



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Mawrth, 13 Ionawr 2004

Tuesday, 13 January 2004

Cynnwys
Contents

- | | |
|----|--|
| 3 | Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal a'r Pwyllgor Deddfau
Election to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity and to the Legislation Committee |
| 4 | Sefydlu Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio (2) 2003-2
Establishment of Planning Decision Committee (2) 2003-2 |
| 6 | Newid i Aelodaeth y Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol
Change to the Membership of the Local Government Partnership Council |
| 7 | Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog
Questions to the First Minister |
| 35 | Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order |
| 36 | Datganiad Busnes
Business Statement |
| 41 | Datganiad ar y Mesur Addysg Uwch
Statement on the Higher Education Bill |
| 56 | Datganiad ar yr Adolygiad o'r Amgylchedd Hanesyddol
Statement on the Historic Environment Review |
| 68 | Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Trwyddedu Rheoli Gwastraff (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004
Approval of the Waste Management Licensing (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004 |
| 70 | Sefydlu Pwyllgor Mesur Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004
Establishment of the Public Audit (Wales) Bill Committee 2004 |
| 71 | Ethol i Bwyllgor Mesur Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004
Election to the Public Audit (Wales) Bill Committee 2004 |
| 72 | Cymeradwyo Canllawiau'r Cynulliad ar Arfarnu Rheoliadol
Approval of the Assembly Guidance on Regulatory Appraisal |
| 74 | Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Cynlluniau Iaith Gymraeg (Cyrff Cyhoeddus) 2004
Approval of the Welsh Language Schemes (Public Bodies) Order 2004 |
| 80 | Adroddiad Blynyddol y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal
The Annual Report of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal a'r Pwyllgor Deddfau
Election to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity and to the Legislation
Committee**

Y Llywydd: Gofynnaf am ganiatâd y Cynulliad, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.4A, i gynnal pleidlais ar y cynigion hyn gyda'i gilydd. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwela'nad oes.

The Presiding Officer: I seek the Assembly's permission, in accordance with Standing Order No. 8.4A, to hold a vote on these motions together. Are there any objections? I see that there are not.

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): I propose that

the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Orders Nos. 8.4 and 14.3, elects Laura Jones (Conservative) to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity in place of Lisa Francis (Conservative). (NDM1765)

I propose that

the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Orders Nos. 8.4 and 11.1, elects Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey (Labour) to its Legislation Committee in place of Catherine Thomas (Labour). (NDM1764)

Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog rhifau 8.4 a 14.3, yn ethol Laura Jones (Ceidwadwyr) i'w Bwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yn lle Lisa Francis (Ceidwadwyr). (NDM1765)

Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog rhifau 8.4 ac 11.1, yn ethol Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey (Llafur) i'w Bwyllgor Deddfau yn lle Catherine Thomas (Llafur). (NDM1764)

*Cynigion (NDM1765 ac NDM1764): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motions (NDM1765 and NDM1764): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann

Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Sefydlu Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio (2) 2003-2 Establishment of Planning Decision Committee (2) 2003-2

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): I Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Cynigiaf fod propose that

the National Assembly for Wales resolves:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn penderfynu:

1. that a committee, to be known as Planning Decision Committee (2) 2003-2 be established, in accordance with Standing Order No. 35, to discharge the functions of the Assembly under sections 79(1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 in respect of the matter identified in the Schedule to this motion (together, in the case of the third matter identified in the Schedule, with the functions of the Assembly under sections 22 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, and that the Assembly's functions in those respects be delegated to that Committee;

2. that the members of that Committee be: Carwyn Jones AM (Chair); Irene James AM; Alun Ffred Jones AM; Brynle Williams AM;

3. that the Committee shall cease to exist when the Chair of the Committee signs the decision letter in accordance with Standing Order No. 35.16 or on the 23 January 2004 whichever is the earlier;

1. y bydd Pwyllgor, a adwaenir fel Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio (2) 2003-2, yn cael ei sefydlu, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 35, i gyflawni swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad o dan adran 79(1) Deddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990 mewn perthynas â'r mater a nodir yn yr Atodlen i'r cynnig hwn (ynghyd â, yn achos y trydydd mater a nodir yn yr Atodlen, swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad o dan adran 22 Deddf Cynllunio (Adeiladau Rhestredig ac Ardaloedd Cadwraeth) 1990, ac y bydd swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad yn hynny o beth yn cael eu dirprwyo i'r Pwyllgor hwnnw;

2. dyma fydd aelodau'r Pwyllgor hwnnw: Carwyn Jones; AC (Cadeirydd); Irene James AC; Alun Ffred Jones AC; Brynle Williams AC;

3. bydd y Pwyllgor yn peidio â bod pan fydd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor yn llofnodi'r llythyr penderfynu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 35.16, neu ar 23 Ionawr 2004, pa un bynnag a ddaw gyntaf;

4. that if the Committee shall cease to exist without the Chair having signed a decision letter in respect of the matter identified in the schedule to this motion, then in that event the functions identified in paragraph 1 above are, in relation to such matter, delegated to the First Minister;

4. os bydd y Pwyllgor yn dod i ben heb i'r Cadeirydd lofnodi'r llythyr penderfynu mewn perthynas â'r mater a nodir yn yr Atodlen i'r cynnig hwn, bydd y swyddogaethau a nodir ym mharagraff 1 uchod, mewn perthynas â'r cyfryw fater, yn cael eu dirprwyo i Brif Weinidog Cymru;

Schedule

Atodlen

Planning appeal by Community Power Ltd for the proposed erection of wind turbines at land at Ton Mawr and Castell Farms, near Margam, Port Talbot;

Cais cynllunio gan Community Power Cyf i godi tyrbinau gwynt ar dir yn Ffermydd Ton Mawr a Chastell, ger Margam, Port Talbot;

Planning appeals by Bellway Homes for residential development and associated public open space, to include the provision of a link road at land between the A48 road and Llantwit Major Road, Cowbridge (application nos. 01/00826/out and 02/01617/out);

Ceisiadau cynllunio gan Bellway Homes am ddatblygiadau preswyl a man agored cyhoeddus cysylltiedig, fydd yn cynnwys darparu ffordd gyswllt ar dir rhwng ffordd yr A48 a Ffordd Llanilltud Fawr, y Bont-faen (ceisiadau rhif 01/00826/out a 02/01617/out);

Planning appeal by Gryphon Corporation for a new external entrance door and listed building consent appeal for a new external entrance door and a new internal party wall at Central Wing, Trawsgoed Mansion, Aberystwyth. (NDM1763)

Cais cynllunio gan Gryphon Corporation am ddrws allanol newydd i'r fynedfa ac apêl caniatâd adeilad rhestredig am ddrws allanol newydd a gwahanfur mewnol yn yr Asgell Ganol, Plas Trawsgoed, Aberystwyth. (NDM1763)

Cynnig (NDM1763): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM1763): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian

Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Newid i Aelodaeth y Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol Change to the Membership of the Local Government Partnership Council

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): I Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Cynigaf fod propose that

the Assembly, in accordance with paragraphs 1 (1) and 4 of Schedule 11 to the Government of Wales Act 1998, appoints the following person to be a member of the Local Government Partnership Council: Mr John Antoniazzi (Dyfed Powys Police Authority) in place of Cllr Malcolm King (North Wales Police Authority). (NDM1766)

y Cynulliad, yn unol â pharagraffau 1(1) a 4 Atodlen 11 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penodi'r person canlynol i fod yn aelod o'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol: Mr John Antoniazzi (Awdurdod Heddlu Dyfed Powys) yn lle'r Cyngorydd Malcolm King (Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru). (NDM1766)

*Cynnig (NDM1766): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1766): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine

Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Health and Social Services

C1 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Beth yw blaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth ar gyfer iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn ystod y 12 mis nesaf? (OAQ30915)

Q1 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: What are the Government's priorities for health and social services during the next 12 months? (OAQ30915)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Blwyddyn newydd dda i ti ac i bawb.

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): A happy new year to you and to everyone.

Mae'r blaenoriaethau ar gyfer iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol wedi'u hamlinellu yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'. Mae enghreifftiau ar gyfer y flwyddyn i ddod yn cynnwys sefydlu tîm,

The priorities for health and social care are outlined in 'Wales: A Better Country'. Examples for the coming year include the establishment of a team, led by Gwenda

dan arweiniad Gwenda Thomas, i baratoi adroddiad ar ein gwasanaethau i ddiogelu plant mewn sefyllfaoedd bregus, a hynny bedair blynedd ar ôl adroddiad Syr Ronald Waterhouse; paratoi cynlluniau i weithredu adroddiad Wanless; a chyflwyno gwarant o ail gynnig i gleifion sydd yn aros mwy na 18 mis am lawdriniaeth.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I respond to your new year greeting by wishing you, personally, a good new year; politically, it might be a different matter.

You will be aware of the report by the Institute of Welsh Affairs which shows a shortfall of £300 million in health and social services under the Barnett formula. Were the formula based on our needs in terms of health and social services, that money would be provided. In an interview before Christmas, you admitted that you could not argue the case for a review of Barnett because the Chancellor of the Exchequer is a Scottish Member of Parliament, with his own interests to defend. Does that mean that you are a quitter, rather than a fighter for Wales? Should not the people of Wales have the right to know whether they have a First Minister who is prepared to fight their case? If you are not prepared to fight on Barnett, will you fight for additional powers for the Assembly? Or are you a quitter on all issues pertaining to Wales?

The First Minister: You have erected an inverted pyramid on shifting sand, Rhodri Glyn. The IWA report says nothing of the kind. It is not based on an objective needs-based formula assessment. It refers to the problem of convergence, which is evidently one of the Barnett formula's problems: if we start from a higher base of expenditure per head in health—which we do in Wales by some 14 per cent—and if health expenditure in England is increased by 10 per cent, then, under Barnett, we have to struggle to increase expenditure by 10 per cent because the Barnett formula only prescribes that we get 6 per cent of what England gets. That is a problem of convergence and mathematics and it has nothing to do with the objective

Thomas, to prepare a report on our services to safeguard vulnerable children, four years on from the publication of Sir Ronald Waterhouse's report; the preparation of plans to implement the Wanless report; and the introduction of a second offer guarantee for patients waiting more than 18 months for surgery.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Ymatebaf i'ch cyfarchiad blwyddyn newydd drwy ddymuno blwyddyn newydd dda i chi'n bersonol; yn wleidyddol, gallai fod yn fater gwahanol.

Byddwch yn gwybod am yr adroddiad gan y Sefydliad Materion Cymreig sy'n dangos bod diffyg o £300 miliwn mewn iechedd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol o dan fformiwla Barnett. Pe bai'r fformiwla honno'n seiliedig ar ein hanghenion o ran iechedd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, darperid yr arian hwnnw. Mewn cyfweiliad cyn y Nadolig, gwnaethoch gyfaddef na allech ddadlau dros gael adolygiad o fformiwla Barnett am fod Canghellor y Trysorlys yn Aelod Seneddol dros yr Alban, a chanddo ei fuddiannau ei hun i'w hamddiffyn. A yw hynny'n golygu mai llwfrgi ydych, yn hytrach na rhywun sy'n barod i ymladd dros Gymru? Oni ddylai pobl Cymru gael yr hawl i wybod a oes ganddynt Brif Weinidog sy'n barod i ymladd dros eu hachos? Os nad ydych yn barod i ymladd ar fater fformiwla Barnett, a wnewch ymladd dros gael pwerau ychwanegol i'r Cynulliad? Ynteu a ydych yn llwfrgi ar bob mater sy'n ymwneud â Chymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych wedi codi tŷ ar y tywod, Rhodri Glyn. Nid yw adroddiad y Sefydliad Materion Cymru yn dweud dim byd o'r fath. Nid yw wedi'i seilio ar asesiad gwrthrychol o fformiwla sy'n seiliedig ar anghenion. Mae'n cyfeirio at broblem cydgyfeirio, sy'n amlwg yn un o'r problemau sydd ynglŷn â fformiwla Barnett: os dechreuwn ar lefel wariant y pen uwch o ran iechedd—a dyna a wnawn yng Nghymru o ryw 14 y cant—ac os cynyddir y gwariant ar iechedd yn Lloegr 10 y cant, yna, o dan fformiwla Barnett, fe'i cawn yn anodd cynyddu gwariant 10 y cant am fod fformiwla Barnett yn pennu na chawn ond 6 y cant o'r hyn a gaiff Lloegr. Problem sy'n ymwneud â chydgyfeirio a mathemateg yw

needs-based assessment to which you referred. You should go back to the Plaid Cymru research department and ask it to read IWA reports more carefully in future; then perhaps you could ask questions in this Assembly that are based on something other than nonsense research and shifting sands.

Val Lloyd: Mental health services are regrettably often referred to as the cinderella of health services. I understand that improving these services is one of the Government's strategic priorities. I know that some issues in this regard have already been addressed, including the appointment of the first director of mental health and the first ever mental health primary care network. Could you give an assurance that there will be further action in the next 12 months on issues such as tackling the stigma and discrimination faced by people with mental illness and also on developing actions for greater service user and carer empowerment?

The First Minister: You raise an interesting and timely point, given the amount of interest that there has been in delayed transfers of care. Delayed transfers of care is a major problem in mental health services, because some 50 per cent of delayed transfers of care apply to mental health patients. In November 2002, we set out the standards that we expect to apply in mental health. It is now important that we follow this through and ensure that all health authorities and trusts in Wales are providing services according to the schedule of required standards that were set out in the national service framework which we published some 15 months ago.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Happy new year, First Minister.

The sum of £22 million has been awarded to Wales by Westminster, as a result of the increase in local authority funding in England. It is being used there to reduce the level of council tax increases, but it is being

honno ac nid oes a wnelo hi ddim â'r asesiad gwrthrychol ar sail anghenion y cyfeiriasoch ato. Dylech fynd yn ôl at adran ymchwil Plaid Cymru a gofyn iddi ddarllen adroddiadau'r Sefydliad Materion Cymreig yn fwy gofalus yn y dyfodol; wedyn efallai y gallech ofyn cwestiynau yn y Cynulliad hwn sy'n seiliedig ar rywbeth amgenach nag ymchwil ddisynnwyr a thywod.

Val Lloyd: Gwaetha'r modd, mae gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yn cael eu galw'n aml yn sinderela'r gwasanaethau iechyd. Deallaf mai gwella'r gwasanaethau hyn yw un o flaenoriaethau strategol y Llywodraeth. Gwn fod rhai materion sy'n ymwneud â hyn wedi derbyn sylw eisoes, gan gynnwys penodi'r cyfarwyddwr iechyd meddwl cyntaf a'r rhwydwaith gofal sylfaenol cyntaf erioed ar gyfer iechyd meddwl. A allech roi sicrwydd y cymerir camau pellach yn y 12 mis nesaf ar faterion megis ymdrin â'r stigma a'r gwahaniaethu y mae rhai sydd â salwch meddwl yn eu hwynebu a hefyd ar baratoi camau gweithredu i alluogi defnyddwyr gwasanaethau a gofalwyr ymhellach?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn codi pwynt diddorol ac amserol, o gofio maint y diddordeb a fu mewn oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal. Mae oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn broblem fawr mewn gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl, gan fod tua 50 y cant o'r achosion o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn ymwneud â chleifion iechyd meddwl. Yn Nhachwedd 2002, gwnaethom nodi'r safonau yr ydym yn disgwyl eu gweld mewn cysylltiad ag iechyd meddwl. Mae'n bwysig yn awr ein bod yn dilyn hynny i'r pen ac yn sicrhau bod yr holl awdurdodau iechyd ac ymddiriedolaethau yng Nghymru'n darparu gwasanaethau'n unol â'r rhestr o safonau gofynnol a nodwyd yn y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol a gyhoeddassom ryw 15 mis yn ôl.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Blwyddyn newydd dda, Brif Weinidog.

Rhoddyd y swm o £22 miliwn i Gymru gan San Steffan, o ganlyniad i'r cynnydd yng nghyllid awdurdodau lleol yn Lloegr. Fe'i defnyddir yno i ostwng lefelau'r cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor, ond fe'i defnyddir gennyh

used by you—without consulting the Assembly and seemingly without consulting local government leaders, because it has been widely criticised by Labour local authority leaders and Labour Welsh MPs—to reduce bedblocking. Why is this money not being used to reduce the above-inflation increases in council tax bills which the hard-pressed council tax payers of Wales will have to pay? That is what the money was intended for.

The First Minister: I do not know what has happened to your research department during the Christmas/new year recess, and to the Plaid Cymru research department. I will read out the relevant paragraph in the letter we had from the Treasury:

‘I am writing to inform you about Barnett formula increases in your resource departmental expenditure limit announced in the pre-budget report for the Welsh Assembly Government. There is an increase of £20.026 million in 2004-05 as a consequence of the increase in local authority funding for England, and there is an increase of £2.3656 million in 2004-05 as a consequence of the additional funding for training pilots in England.’

We had £22 million overall. The sum of £20 million arose as a Barnett consequential because of the increase in local authority funding in England. The money has gone to the local authorities in Wales. I would have thought that everyone, and most particularly those who are stakeholders in providing services to the elderly, would applaud getting £20 million that they did not expect to get. That includes issues around delayed transfers of care, but by no means exclusively—it can include housing adaptations for the elderly, or solutions to the fees disputes between local authorities where there are a high number of people in residential nursing homes. It is up to local authorities how they use that money within that field. The figure is not £22 million, as the additional £2 million did not arise as a result of an increase in local authority funding in England, but from additional funding for training pilots. That sum will be going to renal services in Wales, and I would have thought that you would

chi—heb yngynghori â'r Cynulliad ac, i bob golwg, heb ymgynghori ag arweinwyr llywodraeth leol, gan fod beirniadu cyffredinol wedi bod ar hyn gan arweinwyr awdurdodau lleol Llafur ac Aelodau Seneddol Llafur Cymru—i leihau'r blocio ar welyau. Pam na ddefnyddir yr arian hwn i leihau codiadau mewn biliau'r dreth gyngor sy'n uwch na chyfradd chwyddiant y bydd talwyr y dreth gyngor yng Nghymru'n gorfod eu talu, a hwythau dan bwysau? Dyna oedd diben yr arian.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni wn beth a ddigwyddodd i'ch adran ymchwil yn ystod toriad y Nadolig a'r flwyddyn newydd, ac i adran ymchwil Plaid Cymru. Darllenaf y paragraff perthnasol yn y llythyr a gawsom oddi wrth y Trysorlys:

Yr wyf yn ysgrifennu i'ch hysbysu am yr codiadau yn unol â fformiwla Barnett yn eich terfyn gwariant adrannol ar adnoddau a gyhoeddwyd yn yr adroddiad rhag-gyllidebol ar gyfer Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae cynnydd o £20.026 miliwn yn 2004-05 o ganlyniad i'r cynnydd yng nghyllid awdurdodau lleol i Loegr, ac mae cynnydd o £2.3656 miliwn yn 2004-05 o ganlyniad i'r cyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer cynlluniau hyfforddi rhagbrofol yn Lloegr.

Cawsom gyfanswm o £22 miliwn. Cododd y swm o £20 miliwn o ganlyniad i fformiwla Barnett oherwydd y cynnydd yn y cyllid i awdurdodau lleol yn Lloegr. Aeth yr arian i'r awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru. Tybiaswn y byddai pawb, ac yn enwedig y rhai sy'n rhanddeiliaid yn y gwaith o ddarparu gwasanaethau i'r henoed, yn cymeradwyo'r ffaith eu bod yn cael £20 miliwn heb ei ddisgwyl. Mae hynny'n cynnwys materion sy'n gysylltiedig ag oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal, ond nid hynny'n unig, o bell ffordd—gall gynnwys addasiadau i dai ar gyfer yr henoed, neu ddatrys yr anghydfodau ynghylch ffioedd rhwng awdurdodau lleol lle y mae nifer fawr o bobl mewn cartrefi nyrsio preswyl. Mater i awdurdodau lleol yw'r modd y defnyddiant yr arian hwn yn y maes hwnnw. Nid £22 miliwn yw'r ffigur, gan na chododd y £2 filiwn ychwanegol o ganlyniad i gynnydd yn y cyllid i awdurdodau lleol yn Lloegr, ond o gyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer cynlluniau hyfforddi rhagbrofol. Aiff y swm

have welcomed that, as it enables us to bring renal services—in those parts of Wales that were lagging behind—up to the proper standard of three renal dialysis treatments per week.

Nick Bourne: The First Minister has not said anything that I have not said myself, and what you have said is true. However, what you have not stressed is that you have earmarked how that money is to be spent. Are you also criticising the researchers of Lawrence Bailey, Labour leader of the City and County of Swansea council, and of Sir Harry Jones, the Labour leader of the Welsh Local Government Association? They are making similar criticisms: there has not been a proper process, and you are not using the money to reduce council taxes. You are identifying specific purposes and saying that that is what the money must be spent on. This is at a time when council tax bills have risen, during the six years since you have been in Government, by 70 per cent. In England, the increase is 60 per cent, which is bad enough. Bills have increased by more in Wales, yet you refuse to see that this sum of money should be used to reduce council tax bills for the hard-pressed council tax payers of Wales.

2.10 p.m.

The First Minister: According to the figures that I have, the increase for band D council tax in Wales is 25 per cent, whereas in England the increase is 30 per cent over the same period. So your figures are quite wrong in that regard. If you had watched television or listened to the radio last week, you would have heard lead directors of social services from different authorities say that they were pleased about this money coming in, accepting entirely what had been said in the pre-budget discussions—although we were not able to provide it without this additional money—about the desperate need for extra money for local authority services for the elderly. The Association of the Directors of Social Services in Wales has now written an open letter to us, saying how pleased it is about this additional money, not only because it answers the plea made in pre-budget

hwnnw i wasanaethau arennol yng Nghymru, a thybiaswn y byddech yn croesawu hynny, gan ei fod yn ein galluogi i godi gwasanaethau arennol—yn y rhannau hynny o Gymru a oedd ar ôl—i'r safon briodol o dair triniaeth dialysis arennol yr wythnos.

Nick Bourne: Nid yw'r Prif Weinidog wedi dweud unrhyw beth nad wyf fi wedi'i ddweud fy hun, ac mae'r hyn a ddywedasocho yn wir. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn yr ydych heb ei bwysleisio yw eich bod wedi clustnodi'r modd y mae'r arian hwnnw i gael ei wario. A ydych hefyd yn beirniadu ymchwilwyr Lawrence Bailey, arweinydd Llafur Cyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe, a rhai Syr Harry Jones, arweinydd Llafur Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru? Maent yn debyg yn eu beirmiadaeth: ni ddilynwyd proses briodol, ac nid ydych yn defnyddio'r arian i ostwng trethi cyngor. Yr ydych yn dynodi dibenion penodol ac yn dweud mai ar hynny y mae'n rhaid gwario'r arian. Mae hyn yn digwydd mewn cyfnod pan fo biliau'r dreth gyngor wedi codi, yn ystod y chwe blynedd y buoch mewn Llywodraeth, 70 y cant. Yn Lloegr, y cynnydd yw 60 y cant, sy'n ddigon drwg. Bu mwy o gynnydd yn y biliau yng Nghymru, ac eto yr ydych yn gwrthod cydnabod y dylai'r swm arian hwn gael ei ddefnyddio i ostwng biliau'r dreth gyngor er mwyn talwyr treth gyngor Cymru, a hwythau dan bwysau.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn ôl y ffigurau sydd gennyf fi, y cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor ar gyfer band D yng Nghymru yw 25 y cant, tra bu cynnydd o 30 y cant yn Lloegr dros yr un cyfnod. Felly mae'ch ffigurau'n gwbl anghywir yn hynny o beth. Pe byddech wedi gwyllo'r teledu neu wrando ar y radio yr wythnos diwethaf, byddech wedi clywed prif gyfarwyddwyr gwasanaethau cyhoeddus mewn gwahanol awdurdodau'n dweud eu bod yn falch bod yr arian hwn yn dod i law, gan dderbyn yn llwyr yr hyn a ddywedwyd yn y trafodaethau rhag-gyllidebol—er na allem ei ddarparu heb yr arian ychwanegol hwn—am y taer angen am arian ychwanegol ar gyfer gwasanaethau awdurdodau lleol i'r henoed. Mae Cymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru wedi ysgrifennu llythyr agored atom bellach, gan ddweud mor falch ydyw ynghylch yr arian

discussions with us, but also because—to refer to the problems in the closing months of this financial year—there is a £13 million overspend in social services, children's services, and services for the elderly. That is not the best of starts as we go into the next financial year. Our decision has been widely welcomed. We did not have the option of distributing the money as England is doing, without ring-fencing, because Gordon Brown made his statement on the same day as we had voted through the revenue support grant settlement, and you cannot have two revenue support grant settlements.

ychwanegol hwn, nid yn unig am ei fod yn ateb yr apêl a wnaed yn y trafodaethau rhaggyllidebol â ni, ond hefyd—gan gyfeirio at y problemau ym misoedd olaf y flwyddyn ariannol hon—gan fod gorwariant o £13 miliwn ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol, gwasanaethau i blant, a gwasanaethau i'r henoed. Nid hwnnw yw'r dechrau gorau y gellid ei gael wrth inni fynd i'r flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. Mae ein penderfyniad wedi'i groesawu gan lawer. Ni allem ddewis dosbarthu'r arian fel y gwnaiff Lloegr, heb ei glustnodi, gan fod Gordon Brown wedi gwneud ei ddatganiad ef ar yr un diwrnod ag yr oeddem ni wedi pleidleisio o blaid setliad y grant cynnal refeniw, ac ni ellir cael dau setliad ar y grant cynnal refeniw.

Grantiau Dysgu'r Cynulliad Assembly Learning Grants

Q2 The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): Will the First Minister make a statement on increasing awareness among further education students of their eligibility for Assembly learning grants? (OAQ30907)

The First Minister: Following a promising start to the Assembly learning grant scheme in its pilot year, 2002-03, efforts have been concentrated on encouraging greater take-up among students on further education courses. We have particularly focused on supporting the work of FE colleges to promote the scheme locally through publicity material, display stands and local advertising.

Michael German: We know that from the current position, but since the Christmas recess we also know that Charles Clarke has announced increased funding for England in the Higher Education Bill. As a result of that, and the discredited Barnett formula—Joel Barnett himself asked during the Christmas break for his name to be taken off the formula; and it is so discredited that perhaps we ought to heed that request—we will get some money. How much money will we get through the Barnett formula as a result of the Higher Education Bill? Can you guarantee that that money will go into student support and into supporting the further and higher education sector, and that it will not meet the

C2 Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am godi ymwybyddiaeth ymhlith myfyrwyr addysg bellach eu bod yn gymwys i dderbyn grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad? (OAQ30907)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ar ôl y dechrau addawol a gafodd cynllun grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad yn ei flwyddyn ragbrofol, 2002-03, ymdrechwyd yn bennaf i annog rhagor o fyfyrwyr ar gyrсияu addysg bellach i'w derbyn. Yr ydym wedi canolbwyntio'n benodol ar hybu'r gwaith a wnaiff colegau addysg bellach i hyrwyddo'r cynllun yn lleol drwy ddeunydd cyhoeddusrwydd, stondinau arddangos a hysbysebu'n lleol.

Michael German: Gwyddom am y sefyllfa bresennol, ond ers toriad y Nadolig gwyddom hefyd fod Charles Clarke wedi cyhoeddi mwy o gyllid ar gyfer Lloegr yn y Mesur Addysg Uwch. O ganlyniad i hynny, ac i'r fformiwla Barnett wrthbrofedig—gofynnodd Joel Barnett ei hun yn ystod toriad y Nadolig am gael tynnu ei enw oddi ar y fformiwla; ac mae wedi'i gwrthbrofi i'r fath raddau fel y dylem wrando ar y cais hwnnw, o bosibl—cawn ryw faint o arian. Pa faint o arian a gawn drwy fformiwla Barnett o ganlyniad i'r Mesur Addysg Uwch? A allwch warantu yr aiff yr arian hwnnw tuag at gymorth i fyfyrwyr a chynnal y sector addysg bellach ac uwch, ac na fydd yn rhannu'r un dynged

same fate as the grant regime, given the £20 million cut in the grant regime that we see in the coming financial year?

The First Minister: I am not aware of any effect on the further education take-up of Assembly learning grants arising out of Charles Clarke's announcement, though I stand to be corrected on that. To correct—if it is a correction—what you said about Joel Barnett, contrary to the reports that appeared in some of the Welsh media, Joel Barnett has made it clear that the reason that he wants his name removed from the formula is because he thinks that the formula is unfair to the English regions. That makes it clear that he does not think that an objective assessment of needs in the Celtic areas of the United Kingdom would result in more money for those regions. Rather, he thinks that it would result in more money for the English regions. I take it that you have seen those reports, which are contrary to the impression given by some comments made in Wales.

In relation to the financial impact on Wales of the Second Reading of the Higher Education Bill later this month, you will have to be patient for the two and a half weeks until we get the Bill. I have not been in this position before of not knowing whether there will be further tweekings to the Bill, and therefore it would not be sensible at this stage, with two and a half weeks to go before the Second Reading, to begin bandying figures about. Changes may be made between the First Reading and the Second Reading, so it would not be good for us to speculate now.

Helen Mary Jones: On the awareness of eligibility for Assembly learning grants, I recently attended a public meeting where Labour councillors stated categorically that grants are not available to further education students. That suggests that you have some work to do in explaining the grants to your party, and also that your current publicity strategy is failing. What will your Government do to ensure that further education students are aware of their eligibility? What will you do about the inflexibility of the system, which makes it difficult for students to apply for grants even

â'r gyfundrefn grantiau, yng ngolwg y toriad o £20 miliwn yn y gyfundrefn grantiau a welwn yn y flwyddyn ariannol sydd i ddod?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o ddim yng nghyhoeddiad Charles Clarke a fydd yn effeithio ar y nifer mewn addysg bellach a fydd yn derbyn grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad, er fy mod yn barod i gael fy nghywiro ar hynny. Er mwyn cywiro—os cywiriad ydyw—yr hyn a ddywedasoich am Joel Barnett, yn groes i'r adroddiadau a welwyd yn rhai o'r cyfryngau yng Nghymru, mae Joel Barnett wedi egluro mai'r rheswm y mae am i'w enw gael ei dynnu oddi ar y fformiwla yw ei fod yn credu bod y fformiwla'n annheg â rhanbarthau Lloegr. Dengys hynny nad yw'n credu y byddai asesiad gwrthrychol o anghenion rhannau Celtaidd y Deyrnas Unedig yn arwain at roi rhagor o arian i'r rhanbarthau hynny. Yn hytrach, mae'n credu y byddai'n arwain at roi mwy o arian i ranbarthau Lloegr. Cymeraf eich bod wedi gweld yr adroddiadau hynny, sy'n groes i'r argraff a roddir gan rai sylwadau a wnaed yng Nghymru.

Mewn cysylltiad â'r effaith ariannol a geir ar Gymru yn sgîl Ail Ddarlleniad y Mesur Addysg Uwch yn ddiweddarach y mis hwn, bydd yn rhaid ichi fod yn amyneddgar am y pythefnos a hanner hyd nes y cawn y Mesur. Ni fûm yn y sefyllfa hon o'r blaen o fod heb wybod a fydd mân newidiadau pellach i'r Mesur ac, felly, ni fyddai'n ddoeth dechrau cyfnewid ffigurau rhyngom ar yr adeg hon, a pythefnos a hanner i fynd tan yr Ail Ddarlleniad. Efallai y gwneir newidiadau rhwng y Darlleniad Cyntaf a'r Ail, felly ni fyddai'n beth da inni ddyfalu'n awr.

Helen Mary Jones: Ynghylch yr ymwybyddiaeth o gymhwyster i dderbyn grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad, bûm mewn cyfarfod cyhoeddus yn ddiweddar lle y dywedodd cynghorwyr Llafur yn bendant nad yw grantiau ar gael i fyfyrwyr addysg bellach. Mae hynny'n awgrymu bod gennych waith i'w wneud o ran egluro'r grantiau i'ch plaid, a hefyd fod eich strategaeth gyhoeddusrwydd bresennol yn methu. Beth a wnaiff eich Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod myfyrwyr addysg bellach yn gwybod am eu cymhwysedd? Beth a wnewch ynghylch anhyblygrwydd y system, sy'n peri ei bod yn

when they know that they are eligible for them?

The First Minister: It was not helpful that the further education side of Assembly learning grants commenced with a hue and cry as to whether the grant disqualified students from receiving certain benefits. We solved that problem in the end, but it took a long time. Many students on benefits, particularly mature students and women with parental responsibilities, believed that they were not eligible for Assembly learning grants even when they were. We have now overcome that and the system is reasonably clear, although it depends on the student welfare advisers of all further education colleges across Wales giving good welfare advice. I recently discussed that point in a meeting at Coleg Llandrillo.

Applications by further education students for Assembly learning grants are up 10 per cent this year compared with last year. That figure is not wonderful, but it is healthy. When we get the next batch of data on this—at the end of March, I think—I will write to you, Helen Mary, and place a copy of the letter in the Library. Further education is far more flexible than higher education, with three intakes of students a year, so we can continually update our figures. I hope that they will show a further increase on that 10 per cent indicated in September.

David Davies: Regardless of whether Assembly learning grants are working, do you agree that the principle behind them is that students from poorer backgrounds should not be prevented from attending university? Do you also agree that it is disgraceful that your Westminster colleagues are trying to do just that with the new Higher Education Bill? Will you condemn that Bill, which seeks to prevent students from poorer backgrounds from accessing their right to higher education?

The First Minister: That was an unexpectedly Marxist slant on higher

anodd i fyfyrwyr ymgeisio am grantiau hyd yn oed pan wyddant eu bod yn gymwys i'w cael?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oedd o gymorth bod y rhan o gynllun grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad a oedd yn ymwneud ag addysg bellach wedi dechrau gyda ffraeo ynghylch a oedd y grant yn peri i fyfyrwyr fod yn anghymwys i dderbyn rhai budd-daliadau. Gwnaethom ddatrys y broblem honno yn y pen draw, ond cymerodd amser hir. Yr oedd llawer o fyfyrwyr sy'n derbyn budd-daliadau, yn enwedig myfyrwyr hŷn a menywod a chanddynt gyfrifoldeb fel rhieni, yn credu nad oeddent yn gymwys i dderbyn grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad hyd yn oed os oeddent. Yr ydym wedi datrys hynny bellach ac mae'r system yn weddol glir, er ei bod yn dibynnu ar allu'r cynghorwyr ar les myfyrwyr yn holl golegau addysg bellach Cymru i roi cyngor da ar fudd-daliadau. Trafodais y pwynt hwnnw'n ddiweddar mewn cyfarfod yng Ngholeg Llandrillo.

Mae nifer y ceisiadau gan fyfyrwyr addysg bellach am grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad yn 10 y cant yn uwch eleni o'i gymharu â'r llynedd. Nid yw'r ffigur hwnnw'n wych, ond mae'n iach. Pan gawn y swp nesaf o ddata ar hyn—ar ddiwedd Mawrth, yr wyf yn credu—ysgrifennaf atoch, Helen Mary, a gosod copi o'r llythyr yn y Llyfrgell. Mae addysg bellach yn fwy hyblyg o lawer nag addysg uwch, gan fod myfyrwyr yn cael eu derbyn dair gwaith y flwyddyn, felly gallwn ddiweddarau ein ffigurau'n barhaus. Gobeithiaf y byddant yn dangos cynnydd pellach ar y 10 y cant hwnnw a ddangoswyd ym mis Medi.

David Davies: Heb ystyried a yw grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad yn llwyddo ai peidio, a ydych yn cytuno mai'r egwyddor sy'n sail iddynt yw na ddylai myfyrwyr o gefndiroedd tlotach gael eu hatal rhag mynd i brifysgol? A ydych hefyd yn cytuno ei bod yn warthus mai hynny'n union y mae'ch cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan yn ceisio ei wneud drwy'r Mesur Addysg Uwch newydd? A wneuch gollfarnu'r Mesur hwnnw, sy'n ceisio atal myfyrwyr o gefndiroedd tlotach rhag arfer eu hawl i gael addysg uwch?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oedd honno'n ymagwedd annisgwyl o Farcsaidd at addysg

education from you, David. I know that it is difficult for you but, if you could contain your impatience for another two and a half weeks, we could then consider the Bill when it has received its Second Reading. Perhaps I should say if and when it has received its Second Reading, and perhaps with further tweaking. To be honest, I do not know; I have never been in this position before. Normally, one would proceed on the basis that a Government's Bills will be passed if it has a majority, but there are unusual circumstances regarding this Bill, as I have referred to previously.

The changes that were offered during Charles Clarke's First Reading statement took away much of your criticism about students with poorer backgrounds, and I am particularly pleased that, to a large extent, Westminster has followed the principle set out in our Assembly learning grants, which we have now funded for some 18 months.

uwch ar eich rhan chi, David. Gwn eich bod yn ei chael yn anodd, ond os gallech ffrwyno'ch diffyg amynedd am bythefnos a hanner eto, gallem wedyn ystyried y Mesur ar ôl yr Ail Ddarlleniad arno. Efallai y dylwn ddweud os a phan gaiff ei Ail Ddarlleniad, ac efallai gyda mân newidiadau pellach. A dweud y gwir, nid wyf yn gwybod; ni fŷm yn y sefyllfa hon o'r blaen. Fel arfer, byddai rhywun yn mynd yn ei flaen gan gymryd y caiff Mesurau Llywodraeth eu derbyn os oes ganddi fwyaf, ond mae amgylchiadau anarferol ynghylch y Mesur hwn, yr wyf wedi cyfeirio atynt o'r blaen.

Mae'r newidiadau a gynigiwyd yn ystod datganiad Charles Clarke yn y Darlleniad Cyntaf wedi ateb llawer o'ch beirniadaeth ynghylch myfyrwyr o gefndiroedd tlotach, ac yr wyf yn arbennig o falch bod San Steffan wedi dilyn, i raddau helaeth, yr egwyddor a welir yng ngrantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad, yr ydym wedi'u hariannu bellach ers tua 18 mis.

Llywodraeth Leol Local Government

C3 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am sut y bydd y £22 miliwn ychwanegol a gyhoeddwyd ar gyfer llywodraeth leol fis Tachwedd diwethaf yn cael ei ddyrannu? (OAQ30909)

Y Prif Weinidog: Dyna ddau gamsyniad gennych, Dai. Ym mis Rhagfyr y cyhoeddwyd yr arian, nid ym mis Tachwedd, ac £20 miliwn oedd y cyfanswm, nid £22 miliwn. Bu ichi anghofio am y £2 filiwn a glustnodwyd ar gyfer gwasanaethau arenol ar draws Cymru, yn enwedig yn yr ardaloedd lle nad oes dialysis arenol ar gael yn gyson dair gwaith yr wythnos. Bu inni gyhoeddi y bydd £19.5 miliwn er mwyn cynyddu capasiti i ddarparu gofal i bobl yn eu cartrefi a'u cadw yn eu cymunedau. Hefyd caiff £0.5 miliwn ei ychwanegu at y grant amddifadedd. Mae'r arian yn helpu'r ardaloedd a'r cymunedau hynny gyda'r problemau cymdeithasol mwyaf difrifol.

David Lloyd: A ydych yn rhannu siom llywodraeth leol na chaiff yr arian ei ddefnyddio i atal y cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor, ac na fydd llywodraeth leol yn gallu pennu ei blaenoriaethau ei hun?

Q3 David Lloyd: Will the First Minister make a statement on how the additional £22 million announced last November for local government will be allocated? (OAQ30909)

The First Minister: You made two mistakes there, Dai. The money was announced in December, not November, and the amount was £20 million, not £22 million. You have forgotten about the £2 million allocated to renal services across Wales, particularly in those areas where renal dialysis is not routinely available three times a week. We announced that £19.5 million would go towards increasing the capacity to provide care for people in their homes, allowing them to remain in their communities. Additionally, £0.5 million will be added to the deprivation grant. The money will help those areas and communities with the most serious social problems.

David Lloyd: Do you share the disappointment of local government that the money will not be used to prevent increases in council tax, and that it will not be able to set its own priorities?

2.20 p.m.

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddwch wedi gweld yr hyn a ddywedodd Hugh Gardner, pennaeth gwasanaethau cymdeithasol Dinas a Sir Abertawe, a Tony Garthwaite, pennaeth gwasanaethau cymdeithasol Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, a groesawodd y ffordd y mae'r arian wedi ei ddarparu. Drwy gyd-ddigwyddiad, gwnaeth y Canghellor ei ddatganiad rhag-gyllidebol, a phleidleisiodd y Cynulliad ar 10 Rhagfyr o blaid ein cynnig i roi arian heb ei glustnodi i awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. Nid yw ein trefniadau statudol yn caniatáu inni wneud dau adroddiad ar gyfer ariannu llywodraeth leol, felly drwy grant arbennig yn unig yr oedd modd inni ddarparu'r arian i lywodraeth leol. Yr ydym wedi darparu pob ceiniog y byddai llywodraeth leol wedi ei derbyn dan y system sy'n bodoli yn Lloegr, ond yr ydym wedi ei darparu yn yr unig ffordd yr oedd yn bosibl inni wneud hynny, sef drwy grant arbennig. Dylech fod wedi gallu darllen am y croeso sydd wedi ei roi i hynny gan gyfarwyddwyr gwasanaethau cymdeithasol Cymru.

Brian Gibbons: Would you not agree that, as this money is targeted at core provision in a main service area, it will provide local authorities with the necessary headroom to adjust their budget priorities in other expenditure areas? That includes council tax levying.

The First Minister: Yes. Some authorities are receiving a substantial amount through the deprivation grant—I believe that it is as high as 15 per cent in Merthyr Tydfil, 12 per cent in Blaenau Gwent, reasonably free of any controls, and 6 per cent in Neath Port Talbot—although the average figure is 2.5 per cent. The idea that all English local authorities will use this to reduce council tax bills is wrong. Gordon Brown said nothing about reducing council tax bills in his statement to the House of Commons. He said that it should be free of ring-fencing, but he said nothing about damping or reducing council tax increases or about reducing existing council tax levels. He said that it should meet the needs and concerns of council tax payers. By strange coincidence of

The First Minister: You will have seen the comments made by Hugh Gardner, the City and County of Swansea's head of social services, and Tony Garthwaite, Bridgend County Borough Council's head of social services, welcoming the way in which the money has been allocated. By coincidence, the Chancellor made his pre-budget statement on 10 December, the same day on which the Assembly voted in favour of our proposal to provide money which was not ring-fenced to local authorities for the next financial year. Our statutory arrangements do not allow us to make two reports on local government funding, so we could only provide the funding for local government by way of a special grant. We have provided every penny that local government would have received under the English system, but have provided it in the only way open for us, namely by special grant. You should have been able to read about the welcome given to that by directors of social services in Wales.

