyau yng Nghymru a Thor-faen sydd â'r nifer uchaf yng Ngwent. Mae gan Went hefyd broblem barhaus gyda chapasiti, fel yr amlygodd adroddiad Edwards, ac yng Ngwent y mae'r nifer lleiaf o welyau y pen yng Nghymru. Sut y dyrennir arian? Os am fod yn effeithiol o ran cyflawni'r newid sydd ei angen, rhaid ei ddyrannu i'r ardaloedd sydd o dan y pwysau mwyaf.

Jane Hutt: Mae hynny'n dilyn o bwynt Kirsty. Siaradaf yn llawer manylach am weithredu'r adroddiad a sicrhau bod y £4 miliwn yn arwain at newid ac allbynnau. Bydd canolbwyntio ar yr ardaloedd o dan y pwysau mwyaf yn cael ei gynnwys yn hynny. Mae gennym bellach wybodaeth nad oedd gennym bedair neu bum mlynedd yn ôl; gwyddom ble mae bron bob person, o ran oedi cyn trosglwyddo gofal. Gwyddom a yw hynny am resymau gofal iechyd neu ofal cymdeithasol. Rhaid inni wybod beth yw achos yr oedi fel y gallwn ddefnyddio'r arian yn ddoeth i fynd i'r afael â'r anawsterau hynny. Byddwn yn sicr yn ystyried eich sylwadau; mae'n ddefnyddiol cael barn yr

Aelodau.

On inequalities in health, taking the Townsend formula review forward must be a commitment, and we made it in the Chamber last year. We must reform social justice in Wales to reverse the inverse care law whereby people with the poorest health have often had the poorest services. I welcome your backing and commitment to that.

David Melding: Minister, I commend the Government on commissioning this report. However, its findings are deeply disturbing for all political parties here, because some of the policy recommendations go to the heart of most of our party manifestos and pose fundamental questions about some of the proposals that we have just made.

I am pleased to hear that you will prepare an implementation plan; I suspect that you will ask the Business Minister to make it the subject of a debate in the autumn. That would be helpful. However, Mr Wanless focuses on several short-term objectives. He also says that it is important that the implementation plan has medium and long-term objectives, but he has asked us specifically to consider several short-term objectives. The first is investment in ICT and estate. You recently brought forward policies on those two matters, Minister, but Mr Wanless asks us to fundamentally re-examine them. The second objective is to reduce delayed transfers of care, as mentioned by other Members. Third is to seek alternatives to acute hospital admissions, and, finally, to ring-fence funds to achieve these short-term objectives, a point raised by Kirsty Williams. Those are specific matters for you to respond to.

The most deeply disturbing finding, taking the model used in 'Securing Our Future Health: Taking a Long-term View', is that Wanless rates the Welsh health service as having below-average potential for improvement and states that, by 2020, we will not keep up with current needs let alone advancing needs. That affects policies proposed by all political parties in the Assembly. We need a fundamental

O ran anghydraddoldebau mewn iechyd, rhaid ymrwymo i ddatblygu adolygiad fformiwla Townsend, ac fe'i gwnaethom yn y Siambr y llynedd. Rhaid inni ddiwygio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol yng Nghymru i wyrddroi y gyfraith gofal wrthdro lle mae pobl â'r iechyd gwaethaf yn aml wedi cael y gwasanaethau gwaethaf. Croesawaf eich cefnogaeth a'ch ymrwymiad i hynny.

David Melding: Weinidog, cymeradwyaf y Llywodraeth ar gomisiynu'r adroddiad hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae ei ganfyddiadau yn bryder mawr i bob plaid wleidyddol yma, gan fod rhai o'r argymhellion polisi yn mynd at wraidd y rhan fwyaf o fanifestos ein pleidiau ac yn gofyn cwestiynau sylfaenol ynghylch rhai o'r cynigion yr ydym newydd eu gwneud.

Yr wyf yn falch o glywed y byddwch yn paratoi cynllun gweithredu; mae'n siŵr y byddwch yn gofyn i'r Trefnydd ei wneud yn destun dadl yn yr hydref. Byddai hynny'n ddefnyddiol. Fodd bynnag, mae Mr Wanless yn canolbwyntio ar sawl nod byrdymor. Dywed hefyd ei bod yn bwysig fod gan y cynllun amcanion tymor canolig a hirdymor, ond mae wedi gofyn yn benodol i ni ystyried sawl nod byrdymor. Y cyntaf yw buddsoddi mewn TGCh ac ystâd. Cyflwynasoch bolisiau ar y ddau fater hynny yn ddiweddar, Weinidog, ond gofynna Mr Wanless inni eu hailystyried yn sylfaenol. Yr ail nod yw lleihau achosion o oedi cyn trosglwyddo gofal, fel y crybwyllodd Aelodau eraill. Y trydydd yw chwilio am ofal amgen yn lle derbyniadau i ysbytai aciwt, ac, yn olaf, neilltuo arian i gyflawni'r amcanion byrdymor hyn, pwynt a godwyd gan Kirsty Williams. Mae'r rheini yn faterion penodol ichi ymateb iddynt.

Y canfyddiad mwyaf pryderus, gan gymryd y model a ddefnyddiwyd yn 'Securing Our Future Health: Taking a Long-term View', yw bod Wanless o'r farn bod gan wasanaeth iechyd Cymru botensial is na'r cyffredin ar gyfer gwella a noda, erbyn 2020, na fyddwn yn llwyddo i ddiwallu anghenion presennol heb sôn am anghenion datblygiadol. Mae hynny'n effeithio ar bolisiau a gynigir gan bob plaid wleidyddol yn y Cynulliad. Mae

examination of health and social services in Wales, and all parties must take this report seriously.

3.30 p.m.

Jane Hutt: I thank the new Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee for that constructive contribution. I also welcome David's comment that this is an agenda and a challenge for the entire Assembly. We could refer to history, but I do not intend to do so; I have already commented on previous Governments and their performance.

What is important is what we do now in Wales, and how we engage the public and Members constructively in taking this agenda forward. You mentioned immediate responses. Investment in ICT is vital. I have just appointed Dennis Jessop to chair the 'Informing Healthcare' implementation group. The Health and Social Services Committee has discussed that strategy. Additional investment will be required to take the strategy forward.

Making health service funding—including ring-fencing and hypothecation—more transparent was a key message in Peter Townsend's report. He said that it is not known how much is being spent or how effective it is in terms of outcomes. That is crucial. On alternatives to hospital admission, admissions through the accident and emergency department at the Royal Glamorgan Hospital—which treats people with some of the poorest health in Wales—have been reduced by having a consultant leading the accident and emergency team. The consultant undertakes diagnostic testing on the spot, after which some people are allowed to go home and a team of nurses moves in. The heart failure management project at the hospital, funded through the health inequalities fund, also ensures that people can stay at home.

The need for chronic disease management is a strong message in Derek Wanless's review. That is crucial in areas where there are high

angen inni gynnal archwiliad sylfaenol o'r gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru, a rhaid i bob plaid gymryd yr adroddiad hwn o ddifrif.

Jane Hutt: Diolch i Gadeirydd newydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am y cyfraniad adeiladol hwnnw. Croesawaf hefyd sylwadau David mai agenda yw hon a her i'r Cynulliad cyfan. Gallem gyfeirio at hanes, ond ni fwriadaf wneud hynny; yr wyf eisoes wedi gwneud sylwadau ar Lywodraethau blaenorol a'u perfformiad.

Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw beth a wnawn yn nawr yng Nghymru, a sut yr ydym yn cynnwys y cyhoedd a'r Aelodau yn adeiladol yn y gwaith o ddatblygu'r agenda hon. Soniasoch am ymatebion brys. Mae buddsoddi mewn TGCh yn hanfodol. Yr wyf newydd benodi Dennis Jessop i gadeirio'r grŵp gweithredu 'Hysbysu Gofal Iechyd'. Mae'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi trafod y strategaeth honno. Bydd angen buddsoddiad ychwanegol i ddatblygu'r strategaeth.

Yr oedd sicrhau bod cyllid y gwasanaeth iechyd—gan gynnwys neilltuo a chlustnodi—yn fwy tryloyw yn neges allweddol yn adroddiad Peter Townsend. Dywedodd nad yw'n hysbys faint a werir na pha mor effeithiol ydyw o ran canlyniadau. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig. O ran gofal amgen yn lle gofal ysbyty, mae nifer y bobl a dderbynnir drwy'r adran damweiniau ac achosion brys yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg—sy'n trin pobl â'r iechyd gwaethaf yng Nghymru—wedi gostwng drwy gael ymgynghorydd yn arwain y tîm damweiniau ac achosion brys. Mae'r ymgynghorydd yn cynnal profion diagnostig yn y fan a'r lle, ac wedi hynny caniateir i rai pobl fynd adref o dan ofal tîm o nyrsys. Mae'r prosiect rheoli methiant y galon yn yr ysbyty, a ariennir drwy'r gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd, hefyd yn sicrhau y gall pobl aros gartref.

Mae'r angen i reoli salwch cronig yn neges gref yn adolygiad Derek Wanless. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig mewn ardaloedd lle mae

levels of respiratory disease, coronary heart disease and diabetes—which is highlighted because of the reception held in the Assembly today. Wanless also recognised that we have high levels of ill health, and we must recognise that. I have already mentioned that emergency admissions are 40 per cent higher in Wales than in the rest of the UK, and that admissions through accident and emergency departments in Wales are 19 per cent higher than they are elsewhere. Our projections suggest that there will be 11 per cent more people of retirement age in Wales within the next 10 years, compared with a 3 per cent increase in the population as a whole. That is a huge agenda, and I welcome your positive contribution.

Brian Gibbons: I welcome Derek Wanless's statement in the summary of the review that our health services are too skewed towards the acute sector. Do you agree that it is vital that, in rebalancing the service, we do not compromise our ability to deliver acute and elective care in a timely and appropriate manner?

Jane Hutt: We talk of a whole-systems approach. That may be jargon, but what we are saying is that, by reducing delayed transfers of care and freeing up beds for elective capacity so that people can be treated, and by reducing emergency admissions by offering alternatives, enabling people to be supported at home and ensuring quicker diagnostic testing, we can rebalance the acute hospital service, as is necessary.

lefelau uchel o afiechyd anadlol, clefyd coronaidd y galon a chlefyd siwgr—a amlygir oherwydd y derbyniad a gynhelir yn y Cynulliad heddiw. Cydnabu Wanless hefyd fod gennym lefelau uchel o salwch, a rhaid inni gydnabod hynny. Soniais eisoes fod derbyniadau brys 40 y cant yn uwch yng Nghymru nag yng ngweddill y DU, a bod derbyniadau drwy adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yng Nghymru 19 y cant yn uwch nac mewn mannau eraill. Mae ein rhagamcanion yn awgrymu y bydd 11 y cant yn fwy o bobl o oedran ymdeol yng Nghymru o fewn y 10 mlynedd nesaf, o gymharu â chynnydd o 3 y cant yn y boblogaeth yn gyffredinol. Mae hon yn agenda enfawr, a chroesawaf eich cyfraniad cadarnhaol.

Brian Gibbons: Croesawaf ddatganiad Derek Wanless yng nghrynodeb yr adolygiad bod gormod o bwyslais ar y sector aciwt yn ein gwasanaethau iechyd. A gytunwch ei bod yn hanfodol, wrth ailgydbwysu'r gwasanaeth, i beidio â chyfaddawdu ar ein gallu i ddarparu gofal aciwt a dewisol mewn modd amserol a phriodol?

Jane Hutt: Yr ydym yn sôn am ymagwedd system gyfan. Efallai mai jargon yw hynny, ond yr hyn a ddywedwn yw, drwy leihau'r oedi cyn trosglwyddo gofal a rhyddhau gwelyau ar gyfer capasiti dewisol i bobl gael eu trin, a thrwy leihau nifer y derbyniadau brys drwy gynnig dewisiadau amgen, gan alluogi pobl i gael eu cefnogi yn eu cartrefi a sicrhau profion diagnostig cyflymach, gallwn ailgydbwysu'r gwasanaeth ysbty aciwt, fel bo'r angen.

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Alun Cairns: Point of order. This relates to a written Assembly question to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside on 22 May. I received a reply on 30 May stating that I would receive a full response by 16 June. On 16 June, I received a letter advising me that I would receive a full reply soon. As a result of the extended delay, I tabled another question to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside on 26 June. The First Minister responded to that

Alun Cairns: Pwynt o drefn. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â chwestiwn ysgrifenedig y Cynulliad i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ar 22 Mai. Cefais ymateb ar 30 Mai yn nodi y cawn ateb llawn erbyn 16 Mehefin. Ar 16 Mehefin, cefais lythyr yn fy hysbysu y cawn ymateb llawn yn fuan. O ganlyniad i'r oedi hirfaith, cyflwynais gwestiwn arall i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ar 26 Mehefin. Ymatebodd y Prif Weinidog i'r

question, advising me that I would receive a reply by no later than 25 July. The question related to advice that officials would have provided to the Minister in relation to deciding whether to call in a planning application. I tabled the question on behalf of constituents who are considering taking legal action. If the Minister does not reply until 25 July, the constituents will be prevented from seeking a judicial review, as the time limit for doing so will have passed. I see no reason why such information cannot be provided in line with the principles of open government, given the positive intentions that were voiced and the positive comments made when I have spoken privately to Ministers. I hope that you can support me on this issue and provide guidance on it.

The First Minister: Further to that point of order, in line with the principles of freedom of information, it is not normal for advice to Ministers to be disclosed, but we attempt to disclose such information where possible. However, such a disclosure must be considered carefully because the principle of freedom of information does not cover advice to Ministers. In the light of this point of order and the fact that a judicial review application could be affected, of which I think we were not aware, I am happy to reconsider the matter with the officials who were preparing to reply.

The Presiding Officer: I am grateful to the First Minister for his response. I am sure that no Assembly Minister would seek to impede the possibility of the rights of constituents to go to judicial review if that were regarded as appropriate.

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2003
a Rheoliadau Deddf Addysg 2002 (Darpafiaethau Trosiannol a Diwygiadau
Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2003**

**Approval of the Education Act 2002 (Commencement No. 2) (Wales) Order 2003
and the Education Act 2002 (Transitional Provisions and Consequential
Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2003**

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi derbyn cais yn gofyn am i'r cynigion hyn gael eu cynnig a'u trafod gyda'i gilydd. A oes gwrthwynebiad i hynny? Gwelaf nad oes.

cwestiwn hwnnw, gan fy hysbysu y cawn ateb erbyn 25 Gorffennaf fan bellaf. Yr oedd y cwestiwn yn ymwneud â chyngor y byddai swyddogion wedi'i roi i'r Gweinidog o ran penderfynu a ddylid galw cais cynllunio i mewn. Cyflwynais y cwestiwn ar ran etholwyr sy'n ystyried dwyn achos llys. Os nad yw'r Gweinidog yn ymateb tan 25 Gorffennaf, caiff yr etholwyr eu hatal rhag gofyn am adolygiad barnwrol, oherwydd bydd y terfyn amser ar gyfer gwneud hynny wedi bod. Ni welaf unrhyw reswm pam na ellir darparu gwybodaeth o'r fath yn unol ag egwyddorion llywodraeth agored, o ystyried y bwriad cadarnhaol a fynegwyd a'r sylwadau cadarnhaol a wnaed pan siaradais yn breifat â Gweinidogion. Gobeithiaf y gallwch fy nghefnogi yn y mater hwn a rhoi cyfarwyddyd arno.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, yn unol ag egwyddorion rhyddid gwybodaeth, nid yw'n arferol i gyngor i Weinidogion gael ei ddatgelu, ond ceisiwn ddatgelu gwybodaeth o'r fath lle y bo modd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ystyried yn ofalus a ddylid datgelu gwybodaeth o'r fath gan nad yw egwyddor rhyddid gwybodaeth yn cwmpasu cyngor i Weinidogion. Yn sgîl y pwynt o drefn hwn a'r ffaith y gellid effeithio ar gais i gael adolygiad barnwrol, na chredaf ein bod yn ymwybodol ohono, yr wyf yn fodlon ailystyried y mater gyda'r swyddogion a oedd yn paratoi i ymateb.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Prif Weinidog am ei ymateb. Yr wyf yn siŵr na fyddai unrhyw Weinidog Cynulliad yn ceisio rhwystro'r posibilrwydd o hawl etholwyr i gael adolygiad barnwrol ped ystyrid bod hynny'n briodol.

The Presiding Officer: I have received a request for these motions to be proposed and debated together. Are there any objections? I see that there are none.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Education Act 2002 (Commencement No. 2) (Wales) Order 2003, laid in the Table Office on 24 June 2003. (NDM1548)

I propose that

the National Assembly:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Education Act 2002 (Commencement No. 2) (Wales) Order 2003, laid in the Table Office on 1 July 2003; and

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 24 June 2003. (NDM1549)

I propose that

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Education Act 2002 (Transitional Provisions and Consequential Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 24 June 2003. (NDM1550)

I propose that

the National Assembly:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Education Act 2002 (Transitional Provisions and Consequential Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 1 July 2003; and

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 24 June 2003. (NDM1551)

I welcome this Plenary debate on the Education Act 2002 (Commencement No. 2) Order and the related regulations. Following Royal Assent and our Plenary debates in

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Mehefin 2003. (NDM1548)

Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 yn y gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Gorffennaf 2003; ac

2. yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Mehefin 2003. (NDM1549)

Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Deddf Addysg 2002 (Darpariaethau Trosiannol a Diwygiadau Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Mehefin 2003. (NDM1550)

Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Deddf Addysg 2002 (Darpariaethau Trosiannol a Diwygiadau Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Gorffennaf 2003; ac

2. yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Mehefin 2003. (NDM1551)

Croesawaf y ddadl hon mewn Cyfarfod Llawn ar Orchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) a'r rheoliadau cysylltiedig. Yn dilyn Cydsyniad Brenhinol a'n dadleuon

October and December last year, we began to reap the advantages of the provisions in the 2002 Act to continue the delivery of our education and lifelong learning agenda. The full drafts of the regulations and the Order were presented to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee on 18 June. I have received no representations on their contents from Committee members or other Assembly Members.

The regulations are technical. They modify a small number of sections in the Act, with consequential amendments to other legislation, to ensure that full lawful effect is given to what is proposed in the second Commencement Order. In our debate last December on the first Commencement Order, I referred to the importance of the Act containing powers enabling the Assembly to take significant steps forward for the benefit of schoolchildren and schools throughout Wales. The Education Act 2002 (Commencement No. 2) (Wales) Order is the next secondary legislation component in the achievement of that goal.

The Order will bring into force in Wales on 1 August 2003 those provisions of the Education Act 2002 specified in part I of the schedule to the Order. Provisions in part II and part III of the schedule will be brought into force in Wales on 1 September and 1 November 2003 respectively. Sections 60 to 64 in part I of the Order confer a wide range of new powers on the Assembly to give directions to local education authorities in relation to all education functions, for example those relating to early years education rather than only those relating to compulsory age education, as is the case at present.

Sections 178(1) and (4) amend the Learning and Skills Act 2000 to extend area inspections to persons aged over 14. Section 215 and schedules 21 and 22 make minor and consequential amendments and repeals. Sections 27 and 28 in part II of the Order enable the governing body of a maintained school to provide facilities or services for the benefit of its pupils, their families and the local community. Section 29 re-enacts, with amendments, section 39 of the School Standards Framework Act 1998, which

mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn ym mis Hydref a mis Rhagfyr y llynedd, dechreuasom weld buddiannau'r darpariaethau yn Neddf Addysg 2002 o ran parhau i gyflwyno ein hagenda addysg a dysgu gydol oes. Cyflwynwyd y rheoliadau a'r Gorchymyn drafft llawn i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar 18 Mehefin. Ni dderbyniais unrhyw sylwadau ar eu cynnwys gan aelodau'r Pwyllgor nac Aelodau eraill y Cynulliad.

Mae'r rheoliadau yn dechnegol. Maent yn addasu nifer fach o adrannau yn y Ddeddf, gyda gwelliannau canlyniadol i ddeddfwriaeth arall, er mwyn sicrhau y rhoddir yr hyn a gynigir yn yr ail Orchymyn Cychwyn ar waith yn llawn yn gyfreithlon. Yn ein dadl fis Rhagfyr diwethaf ar y Gorchymyn Cychwyn cyntaf, cyfeiriais at bwysigrwydd sicrhau bod y Ddeddf yn cynnwys pwerau i alluogi'r Cynulliad i gymryd camau arwyddocaol er budd plant ysgol ac ysgolion ledled Cymru. Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) yw'r elfen is-ddeddfwriaeth nesaf yn y broses o gyflawni'r nod hwnnw.

Bydd y Gorchymyn yn dod â'r darpariaethau hynny o fewn Deddf Addysg 2002 a ragnodir yn rhan I yr atodlen i'r Gorchymyn i rym yng Nghymru ar 1 Awst 2003. Daw darpariaethau yn rhan II a rhan III yr atodlen i rym yng Nghymru ar 1 Medi a 1 Tachwedd 2003 yn y drefn honno. Mae adrannau 60 a 64 yn rhan I y Gorchymyn yn rhoi amrywiaeth eang o bwerau newydd i'r Cynulliad roi cyfarwyddiadau i awdurdodau addysg lleol mewn perthynas â phob swyddogaeth addysg, er enghraifft y rheini sy'n ymwneud ag addysg y blynyddoedd cynnar yn hytrach na dim ond y rheini sy'n ymwneud ag addysg oedran gorfodol, fel sy'n wir ar hyn o bryd.

Mae adrannau 178(1) a (4) yn diwygio Deddf Dysgu a Sgiliau 2000 i ehangu arolygiadau ardal i bobl dros 14 oed. Mae adran 215 ac atodlenni 21 a 22 yn gwneud mân welliannau a gwelliannau canlyniadol a diddymiadau. Mae adrannau 27 a 28 yn rhan II y Gorchymyn yn galluogi corff llywodraethol ysgol a gynhelir i ddarparu cyfleusterau neu wasanaethau er budd ei disgyblion, eu teuluoedd a'r gymuned leol. Mae adran 29 yn ailddeddfu, gyda gwelliannau, adran 39 Deddf Safonau a Fframwaith Ysgolion 1998,

required governing bodies to establish a complaints procedure in accordance with regulations. Sections 136 to 140 contain Assembly regulation powers in relation to the qualifications of further education teachers and principals, the courses leading to such qualifications, and the provision of higher education courses at FE institutions.

Sections 181 to 185 enable the Assembly to make regulations providing for allowances to be paid to eligible persons over compulsory school age taking part in education or training that is not higher education. Section 197—a Wales-only provision—enables the Assembly to make regulations requiring LEAs and governing bodies to enter into partnership agreements, setting out how they will carry out their functions in relation to a school. Section 199 and schedule 19 require LEAs to prepare a policy statement setting out their arrangements for the provision of, or support for, transport for post-16 learners. Sections 202 and 203 contain Assembly regulation powers in relation to educational records and the use of hazardous equipment and materials in FE institutions.

