



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**(Cofnod y Trafodion)**

**The National Assembly for Wales**  
**(Record of Proceedings)**

**Dydd Mercher, 15 Mehefin 2005**  
**Wednesday, 15 June 2005**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

3	Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio Questions to the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration
21	Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth Questions to the Minister for Economic Development and Transport
37	Cwestiynau i'r Trefnydd ar ei Chyfrifoldebau Heblaw am Fusnes Questions to the Business Minister on her Responsibilities other than for Business
51	Datganiad ar y Papur Gwyn, 'Trefn Lywodraethu Well i Gymru' Statement on the White Paper, 'Better Governance for Wales'
77	Mesur Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn (Cymru) The Commissioner for Older People (Wales) Bill
90	Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion
91	Mesur Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn (Cymru): Parhad The Commissioner for Older People (Wales) Bill: Continued
103	Dadl Fer: Polisi Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol: Cynnwys Pobl Ifanc neu eu Hallgáu? Short Debate: Anti-social Behaviour Policy: Bringing Young People in or Shutting them Out? .....

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio Questions to the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration**

### **Undebau Credyd Cymru Welsh Credit Unions**

**Q1 Mick Bates:** Will the Minister make a statement on the future of Welsh credit unions? OAQ0261(SJR)

**C1 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ddyfodol undebau credyd Cymru? OAQ0261(SJR)

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** Credit unions in Wales have seen membership treble recently, and I see no reason why this trend cannot continue. I recognise that this has been a difficult time in terms of funding, and my officials are working on a notification to the European Commission on this subject.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Mae aelodaeth undebau credyd yng Nghymru wedi treblu yn ddiweddar, ac ni allaf weld unrhyw reswm pam na all y duedd hon barhau. Yr wyf yn cydnabod ido fod yn gyfnod anodd o ran cyllid, ac mae fy swyddogion yn gweithio ar hysbysiad i'w anfon i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ar y pwnc hwn.

**Mick Bates:** I know of your keen support for the expansion of the credit union network throughout Wales. My own credit union, Robert Owen Montgomeryshire Credit Union Ltd, has been particularly effective in taking a proactive role in ensuring education about the high interest rates often charged by loan sharks. Credit unions offer low interest rates on loans, of course. Would you undertake a review of credit unions to ensure that all become proactive in this way, so that we can reduce the indebtedness so prevalent among our poorest people?

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'ch cefnogaeth frwd dros ehangu rhwydwaith yr undebau credyd drwy Gymru gyfan. Mae fy undeb credyd fy hun, Robert Owen Montgomeryshire Credit Union Cyf, wedi bod yn effeithiol iawn wrth chwarae rhan ragweithiol i sicrhau addysgu am y cyfraddau llog uchel a godir yn aml gan fenthycwyr diegwyddor. Mae undebau credyd yn cynnig cyfraddau llog isel ar fenthyciadau, wrth gwrs. A wnewch addewid i wneud adolygiad o undebau credyd i sicrhau bod pob un yn dod yn rhagweithiol fel hyn, er mwyn inni allu lleihau'r dyledion sydd mor amlwg ymhlith ein pobl dlotaf?

**Edwina Hart:** Credit unions are for everyone, but certainly fulfil a role for those who do not necessarily have bank accounts and have difficulty in accessing loans. The Robert Owen credit union is the second pathfinder area in the UK for the trial of the community banking partnership model, and the Assembly Government has contributed some £5,000 to the cost of the second pilot scheme. I welcome the work undertaken by credit unions across Wales, and hope that they will all be proactive.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae undebau credyd ar gyfer pawb, ond yn sicr mae iddynt rôl i'r rheini nad oes ganddynt gyfrifon banc o anghenraid ac sy'n cael anhawster i gael benthyciadau. Undeb credyd Robert Owen yw'r ail ardal fraenaru yn y DU i dreialu'r model partneriaeth bancio cymunedol, ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cyfrannu tua £5,000 at gost yr ail gynllun peilot. Croesawaf y gwaith y mae undebau credyd yn ei wneud ledled Cymru, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd pob un ohonynt yn rhagweithiol.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Datganaf fy mod yn aelod o undeb credyd. Gwn fod undebau credyd yn gyrff annibynnol, ond faint ohonynt sydd yn hunan-gynhaliol? A oes targed i droi canran ohonynt yn hunan-gynhaliol erbyn rhyw amser penodol?

**Edwina Hart:** I am not quite sure what you mean by 'self-sufficient'. I assume that you mean not being reliant on any element of grant. We give grants for a variety of reasons, because we want to extend training to people and so on, but I would happy to look at whether I can provide you with financial information on the status of credit unions in Wales.

**Alun Cairns:** While most credit unions offer very low rates of interest and are very supportive of those who use their services, there are some credit unions, particularly given that interest rates are low in the economy in general, where, although the amount charged in interest might be small, the rate is exceptionally high. What analysis have you made of this, and what action are you planning to take to ensure that a fair rate of interest is charged?

**Edwina Hart:** Credit unions are regulated, and they decide how they lend money and so on, but I am happy to take up your point in my discussions with the credit unions.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I declare that I am a member of a credit union. I know that credit unions are independent bodies, but how many of them are self-sufficient? Is there a target to make a percentage of them self-sufficient by some specific date?

**Edwina Hart:** Nid wyf yn siŵr beth a olygwch wrth 'hunan-gynhaliol'. Tybiaf mai'r hyn a olygwch yw peidio â dibynnu ar unrhyw elfen o grant. Yr ydym yn rhoi grantiau am amryw o resymau, oherwydd ein bod am ehangu hyfforddiant i bobl, ac ati, ond byddwn yn fodlon ystyried a allaf roi gwybodaeth ariannol ichi am statws undebau credyd yng Nghymru.

**Alun Cairns:** Er bod y rhan fwyaf o undebau credyd yn cynnig cyfraddau llog isel iawn ac yn gefnogol iawn i'r bobl hynny sy'n defnyddio'u gwasanaethau, mae rhai undebau credyd, yn arbennig o gofio bod cyfraddau llog yn isel yn yr economi yn gyffredinol, yn codi cyfradd eithriadol o uchel, er y gall y swm a godir fel llog fod yn isel. Pa ddadansoddiad a wnaed gennych mewn cysylltiad â hyn, a pha gamau yr ydych yn bwriadu eu cymryd i sicrhau codi cyfradd deg o log?

**Edwina Hart:** Caiff undebau credyd eu rheoleiddio, a hwy sy'n penderfynu sut y maent yn roi benthyg arian ac ati. Ond yr wyf yn fodlon trafod eich pwynt yn ystod fy nhrafodaethau gyda'r undebau credyd.

### **Lleihau Troseddu ac Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol Reducing Crime and Anti-social Behaviour**

**Q2 Ann Jones:** What analysis has been made of the impact of alleygating in reducing crime and anti-social behaviour in the west end of Rhyl? OAQ0256(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Recorded crime figures for North Wales Police suggest that the Rhyl alleygating pilot scheme, along with a range of other crime-reduction measures, has led to a significant decrease in the incidence of crime and disorder. The police report that the alleygates have also contributed substantially towards residents feeling reassured.

**C2 Ann Jones:** Pa ddadansoddiad a wnaed o'r effaith y mae gosod gataiau i gau aliau wedi ei chael ar leihau troseddu ac ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ym mhen gorllewinol y Rhyl? OAQ0256(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae ffigurau troseddau wedi eu cofnodi ar gyfer Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn awgrymu bod cynllun peilot i osod gataiau yn y Rhyl, ynghyd ag amrywiaeth o fesurau eraill i leihau troseddau, wedi arwain at ostyngiad sylweddol yn nifer yr achosion o droseddu ac anhrefn. Dywed yr heddlu hefyd fod gosod gataiau wedi cyfrannu'n helaeth at dawelu meddyliau trigolion.

**Ann Jones:** That is borne out in what residents have told me since the alleygating pilot scheme was introduced. Although it is a new initiative, it is welcomed throughout the community. How do we intend to progress alleygating, and how can we ensure that this initiative is spread throughout Rhyl, and to those areas outside Communities First areas that might feel more secure if they had alleygates?

**Edwina Hart:** Community safety partnerships and the police can fund alleygating schemes from their own resources, and I would encourage community safety partnerships across Wales to consider the allocation of resources for this. There have been problems in the past in getting the schemes off the ground, particularly with regard to the legal process involved, but the new gating order provision in the Clean Neighbourhoods and Environment Act 2005 will make this much more straightforward, with local authorities obtaining statutory authority for gating. That will be helpful across Wales.

**Janet Ryder:** Schemes such as this have been trialled successfully in other areas of Wales. Setting aside the community safety aspect of this, it has allowed children a safe area in which to play outside. What are you doing to take a lead on this in the Cabinet to look at this in a cross-cutting way, and to bring in aspects of children's safety as well as community safety, so that those different pots of money can be brought together if necessary, and then to encourage the councils to look at this? Councils should be doing this to develop safe play areas for children in their areas.

**Edwina Hart:** Community safety partnerships are aware of play issues. I have seen an example of alleygating, and it is wonderful. It means, particularly in the case of terraced houses, that there is a wide area at the back of the house in which children can play safely, viewed by their parents. It is nice to see them out and about. I will pick up the more general point for the Cabinet's sub-

**Ann Jones:** Mae hyn yn cael ei gadarnhau gan hyn yn yr hyn y mae trigolion wedi ei ddweud wrthyf ers cyflwyno'r cynllun peilot i osod gataiau. Er ei bod yn fenter newydd, fe'i croesewir drwy'r gymuned gyfan. Sut yr ydym yn bwriadu gwneud cynnydd gyda'r cynllun gosod gataiau, a sut y gallwn sicrhau y caiff y fenter ei lledaenu drwy'r Rhyl, ac i'r ardaloedd hynny y tu allan i ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a allai deimlo'n fwy diogel pe bai ganddynt gataiau?

**Edwina Hart:** Gall partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol a'r heddlu ariannu cynlluniau gosod gataiau o'u hadnoddau eu hunain, a byddwn yn annog partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol ledled Cymru i ystyried dyrannu adnoddau ar gyfer hyn. Cafwyd problemau yn y gorffennol wrth ddatblygu'r cynlluniau hyn, yn arbennig o ran y prosesau cyfreithiol dan sylw. Ond bydd y ddarpariaeth gorchymyn llidiartu newydd yn Neddf Cymdogaethau ac Amgylchedd Glân 2005 yn golygu y bydd hyn lawer yn symlach, ac y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn cael awdurdod statudol i osod gataiau. Bydd hynny'n ddefnyddiol ledled Cymru.

**Janet Ryder:** Cafodd cynlluniau fel yr un hwn eu treialu'n llwyddiannus mewn ardaloedd eraill yng Nghymru. I roi'r agwedd diogelwch cymunedol o'r neilltu, mae wedi rhoi man diogel i blant allu chwarae yn yr awyr agored. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i arwain y ffordd ar hyn yn y Cabinet i edrych ar hyn mewn ffordd drawsbynciol, ac i gynnwys agweddau ar ddiogelwch plant yn ogystal â diogelwch cymunedol, er mwyn sicrhau y gellir dwyn y gwahanol gronfeydd arian hynny at ei gilydd os bydd angen, ac yna annog y cynghorau i edrych ar hyn? Dylai cynghorau fod yn gwneud hyn i ddatblygu mannau chwarae diogel i blant yn eu hardaloedd.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol yn ymwybodol o faterion chwarae. Yr wyf wedi gweld enghraifft o osod gataiau, ac mae'n wych. Mae'n golygu, yn arbennig yn achos tai teras, fod man helaeth yng nghefn y tŷ lle gall plant chwarae'n ddiogel, a'u rhieni'n eu gwyllo. Byddaf yn trafod y pwynt yn fwy cyffredinol yn is-bwyllgor y Cabinet ar blant.

committee on children.

**Mark Isherwood:** Although the west Rhyl community association tells me that it is too early to draw any conclusions about long-term crime reduction, as the gates are new, and some are not yet finished, anecdotal evidence suggests that the residents who have benefited from them like them. Evidence elsewhere also demonstrates that lockable gates at an entrance to an alley can reduce burglaries via the rear access by up to 90 per cent. What action is the Minister taking to address the designation of many alleys as public highways, thereby protecting them from provisions to deal with the closure of routes for crime-prevention purposes? Does she agree with the west Rhyl community association that an analysis of residents' satisfaction would be useful?

**Mark Isherwood:** Er bod cymdeithas gymunedol gorllewin y Rhyl yn dweud wrthyf ei bod yn rhy gynnar dod i gasgliadau ynglŷn â lleihau troseddau yn yr hirdymor, gan fod y gatiâu'n beth newydd, a rhai ohonynt heb eu gorffen, awgryma tystiolaeth anecdotaidd fod y trigolion sydd wedi cael budd ohonynt yn eu hoffi. Mae tystiolaeth mewn mannau eraill hefyd yn dangos y gall gatiâu y gellir eu cloi wrth fynedfa ali leihau nifer yr achosion o fwrgleriaeth drwy gefn tai hyd at 90 y cant. Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â phennu nifer o alïâu yn gefnffyrdd cyhoeddus, a thrwy hynny eu diogelu rhag darpariaethau i ddelio â chau ffyrdd at ddibenion atal troseddau? A yw'n cytuno â chymdeithas gymunedol gorllewin y Rhyl y byddai dadansoddiad o foddhad trigolion yn ddefnyddiol?

**Edwina Hart:** In terms of residents' satisfaction in general, I cannot recall having received any complaints about the alleygating process in correspondence. However, if I am incorrect, I will correct the Record. It is community safety partnerships that need to make the decisions on these issues at a local level, involving the local authority and the police. Highways issues are matters for local authorities. As we all know, people would love to see local authorities taking responsibility for many lanes, but that does not happen. These are local issues.

**Edwina Hart:** O ran boddhad trigolion yn gyffredinol, ni allaf gofio cael unrhyw gwynion mewn gohebiaeth am y broses o osod gatiâu. Fodd bynnag, os wyf yn anghywir, byddaf yn cywiro'r Cofnod. Partneriaethau diogelwch gymunedol ddylai wneud y penderfyniadau hyn ar lefel leol, gan gynnwys yr awdurdod lleol a'r heddlu. Fel y gŵyr pawb, byddai pobl wrth eu bodd yn gweld awdurdodau lleol yn cymryd cyfrifoldeb dros nifer o lonydd, ond nid yw hynny'n digwydd. Materion lleol yw'r rhain.

### **Trais yn y Cartref Domestic Violence**

**Q3 Christine Chapman:** Will the Minister make a statement on what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to reduce the level of domestic violence in homes across Wales? OAQ0282(SJR)

**C3 Christine Chapman:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar yr hyn mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i leihau lefelau trais yn y cartref ledled Cymru? OAQ0282(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** The Assembly Government launched a national strategy on 30 March 2005. To assist with the strategy, an additional £1.1 million is being allocated in the three-year period from 2005-08. I hope that this will build on initiatives already in place such as the new national helpline.

**Edwina Hart:** Lansiodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad strategaeth genedlaethol ar 30 Mawrth 2005. I gynorthwyo gyda'r strategaeth, caiff £1.1 miliwn yn ychwanegol ei ddyrannu yn ystod y cyfnod o dair blynedd o 2005 i 2008. Gobeithio y bydd hyn yn datblygu mentrau sydd eisoes ar waith, fel y llinell gymorth genedlaethol newydd.

**Christine Chapman:** I commend the Welsh Assembly Government for taking this issue seriously. The all-Wales national strategy has been launched, as you said, highlighting that there must be a collective approach to this issue. Domestic violence is not just a problem for the victim, or even the perpetrator. What consideration have you given to the economic cost to society of domestic violence? That cost has been estimated to be just under £6 billion across the UK. What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to ensure that we make this a responsibility for everyone in Wales?

**Edwina Hart:** I hope that the way in which the strategy has developed, and the support that we have across Wales, makes people understand that this is everyone's responsibility. Interestingly, in terms of the economic cost, I first came across the issue of domestic violence through employment—where employees could not come to work for various reasons and, in dealing with disciplinary procedures, we found that the underlying issue was domestic abuse. It is nice to see that some employers have good policies on this issue, recognising not only the impact on the individual, but also the impact on work and business.

**David Lloyd:** What guidance have you provided to community safety partnerships in terms of incorporating the prevention of domestic abuse in their action plans?

**Edwina Hart:** I hope that everyone looks at what we have issued on our policy agenda across the board to understand what domestic violence is and what type of crime it is. There are a lot of interesting initiatives across Wales. In fact, Jocelyn Davies raised a point in the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee meeting this morning about the Crown Prosecution Service in Gwent and how it works with the police to highlight issues and to ensure that abusers are prosecuted, so that people do not become victims twice. I will look at the advice and guidance that we have issued, but I believe that the amount is sufficient.

**Christine Chapman:** Cymeradwyaf Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am gymryd y mater hwn o ddifrif. Lanswyd strategaeth genedlaethol Cymru gyfan, fel y dyweddech, i dynnu sylw at y ffaith fod yn rhaid sicrhau ymagwedd gyfunol tuag at y mater hwn. Nid problem i'r dioddefwr yn unig yw trais yn y cartref, nac i'r sawl sy'n cyflawni'r trosedd hyd yn oed. Pa ystyriaeth a roddwyd gennych i gost economaidd trais yn y cartref? Amcangyfrifwyd bod y gost honno ychydig yn llai na £6 biliwn ar draws y DU. Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod hyn yn gyfrifoldeb ar bawb yng Nghymru?

**Edwina Hart:** Gobeithio bod y ffordd y mae'r strategaeth wedi datblygu, a'r gefnogaeth a gawn ledled Cymru, yn gwneud i bobl ddeall bod hwn yn gyfrifoldeb ar bawb. Yn ddiddorol iawn, o ran cost economaidd, deuthum ar draws trais yn y cartref am y tro cyntaf drwy gyflogaeth—pan na allai gweithwyr ddod i'r gwaith am amryw o resymau. Ac wrth ddelio â gweithdrefnau disgyblu, gwelais mai'r broblem sylfaenol oedd trais yn y cartref. Mae'n braf gweld bod gan rai cyflogwyr bolisiau da ar y mater hwn, gan gydnabod nid yn unig yr effaith ar yr unigolyn, ond hefyd yr effaith ar waith a busnes.

**David Lloyd:** Pa ganllawiau yr ydych wedi eu darparu i bartneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol o ran ymgorffori'r syniad o atal trais yn y cartref yn eu cynlluniau gweithredu?

**Edwina Hart:** Gobeithio y bydd pawb yn edrych ar yr hyn yr ydym wedi'i gyhoeddi ar ein hagenda bolisi yn gyffredinol i ddeall beth yw trais yn y cartref a pha fath o drosedd ydyw. Mae yna nifer o fentrau diddorol ledled Cymru. Yn wir, codwyd pwynt gan Jocelyn Davies yn y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio y bore yma ynglŷn â Gwasanaeth Erllyn y Goron yng Ngwent, a'r ffordd y mae'n gweithio gyda'r heddlu i dynnu sylw at faterion a sicrhau y caiff troseddwyr eu herlyn, er mwyn sicrhau na fydd pobl yn dioddef yr un drosedd ddwywaith. Byddaf yn edrych ar y cyngor a'r canllawiau a gyhoeddwyd gennym, ond credaf ein bod wedi cyhoeddi digon.

**Gwasanaethau Cyngtori Annibynnol  
Independent Advice Services**

**Q4 Eleanor Burnham:** Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of independent advice services in Wales? OAQ0238(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Support for independent advice services remains primarily with local authorities for local citizens advice bureaux and with the Department of Trade and Industry for regional and national CABx. The Legal Services Commission (Wales) also provides support and funding for the independent advice services sector, with whom we work to ensure that support is provided where gaps are identified.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Would you agree that Citizens Advice performs an indispensable service to the people of Wales? Do you acknowledge that it is struggling to deliver this service because of a lack of funding? Would you give serious consideration to providing more core funding to this wonderful organisation?

**Edwina Hart:** Most CABx rely on several funding sources, principally local authorities, the Legal Services Commission, and other small contributors. My concern is that, if I considered other funding methods, I would want to look at that as additionality. I am always frightened that other funders would take their funding away and that mine would become the core funding. However, I recognise that CABx can play an important role in delivering key policies within my portfolio, as I think is highlighted in Huw Lewis's review of over-indebtedness, which we discussed in committee today. I am concerned that many citizens' advice bureaux do not have the resources to undertake the delivery of these policies. In order to get a better picture of this, I have asked my officials to provide me with information on where CABx are working with Communities First partnerships to deliver their objectives, to see what more I can do in those areas.

**C4 Eleanor Burnham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ddarparu gwasanaethau cyngtori annibynnol yng Nghymru? OAQ0238(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Awdurdodau lleol sy'n bennaf gyfrifol am gymorth i wasanaethau cyngor annibynnol, fel y canolfannau cyngor ar bopeth, a'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant sy'n bennaf gyfrifol am y CABau rhanbarthol a chenedlaethol. Mae'r Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Cyfreithiol (Cymru) hefyd yn rhoi cymorth a chyllid i'r sector gwasanaethau cyngor annibynnol, ac yr ydym yn gweithio gyda hwnnw i sicrhau darparu cymorth lle nodir bod bylchau.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A fydddech yn cytuno bod y Ganolfan Cyngor ar Bopeth yn darparu gwasanaeth anhepgor i bobl Cymru? A ydych yn cydnabod ei bod yn cael anhawster i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth hwn oherwydd diffyg cyllid? A fydddech yn ystyried o ddifrif rhoi rhagor o arian craidd i'r sefydliad gwych hwn?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r rhan fwyaf o ganolfannau CAB yn dibynnu ar sawl ffynhonnell gyllido, yn bennaf awdurdodau lleol, y Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Cyfreithiol, a chyfranwyr bach eraill. Yr hyn sy'n peri pryder imi yw hyn: pe byddwn yn ystyried dulliau cyllido eraill, byddwn am ystyried yr arian hwnnw fel arian ychwanegol. Yr wyf bob amser yn ofni y bydd cyllidwyr eraill yn tynnu eu harian yn ôl ac y byddai fy arian i yn dod yn arian craidd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn cydnabod y gall canolfannau CAB chwarae rôl bwysig o fewn fy mhortffolio o ran cyflwyno polisiau allweddol, fel y dangosir, mi gredaf, yn adolygiad Huw Lewis o or-ddyledrwydd, a drafodwyd gennym yn y pwyllgor heddiw. Mae'n destun pryder imi nad oes gan nifer o ganolfannau cyngor ar bopeth yr adnoddau i ymgymryd â darparu'r polisiau hyn. Er mwyn cael gwell darlun o hyn, yr wyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion ddarparu gwybodaeth imi ble mae Canolfannau Cyngor ar Bopeth yn gweithio gyda phartneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf i gyflawni eu hamcanion, i weld beth arall y gallaf ei wneud yn yr ardaloedd hynny.



2.10 p.m.

**David Melding:** Minister, you may know that it is Carers' Week this week, and I am sure that we all send our good wishes to the thousands of carers all over Wales, many of whom need advice and who go to organisations like citizens advice bureaux. It is important that general governmental programmes, such as the carers' strategy and social enterprise—the entire range of them, really—channel some funds towards securing more independent advice.

**Edwina Hart:** There is an issue surrounding independent advice, and what advice citizens should receive on matters. I will look at these issues in the round, in terms of what help and assistance we give to independent advice agencies.

**David Melding:** Weinidog, efallai eich bod yn gwybod ei bod yn Wythnos Gofalwyr yr wythnos hon, ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod pob un ohonom am ddymuno'n dda i'r miloedd o ofalwyr dros Gymru gyfan, nifer ohonynt ag angen cyngor ac yn troi at sefydliadau fel canolfannau cyngor ar bopeth. Mae'n bwysig i raglenni cyffredinol y llywodraeth, fel y strategaeth gofalwyr a mentrau cymdeithasol—yr ystod gyfan, mewn gwirionedd—sianelu rhywfaint o gyllid er mwyn sicrhau cyngor mwy annibynnol.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae yna broblem gyda chyngor annibynnol, a pha gyngor y dylai dinasyddion ei gael ar faterion. Edrychaf ar y materion hyn yn gyffredinol, o ran yr help a'r cymorth y gallwn eu rhoi i asiantaethau cyngor annibynnol.

### **System Darganfod Cyffuriau Ion Track The Ion Track Drug Detection System**

**Q5 William Graham:** Will the Minister make a statement on the use of the Ion Track drug detection system in Wales?  
OAQ0237(SJR)

**C5 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ddefnyddio'r system darganfod cyffuriau Ion Track yng Nghymru?  
OAQ0237(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** The Ion Track drug detection system is another tool for the police to use in tackling substance misuse and dealing. I think that it can fulfil a valuable role and function for the police across Wales.

**Edwina Hart:** Teclyn arall i'r heddlu ei ddefnyddio wrth fynd i'r afael ag achosion o gamddefnyddio sylweddau a masnachu mewn cyffuriau yw'r system darganfod cyffuriau Ion Track. Credaf y gall gyflawni rôl a swyddogaeth werthfawr i'r heddlu ledled Cymru.

**William Graham:** I am sure that you will join me in congratulating the Monmouthshire community safety partnership and Gwent Police on allowing their equipment to be used today—though I query the test results that some of us have had. [*Laughter.*] Minister, you know that this is a first-rate scheme; therefore, will you help to introduce it in more police forces throughout Wales?

**William Graham:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch â mi wrth longyfarch partneriaeth diogelwch cymunedol Sir Fynwy a Heddlu Gwent am adael inni ddefnyddio'u hoffer heddiw—er fy mod yn amau canlyniadau profion rhai ohonom. [*Chwerthin.*] Weinidog, gwyddoch fod y cynllun hwn yn gynllun o'r radd flaenaf, felly, a fyddwch yn rhoi cymorth i'w gyflwyno i ragor o heddluoedd ledled Cymru?

**Edwina Hart:** Some of these matters are not devolved and are obviously matters for the police. However, I was pleased to see the success in forces that have used the system. I will certainly hold discussions with police

**Edwina Hart:** Mae rhai o'r materion hyn heb eu datganoli ac maent yn amlwg yn faterion i'r heddlu. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddwn yn falch gweld y llwyddiant mewn heddluoedd sydd wedi defnyddio'r system.

chief constables on how they feel that the system could be used across Wales. We have to give the police the necessary tools to deal with these issues.

**Val Lloyd:** Minister, as you are an Assembly Member for Swansea, you will know that the police drugs unit in Swansea trialled this machine in 2003, it became fully operational in February 2005, and has led to many arrests. More importantly, many nightclubs and bars are now looking into buying their own machines. Do you agree that this latest development in police technology shows that there is no place for drug dealers and users to hide?

**Edwina Hart:** It is important that there is no place for them to hide; we need to take a strong line on this. Operation Condor was launched in the early hours of Saturday, 4 June in Swansea. Violent crime and drug abuse in Swansea city centre was targeted, and it was a successful police operation. I am sure that we welcome that across the Assembly.

Byddaf yn sicr yn cynnal trafodaethau gyda phrif gwnstabiliaid heddlu ynghylch i weld sut y credant y gellir defnyddio'r system ar draws Cymru. Rhaid inni roi'r offer angenrheidiol i'r heddlu i ddelio â'r problemau hyn.

**Val Lloyd:** Weinidog, gan mai chi yw'r Aelod Cynulliad dros Abertawe, gwyddoch fod uned gyffuriau'r heddlu yn Abertawe wedi treialu'r peiriant hwn yn 2003. Yr oedd ar waith ym mis Chwefror 2005, ac mae wedi arwain at arestio nifer o bobl. Yn bwysicach na hynny, mae nifer o glybiau nos a bariâu erbyn hyn yn ystyried prynu eu peiriannau eu hunain. A gytunwch fod y datblygiad diweddaraf hwn yn nhechnoleg yr heddlu yn dangos nad oes gan werthwyr cyffuriau a phobl sy'n defnyddio cyffuriau unrhyw le i guddio?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'n bwysig iddynt beidio â chael unman le i guddio; mae angen inni fod yn gadarn ar hyn. Lanswyd Operation Condor yn gynnar fore Sadwrn, 4 Mehefin yn Abertawe. Targedwyd troseddau treisgar ac achosion o gamdefnyddio cyffuriau yng nghanol dinas Abertawe, a bu'n ymgyrch lwyddiannus gan yr heddlu. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod yn croesawu hynny ar draws y Cynulliad.

### **Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Caerffili) Social Justice and Regeneration (Caerphilly)**

**Q6 Jeff Cuthbert:** Will the Minister outline the Welsh Assembly Government's main achievements in the field of social justice and regeneration in Caerphilly? OAQ0251(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** The Caerphilly area benefits from a number of schemes that help to deliver our social justice agenda for Wales. Communities First areas have been established, aiming to raise the self-esteem and the aspirations of local people. Caerphilly community safety partnership is making an impact on crime, disorder and anti-social behaviour, while the Care and Repair agency in Caerphilly helps older and disabled people to remain in their own homes. Therefore, it is quite a successful picture across Caerphilly.

**C6 Jeff Cuthbert:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu prif lwyddiannau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ym maes cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio yng Nghaerffili? OAQ0251(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae ardal Caerffili yn elwa o nifer o gynlluniau sy'n helpu darparu ein hagenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ar gyfer Cymru. Sefydlwyd ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, a'u nod yw codi hunan-barch a dyheadau pobl leol. Mae partneriaeth diogelwch cymunedol Caerffili yn cael effaith ar droseddau, anhrefn ac ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, a'r asiantaeth Gofal a Thrwsio yng Nghaerffili yn helpu pobl hŷn anabl i aros yn eu cartrefi eu hunain. Felly, mae'n ddarlun eithaf llwyddiannus ar draws Caerffili.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** The Van Communities First partnership in my constituency is putting together a bid to recreate the Lansbury Lancers. Two local ladies are working with the Gwent Association of Voluntary Organisations to recreate this famous championship jazz band that stopped around 16 years ago. It will provide a fun and learning activity for more than 60 youngsters. This will allow young people to learn teamwork and to appreciate music, and it would help to bind the local community by bringing old and young together. Do you agree that initiatives such as this should be encouraged?

**Edwina Hart:** I think that all initiatives should be encouraged, particularly ones such as that. When Alun Pugh made his statement about the importance of arts and sport to Communities First, we recognised that there is a role for the arts, music and sport in Communities First areas. However, the fact that I say that it is a good project does not necessarily mean that it will be funded.

**Laura Anne Jones:** I understand that, over 2004-05, Caerphilly was awarded one of the highest deprivation grants in Wales as part of the Assembly's programme to achieve social justice. As you will be aware, as I raised it with the First Minister yesterday, Monmouthshire county council has been awarded the ridiculously low sum of £422 for 2005-06—a sum so small that no specific programme of action can be approved with a grant. There are severe pockets of deprivation in Monmouthshire, Minister, and I would be interested to know whether you truly believe that that £422 is enough to achieve social justice in Monmouthshire.

**Edwina Hart:** Communities First was based on the 100 most deprived wards in Wales. The index of multiple deprivation, as we all know, is being revised. It is important to remember that Communities First funding is available, if you have Communities First wards to apply for the cash. Local authorities were able to make representations early on in the process of establishing Communities First to create sub-wards if they did not have Communities First wards. I cannot recall

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae partneriaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn y Fan yn fy etholaeth i yn llunio cais i ail-greu Lansbury Lancers. Mae dwy fenyw leol yn gweithio gyda Chymdeithas Mudiadau Gwirfoddol Gwent i ail-greu'r band jazz enwog hwn a enillodd nifer o bencampwriaethau ac a chwalodd tua 16 mlynedd yn ôl. Bydd yn darparu gweithgarwch dysgu a hwyl i fwy na 60 o blant ifanc. Bydd hyn yn gyfle i bobl ifanc ddysgu sut i weithio mewn tîm a gwerthfawrogi cerddoriaeth, a byddai'n helpu dwyn y gymuned leol ynghyd drwy ddod â'r hen a'r ifanc at ei gilydd. A gytunwch y dylid annog mentrau fel hyn?

**Edwina Hart:** Credaf y dylid annog pob math o fentrau, yn arbennig rhai fel hwnnw. Pan wnaeth Alun Pugh ei ddatganiad ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd y celfyddydau a chwaraeon i Gymunedau yn Gyntaf, yr oeddem yn cydnabod bod rôl i'r celfyddydau, cerddoriaeth a chwaraeon mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r ffaith fy mod yn dweud ei fod yn brosiect da yn golygu o anghenraid y caiff ei ariannu.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Deallaf, yn ystod 2004-05, fod un o'r grantiau amddifadedd uchaf yng Nghymru wedi ei roi i Gaerffili fel rhan o raglen y Cynulliad i sicrhau cyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Fel y gwyddoch, gan imi ei godi gyda'r Prif Weinidog ddoe, dyfarnwyd swm chwerthinllyd o isel i gyngor Sir Fynwy, sef £422 am 2005-06—swm mor fach fel na ellir cymeradwyo unrhyw raglen weithredu benodol gyda grant. Mae yna bocedi o amddifadedd difrifol yn Sir Fynwy, Weinidog, a byddai gennyf ddiddordeb gwybod a ydych o ddifrif yn credu bod £422 yn ddigon i sicrhau cyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn Sir Fynwy.

**Edwina Hart:** Seiliwyd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ar y 100 o wardiau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru. Mae'r mynegai aml-amddifadedd, fel y gŵyr pob un ohonom, yn cael ei ddiwygio. Mae'n bwysig cofio bod arian Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ar gael, os oes gennych wardiau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf i wneud cais am yr arian. Yr oedd awdurdodau lleol yn gallu gwneud sylwadau yn gynnar yn y broses o sefydlu Cymunedau yn Gyntaf i greu is-wardiau os nad oedd

what the position was in Monmouthshire, as the programme was established almost five years ago. You might be referring to deprivation grant figures; that grant is in the local government settlement and does not come under my portfolio.

ganddynt wardiau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Ni allaf gofio beth oedd y sefyllfa yn Sir Fynwy, gan i'r rhaglen gael ei sefydlu bron bum mlynedd yn ôl. Efallai eich bod yn cyfeirio at ffigurau grant amddifadedd; mae'r grant hwnnw yn y setliad llywodraeth leol, ac nid yw'n rhan o fy mhorthffolio i.

### **Cynllun Tai Fforddiadwy i Weithwyr Allweddol Key Workers Affordable Housing Scheme**

**Q7 Peter Black:** What plans does the Minister have to implement a key workers affordable housing scheme in Wales? OAQ0252(SJR)

**C7 Peter Black:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i weithredu cynllun tai fforddiadwy i weithwyr allweddol yng Nghymru? OAQ0252(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** I have no plans at this stage to introduce a key worker housing scheme. The ability to provide assistance already exists through the homebuy scheme. It is for local authorities to identify priorities for investment in accordance with their local housing strategies and assessments of housing need.

**Edwina Hart:** Nid oes gennyf unrhyw gynlluniau ar hyn o bryd i gyflwyno cynllun tai i weithwyr allweddol. Mae'r gallu i ddarparu cymorth eisoes yn bodoli drwy'r cynllun prynu cartref. Cyfrifoldeb awdurdodau lleol yw nodi blaenoriaethau ar gyfer buddsoddi yn unol â'u strategaethau tai lleol a'u hasesiadau o anghenion tai.

**Peter Black:** The homebuy scheme is available in rural areas with a 50 per cent contribution, but, in urban areas, the contribution is 30 per cent. Given that it is in urban areas that affordability problems for nurses, firefighters and other low-paid public sector workers such as teachers and so on have been identified, would it not be worth considering whether the homebuy contribution in these areas could be increased to 50 per cent, to be targeted at those professions?

**Peter Black:** Mae'r cynllun prynu cartref ar gael mewn ardaloedd gwledig gyda chyfraniad o 50 y cant, ond mewn ardaloedd trefol 30 y cant yw'r cyfraniad. O gofio mai mewn ardaloedd trefol y nodwyd problemau fforddio ymhlith nyrsys, diffoddwyr tân a gweithwyr eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus sydd ar gyflogau isel, megis athrawon ac ati, oni fyddai'n werth ystyried a ellid cynyddu'r cyfraniad prynu cartref yn yr ardaloedd hyn i 50 y cant, er mwyn targedu'r proffesiynau hynny?

**Edwina Hart:** I am currently analysing local authority housing strategies, and I will report to committee on this in July. I will consider the point that you have raised when more information is available. I have looked at the issue of key workers and discussed it with the relevant organisations.