Brian Gibbons: Oni chytunwch, gan fod yr arian hwn wedi'i dargedu ar ddarpariaeth graidd mewn prif faes gwasanaeth, y bydd yn rhoi i awdurdodau lleol y cyfle y mae arnynt ei angen i newid blaenoriaethau eu cyllidebau mewn meysydd gwariant eraill? Mae hynny'n cynnwys casglu'r dreth gyngor.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cytunaf. Mae rhai awdurdodau'n cael swm sylweddol drwy'r grant amddifadedd—credaf ei fod cyn uchod â 15 y cant ym Merthyr Tudful, 12 y cant ym Mlaenau Gwent, a hynny heb lawer o reolaeth, a 6 y cant yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot—er mai 2.5 y cant yw'r ffigur cyfartalog. Camsyniad yw credu y bydd yr holl awdurdodau lleol yn Lloegr yn defnyddio hyn i ostwng biliau treth gyngor. Ni ddywedodd Gordon Brown ddim am ostwng biliau treth gyngor yn ei ddatganiad i Dŷ'r Cyffredin. Dywedodd na ddylai gael ei glustnodi, ond ni ddywedodd ddim am leddfu neu leihau codiadau yn y dreth gyngor nac am ostwng lefelau presennol y dreth gyngor. Dywedodd y dylai fodloni anghenion ac ymateb i bryderon talwyr y dreth gyngor.

dates, we had brought forward our revenue support statement by six weeks at the request of local government, and the pre-budget statement was about a fortnight late, so they happened on the same day. The only way in which local government could have been given this additional £20.056 million from the Assembly was by way of a special grant report. This emerged in the pre-budget discussions as the key area of crisis, and has since been confirmed by analysis of overspend in the present budget as the financial year draws towards its end.

Michael German: Could you bring some clarity to this issue, which has received a huge amount of disapprobation from Labour members of local authorities throughout Wales? Last week, Sue Essex, the Finance Minister, announced the ring-fencing of new money for councils to tackle bed-blocking. She said that she did not think that there was any more pressing issue in Wales. Within hours of that announcement, the Labour leader of Cardiff County Council said that Cardiff did not have a problem with bedblocking and that the council would be 'creative' in its use of the money. Within minutes, your Deputy Minister, John Griffiths, confirmed that the money was not ring-fenced for bed-blocking, almost condoning Russell Goodway's 'creativity'. Given that the policy changed so much in a day, could you now tell us what the policy is a week further on?

The First Minister: If you read the press release, the policy is clear. All you have to do is read it, rather than listen to the Radio Wales version. Radio Wales had its own agenda and decided that this was to do with reducing waiting lists in the health service. There are three references to delayed transfers of care in about a 150-word press release; there are also references to adapting people's houses, so that they do not have to go into hospital, and to nursing home fees. For some reason, Radio Wales chose not to focus on that, and some rose to the bait and fell into the trap of believing Radio Wales's version of the press release instead of reading it. Similarly, perhaps some did not go back to

Drwy gyd-ddigwyddiad rhyfedd rhwng dyddiadau, yr oeddem wedi rhoi ein datganiad ar gymorth refeniw chwe wythnos yn gynharach ar gais llywodraeth leol, ac yr oedd y datganiad rhag-gyllidebol tua phythefnos yn hwyr, felly cafwyd y ddau ar yr un diwrnod. Yr unig ffordd y gallai'r Cynulliad fod wedi rhoi'r £20.056 miliwn ychwanegol hwn i lywodraeth leol oedd drwy adroddiad grant arbennig. Daeth y maes hwn i'r amlwg yn y trafodaethau rhag-gyllidebol fel yr un lle'r oedd yr argyfwng mwyaf, a chadarnhawyd hynny wedyn drwy ddadansoddi'r gorwariant yn y gyllideb bresennol wrth i'r flwyddyn ariannol dynnu tua'i therfyn.

Michael German: A allech egluro ychydig ar y mater hwn, a gollfarnwyd yn fawr iawn gan aelodau Llafur mewn awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru? Yr wythnos diwethaf, cyhoeddodd Sue Essex, y Gweinidog Cyllid, y byddai'n clustnodi arian newydd fel y gallai cynghorau ymdrin â blocio gwelyau. Dywedodd na chredai fod yr un mater arall yng Nghymru a alwai mor daer am sylw. O fewn oriau i'r cyhoeddiad hwnnw, dywedodd arweinydd Llafur Cyngor Sir Caerdydd nad oedd problem yng Nghaerdydd o ran blocio gwelyau ac y byddai'r cyngor yn defnyddio'r arian yn greadigol. O fewn munudau, cadarnhaodd eich Dirprwy Weinidog, John Griffiths, nad oedd yr arian wedi'i glustnodi ar gyfer blocio gwelyau, gan bron esgusodi creadigrwydd Russell Goodway. Gan fod y polisi wedi newid cymaint mewn un diwrnod, a allwch ddweud wrthym yn awr beth yw'r polisi wedi i wythnos fynd heibio?

Y Prif Weinidog: Os darllenwch y datganiad i'r wasg, gwelwch fod y polisi'n glir. Nid oes ond rhaid ichi ddarllen hwnnw, yn hytrach na gwrando ar fersiwn Radio Wales. Yr oedd Radio Wales yn dilyn ei agenda ei hun ac wedi penderfynu bod hyn yn ymwneud â lleihau rhestrau aros yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae tri chyfeiriad at oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal mewn datganiad i'r wasg o tua 150 o eiriau; mae cyfeiriadau hefyd at addasu tai pobl, fel nad oes rhaid iddynt fynd i'r ysbyty, ac at ffioedd cartrefi nyrsio. Am ryw reswm, dewisodd Radio Wales beidio â chanolbwyntio ar hynny, a chododd rhai at yr abwyd a syrthio i'r fagl o gredu fersiwn Radio Wales o'r datganiad i'r wasg yn

their county treasurers and ask whether they could have had this money in any way other than by a special grant report. What John Griffiths said is true. If an authority is or was planning an increase in local authority services for the elderly, they can attribute the additional money that they will receive—£2 million, say, in Cardiff—to the increase already planned. The council tax payers in Cardiff will therefore get an extra £2 million-worth of services for the elderly without it costing them a penny. That has to be good for the council tax payers of Cardiff, as I am sure that you would agree.

Michael German: If I were clear on the matter, I would be pleased to help you, First Minister. As far as I can see, you are saying that local authorities can be creative with their money, do what they want, turn it around and take money from one pot and put it in another. In which case, would it not have been far better to say to local authorities in the first place 'here is some extra money; it is on the table for you and can be devoted to resources as you see fit, in line with local circumstances'? This would have meant that we would not have seen so many Labour local authority leaders standing up and saying that this was not a problem for them and that they would prefer to use the money to deal with local circumstances. I am sure that that was somewhat damaging to you. The point is that local government is elected, and it should be allowed to do what it wants to do. You, First Minister, must intervene in this difficult situation in which you find yourself and tell local authorities that the money is there to be used in the way in which they consider to be best for their areas.

The First Minister: I am not in any difficulty on this issue. Indeed, one of the local authority leaders to which you refer has already resigned. I made it clear earlier that if there is an increase in planned budgets for elderly care services, this money can be attributed towards that increase; likewise in England. The money does not have to be used to reduce council tax or damp council

hytrach na'i ddarllen. Yn yr un modd, efallai nad aeth rhai'n ôl at y trysoryddion sir a gofyn a allent fod wedi cael yr arian hwn mewn modd heblaw drwy adroddiad grant arbennig. Mae'r hyn a ddywedodd John Griffiths yn wir. Os yw, neu os oedd, awdurdod yn bwriadu cynyddu gwasanaethau awdurdod lleol ar gyfer yr henoed, gallant briodoli'r arian ychwanegol a dderbyniant—£2 filiwn, dyweder, yng Nghaerdydd—i'r cynnydd a gynlluniwyd eisoes. Gan hynny, bydd talwyr y dreth gyngor yng Nghaerdydd yn cael gwerth £2 filiwn o wasanaethau i'r henoed yn ychwanegol heb geiniog o gost iddynt hwy. Mae hynny'n sicr o fod yn beth da i dalwyr y dreth gyngor yng Nghaerdydd, fel y cytunech, yr wyf yn siŵr.

Michael German: Pe byddwn yn gweld y mater yn glir, byddwn yn falch o'ch helpu, Brif Weinidog. Hyd y gwelaf fi, yr ydych yn dweud y caiff awdurdodau lleol ddefnyddio eu harian yn greadigol, gwneud yr hyn a fyddant, ei droi ar ei ben a chymryd arian o un pot a'i roi mewn un arall. Os felly, onid gwell o lawer fyddai dweud wrth awdurdodau lleol yn y lle cyntaf 'dyma ychydig o arian ychwanegol; mae ar y bwrdd yn barod i chi a gellir ei neilltuo i adnoddau fel y gwelwch orau, yn unol â'r amgylchiadau lleol'? Drwy wneud hynny, ni fyddem wedi gweld cynifer o arweinwyr awdurdodau lleol Llafur yn sefyll ar eu traed ac yn dweud nad oedd hyn yn peri problem iddynt hwy ac y byddai'n well ganddynt ddefnyddio'r arian i ddelio ag amgylchiadau lleol. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod hynny wedi gwneud ychydig o ddrwg i chi. Y pwynt yw bod llywodraeth leol wedi'i hethol, ac y dylid gadael iddi wneud yr hyn a fyn. Brif Weinidog, rhaid ichi ymyrryd yn y sefyllfa anodd hon yr ydych ynddi a dweud wrth awdurdodau lleol fod yr arian ar gael i'w ddefnyddio yn y modd a welont orau er mwyn eu hardaloedd.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf mewn unrhyw drafferthion ar y mater hwn. Yn wir, mae un arweinydd awdurdod lleol y cyfeiriwch ato wedi ymddiswyddo eisoes. Eglurais yn gynharach, os oes cynnydd yn y cyllidebau arfaethedig ar gyfer gwasanaethau gofal i'r henoed, y gellir priodoli'r arian hwn i'r cynnydd hwnnw; felly y mae yn Lloegr hefyd. Nid oes rhaid defnyddio'r arian i

tax increases. Gordon Brown has said no such thing. He did not say that the money should be used to damp increases; he said that the money should not be ring-fenced. We did not have that option because of the coincidence of 10 December. We had already passed the revenue support grant settlement in Wales and, by statute, it is not possible to pass two settlements each year. Therefore, the only way in which we could give the money to local government was through a special grant report. Statements made by directors of social services throughout Wales, via the Association of Directors of Social Services, particularly those of Hugh Gardner in Swansea and Tony Garthwaite in Bridgend, make it clear that this measure is welcome. They also confirm what I and Sue Essex said in pre-budget discussions, namely that this was the pinchpoint identified by the Welsh Local Government Association, which we were unable to fund the first time round. The budget overspend in the final months of this financial year has confirmed everything that we said as well as the correctness of our decision.

Leighton Andrews: Do you agree that this extra money is welcome, particularly by the hard-pressed council tax payers of Rhondda Cynon Taf, who will at least have the certainty that this money will be spent on front-line services rather than being squandered on spaced-out *Star Trek*-style seminars for senior managers?

The First Minister: I will not refer to *Star Trek* seminars for senior managers, but it is important that this money is spent on key front-line services identified by local government as the pinchpoint in the budgeting procedures that we were unable to fund the first time round. However, I am pleased that we are able to provide funding the second time round as a result of the additional money we received from Gordon Brown.

Glyn Davies: When the Finance Minister presented her budget last year, we were told that it was based on a thorough review of all

ostwng y dreth gyngor neu liniaru codiadau yn y dreth gyngor. Ni ddywedodd Gordon Brown ddim byd o'r fath. Ni ddywedodd y dylid defnyddio'r arian i liniaru codiadau; dywedodd na ddylid clustnodi'r arian. Nid oedd y dewis hwnnw ar gael i ni oherwydd y cyd-ddigwyddiad ar 10 Rhagfyr. Yr oeddem eisoes wedi derbyn setliad y grant cynnal refeniw yng Nghymru ac, yn ôl y gyfraith, nid oes modd derbyn dau setliad bob blwyddyn. Gan hynny, yr unig fodd y gallem roi'r arian i lywodraeth leol oedd drwy adroddiad grant arbennig. Mae datganiadau a wnaed gan gyfarwyddwyr gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ledled Cymru, drwy Gymdeithas y Cyfarwyddwyr Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, yn enwedig y rhai gan Hugh Gardner yn Abertawe a Tony Garthwaite ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, yn dangos bod croeso i'r mesur hwn. Maent hefyd yn cadarnhau'r hyn a ddywedais i a Sue Essex mewn trafodaethau rhag-gyllidebol, sef mai hwn oedd y gwasgbwynt a nododd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, nad oeddem yn gallu darparu cyllid ar ei gyfer y tro cyntaf. Mae'r gorwariant yn y gyllideb ym misoedd olaf y flwyddyn ariannol hon wedi cadarnhau popeth a ddywedasom yn ogystal â chywirdeb ein penderfyniad.

Leighton Andrews: A ydych yn cytuno bod croeso i'r arian ychwanegol hwn, yn enwedig ymysg talwyr y dreth gyngor yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, a hwythau o dan bwysau, a fydd o leiaf yn cael bod yn sicr y caiff yr arian hwn ei wario ar wasanaethau yn y rheng flaen yn hytrach na'i wastraffu ar seminarau hurt yn seiliedig ar *Star Trek* ar gyfer uwch reolwyr?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni chyfeiriaf at seminarau *Star Trek* ar gyfer uwch reolwyr, ond mae'n bwysig i'r arian hwn gael ei wario ar y gwasanaethau rheng flaen allweddol y nododd llywodraeth leol eu bod yn peri gwasgbwynt yn y gweithdrefnau cyllidebu, nad oeddem yn gallu eu cyllido y tro cyntaf. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch ein bod yn gallu darparu cyllid ar yr ail gyfle o ganlyniad i'r arian ychwanegol a gawsom gan Gordon Brown.

Glyn Davies: Pan gyflwynodd y Gweinidog Cyllid ei chyllideb y llynedd, dywedwyd wrthym ei bod yn seiliedig ar adolygiad

competing demands. What happened in social services to such an extent that she had to decide that the entire £19.5 million to which you refer had to be spent in one specific area, leading to an increase in the hypothecation that you wanted to see reduced?

The First Minister: It is important for people to understand that there is far less hypothecation in Wales than in England. By and large, we do not ring-fence money proportionately as much as the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister—our equivalent for this purpose—to fund local government in England, or as much as the Department for Education and Skills to fund teachers' pay and teachers' thresholds. When the additional money came through on 10 December, we reran the budget exercise and asked what did not quite make the cut in the budget round. In local government, a requirement of £100 million was identified to deal with unfunded social services pressures, primarily in the area of elderly care. In terms of health, we looked at the renal services that we had been unable to fund and, in areas where there are only two guaranteed dialysis sessions per week, at upgrading the service to three sessions per week, as is the standard in other parts of Wales. We could not do this the last time, but we were then able to ask what would we have funded had we had the extra £22 million in September. We will now provide that funding.

trwyadl o'r holl ofynion a oedd yn gofyn sylw. Beth a ddigwyddodd mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i'r fath raddau fel ei bod wedi gorfod penderfynu gwario'r cwbl o'r £19.5 miliwn y cyfeiriwch ato mewn un maes penodol, gan beri mwy o glustnodi yn hytrach na llai, fel yr oeddech yn dymuno?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n bwysig bod pobl yn deall bod llai o lawer o glustnodi yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr. At ei gilydd, nid ydym yn clustnodi cymaint o arian ar gyfartaledd ag y mae Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog—yr hyn sy'n cyfateb i ni i'r diben hwn—i gyllido llywodraeth leol yn Lloegr, na chymaint ag y mae'r Adran Addysg a Sgiliau i gyllido cyflogau athrawon a throthwyon athrawon. Pan ddaeth yr arian newydd drwodd ar 10 Rhagfyr, bu inni ail-wneud ymarferiad y gyllideb a gofyn beth a oedd wedi methu â chyrraedd y brig o fymryn yng nghylch y gyllideb. Mewn llywodraeth leol, canfuwyd bod angen £100 miliwn i ddelio â phwysau ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol a oedd heb eu cyllido, a hynny ym maes gofal am yr henoed yn bennaf. O ran iechyd, gwnaethom ystyried y gwasanaethau arenol nad oeddem wedi gallu eu cyllido ac, mewn ardaloedd lle nad oes ond gwarant o ddau sesiwn dialysis yr wythnos, gwella'r gwasanaeth fel bod tri sesiwn yr wythnos, sef yr hyn sy'n arferol mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Ni allem wneud hynny y tro diwethaf, ond gallem ofyn wedyn beth y byddem wedi'i gyllido pe bai'r £22 miliwn ychwanegol gennym mis Medi. Darparwn y cyllid hwnnw'n awr.

Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol Anti-social Behaviour

Q4 Lorraine Barrett: What action is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to tackle anti-social behaviour in Cardiff South and Penarth? (OAQ30904)

C4 Lorraine Barrett: Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn Ne Caerdydd a Phenarth? (OAQ30904)

2.30 p.m.

The First Minister: This applies to the whole of Wales, but has a particular resonance in Cardiff South and Penarth. The Assembly Government encourages community safety partnerships to include

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hyn yn berthnasol i Gymru gyfan, ond mae'n taro tant penodol yn Ne Caerdydd a Phenarth. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn annog partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol i gynnwys camau yn erbyn

action on anti-social behaviour in their strategic planning. Registered social landlords also have a responsibility to address anti-social behaviour; the Assembly helps them to do so by funding a range of innovative housing management projects. Around 19 acceptable behaviour contracts have been issued in Cardiff; 63 anti-social-behaviour orders have been issued throughout Wales. However, I do not have the figures for Cardiff and the Vale with me; I will write to you on those. After a slow start, ASBOs and ABCs are now being used more readily by magistrates.

Lorraine Barrett: I welcome that response, First Minister, but one form of anti-social behaviour that continues to plague communities across Wales is drink driving. You will be aware that despite the Assembly's—[*Interruption.*] I am sorry, Presiding Officer, I cannot hear myself think.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I have noticed a tendency—I am not saying it happens exclusively on the opposition benches—to interrupt Members when they raise supplementary questions. I ask for all Members to be treated with the courtesy that they would expect themselves.

Lorraine Barrett: You will be aware, First Minister, that despite the Assembly's campaign to encourage people not to drink and drive during the Christmas and new year period, South Wales Police figures show that 45 per cent of all those found to be over the legal alcohol limit were under the age of 25. Will you consider extending this message throughout the year to all drivers, especially young drivers: if you are drinking, do not drive; if you are driving, do not drink?

The First Minister: That is vital, not just over the Christmas period, but over the whole year. I think that breathalysing is done automatically after every crash, but its use in circumstances other than a crash can be selective in terms of timing, location and the

ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn eu gwaith cynllunio strategol. Mae cyfrifoldeb gan landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig i ymdrin ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol hefyd; mae'r Cynulliad yn eu helpu i wneud hynny drwy gyllido amryw o brosiectau arloesol rheoli tai. Cyhoeddwyd tua 19 o gontractau ymddygiad derbyniol yng Nghaerdydd; cyhoeddwyd 63 o orchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ledled Cymru. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r ffigurau ar gyfer Caerdydd a'r Fro gennyf; ysgrifennaf atoch yn eu cylch. Ar ôl dechrau'n araf, mae gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a chontractau ymddygiad derbyniol yn cael eu defnyddio'n fwy parod gan ynadon erbyn hyn.

Lorraine Barrett: Croesawaf yr ymateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog, ond un math o ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol sy'n dal i flino cymunedau ledled Cymru yw yfed a gyrru. Byddwch yn ymwybodol, er bod y Cynulliad—[*Torri ar draws.*] Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Lywydd, ni allaf fy nghlywed fy hun yn meddwl.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf wedi sylwi ar duedd—ac nid wyf yn dweud mai dim ond ar feinciau'r gwrthbleidiau y digwydd hyn—i dorri ar draws Aelodau pan godant gwestiynau atodol. Gofynnaf am drin yr holl Aelodau â'r un cwrteisi ag a ddisgwylient hwythau.

Lorraine Barrett: Byddwch yn ymwybodol, Brif Weinidog, er gwaethaf ymgyrch y Cynulliad i annog pobl i beidio ag yfed a gyrru dros gyfnod y Nadolig a'r flwyddyn newydd, fod ffigurau Heddlu De Cymru yn dangos bod 45 y cant o'r rhai y cafwyd eu bod wedi mynd dros y terfyn cyfreithiol ar gyfer alcohol yn rhai o dan 25 oed. A wnewch ystyried parhau i gyfleu'r neges hon drwy gydol y flwyddyn i bawb sy'n gyrru, yn enwedig rhai ifanc: os ydych yn yfed, peidiwch â gyrru; os ydych yn gyrru, peidiwch ag yfed?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hynny'n hollbwysig, nid yn unig dros gyfnod y Nadolig, ond drwy gydol y flwyddyn. Credaf y rhoddir prawf anadl yn awtomatig ar ôl pob damwain, ond mai defnydd dewisol a wneir ohono mewn amgylchiadau heblaw damweiniau o ran

types of cars, drivers and so on. If we compare the 2002-03 festive period with that of 2003-04, the number of breathalyser tests taken after crashes decreased, which presumably indicates that there were fewer crashes, but the proportion of drivers that tested positive rose from 8.7 per cent to 8.9 per cent, which is not a healthy sign. It is important to get the message across that, if there is a crash, it could result in severe consequences. If you have a positive test under other circumstances—not after a crash—then you should consider that to be a healthy warning. One should try to maintain standards of good behaviour throughout the year with regard to drink driving.

Owen John Thomas: Llanrumney was prioritised for regeneration in 1997, and since then, between January 2000 and March 2004, I have been corresponding with Lynda Thorne, Cardiff County Council's cabinet member for social justice and regeneration. I have sought action from her on several serious matters. For example, a car was stolen, driven into the back of a house and set on fire and the family was forced to flee. There are three instances of stolen cars driven into woods and set alight, the last occurring just before Christmas. In addition, motorbikes are being driven through parkland dangerously and noisily late at night.

I have not received any positive responses from Lynda Thorne. She has refused to fence around the parkland. At what point will you get the Assembly Government to intervene and give the citizens of Llanrumney the protection that the local authority should guarantee them? It is currently showing total disinterest.

The First Minister: This matter is on the cusp between the responsibility of the police and the responsibility of the local authority. We do not directly control either body, but we have an interest through the crime reduction partnership areas. Some of your examples could be addressed by issuing ABCs, and others by issuing ASBOs. However, some relate to criminal behaviour and are therefore police matters, which could not be suitably addressed by either of those intermediate devices. I will ask our adviser

amseriad, lleoliad a'r mathau o geir a gyrwyr ac yn y blaen. Os cymharwn gyfnod y Nadolig yn 2002-03 â'r un yn 2003-04, bu gostyngiad yn nifer y profion anadl a roddwyd ar ôl damweiniau, a gellir cymryd bod hynny'n dangos bod llai o ddamweiniau, ond bu cynnydd yn y gyfran o yrwyr a gafodd ganlyniad cadarnhaol yn y prawf o 8.7 y cant i 8.9 y cant, ac nid yw hynny'n arwydd iach. Mae'n bwysig cyfleu'r neges y gallai'r canlyniadau fod yn ddifrifol os oes damwain. Os cewch ganlyniad cadarnhaol mewn prawf o dan amgylchiadau eraill—nid ar ôl damwain—dylech ystyried hynny'n rhybudd iach. Dylai rhywun geisio safonau ymddygiad da drwy gydol y flwyddyn mewn cysylltiad ag yfed a gyrru.

Owen John Thomas: Rhoddwyd blaenoriaeth i Lanrhyddi fel ardal i'w hadfywio yn 1997 ac, ers hynny, rhwng Ionawr 2000 a Mawrth 2004, bûm yn gohebu â Lynda Thorne, aelod cabinet Cyngor Sir Caerdydd dros gyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio. Ceisiais ganddi gymryd camau ar sawl mater difrifol. Er enghraifft, cafodd car ei ddwyn, ei yrru i gefn tŷ a'i roi ar dân, a gorfodwyd y teulu i ffoi. Cafwyd tri achos o yrru ceir a gafodd eu dwyn i goedwigoedd a'u rhoi ar dân, a'r diwethaf ohonynt ychydig cyn y Nadolig. Yn ogystal â hynny, caiff beiciau modur eu gyrru'n beryglus ac yn swnllyd drwy barcdir yn hwyr yn y nos.

Ni chefais unrhyw ymateb cadarnhaol gan Lynda Thorne. Gwrthododd godi ffens o amgylch y parcdir. Pa bryd y perwch i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ymyrryd a rhoi i ddinasyddion Lanrhyddi yr amddiffyniad y dylai'r awdurdod lleol ei warantu iddynt? Mae'n amlygu diffyg diddordeb llwyr ar hyn o bryd.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r mater hwn ar y ffin rhwng cyfrifoldeb yr heddlu a chyfrifoldeb yr awdurdod lleol. Nid oes gennym reolaeth uniongyrchol dros y naill gorff na'r llall, ond mae gennym fuddiant drwy ardaloedd y partneriaethau gostwng troseddu. Gellid ymdrin â rhai o'r enghreifftiau a roesoch drwy gyhoeddi contractau ymddygiad derbyniol, ac eraill drwy gyhoeddi gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai'n ymwneud ag ymddygiad troseddol ac maent felly'n

on community policing to advise myself or Edwina Hart, so that we can write to you on this matter.

faterion i'r heddlu, na ellid ymdrin yn briodol â hwy drwy'r naill na'r llall o'r offerynnau rhyngol hynny. Gofynnaf i'n cyngorydd ar blismona cymunedol fy nghynghori i neu Edwina Hart, fel y gallwn ysgrifennu atoch ar y mater hwn.

Blocio Gwelyau Bedblocking

C5 Ieuan Wyn Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am flocio gwelyau yng Nghymru? (OAQ30910)

Q5 Ieuan Wyn Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement about bedblocking in Wales? (OAQ30910)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae oedi yn y broses o drosglwyddo gofal yn digwydd o ganlyniad i nifer o ffactorau cydgysylltiedig sy'n effeithio ar y system iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol a'i heffeitholrwydd. Mae gwella perfformiad drwy sicrhau bod pobl yn cael eu symud i'r sefydliad gofal priodol ar yr adeg iawn yn elfen bwysig o'n gwaith yn dilyn yr adolygiad o iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, a gynghorwyd gan Derek Wanless.

The First Minister: Delayed transfers of care are the result of several interlinking issues affecting the health and social care system and its efficacy. Improving performance by ensuring that people are moved to the appropriate care setting at the right time is an important element of our work following the review of health and social care in Wales, advised by Derek Wanless.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr wyf wedi gwranddo'n ofalus ar eich atebion ynglŷn â'r ffordd yr ydych wedi penderfynu gwario'r £19.5 miliwn hwn yr ydych yn ei roi ar ffurf grant i lywodraeth leol. Efallai y dylem gymryd cam yn ôl a gofyn pam y mae Brown wedi rhoi'r arian ychwanegol yn y gyllideb ym mis Tachwedd. Gwnaeth hynny oherwydd bod y Llywodraeth yn Lloegr dan bwysau difrifol i roi mwy o arian i lywodraeth leol er mwyn sicrhau bod y codiadau yn y dreth gyngor yn gostwng. Dyna oedd y cyd-destun. Dywedodd Gordon Brown yn ei ddatganiad, ac fe gyfeiriasoch yn rhannol at hyn:

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I have listened carefully to your answers to the questions about the way in which you have decided to spend this £19.5 million that you are giving in grant form to local government. Perhaps we should take a step back and ask why Gordon Brown provided that additional money in the budget in November. He did so because the Government in England was under great pressure to provide more funding to local government to curb increases in council tax. That was the context. Gordon Brown said in his statement, and you have partially referred to this:

'from April 2004 also, I am now able to do more for local council tax payers: to allocate across the United Kingdom, free of ring-fencing, for local authorities as they set their budgets'.

o fis Ebrill 2004 hefyd, gallaf wneud rhagor yn awr dros dalwyr y dreth gyngor yn lleol: dyrannu ledled y Deyrnas Unedig, heb glustnodi, ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol wrth iddynt osod eu cyllidebau.

Pan glywodd awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru hynny, yr oeddent yn disgwyl y byddai'r arian ychwanegol yn cael ei ddarparu iddynt heb ei glustnodi, er mwyn iddynt gael ystyried, mewn blwyddyn etholiad—gyda nifer ohonynt yn arweinwyr cynghorau Llafur—ostwng y dreth gyngor. Gwyddoch hynny, yr wyf innau'n gwybod hynny, ac

When local authorities in Wales heard that, they expected that additional funding to be provided to them without being ring-fenced, so that they could consider, in an election year—a number of them being leaders of Labour councils—reducing council tax. You know that, I know it, and the local authorities know it. Without consulting local

mae awdurdodau lleol yn gwybod hynny. Heb ymgynghori gyda llywodraeth leol, penderfynasoch roi'r arian ar ffurf grant.

Ni fu unrhyw ymgynghori—gwnaethoch y penderfyniad eich hun. Yr ydych, ar y lleiaf, wedi camarwain awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, Brif Weinidog. Yr oeddent yn disgwyl yr arian hwn er mwyn iddynt gael ei ddefnyddio. Onid y gwir yw, mewn blwyddyn etholiad, nad ydych yn ymddiried mewn awdurdodau lleol Llafur i wario'r arian hwn yn ddoeth?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oeddent wedi'u camarwain, ac ni fu prinder ymgynghori. Ymgynghorais gyda llywodraethau lleol, drwy Gymdeithas Lywodraeth Leol Cymru ychydig cyn y Nadolig, ac yn syth ar ôl hynny. Yr oeddem yn medru helpu awdurdodau lleol, a chawsant eu cynghori gan bob un o'u trysoryddion nad oedd hi'n bosibl yn gyfreithiol i ddarparu'r arian yng Nghymru heb ei glustnodi o achos y cyddigwyddiad yn y dyddiadau. Darllenaf eiriau Gordon Brown, a thynnaf sylw arweinydd yr wrthblaid at y ffaith nad yw'n dweud dim am ostwng codiadau yn y dreth gyngor nac unrhyw beth arall:

'from April 2004 also, I am now able to do more for local council tax payers: to allocate across the United Kingdom, free of ring-fencing, for local authorities as they set their budgets, an additional £406 million—in England, £340 million extra—making the total available to English local authorities £3.6 billion more next year than this year: cash to meet the needs and concerns of council tax payers.'

Gellir dadlau bod angen rhoi ychydig o sglein ar ei eiriau. Fodd bynnag, mae'r llythyr oddi wrth y Trysorlys yn glir.

'I am writing to inform you about Barnett formula increases in your resource departmental expenditure limit announced in the pre-budget report for the Welsh Assembly Government—an increase of £20.026 million in the next year as a consequence of the increase in local authority funding for England.'

government, you decided to provide the money in grant form.

There was no consultation—you made the decision yourself. You have, at the very least, misled local authorities in Wales, First Minister. They expected this funding so that they could use it. Is it not true that, in an election year, you do not trust Labour local authorities to spend this money wisely?

The First Minister: They were not misled, and there was no lack of consultation. We consulted with local government, through the Welsh Local Government Association, just before Christmas and immediately afterwards. We were able to help local authorities, and they were advised by every one of their treasurers that it was not legally possible to provide the money in Wales without ring-fencing it, because of the coincidence in the dates. I will read Gordon Brown's words, and I draw the attention of the leader of the opposition to the fact that he says nothing about curbing increases in council tax or anything else:

o fis Ebrill 2004 hefyd, gallaf wneud rhagor yn awr dros dalwyr y dreth gyngor yn lleol: dyrannu ledled y Deyrnas Unedig, heb glustnodi, ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol wrth iddynt osod eu cyllidebau, £406 miliwn yn ychwanegol—£340 miliwn yn ychwanegol yn Lloegr—fel bod y cyfanswm sydd ar gael i awdurdodau lleol yn Lloegr yn £3.6 biliwn yn fwy y flwyddyn nesaf nag y mae eleni: arian i ymateb i anghenion a phryderon talwyr y dreth gyngor.

It could be argued that his words require a little gloss. However, the letter from the Treasury is clear.

Yr wyf yn ysgrifennu i'ch hysbysu am y codiadau yn unol â fformiwla Barnett yn eich terfyn gwariant adrannol ar adnoddau a gyhoeddwyd yn yr adroddiad rhag-gyllidebol ar gyfer Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru—cynnydd o £20.026 miliwn y flwyddyn nesaf o ganlyniad i'r cynnydd yng nghyllid awdurdodau lleol i Loegr.

Mae pawb yn deall y rheol honno, gan gynnwys y 22 o drysoryddion llywodraeth leol. Mae'n ychwanegiad hwyr i'r bloc. Byddai unrhyw un o'r trysoryddion hynny yr oeddech yn eu dyfynnu—ni fyddwch byth yn eu dyfynnu pan fyddant yn ein cefnogi, ond yr ydych yn gwneud hynny'n awr am ei fod yn gyfleus, ac am iddynt wneud sylwadau annoeth yn yr wythnosau diwethaf—wedi medru dweud nad yw'r rheolau wedi newid mewn 25 mlynedd, a'u bod yn eu deall. Byddant hefyd yn deall nad oedd hi'n bosibl, oherwydd y dyddiad, i ddarparu'r arian mewn unrhyw ffordd arall ond ar ffurf grant arbennig.

Jonathan Morgan: To return to the issue of bedblocking, you stated that there were a number of interlinking issues. Two of those issues need active consideration. First, what will the Government do to reverse the damaging decline in the number of care home beds in Wales? It is difficult to get people out of hospital unless a bed can be found for them, and the number of care home beds has been reduced drastically in the past few years.

Secondly, why will you not consider charging local authorities that fail to fulfil their statutory obligations to find people the type of care home support that they need when they leave hospital? Many hospitals are now becoming nothing more than extensions of the care home sector.

2.40 p.m.

The First Minister: That last point is a bit of an exaggeration, Jonathan, but you raise an important issue. You should crosscheck the implications of what you said with the points that your leader made earlier, because you are not arguing along the same lines. On your point that disputes over fees are causing some privately owned residential and nursing care homes to become non-viable, this was one reason why we allocated the £19.5 million in the way that we did, and that was specifically referred to. It would help to ease the pressure with regard to the disputes about fees. However, the current property boom is making these disputes worse. Some 10 or 15 years ago, at a time of property price slumps,

Everyone understands that rule, including the 22 local government treasurers. It is a late addition to the block. Any one of the treasurers that you quoted—you never quote them when they support us, but you do so now because it is convenient and because they have made some unwise remarks during the past few weeks—would have been able to say that the rules have not changed in 25 years, and that they understand them. They would also understand that it was not possible, because of the date, to provide that money by any means other than by way of a special grant.

Jonathan Morgan: Gan droi'n ôl at fater blocio gwelyau, dywedasoeh fod sawl mater cydgysylltiedig. Mae dau o'r materion hynny'n gofyn ystyriaeth weithredol. Yn gyntaf, beth a wnaiff y Llywodraeth i wrthdroi'r gostyngiad niweidiol yn nifer y gwelyau mewn cartrefi gofal yng Nghymru? Mae'n anodd mynd â phobl o'r ysbyty os na ellir dod o hyd i wely ar eu cyfer, ac mae nifer y gwelyau mewn cartrefi gofal wedi'i ostwng yn drawiadol yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

Yn ail, pam na wnewch ystyried codi tâl ar awdurdodau lleol sy'n methu â chyflawni eu rhwymedigaethau statudol i ddod o hyd i'r math o gymorth mewn cartref gofal y mae ar bobl ei angen pan adawant yr ysbyty? Mae sawl ysbyty bellach yn troi'n ddim amgen nag estyniad i'r sector cartrefi gofal.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oeddech yn gorliwio braidd yn y pwynt olaf a wnaethoch, Jonathan, ond yr ydych yn codi mater pwysig. Dylech groeswiro rhwng goblygiadau'r hyn a ddywedasoeh a'r pwyntiau a wnaeth eich arweinydd yn gynharach, gan nad yw'ch dadleuon yn debyg. Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaethoch i'r perwyl bod anghydfodau ynghylch ffioedd yn peri i rai cartrefi gofal preswyl a nyrsio dan berchnogaeth breifat fynd yn annichonadwy, dyma un rheswm inni ddyrannu'r £19.5 miliwn fel y gwnaethom, a chyfeiriwyd at hynny'n benodol. Byddai o gymorth i leddfu'r pwysau o ran yr anghydfodau ynghylch ffioedd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r

it was attractive to convert big Victorian houses into residential care homes, but at the moment the pressure is to reverse that trend and to return the houses to their original state as private homes or to convert them into flats and to make a fortune that way. Unfortunately, there is nothing that we can do about the fact that property booms occur in this country once every 15 years or so. We are in the middle of one now, which means that you can create a good pension for yourself if you are a private homeowner.

The other important point is the one that I made to Val Lloyd some 10 or 15 minutes ago: 50 per cent of delayed transfers of care relate to mental health patients. They do not concern what you might call 'classic' bed-blocking, namely when people need to come in due to pneumonia or for an operation but they cannot get in because it has not been possible to discharge last week's patient. Mental health is a major factor in this matter, and that is sometimes forgotten. Finding the right package of care with the community psychiatric nurse and the right housing is important in 50 per cent of cases.

ymchwydd presennol ym mhrisiau eiddo yn gwaethygu'r anghydfodau hynny. Tua 10 neu 15 mlynedd yn ôl, pan oedd prisiau eiddo'n disgyn, peth deniadol oedd troi tai Fictoriaidd mawr yn gartrefi gofal preswyl, ond ar hyn o bryd mae pwysau i wrthdroi'r tuedd hwnnw a throi'r tai'n ôl i'w cyflwr gwreiddiol fel cartrefi preifat neu eu troi'n fflatiau a gwneud ffortiwn drwy hynny. Gwaetha'r modd, nid oes dim y gallwn ei wneud ynghylch y ffaith bod ymchwydd ym mhrisiau eiddo yn y wlad hon bob rhyw 15 mlynedd. Yr ydym ar ganol un ohonynt yn awr, ac mae hynny'n golygu y gallwch wneud pensiwn da i chi'ch hun os ydych yn berchen ar dŷ.

Y pwynt pwysig arall yw'r un a wneuthum wrth ateb Val Lloyd ryw 10 neu 15 munud yn ôl: mae hanner yr achosion o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn ymwneud â chleifion iechyd meddwl. Nid oes a wnelont ddim â'r hyn y gallech ei alw'n flocio gwelyau 'clasurol', sef pan fo angen derbyn pobl am fod niwmonia arnynt neu am fod arnynt angen llawdriniaeth, ond na ellir gwneud hynny am na fu modd rhyddhau'r claf a fu yno'r wythnos cynt. Mae iechyd meddwl yn ffactor o bwys yn y mater hwn, ac anghofir hynny weithiau. Mae canfod y pecyn gofal priodol gyda'r nyrs seiciatrïg gymunedol a'r tai priodol yn bwysig yn hanner yr achosion.

Middleton—Gardd Fotaneg Genedlaethol Cymru Middleton—the National Botanic Garden of Wales

Q6 Lisa Francis: Will the First Minister make a statement on the latest position regarding the National Botanic Garden of Wales? (OAQ30901)

The First Minister: We continue to work closely with the Welsh Development Agency, the Wales Tourist Board and Carmarthenshire County Council, and we look to forward to finding, eventually, an appropriate solution that will ensure a positive future for the national botanic garden.

Lisa Francis: The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport has said that your Government is committed to a future for the garden. You may be aware that the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside recently issued a consultation paper on

C6 Lisa Francis: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf mewn perthynas â Gardd Fotaneg Genedlaethol Cymru? (OAQ30901)

Y Prif Weinidog: Parhawn i gydweithio'n agos ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru a Chyngor Sir Caerfyrddin, ac edrychwn ymlaen at ddarganfod ateb priodol, yn y pen draw, a fydd yn sicrhau dyfodol cadarnhaol i'r ardd fotaneg genedlaethol.

Lisa Francis: Dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon fod eich Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau dyfodol i'r ardd. Efallai y gwyddoch fod y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad wedi cyhoeddi papur

sustainable development, 'Starting to Live Differently', which talks about the importance of flagship biodiversity projects. Given that sustainable development is a key part of what the National Assembly is about, do you not agree that it is essential that the garden continues to be a centre for core scientific research with a clear educational role?

The First Minister: Many parties are waiting in the wings or expressing an interest in how the national botanic garden can be taken forward. Not one has been able to put the right package together as yet. That is why I emphasised the fact that we are working closely with Carmarthenshire County Council and our two principal quangos on this matter, with some communication from time to time with the Millennium Commission, which is a major stakeholder. In order to find the right solution, it is not clear to me that every element of the garden's previous mission must be a part of its future mission. To some extent, we cannot determine which one of the packages is the most viable. However, with so many people currently waiting in the wings and interested in taking the garden forward, if we can find the right package and the right handover procedure, then it seems to me that there are reasonable prospects for the future of the botanic garden. However, I cannot give any guarantees with regard to particular missions.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Y mae'n flwyddyn newydd ond nid oes unrhyw beth newydd yn ymddygiad y Prif Weinidog. Mae wedi treulio'r 40 munud diwethaf yn ceisio esbonio pam nad yw e'n gallu gwneud unrhyw beth ynglŷn ag unrhyw beth o gwbl, ac mae'r ardd fotaneg yn enghraifft glasurol o hynny. Mae'r Prif Weinidog a Llywodraeth Cymru wedi golchi eu dwylo yn lân o'r mater hwn. Mae'n ddiddorol bod y Llywodraeth o'r diwedd yn dechrau trafod gyda Chomisiwn y Mileniwm, a byddai'n ddiddorol gwybod i ba raddau y maent yn trafod oherwydd mae'r comisiwn yn dra phryderus ynglŷn â sefyllfa'r ardd. Mae'n ddiddorol hefyd na fu unrhyw drafodaeth gyda'r ymddiriedolwyr sy'n dal i redeg yr ardd fotaneg.

O ystyried mai'r ardd fotaneg, o bosibl, yw prosiect datblygu cynaliadwy mwyaf Cymru,

ymgyngori'n ddiweddar ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, 'Dechrau Byw'n Wahanol', sy'n sôn am bwysigrwydd prosiectau bioamrywiaeth amlwg. Gan fod datblygu cynaliadwy'n rhan hollbwysig o bwrpas y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, oni chytunwch ei bod yn hanfodol i'r ardd barhau fel canolfan ar gyfer ymchwil wyddonol graidd ag iddi rôl addysgol bendant?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae llawer o bartïon yn disgwyl eu tro neu'n mynegi diddordeb ynghylch y modd y gellir datblygu'r ardd fotaneg genedlaethol. Nid oes yr un sydd wedi gallu paratoi pecyn derbyniol eto. Dyna pam y pwysleisiais ein bod yn cydweithio'n agos â Chyngor Sir Caerfyrddin a'n dau brif gwango ar y mater hwn, ac yn cysylltu o bryd i'w gilydd â Chomisiwn y Mileniwm, sy'n rhanddeiliad o bwys. Er mwyn canfod yr ateb cywir, nid wyf yn gweld bod rhaid i bob elfen yng nghenhadaeth flaenorol yr ardd fod yn rhan o'i chenhadaeth yn y dyfodol. I ryw raddau, ni allwn bennu pa un o'r pecynnau sy'n fwyaf dichonadwy. Er hynny, a chynifer yn disgwyl eu tro ar hyn o bryd ac yn ymddiddori mewn datblygu'r ardd, os gallwn ganfod y pecyn priodol a'r weithdrefn briodol ar gyfer trosglwyddo, mae'n ymddangos i mi fod rhagolygon eithaf da i'r ardd yn y dyfodol. Er hynny, ni allaf roi unrhyw sicrwydd mewn cysylltiad â chenhadaethau penodol.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: It is a new year, but there is nothing new in the First Minister's behaviour. He has spent the last 40 minutes trying to explain why he cannot do anything about anything at all, and the botanic garden is a classic example of that. The First Minister and the Government of Wales have washed their hands of this matter. It is interesting that, at last, the Government is beginning to have discussions with the Millennium Commission, and it would be interesting to know the extent of those discussions because the commission is greatly concerned about the garden's position. It is also interesting that there have been no discussions with the trustees who continue to run the botanic garden.