Section 206 and schedule 20 amend the Education Act 1996 and the Further and Higher Education Act 1992 to extend provisions relating to nuisance or disturbance on educational premises to non-maintained schools, certain premises provided by LEAs and FE institutions. Sections 215 and schedules 21 and 22 make minor and consequential amendments and repeals. Section 43 in part III of the Order requires LEAs to establish a schools forum to represent the views of schools, and other organisations included by the LEA in the membership of the forum, on the authority's school budgets.

David Davies: We do not see anything controversial in these regulations, therefore we are happy to support them.

3.40 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM1548): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1548): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

a oedd yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i gyrff llywodraethol sefydlu gweithdrefn gwyno yn unol â rheoliadau. Mae adrannau 136 i 140 yn cynnwys pwerau rheoleiddio'r Cynulliad mewn perthynas â chymwysterau athrawon a phenaethiaid addysg bellach, y cyrsiau sy'n arwain at gymwysterau o'r fath, a darparu cyrsiau addysg uwch mewn sefydliadau addysg bellach.

Mae adrannau 181 i 185 yn galluogi'r Cynulliad i wneud rheoliadau sy'n darparu ar gyfer talu lwfansau i bobl cymwys dros oedran ysgol gorfodol sy'n cymryd rhan mewn addysg neu hyfforddiant nad yw'n addysg uwch. Mae adran 197—darpariaeth ar gyfer Cymru yn unig—yn galluogi'r Cynulliad i wneud rheoliadau sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol i AALl a chyrrff llywodraethol ymrwmo i gytundebau partneriaeth, yn nodi sut y byddant yn cyflawni eu swyddogaethau mewn perthynas ag ysgol. Mae adran 199 ac atodlen 19 yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i AALl baratoi datganiad polisi yn nodi eu trefniadau ar gyfer darparu neu gefnogi cludiant ar gyfer dysgwyr ôl-16. Mae adrannau 202 a 203 yn cynnwys pwerau rheoleiddio'r Cynulliad mewn perthynas â chofnodion addysgol a defnyddio offer a defnyddiau peryglus mewn sefydliadau addysg bellach.

Mae adran 206 ac atodlen 20 yn diwygio Deddf Addysg 1996 a Deddf Addysg Bellach ac Uwch 1992 i ehangu'r darpariaethau sy'n ymwneud â niwsans neu aflonyddwch ar safleoedd addysgol i ysgolion nas cynhelir, rhai safleoedd penodol a ddarperir gan AALl a sefydliadau addysg bellach. Gwna adrannau 215 ac atodlenni 21 a 22 fân welliannau a gwelliannau canlyniadol a diddymiadau. Mae adran 43 yn rhan III y Gorchymyn yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i AALl sefydlu fforwm ysgolion i gynrychioli barn ysgolion, a sefydliadau eraill a gynhwysir gan yr AALl o fewn aelodaeth y fforwm, ar gyllidebau ysgol yr awdurdod.

David Davies: Ni welwn unrhyw beth dadleuol yn y rheoliadau hyn, felly yr ydym yn fodlon eu cefnogi.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1549): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1549): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1550): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1550): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick

Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Cynnig (NDM1551): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM1551): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff

Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Cynlluniau Trefniadaeth Ysgolion) (Cymru)
 2003
 Approval of the Education (School Organisation Plans) (Wales) Regulations
 2003**

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the names of Kirsty Williams, Mike German and Jenny Randerson to NDM1553. **Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enwau Kirsty Williams, Mike German a Jenny Randerson i NDM1553.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Education (School Organisation Plans) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 24 June 2003. (NDM1552) *y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Addysg (Cynlluniau Trefniadaeth Ysgolion) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Mehefin 2003. (NDM1552)*

I propose that

the National Assembly:

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Education (School Organisation Plans) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 1 July 2003;*

2. *approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 24 June 2003 and the regulatory appraisal, laid in the Table Office on 24 June 2003. (NDM1553)*

I am pleased to bring these regulations before you. They will reduce the frequency of the publication of school organisation plans from every year to every three years and will change the date for the publication of draft plans from 1 September to 31 December. The legislation will also remove the requirement on LEAs to republish their school organisation plans in hard copy once they have consulted upon them.

The plans describe the current patterns of school provision in each LEA area, forecast trends in pupil numbers for a five-year planning period, identify any problem areas, and draw conclusions about the need to reorganise provision and add or remove school places. LEAs have published school organisation plans since 1999. These regulations build on the good work already undertaken. However, experience since 1999 has shown that we can reduce the burden on LEAs without diminishing the impact of the plans. The changes between draft and adopted plans published annually, and between plans published in consecutive years, tend to be small and are often confined to statistical information about the supply of school places in the LEA area. Taken together, these changes should significantly reduce the burden on LEAs and enable them to produce more effective plans every three years. The LEA will still be required to provide the Assembly Government with statistical information every year so that trends in supply and demand for school

Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Addysg (Cynlluniau Trefniadaeth Ysgolion) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Gorffennaf 2003;*

2. *yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Mehefin 2003 a'r arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Mehefin 2003. (NDM1553)*

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r rheoliadau hyn ger eich bron. Byddant yn lleihau amllder cyhoeddi cynlluniau trefniadaeth ysgolion o bob blwyddyn i bob tair blynedd a byddant yn newid y dyddiad ar gyfer cyhoeddi cynlluniau drafft o 1 Medi i 31 Rhagfyr. Bydd y ddeddfwriaeth hefyd yn diddymu'r gofyniad ar AAL i ailgyhoeddi eu cynlluniau trefniadaeth ysgolion ar ffurf copi caled unwaith y byddant wedi ymgynghori arnynt.

Mae'r cynlluniau yn disgrifio patrymau cyfredol darpariaeth ysgolion pob ardal AAL, yn rhagweld tueddiadau o ran nifer y disgyblion am gyfnod cynllunio o bum mlynedd, yn nodi unrhyw ardaloedd lle ceir problemau, ac yn dod i gasgliadau o ran yr angen i ad-drefnu'r ddarpariaeth ac ychwanegu neu ddileu lleoedd ysgol. Bu AAL yn cyhoeddi cynlluniau trefniadaeth ysgolion ers 1999. Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn adeiladu ar y gwaith da a wnaed eisoes. Fodd bynnag, mae profiad ers 1999 wedi dangos y gallwn leihau'r baich ar AAL heb leihau effaith y cynlluniau. Tuedda'r newidiadau rhwng cynlluniau drafft a'r cynlluniau a fabwysiedir a gyhoeddir yn flynyddol, a rhwng cynlluniau a gyhoeddir mewn blynyddoedd dilynol, i fod yn fach ac fe'u cyfyngir yn aml i wybodaeth ystadegol mewn perthynas â chyflenwi lleoedd ysgol yn ardal yr AAL. At ei gilydd, dylai'r newidiadau hyn leihau'r baich ar AAL yn sylweddol a'u galluogi i gynhyrchu cynlluniau mwy effeithiol bob tair blynedd. Bydd yn parhau'n ofynnol i'r AAL ddarparu gwybodaeth

places can continue to be tracked.

The new timetable for producing a draft plan by the end of December is designed to ensure that the information contained in the plan is more up-to-date and that the timing is more convenient. At present, the information in the plans is based on the January school census and will be least eight months out of date by the time that the draft plan is produced in September. By moving the timetable to the end of December, the plan can be based on September admission figures. The change in timetable will also allow the plan to reflect any school closures effected during the summer term, thereby ensuring a more accurate picture of the numbers on roll and of provision in the LEA area. LEAs currently struggle to meet the 1 September deadline, and we hope that the changes incorporated in these regulations will lead to plans being produced more promptly, and with up-to-date information. Full consultation with the LEAs has already taken place, and I confirm that they all welcome these new provisions. We will also soon be consulting on revised guidance on the content of school organisation plans to ensure that they are consistent and contain clear information on the need to add or remove school places in every LEA area.

Turning to the issue of how plans are published, the amendment is based on a misunderstanding of the current situation. At present, LEAs must place a hard copy of both the draft and adopted plans in public libraries, and must send a copy to all consultees, apart from schools' governing bodies, which, under existing regulations, may instead access the plan via the internet. The new regulations extend access to the adopted plan via the internet to the other consultees; a hard copy of the draft plan will continue to be sent to other consultees and placed in libraries. The amendment would create a new obligation on LEAs to print additional hard copies of the adopted plan and circulate it to schools. That would be a backward step, and

ystadegol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad bob blwyddyn er mwyn gallu parhau i olrhain tueddiadau o ran y cyflenwad o leoedd ysgol a'r galw amdanynt.

Cynlluniwyd yr amserlen newydd ar gyfer cynhyrchu cynllun drafft erbyn diwedd Rhagfyr er mwyn sicrhau bod y wybodaeth a gynhwysir yn y cynllun yn fwy cyfredol a bod yr amseru yn fwy cyfleus. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r wybodaeth yn y cynlluniau yn seiliedig ar gyfrifiad ysgolion a gynhaliwyd yn Ionawr a bydd o leiaf wyth mis wedi mynd heibio erbyn cynhyrchu'r cynllun drafft ym Medi, a bydd y wybodaeth felly wedi dyddio. Drwy symud yr amserlen i ddiwedd Rhagfyr, gellir seilio'r cynllun ar ffigurau derbyn mis Medi. Bydd y newid yn yr amserlen hefyd yn fodd i'r cynllun gynnwys unrhyw ysgolion a gaewyd yn ystod tymor yr haf, gan sicrhau darlun mwy cywir o'r nifer ar y gofrestr a'r ddarpariaeth yn ardal yr AALl. Mae AALl yn ei chael hi'n anodd bodloni'r terfyn amser o 1 Medi ar hyn o bryd, a gobeithiwn y bydd y newidiadau a gynhwyswyd yn y rheoliadau hyn yn golygu y caiff cynlluniau eu cynhyrchu yn fwy prydlon, a chyda gwybodaeth gyfredol. Cynhaliwyd ymgynghoriad llawn gyda'r AALl eisoes, a chadarnhaf eu bod oll yn croesawu'r darpariaethau newydd hyn. Byddwn hefyd yn ymgynghori cyn hir ar ganllawiau diwygiedig ar gynnwys cynlluniau trefniadaeth ysgolion er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn gyson ac yn cynnwys gwybodaeth glir ar yr angen i ychwanegu neu ddileu lleoedd ysgol yn ardal pob AALl.

Gan droi at sut y caiff cynlluniau eu cyhoeddi, mae'r gwelliant yn seiliedig ar gamddealltwriaeth o'r sefyllfa sydd ohoni. Ar hyn o bryd, rhaid i AALl osod copi caled o'r cynllun drafft a'r cynllun a fabwysiedir mewn llyfrgelloedd cyhoeddus, a rhaid iddynt anfon copi at bob ymgynghorai, ac eithrio cyrff llywodraethol ysgolion, a all, o dan y rheoliadau presennol, weld y cynllun ar y rhyngwyd. Mae'r rheoliadau newydd yn rhoi'r hawl i'r ymgynghoreion eraill weld y cynllun a fabwysiedir ar y rhyngwyd; parheir â'r arfer o anfon copi caled o'r cynllun drafft at ymgynghoreion eraill a'i osod mewn llyfrgelloedd. Byddai'r gwelliant yn creu rhwymedigaeth newydd ar AALl i argraffu copïau caled ychwanegu o'r cynllun

an unnecessary burden on LEAs. Libraries will have hard copies of the draft plan and access to the adopted plan via the internet. That should provide ample access for parents and other members of the public. I will therefore not support the amendment, as what it proposes is unnecessary and overly bureaucratic.

The new arrangements will improve the existing ones, in that they require LEAs to notify governing bodies when the adopted plan is placed on the LEA's website. At present, the LEAs are not obliged to do this, so governing bodies could be unaware that the adopted plans are available. In light of that explanation, I hope that you will be happy to accept the proposal.

Peter Black: I propose amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams, Mike German and Jenny Randerson. It is proposed that

the National Assembly for Wales resolves to make the following amendments to the Education (School Organisation Plans) (Wales) Regulations 2003, a draft of which was laid in the Table Office on 24 July.

Insert at end of regulation 10:

(d) sending a copy of the plan to all the organisations referred to in regulation 5 (1) and (2).

Our amendment is not based on a misunderstanding. If you read the regulations, the posting of the plans on the internet is clearly substituted for sending them out in hard copy. From reading the regulations, it seems to me that the provision of hard copies has been done away with, and although local authorities may continue to distribute their school plans in that way, they are no longer obliged to do so. Our amendment does not do away with the provision of plans on the internet, so it is not a substitute for the provision of hard copies, it is in addition to it. These plans should be distributed as widely as possible so that

a fabwysiedir a'i ddsbarthu i ysgolion. Byddai hynny yn gam yn ôl, ac yn faich diangen ar AALl. Bydd copïau caled o'r cynllun drafft ar gael mewn llyfrgelloedd a bydd modd gweld y cynllun a fabwysiedir ar y rhyngwrwyd. Dylai hynny roi digon o gyfle i rieni ac aelodau eraill o'r cyhoedd weld y cynllun. Felly ni chefnogaf y gwelliant, gan fod yr hyn a gynigir yn ddiangen ac yn orfiwrocraidd.

Bydd y trefniadau newydd yn gwella'r rhai presennol, gan y byddant yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i AALl hysbysu cyrff llywodraethol pan roddir y cynllun a fabwysiedir ar wefan yr AALl. Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes dyletswydd ar yr AALl i wneud hynny, felly mae'n bosibl na fyddai cyrff llywodraethol yn ymwybodol bod y cynlluniau a fabwysiedir ar gael. O ystyried yr esboniad hwnnw, gobeithiaf y byddwch yn fodlon derbyn y cynnig.

Peter Black: Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams, Mike German a Jenny Randerson. Cynnig bod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn penderfynu mabwysiadu'r gwelliannau canlynol i Reoliadau Addysg (Cynlluniau Trefniadaeth Ysgolion) (Cymru) 2003 y gosodwyd drafft ohonynt yn y swyddfa gyflwyno ar 24 Gorffennaf.

Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd rheoliad 10:

(d) anfon copi o'r cynllun i'r holl gyrff y cyfeirir atynt yn rheoliad 5 (1) a (2).

Nid yw ein gwelliant yn seiliedig ar gamddealltwriaeth. Os darllenwch y rheoliadau, mae'n amlwg bod yr hawl i gyhoeddi cynlluniau ar y rhyngwrwyd yn disodli'r gofyniad i'w dosbarthu ar ffurf copi caled. O ddarllen y rheoliadau, ymddengys imi fod yr angen i ddarparu copïau caled wedi'i ddiddymu, ac er y bydd awdurdodau lleol, o bosibl, yn parhau i ddsbarthu eu cynlluniau ysgol yn y fath fodd, nid oes bellach ddyletswydd arnynt i wneud hynny. Nid yw ein gwelliant yn cael gwared ar yr opsiwn i ddarparu cynlluniau ar y rhyngwrwyd, felly nid yw'n diddymu'r opsiwn i ddarparu copïau caled, mae'n opsiwn ychwanegol.

everybody—parents, governors, teachers and anyone else interested in the development of education and schools in a particular area—can see them and comment upon them.

I welcome the other provisions of the regulations. Changing publication from every year to every three years will reduce the burden on councils and schools and the pressure on LEAs, particularly in rural areas, where the annual review of spare places has put a great deal of pressure on small schools. That is a beneficial side-effect. However, given that there are already enough problems in local government with regard to adequate consultation, the involvement of all interested parties and the availability of documents, we should not add to that by trying to short-circuit the distribution of this plan by stating that it should just be available on the internet or via e-mail, when so many people do not have access to those media. Many people go to their local library to look at these plans. For that reason, I commend the amendment.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I repeat that hard copies of the draft plan, which is what is consulted upon, will be in the libraries; I clearly stated that. Libraries will have hard copies of the draft plan, and access to the adopted plan will be via the internet. I agree that hard copies of the consultation draft must be available to ensure adequate access. That is included in our proposals. We have merely deleted the further obligation to provide the adopted plan in hard copy. That will be available via the internet, and the adopted plan will be placed on the local education authority's website, and all governing bodies will be notified of that.

3.50 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM1552): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1552): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dylid dosbarthu'r cynlluniau hyn mor eang â phosibl er mwyn i bawb—rhieni, llywodraethwyr, athrawon ac unrhyw un arall sydd â diddordeb mewn datblygiad addysg ac ysgolion mewn ardal benodol—allu eu gweld a chyflwyno sylwadau arnynt.

Croesawaf ddarpariaethau eraill y rheoliadau. Bydd newid amllder cyhoeddi o bob blwyddyn i bob tair blynedd yn lleihau'r baich ar gynghorau ac ysgolion a'r pwysau ar AALL, yn arbennig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, lle mae'r adolygiad blynyddol o leoedd gwag wedi rhoi cryn dipyn o bwysau ar ysgolion bach. Mae hynny'n sgîl-effaith fuddiol. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried bod digon o broblemau eisoes o fewn llywodraeth leol o ran ymgynghori digonol, cynnwys pawb sydd â diddordeb ac argaeledd dogfennau, ni ddylem ychwanegu at hynny drwy geisio cwtogi ar y ffyrdd y caiff y cynllun hwn ei ddsbarthu drwy ddatgan mai dim ond ar y rhyngwyd neu drwy e-bost y dylai fod ar gael, pan nad yw'r cyfryngau hynny ar gael i gymaint o bobl. Mae llawer o bobl yn mynd i'r llyfrgell leol i edrych ar y cynlluniau hyn. Am y rheswm hwnnw, cymeradwyaf y gwelliant.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Ailadroddaf y bydd copïau caled o'r cynllun drafft, sef yr hyn yr ymgynghorir arno, ar gael yn y llyfrgelloedd; nodais hynny yn glir. Bydd copïau caled o'r cynllun drafft ar gael mewn llyfrgelloedd, a bydd modd gweld y cynllun a fabwysiedir ar y rhyngwyd. Cytunaf fod yn rhaid sicrhau bod copïau caled o'r drafft ymgynghori ar gael er mwyn rhoi cyfle digonol i bawb gymryd rhan. Cynhwysir hynny yn ein cynigion. Yn syml, yr ydym wedi dileu'r rhwymedigaeth bellach i ddarparu'r cynllun a fabwysiedir ar ffurf copi caled. Bydd hwnnw ar gael ar y rhyngwyd, a rhoddir y cynllun a fabwysiedir ar wefan yr awdurdod addysg lleol, a hysbysir pob corff llywodraethol o hynny.

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Marek, John
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 14, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 38.
 Amendment 1: For 14, Abstain 0, Against 38.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, Janet

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Bourne, Nick
 Butler, Rosemary

German, Michael
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Lloyd, David
Marek, John
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

*Cynnig (NDM1553): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1553): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John

Gibbons, Brian
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Marek, John
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Lles Anifeiliaid a Ffermir (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2003
 Approval of the Welfare of Farmed Animals (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations
 2003**

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Welfare of Farmed Animals (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 24 June 2003. (NDM1554)

I propose that

the National Assembly:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5 in relation to the draft Order, the Welfare of Farmed Animals (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 1 July 2003;

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiad fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Lles Anifeiliaid a Ffermir (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Mehefin 2003. (NDM1554)

Cynigiad fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Lles Anifeiliaid a Ffermir (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Gorffennaf 2003;

2. *approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 24 June 2003 and the regulatory appraisal, laid in the Table Office on 24 June 2003.* (NDM1555)

Brynle Williams: I declare an interest as a farmer in north Wales. Members may be surprised by my approach to this, because I rise to formally support it. The objectives are clear, straightforward and, hopefully, achievable. However, I would like to see the timescales reduced, which would be a sensible option that would help people in both Wales and Europe.

I see no point in opposing for the sake of it. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Hear, hear.'] Thank you, gentlemen. However, I believe that Members should be discussing the significant issues of the moment in much more detail, such as the health service, waiting list targets, budgets for schools and late payments for farmers, to name just a few. Instead of reports such as this being brought before Plenary, they should either be discussed informally with representatives from the political parties, or in Committee. That would allow more time to discuss the urgent and pressing matters that Members face.

Lorraine Barrett: I do not eat pigs or any other poor animals and, before I vote for this motion, I seek assurances from the Minister. I believe that the minimum standards for pigs should be that they can live organically and in a free-range setting. However, I must confine myself to this motion and the code of recommendations. The Minister will know that I have tabled a written question to him about the code of recommendations, and that Compassion in World Farming is still concerned that the code will not ensure pigs adequate access to material such as hay, straw and sawdust, which enables the pigs to carry out their natural investigative activities.

David Davies: Will you give way?

Lorraine Barrett: No. In response to my—

2. *yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Mehefin 2003 a'r arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Mehefin 2003.* (NDM1555)

Brynle Williams: Datganaf fuddiant fel ffermwr yn y Gogledd. Efallai y bydd Aelodau yn synnu at fy ymagwedd tuag at hyn, oherwydd codaf ar fy nhraed i'w gefnogi'n ffurfiol. Mae'r amcanion yn glir, yn syml a, gobeithio, yn gyflawnadwy. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn weld terfynau amser llai, a fyddai'n opsiwn synhwyrol a fyddai'n helpu pobl yng Nghymru ac yn Ewrop.

Ni welaf ddiben mewn gwrthwynebu er mwyn gwrthwynebu. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Clywch, clywch.'] Diolch yn fawr, foneddigion. Fodd bynnag, credaf y dylai Aelodau drafod y materion pwysig cyfredol yn llawer manylach, megis y gwasanaethau iechyd, targedau rhestrau aros, cyllidebau ysgolion a thaliadau hwyr i ffermwyr, i enwi ond ychydig. Yn lle cyflwyno adroddiadau fel yr adroddiad hwn gerbron Cyfarfod Llawn, dylid naill ai eu trafod yn anffurfiol gyda chynrychiolwyr y pleidiau gwleidyddol neu mewn Pwyllgor. Byddai hynny'n rhoi mwy o amser i drafod y materion brys a wyneba Aelodau.

Lorraine Barrett: Nid wyf yn bwyta moch nac unrhyw anifeiliaid truaain eraill a, chyn imi bleidleisio o blaid y cynnig hwn, gofynnaf am sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog. Yn fy marn i, dylai'r safonau gofynnol ar gyfer moch sicrhau y gallant fyw'n organig ac mewn lleoliad lle y gallant symud yn ddirwystr. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi gyfyngu fy hun i'r cynnig hwn a'r cod argymhellion. Gŵyr y Gweinidog fy mod wedi cyflwyno cwestiwn ysgrifenedig iddo ynglŷn â'r cod argymhellion, a bod y mudiad Compassion in World Farming yn dal i bryderu na fydd y cod yn sicrhau y caiff moch ddigon o ddefnyddiau, megis gwair, gwellt a blawd llif, sy'n fodd iddynt wneud yr hyn sy'n naturiol iddynt, sef chwilota.