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf ar hyn o bryd yn dadansoddi strategaethau tai awdurdodau lleol, a byddaf yn cyflwyno adroddiad i'r pwyllgor ar hyn ym mis Gorffennaf. Byddaf yn ystyried y pwynt a godwyd gennych pan fydd rhagor o wybodaeth ar gael. Yr wyf wedi ystyried mater gweithwyr allweddol ac wedi ei drafod gyda'r sefydliadau perthnasol.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** A wnewch chi ymhelaethu ar yr hyn a ddywedwyd gennych, wedi datganiad Canghellor y Trysorlys, Gordon Brown, ynghylch y ffaith nad oes gennych gynlluniau i gyflwyno cynlluniau i brynwyr am y tro cyntaf? Bu ichi ddweud mai mater i awdurdodau lleol yw penderfynu faint o arian

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Will you expand on your comments, following the statement made by the Chancellor of the Exchequer, Gordon Brown, about the fact that you do not have any plans to introduce new schemes for first-time buyers? You have said that it is a matter for local authorities to determine how much

i'w neilltuo ar gyfer cynlluniau fel cynllun cymorth prynu. Gan fod patrymau gwariant o dan y cynllun hwn mor amrywiol ymysg awdurdodau lleol, onid ydych yn credu y byddai'n fuddiol i roi mwy o arweiniad ac i roi mwy o bwysau ar awdurdodau lleol i wneud mwy o ddefnydd o'r cynllun?

**Edwina Hart:** You have raised a number of points there. I am well aware of the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister's proposals for affordable housing in England. One proposal is to extend homebuy to help tenants of local authorities and registered social landlords to buy their homes. We have already provided that capability for tenants of RSLs in Wales. However, we must develop solutions that reflect our needs, and we have commissioned a review of low-cost home ownership to establish future policy direction.

I am attracted to some aspects of the new proposals for the homebuy scheme in England, such as the possibility of jointly funding equity loans with the private sector. I met representatives of the mortgage lending industry on 13 June to discuss this possibility. It is important to recognise that local authorities have a role in this regard, and I will engage with them on the housing agenda in a conference in the autumn, at which some speakers are due to talk about the broader aspects. I assure you, Ieuan, that many issues are being raised in this context, and we are having many discussions with officials and others in order to take this forward positively.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Hoffwn fynd â hyn ychydig ymhellach, Weinidog. Os yw'r cynlluniau hyn yn mynd rhagddynt yn Lloegr o dan arweiniad Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, fel yr awgrymwyd gennych, a hynny gyda chyllid o'r Trysorlys, tybiaf y daw Barnett *consequential* i Gymru. Oni fydd mwy o gyllid yn help mawr ichi oherwydd gellid sicrhau, gydag arian ac ewyllys tu cefn iddynt, fod y cynlluniau yn cael eu gweithredu?

**Edwina Hart:** I am not aware of any new

money is allocated to schemes such as homebuy. Given that the pattern of expenditure under this scheme is so varied, do you not think it would be beneficial for the Government not only to provide a firmer lead on this, but to put more pressure on local authorities to make greater use of the scheme?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr ydych wedi codi nifer o bwyntiau. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn o gynigion Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy yn Lloegr. Un cynnig yw estyn y cynllun prynu cartref i helpu tenantiaid awdurdodau lleol a landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig i brynu eu cartrefi. Yr ydym eisoes wedi darparu'r hynny ar gyfer tenantiaid landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ddatblygu atebion sy'n adlewyrchu ein hanghenion, ac yr ydym wedi comisiynu adolygiad o berchnogaeth cost isel i bennu cyfeiriad y polisi yn y dyfodol.

Mae rhai agweddau ar y cynigion newydd ar gyfer y cynllun prynu cartref yn Lloegr yn apelio ataf, megis y posibilrwydd o ariannu benthyciadau ecwiti ar y cyd â'r sector preifat. Cyfarfûm â chynrychiolwyr y diwydiant benthyca morgeisi ar 13 Mehefin i drafod y posibilrwydd hwn. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod bod gan awdurdodau lleol rôl yn hyn, a byddaf yn cysylltu â hwy ynglŷn â'r agenda tai mewn cynhadledd yn yr hydref, pan fydd rhai siaradwyr yn siarad am yr agweddau ehangach. Hoffwn eich sicrhau, Ieuan, fod nifer o faterion yn cael eu codi yn y cyd-destun hwn, ac yr ydym yn cael nifer o drafodaethau gyda swyddogion ac eraill er mwyn gweithredu ar hyn yn gadarnhaol.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I should like to take this a little further, Minister. If these proposals proceed in England under the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister, as you suggested, and with Treasury funding, I assume Wales will receive a Barnett consequential. Would not more money be of great benefit to you, because it would mean that, with the money and the will behind them, the schemes could go ahead?

**Edwina Hart:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o

money from the Treasury for this. I assume that the ODPM is using its own resources and, therefore, there will not be a consequential to the Welsh block.

unrhyw arian newydd gan y Trysorlys ar gyfer hyn. Tybiaf fod Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn defnyddio ei hadnoddau ei hun, ac felly ni fydd addasiadau canlyniadol i floc Cymru.

2.20 p.m.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** The Minister is well aware of and takes seriously the position on affordable housing, particularly in rural Wales. I am sure that it is a problem throughout Wales, but there are pressure points in rural Wales, certainly in Powys and particularly in Radnorshire, and I have received representations recently about Rhayader. What is the Minister doing to monitor local authorities' performance in this area to ensure that they have robust policies on affordable housing that deliver affordable housing within their areas?

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Gŵyr y Gweinidog yn iawn am y sefyllfa o ran tai fforddiadwy, ac mae'n cymryd y mater o ddifrif, yn arbennig yn ardaloedd gwledig Cymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn broblem ledled Cymru. Ond mae ardaloedd gwael yng Nghymru wledig, yn sicr ym Mhowys ac yn arbennig yn Sir Faesyfed, ac yr wyf wedi cael sylwadau yn ddiweddar ynglŷn â Rhaeadr Gwy. Beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i fonitro perfformiad awdurdodau lleol yn yr ardal hon, i sicrhau bod ganddynt bolisiâu cadarn ar dai fforddiadwy sy'n sicrhau tai fforddiadwy yn eu hardaloedd?

**Edwina Hart:** Local authorities have already set out a policy in their development plans for an element of affordable housing to be provided as part of new housing developments. We can keep an eye on that. The thresholds for such policies are set by the local planning authorities, based on evidence of need and subject to negotiations with developers on a site-by-site basis. The issue of targeting thresholds for affordable housing is being considered, as you know, as part of the review of technical advice note 2. Therefore, we will be able to measure that, and I understand that TAN 2 is going out for consultation later this summer. However, I am concerned about land that is not being made available for affordable housing. We have been reviewing the land that is currently within the Assembly's block, and there were discussions in committee about perhaps considering what land was available in the whole public sector for use for affordable housing. There are issues that are that are not within my portfolio, which relate to how planning is dealt with across Wales.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae awdurdodau lleol eisoes wedi gosod polisi allan yn eu cynlluniau datblygu i ddarparu elfen o dai fforddiadwy fel rhan o ddatblygiadau tai newydd. Gallwn gadw llygad ar hynny. Pennir y trothwyon ar gyfer polisiâu o'r fath gan yr awdurdodau cynllunio lleol, ar sail tystiolaeth o angen ac yn amodol ar negodiadau gyda datblygwyr fesul safle. Mae mater targedau trothwyon ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy yn cael ei ystyried, fel y gwyddoch, fel rhan o'r adolygiad o nodyn cyngor technegol 2. Felly, byddwn yn gallu mesur hynny, a deallaf y bydd TAN 2 yn destun ymgynghori'n ddiweddarach yn yr haf eleni. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn pryderu ynglŷn â thir nad yw'n cael ei ryddhau ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy. Yr ydym wedi bod yn adolygu'r tir sydd ar hyn o bryd o fewn bloc y Cynulliad, a bu trafodaethau yn y pwyllgor ynglŷn ag ystyried efallai pa dir a oedd ar gael yn y sector cyhoeddus cyfan i'w ddefnyddio ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy. Mae yna faterion nad ydynt yn rhan o fy mhorthffolio i ac sy'n ymwneud â'r modd yr ymdrinnir â chynllunio ledled Cymru.

#### **Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn Sir y Fflint Social Justice and Regeneration in Flintshire**

**Q8 Carl Sargeant:** Will the Minister outline the Welsh Assembly Government's main

**C8 Carl Sargeant:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu prif lwyddiannau Llywodraeth

achievements in the field of social justice and regeneration in Flintshire? OAQ0270(SJR)

Cynulliad Cymru ym maes cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio yn Sir y Fflint? OAQ0270(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** The Flintshire area benefits from a number of schemes that deliver our social justice agenda. Communities First areas have been established to raise the aspirations of local people. The community safety partnership is impacting on crime and disorder, and Flintshire Care and Repair helps older and disabled people to remain in their homes.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae ardal Sir y Fflint yn elwa o nifer o gynlluniau sy'n darparu ein hagenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Sefydlwyd ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf i wella dyheadau pobl leol. Mae'r bartneriaeth diogelwch cymunedol yn effeithio ar droseddau ac anrhefn, ac mae Gofal a Thrsio Sir y Fflint yn helpu pobl hŷn ac anabl i aros yn eu cartrefi.

**Carl Sargeant:** As the directly elected Member for Alyn and Deeside, I have witnessed at first hand the good work carried out by the voluntary sector in the area and within Delyn. Will you join me in congratulating Welsh Border Community Transport on its recent achievement of obtaining article 33 funding to buy new minibuses to transport people right across the rural and urban developments within Alyn and Deeside and Flintshire?

**Carl Sargeant:** Fel yr Aelod a etholwyd yn uniongyrchol dros Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy, yr wyf wedi gweld â'm llygaid fy hun y gwaith da sy'n cael ei wneud gan y sector gwirfoddol yn yr ardal ac yn Nelyn. A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch Welsh Border Community Transport am sicrhau cyllid erthygl 33 yn ddiweddar i brynu bysiau mini newydd i gludo pobl ar draws yr holl ddatblygiadau gwledig a threfol yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy a Sir y Fflint?

**Edwina Hart:** I will certainly join you in congratulating that organisation. We need more projects such as this because transport and accessibility to transport are very important in these areas.

**Edwina Hart:** Yn sicr, ymunaf â chi i longyfarch y sefydliad hwnnw. Mae arnom angen mwy o brosiectau fel hwn, oherwydd mae cludiant a gallu cael cludiant yn bwysig iawn yn yr ardaloedd hyn.

**Mark Isherwood:** There are cuts in Jobcentre Plus centres in Prestatyn and Holywell, and the job of tackling isolation and unemployment in the rural north Flintshire Communities First area relied upon an officer from the Shotton Jobcentre Plus centre providing flexible support within the area, and within villages and small estates. However, this officer's job is due to go at the end of July. What action can you therefore take to safeguard this position so that this vital work may continue?

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae toriadau yn y Canolfannau Byd Gwaith ym Mhrestatyn a Threffynnon, a byddai'r gwaith o fynd i'r afael ag unigedd a diweithdra yn ardal ogleddol wledig Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn Sir y Fflint yn dibynnu ar swyddog o Ganolfan Byd Gwaith Shotton i ddarparu cymorth hyblyg yn yr ardal, ac yn y pentrefi a'r ystadau bach. Fodd bynnag, mae disgwyl i swydd y swyddog hwn ddod i ben ddiwedd mis Gorffennaf. Pa gamau y gallwch eu cymryd, felly, i ddiogelu'r swydd hon fel y gall y gwaith hollbwysig hwn barhau?

**Edwina Hart:** Unless the Secretary of State for Wales made an announcement otherwise in his statement today on the White Paper, Jobcentre Plus is not a devolved matter.

**Edwina Hart:** Oni fydd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru wedi cyhoeddi i'r gwrthwyneb yn ei ddatganiad heddiw ar y Papur Gwyn, nid yw Canolfannau Byd Gwaith yn fater sydd wedi ei ddatganoli.

### **Anghydraddoldebau Tâl Inequalities in Levels of Pay**

**Q9 Christine Chapman:** Has the Minister undertaken any research into the role played by inequalities in levels of pay in keeping people in relative poverty in Wales? OAQ0281(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Inequalities in levels of pay play a role in relative poverty, but differences in employment status are more important. The presence in a household of someone in any kind of paid work greatly lessens the risk of relative poverty.

**Christine Chapman:** Like most people, I welcome the raising of the national minimum wage, which will take effect later this year, and I believe that its introduction has been a considerable step in the right direction in terms of alleviating the problem of the working poor and addressing their situation. However, do you agree that we should now be moving to establish a living wage—and I understand that the Greater London Assembly has been working on this—and will you work with the UK Government on this so that workers can begin to escape the poverty trap?

**Edwina Hart:** We made a good start with the minimum wage, and it is important that we recognise that establishing the minimum wage is among the most significant actions of the Labour Government in Westminster. We must work now on getting a fair wage for everybody, and we need wage rates to increase so that people do not live in poverty. The minimum wage does not affect some of the poorest households, of course, because they do not have anyone in employment.

**C9 Christine Chapman:** A yw'r Gweinidog wedi gwneud unrhyw waith ymchwil i'r rhan sydd gan anghydraddoldebau tâl wrth gadw pobl mewn tlodi cymharol yng Nghymru? OAQ0281(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae gan anghydraddoldebau tâl ran mewn dlodi cymharol, ond mae gwahaniaethau mewn statws cyflogaeth yn bwysicach. Mae cael rhywun yn y cartref sydd â gwaith am dâl o unrhyw fath yn lleihau'n fawr iawn y risg o dlodi cymharol.

**Christine Chapman:** Fel y mwyafrif, yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith y bydd yr isafswm cyflog cenedlaethol yn codi ac yn dod i rym yn ddiweddarach eleni. Credaf fod cyflwyno hyn wedi bod yn gam sylweddol i'r cyfeiriad cywir i leddfu problem pobl dlawd sy'n gweithio ac i fynd i'r afael â'u sefyllfa. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn cytuno y dylem fod yn gweithredu yn awr i sefydlu cyflog byw—a deallaf fod Cynulliad Llundain Fwyaf wedi bod yn gweithio ar hyn—ac a fyddwch yn geithio gyda Llywodraeth y DU ar hyn fel y gall gweithwyr ddechrau dianc o'r cylch tlodi?

**Edwina Hart:** Cawsom gychwyn da gyda'r isafswm cyflog, ac mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod bod sefydlu'r isafswm cyflog yn un o weithredoedd pwysicaf y Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan. Rhaid inni weithio'n awr i sicrhau cyflog teg i bawb, ac mae angen i gyfraddau cyflogau gynyddu fel na fydd pobl yn byw mewn tlodi. Nid yw'r isafswm cyflog yn effeithio ar rai o'r cartrefi tlotaf, wrth gwrs, gan nad oes neb yn y cartrefi hynny'n gweithio.

### **Cymdeithasau Tai Housing Associations**

**Q10 Mark Isherwood:** Will the Minister make a statement on housing associations? OAQ0254(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Housing associations, working in partnership with local authorities, provide approximately 1,000 additional affordable homes for rent and part-ownership in Wales each year. The £70 million allocated to the social housing grant programme this year will be enhanced by at least £50 million

**C10 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gymdeithasau tai? OAQ0254(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae cymdeithasau tai, drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth ag awdurdodau lleol, yn darparu tua 1,000 o dai fforddiadwy ychwanegol ar rent ac mewn rhanberchnogaeth yng Nghymru bob blwyddyn. Bydd y £70 miliwn a neilltuwyd i'r rhaglen grant tai cymdeithasol eleni yn cynyddu o



in private finance raised by housing associations.

**Mark Isherwood:** The Welsh Federation of Housing Associations has noted that the national housing strategy has little to say about the supply of affordable housing. At the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee meeting in March 2004, you promised a paper on the role of housing associations. When will that be published and what recognition will it give to the role that housing associations can play in all areas of community regeneration as voluntary non-profit bodies?

**Edwina Hart:** Housing associations have a valuable role and function to play. Clearly, if this matter is on the committee agenda and is included in the action points arising, it will be scheduled for publication according to the papers that I prepare for committee.

**Kirsty Williams:** Wales and West Housing Association has a development in Llandrindod Wells known as Christchurch Court. It has withdrawn the full-time warden service from that sheltered development, causing much angst to the elderly residents, many of whom are in their eighties and nineties. It has been replaced by a two-day-a-week service. What right of appeal do those residents have when Wales and West Housing Association and other housing associations seem to pay such little regard to the needs and desires of their tenants?

**Edwina Hart:** Thank you for raising this with me. Housing associations should consider what their tenants' requirements are. There should be consultation with tenants groups and discussion on particular issues. I would be grateful if you would put this matter to me in writing and I will deal with it.

leiaf £50 miliwn mewn cyllid preifat yn cael ei godi gan gymdeithasau tai.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae Ffederasiwn Cymdeithasau Tai Cymru wedi nodi nad oes gan y strategaeth tai genedlaethol lawer i'w ddweud am gyflenwi tai fforddiadwy. Yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ym mis Mawrth 2004, yr oeddech yn addo papur ar rôl cymdeithasau tai. Pryd y caiff hwnnw ei gyhoeddi, a pha gydnabyddiaeth fydd ynddo i'r rhan y gall cymdeithasau tai ei chwarae ym mhob maes adfywio cymunedol fel cyrff gwirfoddol nad ydynt yn gwneud elw?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae gan gymdeithasau tai rôl a swyddogaeth werthfawr. Yn amlwg, os yw'r mater hwn ar agenda'r pwyllgor ac os yw wedi ei gynnwys yn y pwyntiau gweithredu sy'n codi, trefnir ei gyhoeddi yn unol â'r papurau y byddaf yn eu paratoi ar gyfer y pwyllgor.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae gan Gymdeithas Tai Cymru a Gorllewin Lloegr ddatblygiad yn Llandrindod o'r enw Christchurch Court. Mae wedi tynnu'r gwasanaeth warden amserllawn yn ôl yn y datblygiad lloches hwnnw, gan achosi llawer o bryder i'r trigolion oedrannus, nifer ohonynt yn eu hwythdegau a'u nawdegau. Fe'i disodlwyd gan wasanaeth dau ddiwrnod yr wythnos. Pa hawl i apelio sydd gan y trigolion hynny pan nad yw Cymdeithas Tai Cymru a Gorllewin Lloegr na chymdeithasau tai eraill fel pe baent yn rhoi llawer o sylw i anghenion a dymuniadau eu tenantiaid?

**Edwina Hart:** Diolch ichi am godi hyn gyda mi. Dylai cymdeithasau tai ystyried beth yw gofynion eu tenantiaid. Dylid ymgynghori â grwpiau tenantiaid a thrafod materion penodol gyda hwy. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe baech yn nodi hyn mewn llythyr ataf, a byddaf yn ymdrin ag ef.

### Rêfs Anghyfreithlon Illegal Raves

**Q11 William Graham:** Will the Minister make a statement on discussions she has held with police forces in Wales to co-ordinate action against illegal raves? OAQ0258(SJR)

**C11 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y trafodaethau a fu rhyngddi hi a heddluoedd Cymru er mwyn cydlynu camau gweithredu yn erbyn rêfs anghyfreithlon? OAQ0258(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** I have regular discussions with the four chief constables and the police authorities, covering a wide range of issues. Illegal raves have not been raised with me yet.

**Edwina Hart:** Byddaf yn cael trafodaethau rheolaidd gyda'r pedwar prif gwnstabl ac awdurdodau'r heddlu, yn cwmpasu ystod eang o faterion. Ni chodwyd rêfs anghyfreithlon gyda mi hyd yma.

**William Graham:** You will be aware of an illegal rave that took place at Betws Common near Ammanford a fortnight ago at which there was a significant number of arrests. Will you outline the experience learned from this event and how future events could be presented?

**William Graham:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol o rêf anghyfreithlon a gynhaliwyd ar Gomin Betws ger Rhydaman bythefnos yn ôl, lle arestiwyd nifer sylweddol o bobl. A soniwyd am y profiad a gafwyd yn sgîl y digwyddiad hwn, a sut y gellid cyflwyno digwyddiadau yn y dyfodol?

**Alun Cairns:** You could go on a fact-finding mission, William—[*Laughter.*]

**Alun Cairns:** Gallech fynd yno i gasglu gwybodaeth, William—[*Chwerthin.*]

**Edwina Hart:** I know that there is much levity on this subject, but it is a serious matter for local residents and others as well as being a serious policing matter. I thank William for raising this issue with me and I will raise it at one of my regular meetings with the chief constables and police authorities and ask them about how they dealt with that rave and what the levels of crime were.

**Edwina Hart:** Gwn fod llawer o ddigrifwch am y testun hwn, ond mae'n fater difrifol i drigolion lleol ac eraill, yn ogystal â bod yn fater difrifol o blismona. Diolch i William am godi'r mater hwn gyda mi, ac fe'i codaf yn un o'm cyfarfodydd rheolaidd gyda'r prif gwnstablaid ac awdurdodau'r heddlu a'u holi ynglŷn â sut y deliwyd â'r ref hwnnw a faint o droseddau fu.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 12 has been withdrawn.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 12 yn ôl.

### Mynd i'r Afael â'r Diwylliant Cyffuriau Tackling the Drug Culture

**Q13 Nick Bourne:** Will the Minister make a statement on her policies for tackling the drug culture? OAQ0276(SJR)

**C13 Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ei pholisïau ar gyfer mynd i'r afael â'r diwylliant cyffuriau? OAQ0276(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** It is important to educate people about the danger of drugs at an early age. That is why our all-Wales schools programme is so important. It aims to prepare young people for the various temptations and peer pressure that they may face, including the problems associated with taking drugs. We looked at a detailed paper on this matter in committee this morning and we all welcomed the work that had been done on this on an all-Wales basis.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'n bwysig addysgu pobl am beryglon cyffuriau yn gynnar yn eu bywydau. Dyna pam mae ein rhaglen i ysgolion Cymru gyfan mor bwysig. Ei nod yw paratoi pobl ifanc ar gyfer yr amrywiol dtemtasiynau a'r pwysau gan gyfoedion a all eu hwynebu, gan gynnwys y problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â chymryd cyffuriau. Buom yn edrych ar bapur manwl ar y mater hwn yn y pwyllgor y bore yma, a chroesawodd pob un ohonom y gwaith a oedd wedi ei wneud ar hyn dros Gymru gyfan.

**Nick Bourne:** I pay tribute to the Ion Track detection system, which has been operating

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn rhoi teyrnged i'r system ddarganfod Ion Track, sydd wedi bod

outside the Chamber today, despite the fact that the Minister and William Graham tested positive on it; I was relieved that I did not. However, it is an excellent system.

The use of crack cocaine is a serious problem throughout Wales, in the capital city and elsewhere, and is also becoming a serious problem in smaller towns. Has the Minister had any discussions with the police forces specifically on tackling the problem of crack cocaine use and could she update us on those discussions?

**Edwina Hart:** I have had discussions with the police force in particular on the cannabis issue, which you have raised with me, and on drugs issues in general. I have been invited to discuss further with police forces some of these drugs issues and I will be happy to report back what I can to Plenary.

William Graham and I both tested positive, but, of course, drugs can be found on cash that you withdraw from a cashpoint, beer mats and so on. The public needs to be aware that this is a sophisticated system that can detect anything that you may have picked up from being in contact with someone's jacket, clothes and so on.

ar waith y tu allan i'r Siambr heddiw, er bod y Gweinidog a William Graham wedi cael prawf positif. Yr oeddwn yn falch na chefais i hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n system ragorol.

Mae defnyddio crac cocên yn broblem ddifrifol ledled Cymru, yn y brifddinas ac mewn mannau eraill, ac mae'n dod yn broblem ddifrifol hefyd mewn trefi llai. A yw'r Gweinidog wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gyda'r heddlu yn benodol ar fynd i'r afael â phroblem camdefnyddio crac cocên, ac a allai roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am y trafodaethau hynny?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf wedi cael trafodaethau gyda'r heddlu ynglŷn â phroblem canabis yn benodol, sy'n fater yr ydych wedi ei godi gyda mi, ac am gyffuriau'n gyffredinol. Fe'm gwahoddwyd i drafod rhai o'r problemau cyffuriau hyn ymhellach gyda'r heddlu, ac yr wyf yn ddigon parod i adrodd yn ôl ar hyn yn y Cyfarfod Llawn.

Cafodd William Graham a minnau brawf positif. Ond wrth gwrs, mae cyffuriau i'w cael ar arian parod a gewch o beiriant tynnu arian, matiau cwrw, ac yn y blaen. Mae angen i'r cyhoedd fod yn ymwybodol fod hon yn system soffistigedig a all ddarganfod unrhyw beth y gallech fod wedi ei godi o fod mewn cysylltiad â chôt neu ddillad rhywun, ac yn y blaen.

### Cam-drin yn y Cartref yn Ne Clwyd Domestic Abuse in Clwyd South

**Q14 Karen Sinclair:** Will the Minister make a statement on what is being done to tackle domestic abuse in Clwyd South? OAQ0244(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** In Clwyd South in particular, domestic violence co-ordinators are working closely with the eastern division of the North Wales Police to develop a multi-agency approach to addressing this local issue.

**Karen Sinclair:** As you may be aware, Government figures estimate that one in six men in the UK will experience domestic violence at some point in their lives. Figures also reveal that nearly a third of male victims suffer in silence because they find it too

**C14 Karen Sinclair:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar yr hyn sy'n cael ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â cham-drin yn y cartref yn Ne Clwyd? OAQ0244(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** Yn Ne Clwyd yn arbennig, mae cydgysylltwyr trais yn y cartref yn gweithio'n agos gydag isadran ddwyreiniol Heddlu Gogledd Cymru i ddatblygu ymagwedd aml-asiantaeth i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem leol hon.

**Karen Sinclair:** Fel y gwyddoch, efallai, mae ffigurau'r Llywodraeth yn amcangyfrif y bydd un dyn o bob chwech yn y DU yn dioddef trais yn y cartref ar ryw adeg yn eu bywyd. Mae ffigurau'n datgelu hefyd fod bron traean y dioddefwyr sy'n ddynion yn

difficult to admit that they have a problem. What measures is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to ensure that we provide refuge, support and information to male as well as female victims of abuse in the home?

dioddef yn dawel am ei bod yn ei chael yn rhy anodd cyfaddef bod ganddynt broblem. Pa fesurau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i sicrhau ein bod yn darparu lloches, cymorth a gwybodaeth i ddynion yn ogystal â merched sy'n cael eu cam-drin yn y cartref?

2.30 p.m.

**Edwina Hart:** You have raised this issue previously, and it has been raised by other Members; I am pleased to report that the Cardiff community safety partnership is running a pilot exercise to target male victims of domestic abuse. The aim is to offer a one-stop-shop for men who have experienced domestic abuse. The service will include an all-Wales element in recognition of the lack of availability of appropriate agencies and services across the country. It is also taking referrals from the Welsh Womens Aid free domestic violence helpline, which is supported by the Assembly Government. I will get an understanding of the issues in due course, and we will feed this information into the revision of the strategy.

**Edwina Hart:** Yr ydych wedi codi'r mater hwn o'r blaen, ac mae wedi ei godi gan Aelodau eraill; yr wyf yn falch o adrodd bod partneriaeth diogelwch cymunedol Caerdydd yn cynnal ymarfer peilot i dargedu dynion sy'n cael eu cam-drin yn y cartref. Y nod yw cynnig siop-bopeth i ddynion sydd wedi eu cam-drin yn y cartref. Bydd y gwasanaeth yn cynnwys elfen Cymru gyfan i gydnabod prinder asiantaethau a gwasanaethau priodol ledled y wlad. Bydd hefyd yn derbyn pobl sy'n cael eu cyfeirio gan y llinell gymorth am ddim sy'n cael ei chynnig gan Gymorth i Fenywod Cymru a'i chefnogi gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Byddaf yn dod i ddeall y problemau maes o law, a byddwn yn ychwanegu'r wybodaeth honno at y broses o adolygu'r strategaeth.

### Tai Cymdeithasol Social Housing

**Q15 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on the availability of social housing in Wales? OAQ0274(SJR)

**C15 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y tai cymdeithasol sydd ar gael yng Nghymru? OAQ0274(SJR)

**Edwina Hart:** At the end of 2003-04, the stock of social housing owned by local authorities and registered social landlords amounted to 233,400 dwellings. Together, they provided 17,831 lettings to new tenants.

**Edwina Hart:** Ar ddiwedd 2003-04, yr oedd y stoc tai cymdeithasol sy'n eiddo i awdurdodau lleol a landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig yn 233,400 o anheddau. Gyda'i gilydd, yr oeddent yn gosod 17,831 o gartrefi i denantiaid newydd.

**Lisa Francis:** In an answer to me last month, Minister, you stated that you had meetings with representatives from the Chartered Institute for Housing in Wales, and would meet with the Council of Mortgage Lenders to consider arrangements for private sector finance. Can you tell me if you have met with the Council of Mortgage Lenders and, if so, what was the outcome of the meeting? Did it make any recommendations as to how the Welsh Assembly Government could move forward the issues surrounding housing in

**Lisa Francis:** Mewn ateb imi fis diwethaf, Weinidog, dywedech eich bod wedi cael cyfarfodydd gyda chynrychiolwyr o Sefydliad Tai Siartredig Cymru, ac y byddech yn cyfarfod gyda'r Cyngor Benthycwyr Morgeisi i ystyried trefniadau ar gyfer cyllid y sector preifat. A allwch ddweud wrthyf a ydych wedi cael cyfarfod gyda'r Cyngor Benthycwyr Morgeisi, ac os felly, beth oedd canlyniad y cyfarfod hwnnw? A wnaeth unrhyw argymhellion ynglŷn â sut y gallai Llywodraeth Cynulliad

Wales?

Cymru symud ymlaen gyda'r materion sy'n ymwneud â thai yng Nghymru?

**Edwina Hart:** I met the CML earlier this week, and we had a wide-ranging discussion. Both the CML and I made suggestions, and we will take it forward, with the CML being involved in a conference in the autumn to start to think outside the box in the discussion of the issues in Wales.

**Edwina Hart:** Cyfarfûm â'r Cyngor Benthycwyr Morgeisi yn gynharach yr wythnos hon, a chawsom drafodaeth eang. Gwnaed argymhellion gan y Cyngor a gennyf fi, a byddwn yn eu datblygu. Bydd y Cyngor yn cymryd rhan mewn cynhadledd yn yr hydref i ddechrau meddwl yn ehangach o ran y drafodaeth am y problemau yng Nghymru.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Minister. You seem to have exhausted the questions.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch, Weinidog. Ymddengys eich bod wedi ateb pob cwestiwn.

### **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth Questions to the Minister for Economic Development and Transport**

#### **Ynni Energy**

**Q1 Mark Isherwood:** Will the Minister make a statement on energy use by Welsh industry? OAQ0328(EDT)

**C1 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ddefnyddio ynni gan ddiwydiant yng Nghymru? OAQ0328(EDT)

**The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies):** Wales has a high proportion of energy-intensive heavy industry. During 2003, the Welsh industrial and commercial sectors consumed 9,961 GWh of electricity. Heavy industry has a high dependence on competitively priced supplies of energy. New environmental standards encourage greater energy efficiency in a way that protects jobs and offers economic opportunities.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies):** Mae yng Nghymru gyfran uchel o ddiwydiant trwm sy'n defnyddio llawer iawn o ynni. Yn ystod 2003, defnyddiodd sectorau diwydiannol a masnachol Cymru 9,961 GWh o drydan. Mae diwydiant trwm yn dibynnu'n fawr ar gyflenwadau ynni am brisiau cystadleuol. Mae safonau amgylcheddol newydd yn annog mwy o effeithlonrwydd ynni mewn ffordd sy'n diogelu swyddi ac yn cynnig cyfleoedd economaidd.

**Mark Isherwood:** In considering future energy strategy, what action is the Minister taking with colleagues in Westminster to address the urgent implications for companies such as Anglesey Aluminium, whose future on Ynys Môn is dependent upon its existing contract with the Wylfa Magnox power station being extended by a minimum of two years beyond 2010, and on the construction of a new power station to come into commission at that time?

**Mark Isherwood:** Wrth ystyried strategaeth ynni, r dyfodol, pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd gyda chydweithwyr yn San Steffan i fynd i'r afael â'r goblygiadau brys i gwmnïau fel Alwminiwm Môn sydd â'i ddyfodol ar Ynys Môn yn dibynnu ar ymestyn ei gontract presennol gyda gorsaf bŵer Magnox yn yr Wylfa am ddwy flynedd o leiaf ar ôl 2010, ac ar adeiladu gorsaf bŵer newydd i ddechrau gweithio bryd hynny?

**Andrew Davies:** We have been raising this issue on behalf on Anglesey Aluminium for some years, and have been working closely with the Member of Parliament for Anglesey

**Andrew Davies:** Yr ydym wedi bod yn codi'r mater hwn ar ran Alwminiwm Môn ers rhai blynnyddoedd, ac wedi bod yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r Aelod Seneddol dros Ynys Môn

and the local management of Anglesey Aluminium, raising the issue of the renewable obligations impact on Anglesey Aluminium and the decommissioning of Wylfa power station, projected for 2010. I raised this issue in a recent meeting with the former Energy Minister, Michael Bryant, and the First Minister has raised it in extensive correspondence with the Department of Trade and Industry, pushing the case for Anglesey Aluminium.

**Janet Davies:** As you are aware, energy use is tied to the buoyancy of the industrial economy, and we all remember how it dropped in the early 1980s and 1990s under Conservative UK Governments. The challenge is to find means to control non-renewable energy consumption during upturns in the economic cycles. Would you consider giving a commitment to discuss, with the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside, a technical advice note to ensure that new industrial build has maximum energy efficiency and that there is a presumption in favour of the use of non-renewable energy sources where possible?

**Andrew Davies:** I presume that you mean renewable energy rather than non-renewable?

**Janet Davies:** Yes.

**Andrew Davies:** I would certainly not give a commitment to do that if it was non-renewable.

This is an issue that we have consistently discussed at Cabinet level. All Ministers have discussed this, both in full Cabinet and in the sustainable development sub-committee. Looking at the use of low carbon and renewable energy sources for buildings is something that we have discussed with the Welsh Development Agency, ensuring that the issue of sustainability is embedded in its business planning and any property developments that it takes forward. That is now embedded in its property strategy.

a rheolwyr lleol Alwminiwm Môn, gan godi problem yr effaith rhwymedigaethau ynni adnewyddadwy ar Alwminiwm Môn a dadgomisiynu gorsaf bŵer yr Wylfa. Rhagwelir y bydd hynny'n digwydd yn 2010. Codais y mater hwn mewn cyfarfod yn ddiweddar gyda Michael Bryant, y cyn Weinidog Ynni, ac mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi ei godi mewn gohebiaeth helaeth gyda'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, gan bledio achos Alwminiwm Môn.

**Janet Davies:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae cysylltiad rhwng defnyddio ynni a bywiogrwydd yr economi ddiwydiannol, a gallwn i gyd gofio sut y gostyngodd ar ddechrau'r 1980au a'r 1990au o dan Lywodraethau Ceidwadol y DU. Yr her yw dod o hyd i ddull i reoli defnyddio ynni nad yw'n ynni adnewyddadwy yn ystod y cyfnodau pan fydd y cylchoedd economaidd ar eu gorau. A fydddech yn ystyried ymrwmo i drafod nodyn cyngor technegol gyda'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad i sicrhau bod adeiladau diwydiannol newydd yn defnyddio ynni yn y modd mwyaf effeithlon sy'n bosibl, a bod tybiaeth o blaid defnyddio ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy ble bynnag y bydd yn bosibl?

**Andrew Davies:** Cymeraf eich bod yn cyfeirio at ynni adnewyddadwy yn hytrach nag ynni nad yw'n adnewyddadwy?

**Janet Davies:** Ydwyf.

**Andrew Davies:** Yn sicr, ni fyddwn yn ymrwmo i wneud hynny pe na bai'n ynni adnewyddadwy.

Mae hwn yn fater yr ydym wedi ei drafod yn gyson ar lefel y Cabinet. Mae pob Gweinidog wedi trafod hyn, yn y Cabinet llawn ac yn yr is-bwyllgor datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae edrych ar ddefnyddio ffynonellau ynni carbon isel a ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy yn rhywbeth yr ydym wedi ei drafod gydag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, gan sicrhau bod mater defnyddio ynni cynaliadwy yn cael ei ymgorffori yn ei gynllun busnes ac mewn unrhyw ddatblygiadau eiddo y bydd yn mynd â hwy yn eu blaen. Mae hynny bellach yn rhan o'i strategaeth eiddo.

