



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth, 15 Mehefin 2004
Tuesday, 15 June 2004**

Cynnwys
Contents

Datganiad gan y Dirprwy Lywydd Statement by the Deputy Presiding Officer	3
Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister	3
Datganiad Busnes Business Statement	29
Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order	34
Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders	35
Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Ymddygiad Aelodau (Cod Ymddygiad Enghreifftiol) (Cymru) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2004 Approval of the Conduct of Members (Model Code of Conduct) (Wales) (Amendment) (No. 2) Order 2004	37
Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Etholiadau Lleol (Datganiad Derbyn Swydd) a Ffurfiâu Cymraeg (Cymru) 2004 Approval of the Local Elections (Declaration of Acceptance of Office) and Welsh Forms (Wales) Order 2004	40
Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i Reolau Sefydlog Approval of Changes to Standing Orders	44
Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru) Minority Party Debate (The Welsh Liberal Democrats)	45
Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus ar Weithredu Strwythurau Rheoli Gwleidyddol Newydd mewn Llywodraeth Leol The Local Government and Public Services Committee's Report on the Operation of New Political Management Structures in Local Government	69

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Dirprwy Lywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Deputy Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Datganiad gan y Dirprwy Lywydd Statement by the Deputy Presiding Officer

The Deputy Presiding Officer: In the absence of the Presiding Officer, I will chair the majority of today's Plenary. Under Standing Order No. 1.11, I may ask Peter Black to act as temporary chair during the proceedings.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yn absenoldeb y Llywydd, byddaf fi'n cadeirio'r rhan fwyaf o'r Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw. O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 1.11, gallaf ofyn i Peter Black weithredu fel cadeirydd dros dro yn ystod y trafodion.

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Cynllun yr Ail Gynnig The Second Offer Scheme

C1 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog adroddiad ar hynt cynllun yr ail gynnig? (OAQ35987)

Q1 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Will the First Minister make a progress report on the second offer scheme? (OAQ35987)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Gwnaed trefniadau i drin 364 o gleifion a fu'n aros dros 18 mis i dderbyn triniaeth yn chwarter cyntaf y cynllun. Bydd 270 o'r rheini yn derbyn triniaeth yn Ysbyty BUPA Caerdydd ac mae 84 wedi cael eu trin mewn ysbyty Nuffield a 10 yn Ysbyty Kidderminster.

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): There are arrangements in place to treat 364 patients who have waited longer than 18 months for treatment during the first quarter of the scheme. Two hundred and seventy of those will be treated in the BUPA Hospital Cardiff, and 84 have been treated in a Nuffield hospital and 10 in Kidderminster Hospital.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae'n amlwg i'r cynllun ail gynnig wneud gwahaniaeth i bobl sy'n aros dros 18 mis am driniaeth. Pa gysur sydd gennych i bobl fel etholwr i mi a grybwyllodd wrthyf heddiw iddo aros naw mis i gael archwiliad yn yr ysbyty a chwe mis i gael prawf ar ei glyw? A yw'r math hwn o oedi cyn i bobl gael eu trin yn dderbyniol? Daeth i'm sylw hefyd i wraig yn y Ddeddwyrain aros naw mlynedd a hanner i weld arbenigwr.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: It is obvious that the second offer scheme has made a difference to those waiting longer than 18 months for treatment. What comfort can you offer people such as a constituent of mine who told me today that he waited nine months for a hospital examination and six months for a hearing test? Is that kind of delay acceptable? It has also come to my notice that a woman in south-east Wales has waited over nine and a half years to see a specialist.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. We need to get things going and be much more succinct.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid inni symud ymlaen yn gynt a bod yn llawer mwy cryno.

Y Prif Weinidog: Dim ond ar gyfer cleifion a fu'n aros dros 18 mis y mae'r cynllun. Mae'n dibynnu ar y targed ar gyfer triniaeth. Os mai wyth neu 10 mis yw'r targed ar gyfer

The First Minister: The scheme only applies to patients who have been waiting longer than 18 months. It depends on the target for treatment. If the target is eight or 10 months

triniaeth ar y galon, daw'r cynllun yn weithredol unwaith y mae'r amser hwnnw wedi pasio. Yn achos triniaeth cataract, mae'r cynllun yn weithredol ar ôl pedwar mis. Fel y dywedais, mae'n dibynnu ar y targed. O ran amgylchiadau personol eich etholwr, dylech ysgrifennu ataf i neu Jane Hutt.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Part of the second offer scheme is that in cases of serious waits, out-of-Wales options are considered. One such area is cardiac care, but we know that, because of so-called over-performance at English centres, according to Health Commission Wales people are being forced to wait longer because Wales cannot afford to pay the bills. We know, from the minutes of the meetings of Health Commission Wales, that part of the guarantee is not working. Can the First Minister reassure people who are unable to receive serious cardiac care?

The First Minister: As I mentioned in my answer to Rhodri Glyn Thomas's supplementary, the second offer guarantee is activated after 10 months for cardiac surgery because that is the target. Anyone who has waited longer would receive a second offer of treatment. No-one is over target. Therefore, because of the excellent performance of cardiac surgery and cardiology services in Wales, there is no-one to whom the second offer guarantee would apply. We hope to bring that down quickly to eight months; there are only 30 people waiting more than eight months.

Nick Bourne: I have the figures here. There are 30 people waiting more than eight months for cardiac surgery in Swansea alone. This is nothing to crow about. The position is far better in England, where no-one is waiting more than five months. The First Minister is wrong when he says that the position is not serious. People are waiting eight or nine months for treatment. The point is, and I quote from a board meeting of Health Commission Wales:

'Overperformance at English centres is a significant risk to Health Commission Wales. To counteract this risk as part of the long-term agreement negotiations, Health

for heart surgery, the scheme is operational once that time has elapsed. In the case of cataract treatment, the scheme comes into operation after four months. As I said, it depends on the target. As regards the personal circumstances of your constituent, you should write to me or Jane Hutt.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Elfen o gynllun yr ail gynnig yw yr ystyriwr dewisiadau y tu allan i Gymru yn achos rhai a fu'n disgwyl yn hir iawn. Un maes o'r fath yw gofal cardiaidd, ond gwyddom, oherwydd y gorberfformio, fel y'i gelwir, mewn canolfannau yn Lloegr, fod rhai'n gorfod disgwyl yn hwy, yn ôl Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru, am na all Cymru fforddio talu'r biliau. Gwyddom, oddi wrth gofnodion cyfarfodydd Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru, fod un agwedd ar y warant honno nad yw'n llwyddo. A all y Prif Weinidog dawelu meddwl y rhai na allant gael gofal cardiaidd pwysig?

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i gwestiwn atodol Rhodri Glyn Thomas, rhoddir y warant o ail gynnig ar ôl 10 mis yn achos llawfeddygaeth gardiaidd am mai hwnnw yw'r targed. Byddai unrhyw un a fu'n aros yn hwy'n cael ail gynnig o driniaeth. Nid oes neb wedi mynd heibio i'r targed. Gan hynny, oherwydd perfformiad rhagorol gwasanaethau llawfeddygaeth gardiaidd a chardioleg yng Nghymru, ni fyddai'r warant o ail gynnig yn berthnasol i neb. Gobeithiwn ostwng hynny'n fuan i wyth mis; dim ond 30 sy'n disgwyl yn hwy nag wyth mis.

Nick Bourne: Mae'r ffigurau gennyf yma. Mae 30 yn disgwyl yn hwy nag wyth mis am lawdriniaeth gardiaidd yn Abertawe'n unig. Nid yw hyn yn rhywbeth i ymffrostio ynddo. Mae'r sefyllfa'n well o lawer yn Lloegr, lle nad oes neb yn disgwyl yn hwy na phum mis. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn camgymryd wrth ddweud nad yw'r sefyllfa'n ddifrifol. Mae rhai'n disgwyl wyth neu naw mis am driniaeth. Y pwynt yw, a dyfynnaf o gyfarfod o fwrdd Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru:

Mae gorberfformio mewn canolfannau yn Lloegr yn peri cryn risg i Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru. Er mwyn gwrthsefyll y risg hwn fel rhan o'r negodiadau ar y cytundeb tymor hir,

Commission Wales will require English trusts to manage activity within the agreed financial envelope.'

That is, financial constraints mean that even though there is capacity in England, Welsh patients are having to wait. What are you and the Minister for Health and Social Services going to do about that?

The First Minister: There is no need for us to disagree when we are quoting the same figures. I said 30 and you said 30. We have the same figure: 30 people are waiting over eight months. The target period, in terms of the second offer guarantee scheme, is 10 months. No-one comes under the scheme, because no-one is waiting over the target period. I am pleased that the majority of Welsh trusts are also achieving the target for cataract surgery, namely that no-one should wait over four months for surgery. If you have a specific point about the funding, you should take up the matter with Jane Hutt. We agree on the figure: 30 people are waiting over eight months. However, no-one is waiting over the target period of 10 months.

Nick Bourne: I have to challenge you on this, First Minister. You have not addressed the serious issue here. Health Commission Wales says that because of over-performance in relation to Welsh patients being sent to hospitals in England, it is being told to slow down on their treatment. That is the crucial issue, regardless of whether the wait is six, seven or eight months. Health Commission Wales is being told to slow down on patients sent from Wales to England, because we cannot afford it, given our budget. I want you to address that point.

The First Minister: I am not sure that that has anything to do with the second offer guarantee scheme. No-one is eligible for treatment under the second offer guarantee scheme, because no-one is waiting longer than the target time. That is an excellent performance by cardiac surgery teams in Wales, and by the cardiology treatment

bydd Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru'n mynnu y bydd ymddiriedolaethau yn Lloegr yn trefnu'r gweithgarwch fel ei fod o fewn yr amlen ariannol a gytunwyd.

Hynny yw, mae cyfyngiadau ariannol yn golygu bod yn rhaid i gleifion yng Nghymru ddisgwyl, er bod capasiti ar gael yn Lloegr. Beth a wnewch chi a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ynghylch hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes angen inni anghytuno, a ninnau'n dyfynnu o'r un ffigurau. Deg ar hugain a ddywedais i a 30 a ddywedasoch chi. Yr un ffigur sydd gennym: mae 30 yn disgwyl yn hwy nag wyth mis. Y cyfnod targed, yng nghyd-destun cynllun y warant o ail gynnig, yw 10 mis. Nid yw'r cynllun yn berthnasol i neb gan nad oes neb yn disgwyl yn hwy na'r cyfnod targed. Yr wyf yn falch bod y rhan fwyaf o ymddiriedolaethau Cymru hefyd yn cyrraedd y targed ar gyfer llawdriniaeth ar gataractau, sef na ddylai neb ddisgwyl yn hwy na phedwar mis am driniaeth. Os oes gennych bwynt penodol i'w wneud am y cyllido, dylech godi'r mater gyda Jane Hutt. Cytunwn ar y ffigur: mae 30 yn disgwyl yn hwy nag wyth mis. Fodd bynnag, nid oes neb sy'n disgwyl yn hwy na'r cyfnod targed o 10 mis.

Nick Bourne: Rhaid imi'ch herio ar hyn, Brif Weinidog. Nid ydych wedi ymdrin â'r mater pwysig sydd dan sylw. Dywed Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru ei fod yn cael ei gyfarwyddo i arafu'r driniaeth ar gyfer cleifion o Gymru a anfonir i ysbytai yn Lloegr oherwydd y gorberfformio sy'n digwydd yn y cyswllt hwn. Dyna'r mater hollbwysig, waeth beth fo'r cyfnod a arhosir. Dywedir wrth Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru am arafu wrth anfon cleifion o Gymru i Loegr, am fod ein cyllideb yn golygu na allwn fforddio talu am eu triniaeth. Yr wyf am ichi ymdrin â'r pwynt hwnnw.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf a siŵr a oes a wnelo hynny â chynllun y warant o ail gynnig o gwbl. Nid oes neb yn gymwys i'w drin o dan gynllun y warant o ail gynnig, am nad oes neb yn disgwyl yn hwy na'r cyfnod targed. Dyna berfformiad rhagorol gan dimau llawfeddygaeth gardiaidd yng Nghymru, a chan wasanaethau cardioleg, yn sgîl

services, following the introduction of statins and other measures that reduce the need for cardiac surgery. The same is true in England; there has been a massive improvement in the treatment of heart disease. In the long run, we need to prevent it through changes in diet and lifestyle, and we are only too familiar with what we need to do in that regard.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): You tell us that the second offer scheme is working, and that the health service is improving in Wales, yet the former leaders of the City and County of Swansea Council and Cardiff County Council tell us that the state of the health service was responsible for the defeat of the Labour Party in the local government elections last week. Councillor Goodway said

'If I've been chased down the garden path on any issue it's been on the fact that the health service in Wales does not compare favourably with that in England and people are aware of that.'

Do you agree with Councillor Goodway?

The First Minister: I will not say any more about Councillor Goodway's observations. When you lose an election, it is important that you should look in the mirror rather than point the finger of blame elsewhere. I remember John Major's dignified remarks when he lost the election in 1997, and that is the right way to treat such a situation. When democracy casts its verdict, you have to accept it. There is no point afterwards in bleating about the reasons for it; you have to simply step aside, and John Major did that in exactly the right way in 1997.

Michael German: I take your point about Councillor Goodway, but I am interested in the future of the health service. You will have noted that seven out of the first 10 questions tabled for you to answer today are on health. Seven out of the first 15 questions tabled for answer by the Secretary of State for Wales in his last question time were on health. Yesterday, apparently, Jeremy Vine's phone-in on Radio 2 was so swamped with callers from Wales complaining about the health

cyflwyno statinau a mesurau eraill sy'n lleihau'r angen am lawdriniaeth ar y galon. Mae'r un peth yn wir yn Lloegr; bu gwelliant aruthrol wrth drin clefyd y galon. Yn y tymor hir, rhaid inni ei atal drwy newid deiet pobl a'u ffordd o fyw, ac yr ydym yn gwybod yn iawn beth sydd angen inni ei wneud yn y cyswllt hwnnw.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Dywedwch wrthym fod cynllun yr ail gynnyg yn llwyddo, a bod y gwasanaeth iechyd yn gwella yng Nghymru, ac eto dywed cyn-arweinyddion Cyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe a Chyngor Sir Caerdydd wrthym mai cyflwr y gwasanaeth iechyd a fu'n gyfrifol am drechu'r Blaid Lafur yn etholiadau llywodraeth leol yr wythnos diwethaf. Dywedodd y Cyngorydd Goodway

Os cefais fy ngheryddu ar unrhyw fater, y ffaith nad yw'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru gystal â'r un yn Lloegr oedd hwnnw ac mae pobl yn ymwybodol o hynny.

A ydych yn cytuno â'r Cyngorydd Goodway?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni ddywedaf ragor am sylwadau'r Cyngorydd Goodway. Pan gollwch etholiad, mae'n bwysig ichi edrych yn y drych yn hytrach na cheisio rhoi'r bai ar rywun arall. Cofiaf sylwadau urddasol John Major pan gollodd yr etholiad yn 1997, a dyna sut y dylid trafod sefyllfa o'r fath. Pan fo democratiaeth yn rhoi ei barn, rhaid ichi ei derbyn. Nid oes diben cwyno am y rhesymau wedyn; rhaid ichi sefyll o'r neilltu, a gwnaeth John Major hynny mewn modd cwbl gywir yn 1997.

Michael German: Derbyniaf y pwynt a wnaethoch am y Cyngorydd Goodway, ond ymddiddoraf yn nyfodol y gwasanaeth iechyd. Byddwch wedi sylwi bod saith o'r 10 cwestiwn cyntaf a gyflwynwyd i'w hateb gennyh heddiw'n ymwneud ag iechyd. Yr oedd saith o'r 15 cwestiwn cyntaf a gyflwynwyd i'w hateb gan Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn ei sesiwn gwestiynau ddiwethaf yn ymwneud ag iechyd. Mae'n debyg bod rhaglen Jeremy Vine ar Radio 2

service that the BBC promised to run another phone-in just for Wales. You can see the effect on the people of Wales, and on the politicians elected to represent them, in terms of the questions asked. Nowhere else does the issue dominate like it dominates in Wales. Why is the health service in Wales being treated differently from that in England, and when will we get the reforms that the Wanless report indicated that we should have had a year ago?

The First Minister: It is no surprise, given that it forms almost 40 per cent of our budget, that health is our biggest responsibility. There is no question about that. There are two ways of prioritising what you do in health. England concentrated on shortening waiting lists, and is now grasping the public health agenda. We grasped the public health agenda first, and are now, through the second offer guarantee scheme, doing more to shorten long waiting lists. The difference is a consequence of devolution, but everyone knows that you have to tackle both. You cannot neglect the public health issue. There are huge improvements to be gained in health from changes in diet and lifestyle and smoking cessation or reduction. We must also pay attention to hospital waiting lists and long waits in particular. That is why the second offer guarantee scheme is making good progress in that regard.

2.10 p.m.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. We have spent nearly 10 minutes on the first question, rather than three minutes. It was an important question, which I allowed to run on, but I implore Members to be succinct, as I do not like cutting into Members' questions.

ddoe wedi cael y fath lifeiriant o alwadau o Gymru yn cwyno am y gwasanaeth iechyd fel bod y BBC wedi addo cynnal rhaglen arall i Gymru'n unig. Mae'r cwestiynau a ofynnir yn adlewyrchu'r effaith ar bobl Cymru, ac ar y gwleidyddion a etholwyd i'w cynrychioli. Nid yw'r pwnc hwn yn tra-arglwyddiaethu yn unman arall i'r graddau y mae yng Nghymru. Pam y trinnir y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru yn wahanol i'r un yn Lloegr, a pha bryd y cawn y diwygiadau y dywed adroddiad Wanless y dylem fod wedi'u cael flwyddyn yn ôl?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gan ei fod yn ffurfio bron 40 y cant o'n cyllideb, nid yw'n syndod mai iechyd yw ein cyfrifoldeb mwyaf. Nid oes amheuaeth ynghylch hynny. Mae dau fodd i flaenoriaethu'r hyn a wneir ym maes iechyd. Canolbwytiodd Lloegr ar leihau rhestrau aros, ac mae'n awr yn mynd i'r afael ag agenda iechyd cyhoeddus. Aethom ni i'r afael ag agenda iechyd cyhoeddus yn gyntaf, ac yr ydym yn gwneud mwy yn awr, drwy gynllun y warant o ail gynnig, i leihau rhestrau aros hir. Daw'r gwahaniaeth o ganlyniad i ddatganoli, ond gŵyr pawb fod rhaid mynd i'r afael â'r ddau beth. Ni ellir esgeuluso mater iechyd cyhoeddus. Gellir gwella iechyd yn sylweddol drwy newid deiet pobl a'u ffordd o fyw a thrwy eu hannog i roi'r gorau i ysmegu neu i ysmegu llai. Rhaid i ninnau roi sylw i restrau aros ysbytai ac arosiadau hir yn benodol. Dyna pam y mae cynllun y warant o ail gynnig yn gwneud cynnydd da yn hynny o beth.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Yr ydym wedi treulio ymron i 10 munud ar y cwestiwn cyntaf, yn hytrach na thri munud. Yr oedd yn gwestiwn pwysig, y gadewais iddo barhau, ond erfyniaf ar Aelodau i fod yn gryno, gan nad wyf yn hoffi cwtogi ar gwestiynau Aelodau.

Y Gyfarwydddeb Oriau Gwaith Ewropeaidd The European Working-time Directive

C2 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar oblygiadau'r gyfarwydddeb oriau gwaith Ewropeaidd? (OAQ35984)

Q2 David Lloyd: Will the First Minister make a statement on the implications of the European working-time directive? (OAQ35984)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r goblygiadau yn golygu dod o hyd i ffyrdd newydd o weithio mewn ysbytai. Mae hynny'n cynnwys ymestyn cyfrifoldebau staff ac eithrio meddygon, ac ailwampio trefniadau llanw rhwng gwahanol arbenigaethau, ysbytai ac ymddiriedolaethau, yn ogystal â phrosiect newydd yr ysbyty dros nos.

David Lloyd: Mae'n ofynnol cael meddygon i ymgymryd â rhai dyletswyddau, wrth gwrs. O ystyried bod 150 o swyddi arbenigwyr ysbytai yn wag yng Nghymru, pa gamau ychwanegol fydd eich Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd gan y bydd gofyn i'r meddygon sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd weithio llai o oriau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd cyfrifoldebau a threfniadau llanw meddygon yn cael eu hailwampio, yn enwedig mewn ysbytai sy'n gwasanaethau ardaloedd gwledig—ysbytai fel Glangwili, Bronglais, Llwynhelyg a Gwynedd. Efallai na fydd cymaint o wasanaethau ar gael yn ystod y nos, ond mae llawer o bosibiliadau. Yr ydym wedi cynnal cynllun peilot ysbyty dros nos yn Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Orllewin Cymru, sy'n dangos y ffordd ymlaen.

Laura Anne Jones: The Government has been warned by the haulage industry that it will face a shortfall of 60,000 workers, at the rate things are going, by 2005. The 48-hour week takes no account of seasonal realities: for example, in farming, time is a crucial factor in harvesting and silage. When will you accept that the working-time directive is impractical, and detrimental to those it professes to protect?

The First Minister: There is no argument between us on that issue. The working-time directive has been redefined by recent unexpected legal judgments from the European Court of Justice—the so-called SiMAP and Jaegar judgments about having to take rest periods the following day rather than over a reasonable period. That has been a severe blow to the employment of junior doctors, where there are particular problems because they are regarded as being directly employed by the state, so the state is at fault if it does not do this, that and the other in line

The First Minister: The implications necessitate the creation of new ways of working in hospitals. This includes extending the responsibilities of staff other than doctors, and revamping the cover arrangements between different areas of expertise, hospitals and trusts, in addition to the new overnight hospital project.

David Lloyd: Doctors are, of course, the only ones able to carry out some tasks. Given that there are 150 hospital specialist vacancies in Wales, what additional steps will your Government take in response to the fact that the doctors currently employed will be required to work fewer hours?

The First Minister: Doctors' responsibilities and cover arrangements will be revamped, especially in hospitals serving rural areas—hospitals such as Glangwili, Bronglais, Withybush and Ysbyty Gwynedd. It is possible that fewer services will be available during the night, but there are many possibilities. We have undertaken an overnight hospital pilot scheme within the North West Wales NHS Trust, which shows the way forward.

Laura Anne Jones: Rhybuddiwyd y Llywodraeth gan y diwydiant cludiant y bydd yn wynebu prinder o 60,000 o weithwyr, os aiff pethau ymlaen fel y maent, erbyn 2005. Nid yw'r wythnos 48 awr yn darparu ar gyfer gofynion tymhorol: er enghraifft, ym myd amaeth, mae amser yn ffactor hanfodol wrth gynaeafu a silweirio. Pa bryd y derbyniwch fod y gyfarwyddeb oriau gwaith yn anymarferol, ac yn niweidiol i'r rhai y mae'n honni eu hamddiffyn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes anghytundeb rhyngom ar y mater hwnnw. Mae'r gyfarwyddeb oriau gwaith wedi'i hailddiffinio gan ddyfarniadau cyfreithiol annisgwyl o'r Llys Barn Ewropeaidd—dyfarniadau SiMAP a Jaegar, fel y'u gelwir, sy'n ymwneud â gorfod cymryd cyfnodau i orffwys drannoeth yn hytrach na thros gyfnod rhesymol. Bu honno'n ergyd fawr mewn cysylltiad â chyflogi meddygon iau, lle y ceir problemau penodol gan yr ystyrir eu bod yn cael eu cyflogi'n uniongyrchol gan y wladwriaeth, felly mae'r wladwriaeth ar fai

with the directive and the legal judgment. However, it also has an effect on all on-call working arrangements. I have not heard the seasonal argument before, but it is interesting. It affects road haulage and the North sea oil industry, and may have a massive effect on social care.

os na wnaiff hyn a'r llall yn unol â'r gyfarwydddeb a'r dyfarniad cyfreithiol. Fodd bynnag, caiff effaith hefyd ar yr holl drefniadau gweithio ar alwad. Ni chlywais y ddadl ynghylch tymhorau o'r blaen, ond mae'n ddiddorol. Mae'n effeithio ar gludiant ar ffyrdd a'r diwydiant olew ym môr y Gogledd, a gallai gael effaith aruthrol ar ofal cymdeithasol.

Y Diwydiant Glo The Coal Industry

Q3 Christine Chapman: Will the First Minister make a statement on support for the coal industry in Wales? (OAQ35994)

C3 Christine Chapman: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar gymorth i'r diwydiant glo yng Nghymru? (OAQ35994)

The First Minister: Welsh coal producers received £23,866,511 under the UK scheme between April 2000 and December 2002, which is approximately 15 per cent of the UK allocation. That has now been replaced by an investment aid scheme which has a budget of up to £60 million, to be allocated in three periods between 2003 and 2005, and spent by 31 March 2008. Welsh producers have so far been allocated £3,298,468 up to 31 July 2003 and Welsh applications for the second period are being considered by Department of Trade and Industry.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cafodd cynhyrchwyr glo yng Nghymru £23,866,511 o dan gynllun y DU rhwng Ebrill 2000 a Rhagfyr 2002, sef oddeutu 15 y cant o'r dyraniad yn y DU. Disodlwyd hwnnw bellach gan gynllun cymorth buddsoddi sydd â chyllideb o hyd at £60 miliwn, i'w dyrannu mewn tri chfnod rhwng 2003 a 2005, a'i gwario erbyn 31 Mawrth 2008. Hyd yma, dyfarnwyd £3,298,468 i gynhyrchwyr yng Nghymru hyd at 31 Gorffennaf 2003 ac mae ceisiadau o Gymru ar gyfer yr ail gyfnod yn cael eu hystyried gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant.

Christine Chapman: I am pleased that £2.2 million of that funding has come to Tower Colliery in my constituency. Will you join me in welcoming Tower Colliery's emphasis on diversification and product development? I understand that it is bringing forward an Objective 1 bid to develop new green coal products to ensure that it continues to deliver quality coal products to new markets, thereby securing its future.

Christine Chapman: Yr wyf yn falch bod £2.2 miliwn o'r cyllid hwnnw wedi dod i Lofa'r Tŵr yn fy etholaeth. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i groesawu'r pwyslais y mae Glofa'r Tŵr yn ei roi ar arallgyfeirio a datblygu cynhyrchion? Deallaf ei bod yn cyflwyno cais o dan Amcan 1 i ddatblygu cynhyrchion glo gwyrdd er mwyn parhau i gyflenwi cynhyrchion glo o ansawdd da i farchnadoedd newydd a, drwy hynny, diogelu ei dyfodol.

The First Minister: Your two points are correct. The two collieries to receive money from the £3.3 million allocated to date in the first period are Tower Colliery, which has received £2.2 million, and Aberpergwm Colliery, in the Vale of Neath, which has received the rest. Unlike all other coal industry producers, perhaps, Tower Colliery has grasped the point of what happens after coal and what happens if there is increasing pressure to diversify away from carbon as a

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r ddau bwynt a wnaethoch yn gywir. Y ddwy lofa a gaiff gyfran o'r £3.3 miliwn a ddyrannwyd hyd yma yn y cyfnod cyntaf yw Glofa'r Tŵr, a gaiff £2.2 miliwn, a Glofa Aberpergwm, yng Nghwm Nedd, a gaiff y gweddill. Yn wahanol i'r holl gynhyrchwyr eraill yn y diwydiant glo, o bosibl, mae Glofa'r Tŵr wedi deall beth a ddigwydd wedi i ddyddiau glo ddod i ben a'r hyn a ddigwydd os bydd pwysau cynyddol i ganfod ffynonellau

source of fuel because of fears about global warming. In its bricketting operation, and in its effort to get this into the feedstock for Aberthaw, it is displaying a farseeing attempt to adapt to a new period when the coal industry will be under pressure due to global warming.

Helen Mary Jones: Could you tell us a little more about what your Government is doing to support energy producers in enabling them to make greater use of coal that causes less damage to the environment?

The First Minister: It is important to bear in mind that we do not take a lead on this, but we lobby on the issue and are in constant communication with the DTI. If you were to ask this department which of the units of Government not located within the DTI appears to deploy the highest level of expertise on matters relating to the coal industry, it would probably name our coal and energy team. I am proud of the team's work. We are trying to see to what extent there is real potential for clean coal burning, and whether doing this would sufficiently reduce the amount of coal used to produce a unit of energy in a power station to justify it having special treatment under the emissions trading scheme. We will enter a new world shortly when the emissions trading scheme comes into operation. The scheme will allow power producers to decide whether to trade in their licences rather than continue operations. It is important to explore any opportunity to increase the amount of energy produced from every tonne of coal by 25 per cent, and there is potential in Wales to do this.

Alun Cairns: Many traditional coal-mining communities are among the most deprived in Wales, a contributive factor being the closure of coal mines by Tony Benn and other former energy ministers. It is not recognised by many Members that Tony Benn closed more mines than Margaret Thatcher and Michael Heseltine put together. Your Government has been in office for some years in Westminster and Cardiff bay. Do you think that there is justification for the anger felt by these communities as a result of the fact that the deprivation gap between themselves and the

tanwydd yn hytrach na charbon oherwydd ofnau ynghylch cynhesu byd-eang. Mae ei gwaith brics glo a'i hymdrech i sicrhau bod y brics yn cael eu defnyddio yng ngwaith Aberddawan yn ymgais graff i ymaddasu i gyfnod newydd pan fydd y diwydiant glo o dan bwysau oherwydd cynhesu byd-eang.

Helen Mary Jones: A allwch chi ddweud ychydig mwy wrthym am yr hyn y mae'ch Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i gynorthwyo cynhyrchwyr ynni o ran eu galluogi i wneud mwy o ddefnydd o lo sy'n peri llai o niwed i'r amgylchedd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n bwysig cofio nad ni sy'n arwain ar hyn, ond yr ydym yn lobbio ar y mater ac yr ydym mewn cysylltiad parhaus â'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant. Pe gofynnech i'r adran honno enwi unedau Llywodraeth nad ydynt yn rhan o'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yr ymddengys eu bod yn arfer yr arbenigedd mwyaf ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â'r diwydiant glo, mae'n debyg yr enwai ein tîm glo ac ynni. Ymfalchïaf yng ngwaith y tîm hwnnw. Yr ydym yn ceisio mesur y potensial i losgi glo glân a chanfod a fyddai hynny'n peri digon o ostyngiad ym maint y glo a ddefnyddir i gynhyrchu uned ynni mewn gorsaf drydan i gyfiawnhau ei thrin yn wahanol o dan y cynllun masnachu gollyngiadau. Byddwn ar drothwy oes newydd cyn hir wrth i'r cynllun masnachu gollyngiadau gael ei roi ar waith. Bydd y cynllun hwn yn caniatáu i gynhyrchwyr ynni benderfynu a ydynt am gyfnewid eu trwyddedau yn hytrach na pharhau i weithredu. Mae'n bwysig ymchwilio i bob cyfle i gynhyrchu 25 y cant yn fwy o ynni o bob tunnell fetrig o lo, ac mae posibilrwydd y gellir gwneud hynny yng Nghymru.

Alun Cairns: Mae llawer o gymunedau glofaol traddodiadol ymysg y rhai mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru, ac un rheswm am hynn oedd y ffaith bod Tony Benn a chynweinidogion ynni eraill wedi cau glofeydd. Mae llawer o Aelodau yn gwrthod cydnabod bod Tony Benn wedi cau mwy o lofeydd nag a wnaeth Margaret Thatcher a Michael Heseltine gyda'i gilydd. Bu'ch Llywodraeth mewn grym ers rhai blynyddoedd yn San Steffan ac ym mae Caerdydd. A gredwch fod cyfiawnhad dros y dicter y mae'r cymunedau hyn yn ei deimlo am fod y bwlch

wealthier parts of Wales, and between Wales and the rest of the United Kingdom, has grown even wider, which means that the residents of these communities are far worse off than they previously were?

The First Minister: Are you talking about the traditional coal-mining communities that voted Labour last Thursday? You seem to have a PhD in rewriting history from one of our esteemed universities, Alun. The only observation I can make in response to an extraordinarily tortuous and meaningless question is that the former and remaining coal-mining communities know where their political loyalties lie and know where to expect Government interest—with the Labour Party.

amddifadedd rhyngddynt hwy a'r rhannau cyfoethocach o Gymru, a rhwng Cymru a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig, wedi mynd yn fwy byth, sy'n golygu bod trigolion y cymunedau hyn yn waeth eu byd nag yr oeddent o'r blaen?

Y Prif Weinidog: A ydych yn sôn am y cymunedau glofaol traddodiadol a bleidleisiodd dros Lafur ddydd Iau diwethaf? Ymddengys eich bod wedi cael doethuriaeth mewn ailysgrifennu hanes gan un o'n prifysgolion rhagorol, Alun. Yr unig sylw y gallaf ei wneud mewn ymateb i gwestiwn rhyfeddol o drofaus a diystyr yw bod y cymunedau glofaol, yn y gorffennol a'r presennol, yn gwybod i bwy y maent yn deyrngar yn wleidyddol a chan bwy y gallant ddisgwyl sylw fel Llywodraeth—y Blaid Lafur.

Amseroedd Aros Orthopedig Orthopaedic Waiting Times

Q4 Jenny Randerson: Will the First Minister make a statement on orthopaedic waiting times in Cardiff? (OAQ35998)

The First Minister: In May, the business case for the new ambulatory care and diagnostic unit at Llandough was approved, and construction work is expected to begin in approximately three months, at a cost of just over £7 million. When the unit opens in 12 months' time, it will provide treatment for 1,176 additional patients, making room for a further 524 full joint operations in regular operating theatres. In total, the number of cases treated in the Llandough catchment area—the old south Glamorgan—will increase from 6,200 to almost 8,000.

Jenny Randerson: The trust's chief executive has stated that the new unit, although welcome, will barely enable it to do more than keep pace with the increase in the number of patients. The latest waiting list figures show that 2,342 people are waiting over 18 months for an orthopaedic appointment in the Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust area. These figures hide the true extent of the problem—many people have been waiting over four years to see one consultant alone. This problem could be dealt with via

C4 Jenny Randerson: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar amseroedd aros orthopedig yng Nghaerdydd? (OAQ35998)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ym mis Mai, cymeradwywyd yr achos busnes ar gyfer yr uned triniaethau dydd a diagnostig newydd yn Llandochau, a disgwylir y bydd y gwaith adeiladu'n dechrau ymhen tua thri mis, ar gost o ychydig yn fwy na £7 miliwn. Pan agorir yr uned ymhen 12 mis, bydd yn darparu triniaethau ar gyfer 1,176 o gleifion ychwanegol, gan ryddhau lle i gyflawni 524 o lawdriniaethau llawn ychwanegol ar gymalau mewn ystafelloedd llawdriniaeth arferol. Bydd nifer yr achosion a drinnir yn nalgylch ysbyty Llandochau—yr hen dde Morgannwg—yn codi o 6,200 i bron 8,000.

Jenny Randerson: Mae prif weithredwr yr ymddiriedolaeth wedi dweud mai prin y bydd yr uned newydd, er ei bod i'w chroesawu, yn ei galluogi i wneud mwy na chadw'n wastad â'r cynnydd yn nifer y cleifion. Mae ffigurau diweddaraf y rhestr aros yn dangos bod 2,342 yn disgwyl am fwy na 18 mis am apwyntiad orthopedig yn ardal Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro. Mae'r ffigurau hynny'n celu gwir faint y broblem—mae llawer yn disgwyl ers dros bedair blynedd i weld un ymgynghorydd yn unig. Gellid ymdrin â'r

the second offer scheme, if it were extended to include out-patients. Do you have plans to extend the scheme?

The First Minister: There are no plans to extend the scheme to out-patients. Brian Edwards specified in his report that there is a shortfall, especially in primary hip replacements, when compared with need. The need is high in south-east Wales, and we must face up to the fact that it will become higher with an ageing population. You fail to recognise just how big an increase in treatments the unit will allow, which will enable us to increase the number of operations from 6,300 to around 8,000. Similarly, although it will be around eight months later, the St Woolos scheme will also have a beneficial effect in Gwent.

2.20 p.m.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: When you look at the Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust's record, it has some of the worst waiting times, if not the worst, in Wales. *The Sunday Times* states that

'The trust is rock-bottom for out-patient waits, seeing less than a third of patients within 13 weeks of referral.'

Do you accept responsibility for that appalling record on health in the Welsh capital?

The First Minister: You are underrating the progress that has been made. Clearly, the big jump in progress in terms of orthopaedic waiting times requires physical works. They were set out by Professor Brian Edwards in his report on Gwent and south Glamorgan. We have been waiting for the business case and for the commitment of the recurrent sums of money needed, as well as the capital sums. They will mainly come from us, but some will come from the trust's own resources.

Building work will start in August or September, and I know that you welcome that. That work is supposed to take around 12 months, and then we hope to see a major jump up to 8,000 operations a year from the

problem hon drwy gynllun yr ail gynnig, os câi ei ymestyn i gynnwys cleifion allanol. A oes gennych fwriad i ehangu'r cynllun?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes bwriad i ymestyn y cynllun i gynnwys cleifion allanol. Nododd Brian Edwards yn ei adroddiad fod diffyg, yn enwedig o ran ailosod cluniau am y tro cyntaf, o'i gymharu â'r angen. Mae'r angen yn fawr yn y De-ddwyrain, a rhaid inni wynebu'r ffaith mai cynyddu a wna wrth i'r boblogaeth heneiddio. Ni chydnabyddwch y cynnydd mawr yn nifer y triniaethau a ddaw yn sgîl yr uned, a fydd yn fodd inni godi nifer y llawdriniaethau o 6,300 i tua 8,000. Yn yr un modd, er mai ymhen tua wyth mis wedyn y daw hyn, bydd cynllun St Woolos yn cael effaith lesol yng Ngwent.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: O ystyried record Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro, gwelir bod ei hamseroedd aros ymysg y gwaethaf, os nad yn waethaf oll, yng Nghymru. Dywed *The Sunday Times*

Mae'r ymddiriedolaeth ar y gwaelod un o ran arosiadau gan gleifion allanol, gan ei bod yn gweld llai nag un rhan o dair o'i chleifion o fewn 13 wythnos ar ôl eu hatgyfeirio.

A ydych yn derbyn cyfrifoldeb am y record warthus honno ar iechyd ym mhrifddinas Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn tanbrisiô'r cynnydd a wnaed. Wrth reswm, mae'r cynnydd mawr mewn cysylltiad ag amseroedd aros orthopedig yn galw am waith ffisegol. Nodwyd hynny gan yr Athro Brian Edwards yn ei adroddiad ar Went a de Morgannwg. Buom yn aros am yr achos busnes ac am neilltuo'r symiau rheolaidd y mae eu hangen, yn ogystal â'r symiau cyfalaf. Nyni fydd yn rhoi mwyafrif y cyllid, ond daw rhywfaint o goffrau'r ymddiriedolaeth ei hun.

Bydd y gwaith adeiladu'n dechrau ym mis Awst neu fis Medi, a gwn eich bod yn croesawu hynny. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw i fod i gymryd tua 12 mis, ac wedyn gobeithiwn weld cynnydd mawr yn nifer y

current figure of 6,300. We hope that that will make a huge impact and that it will be replicated in Gwent eight months later. You should recognise that major progress is in the offing once these critical works are completed.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: You acknowledged in the immediate aftermath of the local and European elections that people had difficulty in believing what you say. You have said that people simply do not believe leaders anymore. You asked yourself the question: what do I do? What do Labour leaders do when they lose the trust of the public? I will tell you: you start to acknowledge the real problems of the health service. Why do you not start telling the people of Wales the truth? The NHS is in an appalling mess, and you need to do something about that. They are fed up with your excuses.

The First Minister: There was no question there, but I will try to reinterpret what you said as a question about what we will do. We will build additional capacity and it will start in September, at the latest, in Llandough and around six months later in St Woolos in Newport. Those are physical projects and there is, therefore, no question of ministerial spin. Everyone will be able to see those buildings and they will be filled with consultants, nurses and others doing the jobs that we all want them to do. They will be up and running roughly 12 months after the beginning of construction, which will start very soon.

Jonathan Morgan: Alleviating the pressures that currently exist in Cardiff and the Vale should be a priority; you are talking about a longer-term solution. On the existing pressures, how many patients from Cardiff and the south-east are now being treated for orthopaedic treatment in England this year, and how does that compare with last year?

The First Minister: I do not have those figures, Jonathan. I mentioned earlier that 364 patients were being treated at the Cardiff BUPA hospital, but I do not know whether or not they are orthopaedic patients under the second offer guarantee scheme, which is in its first quarter of the year—April, May and

llawdriniaethau'r flwyddyn o'r ffigur presennol o 6,300 i 8,000. Gobeithiwn y caiff hynny effaith aruthrol ac yr ailadroddir hynny yng Ngwent ymhen wyth mis wedyn. Dylech gydnabod bod cynnydd mawr mewn golwg ar ôl cwblhau'r gwaith hollbwysig hwn.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Gwnaethoch gydnabod yn union ar ôl yr etholiadau lleol ac Ewropeaidd fod pobl yn ei chael yn anodd credu'r hyn a ddywedwch. Dywedasoch nad yw pobl bellach yn credu geiriau arweinwyr. Gofynasoch beth y dylech ei wneud. Beth a wnaiff arweinwyr Llafur pan gollant ymddiriedaeth y cyhoedd? Dywedaf wrthyich: dylech ddechrau cydnabod gwir broblemau'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Pam na ddechreuwch ddweud y gwir wrth bobl Cymru? Mae'r GIG yn llanastr ofnadwy, a rhaid i chi wneud rhywbeth ynghylch hynny. Cawsant lond bol ar eich esgusion.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni ofynnwyd cwestiwn, ond ceisiaf aildehongli'r hyn a ddywedasoch fel cwestiwn ynghylch yr hyn a wnawn. Byddwn yn creu capasiti newydd a bydd y gwaith yn dechrau ym mis Medi, fan bellaf, yn Llandochau ac ymhen tua chwe mis wedyn yn ysbyty Sain Gwynllyw yng Nghasnewydd. Prosiectau ffisegol yw'r rhain ac, felly, nid oes unrhyw bosibilrwydd o sbin gan Weinidogion. Bydd pawb yn gallu gweld yr adeiladau hynny a byddant yn llawn ymgynghorwyr, nyrsys ac eraill a wnaiff y gwaith y dymunwn iddynt ei wneud. Byddant yn cychwyn ar eu gwaith tua 12 mis ar ôl dechrau'r gwaith adeiladu, a fydd yn cychwyn yn fuan iawn.