Given that the botanic garden is perhaps Wales's most important sustainable

a bod gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gyfrifoldeb statudol am ddatblygu cynaliadwy, oni fydd y Prif Weinidog yn y sefyllfa anodd o orfod ceisio esbonio beth y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei wneud i hybu datblygu cynaliadwy, tra'i fod yn gyfrifol am geisio gorfodi'r ardd i fethdaliad?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae eich geiriau gwag ar y pwnc hwn bron yn rhan annatod o bob sesiwn cwestiynau. Nid yw ariannu'r prosiect am 13 mis, fel y gwnaethom o fis Medi 2002 hyd ddiwedd mis Hydref 2003, yn olchi ein dwylo o'r prosiect. Nid ydym erioed wedi dweud nad ydym yn trafod y mater gyda'r ymddiriedolwyr: yr oedd fy swyddogion yn trafod y mater hwn gyda'r ymddiriedolwyr y bore yma, ac felly ni ddeallaf pam yr ydych yn taflu honiadau dwl o gwmpas fel pe baech yn gwybod rhywbeth am y pwnc, pan nad ydych yn gwybod beth sy'n digwydd o gwbl. Fel y dywedais wrth Lisa Francis, mae gan sawl corff ddiddordeb mewn cymryd drosodd, ond y ffordd o drosglwyddo oddi wrth yr ymddiriedolwyr presennol i'r gorau o'r cyrff hyn yw'r broblem, a dyna'r gamp yr ydym yn bwrw ymlaen â hi.

Jenny Randerson: On a point raised by the previous two speakers, can you clarify your view of the national botanic garden? Do you see it in the same light as the Minister for Culture, who clearly views it as no more than a visitor attraction, or do you adhere to your original view, which led you to include it in the culture portfolio, that the garden has the potential to be one of the great institutions of Wales, ranking alongside the national museum and the national library? If you have changed your mind, and now agree with the Minister for Culture that it is just a tourist attraction, would it not be honest to transfer responsibility for it to the economic development portfolio, which includes tourism? If that were done, as the fourth most visited tourist attraction in Wales, the garden would have much greater hope of getting support from this blinkered Labour Assembly Government, which knows the price of everything and the value of nothing.

The First Minister: Well done—there is

development project, and that the National Assembly has a statutory duty towards sustainable development, will the First Minister not find himself in the difficult position of having to try to explain what the Assembly is doing to promote sustainable development, while being responsible for trying to force the garden into bankruptcy?

The First Minister: Your empty words on this subject are an almost integral feature of every questions session. Funding the project for 13 months, as we did from September 2002 to the end of October 2003, is not washing our hands of the project. We have never said that we are not discussing the matter with the trustees: my officials were discussing this matter with the trustees this morning, and so I do not understand why you throw senseless accusations around as though you know something about this subject, when you do not know what is happening at all. As I told Lisa Francis, several bodies have an interest in taking over the garden, but the manner of transfer from the present trustees to the best of those bodies is the problem, and that is the feat that we are pursuing.

Jenny Randerson: Ynghylch pwynt a godwyd gan y ddau siaradwr blaenorol, a allwch egluro sut y gwelwch yr ardd fotaneg genedlaethol? A ydych yn ei gweld yn yr un goleuni â'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y mae'n amlwg nad yw'n ei hystyried yn ddim mwy nag atyniad i ymwelwyr, neu a ydych yn glynu wrth eich barn wreiddiol, a barodd ichi ei chynnwys yn y portffolio diwylliant, y gallai'r ardd fod yn un o sefydliadau mawr Cymru, yn gydradd â'r amgueddfa genedlaethol a'r llyfrgell genedlaethol? Os ydych wedi newid eich meddwl, ac yn cytuno bellach â'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant nad yw'n ddim ond atyniad i ymwelwyr, onid gonest fyddai trosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb drosti i'r portffolio datblygu economaidd, sy'n cynnwys twristiaeth? Pe gwnaed hynny, byddai llawer mwy o obaith i'r ardd, fel yr atyniad i ymwelwyr yng Nghymru y ceir y nifer pedwerydd mwyaf o ymweliadau ag ef, i gael cymorth gan y Llywodraeth Cynulliad Lafur gibddall hon, sy'n gwybod pris popeth heb wybod gwerth dim byd.

Y Prif Weinidog: Da iawn chi—nid oes dim

nothing like an old cliché, is there? I accept the Minister for Culture's view entirely, but I do not recognise the distinction that you make between his views and my previous views as you cite them. There is no distinction. It is clear to all who take a constructive view of the garden's current problems and how it ought to be if it is to secure a glittering new future, that it must become more family friendly. That does not mean turning it into a theme park, and nothing that the Minister for Culture has said has implied that. Trying to make it a bit more family friendly and trying to restore visitor numbers to what they were in the first and second years of its existence, before foot and mouth disease hit, is a perfectly responsible proposition and in no way contradicts what I have said.

byd gwell na hen ystrydeb, nac oes? Yr wyf yn llwyr dderbyn barn y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, ond ni welaf y gwahaniaeth a welwch chi rhwng ei farn ef a'm barn flaenorol i fel yr ydych yn cyfeirio ati. Nid oes gwahaniaeth. Mae'n amlwg i bawb sy'n edrych yn adeiladol ar broblemau presennol yr ardd a sut y dylai fod os ydyw i sicrhau dyfodol newydd llewyrchus, fod rhaid iddi gynnig mwy i deuluoedd. Nid yw hynny'n golygu ei throï'n barc thema, ac nid oes dim a ddywedodd y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant wedi rhoi awgrym o hynny. Mae ceisio peri iddi gynnig ychydig mwy i deuluoedd a cheisio adfer niferoedd yr ymwelwyr i'r hyn oeddent yn ei dwy flynedd cyntaf, cyn argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau, yn gynnig perffaith gyfrifol ac nid yw'n gwrth-ddweud yr hyn a ddywedais i o gwbl.

Cynllun Lliniaru Llifogydd Stryd Mwrog The Mwrog Street Flood Alleviation Scheme

Q7 Brynle Williams: Will the First Minister indicate whether the Welsh Assembly Government will be providing additional funds to account for the overspend in completing the Mwrog street flood alleviation scheme? (OAQ30923)

C7 Brynle Williams: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog nodi a fydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn darparu arian ychwanegol i dalu am y gorwario wrth gwblhau cynllun lliniaru llifogydd stryd Mwrog? (OAQ30923)

The First Minister: I believe that we are doing so. This is a Denbighshire County Council scheme, but its costs are supported with Welsh Assembly Government grant aid. You are right that the scheme's costs have increased significantly, and the Assembly Government has indicated that it is prepared to consider extending its financial support. In October 2003, officials approved approximately £300,000 in additional grant for this scheme. Further information is awaited from the local authority—with some trepidation—in relation to the remaining overspend.

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf ein bod yn gwneud hynny. Cynllun o eiddo Cyngor Sir Ddinbych yw hwn, ond rhoddir cymorth tuag at ei gostau drwy grant gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud bod costau'r cynllun wedi codi'n sylweddol, ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi nodi ei bod yn barod i ystyried parhau â'i chymorth ariannol. Yn Hydref 2003, gwnaeth swyddogion gymeradwyo grant ychwanegol o tua £300,000 ar gyfer y cynllun hwn. Disgwylir—gyda pheth gofid—am gael gwybodaeth bellach oddi wrth yr awdurdod lleol am y gorwariant sy'n weddill.

Brynle Williams: Although Denbighshire County Council has run dramatically over budget, as you noted, it is important to the residents of Ruthin that this scheme is completed. The taxpayers of Denbighshire are concerned that they will have to pay toward this scheme, thereby considerably increasing their council tax bills this year. Will the Welsh Assembly Government contribution remain the same as initially

Brynle Williams: Er bod Cyngor Sir Ddinbych wedi gwario mwy o lawer na'r hyn a oedd yn y gyllideb, fel y dywedasoch, mae'n bwysig i drigolion Rhuthun fod y cynllun hwn yn cael ei gwblhau. Mae trethdalwyr sir Ddinbych yn pryderu y byddant yn gorfod cyfrannu at gost y cynllun hwn, gan beri cynnydd sylweddol yn eu biliau treth gyngor eleni. A fydd cyfraniad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn aros yr un

stated, or will it be increased due to the current cost of the scheme? I believe that this scheme is now running at over £3.1 million, from an original £1 million.

2.50 p.m.

The First Minister: The estimated cost that I have for the original scheme is £1.563 million, although there may have been an earlier stage of which I am unaware, as the information on it was never supplied to us. The point is that the grant is set, I understand, at a standard rate of 85 per cent. Provided that we accept that the overspend is genuine and unavoidable, as far as I am aware, the grant rate of 85 per cent would remain the same. If, in giving you that answer, I have not covered the whole waterfront, I will write to you on the matter.

Janet Ryder: I am sure that you, like many, would congratulate Denbighshire County Council on acting on this matter at last and ensuring that residents in Ruthin will be safe from flooding this year, now that this scheme is in place. No doubt you, like many, are eagerly anticipating the publication of the consultant's report, which will summarise the events that led to this scheme being implemented, and which, hopefully, will fully vindicate the council's stance.

The First Minister: There has been serious flooding in Ruthin, and not only in November 2000 when it hit the headlines at the same time as the widespread flooding in other parts of Wales. Members will recall from that crisis that some roads disappeared off the map. When there is overspend of this nature—provided that it is genuine—we would continue with the 85 per cent grant rate. The issue with the Ruthin Mwrog Street scheme is that it involved many complicated negotiations with landowners and others to obtain wayleave permissions and so forth. However, the scheme protects some 400 properties, which is a substantial proportion of the properties in Ruthin, and, therefore, it has been deemed to be good value for money.

fath â'r hyn a nodwyd yn wreiddiol, neu a gaiff ei gynyddu oherwydd cost bresennol y cynllun? Credaf mai £3.1 miliwn yw cost y cynllun yn awr, o'i chymharu ag £1 filiwn yn wreiddiol.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr amcangyfrif o'r gost sydd gennyf fi ar gyfer y cynllun gwreiddiol yw £1.563 miliwn, er ei bod yn bosibl bod cost gynharach na wn amdani, gan na roddwyd y wybodaeth arni i ni. Y pwynt pwysig yw bod y grant yn cael ei osod, yr wyf yn deall, ar gyfradd safonol o 85 y cant. Ar yr amod ein bod yn derbyn bod y gorwariant yn ddilys ac yn anochel, hyd y gwn i, byddai cyfradd y grant o 85 y cant yn aros yr un fath. Os nad wyf wedi delio â phopeth dan sylw wrth roi'r ateb hwnnw i chi, ysgrifennaf atoch ynghylch y mater hwn.

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech chi, fel llawer un arall, yn llongyfarch Cyngor Sir Ddinbych ar gymryd camau ynghylch y mater hwn o'r diwedd a sicrhau y bydd trigolion Rhuthun yn ddiogel rhag llifogydd eleni, gan fod y cynllun hwn ar waith bellach. Mae'n sicr eich bod chi, fel llawer un arall, yn disgwyl yn eiddgar am gyhoeddi adroddiad yr ymgynghorydd, a fydd yn rhoi crynodeb o'r digwyddiadau a arweiniodd at roi'r cynllun hwn ar waith, ac a fydd, yr wyf yn gobeithio, yn llwyr gyfiawnhau safbwynt y cyngor.

Y Prif Weinidog: Bu llifogydd difrifol yn Rhuthun, a hynny nid yn unig ym mis Tachwedd 2000 pan gipiodd benawdau'r newyddion yr un pryd â'r llifogydd helaeth mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Bydd Aelodau'n cofio o'r argyfwng hwnnw i rai ffyrdd ddiplannu oddi ar y map. Pan geir gorwariant o'r math hwn—ar yr amod ei fod yn ddilys—byddem yn parhau â'r cyfradd grant o 85 y cant. Y mater sy'n codi ynglŷn â chynllun Rhuthun Stryd Mwrog yw ei fod yn cynnwys llawer o negodiadau cymhleth â pherchnogion tir ac eraill i gael ffyrdd-freintiau ac yn y blaen. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cynllun yn amddiffyn tua 400 o dai, sy'n gyfran helaeth o'r tai yn Rhuthun, ac, felly, barnwyd ei fod yn cynnig gwerth da am arian.

Pwysau ar Lywodraeth Leol **Pressures on Local Government**

Q8 Mick Bates: Will the First Minister make a statement on what the Assembly is doing to help reduce the increasing pressure on local government in Wales? (OAQ30917)

The First Minister: Aside from the additional £20 million, which we announced and which has been welcomed by, shall we say, parts of local government in Wales, we deliver a large part of our programme as set out in our policy statement, 'Freedom and Responsibility'. That lays down the principle that we do not ring-fence as much as other parts of the UK ring-fence. The Wales programme for improvement is a more effective and straightforward way of achieving continuous improvement in local government, using a combination of sticks and carrots. It will help local authorities to better cope with pressures.

Mick Bates: I am sure that you agree that one of the worst pressures that local government faces is that of cutting its services. Far from reducing the pressure on local government, your Government's local government settlement has increased it. My local county council of Powys, for example, is having to cut its education budget by 2 per cent. Why has your Government chosen to increase the pressure on local government and on Powys schools in particular? These schools will now have to sack teachers to balance their budgets.

The First Minister: Prior to the £20 million announced a week or so ago, the revenue settlement for Powys was 4.6 per cent, compared with the Welsh average of 5.0 per cent. We do not currently have information on the story behind the comments that Members will have seen recently on television and in the newspapers about the budget position for Powys schools. The informal information that we have at present is confusing, as we understand that there is a rising budget for education, but that there is talk of a 2 per cent cut for all services. When the position becomes clearer, after Powys council has completed setting its budgets, we may be able to understand whether the

C8 Mick Bates: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar yr hyn y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei wneud i leihau'r pwysau cynyddol ar lywodraeth leol yng Nghymru? (OAQ30917)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ar wahân i'r £20 miliwn ychwanegol, a gyhoeddwyd gennym ac a groesawyd gan rai mewn llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru, gellid dweud, yr ydym yn gweithredu rhan helaeth o'n rhaglen fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn ein datganiad polisi, 'Rhyddid a Chyfrifoldeb'. Mae hwnnw'n nodi'r egwyddor nad ydym yn clustnodi i'r un graddau ag y mae rhannau eraill y DU. Mae rhaglen Cymru ar gyfer gwella yn ddull symlach a mwy effeithiol o sicrhau gwella parhaus mewn llywodraeth leol, gan ei bod yn cynnig cosb yn ogystal ag abwyd. Bydd yn helpu awdurdodau lleol i ymdopi'n well â phwysau.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch mai rhai o'r pwysau gwaethaf y mae llywodraeth leol yn eu hwynebu yw dros gwtogi ar ei gwasanaethau. Yn hytrach na lleihau'r pwysau ar lywodraeth leol, mae setliad eich Llywodraeth ar gyfer llywodraeth leol wedi eu cynyddu. Mae'r cyngor sir yn fy ardal i, sef Powys, er enghraifft, yn gorfod torri ei gyllideb addysg o 2 y cant. Pam y bu i'ch Llywodraeth ddewis cynyddu'r pwysau ar lywodraeth leol ac ar ysgolion Powys yn benodol? Yn awr, bydd yr ysgolion hyn yn gorfod diswyddo athrawon i fantoli eu cyllidebau.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cyn cyhoeddi'r £20 miliwn tuag wythnos yn ôl, y setliad refeniw ar gyfer Powys oedd 4.6 y cant, o'i gymharu â chyfartaledd yng Nghymru o 5.0 y cant. Nid oes gennym wybodaeth ar hyn o bryd am yr hanes sy'n sail i'r sylwadau y bydd Aelodau wedi'u clywed yn ddiweddar ar y teledu a'u darllen yn y papurau newydd am y sefyllfa ynghylch y gyllideb ar gyfer ysgolion Powys. Mae'r wybodaeth anffurfiol sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd yn peri penbleth, gan ein bod yn deall bod cynnydd yn y gyllideb ar gyfer addysg, ond bod sôn am doriad o 2 y cant yn yr holl wasanaethau. Pan ddaw'r sefyllfa'n eglurach, wedi i gyngor Powys orffen y gwaith o bennu ei gyllidebau, efallai

budget is going up or down. At present, it seems to be going both ways at once. We have given Powys reasonably generous funding, although it is a shade below the Welsh average. Our budget has gone up by 6 per cent from next year, local government will receive a 5 per cent increase—that is about 80 per cent of the increase—and Powys will receive slightly less than that. I do not believe that local government has anything to complain about regarding its proportion of the budget increase that we receive, which is, of course, dominated by health. This is an election year, so councils are sensitive about the level of council tax increases that their taxpayers can afford this year above all other years. We are happy with the rate of increase allocated to Powys, given the conditions that exist, of 4.6 per cent, relative to the Welsh average of 5.0 per cent.

William Graham: Can you really say that you are reducing pressure on local government when the deprivation grant awarded by your Government to Monmouthshire last year was £340-odd, and this year is £10?

The First Minister: I believe that the £10 is in the actual increase of £20 million. Of that £20 million, £0.5 million is in deprivation grants. That will be on a sliding scale according to deprivation factors. Therefore, Merthyr Tydfil is the top authority, receiving 15 per cent of the deprivation fund money in our announcement of 6 January. The figure is 12 per cent in Blaenau Gwent, and it is virtually nothing in Monmouthshire. The reasons for that are clear from the way that the formula is set out to consider deprivation.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Fel y gwyddoch, Brif Weinidog, un broblem gyda'r berthynas rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac awdurdodau lleol yw nad oes eglurder bob amser ynglŷn â beth yw pwerau'r Cynulliad mewn perthynas â llywodraeth leol. Mae arweinwyr llywodraeth leol, fel pawb arall yng Nghymru, eisiau gwybod ble yr ydych yn sefyll ar bwerau ychwanegol i'r Cynulliad. Mae un aelod Llafur blaenllaw ar ôl y llall yn

y bydd modd inni ddeall a yw'r gyllideb yn codi neu'n gostwng. Ar hyn o bryd, ymddengys ei bod yn mynd i'r ddau gyfeiriad ar unwaith. Buom yn weddol hael wrth roi cyllid i Bowys, er ei fod fymryn yn is na'r cyfartaledd yng Nghymru. Mae ein cyllideb yn codi o 6 y cant o'r flwyddyn nesaf ymlaen, bydd llywodraeth leol yn cael 5 y cant o gynnydd—sef tua 80 y cant o'r cynnydd—a bydd Powys yn cael ychydig yn llai na hynny. Ni chredaf fod gan lywodraeth leol unrhyw le i gwyno ynghylch y gyfran a gaiff o'r cynnydd yn y gyllideb a gawn ni, y mae iechyd yn cymryd y rhan helaethaf ohono, wrth gwrs. Mae eleni'n flwyddyn etholiad, felly mae cynghorau'n sensitif ynghylch lefel y cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor y gall eu trethdalwyr ei fforddio eleni'n fwy na'r un flwyddyn arall. Yr ydym yn fodlon ar gyfradd y cynnydd a roddwyd i Bowys, yn ngolwg yr amgylchiadau, o 4.6 y cant, o'i gymharu â chyfartaledd o 5.0 y cant yng Nghymru.

William Graham: A allwch ddweud o ddifrif eich bod yn lleihau'r pwysau ar lywodraeth leol, o gofio bod y grant amddifadedd a ddyfarnwyd gan eich Llywodraeth i sir Fynwy tua £340 y llynedd, a'i fod yn £10 eleni?

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf fod y £10 hwnnw yn y cynnydd gwirioneddol o £20 miliwn. O'r £20 miliwn hwnnw, mae £0.5 miliwn ar ffurf grantiau amddifadedd. Bydd hynny'n dilyn graddfa symudol yn ôl ffactorau amddifadedd. Gan hynny, Merthyr Tudful yw'r awdurdod uchaf, a bydd yn derbyn 15 y cant o arian y gronfa amddifadedd a gyhoeddwyd gennym ar 6 Ionawr. Mae'r ffigur yn 12 y cant ym Mlaenau Gwent, ac yn bron ddim yn sir Fynwy. Mae'r rhesymau am hynny'n eglur o'r modd y pennwyd y fformiwla i ystyried amddifadedd.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: As you know, First Minister, one problem with the relationship between the Assembly Government and local authorities is that there is not always clarity regarding the powers of the Assembly in relation to those of local government. Local government leaders, like everybody else in Wales, want to know where you stand on additional powers for the Assembly. One prominent Labour member after another is

dod allan i ddweud ble yn union y maent yn sefyll. Mae nifer o Aelodau'r Cynulliad wedi datgan ble y maent yn sefyll, a heddiw mae Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, Peter Hain, wedi gwneud hynny. Mae cwestiwn eithaf sylfaenol yma: pwy yw arweinydd y Blaid Lafur yng Nghymru? Os mai chi ydyw, onid yw'n bryd i chi ddweud ble y sefwich?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae materion yn ymwneud ag eglurder ynglŷn â'n pwerau yn sylfaenol. Yr hyn sy'n fy nrysu yw bod pobl yn ceisio honni nad ydynt yn deall fformiwla Barnett ar ôl 25 mlynedd. Ar ôl chwarter canrif, nid yw'n bosibl i bobl gyfrifol mewn llywodraeth leol ddweud nad ydynt yn deall fformiwla Barnett. Nid yw wedi newid ers blwyddyn gyntaf Nicholas Edwards yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn ôl yn 1979-80. Dyna'r peth pwysig. Os ydych yn ceisio ystyried unrhyw newidiadau yn fformiwla Barnett, neu yn y pwerau, cewch lawer mwy o ddryswech nag sydd ar hyn o bryd. Y broblem yw, os cadwch bethau'n syml, fel gyda fformiwla Barnett, maent yn ddealladwy, er bod rhai'n honni nad ydynt yn ei deall. Fodd bynnag, os ceisiwch newid fformiwla Barnett i ryw fformiwla arall, cewch broblem wrth i bawb orfod ailddysgu'r rheolau ar ôl chwarter canrif o weithio o dan y system bresennol. Dyna sy'n bwysig ynglŷn â'r gwasgu ar lywodraeth leol a sut y mae pobl yn honni bod gwasgu ar lywodraeth leol. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym yn gwasgu ar lywodraeth leol; yr ydym yn ei hariannu'n syml ac yn ddealladwy o dan y system bresennol. Yr ydym yn derbyn arian o San Steffan dan system ddealladwy, ac yr ydym yn ei roi i lywodraeth leol o dan system ddealladwy.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: What a case of avoiding the question that was, First Minister. Why did you not answer my question? I asked you a specific question: where do you stand on further constitutional changes in relation to the Assembly in light of remarks made today by the Secretary of State for Wales that he does not believe that the Richard commission should come out in support of a Scottish-type model and that, if it does, he will oppose it? He has told us where he stands on the issue. I did not ask you a question about the Barnett formula. Please answer my question: as

coming out to say exactly where they stand. Many Assembly Members have said where they stand, and today the Secretary of State for Wales, Peter Hain, has done so. There is quite a fundamental question here: who is the leader of the Labour Party in Wales? If it is you, is it not time that you said where you stand?

The First Minister: Issues regarding clarity in relation to our powers are fundamental. What confuses me is that people try to claim that they do not understand the Barnett formula after 25 years. After a quarter of a century, it is not possible for responsible people in local government to say that they do not understand the Barnett formula. It has not changed since Nicholas Edwards's first year as Secretary of State for Wales back in 1979-80. That is the important point. If you are trying to consider any changes to the Barnett formula, or to the powers, you will have much more confusion than you have at present. The problem is, if you keep it simple, as with the Barnett formula, the situation can be understood, although some people claim not to understand it. However, if you try to change the Barnett formula to some other formula, you face the problem that everybody must relearn the rules after a quarter of a century of working under the present system. That is the important point regarding the squeeze on local government and how people claim that local government is being squeezed. However, we are not squeezing local government; we fund it simply and intelligibly under the present system. We receive funding from Westminster under an intelligible system, and we give it to local government under an intelligible system.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Am ymgais i osgoi ateb cwestiwn, Brif Weinidog. Pam na wnaethoch ateb y cwestiwn a ofynnais? Gofynnais gwestiwn penodol i chi: beth yw'ch safbwynt ar newidiadau cyfansoddiadol pellach mewn cysylltiad â'r Cynulliad yng ngoleuni'r sylwadau a wnaed heddiw gan Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru i'r perwyl nad yw'n credu y dylai comisiwn Richard ddatgan ei fod o blaid patrwm tebyg i un yr Alban ac, os gwnaiff, y bydd yn ei wrthwynebu? Mae wedi dweud wrthym ym mhle y mae'n sefyll ar y mater hwnnw. Ni'ch holais ynghylch

leader of the Labour Party in Wales, where do you stand on that issue, or will you continue to duck and dive until the Richard commission makes its recommendations?

The First Minister: The problem is that you must make your supplementary question compatible with the first question. You did it by way of the most convoluted preamble that I have ever heard. I am sorry that you did not have the right occasion in which to get a clear question across and that you do not have the opportunity today to ask the question that you would like. That is why you wrapped yourself up in a huge ball of wool and failed to get your point across. What Peter Hain said this morning is not that different from what I said in my speech in Bangor. I do not know where you were in north Wales on that day, but you clearly did not read about it; I might send you a copy of what I said in my speech in Bangor.

The Presiding Officer: Order. We are well out of the allocated time for this slot, so I will merely call Karl Francis to ask his question and his supplementary question. I am sorry, it is not Karl Francis, it is Carl Sargeant. *[Laughter.]*

Carl Sargeant: I have not changed that much.

3.00 p.m.

Polisïau Datblygu Economaidd Economic Development Policies

Q9 Carl Sargeant: How have this Government's economic development policies affected the people of Flintshire? (OAQ30902)

The First Minister: The Flintshire area has seen unemployment fall by almost 30 per cent from an already healthy position over the last four years. In the same period, the Assembly Government provided grant assistance to 100 companies there. The associated projects involve grant offers of more than £15 million and capital investment of more than £100 million, and they are

fformiwlâ Barnett. Atebwch fy nghwestiwn, os gwelwch yn dda: fel arweinydd y Blaid Lafur yng Nghymru, ym mhle yr ydych yn sefyll ar y mater hwnnw, neu a fyddwch yn dal i osgoi ateb hyd nes y gwnaiff comisiwn Richard ei argymhellion?

Y Prif Weinidog: Y broblem yw bod rhaid ichi gyfaddasu'ch cwestiwn atodol i'r cwestiwn cyntaf. Gwnaethoch hynny drwy'r rhagymadrodd mwyaf astrus a glywais erioed. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf na chawsoch yr achlysur priodol i gyfleu cwestiwn clir ac nad oes gennych gyfle heddiw i ofyn y cwestiwn a hoffech. Dyna pam y gwnaethoch eich cuddio'ch hun mewn pellen fawr o edafedd a methu â chyfleu'r pwynt a oedd gennych. Nid yw'r hyn a ddywedodd Peter Hain y bore yma yn wahanol iawn i'r hyn a ddywedais yn fy araith ym Mangor. Ni wn ym mhle yr oeddech yn y Gogledd ar y diwrnod hwnnw, ond mae'n amlwg na ddarllenasoch amdani; efallai yr anfonaf gopi atoch o'r hyn a ddywedais yn fy araith ym Mangor.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr ydym wedi mynd ymhell dros yr amser a ddyrannwyd ar gyfer yr eitem hon, felly y cwbl a wnafw yw galw Karl Francis i ofyn ei gwestiwn a'i gwestiwn atodol. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, nid Karl Francis ydyw, ond Carl Sargeant. *[Chwerthin.]*

Carl Sargeant: Nid wyf wedi newid cymaint â hynny.

C9 Carl Sargeant: Sut y mae polisïau datblygu economaidd y Llywodraeth hon wedi effeithio ar bobl sir y Fflint? (OAQ30902)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae ardal sir y Fflint wedi gweld gostyngiad o bron 30 y cant mewn diweithdra o sefyllfa a oedd eisoes yn iach dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf. Yn yr un cyfnod, darparodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gymorth grant i 100 o gwmnïau yno. Mae'r prosiectau sy'n gysylltiedig yn cynnwys cynigion grant o fwy na £15 miliwn a buddsoddiad cyfalaf o fwy na £100 miliwn,

expected to create or safeguard over 3,000 jobs.

Carl Sargeant: First Minister, do you agree that, as the Assembly moves forward to spatial planning, the emphasis should be on future economic development policies, which should include the development of the necessary road infrastructure to strengthen our north-south links? We now have the chance to address the concerns expressed to me by my constituents and shared by the other directly elected Members for north Wales.

The First Minister: The spatial plan is one of our major strategic undertakings. Conveying that message to people, so that they can contribute, by consulting widely across Wales, is a major priority for the Assembly Government during 2004, in partnership with all stakeholders across Wales. I welcome your support for it, Carl; that will be invaluable in north-east Wales.

ac mae disgwyl iddynt greu neu ddiogelu mwy na 3,000 o swyddi.

Carl Sargeant: Brif Weinidog, a ydych yn cytuno, wrth i'r Cynulliad symud ymlaen at gynllunio gofodol, y dylid rhoi pwyslais ar bolisiau datblygu economaidd ar gyfer y dyfodol, a ddylai gynnwys datblygu'r seilwaith ffyrdd y mae ei angen i gryfhau'r cysylltiadau rhwng y De a'r Gogledd? Mae gennym gyfle'n awr i ymateb i'r pryderon a fynegwyd i mi gan fy etholwyr ac a rennir gan yr Aelodau eraill dros y Gogledd sydd wedi'u hethol yn uniongyrchol.

Y Prif Weinidog: Y cynllun gofodol yw un o'n prif ymgymeriadau strategol. Mae cyfleu'r neges honno i bobl, fel y gallant gyfrannu, drwy ymgynghori'n eang ledled Cymru, yn brif flaenoriaeth gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ystod 2004, mewn partneriaeth â'r holl randdeiliaid ledled Cymru. Croesawaf eich cefnogaeth iddo, Carl; bydd hynny'n amhrisiadwy i'r Gogledd-ddwyrain.

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Pwynt o drefn. Yn ystod fy nghwestiwn atodol i gwestiwn 5 i'r Prif Weinidog, ynglŷn ag ymgynghori rhwng llywodraeth leol a'r Llywodraeth ar y mater o glustnodi £1.9 miliwn ar gyfer rhesymau penodol, dywedodd fod ymgynghori wedi digwydd. Mae gen i gopi o e-bost a anfonwyd gan arweinydd Cyngor Gwynedd at Sandy Blair, cyfarwyddwr Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, yn gofyn a oedd y corff wedi ymgynghori ar hynny. Ateb Sandy Blair oedd:

'We were not consulted on the proposals.'

A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn teimlo ei fod wedi camarwain y Cynulliad yn ei ateb, neu a oes eglurhad arall?

Y Llywydd: Nid yw hynny'n bwynt o drefn i mi, fel y gŵyr arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn iawn. Sylwaf i'r Prif Weinidog ysgwyd ei ben, felly gadawn y mater yn y fan honno.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Point of order. In response to my supplementary to question 5 to the First Minister, concerning consultation between local government and the Government on the issue of ring-fencing £1.9 million for specific purposes, he said that there had been consultation. I have a copy of an e-mail sent by the leader of Gwynedd Council to Sandy Blair, director of the Welsh Local Government Association, asking whether the organisation had consulted on that. Sandy Blair's response was:

Nid ymgynghorwyd â ni ynghylch y cynigion.

Does the First Minister feel that he has misled the Assembly with his response, or is there some other explanation?

The Presiding Officer: That is not a point of order for me, as the leader of the opposition well knows. I note that the First Minister is shaking his head, so we will leave the matter there.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): I have some changes to report to this week's business. Today's scheduled statement on widening access to higher education has been postponed until 20 January and, in its place, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning will make a statement on the Higher Education Bill. Tomorrow, the Finance Minister will make a statement on local government funding. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft business statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb under 'supporting documents'.

This morning, the Deputy Presiding Officer determined under Standing Order No. 22.5 that the following Orders need not be referred to Subject Committees for extended consideration: the Water Industry (Prescribed Conditions) (Wales) Regulations 2004, the Local Government (Ordinary Day of Elections) (Wales) Order 2004, the Council Tax (Demand Notices) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004, the Removal of Obstructions from Highways (Wales) Regulations 2004, Domiciliary Care Agencies (Wales) Regulations 2004 and National Minimum Standards, the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 (Commencement No. 4) (Wales) Order 2004, the Housing Renewal Grants (Prescribed Form and Particulars) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004, the Housing Renewal Grants (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004, the Adoption and Children Act 2002 (Commencement No. 5) (Wales) Order 2004, the Conduct of Members (Model Code of Conduct) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2004, the Food (Provisions Relating to Labelling) (Wales) Regulations 2004, the Food (Emergency Control) (Miscellaneous Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2004, the Processed Cereal-based Foods and Baby Foods for Infants and Young Children (Wales) Regulations 2004, and the Infant Formula and Follow-on Formula (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004.

Y Llywydd: A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r

Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Mae gennyf rai newidiadau i'w hadrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Mae'r datganiad a amserlennwyd ar gyfer heddiw ar ehangu mynediad i addysg uwch wedi'i ohirio tan 20 Ionawr ac, yn ei le, bydd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn gwneud datganiad ar y Mesur Addysg Uwch. Yfory, bydd y Gweinidog Cyllid yn gwneud datganiad ar gyllido llywodraeth leol. Mae busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad busnes drafft, y gellir ei weld ar we'r Siambr o dan 'dogfennau ategol'.

Y bore yma, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5 nad oes angen cyfeirio'r Gorchmynion canlynol i Bwyllgorau Pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach: Rheoliadau'r Diwydiant Dŵr (Amodau Rhagnodedig) (Cymru) 2004, Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Diwrnod Cyffredin Etholiad) (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau'r Dreth Gyngor (Hysbysiadau Galw am Dalu) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau Codi Rhwystrau oddi ar Briffyrdd (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau Asiantaethau Gofal Cartref (Cymru) 2004 a Safonau Gofynnol Cenedlaethol, Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 4) (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Ffurflen a Manylion Rhagnodedig) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004, Gorchymyn Deddf Mabwysiadu a Phlant (Cychwyn Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2004, Gorchymyn Ymddygiad Aelodau (Cod Ymddygiad Enghreifftiol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau Bwyd (Darpariaethau sy'n ymwneud â Labelu) (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau Bwyd (Rheolaeth Frys) (Diwygiadau Amrywiol) (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau Bwydydd Proses sydd wedi'u Seilio ar Rawn a Bwydydd Babanod ar gyfer Babanod a Phlant Ifanc (Cymru) 2004, a Rheoliadau Fformiwla Babanod a Fformiwla Ddilynol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any

datganiad busnes? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10. Gofynnaf felly i'r Trefnydd gynnig y cynnig yn ffurfiol.

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.

Y Llywydd: Gwahoddaf un Aelod o bob grŵp i ymateb yn fyr.

Leanne Wood: I have listened carefully to the Minister's business statement, which the Plaid Cymru group cannot support for two reasons. First, Members will be aware of the serious allegations that appeared in today's edition of *The Western Mail*.

The Presiding Officer: Order. The agenda of the National Assembly is not determined by *The Western Mail*. I am not prepared to allow matters raised in today's edition of *The Western Mail* to be raised in the Chamber. The articles contained serious allegations about a Member, and various Assembly officials are named. We have clear procedures to deal with such matters, which I have explained in the past, and I draw particular attention to what I said on 4 February 2003. If a complaint is made against a Member that she or he has not complied with the Code of Standards for Members or the Ministerial Code, it is a matter for the Committee on Standards of Conduct in accordance with Standing Order No. 16 and, in the latter case, for the First Minister. If there is a complaint about a member of Assembly staff, it should be raised with me in private.

Are there other matters that you wish to raise, Leanne?

Leanne Wood: May I ask you a question in that case, Presiding Officer?

The Presiding Officer: You may not ask a question on my ruling, Leanne.

Leanne Wood: We also object to the business statement as a result of Peter Hain's

objections to the business statement? I see that there are at least 10. I therefore ask the Business Minister to formally propose the motion.

Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Cynigaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.

The Presiding Officer: I invite one Member from each group to respond briefly.

Leanne Wood: Gwrandewais yn astud ar ddatganiad busnes y Gweinidog, ac ni all grŵp Plaid Cymru ei gefnogi am ddau reswm. Yn gyntaf, bydd Aelodau'n ymwybodol o'r cyhuddiadau difrifol a ymddangosodd yn rhifyn heddiw o *The Western Mail*.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid *The Western Mail* sy'n pennu agenda'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Nid wyf yn barod i adael i faterion a godir yn rhifyn heddiw o *The Western Mail* gael eu codi yn y Siambr. Yr oedd yr erthyglau'n cynnwys cyhuddiadau difrifol ynghylch Aelod, ac enwir amryw o swyddogion y Cynulliad. Mae gennym weithdrefnau clir i ddelio â materion o'r fath, yr wyf wedi'u hegluro yn y gorffennol, a thynnaf sylw'n benodol at yr hyn a ddywedais ar 4 Chwefror 2003. Os gwneir cynwys yn erbyn Aelod i'r perwyl nad yw wedi cydymffurfio â'r Cod Safonau i Aelodau neu God y Gweinidogion, mae'n fater i'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 16 ac, yn yr achos olaf, i'r Prif Weinidog. Os oes cynwys ynghylch aelod o staff y Cynulliad, dylid ei chodi gyda mi'n breifat.

A oes materion eraill y dymunwch eu codi, Leanne?

Leanne Wood: A gaf ofyn cwestiwn i chi felly, Lywydd?

Y Llywydd: Ni chewch ofyn cwestiwn ynghylch fy nyfarniad, Leanne.

Leanne Wood: Yr ydym hefyd yn gwrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes o ganlyniad

statement this morning in relation to the Richard commission. The First Minister has repeatedly refused to comment on the Richard commission, yet Peter Hain is happy to do so. Ieuan Wyn Jones earlier asked who leads Welsh Labour—is it Rhodri Morgan or Peter Hain? Plaid Cymru feels—
[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order.

Leanne Wood: Plaid Cymru would like to hear the First Minister's views on Peter Hain's comments and on the allegations in *The Western Mail* regarding the Minister for Social Justice—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I have made it clear that it is not appropriate to refer to allegations in the Chamber. We have agreed protocols and conventions to deal with such matters. If any Member seeks to raise this matter, I shall rule it out of order.

David Davies: The Welsh Conservatives also object to the business statement. First, our health spokesman has called on a number of occasions for a debate on waiting lists. It is unacceptable that there are 14,000 people in Wales waiting over 18 months for an operation.

We would also like a Minister to come before the Assembly to discuss the proposed purchase of a piece of land adjacent to the new Assembly building. We are amazed that no Minister has sought to do this.

Finally, I welcome your comments on the importance of ensuring that allegations of a serious nature are dealt with properly. I will make no reference to the allegations, but I take on board what you said about the Committee on Standards of Conduct, which provides a positive way forward in dealing with this issue.

The Presiding Officer: Order. You also referred to a matter that is within the delegated authority of the House Committee, not of Ministers.

Kirsty Williams: First, will the Minister

i'r datganiad gan Peter Hain y bore yma mewn cysylltiad â chomisiwn Richard. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi gwrthod gwneud sylw am gomisiwn Richard dro ar ôl tro, ac eto mae Peter Hain yn fodlon gwneud hynny. Gofynnodd Ieuan Wyn Jones yn gynharach pwy sy'n arwain Llafur Cymru—ai Rhodri Morgan, ai Peter Hain? Mae Plaid Cymru yn teimlo—
[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

Leanne Wood: Carai Plaid Cymru glywed barn y Prif Weinidog am y sylwadau a wnaeth Peter Hain ac am y cyhuddiadau yn *The Western Mail* mewn cysylltiad â'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf wedi egluro nad yw'n briodol cyfeirio at gyhuddiadau yn y Siambr. Mae gennym brotocolau a chonfensiynau y cytunwyd arnynt i ddelio â materion o'r fath. Os yw unrhyw Aelod yn ceisio codi'r mater hwn, dyfarnaf ei fod allan o drefn.

David Davies: Mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn gwrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes hefyd. Yn gyntaf, mae ein llefarydd ar iechyd wedi galw ar sawl achlysur am ddatl ar restrau aros. Annerbyniol yw bod 14,000 o bobl yng Nghymru sy'n disgwyl yn fwy na 18 mis am lawdriniaeth.

Byddem hefyd yn hoffi gweld Gweinidog yn dod gerbron y Cynulliad i drafod y bwriad i brynu darn o dir ger adeilad newydd y Cynulliad. Rhyfeddwn nad oes unrhyw Weinidog wedi ceisio gwneud hynny.

Yn olaf, croesawaf eich sylwadau ynghylch y pwysigrwydd o sicrhau bod cyhuddiadau difrifol yn cael eu trafod yn briodol. Ni chyfeirir at y cyhuddiadau, ond derbyniraf y hyn a ddywedsoch am y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad, sy'n cynnig ffordd gadarnhaol ymlaen wrth ddelio â'r mater hwn.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Cyfeiriasoch hefyd at fater sydd o fewn cwrdd yr awdurdod a ddirprwywyd i Bwyllgor y Tŷ, nid Gweinidogion.

Kirsty Williams: Yn gyntaf, a wnaiff y

clarify what she said with regard to legislation relating to the code of conduct for local councils? I may have misheard, but will the Minister clarify that the legislation will be subject to the standard process and will be debated in the Chamber?

Secondly, I turn to the reason why the Liberal Democrat group opposes the business statement. While we understand that the Finance Minister will make a statement tomorrow on her decision to allocate moneys during the Christmas holiday to local government social services, the Liberal Democrat group has requested a full debate on the circumstances of the hypothecation of the fund, which is in direct contradiction to the Welsh Assembly Government's policy of not hypothecating money given to local government. Given the widespread confusion within and outside the Chamber about the levels of consultation with regard to this measure and its desirability, we cannot accept the business statement as it does not include a full debate on the proposal.

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): I am sorry, I missed Kirsty's first point.

3.10 p.m.

Kirsty Williams: Will you clarify whether or not you intend to ensure that the legislation to which you referred regarding the code of conduct for local government will come before us as a standard procedure? I was not sure, when you read out your list of legislative Orders, whether or not you intended it to be subject to an accelerated or standard procedure. It was the will of the Business Committee, if you recall, for it to come before the Assembly under a standard procedure, but I may have misheard.

Karen Sinclair: I will address that point first. The agreement was that it would be a standard procedure. Therefore I clarify that what I said this morning stands.

On Leanne's point on the Richard commission, Rhodri made his position perfectly clear during questions. On her other question, it would not be particularly helpful

Gweinidog egluro'r hyn a ddywedodd am ddeddfwriaeth sy'n ymwneud â'r cod ymddygiad i gynghorau lleol? Efallai fy mod wedi camglywed, ond a wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro y bydd y ddeddfwriaeth yn cael ei thrafod drwy'r broses arferol ac y bydd dadl arni yn y Siambr?

Yn ail, trof at y rheswm y mae grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn gwrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes. Er ein bod yn deall y bydd y Gweinidog Cyllid yn gwneud datganiad yfory ar ei phenderfyniad i ddyrannu arian yn ystod gwyliau'r Nadolig i wasanaethau cymdeithasol llywodraeth leol, mae grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi gofyn am gael dadl lawn ar yr amgylchiadau y clustnodwyd y cyllid oddi tanynt, sy'n gwbl groes i bolisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o beidio â chlustnodi arian a roddir i lywodraeth leol. Yng ngolwg y dryswch cyffredinol y tu mewn a'r tu allan i'r Siambr ynghylch graddau'r ymgynghori mewn cysylltiad â'r mesur hwn a'i ddymunoldeb, ni allwn dderbyn y datganiad busnes gan nad yw'n cynnwys dadl lawn ar y bwriad hwnnw.

Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ni chlywais y pwynt cyntaf a wnaeth Kirsty.

Kirsty Williams: A wnewch egluro a ydych yn bwriadu sicrhau y bydd y ddeddfwriaeth y cyfeiriasoch ati mewn cysylltiad â'r cod ymddygiad i lywodraeth leol yn dod ger ein bron fel rhan o'r weithdrefn arferol? Nid oeddwn yn sicr, pan ddarlleniasoch eich rhestr o Orchmynion deddfwriaethol, a oeddech yn bwriadu iddo fynd drwy weithdrefn gyflym neu'r un arferol. Dymuniad y Pwyllgor Busnes, os cofiwch, oedd y dylai ddod gerbron y Cynulliad o dan weithdrefn arferol, ond efallai imi gamglywed.

Karen Sinclair: Ymdriniaf â'r pwynt hwnnw'n gyntaf. Yr hyn a gytunwyd oedd y byddai'n weithdrefn arferol. Felly egluraf fod yr hyn a ddywedais y bore yma yn sefyll.

Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaeth Leanne am gomisiwn Richard, eglurodd Rhodri ei safbwynt yn gwbl bendant yn ystod cwestiynau. Ynghylch ei chwestiwn arall, ni

for me to make any comments in addition to those made by the Presiding Officer.

David Davies raised the issue of NHS waiting times and targets in England: the Assembly Government will not make additional Government time available in Plenary to discuss an issue that is routinely raised in the Health and Social Services Committee and during questions to the First Minister and to Jane Hutt. However, the Welsh Conservatives have a minority party debate next week; they may wish to address this matter in that debate.

On Kirsty's question on hypothecation, the Government does not intend to make time available to debate that. The Welsh Liberal Democrats also have a minority party debate scheduled for 27 January; they also could use that time to debate this matter.

fyddai'n arbennig o fuddiol imi ychwanegu dim at y sylwadau a wnaeth y Llywydd.

Cododd David Davies fater amseroedd aros a thargedau'r GIG yn Lloegr: ni fydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn darparu amser ychwanegol o eiddo'r Llywodraeth yn y Cyfarfod Llawn i drafod mater sy'n cael ei godi'n rheolaidd yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ac yn ystod cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog ac i Jane Hutt. Fodd bynnag, mae gan Geidwadwyr Cymru ddadl plaid leiafrifol yr wythnos nesaf; efallai y byddant yn dymuno trafod y mater hwn yn y ddadl honno.

Ynghylch y cwestiwn a ofynnodd Kirsty am glustnodi, nid yw'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu neilltuo amser i drafod hynny. Mae dadl plaid leiafrifol wedi'i hamserlennu ar gyfer Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru hwythau ar 27 Ionawr; gallent hwythau ddefnyddio'r amser hwnnw i gael dadl ar y mater hwn.

Cynnig: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.

Motion: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 28.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Isherwood, Mark
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Datganiad ar y Mesur Addysg Uwch Statement on the Higher Education Bill

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I announced in July that we had reached agreement with the Government in Westminster to devolve student support to the Assembly and, since then, we have been working on this necessary and logical transfer of functions.

I take this opportunity to tell Members about the progress made, the new powers proposed, and the potential impact on the higher education sector in Wales. The Higher Education Bill introduced in Parliament last week is an important step in the process of devolving higher education functions to the Assembly. Devolving HE functions would give us more control of the main levers over student support so that we can continue to build towards a successful and integrated higher education system. Devolving HE functions to Wales would help us to deliver on the commitment that we have made in 'Reaching Higher' to building a HE sector in Wales that is world class in terms of learning, research and economic growth.

In introducing the Bill, Charles Clarke announced a package of financial support for students, which includes increasing the new HE grant from £1,000 in 2004 to £1,500 for new students from 2006-07. That would mirror what we have already achieved in Wales through the Assembly learning grant. Around 30 per cent of students in England and Wales are expected to benefit from the full grant. The amount of maintenance loan available to students will be increased and any outstanding loan amounts after 25 years will be written off.

More students would benefit from the HE grant to be introduced by the Department for Education and Skills on an England and Wales basis from September 2004. Welsh

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Cyhoeddais ym mis Gorffennaf ein bod wedi dod i gytundeb â'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan i ddatganoli cymorth i fyfyrwyr i'r Cynulliad ac, ers hynny, buom yn gweithio ar y trosglwyddo angenrheidiol a rhesymegol hwn ar swyddogaethau.

Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i ddweud wrth Aelodau am y cynnydd a wnaed, a'r pwerau newydd a gynigiwyd, a'r effaith bosibl ar y sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Mae'r Mesur Addysg Uwch a gyflwynwyd yn y Senedd yr wythnos diwethaf yn gam pwysig ymlaen yn y broses o ddatganoli swyddogaethau addysg uwch i'r Cynulliad. Byddai datganoli swyddogaethau addysg uwch yn rhoi mwy o reolaeth i ni dros yr hyn sy'n dylanwadu'n bennaf ar y cymorth a roddir i fyfyrwyr fel y gallwn barhau i weithio tuag at sicrhau system addysg uwch sy'n llwyddiannus ac yn integredig. Byddai datganoli swyddogaethau addysg uwch i Gymru yn ein helpu i gyflawni'r ymrwymiad a wnaethom yn 'Ymgeisio yn Uwch' i greu sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru sydd gyda'r gorau yn y byd o ran dysgu, ymchwil a thwf economaidd.

Wrth gyflwyno'r Mesur, cyhoeddodd Charles Clarke becyn o gymorth ariannol i fyfyrwyr, sy'n cynnwys codi'r grant addysg uwch newydd o £1,000 yn 2004 i £1,500 ar gyfer myfyrwyr newydd o 2006-07 ymlaen. Byddai hynny'n adlewyrchu'r hyn a gyflawnasom eisoes yng Nghymru drwy grant dysgu'r Cynulliad. Disgwylir y bydd tua 30 y cant o fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru a Lloegr yn cael y grant llawn. Bydd cynnydd ym maint y benthyciad cynhaliaeth sydd ar gael i fyfyrwyr a bydd unrhyw ran o'r benthyciadau sy'n weddill ar ôl 25 mlynedd yn cael ei dileu.

Byddai mwy o fyfyrwyr yn elwa o'r grant addysg uwch sydd i'w gyflwyno gan yr Adran Addysg a Sgiliau ledled Cymru a Lloegr o fis Medi 2004. Byddai myfyrwyr

domiciled students, who begin their courses in September/October 2004, and who would have qualified for the maximum £1,500 under the current ALG scheme, would get the £1,000 HE grant plus an additional £500 ALG top-up. From the transfer of functions in 2006, only the ALG would be available in Wales.

By abandoning up-front fees and introducing the HE grant, Westminster further acknowledges the effective work of Professor Teresa Rees's investigation into student hardship in Wales. It is clear that we have been ahead of the game within the powers devolved to us. The full transfer of student support and tuition fee powers would enable us to develop policies that are right for the HE sector in Wales. Some have argued that the transfer of student support gives the Assembly bogus powers. Those 'bogus' powers are the same ones currently enjoyed by the Governments of Scotland and Northern Ireland. These are real powers, which enable us to take a whole system view of HE and FE in Wales. We already have policy and financial responsibility for higher education and further education in Wales.

The proposed new powers would allow us to determine how student support works in Wales, and whether or not to introduce variable fees. The subject of variable fees has provoked much debate. Such debate is healthy if it is well-informed, so let us be clear about the facts. The Bill would allow us to determine our own fee regime in Wales. It would give this Assembly Government, and future Assembly Governments, that statutory flexibility. It is sensible legal drafting. Let me reiterate the commitment on which we were elected: we will not introduce variable fees in the lifetime of this Assembly. We have always said that we will, however, keep our options open. Any future decision will be made on the basis of sound independent advice, and the needs of the HE sector in Wales as a whole.

sydd â'u cartref yng Nghymru, sy'n dechrau eu cyrsiau ym Medi/Hydref 2004, ac a fuasai'n gymwys i gael yr uchafswm o £1,500 o dan gynllun presennol grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad, yn cael y grant addysg uwch o £1,000 ynghyd â £500 ar ben hynny ar ffurf grant dysgu'r Cynulliad. Ar ôl trosglwyddo swyddogaethau yn 2006, dim ond grant dysgu'r Cynulliad a fyddai ar gael yng Nghymru.

Drwy roi'r gorau i ffioedd a delir ymlaen llaw a chyflwyno'r grant addysg uwch, mae San Steffan yn rhoi rhagor o gydnabyddiaeth i'r gwaith a wnaed drwy ymchwiliad yr Athro Teresa Rees i galedi ymysg myfyrwyr yng Nghymru. Mae'n amlwg inni fod ar y blaen wrth arfer y pwerau a ddatganolwyd i ni. Drwy drosglwyddo'r holl bwerau dros gymorth i fyfyrwyr a ffioedd hyfforddi, byddem yn gallu datblygu polisiau sy'n briodol i'r sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Mae rhai wedi dadlau mai pwerau ffug a gaiff y Cynulliad drwy drosglwyddo cymorth i fyfyrwyr. Yr un yw'r pwerau 'ffug' hynny â'r rhai y mae Llywodraethau'r Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon yn meddu arnynt ar hyn o bryd. Pwerau go-iawn yw'r rhain, sy'n ein galluogi i edrych ar y system addysg uwch ac addysg bellach yng Nghymru yn ei chyfanrwydd. Yr ydym eisoes yn meddu ar gyfrifoldeb dros bolisi a chyllid addysg uwch ac addysg bellach yng Nghymru.

Byddai'r pwerau newydd a gynigir yn caniatáu inni benderfynu sut y mae cymorth i fyfyrwyr yn gweithio yng Nghymru, ac a fyddwn yn cyflwyno ffioedd amrywiadwy. Mae pwnc ffioedd amrywiadwy wedi achosi llawer o ddadlau. Mae dadlau o'r fath yn beth iach os ydyw'n wybodus, felly gadewch inni ddeall y ffeithiau. Byddai'r Mesur yn gadael inni bennu ein cyfundrefn ffioedd ein hunain yng Nghymru. Byddai'n rhoi hyblygrwydd statudol o'r fath i'r Llywodraeth Cynulliad hon, a Llywodraethau'r Cynulliad yn y dyfodol. Drafftio cyfreithiol synhwyrol ydyw. Gadewch imi ailddatgan yr ymrwymiad y'n hetholwyd ni ar ei sail: ni chyflwynwn ffioedd amrywiadwy yn ystod oes y Cynulliad hwn. Yr ydym wedi dweud erioed, er hynny, y byddwn yn cadw ein dewis yn rhydd. Gwneir unrhyw benderfyniad yn y dyfodol ar sail cyngor annibynnol dibynadwy, ac anghenion y sector

addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn ei gyfanrwydd.

When the Bill receives Royal Assent, Professor Teresa Rees will conduct an independent review of the issue of variable fees, exploring how we might use devolved student support powers to achieve the best possible outcomes for Wales, and to advise on the way forward for Wales. I have worked closely with Charles Clarke and Alan Johnson on the devolution of student support. That work, including negotiations on the financial settlement, continues, and we will get the best deal possible for Wales. The Assembly Government has also given a commitment that no HE institution will be financially disadvantaged by the manifesto commitment not to introduce variable fees in the academic year of 2006-07. The Higher Education Bill is about more than variable fees. It also has provisions on research and student complaints. The Bill proposes creating a statutory UK-wide arts and humanities research council to replace the existing Arts and Humanities Research Board, as well as for the direct funding of arts and humanities research by the Secretary of State for Wales at the Department for Education and Skills and the Assembly. The aim is to put research in the arts and humanities on the same footing as science-based research. That reflects the importance placed on arts and humanities research. Members of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee have already welcomed this development.

Pan roddir Cydsyniad y Frenhines i'r Mesur, bydd yr Athro Teresa Rees yn cynnal adolygiad annibynnol o fater ffioedd amrywiadwy, gan ymchwilio i'r modd y gallem ddefnyddio'r pwerau dros gymorth i fyfyrwyr a ddatganolwyd i sicrhau'r canlyniadau gorau posibl i Gymru, ac i gynghori ynghylch y ffordd ymlaen i Gymru. Yr wyf wedi gweithio'n agos â Charles Clarke ac Alan Johnson ar ddatganoli cymorth i fyfyrwyr. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw, gan gynnwys negodiadau ar y setliad ariannol, yn parhau, a chawn y fargen orau posibl i Gymru. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo hefyd i sicrhau na fydd unrhyw sefydliad addysg uwch o dan anfantais ariannol oherwydd yr ymrwymiad maniffesto i beidio â chyflwyno ffioedd amrywiadwy ym mlwyddyn academiaidd 2006-07. Mae'r Mesur Addysg Uwch yn ymwneud â mwy na ffioedd amrywiadwy. Mae darpariaethau ynddi hefyd ar gyfer ymchwil a chwynion gan fyfyrwyr. Mae'r Mesur yn cynnig creu cyngor ymchwil statudol ar gyfer y celfyddydau a phynciau dyneiddiol i'r DU gyfan yn lle Bwrdd Ymchwil y Celfyddydau a Phynciau Dyneiddiol fel y mae ar hyn o bryd, yn ogystal â chyllido ymchwil i'r celfyddydau a phynciau dyneiddiol yn uniongyrchol gan Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn yr Adran Addysg a Sgiliau ac yn y Cynulliad. Y bwriad yw gwneud ymchwil i'r celfyddydau a phynciau dyneiddiol yn gydradd ag ymchwil i'r gwyddorau. Mae hynny'n adlewyrchu'r pwys a roddir ar ymchwil i'r celfyddydau a phynciau dyneiddiol. Mae aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes eisoes wedi croesawu'r datblygiad hwn.

The Bill also proposes the establishment of an independent adjudicator who will review complaints made by students in HE institutions. We would envisage operating a scheme, based on the voluntary scheme established by Universities UK, on an England and Wales basis. It is a sensible move, which is welcomed by the National Union of Students, and which makes for a more transparent and cost-effective complaints procedure. This Bill proposes an opportunity to determine in Wales our own

Mae'r Mesur hefyd yn cynnig sefydlu dyfarnwr annibynnol a fydd yn adolygu cwynion a wneir gan fyfyrwyr mewn sefydliadau addysg uwch. Yr ydym yn rhagweld gweithredu cynllun a fyddai'n seiliedig ar y cynllun gwirfoddol a sefydlwyd gan Universities UK, ledled Cymru a Lloegr. Mae'n gam synhwyrol, a groesewir gan Undeb Cenedlaethol y Myfyrwyr, a fydd yn darparu ar gyfer gweithdrefn gwyno fwy tryloyw a chost-ffeithiol. Mae'r Mesur hwn yn cynnig cyfle inni benderfynu ar ein

policies in HE. It would enable us to continue to build a HE sector in Wales that is world class in terms of teaching and research—a vibrant, sustainable HE sector for the benefit of the wider economy.

Janet Ryder: That statement must pass as one of the best pieces of New Labour spin that I have heard for a long time. You continually ducked the crucial issue that is making this one of Labour in Westminster's most unpopular Bills, namely top-up fees, and the detrimental effect that they will have on many students in Wales. You made much of the powers that would be transferred to the National Assembly, but you made no mention of where the money will come from to allow you to develop an alternative route in Wales. You must now be honest and state what your intentions will be post 2007. That is crucial to the people who will be reading your manifesto in 2007, but it is also crucial for the HE sector, which needs to know how it is going to plan for what could be a massive influx of students from England if we do not go ahead with top-up fees in Wales.

Are you not a little embarrassed when you defend a policy that was considered regressive and divisive even by the Thatcher administration? Even if, as Charles Clarke said—and you reiterated his words today—this would devolve HE student support to Wales, if the Bill falls, those powers will go with it.

3.20 p.m.

Do you not agree that if this Bill goes ahead, it will cheat many Welsh students, particularly those from poorer backgrounds? This Bill must be defeated in Westminster for that reason and should never reach the statute book. It is an unfair and elitist Bill that will discriminate against some students and create an unhealthy market in the higher education sector. Also, it will not raise the funds that the higher education sector has identified that it will need. The Bill must be defeated in Westminster.

polisiâu ein hunain ar addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Byddai'n ein galluogi i barhau i greu sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru sydd gyda'r gorau o ran dysgu ac ymchwil—sector addysg uwch bywiog a chynaliadwy er budd yr economi ehangach.

Janet Ryder: Yn ddiôs, mae'r datganiad hwnnw ymysg yr enghreifftiau gorau o sbîn Llafur Newydd a glywais ers talwm. Gwnaethoch osgoi'n barhaus y mater hollbwysig sy'n peri mai hwn yw un o'r Mesurau mwyaf amhoblogaidd sydd gan Lafur yn San Steffan, sef ffioedd ychwanegol, a'r effaith niweidiol a gânt ar lawer o fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru. Cafwyd llawer o sôn gennych am y pwerau a gâi eu trosglwyddo i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ond ni ddywedasoch o ble y daw'r arian i ganiatáu ichi ddatblygu dull gweithredu gwahanol yng Nghymru. Rhaid ichi fod yn onest yn awr a dweud beth fydd eich bwriad ar ôl 2007. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig i'r sawl a fydd yn darllen eich maniffesto yn 2007, ond mae hefyd yn hollbwysig i'r sector addysg uwch, y mae'n rhaid iddo gael gwybod sut y gwnaiff gynllunio ar gyfer y mewnlifiad anferth o fyfyrwyr y gellid ei gael o Loegr os nad awn ymlaen â ffioedd ychwanegol yng Nghymru.

Onid ydych yn teimlo braidd yn chwithig wrth amddiffyn polisi a ystyrid yn atchweliadol ac yn gynhennus hyd yn oed gan weinyddiaeth Thatcher? Hyd yn oed os byddai hyn yn fodd i ddatganoli cymorth i fyfyrwyr mewn addysg uwch i Gymru, fel y dywedodd Charles Clarke—a gwnaethoch ailadrodd ei eiriau heddiw—os bydd y Mesur yn methu, bydd y pwerau hynny'n ei ddilyn.

Onid ydych yn cytuno y bydd y Mesur hwn, os aiff yn ei flaen, yn gwneud cam â llawer o fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru, yn enwedig y rhai o gefndiroedd tlotach? Rhaid trechu'r Mesur hwn yn San Steffan oherwydd hynny ac ni ddylai byth ddod yn Ddeddf. Mae'n Fesur annheg ac elitaidd a fydd yn anffafrio rhai myfyrwyr ac yn creu marchnad afiach yn y sector addysg uwch. Yn ogystal â hynny, ni fydd yn codi'r cyllid y mae'r sector addysg uwch wedi canfod y bydd arno'i angen. Rhaid trechu'r Mesur hwn yn San Steffan.

Minister, what are you and your Government doing to work with your colleagues, the Labour Welsh MPs who oppose this Bill? Are you working with them to try to defeat this Bill in Westminster, or will you take what could be called a hospital pass, if this were a rugby game, from the Government? You have no option, you must defeat this Bill in Westminster, and I want to know what you are doing about this matter. The other issue is that a request was made for a specific Welsh clause in this Bill concerning naming a university within a university. What happened to that clause and when might we see it in Westminster?

Jane Davidson: I am interested that you say that when you have managed to sit through my statement which clearly said how we will take forward the measures proposed in the Bill, subject to a satisfactory outcome for the Bill, how we will take forward our devolved responsibilities, and how the devolution of power to Wales will enable us to take a Welsh view. If we are talking about people coming clean, as a party you should come clean about why you oppose the devolution of power in relation to higher education in Wales. It seems bizarre that it is this part, which is outside our current powers and which is coming to us in this Bill, and which I think that every Member of the Assembly should welcome, that Plaid Cymru does not want, although the so-called party of Wales pledges to seek independence for Wales—‘independence’ was the word that was agreed upon in its party conference. It does not want independence when difficult decisions must be made. I can assure you, as I have done since the proposition was first brought forward in July, that the money will come with the transfer. That is terribly important. It is also important for me to say that I am confident that the work of Teresa Rees and her commission has demonstrated unequivocally that having up-front fees was a deterrent to students, even if they did not have to pay them, and that there is an unequivocal need to introduce grants into the system. The proposed legislation takes both aspects, devolution and grants, into account, and improves what is available to students in Wales. The issue about the university within

Weinidog, beth ydych chi a’ch Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i gydweithio â’ch cyd-aelodau, yr ASau Llafur o Gymru sy’n gwrthwynebu’r Mesur hwn? A ydych yn gweithio gyda hwy i drechu’r Mesur hwn yn San Steffan, neu a fyddwch, pe bai hon yn gêm rygbi, yn dal yr hyn y gellid ei alw’n bêl beryglus gan y Llywodraeth? Nid oes dewis gennych, rhaid ichi drechu’r Mesur hwn yn San Steffan, ac yr wyf am gael gwybod beth ydych yn ei wneud am y mater hwn. Y pwnc arall sy’n codi yw bod cais wedi’i wneud am gymal penodol ar gyfer Cymru yn y Mesur hwn ynghylch enwi prifysgol o fewn prifysgol. Beth fu hanes y cymal hwnnw a pha bryd y gallem ei weld yn San Steffan?

Jane Davidson: Mae o ddiddordeb imi’ch clywed yn dweud hynny a chithau wedi llwyddo i wrando ar fy natganiad ar ei hyd a hwnnw wedi nodi’n glir sut y byddwn yn bwrw ymlaen â’r mesurau a gynigir yn y Mesur, os caiff ganlyniad boddhaol, sut y byddwn yn bwrw ymlaen â’n cyfrifoldebau datganoledig, a sut y bydd datganoli pŵer i Gymru yn ein galluogi i arddel safbwynt Cymreig. Os ydym yn sôn am bobl yn cyfaddef y cwbl, fel plaid dylech chi gyfaddef y cwbl ynghylch y rheswm yr ydych yn gwrthwynebu datganoli pŵer mewn cysylltiad ag addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Ymddengys yn rhyfedd mai’r rhan hon, sydd y tu allan i gwmpas ein pwerau presennol ac sy’n dod atom yn y Mesur hwn, ac y credaf y dylai pob Aelod o’r Cynulliad ei chroesawu, yw’r un nad yw Plaid Cymru am ei chael, er bod y blaid Cymru honedig yn addo ceisio annibyniaeth i Gymru—‘annibyniaeth’ oedd y gair y cytunwyd arno yn ei chynhadledd blaid. Nid yw am gael annibyniaeth pan fo’n rhaid gwneud penderfyniadau anodd. Gallaf eich sicrhau, fel y gwneuthum ers rhoi’r bwriad ger eich bron ym mis Gorffennaf, y daw’r arian gyda’r trosglwyddo. Mae hynny’n ofnadwy o bwysig. Mae hefyd yn bwysig imi ddweud fy mod yn ffyddiog bod y gwaith a wnaeth Teresa Rees a’i chomisiwn wedi profi’n ddiamwys fod ffioedd a delid ymlaen llaw yn rhwystr i fyfyrwyr, hyd yn oed os nad oeddent yn gorfod eu talu, a bod angen pendant i gyflwyno grantiau yn y system. Mae’r ddeddfwriaeth arfaethedig yn ystyried y ddwy agwedd, datganoli a grantiau, ac yn gwella’r hyn sydd ar gael i

a university is separate from the Higher Education Bill, and it was always so.

Jeff Cuthbert: I understand the arguments that are often made that higher education should be free to the learner. When I went to university at Cardiff about 10 years ago in the 1970s—

The First Minister: That was 30 years ago.

Jeff Cuthbert: I wondered who would be the first to notice that—I would have had a full grant and my local authority would have paid my fees, had that been necessary. The National Coal Board paid my fees and it also provided a grant. I did a degree in mining engineering, which would have set me up for life were it not for the 1979 general election when a certain party came to power and destroyed the mining industry in Wales.

There are two points here. First, the number of young people entering higher education has more than doubled, if not trebled, since I went to university. That means that the funding methods that were used then are not sustainable now. Secondly, industry, especially in the fields of science, engineering and technology, could be more pro-active in sponsoring learners, including employees, through higher education.

Has not the UK-wide debate on higher education funding and student support been so widely misrepresented by the media and, certainly, by opposition parties that it is not surprising that there is great confusion?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Labour MPs were against it.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I am keen for Members to stop this habit of making sedentary interventions. I will not allow additional supplementaries to be made in that way, and neither will I allow interventions that are not proper interventions. This is a statement with questions and interventions

fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru. Mae'r pwnc sy'n ymwneud â'r brifysgol o fewn prifysgol yn fater sydd ar wahân i'r Mesur Addysg Uwch, ac felly y bu erioed.

Jeff Cuthbert: Yr wyf yn deall y dadleuon a roddir yn aml i'r perwyl y dylai addysg uwch fod ar gael am ddim i'r dysgwyr. Pan euthum i'r brifysgol yng Nghaerdydd tua 10 mlynedd yn ôl yn y 1970au—

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oedd hynny 30 mlynedd yn ôl.

Jeff Cuthbert: Yr oeddwn yn meddwl tybed pwy a fyddai'r cyntaf i sylwi ar hynny—byddwn wedi cael grant llawn a byddai'r awdurdod lleol wedi talu fy ffioedd, pe buasai angen hynny. Y Bwrdd Glo Cenedlaethol a dalodd fy ffioedd i a darparodd grant hefyd. Astudiais ar gyfer gradd mewn peirianeg mwyngloddio, a fuasai wedi rhoi cynhaliaeth imi am oes oni bai am etholiad cyffredinol 1979 pan ddaeth plaid benodol i rym a dinistrio'r diwydiant glo yng Nghymru.

Mae dau bwynt i'w codi yma. Yn gyntaf, mae nifer y bobl ifanc sy'n mynd i addysg uwch wedi dyblu, os nad treblu, a rhagor ers imi fynd i brifysgol. Oherwydd hynny, nid yw'r dulliau cyllido a arferid bryd hynny'n gynaliadwy bellach. Yn ail, gallai diwydiant, yn enwedig ym meysydd y gwyddorau, peirianeg a thechnoleg, fod yn fwy rhagweithiol o ran noddi dysgwyr, gan gynnwys gweithwyr cyflogedig, i fynd drwy addysg uwch.

Onid yw'r ddadl ledled y DU ar gyllido addysg uwch a chymorth i fyfyrwyr wedi'i chamliwio gymaint gan y cyfryngau ac, yn sicr, gan y gwrthbleidiau fel nad oes syndod bod dryswch mawr?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr oedd ASau Llafur yn ei erbyn.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf yn awyddus i Aelodau roi'r gorau i'r arfer hwn o ymyrryd pan ydynt ar eu heistedd. Ni fyddaf yn caniatáu gofyn cwestiynau atodol ychwanegol yn y modd hwnnw, ac ni fyddaf yn caniatáu ymyriadau nad ydynt yn ymyriadau priodol ychwaith. Datganiad gyda

are therefore not allowed. I will have to take the rather extreme step of not calling people to intervene if they persist in intervening while sitting—and that includes the leader of the opposition.

Jeff Cuthbert: Hear, hear.

Minister, is it not true that these measures will provide a far more solid footing for higher education institutions while enabling more young people to take advantage of places?

Jane Davidson: It is true that there are far more students now than in the 1970s, and that is clearly a good thing. In Wales, we excel at widening access to lowest-income students, but we still have a great deal more to do. There are many from low income families who do not go to university and who would be able to do so if they had some form of support. We have found that the first 18 months of the Assembly learning grant—we have an ongoing evaluation that we fed into Professor Teresa Rees's review—contributed substantially to people feeling that they can go on to higher education, as it put money in their pockets. As I said in my statement, I welcome the UK Government's proposals to re-introduce a grant in England for the poorest students. That is important because, post devolution, as seen in debates in Northern Ireland, Scotland and Wales, all devolved regions of the UK introduced some form of grant system to encourage the most disadvantaged in society to go to university, and that has been important as the UK Government considers introducing its own grant. I am grateful that it has looked long and hard at the Assembly learning grant, and the proposed grant, which starts off at £1,000 this year, rising to £1,500 in 2006, will have similar conditions to the Assembly learning grant. We are clearly influencing the debate on grants for students in the UK, and that is important. While we fully welcome the increase in student numbers, which continue to rise year on year, we do not yet have a system that encourages those on lower incomes to be clear about their own opportunities. That is why it is important that, after the Bill receives Royal Assent, we in Wales are able to define a system to fund

chwestiynau yw hwn ac felly ni chaniateir ymyriadau. Byddaf yn gorfod cymryd y cam eithafol braidd o beidio â galw ar bobl i ymyrryd os ydynt yn dal ati i ymyrryd tra ydynt ar eu heistedd—ac mae hynny'n cynnwys arweinydd yr wrthblaid.

Jeff Cuthbert: Clywch, clywch.

Weinidog, onid yw'n wir y bydd y mesurau hyn yn darparu sylfaen gadarnach o lawer i sefydliadau addysg uwch gan alluogi rhagor o bobl ifanc i gael y fantais o gael lle ynddynt?

Jane Davidson: Mae'n wir bod mwy o lawer o fyfyrwyr yn awr nag yr oedd yn y 1970au, ac mae'n amlwg bod hynny'n beth da. Yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn rhagori o ran ehangu mynediad i fyfyrwyr sydd â'r incwm isaf, ond mae gennym lawer iawn o waith i'w wneud eto. Mae llawer mewn teuluoedd sydd ag incwm isel nad ydynt yn mynd i brifysgol ac a fyddai'n gallu gwneud hynny os caent ryw fath o gymorth. Canfuom fod y 18 mis cyntaf o grant dysgu'r Cynulliad—yr ydym yn cynnal gwerthusiad parhaus a gyfrannwn i adolygiad yr Athro Teresa Rees—wedi cyfrannu'n sylweddol at beri i bobl deimlo y gallant fynd ymlaen i addysg uwch, gan ei fod yn rhoi arian yn eu poced. Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, croesawaf gynlluniau Llywodraeth y DU i ailgyflwyno grant yn Lloegr ar gyfer y myfyrwyr tlotaf. Mae hynny'n bwysig oherwydd, ar ôl datganoli, fel y gwelwyd yn y dadleuon yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, yr Alban a Chymru, gwnaeth holl ranbarthau datganoledig y DU gyflwyno rhyw fath o system grantiau i gymell y rhai mwyaf difreintiedig mewn cymdeithas i fynd i brifysgol, a bu hynny'n bwysig wrth i Lywodraeth y DU ystyried ei grant ei hun. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ei bod wedi bwrw golwg hir a manwl ar grant dysgu'r Cynulliad, a bydd y grant arfaethedig, sy'n dechrau ar £1,000 eleni, gan godi i £1,500 yn 2006, yn debyg o ran yr amodau sydd arno i grant dysgu'r Cynulliad. Mae'n amlwg ein bod yn dylanwadu ar y ddadl ynghylch grantiau i fyfyrwyr yn y DU, ac mae hynny'n bwysig. Er ein bod yn llwyr groesawu'r cynnydd yn nifer y myfyrwyr, sy'n dal i godi o flwyddyn i flwyddyn, nid oes gennym system eto sy'n cymell y rhai sydd ag incwm is i ddeall y cyfleoedd sydd ar gael iddynt. Dyna pam y

institutions and grants that is right for us.

On your proposals for industry, it is important that we have a far closer relationship between the business and industry sectors and the higher education sector. There are increasingly good outcomes and good links between those sectors, and Andrew Davies and I work closely on this agenda. It will, however, be important to feed student sponsorship issues into Teresa Rees's review because, as we know, students often stay in the area where the higher education institution they attend is located.

3.30 p.m.

Therefore, sponsorship of students in our institutions here will also contribute to developing a talented and highly skilled workforce in Wales. That is an attractive option, which I hope that Professor Rees's review will address.

David Davies: Have you not ignored the point made—and made rather well if I may say so—by my Plaid Cymru colleagues, namely that there is no point in having this power if we are not provided with the money to implement these policies properly. The big question that you have failed to deal with is: how will you deal with the inequalities and inconsistencies that will arise if this legislation is passed? If top-up fees are introduced in England but not Wales, that will surely mean that, unless you can plug the gap, English universities will have more money and will, therefore, be able to offer higher standards of education. Will you be able to plug the gap? Will you be able to make up for the relative lack of funding that Welsh universities will suffer by taking money from elsewhere, and, if so, from which budget will you take it? We need a clear answer on that. Will you be able to provide the additional money that Welsh universities will need to compete with English universities? If the answer to that question is 'yes', is it not the case that you will face another problem, as you will surely be flooded by applications from English

mae'n bwysig, wedi i'r Mesur dderbyn Cydsyniad y Frenhines, ein bod ni yng Nghymru'n gallu diffinio system i gyllido sefydliadau a grantiau sy'n briodol i ni.

Ynghylch eich cynigion ar gyfer diwydiant, mae'n bwysig inni gael perthynas agosach o lawer rhwng sectorau busnes a diwydiant a sector addysg uwch. Mae'r canlyniadau a'r cysylltiadau rhwng y sectorau hynny'n gwella fwyfwy, ac mae Andrew Davies a minnau'n cydweithio'n agos ar yr agenda hon. Fodd bynnag, bydd yn bwysig cynnwys materion sy'n ymwneud â noddi myfyrwyr yn adolygiad Teresa Rees oherwydd, fel y gwyddom, mae myfyrwyr yn aml yn aros yn ardal y sefydliad addysg uwch y maent yn mynd iddo.

Gan hynny, bydd noddi myfyrwyr yn ein sefydliadau yma'n cyfrannu hefyd at ddatblygu gweithlu talentog a thra medrus yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n ddewis atyniadol, a gobeithiaf y bydd adolygiad yr Athro Rees yn ymdrin â hynny.

David Davies: Onid ydych wedi anwybyddu'r pwynt a wnaed—a hynny'n eithaf da os caf ddweud—gan fy nghyd-Aelodau ym Mhlaid Cymru, sef nad oes diben cael y pŵer hwn os na ddarperir digon o arian inni roi'r polisiau hyn ar waith yn iawn. Y cwestiwn mawr yr ydych wedi methu â delio ag ef yw: sut y byddwch yn ymdrin â'r anghydraddoldebau a'r anghysonderau a fydd yn codi os caiff y ddeddfwriaeth hon ei phasio? Os cyflwynir ffioedd ychwanegol yn Lloegr ond nid yng Nghymru, mae hynny'n sicr o olygu, os na allwch llenwi'r bwlch, y bydd mwy o arian gan brifysgolion yn Lloegr ac y byddant, felly, yn gallu cynnig safonau addysg uwch. A fyddwch yn gallu llenwi'r bwlch? A fyddwch yn gallu gwneud iawn am y diffyg cyllid cymharol y bydd prifysgolion Cymru'n dioddef ganddo drwy gymryd arian o rywle arall, ac, os byddwch, o ba gyllideb y byddwch yn ei gymryd? Rhaid inni gael ateb pendant ar hynny. A fyddwch yn gallu darparu'r arian ychwanegol y bydd ar brifysgolion Cymru ei angen i gystadlu â phrifysgolion Lloegr? Os mai 'byddwn' yw'r ateb i'r cwestiwn hwnnw, oni fyddwch yn

students who want to study in Wales because they will not be charged fees? Or will they be charged fees? When I put that question to you a few months ago in the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, you made it clear that English students would not be charged fees if they went to Welsh universities, because they will only apply to universities.

That is what you said in the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee a few months ago. Perhaps you would like to tell us whether there has been a change. Is it not the case that this piece of legislation is flawed? You do not need to take my word for it; listen to your Labour Members of Parliament. I find it astounding that Labour—a party formed by socialists at the turn of the last century—is trying to implement a measure that will mean that worse-off students, to whom you have just referred, will be unable to enjoy their right to higher education. Does it not astound you that your colleagues in Westminster are trying to do this? Do you not agree with the Conservatives, Plaid Cymru, the Liberal Democrats, and with your own Members of Parliament, that we must work together to try to defeat this iniquitous piece of legislation before poorer students spend the rest of their lives at a disadvantage?

Jane Davidson: I have made it clear at all points since we began this debate that we would only want student support transferred to Wales if we receive a financial package that is acceptable to the Assembly Government. I have received assurances from Charles Clarke that the transfer in 2006 will be cost neutral. That is, there will be no financial benefit to the Assembly Government or to the UK Government in the transfer. It will be a direct transfer in terms of the existing Assembly support. The new grant proposed is substantially better than what was initially proposed and will, consequentially, bring a substantial income into Wales.

We have made it clear that we will make a statement on how we intend to fund higher education in Wales after the Bill receives

wynebu problem arall, gan y byddwch yn sicr o gael eich boddi dan geisiadau oddi wrth fyfyrwyr yn Lloegr sydd am astudio yng Nghymru am na chodir ffioedd arnynt? Ynteu a godir ffioedd arnynt? Pan ofynnais y cwestiwn hwnnw i chi ychydig fisoedd yn ôl yn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, rhoesoch ar ddeall na fyddid yn codi ffioedd ar fyfyrwyr o Loegr ped aent i brifysgolion yng Nghymru, gan na fyddant ond yn berthnasol i brifysgolion.

Dyna a ddywedasoch yn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ychydig fisoedd yn ôl. Efallai y carech ddweud wrthym a fu newid. Onid yw'n wir bod y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn ddiffygiol? Nid oes rhaid ichi dderbyn fy ngair i am hynny; gwrandewch ar eich Aelodau Seneddol Llafur. Fe'i caf yn syfrdanol bod Llafur—plaid a ffurfiwyd gan sosialwyr ar droad y ganrif ddiwethaf—yn ceisio rhoi mesur ar waith a fydd yn golygu na fydd y myfyrwyr lleiaf cefnog, yr ydych newydd gyfeirio atynt, yn gallu arfer eu hawl i gael addysg uwch. Onid yw'n eich synnu bod eich cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan yn ceisio gwneud hyn? Onid ydych yn cytuno â'r Ceidwadwyr, Plaid Cymru, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, a chyda'ch Aelodau Seneddol eich hun, fod rhaid inni weithio gyda'n gilydd i geisio trechu'r eitem ddeddfwriaeth anghyfiawn hon cyn i fyfyrwyr tlotach ddechrau treulio gweddill eu hoes o dan anfantais?

Jane Davidson: Yr wyf wedi egluro ar bob cyfle ers inni ddechrau'r ddadl hon na fyddem ond am weld cymorth i fyfyrwyr yn cael ei drosglwyddo i Gymru os caem becyn ariannol sy'n dderbyniol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yr wyf wedi cael sicrwydd gan Charles Clarke y bydd y trosglwyddo yn 2006 yn niwtral o ran ei gost. Hynny yw, ni fydd mantais ariannol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad nac i Lywodraeth y DU wrth drosglwyddo. Bydd yn drosglwyddiad uniongyrchol yng nghyd-destun y cymorth a gaiff y Cynulliad ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r grant newydd a gynigir yn well o lawer na'r hyn a gynigiwyd ar y dechrau ac, o ganlyniad, daw ag incwm sylweddol i Gymru.

Yr ydym wedi egluro y byddwn yn gwneud datganiad ar y modd y bwriadwn gyllido addysg uwch yng Nghymru wedi i'r Mesur

Royal Assent, and after Professor Teresa Rees's independent commission, which was so influential for us and for other parts of the UK in the work done before, reports. We estimate that it will do so around the spring of 2005, and we will make a statement that autumn, or thereabouts, on our intentions as an Assembly Government. It is also important to state that we will need to go through several stages before we move to legislative delivery. As Rhodri Morgan said during questions to the First Minister, we are still awaiting the absolute detail of the proposals. The Bill has to pass through Parliament, it will then be subject to a general election, and it will then be subject to the next Assembly election before delivery here, as the Assembly Government has made it clear that we will not introduce variable fees during this Assembly's lifetime. Therefore, there are not only issues around the process of the legislation, there are also several other democratic processes to be considered.

What I said was that English students coming to Wales would therefore be charged the same as Welsh students in Wales would, in the sense that, as part of the legislation, there will be no up-front fees in Wales from 2006 onwards. Students will be able to choose to pay a fee up-front if they wish to—the standard fee will be £1,200 from 2006 onwards—or they will be able to have the fee remitted if they are on a low income, whether they come from England or Wales. What we will not allow our universities to do is charge over and above the standard fee. That is what I said in Committee.

I will end by saying that,

‘we need to consider all the possibilities. I will not rule anything out at this stage. When we have reached our conclusions, we will publish our proposals.’

Those are not my words—they are the words of Michael Howard.

Peter Black: The Assembly Government's position is quite clear: we will not have variable fees before 2007 and it will not commit to anything else until the Rees

dderbyn Cydsyniad y Frenhines, ac ar ôl cael adroddiad comisiwn annibynnol yr Athro Teresa Rees, a fu mor ddylanwadol ar ein rhan ni a thros rannau eraill y DU yn y gwaith a wnaed o'r blaen. Yr ydym yn rhagweld y byddwn yn gwneud hynny tua gwanwyn 2005, a gwnawn ddatganiad yr hydref hwnnw, neu tua'r adeg honno, ynghylch ein bwriadau fel Llywodraeth Cynulliad. Mae hefyd yn bwysig datgan y bydd yn rhaid inni ddilyn sawl cam cyn rhoi'r ddeddfwriaeth ar waith. Fel y dywedodd Rhodri Morgan yn ystod cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog, yr ydym yn dal i ddisgwyl cael holl fanylion y cynigion. Rhaid i'r Mesur fynd drwy'r Senedd, a bydd wedyn yn dibynnu ar ganlyniad etholiad cyffredinol, ac wedyn ar ganlyniad etholiad nesaf y Cynulliad cyn ei roi ar waith yma, gan fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi rhoi ar ddeall na fyddwn yn cyflwyno ffioedd amrywiadwy yn ystod oes y Cynulliad hwn. Gan hynny, mae materion yn codi ynghylch proses y ddeddfwriaeth, a rhaid ystyried sawl proses ddemocrataidd arall hefyd.

Yr hyn a ddywedais oedd y byddid yn codi'r un swm ar fyfyrwyr o Loegr a ddeuai i Gymru ag ar fyfyrwyr o Gymru yng Nghymru, yn yr ystyr na fydd unrhyw ffioedd i'w talu ymlaen llaw yng Nghymru o 2006 ymlaen, fel rhan o'r ddeddfwriaeth. Bydd myfyrwyr yn gallu dewis talu ffi ymlaen llaw os dymunant—£1,200 fydd y ffi arferol o 2006 ymlaen—neu bydd modd dileu'r ffi ar eu cyfer os yw eu hincwm yn isel, pa un a ydynt yn dod o Loegr neu o Gymru. Yr hyn na fyddwn yn caniatáu i'n prifysgolion ei wneud yw codi swm sy'n fwy na'r ffi arferol. Dyna a ddywedais yn y Pwyllgor.

Gorffennaf drwy ddweud bod

rhaid inni ystyried yr holl bosibiliadau. Ni ddiystyraf unrhyw beth ar hyn o bryd. Pan fyddwn wedi dod i'n casgliadau, cyhoeddwn ein cynigion.

Nid fy ngeiriau i yw'r rhain ond rhai Michael Howard.