## Mentrau Cymdeithasol Social Enterprises

**Q2 David Melding:** How many jobs have been created by social enterprises in South Wales Central in the last year for which figures were available? OAQ0334(EDT)

**C2 David Melding:** Faint o swyddi sydd wedi eu creu gan fentrau cymdeithasol yng Nghanol De Cymru yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf yr oedd ffigurau ar gael ar ei chyfer? OAQ0334(EDT)

**Q9 David Melding:** How many jobs have been created by social enterprises in Wales in the last year for which figures are available? OAQ0333(EDT)

**C9 David Melding:** Faint o swyddi sydd wedi eu creu gan fentrau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf y mae ffigurau ar gael ar ei chyfer? OAQ0333(EDT)

**Andrew Davies:** There are no official statistics available for job creation by social enterprises. However, the Welsh labour force survey shows that, in South Wales Central in 2003, 2.8 per cent of the workforce was employed by charities, voluntary organisations or trusts. The equivalent figure for Wales was 2.1 per cent.

**Andrew Davies:** Nid oes ystadegau swyddogol ar gael ar gyfer y swyddi a grëwyd gan fentrau cymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r arolwg o lafurlu Cymru yn dangos, yng Nghanol De Cymru yn 2003, fod 2.8 y cant o'r gweithlu yn cael eu cyflogi gan elusennau, sefydliadau gwirfoddol neu ymddiriedolaethau. Dau bwynt un y cant oedd y ffigur cyfatebol yng Nghymru.

**David Melding:** Social firms currently employ approximately 250 people in Wales, half of whom are disabled people. The concept of social firms is fairly recent, having developed in Europe in the 1990s. It is important that we now start to bring the strands of Government policy together to increase the number of social firms and the number of people that they employ, and perhaps examine whether funding can be made available in loans by credit unions to social firms.

**David Melding:** Ar hyn o bryd mae cwmnïau cymdeithasol yn cyflogi tua 250 o bobl yng Nghymru, a hanner y rheini'n bobl anabl. Mae'r cysyniad o gwmnïau cymdeithasol yn un lled ddiweddar, ac fe'i datblygwyd yn Ewrop yn y 1990au. Mae'n bwysig inni bellach ddechrau dod â meysydd polisi'r Llywodraeth ynghyd i gynyddu nifer y cwmnïau cymdeithasol a nifer y bobl a gyflogir ganddynt, ac o bosibl ymchwilio i weld a ellir sicrhau arian ar eu cyfer drwy fenthyciadau gan undebau credyd i gwmnïau cymdeithasol.

**Andrew Davies:** While I previously had the responsibility for social enterprise, it is now the responsibility of the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration. She will launch the social enterprise strategy for Wales on 27 June. We believe that this sector is of great importance to the development of the Welsh economy. Edwina Hart also has policy responsibility for credit unions, which—I believe—the strategy will take up and take forward in a comprehensive and coherent way.

**Andrew Davies:** Er mai fi oedd yn gyfrifol gynt am fentrau cymdeithasol, cyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ydyw bellach. Bydd yn lansio'r strategaeth menter gymdeithasol i Gymru ar 27 Mehefin. Credwn fod y sector hwn yn bwysig iawn i ddatblygiad economi Cymru. Mae gan Edwina Hart hefyd gyfrifoldeb polisi dros undebau credyd a fydd—mi gredaf—yn dod yn rhan o'r strategaeth ac yn cael eu datblygu mewn modd cynhwysfawr a chydlynus.

**Owen John Thomas:** Your response paints a rather rosy picture but the reality seems somewhat different. I remember meeting a

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae eich ymateb yn creu darlun hyrach yn ffafriol, ond mae'r realiti'n ymddangos ychydig yn wahanol.

group of talented young people who were keen to set up an innovative social enterprise in South Wales Central but they were increasingly frustrated by the bureaucratic process of obtaining advice and funding. What is your Government doing to simplify this process?

**Andrew Davies:** Traditionally, business support is available for companies in the private sector. We recognise that there are issues to be addressed in terms of support for social enterprise and, as I said in my response to David Melding, Edwina Hart is driving this forward with the strategy that will be launched later this month. I have discussed the whole area of business support with the WDA. The Wales Council for Voluntary Action has raised this issue with me and I believe that there is now a compact, signed by the WCVA and the WDA, in terms of support for companies broadly defined as in the social enterprise area. There has been a lack of focused support in the past, but I believe that that support will be increasingly focused on the needs of that sector.

Cofiaf gyfarfod â grŵp o bobl ifanc ddawnus a oedd yn awyddus i sefydlu menter gymdeithasol yng Nghanol De Cymru, ond yr oeddent yn mynd yn fwyfwy rhwystredig oherwydd y broses fiwrocraidaidd o gael cyngor a chyllid. Beth mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i symleiddio'r broses hon?

**Andrew Davies:** Yn draddodiadol, mae cymorth busnes ar gael i gwmnïau yn y sector preifat. Yr ydym yn cydnabod bod problemau i'w datrys o ran cymorth i fentrau cymdeithasol, ac fel y dywedais yn fy ymateb i David Melding, mae Edwina Hart yn datblygu hyn gyda'r strategaeth a gaiff ei lansio'n ddiweddarach y mis hwn. Yr wyf wedi trafod holl fater cymorth busnes gyda WDA. Mae Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru wedi codi'r mater hwn gyda mi, a chredaf fod yna gompact erbyn hyn, wedi'i lofnodi gan WCVA a WDA, o ran cymorth i gwmnïau a ddiffinnir yn gyffredinol fel cwmnïau yn y maes menter gymdeithasol. Cafwyd prinder cymorth ag iddo ffocws yn y gorffennol, ond credaf y bydd y cymorth hwnnw'n canolbwyntio'n gynyddol ar anghenion y sector hwnnw.

### **Twristiaeth Leol Local Tourism**

**Q3 Mick Bates:** Will the Minister make a statement on local tourism? OAQ0298(EDT)

**Andrew Davies:** Local tourism matters are primarily the responsibility of the relevant local or national park authority. Many of these authorities recognise tourism as a key economic driver in their area, and are proactive in its promotion and development, working predominantly with the regional tourism partnerships and the Wales Tourist Board, where appropriate.

**Mick Bates:** There are many good local examples of organisations that encourage sustainable tourism in my constituency. There is none better than the Centre for Alternative Technology near Machynlleth which is currently trying to establish the Welsh institute for sustainable education, a project which will increase tourism in the

**C3 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar dwristiaeth leol? OAQ0298(EDT)

**Andrew Davies:** Cyfrifoldeb yr awdurdod lleol neu'r awdurdod parc cenedlaethol perthnasol yn bennaf yw materion yn ymwneud â thwristiaeth leol. Mae nifer o'r awdurdodau hyn yn cydnabod bod twristiaeth yn ysgogwr economaidd allweddol yn eu hardal ac yn ei hyrwyddo a'i ddatblygu'n rhagweithiol, gan weithio'n bennaf gyda'r partneriaethau twristiaeth rhanbarthol a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, lle mae hynny'n briodol.

**Mick Bates:** Mae yna lawer enghraifft leol dda o sefydliadau sy'n annog twristiaeth gynaliadwy yn fy etholaeth i. Ni chewch enghraifft well na'r Ganolfan Dechnoleg Amgen ger Machynlleth, sydd ar hyn o bryd yn ceisio sefydlu sefydliad addysg gynaliadwy Cymru, prosiect a fydd yn cynyddu twristiaeth yn yr ardal. Fodd



area. However, the project is delayed by the lack of co-ordination between so many different funding bodies—so much so that it has put in jeopardy many of the big grant applications that it has submitted and with which it has been successful. What are you doing to overcome this challenge where large projects are often put in deep jeopardy by different funders not coming to the same deadline?

**Andrew Davies:** I will look at that specific example, Mick, and respond to you in writing. Generally, we recognise that there is an issue of projects or organisations which are seeking funding from a variety of sources trying to get through what is, often—from their point of view—a bureaucratic maze. We are trying to simplify the way in which we can give support for organisations or projects. For example, in the next round of European structural funds, we are trying to simplify this process even further to make funds available to the Centre for Alternative Technology, in this case, or any other organisation whether it is in the private, voluntary or public sector.

2.40 p.m.

**Ann Jones:** Virgin Trains has just announced the decision to withdraw two services along the north Wales coast for the summer period to facilitate travellers to the west country. Will you join me in asking Virgin to reconsider that decision? North Wales relies heavily on tourism and the area's many tourism businesses and outlets need travellers to come to the area probably as much as the west country does.

**Andrew Davies:** I will certainly take that up with Virgin Trains; I am due to meet representatives fairly shortly. Thank you for bringing it to my attention. On the—  
[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I wish to hear the Minister's response to these important questions on transport.

**Andrew Davies:** The role of railways in tourism is very much underdeveloped. I

bynna, mae oedi gyda'r prosiect oherwydd diffyg cydgysylltu rhwng cynifer o gyrff ariannu gwahanol—i'r fath raddau fel ei fod wedi peryglu nifer o'r ceisiadau mawr am grant y mae wedi eu cyflwyno ac y mae wedi llwyddo gyda hwy. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i oresgyn yr her hon, lle mae prosiectau mawr yn aml mewn perygl dybryd oherwydd nad yw gwahanol gyrff ariannu yn cyrraedd yr un terfyn amser?

**Andrew Davies:** Erychaf ar yr enghraifft benodol honno, Mick, a rhoi ateb ysgrifenedig ichi. Yn gyffredinol, yr ydym yn cydnabod bod problem wrth i brosiectau neu sefydliadau sy'n gwneud ceisiadau am arian o nifer o ffynonellau geisio gweld y ffordd drwy'r hyn sy'n aml—o'u rhan hwy—yn ddrysfa fiwrocraidd. Yr ydym yn ceisio symleiddio'r ffordd y gallwn roi cymorth i sefydliadau neu brosiectau. Er enghraifft, yn y rownd nesaf o arian strwythurol Ewropeaidd, yr ydym yn ceisio symleiddio'r broses hon hyd yn oed ymhellach i sicrhau bod arian ar gael i'r Ganolfan Dechnoleg Amgen, yn yr achos hwn, neu unrhyw sefydliad arall, boed yn y sector preifat, y sector gwirfoddol neu'r sector cyhoeddus.

**Ann Jones:** Mae Virgin Trains newydd gyhoeddi'r penderfyniad i roi'r gorau i ddarparu dau wasanaeth ar hyd arfordir y Gogledd dros yr haf er mwyn hwyluso pethau i deithwyr i orllewin Lloegr. A ymunwch â mi i ofyn i Virgin ailystyried y penderfyniad hwnnw? Mae'r Gogledd yn dibynnu'n fawr ar dwristiaeth, ac mae ar y busnesau a'r manau twristiaeth yn yr ardal angen denu teithwyr i'r ardal lawn cymaint, mae'n debyg, â gorllewin Lloegr.

**Andrew Davies:** Yn sicr, byddaf yn mynd ar drywydd hynny gyda Virgin Trains; mae gennyf gyfarfod gyda chynrychiolwyr cyn hir. Diolch ichi am ddod â hynny i'm sylw. O ran y—  
[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Hoffwn glywed ymateb y Gweinidog i'r cwestiynau pwysig hyn ar drafnidiaeth.

**Andrew Davies:** Nid yw rôl rheilffyrdd ym maes twristiaeth wedi ei datblygu'n ddigonol.

know that the Wales Tourist Board had an arrangement with Great Western Railway in terms of exploiting the tourism market. It is also something that I have been discussing with Arriva Trains Wales in terms of developing and using our rail network more imaginatively for the tourism market. I will, however, take up the specific issue that you mentioned.

**Lisa Francis:** You mentioned the work of the regional tourism partnerships; their strategies, budgets and so on are currently set and monitored by the Wales Tourist Board. Which department will be responsible for this post merger, and how do you anticipate that the RTPs will be monitored, particularly in respect of ensuring that they fulfil their strategies? Or, do you anticipate that their strategies will be reviewed post-merger?

**Andrew Davies:** In terms of the portfolio to which they belong, I will give the same answer that I have given on the many occasions when you have raised this issue with me. Tourism, including the funding of the Wales Tourist Board, and other activities, such as the funding of RTPs, will remain in my portfolio. I cannot give any guarantee about any future funding for any area of operations within my budget, particularly those affected by the merger, because, clearly, we are fundamentally looking at the range of operations carried out by the WTB or the Welsh Development Agency. I have, however said that we are committed to regional delivery and see a strong role for the regions. The regional tourism partnerships, which are relatively new organisations, are beginning to come together; they have been successful, and are becoming more successful, so we see a role for them in the future.

Gwn fod gan gan Fwrdd Croeso Cymru gynt drefniant gyda Great Western Railway i fanteisio ar y farchnad dwristiaeth. Mae hefyd yn rhywbeth y bûm yn ei drafod gydag Arriva Trains Cymru o ran datblygu a defnyddio ein rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd yn fwy creadigol ar gyfer y farchnad dwristiaeth. Fodd bynnag, fe godaf y mater penodol yr oeddech yn sôn amdano.

**Lisa Francis:** Soniech am waith y partneriaethau twristiaeth rhanbarthol; ar hyn o bryd caiff eu strategaethau, eu cyllidebau ac ati eu pennu a'u monitro gan Fwrdd Croeso Cymru. Pa adran fydd yn gyfrifol am hyn yn dilyn yr uno, a sut yr ydych yn rhagweld y caiff y partneriaethau twristiaeth rhanbarthol eu monitro, yn arbennig o ran sicrhau eu bod yn cyflawni eu strategaethau? Neu a ydych yn rhagweld y caiff eu strategaethau eu hadolygu ar ôl yr uno?

**Andrew Davies:** O ran y portffolio y maent yn perthyn iddo, rhoddaf yr un ateb ag yr wyf wedi'i roi droeon wrth ichi godi'r mater hwn gyda mi. Bydd twristiaeth, gan gynnwys ariannu Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, a gweithgareddau eraill, megis ariannu partneriaethau twristiaeth rhanbarthol, yn parhau'n rhan o fy mhortffolio i. Ni allaf roi unrhyw sicrwydd ynghylch ariannu unrhyw faes gweithrediadau yn y dyfodol o fewn fy nghyllideb, yn arbennig y rhai y bydd yr uno yn effeithio arnynt, oherwydd yr ydym, yn amlwg, yn y bôn yn edrych ar yr ystod o weithrediadau y mae'r Bwrdd Croeso ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn eu cyflawni. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi dweud ein bod wedi ymrwymo i ddarpariaeth leol ac yn gweld rôl gref i'r rhanbarthau. Mae'r partneriaethau twristiaeth rhanbarthol, sy'n sefydliadau cymharol newydd, yn dechrau dod ynghyd; maent wedi bod yn llwyddiannus ac yn dod yn fwy llwyddiannus. Felly, gwelwn fod rôl iddynt yn y dyfodol.

### Cyflogaeth Employment

**Q4 Mark Isherwood:** Will the Minister make a statement on employment in Wales?  
OAQ0327(EDT)

**C4 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gyflogaeth yng Nghymru?  
OAQ0327(EDT)

**Andrew Davies:** Our economic development

**Andrew Davies:** Mae ein strategaeth

strategy, 'A Winning Wales' sets out our priorities. Wales is maintaining an employment rate well above its historical average, with the level in the three months to April of this year up 109,000 since the Assembly's establishment in 1999, while claimant-count unemployment is at levels not seen for 30 years.

**Mark Isherwood:** With National Statistics figures already showing no-one in employment in 156,000, or 18 per cent, of Welsh working-age households, how many of the additional 450,000 manufacturing job losses forecast by the Confederation of British Industry over the next two years, or of the 150,000 additional retail job losses forecast by Verdict Research over the next five years, have your economic forecasts indicated will be in Wales?

**Andrew Davies:** As I have said to the Economic Development and Transport Committee on many occasions, I do not comment on economic forecasts; I am interested in hard outcomes. The Welsh economy has performed significantly over the last four or five years; the unemployment rate in Wales is not only below the UK average—according to the International Labour Organisation definition of unemployment—it is one of the lowest in Europe. Two of Europe's major economies—France and Germany—have unemployment rates of over 10 per cent. That shows that the Welsh economy is performing very well. Digby Jones, the director general of the CBI, on his recent visit to Wales, told the First Minister and myself that, despite many visits to Wales since becoming director general, he has never seen the Welsh economy so robust, nor his members so optimistic about the future.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Despite the continued pessimism of opposition Members, do you agree that, with 42,000 jobs created, 53,000 jobs safeguarded, and with 250,000 beneficiaries, Objective 1 for west Wales and the Valleys has been a success by any

datblygu economaidd, 'Cymru'n Ennill' yn gosod allan ein blaenoriaethau. Mae Cymru yn cynnal cyfradd gyflogaeth sydd ymhell uwchlaw ei chyfartaledd hanesyddol, a'r lefel yn y tri mis hyd Ebrill eleni wedi codi 109,000 ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad yn 1999, a bod nifer y bobl ddi-waith sy'n hawlio buddaliadau ar ei isaf ers 30 mlynedd.

**Mark Isherwood:** Gyda ffigurau'r Ystadegau Gwladol eisoes yn dangos nad oes neb yn gweithio mewn 156,000, neu 18 y cant, o gartrefi o oedran gweithio yng Nghymru, sawl un o'r 450,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu ychwanegol y mae Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain yn rhagweld a gaiff eu colli dros y ddwy flynedd nesaf, neu sawl un o'r 150,000 o swyddi manwerthu ychwanegol y mae Verdict Reserarch yn rhagweld a gaiff eu colli dros y pum mlynedd nesaf, y mae eich rhagolygon economaidd yn awgrymu a gaiff eu colli yng Nghymru?

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedais wrth y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth droeon, ni fyddaf yn gwneud sylwadau ar ragolygon economaidd; canlyniadau pendant sy'n mynd â'm bryd. Mae economi Cymru wedi perfformio'n dda iawn dros y pedair neu bum mlynedd diwethaf; mae cyfradd diweithdra yng Nghymru nid yn unig yn is na chyfartaledd y DU—yn ôl diffiniad y Sefydliad Llafur Rhyngwladol o ddiweithdra—mae gyda'r isaf yn Ewrop. Mae cyfraddau diweithdra dwy o economïau mwyaf Ewrop—sef Ffrainc a'r Almaen—yn uwch na 10 y cant. Mae hynny'n dangos bod economi Cymru yn perfformio'n dda iawn. Dywedodd Digby Jones, cyfarwyddwr cyffredinol y CBI, yn ystod ei ymweliad â Chymru yn ddiweddar, wrth y Prif Weinidog a minnau nad oedd erioed wedi gweld economi Cymru mor gadarn, ac nad oedd erioed wedi gweld ei aelodau mor galonogol ynglŷn â'r dyfodol, er iddo ymweld â Chymru lawer gwaith ers dod yn gyfarwyddwr cyffredinol.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Er gwaethaf pesimistiaeth barhaus Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau, a ydych yn cytuno, yn sgîl creu 42,000 o swyddi, diogelu 53,000 o swyddi, a chyda 250,000 wedi elwa ohono, fod Amcan 1 ar gyfer y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd wedi bod yn llwyddiant ym mhob

measure, and has brought real benefits in terms of jobs and important related matters such as skills training.

**Andrew Davies:** The delivery of European structural funds, particularly Objective 1, has been a real success. That was recognised by the European Commission when we were awarded £65 million last year—the performance reserve is recognition of that success. As I have just said in response to Mark Isherwood, the fact that we now have the lowest unemployment that we have had since the early 1970s is a reflection of the success of economic policies in the Assembly and of those managed by the Chancellor of the Exchequer at a UK level. The fact that we now have low unemployment is testimony to the success of the European structural fund programmes.

**Elin Jones:** Fel y soniodd Jeff Cuthbert, mae'r cronfeydd strwythurol yn hynod bwysig i greu cyfleoedd cyflogaeth. A ydych yn ymwybodol bod Vincent Cable a Menzies Campbell o'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, mewn llythyr diweddar yn *The Times*, wedi rhoi cefnogaeth lawn i gapio cyllideb Ewrop ar lefel o 1 y cant o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth? A gytunwch fod cap o 1 y cant, fel y mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—a Tony Blair—yn ei arddel, yn golygu bod Ceredigion a gweddill gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd yn debygol iawn o golli'r cyfle i gael miliynau o bunnoedd o arian Ewropeaidd yn y dyfodol?

**Andrew Davies:** That question may be better addressed to the Liberal Democrats in the Chamber.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Liberal Democrats are not currently able to answer questions in the Chamber.

**Andrew Davies:** They may wish to comment on your question later in the proceedings, Elin. However, as I said in answer to Jeff Cuthbert, we have been successful in delivering European structural funds. We have made our position clear in that we are trying to get the best deal possible for Wales in terms of the post-2006 agenda, and will continue to make the case for that. However,

ystyr, ac wedi dod â manteision gwirioneddol yn ei sgîl o ran swyddi a materion cysylltiedig pwysig, megis hyfforddiant sgiliau.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae darparu cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd, yn enwedig Amcan 1, wedi bod yn llwyddiant gwirioneddol. Cydnabu'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd hynny pan ddyfarnwyd £65 miliwn inni y llynedd—mae'r gronfa berfformiad wrth gefn yn gydnabyddiaeth o'r llwyddiant hwnnw. Fel yr wyf newydd ei ddweud wrth ateb Mark Isherwood, mae'r ffaith fod diweithdra ar ei isaf ers dechrau'r 1970au yn adlewyrchiad o lwyddiant y polisïau economaidd yn y Cynulliad a'r rhai sy'n cael eu rheoli gan Ganghellor y Trysorlys ar lefel y DU. Mae'r ffaith fod diweithdra'n isel yn dyst i lwyddiant rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd.

**Elin Jones:** As Jeff Cuthbert mentioned, the structural funds are extremely important in creating job opportunities. Are you aware that Vincent Cable and Menzies Campbell of the Liberal Democrats, in a recent letter to *The Times*, have given full support to capping the European budget at 1 per cent of gross domestic product? Do you agree that a cap of 1 per cent, as the Liberal Democrats—and Tony Blair—support, would mean that Ceredigion and the rest of west Wales and the Valleys are extremely likely to lose out on millions of pounds of European funding in the future?

**Andrew Davies:** Byddai'n well gofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y Siambr.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn gallu ateb cwestiynau yn y Siambr ar hyn o bryd.

**Andrew Davies:** Efallai yr hoffent roi sylwadau ar eich cwestiwn yn ddiweddarach yn ystod y trafodion, Elin. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais wrth ateb Jeff Cuthbert, yr ydym edi bod yn llwyddiannus wrth sicrhau cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd. Yr ydym wedi'i gwneud ein sefyllfa'n glir ein bod yn ceisio cael y fargen orau sy'n bosibl i Gymru o ran yr agenda ar ôl 2006, a byddwn yn

as is clear with the discussions going on at a European level, there are major issues to be addressed in terms of the European budget, and we will continue to make our case. The Prime Minister and the Chancellor are making it clear that they are standing up for the UK interest, and we would support them in that.

**Jenny Randerson:** As has already been made clear, European structural funds are a key driver for additional employment in much of Wales. We have heard Jeff Cuthbert's estimate of how many jobs have been created, but will you give us your estimate? How does your Government plan to plug the gap from 2007 onwards, given that it now seems highly unlikely that an agreement will be made in June or July that will allow Wales to qualify for the future European structural funds that the Welsh Liberal Democrats strongly support?

**Andrew Davies:** As Chair of the Objective 1 Programme Monitoring Committee, I am sure that Jeff is in a good position to give the official figures. Some 106,000 jobs have been either created or safeguarded by European structural funds across the whole programme. That has been a successful programme. These figures are reported by the project sponsors to the Welsh European Funding Office. On the post-2006 agenda, we are looking to plan for any eventuality—whether a budget is agreed at this summit or by the end of this month—and we will plan on that basis or in line with any later deal on the budget. We have shown that we are able to manage the process successfully, and will continue to do so in future.

parhau i ddadlau dros hynny. Fodd bynnag, fel sy'n amlwg o'r trafodaethau sy'n mynd rhagddynt yn Ewrop, mae yna nifer o faterion pwysig y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy o ran y gyllideb Ewropeaidd, a byddwn yn parhau i roi ein dadl. Mae Prif Weinidog a Changhellor y DU yn ei gwneud yn glir eu bod yn amddiffyn buddiannu'r DU, a byddem yn eu cefnogi yn hynny.

**Jenny Randerson:** Fel y gwnaed yn glir eisoes, mae cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd yn ysgogydd allweddol i greu cyflogaeth ychwanegol yn y rhan fwyaf o Gymru. Yr ydym wedi clywed amcangyfrif Jeff Cuthbert o faint o swyddi a grëwyd, ond a wnewch roi inni eich amcangyfrif chithau? Sut y bwriada'ch Llywodraeth lenwi'r bwlch o 2007 ymlaen, o gofio ei bod yn ymddangos yn annhebygol iawn erbyn hyn y bydd cytundeb ym mis Mehefin neu fis Gorffennaf a fydd yn caniatáu i Gymru fod yn gymwys i gael y cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd yn y dyfodol y mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn eu cefnogi'n frwd?

**Andrew Davies:** Ac yntau'n Gadeirydd ar Bwyllgor Monitro Rhaglenni Amcan 1, yr wyf yn siŵr y gall Jeff roi'r ffigurau swyddogol. Mae tua 106,000 o swyddi wedi eu creu neu eu diogelu drwy gronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd ar draws y rhaglen i gyd. Mae wedi bod yn rhaglen lwyddiannus. Dyma'r ffigurau y mae noddwyr prosiectau wedi'u rhoi i Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru. O ran yr agenda ar ôl 2006, yr ydym yn ceisio cynllunio ar gyfer pob sefyllfa a all godi—p'un a gaiff cyllideb ei chytuno yn yr uwchgynhadledd hon neu erbyn diwedd y mis hwn—a byddwn yn cynllunio ar y sail honno neu'n unol ag unrhyw gytundeb diweddarach ar y gyllideb. Yr ydym wedi dangos ein bod yn gallu rheoli'r broses yn llwyddiannus, ac y byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny yn y dyfodol.

### Cyfyngiadau Cyflymder ar Gefnffyrdd Speed Limits on Trunk Roads

**Q5 Kirsty Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on speed limits on trunk roads? OAQ0293(EDT)

**Andrew Davies:** Maximum speed limits for dual and single carriageway trunk roads in

**C5 Kirsty Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gyfyngiadau cyflymder ar gefnffyrdd? OAQ0293(EDT)

**Andrew Davies:** Y terfynau cyflymder uchaf ar gefnffyrdd deuol neu unffrwd yng

Wales are 70 mph and 60 mph respectively, in common with the rest of the UK. *The Highway Code* lists a number of vehicle-specific speed limits. Lower speed limits are set in towns and villages in line with published guidance.

**Kirsty Williams:** Brecon and Radnorshire is equally cursed and blessed by the trunk roads that cross it. The village of Nant Ddu is plagued by speeding traffic along the A470. Despite repeated calls from me, and the residents, you have refused to lower the speed limit in that village to 50 mph, yet you have given permission for a similar village in the neighbouring constituency of Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney—a few miles from Nant Ddu—to have a speed limit of 50 mph. Why do the lives of people in the Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney constituency mean more to you than those of the villagers in my constituency, when they have more houses fronting the trunk road, a busy hotel complex and a drop-off and pick-up point for the bus services that take children to the local high school?

2.50 p.m.

**Andrew Davies:** There are UK guidelines on the use and introduction of speed limits. Many Members have raised issues about speed limits in their constituencies, and, clearly, there are national guidelines by which we must abide. I put on the record that if we do not abide by those national guidelines, anyone who challenges a decision, for example, an aggrieved motorist who believes that a lower speed limit has been introduced that should not have been according to the guidelines, then that is open to challenge. This has happened in the past, and we have had to erase a speed limit accordingly. There are clear guidelines, therefore, about the applicability of lower speed limits.

As Kirsty is aware, there was a recent site meeting on the issue of Nant Ddu. Minor footway improvements and road-marking enhancements are being introduced to increase the comfort of local residents, but this is an area where there are two houses and

Nghymru yw 70 mya a 60 mya yn y drefn honno, fel gweddill y DU. Mae *Rheolau'r Ffordd Fawr* yn rhestru nifer o derfynau cyflymder ar gyfer cerbydau penodol. Gosodir terfynau cyflymder is mewn trefi a phentrefi yn unol â chanllawiau sy'n cael eu cyhoeddi.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae'r cefnffyrdd sy'n mynd drwy Frycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed yn felltith ac yn fendith fel ei gilydd. Mae pentref Nant Ddu yn wynebu problem fawr oherwydd bod gyrwyr yn gyrru'n rhy gyflym ar hyd yr A470. Er gwaethaf galwadau mynych gennyf fi, a chan y trigolion, yr ydych wedi gwrthod gostwng y terfyn cyflymder yn y pentref hwnnw i 50 mya, ac eto yr ydych wedi rhoi caniatâd i bentref tebyg yn etholaeth Merthyr Tudful a Rhymni gerllaw—ychydig filltiroedd o Nant Ddu—osod terfyn cyflymder o 50 mya. Pam y mae bywydau pobl etholaeth Merthyr Tudful a Rhymni yn bwysicach i chi na bywydau'r pentrefwyr yn fy etholaeth i, er bod yno fwy o dai sydd ar fin y gefnffordd, gwesty prysur a man gollwng a chodi i'r gwasanaethau bysiau sy'n mynd â phlant i'r ysgol uwchradd leol?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae yna ganllawiau i'r DU ar ddefnyddio a chyflwyno terfynau cyflymder. Mae nifer o Aelodau wedi codi materion ynglŷn â therfynau cyflymder yn eu hetholaethau, ac yn amlwg mae yna ganllawiau cenedlaethol y mae'n rhaid inni gadw atynt. Hoffwn ddweud ar gofnod, os na fyddwn yn cadw at y canllawiau cenedlaethol hynny, y gall unrhyw un herio penderfyniad, er enghraifft, pan fydd modurwr sydd wedi'i ddigio yn credu bod terfyn cyflymder is wedi ei gyflwyno nag y dylid bod wedi cael ei gyflwyno yn ôl y canllawiau. Mae hyn wedi digwydd yn y gorffennol, a bu'n rhaid inni godi terfyn cyflymder o ganlyniad i hynny. Mae yna ganllawiau clir, felly, ynghylch gosod terfynau cyflymder is.

Fel y gŵyr Kirsty, cynhaliwyd cyfarfod safle yn Nant Ddu yn ddiweddar. Mae mân newidiadau ar y droedffyrdd a gwella'r marciau ar y ffordd yn cael eu cyflwyno i wneud pethau'n fwy hwylus i drigolion lleol, ond dau dŷ a gwesty sydd yn yr ardal hon. O

a hotel. In terms of the built environment, therefore, there is not a huge need. You referred to a case near Merthyr—I do not know whether that is the Llwyn Onn development—but that was in response to a significant and ongoing injury and accident record in that area. Such justification does not exist at Nant Ddu.

**Alun Cairns:** It is important that speed on trunk roads is managed effectively and fairly for all concerned, particularly in a built-up area and when there are schools in the vicinity. However, what about the speed on motorways, Minister? Do you recognise that most of the motoring organisations would support an increase in the maximum speed limit on a motorway from 70 mph to 80 mph? What representation have you made to the Westminster Government in this respect?

**Alun Pugh:** You crashed in the car park.

**Andrew Davies:** I wonder if that was at the lower or upper limit.

Our overriding concern must be road safety. There is a clear correlation between speed of traffic and injury and the severity of injuries. I have made no representations to the Department for Transport about raising the speed limit. My major concern, as I said, is road safety and the management of existing traffic and projected traffic flows. Therefore, it is more a question of the management of that than the speed limit.

ran yr amgylchedd adeiledig, felly, nid oes angen mawr. Bu ichi gyfeirio at achos ger Merthyr—ni wn ai datblygiad Llwyn Onn yw hwnnw—ond gwnaed hynny i ymateb i'r niferoedd sylweddol o anafiadau a damweiniau sydd wedi digwydd yn yr ardal honno ac sy'n parhau i ddigwydd. Nid oes cyfiawnhad o'r fath yn Nant Ddu.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'n bwysig i gyflymder ar gefnffordd gael ei reoli mewn ffordd effeithiol a theg i bawb dan sylw, yn enwedig mewn ardal adeiledig a gerllaw ysgolion. Fodd bynnag, beth am y cyflymder ar draffyrdd, Weinidog? A gydnabyddwch y byddai'r rhan fwyaf o'r sefydliadau moduro o blaid codi'r terfyn cyflymder uchaf ar draffordd o 70 mya i 80 mya? Pa sylwadau yr ydych wedi'u cyflwyno i Lywodraeth San Steffan o ran hyn?

**Alun Pugh:** Fe gawsoch chi ddamwain yn y maes parcio.

**Andrew Davies:** Ai ar y cyflymder isaf neu'r cyflymder isaf oedd hynny, ysgwn i?

Rhaid i ddiogelwch ar y ffyrdd fod yn beth pwysicaf. Mae cydberthynas glir rhwng cyflymder traffig ac anafiadau a difrifoldeb anafiadau. Nid wyf wedi cyflwyno sylwadau i'r Adran Drafnidiaeth ynglŷn â chodi'r terfyn cyflymder. Fel y dywedais, y peth pwysicaf imi yw diogelwch ar y ffyrdd a rheoli'r llifoedd traffig presennol a'r hyn a ragwelir. Felly, mae a wnelo mwy â rheoli hynny nag â'r terfyn cyflymder.

### Polisi Trafnidiaeth Transport Policy

**Q6 Nick Bourne:** Will the Minister identify the priorities of his transport policy? OAQ0305(EDT)

**Andrew Davies:** I set out my transport priorities when I announced the outcome of my transport review last December. The £8 billion, 15-year transport programme is designed to increase the speed of delivery—not the traffic—on transport, to supplement the development of the economy and to help to spread prosperity across the whole of Wales.

**C6 Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog nodi blaenoriaethau ei bolisi trafndiaeth? OAQ0305(EDT)

**Andrew Davies:** Gosodais allan fy mlaenoriaethau ar gyfer trafndiaeth pan gyhoeddais ganlyniad fy adolygiad o drafndiaeth fis Rhagfyr diwethaf. Nod y rhaglen drafndiaeth 15 mlynedd gwerth £8 biliwn yw sicrhau newidiadau mewn trafndiaeth ynghynt—yn hytrach na chyflymu'r traffig—er mwyn ategu'r broses o ddatblygu'r economi a helpu lledaenu ffyniant ledled Cymru.

**Nick Bourne:** Will the Minister update us on what priority he gives to the status of the Llanbadarn Fawr bypass, east of Aberystwyth?

**Andrew Davies:** I will write to you on that, Nick, and give you an update on that situation.

**Nick Bourne:** I am grateful for that. I have written to you about this issue this week, and I believe that you would have received the letter by now. However, I know that you are in Ceredigion tomorrow, and local councillors have offered to meet with you. The projected detrunking of the A44 and the fact that there are no current plans for a bypass will mean severe congestion east of Aberystwyth, particularly with new Assembly jobs being relocated there and with the Aberystwyth mart moving to Lovesgrove. I hope that you will consider this issue seriously, and perhaps take the opportunity when you are in the area tomorrow to visit Llanbadarn, which will be so badly hit by this congestion.

**Andrew Davies:** This issue has also been raised by Elin Jones, and one local councillor has written to me about it. It is not possible, because of diary engagements, for me to meet that councillor tomorrow, but I have given a commitment to do that, when possible, in the future. However, I understand that there are concerns about the Llanbadarn Fawr proposal in terms of the trunking, detrunking and the bypass, and I will respond in detail to you, as I have done to Elin Jones.

**Leighton Andrews:** Within your transport strategy was the new Porth-Rhondda Fach relief road, and I was pleased to welcome you to the Rhondda last week to see the start of the construction of that road. Do you agree that that road will be a great boon to my constituents, that it will ease congestion and make it easier for companies to get their goods to market? Do you also agree that the road is a very significant investment in Porth and the Rhondda Fach?