Jonathan Morgan: Dylid rhoi blaenoriaeth i ysgafnhau'r pwysau a geir ar hyn o bryd yng Nghaerdydd a'r Fro; yr ydych chi'n sôn am ateb tymor hwy. Ynghylch y pwysau presennol, pa sawl claf o Gaerdydd a'r De-ddwyrain sy'n cael triniaeth orthopedig yn Lloegr eleni, a pha gymhariaeth sydd rhwng hynny a'r flwyddyn ddiwethaf?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid yw'r ffigurau hynny gennyf, Jonathan. Dywedais yn gynharach fod 364 o gleifion yn cael eu trin yn ysbyty BUPA yng Nghaerdydd, ond ni wn ai cleifion orthopedig ydynt o dan gynllun y gwarant ail gynnig, sydd yn ei chwarter cyntaf o'r flwyddyn—Ebrill, Mai a Mehefin. Fodd

June. However, I will ensure that you get the facts and figures on where those patients came from and what conditions they are being treated for.

bynag, sicrhaf y cewch y ffeithiau a'r ffigurau ynghylch o lle y daeth y cleifion hynny ac am ba anhwylderau y maent yn cael eu trin.

Gwella Ffyrdd rhwng y De a'r Gogledd North-South Road Improvements

Q5 Carl Sargeant: Will the First Minister make a statement on funding for north-south road improvements? (OAQ35995)

C5 Carl Sargeant: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar gyllid ar gyfer gwella ffyrdd rhwng y De a'r Gogledd? (OAQ35995)

The First Minister: 'Trunk Road Forward Programme 2002', published in March 2002, includes several schemes designed to improve north-south road links. Twelve schemes are programmed for the north-south corridor to be ready for start of work by March 2008, subject to statutory processes and the availability of finances. Anyone who has travelled along the A470 will know that this is not ministerial spin, but fact: £17.5 million is being spent on the Lledr Valley scheme between Dolwyddelan and Pont-yr-Afanc. We hope that next year there will be a start on the Blaenau Ffestiniog to Cancoed A470 improvements, which will cost over £10 million.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae 'Blaenraglen Cefnffyrdd 2002', a gyhoeddwyd ym Mawrth 2002, yn cynnwys sawl cynllun sydd â'r bwriad o wella cysylltiadau ar ffyrdd rhwng y de a'r gogledd. Rhaglennwyd 12 cynllun ar gyfer y coridor o'r de i'r gogledd i fod yn barod i ddechrau gweithio arnynt erbyn Mawrth 2008, yn amodol ar brosesau statudol a chaffaeledd cyllid. Bydd unrhyw un a deithiodd ar hyd yr A470 yn gwybod nad sbin gan Weinidogion yw hyn, ond ffaith: gwarir £17.5 miliwn ar gynllun Dyffryn Lledr rhwng Dolwyddelan a Phont yr Afanc. Yr ydym yn gobeithio y ceir dechrau y flwyddyn nesaf ar y gwelliannau ar yr A470 rhwng Blaenau Ffestiniog a Chancoed, a fydd yn costio mwy na £10 miliwn.

Carl Sargeant: Given the demography of Wales, with Flintshire County Council, the successful Labour-run county council, in north Wales and Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council, now Labour-run, in the south, it is important that we trade effectively in Wales. Do you recognise the deep concerns of my constituents in Alyn and Deeside, given the difficulties of getting from north to south?

Carl Sargeant: Yng ngolwg demograffi Cymru, gyda Chyngor Sir y Fflint, y cyngor sir llwyddiannus sy'n cael ei redeg gan Lafur, yn y Gogledd a Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf, sydd bellach yn cael ei redeg gan Lafur, yn y De, mae'n bwysig inni fasnachu'n effeithiol yng Nghymru. A ydych yn cydnabod pryderon mawr fy etholwyr yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy, yng ngolwg yr anawsterau a geir wrth fynd o'r gogledd i'r de?

The First Minister: Yes. There is a further point about Flintshire, in that it is also part of the corridor through to north-west England. The huge improvements that we are jointly undertaking with the Highways Agency as part of the north-west England A494/A550 Deeside Park to Drome Corner scheme, and the Drome Corner to the river Dee bridge scheme—I believe that £14.5 million has been allocated to the design and build scheme—are expected to be completed later this year. There is also an important commercial corridor from the M56 to south

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydwyf. Mae pwynt pellach i'w wneud am sir y Fflint, sef ei bod hefyd yn rhan o'r coridor drwodd i ogledd-orllewin Lloegr. Mae disgwyl y bydd y gwelliannau aruthrol yr ydym yn ymgymryd â hwy ar y cyd ag Asiantaeth y Priffyrdd fel rhan o gynllun yr A494/A550 yng ngogledd-orllewin Lloegr o Barc Glannau Dyfrdwy i Drome Corner, a'r cynllun rhwng Drome Corner a phont afon Dyfrdwy—credaf fod £14.5 miliwn wedi'i ddyrannu ar gyfer y cynllun dylunio ac adeiladu—yn cael eu cwblhau'n ddiweddarach eleni. Mae coridor

Wales, which passes through your constituency.

Mark Isherwood: Concerns have been raised by both the north Wales economic forum and the north Wales further education and higher education sector colleges that, in economic terms, north Wales is not in Wales because it has vertical political access, but horizontal economic access. When will you take urgent action to deliver sustainable economic development that links north, mid and south Wales? If you do not, and it remains in a west-east axis, what you say will amount to words, not delivery.

The First Minister: There is certainly delivery in that we are spending £14.5 million on trying to meet the demand for travelling from Flintshire into the M56, which is part of the corridor of better communication with Liverpool and Manchester, whether you are in Flintshire or south Wales. With regard to the economic link-ups between north and south Wales, I have an A470 example. I cannot tell you how proud how I am when I see advertisements for jobs at Dolgarrog in the aluminium rolling mill just off the A470, as it is such a key employer in the Conwy Valley, and when I see jobs being advertised at Sealink Stena Line's new call centre at Holyhead. There is no part of Wales, whether Holyhead, Cardiff, anywhere in between, or up in the north-east corner, that we do not regard as a high priority. That is why just as much priority has been given to the jobs created in Holyhead and Dolgarrog, as to those created in areas closer to Cardiff, for example, at Celsa.

Alun Ffred Jones: Ymwelodd cadeirydd Cyngor Gwynedd â'r Cynulliad y bore yma i lansio'r adroddiad ar lywodraeth leol. Yr oedd yn wynebu taith hir ac araf yn ôl i ogledd-orllewin Cymru y prynhawn yma. A yw eich Llywodraeth yn barod i greu rhaglen waith ac amserlen ar gyfer gwelliannau i'r A470 o Feirionydd i Gaerdydd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cyfeiriais eisoes at y fenter fwyaf, sef yr un rhwng Dolwyddelan a Phont yr Afanc, sy'n costio bron i £20 miliwn. Bydd y llall, sy'n agosach at y

masnachol pwysig hefyd o'r M56 i'r De, sy'n mynd drwy eich etholaeth.

Mark Isherwood: Mynegwyd pryderon gan fforwm economaidd gogledd Cymru a chan golegau yn sector addysg uwch ac addysg bellach y Gogledd nad ydyw'r Gogledd o fewn Cymru, mewn cyd-destun economaidd, gan fod iddo echel wleidyddol fertigol, ond echel economaidd lorweddol. Pa bryd y cymerwch gamau brys i sicrhau datblygu economaidd cynaliadwy sy'n cysylltu'r Gogledd, y Canolbarth a'r De? Os na wnewch hynny, ac os pery ar echel o'r dwyrain i'r gorllewin, dim ond geiriau a gawn gennyh, ac nid gweithredoedd.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn sicr ceir gweithredoedd, gan ein bod yn gwario £14.5 miliwn i geisio ateb y galw i gael teithio o sir y Fflint i'r M56, sy'n rhan o'r coridor o well cysylltiadau â Lerpwl a Manceinion, pa un a ydych yn sir y Fflint neu yn y De. Gyda golwg ar y cysylltiadau economaidd rhwng y De a'r Gogledd, mae gennyf enghraifft o hynny ar yr A470. Ni allaf ddweud wrthyhch gymaint yr wyf yn ymfalchïo pan welaf hysbysebion am swyddi yn y felin rowlio aliwminiwm yn Nolgarrog ychydig oddi ar yr A470, gan ei bod yn gyflogwr mor bwysig yn Nyffryn Conwy, a phan welaf hysbysebu swyddi yng nghanolfan alwadau newydd Sealink Stena Line yng Nghaerdydd. Nid oes yr un rhan o Gymru, boed yn Gaerdydd, Caerdydd, rhywle rhwng y ddwy, neu'r gornel ogledd-ddwyreiniol, na roddwn flaenoriaeth uchel iddi. Dyna pam y rhoddwyd yr un flaenoriaeth i'r swyddi a grëwyd yng Nghaerdydd a Dolgarrog, ag i'r rhai a grëwyd mewn ardaloedd sy'n agosach i Gaerdydd, er enghraifft, yn Celsa.

Alun Ffred Jones: The chair of Gwynedd Council visited the Assembly this morning to launch the report on local government. He was facing a lengthy and slow journey back to north-west Wales this afternoon. Is your Government willing to propose a work programme and timetable for improvements to the A470 from Meirionydd to Cardiff?

The First Minister: I have already referred to the biggest scheme, namely the work between Dolwyddelan and Pont-yr-Afanc, which is costing almost £20 million. The

Crimea ar bwys Blaenau Ffestiniog, yn dechrau y flwyddyn nesaf. Yn ogystal, mae'r rhestr o 10 o fentrau yn nyffryn Conwy neu yng nghanolbarth Cymru, a hefyd ar yr A470, a gyhoeddwyd yn 2002, yn dangos ein bod yn ceisio gwella pethau ac yn gobeithio dechrau ar sawl menter arall cyn Ebrill 2008.

Mick Bates: You mentioned the launch of the road transport plan in 2002. Prior to that, a full report was undertaken by the Babcie Group. It was not only the A470 that was identified as being a nuisance with regard to north-south links. The report also identified 10 projects in Powys—that area of mid Wales little known to you—one of which was the Newtown bypass. When will we see some investment in the roads of mid Wales, and in Newtown in particular?

The First Minister: Phase 1 includes one mid Wales scheme, although it is not the one that you want—it is south of that area. If Kirsty Williams were here, I am sure that she would be arguing for it, but I will do it for her in her absence, for the best of reasons. It is the Talgarth relief road—the A438 Bronllys bypass. The 10 schemes that I mentioned earlier include, as you said, not just the A470, but the A483, which is important. Although the Newtown bypass is not included in that list, the Four Crosses relief road is, which, I am sure, will be of great relief to you.

other, which is closer to the Crimea near Blaenau Ffestiniog, will begin next year. In addition, the list of 10 schemes in the Conwy valley, or in mid Wales and also on the A470, published in 2002, shows that we are trying to improve things and hope to be able to commence work on a number of other schemes before April 2008.

Mick Bates: Cyfeiriasoch at lansio'r cynllun trafniadaeth ffyrdd yn 2002. Cyn hynny, lluniwyd adroddiad llawn gan y Babcie Group. Nid yr A470 oedd yr unig ffordd y canfuwyd ei bod yn peri niwsans o ran y cysylltiadau rhwng y de a'r gogledd. Nododd yr adroddiad 10 prosiect ym Mhowys—y rhan honno o'r Canolbarth na wyddoch lawer amdani—ac un ohonynt oedd ffordd osgoi'r Drenewydd. Pa bryd y gwelwn fuddsoddi yn ffyrdd y Canolbarth, ac yn y Drenewydd yn benodol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae rhan 1 yn cynnwys un cynllun yn y Canolbarth, er nad yr un a ddymunwch ydyw—mae yn ne'r ardal honno. Pe byddai Kirsty Williams yma, yr wyf yn siŵr y dadleuai drosto, ond gwnaf hynny ar ei rhan yn ei habsenoldeb, am y rheswm gorau. Ffordd liniaru Talgarth ydyw—ffordd osgoi Bronllys ar yr A438. Mae'r 10 cynllun a grybwyllais yn gynharach yn cynnwys, fel y dywedasoch, nid yn unig yr A470, ond yr A483, ac mae hynny'n bwysig. Er nad yw ffordd osgoi'r Drenewydd ar y rhestr honno, mae ffordd liniaru Four Crosses arni, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd hynny wrth eich bodd.

Pobl ag Anhwylderau Bwyta People with Eating Disorders

Q6 Leanne Wood: Will the First Minister make a statement on facilities for people with eating disorders? (OAQ35990)

The First Minister: That is a timely question because it is such a difficult issue, which goes far beyond the NHS. It is linked to wider pressures on young women in particular in our society to conform to a 'norm' that is almost impossible to meet. Where those pressures impact on the health of individuals, then we hope that services can be provided for them in local or community settings. However, while there is not a

C6 Leanne Wood: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar gyfleusterau i bobl sydd ag anhwylderau bwyta? (OAQ35990)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hwn yn gwestiwn amserol, gan ei fod yn fater mor anodd, a aiff yn bellach o lawer na'r GIG. Mae'n gysylltiedig â phwysau sydd ar fenywod ifanc yn benodol yn ein cymdeithas i gydymffurfio â 'norm' y mae bron yn amhosibl ei gyrraedd. Pan yw'r pwysau hynny'n cael effaith ar iechyd unigolion, gobeithiwn y gellir darparu gwasanaethau ar eu cyfer yn lleol neu yn y gymuned. Fodd bynnag, er nad

specific eating disorder unit in Wales, the Harvey Jones adolescent unit in Whitchurch, Cardiff and the Cedar Court unit in Colwyn Bay will provide specialist care for adolescents. The severest cases may then be referred to English specialist centres, the closest of which are in Liverpool and Bristol.

oes uned benodol ar gyfer anhwylderau bwyta yng Nghymru, bydd uned glasoed Harvey Jones yn yr Eglwys Newydd, Caerdydd ac uned Cedar Court ym Mae Colwyn yn darparu gofal arbenigol ar gyfer y glasoed. Gellir cyfeirio'r achosion mwyaf difrifol wedyn i ganolfannau arbenigol yn Lloegr, y mae'r agosaf ohonynt yn Lerpwl a Bryste.

2.30 p.m.

Leanne Wood: Are you concerned that the current debate on obesity may give the wrong message to those young women who are at the other end of the eating disorder spectrum? Are you also concerned—you touched on this in your answer—that there are no eating disorder beds in Wales? This concern was outlined by the Children's Commissioner for Wales. What will your Government do?

Leanne Wood: A ydych yn pryderu y gallai'r ddadl bresennol ar ordewdra gyfleu'r neges anghywir i'r menywod ifanc hynny sydd ym mhen arall y sbectwm anhwylderau bwyta? A ydych hefyd yn bryderus—cyfeiriasoch at hyn yn eich ateb—nad oes gwelyau ar gyfer anhwylderau bwyta yng Nghymru? Nodwyd y pryder hwn gan Gomisiynydd Plant Cymru. Beth a wnaiff eich Llywodraeth?

The First Minister: I would be interested to know your views, Leanne. Do you think that obesity and anorexia nervosa are two sides of the same coin? I am not sure whether they are, but I suppose that you could argue that they were. I am inclined not to think so, but try to persuade me, if you think otherwise.

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddai o ddiddordeb imi gael gwybod eich barn, Leanne. A gredwch mai dwy ochr i'r un geiniog yw anorecsia nerfol a gordewdra? Nid wyf yn sicr o hynny, ond mae'n debyg y gallech ddadlau mai hynny ydynt. Yr wyf fi'n tueddu i feddwl nad ydynt, ond ceisiwch fy mherswadio, os credwch fel arall.

On where the psychiatric beds should be, as I said, we do not have provision for the severest cases because we believe that early intervention in the community, support for the family, trying to diagnose disorders early, and treating them before they develop into the kind of situation where you would want to think about referral to specialist units, are the right way forward. We are talking about social preference impacting on girls and giving them a terrible problem, which is initially psychiatric and then physical. I hope that we can continue to give the right degree of priority to one of the most difficult, almost insolvable, questions in society today. The idea of 'norms' really gets at girls when they are experiencing hormonal changes, and they can lead to problems that will ultimately be fatal, five or 10 years later.

O ran pa le y dylai'r gwelyau seiciatrig fod, fel y dywedais, nid oes gennym ddarpariaeth ar gyfer yr achosion mwyaf difrifol gan ein bod yn credu mai'r llwybr y dylid ei ddilyn yw ymyrraeth fuan yn y gymuned, cymorth i'r teulu, ceisio canfod anhwylderau'n gynnar, a'u trin cyn iddynt ddatblygu i'r fath raddau fel y byddid yn ystyried atgyfeirio i unedau arbenigol. Yr ydym yn sôn am y modd y mae'r hyn a ffafriir gan gymdeithas yn effeithio ar ferched gan beri problem ofnadwy iddynt, sy'n un seiciatrig ar y dechrau ac wedyn yn un gorfforol. Gobeithiaf y gallwn barhau i roi'r flaenoriaeth briodol i un o'r problemau mwyaf anodd, ac annatrys bron, a geir mewn cymdeithas heddiw. Mae'r syniad o 'normau' yn cael gwir effaith ar ferched pan ydynt yn profi newidiadau hormonol, a gall hynny beri problemau a fydd yn angheuol yn y pen draw, pump neu 10 mlynedd yn ddiweddarach.

Jeff Cuthbert: This is a matter of great

Jeff Cuthbert: Mae hyn yn fater pwysig i

importance for local health boards, in terms of health education. Will you join me in welcoming greater collaboration between Caerphilly Local Health Board and Caerphilly County Borough Council on this issue, which will undoubtedly flow from Labour's election victory in Caerphilly?

The First Minister: I am sure that they will form a champion team, as will all the other local authorities and local health boards. Coterminality between local authorities—including social services in particular, although they are not always the relevant department—and the local health boards is an important advantage for Wales. May they continue to progress and work. We will stimulate that process and ensure that they achieve maximum synergy for the benefit of all, because the voters who elect the local authority representatives also expect to see good services from the local health board, produced in concert with them.

Brynle Williams: I have spoken with health professionals in north Wales regarding this issue and I am concerned about the lack of provision presently available to people who suffer from eating disorders. What measures are you putting in place to address this? What plans do you have to promote centres that help, by using websites and other accessible channels?

The First Minister: I mentioned the Cedar Court unit in Colwyn Bay earlier, although you may not have heard me. The Harvey Jones unit in Whitchurch is the specialist centre for the treatment of adolescents with psychiatric problems. The severest cases must be sent over the border to Liverpool and Bristol. The strategy involves early intervention and treatment in the community. If that fails, the two centres that I mentioned, which serve north and south Wales, are the next step. If that does not work, it is on to Liverpool or Bristol, or another specialist centre.

Lorraine Barrett: I agree with Leanne's view rather than yours on this one, First Minister. Do you agree that we must be careful when we discuss obesity, so that young people, and children in particular, do

fyrddau iechyd lleol, o ran addysg iechyd. A wnewch ymuno â mi i groesawu'r cydweithio helaethach rhwng Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerffili a Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili ar y mater hwn, a fydd yn sicr o ddilyn buddugoliaeth Llafur yn yr etholiad yng Nghaerffili?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddant yn dîm rhagorol, fel y bydd yr holl awdurdodau lleol a byrddau iechyd lleol eraill. Mae'r ffaith bod awdurdodau lleol—gan gynnwys gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn benodol, er nad hwy yw'r adran berthnasol ym mhob achos—a'r byrddau iechyd lleol yn cydffinio yn fantais bwysig i Gymru. Boed iddynt barhau â'u cynnydd a'u gwaith. Symbylwn y broses honno a sicrhau y cânt y synergedd mwyaf posibl er budd pawb, gan fod y rhai sy'n ethol cynrychiolwyr i'r awdurdod lleol hefyd yn disgwyl cael gwasanaethau da gan y bwrdd iechyd lleol, a gynhyrchir ar y cyd â hwy.

Brynle Williams: Yr wyf wedi siarad â gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol yn y Gogledd ynghylch y mater hwn a phryderaf ynghylch y diffyg darpariaeth a geir ar hyn o bryd ar gyfer rhai sy'n dioddef gan anhwylderau bwyta. Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i ymdrin â hyn? Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i hyrwyddo canolfannau sy'n helpu, drwy ddefnyddio gwefannau a chyfryngau hygyrch eraill?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cyfeiriais at uned Cedar Court ym Mae Colwyn yn gynharach, er na'm clywsoch efallai. Uned Harvey Jones yn yr Eglwys Newydd yw'r ganolfan arbenigol ar gyfer trin rhai yn eu glasoed sydd â phroblemau seiciatrig. Rhaid anfon yr achosion mwyaf difrifol dros y ffin i Lerpwl a Bryste. Mae'r strategaeth yn cynnwys ymyrraeth fuan a thriniaeth yn y gymuned. Os bydd hynny'n methu, y ddwy ganolfan a grybwyllais, sy'n gwasanaethu'r De a'r Gogledd, yw'r cam nesaf. Os na lwydda hynny, eir ymlaen i Lerpwl neu Fryste, neu ganolfan arbenigol arall.

Lorraine Barrett: Cytunaf â barn Leanne yn hytrach na'ch barn chi ar y mater hwn, Brif Weinidog. A ydych yn cytuno bod rhaid inni fod yn ofalus wrth drafod gordewdra, fel na fydd pobl ifanc, a phlant yn benodol, yn

not become obsessed with starvation diets? We need to drive home the message about healthy eating, rather than dieting.

The First Minister: Healthy eating and exercise are the answer. Dieting rarely works because you lose weight and then put it on again. Healthy eating, exercise, being in control of your life, and having high self esteem are the sort of things that will solve this problem, or nip it in the bud if it is just beginning at a time of adolescent change. It is a much wider social problem than merely the provision of psychiatric in-patient beds, although they are vital at times. This matter concerns how society looks at body shape and body image, and whether you fail because you do not have the right body image. It is important for people to realise that they could do much for themselves by eating healthily, doing exercise, and having a healthy lifestyle. In order to do that you must have some sense of control over your life. Unfortunately, the sort of people who lose that sense of control over their lives become self-destructive in their lifestyles.

mynd yn obsesiynol ynghylch colli pwysau drwy beidio â bwyta? Rhaid inni beri iddynt ddeall y neges ynghylch bwyta'n iach, yn hytrach na cholli pwysau.

Y Prif Weinidog: Bwyta'n iach ac ymarfer yw'r ateb. Anaml y llwyddir wrth fynd ar ddeiet gan eich bod yn colli pwysau ac wedyn yn ei ennill yn ôl. Bwyta'n iach, ymarfer, gallu rheoli'ch bywyd, a llawer o hunan-barch yw'r math o bethau a fydd yn datrys y broblem hon, neu'n ei lladd yn yr egin os yw newydd ddechrau ar adeg y newid yn y glasoed. Mae'n broblem gymdeithasol lawer ehangach nag un nad yw ond yn gofyn darparu gwelyau seiciatrig ar gyfer cleifion mewnol, er eu bod yn hollbwysig ar adegau. Mae'r mater hwn yn ymwneud â'r modd y mae cymdeithas yn edrych ar ffurf y corff a delwedd y corff, ac a ydych yn methu am nad yw delwedd eich corff yn iawn. Mae'n bwysig i bobl ddeall y gallent wneud llawer drostynt eu hunain drwy fwyta'n iach, ymarfer, a chael ffordd o fyw iach. Er mwyn gwneud hynny, rhaid cael rhyw ymdeimlad o reolaeth dros eich bywyd. Gwaetha'r modd, mae'r math o bobl sy'n colli'r ymdeimlad hwnnw o reolaeth dros eu bywyd yn dod i ddilyn ffyrdd o fyw hunanddiniol.

Ysbyty Brenhinol Caerdydd (Trefniadau Lesddaliad) Cardiff Royal Infirmary (Leasehold Arrangements)

Q7 Owen John Thomas: What are the details of the leasehold arrangements between Helical Bar and the leaseholders of the Cardiff Royal Infirmary? (OAQ36002)

The First Minister: You have had the full details in a written reply already, but I will briefly outline them for you now. Helical Bar is the head leaseholder of part of the site and freeholder of the remainder. The National Assembly for Wales holds a lease to the site from Helical Bar lasting 830 years from March 1882. The lease specifies certain health-related restrictions on the use of the site.

Owen John Thomas: No-one would relinquish such a valuable leasehold tenure without enormous financial compensation. If that is what the National Assembly is thinking of doing, will you bring it to Plenary before taking that step?

C7 Owen John Thomas: Beth yw manylion y trefniadau lesddaliadol rhwng Helical Bar a lesddeiliaid Ysbyty Brenhinol Caerdydd? (OAQ36002)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych eisoes wedi cael y manylion llawn mewn ateb ysgrifenedig, ond fe'u disgrifiaf yn fyr i chi'n awr. Helical Bar yw'r prif lesddeiliad ar ran o'r safle ac mae'n rhydd-ddeiliad ar y gweddill. Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru'n dal prydles ar y safle oddi wrth Helical Bar sy'n parhau am 830 mlynedd oddi ar fis Mawrth 1882. Mae'r brydles yn dynodi rhai cyfyngiadau ar y defnydd o'r safle sy'n ymwneud ag ieched.

Owen John Thomas: Ni fyddai neb yn ildio lesddaliad mor werthfawr heb gael iawndal ariannol enfawr. Os mai hynny y mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried ei wneud, a wnewch ddwyn hynny gerbron Cyfarfod Llawn cyn cymryd y cam hwnnw?

The First Minister: That is a hypothetical question. I have heard no such suggestion. There is no provision for us to part with any land that belongs to any hospital without it being for the best possible price.

David Melding: I am slightly disconcerted that a member of your Cabinet seems to be engaged in a game of strip poker. I hope that he does not make too dramatic a progress.

With regard to the disposal of NHS estates, it is important that we have value for money and that we ensure that facilities remain in the locality whenever possible so that we take the local community with us. Are you convinced that that will happen in this case?

The First Minister: You must explain the rules of strip poker to me sometime, David, as I am unfamiliar with that sport.

Our record over the last few months in disposing of hospital property at Hensol and Sully should give you considerable reassurance. We expect to receive a good commercial deal, and, fortunately, we have been selling into a rising market due to the housing boom. That will not, however, apply to any matter relating to the huge complexities of the Cardiff Royal Infirmary site. I do not know why people think that it will be sold as I have seen no suggestion that it will be.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cwestiwn damcaniaethol yw hwnnw. Ni chlywais unrhyw awgrym o'r fath. Nid oes unrhyw ddarpariaeth inni waredu unrhyw dir sy'n eiddo i unrhyw ysbyty heb gael y pris gorau posibl.

David Melding: Caf fy synnu braidd o weld bod aelod o'ch Cabinet, i bob golwg, yn chwarae gêm o strip-pocer. Gobeithiaf nad aiff yn rhy bell.

O ran gwaredu ystadau'r GIG, mae'n bwysig inni gael gwerth am arian a sicrhau bod cyfleusterau'n parhau yn yr ardal, os oes modd, fel y gallwn gael cefnogaeth y gymuned leol. A ydych yn sicr y bydd hynny'n digwydd yn yr achos hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Rhaid ichi egluro rheolau strip-pocer imi rywbryd, David, gan nad wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r gêm honno.

Dylai ein record dros y misoedd diwethaf ar waredu eiddo ysbytai yn Hensol a Sili roi cryn dawelwch meddwl i chi. Disgwylw'n gael bargaen fasnachol dda, ac, yn ffodus, buom yn gwerthu mewn marchnad sydd ar gynnydd oherwydd yr ymchwydd ym mhrisiau tai. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd hynny'n berthnasol i unrhyw fater sy'n ymwneud â'r chymhlethdodau mawr ar safle Ysbyty Brenhinol Caerdydd. Ni wn pam y mae pobl yn credu y caiff ei werthu gan na welais unrhyw awgrym y gwneir hynny.

Triniaeth Ddewisol Elective Treatment

Q8 Glyn Davies: When did the First Minister last discuss the elective treatment of Welsh patients in English hospitals with his Minister for Health and Social Services? (OAQ35991)

The First Minister: On 24 May.

Glyn Davies: I wonder whether you will discuss this next matter. The consultant who restored me to health 18 months ago told me last week that his patient list has a star against names from Wales, indicating that they are not to be treated. In addition, he cannot treat patients who attend the surgery that he sometimes holds in Wales. Do you

C8 Glyn Davies: Pryd wnaeth y Prif Weinidog drafod ddiwethaf gyda'i Weinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol driniaeth ddewisol cleifion Cymru yn ysbytai Lloegr? (OAQ35991)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ar 24 Mai.

Glyn Davies: Tybed a wnewch drafod y mater a grybwyllaf nesaf. Dywedodd yr ymgynghorydd a adferodd fy iechyd, 18 mis yn ôl, wrthyf yr wythnos diwethaf fod seren wrth enwau o Gymru ar ei restr cleifion, sy'n dangos nad ydynt i gael eu trin. Yn ogystal â hynny, ni all drin cleifion a ddaw i'r feddygfa y mae'n ei chynnal weithiau yng Nghymru. A

accept, and have you discussed with your health Minister, that this must invariably have a damaging effect on the morale of those consultants who are based in England on whom the people of Wales depend?

The First Minister: I understand your appreciation, which I am sure that we all share, of the brilliant treatment that you received, which is a strong recommendation of health treatment in this country. It is important that, where there are disputes between Royal Shrewsbury Hospital NHS Trust or, in some instances, the primary care trust and Powys Local Health Board, we recognise that Powys Local Health Board has a job to do. It probably has nothing to do with your particular case or the particular consultant who treated you, but we have seen some considerable disagreements in relation to the Powys Local Health Board, which felt that it was being bounced by the primary care trust over the border with regard to the specification of treatments for orthopaedic patients at, for example, the Robert Jones and Agnes Hunt Orthopaedic Hospital, Gobowen. However, the Powys Local Health Board has the commissioning role, and it carries that out, as far as we are concerned, honourably and effectively for patients in mid Wales, whether they are to be treated in secondary care in England or in Wales.

ydych yn derbyn, ac a ydych wedi trafod gyda'ch Gweinidog iechyd, fod hyn yn sicr o ddigalonni'r ymgynghorwyr hynny sydd wedi'u lleoli yn Lloegr y mae pobl Cymru'n dibynnu arnynt?

Y Prif Weinidog: Deallaf eich gwerthfawrogiad o'r driniaeth wych a gawsoch, ac yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod ni i gyd yn ei rannu; mae hynny'n gymeradwyaeth fawr i'r driniaeth iechyd yn y wlad hon. Mae'n bwysig, pan geir anghydfodau rhwng Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Ysbyty Brenhinol Amwythig neu, mewn rhai achosion, yr ymddiriedolaeth gofal sylfaenol a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys, ein bod yn cydnabod bod gwaith i'w wneud gan Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys. Mae'n debyg nad oes a wnelo hyn â'ch achos penodol chi neu'r ymgynghorydd hwnnw y buoch dan ei law, ond gwelsom rai anghydfodau sylweddol mewn cysylltiad â Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys, a deimlai ei fod yn cael cam gan yr ymddiriedolaeth gofal sylfaenol y tu draw i'r ffin gyda golwg ar ddynodi triniaethau ar gyfer cleifion orthopedig, er enghraifft, yn Ysbyty Orthopedig Robert Jones ac Agnes Hunt, Gobowen. Serch hynny, gan Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys y mae'r rôl comisiynu, ac mae'n cyflawni honno, yn ein golwg ni, yn anrhydeddus ac yn effeithiol er mwyn cleifion yn y Canolbarth, os ydynt i gael eu trin drwy ofal eilaidd yn Lloegr neu yng Nghymru.

Deintyddion yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin Dentists in Mid and West Wales

Q9 Lisa Francis: Will the First Minister make a statement on the provision of dentists in mid and west Wales? (OAQ36005)

The First Minister: The Minister for Health and Social Services announced last month £5.3 million to smooth the path of the proposed programme of reform of NHS dentistry in Wales and the introduction of the new contract for practitioners. This extra money underlines our commitment to strengthen NHS dentistry and enhance access to services to patients throughout Wales. I am pleased that some 51 per cent of the population of Wales is registered with an NHS dentist, which may not seem a high percentage, but it is 3 per cent more than in

C9 Lisa Francis: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ddarpariaeth deintyddion yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin? (OAQ36005)

Y Prif Weinidog: Cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y mis diwethaf ei bod yn rhoi £5.3 miliwn i hwyluso'r rhaglen ddiwygio arfaethedig ar gyfer deintyddiaeth yn y GIG yng Nghymru ac i gyflwyno'r contract newydd ar gyfer ymarferwyr. Mae'r arian ychwanegol hwn yn amlygu ein hymrwymiad i hybu deintyddiaeth yn y GIG a gwella mynediad i wasanaethau ar gyfer cleifion ledled Cymru. Yr wyf yn falch bod tua 51 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru wedi'i gofrestru gyda deintydd GIG, nad yw efallai'n ymddangos

England.

yn ganran uchel, ond mae'n 3 y cant yn fwy nag yn Lloegr.

2.40 p.m.

Lisa Francis: The £5.3 million is most welcome. You will be aware that the former NHS dentist in Machynlleth left his practice last February and has now been replaced. This practice had received money from the Welsh dental initiative to start up in 2002, and patients joining the practice had to pay a £30 registration fee. Around 1,000 patients have recently re-registered with a new replacement dentist, paying another £30. Does your Government have any plans to reimburse those patients, especially those who have now been forced to re-register in such a short period of time?

Lisa Francis: Mae'r £5.3 miliwn i'w groesawu'n fawr. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod y cyn-ddeintydd GIG ym Machynlleth wedi gadael ei bractis fis Chwefror diwethaf a bod deintydd bellach wedi dod yn ei le. Cafodd y practis hwn arian gan fenter ddeintyddol Cymru i gychwyn yn 2002, ac yr oedd cleifion a ymunodd â'r practis yn gorfod talu ffi gofrestru o £30. Mae tua 1,000 o gleifion wedi ailgofrestru'n ddiweddar gyda deintydd newydd a ddaeth yn lle'r un cynt, gan dalu £30 arall. A oes gan eich Llywodraeth unrhyw fwriad i ad-dalu arian i'r cleifion hynny, yn enwedig y rhai y gorfodwyd iddynt ailgofrestru o fewn cyn lleied o amser?

The First Minister: That is an interesting question. I do not know the answer, but either Jane Hutt or I will write to you about this double registration issue. We are pleased that there are now 24 new or expanded practices to take NHS patients in all parts of Wales, from Holyhead to Cardiff, and that includes the practice in Machynlleth that you mention. That is one of eight new practices, and there have been 16 expansions. I have not heard of anybody who has subsequently left the practice being asked to pay another registration fee. You will receive a full answer either from Jane Hutt or me about that. [*Interruption.*]

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn diddorol. Ni wn yr ateb, ond byddaf i neu Jane Hutt yn ysgrifennu atoch ynghylch y mater hwn o gofrestru dwbl. Yr ydym yn falch bod 24 o bractisiau newydd neu fwy erbyn hyn i gymryd cleifion y GIG ym mhob rhan o Gymru, o Gaerdydd i Gaerdydd, ac mae hynny'n cynnwys y practis ym Machynlleth y cyfeiriasoch ato. Mae hwnnw'n un o'r wyth practis newydd, ac mae 16 o bractisiau wedi ehangu. Ni chlywais am neb a adawodd y practis wedyn yn cael cais i dalu ffi gofrestru arall. Cewch ateb llawn gennyf i neu Jane Hutt ynghylch hynny. [*Torri ar draws.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Rhodri Glyn, please sit down somewhere.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhodri Glyn, eisteddwch yn rhywle, os gwelwch yn dda.

Catherine Thomas: For several months, I have been deeply concerned about the serious lack of NHS dental provision in my constituency of Llanelli. I am particularly worried about the enormous pressure that some dentists in my constituency are putting on patients to sign up to a Denplan scheme that can cost as much as £40 a month. Do you agree that it is wrong for my constituents to be told that if they do not sign up to such a scheme, they will be unable to access dental provision? Will you look at this situation on behalf of my constituents and discover whether dentists are allowed to issue such

Catherine Thomas: Ers rhai misoedd, bûm yn bryderus dros ben ynghylch y diffyg difrifol o ran darpariaeth ddeintyddol y GIG yn fy etholaeth, Llanelli. Yr wyf yn arbennig o bryderus ynghylch y pwysau mawr y mae rhai deintyddion yn fy etholaeth yn ei roi ar gleifion i gytuno i gymryd cynllun Denplan a all gostio cymaint â £40 y mis. A ydych yn cytuno nad yw'n iawn i'm hetholwyr gael eu hysbysu, os na chytunant i gymryd cynllun o'r fath, na fyddant yn gallu cael darpariaeth ddeintyddol? A wnewch edrych ar y sefyllfa hon ar ran fy etholwyr a darganfod a ganiateir i ddeintyddion roi rhybuddion olaf ffiadd o'r

despicable ultimatums, which demonstrate a lack of regard for my constituents' oral health?

The First Minister: You cannot have ultimatums in the national health service. Llanelli is one of the areas that has benefited—although part of your constituency may not be as accessible as others—from the 24 practices that have either been expanded or have opened up under the Welsh dental initiative. Jane and I would be interested to know which NHS dentists, who are thinking of going private or using Denplan, are putting pressure on your constituents—their patients—by saying ‘You have got to go onto Denplan or else’. There is no such thing as an acceptable ultimatum in the provision of NHS services. The issue with the new contract is how we encourage more dentists to sign up to it. It is far more rational than the old contract, as it is based on need rather than on activity, regardless of whether the activity is needed. The old contract contained some perverse incentives; we hope that the new contract will get rid of those. That will be much better for dentists and for dental patients.

Helen Mary Jones: I am glad to hear you say that dentists putting that kind of pressure on individuals to sign up to private health insurance is unacceptable. That is happening in my home community of Llanelli, as Catherine Thomas said. Since you have said that it is unacceptable, will you and the Minister for Health and Social Services have discussions with the British Dental Association to try to stop it? This is not about the provision of national health dental care; it is private dental care when national health dental care is not available. Until we have proper national health coverage, surely something can be done to stop people having to pay these exorbitant private health premiums?

The First Minister: I am sure that that is right. I do not know whether what you and Catherine describe are verbal ultimatums, or what are understood to be ultimatums, or

fath, sy'n dangos diffyg ystyriaeth i iechyd geneuol fy etholwyr?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni ellir cael rhybuddion olaf yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Llanelli yw un o'r ardaloedd a gafodd fudd—er bod rhan o'ch etholaeth nad yw mor hawdd ei chyrraedd ag eraill, o bosibl—o'r 24 o bractisiau sydd wedi agor neu ehangu o dan fenter ddeintyddol Cymru. Byddai o ddiddordeb i Jane a mi gael gwybod pa ddeintyddion GIG, sy'n ystyried troi'n breifat neu ddefnyddio Denplan, sy'n rhoi pwysau ar eich etholwyr—eu cleifion hwy—drwy ddweud ‘Rhaid ichi gymryd Denplan neu wynebu'r canlyniadau’. Nid oes y fath beth â rhybudd olaf derbynol wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau'r GIG. Y mater sy'n codi o ran y contract newydd yw sut yr anogwn ragor o ddeintyddion i'w dderbyn. Mae'n llawer mwy rhesymol na'r hen gontract, gan ei fod yn seiliedig ar angen yn hytrach na gweithgarwch, pa un a oes angen y gweithgarwch ai peidio. Yr oedd rhai anogaethau gwrthnysig yn yr hen gontract; gobeithiwn y bydd y contract newydd yn cael gwared â'r rhain. Bydd hynny'n well o lawer i ddeintyddion a'u cleifion.

Helen Mary Jones: Mae'n dda gennyf eich clywed yn dweud nad yw'n dderbynol i ddeintyddion roi pwysau o'r fath ar unigolion i dderbyn yswiriant iechyd preifat. Mae hynny'n digwydd yn y gymuned lle y mae fy nghartref yn Llanelli, fel y dywedodd Catherine Thomas. Gan eich bod wedi dweud ei fod yn annerbynol, a wnewch chi a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol gael trafodaethau â Chymdeithas Ddeintyddol Prydain i geisio rhoi pen arno? Nid oes a wnelo hyn â darparu gofal deintyddol o dan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol; gofal deintyddol preifat ydyw pan nad yw gofal deintyddol o dan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol ar gael. Hyd nes y cawn ddarpariaeth briodol o dan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, siawns na ellir gwneud rhywbeth i beri na fydd pobl yn gorfod talu crochris am y premiymau iechyd preifat hyn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn siŵr bod hynny'n gywir. Ni wn a yw'r hyn a ddisgrifiasoch chi a Catherine yn rhybuddion olaf llafar, neu'n rhai a ddehonglir fel

whether they are expressed in letters—

rhybuddion olaf, neu a ydynt wedi'u mynegi mewn llythyrau—

Helen Mary Jones: They are given in writing.

Helen Mary Jones: Fe'u rhoddir mewn llythyrau.

The First Minister: If they are given in writing, it is much easier for us to examine them. I am pleased that you both say that they are in the form of letters. We would like to see those. It is important that we remember that the number of NHS dentists in Wales has gone up over the past five years from 975 to 1022, and many people do not realise—and perhaps some dentists do not realise—that we are gradually managing to increase the number of dentists. Unfortunately, many people think that if you lose your NHS dentist because he or she wants to go onto Denplan, before the new contract comes in, there will not be another dentist to whom they can go. There are other dentists to whom people can go, but there are not enough. However, there are 60 more than when the Assembly Government came to power.