David Davies: A ildiwch?

Lorraine Barrett: Nid ildiaf. Mewn ymateb i'm—

Glyn Davies: Will you give way to me?

Lorraine Barrett: Well, I do not mind. I am on the side of the pigs. [*Laughter.*]

Glyn Davies: Will you join me in welcoming that fact that another 1 million people in Britain started eating pig meat last year?

Lorraine Barrett: You know very well that the answer to that is 'no'. I have survived well after 15 years of not eating meat, thank you very much.

The Minister assured me that the code of recommendations makes clear that pig keepers must provide permanent access to a sufficient quantity of materials such as straw, hay and so on. I want the Minister to assure me that these recommendations will ensure that pigs have adequate access to these materials.

Mick Bates: We all welcome these regulations and it is worth pointing out to Members that, in Britain, standards in pig farming are high. For example—[AN ASSEMBLY MEMBER: 'He's telling porkies.'] No porkies. Standards are high. America has intensive units where up to 7,000 pigs are looked by after one man. That is not allowed here. Therefore, there is much that is embodied in this directive—which was meant to be implemented on 1 January, I think—that we would welcome. I would like the Government to offer advice to pig farmers so that they can meet these standards, as there are cost implications. Is the Minister preparing such advice to ensure that our pig industry remains in the lead in terms of welfare requirements?

Glyn Davies: Do you share my great joy, Mick, at the wonderful news that the Vegetarian Society has reported that the number of vegetarians in this country has fallen by 1 million? One million people in Britain last year started enjoying the benefits of eating high-quality British pork again.

Mick Bates: As one who believes in freedom of choice, I welcome people making a choice

Glyn Davies: A ildiwch i mi?

Lorraine Barrett: Wel, nid oes gwahaniaeth gennyf. Yr wyf o blaid y moch. [*Chwerthin.*]

Glyn Davies: A ymunwch â mi i groesawu'r ffaith bod 1 filiwn arall o bobl ym Mhrydain wedi dechrau bwyta cig mochyn y llynedd?

Lorraine Barrett: Fe wyddoch yn iawn mai 'na' yw'r ateb i hynny. Yr wyf wedi llwyddo i fyw ar ôl 15 mlynedd o beidio â bwyta cig, diolch yn fawr.

Rhoddodd y Gweinidog sicrwydd imi bod y cod argymhellion yn egluro bod yn rhaid i geidwaid moch sicrhau bod digon o ddefnyddiau megis gwellt, gwair ac ati ar gael bob amser i foch. Yr wyf am i'r Gweinidog roi sicrwydd imi y bydd yr argymhellion hyn yn sicrhau y rhoddir digon o'r defnyddiau hyn i foch.

Mick Bates: Mae pob un ohonom yn croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn ac mae'n werth tynnu sylw'r Aelodau at y ffaith bod safonau ffermio moch ym Mhrydain yn dda. Er enghraifft—[AELOD O'R CYNULLIAD: 'Mae'n dweud 'porkies' ys dywed y Sais'.] Mae'n wir. Mae safonau yn uchel. Yn America mae unedau dwys lle mae hyd at 7,000 o foch o dan ofal un dyn. Ni chaniateir hynny yma. Felly, mae llawer yn y gyfarwyddeb hon—a oedd fod i gael ei gweithredu ar 1 Ionawr, fe gredaf—y byddem yn ei groesawu. Hoffwn pe bai'r Llywodraeth yn cynnig cyngor i ffermwyr moch fel y gallant gyrraedd y safonau hyn, gan fod goblygiadau o ran cost. A yw'r Gweinidog yn paratoi cyngor o'r fath er mwyn sicrhau bod ein diwydiant moch yn parhau i fod ar y blaen o ran gofynion lles?

Glyn Davies: A rannwch fy llawenydd mawr, Mick, ynglŷn â'r newyddion ardderchog bod Cymdeithas y Llysfwytywyr wedi nod bod nifer y llysfwytywyr yn y wlad hon wedi gostwng 1 filiwn? Y llynedd dechreuodd 1 filiwn o bobl ym Mhrydain fwynhau manteision bwyta cig mochyn o safon dda a gynhyrchwyd ym Mhrydain unwaith eto.

Mick Bates: Fel un sy'n credu mewn rhyddid i ddewis, croesawaf y ffaith bod pobl

in support of whatever food they like to eat. If it happens to be vegetables, that is fair enough. If it is pork, I welcome that too. That is a true liberal statement.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn eithriadol o bwysig oherwydd eu bod yn cadarnhau'r ffaith bod cynnyrch amaethyddol Cymru o'r safon orau, a bod safonau glanweithdra, diogelwch ac iechyd y cyhoedd o fewn y diwydiant hefyd mor uchel â phosibl. Dylem ymhyfrydu yn y ffaith bod gennym ddiwydiant sy'n cyrraedd y safonau hynny. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn manteisio ar y cyfle i hyrwyddo cynnyrch amaethyddol Cymru, sydd o'r safon orau—cig mochyn yn benodol yma—a hefyd i gynorthwyo'r diwydiant drwy farchnata.

Cytunaf â Mick Bates fod ar amaethwyr angen cefnogaeth, cymorth a chyfarwyddyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru i sicrhau y gallant gydymffurfio â'r rheoliadau hyn. Os yw'n bosibl, dylem hefyd sicrhau cymorth ariannol i'r diben hwnnw.

Carwyn Jones: We have not been asked to provide advice at this stage, but if any approaches are made we will consider giving advice. On Lorraine's comments, nothing has happened to change the answer that I gave her in writing previously.

yn gwneud dewis o blaid pa fwyd bynnag y maent yn hoffi ei fwyta. Os mai llysiau a ddewisant, digon teg. Os dewisant borc, croesawaf hynny hefyd. Mae hwnnw'n ddatganiad rhyddfrydig gwirioneddol.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: These regulations are extremely important because they confirm that Wales's agricultural produce is of the highest standard, and that hygiene, safety and public health standards are also as high as possible. We should be proud of the fact that we have an industry that reaches those standards. I hope that the Minister will take advantage of this opportunity to promote Welsh agricultural produce, which is of the highest standard—pig meat in this case—and also to support the industry through marketing.

I agree with Mick Bates that farmers need support, assistance and guidance from the Government of Wales to ensure that they can conform to these regulations. If possible, we should also ensure financial support for that purpose.

Carwyn Jones: Ni ofynnwyd inni roi cyngor hyd yma, ond os bydd unrhyw un yn gofyn am gyngor, byddwn yn ystyried rhoi cyngor. O ran sylwadau Lorraine, nid oes dim wedi digwydd i newid yr ateb ysgrifenedig a roddais iddi o'r blaen.

*Cynnig (NDM1554): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1554): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa

German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Marek, John
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1555): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1555): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice

Griffiths, John
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Marek, John
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

4.00 p.m.

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Ychwanegion Bwyd (Cymru) 2003 Approval of the Food Supplements (Wales) Regulations 2003

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Food Supplements (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 10 June 2003. (NDM1558)

I propose that

the National Assembly:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Food Supplements (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 24 June 2003;

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Ychwanegion Bwyd (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Mehefin 2003. (NDM1558)

Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Ychwanegion Bwyd (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Mehefin 2003;

2. *approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 10 June 2003 and the regulatory appraisal, laid in the Table Office on 10 June 2003. (NDM1559)*

These regulations will implement in Wales European Commission directive 2002/46/EC on the approximation of the laws of the member states relating to food supplements. Prior to the adoption of this directive, there was neither a definition of the term 'food supplements' nor any specific legislation on food supplements in European Union or UK law. In different member states, such products have up until now been regulated by different national rules. These non-harmonised national rules have resulted in different levels of consumer choice, and have a direct impact on the functioning of the internal market. The Government is firmly committed to the view that, in the interests of consumer choice, the law should allow food supplements that are safe and are properly labelled to be freely marketed. New labelling requirements in the directive will contribute to the Government's commitment to promoting honest and informative labelling to facilitate informed consumer choice.

UK businesses stand to benefit from the harmonised market established by the directive, where it opens up markets for their products in other member states that did not previously permit their sale. The commission proposed harmonisation of the rules on supplements because of trade problems between member states. On behalf of the UK, the Food Standards Agency negotiated hard on the food supplements directive, and achieved some significant concessions, particularly the extension of marketing to 2010 for products already on the market, if certain conditions are met. In implementing the directive, the Government has taken full advantage of the flexibility that it allows to permit the continuation of consumer choice. The national regulations that implement the directive allow the maximum length of time

2. *yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Mehefin 2003 a'r arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Mehefin 2003. (NDM1559)*

Bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn gweithredu cyfarwyddeb 2002/46/EC y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yng Nghymru sy'n ymwneud â lledamcan cyfreithiau'r aelod wladwriaethau ynglŷn ag ychwanegion bwyd. Cyn i'r gyfarwyddeb hon gael ei derbyn, nid oedd diffiniad o'r term 'ychwanegion bwyd' nac unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth benodol ar ychwanegion bwyd yng nghyfraith yr Undeb Ewropeaidd neu'r DU. Mewn gwahanol aelod wladwriaethau, rheoleiddiwyd cynnyrch o'r fath gan wahanol reolau cenedlaethol hyd yma. Mae'r rheoliadau cenedlaethol hyn nad ydynt wedi'u cysoni wedi creu gwahanol lefelau o ddewis i ddefnyddwyr ac wedi cael effaith uniongyrchol ar weithrediad y farchnad fewnol. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn ymrwymedig iawn i'r farn y dylai'r gyfraith ganiatáu i ychwanegion bwyd sy'n ddiogel ac sydd wedi'u labelu'n gywir gael eu marchnata'n ddirwystr er mwyn rhoi dewis i ddefnyddwyr. Bydd gofynion newydd o ran labelu yn y gyfarwyddeb yn cyfrannu at ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i hyrwyddo labelu gonest sy'n rhoi gwybodaeth er mwyn ei gwneud yn haws i ddefnyddwyr ddewis ar sail gwybodaeth.

Bydd busnesau yn y DU yn elwa ar y farchnad wedi'i chysoni a greir gan y gyfarwyddeb, oherwydd y caiff werthu cynnyrch mewn aelod wladwriaethau lle nad oedd hynny'n bosibl cyn hyn. Mae'r comisiwn yn cynnig cysoni'r rheolau ar ychwanegion oherwydd problemau masnach rhwng aelod wladwriaethau. Ar ran y DU, bu'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd yn negodi'n galed ynglŷn â'r gyfarwyddeb ar ychwanegion bwyd, a llwyddodd i gael consesiynau sylweddol, yn enwedig o ran ymestyn marchnata tan 2010 ar gyfer cynnyrch sydd eisoes ar y farchnad, os bodlonir amodau penodol. Wrth weithredu'r gyfarwyddeb, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi manteisio i'r eithaf ar ei hyblygrwydd i sicrhau y bydd dewis y defnyddwyr yn parhau. Mae'r rheoliadau cenedlaethol sy'n

for non-compliant products to be brought into line with the requirements of the new legislation.

The negotiations on the food supplements directive were difficult for the UK, because the UK, the Netherlands, and the Republic of Ireland have more diverse food supplement markets than the other 12 member states. Negotiations were carried forward with great vigour, in full consultation with interested parties. It is important to be clear that, while the directive does not deliver all that the UK wanted, it is much better than it could have been. It was certainly the best deal that could have been achieved in the circumstances. At the time of the vote on the directive, the UK was faced with a difficult choice. We could have joined with member states that wanted a more restricted, needs-based approach to the regulation of these products, and blocked the directive's adoption. The UK decided not to do that, because it was clear that further negotiations would have very likely resulted in a more, rather than a less, restrictive regulatory framework. Most of the stakeholders consulted, including all the major trade associations representing UK food supplements manufacturers, agreed with the UK's decision to vote for the directive to secure what the UK Government and they consider to be the best achievable deal.

As a member of the European Union, the UK is obliged to implement the directive. Failure to transpose its requirements properly would be a serious breach of our obligations under the EC treaty, and would result in infraction proceedings against the UK. Ultimately, implementation would be forced upon us. In addition, the Government of Wales Act 1998 specifically requires the Assembly to act in a manner that is consistent with EU law.

Brynle Williams: Prior to the adoption of directive 2002/46/EC, there was neither a definition of the term 'food supplements' nor any specific legislation on food supplements

gweithredu'r gyfarwydddeb yn caniatáu'r cyfnod mwyaf posibl i sicrhau bod cynnyrch nad yw'n cydymffurfio â hi yn gyson â gofynion y ddeddfwriaeth newydd.

Bu'r negodiadau ar y gyfarwydddeb ychwanegion bwyd yn anodd i'r DU, gan fod marchnadoedd ychwanegion bwyd mwy amrywiol yn y DU, yr Iseldiroedd a Gweriniaeth Iwerddon nag yn y 12 aelod wladwriaeth arall. Bu'r negodi'n egniol iawn, ac ymgynghorwyd yn llawn â'r rhai â diddordeb. Mae'n bwysig deall, er nad yw'r gyfarwydddeb yn darparu popeth yr oedd y DU yn ei ddymuno, mae'n llawer gwell nag y gallai fod wedi bod. Yn sicr trawyd y fargen orau y gellid bod wedi'i tharo o dan yr amgylchiadau. Adeg y bleidlais ar y gyfarwydddeb, wynebodd y DU ddewis anodd. Gallem fod wedi ymuno ag aelod wladwriaethau a oedd am reoleiddio'r cynnyrch hyn mewn ffordd fwy cyfyngedig a'u seilio ar angen, ac atal y gyfarwydddeb rhag cael ei derbyn. Penderfynodd y DU beidio â gwneud hynny, gan ei bod yn amlwg y byddai negodiadau pellach wedi arwain, fwy na thebyg, at fframwaith rheoliadol mwy cyfyngol, yn hytrach na llai cyfyngol. Yr oedd y rhan fwyaf o'r rhanddeiliaid yr ymgynghorwyd â hwy, gan gynnwys pob cymdeithas fasnach o bwys sy'n cynrychioli cynhyrchwyr ychwanegion bwyd y DU, yn cytuno â phenderfyniad y DU i bleidleisio o blaid y gyfarwydddeb er mwyn sicrhau'r hyn a oedd yn eu barn hwy a barn Llywodraeth y DU, y fargen orau y gellid bod wedi'i tharo.

Fel aelod o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, mae rhwymedigaeth ar y DU i weithredu'r gyfarwydddeb. Byddai methiant i drawsosod ei gofynion yn gywir yn dor-rhwymedigaeth difrifol o dan gytundeb y Gymuned Ewropeaidd, a byddai'n arwain at gamau yn erbyn y DU i orfodi'r ddeddfwriaeth. Yn y pen draw, byddem yn cael ein gorfodi i weithredu'r gyfarwydddeb. Yn ogystal, mae gofyniad penodol yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 sy'n mynnu bod y Cynulliad yn gweithredu mewn modd sy'n gyson â chyfraith yr UE.

Brynle Williams: Cyn i gyfarwydddeb 2002/46/EC gael ei derbyn, nid oedd diffiniad o'r term 'ychwanegion bwyd' nac unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth benodol yn ymwneud

in the EU. That was extremely worrying. The current framework structure only applies to vitamins and minerals, but will cover other nutrients in future. The full impact of the changes will not be felt until 2005 or 2009. There has always been a great deal of concern regarding food supplements, and research has shown that, previously, not all producers were advising consumers that their foods were irradiated. Research shows that hundreds of supplements on sale in the UK have been irradiated, in breach of food regulations. There is concern that such products are being sold illegally, but many state that there are no food safety concerns. The Food Standards Agency conducted a survey and found that 42 per cent of the samples tested had been exposed to radiation, but that that had not been revealed on the label. I hope that more stringent controls will be put in place to protect producers and consumers, as it is important that people are aware of what they eat and drink for many reasons, not least health-related ones.

Mick Bates: The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome these regulations as they further consumer safety, especially for women, who are most likely to take such supplements. The regulatory assessment states that, compared with men, women are more health conscious and aware of their diet.

Rosemary Butler: They are also brighter.

Mick Bates: I see. I do not accept that remark from a sedentary position. [*Laughter.*]

The market is worth £335 million, so it is important. We welcome the fact that there is now a definition of food supplements and that there will be a list of permitted chemical sources. That is crucial to ensure the safety of these products.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I thank Brynle and Mick for their helpful contributions.

ag ychwanegion bwyd yn yr UE. Yr oedd hynny'n peri cryn ofid. Mae strwythur y fframwaith cyfredol ond yn ymdrin â fitaminau a mwynau, ond bydd yn cynnwys maetholion eraill yn y dyfodol. Ni fydd effaith lawn y newidiadau yn amlwg tan 2005 neu 2009. Bu cryn bryder erioed ynglŷn ag ychwanegion bwyd, a dengys ymchwil nad oedd pob cynhyrchwr, yn y gorffennol, yn dweud wrth ddefnyddwyr bod eu bwydydd wedi'u harbelydru. Dengys ymchwil fod cannoedd o ychwanegion sydd ar werth yn y DU wedi'u harbelydru, yn groes i reoliadau bwyd. Mae pryder bod cynnyrch o'r fath yn cael ei werthu'n anghyfreithlon, ond dywed llawer nad oes pryderon o ran diogelwch bwyd. Cynhaliwyd arolwg gan yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd a chanfuwyd bod 42 y cant o'r samplau a brofwyd wedi'u hamlygu i belydredd, ond nad oedd y ffaith honno wedi'i datgelu ar y label. Gobeithiaf y bydd rheolaeth lymach yn y maes hwn yn diogelu cynhyrchwyr a defnyddwyr, gan ei bod yn bwysig bod pobl yn ymwybodol o'r hyn y maent yn ei fwyta ac yn ei yfed am sawl rheswm, yn bennaf am resymau sy'n ymwneud ag iechyd.

Mick Bates: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn gan eu bod yn hyrwyddo diogelwch defnyddwyr, yn enwedig ymhlith menywod, sydd fwyaf tebygol o gymryd ychwanegion o'r fath. Noda'r asesiad rheoliadol fod menywod yn fwy ymwybodol o'u hiechyd a'u deiet na dynion.

Rosemary Butler: Maent yn fwy deallus hefyd.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn gweld. Ni dderbyniaf y sylw hwnnw gennych a chithau ar eich eistedd. [*Chwerthin.*]

Mae'r farchnad werth £335 miliwn, felly mae'n bwysig. Croesawn y ffaith y cafodd ychwanegion bwyd eu diffinio erbyn hyn ac y bydd rhestr o ffynonellau cemegol a ganiateir yn cael ei chyhoeddi. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig i sicrhau diogelwch y cynnyrch hwn.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Diolchaf i Brynle a Mick am eu cyfraniadau defnyddiol.

*Cynnig (NDM1558): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1558): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Marek, John
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1559): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1559): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Marek, John
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Diogelu'r Amgylchedd (Dyletswydd Gofal) (Diwygio)
(Cymru) 2003**
**Approval of the Environmental Protection (Duty of Care) (Amendment) (Wales)
Regulations 2003**

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Environmental Protection (Duty of Care) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 17 June 2003. (NDM1560)

I propose that

the National Assembly:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5 in relation to the draft Order, the Environmental Protection (Duty of Care) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003 laid in the Table Office 24 June 2003;

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 17 June 2003. (NDM1561)

Janet Davies: I understand that the Order relates to increasing the powers of local authority inspectors to monitor waste carriers. The issue of unlicensed waste carriers is important. They may leave waste in unlicensed areas, even farmers' fields. That happened to a local farmer in my constituency, which led to a dreadful situation, as cows got among the waste. This Order is particularly important because regulations on hazardous waste will be introduced in less than a year and there are no hazardous waste disposal sites at present in Wales. Therefore, there will be strong temptation for people to dispose of hazardous waste in ways that they should not. We welcome these regulations.

Glyn Davies: I welcome this legislation. It is important, and the National Assembly should take waste disposal seriously. We have no

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Diogelu'r Amgylchedd (Dyletswydd Gofal) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Mehefin 2003. (NDM1560)

Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Diogelu'r Amgylchedd (Dyletswydd Gofal) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Mehefin 2003;

2. yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Mehefin 2003. (NDM1561)

Janet Davies: Deallaf fod y Gorchymyn yn ymwneud â chynyddu pwerau arolygwyr awdurdodau lleol i fonitro cludwyr gwastraff. Mae cludwyr gwastraff heb drwydded yn fater pwysig. Gallant adael gwastraff mewn ardaloedd didrwydded, hyd yn oed mewn caeau ffermwyr. Digwyddodd hynny i ffermwr lleol yn fy etholaeth i, a arweiniodd at sefyllfa ofnadwy, gan fod ei fuchod wedi cerdded dros y gwastraff. Mae'r Gorchymyn hwn yn arbennig o bwysig oherwydd caiff rheoliadau ar wastraff peryglus eu cyflwyno ymhenn blwyddyn ac nid oes unrhyw safleoedd gwaredu gwastraff peryglus ar hyn o bryd yng Nghymru. Felly, bydd temtasiwn mawr i bobl waredu gwastraff peryglus mewn ffyrdd na ddylent. Croesawn y rheoliadau hyn.

Glyn Davies: Croesawaf y ddeddfwriaeth hon. Mae hyn yn bwysig, a dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gymryd y pwnc hwn o ddifrif.

objection to waste disposal authorities taking whatever action necessary to ensure that the process is dealt with properly.

Nid ydym yn gwrthwynebu bod awdurdodau gwaredu yn cymryd pa gamau bynnag sydd eu hangen i sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â'r broses yn gywir.

4.10 p.m.

My only concern relates to regulatory appraisals. I have tried to find a copy of the regulatory appraisal applicable to this regulation, and I understand that there is not one. That is out of order. Costs are associated with this regulation, if only the bureaucratic costs of processing the forms and so on. A regulatory appraisal is needed so that we can make a judgment based on costs. We often talk of bringing pressure to bear on bureaucracy in ensuring efficiency, yet here is a regulation that—it seems to me, but the Government may correct me—has not gone through due process.