Peter Black: Mae safbwynt Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwbl glir: ni chawn ffioedd amrywiadwy cyn 2007 ac ni wnaiff ymrwymo i ddim byd arall hyd nes y bydd

commission has met and considered what is in the final Act of Parliament and what we will face once that Act is passed, if indeed it is passed. Yet, for many people, that position makes you appear to be sitting on the fence, Minister. Many people, not just students, but Labour MPs and MPs and Members from all parties, feel that the imposition of a variable fee of up to £3,000 is not just iniquitous but will deter students from going to university. It will increase student debt and will, in particular, put off poorer students, while fostering elitism among many UK universities. It would surely be better for the Assembly Government to make a commitment now and to say that we will not have variable fees, full stop, but will instead find a system of funding universities that will not have those problems and will not disadvantage students. I do not expect you to make that commitment now, Minister, although it would be nice if you did.

On the detail of the statement, can you confirm, now that the Bill has been published and we have an indication of what the proposals are this week at least, what the cost to Wales will be of us not having variable fees in 2006-07? How much money will we have to pay to universities to compensate them for those fees not being levied? Secondly, what will be the position of English students who will come to Welsh universities in 2006-07? In Scotland at present, where there have not been tuition fees for some time, Scottish students do not pay tuition fees, but English students do. Will a similar position apply in Wales with regard to variable fees, and will English students therefore pay variable fees in Welsh universities in 2006-07? Thirdly, in terms of the extra money that will be made available in England for the student grant, will Wales receive a Barnett share of that money and, if so, do we have any indication of how much extra money Wales will get as a result?

Jane Davidson: First, I will pick up some of

comisiwn Rees wedi cwrdd ac wedi ystyried yr hyn sydd yn y Ddeddf Seneddol derfynol a'r hyn a wynebwn ar ôl gwneud y Mesur hwnnw'n Ddeddf, os digwydd hynny, yn wir. Ac eto, yng ngolwg llawer, mae'r safbwynt hwnnw'n peri ichi ymddangos fel pe byddech yn eistedd ar ben y clawdd, Weinidog. Mae llawer o bobl, ac nid myfyrwyr yn unig, ond ASau Llafur ac ASau o bob plaid, yn teimlo y byddai gorfodi ffi amrywiadwy o hyd at £3,000 nid yn unig yn anghyfiawn ond y bydd yn rhwystro myfyrwyr rhag mynd i brifysgol. Bydd yn cynyddu dyledion ymysg myfyrwyr ac, yn benodol, bydd yn codi ofn ar fyfyrwyr tlotach, gan feithrin elitiaeth mewn llawer o brifysgolion yn y DU. Mae'n sicr y byddai'n well i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad wneud ymrwymiad yn awr a dweud na chawn ffioedd amrywiadwy, a dyna ben arni, ond y byddwn yn hytrach yn canfod system i gyllido prifysgolion a fydd heb y problemau hynny ac na fydd yn peri anfantais i fyfyrwyr. Ni ddisgwyliaf ichi wneud yr ymrwymiad hwnnw'n awr, Weinidog, er y byddai'n peth braf pe byddech yn gwneud hynny.

Ynghylch y manylion yn y datganiad, a allwch gadarnhau, gan fod y Mesur wedi'i gyhoeddi bellach a ninnau wedi cael gweld beth yw'r cynigion yr wythnos hon o leiaf, beth fydd y gost i Gymru o beidio â chael ffioedd amrywiadwy yn 2006-07? Faint o arian y byddwn yn gorfod ei dalu i brifysgolion i wneud iawn iddynt am beidio â chodi'r ffioedd hynny? Yn ail, beth fydd sefyllfa myfyrwyr o Loegr a ddaw i brifysgolion Cymru yn 2006-07? Yn yr Alban ar hyn o bryd, lle na fu ffioedd hyfforddi ers cryn amser, nid yw myfyrwyr o'r Alban yn talu ffioedd hyfforddi, ond mae myfyrwyr o Loegr. A geir sefyllfa debyg yng Nghymru mewn cysylltiad â ffioedd amrywiadwy, ac a fydd myfyrwyr o Loegr felly'n talu ffioedd amrywiadwy ym mhrifysgolion Cymru yn 2006-07? Yn drydydd, o ran yr arian ychwanegol a ddarperir yn Lloegr ar gyfer y grant i fyfyrwyr, a fydd Cymru'n derbyn cyfran o'r arian hwnnw yn unol â fformiwla Barnett ac, os bydd, a roddwyd unrhyw awgrym inni o faint o arian ychwanegol a gaiff Cymru o ganlyniad?

Jane Davidson: Yn gyntaf, ymdriniaf â rhai

the issues regarding the timetable for the financial development of the package. We expect to reach agreement with the Department for Education and Skills on the financial package in early 2005, after the 2004 spending review outcomes are known. Charles Clarke and I will be jointly bidding for the money. Therefore, until we know what we have won from that package, we will not be able to answer specific questions about cost. We will not know either what the cost is in terms of English universities until the prospectuses are published in late 2005 for students going on to university in 2006. That is why I am looking at Teresa Rees's work being able to encompass the publication of the prospectuses, because that will give us a clear view about what English institutions will charge.

3.40 p.m.

At this stage in the process, people are involved in much speculation, and I want to ensure that the Assembly Government, in protecting the interests of both students and institutions in Wales, deals with facts and evidence as they arise.

As I have said before, there will be no up-front fees in Wales from 2006 onwards because, subject to its successful passage through Parliament, the Bill will change policy across England and Wales. We will not allow our institutions to charge variable fees. Therefore, any student from England attending an institution in Wales will contribute fees only after graduating. That is the same for all students, whether from England or from Wales.

The Scots' arrangement operates purely for Scottish-domiciled students studying in Scotland, which is the vast majority of Scottish students—over 90 per cent, I think. That is the kind of issue that Professor Teresa Rees's review will consider in terms of Welsh-domiciled students studying in Wales. We differ from every other part of the UK in that 61 per cent of Welsh-domiciled students study in Welsh higher education institutions, 38 per cent study in England, and 1 per cent in Scotland. That 60 per cent studying in Wales still makes up less than half of our

o'r materion sy'n ymwneud â'r amserlen ar gyfer datblygiad ariannol y pecyn. Disgwyliwn ddod i gytundeb â'r Adran Addysg a Sgiliau ar y pecyn ariannol ar ddechrau 2005, ar ôl cael gwybod canlyniadau'r adolygiad o wariant yn 2004. Bydd Charles Clarke a minnau'n ymgeisio ar y cyd am yr arian. Gan hynny, hyd nes y gwyddom beth a gawn o'r pecyn hwnnw, ni fyddwn yn gallu ateb cwestiynau penodol ynghylch cost. Ni fyddwn yn gwybod ychwaith beth fydd y gost o ran prifysgolion Lloegr hyd nes y cyhoeddir y prospectysau ar ddiwedd 2005 ar gyfer myfyrwyr sy'n mynd i brifysgol yn 2006. Dyna pam yr wyf yn ystyried modd i ymestyn gwaith Teresa Rees i gwmpasu'r prospectysau pan gyhoeddir hwy, gan y bydd hynny'n ein galluogi i weld beth yn union y bydd sefydliadau yn Lloegr yn ei godi.

Yn y rhan hon o'r broses, mae pobl yn ymroi i lawer o ddyfalu, ac yr wyf am sicrhau bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, wrth ddiogelu buddiannau myfyrwyr a sefydliadau yng Nghymru, yn delio â ffeithiau a thystiolaeth fel y maent yn dod i'r amlwg.

Fel y dywedais o'r blaen, ni fydd unrhyw ffioedd a delir ymlaen llaw yng Nghymru o 2006 ymlaen oherwydd bydd y Mesur, os aiff drwy'r Senedd yn llwyddiannus, yn newid polisi ledled Cymru a Lloegr. Ni chaniatawn i'n sefydliadau godi ffioedd amrywiadwy. Gan hynny, bydd unrhyw fyfyrwr o Loegr sy'n derbyn ei addysg mewn sefydliad yng Nghymru yn cyfrannu ffioedd ar ôl graddio'n unig. Mae hynny'n wir am bob myfyrwr, pa un a ydyw o Loegr neu o Gymru.

Mae trefniant yr Albanwyr yn gweithredu ar gyfer myfyrwyr sydd â'u cartref yn yr Alban sy'n astudio yn yr Alban yn unig, sef y mwyafrif helaeth o fyfyrwyr yr Alban—mwy na 90 y cant, yr wyf yn credu. Materion o'r math hwnnw y bydd adolygiad yr Athro Teresa Rees yn eu hystyried o ran myfyrwyr sydd â'u cartref yng Nghymru sy'n astudio yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn wahanol i bob rhan arall o'r DU i'r graddau bod 61 y cant o'r myfyrwyr sydd â'u cartref yng Nghymru'n derbyn eu haddysg mewn sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru, 38 y

student population. Therefore, a range of issues surrounding cross-border flows are unique to the Wales-England relationship, which is why they must be considered. That is why we won the case in terms of devolution. We can now consider how best to deliver our own commitments, to ensure that those students on the lowest incomes have a progressive grant system—and the Assembly learning grant is a progressive grant system. I am delighted that the UK Government's grant proposals are better, as they will ensure that more students can access grants than those that we could provide. We can also consider how to fund our institutions effectively.

The Presiding Officer: We are almost out of time for this item, so I ask Members for brief questions and, dare I say it, answers that are as brief as possible, Minister.

Peter Law: There are no soft options here and we are talking about hypotheses really. However, I find it amazing that so many Labour Ministers in Parliament—not you, Minister—took advantage of public funding for their own education, yet now seek to deprive young people of the same opportunities.

The Minister has done much good work, and I congratulate her on working to get this matter devolved to us. However, we must be careful. Through the appointment of the Rees commission, which was necessary, we can raise the expectations of the people of Wales that variable fees may not be introduced in Wales. Like many others, I would prefer not to see variable, or top-up fees introduced in Wales, because I feel that the imposition of those fees—

The Presiding Officer: Order. We are well out of time for this statement, as I said. I wanted a brief question and a brief answer.

cant yn ei derbyn yn Lloegr, ac l y cant yn yr Alban. Mae'r 60 y cant hwnnw o fyfyrwyr sy'n derbyn eu haddysg yng Nghymru'n dal i fod yn llai na hanner ein poblogaeth o fyfyrwyr. Felly, mae amryw o faterion sy'n ymwneud â llifau dros y ffin yn unigryw i'r berthynas rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, a dyna pam y mae'n rhaid eu hystyried. Dyna pam y gwnaethom ennill y ddadl yng nghyd-destun datganoli. Yn awr, gallwn ystyried y dull gorau o gyflawni ein hymrwymiaidau ein hunain, i sicrhau system grantiau flaengar ar gyfer y myfyrwyr hynny sydd â'r incwm isaf—ac mae grant dysgu'r Cynulliad yn system grantiau flaengar. Yr wyf wrth fy modd bod cynigion Llywodraeth y DU ar gyfer grantiau'n well, gan y byddant yn sicrhau bod mwy o fyfyrwyr yn gallu cael y grantiau hynny na'r rhai yr oeddem ni'n gallu eu darparu. Gallwn hefyd ystyried sut i gyllido ein sefydliadau'n effeithiol.

Y Llywydd: Mae ein hamser ar gyfer yr eitem hon bron â dod i ben, felly gofynnaf am gwestiynau byr gan Aelodau ac, os caf fentro dweud, atebion sydd cyn fyrred ag y bo modd, Weinidog.

Peter Law: Nid oes unrhyw ddewisiadau hawdd yn hyn o beth ac yr ydym yn sôn am ddamcaniaethau mewn gwirionedd. Er hynny, fe'i caf yn rhyfeddol bod cynifer o Weinidogion Llafur yn y Senedd—nid chi, Weinidog—wedi manteisio ar gyllid cyhoeddus ar gyfer eu haddysg eu hunain a'u bod yn awr, er hynny, yn ceisio amddifadu pobl ifanc o'r un cyfleoedd.

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi gwneud llawer o waith da, ac fe'i llongyfarchaf ar weithio i beri i'r mater hwn gael ei ddatganoli i ni. Er hynny, rhaid inni fod yn ofalus. Drwy benodi comisiwn Rees, a oedd yn gam angenrheidiol, gallwn godi gobeithion ymysg pobl Cymru na fydd ffioedd amrywiadwy'n cael eu codi yng Nghymru. Fel llawer un arall, byddai'n well gennyf beidio â gweld cyflwyno ffioedd amrywiadwy, neu ychwanegol, yng Nghymru, gan fy mod yn teimlo bod gorfodi'r ffioedd hynny—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r amser ar gyfer y datganiad hwn wedi hen ddod i ben, fel y dywedais. Yr oeddwn am gael cwestiwn byr ac ateb byr.

Peter Law: I have made my point, Llywydd. Sorry, I was temporarily distracted by the makeover of my friend, Peter Black. I thought that we had a new Member.

The Presiding Officer: I have already raised this matter with Peter Black privately. [*Laughter.*]

Peter Law: Do you agree, Minister, that we in Wales will now have the power and the funding to shake up student policy, which must result in greater opportunities in the future for students in Wales?

Jane Davidson: Yes. It is terribly important to keep reasserting that we will have both the power and the funding to make our own decisions here, in the same way as Scotland, Northern Ireland and England do. It is entirely appropriate for the devolved Government in Wales to have that power, and to exercise it responsibly by considering what is best both for students and for institutions in Wales.

Mark Isherwood: If that dreadful Bill is passed in Westminster—and let us pray that it is not—will not the cross-border inequalities that have been referred to, where students in Wales have a disincentive to attend university in England but students in England have an incentive to attend university in Wales, mean that Wales will be forced to fall into line with England, whatever it decides?

In the nightmare scenario that Mr Blair's attempt to break his manifesto commitment on top-up fees is passed by Parliament, will this not mean that children will carry the albatross of high debt into their 30s, 40s and 50s and be unable to join the housing market, as we saw last week, until middle age? This would be to replace a simple meritocratic system that worked until it was recklessly overloaded. Was it only a few months ago that Charles Clarke—

Peter Law: Gwneuthum y pwynt yr oeddwn am ei wneud, Lywydd. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, tynnwyd fy sylw am ennyd gan y gweddnewidiad yn fy nghyfaill, Peter Black. Tybiais fod gennym Aelod newydd.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf eisoes wedi codi'r mater hwn gyda Peter Black yn breifat. [*Chwerthin.*]

Peter Law: A ydych yn cytuno, Weinidog, y byddwn ni yng Nghymru bellach yn meddu ar y pŵer a'r cyllid sydd eu hangen i ddiwygio'r polisi ar gyfer myfyrwyr, a bod hynny'n sicr o arwain at sicrhau rhagor o gyfleoedd yn y dyfodol i fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru?

Jane Davidson: Ydwyf. Mae'n ofnadwy o bwysig parhau i ailddatgan y byddwn yn meddu ar y pŵer a'r cyllid sydd eu hangen i wneud ein penderfyniadau ein hunain yma, yn yr un modd ag y mae'r Alban, Gogledd Iwerddon a Lloegr yn ei wneud. Mae'n gwbl briodol i'r Llywodraeth ddatganoledig yng Nghymru feddu ar y pŵer hwnnw, a'i arfer yn gyfrifol drwy ystyried yr hyn sydd orau i fyfyrwyr ac i sefydliadau yng Nghymru.

Mark Isherwood: Os caiff y Mesur ofnadwy hwnnw ei basio yn San Steffan—a gadewch inni weddio na chaiff—oni fydd yr anghydraddoldebau rhwng y naill ochr i'r ffin a'r llall y cyfeiriwyd atynt, lle y mae anghymhelliad i fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru fynd i brifysgol yn Lloegr ond lle y mae cymhelliad i fyfyrwyr yn Lloegr ddod i brifysgol yng Nghymru, yn golygu y bydd Cymru'n gorfod dilyn Lloegr ym mha beth bynnag a benderfynno?

Os gwireddir yr hunllef o ildio gan y Senedd i ymgais Mr Blair i dorri ei ymrwymiad maniffesto ar ffioedd ychwanegol, oni fydd hynny'n golygu y bydd plant yn dwyn baich dyledion mawr hyd nes eu bod yn eu 30au, eu 40au a'u 50au ac na fyddant yn gallu bod yn rhan o'r farchnad dai, fel y gwelsom yr wythnos diwethaf, nes byddant yn ganol oed? Byddai hyn yn golygu disodli system feritocrataidd syml a lwyddodd nes iddi gael ei gorlwytho'n anystyriol. Ai dim ond ychydig fisoedd yn ôl y bu Charles Clarke—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I think that you have asked your question. We are out of time.

Jane Davidson: It is important to restate my earlier comment that no change will be made until after a general election, therefore all parties will have the opportunity to consider their own manifestos. You should talk to your party colleagues on the basis that, in November, Tim Yeo indicated that there were no plans to change your party's commitment. Yet, on 3 January, Michael Howard on the *Today* programme said, as I quoted earlier,

'we need to look at all the possibilities. I am not going to rule anything out at this stage. When we have reached our conclusions, we will publish our proposals'.

Leighton Andrews: Can you confirm that no higher education institution in Wales will lose out in terms of funding in relation to the proposals being made? Do you agree that in terms of problems in plugging a gap in income, it is the proposals being espoused by the Conservative Party that are a threat to the funding of higher education institutions and to the widening of access for more students to higher education?

Jane Davidson: When we are still battling to increase the number of students from lower-income backgrounds, Conservative proposals to reduce the number of students by some 100,000 would clearly restrict rather than widen access. I assure you, as I said in my statement, that no higher education institution in Wales will lose out as a result of our manifesto commitment. We will do this on the basis of evidence. We will look at the prospectuses of universities and higher education institutions in England and ensure that the Assembly Government contribution to the sector in Wales matches the contributions made in England. We have increased funding to the sector by over 20 per cent since 1999, and funding is predicted to continue likewise. We maintain our commitment to the sector and to students.

Lynne Neagle: It remains the case that the number of students going to university from deprived communities remains low in Wales.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Credaf eich bod wedi gofyn eich cwestiwn. Mae ein hamser ar ben.

Jane Davidson: Mae'n bwysig imi ailddatgan y sylw a wneuthum yn gynharach na wneir unrhyw newid tan ar ôl etholiad cyffredinol, felly caiff yr holl bleidiau gyfle i ystyried eu manifestos eu hunain. Dylech siarad â'ch cyd-aelodau yn eich plaid gan fod Tim Yeo wedi nodi, ym mis Tachwedd, nad oedd unrhyw fwriad i newid ymrwymiad eich plaid. Ac eto, ar 3 Ionawr, dywedodd Michael Howard ar raglen *Today*, fel y dyfynnais yn gynharach,

rhaid inni ystyried yr holl bosibiliadau. Ni ddiystyrâf unrhyw beth ar hyn o bryd. Pan fyddwn wedi dod i'n casgliadau, cyhoeddwn ein cynigion.

Leighton Andrews: A allwch gadarnhau na fydd unrhyw sefydliad addysg uwch yng Nghymru ar ei golled o ran cyllido mewn cysylltiad â'r cynigion a wneir? A ydych yn cytuno, yng nghyd-destun y problemau a geir wrth gau bwlch mewn incwm, mai'r cynigion a gefnogir gan y Blaid Geidwadol yw'r rhai sy'n bygwth sefydliadau addysg uwch a'r bwriad i ehangu mynediad i addysg uwch ar gyfer rhagor o fyfyrwyr?

Jane Davidson: Wrth i ni barhau i ymladd i gynyddu nifer y myfyrwyr o gefndiroedd incwm is, mae'n amlwg y byddai cynigion y Ceidwadwyr i ostwng nifer y myfyrwyr ryw 100,000 yn cyfyngu ar fynediad yn hytrach na'i ehangu. Yr wyf yn eich sicrhau, fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, na fydd unrhyw sefydliad addysg uwch yng Nghymru ar ei golled o ganlyniad i'n hymrwymiad manifesto. Gwnawn hyn ar sail tystiolaeth. Edrychwn ar brosbectysau prifysgolion a sefydliadau addysg uwch yn Lloegr a sicrhau bod cyfraniad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r sector yng Nghymru'n cyfateb i'r cyfraniadau a wneir yn Lloegr. Yr ydym wedi cynyddu'r cyllid a roddir i'r sector fwy na 20 y cant er 1999, a rhagwelir y bydd y cyllido'n parhau yn yr un modd. Daliwn at ein hymrwymiad i'r sector ac i fyfyrwyr.

Lynne Neagle: Mae'n dal i fod yn wir mai isel yw nifer y myfyrwyr o gymunedau difreintiedig yng Nghymru sy'n mynd i

What emphasis will you be asking the Rees commission to put on delivering far higher numbers of students from such communities into higher education? It is vital that we do not consider top-up fees in isolation. The biggest impact on someone's ability to enter university remains the education that they have received earlier on, particularly in their early years. Can you give an assurance that that the Rees commission will also take this point into account?

Jane Davidson: This debate has started to promulgate a further interest in what happens to our children at the earliest stages in their lives. The innovative and radical Assembly agenda on the new foundation stage—I have invited local authorities to put forward proposals for pilot schools and non-maintained settings this week—will contribute towards this in the future.

Although I agree that not enough young people from low-income backgrounds go on to university, it is important to say that we do better than any other part of the UK in this regard. My message to the Rees commission is that this is a league table in which I want to remain top. I want the Assembly Government to demonstrate that it has the best social justice agenda in terms of ensuring that young people from low-income backgrounds can go on to college or university.

brifysgol. Pa bwys y byddwch yn gofyn i gomisiwn Rees ei roi ar sicrhau y bydd niferoedd mwy o lawer o fyfyrwyr o gymunedau o'r fath yn mynd i addysg uwch? Mae'n hollbwysig nad ydym yn ystyried ffioedd ychwanegol ar wahân. Yr effaith fwyaf o hyd ar allu rhywun i fynd i brifysgol yw'r addysg a gafodd yn gynharach, yn enwedig yn ei flynyddoedd cynnar. A allwch roi sicrwydd y bydd comisiwn Rees yn ystyried y pwynt hwn hefyd?

Jane Davidson: Mae'r ddadl hon wedi dechrau hybu rhagor o ddiddordeb yn yr hyn sy'n digwydd i'n plant yn y cyfnodau cynharaf yn eu bywydau. Bydd agenda arloesol a radical y Cynulliad ar y cyfnod sylfaen newydd—yr wyf wedi gwahodd awdurdodau lleol i gyflwyno cynigion ar gyfer ysgolion peilot a lleoliadau nas cynhelir yr wythnos hon—yn cyfrannu at hyn yn y dyfodol.

Er fy mod yn cytuno nad oes digon o bobl ifanc o gefndiroedd incwm isel yn mynd ymlaen i brifysgol, mae'n bwysig nodi ein bod yn gwneud yn well nag unrhyw ran arall o'r DU yn hyn o beth. Y neges a roddaf fi i gomisiwn Rees yw fy mod yn dymuno aros ar ben y tabl cynghrair hwn. Yr wyf am i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ddangos mai ganddi hi y mae'r agenda orau ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol o ran sicrhau bod pobl ifanc o gefndiroedd incwm isel yn gallu mynd ymlaen i gogledd neu brifysgol.

Datganiad ar yr Adolygiad o'r Amgylchedd Hanesyddol Statement on the Historic Environment Review

The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh): I wish to take the opportunity of this statement to highlight the key actions arising from the Assembly's review of the historic environment in Wales. It is not possible to deal with all the matters proposed or in train in the time available this afternoon, therefore I am arranging for an extended version of this statement to be placed on Cadw's website.

The review goes back to 2002. I am indebted to my friend and colleague, Sue Essex, for starting the process and issuing a consultation

Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh): Hoffwn fanteisio ar y datganiad hwn i amlygu'r camau gweithredu allweddol sy'n deillio o adolygiad y Cynulliad o'r amgylchedd hanesyddol yng Nghymru. Nid yw'n bosibl ymdrin â'r holl faterion a gynigiwyd neu sy'n mynd rhagddynt yn yr amser sydd ar gael y prynhawn yma, felly yr wyf yn trefnu i ddatganiad mwy helaeth gael ei osod ar wefan Cadw.

Dechreuodd yr adolygiad yn 2002. Mae fy nyled yn fawr i fy nghyfaill a fy nghyd-Aelod, Sue Essex, am ddechrau'r broses a

document in March 2003 entitled the 'Review of the Historic Environment in Wales'. It generated around 90 detailed and helpful responses. Those responses are summarised in the report, which is also available on Cadw's website.

3.50 p.m.

We can all relate to the historic environment; it embraces historic buildings, landscapes, language and culture, going well beyond the statutorily designated parts. It is particularly rich in Wales and we can all rightly feel proud of it. Its conservation is vital to provide us all with a sense of place, but the benefits of engaging with the historic environment go well beyond the immediate. It also contributes to matters that go to the heart of the Assembly Government's aims, to environmental improvements, sustainability and to social and economic regeneration. The interest that has been generated by this review, and media coverage of our heritage generally, is to be greatly welcomed.

I propose action at the national and local levels, with the aim of involving the local community wherever possible. The consultation confirmed the view that the machinery of government needs to be strengthened to improve co-ordination among interested organisations. Since the report was published, I have assumed responsibility for the historic environment and culture, which has presented a significant opportunity to strengthen links, while also giving weight to the contribution that they each make to other Assembly policy areas.

The co-ordination of the Assembly's cultural policy agenda is assisted by a unified structure—Cymru'n Creu, which Cadw will join because the fundamental link between culture and heritage is self-evident. I will also ask Cadw's chief executive to establish a sub-group that will come under its umbrella and will be broadly analogous with the Wales biodiversity partnership. The group will consider where strategic statements and the identification of priorities would be most useful. I will announce the membership and

chyhoeddi dogfen ymgynghori ym mis Mawrth 2003 yn dwyn y teitl 'Adolygiad o'r Amgylchedd Hanesyddol yng Nghymru'. Derbyniwyd tua 90 ymateb cynhwysfawr a defnyddiol. Ceir crynodeb o'r ymatebion hyn mewn adroddiad sydd hefyd ar wefan Cadw.

Mae'r amgylchedd hanesyddol yn rhywbeth sy'n berthnasol i bawb; mae'n cynnwys adeiladau hanesyddol a thirweddau, iaith a diwylliant yn ogystal â mynd y tu hwnt i'r rhannau a bennwyd yn statudol. Mae'n hynod gyfoethog yng Nghymru ac mae'n briodol i ni i gyd ymfalchïo ynddo. Mae ei gadwraeth yn hanfodol i roi syniad o berthyn i bob un ohonom ond mae'r manteision sy'n deillio o ymwneud â'r amgylchedd hanesyddol yn mynd ymhell y tu hwnt i'r manteision uniongyrchol. Mae hefyd yn cyfrannu at faterion sy'n rhan ganolog o nodau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, sef gwelliannau amgylcheddol, cynaliadwyedd ac adfywio cymdeithasol ac economaidd. Dylid estyn croeso cynnes i'r diddordeb a gynhyrchwyd gan yr adolygiad hwn, a'r sylw a roddwyd yn y cyfryngau i'n trefnadaeth a'n hanes.

Yr wyf yn cynnig camau gweithredu ar lefelau cenedlaethol a lleol, gyda'r nod o gynnwys y gymuned leol lle bynnag y bo'n bosibl. Cadarnhaodd yr ymgynghoriad y farn bod angen cryfhau strwythurau llywodraeth er mwyn gwella'r cydlynad ymhlith y sefydliadau sydd â diddordeb. Ers cyhoeddi'r adroddiad, derbyniais gyfrifoldeb dros ddiwylliant a'r amgylchedd hanesyddol, a gyflwynodd gryn gyfle i gryfhau cysylltiadau, tra'n rhoi pwyslais ar y cyfraniad y gall pob un ohonynt ei wneud i feysydd polisi eraill y Cynulliad.

Caiff y gwaith o gydlyn agenda polisi diwylliannol y Cynulliad ei gynorthwyo gan strwythur unedig—Cymru'n Creu, y bydd Cadw yn ymuno ag ef gan fod y cyswllt sylfaenol rhwng diwylliant a threfnadaeth yn gwbl amlwg. Yn ogystal, byddaf yn gofyn i brif weithredwr Cadw sefydlu is-grŵp a fydd yn dod o dan ei awenau ac a fydd yn gyffredinol debyg i bartneriaeth bioamrywiaeth Cymru. Bydd y grŵp yn ystyried ymhle y byddai datganiadau strategol a nodi blaenoriaethau fwyaf

terms of reference of this group in due course.

Many of the responses recognised the pivotal role of local planning authorities in protecting the historic environment, and in engaging communities. However, there was also a general recognition that the historic environment was generally a low priority for some of those local authorities. Cadw will continue to have regular meetings with local authorities in its built heritage forum, but there is scope to enhance this level of communication and discussion. I intend to invite chief executives and chief officers of national park authorities to meet me along with Sue Essex—given the wider implications—to discuss the challenges facing the historic environment and to explore the actions that central Government and local government can take jointly to tackle those challenges.

There was overwhelming support for the proposal that the Assembly Government should invite local authorities to take into account, in developing their community strategies, the contribution that the historic environment can make to the economic, social and environmental wellbeing of their area. Sue Essex has agreed to that proposal and we will develop guidance on how that might be achieved.

The consultation also raised questions about access to historical information and records, and their ownership. Action has already been taken to address those. To ensure that transparency and clarity exists, duplication is avoided and there are clearly signposted routes to information, a strategic framework for historic environment records in Wales is being developed by the principal record-holding bodies and I hope that others—CyMAL in particular—can also be drawn into this initiative. Cadw has also agreed, with the Welsh Archaeological Trusts, a way of ensuring the long-term security of their records through an arrangement whereby they would be transferred to the Assembly Government in the event of a trust's being wound up.

defnyddiol. Byddaf yn cyhoeddi manylion am aelodaeth a chylch gorchwyl y grŵp hwn maes o law.

Yr oedd llawer o'r ymatebion a dderbyniwyd yn cydnabod rôl ganolog awdurdodau cynllunio lleol wrth ddiogelu'r amgylchedd hanesyddol, ac wrth gynnwys cymunedau. Fodd bynnag, cydnabuwyd yn gyffredinol hefyd nad oedd yr amgylchedd hanesyddol yn gyffredinol yn flaenoriaeth i rai awdurdodau lleol. Bydd Cadw yn parhau i gynnal cyfarfodydd rheolaidd gydag awdurdodau lleol fel rhan o'i fforwm y dreftadaeth adeiledig ond ceir cyfle i wella'r lefel hon o gyfathrebu a thrafod. Bwriadaf wahodd prif weithredwyr a phrif swyddogion awdurdodau'r parciau cenedlaethol i gyfarfod â mi—a Sue Essex, o gofio'r goblygiadau ehangach—i drafod yr heriau sy'n wynebu'r amgylchedd hanesyddol ac i archwilio'r camau gweithredu y gall Llywodraeth ganolog a llywodraeth leol eu cymryd ar y cyd i fynd i'r afael â'r heriau hyn.

Cafwyd cefnogaeth aruthrol i'r cynnig y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wahodd awdurdodau lleol i ystyried y cyfraniad y gall yr amgylchedd hanesyddol ei wneud i les economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol eu hardal wrth ddatblygu eu strategaethau cymunedol. Mae Sue Essex wedi cytuno â'r cynnig hwnnw a byddwn yn datblygu canllawiau ar sut y gellir cyflawni hyn.

Cododd yr ymgynghoriad gwestiynau hefyd ynghylch mynediad i wybodaeth a chofnodion hanesyddol, a pherchnogaeth y deunyddiau hyn. Mae camau eisoes ar waith i ateb y cwestiynau hyn. Er mwyn sicrhau tryloywder ac eglurder, ac i osgoi dyblygu gwaith, ac i sicrhau y ceir llwybrau amlwg i wybodaeth, mae'r prif gyrff sy'n cadw cofnodion wrthi'n datblygu fframwaith strategol ar gyfer cofnodion yr amgylchedd hanesyddol yng Nghymru a gobeithiaf y gellir cynnwys eraill, CyMAL yn arbennig, yn y fenter hon. Mae Cadw, gydag Ymddiriedolaethau Archaeolegol Cymru, hefyd wedi cytuno ar ffordd o sicrhau diogelwch hirdymor i'w cofnodion drwy drefniant lle y byddai'r cofnodion yn cael eu trosglwyddo i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad pe byddai ymddiriedolaeth yn cael ei dirwyn i

ben.

Initiatives to raise the profile of the historic environment among our young people are clearly important. The national curriculum in Wales and the cwricwlwm Cymreig, with its focus on the distinctive features of Wales, will ensure that a new generation of children take an active interest in their local history. Cadw will continue to encourage school children to visit its sites by providing school parties with free entry.

The Assembly's links with the voluntary sector are well established and I want to ensure that the sector is fully engaged in our objectives for the historic environment. I have regular meetings with representatives from voluntary organisations and I propose to expand Cadw's civic initiatives scheme, which provides grant to voluntary organisations for projects that promote local heritage.

I am also keen that locally important historic buildings that have fallen into disrepair or are underused are put to full and productive use in other ways for community benefit, for example, through opportunities for sporting or cultural activities. Cadw will contribute towards this initiative through its grants budget and I have had useful discussions with some of the lottery distributors who have indicated their support. I shall pursue this further and intend that a pilot scheme should be developed later this year. I am aware that the poorest health and the lowest levels of physical activity are in the poorest areas of our nation, and pilot schemes will be targeted carefully. We also need to do more to attract young people to more traditional crafts. Cadw employs apprentices on its labour force to learn traditional techniques, it is involved in several new craft skills initiatives and it is discussing ways of addressing recruitment and training issues with the Construction Industry Training Board. I am pleased that Cadw has been able to help with the establishment of a skills conservation centre at Faenol, which featured on BBC 2's *Restoration* programme. It will be arranging a major conference on traditional materials this year, in conjunction with the Civic Trust.

Mae mentrau i godi proffil yr amgylchedd hanesyddol ymhlith ein pobl ifanc yn amlwg yn bwysig. Bydd y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol a'r cwricwlwm Cymreig, gyda'i ffocws ar nodweddion arbennig Cymru, yn sicrhau y bydd cenedlaeth newydd o blant yn cymryd diddordeb brwd yn eu hanes lleol. Bydd Cadw yn parhau i annog plant ysgol i ymweld â'i safleoedd drwy ddarparu mynediad am ddim i bartion ysgol.

Mae cysylltiadau'r Cynulliad â'r sector gwirfoddol wedi'u hen sefydlu ac yr wyf yn awyddus i sicrhau y cynhwysir y sector yn llawn yn ein hamcanion ar gyfer yr amgylchedd hanesyddol. Caf gyfarfodydd rheolaidd gyda chynrychiolwyr sefydliadau gwirfoddol a chynigiau y dylid ehangu cynllun mentrau dinesig Cadw sy'n darparu grantiau i sefydliadau gwirfoddol ar gyfer prosiectau sy'n hyrwyddo treftadaeth leol.

Yr wyf hefyd yn awyddus i sicrhau y caiff adeiladau sydd o bwysigrwydd lleol sydd mewn cyflwr gwael neu nad ydyw yn cael eu defnyddio'n aml, eu defnyddio yn llawn ac yn adeiladol er budd y gymuned, er enghraifft drwy gyfleoedd ar gyfer gweithgareddau chwaraeon neu weithgareddau diwylliannol. Bydd Cadw yn cyfrannu at y fenter hon drwy ei gyllideb grantiau, ac yr wyf wedi cynnal trafodaethau defnyddiol gyda rhai o ddosbarthwyr y loteri, sydd wedi nodi eu cefnogaeth. Byddaf yn ymchwilio ymhellach i'r mater hwn gyda'r bwriad o ddatblygu cynllun peilot yn ddiweddarach eleni. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod yr iechyd gwaethaf a'r lefelau isaf o weithgarwch corfforol i'w gael yn ardaloedd tlotaf ein cenedl, ac felly bydd y cynlluniau peilot yn cael eu targedu yn ofalus iawn. Mae angen inni hefyd wneud mwy i ddenu pobl ifanc i grefftau mwy traddodiadol. Mae Cadw yn cyflogi prentisiaid fel rhan o'i weithlu er mwyn iddynt ddysgu technegau traddodiadol, mae'n cymryd rhan mewn sawl menter sgiliau crefft newydd sydd ar waith ac mae wrthi'n trafod gyda Bwrdd Hyfforddi'r Diwydiant Adeiladu ffyrdd o ymdrin â materion sy'n ymwneud â recriwtio a hyfforddi. Yr wyf yn falch y bu modd i Cadw helpu wrth sefydlu canolfan cadwraeth sgiliau yn y Faenol, a dangoswyd fel rhan o'r rhaglen *Restoration* ar BBC2.

Bydd yn trefnu cynhadledd fawr ar ddeunyddiau traddodiadol eleni ar y cyd â'r Ymddiriedolaeth Ddinesig.

This statement necessarily highlights key actions only. I will continue to look for other suitable opportunities to ensure that the physical history that surrounds us all can be used to the benefit of everyone in Wales. Much has been achieved, but much remains to be done. I look forward to making further progress, supported by the many organisations whose responsibilities extend to the historic environment.

Owen John Thomas: Croesawaf fwriad yr adolygiad i ddod â nifer o agweddau hanfodol i dreftadaeth Cymru at ei gilydd, yn arbennig yr agweddau hynny sy'n pwysleisio pwysigrwydd a photensial twristiaeth ddiwylliannol, a fydd yn hybu delwedd ac economi Cymru. Croesawaf hefyd y ffaith bod yr adolygiad yn cydnabod ac yn annog defnydd o amgylchedd, tirwedd ac adeiladau hanesyddol Cymru er mwyn adfywio ein cymunedau.

Yr oedd enghraifft ardderchog o hynny ar y gweill yn ystad Llanrhymni, lle yr oedd y fforwm lleol wedi trefnu i Neuadd Llanrhymni, sef hen gartref morleidr enwocaf y byd, Harri Morgan, gael ei ddatblygu fel canolfan hanesyddol a chymdeithasol, a fyddai'n gweithio ar y cyd gyda chlwb rygbi Llanrhymni. Yn anffodus, datblygodd rhwyg rhwng y fforwm a'r cyngor lleol a daeth y prosiect cyffrous i ben.

Croesawaf felly y galwad yn eich datganiad i wella'r cydlynid rhwng y gwahanol gyrff hyn. Mae'n amlwg bod eisiau hynny yn ardal Llanrhymni. Nid oes plac hyd yn oed i gofnodi'r cysylltiad rhwng Harri Morgan a Neuadd Llanrhymni. Yn sicr, gellid lluosio'r math hwnnw o ddiffyg fil gwaith wrth deithio o gwmpas Cymru. Mae cyfle felly, Weinidog, i wneud gwahaniaeth mawr. Penderfynodd Bwyllgor Diwylliant y Cynulliad cyntaf i sefydlu cronfa goffâu i gefnogi cymunedau ledled Cymru i godi placiau i ddathlu unigolion a digwyddiadau o bwys. Byddai menter felly yn codi diddordeb ymhlith ymwelwyr ac yn ennill parch trigolion i'w cymunedau.

O reidrwydd, dim ond y camau gweithredu allweddol a amlygir gan y datganiad hwn. Byddaf yn parhau i edrych am gyfleoedd addas eraill i sicrhau y gellir defnyddio'r hanes ffisegol sydd o'n cwmpas er budd pobl Cymru. Cyflawnwyd cryn dipyn, ond mae llawer i'w wneud o hyd. Edrychaf ymlaen at wneud cynnydd pellach gyda chymorth y sefydliadau niferus y mae eu cyfrifoldebau yn cwmpasu'r amgylchedd hanesyddol.

Owen John Thomas: I welcome this review's aim of bringing together a number of essential aspects of Welsh heritage, particularly those aspects that emphasise the importance and potential of cultural tourism, which will promote the image and economy of Wales. I also welcome the fact that the review recognises and encourages the use of the environment, the landscape and the historic buildings of Wales to regenerate our communities.

There was an excellent example of this on the Llanrumney estate, where the local forum had arranged for the old Llanrumney Hall, the former home of the world's most infamous pirate, Henry Morgan, to be developed as an historic and social centre, which would work hand in hand with the Llanrumney rugby club. Unfortunately, a rift developed between the forum and the local council and the exciting project came to an end.

I welcome therefore the call in your statement to improve the co-ordination between these various bodies. That is obviously needed in the Llanrumney area. There is not even a plaque to commemorate the link between Henry Morgan and Llanrumney Hall. That kind of oversight could be multiplied a thousand times while travelling around Wales. There is an opportunity therefore, Minister, to make a big difference. The Culture Committee decided in the first Assembly to establish a commemorative fund to support communities throughout Wales to erect plaques to commemorate important individuals and events. Such an initiative would raise interest

among visitors, and engender respect among local people for their communities.

Pa gamau a gymerwch, Weinidog, i hybu amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru drwy wireddu'r syniad o greu cronfa goffâu? A fydd yr is-grŵp yr ydych am ei sefydlu yn cynnwys cyrff megis yr Ymddiriedolaeth Genedlaethol, ac yn olaf, faint o arian newydd sydd wedi cael ei ddarparu i weithredu'r cynlluniau peilot y cyfeiriwch atynt?

What steps will you take, Minister, to promote the historic environment of Wales by establishing a commemorative fund? Will the sub-group that you intend to establish include bodies such as the National Trust, and finally, how much new funding has been provided to implement the pilot schemes to which you referred?

Alun Pugh: You raised a number of issues. I will start with your point on cultural tourism. Wales will never compete with other locations on the basis of reliable good weather, but Wales is home to a wealth of historical interest and we must capitalise fully on that with regard to our cultural tourism strategy. On Llanrumney Hall and Henry Morgan, I am sure that many of us could think of such top-quality historical and environmental projects in our regions, which is one of the factors that makes Wales a great country in which to live. I can think of a few examples in Clwyd West.

Alun Pugh: Gwnaethoch godi nifer o faterion. Dechreuaf drwy ymdrin â'r pwynt a wnaethoch am dwristiaeth ddiwylliannol. Ni fydd Cymru byth yn gallu cystadlu â mannau eraill ar sail tywydd da cyson, ond mae digonedd o bethau o ddiddordeb hanesyddol yng Nghymru a rhaid inni elwa'n llawn ar hynny gyda golwg ar ein strategaeth twristiaeth ddiwylliannol. Ynghylch Neuadd Llanrhymni a Harri Morgan, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallai llawer ohonom feddwl am brosiectau hanesyddol ac amgylcheddol rhagorol o'r fath yn ein rhanbarthau, a dyna un o'r ffactorau sy'n peri bod Cymru'n wlad ardderchog i fyw ynddi. Gallaf feddwl am rai enghreifftiau yng Ngorllewin Clwyd.

4.00 p.m.

A wide variety of grants are currently available, and additional support is also available from the heritage lottery fund, but I will address your detailed point on plaques in writing. Finally, in terms of membership, as I said in my statement I will make a further statement on this in due course, but organisations such as the Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Wales and the National Trust will obviously be key players.

Mae amrywiaeth mawr o grantiau ar gael ar hyn o bryd, ac mae cymorth ychwanegol ar gael hefyd oddi wrth gronfa dreftadaeth y loteri, ond ymatebaf i'r pwynt manwl a wnaethoch am blaciau mewn llythyr. Yn olaf, o ran aelodaeth, fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, byddaf yn gwneud datganiad pellach ar hyn maes o law, ond mae'n amlwg y bydd cyrff fel Comisiwn Brenhinol Henebion Cymru a'r Ymddiriedolaeth Genedlaethol yn chwarae rhan allweddol.