Y Prif Weinidog: Os rhoddir hwy mewn llythyrau, mae'n haws o lawer i ni eu harchwilio. Yr wyf yn falch bod y ddwy ohonoch yn dweud eu bod ar ffurf llythyrau. Carem eu gweld. Mae'n bwysig inni gofio bod nifer deintyddion y GIG yng Nghymru wedi codi dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf o 975 i 1022, ac mae llawer nad ydynt yn sylweddoli—ac efallai fod rhai deintyddion nad ydynt yn sylweddoli—ein bod yn llwyddo'n raddol i gynyddu nifer y deintyddion. Gwaetha'r modd, mae llawer yn credu, os collwch eich deintydd GIG am ei fod am ymuno â Denplan, cyn rhoi'r contract newydd ar waith, na fydd deintydd arall y gallant fynd ato. Mae deintyddion eraill y gall pobl fynd atynt, ond nid oes digon. Er hynny, mae 60 yn rhagor nag yr oedd pan ddaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i rym.

Capasiti Gwelyau Ysbytai yn y Sector Acíwt Hospital Bed Capacity in the Acute Sector

Q10 Eleanor Burnham: Will the First Minister make a statement on hospital bed capacity in the acute sector? (OAQ35983)

C10 Eleanor Burnham: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar nifer y gwelyau ysbyty sydd ar gael yn y sector aciwt? (OAQ35983)

The First Minister: Following my visit to Wrexham in late April, I was able to see the work of the multidisciplinary team of Wrexham social services from Wrexham Maelor Hospital and their opposite numbers in the Countess of Chester Hospital from the Chester area social services. That work significantly reduced the need for hospital admission and in-patient stays and reduced the length of stay for those who were admitted. All that has an impact on calculating correctly how many beds you need.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn sgîl fy ymweliad â Wrecsam ddiwedd Ebrill, bu modd imi weld gwaith tîm amlddisgyblaethol gwasanaethau cymdeithasol Wrecsam yn Ysbyty Wrecsam Maelor a'r rhai sy'n cyfateb iddynt yn Ysbyty Iarlls Caer o wasanaethau cymdeithasol ardal Caer. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw wedi peri bod llawer llai o angen derbyn pobl i'r ysbyty ac iddynt aros fel cleifion mewnol ac mae wedi byrhau arosiadau'r rhai a dderbynnir. Mae hynny oll yn cael effaith ar gyfrifo'n gywir nifer y gwelyau sydd eu hangen.

Eleanor Burnham: I am pleased that you referred to Wrexham, especially as we welcome Aled and Llinos Roberts, the mayor and mayoress of Wrexham, to the Assembly today. What is your Government doing to ease problems in paediatric care, such as those that a constituent of mine encountered

Eleanor Burnham: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi cyfeirio at Wrecsam, yn enwedig gan ein bod yn croesawu Aled a Llinos Roberts, maer a maeres Wrecsam, i'r Cynulliad heddiw. Beth y mae'ch Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i leddfu problemau mewn gofal pediatrig, fel y rhai a brofodd un o'm

when her baby was referred to Alder Hey Hospital in Liverpool? Because of a lack of capacity, which often happens apparently, they were referred further afield—patients are often referred to Leeds and Manchester. This is a huge additional strain on already stressed parents and their children. Sadly, my constituent's baby subsequently died.

The First Minister: I am sorry to hear that, and I am sure that we are all saddened by any such event. I am not familiar with the details, so I cannot comment on that particular case. However, we made a commitment to use Alder Hey Hospital as the prime tertiary referral centre for paediatric medicine, treatment, surgery, and so on, for north Wales. The new national children's hospital in Cardiff is now probably 100 ft off the ground and will open fairly soon, and other centres in Wales will use those services. However, for tertiary services in north Wales, we have committed ourselves to using Alder Hey Hospital. I am not aware of that causing huge problems, although you can never legislate for the individual hard cases, especially when Alder Hey Hospital is full and there is onward referral to Manchester or Leeds.

William Graham: Will you confirm that bed capacity in Welsh hospitals, despite a 40 per cent increase in funding, has decreased by three beds per week since 1999?

The First Minister: I do not have the figures; I have no reason to deny your figures. You must remember that there has been a huge and deliberate reduction in the number of in-patient mental health beds, as part of a philosophy, which is not exclusive to this party or this Government, about treatment in the community being much better treatment and, usually, cheaper treatment, than in-patient treatment in psychiatric hospital beds. We would all accept that running down the number of beds in that sector is wise; it has had wide all-party support.

It is a little more questionable whether the

hetholwyr pan atgyfeiriwyd ei baban i Ysbyty Alder Hey yn Lerpwl? Oherwydd diffyg capasiti, a geir yn aml, yn ôl pob sôn, fe'u hatgyfeiriwyd y tu hwnt i Gymru—mae cleifion yn cael eu hatgyfeirio'n aml i Leeds a Manceinion. Mae hynny'n rhoi straen mawr ychwanegol ar rieni a phlant sydd dan straen eisoes. Gwaetha'r modd, bu farw baban fy etholwr wedyn.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf glywed hynny, ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod unrhyw ddigwyddiad o'r fath yn peri tristwch i ni i gyd. Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r manylion, felly ni allaf wneud sylw am yr achos penodol hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, ymrwymasom i ddefnyddio Ysbyty Alder Hey fel y brif ganolfan atgyfeirio trydyddol ar gyfer meddygaeth, triniaeth a llawdriniaeth bediatrig, ac yn y blaen, i'r Gogledd. Mae'n debyg bod adeilad yr ysbyty plant cenedlaethol newydd yng Nghaerdydd wedi codi tua 100 troedfedd bellach a bydd yn agor yn eithaf buan, a bydd canolfannau eraill yng Nghymru'n defnyddio'r gwasanaethau hynny. Fodd bynnag, yn achos gwasanaethau trydyddol yn y Gogledd, yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i ddefnyddio Ysbyty Alder Hey. Nid wyf yn ymwybodol bod hynny'n peri problemau mawr, er na ellir byth ddarparu ar gyfer achosion anodd neilltuol, yn enwedig os yw Ysbyty Alder Hey yn llawn ac yr atgyfeirir ymlaen i Fanceinion neu Leeds.

William Graham: A wnewch gadarnhau bod y capasiti gwelyau yn ysbytai Cymru wedi gostwng, er bod 40 y cant yn fwy o gyllid, dri gwely yr wythnos er 1999?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid yw'r ffigurau gennyf; nid oes gennyf unrhyw reswm i wrthod y ffigurau a roesoch. Rhaid ichi gofio bod nifer y gwelyau iechyd meddwl i gleifion mewnol wedi'i ostwng yn aruthrol ac yn fwriadol, fel rhan o athroniaeth, nad yw'n unigryw i'r blaid hon neu'r Llywodraeth hon, sy'n dal bod triniaeth yn y gymuned yn well o lawer, ac yn rhatach fel arfer, na thriniaeth ar gyfer cleifion mewnol mewn gwelyau seiciatrig mewn ysbytai. Byddem oll yn derbyn mai peth doeth yw lleihau nifer y gwelyau yn y sector hwnnw; mae cefnogaeth eang i hynny gan yr holl bleidiau.

Mae ychydig bach yn fwy o le i amau a yw'r

acute sector has all-party support. That was the point about my visit to Wrexham. All the practitioners, doctors and social workers that I met said that it is far better to concentrate on how to reduce the need for beds by reducing the demand for admissions or the length of stay in hospitals, and on whether an overnight stay is needed or whether patients can be treated in three hours by the consultant, almost at the door if you like. In that way, only those who really need an in-patient stay are admitted. In the old days, if you got to the accident and emergency department, you were admitted and it was only when the consultant did his round in the morning, or sometimes in the afternoon, that you could possibly be discharged, even if there was nothing wrong with you. There is also the issue of delayed transfers of care, which we can reduce. Again, that reduces the real demand for beds.

holl bleidiau yn cefnogi'r sector aciwt. Dyna oedd diben fy ymweliad â Wrecsam. Dywedodd yr holl ymarferwyr, meddygon a gweithwyr cymdeithasol y cyfarfûm â hwy ei bod yn well o lawer canolbwyntio ar sut i leihau'r angen am welyau drwy leihau'r galw am dderbyn cleifion i ysbytai neu hyd yr arhosiad mewn ysbytai, ac ar ganfod a oes angen i gleifion aros dros nos neu a all yr ymgynghorydd drin cleifion o fewn tair awr, wrth y drws, os caf ei roi felly. Yn y modd hwnnw, dim ond y rhai y mae arnynt wir angen aros fel cleifion mewnol a gaiff eu derbyn. Yn yr hen ddyddiau, os cyrhaeddech yr adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys, caech eich derbyn, a dim ond pan ddeuai'r ymgynghorydd ar ei rawd yn y bore, neu yn y prynhawn weithiau, y gallech gael eich rhyddhau, hyd yn oed os nad oedd dim o'i le arnoch. Mae mater yr oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn codi hefyd, a gallwn leihau hynny. Unwaith eto, mae hynny'n lleihau'r gwir alw am welyau.

Addysg Ôl-16 i Gymunedau Difreintiedig Post-16 Education for Deprived Communities

Q11 Lynne Neagle: What action has the Assembly Government taken to widen access to post-16 education for students from deprived communities? (OAQ35992)

The First Minister: We are delighted to be working with the UK Government on this issue. The education maintenance allowances will be introduced in September—there are only three months to wait for that. By the time that that scheme has been introduced in full—starting with 16-year-olds, 16 and 17-year-olds the following year, and the full range of 16 to 18-year-olds in the third year—some 27,500 students will be part of it. They will benefit from the scheme at a cost of some £30 million, with funds being directly provided on a demand-led basis by the Treasury rather than coming out of our departmental expenditure limit.

Lynne Neagle: Given the high rates of economic inactivity in the Valleys, as well as the low rates of young people staying on in education, do you agree that the Assembly Government must do all that it can to remove barriers for people from deprived communities? Do you share my concern that

C11 Lynne Neagle: Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi'u cymryd i gynnig addysg ôl-16 i fwy o fyfyrwyr o gymunedau difreintiedig? (OAQ35992)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym wrth ein bodd o gael gweithio gyda Llywodraeth y DU ar y mater hwn. Cyflwynir y lwfansau cynhalieth addysg ym mis Medi—nid oes ond tri mis tan hynny. Erbyn yr amser y cyflwynir y cynllun hwnnw'n llawn—gan ddechrau â rhai 16 mlwydd oed, y rhai 16 a 17 mlwydd oed y flwyddyn wedyn, a'r amrediad llawn o 16 i 18 mlwydd oed yn y drydedd flwyddyn—bydd rhyw 27,500 o fyfyrwyr yn rhan ohono. Cânt fudd o'r cynllun sy'n costio tua £30 miliwn, a darperir cyllid yn uniongyrchol yn ôl y galw gan y Trysorlys yn hytrach na'i fod yn dod o'n terfyn gwariant adrannol.

Lynne Neagle: Yng ngolwg cyfraddau uchel o anweithgarwch economaidd yn y Cymoedd, yn ogystal â chyfraddau isel o ran y nifer o bobl ifanc sy'n parhau mewn addysg, a gytunwch fod rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad wneud popeth o fewn ei gallu i ddileu rhwystrau i rai o gymunedau difreintiedig? A

the recent actions of Coleg Gwent, particularly its proposals to scrap access courses in Pontypool and to severely restrict A-level provision, place severe barriers in the way of people having an education in Torfaen?

2.50 p.m.

The First Minister: We are trying to ensure that economic obstacles to staying on in school for people from less well-off backgrounds, whether they are between 16 and 18 years of age or older than 18 years of age, are removed. The education maintenance allowances, which I referred to earlier, assist in that, and they flow nicely into the Assembly learning grant, which is available for people over 18 years of age. The actions of individual colleges are usually the management's response to past mismanagement, but I am not sure about the particular case of Coleg Gwent. However, Jane Davidson or I will write to you about that.

David Davies: Large numbers of students from deprived backgrounds who want to continue with their education would prefer to do so in their local schools and would prefer to take their A-levels in the schools where they received their education previously. What impact do you believe the cut in funding for school sixth forms being proposed by Education and Learning Wales will have on students' right to receive an education in their local school?

The First Minister: That would be a wonderful question had ELWa proposed that. I am not aware of any proposed cut in sixth-form funding. ELWa has been seeking to remove unnecessary duplication between sixth-form provision and provision in further education colleges. In doing so, I understood that it had the support of at least three of the four parties in the Assembly. Your party has probably never been on board with this, and you may have good reasons for that. However, there is no proposed cut in funding. An attempt is being made to see what is in the best interest of pupils when they reach 16 years of age by asking whether they want to

ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder bod y camau a gymerodd Coleg Gwent yn ddiweddar, yn enwedig ei fwriad i gael gwared â chyrsgiau mynediad ym Mhont-y-pŵl ac i gyfyngu'n llym ar y ddarpariaeth Safon Uwch, yn codi rhwystrau mawr rhag i bobl dderbyn addysg yn Nhor-faen?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau y chwelir rhwystrau economaidd sy'n atal rhai o gefndiroedd llai cefnog rhag aros ymlaen yn yr ysgol, boed hwy rhwng 16 a 18 mlwydd oed neu'n hŷn na 18 mlwydd oed. Mae'r lwfansau cynhaliath addysg, a grybwyllais yn gynharach, yn helpu yn hynny o beth, ac maent yn cydasio'n braf â grant dysgu'r Cynulliad, sydd ar gael i rai dros 18 mlwydd oed. Fel arfer, mae'r camau a gymer colegau neilltuol yn ymateb gan y rheolwyr i gamreoli yn y gorffennol, ond nid wyf yn sicr ynghylch achos Coleg Gwent yn benodol. Fodd bynnag, byddaf fi neu Jane Davidson yn ysgrifennu atoch am hynny.

David Davies: Ceir niferoedd mawr o fyfyrwyr o gefndiroedd difreintiedig sydd am barhau â'u haddysg y byddai'n well ganddynt wneud hynny yn eu hysgol leol gan ddilyn cyrsiau Safon Uwch yn yr ysgol lle y derbyniasant eu haddysg cyn hynny. Pa effaith y bydd y cwtogi ar gyllid i gyfleusterau chweched dosbarth mewn ysgolion a gynigir gan Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru yn ei chael, yn eich barn chi, ar hawl myfyrwyr i dderbyn addysg yn eu hysgol leol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Buasai hwnnw'n gwestiwn gwych pe bai ELWa wedi cynnig hynny. Ni wn am unrhyw fwriad i gwtogi ar gyllid ar gyfer cyfleusterau chweched dosbarth. Mae ELWa wedi bod yn ceisio dileu dyblygu diangen rhwng y ddarpariaeth mewn cyfleusterau chweched dosbarth a'r ddarpariaeth mewn colegau addysg bellach. Tybiais fod o leiaf dair o'r pedair plaid yn y Cynulliad yn ei gefnogi yn hynny o beth. Mae'n debyg nad yw'ch plaid erioed wedi cytuno â hyn, ac efallai fod gennych resymau da dros beidio â gwneud. Er hynny, nid oes bwriad i gwtogi ar gyllid. Gwneir ymdrech i ganfod yr hyn sydd o'r budd mwyaf i

go to a sixth form or an FE college or whether they want to follow some courses in an FE college and some in a sixth form. The amount of choice available now cannot be compared with that available prior to 1999.

John Griffiths: I am sure that you are aware of the University of Wales, Newport's good record in terms of widening access to post-16 education. It has exciting plans to relocate the university to the riverfront in Newport city centre. Do you agree that that will assist its efforts to further widen participation by raising the profile of university education in Newport and the surrounding area?

The First Minister: Yes. However, that does imply that financial support will be given to what I understand may be a costly bid, although I am not sure of the financial details. However, the University of Wales, Newport has a superb record and a riverside, city-centre location would undoubtedly help it to attract students. However, it depends on making the figures add up.

Peter Black: What impact will the current funding crisis facing many FE colleges in Wales have on access to post-16 education for students from deprived communities? Do you agree with the Secretary of State for Wales that an inquiry should be initiated with regard to Neath Port Talbot College in his constituency?

The First Minister: I was not aware that the Secretary of State had made that plea in his capacity as Member of Parliament for Neath. However, we are always happy for any allegations of mismanagement to be drawn to our attention. They will then be passed on to the necessary authorities so that any proven mismanagement is corrected. We want our FE colleges to be as efficiently managed as possible. Sometimes that involves taking tough decisions and sometimes there are many complaints about such decisions. However, you cannot have it both ways. You either have efficiently managed colleges, which occasionally say 'no' to demand or

ddisgyblion pan gyrhaeddant 16 mlwydd oed drwy ofyn a ydynt am fynd i gyfleuster chweched dosbarth neu goleg addysg bellach neu a ydynt am ddilyn rhai cyrsiau mewn coleg addysg bellach a rhai mewn cyfleuster chweched dosbarth. Nid oes cymhariaeth rhwng maint y dewis sydd ar gael yn awr â'r hyn a oedd ar gael cyn 1999.

John Griffiths: Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch am record dda Prifysgol Cymru, Casnewydd o ran ehangu mynediad i addysg ôl-16. Mae ganddi gynlluniau cyffrous i symud y brifysgol at lannau'r afon yng nghanol dinas Casnewydd. A ydych yn cytuno y bydd hynny'n rhoi hwb i'w hymdrechion i ehangu cyfranogiad ymhellach drwy hybu amlygrwydd addysg brifysgol yng Nghasnewydd a'i gyffiniau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydwyf. Er hynny, nid yw hynny'n golygu y rhoddir cymorth ariannol i'r hyn a allai fod yn gynllun drud, yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, er nad wyf yn sicr ynglŷn â'r manylion ariannol. Serch hynny, mae record wych gan Brifysgol Cymru, Casnewydd a byddai lleoliad ar lan yr afon yng nghanol y ddinas yn sicr o fod yn gymorth i ddenu myfyrwyr. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i'r ffigurau fod yn gywir i wneud hynny.

Peter Black: Beth fydd effaith yr argyfwng cyllido presennol a wynebir gan sawl coleg addysg bellach yng Nghymru ar fynediad i addysg ôl-16 i fyfyrwyr o gymunedau difreintiedig? A gytunwch ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru y dylid sefydlu ymchwiliad mewn cysylltiad â Choleg Castell-nedd Port Talbot yn ei etholaeth?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni wyddwn fod yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol wedi gwneud apêl o'r fath yn rhinwedd ei swydd fel yr Aelod Seneddol dros Gastell-nedd. Er hynny, yr ydym bob amser yn fodlon i unrhyw gyhuddiadau o gamreoli gael eu dwyn i'n sylw. Fe'u trosglwyddir wedyn i'r awdurdodau angenrheidiol fel y cywirir unrhyw gamreoli a brofir. Yr ydym am i'n colegau addysg bellach gael eu rheoli mor effeithlon ag y bo modd. Weithiau mae hynny'n golygu gwneud penderfyniadau anodd ac weithiau ceir cwynion lawer ynghylch penderfyniadau o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, ni ellir ei gael bob ffordd. Naill ai

switch resources from one subject to another, or you have colleges that will cost a fortune and which become quite bloated because they do not have the guts to take tough decisions. We do not want that either.

Carl Sargeant: Do you agree that Deeside College should be given recognition for its role in widening access to the community by setting up an internet cafe on a bus and running other extra-curricular activities in deprived communities?

The First Minister: Indeed. I have visited the internet cafe, which I thought was a brilliant innovation. Any successful FE college will have a successful and vibrant core college and outreach establishments to try to reach people who have not previously considered what education could do for them, their life chances and their families. Deeside College has ensured a good balance in that regard.

ceir colegau a reolir yn effeithlon, sydd weithiau'n gwrthod galw neu'n trosglwyddo adnoddau o un pwnc i un arall, neu ceir golegau sy'n costio arian mawr ac sy'n mynd yn eithaf chwyddedig am nad oes ganddynt ddigon o blwc i wneud penderfyniadau anodd. Nid ydym am gael hynny ychwaith.

Carl Sargeant: A ydych yn cytuno y dylid cydnabod Coleg Glannau Dyfrdwy am y rhan y mae'n ei chwarae mewn ehangu mynediad i'r gymuned drwy sefydlu caffî rhyngwyd ar fws a rhedeg gweithgareddau allgyrsiol eraill mewn cymunedau difreintiedig?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn wir. Ymwelais â'r caffî rhyngwyd, a thybiais ei fod yn fenter wych. Mae pob coleg addysg bellach llwyddiannus yn meddu ar goleg canolog bywiog a llwyddiannus a sefydliadau allanol i geisio cyrraedd y rhai sydd heb ystyried cyn hynny yr hyn y gallai addysg ei wneud drostynt hwy, eu cyfleoedd bywyd a'u teuluoedd. Mae Coleg Glannau Dyfrdwy wedi sicrhau cydbwysedd da yn hynny o beth.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): There are no changes to this week's business. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents.

Following this morning's Business Committee meeting, the Deputy Presiding Officer has determined, under Standing Order No. 24.6, that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration: the Animal Gatherings (Wales) Order 2004; the Feeding Stuffs, the Feeding Stuffs (Sampling and Analysis) and the Feeding Stuffs (Enforcement) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004; the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004; the Conservation (Natural Habitats, &c.) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004; the Education (Pupil Exclusions and Appeals) (Miscellaneous Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2004; the Education Act 2002

Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Nid oes unrhyw newidiadau i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Mae busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad drafft, y gellir ei weld ar we'r Siambr o dan ddogfennau ategol.

Yn dilyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.6, nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau is-ddeddfwriaeth a ganlyn i bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach: Gorchymyn Crynadau Anifeiliaid (Cymru) 2004; Rheoliadau Porthiant, Porthiant (Samplu a Dadansoddi), a Phorthiant (Gorfodi) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004; Rheoliadau Deddf Bywyd Gwyllt a Chefn Gwlad 1981 (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004; Rheoliadau Cadwraeth (Cynefinoedd Naturiol, &c.) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004; Rheoliadau Addysg (Gwahardd Disgyblion ac Apelau) (Diwygiadau Amrywiol) (Cymru) 2004; Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2004; Rheoliadau Deddf Addysg 2002 (Darpariaethau

(Commencement No. 5) (Wales) Order 2004; the Education Act 2002 (Transitional Provisions and Consequential Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2004; the Education (School Teachers' Qualifications) (Wales) Regulations 2004; the Education (Specified Work and Registration) (Wales) Regulations 2004; the General Teaching Council for Wales (Functions) (Amendment) Regulations 2004; the School Teachers (Consequential Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2004; and the Housing (Right to Buy) (Priority of Charges) (Wales) Order 2004.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are at least 10, therefore I invite the Business Minister to formally propose the business statement.

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 5.4, I call one Member from each party to speak briefly in response to the motion.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Ni fyddwn yn gwrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes, er ein bod yn pryderu na chytunwyd i ganiatáu datganiad ar wasanaethau gynecolog yng Nghymru. Mae'n siŵr bod y Trefnydd wedi gweld yr erthygl yn *The Western Mail* heddiw am sefyllfa Carol Paraman, sy'n 50 oed ac yn fam i ddau o blant ifanc ac yn fam-gu. Bu'n disgwyl yn hir am driniaeth ac, yn yr erthygl, mae'n cymharu amseroedd aros yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Y gwahaniaeth rhwng y sefyllfa yng Nghymru a Lloegr yw sail ein pryder a'n cais am ddatganiad. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi ceisio ymateb i'r holl gwestiynau am y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru, ond ni fu iddo argyhoeddi neb yn y Siambr na thu allan iddi. Gŵyr pawb fod y sefyllfa'n waeth yn Nghymru nag yn Lloegr. Mae'r angen i wella'r gwasanaeth hwn yn cyfiawnhau datganiad ar y pwnc, a phwysaf ar y Trefnydd i newid ei meddwl. Cafodd Carol Paraman wybod y byddai'n rhaid iddi aros 18 mis am driniaeth ond, pe bai'n ystyried bod ei hachos yn argyfwng, y gellid

Trosiannol a Diwygiadau Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2004; Rheoliadau Addysg (Cymwysterau Athrawon Ysgol) (Cymru) 2004; Rheoliadau Addysg (Gwaith Penodedig a Chofrestru) (Cymru) 2004; Rheoliadau Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru (Swyddogaethau) (Diwygio) 2004; Rheoliadau Athrawon Ysgol (Diwygiadau Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2004; a Gorchymyn Tai (Hawl i Brynu) (Blaenoriaeth Arwystlon) (Cymru) 2004.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10, felly gwahoddaf y Trefnydd i gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4, galwaf un Aelod o bob plaid i siarad yn fyr mewn ymateb i'r cynnig.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: We will not oppose the business statement, although we are concerned that agreement has not been reached to make time available for a statement on gynaecology services in Wales. I am sure that the Business Minister will have seen the article in today's edition of *The Western Mail* about the situation facing Carol Paraman, a 50-year-old mother of two young children and a grandmother. She has been waiting a long time for treatment and, in the article, she draws attention to the difference between waiting times in England and Wales. It is this difference that gives rise to our concern and our request for a statement. The First Minister has tried to respond to a raft of questions relating to the health service in Wales, but has failed to convince anyone inside, or outside, the Chamber. Everyone knows that the situation is worse in Wales than in England. The need to improve services warrants a statement on this subject, and I impress upon the Minister to change her mind. Carol Paraman was informed that she

ei thrin yn gynt yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent. Gofynnaf i'r Trefnydd sut y disgwylir i fam i ddau o blant ifanc a mam-gu ddygymod â hyn. Onid oes hawl ganddi gael y driniaeth hon yn agos i'w chartref?

would have to wait 18 months for treatment but that if she considered herself to be an urgent case, she could be treated sooner at the Royal Gwent Hospital. I ask the Business Minister how a mother of two young children and a grandmother is expected to deal with such a situation. Is she not entitled to be treated close to her home?

Leighton Andrews: A gawn ni drafod statws cenedlaethol Cymru? Mae'n bwysig cael cyfle i drafod annibendod polisi annibyniaeth anobeithiol Plaid Cymru. Dyma a barodd i'r blaidd golli sawl sedd yn y Cymoedd wythnos diwethaf.

Leighton Andrews: May we please have a debate on the national status of Wales? It is important that we have an opportunity to discuss the shambolic mess that is Plaid Cymru's independence policy. This is what led to its losing a number of Valleys seats last week.

Independence was not the only reason why Plaid Cymru lost so many seats, including those of 25 councillors and five cabinet members in its so-called flagship council of Rhondda Cynon Taf. I am sure that the unpopularity of its council and its hopeless campaign contributed to this. The party will no doubt seek to drop its independence policy, therefore can we have a debate on the national status of Wales before it does so?

Nid annibyniaeth oedd yr unig reswm y colodd Plaid Cymru gynifer o seddau, gan gynnwys rhai 25 o gynghorwyr a phum aelod cabinet ar ei chyngor pwysicaf, fel y'i gelwid, sef Rhondda Cynon Taf. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod amhoblogrwydd ei chyngor a'i hymgyrch anobeithiol wedi cyfrannu at hynny. Mae'n siŵr y bydd y blaidd yn ceisio rhoi ei pholisi ar annibyniaeth o'r neilltu, felly a gawn ddadl ar statws cenedlaethol Cymru cyn iddi wneud hynny?

Jonathan Morgan: I requested this morning that time be given to the Minister for Health and Social Services to make a statement that would allow us to discuss making best use of capacity in English hospitals to treat patients who require cardiac surgery. This request comes in light of the report considered by Health Commission Wales at the beginning of the month. The report demonstrates that there is significant capacity in the English hospital sector and that it is, indeed, capable of treating more Welsh patients that we are currently willing to pay for. This is a serious concern that needs to be addressed. If the Government wants to resolve this problem, then it should put its money where its mouth is.

Jonathan Morgan: Gofynnais y bore yma am neilltuo amser i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol gael gwneud datganiad a ganiatâi inni drafod y modd i wneud y defnydd gorau o gapasiti mewn ysbytai yn Lloegr i drin cleifion y mae angen llawdriniaeth gardiaidd arnynt. Gwneir y cais hwn yng ngoleuni'r adroddiad a ystyriwyd gan Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru ddechrau'r mis. Dengys yr adroddiad fod digon o gapasiti yn y sector ysbytai yn Lloegr ac, yn wir, y gall drin mwy o gleifion o Gymru nag yr ydym yn barod i dalu amdanynt ar hyn o bryd. Mae hwn yn destun pryder dybryd y dylid ei drafod. Os yw'r Llywodraeth am ddatrys y broblem hon, dylai roi ei harian ar ei gair.

3.00 p.m.

It is clear, from reading this report, that English hospitals are capable of taking more patients than the Government is willing to pay for. You should consider scheduling time so that we can consider this report in Plenary and so that the Minister can explain why the

Mae'n amlwg, o ddarllen yr adroddiad hwn, y gall ysbytai yn Lloegr gymryd mwy o gleifion nag y mae'r Llywodraeth yn barod i dalu amdanynt. Dylech ystyried neilltuo amser fel y gallwn ystyried yr adroddiad hwn yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ac fel y gall y

Government is not prepared to invest more money in this to get people treated—many of these people, remember, require triple heart by-passes, which are complicated, life-saving operations. If we can get people treated quickly by paying for them to be treated in England, then the Minister should come here with a statement on this issue and explain the context of this report from Health Commission Wales, which is serious and has far-reaching implications.

Peter Black: On the further education sector in Wales, more than half the colleges are facing deficits: the latest news is that Neath Port Talbot College faces a £1 million deficit. The Secretary of State for Wales, in his capacity as the constituency MP, has called for an inquiry into that. Is it not time that we debated the future of the further education sector and how it is being funded and supported by this Government?

Karen Sinclair: Before I respond to individual requests, I emphasise that there are only four weeks left before the recess. There is a great deal of legislation that needs to be debated and the remainder of the scheduled business is of high importance. All Members should take note of that.

I do not intend to schedule time for the issue raised by Rhodri Glyn. Clearly, I cannot comment on individual cases, but the maximum waiting time for an out-patient appointment in Wales is 18 months. At the end of April 2004, only 27 people were waiting over 12 months for a first gynaecological out-patient appointment. The Minister for Health and Social Services has asked me to find time for a statement on the wider issue of women's services in the NHS. However, as I said, time is tight as there are only four weeks left before the recess.

On Leighton's point, regrettably time is tight and I will have difficulty scheduling new business.

I refer Jonathan to what I said at the beginning of my response. I do not intend to

Gweinidog egluro pam nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn barod i fuddsoddi mwy o arian yn hyn er mwyn trin y bobl hynny, o gofio bod ar lawer ohonynt angen llawfeddygaeth ddargyfeiriol driphlyg ar y galon, sy'n llawdriniaethau cymhleth sy'n achub bywydau. Os gallwn beri i bobl gael eu trin yn gyflym drwy dalu iddynt gael eu trin yn Lloegr, dylai'r Gweinidog ddod yma â datganiad ar y mater hwn ac egluro cyddestun yr adroddiad hwn gan Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru, sy'n un difrifol ac iddo oblygiadau pellgyrhaeddol.

Peter Black: Ynghylch y sector addysg bellach yng Nghymru, mae mwy na hanner y colegau'n wynebu diffyg: y newydd diweddaraf yw bod Coleg Castell-nedd Port Talbot yn wynebu diffyg o £1 filiwn. Mae Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, yn rhinwedd ei swydd fel yr AS dros yr etholaeth, wedi galw am ymchwiliad i hynny. Onid yw'n bryd inni gael dadl ar ddyfodol y sector addysg bellach a'r modd y caiff ei gyllido a'i gynnal gan y Llywodraeth hon?

Karen Sinclair: Cyn imi ymateb i geisiadau neilltuol, pwysleisïaf nad oes ond pedair wythnos yn weddill cyn y toriad. Mae llawer iawn o ddeddfwriaeth y mae'n rhaid cael dadl arni ac mae gweddill y busnes a amserlennwyd yn bwysig dros ben. Dylai'r holl Aelodau nodi hynny.

Ni fwriadaf neilltuo amser ar gyfer y mater a gododd Rhodri Glyn. Wrth gwrs, ni allaf wneud sylw am achosion penodol, ond yr amser aros hwyaf am apwyntiad fel claf allanol yng Nghymru yw 18 mis. Ar ddiwedd Ebrill 2004, dim ond 27 a oedd yn aros ers mwy na 12 mis am apwyntiad gynecolegol cyntaf fel claf allanol. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi gofyn imi ganfod amser ar gyfer datganiad ar y mater mwy cyffredinol o wasanaethau i fenywod yn y GIG. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, mae amser yn brin gan nad oes ond pedair wythnos ar ôl tan y toriad.

Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaeth Leighton, mae amser yn brin, gwaetha'r modd, ac fe'i caf yn anodd amserlennu busnes newydd.

Cyfeiriaf Jonathan at yr hyn a ddywedais ar ddechrau fy ymateb. Ni fwriadaf neilltuo

schedule time for this. We have been successful in reducing waiting times for cardiac surgery in Wales in recent years, largely due to targeted investment as part of our long-term strategy to increase capacity within Wales, rather than relying on spare capacity in England. The target of ensuring that no-one was waiting more than 10 months for surgery by the end of March this year was achieved. Health Commission Wales, which commissions this service, is now working with its partner trusts to achieve this year's target of ensuring that no-one has to wait more than eight months for treatment by the end of March 2005. That target is already being achieved in most of the cardiac centres that serve Wales, which is important; it is just a shame that Jonathan was not listening to my response.

On Peter Black's point, I will not schedule time to debate the FE sector, which was debated on 25 May in the Plaid-Cymru-nominated debate. There is no crisis in the FE sector. There has been more investment than ever under the Assembly Government, and provision has increased by 4.6 per cent for 2004-05. You might not like it, but that is a fact. Education and Learning Wales will come before the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee in July, when Members will have an opportunity to question the organisation. There is nothing to prevent you from attending that Committee meeting—*[Interruption.]*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I will not allow a discussion between Members of the opposition and the Business Minister.

Karen Sinclair: In the meantime, Members can question the Minister in the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee tomorrow and in questions to her in Plenary.

amser ar gyfer hyn. Yr ydym wedi llwyddo i ostwng yr amseroedd aros am lawdriniaethau cardiaidd yng Nghymru yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, a hynny'n bennaf drwy dargedu buddsoddiad fel rhan o'n strategaeth dymor hir i gynyddu capasiti yng Nghymru, yn hytrach na dibynnu ar gapasiti sydd dros ben yn Lloegr. Cyrhaeddwyd y targed o sicrhau na fyddai neb yn disgwyl yn hwy na 10 mis am lawdriniaeth erbyn diwedd Mawrth eleni. Mae Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru, sy'n comisiynu'r gwasanaeth hwn, yn gweithio'n awr gyda'r ymddiriedolaethau sy'n bartneriaid iddo i gyrraedd y targed ar gyfer eleni, sef na fydd neb yn gorfod yn disgwyl yn hwy nag wyth mis am driniaeth erbyn diwedd Mawrth 2005. Cyrhaeddir y targed hwnnw'n barod yn y rhan fwyaf o'r canolfannau cardiaidd sy'n gwasanaethu Cymru, ac mae hynny'n bwysig; mae'n drueni na wrandawodd Jonathan ar fy ymateb.

Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaeth Peter Black, ni neilltuaf amser i gael dadl ar y sector addysg bellach, y cafwyd dadl arno ar 25 Mai yn y ddadl a enwebwyd gan Blaid Cymru. Nid oes argyfwng yn y sector addysg bellach. Bu mwy o fuddsoddi nag erioed o dan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, a darperir 4.6 y cant yn fwy ar gyfer 2004-05. Efallai nad ydych yn hoffi hynny, ond mae'n ffaith. Daw Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru gerbron y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ym mis Gorffennaf, a chaiff Aelodau gyfle bryd hynny i holi'r corff hwnnw. Nid oes dim i'ch atal rhag dod i'r cyfarfod Pwyllgor hwnnw—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ni chaniatâf drafod rhwng Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau a'r Trefnydd.

Karen Sinclair: Yn y cyfamser, caiff Aelodau holi'r Gweinidog yn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yfory ac yn y cwestiynau iddi yn y Cyfarfod Llawn.

*Cynnig: O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 16.
Motion: For 36, Abstain 0, Against 16.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter

Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Alun Cairns: I raise this point of order under Standing Order No. 7, which relates to Members' conduct in the Chamber. I seek your guidance on the appropriate dress code for gentlemen Members in particular.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I thank Alun for giving me notice of this point of order, as we have been able to research it. The Presiding Officer has ruled that Members should appear in normal dress. He suggested that normal dress would include suits and ties for male Members, but I am aware that those standards of dress have not always been upheld. It is important that all Members should uphold the dignity of the Assembly as required by Standing Order No. 7. If I consider that somebody is not suitably dressed, they will not catch my eye and will

Alun Cairns: Codaf y pwynt o drefn hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7, sy'n ymwneud ag ymddygiad Aelodau yn y Siambr. Ceisiaf gyfarwyddyd gennych ynghylch y cod gwisgo priodol ar gyfer Aelodau o wŷr bonheddig yn benodol.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Diolchaf i Alun am roi rhybudd i mi am y pwynt o drefn hwn, gan ein bod wedi gallu ymchwilio iddo. Mae'r Llywydd wedi dyfarnu y dylai Aelodau fod mewn gwisg arferol. Awgrymodd y byddai gwisg arferol yn cynnwys siwt a thei yn achos Aelodau o ddynion, ond gwn na ddaliwyd at y safonau gwisg hynny bob amser. Mae'n bwysig i'r holl Aelodau gynnal urddas y Cynulliad yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7. Os barnaf fod rhywun heb wisgo'n briodol, ni chaiff dynnu fy sylw ac felly nis gelwir i siarad.

therefore not be called to speak.

Peter Law: Further to that point of order, I wondered whether suitable dress encompasses the Liberal Democrat group. We remember Mick Bates coming into the Chamber dressed as Father Christmas. Is that normal dress in the Liberal Democrat party?

Peter Law: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, yr oeddwn yn meddwl tybed a yw gwisg addas yn berthnasol i grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Cofiw'n Mick Bates yn dod i'r Siambr wedi'i wisgo fel Siôn Corn. Ai dyna wisg arferol plaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That matter has been dealt with and is now closed.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Deliwyd â'r mater hwnnw ac mae bellach ar ben.

Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:

a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 8 June 2004 on the draft regulations, the Natural Mineral Water, Spring Water and Bottled Drinking Water (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004; and

a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad mewn e-bost ar 8 Mehefin 2004, ar y Rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Dŵr Mwynol Naturiol, Dŵr Ffynnon a Dŵr Yfed wedi'i Botelu (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004, a

b) approves the Natural Mineral Water, Spring Water and Bottled Drinking Water (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:

b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Dŵr Mwynol Naturiol, Dŵr Ffynnon a Dŵr Yfed wedi'i Botelu (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â:

i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 25 May 2004;

i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Mai 2004;

ii) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 25 May 2004;

ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Mai 2004;

iii) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 8 June 2004; and

iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad mewn e-bost ar 8 Mehefin 2004;

iv) the transposition note laid in the Table Office on 26 May 2004. (NDM1990)

iv) y nodyn trosi a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Mai 2004. (NDM1990)

Cynnig (NDM1990): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM1990): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Ymddygiad Aelodau (Cod Ymddygiad Enghreifftiol)
(Cymru) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2004**
**Approval of the Conduct of Members (Model Code of Conduct) (Wales)
(Amendment) (No. 2) Order 2004**

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Conduct of Members (Model Code of Conduct) (Wales) (Amendment) (No. 2) Order 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 27 May 2004. (NDM1991)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 8 June 2004 in relation to the draft Order, the Conduct of Members (Model Code of Conduct) (Wales) (Amendment) (No. 2) Order 2004, and

2. approves that the Conduct of Members (Model Code of Conduct) (Wales) (Amendment) (No. 2) Order 2004 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 27 May 2004;

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 27 May 2004. (NDM1992)

The Local Government Act 2000 established a new ethical framework and code of conduct for local government members in England and Wales. That new framework is intended to replace similar provisions in the Local Government Act 1972 and the Local Government Housing Act 1989. However, while the UK Government has disappplied the previous code of conduct and related provisions in respect of local government in England and police authorities in England and Wales, they remain in force in relation to the remainder of local government in Wales. The Order rectifies that legislative anomaly by disapplying the previous national code of

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Ymddygiad Aelodau (Cod Ymddygiad Enghreifftiol) (Cymru) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2004, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mai 2004. (NDM1991)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad mewn e-bost ar 8 Mehefin 2004, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Ymddygiad Aelodau (Cod Ymddygiad Enghreifftiol) (Cymru) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2004, a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Ymddygiad Aelodau (Cod Ymddygiad Enghreifftiol) (Cymru) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2004, yn cael ei wneud yn unol â:

a) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mai 2004;

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mai 2004. (NDM1992)

Sefydlodd Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000 fframwaith moesegol a chod ymddygiad newydd ar gyfer aelodau llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Mae'r fframwaith newydd hwnnw i gymryd lle darpariaethau tebyg yn Neddf Llywodraeth Leol 1972 a Deddf Tai Llywodraeth Leol 1989. Er hynny, er bod Llywodraeth y DU wedi datgymhwyso'r cod ymddygiad blaenorol a'r darpariaethau sydd ynglŷn ag ef mewn cysylltiad â llywodraeth leol yn Lloegr ac awdurdodau heddlu yng Nghymru a Lloegr, maent yn dal i fod mewn grym mewn cysylltiad â gweddill llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru. Mae'r Gorchymyn yn cywiro'r

local government conduct and related declaration of interest provisions. The Legislation Committee considered the Order on 8 June and the legal adviser to the committee identified the need for certain minor drafting changes. Those amendments were agreed with the Legislation Committee as minor drafting errors capable of being dealt with by means of the memorandum of corrections, which has been circulated to Members.

Glyn Davies: Whenever we deal with issues concerning the ethical framework, we must be careful to strike a balance between the requirements as to conduct and what should be disclosed, and being unnecessarily onerous. Over recent years, many people who would have served on local authorities and who would have been good councillors have found the requirements unnecessarily onerous. As a result, many people simply did not put their names forward. It has always been our view that the code of conduct has been unnecessarily onerous, for community councils in particular. That remains our view.

3.10 p.m.