Yr unig bryder sydd gennyf yw arfarniadau rheoliadol. Ceisiais ddod o hyd i gopi o'r arfarniad rheoliadol a oedd yn gymwys i'r rheoliad hwn, a deallaf nad oes un ar gael. Mae hynny allan o drefn. Mae costau yn gysylltiedig â'r rheoliad hwn, os mai dim ond costau biwrocraidaidd prosesu'r ffurflenni ac ati yw hynny. Mae angen arfarniad rheoliadol er mwyn inni allu llunio barn yn seiliedig ar gostau. Yr ydym yn aml yn sôn am ddwyn pwysau ar brosesau biwrocraidaidd er mwyn sicrhau effeithlonrwydd, ond eto nid yw'r rheoliad hwn—fe ymddengys i mi, ond gall y Llywodraeth fy nghywiro—wedi dilyn y broses gywir.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): On Glyn Davies's point, this does not add to the regulatory burden because those who keep waste already have a duty of care to keep copies of waste transfer notes. All that this legislation ensures is that local authorities have access to those notes.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): O ran pwynt Glyn Davies, nid yw hyn yn ychwanegu at y baich rheoliadol gan fod dyletswydd gofal eisoes ar y rhai sy'n cadw gwastraff i gadw copïau o nodiadau trosglwyddo gwastraff. Y cyfan y mae'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn ei sicrhau yw bod hawl gan awdurdodau lleol i weld y nodiadau hynny.

*Cynnig (NDM1560): O blaid 56, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1560): For 56, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa

German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Marek, John
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1561): O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1561): For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa

German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.12 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.12 p.m.*

Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ynghylch Effeithlonrwydd Ynni The Economic Development Committee's Report on Energy Efficiency

Christine Gwyther: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales notes the report of the former Economic Development Committee, entitled 'Economic Development Committee Review of Energy Policy in Wales Part 2: Energy Efficiency—Final Report', which was laid in the Table Office on 2 April 2003. (NDM1562)

On Monday night, I attended the launch of the Carmarthenshire youth forum. The evening began with a pretty stark videotape, showing the effects of pollution,

Christine Gwyther: Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi adroddiad yr hen Bwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd o'r enw 'Adolygiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd o Bolisi Ynni yng Nghymru Rhan 2: Effeithlonrwydd Ynni – yr Adroddiad Terfynol', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Ebrill 2003. (NDM1562)

Nos Lun, mynychais lansiad fforwm ieuencid Sir Gaerfyrddin. Dechreuwyd y noson drwy ddangos tâp fideo eithaf trawiadol, a ddangosai effeithiau llygredd,

environmental mismanagement and global warming. That was followed by a taped message from Jonathan Porritt, who said that the most globally important act of young engagement was to 'get in the face' of politicians and stay there. We must understand that young people, more than our generation, are critically appraising how we produce—and waste—energy. The video message talked about the two environmental choices facing the human race today: do nothing and face extinction or do something and be in with a chance of survival.

That was the same message that Sir John Houghton, co-chair of the scientific assessment working group of the Intergovernmental Panel for Climate Change, brought to the Economic Development Committee last year. I mentioned his full title because, when he came to give evidence, it struck me that, if your aims are unambiguous and if you really believe what you are doing, you can take that clarity, promote it at the highest international level and still be able to explain it to a group of relative amateurs in Cardiff bay. That impressed me.

Like Jonathan Porritt, he gave us the either/or choice: either do nothing or take action that will at least give you a fighting chance. His motivation came from the thought that his grandchildren would never forgive him if he did nothing. As politicians, we must use the motivation and the mandate that comes with knowing that our constituents and our country will never forgive us if we do nothing.

This debate brings the second phase of the Economic Development Committee review of energy policy to the Assembly. The first was on renewable energy. It stimulated wide media coverage and sustained public interest—I still have a hate mail hangover as a result of that polarised debate. During the debate we identified the need for industry to be able to plan for the future and to invest with the confidence that it will have secure and competitively priced electricity supplies. The report focused on the challenges arising from climate change and global warming and the challenges and opportunities associated with investment in renewable energy.

camreoli'r amgylchedd a chynhesu byd-eang. Dilynwyd hynny gan neges ar dâp gan Jonathan Porritt, a ddywedodd mai'r weithred bwysicaf yn fyd-eang y gallai pobl ifanc ei chyflawni fyddai herio gwleidyddion a pharhau i'w herio. Rhaid inni ddeall bod pobl ifanc, yn fwy na'n cenhedlaeth ni, yn arfarnu'n feirniadol y modd y cynhyrchwn—ac y gwastraffwn—ynni. Soniodd y neges fideo am y ddau ddewis amgylcheddol sy'n wynebu'r hil ddynol heddiw: gwneud dim a wynebu difodiant neu wneud rhywbeth a chael cyfle i oroesi.

Dyna oedd yr un neges a gyflëwyd gan Syr John Houghton, cyd-gadeirydd gweithgor asesu gwyddonol y Panel Rhynglywodraethol ar Newid yn yr Hinsawdd, i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd y llynedd. Rhoddais ei deitl llawn oherwydd, pan ddaeth i roi tystiolaeth, fe'm trawyd, os yw eich nodau yn ddiawwys ac os credwch yn wirioneddol yn yr hyn a wnewch, gallwch gymryd yr eglurder hwnnw, ei hyrwyddo ar y lefel ryngwladol uchaf a dal i allu ei egluro i grŵp o bobl gymharol amatur ym mae Caerdydd. Creodd hynny argraff arnaf.

Fel Jonathan Porritt, rhoddodd y dewis naill ai/neu inni: gwnewch ddim neu cymerwch gamau a fydd yn rhoi o leiaf gyfle teg ichi. Daeth ei ysgogiad o'r gred na fyddai ei wyrion na'i wyresau byth yn maddau iddo pe bai'n gwneud dim. Fel gwleidyddion, rhaid inni ddefnyddio'r ysgogiad a'r mandad a ddaw yn sgîl gwybod na fydd ein hetholwyr a'n gwlad byth yn maddau inni os na wnawn rhywbeth.

Cyflwyno'r ddadl hon ail gam adolygiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd o bolisi ynni i'r Cynulliad. Bu'r ddadl gyntaf ar ynni adnewyddadwy. Ysgogodd sylw eang yn y cyfryngau a diddordeb parhaus y cyhoedd—yr wyf yn dal i dderbyn llythyrau cas o ganlyniad i'r ddadl hollt honno. Yn ystod y ddadl nodwyd yr angen i ddiwydiant allu cynllunio ar gyfer y dyfodol a buddsoddi gyda'r hyder y caiff gyflenwadau trydan sy'n sicr ac wedi eu prasio'n gystadleuol. Canolbwyntiodd yr adroddiad ar yr heriau sy'n codi o newid yn yr hinsawdd a chynhesu byd-eang a'r heriau a'r cyfleoedd sy'n gysylltiedig â buddsoddi mewn ynni adnewyddadwy.

The second part of our review, focusing on energy efficiency, caused much less of a stir. No-one could accuse us of sexing up our document. The consultation responses came, by and large, from the usual suspects—the converted. We identified that problem during the consultation, and Government must consider how to spread the message to the unconverted.

It is easy to see that, as individuals and as a nation, we are wasteful in our use of energy. Most people agree that we need to be more efficient. The challenge is how to change people's behaviour, and how to provide help and encouragement to change. Learning to live differently is the Assembly's sustainable development mantra, and it is entirely applicable to this issue, which involves attitudes towards the use of energy.

Government must encourage and facilitate a change in attitude. In this report, the Committee considered the wide-ranging ways in which Wales can improve the efficiency with which it uses energy and the action that needs to be taken, by Government and everyone else, to lead to improvements.

The Committee made several specific recommendations. I will not detail them now, as they are listed in the report. The key point is that the Welsh Assembly Government must take a clear lead in promoting and encouraging energy efficiency across Wales. It must establish processes to monitor and report on how we are performing, and use all its powers, as well as those of the agencies that it sponsors, to work towards a change in attitude. It should particularly use its power as the sponsor of a new building, and those of the many Assembly agencies that own and build property, as well as powers as a purchaser of products, to promote the highest standards of energy efficiency wherever it can. This must include understanding where our greatest challenges lie—for instance, in our old, often poorly maintained housing stock.

The benefits are not just greater energy

Achosodd ail ran ein hadolygiad, a oedd yn canolbwyntio ar effeithlonrwydd ynni, lai o gyffro o lawer. Ni allai neb ein cyhuddo o wneud ein dogfen yn fwy deniadol. Daeth yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad, ar y cyfan, oddi wrth y bobl arferol—y rhai sydd eisoes wedi cael troedigaeth. Nodwyd y broblem honno yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad, a rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ystyried sut i ledaenu'r neges i'r rhai sydd heb gael troedigaeth.

Mae'n hawdd gweld ein bod, fel unigolion ac fel cenedl, yn gwastraffu'r ynni a ddefnyddiwn. Cytuna'r rhan fwyaf o bobl fod angen inni fod yn fwy effeithlon. Yr her yw sut i newid ymddygiad pobl, a sut i ddarparu cymorth ac anogaeth i newid. Dysgu byw yn wahanol yw mantra datblygu cynaliadwy y Cynulliad, ac mae'n gwbl berthnasol i'r mater hwn, sy'n cynnwys agweddau tuag at ddefnyddio ynni.

Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth annog a hwyluso newid mewn agwedd. Yn yr adroddiad hwn, ystyriodd y Pwyllgor y ffyrdd pellgyrhaeddol y gall Cymru ddefnyddio ynni yn fwy effeithlon a'r camau y mae angen i'r Llywodraeth, a phawb arall, eu cymryd i arwain at welliannau.

Gwnaeth y Pwyllgor sawl argymhelliad penodol. Ni fanylaf arnynt yn awr, gan eu bod wedi eu rhestru yn yr adroddiad. Y pwynt allweddol yw bod yn rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gymryd yr arweiniad i hyrwyddo ac annog effeithlonrwydd ynni ledled Cymru. Rhaid iddi sefydlu prosesau i fonitro a chyflwyno adroddiadau ar sut yr ydym yn perfformio, gan ddefnyddio ei holl bwerau, yn ogystal â phwerau'r asiantaethau a noddir ganddi, i weithio tuag at newid agwedd. Yn arbennig, dylai ddefnyddio ei phŵer fel noddwr adeilad newydd, a phwerau asiantaethau niferus y Cynulliad sy'n berchen ar eiddo ac sy'n adeiladu eiddo, yn ogystal â phwerau fel prynwr cynnyrch, i hyrwyddo'r safonau gorau o effeithlonrwydd ynni lle bynnag y gall wneud hynny. Rhaid i hyn gynnwys deall beth yw ein heriau mwyaf—er enghraifft, yn ein hen stoc tai, na chaiff ei gynnal a'i gadw'n dda fel arfer.

Nid yw'r buddiannau yn golygu gwell

efficiency but also the opportunities for Welsh companies to develop new products and find new business, and for Welsh people to learn new skills for the new jobs that will be created. One thing that emerged from our deliberations was that energy efficiency jobs can be created where people live—work can be taken to the people, and that must be good for the long-term future of our communities, as well as for the long-term future of our planet.

The Committee published its report for consultation in December 2002, and we appreciated the wide-ranging and carefully considered responses that were put to the Committee. We have read them and have considered them all carefully. It was encouraging to hear the strong commitment to improving energy efficiency, but the fact that it came largely from people and organisations already in the business highlighted the challenge, as I have mentioned. The Welsh Assembly Government must increase the general level of interest in energy efficiency among the people of Wales. At present, there is a disparate group of energy agencies, eco-centres and the like operating across most, but not all, parts of Wales. There appears to be a gap in provision in south-east Wales, for instance. The gaps and other service delivery issues need to be addressed.

As I have said previously, energy efficiency does not sound terribly exciting at the moment. However, it could be if we sell it as an economic and social, as well as environmental, benefit. To do that we need a coherent and accessible energy advice strategy, and I look to the Minister to enable that. We also need funding to enable strategies to be delivered. In this morning's meeting of the Economic Development and Transport Committee, we resolved to include energy as a discrete priority in the budget setting round for the first time. I take this opportunity to deliver that message to the Minister for the second time today.

I close by thanking the members of the

effeithlonrwydd ynni yn unig, maent hefyd yn golygu cyfleoedd i gwmnïau Cymreig ddatblygu cynnyrch newydd a dod o hyd i fusnes newydd, ac i bobl Cymru ddysgu sgiliau newydd ar gyfer y swyddi newydd a gaiff eu creu. Un peth a ddaeth i'r amlwg yn sgîl ein trafodaethau oedd y gall swyddi effeithlonrwydd ynni gael eu creu lle mae pobl yn byw—gellir mynd â gwaith at y bobl, a rhaid bod hynny'n beth da i ddyfodol hirdymor ein cymunedau, yn ogystal ag i ddyfodol hirdymor ein planed.

Cyhoeddodd y Pwyllgor ei adroddiad ar gyfer ymgynghori arno ym mis Rhagfyr 2002, a gwerthfawrogwn yr ymatebion pellgyrhaeddol a ystyriwyd yn ofalus ac a gyflwynwyd i'r Pwyllgor. Yr ydym wedi eu darllen ac wedi ystyried pob un yn ofalus. Yr oedd yn galonogol clywed yr ymrwymiad cryf i wella effeithlonrwydd ynni, ond mae'r ffaith iddo ddod yn bennaf oddi wrth y bobl a'r sefydliadau sydd eisoes yn y busnes yn amlygu'r her, fel y crybwyllais. Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gynyddu'r diddordeb cyffredinol mewn effeithlonrwydd ynni ymhlith pobl Cymru. Ar hyn o bryd, mae grŵp anghymesur o asiantaethau ynni, canolfannau ecolegol a'u tebyg yn gweithredu ar draws y rhan fwyaf o Gymru, ond nid Cymru gyfan. Ymddengys fod bwlch yn y ddarpariaeth yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru, er enghraifft. Mae angen mynd i'r afael â'r bylchau a materion eraill yn ymwneud â darparu gwasanaeth.

Fel y dywedais o'r blaen, nid yw effeithlonrwydd ynni yn swnio'n hynod o gyffrous ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, gallai fod pe baem yn ei werthu fel budd economaidd a chymdeithasol, yn ogystal â budd amgylcheddol. Er mwyn gwneud hynny mae angen strategaeth cyngor ar ynni gydlynol a hygyrch arnom, a gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gyflawni hynny. Mae angen arian arnom hefyd i gyflawni strategaethau. Yng nghyfarfod y bore yma o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, penderfynasom gynnwys ynni fel blaenoriaeth ar wahân yng nghylch pennu'r gyllideb am y tro cyntaf. Manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn i gyfleu'r neges honno i'r Gweinidog am yr ail dro heddiw.

Deuaf i ben drwy ddiolch i aelodau'r cyn

former Economic Development Committee, several of whom did not stand for re-election. I particularly thank the late Phil Williams who made such a lively and intelligent contribution and who regularly attended reference group meetings. I thank the reference group, which was made up of professionals and practitioners, for its advice and guidance in developing the review programme. The content of the report is, nonetheless, the sole responsibility of the Committee. We will accept the brickbats as well as the bouquets for the recommendations made.

4.20 p.m.

I also wish to thank our expert adviser, Professor Jake Chapman, and the Committee clerk, John Grimes, the deputy clerk, Siân Wilkins, and Gareth John, who was a member of the secretariat.

I thank the Business Minister for scheduling this important debate, and I look forward to hearing Members' views and the Minister's response.

Elin Jones: Diolchaf i'r Cadeirydd am gyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn, a chefnogaf yr hyn a ddywedodd. Wrth gyfrannu ar ran Plaid Cymru yn y drafodaeth hon, teimlaf golled Phil Williams. Ymhlith Aelodau Plaid Cymru, ef oedd yr un a gymerai'r diddordeb mwyaf yn y pwnc ac, wrth ysgrifennu fy araith neithiwr, gwelais eisiau ei gyfraniad.

Derbyniaf lythyron di-rif ar ynni adnewyddadwy, a ffermydd gwynt yn benodol. Braff yw cael y cyfle heddiw, ac yn y Pwyllgor yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf, i drafod ochr arall y geiniog, sef effeithlonrwydd ynni. Os yw unrhyw lywodraeth o ddifrif ynglŷn â chynhyrchu llai o garbon deuocsid, rhaid edrych ar ffyrdd o leihau'r defnydd o ynni yn ogystal â chreu ynni glân.

Mae hyrwyddo arbed ynni yn anos ar hyn o bryd gan fod canran cost ynni o wariant domestig yn gostwng. Mae'r cymhelliad i unigolion fuddsoddi mewn dulliau ynni-effeithlon er mwyn arbed arian yn y tymor byr yn gymharol fach. Rhaid edrych felly ar dulliau trethiannol a chyllidol i annog pobl a

Bwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, y penderfynodd sawl un ohonynt na fyddent yn sefyll i gael eu hail-ethol. Diolchaf yn arbennig i'r diweddar Phil Williams a wnaeth gyfraniad mor fywiog a deallus ac a fynychodd gyfarfodydd y grŵp cyfeirio yn rheolaidd. Diolchaf i'r grŵp cyfeirio, a oedd yn cynnwys pobl broffesiynol ac ymarferwyr, am ei gyngor a'i arweiniad i ddatblygu'r rhaglen adolygu. Cyfrifoldeb llwyr y Pwyllgor yw cynnwys yr adroddiad, serch hynny. Byddwn yn derbyn beirniadaeth yn ogystal â chanmoliaeth am yr argymhellion a wnaed.

Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i'n hymgyngorydd arbenigol, yr Athro Jake Chapman, a chlerc y Pwyllgor, John Grimes, y dirprwy glerc, Siân Wilkins, a Gareth John, a fu'n aelod o'r ysgrifenyddiaeth.

Diolchaf i'r Trefnydd am amserlennu'r ddadl bwysig hon, ac edrychaf ymlaen at glywed safbwyntiau'r Aelodau ac ymateb y Gweinidog.

Elin Jones: I thank the Chair for presenting this report, and I support her comments. In contributing on behalf of Plaid Cymru to this debate, Phil Williams is sorely missed. He was the Plaid Cymru Member with the greatest interest in this subject and, while writing my speech last night, I missed his contribution.

I receive countless letters on renewable energy, and windfarms in particular. I welcome the opportunity today, and in Committee in recent months, to discuss the other side of the coin, namely energy efficiency. If any government is serious about reducing carbon dioxide emissions, it must consider methods of reducing energy consumption and clean energy production methods.

Promoting energy efficiency is particularly difficult at present due to the reduction in the percentage of domestic expenditure spent on energy costs. Incentives offered to individuals to persuade them to invest in energy-efficient measures in order to save money in the short term are relatively small.

busnesau i fuddsoddi mewn mesurau i arbed ynni. Mae'r adroddiad yn argymhell hynny'n gryf.

Yr wyf am gyfeirio at ddwy esiampl arloesol y gallai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad annog Llywodraeth San Steffan i'w dilyn drwy eu gweithredu yng Nghymru. Yn ôl pob tebyg, dim ond unwaith bob 15 mlynedd y bydd unigolion yn penderfynu gwneud buddsoddiad ariannol mawr. Mae hynny'n aml yn gysylltiedig â phrynu tŷ, sydd yn cydreddeg â chael morgais. Gellid rhoi gostyngiad sylweddol yn y dreth stamp a delir gan unigolion pe baent yn buddsoddi mewn mesurau i arbed ynni o fewn y chwe mis neu'r flwyddyn gyntaf ar ôl prynu tŷ. Gan fod Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol eisoes wedi penderfynu gostwng y dreth stamp mewn nifer o ardaloedd—a hynny dim ond er mwyn hyrwyddo'r farchnad dai yn ddiangen—gellid bod wedi cyplysu diddymu'r dreth honno gyda chymhelliad positif arbed ynni ac, yn y pen draw, leihau'r gost i unigolion. Hefyd, gallai'r Trysorlys ariannu awdurdodau lleol i'w galluogi i gynnig gostyngiadau yn y dreth gyngor i unigolion a fyddai'n barod i wneud eu tai yn ynni-effeithlon. Mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur wedi ymrwymo i dorri 20 y cant o ollyngiadau carbon deuocsid erbyn 2010. Mae'n bell o gyrraedd y nod hwn, yn enwedig gan fod gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid wedi cynyddu mewn rhai agweddau. Yn ogystal â gosod targedau, rhaid i lywodraethau, drwy eu polisiau a'u mesurau ariannol, helpu busnesau ac unigolion gyrraedd targedau.

Fel mewn sawl dadl arall, wynebwn y broblem o orfod gofyn i Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol weithredu argymhellion er mwyn cyflawni gwir ddyhead adroddiad Pwyllgor. Nid oes gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol bŵer i greu cymhellion ariannol i hyrwyddo effeithlonrwydd ynni nac ychwaith i ddiwygio rheoliadau adeiladu i hyrwyddo gwell defnydd o ynni wrth adeiladu.

Un o'r ychydig feysydd lle y mae gan y Cynulliad rôl i hyrwyddo effeithlonrwydd ynni ac ynni glân yw Amcan 1. Wrth drafod

We must look, therefore, at taxation and fiscal measures to encourage people and businesses to invest in energy efficiency measures. This is one of the report's strong recommendations.

I wish to refer to two innovative examples that the Assembly Government could encourage the Westminster Government to emulate through their implementation in Wales. Apparently, an individual only decides to make a major financial investment once every 15 years. This is usually associated with purchasing a house, which coincides with obtaining a mortgage. Significant stamp duty reductions could be offered if individuals were prepared to invest in energy-efficiency measures within the first six to 12 months of buying a house. Given that the United Kingdom Government has already decided to reduce stamp duty in many areas—solely to boost the housing market unnecessarily—the abolition of stamp duty could have been coupled with the positive incentive of energy efficiency, which would, ultimately, lead to financial savings for the individuals concerned. Also, the Treasury could enable local authorities to offer council tax discounts to people who would be prepared to make their homes energy-efficient. The Labour Government has committed to a 20 per cent reduction in carbon dioxide emissions by 2010. It has a long way to go, particularly as carbon dioxide emissions have increased in some areas. As well as setting targets, governments, through their financial policies and measures, must help businesses and individuals meet these targets.

As in other debates, we face the problem of having to ask the United Kingdom Government to take forward our recommendations so that the true aspirations of a Committee report are realised. The National Assembly does not have the power to offer financial incentives to promote energy efficiency nor to amend building regulations in order to promote better energy use in construction.

Objective 1 is one of the few areas in which the Assembly has a duty to promote energy efficiency and clean energy. In today's

adolygiad canol tymor Amcan 1 yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth heddiw, clywsom fod y cynnydd a'r gwariant ar fesurau'n ymwneud ag ynni yn drychinebus o isel. Dim ond 16 y cant o'r arian ar gyfer mesurau ar ynni glân sydd wedi ei glustnodi a dim ond 1 y cant o'r arian hwnnw sydd wedi ei wario. Dim ond 2 y cant o'r arian a glustnodwyd ar gyfer isadeiledd ynni.

Mae nifer o argymhellion da yn yr adroddiad. Yn anffodus, mae rhai y tu hwnt i bwerau'r Cynulliad ar hyn o bryd ac y mae eraill o fewn pwerau Llywodraeth Cymru os oes ganddi'r ewyllys i fynd i'r afael o ddirif â'r maes pwysig hwn.