**Andrew Davies:** As Leighton Andrews said,

**Nick Bourne:** A all y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am y flaenoriaeth y mae'n ei rhoi i statws ffordd osgoi Llanbadarn Fawr, i'r dwyrain o Aberystwyth?

**Andrew Davies:** Ysgrifennaf atoch am hynny, Nick, a chewch y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y sefyllfa honno.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny. Ysgrifennais atoch ynglŷn â'r mater hwn yr wythnos hon, a chredaf y byddech wedi cael y llythyr erbyn hyn. Fodd bynnag, gwn eich bod yng Ngheredigion yfory, ac mae cynghorwyr lleol wedi cynnig cwrdd â chi. Bydd y cynnig i israddio'r A44, a'r ffaith nad oes unrhyw gynlluniau ar gyfer ffordd osgoi ar hyn o bryd, yn golygu tagfeydd mawr i'r dwyrain o Aberystwyth, yn enwedig gan y bydd y Cynulliad yn symud swyddi newydd yno a marchnad Aberystwyth yn symud i Gelli Angharad. Gobeithio y byddwch yn ystyried y mater hwn o ddifrif, a hwyrach yn manteisio ar y cyfle pan fyddwch yn yr ardal yfory i ymweld â Llanbadarn, lle bydd y tagfeydd hyn yn cael cymaint o effaith.

**Andrew Davies:** Codwyd y mater hwn gan Elin Jones, ac mae un cynghorydd lleol wedi ysgrifennu ataf yn ei gylch. Oherwydd ymrwymadau fy nyddiadur, nid oes modd imi gwrdd â'r cynghorydd hwnnw yfory, ond yr wyf wedi addo gwneud hynny, pan fydd yn bosibl, yn y dyfodol. Deallaf fod pryderon ynglŷn â chynnig Llanbadarn Fawr o ran uwchraddio, israddio a'r ffordd osgoi, a chewch ymateb manwl gennyf, fel y gwneuthum yn achos Elin Jones.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yn eich strategaeth drafnidiaeth, yr oedd ffordd osgoi newydd ar gyfer y Porth a Rhondda Fach, ac yr oedd yn bleser gennyf eich croesawu i Rhondda yr wythnos diwethaf i weld y gwaith o adeiladu'r ffordd honno yn dechrau. A gytunwch y bydd y ffordd honno'n fendith fawr i'm hetholwyr, y bydd yn lleddfu tagfeydd ac yn ei gwneud yn haws i gwmnïau gael eu nwyddau i'r farchnad? A gytunwch hefyd fod y ffordd yn fuddsoddiad sylweddol iawn yn y Porth a Rhondda Fach?

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedodd Leighton



this is a significant development, and I believe that it is the largest local authority-sponsored scheme. It is an £80 million scheme, and you have to see the environment and, in our case, the three-dimensional model of the construction, to realise how significant it is and understand the scale of the engineering challenges that it poses. Leighton is right to say that it will open up the valley for local residents for business, and will be a huge boon to the local communities that will be served by the new road.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I will take you north, Minister, and, unsurprisingly, to the Britannia and Menai bridges. You will be well aware of the enormous congestion to and from Anglesey as a result of the essential maintenance work on the Menai bridge. I have made strong representations to you and many of your predecessors about the need to incorporate three lanes on the Britannia bridge. I ask you now, as a matter of urgency, to consider whether you can bring that programme forward in view of the fact that I am now receiving complaints on a daily basis from angry constituents.

**Andrew Davies:** We have had meetings and many discussions on this issue. The traffic flow over the Britannia bridge is not a straightforward matter, as you know. I have asked officials to examine this matter, but I am being advised that it would not be a straightforward matter to have three lanes on the bridge. I have used that bridge on many occasions, but I accept your invitation to visit and look at it myself. If there were an easy solution, I am sure that it would have been found by now. However, as I said, I accept your invitation to visit and look at it with you.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Another issue that is causing major concern—I know that Alun Ffred Jones has also raised this issue—is maintenance work on the Menai bridge during the course of events like the National Eisteddfod of Wales, the Faenol Festival and the Anglesey County Show. There is massive concern about the congestion that will happen during those three events. Will you please talk to your officials to see if there is a way of at least suspending the work, not bringing

Andrews, mae hwn yn ddatblygiad sylweddol, a chredaf mai hwn yw'r cynllun mwyaf i'w noddi gan awdurdod lleol. Mae'n gynllun gwerth £80 miliwn, a rhaid ichi weld yr amgylchedd, a'r model tri dimensiwn o'r gwaith adeiladu yn ein hachos ni, i sylweddoli mor arwyddocaol ydyw, a deall maint yr her peirianyddol sy'n codi. Mae Leighton yn dweud yn gywir y bydd yn gwneud y cwm yn gyfleus i drigolion lleol ar gyfer busnes, a bydd yn fendith fawr i'r cymunedau lleol a gaiff eu gwasanaethu gan y ffordd newydd.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Af â chi i'r Gogledd, Weinidog, ac i bont Britannia, wrth gwrs, a phont Menai. Byddwch yn ymwybodol iawn o'r tagfeydd aruthrol i mewn ac allan o Ynys Môn o ganlyniad i'r gwaith cynnal a chadw hanfodol ar bont Menai. Yr wyf wedi cyflwyno dadl gref ichi ac i nifer o'ch rhagflaenwyr ynglŷn â'r angen i ymgorffori tair lôn ar bont Britannia. Gofynnaf ichi yn awr, fel mater o frys, ystyried un a allwch ddechrau'r rhaglen honno yn gynharach o gofio fy mod bellach yn cael cwynion bob dydd gan etholwyr dig.

**Andrew Davies:** Yr ydym wedi cael cyfarfodydd a nifer o drafodaethau am y mater hwn. Nid mater syml yw'r llif traffig dros bont Britannia, fel y gwyddoch. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion ystyried y mater hwn, ond fe'm cynghorir na fyddai'n fater syml cael tair lôn ar y bont. Yr wyf wedi defnyddio'r bont honno droeon, ond derbyniaf eich gwahoddiad i ddod i weld y bont fy hun. Pe bai ateb hawdd, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem wedi dod o hyd iddo erbyn hyn. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, derbyniaf eich gwahoddiad i ddod i weld y bont gyda chi.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mater arall sy'n achosi pryder mawr—gwn fod Alun Ffred Jones wedi codi'r mater hwn hefyd—yw'r gwaith cynnal a chadw ar bont Menai yn ystod digwyddiadau fel Eisteddfod Genedlaethol Cymru, Gŵyl y Faenol a Sioe Sir Fôn. Mae pryder enbyd am y tagfeydd a fydd yn digwydd yn ystod y tri digwyddiad hynny. A wnewch chi siarad â'ch swyddogion i weld a fyddai modd o leiaf atal y gwaith dros dro, nid rhoi'r gorau iddo, yn ystod y cyfnod

it to an end, during that period, because the police, the local authority and all the relevant agencies are telling me that they are desperately worried about what will happen if nothing is done?

**Andrew Davies:** Many Members have raised this with me. It has been raised by Denise Idris Jones and the local Member of Parliament, Betty Williams. I am aware of the issue, and I have asked officials to look at it. I am advised that suspension of the work, or certainly the dismantling of the scaffolding, would mean that the cost of the project would rise by £0.75 million, because it is weather-dependent. If the work were suspended, it is likely that the work would have to be restarted next year, hence the additional cost.

However, I am aware of the concerns, and I have asked officials to examine what we can do in terms of managing traffic flow, particularly during the eisteddfod, because Members have raised that with me. I know that, in previous years, for example, when the eisteddfod was in Llanelli, the park and ride and the management of traffic there was exemplary. I have asked officials to look at the issue again to see what can be done to manage the expected increase in traffic flows during the eisteddfod week, and, if necessary, during the Faenol Festival too.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** You have been on the A470, you have been across the bridge to Anglesey, and I will now take you on the railways. Could you describe what powers you have—either executive, legislative or through grant aid—over the provision of rolling stock for the railways in Wales? Given the pressures that exist, particularly in industrial south-east Wales, on our road structure, and the delays that occur, particularly in peak hours, do you agree that comfortable railway carriages, in which people can sit without having to stand up and be jangled around like milk bottles, would make a difference to the number of people using those services? Could you outline what powers you have in that direction?

hwnnw? Mae'r heddlu, yr awdurdod lleol a phob un o'r asiantaethau perthnasol oll yn dweud wrthyf eu bod yn pryderu'n enbyd am yr hyn a fydd yn digwydd os na wneir dim byd?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae nifer o Aelodau wedi codi hyn gyda mi. Fe'i codwyd gan Denise Idris Jones a Betty Williams, yr Aelod Seneddol lleol. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r mater, ac wedi gofyn i swyddogion ei ystyried. Dywedir wrthyf y byddai atal gwaith dros dro, neu'n sicr tynnu'r sgaffaldiau, yn golygu y byddai cost y prosiect yn codi £0.75 miliwn, am ei fod yn dibynnu ar y tywydd. Pe câi'r gwaith ei atal, mae'n debygol y byddai'r gwaith yn gorfod aildechrau y flwyddyn nesaf, a dyna, felly, pam y byddai cost ychwanegol.

Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon, ac yr wyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion ystyried beth y gallwn ei wneud o ran rheoli llif y traffig, yn enwedig yn ystod yr Eisteddfod, am fod Aelodau wedi codi hynny gyda mi. Yn y gorffennol, er enghraifft, pan gynhaliwyd yr eisteddfod yn Llanelli, gwn fod y cynllun parcio a theithio a'r system o reoli traffig yn wych. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion ystyried y mater eto i weld beth y gellir ei wneud i reoli'r cynnydd a ddisgwylir yn llif y traffig yn ystod wythnos yr Eisteddfod, ac yn ystod Gŵyl y Faenol hefyd os bydd angen.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Yr ydych wedi bod ar y ffordd A470, yr ydych wedi mynd dros y bont i Ynys Môn, ac af â chi yn awr am daith ar y rheilffyrdd. A allech ddisgrifio pa bwerau sydd gennych—pwerau gweithredol, pwerau deddfwriaethol neu drwy gymorth grant—o ran darparu cerbydau ar gyfer y rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru? O gofio'r pwysau sydd ar ein ffyrdd, yn enwedig yn y De-ddwyrain diwydiannol, a'r oedi, yn enwedig yn ystod oriau brig, a gytunwch y byddai cerbydau trên cyfforddus, lle gall pobl eistedd heb orfod sefyll a chael eu symud o gwmpas fel poteli llaeth, yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i nifer y bobl sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaethau hynny? A allech amlinellu pa bwerau sydd gennych yn y cyfeiriad hwnnw?

3.00 p.m.

**Andrew Davies:** I am grateful for your invitation to travel on the railways, Mike, but I do not need it as I travel from my constituency to the Assembly every day on the train, usually with First Great Western, but occasionally on Arriva Trains. We are working on the Wales and borders franchise, now that we have the powers and the Strategic Rail Authority will be abolished. As a Government, we will have the responsibility for the franchise and its funding. Even before we had those powers, we had already entered into an arrangement with Arriva Trains Wales to increase capacity on the Valleys lines, and I think that I circulated the arrangements to all Members. That arrangement includes the leasing of additional rolling stock to accommodate that increase in capacity, so that we are also able to increase the frequency of services, on the Cardiff Valley lines in particular. The opening of the Vale of Glamorgan line to passenger services last week is an indication of the imaginative way in which we are using our responsibility for the railways in Wales, increasing and improving services.

**Michael German:** You mentioned the Valleys lines and leasing new rolling stock, but, of course, had the powers been within the National Assembly's remit, it might have been possible to influence the contract issued by the UK Government, eventually to Arriva Trains, which would have given us an opportunity to purchase new rolling stock. I believe that an opportunity to bid for new rolling stock was in its contract bid. Do you think that it would have been better to have had those powers, and will the proposals that we now have in this White Paper give you such powers?

**Andrew Davies:** I do not think that it is a matter of powers. It is a matter of the use of public resources or, in this case, the combination of those resources with those of Arriva Trains Wales, and which would secure the best return on the investment. The

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich gwahoddiad i deithio ar y rheilffyrdd, Mike. Ond nid oes angen y gwahoddiad arnaf am fy mod yn teithio o'm hetholaeth i'r Cynulliad bob dydd ar y trê, fel arfer gyda First Great Western, ond o bryd i'w gilydd ar Drenau Arriva. Yr ydym yn gweithio ar fasnachfaint Cymru a'r gororau am fod gennym y pwerau yn awr a'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol i gael ei ddiddymu. Fel Llywodraeth, byddwn yn gyfrifol am y fasnachfaint a'r broses o'i hariannu. Hyd yn oed cyn inni gael y pwerau hynny, yr oeddem eisoes wedi llunio cytundeb gyda Threnau Arriva Cymru i ddarparu mwy ar linellau'r Cymoedd, a chredaf imi ddsbarthu'r trefniadau i bob Aelod. Mae'r trefniant hwnnw'n cynnwys cymryd cerbydau ychwanegol ar brydles er mwyn darparu ar gyfer y cynnydd hwnnw, fel y gallwn hefyd gynyddu amllder darparu gwasanaethau ar y llinellau o'r Cymoedd i Gaerdydd yn bennaf. Mae agor llinell Bro Morgannwg i wasanaethau teithwyr yr wythnos diwethaf yn arwydd o'r ffordd yr ydym yn defnyddio'n cyfrifoldeb dros y rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru, gyda llawer iawn o ddychymyg gan gynyddu a gwella gwasanaethau.

**Michael German:** Yr oeddech yn sôn am linellau'r Cymoedd a chymryd cerbydau newydd ar brydles. Ond wrth gwrs, pe buasai'r pwerau yn rhan o gylch gwaith y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, efallai y byddai wedi bod yn bosibl dylanwadu ar y contract a roddwyd gan Lywodraeth y DU, i Drenau Arriva yn y pen draw, a hynny wedi rhoi cyfle inni brynu cerbydau newydd. Credaf fod cyfle i wneud cynnig am gerbydau newydd wedi ei gynnwys yn ei gynnig am contract. A gredwch y byddai wedi bod yn well cael y pwerau hynny, ac a fydd y cynigion sydd ger ein bron yn awr yn y Papur Gwyn hwn yn rhoi pwerau felly ichi?

**Andrew Davies:** Ni chredaf mai mater o bwerau yw hyn. Mater yw o'r defnydd a wneir o adnoddau cyhoeddus, neu yn yr achos hwn y ffordd y caiff yr adnoddau hynny eu cyfuno ag adnoddau Trenau Arriva Cymru, ac a fyddai'n sicrhau'r elw gorau am

purchase or lease of new rolling stock would be a matter for Arriva Trains Wales as the franchisee. Ultimately, it is a question of getting the best value for money. I do not think that it has anything to do with powers as such. The enhanced powers that we will have under the Railways Act 2005 and the 15 years of the franchise will allow us a longer period in which we can work with Arriva Trains Wales to improve services and the quality of rolling stock.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 7, OAQ0310(EDT), has been transferred for written answer.

y buddsoddiad. Mater i Trenau Arriva Cymru fel deiliad y fasnachfaint fyddai prynu cerbydau newydd neu eu cymryd ar brydles. Yn y pen draw, mae'n gwestiwn o sicrhau'r gwerth gorau am yr arian. Ni chredaf fod a wnelo hyn ddim â phwerau fel y cyfryw. Bydd y pwerau ychwanegol a fydd gennym o dan Ddeddf Rheilffyrdd 2005 a 15 mlynedd y fasnachfaint yn rhoi cyfnod hwy inni weithio gyda Threnau Arriva Cymru i wella gwasanaethau ac ansawdd cerbydau.

**Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 7, OAQ0310(EDT), i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig

### **Ymlaen y Rhyl Rhyl Going Forward**

**Q8 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on Rhyl Going Forward? OAQ0291(EDT)

**Andrew Davies:** I am pleased to report that the Rhyl town centre project, part of the Drift Park scheme, has recently received approval for almost £3 million of Objective 1 funding. This money will help the local authority to deliver on the key investments highlighted in Rhyl Going Forward. I know that you and the local Member of Parliament were instrumental in driving that agenda forward.

**Ann Jones:** Thank you for that, Minister, and I thank you for listening carefully to the representations made by Chris Ruane MP and me, the WDA and the local authority. The investment is a huge step forward and we thank you for that. I am delighted that it is a Labour Assembly Government that has delivered this investment to fund these projects. The 10-year agenda set out in Rhyl Going Forward is aimed at arresting the town's decline and making the town feel good again. Will you, Andrew, assure me that you will continue your involvement in the delivery of the Rhyl Going Forward project, that you will monitor it carefully and ensure that we all work together to see that the aims and objectives of the project are realised?

**C8 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar Ymlaen y Rhyl? OAQ0291(EDT)

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf yn falch cael dweud fod bron £3 miliwn o arian Amcan 1 wedi'i gymeradwyo'n ddiweddar ar gyfer prosiect canol tref y Rhyl, sy'n rhan o gynllun Drift Park. Bydd yr arian hwn yn helpu'r awdurdod lleol i gyflawni'r buddsoddiadau allweddol y tynnwyd sylw atynt yn Ymlaen y Rhyl. Gwn fod gennych chi a'r Aelod Seneddol ran allweddol yn y gwaith o hyrwyddo'r agenda honno.

**Ann Jones:** Diolch ichi, Weinidog, a diolch am wrando'n ofalus ar y sylwadau a wnaed gan Chris Ruane AS a minnau, WDA a'r awdurdod lleol. Mae'r buddsoddiad yn gam mawr ymlaen, a diolchwn ichi am hynny. Yr wyf yn falch mai Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad sydd wedi sicrhau'r buddsoddiad hwn i ariannu'r prosiectau hyn. Nod yr agenda 10 mlynedd sydd wedi ei gosod allan yn Ymlaen y Rhyl yw atal dirywiad y dref a'i gwneud i deimlo'n dda eto. A allwch fy sicrhau, Andrew, y byddwch yn parhau i gymryd rhan yn y gwaith o gyflawni prosiect Ymlaen y Rhyl, y byddwch yn ei fonitro'n ofalus ac y byddwch yn sicrhau ein bod i gyd yn cydweithio i sicrhau cyflawni nodau ac amcanion y prosiect?

**Andrew Davies:** I certainly give my commitment to that. I know that I also speak for my Cabinet colleagues in giving our commitment to working collaboratively to ensure that our policies and the resources and investment that we make address the needs of communities such as Rhyl, but, obviously, in this case, predominantly Rhyl.

**Andrew Davies:** Yn sicr, rhoddaf fy ymrwymiad i hynny. Gwn fy mod hefyd yn siarad dros fy nghyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet wrth roi ein hymrwymiad i weithio ar y cyd i sicrhau bod ein polisiau a'r adnoddau a'r buddsoddiad a wnawn yn diwallu anghenion cymunedau megis y Rhyl, ond, yn amlwg, y Rhyl yn bennaf yn yr achos hwn.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Trefnydd ar ei Chyfrifoldebau Heblaw am Fusnes Questions to the Business Minister on her Responsibilities other than for Business**

### **Hawliau Plant Children's Rights**

**Q1 Mark Isherwood:** What action is the Minister taking to ensure that children's rights are considered in the development of Welsh Assembly Government policies? OAQ0069(BM)

**C1 Mark Isherwood:** Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod hawliau plant yn cael eu hystyried wrth ddatblygu polisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? OAQ0069(BM)

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** Children's rights have been put into practice in the implementation of the national service framework for children and young people and the Children Act 2004. Discussion at the Cabinet sub-committee on children and young people, which I chair, allows joint consideration of the implications of policy development for children's rights.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Mae hawliau plant wedi'u rhoi ar waith drwy weithredu'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc a Deddf Plant 2004. Mae trafodaeth yn is-bwyllgor y Cabinet ar blant a phobl ifanc- fi yw'r cadeirydd - yn golygu y gellir ystyried ar y cyd oblygiadau datblygiadau polisi i hawliau plant.

**Mark Isherwood:** Minister, if I forward the details to you, will you agree to consider the rights of the Finnegan children in Flintshire, whose education is suffering due to ill health caused by the condition of their home following the demolition by demolition order of the adjoining property some 10 years ago? The local county council executive has spent years and large sums of money on avoiding the need to take into account standards, regulations and guidelines laid down by UK and Assembly administration guidelines, and by Acts of Parliament.

**Mark Isherwood:** Weinidog, os anfonaf y manylion atoch, a wnewch chi gytuno i ystyried hawliau plant y teulu Finnegan yn Sir y Fflint. Mae eu haddysg yn dioddef oherwydd afiechyd a achosir gan gyflwr eu cartref, ar ôl dymchwel yr adeilad cyffiniol o dan orchymyn dymchwel tua 10 mlynedd yn ôl? Mae gweithrediaeth y cyngor sir lleol wedi treulio blynyddoedd ac wedi gwario llawer o arian yn osgoi'r angen i gymryd am ystyriaeth safonau, rheoliadau a chanllawiau sydd wedi eu gosod gan ganllawiau gweinyddiaeth y DU a'r Cynulliad, a chan Ddeddfau Seneddol.

**Jane Hutt:** I would be glad if you would forward that information to me. The local authority has a duty of protection towards vulnerable children, and I would be very pleased to take the matter up.

**Jane Hutt:** Byddwn yn falch pe baech yn anfon y wybodaeth honno ataf. Mae gan yr awdurdod lleol ddyletswydd i ddiogelu plant diamddiffyn, a byddwn yn falch iawn o ymdrin â'r mater.

**Val Lloyd:** I am sure that you will agree that

**Val Lloyd:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch ei

it is very important that the views of children and young people are sought. Funky Dragon, the Assembly's youth body, has carved an excellent reputation for engaging children and young people in Wales in the policy-making process. What are your plans for the continued growth and development of Funky Dragon, so that it can continue to play an important part in ensuring that our policies are responsive to the needs of the younger generation?

**Jane Hutt:** I was very pleased to be involved with Jane Davidson in setting up and supporting Funky Dragon, which is having its annual meeting here in a few weeks' time. It meets regularly with Ministers. It is at the forefront of participation with children and young people, and it is viewed as a model, not only in Wales and the UK, but in the rest of the world. We are certainly going to continue our support, ensuring that young people can have further involvement in the government of Wales.

**Janet Davies:** I wish to refer to the particular right of children under the age of five to free bus travel, provided that they are accompanied by a fee-paying adult. As you probably realise, if a child is accompanied by an older person, such as a grandparent, who pays concessionary bus fares or no fare, the child is not entitled to travel for free. How do you propose to address this anomaly?

**Jane Hutt:** Transport for children and young people is a key agenda issue for the Cabinet sub-committee on children and young people. We have been looking principally at school transport, but also at our manifesto commitment to reduce fares for young people. I will take the issue back to the sub-committee.

#### **Darparu Mynediad ar Gyfer Pobl Anabl mewn Gorsafoedd Pleidleisio The Availability of Disabled Access to Polling Stations**

**Q2 Michael German:** What guidance does the Welsh Assembly Government provide on the availability of disabled access to polling stations? OAQ0063(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** The Assembly has limited

bod yn bwysig iawn cael barn plant a phobl ifanc. Mae'r Ddraig Ffyncei, corff y Cynulliad i blant a phobl ifanc, wedi ennill enw ardderchog am ymgysylltu â phlant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru yn y broses o lunio polisiau. Beth yw eich cynlluniau i ddatblygu'r Ddraig Ffyncei yn barhaus, fel y gall barhau i chwarae rhan bwysig i sicrhau bod ein polisiau'n diwallu anghenion y genhedlaeth iau?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn o fod yn gysylltiedig, ar y cyd â Jane Davidson, â'r gwaith o sefydlu a chefnogi'r Ddraig Ffyncei, a fydd yn cynnal ei chyfarfod blynyddol yma ymhen ychydig wythnosau. Bydd yn cyfarfod â Gweinidogion yn rheolaidd. Mae ar reng flaen y gwaith o ymgysylltu â phlant a phobl ifanc, ac fe'i hystyrir yn batrwm, nid yng Nghymru a'r DU yn unig, ond yng ngweddill y byd hefyd. Mae'n sicr y bydd ein cefnogaeth yn parhau, gan sicrhau y gall pobl ifanc ymwneud ymhellach â llywodraethu Cymru.

**Janet Davies:** Hoffwn gyfeirio at hawl arbennig plant o dan bump oed i deithio ar fysiau am ddim, ar yr amod eu bod yn teithio gydag oedolion sy'n prynu tocyn. Fel y sylweddolwch, mae'n debyg, os bydd plentyn yn teithio gyda pherson hŷn, megis mam-gu neu dad-cu, sy'n prynu tocynnau mantais neu heb fod yn prynu tocyn o gwbl, nid oes gan y plentyn hawl i deithio am ddim. Sut y bwriadwch ymdrin â'r anghysondeb hwn?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae cludiant i blant a phobl ifanc yn fater allweddol ar agenda is-bwyllgor y Cabinet ar blant a phobl ifanc. Buom yn ystyried cludiant i'r ysgol yn bennaf, ond hefyd yr ymrwymiad yn ein maniffesto i ostwng prisiau tocynnau i bobl ifanc. Byddaf yn codi'r mater eto yn yr is-bwyllgor.

**C2 Michael German:** Pa arweiniad y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei roi ar ddarparu mynediad i bobl anabl mewn gorsafoedd pleidleisio? OAQ0063(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** Swyddogaethau cyfyngedig sydd

functions with regard to the conduct of elections. Responsibility for issuing appropriate guidelines lies with the Electoral Commission. In 2003, the Assembly provided part of the funding for the Polls Apart survey, and for the installation of accessible devices. I have also met with Scope Cymru to discuss its Polls Apart campaign.

**Michael German:** We recently had a presentation from Scope Cymru in the Local Government and Public Services Committee, in which it described some parts of Wales as black holes. In other words, there are places in Wales where provision is not adequate. However, it said that some local authorities had been much more active in making access to polling stations more simple and straightforward. Is the lack of guidance due to the Electoral Commission's not exercising its powers properly, or is it going in the wrong direction in terms of ensuring what we all want, which is to have as many polling stations as possible with level access so that all people with disabilities have the opportunity to vote in elections?

**Jane Hutt:** I will respond to that in two ways. First, we have an opportunity with the Disability Discrimination Act 2005, which extends disability equality legislation to cover the functions of public authorities. That will mean that all public authorities—local authorities in this case—will be subject to the positive duty that requires them to promote equality of opportunity for disabled people. The voting process falls within this remit.

Secondly, I am equally interested in the report that the Assembly Government commissioned from the Electoral Commission on how we can improve the accessibility of polling stations, which you no doubt discussed in your committee. The recommendations included the returning officers having statutory duties to use all accessible publicly owned buildings as polling stations, which is a key factor, and that they should also carry out reviews of polling station provision not less than every

gan y Cynulliad o ran cynnal etholiadau. Y Comisiwn Etholiadol sy'n gyfrifol am gyhoeddi canllawiau priodol. Yn 2003, darparodd y Cynulliad ran o'r arian ar gyfer yr arolwg Etholiadau'n Eithrio, ac ar gyfer gosod teclynnau hwylus. Yr wyf hefyd wedi cyfarfod â Scope Cymru i drafod ei ymgyrch Etholiadau'n Eithrio.

**Michael German:** Cawsom gyflwyniad gan Scope Cymru yn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yn ddiweddar. Yr oedd yn disgrifio rhai rhannau o Gymru fel manau du. Mewn geiriau eraill, mae lleoedd yng Nghymru lle nad yw'r ddarpariaeth yn ddigonol. Fodd bynnag, dywedodd fod rhai awdurdodau lleol wedi bod lawer yn fwy gweithredol i sicrhau mynediad symlach i orsafoedd pleidleisio. Ai'r rheswm dros y diffyg canllawiau yw nad yw'r Comisiwn Etholiadol yn arfer ei bwerau'n briodol? Neu a yw'n mynd i'r cyfeiriad anghywir o ran sicrhau'r hyn y mae pob un ohonom am ei weld, sef cynifer â phosibl o orsafoedd pleidleisio gyda mynediad gwastad er mwyn i bawb sydd ag anabledd gael y cyfle i bleidleisio mewn etholiadau?

**Jane Hutt:** Ymatebaf i hynny mewn dwy ffordd. Yn gyntaf, mae gennym gyfle gyda Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd 2005, sy'n ymestyn deddfwriaeth cydraddoldeb anabledd i gwmpasu swyddogaethau awdurdodau lleol. Bydd hynny'n golygu y bydd dyletswydd gadarnhaol ar bob awdurdod cyhoeddus—awdurdodau lleol yn yr achos hwn—sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol iddynt hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal i bobl anabl. Mae'r broses bleidleisio yn rhan o'r cylch gwaith hwn.

Yn ail, mae gennyf ddiddordeb yn yr un modd yn yr adroddiad y comisiynodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad y Comisiwn Etholiadol i'w lunio ar y ffordd y gallwn wneud gorsafoedd pleidleisio yn fwy cyfleus, a thrafodwyd hynny gennyh yn eich pwyllgor, yn ddi-au. Ymhlith yr argymhellion yr oedd gosod dyletswyddau statudol ar swyddogion canlyniadau i ddefnyddio pob adeilad hwylus sy'n eiddo i'r cyhoedd fel gorsafoedd pleidleisio. Mae hynny'n ffactor allweddol, a dylent hefyd

four years, with local disability groups also being consulted. We need to move forward on twin tracks in terms of powers and implementing the recommendations, which I know that the Minister with responsibility for local government and public services is taking forward.

**David Lloyd:** Do you support the individual registration of voters, and how will you prevent the exclusion of social groups?

3.10 p.m.

**Jane Hutt:** This is a key factor with regard to the ways in which we can look at how we can extend democracy and opportunities in terms of accessibility. I am encouraged by the Assembly Government's establishment of an all-Wales elections planning group, under the direction of Sue Essex. I will ask it to take that issue on board.

**David Melding:** Minister, in a vain attempt to defeat your friend John Smith and replace him with my colleague, Alun Cairns, I did a bit of telling in the Vale of Glamorgan. One polling station that I attended had a formidable set of double doors, which anyone under welterweight would have had difficulty negotiating. Is this not part of the problem? In this case, you could get up the ramp, but you could not open the door.

**Jane Hutt:** Absolutely. I undertook my Scope Cymru survey at my local polling station, which, I am sure, was not far from yours, David, knowing where we both live in Barry. I was able to see some improvements, but not all were within the clear guidelines. Referring to my answer to Mike German, we must now ensure that, under the Disability Discrimination Act 2005, the public duty includes access to polling stations, and that the Electoral Commission's recommendations are implemented.

wneud adolygiadau o ddarparu gorsafoedd pleidleisio o leiaf bob pedair blynedd, gan ymgynghori â grwpiau anabledd lleol hefyd. Mae angen inni symud ymlaen ar ddau fater o ran pwerau a gweithredu'r argymhellion, a gwn fod y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am lywodraeth leol a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn mynd ar drywydd hynny.

**David Lloyd:** A ydych yn cefnogi'r cynnig i gofrestru pleidleiswyr yn unigol, a sut y byddwch yn atal grwpiau cymdeithasol rhag cael eu heithrio?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hwn yn ffactor allweddol o ran y ffyrdd y gallwn ystyried sut i ymestyn democratiaeth a chyfleoedd i fod yn hwylus. Mae'r ffaith fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi sefydlu grŵp cynllunio etholiadau i Gymru gyfan, o dan gyfarwyddyd Sue Essex, yn galonogol. Byddaf yn gofyn iddo ystyried y mater hwnnw.

**David Melding:** Weinidog, mewn ymgais ofer i guro'ch cyfaill John Smith a rhoi fy nghyd-Aelod Alun Cairns yn ei le, gwneuthum ychydig waith rhifwr ym Mro Morgannwg. Yr oedd gan un orsaf bleidleisio yr euthum iddi ddrysau dwbl enfawr, a byddai unrhyw un o dan bwysau welter wedi cael anhawster i'w hagar. Onid yw hyn yn rhan o'r broblem? Yn yr achos hwn, gallech fynd i fyny ar hyd y rhamp, ond ni allech agor y drws.

**Jane Hutt:** Yn union. Gwneuthum fy arolwg i Scope Cymru yn fy ngorsaf bleidleisio leol, nad oedd yn bell o'ch gorsaf bleidleisio chi, David, mae'n siŵr, gan wybod ble yr ydym yn byw yn y Barri. Gallwn weld rhai gwelliannau, ond nid oedd pob un o fewn y canllawiau clir. I gyfeirio at fy ateb i Mike German, rhaid inni sicrhau yn awr, o dan Ddeddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd 2005, fod y ddyletswydd gyhoeddus yn cynnwys mynediad i orsafoedd pleidleisio, ac y caiff argymhellion y Comisiwn Etholiadol eu rhoi ar waith.

### **Cyfranogi gan Bobl Anabl Participation by Disabled People**

**Q3 Kirsty Williams:** What is the Assembly **C3 Kirsty Williams:** Beth y mae



Government doing to ensure that disabled people can take a full part in community and civic life? OAQ0065(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** The Assembly is working to promote social inclusion throughout Wales. I chair the accessible venues working group, and a secondee has recently joined the Assembly to take forward the recommendations contained in the British Sign Language report.

**Kirsty Williams:** Minister, would you join me in congratulating the Brecon access group, which has recently introduced the good access awards in Brecon and Radnorshire to highlight those businesses that have taken a positive approach to ensuring that their premises are accessible. Recent winners include Barclays Bank in Brecon, J's newsagent in Ystradgynlais, and the Hay Cinema Bookshop. Unfortunately, other businesses have not responded as positively, and the group is now in the process of compiling a guide to accessible businesses and services in Breconshire. What financial assistance can you give to groups such as the Brecon access group to help them in their work to ensure fair access for disabled people to all services?

**Jane Hutt:** I join you in congratulating the Brecon access group. Indeed, all local access groups play an important role, not only in campaigning, but also in undertaking work such as you described, in acknowledging good practice, highlighting poor practice and in producing guides of that nature. We are supporting organisations such as Disability Wales, which is developing the social model of disability, and I am discussing with its representatives a project that they want to bring forward that will take this issue further. Also, the accessible venues working group is taking these issues on board, and I will report back on available funding sources.

Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod pobl anabl yn gallu cymryd rhan lawn mewn bywyd cymunedol a dinesig? OAQ0065(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r Cynulliad yn gweithio i hyrwyddo cynhwysiant cymdeithasol ledled Cymru. Yr wyf yn gadeirydd y gweithgor lleoliadau hygrych, ac mae aelod ar fenthyg wedi ymuno â'r Cynulliad yn ddiweddar i weithredu'r argymhellion sydd wedi eu cynnwys yn adroddiad Iaith Arwyddion Prydain.

**Kirsty Williams:** Weinidog, a fydddech yn ymuno â mi i longyfarch grŵp mynediad Brycheiniog, sydd wedi cychwyn y gwobrau mynediad da ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed yn ddiweddar i dynnu sylw at y busnesau hynny sydd wedi mabwysiadu ymagwedd gadarnhaol i sicrhau bod eu safleoedd yn hwylus. Ymhlith y rhai sydd wedi ennill yn ddiweddar mae Banc Barclays yn Aberhonddu, siop papurau newydd J yn Ystradgynlais, a Siop Lyfrau'r Sinema yn y Gelli Gandryll. Yn anffodus, nid yw busnesau eraill wedi ymateb mor gadarnhaol, ac mae'r grŵp yn mynd ati yn awr i lunio canllaw i fusnesau a gwasanaethau hwylus ym Mrycheiniog. Pa gymorth ariannol y gallwch ei roi i grwpiau megis y grŵp mynediad ym Mrycheiniog i'w helpu yn eu gwaith i sicrhau mynediad teg i bobl anabl i bob gwasanaeth?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn ymuno â chi i longyfarch grŵp mynediad Brycheiniog. Yn wir, mae gan bob grŵp mynediad lleol ran bwysig, wrth ymgyrchu, a hefyd wrth wneud gwaith fel yr oeddech yn ei ddisgrifio i gydnabod arferion da, tynnu sylw at arferion gwael a chynhyrchu canllawiau felly. Yr ydym yn cefnogi sefydliadau megis Anabledd Cymru, sy'n datblygu patrwm cymdeithasol o anabledd, ac yr wyf yn trafod gyda'i gynrychiolwyr brosiect y maent am ei gyflwyno i ddatblygu'r mater hwn ymhellach. Yn ogystal, mae'r gweithgor lleoliadau hwylus yn ystyried y materion hyn, a byddaf yn cyflwyno adroddiad ar y ffynonellau ariannu sydd ar gael.