Michael German: The issue that I want to raise has nothing to do with the content of the legislation, but its timing. This piece of legislation and the one that we are debating next are crucially related—they both relate to declarations of office and what local government members, when they sign on in the next few days, will say in relation to the code of conduct. These measures were implemented in England some time ago but, in Wales, members of the councils that were elected last Thursday will now make declarations according to a code of conduct that will be altered in September. Will the wording of the model code of conduct, which we get in the next piece of legislation, mean that members will have to make a different declaration in September?

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I understand Glyn's point about community councils, and I have had long discussions on the matter. It is difficult to find codes in

anghysondeb hwnnw yn y ddeddfwriaeth drwy ddatgymhwyso'r cod cenedlaethol blaenorol ar ymddygiad mewn llywodraeth leol a'r darpariaethau ar gyfer datgan buddiant a oedd yn gysylltiedig ag ef. Gwnaeth y Pwyllgor Deddfau ystyried y Gorchymyn ar 8 Mehefin a chanfu cynghorydd cyfreithiol y pwyllgor fod angen rhai mân newidiadau yn y drafftio. Cytunwyd ar y newidiadau hynny gyda'r Pwyllgor Deddfau fel mân wallau drafftio y gellid ymdrin â hwy drwy'r memorandwm cywiriadau, a ddosbarthwyd i Aelodau.

Glyn Davies: Pryd bynnag y deliwn â materion sy'n ymwneud â'r fframwaith moesegol, rhaid inni ofalu dal y ddysgl yn wastad rhwng y gofynion o ran ymddygiad a'r hyn y dylid ei ddatgelu, a gosod rhwymedigaethau heb fod rhaid. Dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae llawer a fuasai wedi gwasanaethu ar awdurdodau lleol ac a fuasai'n gynghorwyr da wedi cael bod y gofynion yn ddiangen o feichus. O ganlyniad, bu llawer na roesant eu henwau ymlaen. Ein barn ni erioed yw bod y cod ymddygiad wedi bod yn ddiangen o feichus, i gynghorau cymuned yn enwedig. Dyna ein barn o hyd.

Michael German: Mae'r mater y dymunaf ei godi'n un nad yw'n ymwneud o gwbl â chynnwys y ddeddfwriaeth, ond â'i hamseriad. Mae cysylltiad annatod rhwng yr eitem ddeddfwriaeth hon a'r un y cawn dadl arni nesaf—mae'r ddwy'n ymwneud â datganiadau derbyn swydd a'r hyn a ddywed aelodau llywodraeth leol, pan gymerant eu lle yn y dyddiau nesaf, mewn cysylltiad â'r cod ymddygiad. Rhoddwyd y mesurau hyn ar waith yn Lloegr beth amser yn ôl ond, yng Nghymru, bydd aelodau'r cynghorau a etholwyd ddydd Iau diwethaf yn gwneud datganiadau'n awr yn unol â chod ymddygiad a gaiff ei newid ym mis Medi. A fydd geiriad y cod ymddygiad enghreifftiol, a gawn yn yr eitem ddeddfwriaeth nesaf, yn golygu y bydd yn rhaid i aelodau wneud datganiad gwahanol ym mis Medi?

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Yr wyf yn deall y pwynt a wnaeth Glyn am gynghorau cymuned, a chefais drafodaethau hir ar y mater. Anodd yw dod o hyd i godau y gall y

which the public can have confidence, without them being too onerous. I do not have information about the number of people who stood for community councils, but I will look at that. However, in the local government elections, we had record levels of candidates for the unitary authorities, or certainly an increase in the numbers of people coming through. I hope that that reassures you, and I will look again at how many people stood for the community and town councils. On Mike's point, it is my understanding that they will not have to sign it again, but we will discuss the form as part of the next regulation that we put through.

cyhoedd ymddiried ynddynt, heb iddynt fod yn rhy feichus. Nid oes gennyf wybodaeth am y nifer a safodd i'w hethol i gynghorau cymuned, ond ystyriaf hynny. Fodd bynnag, yn yr etholiadau llywodraeth leol, cawsom y niferoedd mwyaf erioed o ymgeiswyr ar gyfer yr awdurdodau unedol, neu gynnydd, yn sicr, yn y nifer a ddaeth drwodd. Gobeithiaf fod hynny'n tawelu'ch meddwl, ac ystyriaf eto y nifer a safodd i'w hethol i'r cynghorau tref a chymuned. Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaeth Mike, yr wyf yn deall na fyddant yn gorfod ei lofnodi eto, ond trafodwn y ffurf fel rhan o'r rheoliad nesaf a gyflwynwn.

*Cynnig (NDM1991): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 8.
Motion (NDM1991): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 8.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Williams, Brynle

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Cynnig (NDM1992): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 8.

Motion (NDM1992): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 8.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Williams, Brynle

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Etholiadau Lleol (Datganiad Derbyn Swydd) a
Ffurfiâu Cymraeg (Cymru) 2004
Approval of the Local Elections (Declaration of Acceptance of Office) and Welsh
Forms (Wales) Order 2004**

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Cynigiad

propose that

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Local Elections (Declaration of Acceptance of Office) and Welsh Forms (Wales) Order 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 27 May 2004. (NDM1993)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 8 June 2004 in relation to the draft Order, the Local Elections (Declaration of Acceptance of Office) and Welsh Forms (Wales) Order 2004, and

2. approves that the Local Elections (Declaration of Acceptance of Office) and Welsh Forms (Wales) Order 2004 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 27 May 2004;

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 27 May 2004;

c) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 8 June 2004. (NDM1994)

This Order prescribes a new form for the statutory declaration of acceptance of office by local government members. It replaces and consolidates the existing separate forms of declaration for principal and community councils, and removes the now inappropriate reference to the old national code of local government conduct.

Michael German: I will continue the point that I made in the last debate. Do the declarations that are currently being signed by the councillors who were elected last Thursday include references to the old code of conduct for local government? This piece of legislation will not come into force until 1 September, therefore, presumably, local

fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Etholiadau Lleol (Datganiad Derbyn Swydd) a Ffurfiâu Cymraeg (Cymru) 2004 y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mai 2004. (NDM1993)

Cynigiad fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad mewn e-bost ar 8 Mehefin 2004, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Etholiadau Lleol (Datganiad Derbyn Swydd) a Ffurfiâu Cymraeg (Cymru) 2004, a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Etholiadau Lleol (Datganiad Derbyn Swydd) a Ffurfiâu Cymraeg (Cymru) 2004, yn cael ei wneud yn unol â:

a) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mai 2004;

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mai 2004;

c) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad mewn e-bost ar 8 Mehefin 2004. (NDM1994)

Mae'r Gorchymyn hwn yn rhagnodi ffurf newydd ar gyfer y datganiad derbyn swydd statudol gan aelodau llywodraeth leol. Mae'n disodi ac yn cyfuno'r ffurfiâu gwahanol o ddatgan a geir ar hyn o bryd ar gyfer y prif gynghorau a chynghorau cymuned, ac mae'n dileu'r cyfeiriad, sy'n amhriodol bellach, at yr hen god cenedlaethol ar ymddygiad mewn llywodraeth leol.

Michael German: Parhaf â'r pwynt a wneuthum yn y ddadl ddiwethaf. A yw'r datganiadau a lofnodir yn awr gan y cynghorwyr a etholwyd ddydd Iau diwethaf yn cynnwys cyfeiriadau at yr hen god ymddygiad ar gyfer llywodraeth leol? Ni ddaw'r ddeddfwriaeth hon i rym tan 1 Medi, felly gellir cymryd bod swyddogion

government officers signing on councillors last Friday, Saturday and so on, did so using the terms of the old local government code of conduct. However, those members should be looking to the new code of conduct. This anomaly, and having this legislation so late that it cannot do the job for the new councils, is worrying. Will the Minister comment on how councils will be able to rectify that?

llywodraeth leol a gymerodd lofnodion cynghorwyr ddydd Gwener neu ddydd Sadwrn diwethaf, ac wedyn, wedi gwneud hynny gan ddilyn telerau'r hen god ymddygiad ar gyfer llywodraeth leol. Fodd bynnag, dylai'r aelodau hynny droi at y cod ymddygiad newydd. Mae'r anghysondeb hwn, a'r ffaith y cawn y ddeddfwriaeth hon mor hwyr fel na all ddarparu ar gyfer y cynghorau newydd, yn peri pryder. A wnaiff y Gweinidog sylw am y modd y bydd cynghorau'n gallu cywiro hynny?

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I have been given an assurance that, under the current form of the declaration, members elected on 10 June will be required to give an undertaking to observe the council's code of conduct adopted under the Local Government Act 2000. The new form will only apply to the declaration of members who take up office after 1 September.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Rhoddwyd sicrwydd i mi y bydd yn ofynnol, o dan ffurf bresennol y datganiad, i aelodau a etholwyd ar 10 Mehefin ymgymryd i ufuddhau i god ymddygiad y cyngor a fabwysiadwyd o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000. Ni fydd y ffurf newydd ond yn berthnasol i ddatganiad aelodau sy'n ymgymryd â'u swydd ar ôl 1 Medi.

*Cynnig (NDM1993): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1993): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1994): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1994): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri

Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i Reolau Sefydlog Approval of Changes to Standing Orders

Jenny Randerson: I propose that

the National Assembly, acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 37:

1. considers the report of the Business Committee e-mailed to Members and laid in the Table Office on 8 June; and

2. approves the amendments to Standing Orders set out in the report of the Business Committee. (NDM1989)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I see that no-one wishes to speak, so we will move straight to the vote. I remind Members that a two-thirds majority is required for the motion to be carried.

Jenny Randerson: Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan adran 46(6) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 37:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes a anfonwyd at yr Aelodau mewn e-bost ac a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Mehefin; a

2. yn cymeradwyo'r gwelliannau i'r Rheolau Sefydlog a nodwyd yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes. (NDM1989)

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Gwelaf nad oes neb yn dymuno siarad, felly awn yn syth at y bleidlais. Yr wyf yn atgoffa Aelodau bod angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair i dderbyn y cynnig.

Cynnig (NDM1989): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM1989): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Glyn
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael

Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru) Minority Party Debate (The Welsh Liberal Democrats)

Ynni Adnewyddadwy Renewable Energy

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

Mick Bates: I propose that

Mick Bates: Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales regrets the lack of leadership provided by the Government in achieving the Assembly's vision of sustainability and urges the Government to:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn gresynu at ddiffyg arweiniad y Llywodraeth mewn perthynas â chyflawni gweledigaeth y Cynulliad o ran cynaliadwyedd ac yn annog y Llywodraeth i:

a) integrate 'green energy' and home energy efficiency strategies;

a) integreiddio 'ynni gwyrdd' a strategaethau effeithlonrwydd ynni yn y cartref;

b) improve local government support mechanisms to facilitate councils in

b) gwella dulliau cymorth llywodraeth leol i hwyluso'r gwaith o ddarparu arweiniad

providing leadership across Wales by developing exemplar projects that reduce carbon emissions;

c) amend planning guidance to ensure the promotion of community renewable energy projects;

d) encourage developments which enable the Assembly Governments to meet its 4 TWh renewable energy target. (NDM1987)

It is often said that perception is more important than fact, and, in this at least, I congratulate our Labour Government on creating the perception that Wales is a world leader in sustainability. I present this debate to the Assembly in the knowledge that many practitioners and stakeholders in Wales find that that perception is not true. The rhetoric does not translate into reality when it comes to the implementation of many of our aims for the National Assembly for Wales.

*Daeth Peter Black i'r Gadair am 3.19 p.m.
Peter Black took the Chair at 3.19 p.m.*

Let us start by considering a few facts. In the previous Assembly, the Economic Development Committee undertook two groundbreaking reports on energy efficiency and renewable energy to stimulate and formulate policies that would make Wales a showcase for and world leader in renewable energy, which is an important aspect of sustainability. As a background to this, we had the White Paper on energy from Westminster, which set four clear objectives: a 60 per cent reduction in carbon emissions by 2050, and ensuring safe and secure supplies of energy, competitive energy markets and affordable warmth for all. These issues are directly related to the committee's report, and the first point of the motion draws attention to the lack of integration between the concept of green energy—in which we are supposed to be leading the world—and the delivery of home energy efficiency schemes, for example. This committee report had six recommendations, the first of which, in line with the Energy White Paper of 2003, was to reduce carbon emissions in Wales. Sadly, carbon emissions in Wales have increased rather than decreased.

ledled Cymru gan y cyngorau drwy ddatblygu prosiectau enghreifftiol sy'n lleihau gollyngiadau carbon;

c) diwygio canllawiau cynllunio er mwyn sicrhau bod prosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy cymunedol yn cael eu hyrwyddo;

d) annog datblygiadau sy'n galluogi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i fodloni ei darged ynni adnewyddadwy o 4 TWh. (NDM1987)

Dywedir yn aml fod canfyddiad yn bwysicach na ffaith ac, yn hynny o beth o leiaf, llongyfarchaf ein Llywodraeth Lafur ar greu'r canfyddiad bod Cymru'n arwain y byd ym maes cynaliadwyedd. Cyflwynaf y ddadl hon i'r Cynulliad gan wybod bod llawer o ymarferwyr a rhanddeiliaid yng Nghymru yn cael nad yw'r canfyddiad hwnnw'n wir. Ni wireddir y rhethreg wrth weithredu ar lawer o'n nodau ar gyfer Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

Gadewch inni ddechrau drwy ystyried ychydig ffeithiau. Yn y Cynulliad blaenorol, ymgymerodd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd â dau adroddiad arloesol ar effeithlonrwydd ynni ac ynni adnewyddadwy er mwyn symbylu a chreu polisiau a barai i Gymru fod yn ffenestr siop ac yn arweinydd drwy'r byd ym maes ynni adnewyddadwy, sy'n agwedd bwysig ar gynaliadwyedd. Yn gyd-destun i hyn, cawsom y Papur Gwyn ar ynni oddi wrth San Steffan, a nododd bedwar amcan pendant: 60 y cant o ostyngiad mewn gollyngiadau carbon erbyn 2050, a sicrhau cyflenwadau ynni diogel a dibynadwy, marchnadoedd ynni cystadleuol a chynhesrwydd fforddiadwy i bawb. Mae'r materion hyn yn ymwneud yn uniongyrchol ag adroddiad y pwyllgor, ac mae'r pwynt cyntaf yn y cynnig yn tynnu sylw at y diffyg integreiddio rhwng y cysyniad o ynni gwyrdd—y tybir ein bod yn arwain y byd arno—a darparu cynlluniau effeithlonrwydd ynni yn y cartref, er enghraifft. Yr oedd chwe argymhelliad yn yr adroddiad pwyllgor hwn, a'r cyntaf ohonynt, yn unol â'r Papur Gwyn ar Ynni yn 2003, oedd lleihau gollyngiadau carbon yng Nghymru. Gwaetha'r modd, cynyddu a wnaeth y gollyngiadau carbon yng

Nghymru yn hytrach na lleihau.

3.20 p.m.

The second recommendation in the fourth bullet point stated that, by 2010, we want to produce 4TWh from renewable energy. This was the most important and fundamental point of our policy, but the Government would only accept it as an aspiration, as, unlike the Scottish Executive, it had not provided the stimulation to grow the marketplace. A different approach is taken in Scotland, and major manufacturers move there. I am sure that some Members will be aware that our last major manufacturer in the renewable energy market of turbine towers left Wales and went to Scotland. How can we say that we are leaders when we allow the economic base for a future industry to disappear? There were lengthy discussions with that company, but they amounted to zero. Expectations were raised on many occasions, but there was no delivery.

The third recommendation was that the Welsh Assembly Government set an example in the use of green energy, and switches to green energy and to support the development of technologies to exploit local opportunities and unique resources. The major issue—and this will be developed by other speakers—is that of the use of structural funds. Despite representations from many Members, in laying the parameters for structural funds, the Government failed to ensure that it took the opportunity to stimulate the growth of our renewable energy industries. One might say that Friends of the Earth has done much more to stimulate the energy industries than a Government that supposedly has the power to do so.

On the fourth recommendation regarding embedded generation, some mechanisms exist to improve our grid supplies to cater for renewable energy producers, but there are still large gaps in Wales. Some windfarm proposals in mid Wales, for example, cannot go ahead because the grid cannot take their production.

Yr oedd yr ail argymhelliad yn y pedwerydd pwynt bwled yn datgan ein bod yn dymuno cynhyrchu 4 TWh o ynni adnewyddadwy erbyn 2010. Hwn oedd y pwynt pwysicaf a mwyaf sylfaenol yn ein polisi, ond ni wnâi'r Llywodraeth ond ei dderbyn fel dyhead, oherwydd, yn wahanol i Weithrediaeth yr Alban, nid oedd wedi rhoi anogaeth i hybu'r farchnad. Dilynir dull gweithredu gwahanol yn yr Alban, ac mae gweithgynhyrchwyr mawr yn symud yno. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd rhai Aelodau'n ymwybodol bod ein gweithgynhyrchydd mawr diwethaf ym marchnad ynni adnewyddadwy'r tyrau twrbin wedi gadael Cymru a mynd i'r Alban. Sut y gallwn honni ein bod yn arwain a ninnau'n caniatáu diflaniad sylfaen economaidd un o ddiwydiannau'r dyfodol? Bu trafodaethau hirfaith â'r cwmni hwnnw, ond daeth dim ohonynt. Codwyd gobeithion ar sawl achlysur, ond ni chyflawnwyd dim.

Y trydydd argymhelliad oedd y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru osod esiampl o ran defnyddio ynni gwyrdd, a throï at ynni gwyrdd a hybu datblygiad technolegau i fanteisio ar gyfleoedd lleol ac adnoddau unigryw. Y pwnc pwysicaf—ac fe'i datblygir gan siaradwyr eraill—yw'r defnydd o gronfeydd strwythurol. Er gwaethaf y sylwadau a gyflwynwyd gan sawl Aelod, wrth osod y paramedrau ar gyfer cronfeydd strwythurol, methodd y Llywodraeth â sicrhau ei bod yn achub ar y cyfle i symbylu twf ein diwydiannau ynni adnewyddadwy. Gellid dal bod Cyfeillion y Ddaear wedi gwneud llawer mwy i symbylu'r diwydiannau ynni nag a wnaeth Llywodraeth y tybir ei bod yn meddu ar bŵer i wneud hynny.

Ynghylch y pedwerydd argymhelliad sy'n ymwneud â defnyddio cynhyrchwyr dosbarthu lleol, ceir rhai moddau i wella ein cyflenwadau grid i ddarparu ar gyfer cynhyrchwyr ynni adnewyddadwy, ond mae bylchau mawr yng Nghymru o hyd. Mae rhai cynlluniau ar gyfer ffermydd gwynt yn y Canolbarth, er enghraifft, na allant fynd ymlaen gan nad yw'r grid yn gallu ymdopi â'u cynnyrch.

The fifth recommendation concerned planning procedures. Many Members will know the campaign that has been vigorously pursued to provide a more encouraging planning guideline for renewable energy. Last year, it was announced in 'A Living and Working Environment for Wales: the State of the Welsh Environment 2003' that the Government had published Technical Advice Note 8, a necessary planning guideline. However, it had not been published. I know that the Minister with responsibility for planning has said, on many occasions, that the report is on the way, but I believe that the draft TAN 8—and we should rejoice in this—will be published next month. I am sure that *The Western Mail* will carry a headline proclaiming that it is here at last. However, the downside to this is the loss of Cambrian Engineering to Scotland, as I have mentioned. How many other developers have decided that there is no encouragement in Wales to meet Government guidance or targets, and to, therefore, go where there is encouragement? That is why they end up in Scotland.

Recommendation 6 acknowledged that renewable energy is an economic sector with high growth potential. I hope that, in his response, the Minister will tell me and the rest of Wales how we marry that concept with the loss of a major manufacturer to Scotland. 'A Winning Wales' noted that the development of clean energy technologies in Wales will create a showcase of sustainable economic development. I am sorry to say that there is no showcase.

I will give you some more examples, Minister—let us see how you reply to these. These are groundbreaking but failed projects that could have come to Wales. First, a company proposed a major investment, and I introduced the developers to our Ministers and civil servants, to fund a groundbreaking energy project using waste to make biofuels. That company subsequently lost faith—there was no support from the Government—and it ended up building this plant with European money in Motherwell in Scotland. We lost the opportunity. Likewise, there was a proposal from BSW Sawmills in mid Wales

Yr oedd y pumed argymhelliad yn ymwneud â gweithdrefnau cynllunio. Gŵyr sawl Aelod am yr ymgyrch egniol a gafwyd i ddarparu canllaw cynllunio mwy cefnogol ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy. Y llynedd, datganwyd yn 'Amgylchedd Iach a Gweithredol i Gymru: Cyflwr Amgylchedd Cymru yn 2003' fod y Llywodraeth wedi cyhoeddi Nodyn Cyngor Technegol 8, sy'n ganllaw cynllunio angenrheidiol. Serch hynny, nid oedd wedi'i gyhoeddi. Gwn fod y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros gynllunio wedi dweud, ar sawl achlysur, fod yr adroddiad ar ei ffordd, ond credaf fod y nodyn cyngor technegol 8 drafft—a dylem lawenhau am hynny—i'w gyhoeddi y mis nesaf. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd pennawd yn *The Western Mail* yn datgan ei fod wedi cyrraedd o'r diwedd. Fodd bynnag, yr agwedd annymunol ar hynny yw y collwyd Cambrian Engineering i'r Alban, fel y dywedais. Pa sawl datblygwr arall a benderfynodd nad oes anogaeth yng Nghymru i ddilyn canllawiau'r Llywodraeth neu gyrraedd ei thargedau, a mynd yn lle hynny, felly, i rywle y ceir anogaeth? Dyna pam yr ânt i'r Alban.

Yr oedd argymhelliad 6 yn cydnabod bod ynni adnewyddadwy'n sector economaidd sydd â photensial mawr i dyfu. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog, yn ei ymateb, yn dweud wrthyf fi a gweddill pobl Cymru sut y cysonwn y cysyniad hwnnw â cholli gweithgynhyrchydd mawr i'r Alban. Nododd 'Cymru'n Ennill' y bydd datblygu technolegau ynni glân yng Nghymru'n creu ffenestr siop ar gyfer datblygu economaidd cynaliadwy. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf ddweud nad oes ffenestr siop o'r fath.

Rhoddaf ragor o enghreifftiau i chi, Weinidog—cawn weld sut yr ymatebwch i'r rhain. Prosiectau arloesol ond aflwyddiannus yw'r rhain a allasai ddod i Gymru. Yn gyntaf, gwnaeth cwmni gynnig buddsoddiad mawr, a chyflwynais y datblygwyr i'n Gweinidogion a'n gweision sifil, i gyllido prosiect ynni arloesol i ddefnyddio gwastraff i wneud tanwyddau biolegol. Gwnaeth y cwmni hwnnw golli ffydd wedyn—ni chafwyd cefnogaeth gan y Llywodraeth, ac yn y diwedd cododd ei waith gan ddefnyddio arian Ewropeaidd yn Motherwell yn yr Alban. Collasom gyfle. Yn yr un modd, cafwyd

to build a power station using wood waste, next to a sawmill. That would have been a major economic development for renewable energy, which was not undertaken because of insufficient support in the planning system, which would have enabled a 16 MW power station to be built in mid Wales.

There are many other issues, such as tidal lagoons. Because of the leadership's showcase of empty rhetoric on taking forward sustainable development through sustainable energy projects, such as tidal lagoons, people have come to the Assembly to ask where they are. Again, a developer has walked away. For years we heard of the Severn barrage, which has one of the biggest tidal ranges but, as yet, the Government has made no real announcement on whether or not such a major project is acceptable. Wales still has large areas of upland with ideal wind speed of 6m a second, and we could have the potential to produce 20 per cent of our electricity from wind. On biomass, I will give praise where it is due—the wood energy grants are good. I give that a little plug and praise those who developed the scheme. I am sure that biomass will be an important part of the renewable energy portfolio in Wales.

Can the Assembly achieve its targets? I am sure that the Minister will say that he aims to make all this happen. We have had five years since the Assembly was established and I admit that we were part of the Government then, in a coalition, and I hope that our influence, particularly on biomass, was good, as well as our influence to try to get more positive planning procedures for renewable energy. However, it sounds like such a short timescale. I am sure that the Minister will say, 'Be patient, Mick, hang on, we are doing our best in this field'. It is great to be patient to some extent, but is it possible to move from our low base of renewable energy to a high base, and could we consider producing 100 per cent from renewable sources? The Government's waste strategy, whereby local authority funding is ring-fenced, could be a model mechanism.

cynnig gan BSW Sawmills yn y Canolbarth i godi gorsaf drydan i ddefnyddio gwastraff coed, gerllaw melin lifio. Buasai hwnnw'n ddatblygiad economaidd mawr ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy, nas cyflawnwyd am na chafwyd digon o gefnogaeth yn y system gynllunio, a fyddai wedi hwyluso codi gorsaf drydan 16 MW yn y Canolbarth.

Mae sawl mater arall, fel morlynnoedd llanw. Oherwydd rhethreg wag yr arweinwyr ynghylch hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy drwy brosiectau ynni cynaliadwy, fel morlynnoedd llanw, mae rhai wedi dod i'r Cynulliad gan ofyn ym mhle y maent. Unwaith eto, mae datblygwr wedi troi ei gefn. Am flynyddoedd, clywsom am forglawdd Hafren, afon sydd ag un o'r amrediadau llanw mwyaf, ond, hyd yma, ni wnaeth y Llywodraeth unrhyw gyhoeddiad iawn ynghylch a yw prosiect mor fawr yn dderbyniol. Ceir ardaloedd helaeth yn ucheldir Cymru lle y mae cyflymder gwynt delfrydol o 6 medr yr eiliad, a gallem gynhyrchu 20 y cant o'n trydan o'r gwynt. Ynghylch biomas, rhoddaf glod ddyledus—mae'r grantiau ar gyfer ynni coed yn dda. Rhoddaf ychydig o sylw i hynny a chanmol y rhai a ddatblygodd y cynllun. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd biomas yn rhan bwysig o'r portffolio ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru.

A all y Cynulliad gyrraedd ei dargedau? Yr wyf yn siŵr y dywed y Gweinidog ei fod yn bwriadu peri i hyn oll ddigwydd. Mae pum mlynedd ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad ac yr wyf yn cyfaddef inni fod yn rhan o'r Llywodraeth bryd hynny, a gobeithiaf inni gael dylanwad da, yn enwedig ynghylch biomas, yn ogystal ag wrth geisio sicrhau gweithdrefnau cynllunio mwy cadarnhaol ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ymddangos yn gyfnod mor fyr. Yr wyf yn siŵr y dywed y Gweinidog, 'Byddwch yn amyneddgar, Mick, daliwch arni, yr ydym yn gwneud ein gorau yn y maes hwn'. Peth gwych yw amynedd i ryw raddau, ond a oes modd symud oddi wrth ein sylfaen isel o ynni adnewyddadwy at un uchel, ac ystyried cynhyrchu popeth o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy? Mae strategaeth y Llywodraeth ar wastraff, lle clustnodir cyllid ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol, yn ddull gweithredu y gellid ei ddilyn.

Is it possible to address all these issues? Some of you will have attended, and will attend, a cross-party group, the National Assembly sustainable energy group, which has had speakers from all parts of Europe attend meetings, particularly from upper Austria. In upper Austria, there was clear leadership about what they wanted to achieve. There was the political leadership to achieve 100 per cent of energy production from renewable energy sources. It is a classic sustainable principle that upper Austria wanted all the manufacturing to be undertaken in that area. The population of upper Austria is only 1.4 million but, within five years, it saw a 30 per cent increase in renewable energy and a 33 per cent decrease in energy consumption, which is even better. It offered low interest rate loans to ensure that, when people renovated their houses, they took into account the house's energy efficiency. Under those grants, there was a 64 per cent reduction in energy use. There was even a 2 per cent decrease in industrial energy use. That took five years. It has 13,000 boilers working on wood waste and 0.5 million sq m of solar panels. The reason for that is that it has a proactive energy agency. To quote Gerhard Dell, director of the regional energy agency, 'information to develop public awareness is essential'. Where is the Government's answer and where is its promotional scheme?

3.30 p.m.

Peter Black: Order. You have spoken for over 12 and a half minutes. You must draw your speech to a close.

Mick Bates: I will finish my speech now.

In order to gain that leadership, we should perhaps follow the example of the brightest star in Wales, namely the Mid Wales Energy Agency. I urge everyone to consider that model of advice and delivery so that we can truly become an environmental showcase for and a leader in sustainability.

Elin Jones: Cynigiad welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd, ar ôl pwynt d):

A oes modd ymdrin â'r holl faterion hyn? Bu rhai ohonoch yng nghyfarfodydd y grŵp trawsbleidiol, grŵp ynni cynaliadwy'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, a byddwch ynddynt eto yn y dyfodol, lle bu siaradwyr o bob rhan o Ewrop, yn enwedig Awstria uchaf. Yn Awstria uchaf, rhoddwyd arweiniad clir ynghylch yr hyn yr oeddent am ei gyflawni. Rhoddwyd digon o arweiniad gwleidyddol fel y bu modd cynhyrchu'r cwbl o'u hynni o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy. Un o egwyddorion clasurol cynaliadwyedd oedd bod Awstria uchaf am i'r holl weithgynhyrchu gael ei wneud yn yr ardal honno. Dim ond 1.4 miliwn yw poblogaeth Awstria uchaf ond, o fewn pum mlynedd, cafwyd 30 y cant yn fwy o ynni adnewyddadwy a 33 y cant yn llai o ddefnydd ar ynni, sy'n well byth. Cynigiodd fenthyciadau ar log isel i sicrhau y byddai pobl yn ystyried effeithlonrwydd ynni eu tai wrth eu hadnewyddu. Cafwyd gostyngiad o 2 y cant yn y defnydd o ynni gan ddiwydiant, hyd yn oed. Cymerodd hynny bum mlynedd. Mae yno 13,000 o foeleri sy'n llosgi gwastraff coed a 0.5 miliwn o fedrau sgwâr o baneli ynni'r haul. Y rheswm am hynny yw bod ganddi asiantaeth ynni ragweithiol. Dywedodd Gerhard Dell, cyfarwyddwr yr asiantaeth ynni ranbarthol, bod gwybodaeth sy'n hybu ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd yn hollbwysig. Ym mhle y mae ateb y Llywodraeth ac ym mhle y mae ei chynllun hyrwyddo?

Peter Black: Trefn. Yr ydych wedi siarad am fwy na 12 munud a hanner. Rhaid ichi derfynu.

Mick Bates: Terfynaf fy araith yn awr.

Er mwyn cael yr arweiniad hwnnw, efallai y dylem ddilyn esiampl y seren ddisgleiriaf yng Nghymru, sef Asiantaeth Ynni Canolbarth Cymru. Anogaf bawb i ystyried y patrwm hwnnw o gynghori a gweithredu fel y gallwn ddod yn ffenestr siop amgylcheddol ar gyfer cynaliadwyedd ac arwain yn y maes hwnnw.

Elin Jones: I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as a new point, after point d):

ailldatgan galwad y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol am drosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb am brosiectau ynni mawr o'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

reaffirm the National Assembly's call for the transfer of responsibility for large-scale energy projects from the Department of Trade and Industry to the National Assembly.

Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am gyflwyno'r ddadl hon ac i Mick Bates am agor y ddadl. Yr oeddwn yn cytuno â'r rhan fwyaf o'r pwyntiau a wnaeth yn ei araith faith. Er inni gyflwyno gwelliant i'r ddadl, byddwn yn cefnogi'r cynnig heddiw.

I wish to thank the Liberal Democrats for tabling this debate and Mick Bates for opening the debate. I agreed with most of the points made in his lengthy speech. Although we tabled an amendment to the debate, we will support the motion today.

Fel y dywedodd Mick, trafodwyd y pwnc hwn yn helaeth yn ystod y Cynulliad cyntaf, a chyhoeddodd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ar y pryd ddau adroddiad swmpus ac arwyddocaol ar ynni adnewyddadwy ac effeithlonrwydd ynni. Er hynny, ni chredaf i'r Cynulliad gael yr effaith sylweddol na weladwy y gellid bod wedi ei chael yn y maes hwn yn ystod y pum mlynedd ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Mae hwn yn faes pwysig sy'n gwneud cyfraniad positif i'r amgylchedd, a gellir ei gyplysu hefyd â buddiannau economaidd sylweddol. Dyna pam mae dau fesur ar ynni ac ynni adnewyddadwy o fewn rhaglen Amcan 1. Fodd bynnag, bu'r gwariant a'r ymrwymiad ariannol o ran y ddau fesur hwnnw yn ddifrifol wael yn ystod y tair neu bedair blynedd diwethaf. Dim ond rhyw 17 y cant o'r arian ar gyfer ynni glan o dan flaenoriaeth 2 a ymrwymwyd hyd yn hyn a dim ond 6 y cant o'r arian ar gyfer isadeiledd ynni a ymrwymwyd o dan flaenoriaeth 6. Felly, er yr holl eiriau da a glywyd yn y Cynulliad a thu hwnt o ran cefnogaeth y Llywodraeth ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy ac effeithlonrwydd ynni, ni fu'r gweithredu yn ddigon rhagweithiol. O ran cynllunio, bu arweiniad y Cynulliad yn amlwg yn ei absenoldeb. Er yr holl addewidion, ni chafwyd nodyn cyngor technegol diwygiedig ar gynllunio ac ynni adnewyddadwy hyd yn hyn. Mae angen arweiniad cenedlaethol ar bwnc mor ddadleuol a dyrys â hwn sy'n parchu hawl cymunedau i benderfynu'n derfynol ar geisiadau unigol. Mae angen nodyn cyngor technegol 8, fel y soniodd Mick, ac mae angen i'r cynllun gofodol roi arweiniad o ran clustnodi ardaloedd penodol yng Nghymru ar gyfer cynllunio ynni adnewyddadwy.

As Mick said, this subject was discussed at great length during the first Assembly, and the Economic Development Committee at the time published two lengthy and significant reports on renewable energy and energy efficiency. However, I do not believe that the Assembly, in the five years since its inception, has made the significant and visible impact that one might have expected. This is an important issue that makes a positive contribution to the environment and it can also be linked to significant economic benefits. That is why there are two measures within the Objective 1 programme on energy and renewable energy. However, expenditure and financial commitment in those two measures have been extremely disappointing during the last three or four years. Only around 17 per cent of funding for clean energy under priority 2 has been committed and only 6 per cent of the funding for energy infrastructure under priority 6. Therefore, despite the fine words that we have heard in the Assembly, inside and outside, on the Government's support for renewable energy and energy efficiency, the steps taken have not been sufficiently proactive. In terms of planning, the Assembly's guidance has been notable by its absence. Despite all the promises, we have not yet had a revised technical advice note on planning and renewable energy. Such a contentious and complex issue requires national guidance which respects the right of communities to make the final decision on individual applications. Technical advice note 8 is needed, as Mick mentioned, and the spatial plan must give guidance on earmarking specific areas in Wales for renewable energy planning.

Mae gwelliant Plaid Cymru yn chwilio am gadarnhad gan y Cynulliad ei fod am weld trosglwyddo'r pŵer dros ddatblygiadau ynni dros 50 MW o San Steffan i'r Cynulliad. Gobeithiaf y gall y Gweinidog gadarnhau amserlen bendant ar gyfer y trosglwyddo hwnnw. Gwyddom fod Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, Peter Hain, wedi beirniadu arafwch llunio cynlluniau ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru rhyw 18 mis yn ôl. Gobeithiaf nad arweiniodd hynny at arafu trosglwyddo'r pŵer hwnnw o San Steffan. Edrychaf ymlaen i glywed ymateb y Gweinidog i'r gwelliant.

Plaid Cymru's amendment looks for confirmation from the Assembly that it wants the responsibility for energy developments of over 50 MW to be transferred from Westminster to the Assembly. I hope that the Minister can confirm a definite timetable for that transfer. We know that the Secretary of State for Wales, Peter Hain, criticised the delay in drafting renewable energy plans in Wales some 18 months ago. I hope that that has not led to a delay in the transfer of that power from Westminster. I look forward to the Minister's response to the amendment.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.34 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.34 p.m.*

Mae pwyntiau pwysig yng nghynnig y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol: er enghraifft, pwysigrwydd gwella effeithlonrwydd ynni mewn adeiladau presennol a rhai newydd a'r angen i lywodraeth leol gymryd rôl arweiniol o ran cynlluniau lleol, boed hwynt yn rhai ar ynni adnewyddadwy, ailgylchu neu effeithlonrwydd ynni. Mae ewyllys da ymysg y boblogaeth gyfan a phleidiau gwleidyddol y Cynulliad ynghylch y mater hwn, ond mae angen i'r Llywodraeth gymryd mantais o'r ewyllys da hwnnw a'r argymhellion cadarnhaol a gafwyd yn nau adroddiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth ar ynni adnewyddadwy ac effeithlonrwydd ynni yn ystod y 18 mis diwethaf. Mae'n rhaid i'r Llywodraeth weithredu yn awr ar yr adroddiadau hynny.

There are important points in the Liberal Democrats' motion: for example, the importance of improving energy efficiency in new and existing buildings and the need for local government to take a lead role in terms of local plans, whether those plans are on renewable energy, recycling or energy efficiency. There is goodwill among the whole population and the Assembly's political parties in relation to this issue, but the Government needs to take advantage of that goodwill and the positive recommendations included in the two Economic Development and Transport Committee reports on renewable energy and energy efficiency during the last 18 months. The Government must now act on those reports.

Jenny Randerson: Last July, we debated in Plenary the Economic Development and Transport Committee's review of energy policy. In preparation for this afternoon, I re-read the debate, during which I had expressed frustration at the slow pace of change. I raised the need for the publication of TAN 8 and the need for more grants for small and medium-sized enterprises to ensure that we translate research into commercial exploitation. I also raised the lack of financial incentives for homeowners to insulate their homes. Only those on benefit qualify for grants, and it is often the case that those living just above the benefit line find it impossible to finance installing insulation. If they were to receive grants, we would achieve a double whammy—we would

Jenny Randerson: Fis Gorffennaf diwethaf, cawsom ddadl yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar adolygiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth o bolisi ynni. Wrth baratoi ar gyfer y prynhawn yma, ailddarllenais y ddadl, ac yr oeddwn wedi mynegi rhwystredigaeth ynghylch arafwch y newid. Cyfeiriais at yr angen i gyhoeddi nodyn cyngor technegol 8 a'r angen am fwy o grantiau i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint i sicrhau y byddwn yn manteisio'n fasnachol ar ymchwil. Cyfeiriais hefyd at y diffyg anogaeth ariannol i berchnogion tai insiwleiddio eu cartrefi. Dim ond y rhai sy'n derbyn budd-daliadau sy'n gymwys i gael grantiau, ac mae'n digwydd yn aml mai'r rhai sy'n byw ychydig uwchlaw'r llinell budd-daliadau sy'n ei chael yn amhosibl talu am insiwleiddio. Pe caent

reduce fuel poverty and consumption, and contribute to a reduction in carbon emissions.

Eleven months on, there has been no apparent progress on any of these issues. Incredibly, we are still waiting for TAN 8, and there has been no progress on the other issues I raised. I have referred on several occasions to biomass. This is a well-known technology that has been well developed in other parts of Europe and the world. Although there are plenty of pilot and research projects in Wales, there is no way of effectively translating these into community projects on a grand scale. It has proved possible elsewhere, but we cannot seem to do it here. We appear to have a risk-averse culture. Biomass is new to us, unlike the rest of the world, and we find it difficult to accept that we could take on something new. Eleven months ago, I also referred to the plethora of energy advice agencies and to the need for a one-stop-shop approach to simplify the process of providing advice. There has not been any progress on this either.

Therefore, the gap between rhetoric and reality remains. The rhetoric is fine and we all sign up to it. A few weeks ago, I held a joint surgery with the Energy Saving Trust. As part of the process, people were asked to complete a simple questionnaire in order to provide an energy audit of their homes. I was struck by how little most of the people knew about saving energy, despite being interested in the topic. They knew little about insulation and the energy efficiency of electrical appliances, and there was almost total ignorance of the availability of grants. There is a massive public education campaign to be undertaken, on which the Assembly should take a strategic lead. The Labour Assembly Government should provide support, guidance and funding streams to ensure that local authorities and ASPBs can deliver the ideals.

I turn to the record of Welsh local government, particularly on recycling. Our local authorities will be seriously challenged to achieve the target set by the partnership Government of recycling 40 per cent of all waste by 2010. I recall that Cardiff's former

grantiau, cyflawnem ddwy nod—byddem yn lleihau tloedi tanwydd a'r defnydd o danwydd, ac yn cyfrannu at leihau gollyngiadau carbon.

Ac 11 mis wedi mynd heibio, ni chafwyd unrhyw gynnydd amlwg ar yr un o'r materion hynny. Peth anhygoel yw ein bod yn dal i ddisgwyl am nodyn cyngor technegol 8, ac na fu cynnydd ar y materion eraill a godais. Yr wyf wedi cyfeirio ar sawl achlysur at bio-màs. Technoleg adnabyddus yw hon sydd wedi'i datblygu'n helaeth mewn rhannau eraill o Ewrop a'r byd. Er bod digon o brosiectau peilot ac ymchwil yng Nghymru, nid oes unrhyw fodd effeithiol i'w troi'n brosiectau cymunedol ar raddfa fawr. Cafwyd ei bod yn bosibl mewn mannau eraill, ond ymddengys na allwn wneud hynny yma. Ymddengys nad ydym yn hoff o fentro. Mae bio-màs yn beth newydd i ni, yn wahanol i weddill y byd, ac fe'i cawn yn anodd derbyn y gallem ymgymryd â rhywbeth newydd. Un mis ar ddeg yn ôl, cyfeiriais hefyd at y gormodedd o asiantaethau cynghori ar ynni a'r angen am siop un stop i symleiddio'r broses cynghori. Ni fu unrhyw gynnydd ar hynny ychwaith.