Lisa Francis: As Elin said, one of the outcomes of the Kyoto summit was that the current Government set a target for the UK to achieve a reduction in greenhouse gas emissions, by 2010, of 20 per cent below 1990 levels of emission. As stated in the report's preface, we need to move towards renewable energy and change our waste strategy. However, many renewable energy companies complain that it still takes too long for projects to be approved by local planning authorities—sometimes up to four years—and in some cases as many as 80 per cent of applications fail.

On community energy programmes, it can only be beneficial to promote community heating programmes to reduce fuel poverty as well as environmental emissions. In addition, we must help consumers of gas and electricity who are on low incomes to become more aware of the benefits of energy efficiency and the availability of grant schemes that can pay for these measures. We must help them, not only in terms of saving money, but also in terms of contributing towards carbon dioxide reduction.

The energy market is now at a key point in its development. Due to company consolidation, consumers are faced with a reduction in choice at the retail end of the market. The Government, through its White Paper, expects consumers to contribute significantly to carbon dioxide reduction. Higher energy

discussion in the Economic Development and Transport Committee on the Objective 1 mid-term review, we heard that progress and expenditure on energy-related measures has been terribly disappointing. Only 16 per cent of the money for clean energy measures has been allocated, and only 1 per cent of that money has been spent. Only 2 per cent of the money has been allocated for energy infrastructure.

There are many good recommendations in this report. Unfortunately, some are currently beyond the Assembly's powers and others are within the powers of the Government of Wales, if it has the will to seriously address this important area.

Lisa Francis: Fel y dywedodd Elin, un o ganlyniadau uwchgynhadledd Kyoto oedd bod y Llywodraeth bresennol wedi gosod targed i'r DU i ostwng gollyngiadau nwy tŷ gwydr, erbyn 2010, 20 y cant yn is na lefelau gollyngiadau 1990. Fel y nodwyd yn rhagair yr adroddiad, mae angen inni symud tuag at ynni adnewyddadwy a newid ein strategaeth wastraff. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o gwmnïau ynni adnewyddadwy yn cwyno ei bod yn dal i gymryd gormod o amser i brosiectau gael eu cymeradwyo gan awdurdodau cynllunio lleol—hyd at bedair blynedd weithiau—ac mewn rhai achosion, mae cymaint ag 80 y cant o geisiadau yn methu.

O ran rhaglenni ynni cymunedol, dim ond budd a ddaw o hyrwyddo rhaglenni gwresogi cymunedol i leihau tlodi tanwydd yn ogystal â gollyngiadau amgylcheddol. Yn ogystal, rhaid inni helpu defnyddwyr nwy a thrydan sydd ar incwm isel i ddod yn fwy ymwybodol o fuddiannau effeithlonrwydd ynni a'r cynlluniau grant sydd ar gael a all dalu am y mesurau hyn. Rhaid inni eu helpu, nid yn unig i arbed arian, ond hefyd o ran cyfrannu tuag at leihau carbon deuocsid.

Mae'r farchnad ynni ar bwynt allweddol yn ei datblygiad. O ganlyniad i gyfuno cwmnïau, mae defnyddwyr yn wynebu llai o ddewis yn y farchnad fanwerthu. Disgwylia'r Llywodraeth, drwy ei Phapur Gwyn, i ddefnyddwyr gyfrannu'n sylweddol at leihau carbon deuocsid. Rhagwelir prisiau ynni

prices are forecast, in addition to gas and electricity price increases applied during 2002-03. Millions of households remain in fuel poverty.

Other factors need to be taken into consideration. During 2002-03, the organisation, Energy Watch, became increasingly concerned about the structure of Britain's gas and electricity markets. Consumers were faced with a reduction in choice of supplier as the market consolidated further. For example, consumers who had not changed supplier were paying much more than those who had, and companies were failing to pass on the full benefit of the reduced wholesale prices to domestic customers achieved through the New Electricity Trading Arrangements.

It is difficult to balance the need to reduce consumption and maintain supply and reliability. At the same time, UK competitiveness should not be jeopardised and fuel poverty targets should be met. I note that one of the report's recommendations is to ensure that ELWa and other bodies provide training to support energy efficiency initiatives, particularly in construction. That is a good idea in principle, but I am afraid to report that a constituent of mine, Mr Russell Symons, who is the chair of the National Training Federation of West Wales, wrote to me recently, raising a significant point. He voiced concerns about the shortfall in this year's work-based learning budget, where he expects training places on the foundation modern apprenticeship programme to be reduced by around 66 per cent. Such shortfalls must be put right before this report's recommendations can be fully implemented.

Jenny Randerson: The Welsh Liberal Democrats support the proposals in this report, recognising that at the UK level, there is scope for the reduction in energy use by over 30 per cent. That is worth £12 billion a year. Clearly, promoting energy efficiency is vital in terms of achieving our vision of a sustainable Wales along with developing the use of renewable energy. That is two sides of the same coin. That was covered in the last report of the former Economic Development Committee. By 2050, it is estimated that over

uwch, yn ogystal â chynnydd ym mhrisiau nwy a thrydan a gymhwyswyd yn ystod 2002-03. Mae miliynau o gartrefi yn parhau i fod mewn tlodi tanwydd.

Mae angen ystyried ffactorau eraill. Yn ystod 2002-03, daeth y sefydliad, Energy Watch, yn gynyddol bryderus ynglŷn â strwythur marchnadoedd nwy a thrydan Prydain. Yr oedd defnyddwyr yn wynebu llai o ddewis o ran cyflenwyr wrth i'r farchnad gyfuno ymhellach. Er enghraifft, yr oedd defnyddwyr nad oeddent wedi newid cyflenwr yn talu llawer mwy na'r rhai a oedd wedi newid, ac nid oedd cwmnïau yn trosglwyddo budd llawn y prisiau manwerthu llai i'r cwsmeriaid domestig a gyflawnwyd drwy'r Trefniadau Masnachu Trydan Newydd.

Mae'n anodd cydbwysu'r angen i leihau treuliant a chynnal cyflenwad a dibynadwyedd. Ar yr un pryd, ni ddylai natur gystadleuol y DU gael ei pheryglu a dylid cyraedd targedau tlodi tanwydd. Nodaf mai un o argymhellion yr adroddiad yw sicrhau bod ELWa a chyrrff eraill yn darparu hyfforddiant i gefnogi mentrau effeithlonrwydd ynni, yn arbennig yn y diwydiant adeiladu. Mae hynny'n syniad da mewn egwyddor, ond mae'n ddrwg gennyf nodi i un o'm hetholwyr, Mr Russell Symons, sef cadeirydd Ffederasiwn Hyfforddi Cenedlaethol Gorllewin Cymru, ysgrifennu ataf yn ddiweddar i godi pwnt pwysig. Lleisiodd bryderon ynglŷn â'r diffyg yn y gyllideb dysgu yn y gwaith eleni, lle y mae'n disgwyl gostyngiad o tua 66 y cant yn y lleoedd hyfforddi yn y rhaglen prentisiaethau modern sylfaen. Rhaid unioni diffygion o'r fath cyn y gellir gweithredu argymhellion yr adroddiad hwn yn llawn.

Jenny Randerson: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynigion yn yr adroddiad hwn, gan gydnabod bod cyfle, ar lefel y DU, i leihau'r defnydd o ynni fwy na 30 y cant. Mae hynny'n werth £12 biliwn y flwyddyn. Yn amlwg, mae hyrwyddo effeithlonrwydd ynni yn hollbwysig o ran cyflawni ein gweledigaeth o Gymru gynaliadwy ynghyd â datblygu'r defnydd o ynni adnewyddadwy. Dyna ddwy ochr yr un geiniog. Cwmpaswyd hynny yn adroddiad diwethaf y cyn-Bwyllgor Datblygu

100 million people a year will be victims of global warming related disasters, such as floods and droughts. The National Farmers Union has said that it is the biggest challenge that we face today. It is essential that we are prepared to take bold action, particularly in the household sector, where improving efficiency can reduce bills and alleviate fuel poverty. That has a particular impact on older people. As we all know, unnecessary deaths and illnesses still occur among older people as a result of cold winters. The report proposes several practical steps—promoting the use of combined heat and power is one example that can be of benefit to all. Combined heat and power systems have proved successful in NHS buildings and they could be as successful on a much wider basis, not least in our new Assembly building, where the use of such systems will be combined with the use of heat exchangers and biomass. We must champion the most modern standards and push at the edge of technical expertise. The new Assembly building will also be an effective way of raising awareness.

4.30 p.m.

However, we must address some specific issues. Too many different bodies and schemes are promoting energy efficiency, which leads to confusion and gaps in provision, with some areas ignored. The lack of financial incentives for homeowners to insulate their homes is also a problem. Those incentives are only available to people on benefit, but many families who are living just above the benefit line could not possibly afford to install home insulation measures without financial incentives and grants. Commercial buildings face similar problems, and we must find ways of stimulating efficiency in that regard. The Assembly, local authorities and Assembly sponsored public bodies must lead the way. We must support the work of the Energy Saving Trust and the Carbon Trust, and we must promote the highest standards of energy efficiency in our own buildings, and in the buildings of organisations that we fund. If we do not lead by example, we cannot expect ordinary homeowners to take up our ideas.

Economaidd. Erbyn 2050, rhagwelir y bydd mwy na 100 miliwn o bobl y flwyddyn yn dioddef trychinebau yn gysylltiedig â chynhesu byd-eang, megis llifogydd a chyfnodau o sychder. Mae Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Amaethwyr wedi dweud mai hon yw'r her fwyaf a wynebwn heddiw. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn barod i gymryd camau mentrus, yn enwedig yn y sector tai, lle y gall gwella effeithlonrwydd leihau biliau a lleddfu tlodi tanwydd. Caiff hynny effaith arbennig ar bobl hŷn. Fel y gwyddom i gyd, mae marwolaethau a salwch diangen yn codi o hyd ymhlith pobl hŷn o ganlyniad i aeafau oer. Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnig sawl cam ymarferol—mae hyrwyddo'r defnydd o wres a phŵer cyfunol yn un enghraifft a all fod o fudd i bawb. Bu systemau gwresogi a phŵer cyfunol yn llwyddiannus yn adeiladau'r GIG a gallent fod yr un mor llwyddiannus ar sail ehangach o lawer, yn enwedig yn adeilad newydd y Cynulliad, lle y caiff y defnydd o systemau o'r fath ei gyfuno â'r defnydd o gyfnewidwyr gwres a bio-màs. Rhaid inni hyrwyddo'r safonau mwyaf modern a gwthio ffiniau arbenigedd technegol. Bydd adeilad newydd y Cynulliad hefyd yn ffordd effeithiol o godi ymwybyddiaeth.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â rhai materion penodol. Mae gormod o gyrff a chynlluniau gwahanol yn hyrwyddo effeithlonrwydd ynni, sy'n arwain at ddryswch a bylchau mewn darpariaeth, gyda rhai meysydd yn cael eu hanwybyddu. Mae'r diffyg cymhellion ariannol i berchnogion tai inswleiddio eu cartrefi yn broblem hefyd. Dim ond i bobl ar fudd-daliadau y mae'r cymhellion hynny ar gael, ond mae llawer o deuluoedd sydd ond yn cael incwm sydd ychydig yn fwy na budd-daliadau na allent fyth fforddio gosod mesurau inswleiddio yn eu cartrefi heb gymhellion ariannol a grantiau. Mae adeiladau masnachol yn wynebu problemau tebyg, a rhaid inni ddod o hyd i ffyrdd o ysgogi effeithlonrwydd yn hynny o beth. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad, awdurdodau lleol a chyrrff cyhoeddus a noddur gan y Cynulliad arwain y ffordd. Rhaid inni gefnogi gwaith yr Ymddiriedolaeth Arbed Ynni a'r Ymddiriedolaeth Carbon, a rhaid inni hyrwyddo'r safonau uchaf o effeithlonrwydd

ynni yn ein hadeiladau ni ein hunain, ac yn adeiladau'r sefydliadau a ariannwn. Os na osodwn esiampl, ni allwn ddisgwyl i berchnogion tai cyffredin dderbyn ein syniadau.

The ideals in this report are fine, but does the practice live up to the rhetoric? Earlier this afternoon, Mick Bates stated that the best way to promote energy efficiency is through exemplar projects, in order to prove that renewable energy and energy efficiency works. The previous Minister for Environment promised that technical advice note 8 on renewable energy would be introduced this summer. We are now told that consultation on it will not start until the autumn. The Chair of the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee said earlier that we must plan for the future. Where is the advice note, Minister? We need to plan for the future, and the advice note is essential to that.

Mae'r delfrydau yn yr adroddiad hwn yn iawn, ond a yw'r hyn a weithredir yn bodloni'r rhethreg? Yn gynharach y prynhawn yma, dywedodd Mick Bates mai'r ffordd orau o hyrwyddo effeithlonrwydd ynni yw drwy brosiectau enghreifftiol, er mwyn profi bod ynni adnewyddadwy ac effeithlonrwydd ynni yn gweithio. Addawodd y cyn-Weinidog dros yr Amgylchedd y byddai nodyn cyngor technegol 8 ar ynni adnewyddadwy yn cael ei gyflwyno yn ystod yr haf eleni. Dywedir wrthym bellach na fydd yr ymgynghoriad arno yn dechrau tan yr hydref. Dywedodd Cadeirydd Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad yn gynharach fod yn rhaid inni gynllunio ar gyfer y dyfodol. Ble mae'r nodyn cyngor, Weinidog? Mae angen inni gynllunio ar gyfer y dyfodol, ac mae'r nodyn cyngor yn angenrheidiol er mwyn gwneud hynny.

A wide range of grants are available for research and pilot projects, but we have not yet been able to translate the research and pilot project stage into fully-fledged commercial exploitation. We need more grants for small and medium-sized enterprises to ensure that we translate the research into commercial exploitation on the high street for ordinary householders.

Mae amrywiaeth eang o grantiau ar gael ar gyfer prosiectau ymchwil a phrosiectau peilot, ond nid ydym wedi gallu troi'r cam ymchwil a phrosiect peilot yn brosiectau ymelwa masnachol cwbl weithredol eto. Mae angen mwy o grantiau arnom ar gyfer busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint er mwyn sicrhau y gallwn droi'r ymchwil yn brosiectau ymelwa masnachol ar y stryd fawr ar gyfer deiliaid tai cyffredin.

Janet Davies: I welcome the debate. However, the Assembly has not yet made a real impact on energy efficiency. Many people in different organisations are working hard, but the Assembly lacks the powers to drive this agenda forward. The powers lie elsewhere, and the UK Government, despite its manifesto commitments of 1997 and 2001 to reduce carbon dioxide levels, has instead allowed carbon dioxide levels to increase. VAT is levied inconsistently and illogically, with 5 per cent on energy consumption and 17.5 per cent on energy saving materials, and yet energy conservation measures result in a win-win situation. They win for us by cutting costs for householders, businesses and taxpayers, by tackling fuel poverty, by

Janet Davies: Croesawaf y ddadl. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r Cynulliad wedi cael effaith wirioneddol hyd yn hyn ar effeithlonrwydd ynni. Mae llawer o bobl mewn gwahanol sefydliadau yn gweithio'n galed, ond nid oes gan y Cynulliad ddigon o bŵer i ddatblygu'r agenda hon. Mae'r pŵerau yn rhywle arall, ac mae Llywodraeth y DU, er gwaethaf ymrwymadau ei manifffesto yn 1997 a 2001 i leihau lefelau carbon deuocsid, wedi caniatáu i lefelau carbon deuocsid gynyddu yn lle hynny. Codir TAW yn anghyson ac yn afresymegol, gyda 5 y cant ar ddefnyddio ynni a 17.5 y cant ar ddeunyddiau arbed ynni, ac eto mae mesurau arbed ynni yn arwain at sefyllfa lle mae pawb ar eu hennill. Yr ydym ar ein hennill gan ein bod yn lleihau costau ar

reducing the use of fossil fuels, therefore reducing global warming and conserving finite resources for future generations, and by creating jobs for local people using local products. Given that the ardent letter writers who oppose windfarms often cite such measures, it is odd that such people have not responded to this consultation, either to support or to oppose energy conservation.

Energy conservation, energy efficiency, and the use of renewable sources of energy, are all essential in the battle to reduce global warming. One winning aspect of energy conservation is its scope for creating jobs. Plaid Cymru produced a paper in the mid-1990s that called for the creation of 10,000 jobs from short-term measures. One such measure was energy conservation. We are pleased to see that the Assembly Government is catching up with this idea, but we are not too impressed by the speed with which it is getting the schemes off the ground. A proportion of Objective 1 money is designated for energy and environmental projects, but spending is abysmally slow. Elin Jones referred to a few issues in that regard. I would add that less than 2 per cent of the £28 million that is designated for environmental infrastructure has been committed. At the present rate of spending on home energy conservation, it will take 103 years to achieve the targets, instead of seven years. Not only has that money not been used to improve energy conservation, it has also not been used to provide jobs.

Alun Cairns: I thank Christine Gwyther for how she proposed the report and handled the consultation and the deliberations of the former Economic Development Committee. I recognise the efforts of the clerk and the deputy clerk, John Grimes and Siân Wilkins, and of the special adviser, Professor Jake Chapman.

I oppose windfarms on principle because of their unpopularity, the negative effect that they have on tourism, and the impact that they have on quality of life for so many people. I appreciate that we are obliged to

gyfer deiliaid tai, busnesau a threthdalwyr, drwy fynd i'r afael â thlodi tanwydd, drwy leihau'r defnydd o danwydd ffosil, gan leihau cynhesu byd-eang ac arbed adnoddau prin ar gyfer cenedlaethau'r dyfodol, a thrwy greu swyddi ar gyfer pobl leol gan ddefnyddio cynnyrch lleol. O ystyried bod y bobl brwdfrydig sy'n ysgrifennu llythyrau yn gwrthwynebu ffermydd gwynt yn aml yn cyfeirio at fesurau o'r fath, mae'n rhyfedd nad yw pobl o'r fath wedi ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad hwn, naill ai i gefnogi neu i wrthwynebu arbed ynni.

Mae arbed ynni, effeithlonrwydd ynni, a defnyddio ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy, oll yn hanfodol yn y frwydr i leihau cynhesu byd-eang. Un agwedd gadarnhaol ar arbed ynni yw ei gwmpas i greu swyddi. Cynhyrchodd Plaid Cymru bapur yng nghanol y 1990au a alwodd am greu 10,000 o swyddi o fesurau byrdymor. Un mesur o'r fath oedd arbed ynni. Yr ydym yn falch o weld bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn mynd i'r afael â'r syniad hwn, ond nid yw ei chyflymdra wrth weithredu'r cynlluniau yn creu argraff dda iawn arnom. Dyrennir cyfran o arian Amcan 1 i brosiectau ynni ac amgylcheddol, ond mae'r gwariant yn ofnadwy o araf. Cyfeiriodd Elin Jones at ychydig o faterion yn hynny o beth. Ychwanegaf fod llai na 2 y cant o'r £28 miliwn a ddyrennir i seilwaith amgylcheddol wedi'i ymrwymo. Ar y gyfradd wario bresennol o ran arbed ynni cartref, bydd yn cymryd 103 o flynyddoedd i gyflawni'r targedau, yn hytrach na saith mlynedd. Yn ogystal â'r ffaith na ddefnyddiwyd yr arian hwnnw i wella arbed ynni, ni chafodd ei ddefnyddio i ddarparu swyddi ychwaith.

Alun Cairns: Diolchaf i Christine Gwyther am y ffordd y bu iddi gynnig yr adroddiad ac ymdrin â'r ymgynghoriad a thrafodaethau'r cyn-Bwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Cydnabyddaf ymdrechion y clerwr a'r dirprwy glerc, John Grimes a Siân Wilkins, a'r ymgynghorydd arbennig, yr Athro Jake Chapman.

Gwrthwynebaf ffermydd gwynt o ran egwyddor oherwydd eu hamhoblogrwydd, yr effaith negyddol a gânt ar dwristiaeth, a'r effaith a gânt ar ansawdd bywyd gymaint o bobl. Gwerthfawrogaf fod dyletswydd arnom

increase energy efficiency, and that it would, to a large extent, negate the need for unsightly windfarms that would have to be established to meet the Kyoto 2010 target.

To meet the obligations in the report, the Assembly Government must be as imaginative as possible. I will highlight the situation at Baglan energy park and Baglan Moors hospital. These are relatively new establishments, in close proximity to each other. A new generation gas-fired power station has been established at the Baglan energy park, which produces a large amount of low-grade waste heat. There is no reason—other than bureaucracy and regulations that could have been overcome—why Baglan Moors hospital cannot use the low-grade waste heat from the gas-fired power station. That would reduce national health service costs, as well as being a more efficient use of energy. That kind of initiative could be undertaken easily, if the will to do so existed in the right place.

4.40 p.m.

Brian Gibbons: What you said is sound in principle, but the problem at Baglan is that the hospital is too far away from the energy plant. The GE power plant hopes to supply heat and energy to companies locating to the energy park but, unfortunately, the hospital is too far away. More substantial infrastructure is needed to deliver that desirable objective.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful for Brian Gibbons's remarks. My understanding was that the hospital was not necessarily too far away, but that the private finance aspect of establishing the hospital caused some difficulties. It may well be a combination of both. However, the principle remains: a little imagination from the Government at the time—the energy lobby was not strong at that time either—could easily have resulted in a convenient, innovative, cheap and efficient use of energy that would have meant benefits all round. The climate change levy has been introduced, and the net tax gains that the Chancellor receives as a result could be used effectively to improve energy supply in the industrial market as well as the domestic

i gynyddu effeithlonrwydd ynni, ac y byddai, i raddau helaeth, yn negyddu'r angen am ffermydd gwynt hyll y byddai'n rhaid eu sefydlu er mwyn cyrraedd targed 2010 Kyoto.

Er mwyn bodloni'r rhwymedigaethau yn yr adroddiad, rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad fod mor ddychmygus â phosibl. Amlygaf y sefyllfa ym mharc ynni Baglan ac ysbyty Baglan Moors. Mae'r rhain yn sefydliadau cymharol newydd sy'n agos at ei gilydd. Sefydlwyd gorsaf bŵer nwy fodern ym mharc ynni Baglan, sy'n cynhyrchu llawer iawn o wres gwastraff o radd isel. Nid oes rheswm—heblaw biwrocratiaeth a rheoliadau y gellid bod wedi eu goresgyn—pam na all ysbyty Baglan Moors ddefnyddio gwres gwastraff gradd isel yr orsaf bŵer nwy. Byddai hynny yn lleihau costau'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, yn ogystal â bod yn ddefnydd mwy effeithlon o ynni. Gellid ymgymryd â'r cyfryw fenter yn hawdd, pe bai ewyllys i wneud hynny yn y lle cywir.