## Ansawdd Bywyd Plant The Quality of Life for Children

**Q4 Mark Isherwood:** Will the Minister make a statement on how she is co-ordinating the Welsh Assembly Government's policies to improve the quality of life for children in Wales? OAQ0064(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** I chair the Cabinet sub-committee on children and young people, which provides the context for all Ministers concerned to discuss issues across their portfolios. This allows for joint consideration and co-ordination of policies that affect children and young people.

**Mark Isherwood:** Citizens Advice reports an increase of nearly 50 per cent in new inquiries with regard to debt, with Wales reporting an even bigger increase than any other nation or region in Britain. What action are you taking to co-ordinate Welsh Assembly Government policies in this matter, given that the Basic Skills Agency states that there is a link between poor basic skills and financial exclusion, given that the skills agency strategy for Wales identified 780,000 children as well as young people and adults with literacy and numeracy problems, and given that 87,000 children are being brought up in households where no-one is in employment?

**Jane Hutt:** This matter is being addressed in the Deputy Minister for Social Justice's report on over-indebtedness, which the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee is considering and which was touched upon by the voluntary sector partnership council. It is key to a fair future for Wales, which is addressing issues from a poverty aspect in terms of children. Citizens advice bureaux have a crucial role to play in this, and I look forward to the deliberations of the committee on that important report.

**Janet Ryder:** Minister, as you know, children expressed their views on the Children First programme through the conferences organised by Voices From Care Cymru. Among the concerns that young people have voiced in those conferences is that the level set for their educational

**C4 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y ffordd y mae'n cydlynu polisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella ansawdd bywyd i blant yng Nghymru? OAQ0064(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn gadeirydd is-bwyllgor y Cabinet ar blant a phobl ifanc, sy'n darparu'r cyd-destun i'r holl Aelodau dan sylw i drafod materion ar draws eu portffolios. Mae hyn yn sicrhau y gellir ystyried ar y cyd a chydlynu polisiau sy'n effeithio ar blant a phobl ifanc.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae Cyngor ar Bopeth yn sôn am gynnydd o bron 50 y cant mewn ymholiadau newydd ynglŷn â dyled, ac mae Cymru yn sôn gynnydd hyd yn oed yn fwy nag unrhyw wlad neu ranbarth arall ym Mhrydain. Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i gydlynu polisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn y mater hwn, o gofio bod yr Asiantaeth Sgiliau Sylfaenol yn dweud bod cysylltiad rhwng sgiliau sylfaenol gwael ac eithrio ariannol, o gofio i strategaeth yr asiantaeth sgiliau i Gymru ddweud bod gan 780,000 o blant yn ogystal â phobl ifanc ac oedolion broblemau llythrennedd a rhifedd, ac o gofio y caiff 87,000 o blant eu magu mewn cartrefi lle nad oes neb mewn gwaith?

**Jane Hutt:** Ymdrinnir â'r mater hwn yn adroddiad y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ar orddyledusrwydd. Mae hwn yn cael ei ystyried gan y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, ac mae cyngor partneriaeth y sector gwirfoddol wedi cyfeirio ato. Mae'n allweddol i ddyfodol teg i Gymru, sy'n ymdrin â materion o safbwynt tloidi ymhlith plant. Mae gan ganolfannau cyngor ar bopeth ran allweddol yn hyn, ac edrychaf ymlaen at drafodaethau'r pwyllgor ar yr adroddiad pwysig hwnnw.

**Janet Ryder:** Weinidog, fel y gwyddoch, mynegodd plant eu barn am y rhaglen Plant yn Gyntaf drwy'r cynadleddau a drefnwyd gan Voices from Care Cymru. Ymhlith y pryderon a leisiwyd gan bobl ifanc yn y cynadleddau hynny mae'r ffaith fod y lefel a bennir ar gyfer eu cyrhaeddiad addysgol yn

attainment is too low; it is lower than that set for children who are not in care. Those young people are greatly concerned that they are being judged at a much lower level than children who are not in care.

Do you have any intention of raising the attainment level that we have set for children in care? If so, how will you help and support those young people who have been in care who wish to enter further and higher education?

**Jane Hutt:** Thank you for bringing this issue to the Assembly's attention, because those discussions, which were facilitated by Voices in Care, are key to understanding how we address the needs of looked-after children. The motion brought forward by Christine Chapman yesterday also demonstrated a way in which we are trying to reach out to our looked-after children, in terms of the child trust fund.

The level of educational attainment of looked-after children is crucial to them becoming included and a part of our society and communities. The role of local authorities and local authority members as corporate parents is also key. As corporate parents, they will be looking for looked-after children to have the same opportunities and expectations as all other children in Wales. Brian Gibbons and the children's cabinet committee will be looking at this in terms of raising the levels of attainment.

rhy isel; mae'n is na'r lefel a bennir ar gyfer plant nad ydynt mewn gofal. Mae'r plant ifanc hynny'n pryderu'n fawr eu bod yn cael eu barnu ar lefel lawer is na phlant nad ydynt mewn gofal.

A oes gennych unrhyw fwiad i godi'r lefel cyrhaeddiad a osodwyd gennym ar gyfer plant mewn gofal? Os felly, sut y byddwch yn helpu ac yn cefnogi'r bobl ifanc hynny sydd wedi bod mewn gofal ac sy'n dymuno mynd i mewn i addysg bellach ac addysg uwch?

**Jane Hutt:** Diolch ichi am ddod â'r mater hwn i sylw'r Cynulliad, gan fod y trafodaethau hynny, a hwyluswyd gan Voices in Care, yn allweddol i ddeall sut yr ydym yn mynd i'r afael ag anghenion plant sydd mewn gofal. Yr oedd y cynnig a gyflwynwyd gan Christine Chapman ddoe hefyd yn dangos sut yr ydym yn ceisio estyn llaw i'n plant sydd mewn gofal, o ran y gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant.

Mae lefel cyrhaeddiad addysgol plant sydd mewn gofal yn hanfodol er mwyn iddynt gael eu cynnwys yn ein cymdeithas a'n cymunedau a dod yn rhan ohonynt. Mae rôl awdurdodau lleol ac aelodau awdurdodau lleol fel rhieni corfforaethol hefyd yn allweddol. Fel rhieni corfforaethol, byddant yn ceisio sicrhau bod plant sydd mewn gofal yn cael yr un cyfleoedd a'r un disgwyliadau â phob plentyn arall yng Nghymru. Bydd Brian Gibbons a phwyllgor cabinet plant yn edrych ar hyn o ran codi lefelau cyrhaeddiad.

### **Polisïau ar Ddiogelwch Plant Policies on Child Safety**

**Q5 William Graham:** Will the Minister make a statement on how she is co-ordinating policies on child safety? 0AQ0075(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** The Assembly takes the issue of child safety very seriously, and has issued comprehensive guidance to all schools in Wales on bullying, including, for example, bullying by text message, and on the internet.

**William Graham:** I particularly wanted to ask you about bullying via mobile phone; the issue is very much featured in the press at the

**C5 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y ffordd y mae'n cydlynu polisïau ar ddiogelwch plant? 0AQ0075(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r Cynulliad yn cymryd diogelwch plant o ddifrif mawr, ac mae wedi rhoi canllawiau cynhwysfawr i bob ysgol yng Nghymru ar fwlio, gan gynnwys, er enghraifft, bwlio drwy negeseuon testun ac ar y rhyngwyd.

**William Graham:** Yr oeddwn am eich holi'n benodol am fwlio ar ffonau symudol; caiff y mater sylw amlwg yn y wasg ar hyn o bryd,

moment, and the stories clearly seem to encourage further incidents. Could you outline what discussions you have had with your colleagues in Westminster, particularly with regard to talks, perhaps, with network providers, to try to prevent these sorts of incidents?

**Jane Hutt:** I was pleased to meet the new Minister for Children, Beverley Hughes, on Monday in London, and to have the opportunity to open a dialogue with her about issues. I will be bringing this issue to her attention at our next meeting, and we can be grateful to NCH, the children's charity, which identified text bullying as a new problem in 2002. We must take forward the findings of its survey and link it to the guidance in schools. Schools' policies on bullying can also cover text messaging.

ac ymddengys fod y storïau'n annog digwyddiadau pellach. A allech amlinellu pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi eu cael gyda'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan, yn arbennig o ran trafodaethau, efallai, gyda darparwyr rhwydweithiau, i geisio atal y mathau hyn o ddiwyddiadau?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr oeddwn yn falch o gyfarfod y Gweinidog Plant newydd, Beverley Hughes, ddydd Llun yn Llundain, a chael cyfle i ddechrau trafodaeth gyda hi am broblemau. Byddaf yn dod â'r mater hwn i'w sylw yn ein cyfarfod nesaf, a gallwn fod yn ddiolchgar i NCH, yr elusen plant, a nododd fwlio drwy negeseuon testun fel problem newydd yn 2002. Rhaid inni symud ymlaen gyda darganfyddiadau ei harolwg a'i gysylltu â'r canllawiau mewn ysgolion. Gall polisïau ysgolion ar fwlio hefyd gwmpasu negeseuon testun.

### Tryloywder yn Holl Adrannau'r Llywodraeth Transparency Across Government Departments

**Q6 Nick Bourne:** Will the Minister outline her policies for increasing transparency across Government departments?  
OAQ0076(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** The latest edition of our Code of Practice on Public Access to Information establishes a stronger framework for increasing transparency across the Assembly. We have also recently implemented improved procedures for handling requests to ensure that the lessons learned from experience are embedded into our standard practices.

**Nick Bourne:** Will the Minister look at the issue of transparency in the health service? It perhaps would not have happened when the Minister was in her former job, but we are having difficulty, because of the withholding of detailed costings, finding out about the waiting lists strategy, because the papers will not be released. Will the Minister make a statement on that issue, because it does not seem to me to increase transparency within the Assembly Government?

**Jane Hutt:** This is a matter for the Minister for Health and Social Services, and I am sure

**C6 Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei pholisïau ar gyfer cael mwy o dryloywder yn holl adrannau'r llywodraeth?  
OAQ0076(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r argraffiad diweddaraf o'n Cod Ymarfer ar Ganiatáu i'r Cyhoedd Weld Gwybodaeth yn sefydlu fframwaith cadarnach ar gyfer cynyddu eglurder ar draws y Cynulliad. Yr ydym hefyd wedi rhoi gwell gweithdrefnau ar waith yn ddiweddar i ymdrin â cheisiadau er mwyn sicrhau y caiff gwersi a ddysgwyd o brofiad eu hymgorffori yn ein harferion sefydlog.

**Nick Bourne:** A fydd y Gweinidog yn edrych ar eglurder yn y gwasanaeth iechyd? Efallai na fyddai wedi digwydd pan oedd y Gweinidog yn ei swydd flaenorol, ond yr ydym yn cael anhawster, oherwydd bod gwybodaeth am gostau manwl yn cael ei hatal, i gael gwybodaeth am y strategaeth rhestrau aros, am na chaiff y papurau eu rhyddhau. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y mater hwnnw, gan nad yw'n ymddangos i mi fel pe bai'n cynyddu eglurder o fewn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad?

**Jane Hutt:** Mater i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yw hwn, ac yr

that he is dealing with it according to the due process.

**Jenny Randerson:** An initiative that is likely to be affected by any lack of transparency between Government departments is the older people's commissioner, the Bill for which is currently before Parliament. What representations have you or your Welsh Assembly Government colleagues made to the UK Government on the deficiencies in the Bill? In particular, have you asked them to include an obligation in the Bill for the Department for Work and Pensions to respond to reports and investigations by the commissioner, when the post is set up?

**Jane Hutt:** The Commissioner for Older People (Wales) Bill is a major step forward. Wales will have the first such commissioner in the UK, if not in Europe and the world, and I look forward to the debate on the Bill this afternoon.

In terms of the way in which this will develop, there will be the usual channels to enable us and the commissioner for older people to take things up directly with our departmental colleagues and Ministers in Whitehall. That will ensure that we can address the issues that you raised in relation to the Department of Work and Pensions.

**The Presiding Officer:** Questions 7 OAQ0073(BM) and 8 OAQ0072(BM) are withdrawn.

wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn ymdrin ag ef yn unol â'r drefn gywir.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae unrhyw ddiffyg tryloywder rhwng adrannau'r Llywodraeth yn debygol o effeithio ar fenter y comisiynydd pobl hŷn, sydd â'r Mesur ar ei gyfer gerbron y Senedd ar hyn o bryd. Pa sylwadau yr ydych chi neu eich cyd-Weinidogion yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi eu cyflwyno i Lywodraeth y DU am y diffygion yn y Mesur? Yn benodol, a ydych wedi gofyn iddynt gynnwys rhwymedigaeth yn y Mesur i'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau ymateb i adroddiadau ac ymchwiliadau gan y comisiynydd, pan sefydlir y swydd?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae Mesur y Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn (Cymru) yn gam pwysig ymlaen. Cymru fydd â'r comisiynydd cyntaf o'i fath yn y DU, os nad yn Ewrop a'r byd, ac edrychaf ymlaen at y ddadl ar y Mesur y prynhawn yma.

O ran y ffordd y bydd hyn yn datblygu, bydd y sianelau arferol ar gael i'n galluogi ni a'r comisiynydd pobl hŷn i drafod pethau'n uniongyrchol gyda'n cyd-aelodau adrannol a Gweinidogion yn Whitehall. Bydd hynny'n sicrhau y gallwn fynd i'r afael â'r materion a godwyd gennych mewn cysylltiad â'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiynau 7 OAQ0073(BM) ac 8 OAQ0072(BM) yn ôl.

### Gweithio gyda Gweinidogion Eraill Work with Other Ministers

**Q9 Peter Black:** Will the Minister make a statement on how she works with other Assembly Ministers for the benefit of children? OAQ0071(BM)

3.20 p.m.

**Jane Hutt:** I refer you to my answer to question 4.

**Peter Black:** One of the big issues in terms of working with children and dealing with children's issues is the provision of advocacy services. Could you outline what support the

**C9 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y ffordd y mae'n gweithio gyda Gweinidogion eraill y Cynulliad er lles plant? OAQ0071(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at fy ateb i gwestiwn 4.

**Peter Black:** Un o'r materion pwysig o ran gweithio gyda phlant ac ymdrin â materion yn ymwneud â phlant yw darparu gwasanaethau eiriolaeth. A allech amlinellu

Assembly Government provides for organisations around Wales that wish to provide advocacy services and what investment you are putting into providing a dedicated unit that could provide advice and assistance to those bodies?

**Jane Hutt:** This is key, and we have been working on this to ensure, particularly following the withdrawal of the Children's Society from Wales, that we not only have organisations capable and independent enough to provide that advocacy, but also that we have minimum standards for advocacy. You will be aware that we are taking this forward in terms of a task group to look at the future provision of advocacy services for children and young people in Wales. We also look forward to the results of the safeguarding vulnerable children review, chaired by Gwenda Thomas, which will be reporting later this year.

**Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 10, OAQ0068(BM), i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

pa gymorth y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei ddarparu i sefydliadau ledled Cymru sydd am ddarparu gwasanaethau eiriolaeth? A pha fuddsoddiad yr ydych yn ei wneud i ddarparu uned benodol a allai ddarparu cyngor a chymorth i'r cyrff hynny?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hyn yn allweddol, ac yr ydym wedi bod yn gweithio arno i sicrhau, yn arbennig ar ôl i Gymdeithas y Plant gau eu swyddfa yng Nghymru, fod gennym nid yn unig sefydliadau sydd â'r gallu i ddarparu'r eiriolaeth honno ac sy'n ddigon annibynnol i wneud hynny, ond bod gennym hefyd y safonau gofynnol ar gyfer eiriolaeth. Byddwch yn gwybod ein bod yn datblygu hyn ar ffurf tasglu i edrych ar ddyfodol darparu gwasanaethau eiriolaeth i blant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Edrychwn ymlaen hefyd at ganlyniadau'r adolygiad o ddiogelu plant diamddiffyn, dan gadeiryddiaeth Gwenda Thomas, a fydd yn cyflwyno'i adroddiad yn ddiweddarach eleni.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 10, OAQ0068(BM), has been transferred for written answer.

### **Anableddau Disabilities**

**Q11 Christine Chapman:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to help those with disabilities in Wales? OAQ0077(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** In 2002, the Welsh Assembly Government adopted the social model of disability as the foundation for all its work on disability. I have met Disability Wales to discuss its proposed equality in action project in order to take this forward.

**Christine Chapman:** I welcome the comments and the work that is being done. You may remember that have I raised the issue of the low proportion of people with disabilities who are in employment. I specifically mentioned this in relation to people with visual impairment. I was encouraged to hear, I think during the last session of questions to you, that you had met representatives of the Royal National Institute for the Blind that very morning and

**C11 Christine Chapman:** Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i helpu pobl yng Nghymru sydd ag anableddau? OAQ0077(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** Yn 2002, mabwysiadodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru y patrwm cymdeithasol o anabledd fel sylfaen ar gyfer ei holl waith ar anabledd. Yr wyf wedi cwrdd ag Anabledd Cymru i drafod eu prosiect arfaethedig ar weithredu cydraddoldeb er mwyn datblygu hyn.

**Christine Chapman:** Yr wyf yn croesawu'r sylwadau a'r gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud. Efallai y cofiwch imi godi mater y gyfran isel o bobl ag anableddau sydd mewn gwaith. Cyfeiriais yn benodol at hyn mewn cysylltiad â phobl sydd â nam ar eu golwg. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed, yn ystod y sesiwn gwestiynau ddiwethaf i chi, mi gredaf, eich bod wedi cwrdd â chynrychiolwyr Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol y Deillion y bore hwnnw ac wedi trafod ffyrdd i annog

discussed ways of encouraging employers to take on people with visual impairment for work placements or, indeed, employment. Can you give me any more details about how the Welsh Assembly Government will be taking the lead in encouraging employers to be more responsive to all people with disabilities?

**Jane Hutt:** The recent launch in Merthyr of 'Want to Work', a combined Department for Work and Pensions and Welsh Assembly Government initiative, by the First Minister and the Minister for Health and Social Services, demonstrates how we want to break that logjam in terms of bringing those who are economically inactive due to disability, impairment or ill health, back into work, in partnership with the NHS. The Welsh Assembly Government has been pioneering eight-week placements for disabled undergraduates and graduates in the Assembly and civil service, equipping disabled people with work-based skills to give them the confidence to pursue the careers that they would like.

**David Melding:** You may know that current Government policy aims to increase the number of social firms in Wales. We are at the early stages, but that is a clear intention. At least 25 per cent of social firms' workforces are made up of disabled people, and for many firms in Wales the figure is 50 per cent. It is important that you urge your colleagues to aim for as high a percentage of disabled people employed in social firms as possible, and for it to be as near to 50 per cent as possible.

**Jane Hutt:** I endorse that. I will be taking this up with Disability Wales with regard to its social model of disability action plan.

cyflogwyr i gyflogi pobl sydd â nam ar eu golwg ar leoliadau gwaith neu, yn wir, mewn swyddi. A allwch roi rhagor o fanylion imi am y ffordd y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn arwain wrth annog cyflogwyr i ymateb yn well i bawb sydd ag anableddau?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr oedd lansio 'Want to Work' ym Merthyr yn ddiweddar, sef menter ar y cyd rhwng yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, gan y Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, yn dangos ein hawydd i gael gwared ar y dagfa wrth helpu pobl sy'n economaidd anweithgar oherwydd anabledd, nam neu salwch, i fynd yn ôl i'r gwaith, mewn partneriaeth â'r GIG. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi bod yn arloesi gyda lleoliadau wyth wythnos i fyfyrwyr a graddedigion anabl yn y Cynulliad a'r gwasanaeth sifil, gan roi i bobl anabl sgiliau'n seiliedig ar waith er mwyn iddynt gael yr hyder i ddilyn y gyrfaeodd y byddent yn hoffi eu cael.

**David Melding:** Efallai y gwyddoch fod polisi cyfredol y Llywodraeth yn anelu at gynyddu nifer y cwmnïau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Mae'n gynnar iawn, ond mae hynny'n fwriad clir. Pobl anabl yw o leiaf 25% o weithluoedd cwmnïau cymdeithasol, ac i nifer o gwmnïau yng Nghymru mae'r ffigur yn 50 y cant. Mae'n bwysig ichi annog eich cyd-aelodau i anelu at sicrhau bod canran mor uchel â phosibl o bobl anabl yn cael eu cyflogi mewn cwmnïau cymdeithasol, ac i hynny fod mor agos â phosibl i 50 y cant.

**Jane Hutt:** Cefnogaf hynny. Byddaf yn trafod hyn gydag Anabledd Cymru o ran eu patrwm cymdeithasol o gynllun gweithredu ar anableddau.

### **Mynediad Pobl Anabl i Wasanaethau Disabled People's Access to Services**

**Q12 William Graham:** Will the Minister outline this administration's policies to increase disabled access to services in Wales? OAQ0074(BM)

**C12 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu polisiâu'r weinyddiaeth hon i gynyddu mynediad pobl anabl i wasanaethau yng Nghymru? OAQ0074(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** I refer you to the answer that I

**Jane Hutt:** Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at yr ateb a

gave to Kirsty Williams earlier.

**William Graham:** Thank you for your answer, but, to be slightly more specific, are you aware of the 'Mind the Gap' report, which particularly highlighted problems with disabled people's access to rail services in Wales? Do you have any idea of how you might enhance access in that regard?

**Jane Hutt:** I was pleased to be involved, on Friday, in the historic reopening of the Vale of Glamorgan railway line, where we have the benefit of new railway stations at Llantwit Major and Rhose. I will be parochial for a moment and discuss them. They have been assessed for disabled access and are disabled access friendly, and I was very impressed with what has been provided. I know that the Committee on Equality of Opportunity is bringing the rail operators before it to discuss these issues. They will have to take account of the Disability Discrimination Act 1995, and this is key for accessibility, mobility and access to work as well as leisure for disabled people.

roddais i Kirsty Williams yn gynharach.

**William Graham:** Diolch ichi am eich ateb, ond i fod ychydig yn fwy penodol a ydych yn ymwybodol o adroddiad 'Mind the Gap', a oedd yn tynnu sylw'n bennaf at broblemau pobl anabl i allu defnyddio gwasanaethau rheilffordd yng Nghymru? A oes gennych unrhyw syniad sut y gallech wella mynediad yn y cyswllt hwnnw?

**Jane Hutt:** Ddydd Gwener, yr oeddwn yn falch o fod yn rhan o ail-agoriad hanesyddol rheilffordd Bro Morgannwg, lle y gallwn fanteisio ar orsafoedd rheilffordd newydd yn Llanilltud Fawr a'r Rhws. Byddaf yn blwyfol am eiliad a'u trafod hwy. Maent wedi eu hasesu ar gyfer mynediad i'r anabl, ac maent yn hwylus i'r anabl, a gwnaeth yr hyn sydd wedi ei ddarparu argraff arnaf. Gwn fod y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal wedi gwahodd y gweithredwyr rheilffordd i drafod y materion hyn. Bydd yn rhaid iddynt ystyried Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd 1995, ac mae hyn yn allweddol i bobl anabl o ran bod yn hwylus, o ran symudedd a gallu cael gwaith yn ogystal â hamdden.

### Cydraddoldeb Rhwng y Ddau Ryw Gender Equality

**Q13 Michael German:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Assembly Government's policies to promote gender equality? OAQ0066(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** The mainstreaming task and finish group will ensure that equalities issues, including gender inequality issues, are integrated into the practices of the Assembly's everyday work. We are also actively working in partnership with organisations across Wales that are working to improve gender equality.

**Michael German:** I am sure that you are aware that the European Institute for Gender Equality is looking for a capital city or somewhere else in which to locate. Have you considered anywhere in Wales for that, and, if so, where?

**Jane Hutt:** Ann Jones, as Chair of the Local

**C13 Michael German:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar bolisiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb rhwng y ddau ryw? OAQ0066(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** Bydd y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen prif-ffrydio yn sicrhau y caiff materion cydraddoldeb, gan gynnwys materion anghydraddoldeb rhwng y ddau ryw eu hintegreiddio yn arferion gwaith bob dydd y Cynulliad. Yr ydym hefyd yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth â sefydliadau ledled Cymru, sy'n gweithio i wella cydraddoldeb rhwng y ddau ryw.

**Michael German:** Mae'n siŵr eich bod yn gwybod bod y Sefydliad Ewropeaidd dros Gydraddoldeb Rhwng y Ddau Ryw yn chwilio am brifddinas neu rywle arall i symud iddo. A ydych wedi ystyried rhywle yng Nghymru ar gyfer hynny, ac os felly, ble?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae Ann Jones, Cadeirydd y



Government and Public Services Committee, has just raised this with me. I would be keen to promote Wales as a location for the new Institute for Gender Equality, particularly as we have been at the forefront of mainstreaming equality in terms of structural funds. That will serve us well in terms of our bid to the European Commission.

**Glyn Davies:** One of the greatest examples of gender inequality has related to women gaining access to sports such as football and cricket. Over the last few weeks, we have seen international women's teams, including one from England, playing in a European competition that has been of a fantastically high standard. Will you join me in congratulating all those teams on providing a huge amount of entertainment and on the sheer skill and dedication that they have shown? I hope that it will be an inspiration to many other women to join in these sports.

**Jane Hutt:** I am glad that you brought that to our attention. I congratulate the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport on his work on ensuring that young women in Wales, through schools, are able to take part in sport, train and improve, and have access to the kind of sports that will put them on the world map, as you have described, Glyn.

Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus, newydd godi hyn gyda mi. Byddwn yn awyddus i hybu Cymru fel lleoliad ar gyfer y Sefydliad newydd dros Gydraddoldeb Rhyw, yn arbennig gan ein bod wedi bod yn flaengar yn prif-ffrydio cydraddoldeb mewn cysylltiad â chronfeydd strwythurol. Bydd hynny o'n plaid yn ein cais i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd.

**Glyn Davies:** Un o'r enghreifftiau gorau o anghydraddoldeb rhwng y ddau ryw oedd caniatáu menywod mewn chwaraeon megis pêl-droed a chriced. Dros yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf, yr ydym wedi gweld timau merched rhyngwladol, gan gynnwys un o Loegr, yn chwarae mewn cystadleuaeth Ewropeaidd o safon arbennig o uchel. A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch yr holl dimau hynny am roi llawer o adloniant ac am y sgiliau a'r ymroddiad llwyr a ddangoswyd ganddynt? Gobeithio y bydd yn ysbrydoliaeth i nifer o ferched eraill i ymuno yn y chwaraeon hyn.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn falch ichi ddod â hynny i'n sylw. Hoffwn longyfarch y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon am ei waith yn sicrhau bod merched ifanc yng Nghymru, drwy ysgolion, yn gallu cymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon, hyfforddi a gwella, a chymryd rhan yn y math o chwaraeon a fydd yn eu gwneud yn fyd-enwog, fel y disgrifiwyd gennych, Glyn.

### **Llywodraeth Agored ac Atebol Open and Accountable Government**

**Q14 Eleanor Burnham:** What is the Assembly Government doing to ensure that government is open and accountable in Wales? OAQ0067(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** Our code of practice already gives us the framework for maximising openness in the most appropriate ways possible. We are closely monitoring the implementation of the code and continue to strengthen and embed good practice in order to meet the expectations of the Information Commissioner and others.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I praise you and the Government for doing your best to ensure

**C14 Eleanor Burnham:** Beth y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod llywodraeth yn agored ac yn atebol yng Nghymru? OAQ0067(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** Mae ein cod ymarfer eisoes yn rhoi fframwaith inni ar gyfer bod mor agored â phosibl yn y ffyrdd mwyaf priodol posibl. Yr ydym yn monitro gweithredu'r cod yn ofalus iawn ac yn parhau i atgyfnerthu ac ymgorffori arferion da er mwyn bodloni disgwyliadau'r Comisiynydd Gwybodaeth ac eraill.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf yn eich canmol chi a'r Llywodraeth am wneud eich gorau i

open and accountable government in Wales. However, do you not agree that we should have our own information commissioner, who can give full attention to Wales, as is the case in Scotland, rather than the current arrangement of being under the jurisdiction of the Westminster commissioner?

**Jane Hutt:** We are well served by the Information Commissioner for England and Wales, and I have met Richard Thomas. Although the powers that the Scottish Information Commissioner holds extend beyond those available to Richard Thomas, the Assembly's code of practice goes beyond the requirements of the Freedom of Information Act 2000. That puts us at the forefront in terms of enabling us to deliver openness in line with other legal obligations.

sicrhau llywodraeth agored ac atebol yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, oni chytunwch y dylem gael ein comisiynydd gwybodaeth ein hunain, a all roi ei holl sylw i Gymru, fel sy'n digwydd yn yr Alban, yn hytrach na'r trefniadau presennol o fod o dan awdurdodaeth comisiynydd San Steffan?

**Jane Hutt:** Cawn ein gwasanaethu'n dda gan Gomisiynydd Gwybodaeth Cymru a Lloegr, ac yr wyf wedi cwrdd â Richard Thomas. Er bod y pwerau sydd gan Gomisiynydd Gwybodaeth yr Alban yn ymestyn y tu hwnt i'r rheini sydd gan Richard Thomas, mae cod ymarfer y Cynulliad yn mynd y tu hwnt i ofynion Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000. Mae hynny'n ein rhoi ar y blaen o ran ein galluogi i fod yn agored yn unol â rhwymedigaethau cyfreithiol eraill.

### **Ymgyrch i Gau'r Bwlch Cyflog The Close Pay Gap Campaign**

**Q15 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on the 'Close the Pay Gap' campaign? OAQ0078(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** We are now entering the third phase of the campaign, which will continue the partnership between the Equal Opportunities Commission, the Wales Trades Union Congress and the Assembly. This phase will concentrate on the public sector, building on the achievements of the first two phases of the campaign.

**Lisa Francis:** Women make up almost half of Wales's workforce. What measures are you putting in place to encourage the private sector to ensure that women receive the same pay as men, and that they are not penalised for taking time off from the workplace to raise a family?

**Jane Hutt:** A key objective of the second phase was to encourage private sector employers to undertake equal pay audits. That was led by the Wales TUC over a 12-month period. Unfortunately, it has been difficult to persuade private sector companies to undertake these important audits, and we now need to learn lessons from that. Although I am focusing on the public sector, we must ensure, working with our colleagues

**C15 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar yr ymgyrch 'Cau'r Bwlch Cyflog'? OAQ0078(BM)

**Jane Hutt:** Yr ydym bellach ar fin dechrau trydydd cam yr ymgyrch, a fydd yn parhau'r bartneriaeth rhwng y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal, Cyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru a'r Cynulliad. Bydd y cam hwn yn canolbwyntio ar y sector cyhoeddus, gan adeiladu ar yr hyn a gyflawnwyd yn nau gam cyntaf yr ymgyrch.

**Lisa Francis:** Mae menywod yn cyfrif am yn agos i hanner y gweithlu yng Nghymru. Pa fesurau yr ydych yn eu rhoi ar waith i annog y sector cyhoeddus i sicrhau bod menywod yn cael yr un cyflog â dynion, ac na chânt eu cosbi am gymryd amser i ffwrdd o'r gweithle i fagu teulu?

**Jane Hutt:** Un o amcanion allweddol yr ail gam oedd annog cyflogwyr yn y sector preifat i wneud archwiliadau cyflog cyfartal. Arweiniwyd hynny gan TUC Cymru dros gyfnod o 12 mis. Yn anffodus, yr oedd yn anodd darbwylllo cwmnïau yn y sector preifat i wneud yr archwiliadau pwysig hyn, a rhaid inni bellach ddysgu gwersi o hynny. Er mod yn canolbwyntio ar y sector cyhoeddus, rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod, drwy weithio

in the Confederation of British Industry and the Wales TUC, that we address this in the private sector, as this is a clear issue in terms of the 'Close the Pay Gap' campaign.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Minister. You have answered all the questions.

3.30 p.m.

### **Datganiad ar y Papur Gwyn, 'Trefn Lywodraethu Well i Gymru' Statement on the White Paper, 'Better Governance for Wales'**

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn gynharach heddiw, gwnaeth Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ddatganiad gerbron Tŷ'r Cyffredin ynglŷn â chyhoeddi'r Papur Gwyn hwn. Deallaf fod Swyddfa Cymru yn trefnu i bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad dderbyn copi. Fe gyflwynir Mesur tua diwedd y flwyddyn hon neu'n gynnar y flwyddyn nesaf er mwyn rhoi cynigion y Papur Gwyn ar waith.

Mae'r Papur Gwyn yn cadarnhau cynigion ar gyfer ymwahaniad cyfreithiol cangen lywodraethol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol oddi wrth y gangen ddeddfwriaethol. Tair blynedd yn ôl, cymrodd y Cynulliad gamau, o fewn ffiniau Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, i wahaniaethu rhwng rôl llywodraethol Gweinidogion y Cynulliad a rôl ddeddfwriaethol a chraffu Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, tra bydd y Cynulliad, yn gyfreithiol, yn parhau i fod yn un corff corfforaethol, ni fydd y gwahaniaeth allweddol hwnnw'n glir. Bydd cynigion y Papur Gwyn yn cyflawni'r gwahaniaeth hwnnw. Mae pawb yng Nghymru eisoes yn gyfarwydd â'r egwyddor honno gan ei fod yn amlwg yn y ffordd yr ydym yn cael ein llywodraethu ar lefel y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae pobl yr Alban hefyd yn ei weld ar waith yn ei Senedd hwy, ond nid yw ar waith yng Nghymru hyd yma.

The consequence of those changes would be that Assembly Ministers, like their UK and Scottish counterparts, would hold office on behalf of the Crown. The First Minister, whoever he or she will be, would be nominated by the Assembly, but would hold office on the same basis as the Prime Minister or the Scottish First Minister, by

gyda'n cydweithwyr yng Nghyddfederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain a TUC Cymru, yn mynd i'r afael â hyn yn y sector preifat, gan fod hwn yn fater amlwg yn yr ymgyrch 'Cau'r Bwlch Cyflog'.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch, Weinidog. Yr ydych wedi ateb pob cwestiwn.

**The First Minister:** Earlier today, the Secretary of State for Wales made a statement in the Commons on the publication of this White Paper. I understand the Wales Office is making arrangements for all Assembly Members to receive a copy. A Bill will be introduced towards the end of this year or early next year to give effect to the proposals in the White Paper.

The White Paper confirms proposals to bring about the legal separation of the governmental and legislative arms of the National Assembly. The Assembly took steps three years ago, within the confines of the Government of Wales Act 1998, to distinguish between the governmental roles of Assembly Ministers and the legislative and scrutiny roles of Assembly Members. However, as long as the Assembly remains, in law, one corporate body, that crucial distinction will be blurred. The proposals in the White Paper will achieve that separation. Everyone in Wales is already aware of that distinction because it is evident in the way we are governed on a UK basis. The people of Scotland also see it in action in their Parliament, but it is not yet in effect in Wales.

O ganlyniad i'r newidiadau hynny, byddai Gweinidogion y Cynulliad, fel eu Gweinidogion cyfatebol yn y DU a'r Alban, yn dal swydd ar ran y Goron. Byddai'r Prif Weinidog, pwy bynnag fydd ef neu hi, yn cael ei enwebu gan y Cynulliad, ond byddai'n dal swydd ar yr un sail â Phrif Weinidog y DU neu Brif Weinidog yr Alban, drwy

Crown appointment. With Her Majesty's approval, the First Minister would appoint Ministers and Deputy Ministers who would also hold office under the Crown. The staff working for them would remain part of the civil service.

Separation will mean that the executive functions, which at present are legally the responsibility of the Assembly as a whole, and exercised by Ministers on behalf of the Assembly only through delegations, will in future be the responsibility of Assembly Ministers. Ministers will be accountable to the Assembly for the exercise of those functions and scrutinised by the Assembly in that regard.

The National Assembly for Wales itself, namely 60 AMs, will become closer in structure and functions to the UK and Scottish Parliaments. In terms of structure, the Assembly will have far greater freedom to determine its own working procedures. Most of the detailed requirements for committees specified in the Government of Wales Act 1998 will be repealed, and it will be for the Assembly to decide which committees it wants to establish and what their remits should be. The Assembly will employ its own staff, in the same way as other parliamentary bodies.