Gan hynny, mae bwlch o hyd rhwng y rhethreg a'r realiti. Mae'r rhethreg yn iawn ac yr ydym oll yn cyd-fynd â hi. Ychydig wythnosau'n ôl, cynheliais gymhorthfa ar y cyd â'r Ymddiriedolaeth Arbed Ynni. Fel rhan o'r broses, gofynnwyd i bobl gwblhau holiadur syml er mwyn gwneud archwiliad ynni o'u cartrefi. Fe'm trawyd o weld cyn lleied y gwyddai'r rhan fwyaf am arbed ynni, er eu bod yn ymddiddori yn y pwnc. Ychydig a wyddent am insiwleiddio ac effeithlonrwydd ynni cyfarpar trydanol, ac yr oedd anwybodaeth lwyr bron am y grantiau a oedd ar gael. Rhaid ymgymryd ag ymgyrch addysg gyhoeddus enfawr, a dylai'r Cynulliad roi arweiniad strategol ynddi. Dylai Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad gynnig cymorth, cyfarwyddyd a ffrydiau cyllido i sicrhau y gall awdurdodau lleol a CCNC wireddu'r delfrydau.

Trof at record llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru, ar ailgylchu'n benodol. Bydd ein hawdurdodau lleol yn ei chael yn anodd iawn cyrraedd y targed a osodwyd gan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth o ailgylchu 40 y cant o'r holl wastraff erbyn 2010. Cofiaf fod

city council, under the leadership of Sue Essex, proudly used the title 'recycling city'. Plans for an anaerobic digester were well advanced. Then came the new unitary authority and the Goodway era. The new Labour leadership jettisoned most of the environmental initiatives planned by the city council, including much of the recycling programme. Cardiff slid down the recycling league table to a position that we should be ashamed for our capital city to be in.

We are at the start of another new era in Cardiff, and I do not know whether it is the Liberal Democrats or the Labour Assembly Government who are most grateful for this. The Welsh Liberal Democrats, as the party with most seats on the new council, are intent on change. We believe that we must extend kerbside recycling to all households, provide green bags free of charge to everyone, introduce free pilot schemes for the segregation of recyclable materials—if they are recycled, they are worth much more when sold—make more recycling facilities available in schools, universities, halls of residence and in the city centre, and aim not just to achieve the Government's targets, but to exceed them.

3.40 p.m.

None of this is new stuff; none of it is intrinsically difficult—it is all done elsewhere and it has been done for decades by the Liberal-Democrat-controlled London Borough of Sutton. We are not talking about complex or groundbreaking measures, but measures that will make a decent contribution towards saving our planet, if they are done throughout Wales.

Local authorities should be more positively led by the Assembly. They should not be allowed to sit back complacently, waiting for 2010, when they will not be able to achieve the targets.

Glyn Davies: I declare an interest in that I own land that is the subject of some interest

cyngor blaenorol dinas Caerdydd, o dan arweinyddiaeth Sue Essex, yn ymfalchïo yn ei ddefnydd o deitl 'y ddinas sy'n ailgylchu'. Yr oedd cynlluniau ar gyfer treulydd anerobig yn mynd rhagddynt yn dda. Wedyn y daeth yr awdurdod unedol newydd ac oes Goodway. Taflodd yr arweinwyr Llafur newydd rhan fwyaf o'r mentrau amgylcheddol yr oedd cyngor y ddinas wedi'u cynllunio o'r neilltu, gan gynnwys llawer o'r rhaglen ailgylchu. Dirywio a wnaeth statws Caerdydd o ran ailgylchu i'r fath raddau fel y dylem gywilyddio dros ein prifddinas.

Yr ydym ar drothwy oes newydd arall yng Nghaerdydd, ac ni wn ai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ynteu Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad sy'n fwyaf diolchgar am hynny. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, fel y blaidd a chanddi'r nifer mwyaf o seddau ar y cyngor newydd, â'u bryd ar newid. Credwn fod rhaid inni ymestyn ailgylchu ar ochr y ffordd i gynnwys pob cartref, darparu bagiau gwyrdd yn rhad ac am ddim i bawb, cyflwyno cynlluniau peilot am ddim i wahanu deunyddiau ailgylchadwy—os ailgylchir hwy, maent yn werth mwy o lawer wrth eu gwerthu—darparu mwy o gyfleusterau ailgylchu mewn ysgolion, prifysgolion, neuaddau preswyl ac yng nghanol y ddinas, ac nid yn unig cyrraedd targedau'r Llywodraeth, ond rhagori arnynt.

Nid oes dim sy'n newydd yn hyn; nid oes dim sy'n anodd ynddo'i hun—gwneir hyn oll mewn mannau eraill ac fe'i gwnaed ers degawdau gan Fwrdeistref Sutton yn Llundain sy'n cael ei rheoli gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Nid ydym yn sôn am fesurau cymhleth neu arloesol, ond mesurau a wnaiff gyfraniad derbynol tuag at achub ein planed, os ymgwymerir â hwy ledled Cymru.

Dylai awdurdodau lleol gael arweiniad mwy cadarnhaol gan y Cynulliad. Ni ddylid caniatáu iddynt eistedd yn ddifater, wrth ddisgwyl am 2010, pan na fyddant yn gallu cyrraedd y targedau.

Glyn Davies: Datganaf fuddiant gan fy mod yn berchen ar dir y mae cwmni datblygu ynni

from a wind power development company.

I support this motion. Mick Bates, when speaking on this subject—perhaps this subject alone—does so with sense and authority. I also support Plaid Cymru's amendment 1, the subject of which has long been a policy of the Conservative group. The current position is entirely illogical and it encourages developers to increase the size of their proposals simply in order to bypass the planning system, which has been notoriously slow.

As I was speaking on an environmental issue today, I decided to put myself in the mood by taking one of my first bus journeys since I joined a rugby bus tour around 30 years ago. It is incredible and something that all of us must do. We should start to think about our lifestyles. That was a small issue for me, but it matters. It is every bit as convenient to use a bus as a taxi, and that never occurred to me until this morning. By bringing forward this debate, the Liberal Democrats have made a difference to Cardiff's environment.

There is cross-party support for all proposals that protect and enhance the environment. There is great concern about this throughout the Assembly. Sustainable development and renewable energy issues attract the support of all parties. The motion refers to the Government's failure, and it is right to do so. We will support the motion because the Government's targets have not been achieved. The Minister may argue that some of them were unachievable and ambitious—as were the national economic development strategy targets—but unachievable targets suddenly become an objective.

One target is a 20 per cent reduction in carbon dioxide emissions by 2010. All the current indications are that not only will the target not be achieved, but the level of emissions will not change at all by 2010. In fact, the Government has achieved little in terms of renewable energy, except for windfarm development. That is a concern, because windfarm developments are controversial—a fact of which I am very

gwynt yn mynegi cryn ddiddordeb ynddo.

Cefnogaf y cynnig hwn. Mae Mick Bates, wrth siarad ar y pwnc hwn—ac ar y pwnc hwn yn unig o bosibl—yn gwneud hynny'n synhwyrol ac yn awdurdodol. Yr wyf hefyd yn cefnogi gwelliant 1 o eiddo Plaid Cymru, y mae ei destun yn bolisi gan grŵp y Ceidwadwyr ers talwm. Mae'r sefyllfa bresennol yn gwbl afresymegol ac mae'n cymhell datblygwyr i gynnig cynlluniau mwy dim ond er mwyn osgoi'r system gynllunio, a fu'n ddjarhebol o araf.

Gan fy mod yn siarad ar fater amgylcheddol heddiw, penderfynais fynd i hwyl pethau drwy fynd ar daith mewn bws am y tro cyntaf ers imi ymuno â thaith bws rygbi tua 30 mlynedd yn ôl. Mae'n anhygoel ac yn rhywbeth y dylai pob un ohonom ei wneud. Dylem ddechrau drwy feddwl am ein ffyrdd o fyw. Mater bach oedd hwnnw i mi, ond mae'n bwysig. Mae yr un mor gyfleus mynd mewn bws ag ydyw i fynd mewn tacsî, ac ni sylweddolais hynny o gwbl tan y bore yma. Drwy gyflwyno'r ddatl hon, mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth i amgylchedd Caerdydd.

Ceir cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol i bob cynnig sy'n diogelu ac yn gwella'r amgylchedd. Mae pryder mawr am hyn drwy'r Cynulliad. Mae'r holl bleidiau'n gefnogol i faterion sy'n ymwneud â datblygu cynaliadwy ac ynni adnewyddadwy. Mae'r cynnig yn cyfeirio at fethiant y Llywodraeth, ac mae hynny'n briodol. Cefnogwn y cynnig gan na chyflawnwyd targedau'r Llywodraeth. Gallai'r Gweinidog ddatlau bod rhai ohonynt yn anghyraeddadwy ac yn uchelgeisiol—fel yr oedd targedau'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol—ond mae targedau anghyraeddadwy'n dod yn amcan yn fwyaf sydyn.

Un targed yw gostyngiad o 20 y cant mewn gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid erbyn 2010. Yn ôl yr holl arwyddion a geir ar hyn o bryd, nid yn unig y methir â chyrraedd y targed hwnnw, ond ni fydd lefel y gollyngiadau'n newid o gwbl erbyn 2010. Mewn gwirionedd, ychydig a gyflawnodd y Llywodraeth o ran ynni adnewyddadwy, heblaw am ddatblygu ffermydd gwynt. Mae hynny'n destun pryder, gan fod datblygiadau ffermydd gwynt yn

aware. Windfarms have negative and positive associations—many renewable energy issues do not have a negative side. However, the Government should take forward many other initiatives as well as windfarm developments.

We are all concerned about principles; we hear speeches about the environment, which are always worthy but often meaningless, because they do not lead to sufficient targets and monitoring. I have been disappointed on several occasions by the response to what I consider to be real and positive suggestions from other parties. In the past, I have tried to persuade the Government to take the success, or otherwise, of butterflies more seriously. I have raised the issue of pearl-bordered butterflies. I note that the Government will consider the success, or otherwise, of bird breeding. However, butterfly breeding and its success, or otherwise, is a much better indicator of environmental change and I encourage the Government to take better note of that.

There is another environmental issue, that has not been taken sufficiently seriously, namely the pest of the grey squirrel. Many people believe that it is a cute little animal, but it is a rat with a tail and it causes incredible damage, not only by killing trees—and trees help in relation to climate change—by tearing the bark from them, but also by removing from Wales one of our most beautiful creatures, namely the red squirrel. We need a Government policy of a mass cull of grey squirrels. Let us get rid of them on Anglesey, where there are red squirrels, as a start. Worthy words alone do not achieve anything.

We talk about guidance to local government, but why do we not have guidance that encourages local government to plant a certain number of trees every year? One sees trees everywhere when visiting a continental city. In British cities, one does not. People do not realise that they can help to tackle climate change by travelling on the bus instead of taking a taxi, and by planting trees. We are all concerned about developing

ddadleuol—ffaith yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn ohoni. Mae goblygiadau negyddol a chadarnhaol i ffermydd gwynt—mae sawl mater sy'n ymwneud ag ynni adnewyddadwy nad oes iddo ochr negyddol. Fodd bynnag, dylai'r Llywodraeth hyrwyddo nifer o fentrau eraill yn ogystal â datblygiadau ffermydd gwynt.

Yr ydym i gyd yn ymboeni ynghylch egwyddorion; clywn areithiau am yr amgylchedd, sydd bob amser yn glodwiw, ond yn aml yn ddiystyr, am nad ydynt yn arwain at osod targedau digonol ac at fonitro. Yr wyf wedi fy siomi ar sawl achlysur gan yr ymateb i'r hyn a ystyriaf yn awgrymiadau dilys a chadarnhaol gan bleidiau eraill. Yn y gorffennol, yr wyf wedi ceisio darbwyllo'r Llywodraeth i feddwl yn fwy difrifol ynghylch ffyniant, neu ddiffyg ffyniant, glöynnod byw. Yr wyf wedi codi mater glöynnod byw brith perladeiniog. Nodaf y gwnaiff y Llywodraeth ystyried llwyddiant, neu ddiffyg llwyddiant, magu adar. Er hynny, mae llwyddiant, neu ddiffyg llwyddiant, magu glöynnod byw yn well arwydd o lawer o newid yn yr amgylchedd ac anogaf y Llywodraeth i gymryd mwy o sylw o hynny.

Mae mater amgylcheddol arall, nas ystyriwyd yn ddigon difrifol, sef pla'r gwiwerod llwyd. Mae llawer o'r farn mai anifail bach pert ydyw, ond llygoden fawr gynffonnog ydyw sy'n peri difrod ofnadwy, nid yn unig drwy ladd coed—ac mae coed o gymorth o ran newid yn yr hinsawdd—drwy eu dirisglo, ond hefyd drwy ddileu o Gymru un o'n creaduriaid harddaf, sef y wiwer goch. Mae arnom angen polisi gan y Llywodraeth i ddifa gwiwerod llwyd ar raddfa helaeth. Gadewch inni gael gwared arnynt yn Ynys Môn, lle y ceir gwiwerod coch, fel man cychwyn. Nid yw geiriau clodwiw'n cyflawni dim ar eu pennau eu hunain.

Soniwn am ganllawiau i lywodraeth leol, ond pam nad oes gennym ganllawiau sy'n cymell llywodraeth leol i blannu nifer penodol o goed bob blwyddyn? Gwelir coed ym mhob man wrth ymweld â dinasoedd ar y cyfandir. Nis gwelir mewn dinasoedd ym Mhrydain. Nid yw pobl yn sylweddoli y gallant helpu i wrthsefyll newid yn yr hinsawdd drwy deithio mewn bws yn hytrach na thacsi, a thrwy blannu coed. Yr ydym i gyd yn

environmentally friendly policies, and I hope that the Government listens to my advice today.

Eleanor Burnham: The Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that it is imperative that the Labour Assembly Government leads and assists local government, Assembly sponsored public bodies and others in their strategic development sustainable energy policy. I know of no local authority exemplar in sustainable energy development. Too many different bodies and schemes promote energy efficiency, and people are confused. That leads to gaps and areas that are completely ignored. The issue of home insulation has been alluded to by my colleague Jenny Randerson, and it is a problem. I reiterate that people on benefits receive some help, but people just above the benefit line have real problems, particularly with regard to home insulation. For pensioners, who perhaps live in old properties that have gaps under the doors and so on, it is an issue of real concern.

The Labour Assembly Government, local authorities and ASPBs must lead the way and provide more grants for small and medium-sized enterprises, and we must support the work of the Energy Saving Trust and the Carbon Trust. We must also promote higher standards of energy efficiency in our own building, as well as those of the bodies that we fund. If we do not lead the way in Wales, how can we expect others to act? What is the Minister doing, for example, to improve building regulations? When will the Minister integrate home energy efficiency policies with green energy policies? We must educate people about sustainability. For example, in north Wales, there are variations in kerb collections. Kerb collections of different types of waste are woefully inadequate. I do not have the statistics, but I know from various councillors in north Wales that they are inadequate. That must be discussed at a local level. Many people do not understand why they must separate waste. My daughter spent some time in Vienna, where she had six boxes for recycling in an old block of flats. If

ymboeni ynghylch datblygu polisïau sy'n ystyriol o'r amgylchedd, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn gwrando ar fy nghyngor heddiw.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n credu ei bod yn hollbwysig i Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad gynorthwyo a rhoi arweiniad i lywodraeth leol, cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad ac eraill yn eu polisi ar ddatblygu ynni cynaliadwy mewn modd strategol. Ni wn am yr un awdurdod lleol sy'n gosod esiampl o ran datblygu ynni cynaliadwy. Ceir gormod o lawer o wahanol gyrff a chynlluniau i hybu effeithlonrwydd ynni, ac mae hynny'n peri penbleth i bobl. Ceir bylchau oherwydd hynny a meysydd sy'n cael eu hanwybyddu'n gyfan gwbl. Mae fy nghyd-Aelod Jenny Randerson wedi cyfeirio at insiwleiddio cartrefi sy'n broblem. Nodaf eto fod rhai sy'n derbyn budd-daliadau'n cael rhywfaint o gymorth, ond mae gwir broblemau gan y rhai sydd ychydig uwchlaw'r llinell budd-daliadau, yn enwedig o ran insiwleiddio eu cartrefi. Yn achos pensynwyr, sydd efallai'n byw mewn hen dai lle y mae bylchau o dan ddrysau ac yn y blaen, mae hyn yn peri pryder gwirioneddol.

Rhaid i Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad, awdurdodau lleol a CCNC gynnig arweiniad a darparu rhagor o grantiau ar gyfer busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint, a rhaid inni gefnogi gwaith yr Ymddiriedolaeth Arbed Ynni a'r Ymddiriedolaeth Carbon. Rhaid inni hefyd hyrwyddo safonau uwch o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni yn ein hadeilad ein hunain, yn ogystal ag adeiladau'r cyrff yr ydym yn eu cyllido. Os na wnawn ni arwain yng Nghymru, sut y gallwn ddisgwyl i eraill weithredu? Beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud, er enghraifft, i wella rheoliadau adeiladu? Pa bryd y gwnaiff y Gweinidog integreiddio polisïau effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref â pholisïau ar ynni gwyrdd? Rhaid inni addysgu pobl ynghylch cynaliadwyedd. Er enghraifft, yn y Gogledd, ceir gwahanol arferion o ran casglu ar ochr y ffordd. Mae'r casglu ar wahanol fathau o wastraff ar ochr y ffordd yn druenus o annigonol. Nid yw'r ystadegau gennyf, ond gwn o'r hyn a ddywed gwahanol gynghorwyr yn y Gogledd ei fod yn annigonol. Rhaid trafod hynny'n lleol. Mae llawer nad ydynt yn deall pam y mae'n

Vienna can do it, why can we not do the same? If there is going to be separation at source and kerb collections, people must have the incentive to do it and know why it is good for the environment. If we continue to build landfill sites, or incineration sites, we will not be making any progress in Wales.

Windfarms have been mentioned, and they are controversial. Offshore windfarms are extremely successful, and many people allude to their beauty. However, onshore windfarms cause huge problems in certain rural areas. Will the Minister highlight exemplar projects in local government buildings? Perhaps I have missed them, but I am sure that the Minister will have an answer for us at the end of the debate.

Brian Gibbons: I approach this debate with a little cynicism, particularly as it has been nominated by the Liberal Democrats. On the basis of what they have said, one would have thought that they were shining exemplars of good practice and that they were leading the campaign at a local level to promote renewable energy policies. For example, and Eleanor Burnham just mentioned it, they say that we should promote offshore windfarms, and they talk of how aesthetically pleasing they can be. May we have some information on the Welsh Liberal Democrats' attitude towards offshore windfarms in south Wales? May we have a declaration that the Welsh Liberal Democrat position is that they are fully behind the windfarm off the coast of south Wales, or whether they have some misgivings or qualifications in relation to it?

3.50 p.m.

Peter Black: Brian, I am sure that, as a politician, you understand that policy does not apply to individual planning issues—each issue must be taken on its own merit. We would support offshore windfarms in some areas, but might not do so in others. That is a perfectly reasonable position, which anyone

rhaid iddynt wahanu gwastraff. Treuliodd fy merch beth amser yn Fienna, ac yno yr oedd ganddi chwe blwch ar gyfer ailgylchu mewn hen floc o fflatiau. Os gall Fienna wneud hynny, pam na allwn ni? Os ydym i wahanu gwastraff yn y man cychwyn a'i gasglu ar ochr y ffordd, rhaid i bobl gael anogaeth i wneud hynny a chael gwybod pam y mae hynny'n beth da i'r amgylchedd. Os parhawn i agor safleoedd tirlenwi, neu safleoedd llosgi, ni wnawn unrhyw gynnydd yng Nghymru.

Cyfeiriwyd at ffermydd gwynt, ac maent yn ddadleuol. Mae ffermydd gwynt ar y môr yn dra llwyddiannus, ac mae llawer yn sôn am eu harddwch. Serch hynny, mae ffermydd gwynt ar y tir yn peri problemau aruthrol mewn rhai ardaloedd gwledig. A wnaiff y Gweinidog dynnu sylw at brosiectau enghreifftiol mewn adeiladau llywodraeth leol? Efallai fy mod wedi methu â sylwi arnynt, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd gan y Gweinidog ateb i ni ar ddiwedd y ddadl.

Brian Gibbons: Deuaf at y ddadl hon yn sinigaidd braidd, yn enwedig gan ei bod wedi'i henwebu gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Ar sail yr hyn a ddywedasant, credai rhywun eu bod yn esiamplau disglair o ymarfer da a'u bod yn arwain yr ymgyrch yn lleol i hyrwyddo polisiau ynni adnewyddadwy. Er enghraifft, ac mae Eleanor Burnham newydd sôn am hyn, dywedant y dylem hyrwyddo ffermydd gwynt ar y môr, gan ddweud mor hardd i'r llygad y gallant fod. A gawn rywfaint o wybodaeth am agwedd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru at ffermydd gwynt ar y môr yn y De? A gawn ddatganiad i'r perwyl mai safbwynt Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yw eu bod yn llawn gefnogi'r fferm wynt oddi ar arfordir y De, neu fod ganddynt rai amheuan neu amodau mewn cysylltiad â hi?

Peter Black: Brian, yr wyf yn siŵr y deallwch, a chithau'n wleidydd, nad yw polisi'n ymwneud â materion cynllunio penodol—rhaid ystyried pob mater yn ôl ei rinweddau ei hun. Byddem o blaid ffermydd gwynt ar y môr mewn rhai ardaloedd, ond efallai na fyddem mewn ardaloedd eraill.

on a planning authority would take.

Brian Gibbons: For the record, was that a 'yes' or a 'no', Peter? That was a clever example of verbal dexterity. However, if one asked your electorate what your position is, I do not think that you have clarified it one bit. It is a clear example of the opportunism that the Liberal Democrats choose to exercise with regard to this issue.

Welsh Labour in my area has tried to support the waste management strategy, which was mentioned in this debate. In Neath Port Talbot, one key development in trying to address waste management was the facility at Crymlyn Burrows. Under the plans for that facility, the vast majority of the waste materials that will go there will be recycled, subject to the issues that Michael Bates raised last week. Crymlyn Burrows has the potential to be a substantial recycling facility for Neath Port Talbot and Bridgend. It would be interesting to know what the attitude of any Liberal Democrat council in Bridgend, if they were ever to have that responsibility, would be. May we have some idea from the Welsh Liberal Democrats whether their colleagues in Bridgend will propose to continue using the waste management facility at Crymlyn Burrows? Until now, I think that it is fair to say that the Welsh Liberal Democrats have not had a consistent policy in supporting the waste management facility at Crymlyn Burrows. Perhaps, in responding to this debate, the Welsh Liberal Democrats could tell us whether, if they were in a position to influence policy in Bridgend, they would use the facility in Crymlyn Burrows, about which they have been so ambiguous to date?

During the debate on the manufacturing task group report, we were exhorted by all opposition parties not to copper-bottom EU legislation in relation to environmental regulation. Last week, when we discussed manufacturing, it was fine to say that. This

Safbwynt cwbl resymol yw hwnnw, y byddai unrhyw un mewn awdurdod cynllunio'n ei arddel.

Brian Gibbons: Er mwyn i bawb gael gwybod, ai 'ie' ynteu 'nace' oedd hwnnw, Peter? Yr oedd hynny'n enghraifft o'r ddawn i drin geiriau'n glyfar. Fodd bynnag, pe byddai rhywun yn holi'ch etholwyr am eich safbwynt, credaf y gwelid nad ydych wedi'i egluro o gwbl. Mae'n enghraifft amlwg o'r cyflegarwch y mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn dewis ei arfer mewn cysylltiad â'r mater hwn.

Mae Llafur Cymru yn fy ardal wedi ceisio cefnogi'r strategaeth ar reoli gwastraff, a grybwyllwyd yn y ddadl hon. Yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot, un datblygiad pwysig wrth geisio rhoi sylw i reoli gwastraff oedd y cyfleuster yn Nhywyn Crymlyn. O dan y cynlluniau ar gyfer y cyfleuster hwnnw, bydd y rhan helaethaf o'r gwastraff a ddanfonir yno'n cael ei ailgylchu, yn amodol ar y materion a gododd Mick Bates yr wythnos diwethaf. Gallai'r cyfleuster ailgylchu yn Nhywyn Crymlyn fod yn un pwysig i Gastell-nedd Port Talbot a Phen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Diddorol fyddai cael gwybod beth fydd agwedd unrhyw gyngor o eiddo'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, os cânt y cyfrifoldeb hwnnw byth. A gawn ryw awgrym gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru ynghylch a fydd eu cymheiriaid ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr yn cynnig parhau i ddefnyddio'r cyfleuster rheoli gwastraff yn Nhywyn Crymlyn? Hyd yma, credaf mai teg yw dweud nad yw polisi Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru ar gefnogi'r cyfleuster rheoli gwastraff yn Nhywyn Crymlyn wedi bod yn un cyson. Efallai, wrth ymateb i'r ddadl hon, y gallai Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru ddweud wrthym, pe baent yn gallu dylanwadu ar bolisi ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, a ddefnyddient y cyfleuster yn Nhywyn Crymlyn, y buont mor amwys yn ei gylch hyd yma?

Yn ystod y ddadl ar adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl ar weithgynhyrchu, galwodd yr holl wrthbleidiau arnom i beidio â chymhwyso deddfwriaeth yr UE mewn cysylltiad â rheoleiddio amgylcheddol yn rhy gaeth. Yr wythnos diwethaf, pan fuom yn trafod

week, in this debate, we are told that not enough is being done. It is the luxury of opposition that you can run with the hares and hunt with the hounds, but I do not think that the electorate is being fooled that opposition parties in the Assembly are trying to get a correct balance and make difficult decisions.

Mick Bates: You have raised some critical issues, and I am sure that you have spoken to Carwyn Jones about his attitude to the offshore development that you referred to earlier. It is a difficult issue, but you were talking about targets and goals, so how do you defend your Government's record, when carbon emissions went up last year in Wales?

Brian Gibbons: I cannot respond to that specifically because I do not have the figures before me. If that is the situation, I am not in a position to give a quick or a glib answer. I would need to come back to that to give you a specific answer. Nonetheless, the record of the Welsh Labour Party in this matter shows a clear, good balance between trying to deliver sustainable economic and social development in Wales, and environmental concerns. It does the environmental cause no good, however—not least in my constituency, where environmental issues are crucial—for Members to make lavish promises or criticisms without backing their rhetoric with political courage.

David Davies: As Brian pointed out, it is easy to give cross-party support to the motion before us. However, we need to cut through some of the issues of environmental debate and try to look objectively at the pros and cons of renewable energy. It has been difficult to have a constructive debate on these matters, as they raise so many strong concerns.

I think that Members accept that there is almost—though not quite—unanimous agreement that global warming is happening as a result of man's activities. There is complete agreement on the fact that, one day soon, although not necessarily too soon, fossil fuels will run out, but there is much greater disagreement than people realise over

gweithgynhyrchu, yr oedd yn iawn dweud hynny. Yr wythnos hon, yn y ddadl hon, dywedir wrthym nad ydym yn gwneud digon. Y peth braf wrth fod yn wrthblaid yw y gallwch redeg gyda'r cadno a hela gyda'r cŵn, ond ni chredaf fod yr etholwyr yn cael eu twyllo i gredu bod y gwrthbleidiau yn y Cynulliad yn ceisio dal y ddysgl yn wastad a gwneud penderfyniadau anodd.

Mick Bates: Yr ydych wedi codi rhai materion hanfodol, ac yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod wedi siarad â Carwyn Jones am ei agwedd at y datblygiad ar y môr y cyfeiriasoch ato'n gynharach. Mae'n fater anodd, ond soniasoch am dargedau a nodau, felly sut y gwnewch amddiffyn record eich Llywodraeth, a'r gollyngiadau carbon wedi cynyddu y llynedd yng Nghymru?

Brian Gibbons: Ni allaf ymateb i hynny'n benodol gan nad yw'r ffigurau gennyf o'm blaen. Os felly y mae, nid wyf mewn lle i roi ateb sydyn neu rwydd. Byddai'n rhaid imi ddod yn ôl at hynny i roi ateb penodol i chi. Er hynny, mae record Plaid Lafur Cymru ar y mater hwn yn dangos cydbwysedd da a chlir rhwng ceisio sicrhau datblygu economaidd a chymdeithasol cynaliadwy yng Nghymru, a phryderon amgylcheddol. Fodd bynnag, ni wneir unrhyw les i'r achos amgylcheddol—yn fy etholaeth i yn anad yr un arall, lle y mae materion amgylcheddol yn hollbwysig—os yw Aelodau'n cynnig addewidion neu feirniadaethau mawr heb ddewrder gwleidyddol i ategu eu rhethreg.

David Davies: Fel y nododd Brian, hawdd yw rhoi cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol i'r cynnig sydd ger ein bron. Fodd bynnag, rhaid torri drwy rhai o'r pynciau yn y ddadl ar yr amgylchedd a cheisio edrych yn wrthrychol ar fanteision ac anfanteision ynni adnewyddadwy. Bu'n anodd cael dadl adeiladol ar y materion hyn, gan eu bod yn codi cynifer o bryderon mawr.

Credaf fod Aelodau'n derbyn bod cytundeb unfrydol, bron, fod y cynhesu byd-eang yn digwydd o ganlyniad i weithgareddau'r ddynol ryw. Mae cytundeb llwyr ar y ffaith y bydd tanwyddau ffosil ryw ddiwrnod cyn hir, ond nid o reidrwydd yn fuan iawn, yn dod i ben, ond mae llawer mwy o anghytundeb nag a sylweddolir ynghylch y graddau y mae'r

the extent to which global warming is happening as a result of man's activities. In fact, many scientific papers suggest that the gradual warming and cooling of the planet is a natural cycle that happens over hundreds of years and that what we are currently seeing is largely down to natural forces. There is also a view that fossil fuels are not about to run out in the near future, with talk of reserves being less than 25 to 30 years or that they are about to run out when actually, when it reaches a certain level, oil becomes easier to extract and, as it goes from \$40 a barrel to \$50 and \$60 a barrel, we will be able to draw oil from all sorts of oilfields which would currently be financially unviable. It is not, therefore, the case that we are about to run out of fossil fuels. However, we will run out one day, and nobody doubts that, so we need to consider some of the alternatives on offer.

We just heard about one of the most-touted solutions: wind power. Brian made a good point in that everyone likes the idea of windfarms until one actually appears in one's own constituency. I must be honest; I understand his point exactly. I would not have supported the offshore windfarm near Porthcawl had I lived there, and I would not support a similar, land-based facility in the hills of Monmouthshire. We must be honest about this issue and accept that windfarms come with a visual cost and that people do not like living near them. Not only that, but windfarms are not as efficient as people imagine them to be as they only work one day out of three and, if you add up all the costs and take out the public subsidies to windfarms, the actual cost per kilowatt is more expensive than the current cost of fossil fuels.

Jenny Randerson: I welcome the fact that you point out that windfarms are not necessarily the most efficient way to produce renewable energy. We have devoted much attention in Wales to the pros and cons of windfarms, but the point that I was trying to make earlier was that alternatives, such as biomass and wave power, are now available, and we are not giving them their due priority.

cynhesu byd-eang yn digwydd o ganlyniad i weithgareddau'r ddynol ryw. Mewn gwirionedd, mae llawer o bapurau gwyddonol yn awgrymu bod y cynhesu a'r oeri graddol ar y blaned yn gylch naturiol sy'n digwydd dros gannoedd o flynyddoedd, a bod yr hyn a welwn yn awr yn ganlyniad, gan mwyaf, i rymoedd naturiol. Ceir barn hefyd nad yw tanwyddau ffosil ar fin dod i ben yn y dyfodol agos, a sôn bod llai na 25 i 30 mlynedd o adnoddau wrth gefn neu eu bod ar fin dod i ben, er bod olew, wrth gyrraedd lefel benodol, yn haws ei dynnu ac, wrth iddo godi o \$40 y gasgen i \$50 a \$60 y gasgen, byddwn yn gallu tynnu olew o bob math o feysydd olew a fyddai'n ariannol annichonadwy ar hyn o bryd. Felly, nid yw'n wir bod tanwyddau ffosil ar fin dod i ben. Er hynny, dânt i ben ryw ddydd, ac nid oes neb yn amau hynny, felly rhaid inni ystyried rhai o'r dewisiadau eraill sydd ar gael.

Yr ydym newydd glywed am un o'r atebion a gaiff ei bedlera'n amlaf: ynni'r gwynt. Gwnaeth Brian bwynt da wrth ddweud bod pawb yn hoffi'r syniad o ffermydd gwynt hyd nes y bydd un yn ymddangos yn ei etholaeth ei hun. Rhaid imi gyfaddef; yr wyf yn deall y pwynt a wnaeth i'r dim. Ni fyddwn wedi cefnogi'r fferm wynt ar y môr ger Porthcawl pe byddwn yn byw yno, ac ni chefnogwn gyfleuster tebyg ar y tir, ar fryniau sir Fynwy. Rhaid inni fod yn onest ynghylch y mater hwn a derbyn bod ffermydd gwynt yn dwyn cost weledol yn eu sgîl ac nad yw pobl yn hoffi byw yn eu hymyl. Yn ogystal â hynny, nid yw ffermydd gwynt mor effeithlon ag y mae pobl yn tybio eu bod gan nad ydynt ond yn gweithio ar un dydd ym mhob tri ac, os adiwch yr holl gostau a thynnu'r cymorthdaliadau cyhoeddus i ffermydd gwynt, mae'r wir gost y cilowatt yn ddrutach na chost tanwyddau ffosil ar hyn o bryd.

Jenny Randerson: Croesawaf y ffaith eich bod yn nodi nad ffermydd gwynt o reidrwydd yw'r modd mwyaf effeithlon i gynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy. Rhoesom lawer o sylw yng Nghymru i fanteision ac anfanteision ffermydd gwynt, ond y pwynt yr oeddwn yn ceisio'i wneud yn gynharach oedd bod dewisiadau eraill ar gael yn awr, fel biomas ac ynni tonnau, ac nad ydym yn rhoi blaenoriaeth ddyladwy iddynt.

David Davies: I certainly think that biomass is an interesting option, and, as I am not aware of many associated disadvantages, I would support research into making that option more viable. Wave power, however, actually comes at a higher environmental cost, and a scheme such as the Severn barrage would cause all sorts of environmental problems and put at risk many plants and animals currently thriving in the Severn area. Many such schemes come at an environmental cost.

Jenny Randerson: I would just like to clarify that the Severn barrage is a tidal power scheme, and not a wave power scheme.

David Davies: Okay, you have got one over on me. I thought that wave power and tidal power were similar, but they are clearly not. I would still make the point, however, that putting structures into the ocean comes with an environmental cost. I suspect that we are getting a little too technical now.

4.00 p.m.

I initially called for an objective debate on the pros and cons of different environmental measures, such as wind power and the Crymlyn Burrows plant, which I understand uses a form of incineration. Much public outcry has been whipped up over that, but as Eleanor knows, because I think that she has seen a plant operating in Vienna, incineration does not have to be environmentally unclean; it can be one of the cleanest ways of dealing with waste. Providing that safeguards are properly and transparently in place, incineration is not in itself bad.

As politicians, we have a duty not to whip up public hysteria for political reasons; there are serious issues to be debated here. We can all be a little cynical about some aspects of big business, which may try to downplay problems of global warming, but, on the other hand, all sorts of other organisations, including those viewed as charitable or voluntary organisations, employ people and, in a way, have a vested financial interest in overplaying horror stories, because it gets the

David Davies: Yr wyf yn sicr yn credu bod biomas yn ddewis diddorol a, gan na wn am lawer o anfanteision sy'n gysylltiedig ag ef, byddwn o blaid cael ymchwil er mwyn peri i'r dewis hwnnw fod yn fwy dichonol. Fodd bynnag, ceir cost uwch i'r amgylchedd yn sgîl ynni tonnau, a byddai cynllun fel morglawdd Hafren yn achosi pob math o broblemau amgylcheddol ac yn peryglu llawer o blanhigion ac anifeiliaid sy'n ffynnu ar hyn o bryd yng nghyffiniau afon Hafren. Ceir cost i'r amgylchedd yn sgîl sawl cynllun o'r fath.

Jenny Randerson: Hoffwn egluro mai cynllun ynni'r llanw yw morglawdd Hafren, ac nid cynllun ynni tonnau.

David Davies: O'r gorau, yr ydych wedi cael y gorau arnaf. Credais fod ynni tonnau ac ynni'r llanw yn debyg, ond mae'n amlwg nad ydynt. Er hynny, byddwn yn dal i wneud y pwynt bod codi adeiladweithiau yn y môr yn dwyn cost i'r amgylchedd yn ei sgîl. Yr wyf yn amau ein bod yn mynd braidd yn rhy dechnegol yn awr.

Ar y dechrau, gelwais am ddadl wrthrychol ar fanteision ac anfanteision gwahanol fesurau amgylcheddol, fel ynni'r gwynt a'r gwaith yn Nhywyn Crymlyn, y deallaf ei fod yn llosgi mewn rhyw fodd. Enynnwyd llawer o wrthwynebiad cyhoeddus i hynny ond, fel y gŵyr Eleanor, gan ei bod wedi gweld gwaith yn rhedeg yn Fienna, yr wyf yn credu, nid yw llosgi'n amgylcheddol frwnt o reidrwydd; gall fod yn un o'r dulliau glanaf o ddelio â gwastraff. Ar yr amod bod mesurau diogelwch priodol a thryloyw ar waith, nid yw llosgi'n beth drwg ynddo'i hun.

Fel gwleidyddion, yr ydym o dan ddyletswydd i beidio ag ennyn hysteria yn y cyhoedd am resymau gwleidyddol; mae materion difrif i'w trafod yma. Gallwn oll fod braidd yn sinigaidd ynghylch rhai agweddau ar fyd masnach, a all geisio bychanu problemau sy'n ymwneud â'r cynhesu bydeang, ond, ar y llaw arall, mae pob math o gyrff eraill, gan gynnwys y rhai a ystyrir yn gyrff elusennol neu wirfoddol, yn cyflogi pobl ac, ar un ystyr, mae o fudd ariannol

donations in. It is difficult to have an objective debate about this matter, but I hope that the Assembly can do so in future years.

The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies): This has been an interesting debate, but the motion seeks to accuse the Assembly Government of a supposed lack of leadership in driving forward our vision of a sustainable Wales. I believe, as I am sure do most of my colleagues, that that accusation is not based on fact. The motion is long on political rhetoric and short on fact, and fails to recognise the progress that the Assembly Government has made, in concert with partners in the public, private and voluntary sectors, in setting Wales on a path towards a low-carbon future, making Wales a showcase for clean energy production, and in taking steps to improve energy efficiency within the home and business environment. I regret that this motion does not recognise those efforts and has nothing constructive to offer in terms of helping us to take the sustainable development agenda forward. We will oppose the motion for those reasons.

I believe that we can take pride in the leadership provided by the Assembly Government. Cutting through the rhetoric and looking at the facts, we see that as soon as possible after the revised sustainable development scheme was adopted, my colleague, Carwyn Jones, published our proposals for action. These were widely welcomed. We are now reflecting on the responses to our consultation and on comments from subject committees. We hope to firm up our proposals shortly, bring them to Plenary, and implement them, with our partners and through our agents. We believe that that is responsible and responsive government and practical leadership in action. It represents leadership in matters relating to energy—around which much of this debate has centred—and an integrated view of what we can achieve.

iddynt or-wneud y storïau arswyd, gan fod hynny'n denu cyfraniadau. Anodd yw cael dadl wrthrychol ar y mater hwn, ond gobeithiaf y bydd y Cynulliad yn gallu gwneud hynny ym mlynnyddoedd y dyfodol.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies): Bu hon yn dadl ddiddorol, ond mae'r cynnig yn ceisio cyhuddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o ddiffyg arweiniad tybiedig wrth hyrwyddo ein gweledigaeth o Gymru gynaliadwy. Yr wyf fi'n credu, fel y mae'r rhan fwyaf o'm cyd-Aelodau, yr wyf yn siŵr, nad yw'r cyhuddiad hwnnw'n seiliedig ar ffaith. Mae llawer o rethreg wleidyddol yn y cynnig a fawr ddim ffeithiau, ac mae'n methu â chydabod y cynnydd a wnaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ar y cyd â'i phartneriaid yn y sectorau cyhoeddus, preifat a gwirfoddol, wrth roi Cymru ar ben ffordd tuag at ddyfodol isel o ran carbon, gan beri i Gymru fod yn ffenestr siop ar gyfer cynhyrchu ynni glân, a chymryd camau i wella effeithlonrwydd ynni mewn cartrefi ac mewn busnes. Mae'n ofid imi nad yw'r cynnig hwn yn cydnabod yr ymdrechion hynny ac nad yw'n cynnig dim byd adeiladol o ran ein helpu i hyrwyddo'r agenda ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Gwrthwynebwn y cynnig am y rhesymau hynny.

Credaf y gallwn ymfalchïo yn yr arweiniad a roddodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. O dorri drwy'r rhethreg ac edrych ar y ffeithiau, gwelwn fod fy nghyd-Weinidog, Carwyn Jones, wedi cyhoeddi ein cynigion ar gyfer gweithredu cyn gynted ag y bu modd ar ôl derbyn y cynllun gweithredu diwygiedig ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy. Fe'u croesawyd yn gyffredinol. Yn awr, yr ydym yn myfyrio ynghylch yr ymatebion i'n hymgynghoriad ac ynghylch y sylwadau a gafwyd gan bwyllgorau pwnc. Gobeithiwn gwblhau ein cynigion cyn hir, eu dwyn gerbron y Cyfarfod Llawn, a'u rhoi ar waith, gyda'n partneriaid a thrwy ein gweithredwyr. Credwn mai llywodraethu cyfrifol ac ymatebol yw hynny a'i fod yn enghraifft o arweiniad ymarferol. Mae'n dangos arweiniad mewn materion sy'n ymwneud ag ynni—y bu llawer o sôn amdano yn y dadl hon—a golwg integredig ar yr hyn y gallwn ei gyflawni.

I would be the first to admit that there is a long way to go, and that there is more to do than can be achieved in the short term. The pace of progress may be frustrating at times, but the level of political leadership and commitment in implementing the sustainability agenda is not in doubt. Sustainable development is not just a high-ranking priority of this Government, but a statutory duty of this body. We take this commitment and responsibility seriously, and it is underpinned by a clear vision, which we outline in our key strategic documents. In 'A Winning Wales', our national economic development strategy, and in 'Wales: A Better Country', we make clear our vision for a sustainable Wales, where action for social, economic and environmental improvements complement each other to create positive change. A great deal of progress is taking place to transform that vision into reality.