Janice Gregory: On the issue of listing residential properties, a few years ago the residents of Park Terrace, Tondu, in my constituency, were bewildered to receive indication from Cadw that their properties were to be listed as Grade II buildings and that they would then have to adhere to certain standards and conditions in terms of the repair and upkeep of their homes. While any reasonable person would not object to the preservation of buildings of historical

Janice Gregory: Ynghylch mater rhestru tai annedd, ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl syfrdanwyd trigolion Park Terrace, Ton-du, yn fy etholaeth i, pan gawsant eu hysbysu gan Cadw fod eu tai i gael eu rhestru'n adeiladau Gradd II ac y byddent wedyn yn gorfod glynu wrth safonau ac amodau penodol wrth atgyweirio a chynnal a chadw eu cartrefi. Er na fyddai unrhyw un rhesymol yn gwrthwynebu cadw adeiladau o bwys hanesyddol, credaf ei bod yn rhesymol

significance, I think that it is reasonable to expect that residents will be consulted before such steps are taken. Will you ensure that the principle of consultation is enshrined in the practices of bodies such as Cadw, so that our historic environment is protected and cherished, and that the public are brought fully on board, especially where residential properties are affected, to be a meaningful part of the process?

Alun Pugh: There is indeed a separate consultation, as you say, on the protection of historical interests. You have vigorously represented the interests of your constituents in Tondy. The whole question concerning whether there should be prior consultation before properties, particularly residential properties, are listed is a key issue and I will say more about that later this year.

Lisa Francis: The purpose of this review is to obtain a clear picture of all controls that affect the historic environment and it is important that it includes the rural environment. Education is crucial, as you rightly outlined, as is raising general awareness, so that we understand the importance of the measures that are necessary to protect that environment and contribute to that objective. The role of planning authorities is also crucial, as is ensuring adequate conservation expertise. Following this review, do you anticipate that local authorities will continue to be responsible for those elements that are currently within their remit?

Janice Gregory mentioned listing. The Department for Culture, Media and Sport's White Paper, envisaged early this year, means that it will be open for Welsh Assembly Government Ministers to request that different arrangements apply in Wales, which could be done in a variety of ways. In that respect, do you anticipate changes to designation, a simplification of the process, or changes to owners' rights? Regarding consents, have you considered the fact that buildings and monuments may require more detailed consents, whereas landscapes may not? Have you considered the implications in terms of additional costs to the Assembly and the practicalities involved in undertaking such a task?

disgwyl y bydd ymgynghori â thrigolion cyn cymryd camau o'r fath. A wnewch sicrhau y caiff egwyddor ymgynghori ei chynnwys yn arferion cyrff fel Cadw, fel y caiff ein hamgylchedd hanesyddol ei ddiogelu a'i drysori, ac fel bod y cyhoedd yn cael eu cynnwys yn llawn, yn enwedig pan fo tai annedd dan sylw, fel y gallant chwarae rhan ystyrlon yn y broses?

Alun Pugh: Yn wir, mae ymgynghoriad ar wahân, fel y dywedwch, ynghylch diogelu buddiannau hanesyddol. Yr ydych wedi cynrychioli buddiannau eich etholwyr yn Nhondu yn egniol. Mae'r holl gwestiwn ynghylch a ddylid ymgynghori o flaen llaw cyn rhestru adeiladau, yn enwedig tai annedd, yn fater allweddol a dywedaf ragor am hynny'n ddiweddarach eleni.

Lisa Francis: Pwrpas yr adolygiad hwn yw cael darlun clir o'r holl reolaethau sy'n effeithio ar yr amgylchedd hanesyddol ac mae'n bwysig iddo gynnwys yr amgylchedd gwledig. Mae addysg yn hollbwysig, fel y dywedasoch, yn ogystal â hybu ymwybyddiaeth gyffredinol, fel ein bod yn deall pwysigrwydd y mesurau sydd eu hangen i ddiogelu'r amgylchedd hwnnw ac i gyfrannu at yr amcan hwnnw. Mae rôl awdurdodau cynllunio'n hollbwysig hefyd, a sicrhau arbenigedd digonol mewn cadwraeth. Ar ôl yr adolygiad hwn, a ydych yn rhagweld y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn dal i fod yn gyfrifol am yr elfennau sydd o fewn eu cylch gorchwyl ar hyn o bryd?

Cyfeiriodd Janice Gregory at restru. Mae Papur Gwyn yr Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon, a welwyd yn gynharach eleni, yn golygu y bydd modd i Weinidogion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ofyn am gymhwyso trefniadau gwahanol yng Nghymru, a gellid gwneud hynny mewn amryw o ffyrdd. Yn hynny o beth, a ydych yn rhagweld y bydd newidiadau mewn dynodi, y caiff y broses ei symleiddio, neu y bydd newidiadau i hawliau perchnogion? Mewn cysylltiad â chaniatâd, a ydych wedi ystyried y gallai caniatâd mwy manwl fod yn angenrheidiol ar gyfer adeiladau a henebion, ond nid ar gyfer tirluniau? A ydych wedi ystyried y goblygiadau o ran costau ychwanegol i'r Cynulliad a'r agweddau

ymarferol ar gyflawni gorchwyl o'r fath?

You said that the National Assembly invited local authorities to look at the contribution that the historic environment can make to the social and environmental wellbeing of their areas, and you also spoke of the importance of the work of CyMAL and Cadw. Do you agree that inviting the Wales Tourist Board to work more closely with organisations such as the Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Wales would also be good for the cultural tourism economy? This is especially true in respect of the work done through SWISH, which provides online public access and information about ancient archaeological sites, and the Gathering the Jewels project, which provides access to over 1 million photo images and is a great asset, particularly to cultural tourists from overseas. I refer to those many visitors to Wales whose purpose is to trace their ancestors and the places where their ancestors lived.

Dywedasoch fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi gwahodd awdurdodau lleol i ystyried cyfraniad posibl yr amgylchedd hanesyddol at les cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol eu hardaloedd, a soniasoch hefyd am bwysigrwydd gwaith CyMAL a Cadw. A ydych yn cytuno y byddai gwahodd Bwrdd Croeso Cymru i gydweithio'n agosach â chyrrff fel Comisiwn Brenhinol Henebion Cymru yn llesol i economi twristiaeth ddiwylliannol hefyd? Mae hyn yn arbennig o wir mewn cysylltiad â'r gwaith a wneir drwy SWISH, sy'n darparu mynediad ar-lein a gwybodaeth i'r cyhoedd am safleoedd archaeolegol hynafol, a phrosiect Casglu'r Tlysau, sy'n cynnig mynediad at fwy nag 1 filiwn o ddelweddau ffotograffig ac sy'n ased rhagorol, yn enwedig i dwristiaid diwylliannol o wledydd tramor. Cyfeiriaf at y nifer fawr sy'n ymweld â Chymru er mwyn mynd ar drywydd eu hynafiaid a'r manau yr oeddent yn byw.

We welcome any initiative that will put disused buildings and buildings that are in need of repair back into good community use. Cadw has lately made it possible to purchase tickets for a variety of its sites at some of its sites in Wales. Can you tell me if it intends to sell tickets by using different websites or through tourist information centres? Do you know if Cadw will look at whether buildings merit listing for their local importance or should it only support the listing of buildings that are of a national importance?

Croesawn unrhyw fenter a fydd yn gwneud defnydd o'r newydd o adeiladau gwag a rhai y mae angen eu hatgyweirio er budd y gymuned. Yn ddiweddar, mae Cadw wedi darparu modd i brynu tocynnau ar gyfer amryw o'i safleoedd yn rhai o'i safleoedd yng Nghymru. A allwch ddweud wrthyf a yw'n bwriadu gwerthu tocynnau drwy ddefnyddio gwahanol wefannau neu drwy ganolfannau gwybodaeth ymwelwyr? A wyddoch a fydd Cadw yn ystyried a yw adeiladau'n deilwng o'u rhestru oherwydd eu pwysigrwydd lleol neu a ddylai ffafrio rhestru adeiladau sydd o bwys cenedlaethol yn unig?

Alun Pugh: To start with your point on education, I can confirm that, since April 2002, nearly 170,000 schoolchildren have visited Cadw sites free of charge. Schoolchildren from all over Wales have had the opportunity to learn about construction methods of castles as well as dressing in costumes. There is an enormous input into education. As far as listing and scheduling is concerned, as I said to Janice, there is a separate consultation on the protection of historic interests. I will have more to say about that in a statement later this year. We work closely with DCMS on this matter.

Alun Pugh: Gan ddechrau â'r pwynt a wnaethoch am addysg, gallaf gadarnhau bod ymron 170,000 o blant ysgol wedi ymweld â safleoedd Cadw yn rhad ac am ddim er Ebrill 2002. Mae plant ysgol o bob rhan o Gymru wedi cael cyfle i ddysgu am y dulliau o adeiladu cestyll ac i wisgo amdanynt mewn gwisgoedd hanesyddol. Gwneir cyfraniad aruthrol i addysg. O ran rhestru adeiladau, fel y dywedais wrth Janice, mae ymgynghoriad ar wahân yn mynd rhagddo ar ddiogelu buddiannau hanesyddol. Bydd gennyf ragor i'w ddweud am hynny mewn datganiad yn ddiweddarach eleni. Yr ydym yn

cydweithio'n agos â'r Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon ar y mater hwn.

You make a valid point about the work currently underway on the upland survey of Wales and, especially in terms of archaeological sites, a huge amount of work has been done to catalogue and photograph this part of our historic environment. Clearly, that will be a major resource for tourism, especially walking tourism, which is exactly the sort of aspect that we are trying to support. With regard to admission to Cadw sites, that is easy, and I hope that you will welcome Cadw's decision not to accept pounds sterling only but also the euro to make admission to Cadw sites as easy as possible.

Eleanor Burnham: The Welsh Liberal Democrat group welcomes this review and particularly your commitment to the intended partnership with the national parks so that Wales can develop a more coherent strategy to make better use of our historic environment in terms of the development of events and cultural tourism, which have already been alluded to, as well as the local economies, and for educational purposes. Surely, this will enable our youth can get a better flavour of our wonderful heritage than we did. What assurances can you give that the proposed changes to the current legislation will simplify the process of protecting Welsh historic environment and that Cadw's remit will be, and be seen to be, more pro-active and positive? In the light of the considerable differences between Wales and England with regard to historic environment and the various bodies and organisations associated with that, do you not agree that Wales should be able to determine its own legislation and procedures on historic environment rather than having to rely on the UK Parliament? Also, will you press the UK Government to ensure that legislation is enacted to protect Wales's industrial heritage, which is a significant and important part of our history, for future generations so that it is not adversely affected by the possible loss of lottery funding? Do you agree that what may appear to be eyesores to some can in fact be sites of historic and cultural importance to

Gwnaethoch bwynt dilys am y gwaith sy'n mynd rhagddo'n awr ar yr arolwg o ucheldiroedd Cymru ac, yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun safleoedd archaeolegol, gwnaed llawer iawn o waith i gatalogio a thynnu lluniau o'r rhan hon o'n hamgylchedd hanesyddol. Wrth gwrs, bydd hynny'n adnodd o bwys mawr i dwristiaeth, yn enwedig twristiaeth cerdded, sef yr union fath o agwedd yr ydym yn ceisio ei chefnogi. Gyda golwg ar fynediad i safleoedd Cadw, mae hynny'n hawdd, a gobeithiaf y byddwch yn croesawu penderfyniad Cadw i dderbyn yr ewro, ac nid punnoedd sterling yn unig, er mwyn hwyluso mynediad i safleoedd Cadw i'r graddau mwyaf posibl.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r adolygiad hwn ac yn enwedig eich ymrwymiad i'r bartneriaeth arfaethedig â'r parciau cenedlaethol fel y gall Cymru ddatblygu strategaeth fwy cydlynol i wneud gwell defnydd o'n hamgylchedd hanesyddol yng nghyd-destun datblygu digwyddiadau a thwristiaeth ddiwylliannol, y cyfeiriwyd atynt eisoes, yn ogystal â'r economïau lleol, ac i ddibenion addysgol. Bydd hyn yn sicr o alluogi ein pobl ifanc i gael gwell blas ar ein treftadaeth ryfeddol nag a gawsom ni. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi y bydd y newidiadau a gynigir i'r deddfwriaeth bresennol yn symleiddio'r broses o ddiogelu amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru ac y bydd cylch gorchwyl Cadw yn fwy rhagweithiol a chadarnhaol, ac y gwelir ei fod felly? Yng ngolwg y gwahaniaethau sylweddol rhwng Cymru a Lloegr o ran yr amgylchedd hanesyddol a'r gwahanol gyrff a mudiadau sy'n gysylltiedig â hynny, onid ydych yn cytuno y dylai Cymru allu pennu ei deddfwriaeth a'i gweithdrefnau ei hun ar yr amgylchedd hanesyddol yn hytrach na gorfod dibynnu ar Senedd y DU? Hefyd, a wnewch chi bwyso ar Lywodraeth y DU i sicrhau y daw deddfwriaeth i rym i ddiogelu treftadaeth ddiwydiannol Cymru, sy'n rhan bwysig ac arwyddocaol o'n hanes, ar gyfer cenedlaethau'r dyfodol fel na fydd y posibilrwydd o golli cyllid y loteri'n amharu arni? A ydych yn cytuno y gall yr hyn a allai

others? The St Giles brewery in Wrexham, for example, was not a listed building, but many constituents complained to me that they did not feel that there had been enough consultation and open discussion between the local authority and, possibly, the WDA. I urge you to ensure that these matters are publicised as much as possible.

Alun Pugh: You raised many separate points. Certainly, the historic environment is a massive asset to Wales on which we must capitalise. With regard to separate legislation, you and I both must wait for the Richard commission to report. On lottery funding, it is true the world over that, as lotteries mature, sales go into gradual decline, which has clear implications for Sportlot, Artslot and, unfortunately, the heritage lottery fund. Finally, I would happily take up your invitation to come to Wrexham—I am always happy to look at a brewery.

Lynne Neagle: I welcome your statement. As part of your work to promote the historic environment in Wales, will you look at Cadw's role at the ironworks at Blaenavon, which are a key part of the world heritage site? While I welcome the investment and the important work that Cadw has done to conserve those ironworks, there is considerable scope for improvement in its interpretation and presentation of them—I have written to you previously on this matter. Do you agree that it is crucial that, if we are to allow people access and the benefit of the historic environment and also to capitalise on the tourist potential of such sites, we must ensure that Cadw promotes, and provides appropriate interpretation at, sites such as the ironworks?

4.10 p.m.

Will you agree to discuss this matter with Andrew Davies, the Minister responsible for tourism, and take it up with Cadw, so that we can enjoy the full benefits of the world heritage site in Blaenavon?

ymddangos yn ddoluriau llygad i rai fod yn safleoedd o bwys hanesyddol a diwylliannol yng ngolwg eraill? Er enghraifft, nid oedd bragdy St Giles yn Wrecsam yn adeilad rhestredig, ond cwynodd llawer o etholwyr wrthyf eu bod yn teimlo na fu digon o ymgynghori a thrafod agored rhwng yr awdurdod lleol ac, o bosibl, y WDA. Pwysaf arnoch i sicrhau cymaint o gyhoeddusrwydd ag y bo modd i'r materion hyn.

Alun Pugh: Gwnaethoch godi sawl pwynt gwahanol. Yn sicr, mae'r amgylchedd hanesyddol yn gaffaeliad aruthrol i Gymru y mae'n rhaid inni elwa arno. Gyda golwg ar ddeddfwriaeth ar wahân, rhaid i chi a minnau ddisgwyl am adroddiad comisiwn Richard. Ynghylch cyllid loteri, yr hyn a welir ym mhobman yw bod gwerthiant loteriau'n disgyn yn raddol gydag amser, ac mae'n amlwg bod goblygiadau yn hynny i Sportlot, Artslot a, gwaetha'r modd, cronfa dreftadaeth y loteri. Yn olaf, byddwn yn falch o dderbyn eich gwahoddiad i ddod i Wrecsam—yr wyf bob amser yn fodlon cael golwg ar fragdy.

Lynne Neagle: Croesawaf eich datganiad. Fel rhan o'ch gwaith i hyrwyddo'r amgylchedd hanesyddol yng Nghymru, a wnewch chi ystyried y rôl sydd gan Cadw mewn cysylltiad â'r gwaith haearn ym Mlaenavon, sy'n rhan allweddol o safle treftadaeth y byd yno? Er fy mod yn croesawu'r buddsoddi a'r gwaith pwysig a wnaeth Cadw i gadw'r gwaith haearn hwnnw, mae cryn le i wella'r modd y mae'n ei ddehongli a'i gyflwyno—yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu atoch o'r blaen ar y mater hwn. A ydych yn cytuno, os ydym i adael i bobl gael mynediad i'r amgylchedd hanesyddol a chael budd ohono a hefyd er mwyn manteisio ar botensial safleoedd o'r fath i ddenu ymwelwyr, ei bod yn hollbwysig inni sicrhau bod Cadw yn hybu safleoedd fel y gwaith haearn ac yn darparu dehongliad priodol ohonynt?

A wnewch chi drafod y mater hwn gydag Andrew Davies, y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am dwristiaeth, a'i godi gyda Cadw, fel y gallwn fwynhau holl fanteision safle treftadaeth y byd ym Mlaenavon?

Alun Pugh: Big Pit in Blaenavon is a huge historic and cultural asset, and the ironworks, as you rightly say, is also extremely significant. I am happy to take up your invitation to visit Blaenavon and to hold further, detailed discussions on the ground.

David Melding: I welcome all measures to protect and enhance the historic environment. As part of this policy, would you convene a sub-group to consider the possibility of purchasing 20 Park Place, commonly known as Burgess House, for public use? I ask you to do this in all earnestness. I also ask you to have some assessment made of the building's historical value if you do not believe me, as, in my opinion, and in the opinion of many architectural experts, it is the finest domestic Victorian building in Britain, and we do not value it.

Alun Pugh: Your championing of the cause of 20 Park Place is well known, and the matter regularly appears in questions. I will write to you on the latest situation regarding the building.

Catherine Thomas: I too welcome your statement. Do you share my annoyance and great disappointment that an editorial decision in the BBC's recent *Restoration* programme, broadcast approximately two weeks ago, meant that no reference was made to Llanelly House? As you are aware, the house was the winner of the Welsh heat of *Restoration* and went on to compete in the UK-wide final. The house, which you visited last September, is steeped in history and is a truly magnificent example of an early Georgian town house. Do you agree that the interest surrounding the house and its restoration must be sustained? Although the BBC may now choose to ignore it, will the Assembly do all that it can to support this historic building, which is located on the edge of three Communities First areas in my constituency and is central to any local regeneration plans?

Alun Pugh: I did not see that programme, but you are right to say that Llanelly House is

Alun Pugh: Mae'r Pwll Mawr ym Mlaenafon yn ased hanesyddol a diwylliannol aruthrol, ac mae'r gwaith haearn, fel y dywedasoeh, yn bwysig iawn hefyd. Yr wyf yn falch o dderbyn eich gwahoddiad i ymweld â Blaenafon a chynnal trafodaethau manwl pellach yn y fan a'r lle.

David Melding: Croesawaf bob cam a gymerir i ddiogelu a hyrwyddo'r amgylchedd hanesyddol. Fel rhan o'r polisi hwn, a wnewch chi gynnull is-grŵp i ystyried y posibilrwydd o brynu 20 Plas-y-Parc, a elwir yn gyffredin yn Burgess House, i'w ddefnyddio gan y cyhoedd? Gofynnaf yn daer ichi wneud hyn. Gofynnaf hefyd ichi gael rhyw fath o asesiad o werth hanesyddol yr adeilad os nad ydych yn fy nghoelio, oherwydd, yn fy marn i, ac ym marn llawer o arbenigwyr pensaernïol, hwn yw'r adeilad domestig Fictoriaidd harddaf ym Mhrydain, ac nid ydym yn ei drysori.

Alun Pugh: Mae'ch gwaith o ran pleidio achos 20 Plas-y-Parc yn adnabyddus iawn, ac mae'r mater yn codi'n rheolaidd mewn cwestiynau. Ysgrifennaf atoch ynghylch y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf mewn cysylltiad â'r adeilad.

Catherine Thomas: Yr wyf finnau'n croesawu'ch datganiad. A ydych yn rhannu'r dieter a'r siom fawr a deimlaf am fod penderfyniad golygyddol ynghylch rhaglen *Restoration* y BBC a ddarlledwyd yn ddiweddar, tua phythefnos yn ôl, wedi peri nad oedd unrhyw gyfeiriad at Llanelly House? Fel y gwyddoch, y tŷ hwn a enillodd ragbrawf *Restoration* yng Nghymru ac aeth ymlaen i gystadlu yn y gystadleuaeth derfynol ledled y DU. Mae'r tŷ hwn, yr ymwelasoch ag ef fis Medi diwethaf, yn gyforiog o hanes ac yn enghraifft wironeddol wych o blas mewn tref ar ddechrau'r oes Sioraidd. A ydych yn cytuno bod rhaid cynnal y diddordeb ynghylch y tŷ a'r gwaith o'i adfer? Er y gallai'r BBC ddewis ei anwybyddu'n awr, a wnaiff y Cynulliad y cwbl a allo i gynnal yr adeilad hanesyddol hwn, sydd ar ymyl tair ardal Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn fy etholaeth i ac sydd â lle canolog mewn unrhyw gynlluniau adfywio lleol?

Alun Pugh: Ni welais y rhaglen honno, ond yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud bod Llanelly

a fantastic building. Having had the opportunity to look around it last year, I was amazed by the quality of the project and the work that is going on there. I was disappointed that it did not win the competition. Despite a vigorous three-votes-for-a-pound campaign that was run in all of Llanelli's supermarkets, we were, unfortunately, outvoted by the population of English conurbations.

Rosemary Butler: This is an interesting review, and I hope that we have wide consultation on it. As several speakers have said, we have some of the finest historic buildings in Europe, not just in the UK. Lynne's plea for the ironworks must not go unheeded. I hope that, when the review is complete, you will continue to support local authorities with grants to help them preserve and conserve any listed building that they may own—I am thinking particularly of Tredegar House in Newport. Can we also consider the other end of the market—not the grand houses, but the smaller houses owned by ordinary members of the public? When these people apply for planning permission, perhaps for alterations, and the local authority agrees to it, there is sometimes a hold up because Cadw has not had time to consider the application. This causes great difficulties for families. I am sorry, I believe that I am being wound up—

The Presiding Officer: Order. You are not being wound up, but we only have a few minutes left.

Rosemary Butler: My constituency has several conservation areas, as do many other Assembly Member's constituencies. Those areas are important to the historic landscape of towns and cities, but it is also important that individuals living in major historic buildings receive as much support as possible.

Alun Pugh: It is important to continue a programme of grants. You are right to draw attention to the fact that it is important that small-scale projects, which have played a major part in the industrial and commercial heritage of Wales, are properly protected, as well as the large, obvious projects.

House yn adeilad gwych. A minnau wedi cael cyfle i fwrw golwg arno y llynedd, rhyfeddais at ansawdd y prosiect a'r gwaith sy'n mynd ymlaen yno. Yr oeddwn yn siomedig na enillodd y gystadleuaeth. Er gwaethaf yr ymgyrch tair-pleidlais-am-bunt egniol a gynhaliwyd yn holl archfarchnadoedd Llanelli, fe'n trechwyd yn y bleidlais, gwaetha'r modd, gan boblogaeth cytreffi Lloegr.

Rosemary Butler: Adolygiad diddorol yw hwn, a gobeithiaf y cawn ymgynghori eang yn ei gylch. Fel y dywedodd sawl siaradwr, gennym ni y mae rhai o'r adeiladau hanesyddol harddaf yn Ewrop, nid yn y DU yn unig. Rhaid gwrandao ar apêl Lynne dros y gwaith haearn. Yr wyf yn gobeithio, ar ôl cwblhau'r adolygiad, y byddwch yn parhau i roi grantiau i awdurdodau lleol i'w helpu i gadw a diogelu unrhyw adeilad rhestredig a allai fod yn eiddo iddynt—yr wyf yn meddwl yn benodol am Tredegar House yng Nghasnewydd. A allwn ystyried pen arall y farchnad hefyd—nid y tai mawreddog, ond y tai llai sy'n eiddo i aelodau cyffredin y cyhoedd? Pan fo'r bobl hyn yn ymgeisio am ganiatâd cynllunio, i gael gwneud newidiadau efallai, a'r awdurdod lleol yn cytuno, ceir oedi weithiau am nad yw Cadw wedi cael digon o amser i ystyried y cais. Mae hyn yn peri trafferthion mawr i deuluoedd. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, credaf fy mod yn gorfod gorffen—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid ydych yn gorfod gorffen, ond nid oes gennym ond ychydig funudau'n weddill.

Rosemary Butler: Mae sawl ardal gadwraeth yn fy etholaeth i, fel y ceir yn etholaethau nifer o Aelodau eraill y Cynulliad. Mae'r ardaloedd hynny'n bwysig i dirlun hanesyddol trefi a dinasoedd, ond mae hefyd yn bwysig bod y rhai sy'n byw mewn adeiladau hanesyddol o bwys yn cael cymaint o gymorth ag y bo modd.

Alun Pugh: Mae'n bwysig inni barhau â rhaglen grantiau. Mae'n briodol ichi dynnu sylw at y ffaith ei bod yn bwysig diogelu prosiectau bach, a chwaraeodd ran o bwys yn nhreftadaeth ddiwydiannol a masnachol Cymru, mewn modd priodol, yn ogystal â'r prosiectau mawr amlwg.

Brynle Williams: I support everything that has been said. I have noticed that many old buildings in my area need slate roofing but have regrettably been left, as people cannot afford to re-roof them. Cadw tends to say that we leave them to get dilapidated and that is it, whereas some intervention now could possibly save them, and in 20 or 30 years' time we could have a building that is worth keeping. I would like you to consider that for the future, Minister.

Alun Pugh: I will consider that. Slate is a magnificent material; I cannot think of a finer roofing product than Welsh slate.

Leighton Andrews: I welcome the recognition in your statement, Minister, that many historic buildings could be reclaimed for community sporting activities. Notwithstanding the tremendous success at the weekend of the Rhondda Rebels, which has now won basketball's national cup four times in the last five years, do you agree that we still have major issues of poor health in our Valleys communities? Will you ensure that proposals from Valleys communities to reclaim historic buildings for sporting activities are used as pilots in the initiatives that you suggest?

Alun Pugh: The Rhondda Rebels is a fantastic team. It was great to see the team in action with you in the Rhondda last year. The Rhondda is precisely the sort of place that I was thinking about when I said that we need to target these pilot schemes carefully.

Brynle Williams: Ategaf bopeth a ddywedwyd. Yr wyf wedi sylwi bod angen toeau llechi ar lawer o hen adeiladau yn fy ardal ond eu bod wedi'u gadael, gwaetha'r modd, gan nad yw pobl yn gallu fforddio eu hail-doi. Mae Cadw yn tueddu i ddweud y dylem eu gadael i ddadfeilio a dyna ben arni, er ei bod yn bosibl y byddai rhyw fath o ymyrraeth yn awr yn eu hachub, ac y gallai fod gennym adeilad gwerth ei gadw ymhen 20 neu 30 mlynedd. Byddai'n dda gennyf pe byddech yn ystyried hynny ar gyfer y dyfodol, Weinidog.

Alun Pugh: Gwnaf ystyried hynny. Mae llechfaen yn ddeunydd rhagorol; ni allaf feddwl am well cynnyrch toi na llechi Cymru.

Leighton Andrews: Croesawaf y gydnabyddiaeth yn eich datganiad, Weinidog, y gellid adfer sawl adeilad hanesyddol i'w defnyddio ar gyfer gweithgareddau chwaraeon cymunedol. Er llwyddiant aruthrol y Rhondda Rebels ar y penwythnos, wrth ennill cwpan cenedlaethol pêl-fasged am y pedwerydd tro yn y pum mlynedd diwethaf, a gytunwch fod materion o bwys yn codi ynghylch iechyd gwael yng nghymunedau'r Cymoedd o hyd? A wnewch chi sicrhau y bydd cynigion gan gymunedau yn y Cymoedd i adfer adeiladau hanesyddol ar gyfer gweithgareddau chwaraeon yn cael eu defnyddio fel cynlluniau peilot yn y mentrau a awgrymwch?

Alun Pugh: Mae'r Rhondda Rebels yn dîm gwych. Yr oedd yn braf gweld y tîm yn chwarae pan oeddwn gyda chi yn y Rhondda y llynedd. Y Rhondda yw'r union fath o le yr oeddwn yn meddwl amdano pan ddywedais fod rhaid inni dargedu'r cynlluniau peilot hyn yn ofalus.

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Trwyddedu Rheoli Gwastraff (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004 Approval of the Waste Management Licensing (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, nid yw'r cynnig hwn yn destun dadl.

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 22.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): I

Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Cynigiaf fod:

propose that:

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 22.25:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25:

a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 2 December 2003, on the draft regulations, the Waste Management Licensing (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004; and

a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Rhagfyr 2003, ar y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Trwyddedu Rheoli Gwastraff (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004; ac

b) approves that the Waste Management Licensing (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 25 November 2003 and the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 26 November 2003. (NDM1767)

b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Trwyddedu Rheoli Gwastraff (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Tachwedd 2003, a'r arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Tachwedd 2003.(NDM1767)

Cynnig (NDM1767): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM1767): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine

Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Sefydlu Pwyllgor Mesur Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004 Establishment of the Public Audit (Wales) Bill Committee 2004

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I propose that:

the National Assembly establish the Public Audit (Wales) Bill Committee 2004, under Standing Order No. 8.1, to consider aspects of the Public Audit (Wales) Bill, including the Finance Minister's letter of 1 December to the Chair of the Public Audit (Wales) Bill Committee. Membership of the Committee shall comprise five Assembly Members, two from the Labour Party, and one each from Plaid Cymru, the Conservative Party and the Liberal Democrat Party.

The terms of reference for the Committee will be to:

1. consider the Public Audit (Wales) Bill as introduced to Parliament on 27 November 2003;

2. consider the Finance Minister's letter of 1 December reporting the UK Government's response to the Public Audit (Wales) Bill Committee's recommendations on the draft Public Audit (Wales) Bill;

3. report to the Assembly by 6 February on its conclusions.

The Committee shall cease to exist on 27 February 2004. (NDM1770)

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Cynigiau fod:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn sefydlu Pwyllgor Mesur Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.1, i ystyried agweddau o'r Mesur Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru), gan gynnwys llythyr y Gweinidog Cyllid dyddiedig 1 Rhagfyr at Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Mesur Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru). Bydd pump Aelod o'r Cynulliad ar y Pwyllgor, dau o'r Blaid Lafur ac un yr un o Blaid Cymru, y Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

Cylch gorchwyl y Pwyllgor fydd:

1. ystyried Mesur Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) fel y'i cyflwynwyd gerbron y Senedd ar 27 Tachwedd 2003;

2. ystyried llythyr y Gweinidog Cyllid dyddiedig 1 Rhagfyr yn adrodd am ymateb Llywodraeth y DU i argymhellion Pwyllgor Mesur Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) ar y drafft o'r Mesur Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru);

3. adrodd am ei gasgliadau i'r Cynulliad erbyn 6 Chwefror.

Bydd y Pwyllgor yn dod i ben ar 27 Chwefror 2004. (NDM1770)

Cynnig (NDM1770): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM1770): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Bourne, Nick

Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gibbons, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Ethol i Bwyllgor Mesur Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004 Election to the Public Audit (Wales) Bill Committee 2004

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): I **Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiaf fod:
 propose that:

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 8.3, elects the following members to the Public Audit (Wales) Committee 2004: Leighton Andrews (Labour); Janice Gregory (Labour); Janet Davies (Plaid Cymru); Alun Cairns (Conservative); Jenny Randerson (Liberal Democrat); and elects Janet Davies (Plaid Cymru) to be the Chair of the Committee. (NDM1771)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 8.3 yn ethol yr aelodau canlynol i Bwyllgor Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004: Leighton Andrews (Llafur); Janice Gregory (Llafur); Janet Davies (Plaid Cymru); Alun Cairns (Ceidwadwyr); Jenny Randerson (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol) ac yn ethol Janet Davies (Plaid Cymru) i fod yn Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor. (NDM1771)

Cynnig (NDM1771): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM1771): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, David
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Canllawiau'r Cynulliad ar Arfarnu Rheoliadol
Approval of the Assembly Guidance on Regulatory Appraisal**

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair) I Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Cynigiau fod
propose that:

the National Assembly for Wales adopts the Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn

revised guidance on regulatory appraisal, e-mailed to Assembly Members on 6 January 2004. (NDM1769) *mabwysiadu'r canllawiau diwygiedig ar arfarnu rheoliadol, a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 6 Ionawr 2004. (NDM1769)*

*Cynnig (NDM1769): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1769): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, David
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.20 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.20 p.m.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Cynlluniau Iaith Gymraeg (Cyrff Cyhoeddus) 2004
Approval of the Welsh Language Schemes (Public Bodies) Order 2004**

Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh): Cynigiad fod **The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh): I propose that**

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Cynlluniau Iaith Gymraeg (Cyrff Cyhoeddus) 2004, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Tachwedd 2003. (NDM1761)

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Welsh Language Schemes (Public Bodies) Order 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 25 November 2003. (NDM1761)

Cynigiad fod

I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Rhagfyr 2003 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Cynlluniau Iaith Gymraeg (Cyrff Cyhoeddus) 2004, ac

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 2 December 2003 in relation to the draft Order the Welsh Language Schemes (Public Bodies) Order 2004, and

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Cynlluniau Iaith Gymraeg (Cyrff Cyhoeddus) 2004 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Tachwedd 2003, a'r arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Tachwedd 2003. (NDM1762)

2. approves that the Welsh Language Schemes (Public Bodies) Order 2004 is made in accordance with the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 25 November 2003 and the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 26 November 2003. (NDM1762)

A minnau'n dysgu Cymraeg, mae'n fraint gennyf ddal y swydd hon.

As a Welsh learner, it is a privilege for me to hold this post.

Mae gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad weledigaeth glir: yn yr hirdymor, yr ydym am greu cymdeithas ddwyieithog yma yng Nghymru. Mae'n bleser gennyf ategu'r ymrwymiad hwnnw heddiw. Yr ydym am greu cymdeithas lle mae'r ddwy iaith yn destun balchder a chryfder. Y llynedd, cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad y ddogfen strategol 'Iaith Pawb', cynllun gweithredu clir ar gyfer yr iaith. Yr ydym wedi rhoi £28 miliwn ychwanegol er mwyn helpu cynnal twf yr iaith—ac mae'r iaith yn tyfu.

The Assembly Government has a clear vision: in the long term, we want to create a bilingual society here in Wales. I am pleased to uphold that commitment today. We want to create a society where both languages are a source of pride and strength. Last year, the Assembly Government published the strategic document 'Iaith Pawb', a distinct action plan for the language. We have provided an additional £28 million to help sustain the growth of the language—and the language is growing.

Mae ieithoedd lleiafrifol a rhanbarthol ar draws y byd yn dirywio. A dweud y gwir, mae'r ieithoedd Celtaidd yn dirywio, ond nid

Minority and regional languages across the world are in decline. To be honest, Celtic languages are in decline, but not the Welsh

y Gymraeg. Yn y cyfrifiad diwethaf, yr oedd cynnydd yn nifer y siaradwyr Cymraeg, ac mae hynny'n newyddion da. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni beidio ag anghofio mai dim ond 20 y cant o'r boblogaeth sy'n siarad Cymraeg; mae'n bwysig inni gadw cefnogaeth y mwyafrif hefyd. Ni fyddaf yn derbyn statws ail ddsbarth ar gyfer y sawl nad ydynt yn siarad Cymraeg, sef mwyafrif y genedl Gymreig.

Yn y cyd-destun hwn, y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cyflwyno'r darn hwn o ddeddfwriaeth gerbron y Cynulliad. Nid ydym yn credu bod angen Deddf newydd, ond rhaid inni ddefnyddio'r Ddeddf bresennol i gael yr effaith fwyaf. Heddiw, gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad ddod â chwmnïau dŵr o dan Ddeddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993. Dyma'r enghraifft gyntaf o osod rheidrwydd cyfreithiol ar gwmnïau preifat sy'n cynnig gwasanaeth cyhoeddus i weithio drwy gyfrwng y ddwy iaith. Rhydd wasanaeth i bobl Cymru yn eu dewis iaith. Yr wyf yn falch o allu dweud wrth y Cynulliad bod y tri chwmni dŵr yng Nghymru am weithio yn y ddwy iaith fel rhan o'u hymrwymiad i roi gwasanaeth da. Gwyddoch fod Dŵr Cymru wedi gwneud llawer yn y maes hwn eisoes, a rhaid canmol y cwmni am ei ymdrechion. Gobeithiaf y bydd pob Aelod yn croesawu'r ddeddfwriaeth hon.

Owen John Thomas: Weinidog, yr oeddwn yn synnu i glywed eich geiriau mawr am 'Iaith Pawb'. Mae'n amlwg i unrhyw un sy'n astudio'r ddogfen fod y diffyg cydnabyddiaeth o bwysigrwydd addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, a'r arian a neilltuwyd ar gyfer y cynllun, yn ei gwneud yn wan.

I ddechre at y pwynt ar yr agenda, croesawaf y bwriad i ddod â chwmnïau dŵr a charthffosiaeth o dan ofynion Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993. Fodd bynnag, mae dulliau newydd o gyfathrebu yn ei gwneud yn bwysicach nag erioed i annog cwmnïau fel Vodafone i ddarparu gwasanaeth dwyieithog. Mae Vodafone yn cynnig gwasanaeth amlieithog yng Nghymru ond nid oes darpariaeth ar gyfer y Gymraeg. Gellir cael gwasanaeth drwy gyfrwng y Sbaeneg a Swahili, ond nid y Gymraeg. I ganran sylweddol o'r miloedd o bobl yng Nghymru

language. The last census figures show that there was an increase in the number of Welsh speakers, and that is good news. However, we must not forget that only 20 per cent of the population speaks Welsh; it is important that we also retain the support of the majority. I will not accept second-class status for those who do not speak Welsh, namely the majority of the Welsh nation.

That is the context in which the Assembly Government is introducing this piece of legislation before the Assembly. We do not believe that a new Act is needed, but we must use the current Act to maximum effect. Today, I ask the Assembly to bring water companies within the remit of the Welsh Language Act 1993. This is the first case whereby a legal requirement is to be placed on private companies that provide public services to operate through the medium of both languages. It provides a service for the people of Wales in their language of choice. I am pleased to be able to tell the Assembly that the three water companies in Wales want to work through the medium of both languages as part of their commitment to good service. You will know that Welsh Water has already achieved much in this respect, and we must praise the company for its efforts. I hope that all Members will welcome this legislation.

Owen John Thomas: Minister, I was surprised to hear your grand words about 'Iaith Pawb'. It is evident to anyone who studies the document that the absence of any acknowledgement of the importance of Welsh-medium education, and the money allocated for the plan, make it weak.

Returning to the point on the agenda, I welcome the intention to bring water and sewerage companies within the remit of the Welsh Language Act 1993. However, new methods of communication make it more important than ever to persuade companies such as Vodafone to provide bilingual services. Vodafone offers a multilingual service in Wales, but there is no Welsh-language provision. Service is available in Spanish and Swahili, but not in Welsh. To a considerable percentage of the thousands of people in Wales who use Vodafone, that is

sy'n defnyddio Vodafone, mae hynny'n unacceptable. annerbyniol.

Mae mwy a mwy o bobl yn defnyddio'r rhyngwrwyd wrth ymdrin â banciau, ond dim ond yn uniaith Saesneg y gellir gwneud hyn. Pa gamau yr ydych yn barod i'w cymryd i ddwyn perswâd ar fanciau a chwmnïau fel Vodafone i sicrhau bod gwasanaeth dwyieithog ar gael yn y byd uwch-dechnolegol hwn? Mae hwn yn fater pwysig. Mae pobl ifanc yn defnyddio dulliau modern o gyfathrebu gyda'i gilydd, ond nid yw'n bosibl defnyddio'r dulliau hynny i gyfathrebu â banciau a chwmnïau fel Vodafone yn y Gymraeg. Beth ydych chi'n bwriadu ei wneud am hynny?

Eleanor Burnham: Mae grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn croesawu'r Gorchymyn hwn. Ers datganoli, mae gwaith Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg a chyrrff eraill wedi datblygu ac ehangu. Lluniwyd deddfwriaeth y bwrdd mewn oes wahanol, cyn i'r cyfleustodau gael eu preifateiddio a phan oedd strwythur cyrrff cyhoeddus yn symlach o lawer. Mae mwy a mwy o gwmnïau bellach yn darparu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus ar sail gystadleuol. Bydd hyn yn wir am gwmnïau dŵr yn y dyfodol agos.

Croesawn y ddeddfwriaeth hon, y cyfeiriwyd ati y llynedd yn ystod cyfnod y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth â'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y cawn gadarnhad gan y Gweinidog y bydd y gwaith hwn yn parhau gyda chwmnïau rhyngwladol. Mae'n allweddol bod pawb yn cael siawns i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg fwyfwy. Yr wyf yn cynnwys fy hun yn hynny o beth gan fy mod yn ceisio gwella fy Nghymraeg drwy ei defnyddio bob tro y caf gyfle.

Lisa Francis: Mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn cefnogi'r datblygiadau polisi cynhwysol ar yr iaith Gymraeg sy'n pwysleisio pwysigrwydd yr iaith i bawb sy'n byw yng Nghymru.

We continue to support the work of the Welsh Language Board and accept that, under Part II of the Welsh Language Act 1993, the Welsh Language Board may give notice in writing to any public body to produce a Welsh language scheme. Section 6

More and more people use the internet to communicate with their banks, but this can only be done through the medium of English. What steps are you prepared to take in order to urge banks and companies such as Vodafone to ensure that they provide bilingual services in this high-tech world? This is an important issue. Young people frequently use modern means of communication, but they cannot be used to communicate with banks and companies such as Vodafone through the medium of Welsh. What do you intend to do about this?

Eleanor Burnham: The Liberal Democrat group welcomes this Order. Since devolution, the work undertaken by the Welsh Language Board and other organisations has developed and broadened. The legislation relating to the board was drafted in a different age, before utility privatisation and at a time when the structure of public bodies was far simpler. More and more companies now provide public services on a competitive basis. This will soon apply to water companies.

We welcome this legislation, which was discussed last year during the partnership Government with the Liberal Democrats. I hope that the Minister will confirm that this work will continue with regard to international companies. It is vital that opportunities for people to use the Welsh language are increased. I include myself in that because I try to improve my Welsh by using it at every opportunity.

Lisa Francis: The Welsh Conservatives support the inclusive policy developments on the Welsh language that emphasise the importance of the language to all who live in Wales.

Parhawn i gefnogi gwaith Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg ac yr ydym yn derbyn y gall y bwrdd, o dan Ran II Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993, roi rhybudd ysgrifenedig i unrhyw gorff cyhoeddus i wneud cynllun iaith Gymraeg. Mae adran 6 y Ddeddf yn rhestru gwahanol

of the Act lists various public bodies for the purposes of Part II of the Act, and these include sewerage and water undertakers. The requirement for all water and sewerage companies in Wales to prepare Welsh language schemes and provide fully bilingual services will ensure a level playing field and mean that each would bear the costs of bilingual services on a fair basis as well as providing a bilingual service to Welsh consumers. Consultation has been carried out with all water and sewerage undertakers operating in Wales and with Ofwat. Their views have been taken into account. None of the companies consulted envisage that the costs of complying with the Order will be significant. There are no additional costs implied to the Welsh Language Board or to the National Assembly for Wales. Therefore, the regulatory option embodied in the proposed Order is the best option, ensuring that consumers in Wales are able to receive a fully bilingual service from water undertakers.