Brian Gibbons: Mae'r hyn a ddywedasochn yn gadarn o ran egwyddor, ond y broblem ym Maglan yw bod yr ysbyty yn rhy bell i ffwrdd o'r ffatri ynni. Mae'r ffatri bŵer GE yn gobeithio cyflenwi gwres ac ynni i gwmnïau sy'n ymgartrefu yn y parc ynni ond, yn anffodus, mae'r ysbyty yn rhy bell i ffwrdd. Mae angen seilwaith mwy sylweddol er mwyn cyflawni'r amcan dymunol hwnnw.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am sylwadau Brian Gibbons. Yn ôl fy nealltwriaeth i, nid y ffaith bod yr ysbyty o reidrwydd yn rhy bell i ffwrdd a achosodd rai anawsterau, ond yr agwedd cyllid preifat ar y broses o sefydlu'r ysbyty. Efallai mai cyfuniad o'r ddau beth ydyw. Fodd bynnag, erys yr egwyddor: gallai ychydig o ddychmyg gan Lywodraeth y dydd—nid oedd y lobi ynni yn gryf bryd hynny ychwaith—fod wedi arwain yn hawdd at ddefnydd cyfleus, arloesol, rhad ac effeithlon o ynni a fyddai wedi golygu buddiannau i bawb. Cyflwynwyd yr ardoll newid hinsawdd, a gellid defnyddio'r enillion treth net a dderbynia'r Canghellor yn sgîl hynny yn effeithlon i wella cyflenwad ynni yn y

market. The difficulty is that, because energy is relatively cheap at the moment, there is not a great incentive to do that. The Chancellor's tax has incentivised energy efficiency to an extent, but not in the way that I would have chosen.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae Alun Cairns yn dadlau y byddai defnydd effeithlon o ynni rhywsut yn nacáu'r angen am ynni adnewyddadwy. Mae'r ddau yn mynd law yn llaw. Fe'm synnir yn aml bod pobl yn beirniadu cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy drwy ddulliau megis ffermydd gwynt a defnyddio pŵer tonnau'r môr. Eu dadl yw na ellir creu digon o ynni drwy ddulliau adnewyddadwy i ddiwallu'n gofynion presennol. Y gwir yw na allwn gynnal y galw hwnnw. Rhaid inni dorri yn sylweddol ar ein defnydd o ynni. Dyna pam mae'r adroddiad mor bwysig. Mae hefyd yr un mor bwysig inni gael ymateb cadarnhaol, ymarferol a gweithredol i'r adroddiad hwn gan Lywodraeth Cymru.

Gwnaed y pwynt eisoes fod yn rhaid i'r Llywodraeth wneud dau beth. Mae'n rhaid iddi ddefnyddio ei phwerau presennol yn llawn. Wedi dweud hynny, y gwir plaen yw nad yw ein pwerau presennol yn ddigonol i fynd i'r afael â defnyddio ynni'n effeithiol. Galwaf arnoch, Weinidog, i wneud datganiad clir y ceisiwch bwerau ychwanegol. Gwyddoch fod eu hangen i ymateb yn llawn i'r adroddiad hwn ac i'r angen yng Nghymru i ddefnyddio ynni yn effeithiol. Dyna fydd yr arwydd bod y Llywodraeth o ddifrif ynghylch y mater hwn.

O ran ein gallu presennol i ymateb i'r sefyllfa, rhannaf siom Elin Jones nad ydym wedi defnyddio arian Amcan 1 i'w lawn botensial i hyrwyddo mentrau ynni effeithlon. Hoffwn glywed esboniad y Gweinidog pam nad yw hyn wedi digwydd. Os yw'r Llywodraeth yn sylweddoli bod angen defnyddio ynni yn effeithlon, pam nad yw'r ffynhonnell amlwg hon o arian wedi'i defnyddio? Cyfeiriodd Janet Davies at y posibiliad o greu swyddi cynaliadwy drwy ddefnyddio effeithlon o ynni. Fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog, cyhoeddwyd adroddiad yn ddiweddar sy'n nodi bod nifer y swyddi a grëwyd, ac sy'n debygol o gael eu creu o dan

farchnad ddiwydiannol yn ogystal â'r farchnad gartref. Yr anhawster yw, gan fod ynni yn weddol rhad ar hyn o bryd, nid oes cymhelliant mawr i wneud hynny. Mae treth y Canghellor wedi rhoi rhywfaint o gymhelliant i effeithlonrwydd ynni, ond nid yn y ffordd y byddwn wedi'i dewis.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Alun Cairns argues that the efficient use of energy would somehow obviate the need for renewable energy. The two go hand in hand. I am frequently surprised that people criticise the production of renewable energy through methods such as windfarms and using wave power. Their argument is that not enough energy can be generated by renewable means to satisfy our present requirements. The truth is that we cannot sustain that demand. We must reduce our energy consumption significantly. That is why the report is so important. It is equally important that we receive a positive, practical and active response to this report from the Government of Wales.

The point has already been made that the Government must do two things. It must make full use of its present powers. That said, the plain truth is that our current powers are not sufficient to tackle the issue of using energy efficiently. I call upon you, Minister, to make a clear statement that you will seek additional powers. You know that they are needed to respond fully to this report and to the need in Wales to use energy efficiently. That will be the signal that the Government takes this matter seriously.

In terms of our current ability to respond to the situation, I share Elin Jones's disappointment that we have not used Objective 1 funding to its full potential to promote energy-efficient enterprises. I would like to hear the Minister's explanation as to why that has not happened. If the Government recognises the need for energy efficiency, why has that obvious source of funding not been used? Janet Davies referred to the possibility of creating sustainable jobs through energy efficiency. As the Minister knows, a recently published report notes that the number of jobs that have been created and are likely to be created under Objective 1 is

Amcan 1, yn siomedig—llawer yn is na thargedau'r Llywodraeth. Dyma gyfle nid yn unig i sicrhau defnydd effeithlon o ynni, ond i greu swyddi gwirioneddol gynaliadwy yng Nghymru. Pam nad yw'r Gweinidog wedi manteisio ar hynny?

Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch, Weinidog, â chyngor ac awdurdodau'r parciau cenedlaethol i weld sut y gellir cyflwyno dulliau effeithlon o ddefnyddio ynni o fewn y parciau? Gwyddoch i'r parciau gynnal nifer o gynlluniau peilot sydd yn defnyddio paneli solar. A ydych wedi ystyried y posibiladau o ehangu'r cynlluniau hynny yn y parciau cenedlaethol a ledled Cymru? A yw'r Llywodraeth yn barod nid yn unig i fentro i hyrwyddo a chynnig abwyd i bobl ddefnyddio paneli solar, ond i ystyried cynnwys hynny yn y canllawiau cynllunio? Byddai hynny'n golygu bod gan bob cartref a adeiladwyd yng Nghymru ddull effeithlon o ddefnyddio ynni a fyddai hefyd yn adnewyddadwy.

Cafwyd llawer o feirniadaeth gan un garfan yn y Siambr ar adeilad newydd y Cynulliad. Fel yr awgryma'r adroddiad hwn, os y gallwn fodloni'r safonau uchaf yn yr adeilad newydd, o ran y math o ynni a ddefnyddir, a defnydd effeithlon o ynni, bydd hynny'n cynnig arweiniad i Gymru. Yna, gallai pobl Cymru nid yn unig ymhyfrydu yn yr adeilad, ond hefyd ei weld yn arwydd o'r ffordd ymlaen o ran sicrhau ein bod yn creu ynni yn adnewyddadwy ac yn ei ddefnyddio'n effeithlon.

The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies): I will respond on behalf of the Cabinet with a formal statement in due course, as is the practice. However, I take this opportunity to thank Christine Gwyther and the members of the former Economic Development Committee, as well as the clerk and deputy clerk, and the special advisers and the advisory group.

It may be appropriate on this occasion to pay particular tribute to the late Phil Williams's contribution, and to echo Christine's words in that regard. I remember Phil saying on this report, and on the sister report on renewable energy, as well as in relation to broadband,

disappointing—far below the Government's targets. Here is an opportunity not only to ensure efficient use of energy, but to create truly sustainable jobs in Wales. Why has the Minister not taken advantage of that opportunity?

What discussions have you had, Minister, with the national parks council and authorities to ascertain how energy efficient measures can be introduced in national parks? You will be aware that the parks conducted several pilot schemes using solar panels. Have you considered the possibilities of extending those schemes in the national parks and throughout Wales? Is the Government ready not only to venture to promote and give incentives to people to use solar panels, but to consider including that in the planning regulations? That would mean that all homes built in Wales would have a means of using energy efficiently that was also sustainable.

There has been much criticism from one group in the Chamber on the new Assembly building. As this report suggests, if we can meet the highest standards in the new building, in terms of the type of energy used, and efficient energy use, that would provide a lead to Wales. The people of Wales would then not only be able to be proud of the building, but could also see it as a sign of the way forward in terms of ensuring that we create energy by renewable means and use it efficiently.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies): Ymatebaf ar ran y Cabinet gyda datganiad ffurfiol maes o law, yn unol â'r arfer. Fodd bynnag, cymeraf y cyfle hwn i ddiolch i Christine Gwyther ac aelodau'r cyn-Bwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, yn ogystal â'r clerc a'r dirprwy glerc, a'r ymgynghorwyr arbennig a'r grŵp ymgynghorol.

Efallai ei bod yn briodol ar yr achlysur hwn i dalu teyrnged arbennig i gyfraniad y diweddar Phil Williams, ac i adleisio geiriau Christine yn hynny o beth. Cofiaf Phil yn dweud am yr adroddiad hwn, a'r chwaer-adroddiad ar ynni adnewyddadwy, yn ogystal

that he felt that he could leave the Assembly a happy man, because some of his major priorities and enthusiasms had been recognised by the Committee and by the Assembly Government.

I welcome the Committee's contribution to this work. As I said, I will give a full and considered response in due course, and I am sure that the Committee and Assembly Members will be pleased with that response.

Christine Gwyther: Several Members mentioned the need to reduce energy costs. One issue that arose clearly in our deliberations was that, when we consider additional incentives and financial support to encourage householders to improve the insulation of their properties, we should also consider those householders that are above the income threshold of those who would normally receive financial incentives. Therefore, that would not just include those in receipt of what we call 'passport benefits', but those who are mainly in the middle income bracket. That is an important piece of work that must be carried out by the Welsh Assembly Government, probably in conjunction with the UK Government, as it has national ramifications.

Everybody agreed that we must reduce energy costs, and the use of energy. This was the Committee's second report. I should explain why we considered renewable energy first and energy efficiency second: we felt that it was important to contribute to the debate that was happening in relation to planning and renewable energy at that time. It is particularly relevant that Members have said today that we need to have TAN 8 as soon as possible. It is appropriate that that has been mentioned, and I am sure that the Minister will have heard those comments. That is why we considered renewable energy first, and energy efficiency second.

The hierarchy of sustainable development and waste management, including waste produced from energy, is reduce, reuse, and recycle. Energy efficiency is at the top of that hierarchy. Many Members also mentioned

â mewn perthynas â band eang, ei fod yn teimlo y gallai adael y Cynulliad yn ddyn hapus, gan fod rhai o'i brif flaenoriaethau a'i ddi-ddordebau wedi'u cydnabod gan y Pwyllgor a chan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Croesawaf gyfraniad y Pwyllgor i'r gwaith hwn. Ac fel y dywedais, rhoddaf ymateb llawn ac ystyriol maes o law, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Aelodau'r Pwyllgor a'r Cynulliad yn falch gyda'r ymateb hwnnw.

Christine Gwyther: Crybwyllodd sawl Aelod yr angen i leihau costau ynni. Un mater a gododd yn glir yn ein trafodaethau, wrth ystyried cymhellion ychwanegol a chymorth ariannol i annog deiliaid tai i wella sut y mae eu heiddo wedi ei insiwleiddio, oedd y dylem hefyd ystyried y deiliaid tai hynny sydd uwchlaw trothwy incwm y bobl hynny a fyddai fel arfer yn derbyn cymhellion ariannol. Felly, byddai hynny'n cynnwys nid yn unig y bobl hynny sy'n derbyn yr hyn a alwn yn 'fudd-daliadau pasport', ond y bobl hynny sy'n bennaf yn perthyn i'r grŵp cyflog canol hefyd. Mae hyn yn waith pwysig y mae'n rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ymgymryd ag ef, fwy na thebyg mewn cydweithrediad â Llywodraeth y DU, am fod ganddo oblygiadau cenedlaethol.

Cytunodd pawb fod yn rhaid inni leihau costau ynni, a'r defnydd o ynni. Dyma oedd ail adroddiad y Pwyllgor. Dylwn egluro pam y bu inni ystyried ynni adnewyddadwy yn gyntaf ac effeithlonrwydd ynni yn ail: yr oeddem yn teimlo ei bod yn bwysig cyfrannu at y ddadl a oedd yn digwydd mewn perthynas â chynllunio ac ynni adnewyddadwy bryd hynny. Mae'n arbennig o berthnasol bod Aelodau wedi dweud heddiw bod angen inni gael TAN 8 cyn gynted â phosibl. Mae'n briodol bod hyn wedi'i grybwyll, ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog wedi clywed y sylwadau hynny. Dyna pam y bu inni ystyried ynni adnewyddadwy yn gyntaf, ac effeithlonrwydd ynni yn ail.

Hierarchaeth datblygu cynaliadwy a rheoli gwastraff, gan gynnwys gwastraff a gynhyrchir gan ynni, yw lleihau, aildefnyddio ac ailgylchu. Mae effeithlonrwydd ynni ar ben yr hierarchaeth

Objective 1 and its poor performance on various clean energy measures. We are in the middle of the mid-term review and now is the time to raise such concerns. I hope that the Government will take those points on board.

Many Members, Lisa in particular, mentioned training, particularly with regard to ELWa and what she considers to be its lack of emphasis on vocational training.

4.50 p.m.

Jane Davidson: Hardly.

Christine Gwyther: The Minister is listening, and does not agree with you. However, it is my duty to report what Members have said in the debate.

Jenny spoke about practical steps, such as combined heat and power, and the use of biomass in relation to the new Assembly building. That is wonderful and laudable and I hope that it happens. I am also interested in energy-neutral air conditioning. I have seen it in operation in other buildings and it provides a comfortable atmosphere in which to work. It is also undoubtedly cheaper and wastes less energy than conventional air conditioning. I am sure that we can roll that out to all our public buildings in Wales.

Alun spoke about windfarms and the polarised debate and attempted to reopen the issue. That underlines our obligation to energy efficiency. I am sure that he is right that there should be more imaginative and lateral thinking with regard to the Baglan Moors hospital, and I am sure that the Government listened to his suggestions.

Rhodri Glyn underlined the need for renewable energy alongside energy efficiency. We cannot divorce the two. Energy efficiency is clearly at the top of the hierarchy. However, renewable energy is also important. I thank everyone for their contributions.

honno. Crybwyllodd nifer o Aelodau Amcan 1 a'i berfformiad gwael o ran mesurau ynni glân amrywiol. Yr ydym ar ganol yr adolygiad canol tymor a dyma'r amser i godi pryderon o'r fath. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ymdrin â'r pwyntiau hynny.

Crybwyllodd llawer o Aelodau, Lisa yn arbennig, hyfforddiant, yn arbennig o ran ELWa a'r hyn a ystyria yn ddiffyg pwyslais ar hyfforddiant galwedigaethol.

Jane Davidson: Go brin.

Christine Gwyther: Mae'r Gweinidog yn gwrando, ac nid yw'n cytuno â chi. Fodd bynnag, fy nyletswydd i yw cyflwyno adroddiad ar yr hyn a ddywedodd Aelodau yn y ddadl.

Siaradodd Jenny am gamau ymarferol, fel cyfuno gwres a phŵer, a defnyddio bio-màs mewn perthynas ag adeilad newydd y Cynulliad. Mae hynny'n wych ac yn ganmoladwy a gobeithiaf y bydd yn digwydd. Mae gennyf ddiddordeb hefyd mewn system aerdymheru ynni-niwtral. Yr wyf wedi'i gweld ar waith mewn adeiladau eraill ac mae'n darparu awyrgylch cyfforddus i weithio ynddo. Yn ddiamau, mae hefyd yn rhatach ac yn gwastraffu llai o ynni na system aerdymheru gonfensiynol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn gyflwyno hynny ym mhob un o'n hadeiladau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Siaradodd Alun am ffermydd gwynt a'r ddadl sydd wedi'i phegynnu a cheisiodd ailgodi'r mater. Mae hynny'n tanlinellu ein rhwymedigaeth i effeithlonrwydd ynni. Yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn gywir y dylid meddwl yn fwy dychmygus ac ochrol mewn perthynas ag ysbyty Baglan Moors, ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Llywodraeth wedi gwrando ar ei awgrymiadau.

Pwysleisiodd Rhodri Glyn yr angen am ynni adnewyddadwy ochr yn ochr ag effeithlonrwydd ynni. Ni allwn wahanu'r ddau. Mae effeithlonrwydd ynni yn amlwg ar ben yr hierarchaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae ynni adnewyddadwy hefyd yn bwysig. Diolchaf i bawb am eu cyfraniadau.

*Cynnig (NDM1562): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1562): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Methiant y Llywodraeth i Sicrhau Addysg o Safon Uchel i Ddysgwyr cyn ac ar ôl 16 Oed The Government's Failure to Deliver a High Standard of Education for pre and post-16 Learners

David Davies: Peter Black, Helen Mary Jones, Jeff Cuthbert and Mark Isherwood have indicated that they wish to contribute to this short debate. I hope that there will be sufficient time for them to do so.

The Labour Party has made much of its 'education, education, education' slogan. We have heard little else in its recent election campaigns. It led us to believe that its policies would lead to more money for education, more teachers, better schools and higher teaching standards. However, the reality is that schools are being closed down, the gap between the best and worst state schools is widening and it is impossible to ascertain how much, if any, additional money is going into education because of the huge increase in fixed costs—the costs involved in addressing pension deficits, meeting increased national insurance contributions and implementing the teachers' workload agreement to name but a few. The Government does not seem to know what these additional costs are. I asked the Minister about them in this morning's meeting of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee and she told me that she has no idea how much more money teachers and others in the education sector are paying in national insurance contributions.

One thing is certain: teachers are being made redundant as a result of a lack of money. Yesterday, the Minister triumphantly told us that she had spoken to Monmouthshire County Council and had been told that there would be no compulsory redundancies in the county. She then refused to respond to an intervention on the matter. She refused to do so because she knew perfectly well that the Conservatives' amendment referred to job losses, and that Monmouthshire County Council had told me that those losses would be met largely by voluntary redundancies and by not replacing teachers who retire. The effect is identical: there will be fewer

David Davies: Nododd Peter Black, Helen Mary Jones, Jeff Cuthbert a Mark Isherwood eu bod am gyfrannu i'r ddadl fer hon. Gobeithiaf y bydd digon o amser iddynt wneud hynny.

Bu i'r Blaid Lafur frolio ei slogan, 'addysg, addysg, addysg'. Ni chlywsom ddim byd arall bron yn ei hymgyrchoedd diweddar mewn etholiadau. Fe'n harweiniodd i gredu y byddai ei pholisïau yn arwain at fwy o arian i addysg, mwy o athrawon, gwell ysgolion a safonau addysgu uwch. Fodd bynnag, y gwir yw bod ysgolion yn cau, bod y bwlc rhwng ysgolion gorau ac ysgolion gwaethaf y wladwriaeth yn mynd yn fwy a'i bod yn amhosibl canfod faint o arian ychwanegol, os o gwbl, sy'n cael ei ddarparu ar gyfer addysg oherwydd y cynnydd enfawr mewn costau sefydlog—y costau sy'n gysylltiedig â mynd i'r afael â diffygion pensiwn, talu cyfraniadau yswiriant gwladol cynyddol a gweithredu cytundeb baich gwaith yr athrawon i enwi ond ychydig. Ymddengys nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn gwybod faint yw'r costau ychwanegol hyn. Holais y Gweinidog yn eu cylch yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes y bore yma a dywedodd wrthyf nad oedd unrhyw syniad ganddi faint yn fwy o arian y mae athrawon ac eraill yn y sector addysg yn ei dalu mewn cyfraniadau yswiriant gwladol.

Un peth sy'n sicr: mae athrawon yn colli eu swyddi o ganlyniad i ddiffyg arian. Ddoe, dywedodd y Gweinidog wrthym yn orfoleddus ei bod wedi siarad â Chyngor Sir Fynwy a oedd wedi dweud wrthi na fyddai unrhyw athrawon yn colli eu swyddi'n orfodol yn y sir. Yna gwrthododd ymateb i ymyriad ar y mater am ei bod yn gwybod yn iawn bod gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr yn cyfeirio at golli swyddi, a bod Cyngor Sir Fynwy wedi dweud wrthyf y byddai'r swyddi hynny yn cael eu colli yn bennaf drwy ddiswyddiadau gwirfoddol a thrwy beidio â phenodi athrawon newydd yn lle athrawon sy'n ymddeol. Yr un yw'r effaith: bydd llai o

teachers because the money is not there to pay their salaries.

Funding is not the only problem. The head of the National Association of Schoolmasters and Union of Women Teachers in Monmouthshire recently came to see me to tell me that some teachers spend 80 per cent of their time trying to maintain order in the classroom, while the able pupils are left to fend for themselves—a particular though not exclusive problem for schools in deprived areas. All too often, the brightest children in the most deprived areas do not reach their full potential. There, in a nutshell, is the reality behind the depressing statistical fact of the gap between the best and the worst state schools.

The situation gets no better as pupils get older and leave schools. The well-documented mismanagement of ELWa has led to cuts in funding for genuine training providers, who have lost out because of headline-grabbing initiatives such as the non-existent £4 million interactive pop cafe, which allowed the establishment to rub shoulders and indulge in gratuitous press opportunities with pop stars. Less well-documented but equally important, if not more so, is ELWa's refusal to devise the training programmes that employers are crying out for. During the last month, two key players have told me separately that ELWa's attitude to them was 'we are not here to train your workforce'—a shocking attitude while we need to be creating jobs in the manufacturing sector.

What causes me the greatest concern is the cavalier attitude displayed towards the most vulnerable section of the learning population: those under the age of 10. Across Wales, we are witnessing the destruction of small schools, which are being replaced by educational behemoths, often located far from the communities that they are meant to serve. In Monmouthshire, the proposed closure of the schools at Llanover, Llanellen

athrawon am nad oes arian ar gael i dalu eu cyflogau.