Mick Bates: I have no doubt that the last section of your speech will be well received throughout Wales. However, I know that you have been to Navarra, a region in Spain, and that you have seen the work done there to move from a low to a high level of renewable energy production. I mentioned upper Austria in my opening speech, which similarly went from a low base to 30 per cent of production from renewable energy in a five-year programme. The figures for Wales used to be good, but we have gone backwards in terms of our percentage increase—we are not increasing at the same rate. What do you say to the producers who clearly see that happening?

Andrew Davies: I do not accept that we have gone backwards. The point that I took from my visit to Navarra is the importance of political leadership and vision in putting sustainability and sustainable energy production at the heart of our policies. As a Government, we are doing that.

The motion refers to action to integrate green energy and home efficiency energy schemes. We are already taking that action. Our home energy efficiency strategy is helping us to focus on the most cost-effective improvements, namely insulation and central

Myfi fyddai'r cyntaf i gyfaddef bod llawer iawn i'w wneud, a bod mwy i'w wneud nag y gellir ei gyflawni yn y tymor byr. Efallai fod graddau'r cynnydd wedi peri rhwystredigaeth ar adegau, ond nid oes amheuaeth am lefel yr arweiniad gwleidyddol a'r ymrwymiad wrth roi'r agenda ar gynaliadwyedd ar waith. Nid blaenoriaeth uchel yn unig yw datblygu cynaliadwy i'r Llywodraeth hon, ond dyletswydd statudol i'r corff hwn. Cymerwn yr ymrwymiad a'r cyfrifoldeb hwn o ddifrif, ac mae gweledigaeth glir yn sail iddynt, a ddisgrifiwn yn ein prif ddogfennau strategol. Yn 'Cymru'n Ennill', ein strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, ac yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well', eglurwn ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer Cymru gynaliadwy, lle y mae camau gweithredu i sicrhau gwelliannau cymdeithasol, economaidd ac amgylcheddol yn ategu'i gilydd i greu newid cadarnhaol. Gwneir llawer o gynnydd wrth wireddu'r weledigaeth honno.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd croeso i'r rhan ddiwethaf o'ch araith ledled Cymru. Er hynny, gwn i chi fod yn Navarra, un o ranbarthau Sbaen, a'ch bod wedi gweld y gwaith a wneir yno i symud oddi wrth lefel isel i lefel uchel o gynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy. Cyfeiriais at Awstria uchaf yn fy araith agoriadol, a gododd yn yr un modd o linell sylfaen isel i gynhyrchu 30 y cant o'i ynni o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy drwy ddilyn rhaglen bum mlynedd. Yr oedd y ffigurau ar gyfer Cymru'n arfer bod yn dda, ond aethom yn ein hôl o ran canran y cynnydd a fu yma—nid yw ein cynnydd mor gyflym. Beth a ddywedwch wrth y cynhyrchwyr sy'n gweld bod hynny'n digwydd?

Andrew Davies: Nid wyf yn derbyn ein bod wedi mynd yn ein hôl. Yr hyn a ddysgais o'm hymweliad â Navarra yw mor bwysig yw arweiniad gwleidyddol a gweledigaeth wrth roi lle canolog i gynaliadwyedd a chynhyrchu ynni cynaliadwy yn ein polisïau. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym yn gwneud hynny.

Mae'r cynnig yn cyfeirio at gamau i integreiddio ynni gwyrdd a chynlluniau effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref. Yr ydym eisoes yn cymryd y camau hynny. Mae ein strategaeth ar effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref yn ein helpu i ganolbwyntio ar y gwelliannau

heating. We remain committed to exploring all technologies. We actively promote participation in renewable energy grant schemes, which are funded by the Department of Trade and Industry, and we have funded the installation of solar water heating systems in more than 200 new homes. I launched the Objective 1 wood energy business scheme at Atlantic College, where biomass is used. On biomass, the technologies may be well proven, but, as I saw at first hand in Navarra, technology is not the issue, but rather the supply of the particular fuel that is used. That is not an easy issue to resolve.

On support and leadership in local government, through the present round of policy agreements, local authorities are setting local energy efficiency targets—one in the domestic sector and one for their own buildings. These will be measured by the reduction in carbon dioxide emissions. Moreover, with the Welsh Local Government Association, the Energy Saving Trust, the Carbon Trust, we are formulating an approach to help local authorities to create and revise energy policies to support them in progressing towards the policy agreement targets. There are excellent exemplars in local government that are leading the way and which others can follow. For example, Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council's commitment illustrates how local government can provide leadership across Wales in reducing carbon emissions.

On renewable energy production, we have ambitious targets—4 TWh from renewable energy by 2010. We are establishing a good foundation to reach that target. We currently have approximately 390 wind turbines on 18 offshore windfarms, providing a total installed generating capacity of over 230 MW of electricity. However, we recognise that the fortunate combination of our geography and climate allows us to do much more. We need to maximise the opportunities that are available to us, and, as Minister, I am determined to do that. With that in mind, we are working with our partners to develop the energy strategy operational plan. Our aim is

mwyaf cost-effeithiol, sef insiweiddio a gwresogi canolog. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo o hyd i ymchwilio i'r holl dechnolegau. Hyrwyddwn gyfranogi mewn cynlluniau grant ynni adnewyddadwy, a gyllidir gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, ac yr ydym wedi talu am osod systemau gwresogi dŵr o ynni'r haul mewn mwy na 200 o gartrefi newydd. Lansiais gynllun busnes ynni coed Amcan 1 yng Ngholeg Iwerydd, lle y defnyddir biomas. Ynghylch biomas, mae'n bosibl bod y technolegau wedi'u profi'n helaeth, ond, fel y gwelais â'm llygaid fy hun yn Navarra, nid technoleg yw'r peth pwysig, ond yn hytrach y cyflenwad o'r tanwydd penodol a ddefnyddir. Nid yw'n hawdd datrys y mater hwnnw.

Ynghylch cymorth ac arweiniad mewn llywodraeth leol, drwy'r cylch presennol o gytundebau polisi, mae awdurdodau lleol yn gosod targedau effeithlonrwydd ynni lleol—un yn y sector domestig ac un ar gyfer eu hadeiladau eu hunain. Fe'u mesurir yn ôl y gostyngiad mewn gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid. Yn ogystal â hynny, ar y cyd â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, yr Ymddiriedolaeth Arbed Ynni a'r Ymddiriedolaeth Carbon, yr ydym yn fformiwleiddio dull gweithredu i helpu awdurdodau lleol i greu ac adolygu polisiâu ynni i'w cynorthwyo i gyrraedd y targedau yn y cytundeb polisi. Ceir esiamplau rhagorol ac arloesol mewn llywodraeth leol, y bydd eraill yn gallu eu dilyn. Er enghraifft, mae'r ymrwymiad gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot yn dangos y modd y gall llywodraeth leol gynnig arweiniad ledled Cymru wrth leihau gollyngiadau carbon.

Ynghylch cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy, mae gennym dargedau uchelgeisiol—4 awr terawatt o ynni adnewyddadwy erbyn 2010. Yr ydym yn gosod sylfaen gadarn er mwyn cyrraedd y targed hwnnw. Ar hyn o bryd, mae gennym tua 390 o dyrbinau gwynt ar 18 o ffermydd gwynt ar y môr, sy'n cynnig capasiti cynhyrchu o gyfanswm o fwy na 230 megawatt o drydan. Er hynny, cydnabyddwn fod y cyfuniad ffodus o'n daearyddiaeth a'n hinsawdd yn caniatáu inni wneud llawer mwy. Rhaid inni wneud y gorau o'r cyfleoedd sydd ar gael i ni, ac, fel Gweinidog, yr wyf yn benderfynol o wneud hynny. Gyda golwg ar hynny, yr ydym yn

to embrace all aspects of developing a successful and vibrant renewable energy industry, including grid enhancement. I have had several meetings with Scottish Power, and the First Minister and I are meeting Western Power shortly to discuss its future plans. The operational plan will deliver policy initiatives and support structures to help the energy sector in Wales to develop a clean energy agenda. I expect to publish the operational plan later this year.

TAN 8 will provide advice and guidance to planning authorities on managing and delivering renewable energy proposals in Wales, particularly onshore. It is expected to provide an inclusive and participatory framework for local authorities and the industry to help deliver the renewable energy targets. I expect the technical advice note to be published in draft form next month for more widespread consultation. I have always said that we must get TAN 8 right. It is better to do that than to rush into publishing a document that is not ready for consultation.

The amendment, which concerns the transfer of functions to the National Assembly, does nothing to resolve the issues at heart, and we will oppose it and the motion. I am happy to reaffirm the Assembly Government's call for the transfer of responsibility for large-scale energy projects of over 50 MW to the Assembly from the DTI. The Assembly Government is part of a tripartite group that is considering our request for the transfer of consenting powers relating to energy generating stations contained in sections 36 and 37 of the Electricity Act 1989. The group has met on many occasions and good progress is being made. It aims to report to Ministers later this year. The final decision on the transfer will, however, be a matter for the UK Cabinet committee on devolution policies. We are moving Wales in the right direction and my vision is of a Wales with a low-carbon economy.

gweithio gyda'n partneriaid i ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu'r strategaeth ynni. Ein bwriad yw cwmpasu pob agwedd ar y gwaith o ddatblygu diwydiant ynni adnewyddadwy llwyddiannus a bywiog, gan gynnwys gwella'r grid. Cefais sawl cyfarfod â Scottish Power, a bydd y Prif Weinidog a mi'n cwrdd â Western Power cyn hir i drafod ei gynlluniau ar gyfer y dyfodol. Bydd y cynllun gweithredu'n darparu mentrau polisi a dulliau cymorth i helpu'r sector ynni yng Nghymru i ddatblygu agenda ar ynni glân. Disgwyliaf gyhoeddi'r cynllun gweithredu yn ddiweddarach eleni.

Bydd nodyn cyngor technegol 8 yn cynnig cyngor a chyfarwyddyd i awdurdodau cynllunio ynghylch trafod a chyflawni cynlluniau ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru, yn enwedig rhai ar y tir. Disgwylir iddo gynnig fframwaith cynhwysol a chyfranogol i awdurdodau lleol ac i'r diwydiant er mwyn cyrraedd y targedau ar ynni adnewyddadwy. Disgwyliaf y bydd y nodyn cyngor technegol yn cael ei gyhoeddi ar ffurf drafft y mis nesaf ar gyfer ymgynghori ehangach. Yr wyf wedi dweud erioed fod rhaid inni sicrhau y bydd nodyn cyngor technegol 8 yn iawn. Gwell gwneud hynny na rhuthro i gyhoeddi dogfen nad yw'n barod ar gyfer ymgynghori.

Mae'r gwelliant, sy'n ymwneud â throsglwyddo swyddogaethau i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn un na wnaiff ddim i ddatrys y materion hanfodol, a gwrthwynebwn ef a'r cynnig. Yr wyf yn falch o ailddatgan galwad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad am drosglwyddo cyfrifoldeb dros brosiectau ynni mawr o fwy na 50 megawatt i'r Cynulliad oddi wrth yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhan o grŵp tairochrog sy'n ystyried ein cais am drosglwyddo pwerau caniatáu sy'n ymwneud â gorsafoedd cynhyrchu ynni a geir yn adrannau 36 a 37 Deddf Trydan 1989. Cyfarfu'r grŵp sawl gwaith a gwneir cynnydd da. Mae'n bwriadu rhoi adroddiad i Weinidogion yn ddiweddarach eleni. Fodd bynnag, bydd y penderfyniad terfynol ar drosglwyddo'n fater i bwllgor Cabinet y DU ar bolisiau datganoli. Yr ydym yn mynd â Chymru i'r cyfeiriad iawn a'm gweledigaeth i yw Cymru sydd ag economi carbon isel.

4.10 p.m.

Michael German: I thank my colleague, Mick Bates, who is noted for his vision and commitment on this issue and, sometimes, his impatience when it comes to the development of sustainable energy in Wales and across Europe and the world.

The sad reality for the Minister is that, while he says that he is taking action and moving forward, carbon emissions increased in Wales last year. That shows that we are not making a difference. [*Interruption.*] I am not giving way, as I only have two minutes in which to make my speech. You said that we will be producing 4 TWh from renewable energy sources by 2010, Minister, and that we currently produce 230 MW. It is a real challenge to reach that target in the next five and a half years. We are told that action will be taken and that TAN 8 will appear shortly. We have a clear strategy in the Assembly. The Minister may not want to accept the motion, but I cannot understand why he refuses to accept Plaid Cymru's amendment, given that it reflects the Assembly's committed view. Perhaps he does not wish to support it because it was tabled by Plaid Cymru. We heard from Elin that spend on renewable energy and energy infrastructure projects is low within the Objective 1 programme. That is an indication of low demand, and that is why we are not making the progress that we should be making. We need to see appropriate renewable energy use and priority support being given to the industry. The Minister is right to say that we need to do much more than simply go for the energy issues. On energy from waste, biofuels and biomass, we need to establish a structure for the business, as well as ensuring grants and supporting the concept.

It is important that we support the electricity grid. We do not have sustainable possibilities in mid Wales, on the north Wales coast or in west Wales because we cannot connect the electricity generated to the national grid. Why is the Minister not dealing with housing design issues and issues relating to solar energy? We have exemplar projects and the Minister must use them. We will not then be

Michael German: Diolchaf i'm cyd-Aelod, Mick Bates, sy'n nodedig am ei weledigaeth a'i ymrwymiad ar y mater hwn ac, weithiau, ei ddiffyg amynedd mewn cysylltiad â datblygu ynni cynaliadwy yng Nghymru a ledled Ewrop a'r byd.

Y gwir trist y mae'n rhaid i'r Gweinidog ei wynebu, er y dywed ei fod yn cymryd camau ac yn symud ymlaen, yw bod gollyngiadau carbon wedi cynyddu yng Nghymru y llynedd. Dengys hynny nad ydym yn gwneud llawer o wahaniaeth. [*Torri ar draws.*] Nid iildiaf, gan nad oes gennyf ond dau funud i roi fy araith. Dywedasoeh y byddwn yn cynhyrchu 4 awr terawatt o ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy erbyn 2010, Weinidog, a'n bod yn cynhyrchu 230 megawatt ar hyn o bryd. Her fawr fydd cyrraedd y targed hwnnw yn y pum mlynedd a hanner nesaf. Dywedir wrthym y cymerir camau ac y bydd nodyn cyngor technegol 8 yn ymddangos cyn hir. Mae gennym strategaeth bendant yn y Cynulliad. Efallai nad yw'r Gweinidog yn dymuno derbyn y cynnig, ond ni allaf ddeall pam y mae'n gwrthod derbyn gwelliant Plaid Cymru, gan ei fod yn adlewyrchu barn bendant y Cynulliad. Efallai nad yw'n dymuno'i gefnogi am ei fod wedi'i gyflwyno gan Blaid Cymru. Clywsom gan Elin fod y gwariant ar brosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy a seilwaith ynni yn isel yn rhaglen Amcan 1. Mae hynny'n arwydd o alw isel, a dyna pam nad ydym yn gwneud cynnydd fel y dylem. Rhaid inni weld defnydd priodol ar ynni adnewyddadwy a chymorth blaenoriaethol i'r diwydiant. Mae'r Gweinidog yn iawn wrth ddweud bod angen inni wneud llawer mwy nag ymdrin â materion ynni'n unig. Ynghylch ynni o wastraff, tanwyddau biolegol a biomas, rhaid inni sefydlu fframwaith ar gyfer y busnes, yn ogystal â sicrhau grantiau a hybu'r cysyniad.

Mae'n bwysig inni gynnal y grid trydan. Nid oes gennym bosibiliadau cynaliadwy yn y Canolbarth, ar arfordir y Gogledd neu yn y Gorllewin am na allwn gysylltu'r trydan a gynhyrchir â'r grid cenedlaethol. Pam nad yw'r Gweinidog yn delio â materion sy'n ymwneud â dylunio tai ac ynni'r haul? Mae gennym brosiectau enghreifftiol a rhaid i'r Gweinidog eu defnyddio. Nid colli tir a

falling behind, rather we will be celebrating the fact that we will meet the 4 TWh target. The current figure of 230 MW is not sufficiently high to ensure that we reach that target by 2010.

wnawn wedyn ond, yn hytrach, dathlu'r ffaith y byddwn yn cyrraedd y targed o 4 awr terawatt. Nid yw'r ffigur presennol o 230 megawatt yn ddigon uchel i sicrhau y cyrhaeddwn y targed hwnnw erbyn 2010.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.

Amendment 1: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 29.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

Cynnig (NDM1987): O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.

Motion (NDM1987): For 21, Abstain 0, Against 29.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina

Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.
 Motion defeated.*

**Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus ar
 Weithredu Strwythurau Rheoli Gwleidyddol Newydd mewn Llywodraeth Leol
 The Local Government and Public Services Committee's Report
 on the Operation of New Political Management Structures in Local Government**

Ann Jones: I propose that

Ann Jones: Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales notes the report of the Local Government and Public Services Committee entitled 'The Operation of New Political Management Structures in Local Government', which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 8 June 2004. (NDM1988)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus sef 'Gweithredu Strwythurau Rheoli Gwleidyddol Newydd mewn Llywodraeth Leol', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at yr Aelodau mewn e-bost ar 8 Mehefin 2004. (NDM1988)

I am pleased to present the Local Government and Public Services Committee's first report on the operation of new political management structures in local government. I thank past and present committee members for their enthusiasm in taking forward this inquiry. I pay tribute to the valuable work carried out on this report by the former committee clerk, Adrian Crompton, the current committee secretariat, Siwan Davies, Liz Wilkinson and Ruth Hughes, and the Members' Research and Committee Services, without whose support this report could not have been completed. I am also grateful to all the individuals and bodies who submitted evidence to the inquiry, and I record particular thanks to those local authorities that extended such a warm welcome to committee members during our visits to gather evidence for this investigation.

Yr wyf yn falch o gyflwyno adroddiad cyntaf y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus ar weithredu strwythurau rheoli gwleidyddol newydd mewn llywodraeth leol. Diolchaf i aelodau blaenorol a phresennol y pwyllgor am eu brwdfrydedd wrth hyrwyddo'r ymchwiliad hwn. Talaf deyrnged i'r gwaith gwerthfawr a wnaed ar yr adroddiad hwn gan gyn-glerc y pwyllgor, Adrian Crompton, ysgrifenyddiaeth bresennol y pwyllgor, Siwan Davies, Liz Wilkinson a Ruth Hughes, a Gwasanaethau'r Pwyllgorau ac Ymchwil yr Aelodau, y bu ei gymorth yn anhepgor wrth gwblhau'r adroddiad hwn. Yr wyf hefyd yn ddiolchgar i'r holl unigolion a chyrrff a gyflwynodd dystiolaeth i'r ymchwiliad, a diolchaf yn arbennig i'r awdurdodau lleol hynny a estynnodd y fath groeso cynnes i aelodau'r pwyllgor yn ystod ein hymweliadau i gasglu dystiolaeth ar gyfer yr ymchwiliad hwn.

The report, and today's debate, is particularly timely following last week's local government elections. I hope that it will be of interest to newly elected, and re-elected, councillors, with whom we look forward to working over the coming months and years. The committee urges the Welsh Assembly Government, the Welsh Local Government Association and local authorities to take forward the recommendations in the report, which ultimately are aimed at assisting councillors to develop their role in serving local communities, and we hope that they take it in the spirit of partnership in which it is intended.

As Members are aware, the Local Government Act 2000 made major changes to the political management structures of local authorities. The aim was to enable more visible and accountable leadership for councils and the communities they serve, and to promote transparent and efficient decision making. Perhaps the most significant change was the replacement of the old committee system with a new structure made up of a clearly identified executive, along with overview and scrutiny committees charged with reviewing the performance of the executive and assisting on policy development. The Act set out three broad forms of executive—a directly elected mayor, a leader and cabinet model, and a directly elected mayor with a council manager. The Assembly added a fourth option of a modernised committee structure with enhanced scrutiny powers in place of the cabinet system.

Prior to last week's elections, most Welsh local authorities had adopted the leader and cabinet model, and three had opted for the so-called fourth option. Following the rejection by the people of Ceredigion in last month's referendum of changing to the directly elected mayor option, it seems unlikely that further moves in this direction will be made in Wales in the immediate future.

In June 2003, the committee agreed to undertake an inquiry into how the new political management structures in local

Mae'r adroddiad, a'r ddadl heddiw, yn arbennig o amserol ar ôl etholiadau llywodraeth leol yr wythnos diwethaf. Gobeithiaf y bydd o ddiddordeb i'r cynghorwyr a ailetholwyd ac a etholwyd o'r newydd, yr edrychwn ymlaen at weithio gyda hwy dros y misoedd a'r blynnyddoedd i ddod. Mae'r pwyllgor yn annog Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ac awdurdodau lleol i hyrwyddo'r argymhellion sydd yn yr adroddiad, sydd â'r amcan sylfaenol o helpu cynghorwyr i ddatblygu eu rôl wrth wasanaethu cymunedau lleol, a gobeithiwn y byddant yn derbyn hyn yn yr un ysbryd o bartneriaeth ag y'i rhoddir.

Fel y gŵyr Aelodau, gwnaeth Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000 newidiadau mawr i strwythurau rheoli gwleidyddol awdurdodau lleol. Yr amcan oedd hwyluso arweiniad mwy gweladwy ac atebol ar gyfer cynhorau a'r cymunedau a wasanaethant, a hybu penderfynu tryloyw ac effeithlon. Efallai mai'r newid pwysicaf oedd disodli'r hen system pwyllgorau a rhoi strwythur newydd yn ei lle a oedd yn cynnwys gweithrediaeth a ddynodwyd yn glir, ynghyd â phwyllgorau arolygu a chraffu a ymddiriedwyd â'r gwaith o adolygu perfformiad y weithrediaeth a helpu i ddatblygu polisi. Pennodd y Ddeddf dri math cyffredinol o weithrediaeth—maer a etholir yn uniongyrchol, model yr arweinydd a'r cabinet, a maer a etholir yn uniongyrchol gyda rheolwr cyngor. Gwnaeth y Cynulliad ychwanegu pedwerydd dewis o strwythur pwyllgorau diwygiedig gyda phwerau craffu gwell yn lle'r system cabinet.

Cyn yr etholiadau yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oedd y rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau lleol Cymru wedi mabwysiadu model yr arweinydd a'r cabinet, ac yr oedd tri wedi cymryd y pedwerydd dewis, fel y'i gelwir. Wedi i bobl Ceredigion wrthod y dewis o faer a etholir yn uniongyrchol yn y refferendwm y mis diwethaf, nid yw'n ymddangos yn debygol y ceir camau pellach i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol agos.

Ym Mehefin 2003, cytunodd y pwyllgor i ymgymryd ag ymchwiliad i'r modd yr oedd y strwythurau rheoli gwleidyddol newydd

government were operating. Although these were still relatively new, the committee felt that the structures had been in place long enough to learn lessons that might be of use to successor authorities. During the inquiry, the committee focused on how the introduction of executive governance had affected lines of accountability and the efficiency, transparency and openness of decision making in local government, how successful overview and scrutiny committees had been in holding the executive to account and in contributing to the process of policy development, how the role of backbench councillors had developed, and how the new structures had opened up the decision-making process to the general public and established clear accountability for decisions in the minds of voters.

The committee received written and oral evidence from a number of individuals and bodies. We also visited seven local authorities to observe scrutiny committees in action and to discuss the operation of the new arrangements with local authority members and officers. The report, which is the result of nine months' work, includes 17 recommendations aimed at improving the transparency, efficiency and accountability of local government in Wales.

I will discuss the report's main findings under the headings of accountability, efficiency, transparency and openness of decision making. A consistent theme in the evidence we received was that accountability had improved following the new arrangements, with clearer lines of individual and collective responsibility. The committee agreed that there is a positive link between clear political leadership and managerial accountability, and effective service delivery. In view of this, we recommend that local authorities develop awareness of executive leadership within their authority, for example through training, so that the idea of executive leadership is understood by all councillors, not just those in the cabinet or on the board at a particular time.

A key objective of the new political structures was to enable greater clarity in

mewn llywodraeth leol yn gweithredu. Er eu bod yn gymharol newydd o hyd, teimlai'r pwyllgor fod y strwythurau wedi bod yn gweithredu'n ddigon hir i allu dysgu gwersi a allai fod o fudd i awdurdodau dilynol. Yn ystod yr ymchwiliad, canolbwyntiodd y pwyllgor ar y modd yr oedd cyflwyno llywodraethu drwy weithrediaeth wedi effeithio ar linellau atebolrwydd ac ar effeithlonrwydd, tryloywder a natur agored y penderfynu mewn llywodraeth leol, y graddau yr oedd pwyllgorau arolygu a chraffu wedi llwyddo i alw'r weithrediaeth i gyfrif ac i gyfrannu at y broses o ddatblygu polisi, sut yr oedd rôl cynghorwyr y meinciau cefn wedi datblygu, a'r modd yr oedd y strwythurau newydd wedi agor y broses penderfynu i'r cyhoedd ac wedi pennu atebolrwydd clir am benderfyniadau ym meddwl yr etholwyr.

Cafodd y pwyllgor dystiolaeth ysgrifenedig a llafar gan sawl unigolyn a chorff. Ymwelasom hefyd â saith awdurdod lleol i weld pwyllgorau craffu ar waith ac i drafod gweithrediad y trefniadau newydd gydag aelodau a swyddogion awdurdodau lleol. Mae'r adroddiad, sy'n ganlyniad i naw mis o waith, yn cynnwys 17 argymhelliad sydd â'r amcan o wella tryloywder, effeithlonrwydd ac atebolrwydd llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru.

Trafodaf brif ganfyddiadau'r adroddiad o dan benawdau atebolrwydd, effeithlonrwydd, tryloywder a gweithredu agored wrth benderfynu. Un thema a gododd dro ar ôl tro yn y dystiolaeth a gawsom oedd bod atebolrwydd wedi gwella yn sgîl y trefniadau newydd, a bod llinellau cliriach ar gyfer cyfrifoldeb unigol ac ar y cyd. Cytunodd y pwyllgor fod cysylltiad pendant rhwng arweiniad gwleidyddol clir ac atebolrwydd y rheolwyr, a'r gallu i ddarparu gwasanaethau'n effeithiol. Yng ngolwg hynny, yr ydym yn argymhell y dylai awdurdodau lleol hybu ymwybyddiaeth o arweiniad y weithrediaeth yn eu hawdurdod, er enghraifft, drwy hyfforddi, fel bod yr holl aelodau'n deall y syniad o arweiniad y weithrediaeth, ac nid y rhai sydd yn y cabinet neu ar y bwrdd ar adeg benodol yn unig.

Un o brif amcanion y strwythurau gwleidyddol newydd oedd sicrhau mwy o

decision making. We feel that more could be done to raise levels of understanding of the decision-making process among councillors and the general public, and we recommend that executive arrangements be reinforced with procedures that maximise openness and transparency.

In terms of holding the executive to account and contributing to the process of policy development, one of the strongest themes emerging from the inquiry was confusion over the role of overview and scrutiny committees and their abilities to effectively hold the executive to account. Our visits to local authorities gave us first-hand experience of the operation of the overview and scrutiny function. From these visits and the evidence received, it was clear that there is no uniform way in which councils run their overview and scrutiny committees. Although we support a flexible approach that allows authorities to adapt these arrangements as they see fit to meet local circumstances, we feel that the scrutiny role needs to be developed and strengthened further.

4.20 p.m.

Scrutiny committee members need to understand their role and appreciate its potential and importance. Properly resourced support and training should be available to councillors in order to carry out effective scrutiny of the executive. Ideally, all local authorities should have dedicated officer support teams for scrutiny, and in all cases it is vital that skilled and independent support is available.

At present, a local authority cannot alter its basic structure without a petition to the Welsh Assembly Government, followed by a possible referendum on the proposals. The committee feels that this requirement, as currently framed, is overly restrictive and it recommends that legislation is amended to enable local authorities to reform their structures as they see fit. Indeed, it may be appropriate for this to be considered as a priority in light of the recent elections.

Having looked at the role of non-executive councillors as members of scrutiny

eglurder wrth benderfynu. Teimlwn y gellid gwneud mwy i wella dealltwriaeth o'r broses penderfynu ymysg cynghorwyr a'r cyhoedd, ac yr ydym yn argymhell y dylid ategu trefniadau'r weithrediaeth drwy weithdrefnau sy'n sicrhau'r gweithredu mwyaf agored a thryloyw posibl.

O ran galw'r weithrediaeth i gyfrif a chyfrannu at y broses o ddatblygu polisi, un o'r themâu cryfaf a gododd o'r ymchwiliad oedd y dryswch ynghylch rôl y pwyllgorau arolygu a chraffu a'u gallu i alw'r weithrediaeth i gyfrif yn effeithiol. Cawsom brofiad uniongyrchol yn ein hymweliadau ag awdurdodau lleol o weithrediad y swyddogaeth arolygu a chraffu. Ar sail yr ymweliadau hyn a'r dystiolaeth a gafwyd, yr oedd yn amlwg nad oes dull unffurf o redeg pwyllgorau arolygu a chraffu yn y cynghorau. Er ein bod o blaid cael dull gweithredu hyblyg sy'n caniatáu i awdurdodau addasu'r trefniadau hyn fel y gwelont orau ar gyfer amgylchiadau lleol, teimlwn fod angen datblygu a chryfhau'r rôl craffu ymhellach.

Rhaid i aelodau pwyllgorau craffu ddeall eu rôl a gwerthfawrogi ei photensial a'i phwysigrwydd. Dylid cynnig cymorth a hyfforddiant a gyllidir yn briodol i gynghorwyr fel y gallant graffu ar waith y weithrediaeth yn effeithiol. Gorau oll os bydd gan yr holl awdurdodau lleol dimau swyddogion penodol i hyrwyddo craffu ac mae'n hollbwysig, ym mhob achos, bod cymorth medrus ac annibynnol ar gael.

Ar hyn o bryd, ni all awdurdod lleol newid ei strwythur sylfaenol heb ddeisebu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a chynnal refferendwm ar ôl hynny, o bosibl, ar y cynigion. Mae'r pwyllgor yn teimlo bod y gofyniad hwn, fel y mae wedi'i eirio ar hyn o bryd, yn rhy gaeth ac mae'n argymhell diwygio'r ddeddfwriaeth fel y gall awdurdodau lleol newid eu strwythurau fel y gwelont orau. Yn wir, gallai fod yn briodol ystyried hynny'n flaenoriaeth yng ngoleuni'r etholiadau diweddar.

Ar ôl ystyried rôl cynghorwyr anweithredol fel aelodau o bwyllgorau craffu, gwnaeth y

committees, the committee also looked, more generally, at their role in the operation of new political management arrangements. We were extremely concerned about word-of-mouth reports of 'low-morale' and feelings of 'disempowerment and disengagement' among non-executive members. The committee believes that facilitating proper roles for backbenchers is key if the operation of the new structures is to flourish. I use the term 'backbenchers' for lack of a better description. We came up with other descriptions, such as 'frontliners', but could not come up with one preferable to 'backbenchers', therefore, we are still open to suggestions.

We urge the Welsh Assembly Government and the Welsh Local Government Association to seek ways in which to re-engage non-executive members in the decision-making process. In particular, the committee recommends that all non-executive councillors should be a member of at least one council committee.

On opening up the decision-making process to the public and establishing clear accountability for decisions in the minds of voters, I have already alluded to the crucial importance of accountability and transparency to any democratic body. That should extend beyond the realms of the council chamber and committee rooms to the community that they serve. It is vital that the public is clear about who is responsible for making decisions as well as how, when and why those decisions are made.

During our inquiry, the committee found little evidence of an increased public interest in the work of councils. However, we welcome the initiatives being taken forward by some authorities to disseminate information and actively engage with the public. We recommend that the Welsh Assembly Government, the WLGA and local authorities work together to promote the sharing of existing good practice in this area.

Our report includes a series of recommendations to the Welsh Assembly Government and local authorities, which we

pwyllogor fwrw golwg mwy cyffredinol ar eu rôl wrth weithredu'r trefniadau rheoli gwleidyddol newydd. Yr oeddem yn bryderus dros ben ynghylch adroddiadau llafar am 'ddigalondid' a theimladau o 'golli pŵer a chysylltiad' ymysg aelodau anweithredol. Mae'r pwyllogor o'r farn ei bod yn hollbwysig hwyluso rolau priodol i feincwyr cefn os yw'r strwythurau newydd i ffynnu. Defnyddiaf y term 'meincwyr cefn' yn niffyg disgrifiad gwell. Gwnaethom ddyfeisio disgrifiadau eraill, fel 'frontliners', ond ni allem feddwl am un a oedd yn well na 'meincwyr cefn', felly, yr ydym yn dal i fod yn barod i ystyried awgrymiadau.

Anogwn Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i geisio dulliau i ailgynnwys aelodau anweithredol yn y broses penderfynu. Yn benodol, mae'r pwyllogor yn argymhell y dylai'r holl gynghorwyr anweithredol fod yn aelod o o leiaf un pwyllogor cyngor.

Ynghylch agor y broses penderfynu i'r cyhoedd a sicrhau atebolrwydd clir ar gyfer penderfyniadau ym meddwl yr etholwyr, yr wyf eisoes wedi nodi bod atebolrwydd a thryloywder yn hollbwysig i unrhyw gorff democrataidd. Dylai hynny fynd y tu hwnt i amgylchoedd siambr y cyngor a'r ystafelloedd pwyllogora a chynnwys y gymuned a wasanaethant. Mae'n hollbwysig bod y cyhoedd yn deall pwy sy'n gyfrifol am wneud penderfyniadau yn ogystal â sut a phryd a pham y gwneir y penderfyniadau hynny.

Yn ystod ein hymchwiliad, ychydig o dystiolaeth a ganfu'r pwyllogor i ddangos bod mwy o ddiddordeb ymysg y cyhoedd yng ngwaith cynghorau. Er hynny, croesawn y mentrau y mae rhai awdurdodau'n eu hyrwyddo i ledaenu gwybodaeth a chysylltu â'r cyhoedd. Yr ydym yn argymhell y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, CLILC ac awdurdodau lleol weithio gyda'i gilydd i hyrwyddo'r gwaith o rannu'r arferion da a geir yn y maes hwn ar hyn o bryd.

Mae ein hadroddiad yn cynnwys cyfres o argymhellion i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac awdurdodau lleol, sydd â'r amcan o greu

have designed to improve the transparency, efficiency and accountability of local political management in Wales. The advent of the new political management structures has brought about far-reaching structural changes within Welsh local authorities. These, in turn, have led to a period of profound cultural change as both councillors and officers adapt to new and challenging roles and relationships. Although some local authorities have come a long way since the old committee system to successfully embrace this change, it is clear that there is still much work to be done in this area.

During the course of its work, the committee saw many examples of good and innovative practice and hopes that its report will be used as a vehicle to encourage local authorities to look outwards and share modern, successful, ways of working. We believe that local government in Wales should strive to achieve confident, dynamic, visible and accountable leadership that is open to robust scrutiny and challenge, and have made recommendations which aim to assist with this end. I therefore commend the committee's report to the Assembly and look forward to receiving the Government's formal response to our recommendations in due course

Mark Isherwood: I declare an interest in that my wife was elected to Flintshire County Council last Thursday.

Section 3.7 of this report states that, in its written evidence to the committee, the Audit Commission in Wales indicated that executive leadership is less well-advanced in authorities where councils struggle to find a sufficient number of capable portfolio members, where there is a lack of clarity or protocols for schemes of delegation and where the quality of information available to the executive leadership is poor, or officers' reports are insufficiently succinct or direct to allow for well-informed risk decision-making. The need for that report, and for a major enhancement in political management structures in local government, was highlighted in part by the Wales programme for improvement, and it must therefore be noted that, in his summary report on the plan, the Director General of the Audit Commission questioned,

rheoli gwleidyddol lleol yng Nghymru sy'n fwy tryloyw, effeithlon ac atebol. Cafwyd newidiadau pellgyrhaeddol yn strwythur awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru yn sgîl y strwythurau rheoli gwleidyddol newydd. Mae'r rhain wedi arwain, yn eu tro, at gyfnod o newid sylfaenol mewn arferion wrth i gynghorwyr a swyddogion ymaddasu i rolau a chydbertnasau newydd ac ymestynnol. Er bod rhai awdurdodau lleol wedi gwneud llawer ers dyddiau'r hen system pwyllgorau i goleddu'r newid hwn yn llwyddiannus, mae'n amlwg bod llawer o waith i'w wneud o hyd yn y maes hwn.

Yn ystod ei waith, gwelodd y pwyllgor lawer enghraifft o arferion da ac arloesol ac mae'n gobeithio y caiff ei adroddiad ei ddefnyddio fel cyfrwng i annog awdurdodau lleol i edrych tuag allan a rhannu dulliau gweithio modern a llwyddiannus. Credwn y dylai llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru ymdrechu i sicrhau arweinyddiaeth hyderus, deinamig, gweladwy ac atebol sy'n agored i graffu a herio trwyadl, a gwnaethom argymhellion sydd â'r bwriad o gyflawni hynny. Gan hynny, cymeradwyaf adroddiad y pwyllgor i'r Cynulliad ac edrychaf ymlaen at gael ymateb ffurfiol y Llywodraeth i'n hargymhellion gyda hyn.

Mark Isherwood: Datganaf fuddiant gan fod fy ngwraig wedi'i hethol i Gyngor Sir y Fflint ddydd Iau diwethaf.

Yn adran 3.7 yn yr adroddiad hwn, dywedir bod y Comisiwn Archwilio yng Nghymru, yn ei dystiolaeth ysgrifenedig i'r pwyllgor, wedi nodi nad yw arweinyddiaeth weithredol wedi datblygu cymaint mewn awdurdodau lle y mae cynghorau'n ei chael yn anodd canfod digon o aelodau portffolio galluog, lle y mae diffyg eglurder neu brotocolau ar gyfer cynlluniau dirprwyo a lle y mae'r wybodaeth sydd ar gael i'r arweinyddiaeth weithredol o ansawdd gwael, neu lle nad yw adroddiadau swyddogion yn ddigon cryno neu uniongyrchol i ganiatáu penderfynu gwybodus ynghylch risg. Yr oedd yr angen am yr adroddiad hwnnw, ac am welliant mawr mewn strwythurau rheoli gwleidyddol mewn llywodraeth leol, wedi'i amlygu'n rhannol drwy raglen Cymru ar gyfer gwella, a rhaid nodi, felly, fod Cyfarwyddwr Cyffredinol y Comisiwn Archwilio, yn ei

adroddiad ar y cynllun, wedi gofyn,

‘whether the WPI framework is strong enough and ‘external’ enough to ensure that weaknesses or failures in managerial or political leadership will be addressed’.

‘p’un a yw fframwaith y Rhaglen yn ddigon cryf ac ‘allanol’ i sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â gwendidau neu ddiffygion mewn arweinyddiaeth reoli neu arweinyddiaeth wleidyddol’.

That was reinforced by the National Audit Office in its report on the renewal of private sector housing in Wales, when it recommended that the Assembly

Ategwyd hynny gan y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol yn ei hadroddiad ar adnewyddu tai sector preifat yng Nghymru, pan argymhellodd y dylai’r Cynulliad

‘remain alert to the risk concerning the devolution of power to local authorities and continue to play a full and active role’.

fod yn effro o hyd i’r risg sy’n gysylltiedig â datganoli pŵer i awdurdodau lleol ac y dylai barhau i chwarae rhan lawn a gweithredol.

A letter to Jane Hutt on 4 October 2001 from Freedom to Care, the whistleblowers organisation, states that

Mewn llythyr at Jane Hutt ar 4 Hydref 2001 oddi wrth Freedom to Care, corff y rhai sy’n datgelu camarfer, dywedir,

‘what our previous correspondence with you has made clear is that if a local authority is determined to conceal its own failures and malpractices from the top, you see little option but to recourse back to that Authority. We know from Cardiff and other Welsh Authorities that the powers of suspension are frequently imposed on the more junior worker trying to raise concerns in good faith, but not against the more senior person causing the concern’.

yr hyn a ddangosodd ein gohebiaeth flaenorol â chi yw na welwch fod fawr o ddewis, os yw awdurdod lleol yn benderfynol o gelu ei ddiffygion a’i gamarferion ei hun o’r top, ond troi’n ôl at yr Awdurdod hwnnw. Gwyddom o’r hyn a welsom yng Nghaerdydd ac mewn Awdurdodau eraill yng Nghymru fod pwerau i atal rhai o’u gwaith yn cael eu gorfodi’n aml ar weithwyr iau sy’n ceisio mynegi pryderon yn ddidwyll, ond nid ar yr un hŷn sy’n peri’r pryder.

The Minister wrote back saying that

Ysgrifennodd y Gweinidog yn ôl gan ddweud mai’r

‘the modernisation agenda for local government would be the way that the Assembly would express its commitment to promoting the highest standards of conduct in local government.’

agenda ar foderneiddio ar gyfer llywodraeth leol yw’r modd y carai’r Cynulliad fynegi ei ymrwymiad i hyrwyddo’r safonau ymddygiad uchaf mewn llywodraeth leol.

That would be a procedural route for solving the problems of council malpractice, by setting up standards committees and drafting codes of conduct, but that does not answer the evidence that we have about councils riding roughshod over their own procedures in order to silence ethical staff. That has been highlighted in Flintshire County Council in particular where, after four weeks of detailed evidence, an employment tribunal unanimously decided that its internal audit manager, Andy Sutton, was unfairly dismissed because of the investigations into

Dull gweithdrefnol o ddatrys problemau camarfer mewn cynghorau fyddai hwnnw, drwy sefydlu pwyllgorau safonau a drafftio codau ymddygiad, ond nid yw hynny’n ddigon yng ngolwg y dystiolaeth sydd gennym am gynghorau sy’n sathru eu gweithdrefnau eu hunain dan draed er mwyn rhoi taw ar staff egwyddorol. Amlygwyd hynny yng Nghyngor Sir y Fflint yn benodol, lle y penderfynodd tribiwnlys cyflogaeth yn unfrydol, ar ôl gwrando ar dystiolaeth fanwl am bedair wythnos, fod ei reolwr archwilio mewnol, Andy Sutton, wedi’i ddiswyddo’n

malpractice he was blocked from carrying out. The judgment was upheld by the employment appeals tribunal. After two eminent QCs had previously identified directors as being responsible for falsification of documents, the employment tribunal judgment stated that 'there had been positive falsification of documentation'. It added,

'there is no doubt under the financial regulations that all officers must co-operate with internal audit'.