On the Assembly's functions, the second part of the White Paper concerns the strengthening of the National Assembly's legislative powers. It sets out clearly three elements. The first of these has immediate effect from today and does not require a Bill to bring it into effect. That is a commitment to make the Welsh element of any England and Wales Bill on devolved matters as flexible as possible in terms of the powers conferred on the Assembly. From now on, such Bills will be drafted as framework Bills, giving the Assembly as much latitude as possible to determine the exact shape of implementing legislation in Wales.

The second element needs the provisions of the Bill to bring into effect the mechanism for Parliament to confer on the Assembly the authority to legislate in specified areas of policy. When the Assembly Government

benodiad y Goron. Gyda chymeradwyaeth Ei Mawrhydi, byddai'r Prif Weinidog yn penodi Gweinidogion a Dirprwy Weinidogion a fyddai hefyd yn dal swydd o dan y Goron. Byddai'r staff sy'n gweithio iddynt yn parhau'n rhan o'r gwasanaeth sifil.

Bydd gwahanu yn golygu y bydd y swyddogaethau gweithredol, sy'n gyfreithiol yn rhan o gyfrifoldeb i'r Cynulliad cyfan ar hyn o bryd, ac sy'n cael eu hymarfer gan Weinidogion ar ran y Cynulliad drwy ddirprwyaethau'n unig, yn cael eu trosglwyddo i gyfrifoldeb Gweinidogion y Cynulliad yn y dyfodol. Bydd Gweinidogion yn atebol i'r Cynulliad am ymarfer y swyddogaethau hynny, a chreffir arnynt gan y Cynulliad yn y cyswllt hwnnw.

Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ei hun, sef 60 o ACau, yn nes o ran strwythur a swyddogaethau i Seneddau'r DU a'r Alban. O ran strwythur, bydd gan y Cynulliad lawer mwy o ryddid i benderfynu ei weithdrefnau gwaith ei hun. Caiff y rhan fwyaf o'r gofynion manwl ar gyfer pwyllgorau a nodwyd yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 eu diddymu, a chyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad fydd penderfynu pa bwyllgorau y mae am eu sefydlu a beth ddylai eu cylch gwaith fod. Bydd y Cynulliad yn cyflogi ei staff ei hun, yn yr un ffordd â chyrrff seneddol eraill.

O ran swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad, mae ail ran y Papur Gwyn yn ymwneud â chryfhau pwerau deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae'n gosod allan yn glir dair elfen. Mae'r elfen gyntaf yn weithredol o heddiw ymlaen ac nid oes Mesur yn ofynnol i'w gweithredu. Mae hynny'n ymrwymiad i wneud yr elfen Gymreig mewn unrhyw Fesur yn Lloegr a Chymru ar faterion datganoledig mor hyblyg â phosibl o ran y pwerau a roddir i'r Cynulliad. O hyn ymlaen, caiff Mesurau eu llunio fel Mesurau fframwaith, gan roi cymaint o ryddid â phosibl i benderfynu union ffurf gweithredu deddfwriaeth yng Nghymru.

Mae angen darpariaethau'r Mesur ar gyfer yr ail elfen i'w gwneud yn bosibl i'r Senedd roi'r Awdurdod i'r Cynulliad ddeddfu mewn meysydd polisi penodol. Pan fydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud cais

makes a formal request for a power to legislate in an area within the limits set out in the Bill, that request would then be a matter for the Secretary of State and parliamentary consideration, under procedures to be laid out in the Bill. If the request is approved, an Order in Council would be made and the Assembly would then be able to exercise the legislative powers delegated to it. The Assembly would then no longer depend on a mention in the Queen's Speech to deliver legislative changes needed for the benefit of people in Wales. With the authority of an Order in Council, the Assembly itself will be able to debate and approve legislation that would previously have been the preserve of the Houses of Parliament. The proposals establish a new and better balance between the Assembly and Parliament over the authority to legislate for Wales.

What I have described will allow the executive and legislative branches of this Assembly to deliver for the people of Wales. However, the White Paper also proposes that the Bill should include provision for a post-legislative referendum on primary legislative powers so that if, at some future time, there is still concern that we do not have all of the tools necessary to do the job, the people of Wales can be asked their opinion on that matter.

Finally the White Paper proposes an end to the situation whereby candidates for the Assembly can simultaneously stand for election both in a constituency and on a regional list.

The changes described in the White Paper, in particular the separation proposals, will require fundamental changes to the Standing Orders of the Assembly. The White Paper proposes that the Secretary of State should have the power to make a set of reformed Standing Orders, on the advice of a committee. I am sure, from the spirit in which we have worked to reach this point, that he will be willing to listen to any representations proposing that it should be a committee of this Assembly that prepares those Standing Orders and this Assembly that adopts them. He may need fallback powers so that he can

ffurfiol am bŵer i ddeddfu mewn maes o fewn y terfynau a osodir allan yn y Mesur, byddai'r cais hwnnw'n fater i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol a'r Senedd i'w ystyried, o dan weithdrefnau a osodir allan yn y Mesur. Os caiff y cais ei gymeradwyo, byddai Gorchymyn yn y Cyfrin Gyngor yn cael ei wneud a byddai'r Cynulliad wedyn yn gallu ymarfer y pwerau deddfwriaethol a ddirprwywyd iddo. Ni fyddai'r Cynulliad mwyach yn dibynnu ar gyfeiriad ato yn Araith y Frenhines i ddarparu'r newidiadau deddfwriaethol angenrheidiol er mwyn pobl yng Nghymru. Gydag awdurdod Gorchymyn yn y Cyfrin Gyngor, bydd y Cynulliad ei hun yn gallu dadlau a chymeradwyo deddfwriaeth a fyddai gynt wedi bod yn rhan o gyloch gwaith y Senedd. Mae'r cynigion yn sefydlu cydbwysedd newydd a gwell rhwng y Cynulliad a'r Senedd ynglŷn â'r awdurdod i ddeddfu ar gyfer Cymru.

Bydd yr hyn a ddisgrifiais yn caniatáu i ganghennau gweithredol a deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad hwn ddarparu ar gyfer pobl Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Papur Gwyn hefyd yn cynnig y dylai'r Mesur gynnwys darpariaeth ar gyfer refferendwm ar ôl y ddeddfwriaeth ar bwerau deddfwriaethol sylfaenol. Ac os bydd pryder, rywbryd yn y dyfodol, nad oes gennym yr holl offer angenrheidiol i wneud y gwaith, yna gellir gofyn i bobl Cymru am eu barn ar y mater hwnnw.

Yn olaf mae'r Papur Gwyn yn cynnig rhoi terfyn ar sefyllfa lle gall ymgeiswyr ar gyfer y Cynulliad sefyll fel ymgeiswyr mewn etholaeth ac ar restr ranbarthol ar yr un pryd.

Mae'r newidiadau a ddisgrifir yn y Papur Gwyn, yn arbennig y cynigion gwahanu, yn golygu y bydd angen gwneud newidiadau sylfaenol yn Rheolau Sefydlog y Cynulliad. Mae'r Papur Gwyn yn cynnig y dylai'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol gael y pŵer i wneud cyfres o Reolau Sefydlog diwygiedig, yn ôl cyngor pwyllgor. Yr wyf yn siŵr, o gofio ysbryd y gweithio a fu rhyngom hyd yma, y bydd yn barod i wrando ar unrhyw sylwadau yn cynnig mai un o bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad hwn a ddylai baratoi'r Rheolau Sefydlog hynny, ac mai'r Cynulliad hwn a ddylai eu derbyn. Efallai y bydd arno angen pwerau

be absolutely sure that reformed Standing Orders will be in place before the next Assembly elections. I think that that is a reasonable way forward.

Yr wyf wedi cymryd y cyfle cyntaf hwn i dynnu sylw'r Aelodau at y cynigion. Mae'r newidiadau arfaethedig yn rhai fydd yn digwydd yn gynyddol yn hytrach na rhai sylfaenol. Byddant ar gael mewn egwyddor at ddefnydd y Cynulliad nesaf ym mis Mai 2007. Maent yn dileu'r anghysonderau presennol. Eu sail yw bod yn ymarferol yn hytrach na mynd yn rhy bell o flaen barn y cyhoedd yng Nghymru. Nid ydynt yn diystyru newid sylfaenol yn y tymor canol neu'r tymor hir, ond bydd angen cynnal refferendwm cyn gwneud newid o'r fath.

Bydd cyfle cynnar arall i drafod gosodiadau'r Papur Gwyn yn y ddaid ar Araith y Frenhines yr wythnos nesaf. Yr wyf hefyd wedi gosod cynnig yn dangos ein bwriad i sefydlu pwyllgor cynghori i ystyried y cynigion deddfwriaethol i ddiwygio Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Yr wyf, felly, yn cymeradwyo'r Papur Gwyn i'w ystyried gan y Cynulliad.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Prif Weinidog am y datganiad hwn. Mae rhai pethau yn y Papur Gwyn y gallwn ei croesawu: y peth cyntaf yw ein bod ni wedi dadlau, fel y Prif Weinidog a phobl eraill, fod angen hollti'r cyfrifoldeb rhwng y Llywodraeth a'r corff deddfwriaethol. Yr ydym yn falch bod y cynigion hynny wedi eu cynnwys yn y Papur Gwyn. Croesawaf hefyd rai o'ch sylwadau ynglŷn â phwyllgorau—mai mater i'r Cynulliad yw penderfynu pa bwyllgorau sydd yn addas ac nid mater ar gyfer deddfwriaeth. Hefyd, mae'r pwerau craffu yn cael eu cryfhau, gan na fydd Gweinidogion, o anghenraid, yn aelodau o bwyllgorau.

Fodd bynnag, ar fater pwerau'r Cynulliad, mae'r Papur Gwyn wedi colli cyfle mawr. Anghytunaf yn llwyr â gosodiad yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol nad oes consensws ar fater pwerau deddfu llawn i'r Cynulliad. Mae consensws, a gwelwyd y consensws hwnnw yn adroddiad comisiwn Richard; yr oedd y corff hwnnw yn unfrydol ynglŷn â'r angen hwnnw ar ôl cymryd tystiolaeth am 18 mis.

wrth gefn fel y gall fod yn hollol siŵr y bydd Rheolau Sefydlog diwygiedig ar waith cyn etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad. Credaf fod hynny'n gam rhesymol ymlaen.

I have taken this first opportunity to draw the proposals to the attention of Members. The changes proposed will be incremental and not fundamental. They will be available in principle for the use of the next Assembly in May 2007. They remove the current anomalies. They are based on the principle of what is practical rather than running too far ahead of public opinion in Wales. They do not exclude fundamental change in the medium or long term, but they make such change subject to a referendum.

There will be a further opportunity to discuss the White Paper's proposals in the debate on the Queen's Speech next week. I have also tabled a motion signalling our intention to establish an advisory committee to consider the legislative proposals for reform of the National Assembly for Wales. I therefore commend the White Paper for the Assembly's consideration.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I should like to thank the First Minister for this statement. There are some elements in the White Paper which we can welcome: the first is that we have argued, as has the First Minister and others, that the governmental and legislative arms of the Assembly need to be split, and we are pleased that those proposals are included in the White Paper. I also welcome some of your comments regarding committees—that it is a matter for the Assembly to decide which committees are appropriate, and not a matter for legislation. There is also a strengthening of the scrutiny powers, as Ministers will not necessarily be members of the committees.

However, on the matter of Assembly's powers, the White Paper has lost a significant opportunity. I completely disagree with the Secretary of State's statement that there is no consensus on the matter of full legislative powers for the Assembly. There is a consensus, and that consensus was contained in the Richard commission report; that body was unanimous about that need after taking

Ar ddechrau'r broses, yr oeddech yn cefnogi hynny, ond, am resymau mewnol sydd yn ymwneud â'r Blaid Lafur yn hytrach nag anghenion Cymru, yr ydych wedi symud oddi wrth hynny.

Yr ydym yn gwrthwynebu'r syniad fod yn rhaid i Aelodau ddewis rhwng sefyll mewn etholaethau a sefyll ar y rhestr—rhywbeth mewnol i'r Blaid Lafur yw hynny hefyd, nid wyf wedi clywed am un aelod o'r cyhoedd sydd yn elyniaethus i'r syniad fod pobl yn gallu sefyll ar y ddwy ochr. Efallai y bydd rhai Aelodau o'ch plaid chi am weld y sefyllfa honno yn newid.

3.40 p.m.

As I have indicated, we welcome a number of issues in the White Paper, but the fundamental reason for it was to set out a vision for the future of this Assembly in relation to primary law-making powers. To the extent that it is falling short, it falls short on that vision which was set out quite clearly by the Richard commission. I do not accept this view put forward by the Secretary of State and the First Minister that there is no consensus on that in Wales. There is a clear consensus in Wales to move forward to that proposal.

I will now deal with some of those issues in a little greater detail. Your first point is that the new streamlined procedure—which some people called the 'fast-track procedure', but which the Secretary of State now calls 'the streamlined procedure'—is to enable Westminster, on an Order in Council, to introduce legislation at the behest of the Assembly.

The problem with that proposal is that the Secretary of State will have a veto on that Order in Council. Parliament can vote it down if it wishes, and the Secretary of State can say that he does not wish that proposal to be put forward. While that proposal might be all right if you have a Government of the same persuasion in London, I can foresee all sorts of problems if you have governments of different persuasions in Cardiff and in London. What guarantees can you give, First

evidence for 18 months. At the beginning of the process you supported this, but for internal reasons to do with the Labour Party, rather than the needs of Wales, you have moved away from that.

We oppose the idea that Members have to choose between standing in constituencies and standing on the list—that is an internal Labour Party issue; I have not heard of a single person who is hostile to the idea that people can stand on both sides. Some Members of your own party may wish to see that situation change.

Fel y dywedais, yr ydym yn croesawu nifer o faterion yn y Papur Gwyn. Ond y rheswm sylfaenol drosto oedd gosod allan weledigaeth ar gyfer dyfodol y Cynulliad hwn mewn perthynas â phwerau deddfwriaeth sylfaenol. I'r graddau ei fod yn ddiffygiol, mae'n ddiffygiol o ran y weledigaeth honno, a gafodd ei gosod allan yn ddigon clir gan gomisiwn Richard. Ni dderbyniaf y farn a gyflwynwyd gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol a'r Prif Weinidog nad oes consensws ar hynny yng Nghymru. Mae consensws clir yng Nghymru i symud ymlaen i'r cynnig hwnnw.

Ymdriniaf yn awr â rhai o'r materion hynny ychydig yn fanylach. Eich pwynt cyntaf yw mai diben y weithdrefn symlach newydd—a elwir gan rai yn 'weithdrefn llwybr cyflym', ond a elwir yn awr gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn 'weithdrefn symlach'—yw galluogi San Steffan, ar Orchymyn yn y Cyfrin Gyngor, i gyflwyno deddfwriaeth ar gais y Cynulliad.

Y broblem gyda'r cynnig hwnnw yw y bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn gallu rhoi fetu ar y Gorchymyn hwnnw yn y Cyfrin Gyngor. Gall y Senedd bleidleisio yn ei erbyn os dymuna, a gall yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ddweud nad yw'n dymuno i'r cynnig hwnnw gael ei gyflwyno. Er y gallai'r cynnig hwnnw fod yn iawn pe bai gennych Lywodraeth a oedd yn credu'r un fath yn Llundain, gallaf ragweld pob math o broblemau os oes gennych ddwy lywodraeth yn credu'n

Minister, that the will of the Assembly will prevail?

You have referred to the fact that there will be a trigger for a referendum if this mythical consensus, which you do not appear to accept at present, arises in favour of moving to the next step. In this White Paper, I cannot understand why it would take a simple majority in Westminster to trigger that referendum, but that it would take two-thirds of Assembly Members, for some reason, to do the same. Why can those elected to Westminster be trusted in a simple majority, but that those elected to the Assembly would need a two-thirds majority to enable that to happen?

Therefore, will the First Minister revisit that proposal and say that he would favour a simple majority in the Assembly to trigger that referendum? I would want to see that happen much sooner than envisaged by the Secretary of State. The First Minister has not set out an agenda for that, but the Secretary of State says that he does not want to see it happen until 2015. I would welcome the First Minister's response on where he stands on that basic issue.

Finally, I have two detailed questions for the First Minister. First, how will the Assembly take part in the consultation on the White Paper; and secondly, when the Bill is introduced in due course, what level of scrutiny will there be in the Assembly? The proposal, insofar as the consultation period is concerned, is that a committee will be set up under Standing Order No. 8.1 which is the Standing Order used for other all-party ad hoc committees. How does the First Minister intend that committee to operate? Will it be able to take evidence, invite witnesses to give evidence, and will it look at proposals coming forward from outside the Assembly?

When that committee completes his work, will the First Minister then consider having a committee of Assembly Members which is wider than the Standing Order No. 8.1 committee, to scrutinize the Bill when it is eventually published? Will the First Minister

wahanol yng Nghaerdydd ac yn Llundain. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi, Brif Weinidog, mai ewylllys y Cynulliad fydd yn trechu?

Yr ydych wedi cyfeirio at y ffaith y bydd achos dros gynnal refferendwm os bydd y consensws mytholegol hwn, nad ydych yn ei dderbyn, mae'n ymddangos, ar hyn o bryd, yn codi o blaid symud i'r cam nesaf. Yn y Papur Gwyn hwn, ni allaf ddeall pam y byddai'n cymryd mwyafrif syml yn San Steffan i beri i'r refferendwm hwnnw gael ei gynnal, ond y byddai'n cymryd dwy ran o dair o Aelodau'r Cynulliad, am ryw reswm, i wneud yr un peth. Pam y gellir ymddiried yn y rheini a etholir i San Steffan gyda mwyafrif syml, ond y byddai angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair o'r rheini a etholir i'r Cynulliad er mwyn i hynny ddigwydd?

Felly, a wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ailystyried y cynnig hwnnw a dweud y byddai o blaid mwyafrif syml yn y Cynulliad i beri i'r refferendwm hwnnw gael ei gynnal? Byddwn am weld hynny'n digwydd lawer ynghynt nag a ragwelir gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol. Nid yw'r Prif Weinidog wedi pennu agenda ar gyfer hynny, ond dywed yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol nad yw am weld hynny'n digwydd tan 2015. Byddwn yn croesawu ymateb y Prif Weinidog ar ei safbwynt ef ar y mater sylfaenol hwnnw.

I gloi, mae gennyf ddau gwestiwn manwl i'r Prif Weinidog. Yn gyntaf, sut y bydd y Cynulliad yn cymryd rhan yn yr ymgynghori ar y Papur Gwyn; ac yn ail, pan gyflwynir y Mesur maes o law, faint o graffu fydd yn y Cynulliad? Y cynnig, o ran y cyfnod ymgynghori, yw y caiff pwyllgor ei sefydlu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 8.1, sef y Rheol Sefydlog a ddefnyddir gan bwyllgorau pob plaid ad hoc eraill. Sut y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn bwriadu i'r pwyllgor hwnnw weithredu? A fydd yn gallu derbyn tystiolaeth, gwahodd tystion i roi tystiolaeth, ac a fydd yn edrych ar gynigion a gyflwynir o'r tu allan i'r Cynulliad?

Pan fydd y pwyllgor hwnnw'n cwblhau ei waith, a fydd y Prif Weinidog yn ystyried cael pwyllgor o Aelodau Cynulliad sy'n ehangach na phwyllgor Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.1, i graffu ar y Mesur pan gaiff ei gyhoeddi yn y pen draw? A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog



place on record his support for that proposal? When it gets to that stage, it is necessary for more Assembly Members to be involved than would be on a Standing Order No. 8.1 committee.

**The First Minister:** I will first deal with this question where, I think, you have it in reverse in terms of the actual circumstances that the White Paper proposals are meant to address, namely, are these proposals sufficiently robust to deal with a different colour of Government to that in Westminster at some future date? You say that they would break down at that point, and that they would only work if there was a Labour Government both here and in Westminster. I believe that you have the wrong end of the stick on that important point.

This is where life gets very difficult for me, but—I am going to have to squeeze these words out under duress—picture a Conservative Government being elected. I managed to get the words out, as you have to, sometimes, for the good of Wales. Picture the scenario: a Labour administration in the Assembly making a bid for primary legislation to be included in the Queen's Speech, and a Conservative Secretary of State taking it through Parliament. To my mind, that will not happen because a Conservative Secretary of State will have to take a Bill through Parliament and defend it while probably disagreeing with every clause. So, I cannot see that happening.

Under these proposals a Conservative Secretary of State could say, 'Okay, I do not agree with the proposals, but, then again, I do not have to defend them because this is a matter for the Assembly to deal with'. We would then agree that it would be a matter for the Assembly to take through, and, therefore, there would be a far greater chance of legislation being introduced by us, with Parliament's permission—with a Conservative majority in the scenario I mentioned—than there is under the present system. So, it is a major improvement in robustness to deal with that transposition, if you like, of a Labour administration in the Assembly and a Government of a different colour in Westminster. Therefore, you have

gofnodi ei gefnogaeth i'r cynnig hwnnw? Pan ddaw'r adeg honno, bydd angen cynnwys mwy o Aelodau Cynulliad nag a fyddai ar bwyllgor Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.1.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ymdrniaf yn gyntaf â'r cwestiwn lle mae i'r gwrthwyneb, mi gredaf, o ran yr union amgylchiadau y bwriedir i gynigion y Papur Gwyn ymdrin â hwy, sef a yw'r cynigion hyn yn ddigon cadarn i ymdrin â llywodraeth o liw gwahanol i'r llywodraeth yn San Steffan yn y dyfodol? Dywedwch y byddent yn chwalu bryd hynny, ac y byddent yn gweithio dim ond pe bai Llywodraeth Lafur yma ac yn San Steffan. Credaf eich bod wedi camddeall y pwynt pwysig hwnnw.

Dyma lle mae pethau'n mynd yn anodd iawn i mi, ond—rhaid imi yngan y geiriau hyn o'm hanfodd—dychmygwch fod Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn cael ei hethol. Llwyddais i ddweud y geiriau, fel y mae'n rhaid gwneud weithiau: er lles Cymru. Dychmygwch hyn: gweinyddiaeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad yn cyflwyno cynnig am gynnwys deddfwriaeth sylfaenol yn Araith y Frenhines, ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol o'r blaidd Geidwadol yn mynd â hynny drwy'r Senedd. Yn fy marn i, ni fydd hynny'n digwydd oherwydd bydd yn rhaid i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol o'r blaidd Geidwadol gyflwyno Mesur drwy'r Senedd a'i amddiffyn er y bydd yn anghytuno, mae'n siŵr, â phob cymal. Felly, ni allaf weld hynny'n digwydd.

O dan y cynigion hyn, gallai Ysgrifennydd Gwladol o'r blaidd Geidwadol ddweud, 'Iawn, ni chytunaf â'r cynigion, ond eto nid oes rhaid imi eu hamddiffyn gan mai mater i'r Cynulliad ymdrin ag ef yw hwn'. Byddem felly yn cytuno mai cyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad fyddai cyflwyno'r cynigion, ac felly byddai lawer yn fwy tebygol y byddai deddfwriaeth yn cael ei chyflwyno gennym ni, gyda chaniatâd y Senedd—gyda mwyafrif Ceidwadol yn y sefyllfa y soniais amdani—nag sydd yn debygol o dan y system bresennol. Felly, mae'n welliant mawr o ran cadernid i ddelio â'r trawsosodiad hwnnw, os hoffech chi, o weinyddiaeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth o liw gwahanol yn San Steffan. Felly, yr ydych wedi camddeall

the wrong end of the stick completely on that. hynny'n llwyr.

The second question is on the issue of the two-thirds trigger in the Assembly, with only a bare majority in the House of Commons. This seems perfectly sensible to me because you are testing the consensus in Wales. If there is strong consensus, Parliament, with its Members mostly coming from outside Wales, only has to say whether it disagrees with that consensus. Again, you could say that it ought to be 51 per cent here and 51 per cent in Parliament in order to have parity, but it is not really like that. We represent the people of Wales only, while Parliament represents 20 times more people than we do. Therefore, it only has to ask whether its Members accept the consensus, based on a two-thirds majority of the people of Wales.

On the question of what a committee ought to be doing here, I think that the primary purpose of an advisory committee is to co-ordinate all the different internal aspects of the Assembly's response. The House Committee, the Legislation Committee, and possibly other bodies, would have a view, and someone must co-ordinate that, because this cannot go through a subject committee. I am open-minded on whether it should go beyond that, because we have to work out how, during this four-month consultation period, the views of the Welsh people are best solicited. I am completely open-minded on how we do that. We can return to this, and, as I mentioned in my statement, there will be an opportunity to do that during the debate on the Queen's Speech next week.

You mentioned your opposition to the changes to the electoral system. All that we are trying to do is to assist the people of Wales by having a clear voting system. You cannot describe as satisfactory a system where the phrase, 'I am your local AM' can mean one of two things. It can mean, 'I am the candidate that you rejected' or 'I am the candidate that you elected'. It cannot be right that those phrases could have exactly the same meaning. Voters are not going to be happy at that. They are currently confused, and anything that we can do to reduce that confusion will benefit democracy.

Mae'r ail gwestiwn yn ymwneud â'r sbardun o ddwy ran o dair yn y Cynulliad, gyda mwyafrif prin yn unig yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin. Mae hyn yn ymddangos yn gwbl synhwyrol i mi oherwydd eich bod yn profi'r consensws yng Nghymru. Os oes consensws cryf, dim ond dweud a yw'n anghytuno â'r consensws hwnnw y mae'n rhaid i'r Senedd ei wneud, gyda'i Haelodau'n dod yn bennaf o'r tu allan i Gymru. Eto, gallech ddweud y dylai fod 51 y cant yma a 51 y cant yn y Senedd er mwyn cael cydraddoldeb, ond nid felly y mae mewn gwirionedd. Pobl Cymru yn unig yr ydym yn eu cynrychioli, ond mae'r Senedd yn cynrychioli 20 gwaith yn fwy o bobl na ni. Felly, dim ond gofyn a yw ei Haelodau'n derbyn y consensws, ar sail mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair o bobl Cymru, y mae'n rhaid iddi ei wneud.

O ran yr hyn y dylai pwyllgor fod yn ei wneud yma, credaf mai prif bwrpas pwyllgor cynghori yw cydgysylltu'r holl agweddau mewnol gwahanol ar ymateb y Cynulliad. Byddai gan Bwyllgor y Tŷ, y Pwyllgor Deddfwriaeth, a chyrrff eraill o bosibl, farn a rhaid i rywun gydgysylltu hynny, oherwydd ni all hyn gael ei gyflwyno drwy bwyllgor craffu. Mae gennyf feddwl agored a ddylai hyn fynd y tu hwnt i hynny, oherwydd bod yn rhaid inni ddarganfod sut orau, yn ystod y cyfnod ymgynghori hwn o bedwar mis, i geisio barn pobl Cymru. Mae gennyf feddwl cwbl agored ar y modd y gwnawn hynny. Gallwn ddychwelyd at hyn, ac fel y soniais yn fy natganiad, bydd cyfle i wneud hynny yn ystod y ddadl ar Araith y Frenhines yr wythnos nesaf.

Soniech eich bod yn gwrthwynebu'r newidiadau yn yr system etholiadol. Y cyfan yr ydym yn ceisio'i wneud yw cynorthwyo pobl Cymru drwy gael system bleidleisio eglur. Ni allwch ddisgrifio system, lle gall y frawddeg 'Fi yw eich AC lleol' olygu un o ddau beth, fel system foddhaol. Gall olygu 'Fi yw'r ymgeisydd a wrthodwyd gennych' neu 'Fi yw'r ymgeisydd a etholwyd gennych'. Nid yw'n iawn y gallai'r brawddegau hynny olygu'r un peth yn union. Ni fydd pleidleiswyr yn fodlon ar hynny. Maent wedi drysu ar hyn o bryd, a bydd unrhyw beth y gallwn ni ei wneud i leihau'r

dryswch hwnnw yn fuddiol i ddemocratiaeth.

O ran cwestiynau eraill Ieuan ynglŷn ag a ydym yn colli cyfle, rhaid troi at y gymhariaeth rhwng argymhellion comisiwn Ivor Richard a'r cynigion yn y Papur Gwyn. Mae prif elfennau argymhellion comisiwn Richard yn y Papur Gwyn, ond maent wedi eu gosod cam wrth gam. Y cam cyntaf, a'r pellaf, yw'r amod y dangosir cefnogaeth pobl Cymru drwy refferendwm, tra byddai'r llall ar gael llawer yn gynt nag unrhyw beth yng nghomisiwn Richard, sef yn barod ar gyfer y trydydd Cynulliad a gaiff ei ethol ymhenni llai na dwy flynedd. Felly, mae elfen o fod yn ymarferol, o gyflymu'r broses o roi hawliau ychwanegol, sydd yn ymarferol, a bargaen newydd rhwng y Senedd a'r Cynulliad ar rywbeth a gyflawnwyd ac sy'n barod i'w ddefnyddio gan y trydydd Cynulliad—pwy bynnag a gaiff ei ethol bryd hynny.

With regard to Ieuan's other questions whether this is a missed opportunity, we must turn to the comparison between the recommendations of the Ivor Richard commission and the proposals in the White Paper. The main elements of the Richard commission's recommendations are contained within the White Paper, but they are set out step by step. The first and furthest step is the condition that the support of the people of Wales is shown by means of a referendum, while the other would be achieved far earlier than anything proposed by the Richard commission, and available for the third Assembly which will be elected in less than two years' time. Therefore, there is an element of practicality, of speeding up the process of providing enhanced powers, which is practical, and a new deal between Parliament and the Assembly on something that has been achieved and which is ready for use by the third Assembly—whoever is elected then.

3.50 p.m.

Yn olaf, diolchaf i Ieuan am ei groeso i rai o'r elfennau, fel yr hollt rhwng ochr lywodraethol ac ochr deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad.

Finally, I thank Ieuan for welcoming some of the elements, such as the separation between the Executive and legislative arms of the Assembly.

**Nick Bourne:** I thank the First Minister for his statement on this important event of the publication of the White Paper. I pick up where the First Minister has just finished by referring to the issue on which we all agree—I think that there has been unanimous agreement on this in the Assembly—namely the need to separate the Executive and the legislative functions of this body. We did not need the Richard commission to do that for us because we were all agreed on that. Nevertheless, I welcome that, and we welcome that part of the White Paper.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolchaf i'r Prif Weinidog am ei ddatganiad ar y digwyddiad pwysig hwn o gyhoeddi'r Papur Gwyn. Af ymlaen o'r fan lle mae'r Prif Weinidog newydd orffen drwy gyfeirio at y mater yr ydym bob un yn cytuno arno—credaf fod cytundeb unfrydol ar hyn yn y Cynulliad—sef yr angen i wahanu swyddogaethau'r Weithrediaeth a swyddogaethau deddfwriaethol y corff hwn. Nid oedd angen i gomisiwn Richard wneud hynny ar ein rhan oherwydd yr oeddem oll yn cytuno ar hynny. Er hyn, croesawaf hynny, a chroesawn y rhan honno o'r Papur Gwyn.

The proposals for electoral arrangements are totally different from anything that appears in the Richard commission report, because the Richard commission did not raise this as an issue at all. The commission, having taken a considerable amount of time and having cost a fair amount of money, does not mention this, nor was it ever breathed about in the

Mae'r cynigion ar gyfer trefniadau etholiadol yn hollol wahanol i unrhyw beth sy'n ymddangos yn adroddiad comisiwn Richard, oherwydd na chododd comisiwn Richard hyn fel mater o gwbl. Nid yw'r comisiwn, ar ôl treulio cryn amser ac ar ôl costio llawer iawn o arian, yn sôn am hyn, ac ni soniwyd amdano erioed yn y Blaid Lafur pan gafodd

Labour Party when it was introduced, nor when the First Minister was elected via the list—admittedly, not via a constituency as well, because it was too late to find him one.

Let us consider this, before you sacrifice Alun Pugh, Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Jane Hutt and Sue Essex. Even on the grounds of enlightened self-interest, this is not sensible. However, the First Minister says that there is confusion among the Welsh public about the electoral system. I have tabled a question to the First Minister—and I have not yet received a response—asking him to disclose all the correspondence indicating that there has been confusion on this issue, because I do not have such a low opinion of the Welsh electorate as to believe that there has been any confusion at all. This has been an exercise to keep the Labour Party together.

I watched Peter Hain delivering his statement in another place and saw that this proposal was the only part of the statement that was cheered by Labour Party members and got them going. There is an idea that this would somehow dilute the potency of the opposition parties. However, the First Minister should look around him—it could well be that this is not in the Labour Party's interest either. It is certainly not in the interest of the better governance of Wales. As I have said before, it is malicious, malevolent and spiteful. I do not believe, because the First Minister is none of those things, that, in reality, his heart is in this proposal.

Many people canvassing for the Labour Party were telling voters in the constituencies of Members that I have just mentioned that they could have not just Alun Pugh, but Brynle Williams as well, and that, elsewhere, they could have Jane Hutt and David Melding. That is how the election was conducted on the doorstep by many Labour Party canvassers. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] Just as in the House of Commons, this is obviously the section of the White Paper that most excites the Labour Party, but perhaps not all of its Members.

I move on to the important issue of the future governance of Wales and the proposals contained in the White Paper. There is no long-term stability in the present settlement,

ei gyflwyno, na phan etholwyd y Prif Weinidog drwy'r rhestr—nid drwy etholaeth hefyd, rhaid cyfaddef, oherwydd ei bod yn rhy hwyr i gael un ar ei gyfer.

Gadewch inni ystyried hyn, cyn i chi aberthu Alun Pugh, Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Jane Hutt a Sue Essex. Hyd yn oed ar sail hunan-les goleuedig, nid yw hyn yn synhwyrol. Fodd bynnag, dywed y Prif Weinidog fod dryswch ymhlith pobl Cymru ynglŷn â'r system etholiadol. Yr wyf wedi cyflwyno cwestiwn i'r Prif Weinidog—ac nid wyf wedi cael ateb eto—yn gofyn iddo ddadlennu'r holl ohebiaeth sy'n dangos bod dryswch wedi bod ynglŷn â'r mater hwn, oherwydd nid yw fy marn o etholwyr Cymru mor isel nes credu bod unrhyw ddryswch o gwbl. Mae hwn wedi bod yn ymarfer i gadw'r Blaid Lafur ynghyd.

Gwyliais Peter Hain yn rhoi ei ddatganiad mewn man arall, a gwelais mai'r cynnig hwn oedd yr unig ran o'r datganiad a gafodd ei gymeradwyo gan aelodau o'r Blaid Lafur a'u cyffroi. Mae yna syniad y byddai hyn rywsut yn lleihau grym y gwrthbleidiau. Fodd bynnag, dylai'r Prif Weinidog edrych o'i amgylch—efallai nad yw hyn o les i'r Blaid Lafur ychwaith. Yn sicr, nid yw o les i wella llywodraethu yng Nghymru. Fel yr wyf wedi'i ddweud o'r blaen, mae'n faleisus, yn fileinig ac yn sbeitlyd. Nid wyf yn credu, gan nad oes yr un o'r pethau hynny'n wir am y Prif Weinidog, fod ei galon yn y cynnig hwn, mewn gwirionedd.

Yr oedd nifer o bobl wrth ganfasio ar ran y Blaid Lafur yn dweud wrth bleidleiswyr yn etholaethau'r Aelodau yr wyf newydd sôn amdanynt y gallent gael Alun Pugh, yn ogystal â Brynle Williams ac y gallent, mewn man arall, gael Jane Hutt a David Melding. Dyna sut y cynhaliwyd yr etholiad o ddrws i ddrws gan nifer o ganfaswyr y Blaid Lafur. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O'] Fel yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin, dyma'r adran yn y Papur Gwyn, mae'n amlwg, sy'n cyffroi'r Blaid Lafur fwyaf, ond efallai nad yw'n cyffroi pob un o'i Haelodau.

Symudaf ymlaen at fater pwysig llywodraethu Cymru yn y dyfodol a'r cynigion a gynhwysir yn y Papur Gwyn. Nid oes unrhyw sefydlogrwydd hirdymor yn y

and perhaps we all agree on this. We have to move forward, or abolish the institution. My views are well known—I do not believe that we should abolish the institution. However, there is a range of opinions, and there is a range of opinions in my party. Goodness knows, one of my Assembly Members, who is still an Assembly Member, may have gone a little bit native now that he has gone to Westminster. He may not be the strong supporter of devolution that he once was. However, these opinions cut across parties; they cut across the Labour Party. Peter Hain is not convinced. Indeed, he is convinced that there would not be a 'yes' vote if there were a referendum. That is one reason, and it seems to be the prime reason, why he does not want one. If that is the case, there has to be a substantial body of opinion in the Labour Party that would not support that, otherwise he could say with certainty that this would go through.