Nid arian yw'r unig broblem. Daeth pennaeth Cymdeithas Genedlaethol yr Ysgolfeistri ac Undeb yr Athrawesau yn sir Fynwy i'm gweld yn ddiweddar er mwyn dweud wrthyf fod rhai athrawon yn treulio 80 y cant o'u hamser yn ceisio cadw trefn yn yr ystafell ddosbarth, tra bod y disgyblion galluog yn cael eu gadael i ymdopi ar eu pennau eu hunain—problem arbennig ond nid unigryw i ysgolion mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig. Yn amlach na pheidio, nid yw'r plant mwyaf disglair yn yr ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig yn cyflawni eu potensial llawn. Dyna'r gwirionedd, yn gryno, sy'n sail i'r ffaith ystadegol ddigalon bod bwlech rhwng ysgolion gorau ac ysgolion gwaethaf y wladwriaeth.

Nid yw'r sefyllfa yn gwella o gwbl wrth i ddisgyblion fynd yn hŷn a gadael yr ysgol. Yn sgîl camreolaeth ELWa, y rhoddyd llawer o sylw iddi, cwtogwyd ar yr arian i ddarparwyr hyfforddiant dilys, sydd ar eu colled oherwydd y mentrau sy'n denu sylw'r cyfryngau megis y caffi pop rhyngweithiol gwerth £4 miliwn nad yw'n bodoli, a fu'n fodd i'r sefydliad gymysgu gyda sêr y byd pop ac ymhyfrydu mewn cyfleoedd i gael eu lluniau wedi'u tynnu a hynny'n gwbl ddi-awl amdano. Yr hyn na fu cymaint o sôn amdano ond sydd yr un mor bwysig, os nad yn bwysicach, yw penderfyniad ELWa i wrthod llunio rhaglenni hyfforddiant y mae galw mawr amdanynt ymhlith cyflogwyr. Yn ystod y mis diwethaf, dywedodd dau unigolyn allweddol wrthyf ar ddau achlysur gwahanol mai 'nid ein gwaith ni yw hyfforddi'ch gweithlu' oedd agwedd ELWa tuag atynt—agwedd echrydus pan fo angen inni fod yn creu swyddi yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu.

Y pryder mwyaf i mi yw'r agwedd ddi-hid tuag at y dysgwyr mwyaf diamddiffyn: y rhai o dan 10 oed. Ledled Cymru, gwelwn ysgolion bach yn cael eu dinistrio a'u disodli gan sefydliadau anferthol, sy'n aml wedi'u lleoli ymhell o'r cymunedau y dylent eu gwasanaethu. Yn sir Fynwy, mae'r bwriad i gau'r ysgolion yn Llanover, Llanellen a Llanffwyst yn golygu y bydd ysgol gynradd fawr i fabanod a phlant iau yng Ngofilon, nad

and Llanfoist will mean a large, all-through primary school at Govilon, which makes no sense because that school is the furthest away in a line from north to south and has fewer pupils than the school at Llanfoist has. Many believe that this highly illogical decision may have been taken because of the connections that some council members had with the school that is set to benefit. I do not wish to explore that, Minister, but, before you take your decision, you should satisfy yourself that you are aware of the circumstances and the potential for conflicts of interest.

In Monmouth, two junior and two infant schools that function perfectly satisfactorily face amalgamation. I live a few hundred yards away from two of the four schools affected: Osbaston junior and Osbaston infants schools. I recently attended a meeting between the governors and the education officials, who said that the primary reason for amalgamating the two schools was that it would lead to a seamless transfer of pupils from one school to the other. They are situated at opposite ends of a playing field. If that amalgamation goes ahead, they will continue to be situated at opposite ends of a playing field. If there were a problem with the current procedures for familiarising pupils from the infant school with the junior school, I would understand that reasoning, although I would expect officials to consider alternatives, such as changing the procedure. However, it became clear after a few perfunctory questions that the officials were not interested in alternatives to amalgamation. Whatever solutions parents suggested to the problem were not good enough, because they had made up their minds.

Perhaps most astounding of all is the situation in Abergavenny. The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning must shortly decide on the closure of Park Street and Croesonen junior schools in the town. Those schools are in the middle of a well-populated area. They are two of the most successful schools of their kind in the county, if not in south Wales. They have received outstanding reports from Estyn; no-one denies that. However, the council now seeks

yw'n gwneud unrhyw synnwyr gan mai'r ysgol honno yw'r ysgol bellaf mewn cyfres o ysgolion o'r gogledd i'r de ac mae llai o ddisgyblion ynnddi nag yn yr ysgol yn Llanffwyst. Cred llawer i'r penderfyniad hynod afresymegol hwn gael ei wneud o bosibl oherwydd y cysylltiadau rhwng rhai aelodau'r cyngor a'r ysgol a fydd yn elwa ar y penderfyniad. Nid wyf am fynd ar drywydd hynny, Weinidog, ond cyn ichi wneud eich penderfyniad, dylech fodloni eich hun eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r amgylchiadau a'r posibilïadau o wrthdaro buddiannau.

Yn Nhrefynwy, mae dwy ysgol iau a dwy ysgol fabanod sy'n gweithredu'n gwbl foddhaol yn wynebu'r posibilrwydd o uno. Yr wyf yn byw ychydig gannoedd o lathenni o ddwy o'r pedair ysgol yr effeithir arnynt: ysgol iau ac ysgol fabanod Tre-osbon. Mynychais gyfarfod yn ddiweddar rhwng y llywodraethwyr a'r swyddogion addysg, a ddywedodd mai'r prif reswm dros uno'r ddwy ysgol oedd y byddai'n arwain at drosglwyddo disgyblion yn ddi-dor o'r naill ysgol i'r llall. Maent wedi'u lleoli gyferbyn â'i gilydd ar y naill ben a'r llall o faes chwarae. Os cânt eu huno felly, byddant yn parhau i fod ar y naill ben a'r llall o faes chwarae. Pe bai problem gyda'r gweithdrefnau presennol ar gyfer gwneud disgyblion yr ysgol fabanod yn gyfarwydd â'r ysgol iau, byddwn yn deall y rhesymu hwnnw, ond byddwn yn disgwyl i'r swyddogion ystyried trefniadau amgen, megis newid y weithdrefn. Fodd bynnag, daeth yn amlwg ar ôl ychydig o gwestiynau cyflym nad oedd gan y swyddogion ddi-ddordeb mewn unrhyw ddewisiadau amgen i uno'r ysgolion. Nid oedd unrhyw atebion i'r broblem a awgrymwyd gan y rhieni yn ddigon da, am eu bod wedi gwneud eu penderfyniad.

Efallai mai'r peth mwyaf syfrdanol yw'r sefyllfa yn y Fenni. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes benderfynu cyn bo hir ar gau ysgol iau Park Street ac ysgol iau Croesonen yn y dref. Mae'r ysgolion hynny yng nghanol ardal boblog iawn. Mae'r rhain yn ddwy o'r ysgolion mwyaf llwyddiannus o'u bath yn y sir, os nad y De. Cawsant adroddiadau gwych gan Estyn; nid oes neb yn gwadu hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cyngor bellach yn gofyn am eich

your support, Minister, in closing those schools and demanding that parents send their children to the other side of town instead, to a large all-through primary school that has yet to be built.

These schools have the overwhelming support of the parents, teachers and governors in the catchment area. The governors of Park Street school have met the diocesan representative of the Church in Wales and have its support for an application to seek voluntary-aided status, yet they have been told that that will make no difference to the closure application. Section 2.2 of the school organisation proposals circular 23/02 clearly states that a demand for places in church schools should be a material consideration when determining a closure order. Furthermore, the document goes on to say that the concerns of the diocese should be taken into consideration, yet I am told that at no time during the consultation was a diocesan officer consulted.

5.00 p.m.

This is not the time or place for a legal argument, Minister. However, you can be certain of one thing: if you uphold the closure notices against Park Street and Croesonen schools, we will not give up the fight. Even as I speak, legal advice is being sought with a view to taking the matter to the High Court.

There is no reason why the situation should come to that. We should be proud that parents are so supportive of their local schools, and we should remember that we were elected to serve those parents, not to impose our views upon them. In the four years during which I have been an Assembly Member, nothing has moved me so much as the parents' determination to fight a David-and-Goliath-style battle against the council and the Assembly, with the odds stacked against them, in order to protect the education standards of their children and all other children in their community.

To many, it seems that the council has taken the decision that large, all-through primary schools are better than junior and infant schools, and that nothing will stop it from

cefnogaeth, Weinidog, i gau'r ysgolion hynny a mynnu bod rhieni yn anfon eu plant yr ochr arall i'r dref yn lle hynny, i ysgol gynradd fawr i fabanod a phlant iau nad yw wedi ei hadeiladu eto.

Cefnogir yr ysgolion hyn gan y mwyafrif llethol o rieni, athrawon a llywodraethwyr yn y dalgylch. Cyfarfu llywodraethwyr ysgol Park Street â chynrychiolydd esgobaethol yr Eglwys yng Nghymru a chawsant gefnogaeth yr eglwys i wneud cais am statws ysgol a gynorthwyr yn wirfoddol, ond dywedwyd wrthynt na fydd hynny'n gwneud unrhyw wahaniaeth i'r cais i gau'r ysgol. Noda adran 2.2 cylchlythyr 23/02 ar gynigion trefniadaeth ysgolion yn glir y dylai'r galw am leoedd mewn ysgolion eglwysig fod yn ystyriaeth berthnasol wrth benderfynu ar orchymyn cau. At hynny, noda'r ddogfen hefyd y dylid ystyried pryderon yr esgobaeth, ond eto dywedir wrthyf nad ymgynghorwyd â'r swyddog esgobaethol o gwbl yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad.

Ni fyddai dadl gyfreithiol yn briodol yma, Weinidog. Fodd bynnag, gallwch fod yn sicr o un peth: os cadarnhewch yr hysbysiadau cau yn erbyn ysgol Park Street ac ysgol Croesonen, byddwn yn parhau i ymladd. Wrth imi eich annerch y prynhawn yma, ceisir cyngor cyfreithiol gyda'r bwriad o fynd â'r mater gerbron yr Uchel Lys.

Nid oes rheswm pam y dylai'r sefyllfa fynd i'r pen. Dylem ymfalchïo yn y ffaith bod rhieni mor gefnogol o'u hysgolion lleol, a dylem gofio inni gael ein hethol i wasanaethu'r rhieni hynny, nid gorfodi ein barn arnynt. Yn y pedair blynedd y bûm yn Aelod Cynulliad, nid oes dim wedi ennyn mwy o gydymdeimlad ynof na phenderfyniad y rhieni i ymladd brwydr megis Dafydd a Goliath yn erbyn y cyngor a'r Cynulliad, er mai go anobeithiol yw eu sefyllfa, er mwyn diogelu safonau addysg eu plant a'r holl blant eraill yn eu cymuned.

I lawer, ymddengys fod y cyngor wedi gwneud y penderfyniad bod ysgolion cynradd mawr i fabanod a phlant iau yn well nag ysgolion iau ac ysgolion babanod ar eu

proceeding with the closures. The council does not seem to see school closures and amalgamations as a means to an end; it sees them as an end in themselves. These plans are not about delivering a higher standard of education because, as demonstrated by the Estyn reports, all of these schools are already delivering a high standard of education. Other schools that are not delivering as high a standard of education are not being subjected to any of these measures.

You are the only person who can stop this travesty, Minister, because you must sign the Orders that will allow these closures and amalgamations to go ahead. If you do so, you will undoubtedly be responsible for the failure to provide a decent standard of education for pre-16 schoolchildren. However, if you take the courageous decision to stand by parents and pupils, and put their wishes above the wishes of the bureaucrats in the local education authority and the council cabinet—not in the council, as the majority of Monmouthshire County Council members have voted against these proposals—you would earn the respect not only of the parents and children but of fellow Assembly Members. You must choose wisely, Minister, as the future of thousands of children depends on your decision.

Peter Black: Although the title of the short debate was general, David has concentrated on Monmouthshire. I will not discuss Monmouthshire; I will discuss educational issues relating to the title of the short debate. Much good work was undertaken by the previous partnership Government, particularly in terms of class sizes at key stages 1 and 2. It is important that we retain the target set by the partnership Government of reducing primary school class sizes to 25 or less. We should also extend the target to reduce class sizes at comprehensive level to 25 or less.

The issue that is exercising most minds in education in Wales at present is that of the national agreement on teachers' workload, which David mentioned. The issue was also raised at this morning's meeting of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee.

pennau eu hunain, ac ni fydd dim yn ei atal rhag bwrw ymlaen â'i benderfyniad i gau'r ysgolion. Ymddengys nad yw'r cyngor yn ystyried cau ac uno ysgolion yn fodd i ateb diben; i'r cyngor mae'n ddiben ynddo'i hun. Nid oes a wnelo'r cynlluniau hyn â darparu addysg o safon uwch gan fod pob un o'r ysgolion hyn eisoes yn darparu addysg o safon uchel, fel y dengys adroddiadau Estyn. Nid yw ysgolion eraill nad ydynt yn darparu addysg cystal yn wynebu unrhyw un o'r mesurau hyn.

Chi yw'r unig un a all atal hyn, Weinidog, gan mai chi sy'n gorfod llofnodi'r Gorchmynion a fydd yn caniatáu i'r cyngor gau ac uno'r ysgolion hyn yn y fath fodd. Os gwnewch hynny, byddwch yn ddi-os yn gyfrifol am y methiant i ddarparu addysg o safon i blant ysgol cyn-16. Fodd bynnag, os gwnewch y penderfyniad dewr i gefnogi'r rhieni a'r disgyblion, a rhoi mwy o bwys ar eu dymuniadau hwy nag ar ddyuniadau'r biwrocratiaid yn yr awdurdod addysg lleol a chabinet y cyngor—nid yn y cyngor, gan fod y mwyafrif o aelodau Cyngor Sir Fynwy wedi pleidleisio yn erbyn y cynigion hyn—byddech nid yn unig yn ennyn parch y rhieni a'r plant ond eich cyd-Aelodau yn y Cynulliad. Rhaid ichi ddewis yn ddoeth, Weinidog, gan fod dyfodol miloedd o blant yn dibynnu ar eich penderfyniad chi.

Peter Black: Er bod teitl y ddadl fer yn gyffredinol, mae David wedi canolbwyntio ar sir Fynwy. Ni thrafodaf sir Fynwy; trafodaf faterion addysgol sy'n ymwneud â theitl y ddadl fer. Gwnaed llawer o waith da gan y gyn-Lywodraeth bartneriaeth, yn enwedig o ran maint dosbarthiadau yng nghyfnodau allweddol 1 a 2. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cadw'r targed a osodwyd gan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth sef lleihau maint dosbarthiadau mewn ysgolion cynradd i 25 o blant neu lai. Dylem hefyd ymestyn y targed i leihau maint dosbarthiadau mewn ysgolion cyfun i 25 neu lai.

Yr hyn y mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl ym maes addysg yng Nghymru yn ymboeni yn ei gylch ar hyn o bryd yw'r cytundeb cenedlaethol ar faich gwaith athrawon, y cyfeiriodd David ato. Codwyd y mater hefyd yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes y bore

It is important that that initiative is properly funded. I regret the fact that the Finance Minister is not present in the Chamber because, in order to implement the workload agreement, we must make the case for funding to be available to all schools. Otherwise, schools will have to make cuts in other aspects of education in order to fund it.

Jeff Cuthbert: David will not be surprised to hear that I do not support his short debate. I will talk briefly of the Government's record on post-16 education and training. It is worth reminding Members that over 10,000 people are undertaking modern apprenticeships and that 25,000 young people are involved in general work-based learning. Furthermore, over 5,000 adults are involved in work-based learning, including 900 starts on the new modern skills diploma. We have met and exceeded our targets. No-one is suggesting that everything is rosy. There are problems with the provision and delivery of work-based learning, but those problems must not be exaggerated. They have been identified and will be resolved. In terms of adult education, 42 per cent of adults in Wales are current or recent learners, compared with 39 per cent in England. Also, we have launched the Welsh baccalaureate. Admittedly, the pilot scheme is only about to begin, and I am sure that there will be problems which must be ironed out. That is the purpose of having a pilot scheme. However, I am confident that the Welsh baccalaureate will, in due course, prove to be a valuable and relevant choice for many older school students. Therefore, it is untrue to claim, as David does—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You should only be making a short speech of about a minute. You have already spoken for a minute and 15 seconds. Please wind up.

Jeff Cuthbert: This is my last sentence. It is untrue to claim that our programme is failing learners. The evidence shows that the opposite is true.

Mark Isherwood: I was hoping that information from my office would have

yma. Mae'n bwysig bod y fenter honno yn cael ei hariannu'n briodol. Gresynaf at y ffaith nad yw'r Gweinidog Cyllid yn bresennol yn y Siambr oherwydd, er mwyn gweithredu'r cytundeb baich gwaith, rhaid inni gyflwyno'r ddadl dros sicrhau bod arian ar gael i bob ysgol. Fel arall, bydd yn rhaid i ysgolion wneud toriadau ar agweddau eraill ar addysg er mwyn ei ariannu.

Jeff Cuthbert: Ni fydd David yn synnu i glywed na chefnogaf ei ddadl fer. Soniaf yn fyr am record y Llywodraeth ar addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16. Mae'n werth atgoffa'r Aelodau bod dros 10,000 o bobl mewn prentisiaethau modern a bod 25,000 o bobl ifanc yn ymgymryd â dysgu cyffredinol yn seiliedig ar waith. At hynny, mae dros 5,000 o oedolion yn ymgymryd â dysgu yn seiliedig ar waith, gan gynnwys 900 o bobl sydd wedi dechrau ar y cwrs diploma sgiliau modern newydd. Yr ydym wedi cyrraedd ein targedau ac wedi rhagori arnynt. Nid oes neb yn awgrymu bod popeth yn fêl i gyd. Mae problemau o ran darparu a chyflwyno dysgu yn seiliedig ar waith, ond ni ddylid gorliwio'r problemau hynny. Maent wedi'u nodi a chânt eu datrys. O ran addysg oedolion, mae 42 y cant o oedolion yng Nghymru yn dysgu ar hyn o bryd neu wedi dysgu yn ddiweddar, o gymharu â 39 y cant yn Lloegr. Hefyd, bu inni lansio'r fagloriaeth Gymreig. Ar fin cychwyn y mae'r cynllun peilot, rhaid cyfaddef, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd problemau y bydd yn rhaid eu datrys. Dyna ddiben cael cynllun peilot. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ffyddiog y bydd y fagloriaeth Gymreig, maes o law, yn ddewis gwerthfawr a pherthnasol i lawer o fyfyrwyr ysgol hŷn. Felly, nid yw'n wir honni, fel y gwna David—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Dim ond araith fer o tua munud y dylech fod yn ei gwneud. Yr ydych eisoes wedi siarad am funud a 15 eiliad. A wnewch ddirwyn eich araith i ben.

Jeff Cuthbert: Dyma fy mrawddeg olaf. Nid yw'n wir honni bod ein rhaglen yn methu â chefnogi dysgwyr. I'r gwrthwyneb, yn ôl y dystiolaeth.

Mark Isherwood: Yr oeddwn yn gobeithio y byddai gwybodaeth o'm swyddfa wedi fy

reached me by now, but I will do the best I can without it. A report published in *The Times* last month stated that the number of teachers leaving the profession since Labour came to power has doubled. Surveys conducted by the teaching profession and the General Teaching Council for Wales show that the number of teachers who intend to leave the profession has reached crisis point. This is a result of the fact that 'education, education, education' has become regulation, regulation, regulation. Teachers, governors and others who care for children in our communities are drowning in bureaucracy, when what they want to do is focus on giving the best education possible to the children in their care. In many schools, the ability to discipline and control classrooms and to work in partnership with children for their common good is frustrated by Government edicts. Also, as has been mentioned many times today, education funding arrangements are penalising children in many parts of Wales because they are based on political dogma, not local need. I endorse everything that David has said, and I know from personal experience that this is not just an issue in Monmouthshire; it is an issue in many parts of Wales.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I am grateful to David for selecting this topic for debate. As a Minister, I have always acted on evidence from a range of organisations, not just from the Government, about how well learners in Wales are doing. To respond to your allegation about the Government's failure to deliver a high standard of education for pre-16 and post-16 learners, I will quote the Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales, who is entirely independent of Government and has no fear or favour in terms of advising me, or anyone else, about the quality of education. She says that

'the picture is a bright one. The quality of education and training is, in almost every way, better than it was last year. In most respects, learners have achieved higher standards. Schools have now hit the 2002 targets the Welsh Assembly Government set for quality of work in the classroom. Managers, teachers and learners should be proud of what they have achieved.'

nghyrraedd erbyn hyn, ond gwnaf fy ngorau hebdi. Nododd adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd yn *The Times* fis diwethaf fod nifer yr athrawon sy'n gadael y proffesiwn ers i Lafur ddod i rym wedi dyblu. Dengys arolygon a gynhaliwyd gan y proffesiwn addysgu a Cyngor Addysg Cyffredinol Cymru fod nifer yr athrawon sy'n bwriadu gadael y proffesiwn bellach wedi mynd yn argyfwng. Y rheswm dros hyn yw'r ffaith bod 'addysg, addysg, addysg' wedi mynd yn 'rheoleiddio, rheoleiddio, rheoleiddio'. Mae athrawon, llywodraethwyr ac eraill sy'n gofalu am blant yn ein cymunedau yn boddi mewn biwrocratiaeth, er mai'r cyfan y maent am ei wneud yw canolbwytio ar roi'r addysg orau bosibl i'r plant o dan eu gofal. Mewn llawer o ysgolion, caiff y gallu i ddisgyblu a rheoli ystafelloedd dosbarth a gweithio mewn partneriaeth â phlant er lles pawb ei rwystro gan orchmynion y Llywodraeth. Hefyd, fel y soniwyd droeon heddiw, mae trefniadau ar gyfer ariannu addysg yn cosbi plant mewn sawl rhan o Gymru am eu bod yn seiliedig ar ddogma wleidyddol, nid angen lleol. Cefnogaf bopeth a ddywedodd David, a gwn, o brofiad, nad yn sir Fynwy yn unig y mae hyn yn broblem; mae'n broblem mewn sawl rhan o Gymru.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i David am ddewis y pwnc hwn ar gyfer dadl. Fel Gweinidog, yr wyf bob amser wedi gweithredu ar dystiolaeth gan ystod o sefydliadau, nid dim ond gan y Llywodraeth, ynghylch pa mor dda y mae dysgwyr yng Nghymru yn ei wneud. I ymateb i'ch honiad ynglŷn â methiant y Llywodraeth i ddarparu addysg o safon uchel i ddysgwyr cyn-16 ac ôl-16, dyfynnaf eiriau'r Prif Arolygydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant yng Nghymru, sy'n gwbl annibynnol ar y Llywodraeth ac yn gallu rhoi cyngor i mi, neu unrhyw un arall am ansawdd addysg yn ddi-ofn. Dywed

'mae'r darlun yn un disglair. Mae ansawdd addysg a hyfforddiant, ym mhob ffordd bron, yn well na'r llynedd. Yn y rhan fwyaf o bethau, mae dysgwyr wedi cyflawni safonau uwch. Mae ysgolion bellach wedi cyrraedd targedau 2002 a gafodd eu gosod gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer ansawdd gwaith yn yr ystafell ddosbarth. Fe ddylai rheolwyr, athrawon a dysgwyr fod yn

falch o'r hyn maen nhw wedi'i gyflawni.'