The county secretary's explanation to the tribunal of why he delayed or avoided responding to the internal audit's request was far from convincing. The tribunal decision further commended Mr Sutton as a 'reliable and convincing witness', but described the council's chief executive and county secretary as

'uncomfortable and unconvincing and more to be arguing a point than to be giving a straightforward factual account'.

In a letter to the First Minister from Freedom to Care—

Ann Jones: Will you turn some of your remarks to the Committee's report and tell us what your views are on some of its recommendations, rather than giving us a whole diatribe about a council that contributed to this report? You are going on and on, and this report's progress is more important than what you think about an individual council.

Mark Isherwood: My conclusions will address that, but I am trying to make the point that only half a job is being done. I quote from a letter to the First Minister, in which it states that the Labour council leader

'has been very hostile toward Sutton ever since the Internal Auditor investigated serious allegations made against Aldridge in 1999. Before Sutton and his staff could write the report on this serious matter, the former Treasurer took charge of the file and wrote an audit report herself. This was nothing like the

annheg oherwydd yr ymchwiliadau i gamarfer y'i rhwystrwyd rhag eu cyflawni. Cadarnhawyd y dyfarniad gan y tribiwnlys apêl cyflogaeth. Wedi i ddau Gwnsler y Frenhines amlwg ddangos bod cyfarwyddwyr wedi bod yn gyfrifol am ffugio dogfennau, nodwyd yn nyfarniad y tribiwnlys cyflogaeth ei bod 'yn sicr bod dogfennau wedi'u ffugio'. Ychwanegodd,

nid oes amheuaeth o dan y rheoliadau ariannol fod rhaid i bob swyddog gydweithredu ag archwilwyr mewnol.

Yr oedd eglurhad ysgrifennydd y sir i'r tribiwnlys o'r rheswm y gwnaeth ohirio neu osgoi ymateb i gais yr archwilwyr mewnol ymhell o fod yn argyhoeddiadol. Yn nyfarniad y tribiwnlys, canmolwyd Mr Sutton ymhellach drwy ei alw'n 'dyst dibynadwy ac argyhoeddiadol', ond disgrifiodd brif weithredwr y cyngor ac ysgrifennydd y sir fel rhai

anghysurus ac anargyhoeddiadol a oedd yn rhoi mwy o bwys ar ddadlau ar bwynt na rhoi disgrifiad ffeithiol syml.

Mewn llythyr at y Prif Weinidog oddi wrth Freedom to Care—

Ann Jones: A wnewch gyfeirio mewn rhai o'ch sylwadau at adroddiad y Pwyllgor a dweud wrthym beth yw'ch barn am rai o'i argymhellion, yn hytrach nag ymosod ar gyngor a gyfrannodd i'r adroddiad hwn? Yr ydych yn mynd ymlaen ac ymlaen, ac mae cynnydd yr adroddiad hwn yn bwysicach na'ch barn am un cyngor.

Mark Isherwood: Byddaf yn ymdrin â hynny yn fy nghasgliadau, ond yr wyf yn ceisio dangos nad yw ond hanner y gwaith yn cael ei wneud. Dyfynnaf o lythyr at y Prif Weinidog, lle y dywedir bod arweinydd Llafur y cyngor

wedi bod yn elyniaethus iawn tuag at Sutton byth ers i'r Archwilydd Mewnol ymchwilio i gyhuddiadau difrifol a wnaed yn erbyn Aldridge yn 1999. Cyn y gallai Sutton a'i staff ysgrifennu'r adroddiad ar y mater difrifol hwn, cymerodd y cyn-Drysorydd ofal o'r ffeil ac ysgrifennu adroddiad archwilio ei

report that Sutton, as the appointed Auditor, would have written. The Renshaw report was apologetic, incomplete and sought to prematurely close off the investigation. During the tribunal, an Audit file relating to the investigation of Aldridge was put in front of Sutton by Flintshire's QC. This file was incomplete. Items had been removed from it. It is doubtful that the outstanding matters will ever be dealt with by a Council where a culture of fear and institutionalised suppression prevails'.

All those senior persons have subsequently remained in situ and in control as a series of internal investigations have failed to provide proper and effective scrutiny and accountability, and the council now faces a bill for legal costs and compensation possibly running into millions of pounds—

Carl Sargeant: Will the Member give way?

Mark Isherwood: Sorry, I did not see you, Carl.

Carl Sargeant: That was quite a compliment.

4.30 p.m.

On your comments, Mark, the leader and members of Flintshire County Council have recently received phone calls regarding the scrutiny committee and the system that they use. They have been asked if that system could be extended across the country as a model of good practice. Will you explain that?

Mark Isherwood: If you had been listening earlier, I said that internal controls alone will never do the job where serious concerns exist. Like me, everyone here, without a doubt, is familiar with the rules that apply to suspension. This is a neutral, no fault—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You must wind up now, you have had six minutes.

hun. Nid oedd hwnnw'n ddim byd tebyg i'r adroddiad y byddai Sutton, fel yr Archwilydd penodedig, wedi'i ysgrifennu. Yr oedd adroddiad Renshaw yn gyfiawnhaol, yn anghyflawn a cheisiai roi pen ar yr ymchwiliad cyn pryd. Yn ystod y tribiwnlys, rhoddwyd ffeil Archwilio a oedd yn ymwneud â'r ymchwiliad ynghylch Aldridge gerbron Sutton gan Gwnsler y Frenhines Cyngor Sir y Fflint. Yr oedd y ffeil honno'n anghyflawn. Yr oedd eitemau wedi'u tynnu ohoni. Mae'n amheus a fydd y materion sy'n weddill byth yn cael eu trafod gan Gyngor lle y mae ofn ac atal sefydliadol yn gyffredin yn ei ddull o weithredu.

Mae'r holl bersonau uwch hynny wedi aros yn eu lle wedyn ac wedi bod wrth y llyw tra bo cyfres o ymchwiliadau mewnol wedi methu â sicrhau craffu ac atebolrwydd priodol ac effeithiol, ac mae'r cyngor bellach yn wynebu bil am gostau cyfreithiol ac iawndal a allai fod yn gymaint â miliynau o bunnoedd—

Carl Sargeant: A wnaiff yr Aelod ildio?

Mark Isherwood: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ni'ch gwelais, Carl.

Carl Sargeant: Yr oedd hynny'n eithaf compliment.

Ynghylch eich sylwadau, Mark, mae arweinydd ac aelodau Cyngor Sir y Fflint wedi cael galwadau ffôn yn ddiweddar ynghylch y pwyllgor craffu a'r system a ddefnyddiant. Gofynnwyd iddynt a ellid ymestyn y system honno ar draws y wlad fel model o arferion da. A wnewch egluro hynny?

Mark Isherwood: Pe byddech wedi gwrandao arnaf yn gynharach, fe'm clywasech yn dweud na fydd rheolaethau mewnol byth yn ddigon ar eu pennau eu hunain os ceir pryderon difrif. Fel minnau, mae pawb sydd yma'n gyfarwydd, yn sicr, â'r rheolau sy'n ymwneud ag atal rhai o'i swydd. Mae hyn yn niwtral, nid oes bai—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid ichi orffen yn awr, cawsoch chwe munud.

Mark Isherwood: I defer by saying that external controls will safeguard rather than challenge local democracy, and protect rather than threaten the innocent people against whom allegations are made. We must at last have full transparency and accountability, so that local people can know what has been going on.

Leighton Andrews: I commend this report's recommendations, which will be immensely useful to the Labour council that has now taken office in Rhondda Cynon Taf, elected on a manifesto commitment to openness and accountability in government—unlike the previous Plaid Cymru council. Electors perform the ultimate scrutiny, and the electors in Rhondda Cynon Taf, and other Valleys communities, made it clear last week what they felt about a highly secretive Plaid-Cymru-run council, when they removed five members of the Plaid Cymru cabinet, including three in the Rhondda.

Janet Ryder: Would you like to comment on how voters made their views clearly known in Cardiff, Wrexham, Conwy and Swansea? They are all former Labour-controlled councils that are not Labour-controlled any more.

Leighton Andrews: Plaid Cymru lost councillors in Rhondda Cynon Taf, Caerphilly and all three of its councillors in Merthyr Tydfil, and it lost councillors in Flintshire and Denbighshire, and in its leader's community of Anglesey.

I will comment specifically on the scrutiny arrangements of the previous Plaid-Cymru-run Rhondda Cynon Taf council, since this may be the last opportunity to draw conclusions from its performance, which I know will not be liked in some quarters of the Chamber. Theoretically, there was a scrutiny system in operation under the Plaid Cymru council, but the district auditor in his report to the council in April 2003 said that this system was unusual compared with other authorities in England and Wales. It also said that the task teams that operated within the scrutiny function in the council were informal

Mark Isherwood: Ildiaf drwy ddweud mai diogelu democratiaeth leol a wnaiff rheolaethau allanol yn hytrach na'i herio, ac amddiffyn yn hytrach na bygwth rhai dieuog y gwneir cyhuddiadau yn eu herbyn. Rhaid inni gael tryloywder ac atebolrwydd llawn o'r diwedd, fel y caiff pobl leol wybod beth a fu'n mynd ymlaen.

Leighton Andrews: Cymeradwyaf argymhellion yr adroddiad hwn, a fydd yn ddefnyddiol dros ben i'r cyngor Llafur sydd bellach wedi dod i rym yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, a etholwyd ar sail ymrwymiad maniffesto i weithredu agored ac atebol mewn llywodraeth—yn wahanol i'r cyngor Plaid Cymru a'i rhagflaenodd. Etholwyr sy'n cyflawni'r craffu terfynol, a gwnaeth yr etholwyr yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, a chymunedau eraill yn y Cymoedd, roi ar ddeall yr wythnos diwethaf yr hyn a deimlent am gyngor tra chyfrinachgar dan Blaid Cymru, pan gawsant wared â phum aelod o gabinet Plaid Cymru, gan gynnwys tri yn y Rhondda.

Janet Ryder: A hoffech wneud sylw am y modd y rhoddodd etholwyr wybod am eu barn yng Nghaerdydd, Wrecsam, Conwy ac Abertawe? Maent i gyd yn gynghorau a gâi eu rheoli gan Lafur nad ydynt yn cael eu rheoli ganddo bellach.

Leighton Andrews: Collodd Plaid Cymru gynghorwyr yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, Caerffili a phob un o'i dri chynghorydd ym Merthyr Tudful, a chollodd gynghorwyr yn sir y Fflint a sir Ddinbych, ac yng nghymuned ei harweinydd yn Ynys Môn.

Gwnaf sylw'n benodol am drefniadau craffu cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf, a gâi ei reoli gynt gan Blaid Cymru, gan ei bod yn bosibl mai hwn fydd y cyfle olaf i dynnu casgliadau o'i berfformiad, na fydd, mi wn, wrth fodd rhai yn y Siambr. Yn ddamcaniaethol, yr oedd system graffu ar waith o dan gyngor Plaid Cymru, ond dywedodd yr archwilydd dosbarth yn ei adroddiad i'r cyngor yn Ebrill 2003 fod y system hon yn anarferol o'i chymharu ag awdurdodau eraill yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Dywedodd hefyd fod y timau gorchwyl a weithredai o dan y swyddogaeth craffu yn y cyngor yn anffurfiol

and not politically balanced. The report also raised critical issues about the use of call-in mechanisms. I welcome the conclusions and recommendations in this report by the Local Government and Public Service Committee, as they will provide a basis on which the new council in Rhondda Cynon Taf can operate.

Scrutiny also concerns how councils are held accountable to their public, and how they communicate with their voters. Again, the district auditor said many interesting things during the last year or so about the operation of the Plaid-Cymru-run council in Rhondda Cynon Taf. In a letter to me, in June 2003, when I complained about the Plaid Cymru propaganda sheet, *Rapidly Changing Times*, the district auditor said that he would bring a few matters to the council's attention to ensure that balance was maintained. Again, in October last year, he wrote to me to say that he felt that there were a few examples where he considered that a better balance could have been struck, in particular on reporting audit and inspection reports, where the opportunities for improvement were, in his view, not always as prominent as the good practice. In other words, the council needed to be more accurate in the way it reported the district auditor's comments. The district auditor raised the issue of the propaganda sheet in his annual audit letter to the council earlier this year, because he believed that it required further comment.

A lot has been said in the Chamber over the last few months about the claims of the Plaid Cymru leadership that theirs was the most improved council in Wales. I will put this matter finally to rest on the record. I hope that this is the last time that I have to say this, and I am sure that many others feel the same. However, the *Local Government Chronicle* wrote to me in April to confirm that the Rhondda Cynon Taf application to be considered the most improved council was self-nominated. It was not only self-nominated but self-promoted and self-obsessed, as the voters demonstrated last week. I am pleased to see that we are now going forward with a new council in Rhondda Cynon Taf. Plaid Cymru sustained

ac yn wleidyddol anghytwys. Yr oedd yr adroddiad yn mynegi beirniadaeth hefyd ynghylch y defnydd o ddulliau galw i mewn. Croesawaf y casgliadau a'r argymhellion sydd yn yr adroddiad hwn o eiddo'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus, gan y byddant yn sail i weithrediad y cyngor newydd yn Rhondda Cynon Taf.

Mae craffu'n ymwneud hefyd â'r modd y bydd cynghorau'n cael eu dal yn atebol i'w cyhoedd, a sut y maent yn cyfathrebu â'u hetholwyr. Unwaith eto, dywedodd yr archwilydd dosbarth lawer o bethau diddorol yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, fwy neu lai, am weithrediad y cyngor a oedd yn cael ei redeg gan Plaid Cymru yn Rhondda Cynon Taf. Mewn llythyr ataf, ym Mehefin 2003, pan gwynais am daflen bropropaganda Plaid Cymru, *Rapidly Changing Times*, dywedodd yr archwilydd dosbarth y deuai â rhai materion i sylw'r cyngor i sicrhau y cedwid cydbwysedd. Wedyn, ym mis Hydref y llynedd, ysgrifennodd ataf i ddweud ei fod yn teimlo bod rhai enghreifftiau lle y barnai y gallesid bod yn fwy cytwys, yn enwedig wrth adrodd am adroddiadau archwilio ac arolygu, lle nad oedd y cyfleoedd i wella mor amlwg bob amser, yn ei farn ef, â'r arferion da. Mewn geiriau eraill, yr oedd angen i'r cyngor adrodd yn fwy cywir ar sylwadau'r archwilydd dosbarth. Gwnaeth yr archwilydd dosbarth godi mater y daflen bropropaganda yn ei lythyr archwilio blynyddol i'r cyngor yn gynharach eleni, am ei fod yn credu bod hynny'n galw am sylw pellach.

Dywedwyd llawer yn y Siambr dros y misoedd diwethaf am honiadau arweinwyr Plaid Cymru mai eu cyngor hwy a oedd wedi gwella'n fwyaf yng Nghymru. Cyfeiriaf at y mater hwn am y tro olaf fel y caiff pawb wybod amdano. Gobeithiaf mai hwn fydd y tro olaf y bydd yn rhaid imi ddweud hyn, ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod sawl un arall yn teimlo'r un fath. Fodd bynnag, ysgrifennodd y *Local Government Chronicle* ataf yn Ebrill i gadarnhau mai Rhondda Cynon Taf a oedd wedi'i enwebu ei hun i gael ei ystyried yn gyngor a oedd wedi gwella fwyaf. Yn ogystal â'i enwebu ei hun, yr oedd yn ei hyrwyddo ei hun ac yn hunanobsesiynol, fel y dangosodd yr etholwyr yr wythnos diwethaf. Yr wyf yn falch o weld ein bod yn mynd yn ein blaen â

25 losses while Labour made 31 gains. This was not the most improved council in Wales, but the most heavily defeated council in Wales.

Peter Black: I declare an interest as a member of the new Liberal Democrat-led administration in the City and County of Swansea Council, of which Labour lost control at the election for many of the reasons that Leighton Andrews set out just now with regard to Rhondda Cynon Taf. The practices that he described apply to Labour in Swansea, Bridgend, Cardiff and other councils.

I will, however, talk about the report. *[Interruption.]* No, I have much to say about the report and I will not take interventions. We must be clear about the issue before us. Many of the criticisms in this report were made because of the system imposed on local government by the Local Government Act 2000 in the form of the executive scrutiny split. When we were in partnership Government, we tried our best to mitigate the effects of that split by adopting the fourth option, namely the executive board. Essentially, however, there was no way around that executive scrutiny split because the system was imposed on us by Westminster, and we in the National Assembly for Wales did not have the power to overrule it.

Faced with that system, how have local councils reacted? The report is clear that there are many practices which are not good and much that could be improved. I will talk about some of the examples, evidence of which I have seen for myself as a councillor and in various other councils in the region.

Peter Law: I note that you are taking the greedy approach of being a county councillor and an Assembly Member. Are you abating your council payments, especially given the lack of time available to you if you do your Assembly job properly? With regard to this 'fourth option', do you refer to the famous Liberal Democrat-supported idea that few

chyngor newydd yn Rhondda Cynon Taf yn awr. Collodd Plaid Cymru 25 o seddau tra enillodd Llafur 31. Nid y cyngor a oedd wedi gwella fwyaf yng Nghymru oedd hwn, ond yr un a drechwyd fwyaf.

Peter Black: Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o'r weinyddiaeth newydd sy'n cael ei harwain gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar Gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe, y collodd Llafur reolaeth arno yn yr etholiad am lawer o'r rhesymau y mae Leighton Andrews newydd eu nodi mewn cysylltiad â Rhondda Cynon Taf. Mae'r arferion a ddisgrifiodd yn berthnasol i Lafur yn Abertawe, Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, Caerdydd a chynghorau eraill.

Fodd bynnag, trafodaf yr adroddiad. *[Torri ar draws.]* Na, mae gennyf lawer i'w ddweud am yr adroddiad ac ni dderbyniaf ymyriadau. Rhaid inni fod yn glir ynghylch y mater sydd ger ein bron. Yr oedd llawer o'r beirniadaethau a wnaed yn yr adroddiad hwn yn ganlyniad i'r system a orfodwyd ar lywodraeth leol drwy Ddeddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000 ar ffurf y rhaniad rhwng y weithrediaeth a chraffu. Pan oeddem yn y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, gwnaethom ein gorau i leddfu effeithiau'r rhaniad hwnnw drwy fabwysiadu'r pedwerydd dewis, sef y bwrdd gweithredol. Fodd bynnag, yn y bôn, nid oedd unrhyw fodd i osgoi'r rhaniad hwnnw rhwng y weithrediaeth a chraffu gan fod y system wedi'i gorfodi arnom gan San Steffan, ac nid oedd gennym bŵer yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru i'w gwrthod.

Yn wyneb y system honno, sut y mae cynghorau lleol wedi ymateb? Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi'n glir fod llawer o arferion sydd heb fod yn dda a bod llawer y gellid ei wella. Soniaf am rai o'r enghreifftiau, y gwelais dystiolaeth ohonynt fel cynghorydd ac mewn amryw o gynghorau eraill yn y rhanbarth.

Peter Law: Sylwaf eich bod yn mynd at hyn yn farus drwy fod yn gynghorydd sir ac yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad. A ydych yn cymryd llai o dâl gan y cyngor, yn enwedig o gofio y bydd eich amser yn brin os gwnewch eich gwaith yn y Cynulliad yn iawn? Gyda golwg ar y 'pedwerydd dewis', fel y'i gelwir, a ydych yn cyfeirio at y syniad enwog a

people took up? Is that the style that the City and County of Swansea Council will adopt under Liberal Democrat control in the future? I would be interested to see if you have the fourth option there.

Peter Black: You have obviously been reading the Liberal Democrat manifesto, because that is exactly what we want to adopt. However, as the report points out, it is not easy to change, as councils need Welsh Assembly Government approval and must go through another consultation exercise. In the meantime, we will try to amend the current system to make it as close as possible to the desired model when we look at that issue.

With regard to scrutiny committees, one of the biggest problems was their perceived lack of independence. Many councils determined that they should be chaired by a member of the ruling group, with the honourable exception of Labour-controlled Bridgend, which insisted that opposition party members chaired those committees. I observed that scrutiny committees in Bridgend worked far more effectively because they were chaired by the opposition than those in Swansea and other councils, whose scrutiny committees were chaired by members of the ruling group. The fact that those committees were chaired by members of the ruling group often led to requests for scrutiny being blocked and it often caused problems in terms of calling in items and, sometimes—and I am not just talking about Labour, but across the board—the ruling party also blocked recommendations that would have led to a far more effective scrutiny report. That is regrettable and must be addressed as part of reforming this system.

The system of calling in was also particularly difficult. Because the cabinet was, in effect, given delegated powers, many councils designed a call-in system that effectively reduced the number of issues that could be called in, making it as difficult as possible to call in a particular decision. You had to

gefnogodd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol nas derbyniwyd ond gan ychydig? Ai dull o'r fath y bydd Cyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe yn ei fabwysiadu o dan reolaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y dyfodol? Bydd o ddiddordeb imi weld a gymerwch y pedwerydd dewis yno.

Peter Black: Mae'n amlwg eich bod wedi darllen maniffesto'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, gan mai hwnnw yw'r union beth yr ydym am ei fabwysiadu. Fodd bynnag, fel y noda'r adroddiad, nid yw'n hawdd newid, gan fod rhaid i gynghorau gael cymeradwyaeth gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a rhaid iddynt gynnal ymgynghoriad arall. Yn y cyfamser, ceisiwn newid y system bresennol fel y bydd cyn debyced ag y bo modd i'r model a ddymunnir pan ystyriwn y mater hwnnw.

Gyda golwg ar bwyllgorau craffu, un o'r problemau oedd eu diffyg annibyniaeth canfyddedig. Penderfynodd llawer o gynghorau mai aelod o'r grŵp rheoli ddylai eu cadeirio, gyda chyngor Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr o dan reolaeth Llafur yn eithriad gwiw, gan ei fod wedi mynnu mai aelodau'r wrthblaid a ddylai gadeirio'r pwyllgorau hynny. Sylwais fod y pwyllgorau craffu ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr yn gweithio'n llawer mwy effeithiol, am mai'r wrthblaid a oedd yn eu cadeirio, o'u cymharu â'r rhai yn Abertawe ac mewn cynghorau eraill, yr oedd eu pwyllgorau craffu'n cael eu cadeirio gan aelodau'r grŵp rheoli. Yr oedd y ffaith mai aelodau o'r grŵp rheoli a gadeiriai'r pwyllgorau hynny yn peri'n aml fod ceisiadau am graffu'n cael eu gwrthod a pharai broblemau'n aml o ran galw eitemau i mewn ac, weithiau—ac nid wyf yn sôn am Lafur yn unig, ond am bawb—yr oedd y blaid a oedd yn rheoli hefyd wedi gwrthod argymhellion a fyddai wedi sicrhau adroddiad craffu mwy effeithiol o lawer. Mae hynny'n destun gofid a rhaid ymdrin â hynny wrth ddiwygio'r system hon.

Yr oedd y system galw i mewn yn neilltuol o anodd hefyd. Gan fod y cabinet yn cael pwerau dirprwyedig, i bob pwrpas, gwnaeth sawl cyngor ddyfeisio system galw i mewn a oedd mewn gwirionedd yn lleihau nifer y materion y gellid eu galw i mewn, gan ei gwneud cyn anhawsed â phosibl galw

demonstrate, for example, that the matter had not been determined previously by the policy of the council. Until you start to open up that process and give opposition councils more freedom to call in decisions, the scrutiny process will not be as effective as it can be and will not be half as effective as that which we have in the Assembly, imperfect as that system is. The call-in procedures that councils operate must be examined.

4.40 p.m.

As part of the partnership Government, we insisted that executives meet in public. Many councils took that in good spirit, but others abused the privilege, held pre-meetings and made decisions beforehand. Some executive meetings—one of which was a Cardiff executive meeting—famously lasted for less than five minutes because the decisions had been made beforehand. Again, that was an abuse. I sat in on some council cabinet meetings, and, in many instances, the way in which they were scripted and rehearsed made it much better than the pantomime that was playing in Swansea's Grand Theatre. That sort of behaviour in executive committees was an abuse of the process and of the attempt to make those committees open and transparent, and it led people to believe, rightly or wrongly, that no real debate was taking place on the council's decisions. The councils in Cardiff, Swansea and Bridgend will probably end up with multi-party committees, so that will not happen there, and I hope that other councils take advantage of the changes brought about by the elections to ensure that we have proper debates in those committees.

Scrutiny is not just about resource and training. We must also have a free flow of information, and cabinet members must be formally questioned on a regular basis, so that we can reinforce the independence of scrutiny committees from the ruling group. If

penderfyniad penodol i mewn. Rhaid oedd profi, er enghraifft, nad oedd y mater wedi'i benderfynu o'r blaen o dan bolisi'r cyngor. Hyd nes yr agorir y broses honno a rhoi mwy o ryddid i wrthbleidiau ar gynghorau gael galw penderfyniadau i mewn, ni fydd y broses craffu mor effeithiol ag y gallo fod ac ni fydd hanner mor ffeithiol â'r hyn sydd gennym yn y Cynulliad, er amherffeithed y system honno. Rhaid edrych ar y gweithdrefnau galw i mewn y mae cynghorau'n eu gweithredu.

Pan oeddem yn rhan o'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, gwnaethom fynnu bod gweithrediaethau'n cwrdd yn gyhoeddus. Gwnaeth llawer o gynghorau dderbyn hynny'n galonnog, ond gwnaeth eraill gamddefnyddio'r fraint, gan gynnal cyfarfodydd a gwneud penderfyniadau ymlaen llaw. Yr oedd rhai cyfarfodydd gweithrediaeth—a chyfarfod gweithrediaeth Caerdydd yn un ohonynt—yn nodedig am eu bod yn parhau am lai na phum munud gan fod y penderfyniadau wedi'u gwneud ymlaen llaw. Yr oedd hwnnw hefyd yn gamarfer. Ymbresenolais yn rhai o gyfarfodydd cabinet y cyngor, ac, mewn sawl achos, yr oedd y modd yr oeddent wedi'u hysgrifennu a'u hymarfer yn peri eu bod yn well o lawer na'r pantomeim a oedd ymlaen yn Theatr y Grand yn Abertawe. Yr oedd ymddygiad o'r fath mewn pwyllgorau gweithredol yn gamddefnydd o'r broses ac o'r ymgais i beri i'r pwyllgorau hynny fod yn agored ac yn dryloyw, a pharai i bobl gredu, yn gam neu'n gymwys, nad oedd unrhyw wir ddadlau'n digwydd ynghylch penderfyniadau'r cyngor. Mae'n debyg mai pwyllgorau ambleidiol fydd gan y cynghorau yng Nghaerdydd, Abertawe a Phen-y-bont ar Ogwr yn y diwedd, felly ni ddigwydd hynny yno, a gobeithiaf y bydd cynghorau eraill yn manteisio ar y newidiadau a ddaeth yn sgîl yr etholiadau i sicrhau y cawn ddadleuon iawn yn y pwyllgorau hynny.

Nid ag adnoddau a hyfforddiant yn unig y mae a wnelo craffu. Rhaid inni gael llif dirwysr o wybodaeth, a rhaid i aelodau cabinet gael eu holi'n ffurfiol, a hynny'n rheolaidd, fel y gallwn beri i bwyllgorau craffu fod yn fwy annibynnol ar y grŵp sy'n

you can do that, you will have a far more effective scrutiny process.

Gwenda Thomas: I am pleased to note this report. I will focus on chapter 4 and, in particular, the importance of effective scrutiny with regard to policy development and implementation. An effective scrutiny process is essential in identifying cross-cutting issues such as equality of opportunity and the eradication of child poverty. During the debate on child poverty last week, I suggested that the Minister for Health and Social Services sought to ensure, jointly with Sue Essex, that policy agreements with local authorities recognise child poverty as a cross-cutting issue in local government. I see a strong link between that debate and the debate today on the operation of new political management structures. It would be useful and constructive for scrutiny committees' agendas to include thematic items, which should include child poverty and equality of opportunity. Mainstreaming the fight against child poverty and equality of opportunity in local government is essential if the Assembly's targets are to be met.

The chair and members of scrutiny committees are empowered to set an agenda and to make recommendations to the executive, and, as this report clearly states, there must be adequate and effective support from preferably independently designated officials for this to happen. Scrutiny committee recommendations should be made publicly to the executive and the response of the executive should subsequently be published within reasonable time limits. Scrutiny committees should then monitor implementation and evaluate the effect of agreed recommendations on policy development. There is currently some excellent practice in local authorities, but public awareness of the modernisation agenda is lacking, and this can lead to a misleading perception of local government's role in our communities.

I would like to see more consistency in, and among, local authorities with regard to monitoring services for our most vulnerable children. Does the modernisation process adequately accommodate the corporate and

rheoli. Os gellir gwneud hynny, ceir proses craffu sy'n fwy effeithiol o lawer.

Gwenda Thomas: Yr wyf yn falch o nodi'r adroddiad hwn. Canolbwyntiaf ar bennod 4 ac, yn benodol, ar bwysigrwydd craffu effeithiol gyda golwg ar ddatblygu polisi a gweithredu. Mae proses craffu effeithiol yn hollbwysig wrth ganfod materion trawsbynciol fel cyfle cyfartal a dileu tlodi ymysg plant. Yn ystod y ddadl ar dlodi ymysg plant yr wythnos diwethaf, awgrymais y dylai'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol geisio sicrhau, ar y cyd â Sue Essex, y bydd cytundebau polisi ag awdurdodau lleol yn cydnabod tlodi ymysg plant yn fater trawsbynciol mewn llywodraeth leol. Gwelaf gysylltiad pendant rhwng y ddadl honno a'r ddadl a geir heddiw ar weithredu strwythurau rheoli gwleidyddol newydd. Byddai'n fuddiol ac yn adeiladol pe byddai agendâu pwyllgorau craffu'n cynnwys eitemau thematig, a thlodi ymysg plant a chyfle cyfartal yn eu plith. Mae'n hollbwysig rhoi'r frwydr yn erbyn tlodi ymysg plant a chyfle cyfartal mewn llywodraeth leol yn y brif ffrwd os ydys i gyrraedd targedau'r Cynulliad.

Mae pŵer gan gadeirydd ac aelodau pwyllgorau craffu i osod agenda a rhoi argymhellion i'r weithrediaeth, ac, fel y mae'r adroddiad hwn yn datgan yn glir, mae hynny'n gofyn cymorth digonol ac effeithiol gan swyddogion, a ddylai fod wedi'u dynodi'n annibynnol os oes modd. Dylai argymhellion pwyllgorau craffu gael eu rhoi ar goedd i'r weithrediaeth a dylid cyhoeddi ymateb y weithrediaeth wedyn o fewn cyfnod rhesymol. Wedyn dylai pwyllgorau craffu gadw golwg ar y modd y'u rhoddir ar waith a gwerthuso effaith argymhellion a gytunwyd ar y gwaith o ddatblygu polisi. Mae rhai arferion rhagorol ar hyn o bryd mewn awdurdodau lleol, ond mae diffyg ymwybyddiaeth ymysg y cyhoedd o'r agenda ar fodernaiddio, a gall hynny greu camargraff o rôl llywodraeth leol yn ein cymunedau.

Carwn weld mwy o gysondeb mewn awdurdodau lleol, a chyd-rhyngddynt, mewn cysylltiad â monitro gwasanaethau ar gyfer y plant sy'n fwyaf agored i niwed. A yw'r broses moderneiddio'n darparu'n ddigonol ar

individual responsibilities of elected members towards children at risk in our society? This responsibility exists regardless of whether a member is part of the executive or is a backbencher.

I would have welcomed a recommendation on best practice to ensure that the modernisation process accommodates the individual, specific statutory responsibility of elected members in regard to children looked-after by local authorities where the authority is in loco parentis. However, I welcome the reference to elected members in recommendations 1, 2, 3, 10, 11, and 13. I welcome this debate and hope that, in the context of my contribution, recommendations 3 and 5 will be fully embraced by local government in Wales.

William Graham: I endorse many of the recommendations, if not on a party basis, then from personal experience. On some of Mrs Thomas's remarks, I wholly endorse what she says, having served on such committees. However, there must be adequate resources for training. It is vital that that is kept in mind, given the problems that have occurred with the most vulnerable members of our society. You must be trained, not only to go along as an individual, but with an idea of what to look for, in old people's homes and, particularly, with children. I cannot over-emphasise how important that is, and many recommendations mention that. You brought up that point directly in our debate of three years ago, Gwenda. However, no substantial steps have been taken in local authorities. We do not want to wait for another disaster or scandal before we have to put these things into practice. Let us do that now. Therefore, I welcome that recommendation.

Recommendation 4 mentions committee chairs not being able to veto the use of call-in procedures. I echo Peter's warning about how call-in procedures have been drafted. I ask the committee again to consider the procedures and to make them as wide as possible. In my own authority of Newport, one of the main difficulties was getting people to attend the scrutiny committee. If it were not for opposition members, there rarely

gyfer y cyfrifoldebau corfforaethol ac unigol sydd gan aelodau etholedig tuag at blant sydd mewn perygl yn ein cymdeithas? Mae'r cyfrifoldeb hwn yn bod pa un a yw aelod yn rhan o'r weithrediaeth neu'n feinciwr cefn.

Buaswn yn falch o weld argymhelliad ar arferion gorau i sicrhau bod y broses moderneiddio'n darparu ar gyfer y cyfrifoldeb statudol penodol, unigol sydd gan aelodau etholedig mewn cysylltiad â phlant sy'n derbyn gofal gan awdurdodau lleol os yw'r awdurdod yn gweithredu yn lle rhiant. Serch hynny, croesawaf y cyfeiriad at aelodau etholedig yn argymhellion 1, 2, 3, 10, 11, a 13. Croesawaf y ddatl hon a gobeithiaf, yng nghyd-destun fy nghyfraniad, y bydd argymhellion 3 a 5 yn cael eu derbyn yn llawn gan lywodraeth leol yng Nghymru.

William Graham: Cymeradwyaf lawer o'r argymhellion ar sail profiad personol, os nad o safbwynt plaid. Ynghylch rhai o sylwadau Mrs Thomas, llwyr gefnogaf yr hyn a ddywed, a minnau wedi gwasanaethu ar bwyllgorau o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, rhaid cael adnoddau digonol ar gyfer hyfforddiant. Mae'n hollbwysig dal hynny mewn cof, o ystyried y problemau a gafwyd gyda'r rhai sy'n fwyaf agored i niwed yn ein cymdeithas. Rhaid ichi gael eich hyfforddi, nid yn unig i fynd yno fel unigolyn, ond i gael syniad o'r hyn y dylid chwilio amdano, mewn cartrefi hen bobl ac, yn enwedig, yn achos plant. Ni allaf orbwysleisio mor bwysig yw hynny, ac mae nifer o'r argymhellion yn ei grybwyll. Gwnaethoch godi'r union bwynt hwnnw yn ein dadl dair blynedd yn ôl, Gwenda. Fodd bynnag, ni chymerwyd unrhyw gamau sylweddol mewn awdurdodau lleol. Nid ydym am orfod disgwyl trychineb neu sgandal arall cyn inni roi'r pethau hyn ar waith. Gadewch inni wneud hynny'n awr. Felly, croesawaf yr argymhelliad hwnnw.

Mae argymhelliad 4 yn sôn am anallu cadeiryddion pwyllgorau i wahardd defnyddio gweithdrefnau galw i mewn. Ategaf y rhybudd a roddodd Peter ynghylch y modd y mae gweithdrefnau galw i mewn wedi'u drafftio. Galwaf eto ar y pwyllgor i ystyried y gweithdrefnau a pheri iddynt fod mor gynhwysfawr ag y bo modd. Yn fy awdurdod i yng Nghasnewydd, un o'r prif anawsterau oedd cael rhai i ddod i'r pwyllgor

would have been anything like a quorum. That was because there was a definite idea that we were considering matters that had already occurred—they were always in the past, and never current. I am sure that both the present and previous Ministers considered how to make these matters contemporary, by directly considering what happens in a council and not decisions already taken by the cabinet and implemented across the county council.

I cannot find much in the report about silencing ethical staff. I would like to see proper and adequate safeguards in that respect. Recommendation 8 is interesting—it recommends that the party whip should not be used in the business of overview and scrutiny committees, and, if used, its use should be declared. That is a laudable attempt, but we all know what will happen in practice. The ex-leader of Cardiff County Council, who gave evidence some time ago, said:

‘I really do not think that it is working on a democratic process. With this system the decision making process is left to a few people, i.e. the cabinet members’.

We have already discussed that. In our capital city, the decision to hold cabinet meetings in public will mean that discussions and decisions will be made at party meetings on a Monday night not in the cabinet meeting on a Tuesday morning.

I take on board that you know how this must happen in practice, to an extent. The more transparent and more open our government can become, the more likely it is that people will engage with local government.

Finally, I make a plea that this is more widely discussed. Sadly, many new councillors will be unaware of these recommendations. Now is the time to make their views known to us as Assembly Members so that the Local Government and Public Services Committee can work for an effective report, which all councillors and parties across Wales may endorse.

craffu. Oni bai am aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau, anaml y ceid cworwm o gwbl. Yr oedd hynny am fod cred bendant ein bod yn ystyried materion a oedd wedi digwydd eisoes—rhywbeth yn y gorffennol oeddynt bob amser, nid oedd byth yn gyfredol. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog presennol a'r un blaenorol wedi ystyried sut y gellid peri i'r materion hyn fod yn gyfoes, drwy ystyried yr hyn sy'n digwydd mewn cyngor ar y pryd ac nid penderfyniadau a wnaed eisoes gan y cabinet a'u rhoi ar waith drwy'r cyngor sir.

Ni allaf ganfod llawer yn yr adroddiad sy'n ymwneud â rhoi taw ar staff egwyddorol. Carwn weld mesurau diogelwch priodol a digonol yn hynny o beth. Mae argymhelliad 8 yn ddiddorol—mae'n argymhell na ddylid arfer chwip y blaid ym musnes pwyllgorau arolygu a chraffu, ac, os arferir hi, y dylid datgan hynny. Mae honno'n ymgais glodwiw, ond yr ydym oll yn gwybod beth a ddigwydd yn ymarferol. Yn ôl cyn-arweinydd Cyngor Sir Caerdydd, a roddodd dystiolaeth gryn amser yn ôl:

Ni chredaf ei fod yn dilyn proses ddemocrataidd. Drwy'r system hon, gadewir y broses penderfynu i ychydig o bobl, hynny yw, aelodau'r cabinet.

Yr ydym eisoes wedi trafod hynny. Yn ein prifddinas, bydd y penderfyniad i gynnal cyfarfodydd cabinet yn gyhoeddus yn golygu mai mewn cyfarfodydd plaid nos Lun y ceir y trafodaethau a'r penderfyniadau, ac nid yng nghyfarfod y cabinet fore Mawrth.

Derbyniaf eich bod yn gwybod bod hyn yn sicr o ddigwydd yn ymarferol, i ryw raddau. Po fwyaf tryloyw ac agored y bydd ein llywodraeth, mwyaf tebygol ydyw y bydd pobl yn ymwneud â llywodraeth leol.

Yn olaf, gwnaf apêl am gael trafodaeth ehangach ar hyn. Gwaetha'r modd, bydd llawer o gynghorwyr newydd na wyddant am yr argymhellion hyn. Dyma'r adeg i ni Aelodau'r Cynulliad gael gwybod eu barn fel y gall y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus weithio i gael adroddiad effeithiol, y gall yr holl gynghorwyr a phleidiau ledled Cymru ei gefnogi.

David Lloyd: This debate is about noting the contents of this purple-coloured report, so I will address my remarks to that. The report, 'The Operation of New Political Management Structures in Local Government', was launched at lunchtime today. I thank everyone who was involved in that launch, as well as the committee Chair, Ann Jones, for capably overseeing and steering this comprehensive review into the new management structures. Following Ann's lead, I also thank the committee clerks and the Members' Research Service for their excellent work in preparing this review. I also thank, as already alluded to by Ann, all the local authorities, their members, chief executives and support staff, who also played a valuable role in formulating this review. I believe that local government appreciated this interaction with Assembly Members and staff and felt that it should happen more often. We should have more reviews that involve local authorities and more opportunities to visit them.

4.50 p.m.

There are 17 recommendations in the report, none of which allude to the inner workings of the Plaid Cymru Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council over the past five years. However, it is worth noting that the Plaid Cymru group is proud of its achievements in turning around the performance of that council, which was failing. We regret last Thursday's result, but we will face the rather childish triumphalism shown today with stoicism.

We are only asked to note the content of this report today. In that context, I will concentrate on a few headlines. Is the cabinet structure and its operation truly open and transparent or does it constitute a formalised stitch-up? The people of Swansea decided last week that it was the latter. It is early days, and much was said during the recent local election campaign about how our councils are run, how open, accountable and transparent they are and about the quality of decision making. Scrutiny committees hold the executive to account—they carry out the

David Lloyd: Mae'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud â nodi cynnwys yr adroddiad porffor hwn, felly ymdriniaf â hwnnw yn fy sylwadau. Cafodd yr adroddiad, 'Gweithredu Strwythurau Rheoli Gwleidyddol Newydd mewn Llywodraeth Leol', ei lansio amser cinio heddiw. Diolchaf i bawb a fu'n ymwneud â'r cyfarfod lansio hwnnw, yn ogystal â Chadeirydd y pwyllgor, Ann Jones, am ei gwaith medrus wrth oruchwylio a llywio'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr hwn o'r strwythurau rheoli newydd. Gan ddilyn Ann, diolchaf finnau i glercod y pwyllgor a Gwasanaeth Ymchwil yr Aelodau am eu gwaith rhagorol wrth baratoi'r adolygiad hwn. Yr wyf hefyd yn diolch, fel y gwnaeth Ann eisoes, i'r holl awdurdodau lleol, eu haelodau, eu prif weithredwyr a'u staff ategol, a chwaraeodd ran werthfawr hefyd wrth wneud yr adolygiad hwn. Credaf fod llywodraeth leol yn gwerthfawrogi'r rhyngweithio hwn ag Aelodau a staff y Cynulliad a'i bod yn teimlo y dylai ddiwydd yn amlach. Dylem gael rhagor o adolygiadau sy'n cynnwys awdurdodau lleol a mwy o gyfleoedd i ymweld â hwy.