Therefore, let us acknowledge the truth out there, which is that there is a division of opinion in Wales, but, for heaven's sake, do we only have referenda when we are confident of the result? Perhaps Peter Hain has been speaking to Jacques Chirac and been greatly influenced. However, to be fair to the Prime Minister, when he said that there would be a referendum on the constitution of Europe, I am sure that he realised that that was not in the bag. You have a referendum and you seek to convince people of the rightness of a particular case. If you only have them when you are certain of the decision, there is not much point in having them. That is an extraordinary view of democracy, and it is lucky that we do not apply the same rule to general elections, but perhaps that is in Peter Hain's mind.

To return to the issue, we need a referendum. Peter Hain said in his statement that he did not anticipate that happening. At the very earliest, it would not happen in the next Assembly and, even if it did, he thought that it would be a very slow process. I believe, as was envisaged by the Richard commission, that this should happen no later than 2011, and there should be a range of options. We need legislative powers, but this is too

setliad presennol, ac efallai ein bod i gyd yn cytuno ar hyn. Rhaid inni symud ymlaen, neu ddiddymu'r sefydliad. Mae fy marn i am hyn yn ddigon hysbys—ni chredaf y dylem ddiddymu'r sefydliad. Fodd bynnag, mae yna amrywiaeth o safbwyntiau, ac amrywiaeth o safbwyntiau o fewn fy mhleid i. Duw a wŷr, efallai fod un o'm Haelodau Cynulliad, sy'n dal yn Aelod Cynulliad, wedi mynd ychydig yn naïf ers mynd i San Steffan. Efallai nad yw'n cefnogi datganoli mor gryf ag yr arferai. Fodd bynnag, mae'r safbwyntiau hyn yn torri ar draws pleidiau; maent yn torri ar draws y Blaid Lafur. Nid yw Peter Hain wedi'i argyhoeddi. Yn wir, mae wedi'i argyhoeddi na fyddai pleidlais 'ie' pe bai refferendwm yn cael ei gynnal. Dyna un rheswm, ac ymddengys mai dyna'r prif reswm, pam nad yw'n awyddus i gael un. Os felly, mae'n rhaid bod nifer sylweddol o bobl o'r farn honno yn y Blaid Lafur na fyddai'n cefnogi hynny, neu gallai ddweud yn bendant y byddai hyn yn mynd rhagddo.

Felly, gadewch inni gydnabod y gwirionedd, sef bod y farn yn rhanedig yng Nghymru. Ond er mwyn popeth, ai dim ond pan fyddwn yn hyderus ynglŷn â'r canlyniad y byddwn yn cael refferenda? Efallai fod Peter Hain wedi bod yn siarad â Jacques Chirac ac wedi cael ei ddylanwadu'n fawr ganddo. Fodd bynnag, i fod yn deg â Phrif Weinidog y DU, pan ddywedodd y byddai refferendwm ar gyfansoddiad Ewrop, yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn sylweddoli nad oedd hwnnw'n sicr. Mewn refferendwm, y nod yw ceisio argyhoeddi pobl o uniondeb achos penodol. Os cynhelir refferenda dim ond pan fyddwch yn siŵr o'r canlyniad, nid oes llawer o ddiben eu cynnal. Mae honno'n farn anhygoel am ddemocratiaeth, ac mae'n ffodus nad ydym yn defnyddio'r un rheol mewn etholiadau cyffredinol. Ond efallai mai dyna sydd ym meddwl Peter Hain.

I ddychwelyd at y mater, mae arnom angen refferendwm. Dywedodd Peter Hain yn ei ddatganiad nad oedd yn rhagweld y byddai hynny'n digwydd. Ar y cynharaf, ni fyddai'n digwydd yn y Cynulliad nesaf, a hyd yn oed pe bai'n digwydd, credai y byddai'n broses araf iawn. Fel y rhagwelwyd gan gomisiwn Richard, credaf y dylai hyn ddigwydd erbyn 2011 fan bellaf, a dylid cael amrywiaeth o ddewisiadau. Mae arnom angen pwerau

important an issue for politicians for determine. It cuts across political parties and it must be left to the people of Wales to decide. We must make the case for what we believe in—I believe in legislative powers while others do not. This interim measure is nothing but a fudge and a sticking plaster to keep the Labour Party together. I know that because I heard the First Minister say in his response to the Richard commission report—which was a good and strong response—that this is not what he believes in. When he heard the proposals, his instinctive reaction was to welcome them and say, ‘Let us run with this particular baton’. His position has changed. I would welcome, therefore, his reaffirmation of where he stands on this issue. I would also welcome his looking at the issue of the proposals for electoral arrangements in particular, which will not aid the good governance of Wales one jot.

**The First Minister:** I noted your words about Conservative attitude to legislative powers. You said,

‘I believe in legislative powers while others do not’.

Presumably, you are referring to others in the Conservative Party, and you mentioned our absent friend, David Davies. It seems that what you are saying is that you want a referendum to avoid having to settle Conservative policy on devolution. That is a wholly inappropriate use of referenda. As regards what Peter Hain said about having a referendum, it seems perfectly logical to me. If you are making new arrangements that give additional legislative powers and strike a new bargain between the Assembly and Parliament ready for use by the third Assembly elected in early May 2007, you should at least give one term of experience to those new arrangements in 2007 before you start contemplating a further referendum on major change any time after 2011. I believe that he said 2015—which is two Assemblies—but he is open-minded about that. It is up to the Assembly to consider whether it believes that we still do not have the tools to do the job. I am also inclined to

deddfwriaethol, ond mae hwn yn fater rhy bwysig i wleidyddion ei benderfynu. Mae’n torri ar draws pleidiau gwleidyddol, a rhaid gadael i bobl Cymru benderfynu hyn. Rhaid inni ddadlau o blaid yr hyn a gredwn—yr wyf fi’n credu mewn pwerau deddfwriaethol ac eraill yn arddel barn wahanol. Dim ond cyfaddawd yw’r mesur interim hwn, a rhwymyn dros dro i gadw’r Blaid Lafur gyda’i gilydd. Gwn fod hyn yn wir, gan imi glywed y Prif Weinidog yn dweud yn ei ymateb i adroddiad comisiwn Richard—a oedd yn ymateb da a chryf—nad yw’n credu yn hyn. Pan glywodd y cynigion, ei ymateb greddfoll oedd eu croesawu a dweud, ‘Gadewch inni dderbyn hyn’. Mae ei safbwynt wedi newid. Felly, byddwn yn croesawu ei glywed yn ailddatgan ei farn am y mater hwn. Byddwn hefyd yn croesawu ei weld yn edrych ar y cynigion ar gyfer trefniadau etholiadol yn arbennig, na fyddant yn helpu llywodraethu da yng Nghymru o gwbl.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf wedi nodi’ch geiriau ynglŷn ag agwedd y Ceidwadwyr at bwerau deddfwriaethol. Meddech,

‘Yr wyf fi’n credu mewn pwerau deddfwriaethol ac eraill yn arddel barn wahanol’.

Mae’n debyg mai cyfeirio yr ydych at eraill yn y Blaid Geidwadol, ac yr oeddech yn sôn am ein cyfaill absennol, David Davies. Ymddengys mai’r hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud yw eich bod am gael refferendwm i osgoi gorfod penderfynu polisi’r Ceidwadwyr ar ddatganoli. Mae hynny’n ffordd hollol amhriodol o ddefnyddio refferenda. O ran yr hyn a ddywedodd Peter Hain am gael refferendwm, ymddengys yn hollol resymegol i mi. Os ydych yn gwneud trefniadau newydd sy’n rhoi pwerau deddfwriaethol ychwanegol ac yn taro bargaen newydd rhwng y Cynulliad a’r Senedd yn barod at ddefnydd y trydydd Cynulliad a gaiff ei ethol ar ddechrau Mai 2007, dylech roi cyfnod o brofiad o leiaf i’r trefniadau newydd hynny yn 2007 cyn dechrau ystyried refferendwm arall ar newid mawr unrhyw bryd ar ôl 2011. Credaf iddo ddweud 2015—sy’n cynnwys dau Gynulliad—ond mae ei feddwl yn agored ynglŷn â hynny. Cyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad yw ystyried a yw’n

think that two Assemblies under the new arrangements would be more logical, but you do not rule out an Assembly generating a proposition for a referendum at any time that it chooses to do so, if it believes that the consensus exists.

You made many interesting points about referenda, including the recent one in France, and Tony Blair's view and so on. The ironic point about referenda is that they are always reserved, not in Ireland, but here, on constitutional changes. If there is one thing that bores the UK general public rigid, it is constitutional change. You are asking people to vote in large numbers on something that bores them rigid—the details of constitutional change. If it is a massive change that determines who we governed by and whether we have an assembly or enter the European Common Market—although that referendum was two years late—that is fair enough because that is about who you are governed by. However, on matters of constitutional detail, I do not believe that the public wants to get involved in referenda because it is more interested in the issues that arise in general elections and Assembly elections, namely public service delivery, economic growth, jobs, mortgage rates and so on.

During your impassioned plea for no change to the voting system, Nick, I noticed that you did not address the point that I raised. It is possible for defeated candidates—it happens all the time—to describe themselves as local Assembly Members. The person who was elected as the local AM is the local AM, but defeated candidates can also call themselves the local AM. I noticed that you did not address that, and I presume that that is because you do not have an answer to it. If you do not have an answer to that point, then you are not in a position to put forward an effective opposition to this sensible change that clarifies the issue of who the real local AM is for a particular area. Only one person is really elected as the local AM. Unfortunately, others can continue to describe themselves as such.

credu nad oes gennym yr adnoddau i wneud y gwaith o hyd. Yr wyf hefyd yn tueddu i feddwl y byddai dau Gynulliad o dan y trefniadau newydd yn fwy rhesymegol. Ond nid ydych yn diystyru Cynulliad sy'n cynhyrchu cynnig am refferendwm unrhyw bryd y bydd yn dewis gwneud hynny, os yw o'r farn fod yna gonsensws.

Gwnaethoch nifer o bwyntiau diddorol ynglŷn â refferenda, gan gynnwys yr un yn Ffrainc yn ddiweddar, a barn Tony Blair, ac ati. Y pwynt eironig am refferenda, nid yn Iwerddon, ond yma, yw mai dim ond ar gyfer newidiadau cyfansoddiadol y cânt eu cynnal, ac mae newidiadau etholiadol yn diflasu'r cyhoedd yn y DU i'r byw. Yr ydych yn gofyn i bobl bleidleisio'n helaeth ar rywbeth sy'n eu diflasu'n llwyr—manyllion newid cyfansoddiadol. Os yw'n newid mawr sy'n penderfynu pwy sy'n ein llywodraethu ac a ydym am gael cynulliad ai peidio neu ymuno â'r Farchnad Gyffredin—er bod y refferendwm hwnnw ddwy flynedd yn hwyr—mae hynny'n ddigon teg oherwydd bod a wnelo hynny â phwy sy'n eich llywodraethu. Fodd bynnag, o ran materion ynglŷn â manyllion cyfansoddiadol, nid wyf yn credu bod pobl am gael refferenda am fod ganddynt fwy o ddiddordeb yn y materion sy'n codi mewn etholiadau cyffredinol ac etholiadau'r Cynulliad, sef darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, twf economaidd, swyddi, cyfraddau morgeisi, ac ati.

Yn ystod eich ple taer am beidio â newid y system bleidleisio, Nick, sylwais nad oeddech yn mynd i'r afael â'r pwynt a godais. Mae'n bosibl i ymgeiswyr aflwyddiannus—mae'n digwydd o hyd—ddisgrifio'u hunain fel Aelodau Cynulliad lleol. Y sawl a etholwyd yn AC lleol yw'r AC lleol, ond gall ymgeiswyr aflwyddiannus hefyd alw eu hunain yn AC lleol. Sylwais nad aethoch i'r afael â hynny, a thybiaf mai'r rheswm am hynny yw am nad oes gennych ateb. Os nad oes gennych ateb i'r pwynt hwnnw, yna nid ydych mewn sefyllfa i gyflwyno gwrthwynebiad effeithiol i'r newid synhwyrol hwn, sy'n egluro pwy yn union yw'r AC lleol gwirioneddol ar gyfer ardal benodol. Dim ond un person sy'n cael ei ethol yn wirioneddol yn AC lleol. Yn anffodus, gall eraill barhau i ddisgrifio'u hunain felly.

4.00 p.m.

You have mentioned the corporate body split, and I am grateful for your support for it. On the other general issue about what was in the Richard commission's proposals, you must remember that the proposals also involved an increase from 60 to 80 AMs that would, in turn, mean a change in the voting system to the single transferable vote, as well as boundary changes to accommodate the constituencies of 80 AMs. If all that is involved, it is a pretty major change—the kind of change that bores people rigid. I believe that we should be getting on with something practical that is far more in tune with Welsh public opinion.

**Michael German:** I am grateful for the statement, although I am currently a little confused about your attitude towards referenda, because it seems to me that you are suggesting that referenda are a bad thing that should be used very sparingly, if at all. Perhaps that has coloured your judgment on the whole issue, and you may like to explain that attitude.

When we set up the Richard commission, the idea was that it would set out a route for us to take in order for the Assembly to deal with the division of interests between the Westminster Parliament and the National Assembly. It came out with a clear view, proposing a two-stage process. Stage 1 is that this Assembly would build up capacity—and you reminded me that you answered questions on the matter yesterday—and the second stage is that full legislative powers would be transferred to the National Assembly. It set out a timetable: 2007 for stage 1, 2011 for stage 2.

It seems to me that what has happened with the magic hurdle that you have managed to get into this White Paper, and which I will come to in a moment, is that that route map does not go on. It ends with a dramatic full stop with the end of the stage 1 process. The reason that it ends with that full stop is that you have engendered a massive hurdle. I ask you to cast your mind back to the 1970s referenda. You will know that the Scottish referendum at that time failed because MPs

Yr ydych wedi crybwyll rhannu'r corff corfforaethol, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich cefnogaeth i hynny. O ran y mater cyffredinol arall am yr hyn a oedd yng nghynigion y comisiwn Richard, rhaid eich bod yn cofio bod y cynigion yn cynnwys cynnydd o 60 i 80 o ACau a hynny, yn ei dro, yn golygu newid yn y system bleidleisio i bleidlais sengl drosglwyddadwy, yn ogystal â newid ffiniau i gynnwys etholaethau o 80 o ACau. Os dyna sydd o dan sylw, mae'n newid mawr iawn—y math o newid sy'n syrffedu pobl yn llwyr. Credaf y dylem fod yn ymwneud â rhywbeth ymarferol sydd lawer yn fwy cydnaws â barn pobl Cymru.

**Michael German:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y datganiad, er fy mod wedi drysu ychydig ynglŷn â'ch agwedd at refferenda, oherwydd ymddengys i mi eich bod yn awgrymu bod refferenda yn rhywbeth drwg na ddylid eu defnyddio'n ormodol, os o gwbl. Efallai i hyn liwio'ch barn ar y mater cyfan, ac efallai yr hoffech egluro'r agwedd honno.

Pan sefydlwyd comisiwn Richard gennym, y syniad oedd y byddai'n pennu cyfeiriad inni er mwyn i'r Cynulliad ymdrin â'r rhanian buddiannau rhwng Senedd San Steffan a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Lluniodd farn glir, gan gynnig proses dau gam. Cam 1 yw y byddai'r Cynulliad hwn yn cynyddu gallu—ac yr oeddech yn fy atgoffa ichi ateb cwestiynau ar y mater ddoe—a'r ail gam yw y byddai pwerau deddfu llawn yn cael eu trosglwyddo i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Pennwyd amserlen: 2007 ar gyfer cam 1, 2011 ar gyfer cam 2.

Ymddengys i mi mai'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd gyda'r rhwystr hud yr ydych wedi llwyddo i'w gynnwys yn y Papur Gwyn hwn, ac y byddaf yn ei drafod ymhen ychydig, yw nad yw'r map sy'n pennu cyfeiriad yn mynd ymlaen. Daw i ben gydag atalnod llawn dramatig ar ddiwedd proses cam 1. Y rheswm pam mae'n dod i ben gyda'r atalnod llawn hwnnw yw eich bod wedi creu rhwystr anferthol. Gofynnaf ichi gofio am refferenda'r 1970au. Gwyddoch i'r



from the UK Parliament put in an artificial hurdle of two-thirds support. What did that do for the Scottish referendum, and the referendum and campaign for a proper parliament for Wales? It put the campaign back over 20 years. Two decades passed before the issue came to pass.

So, what we are to believe from the proposal in this White Paper is that we have stage 1, but, because of the hurdle that you have put in place—a hurdle that, in fact, means that, unless the Welsh Labour Party agrees to it, we are not going anywhere—we may be faced with nothing but your stage 1 proposals for decades to come. Admittedly, you have gone further in your stage 1 proposal than Richard proposed, and I welcome those moves. The period from 2007-2011 should and could be an exciting period for the Assembly, when it should be gearing itself up for the 2011 transfer that the Richard commission proposed.

Let us look at that second part of your proposal for 2007, and the proposal to use Orders in Council. Can you tell me what the paragraph on the breadth of Orders that could be proposed means? It is clear to me that you could have a situation in which the Secretary of State would not put forward an Order in Council if he believed it to be too broad. If 'breadth' means that you could legislate for any area concerned with, for example, restructuring the health service, or re-organising the education service in Wales in whichever way you wanted, we would clearly have the ability to write the legislation akin to primary legislation in another name in that period of time. If, however, the 'breadth' was written narrowly, in the terms of 'can produce an older person's commissioner for Wales', we are clearly talking about a much narrower definition of those powers. Therefore, clarity on what 'the breadth of Orders' means and how Parliament would deal with that request is essential. I would value your view on that matter.

In respect of the Alun Pugh/Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey unemployment

refferendwm yn yr Alban fethu bryd hynny oherwydd i ASau yn Senedd y DU gynnwys rhwystr artiffisial o gefnogaeth gan ddwy ran o dair. Beth wnaeth hynny i'r refferendwm yn yr Alban a'r refferendwm a'r ymgyrch dros senedd iawn i Gymru? Yr oedd yn gam yn ôl o 20 mlynedd yn yr ymgyrch. Aeth dau ddegawd heibio cyn ymdrin â'r mater.

Felly, yr hyn yr ydym i'w gredu o'r cynnig yn y Papur Gwyn hwn yw bod gennym gam 1. Ond oherwydd y rhwystr yr ydych wedi'i gynnwys—rhwystr sy'n golygu, mewn gwirionedd, oni fydd Plaid Lafur Cymru yn cytuno iddo, na fyddwn yn mynd i unman—mae'n bosibl cynigion cam 1 yn unig fydd yn ein hwynebu am ddegawdau i ddod. Yr ydych yn sicr wedi mynd ymhellach yn eich cynnig cam 1 na'r hyn a gynigiwyd gan Richard, a chroesawaf y cynigion hynny. Gallai'r cyfnod o 2007 i 2011 fod yn gyfnod cyffrous i'r Cynulliad, a dylai fod felly, pan ddylai fod yn ymbaratoi ar gyfer y trosglwyddiad yn 2011 a gynigiwyd gan gomisiwn Richard.

Gadewch inni edrych ar ail ran eich cynnig ar gyfer 2007, a'r cynnig i ddefnyddio Gorchmynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor. A allwch egluro wrthyf ystyr y paragraff ar ehangder y Gorchmynion y gellid eu cynnig? Mae'n amlwg imi y gallech wynebu sefyllfa lle na fyddai'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn cyflwyno Gorchmyn yn y Cyfrin Gyngor pe bai o'r farn ei fod yn rhy eang ei gwmpas. Os ystyr 'ehangder' yw y gallech ddeddfu ar gyfer unrhyw faes sy'n ymwneud, er enghraifft, ag ailstrwythuro'r gwasanaeth iechyd, neu ad-drefnu'r gwasanaeth addysg yng Nghymru ym mha ffordd bynnag a fynnwch, mae'n amlwg y byddai gennym y gallu i lunio'r ddeddfwriaeth yn debyg i ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol mewn enw arall yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, pe bae'r 'ehangder' yn cael ystyr gul, o ran 'gallu creu comisiynydd pobl hŷn i Gymru', yr ydym yn amlwg yn siarad am ddiffiniad llawer culach o'r pwerau hynny. Felly, mae eglurder am ystyr 'ehanger Gorchmynion' a'r modd y byddai'r Senedd yn ymdrin â'r cais hwnnw yn hanfodol. Byddem yn gwerthfawrogi eich barn am y mater hwnnw.

O ran cymal diweithdra Alun Pugh/Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey—ac wrth gwrs, rhaid

clause—and I must, of course, include Andrew Davies in this proposed unemployment clause, we believe that this is a spiteful way of dealing with it, simply because it is in the interests of only the Labour Party in Wales. Do you know that that proposal has been rejected by the Labour Party in Government in Scotland? That has been proposed and they have rejected it, so this is a proposal for Wales only, when Scotland has the same system. I noticed the difficulties that Peter Hain was having in answering questions from Scottish MPs on this matter. If the First Minister wants to see this system introduced, as he believes that it is absolutely essential to provide clarity, would it not be fair for him also to believe that that clarity was important for the Labour education Minister in Scotland, who was elected from the list having failed to win a constituency seat? Is it not also right for him? Perhaps you could tell your colleagues in Scotland whether it should be the same for them.

There are matters in your statement with which we broadly agree, First Minister. Obviously, the separation of the Executive and the legislature is an appropriate move, on which there is widespread agreement, as Nick Bourne has said. I find it slightly strange, however, that the new Standing Orders—and you referred to this in your statement—post 2007 are to be written by the Secretary of State. In your statement you proposed that he be advised by an Assembly committee. I commend that. That should be the case, but perhaps it should also be the case, as we will be able to amend them afterwards anyway, that they be written by the National Assembly in the first place. Perhaps you could explain to me the logic of having someone else write our Standing Orders when we have been in existence for that length of time. Of course, it would be perfectly appropriate for the Secretary of State to tell us the sort of things that he could enshrine in our Standing Orders to make them comply with the broader Government of Wales Acts that we will have in front of us.

In conclusion, it seems to me that the nature of the proposals in the White Paper has been hidebound by the needs and demands of

imi gynnwys Andrew Davies yn y cymal diweithdra hwn a gynigir—yr ydym o'r farn mai ffordd sbeityld yw hyn o ymdrin ag ef, dim ond am ei fod o fudd yn unig i'r Blaid Lafur yng Nghymru. A wyddech fod y cynnig hwnnw wedi ei wrthod gan y Blaid Lafur sydd mewn grym yn yr Alban? Cynigiwyd hynny, ac maent wedi'i wrthod. Felly, cynnig i Gymru yn unig yw hwn, pan fydd gan yr Alban yr un system. Sylwais ar y trafferthion yr oedd Peter Hain yn eu cael i ateb cwestiynau gan ASau o'r Alban ar y mater hwn. Os dymuna'r Prif Weinidog weld cyflwyno'r system hon, am ei fod o'r farn ei bod yn gwbl hanfodol i ddarparu eglurder, oni fyddai'n deg iddo hefyd gredu bod yr eglurder hwnnw'n bwysig i'r Gweinidog Addysg Llafur yn yr Alban, a etholwyd o'r rhestr ar ôl methu ag ennill sedd etholaethol? Onid yw'n iawn iddo yntau hefyd? Efallai y gallech ddweud wrth eich cyd-aelodau yn yr Alban a ddylid cael yr un peth ar eu cyfer hwy.

Mae materion yn eich datganiad yr ydym yn cytuno â hwy'n gyffredinol, Brif Weinidog. Wrth gwrs, mae gwahanu'r Weithrediaeth a'r ddeddfwrfa yn gam priodol, ac mae cytundeb cyffredinol arno, fel y dywedodd Nick Bourne. Fodd bynnag, credaf ei bod ychydig yn rhyfedd mai'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol fydd yn ysgrifennu'r Rheolau Sefydlog newydd ar ôl 2007—yr ydych wedi cyfeirio at hyn yn eich datganiad. Yn eich datganiad, yr oeddech yn cynnig y byddai pwyllgor o'r Cynulliad yn ei gynghori. Cymeradwyaf hynny. Felly y dylai fod. Ond efallai y dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol eu hysgrifennu yn y lle cyntaf, oherwydd bydd modd inni eu diwygio yn dilyn hynny beth bynnag. Efallai y gallech egluro'r rhesymeg dros gael rhywun arall i lunio ein Rheolau Sefydlog a ninnau wedi bod mewn bodolaeth yr holl amser hwnnw. Wrth gwrs, byddai'n gwbl briodol i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ddweud wrthym am y math o bethau y gallai eu hymgorffori yn ein Rheolau Sefydlog, i sicrhau eu bod yn cydymffurfio â Deddfau Llywodraeth Cymru ehangach a fydd o'n blaenau.

Wrth gloi, ymddengys imi fod natur y cynigion yn y Papur Gwyn wedi bod yn gaeth i anghenion a galwadau'r bobl hynny a oedd

those people who were sitting behind Peter Hain when he made his statement this morning, namely the Labour backbench Members of Parliament for Wales. I suspect that what we have seen today, instead of your ambition of primary legislative powers, the ambition of the Richard commission and what I believe was the ambition of Peter Hain underneath it all, is a surrender to the white flag that has been shown to be the Labour Members of Parliament on the backbenches at Westminster.

**The First Minister:** I do not agree with that last point at all. I think that it is an easy criticism to make. If you cannot think of an actual criticism, you simply say that this is in Labour's interests. We heard the same contradiction in what you were trying to say about not allowing people to hedge their bets by standing both on the list and for first-past-the-post seats. At one and the same time, you said that it would cause Alun Pugh, Andrew Davies and Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey to become unemployed, but then you said that it was only in the interests of the Labour Party—both those propositions simply cannot be true.

On the issue of Standing Orders, I think that you may have slightly misunderstood my point. The description that I gave was of the White Paper, but we do not want to exclude the possibility of returning to this issue during the four-month consultation period. I think that there is quite widespread support for the logic of what you say, while it is clear that, if we totally fail to write Standing Orders, the Secretary of State would need some sort of fall-back powers to ensure that we have got some to kick off with. This would be a new Government of Wales Act, and we simply would not be able to use our existing Standing Orders. We can come back to the issue of whether they should be written by us or by the Secretary of State. I think that we probably have to agree—it is almost like the big bang theory of the universe—that there must be some starting Standing Orders if we fail to create them pretty quickly. Therefore, you must have some sort of fall-back power for the Secretary of State. At least, that is my view and I am sure that we can come back to that over the next four months.

yn eistedd y tu ôl i Peter Hain wrth iddo wneud ei ddatganiad y bore yma, sef Aelodau Seneddol Llafur y meinciau cefn o Gymru. Yr wyf yn amau mai'r hyn a welsom heddiw, yn hytrach na'ch uchelgais chi o gael pwerau deddfu sylfaenol, uchelgais comisiwn Richard a'r hyn a gredaf oedd uchelgais Peter Hain yn sail i'r cyfan, yw ildio i'r faner wen, sef Aelodau Seneddol Llafur y meinciau cefn yn San Steffan.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chytunaf â'r pwynt olaf hwnnw o gwbl. Credaf ei bod yn feirniadaeth hawdd ei gwneud. Os na allwch feddwl am feirniadaeth go iawn, yr ydych yn dweud mai er lles i Lafur mae hyn. Clywsom yr un math o wrth-ddweud yn yr hyn yr oeddech yn ceisio'i ddweud ynglŷn ag atal pobl rhag ceisio ennill bob ffordd drwy sefyll ar y rhestr ac ar gyfer seddau yn system y cyntaf i'r felin. Ar yr un pryd, dyweddech y byddai'n golygu y byddai Alun Pugh, Andrew Davies a Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey yn ddi-waith, ond yna yr oeddech yn dweud mai er lles i'r Blaid Lafur yn unig oedd hynny—ni all y ddau gynnig hynny fod yn wir.

O ran Rheolau Sefydlog, credaf efallai eich bod wedi camddeall fy mhwynt ryw ychydig. Disgrifiad o'r Papur Gwyn a roddais, ond nid ydym am eithrio'r posibilrwydd o ddychwelyd at y mater hwn yn ystod y cyfnod ymgynghori o bedwar mis. Credaf fod cefnogaeth eithaf cyffredinol i resymeg yr hyn a ddyweddech, er ei bod yn glir y byddai angen rhyw fath o bwerau wrth gefn ar yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol i sicrhau bod gennym rywbeth i ddechrau gydag ef os byddwn yn methu'n llwyr â llunio Rheolau Sefydlog. Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru newydd fyddai hon, ac ni fyddai modd inni ddefnyddio ein Rheolau Sefydlog presennol. Gallwn dychwelyd at y cwestiwn ai ni neu'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol a ddylai eu hysgrifennu. Credaf fod yn rhaid inni gytuno, fwy na thebyg—mae'n debyg i ddamcaniaeth y glec fawr o ran y bydysawd—fod yn rhaid cael rhai Rheolau Sefydlog i ddechrau os byddwn yn methu â'u creu'n lled gyflym. Felly, rhaid ichi gael rhyw fath o bŵer wrth gefn ar gyfer yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol. O leiaf, dyna fy marn i ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn ddychwelyd at y mater hwnnw dros y

pedwar mis nesaf.

You made some points about Scotland. Again, this is an area of huge concern in Scotland at the moment and they have the Arbuthnott commission looking at all areas relating to future voting systems. Some interesting submissions have been made by the mainstream parties.

You made a point about the breadth or narrowness of the Assembly's legislative powers; if we vote on them, Parliament agrees them through Orders in Council. How broad or narrow could they be? It is important to understand that, on the one hand, Parliament can refuse to give us those powers, but, on the other, if it does give us those powers, they will go wider than Henry VIII powers; they are Charles III powers, if you like, not Henry VIII powers.

4.10 p.m.

They do not look back; they look forward, and they involve the ability to make new provision, as well as to amend existing legislation. However, the price for that is that Parliament can refuse to do it, so, to some extent, there would clearly be a lot of informal discussions at all times. If you do get them, they are as broad or as narrow as whatever you can negotiate with Parliament. Once you have them, they are incremental, because they would gradually build up quite an extensive area of freedom to manoeuvre for the Assembly. It is a deal, and it is a matter of striking a new bargain on who does what between Parliament and the Assembly.

You mentioned the question of the hurdle of a two-thirds majority in favour. Activating the referendum provision requires a degree of cross-party consensus here. You see it as Labour having a power of veto, but I do not see it that way at all. It is simply a matter of what is reasonable to activate a fairly major piece of constitutional change. People have different views on that. You want to go back to 1979, and you asked me about my views on referenda. As I have mentioned before, I do not like referenda because they are

Gwnaethoch rai pwyntiau ynglŷn â'r Alban. Unwaith eto, mae hwn yn faes sy'n peri pryder mawr yn yr Alban ar hyn o bryd, ac mae comisiwn Arbuthnott yno yn edrych ar bob maes sy'n ymwneud â systemau pleidleisio yn y dyfodol. Gwnaed rhai cynigion diddorol gan y pleidiau prif ffrwd.

Gwnaethoch bwynt ynglŷn ag ehangder neu gulni pwerau deddfu'r Cynulliad; os byddwn yn pleidleisio arnynt, bydd y Senedd yn cytuno arnynt drwy Orchmynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor. Pa mor eang neu gyfyng allai'r rheiny fod? Mae'n bwysig deall, ar y naill law, y gall y Senedd wrthod rhoi'r pwerau hynny inni. Ond ar y llaw arall, os bydd yn rhoi'r pwerau hynny inni, byddant yn mynd y tu hwnt i bwerau Harri'r VIII; pwerau Siarl III ydynt, os dymunwch, nid pwerau Harri'r VIII.

Nid ydynt yn edrych yn ôl; maent yn edrych ymlaen, ac maent yn cynnwys y gallu i wneud darpariaethau newydd yn ogystal â diwygio deddfwriaeth bresennol. Fodd bynnag, y pris sydd i'w dalu am hynny yw'r ffaith y gall y Senedd wrthod gwneud hynny. Felly, i ryw raddau mae'n amlwg y byddai llawer o drafodaethau anffurfiol yn digwydd bob amser. Os cewch y pwerau, gallant fod mor eang neu mor gul ag unrhyw beth y gallwch ei negodi gyda'r Senedd. Pan fydd y pwerau hyn gennyh, maent yn gynyddol, oherwydd byddent yn graddol yn crynhoi maes digon helaeth o ryddid i'r Cynulliad drin a thrafod. Dêl yw hyn, ac mae'n fater o daro bargaen newydd o ran pwy sy'n gwneud beth rhwng y Senedd a'r Cynulliad.

Yr oeddech yn crybwyll cwestiwn y rhwystr o fwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair o blaid. Mae gweithredu'r ddarpariaeth refferendwm yn gofyn am rywfaint o gonsensws ar draws y pleidiau yn y fan hon. Yr ydych yn ei weld fel pŵer fetu i Lafur, ond nid wyf yn ei weld fel hynny o gwbl. Yn syml, mae'n fater o'r hyn sy'n rhesymol i weithredu darn digon pwysig o newid cyfansoddiadol. Mae gan bobl farn wahanol am hynny. Yr ydych am ddychwelyd i 1979, ac yr oeddech yn gofyn fy marn am refferenda. Fel yr wyf wedi'i

normally confined to constitutional change. I remember canvassing for the 'yes' side in Barry Island in 1979—I was a civil servant, so I could not do too much—and I recall the overwhelming sense when you knocked on doors in Dinas Powys and Barry was that people were utterly bored by it. They said, 'Why are you asking us this?', and they thought that it was a very boring question to be asked. You have a real problem with turnout, and people do not really vote on the constitutional questions that they are being asked. You do not ask them non-constitutional questions, but those are the questions that they want to be asked, and they are waiting for a general election.

The most important question that you asked was about making an adverse comparison with the Richard commission proposals. In some ways, what we have here is much better in that it is not the two-stage process referred to in those proposals, and which you mentioned. I welcome your support for the fact that the first stage is now bigger and better because it involves Orders in Council being wider than envisaged in the Richard proposals. The first stage is activated straight away—as of today. The framework legislation for all future parliamentary legislation within devolved fields on an England and Wales basis will have an in-built framework component. So, there are really three stages. The first is framework legislation, which is activated straight away; the second stage is Orders in Council, but subject to the Bill; and, subject to a referendum, a third stage happens at whatever point the Assembly can muster a majority of two thirds to activate the post-legislative referendum.

**Leighton Andrews:** Many of us on all sides of the Chamber were proud to have been involved in the referendum campaign in 1997, which delivered a 'yes' vote for devolution. However, it is Welsh Labour that has delivered the National Assembly for Wales; it is Welsh Labour that is now strengthening the powers of the Assembly

grybwyll o'r blaen, nid wyf yn hoff o refferenda oherwydd maent fel rheol yn gyfyngedig i newid cyfansoddiadol. Cofiaf ganfasio dros yr ochr 'ie' yn Ynys y Barri yn 1979—yr oeddwn yn was sifil, felly, ni allwn wneud llawer—a chofiaf y teimlad llethol, wrth gnocio drysau yn Ninas Powys a'r Barri, fod pobl wedi diflasu'n llwyr ganddo. Yr oeddent yn gofyn, 'Pam yr ydych yn gofyn hyn inni?', ac yr oeddent o'r farn ei fod yn gwestiwn diflas iawn i'w ofyn. Mae gennych broblem wirioneddol gyda'r niferoedd sy'n pleidleisio, ac mewn gwirionedd nid yw pobl yn pleidleisio ar y cwestiynau cyfansoddiadol a ofynnir iddynt. Ni fyddwch yn gofyn cwestiynau anghyfansoddiadol iddynt, ond y rheini yw'r cwestiynau y maent yn dymuno ichi eu gofyn, ac maent yn aros am etholiad cyffredinol.