David Davies: Will you give way?

David Davies: A wnewch ildio?

Jane Davidson: I am delighted to give way, David.

Jane Davidson: Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i ildio, David.

David Davies: I am grateful to you for giving way. As you know, it is easy to quote selectively from a document. Do you agree that someone who has even less fear or favour of Government is the former chief inspector of schools, Chris Woodhead, who has a different opinion about the situation?

David Davies: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am ildio. Fel y gwyddoch, mae'n hawdd dyfynnu'n ddethol o ddogfen. A gytunwch fod gan Chris Woodhead, cyn-brif arolygydd ysgolion, sef rhywun sy'n llai ofnus byth o'r Llywodraeth, farn wahanol ar y sefyllfa?

Denise Idris Jones: Will you give way?

Denise Idris Jones: A wnewch ildio?

Jane Davidson: Yes.

Jane Davidson: Gwnaf.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister must reply to the first intervention. You may then seek to catch the Minister's eye, Denise.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog ymateb i'r ymyriad cyntaf. Yna cewch geisio tynnu sylw'r Gweinidog, Denise.

Jane Davidson: I point out to David that a knowledge of history is a wonderful thing and Chris Woodhead did not operate in Wales.

Jane Davidson: Dywedaf wrth David fod gwybodaeth o hanes yn beth gwych ac na fu Chris Woodhead yn gweithredu yng Nghymru.

Denise Idris Jones: I disagree with David Davies's comments that our Government is failing to deliver a high standard of education for pre-16 and post-16 learners. *[Interruption.]*

Denise Idris Jones: Anghunaf â sylwadau David Davies fod ein Llywodraeth yn methu â darparu addysg o safon uchel i ddsygyr cyn-16 ac ôl-16. *[Torri ar draws.]*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. We cannot have interventions on interventions.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ni ellir caniatáu ymyriadau ar ymyriadau.

Denise Idris Jones: I say that because, last weekend, I was responding to the report of an Estyn inspection carried out at Ysgol John Bright in Llandudno on 1 May, when the Conservatives were trying to fight the election and did not win, but I will not dwell on that. The inspection report was positive and made pleasant reading. The only area of concern was the reference to the poor standard of the building. Pupils aged 11 to 16 are now achieving satisfactory or better standards in 96 per cent of lessons, with 60 per cent assessed as being good or very good. *[Interruption.]*

Denise Idris Jones: Dywedaf hynny am fy mod, y penwythnos diwethaf, yn ymateb i adroddiad ar arolygiad gan Estyn a gynhaliwyd yn Ysgol John Bright yn Llandudno ar 1 Mai, pan oedd y Ceidwadwyr yn ceisio ymladd yr etholiad ac na lwyddasant i'w ennill, ond nid ymhelaethaf ar hynny. Yr oedd adroddiad yr arolygiad yn gadarnhaol ac yn bleser i'w ddarllen. Yr unig bryder oedd y cyfeiriad at safon wael yr adeilad. Mae disgyblion 11 i 16 mlwydd oed bellach yn cyflawni safon foddhaol neu safon well mewn 96 y cant o wersi, gyda 60 y cant yn dda neu'n dda iawn yn ôl yr asesiad. *[Torri ar draws.]*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn.

Denise Idris Jones: May I finish?
[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Oh.’]

Denise Idris Jones: A gaf orffen?
[AELODAU’R CYNULLIAD: ‘O.’]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: No. I think that that was enough of an intervention. You can try again later.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Na chewch. Credaf fod yr ymyriad hwnnw yn ddigon. Cewch geisio ymyrryd eto yn nes ymlaen.

Jane Davidson: As other Members sought to do, Denise used information and statistics to demonstrate unequivocally that education and lifelong learning in Wales has a bright existence and future. One of the comments you made, David, was that you did not intend to make a contribution defined by ideology and yet, once again, you have not welcomed any of the successes of learners in Wales. We now have higher levels of achievement than before; there are 878 more teachers than in 1999; there are more learners throughout the system—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘You are closing more schools.’] We are not closing more schools. Schools in Wales have been closing at an average of three per year for the last 10 years. Half of those closures have been unopposed, because people want to ensure that their children are educated in a high-quality environment.

Jane Davidson: Fel y ceisiodd Aelodau eraill ei wneud, defnyddiodd Denise wybodaeth ac ystadegau i ddangos yn ddigamsyniol fod presennol a dyfodol disgrair i addysg a dysgu gydol oes yng Nghymru. Un o’r sylwadau a wnaethoch chi, David, oedd nad oeddech yn bwriadu gwneud cyfraniad ar sail ideoleg ac eto, unwaith eto, ni wnaethoch groesawu unrhyw un o lwyddiannau dysgwyr yng Nghymru. Mae gennym lefelau uwch o gyflawniad nag erioed erbyn hyn; mae 878 yn fwy o athrawon nag yn 1999; mae mwy o ddsygwyr ar draws y system—[AELODAU’R CYNULLIAD: ‘Yr ydych yn cau mwy o ysgolion.’] Nid ydym yn cau mwy o ysgolion. Yn ystod y 10 mlynedd diwethaf caewyd tair ysgol y flwyddyn yng Nghymru ar gyfartaledd. Ni fu unrhyw wrthwynebiad i hanner y cynigion hynny i gau ysgolion, am fod pobl am sicrhau bod eu plant yn cael addysg mewn amgylchedd o safon.

5.10 p.m.

I am delighted to have the opportunity to reaffirm these issues because learners and practitioners, through hard work and dedication, are achieving these outcomes. We will continue to take our agenda forward based on the evidence that standards and participation are rising across the board. That has been achieved through partnership at all levels in Wales. We need to consider the successes in all sectors. In primary schools, the chief inspector’s report made clear that standards have improved more over the last year than at any time during the last four years. For the first time, standards are good or very good in 60 per cent of the classes inspected. That is twice the level achieved five years ago. The percentage of classes where standards were assessed as being unsatisfactory fell to just under 4 per cent. Our plans for the new foundation phase will look to consolidate and build on the

Yr wyf yn falch iawn o gael y cyfle i ailddatgan y materion hyn gan fod dysgwyr ac ymarferwyr, drwy waith caled ac ymroddiad, yn cael y canlyniadau hyn. Parhawn i ddatblygu ein hagenda yn seiliedig ar y dystiolaeth fod safonau a nifer y dysgwyr yn cynyddu yn gyffredinol. Cyflawnwyd hynny drwy bartneriaeth ar bob lefel yng Nghymru. Mae angen inni ystyried y llwyddiannau ym mhob sector. O ran ysgolion cynradd, eglurodd y prif weithredwr yn ei hadroddiad fod safonau wedi gwella mwy yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf nag ar unrhyw adeg yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf. Am y tro cyntaf, mae safonau’n dda neu’n dda iawn mewn 60 y cant o’r dosbarthiadau a arolygwyd. Mae hynny ddwywaith gymaint â’r lefel a gyflawnwyd bum mlynedd yn ôl. Gostyngodd canran y dosbarthiadau yr aseswyd eu bod o safon anfodddhaol i ychydig o dan 4 y cant. Yn ein

significant gains made in this sector. I am pleased to acknowledge the extensive and positive response to that consultation and the helpful and extensive policy review undertaken by the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee. The Narrowing the Gap project is now being extended to primary as well as secondary schools, ensuring that our least well performing schools can learn from the lessons and experience of our best performers.

There is increasing evidence that breakfasts have a positive effect on children's attitude and ability to learn. Our manifesto commitment to providing breakfasts at primary schools has met with widespread support from parents, governors and teachers. We will publish a consultation paper in the autumn and engage in a series of seminars early next year on proposals to roll out the provision of free breakfasts to all primary schools over the lifetime of this Assembly. The programmes of development will start in September 2004 in primary schools in the Communities First areas. They will be extended to other deprived areas from September 2005 and then to all primary schools by September 2006.

We met all our targets in primary schools, with the highest levels of achievement that pupils had ever achieved in Wales. In secondary schools, there are big improvements in the quality of teaching, leadership and management. Pupils aged 11 to 16 are achieving satisfactory or better standards in 96 per cent of lessons, with 60 per cent achieving good or very good standards. There is a huge challenge to capitalise on the momentum and enthusiasm for learning developed in primary schools. That is why one of the Wales-only powers in the Education Act 2002 was to put effective plans in place for transition from the primary to the secondary sector to ensure continuity and progression. The chief inspector's report confirms that youth work is good. 'Extending Entitlement' is a flagship policy, which is widely supported here across party boundaries. The initiative relies on that support. I will report on its progress to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee

cynlluniau ar gyfer y cyfnod sylfaen newydd disgwyliwn atgyfnerthu ac adeiladu ar y cynnydd sylweddol a wnaed yn y sector hwn. Yr wyf yn falch o gydnabod yr ymateb helaeth a chadarnhaol i'r ymgynghoriad hwnnw a'r adolygiad defnyddiol ac eang o bolisi a gynhaliwyd gan y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Erbyn hyn estynnir prosiect Cau'r Bwlch i ysgolion cynradd yn ogystal ag ysgolion uwchradd, gan sicrhau y gall ein hysgolion sy'n perfformio waethaf ddysgu o wersi a phrofiad ein perfformwyr gorau.

Ceir tystiolaeth gynyddol bod bwyta brecwast yn cael effaith gadarnhaol ar agwedd plant a'u gallu i ddysgu. Bu cefnogaeth gyffredinol i'n hymrwymiad yn ein maniffesto i ddarparu brecwast mewn ysgolion cynradd gan rieni, llywodraethwyr ac athrawon. Byddwn yn cyhoeddi papur ymgynghori yn yr hydref ac yn cynnal cyfres o seminarau ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf ar gynigion i gyflwyno brecwast am ddim ym mhob ysgol gynradd yn ystod y Cynulliad hwn. Bydd y rhaglenni datblygu yn dechrau ym mis Medi 2004 mewn ysgolion cynradd yn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Cânt eu hestyn i ardaloedd difreintiedig eraill o fis Medi 2005 ac yna i bob ysgol gynradd erbyn Medi 2006.

Cyrhaeddom bob un o'n targedau mewn ysgolion cynradd, gyda'r lefelau uchaf o gyflawniad ymhlith disgyblion yng Nghymru a gafwyd erioed. Mewn ysgolion uwchradd, mae gwelliannau mawr i ansawdd addysgu, arweinyddiaeth a rheolaeth. Mae disgyblion 11 i 16 mlwydd oed yn cyrraedd safon foddhaol neu safon well mewn 96 y cant o wersi, gyda 60 y cant yn cyrraedd safon dda neu dda iawn. Wynebwn her enfawr i fanteisio ar y momentwm a'r brwdfrydedd dros ddysgu sydd wedi datblygu mewn ysgolion cynradd. Dyna pam mai un o bwerau i Gymru yn unig yn Neddf Addysg 2002 oedd rhoi cynlluniau effeithiol ar waith i bontio o'r sector cynradd i'r sector uwchradd er mwyn sicrhau parhad a dilyniant. Mae adroddiad y prif arolygydd yn cadarnhau bod gwaith ieuenedig yn dda. Mae 'Ymestyn Hawliau' yn un o'n prif bolisiau, a gefnogir yma ar draws ffiniau'r pleidiau. Mae'r fenter yn dibynnu ar y gefnogaeth honno. Byddaf yn rhoi adroddiad ar ei

later this month.

In the further education sector, standards attained by students have improved again with 73 per cent of provision now assessed as good with no shortcomings. Standards in work-based training have also improved, but it is a mixed picture. In the long term, we will not be prepared to accommodate poor standards of work-based training, which is why that will go out to tender over the next 18 months. I have asked the council to take action to lever up standards so that there is access to high-quality provision across Wales. In the higher education sector, the 2001 research assessment exercise resulted in the highest awards ever achieved by 139 departments in Welsh higher education institutes. Eighty-four were awarded the highest 4/5 and 5* ratings, and that 5* award increased fourfold from 3 in 1996 to 12 in 2001.

The widening access scheme has been more successful in Wales than in any other part of the UK. More people from low-income communities are going on to study at university. That is why Assembly learning grants were put in place and why learning pathways for 14 to 19-year-olds was set up to provide a flexible approach tailored to individual needs, to encourage those at risk of dropping out to continue participating in education and lifelong learning. 'The Learning Country' sets out an ambitious programme to 2010, for the benefit of all learners, young and old, and practitioners across the board. There will always be room for improvement, and I want everybody in Wales to take up opportunities for learning. However, you cannot entitle a debate with the statement that this Government is failing education in Wales, when there are huge and notable successes, which have never been achieved before, and certainly not under your Government. It is unfair to the learners and teachers of Wales that you never acknowledge their successes. The record to date speaks for itself. It is not my record; it is the record of teachers, lecturers and learners in Wales. They are outstripping your performance—

chynnydd i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn ddiweddarach y mis hwn.

Yn y sector addysg bellach, mae safonau myfyrwyr wedi gwella eto gyda 73 y cant o'r ddarpariaeth yn cael ei hasesu'n ddarpariaeth dda heb ddiffygion erbyn hyn. Mae safonau mewn hyfforddiant yn seiliedig ar waith hefyd wedi gwella, ond mae'n ddarlun cymysg. Yn y tymor hir, ni fyddwn yn barod i dderbyn safonau gwael mewn hyfforddiant yn seiliedig ar waith, a dyna pam y bydd hynny yn mynd i dendr yn ystod y 18 mis nesaf. Gofynnais i'r cyngor gymryd camau i godi safonau er mwyn sicrhau bod darpariaeth o safon ar gael ar draws Cymru. Yn y sector addysg uwch, arweiniodd ymarfer asesu ymchwil 2001 at y dyfarniadau uchaf erioed i 139 o adrannau mewn sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Dyfarnwyd gradd 4/5 a 5* sef y graddau uchaf i 84, a bu cynnydd bedair gwaith yn nifer yr adrannau y dyfarnwyd 5* iddynt o 3 yn 1996 i 12 yn 2001.

Bu'r cynllun i ehangu mynediad yn fwy llwyddiannus yng Nghymru nag mewn unrhyw ran arall o'r DU. Mae mwy o bobl o gymunedau incwm isel yn mynd ymlaen i astudio yn y brifysgol. Dyna pam y cynigir grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad a pham y sefydlwyd llwybrau dysgu i bobl ifanc 14 i 19 mlwydd oed i gynnig dulliau hyblyg o ddysgu wedi'u teilwra at anghenion unigolion, er mwyn annog y rhai sy'n debygol o roi'r gorau i addysg i barhau i gymryd rhan mewn addysg a dysgu gydol oes. Mae 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' yn amlinellu rhaglen uchelgeisiol sydd i redeg tan 2010, er budd pob dysgwr, hen ac ifanc, ac ymarferwyr ar draws y sector. Bydd lle i wella bob amser, ac yr wyf am i bawb yng Nghymru fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd i ddysgu. Fodd bynnag, ni allwch roi fel teitl ar ddadl y datganiad bod addysg yn dirywio o dan y Llywodraeth hon yng Nghymru, oherwydd rhaid cofio'r llwyddiannau enfawr a nodedig, nas cyflawnwyd erioed o'r blaen, ac yn sicr nid o dan eich Llywodraeth chi. Mae'r ffaith nad ydych byth yn cydnabod eu llwyddiannau yn annheg i ddysgwyr ac athrawon Cymru. Mae'r record hyd yma yn siarad drosti'i hun. Nid fy record i ydyw; record athrawon, darlithwyr a dysgwyr yng Nghymru ydyw. Maent yn rhagori ar eich

perfformiad—

David Davies: If the teachers of Wales are so happy, why is it that in a recent National Association of Schoolmasters/Union of Women Teachers survey, 82 per cent of teachers said that they were considering leaving the profession?

Jane Davidson: Whenever a survey is conducted and people are asked if they want to go elsewhere, the results always demonstrate that people want to consider other kinds of employment— [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘No, they do not.’]

A GTC survey, which is accurate, was also conducted, involving a far wider group of teachers than the NASUWT survey. The majority of teachers leave either within the first five years—not least because they feel unsupported, which is why there are specific mechanisms in place for early professional development—or after 30 years. Many people who seek early retirement—as have eight teachers in Monmouthshire—do so because, after 30 years in the profession, they want to do something else.

Alun Cairns: The figures you quote are historic, but the NASUWT figures are current. Should there not be a correlation between the two?

Jane Davidson: The GTC figures are current, accurate and up to date, and those are the figures that the Committee works with. It is important—

Denise Idris Jones: I was speaking from experience, David, because I was a teacher and I am a parent. Our attitude towards young people today should be far more positive, and we should have more confidence in our excellent teaching staff.

Jane Davidson: The teaching profession in Wales is superbly qualified and professional. The reason that we want to implement workload reform and, in particular, planning, preparation and marking time, is to support that profession. That is why we have

David Davies: Os yw athrawon Cymru mor fodlon, pam y dywedodd 82 y cant o athrawon mewn arolwg diweddar a gynhaliwyd gan Gymdeithas Genedlaethol yr Ysgolfeistri ac Undeb yr Athrawesau, eu bod yn ystyried gadael y proffesiwn?

Jane Davidson: Pryd bynnag y cynhelir arolwg sy'n gofyn i bobl a ydynt am fynd rywle arall, dengys y canlyniadau bob amser fod pobl am ystyried mathau eraill o gyflogaeth—[AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: ‘Nac ydynt.’]

Cynhaliwyd arolwg hefyd gan y Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol. Yr oedd yr arolwg cywir hwn yn cynnwys grŵp llawer mwy eang o athrawon nag arolwg NASUWT. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o athrawon yn gadael naill ai o fewn y pum mlynedd cyntaf—yn bennaf am eu bod yn teimlo nad ydynt yn cael cefnogaeth, sef y rheswm pam mae systemau penodol ar waith i hybu datblygiad proffesiynol cynnar—neu ar ôl 30 mlynedd. Mae llawer o bobl sy'n gofyn am ymddeol yn gynnar—fel y gwnaeth wyth athro yn sir Fynwy—yn gwneud hynny am eu bod am wneud rhywbeth arall ar ôl 30 mlynedd yn y proffesiwn.

Alun Cairns: Mae'r ffigurau a ddyfynnwch yn rhai hanesyddol, ond mae ffigurau NASUWT yn gyfredol. Oni ddylai fod cydberthynas rhwng y ddau?

Jane Davidson: Mae ffigurau'r Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol yn gyfredol ac yn gywir. Y ffigurau hynny a ddefnyddir gan y Pwyllgor. Mae'n bwysig—

Denise Idris Jones: Yr oeddwn yn siarad o brofiad, David, am fy mod yn athrawes ac yn rhiant. Dylai ein hagwedd tuag at bobl ifanc fod yn llawer mwy cadarnhaol, a dylem ymddiried mwy yn ein staff addysgu rhagorol.

Jane Davidson: Mae gan y proffesiwn addysgu yng Nghymru gymwysterau gwych ac maent yn broffesiynol. Y rheswm pam yr ydym am gyflwyno diwygiadau i faich gwaith ac, yn enwedig, amser cynllunio, paratoi a marcio, yw ein bod am gefnogi'r

introduced our own plans for individual continuous professional development in Wales, and I want to ensure that that continues in a way that rewards the individual teacher. There is huge support for that.

In closing, I will mention Monmouthshire. I cannot comment on the individual proposals; you are fully aware of that, David. It is important to stress that you are a political champion, but my job as Minister is to not respond politically in any way, but in a quasi-judicial sense. It is an important distinction. Any decision that I take as Minister in a quasi-judicial sense can, as some of you have said, be challenged by judicial review. That is why the Assembly Government, or any Government, would deal with any proposal that requires a quasi-judicial response by conducting a full analysis of whether or not the proposal satisfies all the obligations laid down in law. It is important that I reaffirm that.

Jonathan Morgan: Will you assure us that you will consider David's point about the circular? It stated that, in that instance, certain diocesan authorities should be consulted about whether or not those schools should exist. In carrying out your role in a sub-judicial manner, you should familiarise yourself with all those documents and evidence. Will you speak with the Counsel General to ensure that that information is taken on board?

Jane Davidson: I can assure you a copy of this debate will be given to officials so that they can consider the points that you have raised.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close.

proffesiwn hwnnw. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi cyflwyno ein cynlluniau ein hunain ar gyfer datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus unigol yng Nghymru, ac yr wyf am sicrhau bod hynny yn parhau mewn ffordd sy'n gwobrwyo'r athro unigol. Mae cefnogaeth fawr i hynny.

I gloi, soniaf am sir Fynwy. Ni allaf wneud sylwadau ar y cynigion unigol; fe wyddoch hynny, David. Mae'n bwysig pwysleisio mai eiriolwr gwleidyddol ydych chi, ond fy ngwaith i fel Gweinidog yw ymateb mewn ffordd led-farnwrol, ac nid yn wleidyddol. Mae'n wahaniaeth pwysig. Gall unrhyw benderfyniad lled-farnwrol a wnaif fel Gweinidog, fel y'i nodwyd gan rai ohonoch, ei herio mewn arolwg barnwrol. Dyna pam y byddai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, neu unrhyw Lywodraeth, yn ymdrin ag unrhyw gynnig y mae'n ofynnol rhoi ymateb lled-farnwrol iddo drwy gynnal dadansoddiad llawn i ganfod a yw'r cynnig yn bodloni pob rhwymedigaeth a osodwyd o dan y gyfraith. Mae'n bwysig imi ailddatgan hynny.

Jonathan Morgan: A wnewch chi roi sicrwydd inni y byddwch yn ystyried pwynt David ynglŷn â'r cylchlythyr? Nododd, yn yr achos hwnnw, y dylid ymgynghori ag awdurdodau esgobaethol penodol pa un a ddylai'r ysgolion hynny fodoli. Wrth gyflawni'ch rôl lled-farnwrol, dylech ymgysfarwyddo â'r holl ddogfennau hynny a'r dystiolaeth. A wnewch chi siarad â'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol er mwyn sicrhau bod y wybodaeth honno yn cael ei hystyried?

Jane Davidson: Gallaf roi sicrwydd ichi y caiff copi o'r ddadl hon ei roi i swyddogion er mwyn iddynt allu ystyried y pwyntiau a godwyd gennych.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.20 p.m.

The meeting ended at 5.20 p.m.

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)

Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)

Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)

Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)

Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