Mae 17 o argymhellion yn yr adroddiad, nad oes yr un ohonynt yn cyfeirio at weithrediadau mewnol Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf Plaid Cymru dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf. Er hynny, mae'n werth nodi bod grŵp Plaid Cymru'n ymfalchïo yn yr hyn a gyflawnodd wrth weddnewid perfformiad y cyngor hwnnw, a oedd yn methu. Mae'r canlyniad ddydd Iau diwethaf yn peri gofid i ni, ond wynebwn yr ymorchestu plentynnaidd braidd a welwyd heddiw'n stoicaidd.

Y cwbl y gofynnir inni ei wneud yw nodi cynnwys yr adroddiad hwn heddiw. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, canolbwyntiaf ar rai penawdau. A yw'r strwythur cabinet a'i weithrediad yn wirioneddol agored a thryloyw ynteu a yw'n fradychiad ffurfiol? Penderfynodd pobl Abertawe yr wythnos diwethaf mai'r olaf ydoedd. Mae'n gynnar eto, a dywedwyd llawer yn ystod ymgyrch yr etholiadau lleol yn ddiweddar am y modd y mae ein cynghorau'n cael eu rhedeg, am y graddau y maent yn agored, yn atebol ac yn dryloyw ac am ansawdd y penderfynu. Mae

checks and balances of the whole system. During our review we visited several authorities, and it became obvious that the quality of scrutiny is not uniformly excellent. As is alluded to in the recommendations, more resources in terms of officer time and research are required to improve opposition scrutiny of executive decisions. That will improve the overall performance of county councils, in terms of scrutiny and the executive's performance. I also believe that the chairs of scrutiny committees should not be members of the same political party as the ruling cabinet. That is alluded to in the report, but we should make that more explicit. In Swansea, for example, until last week, there was a Labour ruling cabinet and all the scrutiny committees chairs were also Labour members.

O ran y cynghorwyr hynny nad ydynt yn rhan o'r cabinet, sef cynghorwyr y meinciau cefn neu'r cynghorwyr anweithredol, fel y'u gelwir yn y ddogfen hon, mae argymhelliad 11 ac eraill yn nodi pwysigrwydd datblygu rôl benodol iddynt fel arweinwyr cymunedol ac arweinwyr naturiol lleol, ac yn nodi y dylent dderbyn y gefnogaeth a'r hyfforddiant i aeddfedu a thyfu fel cynghorwyr. Clywsom yn aml fod cynghorwyr y meinciau cefn yn teimlo eu bod yn colli grym, dylanwad a phwrpas oherwydd y newidiadau gweinyddol newydd. Dyna'r adborth a gawsom.

Mae angen cadarnhau rôl y rhiant corfforaethol, sy'n ddyletswydd ar bob cynghorydd sir. Gwyddom am yr holl broblemau o ran gwasanaethau plant, ac mae'n bwysig cryfhau'r rôl hon a'i chymryd o ddifrif o fewn y strwythurau newydd.

I gloi, mae Plaid Cymru yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn ac edrychwn ymlaen at glywed ymateb cadarnhaol Llywodraeth Cymru i'r argymhellion.

Peter Law: I am pleased to contribute to this debate because I believe that the committee has done a good job—I will stick to the agenda, if you do not rule me out of order, in contrast to others. It has been worthwhile, because since the new political structures were introduced, there has been a great deal

pwyllogorau craffu'n galw'r weithrediaeth i gyfrif—hwy sy'n cynnal rhwystrau a gwrthbwsau'r system gyfan. Yn ystod ein hadolygiad, ymwelâsom â sawl awdurdod, a daeth yn amlwg nad yw ansawdd y craffu'n rhagorol ym mhob achos. Fel y nodir yn yr argymhellion, mae angen mwy o adnoddau ar ffurf amser swyddogion ac ymchwil i wella'r craffu gan yr wrthblaid ar benderfyniadau gweithrediaethau. Bydd hynny'n gwella perfformiad cyffredinol y cynghorau sir, o ran craffu a pherfformiad y weithrediaeth. Yr wyf finnau'n credu na ddylai cadeiryddion pwyllogorau craffu fod yn aelodau o'r un blaid wleidyddol â'r cabinet sy'n rheoli. Cyfeirir at hynny yn yr adroddiad, ond dylem ddweud hynny'n fwy croyw. Yn Abertawe, er enghraifft, hyd yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oedd cabinet Llafur yn rheoli ac yr oedd holl gadeiryddion y pwyllogorau craffu'n aelodau Llafur hefyd.

In terms of the councillors who are not members of the cabinet, namely backbench or non-executive councillors, as they are called in this document, recommendation 11 and others note the importance of developing a specific role for them as community leaders and natural local leaders, and notes that they should receive support and training to mature and grow as councillors. As we have often heard, backbench councillors feel that they are losing power, influence and purpose as a result of the administrative changes. That is the feedback that we received.

The role of corporate parent, which is incumbent upon every county councillor, must be confirmed. We know about all the problems in terms of children's services, and it is important that this role is strengthened and taken seriously within the new structures.

To conclude, Plaid Cymru welcomes this report and we look forward to a positive response to the recommendations from the Government of Wales.

Peter Law: Yr wyf yn falch o gyfrannu i'r ddatl hon gan fy mod yn credu bod y pwyllogor wedi gwneud gwaith da—daliâf at yr agenda, os na ddyfarnwch fy mod allan o drefn, yn wahanol i eraill. Bu'n waith buddiol oherwydd, ers cyflwyno'r strwythurau gwleidyddol newydd, bu llawer o ddadurithiad

of disillusionment among backbench council members, with whom I sympathise. It is important that we have been able to consider this issue, thanks to the co-operation of local authorities and the WLGA, and we will be able to get to grips with it. I sincerely hope that the Minister will take these recommendations seriously, as she always has done with regard to others in the past, and implement them within local authorities in Wales. I pay tribute to the chair, Ann Jones, who has led the committee excellently. She has been the captain—or the fire captain—on the bridge and has done a first-class job. I endorse her thanks to Adrian, Siwan, Liz and Ruth, who provided immense support.

It is important that we maximise the opportunity to promote openness and transparency in local government. No political institution will ever be as perfect as we want, but everything possible should be done to ensure that its work is open and transparent. We could do a lot more in this regard, and this is the purpose of the recommendations. It is important that overview and scrutiny have a central role. This will lead to backbench members, who, in many authorities, feel excluded, being empowered and included. I do not subscribe to exclusion; backbenchers are elected by the people and should be included. As the Chair said, a new session is an opportune time to empower and include councillors.

The chairs of scrutiny committees must lose the power to veto call-in procedures if there are sufficient numbers, as laid down in councils' standing orders, to ask for a call-in. This should be allowed and should not be done frivolously. There are many reasons, including political bias, why chairs must not act as gatekeepers and therefore not be allowed to prevent call-ins when this scrutiny would be in the interest of communities and the public.

Scrutiny teams should be supported by dedicated officers. Unfortunately, this has been overlooked in some authorities. We read and listened to heartfelt pleas during the investigation, and there is no doubt that we should tell local authorities that we expect them to have dedicated officers to support

ymysg aelodau cyngor y meinciau cefn, y cydymdeimlaf â hwynt. Mae'n bwysig ein bod wedi gallu ystyried y mater hwn, diolch i gydweithrediad awdurdodau lleol a CLILC, a byddwn yn gallu mynd i'r afael ag ef. Gwir obeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cymryd yr argymhellion hyn o ddifrif, fel y gwnaeth bob amser mewn cysylltiad ag eraill yn y gorffennol, ac y bydd yn eu gweithredu gydag awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru. Talaf deyrnged i'r cadeirydd, Ann Jones, sydd wedi arwain y pwyllgor yn ardderchog. Hi fu'r capten—neu'r diffoddwr tân—wrth y llyw a gwnaeth waith rhagorol. Ategap ei diolch i Adrian, Siwan, Liz a Ruth, a roddodd gymorth aruthrol.

Mae'n bwysig inni wneud yn fawr o'r cyfle i hybu gweithredu agored a thryloyw mewn llywodraeth leol. Ni fydd yr un sefydliad gwleidyddol byth mor berffaith ag y dymunem, ond dylid gwneud popeth a ellir i sicrhau bod ei waith yn agored ac yn dryloyw. Gallew wneud llawer mwy yn hyn o beth, a dyma bwrpas yr argymhellion. Mae'n bwysig rhoi lle canolog i arolygu a chraffu. Drwy wneud hynny, bydd aelodau'r meinciau cefn, sydd, mewn sawl awdurdod, yn teimlo eu bod wedi'u cau allan, yn cael eu galluogi a'u cynnwys. Nid wyf o blaid cau allan; mae meincwyr cefn wedi'u hethol gan y bobl a dylent gael eu cynnwys. Fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd, mae dechrau sesiwn newydd yn adeg amserol i alluogi a chynnwys cynghorwyr.

Rhaid i gadeiryddion pwyllgorau craffu golli'r pŵer i atal gweithdrefnau galw i mewn os oes nifer digonol, fel y nodir yn rheolau sefydlog y cynghorau, i ofyn am alw penderfyniad i mewn. Dylid caniatáu hyn ac ni ddylid ei wneud yn ddifeddwl. Mae sawl rheswm, a rhagfarn wleidyddol yn un ohonynt, na ddylai cadeiryddion fod yn borthorion ac felly cael atal galw penderfyniadau i mewn gan y byddai'r craffu hwn er budd cymunedau a'r cyhoedd.

Dylai timau craffu gael cymorth gan swyddogion penodol. Gwaetha'r modd, esgeuluswyd hynny mewn rhai awdurdodau. Darllenasom a ggrandawasom ar ymbil diffuant yn ystod yr ymchwiliad, ac nid oes amheuaeth na ddylem ddweud wrth awdurdodau lleol ein bod yn disgwyl iddynt

these teams.

If we are to get to grips with the situation, it is reasonable to request that the chairs of overview and scrutiny committees reflect party balance. I fully support this recommendation. I firmly believe that party whips should not be used if possible, because this would be in the interest of communities. However, I am a realist as a politician, and I am aware that whips will need to be used on occasion. When their use proves necessary, it should be declared. Doing this would be to take a step forward, because declarations are not always made and we see a picture that is different to the one expected. Therefore, transparency is also important in this regard, and I believe that the public will find this refreshing.

Councillor training is important, particularly at the threshold of a new term. Council members cannot be blamed if training has not been provided. However, with the WLGA and Syniad on tap, there is no reason why training is not provided. Resources should be available to ensure that we get the best possible input from elected councillors to improve the quality of life of those they represent. I pay tribute to recently retired councillors for their contribution, and I congratulate Wales's new councillors and wish them every success in their important work.

The committee expects the Welsh Assembly Government to implement the recommendations, which are based on openness, fairness, transparency and efficiency. They will lead to more effective local government throughout Wales.

Glyn Davies: I start with a tribute to the committee Chair—our team captain has controlled matters with a combination of charm, which encourages participation, and feistiness, which strikes fear in the heart of those who might wish to misbehave.

The Welsh Conservatives welcome the report's recommendations, and I am pleased to have played a part in their formulation. We particularly welcome recommendation 9, which caused concern when the

gael swyddogion penodol i gynorthwyo'r timau hyn.

Os ydym i fynd i'r afael â'r sefyllfa hon, rhesymol yw gofyn i gadeiryddion pwyllgorau arolygu a chraffu adlewyrchu cydbwysedd y pleidiau. Llwyf gefnogaf yr argymhelliad hwn. Credaf yn bendant na ddylid arfer chwip y blaid os oes modd, gan y byddai hynny er budd cymunedau. Er hynny, yr wyf yn realydd o wleidydd, a gwn y bydd yn rhaid arfer chwip ar adegau. Pan welir bod angen hynny, dylid ei ddatgan. Byddai gwneud hynny'n gam ymlaen, gan na wneir datganiadau bob amser a gwelwn ddarlun gwahanol i'r disgwyl. Gan hynny, mae tryloywder yn bwysig yn hyn o beth hefyd, a chredaf y bydd hynny'n galonidid i'r cyhoedd.

Mae hyfforddi cynghorwyr yn beth pwysig, yn enwedig ar drothwy tymor newydd. Ni ellir gweld bai ar aelodau cyngor os na roddwyd hyfforddiant. Fodd bynnag, gan fod CLILC a Syniad wrth law, nid oes reswm dros beidio â darparu hyfforddiant. Dylai adnoddau fod ar gael i sicrhau y cawn y cyfraniad gorau posibl gan gynghorwyr etholedig i wella ansawdd bywyd y rhai a gynrychiolant. Talaf deyrnged i gynghorwyr sydd wedi ymddeol yn ddiweddar am eu cyfraniad, a llongyfarchaf gynghorwyr newydd Cymru a dymuno pob hwyl iddynt yn eu gwaith pwysig.

Mae'r pwyllgor yn disgwyl i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru roi'r argymhellion ar waith, gan eu bod yn seiliedig ar weithredu agored, tegwch, tryloywder ac effeithlonrwydd. Byddant yn arwain at lywodraeth leol fwy effeithiol ledled Cymru.

Glyn Davies: Dechreuaf drwy dalu teyrnged i Gadeirydd y pwyllgor—mae capten y tîm wedi cadw trefn ar bethau drwy gyfuniad o swyn, sy'n cymell rhywun i gyfrannu, ac eofndra, sy'n codi ofn ar y rhai a allai ddymunio camymddwyn.

Mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru'n croesawu argymhellion yr adroddiad, ac yr wyf yn falch o fod wedi cymryd rhan yn y gwaith o'u llunio. Croesawn argymhelliad 9 yn enwedig, gan fod hyn wedi peri pryder pan

modernisation proposals were first discussed. When the Government proposals were first brought to the Assembly a while ago, I felt unsure about whether they would take us in the right direction. It was clear to everyone that the case for clarity, greater efficiency and accountability was unanswerable and that these qualities needed to be encouraged. However, we were concerned that there would be a small council within a council, that power would be exercised by too small a group and that the backbench row would disappear. At the time, it was very much a Conservative view, that the original committee system, albeit adapted, should have been one of the options. Clearly, option four, which has been adopted by Powys, where I live, was a good option for that type of council.

5.00 p.m.

I had some knowledge of these difficulties before the committee started its work on this matter. When I was a councillor, I was honoured to have been made the chair of the finance and general purposes committee. It was clear that the council did not have much direction and with some degree of ambition—which I had in those days and which has essentially disappeared—I wanted to convert that committee into a policy and resources committee. My fellow councillors quickly saw the trap into which I was trying to lead them and refused to have anything to do with my option because they knew perfectly well that the policy and resources committee could become an all-powerful body and they were, therefore, not prepared to help.

It is interesting to look at what has happened in Powys—and I do not criticise it, because it is a good council—because there is no doubt, when talking to the councillors, that there are issues of concern. Backbenchers feel left out and councillors enjoy poking the board in the eye, if they can get away with it. If a board makes a recommendation in a council meeting, some councillors quite enjoy poking it in the eye. Therefore, there is that gap between them. I do not think that openness has improved. There is now less transparency than when I was actively involved in local politics. Therefore, we welcome and support

draffodwyd y cynigion ar gyfer moderneiddio gyntaf. Pan dducpwyd cynigion y Llywodraeth gerbron y Cynulliad ychydig yn ôl, teimlais yn ansicr a fyddent yn mynd â ni i'r cyfeiriad iawn. Yr oedd yn amlwg i bawb fod y ddadl dros eglurder, mwy o effeithlonrwydd ac atebolrwydd yn un ddiwrthbrawf a bod angen meithrin y rhinweddau hyn. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddem yn bryderus y byddai cyngor bach oddi mewn i gyngor, y byddai pŵer yn cael ei arfer gan grŵp rhy fach ac y byddai rhes y meincwyr cefn yn diflannu. Ar y pryd, barn bendant y Ceidwadwyr oedd y dylai'r system bwyllgorau wreiddiol, er y byddai wedi'i haddasu, fod yn un o'r dewisiadau. Mae'n amlwg bod dewis pedwar, a fabwysiadwyd gan Bowys, lle yr wyf yn byw, yn ddewis da i gyngor o'r fath.

Gwyddwn rywfaint am yr anawsterau hyn cyn i'r pwyllgor ddechrau ar ei waith ar y mater hwn. Pan oeddwn yn gynghorydd, fe'm hanrhydeddwyd drwy fy ngwneud yn gadeirydd y pwyllgor cyllid a dibenion cyffredinol. Yr oedd yn amlwg nad oedd llawer o fynd yn y cyngor a chan fod gennyf rywfaint o uchelgais—rhywbeth a oedd gennyf bryd hynny ac sydd wedi diflannu i bob pwrpas—yr oeddwn am droi'r pwyllgor hwnnw'n bwyllgor polisi ac adnoddau. Buan iawn y sylwodd fy nghyd-gynghorwyr ar y fagl yr oeddwn yn ceisio eu dal ynddi a gwrthodasant wneud dim â'r dewis a gynigiais gan y gwyddent yn iawn y byddai'r pwyllgor polisi ac adnoddau'n mynd yn gorff hollbwerus ac felly nid oeddent yn barod i helpu.

Diddorol yw ystyried yr hyn a ddigwyddodd ym Mhowys—ac nid wyf yn ei feirniadu gan ei fod yn gyngor da—oherwydd nid oes amheuaeth, wrth siarad â'r cynghorwyr, fod materion sy'n peri pryder. Mae meincwyr cefn yn teimlo eu bod wedi'u gadael allan ac mae cynghorwyr yn mwynhau cael y gorau ar y bwrdd, os gallant. Os yw bwrdd yn gwneud argymhelliad mewn cyfarfod cyngor, mae rhai cynghorwyr yn cael eithaf hwyl wrth gael y gorau arno. Felly, mae bwlch o'r fath rhyngddynt. Ni chredaf fod y gweithredu'n fwy agored. Mae llai o dryloywder yn awr nag yr oedd pan oeddwn i'n ymwneud â

these recommendations.

I support Peter Law's and other Members' comments about the scrutiny role. We should not concentrate the power in the decision-makers, which is at the heart of modernisation, because we do not want to create dictatorships. Therefore, that power must be balanced effectively, which is where the scrutiny role must play a significant part. Most of the evidence that we received indicated that that balance did not work as well as it should. We must kick out the system of gatekeepers because that is unacceptable. When that matter was discussed around two or three years ago, the Minister was concerned and said that guidance would be given and that the chair of the scrutiny committee should not be from the governing party. I do not know to what extent that guidance has been implemented across Wales, but it has not been implemented across the board. There is a great deal of concern about that issue, which must be addressed. We all want local government to be respected by the people who are served by it and in many instances, it is not. That does not serve the interests of anyone involved in the governance of Wales.

Finally, I congratulate all those who have been elected to serve their areas over the next four years. I wish them huge success and I hope that they enjoy the job of councillor as much as I did many years ago.

Michael German: I echo the thanks to the Chair, the officials and to everyone else who contributed to this report. There was a remarkable amount of agreement across all of the political parties on this. I also echo, largely and unusually, what Peter Law said this afternoon about the role of backbenchers. You do not have to travel far in Wales to find a backbencher from whatever political persuasion, or no political persuasion, who has been elected and, over years of service, has found that his or her role has been diminished. They have felt that they could not contribute to the work of the community for which they stood for election. For many of them, it has been a frustrating time.

gwleidyddiaeth leol. Gan hynny, croesawn a chefnogwn yr argymhellion hyn.

Ategap y sylwadau a wnaeth Peter Law ac Aelodau eraill am y rôl craffu. Ni ddylem ganoli pŵer yn y rhai sy'n penderfynu, sef hanfod moderneiddio, am nad ydym am greu unbennaeth. Gan hynny, rhaid i'r pŵer hwnnw gael ei fantoli'n effeithiol, a rhaid i'r rôl craffu chwarae rhan bwysig yn hynny. Yr oedd y rhan fwyaf o'r dystiolaeth a gawsom yn dangos nad oedd y mantoli hwnnw'n gweithio'n gystal ag y dylai. Rhaid inni gael gwared â'r system porthorion gan ei bod yn annerbyniol. Pan drafodwyd y mater hwnnw ddwy neu dair blynedd yn ôl, yr oedd y Gweinidog yn bryderus a dywedodd y byddid yn rhoi cyfarwyddyd ac na ddylai cadeirydd y pwyllgor craffu fod yn un o'r blaid sy'n llywodraethu. Ni wn i ba raddau y rhoddyd y cyfarwyddyd hwnnw ar waith ledled Cymru, ond ni wnaed hynny ym mhob man. Mae pryder mawr ynghylch y mater hwnnw, a rhaid ymdrin â hynny. Yr ydym i gyd am i lywodraeth leol gael ei pharchu gan y rhai y mae'n eu gwasanaethu ac nid yw hynny'n digwydd mewn sawl achos. Nid yw hynny er budd neb sy'n ymwneud â llywodraeth Cymru.

Yn olaf, llongyfarchaf bawb a etholwyd i wasanaethu eu hardaloedd dros y pedair blynedd nesaf. Dymunaf bob hwyl iddynt a gobeithiaf y byddant yn mwynhau swydd y cynghorydd yn gymaint ag y gwneuthum i flynyddoedd lawer yn ôl.

Michael German: Ategap y diolch i'r Cadeirydd, i'r swyddogion ac i bawb arall a gyfrannodd i'r adroddiad hwn. Yr oedd graddau'r cytundeb ar hyn rhwng yr holl bleidiau gwleidyddol yn rhyfeddol. Yr wyf hefyd yn ategu, i raddau helaeth ac yn anarferol, yr hyn a ddywedodd Peter Law y prynhawn yma am rôl meincwyr cefn. Nid oes raid mynd ymhell yng Nghymru i ddod o hyd i feinciwr cefn o ba bynnag liw gwleidyddol, neu heb unrhyw liw gwleidyddol, sydd wedi'i ethol ac wedi gweld, dros y blynyddoedd y gwasanaethodd, fod ei rôl wedi lleihau. Teimlasant na allent gyfrannu i waith y gymuned lle y gwnaethant sefyll etholiad. Bu hwn yn gyfnod o rwystredigaeth i lawer ohonynt.

This report is an attempt to try to establish the nature of the role of councillors across the board and to try to avoid some of the difficulties that have arisen as councils have interpreted the rules and regulations in their own particular way, and I begin with that. When the Minister responds, she will be faced with a series of recommendations that obviously carry the will of all political parties in the Assembly, but her powers, and ability to make changes, are somewhat limited. There is hierarchy and the dissemination of good practice at one level, and above that, there is strengthened guidance. Substantial guidance is already being issued to local authorities in terms of changing the regulations or the law to give statutory basis to those recommendations. Only recommendation 7 would require the Minister to go to the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister to seek extra powers for the National Assembly to be able to do something. That is regrettable because I know from the Minister's contribution in Committee that she has a great deal of sympathy with local authorities' ability to reflect the changes that they want and to change their structures to suit their needs. Wales would like to ensure that devolution does not mean that the Assembly takes powers from local authorities, but rather enables them to do the things that they want to do.

The Minister must ask herself where those appropriate changes can be made in the best way. Perhaps she will reflect on the guidance that has already been issued to local authorities and how much notice has been taken of it. We know, from the evidence in the report, that some local authorities, when given the guidance that the ruling party should not chair all the scrutiny committees, have not followed that route. The problem with that is that the backbenchers ability to scrutinise has become more limited. If there are a large number of councillors from the ruling party who are also in scrutiny committees, the difficulty for them is that they must distinguish from their party nature. This is about scrutiny of positions, which does not mean simply being a soft touch for the cabinet of the same political persuasion. That is a difficult lesson for some councillors

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ymgais i gadarnhau natur rôl cynghorwyr yn gyffredinol ac i osgoi rhai o'r anawsterau a gododd wrth i gynghorau ddehongli'r rheolau a'r rheoliadau yn eu ffordd eu hunain, a dechreuaf â hynny. Pan fydd y Gweinidog yn ymateb, bydd yn wynebu cyfres o argymhellion sy'n amlwg yn seiliedig ar ddymuniad yr holl bleidiau gwleidyddol yn y Cynulliad, ond mae ei phwerau, a'i gallu i wneud newidiadau, yn gyfyngedig braidd. Ceir hierarchaeth a lledaenu ar arferion da ar un lefel, ac uwchben honno, mae canllawiau cryfach. Rhoddir canllawiau sylweddol i awdurdodau lleol yn barod mewn cysylltiad â newid y rheoliadau neu'r gyfraith i roi sail statudol i'r argymhellion hynny. Dim ond argymhelliad 7 a'i gwnâi'n ofynnol i'r Gweinidog fynd i Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog i geisio pwerau ychwanegol fel y gallai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wneud rhywbeth. Mae hynny'n destun gofid gan fy mod yn gwybod, ar sail cyfraniad y Gweinidog yn y pwyllgor, ei bod yn cydymdeimlo'n fawr â gallu awdurdodau lleol i adlewyrchu'r newidiadau y dymunant eu gweld ac i newid eu strwythurau i fodloni eu hanghenion. Carai Cymru sicrhau nad yw datganoli'n golygu bod y Cynulliad yn cymryd pwerau oddi wrth awdurdodau lleol, ond yn eu galluogi, yn hytrach, i wneud yr hyn a ddymunant.

Rhaid i'r Gweinidog ofyn iddi'i hun ym mhle y gellir gwneud y newidiadau priodol hynny yn y modd gorau. Efallai y gwnaiff fyfyrion ynghylch y canllawiau sydd wedi'u rhoi i awdurdodau lleol eisoes a pha faint o sylw a roddwyd iddynt. Gwyddom, ar sail y dystiolaeth sydd yn yr adroddiad, nad yw rhai awdurdodau lleol, a gafodd gyfarwyddyd i'r perwyl na ddylai'r blaid sy'n rheoli gadeirio'r holl bwyllgorau craffu, wedi dilyn y llwybr hwnnw. Y broblem sydd ynglŷn â hynny yw bod gallu meincwyr cefn i graffu wedi mynd yn fwy cyfyngedig. Os oes nifer fawr o gynghorwyr o'r blaid sy'n rheoli sydd hefyd yn eistedd ar bwyllgorau craffu, yr hyn a gânt hwy'n anodd yw gorfod gwahaniaethu rhwng y rôl honno a'u rôl bleidiol. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â chraffu ar safbwyntiau, ac nid yw hynny'n golygu bod yn hawdd eu trin gan gabinet o'r un lliw gwleidyddol. Mae rhai

to learn because they must change their own persuasion to see that they have a role in scrutinising. The independence of that scrutiny function is important.

As William Graham also said, the empowerment of those members is crucial. They must be given the necessary support and training to help them understand that that role means that they are freeing themselves in some way from the party bands of the old committee structure. That means that there must be freedom from the whip, as highlighted in the recommendations. The accountability of the whole process has left us with a feeling that the job has not been accomplished properly. The fourth option has been picked up by three councils in Wales—Merthyr Tydfil in the Valleys, Gwynedd with overall party control, and Powys, which has a high degree of independence. The fourth option has been tested therefore in three local authorities in Wales, and if those authorities were asked about the benefits of that option, they would say that the councillor's role has been enhanced. Would it not be far better if those authorities could decide upon the options themselves? I commend the recommendations and Members' responses. We must build in a degree of flexibility into the structures to allow councils to make their own decisions, and to allow them to take on board any criticism that comes their way.

5.10 p.m.

Alun Ffred Jones: Cyfeiriaf yn benodol at baragraff 5.7. Bu cryn siarad ynglŷn â chraffu a rôl cynghorwyr unigol y prynhawn yma, fel y mae Mike German newydd ei ddweud. Mae problem, sef bod cymysgu'r agwedd creu polisi â'r agwedd graffu yn gallu creu agendâu cymhleth. Gwnaethpwyd yr un feirniadaeth o'r drefn yn y Cynulliad gan gomisiwn Richard. Nid yw bob amser yn hawdd i bobl sy'n perthyn i blaid benodol wahaniaethu rhwng eu rôl o fewn y pwyllgor a'u rôl wrth graffu ar waith y Llywodraeth. Credaf fod problem tymor hir yn wynebu'r Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol.

Cyfeiriaf at baragraff 5.7 sy'n dweud

'Rydym yn argymhell bod pob cynghorydd

cynghorwyr yn ei chael yn anodd deall hynny ond rhaid iddynt gymryd golwg o'r newydd ar hyn a gweld bod rôl iddynt wrth graffu. Mae annibyniaeth y swyddogaeth graffu honno'n bwysig.

Fel y dywedodd William Graham hefyd, mae'n hollbwysig galluogi'r aelodau hynny. Rhaid iddynt gael y cymorth a'r hyfforddiant y mae arnynt eu hangen i ddeall bod y rôl honno'n golygu eu bod yn ymryddhau mewn rhyw fodd o glymau pleidiol yr hen strwythur pwyllgorau. Mae hynny'n golygu bod rhaid cael rhyddid oddi wrth y chwip, fel y nodir yn yr argymhellion. Mae atebolrwydd y broses gyfan yn peri inni deimlo na wnaed y gwaith yn iawn. Cymerwyd y pedwerydd dewis gan dri chyngor yng Nghymru—Merthyr Tudful yn y Cymoedd, Gwynedd a reolir gan un blaid, a Phowys, sydd â llawer iawn o aelodau annibynnol. Felly, mae'r pedwerydd dewis wedi'i brofi mewn tri awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru, a phe holid yr awdurdodau hynny am fanteision y dewis hwnnw, dywedent fod rôl y cynghorydd wedi'i chryfhau. Oni fyddai'n well o lawer pe gallai'r awdurdodau hynny benderfynu ar y dewisiadau eu hunain? Cymeradwyaf yr argymhellion ac ymatebion Aelodau. Rhaid inni gynnwys rhywfaint o hyblygrwydd yn y strwythurau fel y gall cynghorau benderfynu drostynt eu hunain, ac fel y gallant ystyried unrhyw feirniadaeth a ddaw i'w rhan.

Alun Ffred Jones: I refer specifically to paragraph 5.7. Much has been made of scrutiny and the role of individual councillors this afternoon, as Mike German just said. There is a problem, namely that mixing the policy-making aspect with the scrutiny aspect can create complex agendas. The Richard commission made the same criticism of the system in the Assembly. It is not always easy for members of a particular party to differentiate between their role within the committee and their role in scrutinising the Government. I believe that the Assembly and local government face a long-term problem.

I refer to paragraph 5.7 which says

'We recommend that all non-executive

anweithredol'—

nid wyf yn hoff o'r gair hwnnw yn y Gymraeg—

'yn gwasanaethu ar o leiaf un pwyllgor o'r cyngor fel y bo ganddynt ryw rôl yn rhan o'r swyddogaeth trosolygu a chraffu neu faterion rheolaethol.'

Wrth gwrs y dylai cynghorydd sy'n derbyn £10,000 y flwyddyn fod ar o leiaf un pwyllgor—yr oeddwn yn cymryd hynny'n ganiataol. Mae nifer ohonoch wedi cyfeirio at y ffaith y prynhawn yma fod aelodau'r meinciau cefn wedi colli'r cysylltiad uniongyrchol a oedd ganddynt gyda'r broses gwneud penderfyniadau sy'n effeithio ar eu cymunedau. Gan fod cyfeiriad mewn rhan arall o'r adroddiad at rannu arferion da, mae'n werth cyfeirio at yr hyn a weithredir yng Ngwynedd ar hyn o bryd, sef arbrawf diddorol o fewn y pwyllgorau craffu. Byddwn yn creu cysylltiad uniongyrchol rhwng cynghorwyr a gwasanaethau penodol o fewn briff y pwyllgor. Er enghraifft, os yw pwyllgor craffu yn edrych ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol, bydd un neu ddau gynghorydd yn edrych yn benodol ar wasanaethau plant. Rhoddir hawl i'r cynghorwyr hynny fynd i mewn i gyfarfodydd tîm rheoli'r gwasanaeth hwnnw. Wrth wneud hynny, bydd cynghorwyr yn datblygu arbenigedd y gallant ei rannu gyda'r pwyllgor craffu ac efallai gyda'r cabinet. Mae hwn yn un ffordd o roi rôl benodol yn ôl i gynghorwyr, rôl y maent yn teimlo eu bod wedi'i gollu gan nad yw'r gwaith craffu y maent yn ei wneud, yn enwedig ym maes polisi, yn apelio atynt. Dim ond y cyfeiriad byr hwnnw sydd gennyf at yr argymhelliad hwnnw. Gobeithiaf y gallwn rannu arferion da rhwng cynghorau, oherwydd nid oes dwywaith y byddai gwell ymddiriedaeth gan bobl mewn llywodraeth leol pe bai cynghorau yn barod i ddysgu oddi wrth ei gilydd.

Ann Jones: I thank all Members who participated, especially the committee members who realised what the debate was about, and stuck to the agenda. Mike German and Dai alluded to the fact that we achieved a consensus, across the committee, while we were out on visits, taking evidence. There is not much variation in how we want to see

councillors'—

I do not like '*anweithredol*', the Welsh word for 'non-executive',—

'should sit on at least one council committee so that they have some role in the overview and scrutiny function, or in regulatory matters.'

Of course a councillor who receives £10,000 a year should sit on at least one committee—I took that for granted. Many of you have referred this afternoon to the fact that backbenchers have lost the direct contact that they once had with the decision-making process that affects their communities. As there is a reference to sharing good practice in another part of the report, it is worth referring to a scheme in operation in Gwynedd at present, which is an interesting experiment within the scrutiny committees. We create a direct link between councillors and specific services within the committee's brief. For example, if the scrutiny committee is looking at social services, one or two councillors will look specifically at children's services. Those councillors will be given the right to attend the management team meetings of that service. In doing so, the councillors will develop expertise that they can share with the scrutiny committee, and perhaps with the cabinet. This is one way of giving back a specific role to councillors, a role that they feel that they have lost because the scrutiny work that they undertake, particularly in policy areas, does not appeal to them. I will only make that brief reference to that recommendation. I hope that we will be able to share good practice between councils because without doubt people would have more faith in local government if councils were willing to learn from each other.

Ann Jones: Diolchaf i'r holl Aelodau a gymerodd ran, yn enwedig aelodau'r pwyllgor a sylweddolodd beth oedd diben y ddadl hon, a dal at yr agenda. Cyfeiriodd Mike German a Dai at y ffaith ein bod wedi sicrhau consensws, drwy'r pwyllgor, pan oeddem yn ymweld, gan gymryd tystiolaeth. Nid oes llawer o wahaniaeth barn rhyngom o

local government being taken forward.

We talked to many councillors, across the political parties, and they were all interested in sharing their experiences with us. Dai alluded to the fact that local government appreciated that we were out and about, listening to them and the problems that they perceive. Scrutiny is the main problem, and many speakers referred to it in this debate. We must have enough resources to provide effective scrutiny and that is why we recommend that the party whip should be removed. If we are to be open and transparent, as a committee we had to make such recommendations, and we will wait to see how the Welsh Assembly Government will respond.

Alun Ffred, we were lucky on this committee, because it included several county councillors with experience of running a council and being councillors, and members who had taken part as backbenchers. I am glad that you talked about sharing best practice. Gwenda, as ever, you have reminded us that there are issues concerning mainstreaming equality of opportunities for vulnerable adults and children. I hope that the work that we are asking the Welsh Assembly Government and the WLGA to undertake in partnership with local authorities will develop some of the issues that you raised. I know that you, Dai, are keen on the corporate parenting aspects of our work, and we hope that that work will continue. Also, you are right about training, which is important. Empowerment is also important, as councillors must feel that they still have value on that committee, whatever the style of operation adopted by an authority.

William, you mentioned new councillors. This is the first stage of this report, whose launch today was attended by many local authority members and many of those who gave evidence. This report will now be distributed to all county councillors and clerks of community and town councils. If those clerks want copies for their members,

ran y modd y dymunwn weld hyrwyddo llywodraeth leol.

Gwnaethom siarad â llawer o gynghorwyr, o'r holl bleidiau gwleidyddol, ac yr oeddent i gyd yn ymddiddori mewn rhannu eu profiadau â ni. Cyfeiriodd Dai at y ffaith bod llywodraeth leol yn gwerthfawrogi'r ffaith ein bod yn teithio o gwmpas, yn gwrando arnynt hwy ac ar y problemau a welant. Craffu yw'r brif broblem, ac mae sawl siaradwr wedi cyfeirio at hynny yn y ddadl hon. Rhaid inni gael digon o adnoddau i ddarparu craffu effeithiol a dyna pam yr ydym yn argymhell y dylid dileu chwip y blaid. Er mwyn bod yn agored ac yn dryloyw, yr oedd yn rhaid i ni fel pwyllgor wneud argymhellion o'r fath, ac arhoswn i weld ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Alun Ffred, yr oeddem yn ffodus ar y pwyllgor hwn, gan fod arno sawl cynghorydd sir a oedd â phrofiad o redeg cyngor ac o fod yn gynghorydd, ac aelodau a oedd wedi cymryd rhan fel meincwyr cefn. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi sôn am rannu'r arferion gorau. Gwenda, fel y gwnewch bob amser, yr ydych wedi ein hatgoffa bod materion sy'n ymwneud â rhoi cyfle cyfartal ar gyfer oedolion a phlant sy'n agored i niwed yn y brif ffrwd. Gobeithiaf y bydd y gwaith yr ydym yn gofyn i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a CLILC ei wneud mewn partneriaeth ag awdurdodau lleol yn datblygu rhai o'r materion y gwnaethoch eu codi. Gwn eich bod chi, Dai, yn frwdfrydig ynghylch yr agweddau ar ein gwaith sy'n ymwneud â gweithredu fel rhiant corfforaethol, a gobeithiwn y bydd y gwaith hwnnw'n parhau. Hefyd, yr ydych yn iawn ynghylch hyfforddiant, gan ei fod yn bwysig. Mae galluogi'n bwysig hefyd, gan fod rhaid i gynghorwyr deimlo bod gwerth iddynt o hyd ar y pwyllgor hwnnw, ni waeth pa ddull gweithredu y mae awdurdod yn ei fabwysiadu.

William, gwnaethoch sôn am gynghorwyr newydd. Hwn yw cam cyntaf yr adroddiad, y bu llawer o aelodau awdurdodau lleol a llawer o'r rhai a roddodd dystiolaeth yn bresennol wrth ei lansio heddiw. Dosberthir yr adroddiad hwn yn awr i bob cynghorydd sir ac i glercod cynghorau tref a chymuned. Os yw'r clercod hynny am gael copïau ar

they should ring up and we will send them copies, because we see that as part of the job. We do not want this report to sit in a box or on a dusty shelf or to prop up a piano leg—it must be acted upon. We, as a committee, want the Government to put that response in, and ensure that that is carried out throughout the councils.

The issue of openness came across, even though Glyn said that it was not being improved. In a way, that was quite sad, Glyn, because nearly everybody that we spoke to recognised that we have not always got it right, as alluded to by Peter. There will never be 101 per cent perfection in this matter, although we are aiming for 99 per cent perfection, which is good. It is also sad that we have to end on a note that states that we did not get it right. We recognised that we did not get it right, and that is what this report is about. I understand that you were trying to say that we need to take the matter forward. Therefore, in the spirit of consensus, I hope that we can take it forward together.

Finally, there are four main themes that we all spoke about, and it is those that will drive local government forward. They will drive the partnership between the Welsh Assembly Government, the WLGA and county councils forward, along with the important town and community councils, which have a big role to play in the delivery of services and democracy throughout Wales. I thank Members for their contributions and ask you to vote for the motion.

gyfer eu haelodau, dylent ffonio ac anfonwn gopiâu atynt, gan ein bod yn ystyried bod hynny'n rhan o'r gwaith. Nid ydym am weld yr adroddiad hwn yn sefyll mewn blwch neu ar silff lychlyd neu'n dal coes piano—rhaid gweithredu ar ei sail. Yr ydym ni, fel pwyllgor, am weld y Llywodraeth yn ymateb yn y modd hwnnw, ac yn sicrhau y cyflawnir hyn yn yr holl gynghorau.

Cafwyd sôn am weithredu agored, er bod Glyn yn dweud nad oedd yn gwella. Ar un ystyr, mae hynny'n beth eithaf trist, Glyn, gan fod bron bawb y buom yn siarad â hwy'n cydnabod nad ydym wedi gallu sicrhau hynny bob amser, fel y nododd Peter. Ni cheir byth 101 y cant o berffeithrwydd yn y mater hwn, er ein bod yn anelu at 99 y cant o berffeithrwydd, ac mae hynny'n beth da. Mae hefyd yn beth trist ein bod yn gorfod gorffen ar nodyn sy'n datgan ein bod wedi methu ar hyn. Gwnaethom gydnabod ein bod wedi methu ar hyn, a hynny sydd dan sylw yn yr adroddiad hwn. Deallaf eich bod yn ceisio dweud bod angen inni fwrw ymlaen â'r mater hwn. Gan hynny, o ran consensws, dywedaf fy mod yn gobeithio y gallwn fwrw ymlaen â hyn gyda'n gilydd.

Yn olaf, mae pedair prif thema y gwnaethom oll sôn amdanynt, a'r rhain a fydd yn gyrru llywodraeth leol yn ei blaen. Hwy fydd yn gyrru'r bartneriaeth rhwng Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, CLILC a chynghorau sir, ynghyd â'r cynghorau tref a chymuned pwysig, sydd â rhan fawr i'w chwarae wrth redeg gwasanaethau a democratiaeth ledled Cymru. Diolchaf i Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau a gofynnaf ichi bleidleisio o blaid y cynnig.

Cynnig (NDM1988): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM1988): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane

Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.18 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.18 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)