Felly, yr ydym yn cefnogi'r mesur hwn.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Fel y dywedodd Owen John Thomas, mae llawer o waith i'w wneud yn y maes hwn. Llongyfarchaf y Gweinidog ar y datblygiad diddorol a phwysig hwn. Yn ystod arolwg y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, clywsom dystiolaeth gan nifer o unigolion a mudiadau a oedd yn poeni am y gwasanaeth a gaent gan gwmnïau cyfleustodau yn y sector preifat o ran gwasanaeth dwyieithog. Gobeithiaf fod hwn yn gam cyntaf proses a fydd yn golygu y bydd pob cwmni sy'n cynnig gwasanaeth i'r cyhoedd yng Nghymru yn y pen draw yn gorfod cynnig gwasanaeth dwyieithog llawn ac y bydd hawliau'r iaith Gymraeg yn cael eu cydnabod. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor yn awyddus i'r Gweinidog ymestyn yr hawliau dan Ddeddf 1993 ac ystyried sut y gellid sicrhau hynny.

Fe wŷr y Gweinidog am y galwadau cyson am ddeddf iaith newydd wedi'i hanelu at y sector preifat er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn darparu gwasanaethau dwyieithog. A yw'r Gweinidog yn teimlo bod ganddo fwy o sgôp i ddatblygu pwerau Deddf 1993 er mwyn gwneud y gofyniad hwn i gynnig gwasanaeth

gyrff cyhoeddus i ddibenion Rhan II y Ddeddf, ac ymhlith y rhain y mae ymgwymerwyr dŵr a charthffosiaeth. Bydd y gofyniad i'r holl gwmnïau dŵr a charthffosiaeth yng Nghymru baratoi cynlluniau iaith Gymraeg a darparu gwasanaethau cwbl ddwyieithog yn sicrhau chwarae teg ac yn golygu y byddai pob un yn dwyn cyfran deg o gostau gwasanaethau dwyieithog yn ogystal â darparu gwasanaeth dwyieithog i ddefnyddwyr yng Nghymru. Ymgynghorwyd â'r holl ymgwymerwyr dŵr a charthffosiaeth sy'n gweithredu yng Nghymru a chydag Ofwat. Ystyriwyd eu barn. Nid yw'r un o'r cwmnïau yr ymgynghorwyd â hwy'n rhagweld y bydd y costau o gydymffurfio â'r Gorchymyn yn sylweddol. Nid yw hyn yn golygu unrhyw gostau ychwanegol i Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg nac i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Gan hynny, y dewis rheoliadol a ymgorfforir yn y Gorchymyn a gynigir yw'r un gorau, gan ei fod yn sicrhau bod defnyddwyr yng Nghymru'n gallu derbyn gwasanaeth cwbl ddwyieithog gan ymgwymerwyr dŵr.

Therefore, we support this measure.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: As Owen John Thomas said, there is a great deal of work to be done in this field. I congratulate the Minister on this interesting and important development. During the Culture Committee's review, we took evidence from a number of individuals and organisations that were concerned about the service they were receiving from private-sector utility companies. I hope that this is the first step in a process that will eventually require every company providing services to the public in Wales to provide a fully bilingual service and that rights relating to the Welsh language will be recognised. The Committee urged the Minister to extend the rights under the 1993 Act and to consider how this could be done.

The Minister will have heard the frequent calls for a new language act targeted at the private sector to ensure that it provides bilingual services. Does the Minister feel that he now has more scope to develop the powers of the 1993 Act so that more companies could be required to offer bilingual services?

dwyieithog yn berthnasol i fwy o gwmnïau? I would be interested to hear his response.
Mae gennyf ddiddordeb mawr yn ei ymateb.

4.30 p.m.

The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh): I was happy to see the joint statement of the three water companies in Wales. They will offer a bilingual service to their customers, which is clearly an improvement on the current situation. It is entirely reasonable that water consumers in Wales have a choice of language when dealing with these organisations. On how far we take the existing legislation, clearly I want to explore the possibilities of bringing more organisations within its scope. However, we have to move at a pace that people find acceptable. Creating a bilingual society is a huge undertaking; it will take many decades. What I will say is, *dyfal donc a dyrr y garreg*: we must persevere.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh): Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld y datganiad ar y cyd gan y tri chwmni dŵr yng Nghymru. Byddant yn cynnig gwasanaeth dwyieithog i'w cwsmeriaid, ac mae'n amlwg bod hynny'n welliant ar y sefyllfa bresennol. Mae'n gwbl resymol i gwsmeriaid dŵr yng Nghymru gael dewis o ran iaith wrth ddelio â'r cyrff hyn. Ynghylch pa mor bell y gallwn fynd â'r ddeddfwriaeth bresennol, yr wyf yn sicr yn dymuno ymchwilio i'r posibilrwydd o gynnwys rhagor o gyrff yng nghwmpas y ddeddf. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni symud ar gyflymder y mae pobl yn ei gael yn dderbyniol. Mae creu cymdeithas ddwyieithog yn waith anferth; cymer ddegawdau lawer. Yr hyn a ddywedaf yw, *dyfal donc a dyrr y garreg*: rhaid inni ddyfalbarhau.

Yr oeddwn yn siomedig i glywed sylwadau Owen John Thomas. Yr ydym yn trafod cwmnïau dŵr, nid Vodafone na Banc Barclays Bank.

I was disappointed to hear Owen John Thomas's remarks. We are discussing water companies, not Vodafone or Barclays Bank.

*Cynnig (NDM1761): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1761): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina

Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1762): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1762): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter

Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Adroddiad Blynyddol y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal The Annual Report of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

Gwenda Thomas: I propose that

Gwenda Thomas: Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 6.5 and No. 14.2, notes the fourth annual report of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity which was laid in the Table Office on 22 December 2003. (NDM1768)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.5 a Rhif 14.2 yn nodi pedwerydd adroddiad blynyddol y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Rhagfyr 2003. (NDM1768)

First, on behalf of the Committee, I thank officials in the Members' Research and Committee Services for their help and support.

Yn gyntaf, ar ran y Pwyllgor, diolchaf i swyddogion yng Ngwasanaethau'r Pwyllgorau ac Ymchwil yr Aelodau am eu cymorth a'u cefnogaeth.

I am delighted to present this report to the Assembly. It sets out the progress that the Assembly has made in terms of fulfilling its duty to promote equality of opportunity for all people. That duty, which is set out in the Government of Wales Act 1998, is a key aspect of the vision for devolved Government in Wales. The work of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity has been vital in driving it forward.

Yr wyf yn falch o gyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn i'r Cynulliad. Mae'n nodi'r cynnydd a wnaeth y Cynulliad o ran cyflawni ei ddyletswydd i hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal i bawb. Mae'r ddyletswydd honno, a nodir yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn agwedd allweddol ar y weledigaeth ar gyfer Llywodraeth ddatganoledig yng Nghymru. Bu gwaith y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yn hollbwysig wrth ei hyrwyddo.

The report covers the financial year, 2002-03, and therefore focuses on work carried out during the first Assembly. The first part of the report deals with the Committee on

Mae'r adroddiad yn ymdrin â'r flwyddyn ariannol, 2002-03, ac yn canolbwyntio felly ar y gwaith a wnaed yn ystod y Cynulliad cyntaf. Mae rhan gyntaf yr adroddiad yn

Equality of Opportunity's activities. The second part covers the Presiding Office's work and the final part, which makes up the bulk of the report, outlines the Assembly Government's activity. I pay tribute to the previous Committee on Equality of Opportunity and to Ann Jones, my predecessor as Chair, for their commitment and hard work.

The contribution of the Committee's standing invitees, the Commission for Racial Equality, the Disability Rights Commission, the Equal Opportunities Commission and Stonewall Cymru was, and continues to be, invaluable. The Welsh Language Board is now also a standing invitee. I also thank the many other individuals and organisations that have taken the time to provide advice and give evidence to the Committee.

The Committee considered a wide range of issues in 2002-03, including matters relating to the Assembly's internal processes, the operation of organisations under the Assembly's remit, and issues relating to the wider community in Wales. I take this opportunity to draw attention to some of the key areas that the previous Committee considered, and, where possible, set out how we are taking them forward. The major focus of the Committee's work during the period of the report was its review of service provision for Gypsies and travellers. As part of the review, the Committee took evidence from service providers in health, education and accommodation. The Committee also heard from a group of young people from the Gypsy traveller community, visited a number of Gypsy traveller sites and held a seminar for service providers. The final report was published just before Easter and the Committee received positive feedback on its contents and recommendations. We look forward to receiving the Government's response to the report and to seeing the recommendations implemented.

Another major area of work undertaken by the previous Committee was to consider how the diversity of public appointees could be increased to secure a broader representation from the whole spectrum of society. We have

trafod gweithgareddau'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal. Mae'r ail ran yn ymdrin â gwaith Swyddfa'r Llywydd ac mae'r rhan olaf, sef y rhan fwyaf o'r adroddiad, yn disgrifio gweithgarwch Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Talaf deyrnged i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal blaenorol ac i Ann Jones, a'm rhagflaenodd fel Cadeirydd, am eu hymrwymiad a'u gwaith caled.

Bu cyfraniad gwahoddedigion sefydlog y Pwyllgor, y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol, y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd, y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal a Stonewall Cymru yn amhrisiadwy, fel y mae o hyd. Mae Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn un o'r gwahoddedigion sefydlog yn awr hefyd. Diolchaf hefyd i'r nifer mawr o unigolion a chyrrff eraill a roddodd o'u hamser i gynnig cyngor a rhoi tystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor.

Gwnaeth y Pwyllgor ystyried amrywiaeth mawr o faterion yn 2002-03, gan gynnwys materion a oedd yn ymwneud â phrosesau mewnol y Cynulliad, gweithrediad cyrff y mae'r Cynulliad yn gyfrifol amdanynt, a materion a oedd yn ymwneud â'r gymuned ehangach yng Nghymru. Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i dynnu sylw at rai o'r meysydd allweddol a ystyriwyd gan y Pwyllgor blaenorol, gan nodi, lle y bo modd, sut yr ydym yn eu hyrwyddo. Yn ystod cyfnod yr adroddiad, yr oedd gwaith y Pwyllgor yn ymwneud yn bennaf â'i adolygiad o'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir i Sipsiwn a chrwydriaid. Fel rhan o'r adolygiad hwnnw, cymerodd y Pwyllgor dystiolaeth gan ddarparwyr gwasanaethau ym meysydd iechyd, addysg a llety. Clywodd y Pwyllgor hefyd gan grŵp o bobl ifanc o gymuned y Sipsiwn crwydrol, ymwelodd â nifer o safleoedd Sipsiwn crwydrol a chynhaliodd seminar ar gyfer darparwyr gwasanaethau. Cyhoeddwyd yr adroddiad terfynol ychydig cyn y Pasg a chafodd y Pwyllgor ymateb cadarnhaol i'w gynnwys a'i argymhellion. Edrychwn ymlaen at gael ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r adroddiad ac at weld yr argymhellion yn cael eu rhoi ar waith.

Maes gwaith arall o bwys yr ymgymerodd y Pwyllgor blaenorol ag ef oedd ystyried sut y gellid cael mwy o amrywiaeth ymysg y rhai a benodir i swyddi cyhoeddus er mwyn sicrhau cynrychiolaeth ehangach o holl rychwant

continued this work and, at our last meeting, we discussed the Commissioner for Public Appointments's annual report, and how she is taking action to increase diversity. We also have an ongoing dialogue with the Welsh Local Government Association on how gender balance in local authorities can be improved. The previous Committee paid particular attention to tackling the pay gap between men and women, which remains at an unacceptably high level. David Melding chaired an informal reference group to oversee the development of a campaign on equal pay, in partnership with the Assembly, the Equal Opportunities Commission and the Wales Trades Union Congress. The campaign was launched on 7 March 2002 in Cardiff, Swansea and Llandudno. Mobile exhibitions travelled around Wales to increase awareness about pay equity, and a series of public sector seminars have been held for the education, health and local government sectors.

The Assembly won a Castle award in recognition of its work in promoting equality of pay. We continue to take an active interest in the campaign, and we are pleased to note the Minister's recent announcement of funding for phase 2. We will discuss the recommendations made in the campaign evaluation report at our meeting in February. The Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 came into force in April 2001, and placed a general duty on all public authorities to eliminate racial discrimination. It also confers enforcement powers on the Commission for Racial Equality. The Committee considers that the Act is a powerful tool for removing racial discrimination, and it has taken an active interest in the implementation of its requirements in Wales. The previous Committee considered the Assembly's initial race equality scheme, and it has recently considered the Assembly's revised scheme as it went out to consultation in October. We look forward to considering it again later in the spring, and to examining how it has developed as a result of the consultation process.

The previous Committee welcomed the

cymdeithas. Yr ydym wedi parhau â'r gwaith hwn ac, yn ein cyfarfod diwethaf, gwnaethom drafod adroddiad blynyddol y Comisiynydd Penodiadau Cyhoeddus, a'r camau y mae'n eu cymryd i sicrhau mwy o amrywiaeth. Mae gennym ddeialog barhaus hefyd â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ynghylch y modd y gellir gwella'r cydbwysedd rhwng y rhywiau mewn awdurdodau lleol. Rhoddwyd sylw penodol gan y Pwyllgor blaenorol i'r gwaith o fynd i'r afael â'r bwlch cyflogau rhwng dynion a menywod, sy'n dal i fod yn annerbyniol o fawr. Cadeiriodd David Melding grŵp cyfeirio anffurfiol i oruchwylio'r gwaith o ddatblygu ymgyrch cyflogau cyfartal, ar y cyd â'r Cynulliad, y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal a Chyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru. Lanswyd yr ymgyrch ar 7 Mawrth 2002 yng Nghaerdydd, Abertawe a Llandudno. Aed ag arddangosfeydd symudol o gwmpas Cymru i hybu ymwybyddiaeth ynghylch tegwch o ran cyflogau, a chynhaliwyd cyfres o seminarau i'r sector cyhoeddus ar gyfer sectorau addysg, iechyd a llywodraeth leol.

Enillodd y Cynulliad wobwr Castle sy'n cydnabod ei waith o ran hyrwyddo cyflogau cyfartal. Parhawn i ymddiddori'n weithredol yn yr ymgyrch, ac yr ydym yn falch o nodi cyhoeddiad diweddar y Gweinidog am gyllid ar gyfer rhan 2. Byddwn yn trafod yr argymhellion a wnaed yn adroddiad gwerthuso'r ymgyrch yn ein cyfarfod ym mis Chwefror. Daeth Deddf Cysylltiadau Hiliol (Diwygio) 2000 i rym yn Ebrill 2001, a rhoddodd bob awdurdod cyhoeddus o dan ddyletswydd gyffredinol i ddileu gwahaniaethu ar sail hil. Mae hefyd yn rhoi pwerau gorfodi i'r Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol. Mae'r Pwyllgor o'r farn bod y Ddeddf hon yn arf grymus i ddileu gwahaniaethu ar sail hil, ac ymddiddorodd yn weithredol yn y modd y rhoddir ei gofynion ar waith yng Nghymru. Gwnaeth y Pwyllgor blaenorol ystyried cynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol cyntaf y Cynulliad ac, yn ddiweddar, ystyriodd gynllun diwygiedig y Cynulliad pan ddosbarthwyd ef ar gyfer ymgyngori ym mis Hydref. Edrychwn ymlaen at ei ystyried eto yn ddiweddarach yn y gwanwyn, ac at edrych ar y modd y datblygodd o ganlyniad i'r broses ymgyngori.

Croesawodd y Pwyllgor blaenorol gyhoeddi

publication in March 2001 of a report by Robert McKenzie entitled, 'Lifting Every Voice'. The report and its action programme addressed institutional racism at the National Assembly. The previous Committee encouraged the implementation of the report's recommendations and received a series of updates during 2002-03.

4.40 p.m.

The previous Committee took an active interest in the issues of access to polling stations. At its meeting in November 2002, the Committee discussed the issue with representatives of the Disability Rights Commission, Scope Cymru, and the Welsh Local Government Association. The Committee recommended that a study of accessibility, similar to previous 'polls apart' reports, should be carried out during the Assembly election. The Committee was pleased when the Minister with responsibility for local government and housing agreed to take this forward. The 'Polls Apart Cymru' report was published last autumn. We considered it, alongside several other reports on access to electoral procedures, at our meeting on 11 December. In the light of our discussion I have written to the Finance Minister, setting out the best practice examples that we discussed, to ask her to ensure that they are disseminated to returning officers in Wales. The previous Committee also made a formal response to the Electoral Commission consultation on equal access to electoral procedures.

The previous Committee responded to the UK Government's consultation on proposals for a single equality body. The key principle underlying the Committee's consideration of the consultation was that the driving force in revising the existing structures must be a desire to promote and develop equality, and that it should not be embarked upon as an administrative quick fix or in pursuit of benefits seen largely in economic terms. The Committee's response stressed that a new body would need a single legislative underpinning and that a single equality Act was a prerequisite for it to be able to operate

adroddiad gan Robert McKenzie o'r enw 'Lifting Every Voice' ym mis Mawrth 2001. Yr oedd yr adroddiad a'r rhaglen weithredu a oedd ynddo'n ymdrin â hiliaeth sefydliadol yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor blaenorol wedi rhoi anogaeth i roi'r argymhellion a oedd yn yr adroddiad ar waith a chafodd gyfres o adroddiadau ar y datblygiadau yn ystod 2002-03.

Ymddiddorodd y Pwyllgor blaenorol yn weithredol yn y materion sy'n ymwneud â mynediad i orsafoedd pleidleisio. Yn ei gyfarfod ym mis Tachwedd 2002, trafododd y Pwyllgor y mater gyda chynrychiolwyr y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd, Scope Cymru, a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Argymhellodd y Pwyllgor y dylid cynnal astudiaeth o fynediad, yn debyg i adroddiadau blaenorol 'etholiadau'n eithrio', yn ystod etholiad y Cynulliad. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor yn falch bod y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros lywodraeth leol a thai wedi cytuno i fwrw ymlaen â hyn. Cyhoeddwyd adroddiad 'Etholiadau'n Eithrio' yr hydref diwethaf. Gwnaethom ei ystyried, ochr yn ochr â sawl adroddiad arall ar fynediad i drefniadau etholiadol, yn ein cyfarfod ar 11 Rhagfyr. Yng ngolwg y drafodaeth a gawsom, yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog Cyllid, gan nodi'r enghreifftiau o'r arferion gorau a drafodasom, i ofyn iddi sicrhau y cânt eu lledaenu ymhlith swyddogion canlyniadau yng Nghymru. Rhoddodd y Pwyllgor blaenorol ymateb ffurfiol hefyd i ymgynghoriad y Comisiwn Etholiadol ar fynediad cyfartal i drefniadau etholiadol.

Ymatebodd y Pwyllgor blaenorol i ymgynghoriad Llywodraeth y DU ar gynigion ar gyfer un corff cydraddoldeb. Y brif egwyddor a oedd yn sail i ystyriaeth y Pwyllgor o'r ymgynghoriad oedd mai'r ysgogiad priodol i ddiwygio'r strwythurau presennol oedd awydd i hybu a datblygu cydraddoldeb, ac na ddylid ymgymryd ag ef fel ateb gweinyddol brys neu er mwyn ceisio manteision a welir mewn cyd-destun economaidd yn bennaf. Yn ymateb y Pwyllgor, pwysleiswyd y byddai angen un sylfaen ddeddfwriaethol i unrhyw gorff newydd a bod rhaid cael un Ddeddf

effectively. The Committee also emphasised the need for any new body to have a strong and largely autonomous presence in Wales, with formal links to the Assembly that would provide the Assembly with a role in its management and strategic direction. The UK Government made a formal announcement that it planned to set up a commission for equality and human rights in October. We look forward to considering the UK Government's plans again when further details emerge.

The previous Committee invited LGB Forum Cymru, now Stonewall Cymru, to become a standing invitee in 2002. As a result of a presentation by LGB Forum Cymru, the Committee identified a number of issues to be pursued. These included the provision of guidance to teacher training colleges on delivering advice on sexual identity and orientation, civil partnership registration schemes, the repeal of section 28, and the implications of a vote in the House of Lords on the Adoption and Children Bill.

I have already indicated some of the work that we, as a Committee, have done since the election and this will be reported on in full in the next annual report. However, I would like to briefly draw attention to some of the other issues that we have considered. The Committee has begun a policy review to look at how effectively the Assembly is mainstreaming equality in its work. We have discussed the European Year of Disabled People and the International Congress of Young Disabled People in some detail, and have identified the issues raised by the congress as an appropriate subject for our next policy review. We responded to the UK Government consultation on 'Civil Partnership—A Framework for the Legal Recognition of Same-Sex Couples' by welcoming the proposals and urging early legislative action. We also responded to another UK Government consultation 'Equality and Diversity: Age Matters', which deals with age discrimination in the workplace.

In terms of our future work, we have

cydraddoldeb er mwyn iddo allu gweithredu'n effeithiol. Rhoddodd y Pwyllgor bwys hefyd ar yr angen i unrhyw gorff newydd feddu ar bresenoldeb cadarn ac ymreolus i raddau helaeth yng Nghymru, gyda chysylltiadau ffurfiol â'r Cynulliad a fyddai'n rhoi rôl i'r Cynulliad yn y gwaith o'i reoli a phennu ei gyfeiriad strategol. Gwnaeth Llywodraeth y DU gyhoeddiad ffurfiol ei bod yn bwriadu sefydlu comisiwn ar gyfer cydraddoldeb a hawliau dynol ym mis Hydref. Edrychwn ymlaen at ystyried cynlluniau Llywodraeth y DU eto pan geir manylion pellach.

Bu i'r Pwyllgor blaenorol wahodd LGB Forum Cymru, Stonewall Cymru bellach, i fod yn un o'r gwahoddedigion sefydlog yn 2002. O ganlyniad i gyflwyniad gan LGB Forum Cymru, canfu'r Pwyllgor nifer o faterion yr oedd angen eu dilyn. Yr oedd y rhain yn cynnwys yr angen i ddarparu canllawiau i golegau hyfforddi athrawon ynghylch cynghori ar hunaniaeth a thueddiadau rhywiol, cynlluniau cofrestru partneriaethau sifil, diddymu adran 28, a'r goblygiadau a oedd i bleidlais yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi ar y Mesur Mabwysiadu a Phlant.

Yr wyf eisoes wedi nodi rhywfaint o'r gwaith a wnaethom ni, fel Pwyllgor, ers yr etholiad ac adroddir yn llawn am hynny yn yr adroddiad blynyddol nesaf. Er hynny, carwn dynnu sylw'n fyr at rai o'r materion eraill yr ydym wedi'u hystyried. Mae'r Pwyllgor wedi dechrau adolygiad polisi i ystyried i ba raddau y mae'r Cynulliad yn llwyddo i gynnwys cydraddoldeb ym mhrif ffrwd ei waith. Yr ydym wedi trafod Blwyddyn Ewropeaidd Pobl Anabl a'r Gyngres Ryngwladol ar gyfer Pobl Ifanc Anabl yn eithaf manwl, ac wedi nodi bod y materion a godwyd gan y gyngres yn bwnc priodol ar gyfer ein hadolygiad polisi nesaf. Gwnaethom ymateb i ymgynghoriad Llywodraeth y DU ar 'Civil Partnership—A Framework for the Legal Recognition of Same-Sex Couples' drwy groesawu'r cynigion ac annog deddfu'n fuan. Gwnaethom ymateb hefyd i ymgynghoriad arall gan Lywodraeth y DU ar 'Equality and Diversity: Age Matters', sy'n ymdrin â gwahaniaethu ar sail oedran yn y gweithle.

O ran ein gwaith yn y dyfodol, yr ydym wedi

identified a number of key issues on which we must focus: our current policy review on how effectively the Assembly is mainstreaming equality in its work, follow-up work on the review of service provision for Gypsies and travellers, a new policy review on access to services for young disabled people, work on increasing diversity in public appointments and in local government, on the implications of a single equality body, and on asylum issues. I commend this report to you and hope that you will have an interesting debate on it and the wider issues of equality of opportunity. The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration and I will respond jointly to the debate; I will pick up points that relate to the work of the Committee and the Minister will respond to issues raised about the work of the Assembly Government.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. There will be only one response to the debate, and that will be from the Committee Chair.

David Davies: I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Delete '*notes*' and replace with '*regrets*'.

I place on record my sincere belief, and that of all in the Conservative Party, in the importance of equality, of ensuring that discrimination in any form is not tolerated and, perhaps most of all, of ensuring that anyone who commits an act of violence against another because of their skin colour or sexual orientation should be severely punished. That does not mean, however, that we cannot be critical of those bodies that are meant to deliver equality in Wales. With the exception of those groups that deal with disability issues in particular, I am extremely critical of many equality organisations and much of what they do. My criticism of the plethora of Government-funded equality organisations stems from a belief that they are all too often incompetent and out of touch, that they are more interested in getting their hands on funding than in promoting equality, that they are pursuing political agendas and are guilty of double standards. Perhaps most serious of all, two highly-

nodi nifer o faterion allweddol y mae'n rhaid inni ganolbwyntio arnynt: ein hadolygiad polisi presennol ar y graddau y mae'r Cynulliad yn llwyddo i gynnwys cydraddoldeb ym mhrif ffrwd ei waith, gwaith dilynol ar yr adolygiad o'r ddarpariaeth o wasanaethau ar gyfer Sipsiwn a chrwydriaid, adolygiad polisi newydd ar fynediad i wasanaethau ar gyfer pobl ifanc anabl, gwaith ar gynyddu amrywiaeth mewn penodiadau cyhoeddus ac mewn llywodraeth leol, ar y goblygiadau o gael un corff cydraddoldeb, ac ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â lloches. Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad hwn i chi gan obeithio y cewch ddadl ddiddorol arno ac ar y materion ehangach sy'n ymwneud â chyfle cyfartal. Bydd y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio a minnau'n ymateb ar y cyd i'r ddadl; byddaf fi'n ymateb i bwyntiau sy'n ymwneud â gwaith y Pwyllgor a bydd y Gweinidog yn ymateb i faterion a godir sy'n gysylltiedig â gwaith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ni fydd ond un ymateb i'r ddadl, a hynny gan Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor.

David Davies: Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Dileu '*nodi pedwerydd*' a rhoi '*gresynu at bedwerydd*' yn ei le.

Dywedaf ar goedd fy mod i, a phawb yn y Blaid Geidwadol, yn credu'n ddidwyll ym mhwyysigrwydd cydraddoldeb, a sicrhau na oddefir unrhyw fath o wahaniaethu ac, yn fwy na dim o bosibl, sicrhau bod unrhyw un sy'n gweithredu'n dreisiol yn erbyn un arall oherwydd lliw ei groen neu ei dueddiad rhywiol yn cael ei gosbi'n llym. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n golygu na allwn feirniadu'r cyrff hynny sydd i fod i sicrhau cydraddoldeb yng Nghymru. Heblaw am y grwpiau hynny sy'n ymdrin â materion anabledd yn benodol, yr wyf yn feirniadol tu hwnt o lawer o gyrff cydraddoldeb a llawer o'r hyn a wnânt. Mae fy meirniadaeth o'r gormodedd o gyrff cydraddoldeb sy'n cael eu cyllido gan y Llywodraeth yn deillio o gred eu bod yn rhy aml o lawer yn analluog a heb wybod beth sy'n mynd ymlaen, eu bod yn ymddiddori'n fwy mewn cael gafael ar gyllid nag mewn hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb, eu bod yn dilyn agendâu gwleidyddol a bod ganddynt safonau dwbl. Yn fwyaf difrifol o'r

respected members of the Afro-Caribbean community have put it to me that they have, on occasion, been treated less favourably than members of other ethnic groups.

Lorraine Barrett: I wonder if your group colleagues agree with every word that you have just said, particularly David Melding—I cannot believe that.

David Davies: David Melding is more than capable of speaking for himself.

There are plenty of obvious examples of incompetence and political correctness gone mad among the groups that come before our Committee. Last month, we received a completely fatuous presentation from a group called the Wales Gender Budget Group. Its members have been finding examples of sexism in all sorts of areas of Government policy, including transport. ‘We subsidise buses,’ they say, and most of those going to work between nine and five are men, so there you have an example of ‘rampant sexism’. Andrew Davies, as Minister for Economic Development and Transport, had better watch out because he appears to be in their sights. They have now been sent off to find more examples—a task in which they will no doubt succeed. The health service provides another example of the politically correct mania sweeping public life. Next week, it launches the NHS Centre for Equality and Human Rights. I always thought that the NHS has plenty to do in dealing with accidents and emergencies, the general lack of NHS dentists or, perhaps, in getting the thousands languishing on waiting lists into hospital for operations. I wonder how many members of the public who are waiting 18 months or longer for an operation will see the establishment of an NHS Centre for Equality and Human Rights as a good use of money. Whether they are black, white, gay, straight, male or female, I am sure that they would rather that money be spent on delivering a health service.

Brian Gibbons: In making those comments,

cwbl efallai, mae dau aelod mawr eu parch o’r gymuned Affro-Caribiaidd wedi awgrymu i mi eu bod, ar brydiau, wedi’u trin yn llai ffafriol nag aelodau o grwpiau ethnig eraill.

Lorraine Barrett: Tybed a yw’ch cyd-Aelodau yn eich grŵp yn cyd-weld â phob gair o’r hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud, yn enwedig David Melding—ni allaf goelio hynny.

David Davies: Mae David Melding yn hen ddigon galluog i siarad drosto’i hun.

Mae digon o enghreifftiau amlwg o anfedruswydd a chywirdeb gwleidyddol wedi mynd yn rhemp ymysg y grwpiau sy’n dod gerbron ein Pwyllgor. Y mis diwethaf, cawsom gyflwyniad cwbl hurt gan grŵp o’r enw Wales Gender Budget Group. Bu ei aelodau’n darganfod enghreifftiau o ragfarn rhyw ym mhob math o feysydd polisi Llywodraeth, gan gynnwys trafndiaeth. ‘Yr ydym yn rhoi cymhorthdal ar gyfer bysiau,’ meddant, ac mae’r rhan fwyaf o’r rhai sy’n mynd i’w gwaith rhwng naw a phump o’r gloch yn ddynton, felly dyna ichi enghraifft o ‘ragfarn rhyw ronc’. Dylai Andrew Davies, fel y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, fod yn ofalus gan ei bod yn ymddangos eu bod yn anelu amdano. Bellach maent wedi’u gyrru i ddod o hyd i ragor o enghreifftiau—gwaith y maent yn sicr o lwyddo ynddo. Mae’r gwasanaeth iechyd yn cynnig enghraifft arall o’r gwallgofrwydd gwleidyddol gywir sy’n ysgubo drwy fywyd cyhoeddus. Yr wythnos nesaf, mae’n lansio Canolfan y GIG dros Gydraddoldeb a Hawliau Dynol. Yr oeddwn i wastad yn meddwl bod gan y GIG ddigon i’w wneud wrth ddelio â damweiniau ac achosion brys, y prinder cyffredinol o ddeintyddion yn y GIG neu, efallai, mynd â’r miloedd sy’n dihoeni ar restrau aros i’r ysbyty i gael llawdriniaethau. Tybed pa sawl aelod o’r cyhoedd sy’n aros 18 mis neu fwy am lawdriniaeth a fydd yn ystyried bod sefydlu Canolfan y GIG dros Gydraddoldeb a Hawliau Dynol yn ddefnydd da o arian. Boed hwy’n groenddu, yn groenwyn, yn hoyw neu fel arall, yn ddynt neu’n fenyw, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai’n well ganddynt weld gwario’r arian hwnnw ar ddarparu gwasanaeth iechyd.

Brian Gibbons: Wrth wneud y sylwadau

were you informed of the series of articles published in the medical press that shows systematic discrimination against people from ethnic minorities in obtaining access to medical schools? Do you acknowledge that such discrimination takes place, and how do you think it should be tackled?

David Davies: I doubt that the NHS is an inherently discriminatory organisation. If there is discrimination, it is not as though we do not have plenty of organisations that are, or should be, well equipped to deal with the matter. We have the Equal Opportunities Commission, Stonewall, the All Wales Ethnic Minority Association, the Muslim Council of Britain, and many other organisations, including the Commission for Racial Equality. Perhaps the NHS set up its unit because it no longer has faith in the CRE's ability to do the job that it was established to do. I always thought that the CRE had a good reputation for professionalism, and I am sad to see that even that organisation is starting to display the worst kinds of politically correct double standards. This week, the Commission for Racial Equality managed to grab the headlines for reporting former Labour MP Robert Kilroy-Silk to the police for comments made in a newspaper, yet only a few years ago, when a Welsh television pundit wrote a well-publicised article in which she said that she hated the English as a race for what they have done to Wales and the Welsh people, the CRE said nothing, despite the fact that that case was reported to it. The CRE rightly condemns violent racist attacks by white youths on blacks or Asians, but it has nothing to say about the growing problems of white, or even, occasionally, black and Asian youths, who suffer racist violence from other black or Asian youths. It seems incapable of recognising the obvious fact that racists come in every colour, as do their victims.

Instead of having a few organisations working professionally for equality, what we have done in Wales—and this is happening across the rest of the UK—is to create a plethora of organisations, which all too often

hynny, a wyddech am y gyfres o erthyglau a gyhoeddwyd yn y wasg feddygol sy'n dangos bod gwahaniaethu systematig yn erbyn pobl o leiafrifoedd ethnig wrth sicrhau mynediad i ysgolion meddygol? A ydych yn cydnabod bod gwahaniaethu o'r fath yn digwydd, a sut y credwch y dylid ymdrin â hynny?

David Davies: Mae'n amheus gennyf a yw'r GIG yn gorff gwahaniaethol o'i hanfod. Os oes gwahaniaethu, yr wyf yn siŵr bod gennym ddigon o gyrff sydd, neu a ddylai fod, yn barod i ddelio â'r mater. Mae'r Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal gennym, Stonewall, Cymdeithas Lleiafrifoedd Ethnig Cymru Gyfan, Cyngor Moslemaidd Prydain, a llawer o gyrff eraill, gan gynnwys y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol. Efallai fod y GIG wedi sefydlu ei uned am nad oes ganddo ffydd bellach yng ngallu'r Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol i wneud y gwaith y'i sefydlwyd i'w wneud. Tybiais erioed fod gan y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol enw da am ei broffesiynoldeb, ac mae'n chwith gennyf weld bod hyd yn oed y corff hwnnw'n dechrau amlygu'r mathau gwaethaf o safonau dwbl gwleidyddol gywir. Yr wythnos hon, llwyddodd y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol i gipio'r penawdau drwy roi gwybod i'r heddlu am y cyn AS Llafur Robert Kilroy-Silk oherwydd sylwadau a wnaed mewn papur newydd, ac eto, ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl, pan wnaeth pyndit teledu o Gymru ysgrifennu erthygl a gafodd sylw mawr lle y dywedodd ei bod yn casáu'r Saeson fel hil am yr hyn a wnaethant i Gymru ac i bobl Cymru, ni ddywedwyd dim gan y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol, er adrodd ffeithiau'r achos iddo. Mae'r comisiwn yn collfarnu ymosodiadau hiliol treisiol gan bobl ifanc groenwyn ar bobl groenddu neu Asiaid, a hynny'n briodol, ond ni ddywed ddim am y problemau cynyddol o bobl ifanc groenwyn, neu hyd yn oed rai croenddu ac Asiaidd weithiau, sy'n profi trais hiliol dan law pobl ifanc groenddu neu Asiaidd eraill. Ymddengys nad yw'n gallu cydnabod bod pobl hiliol i'w cael o bob lliw croen, yn yr un modd â'r rhai sy'n dioddef o'u herwydd.

Yn hytrach na chael ychydig o gyrff sy'n gweithio'n broffesiynol dros gydraddoldeb, yr hyn a wnaethom yng Nghymru—ac mae hyn yn digwydd yng ngweddill y DU—yw creu gormodedd o gyrff, sy'n rhy aml o lawer

compete with each other for funding and press coverage. The Committee on Equality of Opportunity should start scrutinising what is going on and ensure that public money is properly spent. As the story in *The Western Mail* today shows, we have failed as a Committee.

4.50 p.m.

Christine Chapman: Unlike David Davies, I welcome this report. It is good to see the progress that is being made in addressing equality issues in Wales, where, for generations, we have had many shortcomings in matters relating to the equal and fair treatment of our citizens. We should not shy away from that. This is about policy-making and investment, and Wales is starting to take a lead through the Assembly. In her report, Gwenda noted that ensuring equality was enshrined as a duty in the Government of Wales Act 1998, and is not just an aspiration. As a result, the people of Wales are the first in the UK to be given a series of positive rights to exercise, which can be enforced through the courts of Wales if necessary. Unlike David Davies, I believe that we should celebrate that. Equality must apply through all levels of Assembly policy.

This report contains much to debate, but I will concentrate on two points. First, I was pleased that the Committee took part in the UK Government consultation on civil partnership and was delighted that this new legislation was included in the Queen's Speech. Giving rights to same-sex couples is the right way forward. These rights do not exist at present and that is clearly unacceptable and does not reflect the roles that same-sex partners play in each other's lives. Opening up rights and responsibilities on issues such as pensions, visiting rights and employment benefits will be an important step to achieving equality.

This issue has generated much interest and has captured the imagination of many people in my constituency of Cynon Valley. I pay tribute to my constituent, Paul Thomas, who

yn cystadlu yn erbyn ei gilydd i gael cyllid a sylw yn y wasg. Dylai'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ddechrau craffu ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd a sicrhau bod arian cyhoeddus yn cael ei wario'n briodol. Fel y mae'r stori yn *The Western Mail* heddiw'n dangos, yr ydym wedi methu fel Pwyllgor.

Christine Chapman: Yn wahanol i David Davies, croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn. Mae'n dda gweld y cynnydd a wneir wrth ymdrin â materion cydraddoldeb yng Nghymru, lle y cawsom lawer o ddiffygion, ers cenedlaethau, mewn materion sy'n ymwneud â thrin ein dinasyddion yn deg ac yn gyfartal. Ni ddylem wingo rhag hynny. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â llunio polisi a buddsoddi, ac mae Cymru'n dechrau arwain y ffordd drwy'r Cynulliad. Yn ei hadroddiad, nododd Gwenda fod y gofyniad i sicrhau cydraddoldeb wedi'i ymgorffori fel dyletswydd yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, ac nad dyhead yn unig ydyw. Oherwydd hynny, pobl Cymru yw'r rhai cyntaf yn y DU i gael cyfres o hawliau cadarnhaol i'w harfer, y gellir eu gorfodi drwy lysoedd Cymru os oes angen. Yn wahanol i David Davies, credaf y dylem fawrygu hynny. Rhaid cymhwyso cydraddoldeb drwy holl lefelau polisi'r Cynulliad.

Mae llawer i'w drafod yn yr adroddiad hwn, ond canolbwyntiaf ar ddau bwynt. Yn gyntaf, yr oeddwn yn falch bod y Pwyllgor wedi cymryd rhan yn ymgynghoriad Llywodraeth y DU ar bartneriaethau sifil ac yr oeddwn yn falch iawn bod y ddeddfwriaeth newydd hon wedi'i chynnwys yn Araith y Frenhines. Rhai hawliau i gyplau o'r un rhyw yw'r ffordd iawn ymlaen. Nid yw'r hawliau hynny'n bod ar hyn o bryd ac mae'n amlwg bod hynny'n annerbyniol ac nad yw'n adlewyrchu'r rolau y mae partneriaid o'r un rhyw yn chwarae ym mywydau ei gilydd. Drwy gael hawliau a chyfrifoldebau mewn materion fel pensiynau, hawliau ymweld a budd-daliadau cyflogaeth, cymerir cam pwysig tuag at sicrhau cydraddoldeb.

Mae'r mater hwn wedi ennyn llawer o ddiddordeb ac wedi dal dychymyg llawer o bobl yn fy etholaeth i, sef Cwm Cynon. Talaf deyrnged i un o'm hetholwyr, Paul Thomas, a

gathered 500 signatures for a petition that was presented to Westminster. That proves that there is much interest in this in the community.

Secondly, I welcome the reference to gender budgeting in the report. Whether David Davies likes it or not, men and women's lives can differ widely for a variety of reasons, for example, in terms of providing different levels of domestic care. In policy making, it is appropriate that Government should seek to use sound evidence to analyse where needs and shortfalls arise. There is much evidence that shows the different types of lives that men and women lead, and the process of gender budgeting will add to that. I look forward to further reports on this issue.

David Davies spoke a great deal about political correctness. Does he share my view that the definition of political correctness is that it is a good, though occasionally awkward, way of trying to redress great injuries done against various people?

Leanne Wood: Thankfully, David Davies's views are in the minority among the members of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, and I am sure that we are all grateful for that. I will address a matter that is missing from the report in some ways, namely wider racism in society.

The Committee on Equality of Opportunity has undertaken, and continues to undertake, valuable and worthwhile work, and I place on record my congratulations to those responsible for introducing the dignity at work policy in 2002 to tackle harassment and bullying. We now have 23 harassment officers and a bullying hotline. I am sure that every Member is concerned about bullying in the workplace and is keen to stamp it out.

I have raised concerns on several occasions in the Committee on Equality of Opportunity about the apparent rise in racism in Wales. In the debate leading up to, and continuing after, the war on Iraq, some sections of the media demonised Muslims. The incidences of Muslim children being bullied in schools

gasglodd 500 o lofnodion ar gyfer deiseb a gyflwynwyd yn San Steffan. Mae hynny'n profi bod llawer o ddiddordeb yn hyn yn y gymuned.

Yn ail, croesawaf y cyfeiriad at gyllidebu yn ôl rhyw yn yr adroddiad. Pa un a yw hynny at ddant David Davies ai peidio, mae bywydau dynion a menywod yn gallu bod yn wahanol iawn am amryw o resymau, er enghraifft, o ran darparu lefelau gwahanol o ofal yn y cartref. Wrth lunio polisi, mae'n briodol i Lywodraeth geisio defnyddio tystiolaeth gadarn i ddadansoddi i ganfod ym mhle y mae anghenion a diffygion. Ceir llawer o dystiolaeth sy'n dangos y gwahanol fathau o fywydau sydd gan ddynion a menywod, a bydd y broses o gyllidebu yn ôl rhyw yn ategu hynny. Edrychaf ymlaen at gael adroddiadau pellach ar y mater hwn.

Cafwyd llawer iawn o sôn am gywirdeb gwleidyddol gan David Davies. A yw'n rhannu fy marn mai'r diffiniad o gywirdeb gwleidyddol yw ei fod yn ddull da, ond trwsogl weithiau, o geisio gwneud iawn am y niwed mawr a wnaed i wahanol bobl?

Leanne Wood: Yn ffodus, lleiafrif o aelodau'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal sy'n rhannu barn David Davies, ac yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod ni i gyd yn ddiolchgar am hynny. Ymdriniaf â mater nad oes llawer o sôn amdano yn yr adroddiad, sef hiliaeth fwy cyffredinol mewn cymdeithas.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal wedi gwneud gwaith gwerthfawr a buddiol, ac mae'n dal i wneud hynny, a dywedaf ar goedd fy mod yn llongyfarch y rhai a fu'n gyfrifol am gyflwyno'r polisi urddas yn y gweithle yn 2002 i fynd i'r afael ag aflonyddu a bwlio. Bellach mae gennym 23 o swyddogion aflonyddu a llinell gymorth ar gyfer bwlio. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod yr holl Aelodau'n pryderu ynghylch bwlio yn y gweithle ac yn awyddus i'w ddileu.

Yr wyf wedi mynegi pryderon ar sawl achlysur yn y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ynghylch y cynnydd amlwg mewn hiliaeth yng Nghymru. Yn y ddadl cyn ac ar ôl y rhyfel yn erbyn Irac, cafodd Moslemaid eu demoneiddio gan rai yn y cyfryngau. Bu cynnydd sylweddol yn nifer yr achosion o

have increased significantly. We have seen a clear example of this demonising in Robert Kilroy-Silk's idiotic comments about Arabs.

Another issue that contributes to increased racist attitudes is the debate on asylum seekers. Thankfully, we have managed to steer away from the racist element to that debate in Wales; unfortunately, we cannot say the same for the British tabloid press.

I am sure that all Members are concerned about racism. An increase in racist attitudes not only increases the risk of violent incidences, which in itself is worrying enough, it also increases the support for fascist politics and parties such as the British National Party. As I said earlier, the Committee on Equality of Opportunity—

David Davies: Do you not agree that the reason for the support for the British National Party is that mainstream politicians appear to be unable or afraid to debate real concerns around these issues?

Leanne Wood: No, I do not agree, David. Mainstream politicians contribute to racism in that debate and fuel support for the BNP. I disagree with you.

The Committee on Equality of Opportunity undertakes good work. However, increasing racism and fascism in Wales could serve to undermine that good work. Does the Minister therefore agree that, as a Committee and as an Assembly, we should do everything within this body's limited powers to stamp out racism in Welsh society and ensure that Wales remains a fascist-free country?

Ann Jones: I thank Gwenda for introducing the report and for her kind comments on my tenure as the Chair of the first Committee on Equality of Opportunity. I was pleased with the positive and constructive way in which that first Committee set about its work. I am no longer a member of that Committee, but if

fwlio plant Moslemaidd mewn ysgolion. Gwelsom enghraifft bendant o'r demoneiddio hwn yn sylwadau hurt Robert Kilroy-Silk am Arabiaid.

Mater arall sy'n cyfrannu at y cynnydd mewn agweddau hiliol yw'r ddadl ar geiswyr lloches. Yn ffodus, yr ydym wedi llwyddo yng Nghymru i osgoi'r elfen hiliol sydd i'r ddadl hon; gwaetha'r modd, ni allwn ddweud yr un peth am wasg y papurau newydd tabloid Prydeinig.

Yr wyf yn siŵr bod yr holl Aelodau'n pryderu ynghylch hiliaeth. Mae cynnydd mewn agweddau hiliol nid yn unig yn cynyddu'r perygl o ddigwyddiadau treisiol, sy'n peri digon o bryder ynddo'i hun, ond mae hefyd yn cynyddu'r gefnogaeth i wleidyddiaeth ffasgaid a phleidiau fel y Blaid Genedlaethol Brydeinig. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mae'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal—

David Davies: Onid ydych yn cytuno mai'r rheswm dros y gefnogaeth i'r Blaid Genedlaethol Brydeinig yw bod gwleidyddion y brif ffrwd yn ymddangos yn analluog neu'n rhy ofnus i drafod pryderon dilys ynghylch y materion hyn?

Leanne Wood: Nac ydwyf, nid wyf yn cytuno, David. Mae gwleidyddion y brif ffrwd yn cyfrannu at hiliaeth yn y ddadl honno ac yn hybu cefnogaeth i'r BNP. Anghytunaf â chi.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yn gwneud gwaith da. Fodd bynnag, gallai'r gwaith da hwnnw gael ei danseilio gan hiliaeth a ffasgaeth gynyddol yng Nghymru. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno, felly, y dylem ni, fel Pwyllgor ac fel Cynulliad, wneud popeth sydd o fewn gallu cyfyngedig y corff hwn i ddileu hiliaeth mewn cymdeithas yng Nghymru a sicrhau bod Cymru'n parhau'n wlad sy'n rhydd oddi wrth ffasgaeth?

Ann Jones: Diolchaf i Gwenda am gyflwyno'r adroddiad ac am ei sylwadau caredig am fy nghyfnod yn Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal cyntaf. Yr oeddwn yn falch o'r modd cadarnhaol ac adeiladol yr aeth y Pwyllgor cyntaf hwnnw ynghylch ei waith. Nid wyf yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor hwnnw

David Davies is perhaps that is not a bad thing. It is fair to say that every member of that first Committee shared a commitment to an active approach to promoting equality and combating the prejudices against certain groups in society that sadly still exist. *[Interruption.]* Some Members obviously do not want to listen to those people who need the Committee on Equality of Opportunity to work for them. If you think that this is funny, David, that is fine.

Discrimination still exists, and it is often the unconscious discrimination that people face of which we must be aware. I pay particular tribute to the efforts made by the working group on equal pay, which was chaired so well by David Melding. When you consider the two Davids in the Conservative Party, you must stop to think. In David Melding, you know that you are dealing with someone who believes in the true focus of equality of pay for everybody across Wales. He did a sterling job on that Committee. As a result of the Committee's work, Wales leads the UK in this field, as was recognised when the Assembly won the Barbara Castle award for its internal commitment to ensuring equal pay. However, as Gwenda has pointed out, that gap is still too wide and there is still work to do on that.

The first Committee on Equality of Opportunity invited people to join it to give their experiences of how they felt we could assist them. One group that joined us was the British Deaf Association, which discussed with us how we could help it further its commitment. I am pleased that the Assembly Government has acted by recognising the fact that, should a person with a hearing impairment want to come to the Assembly, interpretation will be available for them. That is the sort of issue that we need to consider.

Finally, an area that is of close interest to me is the poles apart survey. As Gwenda has pointed out, I was pleased when the Minister with responsibility for local government and housing found money to allow the poles apart survey to take place. That pleasure was only tempered by the fact that my returning officer

bellach, ond os yw David Davies yn aelod ohono, efallai nad yw hynny'n beth drwg. Teg yw dweud bod pob aelod o'r Pwyllgor cyntaf hwnnw'n rhannu ymrwymiad i gymryd camau gweithredol i hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb ac ymladd yn erbyn y rhagfarn yn erbyn rhai grwpiau mewn cymdeithas a geir o hyd, gwaetha'r modd. *[Torri ar draws.]* Mae'n amlwg bod rhai Aelodau nad ydynt am wrando ar y bobl hynny y mae arnynt angen y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal i weithio ar eu rhan. Os credwch fod hyn yn ddoniol, David, mae hynny'n iawn.

Ceir gwahaniaethu o hyd ac, yn aml, y gwahaniaethu anymwybodol y mae pobl yn ei wynebu yw'r hyn y mae'n rhaid inni fod yn effro iddo. Talaf deyrnged yn benodol i ymdrechion y gweithgor ar gyflogau cyfartal, a gadeiriwyd gystal gan David Melding. Pan ystyriwch y ddau David yn y Blaid Geidwadol, rhaid ichi aros i feddwl. O ran David Melding, gwyddoch eich bod yn delio â rhywun sy'n credu y dylid canolbwyntio ar gyflogau cyfartal i bawb ledled Cymru. Gwnaeth waith rhagorol ar y Pwyllgor hwnnw. O ganlyniad i waith y Pwyllgor, mae Cymru yn arwain yn y DU yn y maes hwn, fel y cydnabuwyd pan enillodd y Cynulliad wobr Barbara Castle am ei ymrwymiad mewnol i sicrhau cyflogau cyfartal. Fodd bynnag, fel y nododd Gwenda, mae'r bwlch hwnnw'n dal i fod yn rhy fawr ac mae gwaith i'w wneud ar hynny o hyd.

Gwnaeth y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal cyntaf wahodd rhai i ddod ato i gyfleu eu profiadau o'r modd y teimlent y gallem eu helpu. Un grŵp a ddaeth atom oedd Cymdeithas Fyddar Prydain, a drafododd â ni y modd y gallem ei helpu i hyrwyddo ei hymrwymiad. Yr wyf yn falch bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cymryd camau drwy sicrhau y bydd darpariaeth cyfieithu ar gael i unrhyw un sydd â diffyg ar ei glyw sy'n dymuno dod i'r Cynulliad. Dyna'r math o fater y mae'n rhaid inni ei ystyried.

Yn olaf, un maes sydd o ddiddordeb mawr i mi yw'r arolwg 'Etholiadau'n Eithrio'. Fel y nododd Gwenda, yr oeddwn yn falch bod y Gweinidog a chanddo gyfrifoldeb dros lywodraeth leol a thai wedi dod o hyd i arian hwyluso'r arolwg hwnnw. Yr unig beth a amharodd ar y pleser hwnnw oedd bod y

refused to allow the research work to be conducted in my constituency. Fortunately, the other 39 returning officers took a more constructive view, and I hope that there will be lessons for us to consider. I hope that that report will also be read by the returning officer for my area. I thank all members of the first Committee on Equality of Opportunity, and its secretariat, for their work on that report. I wish Gwenda and the second Committee well in their work in the years ahead.

5.00 p.m.

Lorraine Barrett: It was a shame to hear David's contribution, and an even greater shame to see the Conservative group smiling as he sat down. I welcome the opportunity to contribute positively to today's debate on the report. I thank Gwenda Thomas as Chair of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity and Ann Jones for her work as its former Chair, and I do so from a privileged position as a member of both the former and the current Committee.

As the report outlines, the Committee has achieved a great deal in taking forward its commitment to ensuring that we eliminate discrimination on the grounds of gender, race, disability and sexuality, or on any other grounds. The reports are comprehensive and Gwenda has covered the important sections, so I will not go into detail. I will just touch on the Assembly's recruitment strategy.

As the report of the Clerk to the Assembly outlines, the Presiding Office is undertaking work to address the Assembly's lack of progress in recruiting people from black and minority ethnic communities. I find that rather bizarre, given that the Assembly building is situated in Butetown, which has one of the highest concentrations of black and ethnic minority people in Wales. However, I have seen some local faces in the building recently, so perhaps that recruitment strategy is paying off. I welcome the fact that the Clerk to the Assembly has taken it upon himself to speak to community leaders. I am sure that any Member representing a Cardiff area would be happy to help him by providing him with contacts to ensure that he

swyddog canlyniadau wedi gwrthod caniatáu gwaith ymchwil yn fy etholaeth i. Yn ffodus, yr oedd ymagwedd y 39 swyddog canlyniadau arall yn fwy cadarnhaol, a gobeithiaf y bydd gwersi inni eu hystyried. Yr wyf hefyd yn gobeithio y bydd y swyddog canlyniadau dros fy ardal i yn darllen yr adroddiad hwnnw. Diolchaf i holl aelodau'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal cyntaf, ac i'w ysgrifenyddiaeth, am eu gwaith ar yr adroddiad hwnnw. Dymunaf yn dda i Gwenda a'r ail Bwyllgor ar eu gwaith yn y blynyddoedd i ddod.

Lorraine Barrett: Trist oedd clywed cyfraniad David, a thristach byth oedd gweld grŵp y Ceidwadwyr yn gwenu pan eisteddodd. Croesawaf y cyfle i gyfrannu'n gadarnhaol i'r ddadl heddiw ar yr adroddiad. Diolchaf i Gwenda Thomas fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ac i Ann Jones am ei gwaith fel ei gyn Gadeirydd, a gwnaf hynny a minnau wedi cael y fraint o fod yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor blaenorol yn ogystal â'r un presennol.

Fel y mae'r adroddiad yn dangos, mae'r Pwyllgor wedi cyflawni llawer iawn wrth ddilyn ei ymrwymiad i sicrhau ein bod yn dileu gwahaniaethu ar sail rhyw, hil, anabledd a rhywioldeb, neu ar unrhyw sail arall. Mae'r adroddiadau'n rhai cynhwysfawr ac mae Gwenda wedi ymdrin â'r adrannau pwysig, felly nid af i fanylu. Ni wna'f ond cyfeirio at strategaeth recriwtio'r Cynulliad.

Fel y mae adroddiad Clerc y Cynulliad yn nodi, mae Swyddfa'r Llywydd yn ymgymryd â gwaith i ymateb i ddiffyg cynnydd y Cynulliad o ran recriwtio pobl o gymunedau pobl groenddu a lleiafrifoedd ethnig. Yr wyf yn cael hynny braidd yn rhyfedd, o gofio bod adeilad y Cynulliad wedi'i leoli yn Butetown, lle y mae trwch y boblogaeth o bobl groenddu a lleiafrifol ethnig gyda'r mwyaf yng Nghymru. Er hynny, gwelais rai wynebau lleol yn yr adeilad yn ddiweddar, felly efallai fod y strategaeth recriwtio honno'n dechrau llwyddo. Croesawaf y ffaith bod Clerc y Cynulliad wedi ymgymryd â'r gwaith o siarad ag arweinwyr cymunedol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai unrhyw Aelod sy'n cynrychioli rhan o Gaerdydd yn falch o'i

can reach everyone.

I also welcome the deaf awareness training mentioned in the report, and Ann Jones has also covered that point. We both belong to, and Ann now chairs, the deaf issues group set up by Karen Sinclair, who did some sterling work. One of our big achievements was the provision of translation facilities for those who use British Sign Language. I only hope that more people will come forward to use that service. One of the most enjoyable Committee meetings that I can remember was when the British Deaf Association came to speak to us about British Sign Language. We had at least four different systems of communication and translation operating simultaneously. It was fascinating to see how everyone was able to communicate by different means. From that, as well as the work of the deaf issues group, British Sign Language training is now available here, and the first session will be held next week. It is great that Presiding Office staff and Assembly Members are taking the opportunity to try to learn BSL and I am one of them. I will let you know next year whether I managed to reach the end of the first part of the course.

Finally, without the initial unstinting support and encouragement of Edwina Hart, the Minister for equal opportunities—*[Interruption.]*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Alun Pugh, it is not permitted for you to stand in the Chamber.

Lorraine Barrett: I just wanted to pay tribute to Edwina Hart, as she is so well respected by all of the equality groups and commissions in Wales. That is not to take anything away from Carwyn Jones and his time as Minister for equal opportunities; he also did a great job. I just wanted to put that on record.

Eleanor Burnham: We must guard against

helpu drwy ddarparu cysylltiadau ar ei gyfer fel y gall gyrraedd pawb.

Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'r hyfforddiant mewn ymwybyddiaeth o bobl fyddar y cyfeirir ato yn yr adroddiad, ac mae Ann Jones wedi ymdrin â'r pwynt hwnnw hefyd. Mae'r ddwy ohonom yn aelodau o'r grŵp ar faterion pobl fyddar a sefydlwyd gan Karen Sinclair, a wnaeth waith rhagorol, ac mae Ann yn Gadeirydd arno bellach. Un o'n cyflawniadau mawr oedd darparu cyfleusterau cyfieithu ar gyfer y rhai sy'n defnyddio Iaith Arwyddion Prydain. Nid wyf ond yn gobeithio y daw rhagor ymlaen i ddefnyddio'r gwasanaeth hwnnw. Un o'r cyfarfodydd Pwyllgor mwyaf pleserus a gofiat oedd pan ddaeth Cymdeithas Pobl Fyddar Prydain atom i sôn am Iaith Arwyddion Prydain. Yr oedd gennym o leiaf bedair system cyfathrebu a chyfieithu wahanol yn gweithredu ar yr un pryd. Diddorol iawn oedd gweld sut y gallai pawb gyfathrebu drwy wahanol ddulliau. Yn sgîl hynny, yn ogystal â gwaith y grŵp ar faterion pobl fyddar, mae hyfforddiant mewn Iaith Arwyddion Prydain ar gael yma bellach, a chynhelir y sesiwn gyntaf yr wythnos nesaf. Mae'n beth ardderchog bod staff Swyddfa'r Llywydd ac Aelodau o'r Cynulliad, a minnau yn eu plith, yn achub ar y cyfle i geisio dysgu Iaith Arwyddion Prydain. Rhoddaf wybod ichi'r flwyddyn nesaf a lwyddais i gwblhau rhan gyntaf y cwrs.

Yn olaf, oni bai am gefnogaeth ac anogaeth Edwina Hart, y Gweinidog dros gyfle cyfartal, ar y dechrau—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Alun Pugh, ni chaniateir ichi sefyll yn y Siambr.

Lorraine Barrett: Nid oeddwn ond am dalu teyrnged i Edwina Hart, gan fod cymaint o barch tuag ati ymhlith yr holl grwpiau a chomisiynau cydraddoldeb yng Nghymru. Nid yw dweud hynny'n bychanu dim ar Carwyn Jones a'i gyfnod ef yn Weindog dros gyfle cyfartal; gwnaeth yntau waith gwych. Nid oeddwn ond am ddweud hynny ar goedd.

Eleanor Burnham: Rhaid inni ymochel rhag

self-congratulation because, although it is true that progress has been made, there is still a mountain to climb. I commend the Equal Opportunities Commission's report, which shows the clear progress made, but also shows how much more remains to be done. More than 30 years after the introduction of the Equal Pay Act 1970, there is still a 12 per cent gap between the wages of men and women working full time. If we consider part-time working, that gap increases to 34 per cent. Progress is therefore rather slow. Britain has the widest male/female pay gap in Europe and wages in Wales are greatly lower than the UK's average wage—that paints a bleak picture for many families.

Events sometimes remind us starkly of the work remaining. Following the shocking revelations of the BBC programme, *The Secret Policeman*, I greatly welcome North Wales Police's recent move to require all new recruits to sign an equality commitment. However, pieces of paper will not in themselves solve the problem. We can only move forward by mainstreaming equality issues relating to gender, disability, race, sexual orientation and age. Reference has been made to the latter and I believe that ageism is an issue.

Inequality needs to be tackled at many different levels. After almost 40 years of equal opportunity legislation, anything that is easy to change will have been changed. Although there have been improvements, an uphill struggle remains.

We recently discussed gender budgeting, which is an interesting technique with which David Davies does not agree. It highlights the often unintended impact of funding, which can discriminate against the genders, and particularly against groups. I venture to say that the whole tax and benefits system, which should be a natural contributor to equality, falls far short of what we should expect of it. The slide towards more indirect tax, out of the fear of income tax rises, means that the tax system is increasingly regressive and hits the poor hardest.

ein canmol ein hunain oherwydd, er ei bod yn wir bod cynnydd wedi digwydd, mae mynydd i'w ddringo o hyd. Cymeradwyaf adroddiad y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal, sy'n dangos y cynnydd pendant a gafwyd, ond sydd hefyd yn dangos cymaint sydd i'w wneud eto. Mwy na 30 mlynedd ers cyflwyno Deddf Cyflog Cyfartal 1970, mae bwlch o fwy na 12 y cant yn dal i fod rhwng cyflogau dynion a menywod sy'n gweithio'n llawn amser. Os ystyriwn waith rhan amser, mae'r bwlch hwnnw'n codi i 34 y cant. Braidd yn araf yw'r cynnydd felly. Gan Brydain y mae'r bwlch mwyaf rhwng cyflogau dynion a menywod yn Ewrop ac mae cyflogau yng Nghymru'n is o lawer na'r cyfartaledd cyflogau yn y DU—mae hynny'n peri bod y rhagolygon i lawer o deuluoedd yn ddigalon.

Weithiau, mae digwyddiadau'n ein deffro'n llwyr i weld y gwaith sy'n aros. Ar ôl y datguddiadau brawychus yn rhaglen y BBC, *The Secret Policeman*, yr wyf yn mawr groesawu'r cam a gymerodd Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn ddiweddar i fynnu bod pawb sy'n cael ei recriwtio o'r newydd yn llofnodi ymrwymiad i gydraddoldeb. Er hynny, ni fydd darnau o bapur yn datrys y broblem ar eu pennau eu hunain. Yr unig fodd inni symud ymlaen yw drwy roi materion cydraddoldeb sy'n ymwneud â rhyw, anabledd, hil, tueddiad rhywiol ac oedran yn y brif ffrwd. Cyfeiriwyd at yr olaf a chredaf fod rhagfarn oed yn fater o bwys.

Rhaid mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldeb ar sawl lefel wahanol. Wedi bron 40 mlynedd o ddeddfwriaeth cyfle cyfartal, bydd unrhyw beth sy'n hawdd ei newid wedi cael ei newid. Er y gwnaed gwelliannau, mae gwaith anodd o'n blaen.

Yn ddiweddar, yr ydym wedi trafod cyllidebu yn ôl rhyw, sy'n dechneg ddiddorol nad yw David Davies yn cytuno â hi. Mae'n tynnu sylw at effaith cyllido, sy'n anfwriadol yn aml, a all wahaniaethu yn erbyn y rhywiau, ac yn enwedig yn erbyn grwpiau. Mentraf ddweud bod yr holl system trethi a budd-daliadau, a ddylai gyfrannu'n naturiol at gydraddoldeb, yn methu â chyrraedd y nod o ran yr hyn y dylem ei ddisgwyl. Mae'r llithro tuag at ragor o drethi anuniongyrchol, oherwydd ofn codiadau mewn treth incwm, yn golygu bod y system dreth yn fwyfwy

atchweliadol a'i bod yn taro'r tlawd galetaf.

Council tax is one of the most unfair taxes of all. The recent consultation on age discrimination must surely have at least raised in Ministers' minds the council tax's serious impact on pensioners in particular. If the UK Government were to mainstream equality, it would abandon the Tory council tax—let us not forget that it was a Tory tax—and replace it with the local income tax that we put forward yesterday.

Given that progress on race and sex equality has been so slow, we must ensure improvements because it is clear that the newer equality issues of disability, sexual orientation and age will have a long struggle ahead. I think that I have now said quite enough.

Nick Bourne: I had not intended to speak, but as it is such an important debate I want to say a few words. David Davies clearly set out that everyone here regards discrimination on the grounds of race, sex, sexual orientation, disability and age as abhorrent. It is not right that any Member should be howled down for raising concerns. It is legitimate that David raised concerns. Hatred of Jews is every bit as bad as hatred of Arabs. We have problems in Wales where hatred is directed at people because they are Welsh-speaking or because they are English-speaking. We must ensure a proper balance when we consider these issues. They need to be addressed, and I am sure that there is a consensus in the Assembly on ensuring that they are dealt with appropriately. I hope that, at the end of this debate, we are united in our determination that we are able to build in Wales a society where there is true equality on all the issues raised. I take issue with Leanne—

Leanne Wood *rose*—

Nick Bourne: I will give way to Leanne in a minute, given that I have named her. I take issue with her because it is vital that we raise these issues and, if we do not, hearing them raised on the political fringes does immense damage to democratic debate in the Chamber.

Y dreth gyngor yw un o'r trethi mwyaf annheg o'r cwbl. Mae'r ymgynghori diweddar ar wahaniaethu ar sail oed yn sicr o fod wedi peri i Weinidogion o leiaf feddwl am effaith ddifrifol y dreth gynor ar benisynwyr yn benodol. Pe byddai Llywodraeth y DU yn rhoi cydraddoldeb yn y brif ffrwd, rhoddai'r gorau i dreth gyngor y Torïaid—na foed inni anghofio mai treth Dorïaidd ydoedd—a rhoi treth incwm leol yn ei lle fel yr un a gynigiasom ddoe.

Gan mai araf fu'r cynnydd ar gydraddoldeb o ran hil a rhyw, rhaid inni sicrhau gwelliannau gan ei bod yn amlwg y bydd angen ymdrechu'n hir ynghylch y materion cydraddoldeb mwy newydd, sef anabledd, tueddiad rhywiol ac oed. Credaf fy mod wedi dweud hen ddigon bellach.

Nick Bourne: Nid oeddwn wedi bwriadu siarad, ond gan fod hon yn ddadl mor bwysig dymunaf ddweud ychydig o eiriau. Nododd David Davies yn glir fod pawb yma'n ystyried mai gwrthun yw gwahaniaethu ar sail hil, rhyw, tueddiad rhywiol, anabledd ac oedran. Nid yw'n iawn bloeddio ar draws unrhyw Aelod am iddo fynegi pryderon. Mae'n deg i David fynegi pryderon. Mae casineb tuag at Iddewon lawn cyn waethed â chasineb tuag at Arabiaid. Mae gennym broblemau yng Nghymru lle y cyfeirir casineb at bobl am eu bod yn siarad Cymraeg neu am eu bod yn siarad Saesneg. Rhaid inni sicrhau cydbwysedd priodol wrth ystyried y materion hyn. Rhaid ymdrin â hwy, ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod consensws yn y Cynulliad ynghylch sicrhau y cânt eu trin yn briodol. Gobeithiaf, ar derfyn y ddadl hon, y byddwn yn gytûn yn ein penderfyniad ynghylch ein gallu i greu cymdeithas yng Nghymru lle y mae gwir gydraddoldeb yn yr holl faterion a godwyd. Anghytunaf â Leanne—

Leanne Wood *a gododd*—

Nick Bourne: Ildiaf i Leanne mewn munud, gan fy mod wedi'i henwi. Anghytunaf â hi gan ei bod yn hollbwysig inni godi'r materion hyn ac, os na wnawn, mae clywed eu codi ar gyrion gwleidyddiaeth yn gwneud niwed dirfawr i ddadlau democrataidd yn y Siambr.

Leanne Wood: That being the case, do you accept that inequality exists, that there is discrimination against black people and women, that the incomes of black people are lower than those of white people, that the incomes of women are lower than the incomes of men, and that, therefore, we need to put in place a system to ensure that this inequality is rebalanced? Is this not what the Committee on Equality of Opportunity is attempting to do?

Nick Bourne: I accept all of that; it is well documented and there is no doubt about it. I wanted to ensure that we are all aware of the discrimination that exists against other communities. You are right, and no-one would want to deride the issues addressed by the Committee. However, we should not say that everything in the garden is wonderful. Some institutions are not doing the work that they should be doing, and we need to recognise that there are structural problems that perhaps need to be addressed. I accept everything that you have said because there is no doubt about those issues.

5.10 p.m.

The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart): I welcome this year's annual report and the progress that the National Assembly for Wales has made. However, like Eleanor, I have some concerns that that progress has been insufficient in some areas. After seeing the enlightening television documentary about the police, it is now good to see that action is being taken. However, we must all be aware that there is a long way to go in many areas.

I regret the Conservative amendment and I agree with Christine Chapman's quote on the definition of political correctness in this regard. It is a tribute to democracy and tolerance that we can discuss these issues today. I am always mindful that there are many women, members of black and ethnic minority communities, disabled people, lesbians and gays, who have no voice and no tolerance shown towards them when they wish to express their opinions. They and their aspirations are not heard, which is why it is

Leanne Wood: Gan mai felly y mae, a ydych yn derbyn bod anghydraddoldeb yn bodoli, bod gwahaniaethu yn erbyn pobl dduon a menywod, bod incwm pobl dduon is nag incwm pobl wyn, bod incwm menywod yn is nag incwm dynion ac, felly, fod rhaid inni sefydlu system i sicrhau gwrthbwysor anghydraddoldeb hwn? Onid hynny y mae'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yn ceisio'i wneud?

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn derbyn hynny i gyd; mae cryn dystiolaeth i hynny ac nid oes amheuaeth yn ei gylch. Yr oeddwn am sicrhau ein bod ni i gyd yn ymwybodol o'r gwahaniaethu a geir yn erbyn cymunedau eraill. Yr ydych yn iawn, ac ni fyddai neb am wfftio'r materion y mae'r Pwyllgor yn ymdrin â hwy. Er hynny, ni ddylem honni bod popeth yn hyfryd. Mae rhai sefydliadau nad ydynt yn gwneud y gwaith y dylent ei wneud, a rhaid inni gydnabod bod materion strwythurol sy'n gofyn sylw o bosibl. Derbyniaf bopeth a ddywedasoch gan nad oes amheuaeth ynghylch y materion hynny.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart): Croesawaf adroddiad blynyddol eleni a'r cynnydd a wnaeth Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Fodd bynnag, fel Eleanor, mae gennyf rai pryderon na fu'r cynnydd yn ddigon mewn rhai meysydd. Ar ôl gweld y rhaglen ddogfen ddadlennol ar y teledu am yr heddlu, mae'n dda gweld bod camau'n cael eu cymryd yn awr. Er hynny, rhaid inni i gyd fod yn ymwybodol bod llawer iawn i'w wneud eto mewn sawl maes.

Mae'n ofid gennyf weld gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr a chytunaf â'r dyfyniad a roddodd Christine Chapman ynghylch y diffiniad o gywirdeb gwleidyddol yn hyn o beth. Mae'n deyrnged i ddemocratiaeth a goddefgarwch ein bod yn gallu trafod y materion hyn heddiw. Yr wyf bob amser yn ymwybodol bod llawer o fenywod, aelodau o gymunedau pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig, pobl anabl, lesbiaid a hoywon, nad oes ganddynt lais ac na amlygir goddefgarwch tuag atynt pan ddymunant fynegi eu barn. Ni

important that the Committee on Equality of Opportunity is here to give a voice to those people who are often unheard.

In light of Nick's contribution, perhaps the Welsh Conservatives would consider withdrawing their amendment, so that we can achieve cross-party agreement on this motion to show the Assembly's commitment to equality of opportunity.

I thank Gwenda Thomas for the way in which she introduced this debate and the fact that she covered many issues in her contribution. I was also delighted to hear Ann's contributions as the former Chair of the Committee. We have been lucky in terms of Members who have chaired the Committee and their commitment to the agendas.

There is no doubt that the National Assembly has taken a lead on equality work throughout the UK. I am happy that the Committee on Equality of Opportunity has put forward a work programme that aims to support the mainstreaming of equality across all areas of the National Assembly's agenda. I am committed to providing a detailed mainstreaming report to the Committee and hope that it will help to drive forward the Committee's mainstreaming agenda so that improvements to the inclusivity of service delivery and policy making can be made.

Gender budgeting is an essential issue that relates to some of these discussions. It is not a topic that only academics discuss; it is quite real—how we make decisions about money can have an enormous influence on groups of people. When discussing transport policy, you must consider which groups use public transport and make financial decisions in light of that.

I particularly welcome the Committee's work on Gypsies and travellers in Wales. Since the Committee's review of service provision for Gypsies and travellers, I have formed a ministerial working group and an officials working group to take forward and address the Committee's recommendations. Dealing with the Committee's recommendations is

chlywir hwy a'u dyheadau, a dyna pam y mae'n bwysig bod y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yma i roi llais i'r bobl hynny nas clywir yn aml.

Yng ngolwg cyfraniad Nick, efallai y gwnaiff Ceidwadwyr Cymru ystyried tynnu'n ôl eu gwelliant, fel y gallwn sicrhau cytundeb trawsbleidiol ar y cynnig hwn a dangos ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i gyfle cyfartal.

Diolchaf i Gwenda Thomas am y modd y cyflwynodd y ddaid hon ac am iddi ymdrin â llawer o faterion yn ei chyfraniad. Yr oeddwn hefyd yn falch iawn o glywed cyfraniad Ann a hithau'n gyn Gadeirydd ar y Pwyllgor. Buom yn ffodus o ran Aelodau a gadeiriodd y Pwyllgor a'u hymrwymiad i'r agendâu.

Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi arwain ar waith ar gydraddoldeb ledled y DU. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal wedi cyflwyno rhaglen waith sy'n ceisio hyrwyddo'r gwaith o gynnwys cydraddoldeb yn y brif ffrwd ym mhob maes yn agenda'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i ddarparu adroddiad manwl ar gynnwys cydraddoldeb yn y brif ffrwd i'r Pwyllgor a gobeithiaf y bydd yn gymorth i hyrwyddo agenda brif ffrydio y Pwyllgor fel y gellir darparu gwasanaethau a llunio polisi mewn modd mwy cynhwysol.

Mae cyllidebu yn ôl rhyw yn fater hollbwysig sy'n ymwneud â rhai o'r trafodaethau hyn. Nid yw'n bwnc a drafodir gan academyddion yn unig; mae'n gwbl real—mae'r modd y penderfynwn ynghylch arian yn gallu cael dylanwad enfawr ar grwpiau o bobl. Wrth drafod polisi trafndiaeth, rhaid ystyried pa grwpiau sy'n defnyddio trafndiaeth gyhoeddus a gwneud penderfyniadau ariannol ar sail hynny.

Croesawaf yn enwedig y gwaith a wnaeth y Pwyllgor ar Sipsiwn a chrwydriaid yng Nghymru. Ers adolygiad y Pwyllgor o wasanaethau ar gyfer Sipsiwn a chrwydriaid, yr wyf wedi ffurfio gweithgor gweinidogol a gweithgor swyddogion i ymdrin ag argymhellion y Pwyllgor ac ymateb iddynt. Nid gwaith hawdd yw ymdrin ag

not an easy task because they have enormous implications—budgetary and otherwise—for the whole of the National Assembly. As Gwenda said, I know that the Committee looks forward to receiving the Assembly Government's response to this review and, more importantly, to seeing an improvement in the lives of Gypsies and travellers in Wales.

At this point, it would be pertinent to comment on racism. Gypsies and travellers are often the most vilified groups in Wales, and by people who would not dream of commenting on other groups and who often do not realise that their comments are inherently racist. We all live our lives in a certain way; Gypsies and travellers have chosen to live their lives differently. We should welcome diversity and encourage people to exercise their rights to live in the way that they choose.

The Committee has undertaken excellent work on taking other issues forward. One good example is the black and minority ethnic housing action plan, which builds on the work of the black and minority ethnic housing strategy to develop black and ethnic minority housing. This work is making good progress.

The International Congress of Young Disabled People, which several Members attended—including Helen Mary Jones, Gwenda and others—was an emotional event for many, but an enormous success. As such, I agreed to support the young people's charter and to fund a video to capture the key elements of the congress. I hope that Assembly Members will use that video when they go out to talk about the Assembly's work; this is a positive example of such work.

Furthermore, the Committee is keen to continue the momentum attained during the European Year of Disabled People and will therefore conduct a policy review looking into issues raised by young disabled people and their experiences of accessing services. Service delivery will be key to this agenda—the fact that people want to be listened to in terms of what they want from services. It is a

argymhellion y Pwyllgor gan fod goblygiadau enfawr ynddynt—rhai cyllidebol ac fel arall—i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ei gyfanrwydd. Fel y dywedodd Gwenda, gwn fod y Pwyllgor yn edrych ymlaen at gael ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r adolygiad hwn ac, yn bwysicach, at weld gwelliant ym mywydau Sipsiwn a chrwydriaid yng Nghymru.

Ar y pen hwn, priodol fyddai gwneud sylw am hiliaeth. Sipsiwn a chrwydriaid yw'r grwpiau sy'n cael eu difrio fwyaf yng Nghymru yn aml, a hynny gan rai na fyddent yn meddwl am wneud sylw am grwpiau eraill ac na sylweddolant yn aml fod eu sylwadau'n hiliol o'u hanfod. Mae gan bawb ohonom ein ffyrdd penodol o fyw; mae Sipsiwn a chrwydriaid wedi dewis byw'n wahanol. Dylem groesawu amrywiaeth ac annog pobl i arfer eu hawliau i fyw yn y modd a ddewisant.

Mae'r Pwyllgor wedi gwneud gwaith rhagorol ynghylch materion eraill. Un enghraifft dda o hynny yw'r cynllun gweithredu ar dai ar gyfer pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig, sy'n ychwanegu at y gwaith a wnaed ar y strategaeth dai i bobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig i ddatblygu tai ar gyfer pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig. Mae'r gwaith hwn yn mynd rhagddo'n dda.

Bu Cyngres Ryngwladol ar gyfer Pobl Ifanc Anabl, yr aeth sawl Aelod iddi—gan gynnwys Helen Mary Jones, Gwenda ac eraill—yn ddigwyddiad emosiynol i lawer, ond yn llwyddiant aruthrol. Gan hynny, cytunais i gefnogi siarter y bobl ifanc ac i gyllido fideo i gofnodi prif elfennau'r gyngres. Gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn defnyddio'r fideo hwnnw pan ânt allan i sôn am waith y Cynulliad; mae hyn yn enghraifft gadarnhaol o waith o'r fath.

At hynny, mae'r Pwyllgor yn awyddus i fwrw ymlaen yn yr un modd yn ystod Blwyddyn Ewropeaidd Pobl Anabl ac, felly, bydd yn cynnal adolygiad polisi i ymchwilio i faterion a godwyd gan bobl ifanc ac i'r profiadau a gawsant wrth ddefnyddio gwasanaethau. Bydd y dull o ddarparu gwasanaethau'n rhan allweddol o'r agenda hon—y ffaith bod pobl am gael gwrandawriad

tremendous issue for the Committee to consider, but a difficult one to be reviewed.

On equal pay, the Welsh Assembly Government in conjunction with the Equal Opportunities Commission and the TUC conducted a highly successful campaign, as Gwenda said. I was pleased that David Melding was able to chair, so excellently, the group that dealt with that campaign. We are now entering the second year, and we must start to make progress in the private sector. The Government can put its own house in order, but we must consider the private sector and what trade unions in particular can do to raise awareness of the equal pay argument. As Eleanor said, 30 years after the Equal Pay Act 1970, where are we now? When you consider some of the statistics, it is a disgrace. This is the twenty-first century, women are working, but pay gaps still exist. The stereotyping of women's jobs also continues, which makes matters much worse.

Leanne asked about the fight against racism and about taking an effective lead against the British National Party. That is the responsibility of all parties in the Chamber. We live in dangerous times with regard to the re-emergence of the BNP in certain areas. Politicians are duty-bound to tackle these arguments head on and to be careful about what they say in public and how they address issues. We must not give these groups any leeway. We all know the history of Europe and what happened when fascism was allowed to prosper.

Finally, I am happy to endorse the fourth annual report on equality of opportunity, but I also recognise that the Permanent Secretary has produced a report about the Assembly itself. Lorraine Barrett raised the issue of the recruitment of ethnic minorities, and the Permanent Secretary must consider and monitor issues relating to recruitment, promotion and progress, for our staff in particular, and with regard to our wider

ynghylch yr hyn y maent am ei gael gan wasanaethau. Mae'n fater rhagorol i'w ystyried gan y Pwyllgor, ond yn un anodd ei adolygu.

Ynghylch cyflogau cyfartal, cynhaliodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ymgyrch dra llwyddiannus, ar y cyd â'r Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal a Chyngres yr Undebau Llafur, fel y dywedodd Gwenda. Yr oeddwn yn falch bod David Melding wedi gallu cadeirio'r grŵp a ddeliodd â'r ymgyrch honno, a hynny mewn modd mor rhagorol. Yr ydym yn dechrau ar yr ail flwyddyn yn awr, a rhaid inni ddechrau gwneud cynnydd yn y sector preifat. Gall y Llywodraeth roi trefn ar ei phethau ei hun, ond rhaid inni ystyried y sector preifat a'r hyn y gall undebau llafur ei wneud yn benodol i hybu ymwybyddiaeth o'r ddatl ynghylch cyflogau cyfartal. Fel y dywedodd Eleanor, ym mhle yr ydym yn awr, a 30 mlynedd wedi mynd heibio ers cael Deddf Cyflog Cyfartal 1970? Pan ystyrir rhai o'r ystadegau, mae hyn yn warthus. Yr unfed ganrif ar hugain yw hon, mae menywod yn gweithio, ond mae bwloch cyflogau'n dal i fod. Mae'r stereoteipio ar swyddi menywod yn parhau hefyd, ac mae hynny'n gwneud pethau'n waeth o lawer.

Holodd Leanne ynghylch y frwydr yn erbyn hiliaeth ac am roi arweiniad effeithiol yn erbyn y Blaid Genedlaethol Brydeinig. Mae hynny'n gyfrifoldeb i'r holl bleidiau yn y Siambr. Yr ydym yn byw mewn oes beryglus gyda golwg ar ailymddangosiad y BNP mewn rhai ardaloedd. Mae gwleidyddion o dan ddyletswydd i fynd i'r afael â'r dadleuon hyn yn uniongyrchol ac i fod yn ofalus am yr hyn a ddywedant yn gyhoeddus a'r modd yr ymdriniant â'r materion sy'n codi. Rhaid inni beidio ag ildio dim i'r grwpiau hyn. Yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod am hanes Ewrop a'r hyn a ddigwyddodd pan adawyd i ffasgaeth ffynnu.

Yn olaf, yr wyf yn falch o gymeradwyo'r pedwerydd adroddiad blynyddol ar gyfle cyfartal, a hefyd o gydnabod bod yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol wedi llunio adroddiad am y Cynulliad ei hun. Lorraine Barrett a gododd fater recriwtio lleiafrifoedd ethnig, a rhaid i'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol ystyried a monitro materion sy'n ymwneud â recriwtio, dyrchafu a chynnydd, ar gyfer ein staff ni'n benodol, a chyda golwg ar ein cysylltiad

involvement in the community. I am looking forward, as are all my ministerial colleagues, to working with the Committee during the coming year. I thank the Committee for its hard work in this area, and I am always hopeful that we maintain a cross-party consensus on equality. We must do so, or it is society that will lose out.

Gwenda Thomas: I will begin with David Davies's comments. He provided the clearest indication yet that we need a Committee on Equality of Opportunity, supported by legislation. I am grateful to Christine Chapman for her positive comments and the mention of gender budgeting. Leanne talked about bullying, racism and asylum, which the Committee will continue to consider. Ann Jones praised the Committee members' commitment to equality of opportunity, and I endorse that. Lorraine Barrett talked about the commitment to fight discrimination wherever it exists, and that underpins all of the Committee's work. Eleanor Burnham made some positive remarks about equal pay and other issues, and Nick Bourne made a brave attempt to tidy up after David Davies, and he certainly used more temperate language than his colleague. I thank the Minister, on behalf of the Committee, for your support. We look forward to the report that you have promised in the spring on mainstreaming equality issues. Mainstreaming is the big issue, and I thank all Committee members for their work. It has been a pleasure to work with you.

ehangach â'r gymuned. Yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen, fel y mae fy nghyd-Weinidogion, at weithio gyda'r Pwyllgor yn ystod y blynyddoedd i ddod. Diolchaf i'r Pwyllgor am ei waith caled yn y maes hwn, ac yr wyf bob amser yn obeithiol y byddwn yn cadw consensws trawsbleidiol ar gydraddoldeb. Rhaid inni wneud hynny, neu gymdeithas a fydd ar ei cholled.

Gwenda Thomas: Dechreuaf drwy sôn am sylwadau David Davies. Ef a ddangosodd yn fwyaf eglur fod arnom angen Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, a deddfwriaeth i'w ategu. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Christine Chapman am ei sylwadau cadarnhaol ac am sôn am gyllidebu yn ôl rhyw. Soniodd Leanne am fwlio, hiliaeth a lloches, y bydd y Pwyllgor yn dal i'w hystyried. Gwnaeth Ann Jones ganmol ymrwymiad aelodau'r Pwyllgor i gyfle cyfartal, ac ategaf hynny. Soniodd Lorraine Barrett am yr ymrwymiad i ymladd yn erbyn gwahaniaethu ym mhle bynnag y'i ceir, ac mae hynny'n sail i holl waith y Pwyllgor. Gwnaeth Eleanor Burnham rai sylwadau cadarnhaol am gyflogau cyfartal a materion eraill, a gwnaeth Nick Bourne ymdrech lew i dacluso ar ôl David Davies, a defnyddiodd iaith fwy cymedrol na'i gyd-Aelod, yn sicr. Diolchaf ichi, Weinidog, ar ran y Pwyllgor, am eich cefnogaeth. Edrychwn ymlaen at gael yr adroddiad yr ydych wedi'i addo yn y gwanwyn ar brif ffrydio materion cydraddoldeb. Prif ffrydio y materion hynny yw'r mater pwysig, a diolchaf i holl aelodau'r Pwyllgor am eu gwaith. Bu'n bleser gweithio gyda chi.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 10, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 40.
Amendment 1: For 10, Abstain 0, Against 40.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian

Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Jones, Ann
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.

Cynnig (NDM1768): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1768): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary

Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â
 today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.20 p.m.
 The meeting ended at 5.20 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
 Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)