Yr oedd y cwestiwn pwysicaf yn ymwneud â chymhariaeth anffafriol â chynigion comisiwn Richard. Mewn rhai ffyrdd, mae'r hyn sydd gennym dan sylw lawer yn well yn yr ystyr nad y broses dau gam ydyw, fel y cyfeirir ati yn y cynigion hynny a'r hyn a grybwyllwyd gennych chi. Croesawaf eich cefnogaeth i'r ffaith fod y cam cyntaf bellach yn fwy ac yn well oherwydd ei fod yn golygu bod Gorchmynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor yn ehangach na'r hyn a ragwelwyd yng nghynigion Richard. Caiff y cam cyntaf ei weithredu ar unwaith—o heddiw ymlaen. Bydd elfen fframwaith wedi'i hymgorffori yn y ddeddfwriaeth fframwaith ar gyfer yr holl ddeddfwriaeth seneddol yn y dyfodol yn y meysydd sydd wedi eu datganoli yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Felly, mae tri cham, mewn gwirionedd. Y cam cyntaf yw deddfwriaeth fframwaith a weithredir ar unwaith; yr ail gam yw Gorchmynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor, ond sy'n amodol ar y Mesur; ac, yn amodol ar refferendwm, mae trydydd cam yn digwydd pan all y Cynulliad sicrhau mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair i weithredu'r refferendwm ar ôl y ddeddfwriaeth.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr oedd nifer ohonom ar bob ochr i'r Siambr yn falch o fod yn gysylltiedig â'r ymgyrch refferendwm yn 1997, a sicrhodd bleidlais dros ddatganoli. Fodd bynnag, Llafur Cymru sydd wedi sicrhau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru; Llafur Cymru sydd yn awr yn cryfhau pwerau'r Cynulliad ac yn datblygu datganoli.

and taking devolution forward. First Minister, do you agree that the first stage proposals outlined today in the White Paper would operate faster than the first phase that the Richard commission proposed, and that the fast-track proposals go further than the Richard commission proposed? Do you also agree that the White Paper identifies a clear route map to primary powers for the Assembly, if backed by the Welsh people in a referendum, which will be set out in the new Government of Wales Act? Is this not evidence that Welsh Labour is the party of practical, effective and popular devolution for Wales?

**The First Minister:** I agree, and I am glad that you made that point because opposition parties have tried to pretend that Labour is in business to veto legislation. In fact, Labour is the only party that has delivered devolution. The first attempt in 1979 failed, but the second attempt in 1997 succeeded, and, this being in Labour's manifesto, on which we achieved a historic third term with a working majority a month ago, I have no doubt that it can also be delivered. It is a matter of democratic accountability to the electorate; we do what we say we will do on the tin, as it were. We put it to a conference; if we get a majority support in a conference, we put it in the manifesto; if we win a majority in the subsequent general election, we activate what we said we would in the manifesto. That is basis on which I trust that, not only the House of Commons, but the House of Lords—which has a different party composition—will accept that, under the Salisbury convention, they are not going to oppose the implementation of this principle and all the main things covered in Labour's manifesto commitment. It is exactly the same with women's equality.

It is true that this Assembly is gender balanced. It is gender balanced because of what Labour has done to bring about gender balance, and we have carried the burden on that, if you like. It is exactly the same for devolution; we do not think of it, we implement it.

**Y Llywydd:** Fel y bydd Aelodau wedi sylwi,

Brif Weinidog, a gytunwch y byddai cynigion y cam cyntaf a amlinellir heddiw yn y Papur Gwyn yn gweithredu'n gyflymach na'r cam cyntaf a gynigiwyd gan gomisiwn Richard, a bod y cynigion carlam yn mynd ymhellach na'r hyn a gynigiwyd gan gomisiwn Richard? A gytunwch hefyd fod y Papur Gwyn yn nodi llwybr clir i bwerau sylfaenol ar gyfer y Cynulliad, os bydd trigolion Cymru yn pleidleisio drostynt mewn refferendwm, a gaiff ei osod allan yn y Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru newydd? Onid yw hyn yn dystiolaeth mai Llafur Cymru yw plaid datganoli ymarferol, effeithiol a phoblogaidd i Gymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno, ac yr wyf yn falch ichi wneud y pwynt hwnnw am fod y gwrthbleidiau wedi ceisio creu'r argraff mai nod Llafur yw gosod fetu ar ddeddfwriaeth. Yn wir, Llafur yw'r unig blaid a sicrhodd ddatganoli. Methodd yr ymgais gyntaf yn 1979, ond llwyddodd yr ail ymgais yn 1997, ac oherwydd bod hyn ym maniffesto Llafur a sicrhodd drydydd tymor hanesyddol inni gyda mwyafrif ymarferol fis yn ôl, yr wyf yn gwbl hyderus y gellir sicrhau hyn hefyd. Mae'n fater o atebolrwydd democrataidd i'r etholwyr; yr ydym yn gweithredu yn ôl yr addewid, fel petai. Byddwn yn ei gyflwyno gerbron y gynhadledd; os cawn gefnogaeth gan y mwyafrif yn y gynhadledd, fe'i rhown yn y maniffesto; os enillwn fwyafrif yn yr etholiad cyffredinol yn dilyn hynny, gweithredwn ar yr hyn a addawyd yn y maniffesto. Hyderaf, ar sail hynny, y bydd nid yn unig Tŷ'r Cyffredin ond Tŷ'r Arglwyddi hefyd—sydd â chyfansoddiad pleidiau gwahanol—yn derbyn, o dan gonfensiwn Salisbury, na fyddant yn gwrthod gweithredu'r egwyddor hon a'r holl brif bethau sydd yn ymrwymiad maniffesto Llafur. Mae'r un peth yn union yn wir gyda chydarddoldeb i fenywod.

Mae'n wir fod cydbwysedd rhwng y ddau ryw yn y Cynulliad hwn. Mae yma gydbwysedd rhwng y ddau ryw oherwydd yw hyn y mae Llafur wedi'i wneud i sicrhau'r cydbwysedd hwnnw, ac yr ydym wedi cario'r baich am hynny. Yr un yw'r sefyllfa gyda datganoli; nid meddwl amdano a wnawn: yr ydym yn ei weithredu.

**The Presiding Officer:** As Members will

yr ydym wedi mynd dros yr amser ar gyfer y datganiad hwn. Felly, apelïaf i'r pum Aelod sydd yn weddill i ofyn cwestiynau cryno.

**Jocelyn Davies:** First Minister, the best test for your Orders in Council proposal is whether it will result in change that can withstand the icy wind that might blow from Westminster. You say that it will be robust, but does that not rather ignore the fact that you have been promising us broad framework legislation since 2000, and that, in five years, that has not happened once? These Orders in Council could be so narrowly drawn as to not allow the Assembly much discretion. Is this not, therefore, more about Labour avoiding the referendum that you know the people of Wales would vote for than about better governance?

**The First Minister:** No, and I do not agree with your analysis of the last five years. Higher education is a good point in case, as are the undertakings given with regard to smoking in the forthcoming Health Improvement and Protection Bill, which are exactly along the same lines. They will confer powers on the Assembly to make its own determination on smoking. With regard to your remarks about the principle of framework legislation, which is the stage 1, that is activated as of today, and then, for the design of all future England-and-Wales legislation, it will also make that a permanent character of Parliament, and how it frames England-and-Wales legislation. However, you are taking a negative view of what I said earlier about the comparison with Henry VIII powers. We always sought to ensure that, in the design of future framework legislation that did depend on the Bill, namely, the ability to confer the powers of Orders in Council, we should be regarded as a democratically elected body with its own scrutiny procedures and as rather more important than a Secretary of State having powers conferred through Henry VIII powers—and that is what we got. That is subject to the Secretary of State's having the right of veto, but, if the Secretary of State does not have the right of veto, or does not exercise that veto, then the powers here go

have noticed, we have exceeded the time for this statement. Therefore, I appeal to the remaining five Members to ask succinct questions.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Brif Weinidog, y prawf gorau ar gyfer eich cynnig am Orchmynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor yw a fydd yn arwain at newid sy'n gallu gwrthsefyll y gwrthwynebiad chwyrn a allai ddod o San Steffan. Dywedwch y bydd yn gadarn, ond onid yw hynny'n anwybyddu'r ffaith eich bod wedi addo deddfwriaeth fframwaith eang ers 2000, ac mewn pum mlynedd nad yw hynny wedi digwydd unwaith? Gallai'r Gorchmynion hyn yn y Cyfrin Gyngor gael eu llunio mor gul fel na fyddent yn rhoi llawer o ryddid i'r Cynulliad. Onid oes a wnelo hyn, felly, yn fwy â Llafur yn osgoi'r refferendwm y gwyddoch y byddai pobl Cymru yn pleidleisio drosto, nag â llywodraethu gwell?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nac oes, ac ni chytunaf â'ch dadansoddiad o'r pum mlynedd diwethaf. Mae addysg uwch yn enghraifft dda, yn ogystal â'r addewidion a roddwyd o ran ysmegu yn y Mesur arfaethedig ar Wella a Diogelu Iechyd sydd ar hyd yr un llinellau'n union. Byddant yn rhoi pwerau i'r Cynulliad i wneud ei benderfyniad ei hun ar ysmegu. O ran eich sylwadau ar egwyddor deddfwriaeth fframwaith, sef cam 1, a gaiff ei weithredu o heddiw ymlaen, ac wedyn ar gyfer llunio'r holl ddeddfwriaeth yng Nghymru a Lloegr yn y dyfodol, bydd hefyd yn gwneud hynny'n nodwedd barhaol o'r Senedd, a sut y mae'n llunio deddfwriaeth yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn arddel barn negyddol am yr hyn a ddywedais yn gynharach ynglŷn â'r gymhariaeth â phwerau Harri VIII. Yr ydym bob amser wedi ceisio sicrhau, wrth lunio deddfwriaeth fframwaith yn y dyfodol sy'n ddibynnol ar y Mesur, sef y gallu i roi pwerau Gorchmynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor, ein bod yn cael ein hystyried fel corff wedi ei ethol yn ddemocrataidd ac sydd â'i weithdrefnau craffu ei hun ac ychydig yn bwysicach nag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol sydd â phwerau wedi'u trosglwyddo drwy bwerau Harri VIII—a dyna'r hyn a gawsom. Mae hynny'n amodol ar yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn cael hawl fetu, ond os na chaiff yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol hawl fetu, neu os na fydd yn arfer y

further than Henry VIII powers. Henry VIII powers enable you to modify existing primary legislation to bring it into line with other primary legislation, and this proposal enables you to make new provision, as well as to do that. The proposal does, therefore, go further than Henry VIII powers, but it is subject to a parliamentary veto. Therefore you are giving away one bit, but you are gaining a lot more in return. If you read the White Paper again in greater detail, I think that you will accept that what I have said is the view that lawyers will hold with regard to what powers or rights are contained within the paper for the Assembly in the future.

**David Melding:** I will not pass any judgment as to whether these proposals will deliver enhanced legislative functions, but should they do so, do you agree that we must look at what is called the 'committee stage' of legislation in the Westminster system, and that Assembly committees will have to focus much more on the detail of legislation that comes before them?

**The First Minister:** It is a matter of line-by-line scrutiny. I entirely agree with that. It is not for me to determine Assembly procedures, particularly ones that will primarily involve backbenchers, if you like, and it will be of particular interest to opposition parties to ensure that we in the Government do not get away with anything and do not produce legislation that is not well-drafted. The art of line-by-line scrutiny will have to evolve, and I think that it will evolve in such a way as to make this place more exciting.

**Kirsty Williams:** Is it your intention to include a definition of 'local' in your Bill? Unless you do, the new system will not prevent hardworking list Members from calling themselves local Members. Also, can you explain to my constituents whether proposals banning smoking in public places and abolishing council tax could be delivered under your system? What is important to our constituents is what they will get from this new development. If we will not be able to ban smoking in public places, axe council tax

feto hwnnw, yna bydd y pwerau hyn yn mynd ymhellach na phwerau Harri VIII. Mae pwerau Harri VIII yn eich galluogi i addasu deddfwriaeth sylfaenol bresennol i sicrhau ei bod yn unol â deddfwriaeth sylfaenol arall, ac mae'r cynnig hwn yn eich galluogi i wneud darpariaeth newydd, yn ogystal â gwneud hynny. Mae'r cynnig, felly, yn mynd ymhellach na phwerau Harri VIII, ond mae'n amodol ar feto seneddol. Felly, yr ydych yn ildio un darn, ond yr ydych yn ennill llawer mwy. Os darllenwch y Papur Gwyn eto'n fanylach, credaf y byddwch yn derbyn bod yr hyn a ddywedais yn adlewyrchu'r farn a fydd gan gyfreithwyr am y pwerau neu'r hawliau a gynhwysir yn y papur ar gyfer y Cynulliad yn y dyfodol.

**David Melding:** Nid wyf am farnu a fydd cynigion hyn yn darparu swyddogaethau deddfwriaethol gwell neu beidio. Ond pe baent yn gwneud hynny, a gytunwch fod yn rhaid inni edrych ar yr hyn a elwir yn 'gam pwyllgor' y ddeddfwriaeth yn system San Steffan, ac y bydd yn rhaid i bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad ganolbwyntio'n fanylach o lawer ar fanylion y ddeddfwriaeth a ddaw ger ei fron?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n fater o graffu fesul llinell. Cytunaf yn llwyr â hynny. Nid fy nghyfrifoldeb i yw pennu gweithdrefnau'r Cynulliad, yn enwedig y rhai a fydd yn cynnwys y meinciau cefn yn bennaf, os hoffech. A bydd o ddiddordeb arbennig i'r gwrthbleidiau sicrhau nad ydym ni yn y Llywodraeth yn cael gwneud fel y mynnwn ac nad ydym yn cynhyrchu deddfwriaeth sydd heb ei drafftio'n dda. Bydd yn rhaid i'r grefft o graffu fesul llinell ddatblygu, a chredaf y bydd yn datblygu yn y fath fodd fel y bydd yn gwneud y lle hwn yn fwy cyffrous.

**Kirsty Williams:** A ydych yn bwriadu cynnwys diffiniad o 'lleol' yn eich Mesur? Oni wnewch hynny, ni fydd y system newydd yn atal Aelodau rhestr diwyd rhag cyfeirio at eu hunain fel Aelodau lleol. Hefyd, a allwch egluro wrth fy etholwyr a ellid cyflwyno cynigion i wahardd ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus ac i ddileu'r dreth gyngor o dan eich system? Yr hyn sy'n bwysig i'n hetholwyr yw'r hyn y byddant yn ei gael yn sgîl y datblygiad newydd hwn. Os na allwn wahardd ysmegu mewn mannau



or undertake other such measures, then it is all a waste of time.

**The First Minister:** I mentioned in answer to Jocelyn that we are absolutely confident that the Health Improvement and Protection Bill, which we expect to see published quite soon, will be on a framework basis. That is, it will confer the power to determine on the issue of banning smoking in enclosed public places on the National Assembly for Wales.

4.20 p.m.

I had better write to you about the abolition of council tax—that is an interesting one—because I am not absolutely certain about that. We are awaiting the report of the Lyons review in December, which may propose replacing council tax with local income tax. I deprecate the Liberal Democrat habit of referring to the abolition of one tax, without referring to the fact that a new tax must be introduced to replace it, otherwise there will be no local government expenditure. The elections are over now, Kirsty. It might be to our convenience for it to be done in one Bill, and for us to have through that a power to keep council tax, to abolish it and replace it with a local income tax, or to have a hybrid system. We might want to do that separately in Wales, or do exactly the same as in England.

You make an interesting point about local Assembly Members. List AMs who have not stood in a constituency may be able to call themselves local AMs, but the candidates who were defeated in a constituency election will not. The confusion that currently exists in the elector's mind, because he or she thought someone defeated, so how can that person be the local AM, and who really is the local AM, will cease, and I think that will be of enormous benefit to confused local electors, who do ask who their local AM actually is.

**Carl Sargeant:** Proportional representation leads to extremist and minority parties being elected with as little as 5 per cent of the

cyhoeddus, dileu'r dreth gyngor neu ymgymryd â mesurau eraill o'r fath, yna mae'r cyfan yn wastraff amser.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Soniais yn fy ateb i Jocelyn ein bod yn gwbl hyderus y bydd y Mesur Gwella a Diogelu Iechyd, y disgwyliwn iddo gael ei gyhoeddi yn weddol fuan, ar sail fframwaith. Hynny yw, bydd yn trosglwyddo'r pŵer i benderfynu ar wahardd ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus caeedig i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

Byddai'n well imi ysgrifennu atoch ynglŷn â dileu'r dreth gyngor—mae hwnnw'n fater diddorol—oherwydd nid wyf yn gwbl sicr ynglŷn â hynny. Yr ydym yn disgwyl adroddiad adolygiad Lyons ym mis Rhagfyr, a allai gynnig disodli'r dreth gyngor gan dreth incwm leol. Yr wyf yn gresynu at arfer y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol o gyfeirio at ddileu un dreth heb gyfeirio at y ffaith fod yn rhaid cyflwyno treth newydd yn ei lle. Os na wneir hynny, ni fydd unrhyw wariant gan lywodraeth leol. Mae'r etholiadau drosodd erbyn hyn, Kirsty. Efallai y byddai'n gyfleus i ni pe bai'n cael ei wneud mewn un Mesur, ac i ni, drwy hynny, gael pŵer i gadw'r dreth gyngor, ei diddymu a'i disodli gan threth incwm leol, neu gael system gymysg. Efallai y byddem am wneud hynny ar wahân yng Nghymru, neu wneud yn union yr un fath â Lloegr.

Mae gennych bwynt diddorol ynglŷn ag Aelodau lleol y Cynulliad. Hwyrach y gall ACau rhestr nad ydynt wedi sefyll mewn etholaeth alw eu hunain yn ACau lleol, ond ni all yr ymgeiswyr sydd wedi eu trechu mewn etholiad etholaethol wneud hynny. Mae dryswch ar hyn o bryd ym meddwl yr etholwr, oherwydd ei fod ef neu hi'n meddwl bod rhywun wedi'i drechu, felly sut gall y person hwnnw fod yn AC lleol, a phwy yw'r AC lleol mewn gwirionedd. Ond bydd y dryswch hwnnw'n dod i ben, a chredaf y bydd hynny o fudd enfawr i etholwyr lleol sydd mewn penbleth, sy'n gofyn pwy yw eu AC mewn gwirionedd.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol yn arwain at ethol pleidiau eithafol a lleiafrifol gyda chyn lleied â 5 y cant o'r

vote—those are not my words, but the words of Oliver Heald MP, the Tory shadow secretary for constitutional affairs. Is it not about time that a change was made to our voting system? In the Scottish Parliament, regional Members and list Members are clearly defined, and defined differently from first-past-the-post Members.

**The First Minister:** You are being unfair to the Conservative Party: that was its policy on Monday—it has probably changed since then.

The White Paper proposes a minor change in the proportional representation system to try to prevent confusion in the minds of the electorate as to who was elected and who was defeated. We have heard many passionate speeches on this—most often from Peter Law—and I have listened to them with great enjoyment. However, this is a minimal change to clarify the proportional representation system that we have for the Assembly.

**Peter Law:** I welcome the White Paper. It contains what the Labour Party and Peter Hain said it would last year. I do not see it as a glass half empty; it is half full. We should not damn it with faint praise. It is a move forward for Wales as far as devolution is concerned, and I say that as someone who has supported devolution since 1979. As I am now a Member in another place, I will do all I can there to enhance the powers of the National Assembly.

I am pleased that there will be legislative separation, and that people such as Deputy Ministers, who are nothing more than window dressing, will get some kind of respect, because no-one can justify what they do at the moment.

I will ask about proportional representation, which you have just referred to, about which I have spoken many times, and which I believe is a perversion of democracy. Although I do not believe that people should be elected to the Assembly through the back door—I would never support that—would you agree that the rejection of the Richard commission's suggestion of the single transferable vote is in the interests of Wales?

bledlais—nid fy ngeiriau i yw'r rheini, ond geiriau Oliver Heald AS, darpar ysgrifennydd y Toriaid dros faterion cyfansoddiadol. Onid yw'n amser newid ein system bleidleisio? Yn Senedd yr Alban caiff Aelodau rhanbarthol ac Aelodau rhestr eu diffinio'n glir, a'u diffinio'n wahanol i Aelodau y cyntaf i'r felin.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn bod yn annheg wrth y Blaid Geidwadol: dyna oedd ei pholisi ddydd Llun—mae'n siŵr ei fod wedi newid ers hynny.

Mae'r Papur Gwyn yn cynnig newid bach yn y system cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol i geisio atal y dryswch ym meddyliau'r etholwyr o ran pwy sydd wedi eu hethol a phwy sydd wedi eu trechu. Clywsom nifer o areithiau angerddol ar hyn—gan Peter Law gan amlaf—a gwrandewais arnynt gyda chrym foddhad. Fodd bynnag, newid bach yw hwn i egluro'r system gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol sydd gennym ar gyfer y Cynulliad.

**Peter Law:** Croesawaf y Papur Gwyn. Mae'n cynnwys yr hyn y dywedodd y Blaid Lafur a Peter Hain y byddent yn ei gynnwys y llynedd. Nid wyf yn ystyried mai gwydr hanner gwag sydd yma; mae'n hanner llawn. Ni ddylem ei lasganmol. Mae'n gam ymlaen i Gymru o ran datganoli, a dywedaf hynny fel rhywun sydd wedi cefnogi datganoli er 1979. Gan fy mod bellach yn Aelod mewn lle arall, gwnaf bopeth o fewn fy ngallu i wella pwerau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Yr wyf yn falch y bydd gwahaniad deddfwriaethol, ac y caiff pobl megis Dirprwy Weinidogion, sy'n gwneud mân dasgau yn unig, ryw fath o barch oherwydd ni all unrhyw un gyfiawnhau'r hyn a wnânt ar hyn o bryd.

Byddaf yn holi ynghylch cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol, fel yr ydych newydd gyfeirio ato. Yr wyf wedi siarad am hyn droeon, a chredaf ei fod yn gwyrdroi democratiaeth. Er na chredaf y dylid ethol pobl i'r Cynulliad drwy'r drws cefn—ni fyddwn byth yn cefnogi hynny—a fyddech yn cytuno bod gwrthod awgrym comisiwn Richard ynglŷn â'r bleidlais dros glwyddadwy sengl yn llesol i Gymru? Gwn eich bod wedi cefnogi

I know that you have always been a big supporter of proportional representation, so I would be interested to hear that you are totally on-side and that we will not see the concoction that was suggested of multi-constituencies, which are totally divorced from the reality of being close to the people whom we are supposed to represent.

**The First Minister:** As ever, Peter, we are grateful for your support, whenever we get it. I agree that now is not the time for faint praise—it is the time for trying to get a clear understanding of what is on offer to the people of Wales by striking this new bargain between Parliament and the Assembly.

On proportional representation, I have never been a supporter of the single transferable vote, and the proportional system that we introduced for the Assembly has one great virtue, given the political history of Wales during the past 50 to 70 years. The reason that we went for the particular model that we did in the Government of Wales Act 1998, and the White Paper in 1997, was that we did not want to enshrine Labour in power permanently. We wanted to leave it in the hands of the electorate to determine what the character of the majority in this body is to be. You always have to leave that in the hands of the electorate. In Scotland, sadly, that has not happened. Scotland knows that there will be a Labour-Liberal Democrat coalition until hell freezes over. Here, we can get a majority mandate—at least we thought that we had one—but what is important is that, when people vote here, it is in the hands of the electorate whether to give or deny Labour a majority. The list system is very carefully balanced, like a clockwork mechanism, so that you can have a majority Government, coalition Government or a minority Government, as we have now, according to what the voters say. That is a very important principle. You want to leave to the electorate the verdict as to who will be running this Assembly in its name. Permanent coalitions, such as that in Scotland, remove choice from the electorate, in effect.

**Glyn Davies:** I welcome the proposal for the formal separation of the Assembly

cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol o'r cychwyn, felly byddai gennyf ddiddordeb clywed eich bod o blaid un ochr yn llwyr ac na fyddwn yn gweld y gymysgedd a awgrymwyd o aml-etholaethau, sy'n gwbl wahanol i'r realiti o fod yn agos at y bobl yr ydym i fod i'w cynrychioli.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fel erioed, Peter, yr ydym yn ddiolchgar am eich cefnogaeth, pryd bynnag y'i cawn. Cytunaf nad nawr yw'r amser i lasganmol—nawr yw'r amser i geisio cael dealltwriaeth glir o'r hyn sydd ar gael i bobl Cymru drwy sicrhau'r fargen newydd hon rhwng y Senedd a'r Cynulliad.

O ran cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol, ni fûm erioed yn un o gefnogwyr y bleidlais drosglwyddadwy sengl, ac mae gan y system gyfrannol a gyflwynwyd gennym ar gyfer y Cynulliad un rhinwedd fawr, o ystyried hanes gwleidyddol Cymru yn ystod y 50 i 70 mlynedd diwethaf. Y rheswm inni benderfynu ar y model arbennig yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a'r Papur Gwyn yn 1997, oedd nad oeddem am gadw Llafur mewn pŵer yn barhaol. Yr oeddem am i'r etholwyr benderfynu beth fyddai cymeriad y mwyafrif yn y corff hwn. Rhaid ichi roi'r penderfyniad hwnnw yn nwylo'r etholwyr bob amser. Yn yr Alban, yn anffodus, ni ddigwyddodd hynny. Gŵyr yr Alban y bydd clymblaid rhwng Llafur a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol tan Ddydd y Farn. Yma, gallwn gael mandad mwyafrifol—o leiaf yr oeddem yn meddwl bod un gennym—ond yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw, pan fydd pobl yn pleidleisio yma, cyfrifoldeb yr etholwyr yw penderfynu a ddylid rhoi neu wrthod rhoi mwyafrif i'r blaid Lafur. Mae'r system rhestr wedi'i chydwyso'n ofalus, fel peirianwaith cloc, er mwyn gallu cael Llywodraeth fwafrifol, Llywodraeth glymblaid neu Lywodraeth leiafrifol, fel sydd gennym yn awr, yn ôl yr hyn a ddywed y pleidleiswyr. Mae hynny'n egwyddor bwysig iawn. Yr ydych am ganiatau i'r etholwyr benderfynu pwy fydd yn rhedeg y Cynulliad hwn yn eu henw. Mae clymbleidiau parhaol, fel sydd yn yr Alban, yn mynd â dewis allan o ddwylo'r etholwyr, i bob diben.

**Glyn Davies:** Croesawaf y cynnig i wahanu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r Cynulliad ei hun

Government and the Assembly by ending the Assembly's corporate structure. The White Paper makes reference to law-making powers over devolved areas as a long-term objective, and to there being a stage in achieving that objective. I have made it clear that I support that long-term objective of a law-making Assembly as the only way to create true accountability for the Government in the National Assembly. I have done this recognising that not everybody in my party agrees with that and I have felt that it has required a degree of personal courage to stand up and state that view. Will you tell us what your view is on achieving that long-term objective of having full law-making powers for this Assembly?

**The First Minister:** I think that the new system that we are proposing today will work extremely well. Whether, if it does not work that well, it will still set up a demand for primary legislative powers similar to those under the Scottish model, but without tax-varying powers and with or without Home Office and Lord Chancellor powers over the courts and prisons and so on—that is, the bits that are devolved in Scotland and that are not devolved here—I do not know. I cannot foretell the future. The important thing is to give this new system a running chance to see what we can make of it by striking a bargain with Parliament for a different division of labour between what it does and what we do as regards the people of Wales, and avoiding the logjam in every Queen's Speech. I think that that is the right way forward.

You asked for views, and you say that you have displayed a considerable amount of courage in expressing your view. From what Nick said—and I think that he was quite open about it—as far as we can tell, there is no Conservative view on devolution. That is why the Conservatives want a referendum: to see whether the people can solve this problem for them. He said that he is in favour of legislative powers, as you are, and that others are not. We heard a characteristic rant from David Davies about that earlier on, saying that not only should the Assembly not have law-making powers, it probably should not exist at all. In the end, parties have to have views. This is the view that our party

yn ffurfiol drwy ddod â strwythur corfforaethol y Cynulliad i ben. Mae'r Papur Gwyn yn cyfeirio at bwerau llunio deddfau dros feysydd sydd wedi eu datganoli fel amcan dros gyfnod hir, ac at y ffaith bod man penodol wrth gyflawni'r amcan hwnnw. Eglurais fy mod yn cefnogi'r amcan cyfnod hir o gael Cynulliad sy'n deddfu fel yr unig ffordd i greu atebolrwydd gwirioneddol i'r Llywodraeth yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Yr wyf wedi gwneud hyn gan gydnabod nad yw pawb yn fy mhlaid yn cytuno â hynny, a theimlwn fod angen rhywfaint o ddewrder personol i sefyll ar fy nhraed a mynegi'r farn honno. A ddywedwch wrthym beth yw eich barn chi ar gyflawni'r amcan hwnnw dros gyfnod hir o gael pwerau deddfu llawn ar gyfer y Cynulliad hwn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credaf y bydd y system newydd a gynigir gennym heddiw yn gweithio'n dda iawn. Os na fydd yn gweithio, ni wn a fydd yn parhau i greu galw am bwerau deddfu sylfaenol tebyg i'r rhai o dan batrwm yr Alban, ond heb bwerau amrywio trethi, a chyda neu heb bwerau'r Swyddfa Gartref a'r Arglwydd Ganghellor dros y llysoedd a'r carchardai, ac ati—hynny yw, y darnau sydd wedi eu datganoli yn yr Alban nad ydynt wedi eu datganoli yn y wlad hon. Ni allaf ragweld y dyfodol. Y peth pwysicaf yw inni roi cyfle i'r system newydd i weld beth y gallwn ei gyflawni drwy daro bargaen gyda'r Senedd i rannu'r gwaith yn wahanol rhwng yr hyn a wna'r Senedd a'r hyn a wnawn ni o ran pobl Cymru, gan osgoi'r dagfa ym mhob un o Areithiau'r Frenhines. Credaf mai dyna'r ffordd gywir ymlaen.

Yr oeddech yn gofyn am safbwyntiau, a dywedwch ichi ddangos cryn ddewrder wrth fynegi eich barn. O'r hyn a ddywedodd Nick—a chredaf iddo fod yn ddigon agored ynglŷn â hynny—hyd y gwyddom, nid oes barn gan y Ceidwadwyr ar ddatganoli. Dyna'r rheswm pam mae'r Ceidwadwyr am gael refferendwm: i weld a all y bobl ddatrys y broblem hon ar eu rhan. Dywedodd ei fod o blaid pwerau deddfu, fel chithau, ac nad yw eraill o'u plaid. Clywsom refru nodweddiadol gan David Davies ynglŷn â hynny yn gynharach, pan ddywedodd nid yn unig na ddylai'r Cynulliad gael pwerau deddfu, ond na ddylai fodoli o gwbl. Yn y pen draw, rhaid i bleidiau gael safbwyntiau. Dyma safbwynt

has come to, we have passed it through conference, and, more importantly, we put it in our manifesto. There is now a sacred duty on us to do what we said on the tin and deliver what we put in our manifesto.

ein plaid ni, ac mae wedi llwyddo yn y gynhadledd. Ond yn bwysicach, yr ydym wedi'i roi yn ein maniffesto. Erbyn hyn mae'n ddyletswydd gysegredig arnom i wneud yr hyn a addawyd a chyflawni'r hyn sydd yn ein maniffesto.

### **Mesur Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn (Cymru) The Commissioner for Older People (Wales) Bill**

**Y Llywydd:** Oherwydd yr amser a gymerwyd gan y busnes blaenorol, yr wyf yn gosod y terfynau amser arferol, sef 15 munud i'r rhai sydd yn agor a chloi'r ddadl, pum munud i'r rhai sydd yn cynnig gwelliannau a thri munud i siaradwyr eraill.

**The Presiding Officer:** Due to the time taken by the previous business, I am setting the usual time limits, namely 15 minutes for those opening and closing the debate, five minutes for those proposing amendments and three minutes for other speakers.

Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 3 a 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 5 a 6 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ni ddetholwyd gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

I have selected amendments 1, 3 and 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendments 5 and 6 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams has not been selected

**The Deputy Minister for Older People (John Griffiths):** I propose that

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Bobl Hŷn (John Griffiths):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. welcomes the Commissioner for the Older People (Wales) Bill, which was introduced in the House of Lords on 25 May 2005; and*

*1. yn croesawu Mesur Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn (Cymru) a gyflwynwyd yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi ar 25 Mai 2005; ac*

*2. endorses the commitment to establish a fully independent commissioner for older people in Wales. (NDM2485)*

*2. yn cymeradwyo'r ymrwymiad i sefydlu comisiynydd pobl hŷn cwbl annibynnol yng Nghymru. (NDM2485)*

4.30 p.m.

I will deal first with the proposed amendments to the motion. Amendments 1 and 5 want to note the Bill and commitment to establish a commissioner rather than welcoming the Bill and endorsing the commitment. We do not accept these amendments. This policy has been the subject of extensive consultation and overwhelming public support. The development of the policy for the Bill is based on previous discussions in Plenary, discussions of the Health and Social Services Committee, and, importantly, those of the expert advisory group as well as the responses to the public consultation on its report. The Bill and the commitment to establish a commissioner

Ymdriniaf yn gyntaf â'r gwelliannau arfaethedig yn y cynnig. Mae gwelliannau 1 a 5 am nodi'r Mesur a'r ymrwymiad i sefydlu comisiynydd, yn hytrach na chroesawu'r Mesur a chymeradwyo'r ymrwymiad. Ni dderbyniwn y gwelliannau hyn. Bu ymgynghori helaeth ar y polisi hwn ac fe'i cefnogwyd gan y mwyafrif llethol o'r cyhoedd. Mae'r broses o ddatblygu'r polisi ar gyfer y Mesur yn seiliedig ar drafodaethau blaenorol yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, trafodaethau'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus, ac yn bwysicach na dim, ar drafodaethau'r grŵp cynghori o arbenigwyr yn ogystal ag ymatebion i'r ymgynghori cyhoeddus ar ei adroddiad.

have undergone a thorough process of policy development, and they therefore deserve to be welcomed and endorsed by the Assembly today.

Jocelyn's amendment 4 expresses regret that there is no requirement in the Bill for the UK Government to respond to the commissioner or the Assembly on representations made on non-devolved matters. Kirsty's amendment 5 also specifies that the commissioner should have a locus in all non-devolved areas of policy, and requests that we make representations to our Westminster colleagues to this effect. We oppose both amendments. It is possible to make a case for a different role for the commissioner in terms of non-devolved issues, but the proposal in the Bill already enables the commissioner to make representations to the Assembly on any matter, including non-devolved issues. The Assembly already has powers to make representations to the UK Government on any issue affecting people in Wales.

**Jonathan Morgan:** You are right to point out that the Bill notes that the commissioner could make representations to the Assembly on non-devolved matters. The problem with the Bill is that, under section 14(2), the commissioner is not allowed to lay formal reports to the Assembly on such matters. That is where the real inconsistency lies, because there is no formal procedure. A representation may merely be a telephone call.

**John Griffiths:** Of course, these arrangements are similar to those relating to the Children's Commissioner for Wales, and, given the popular acclaim, they have worked well. The Wales Office's offer in terms of the commissioner for older people is the same as that that exists and has worked well in terms of the children's commissioner. The commissioner for older people would be able to go directly to the Wales Office and meet the Secretary of State for Wales or his parliamentary under-secretary to make representations and to raise issues. They would then be raised with the relevant UK Ministers and responses would come back. There is a concordat that governs the

Mae'r Mesur a'r ymrwymiad i sefydlu comisiynydd wedi mynd drwy broses o ddatblygu polisi, ac felly haeddant gael eu croesawu a'u cymeradwyo gan y Cynulliad heddiw.

Mae gwelliant 4 gan Jocelyn yn gresynu nad yw'n ofynnol yn y Mesur i Lywodraeth y DU ymateb i'r comisiynydd na'r Cynulliad ar sylwadau a wneir ar faterion nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli. Mae gwelliant 5 gan Kirsty yn nodi hefyd y dylai fod lle i'r comisiynydd ym mhob maes polisi nad yw wedi'i ddatganoli, ac mae'n gofyn inni gyflwyno sylwadau i'n cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan i'r perwyl hwn. Gwrthwynebwn y ddau welliant. Mae'n bosibl dadlau dros rôl wahanol i'r comisiynydd o ran materion nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli, ond mae'r cynnig yn y Mesur eisoes yn galluogi'r comisiynydd i gyflwyno sylwadau i'r Cynulliad ar unrhyw fater, gan gynnwys materion sydd heb eu datganoli. Mae gan y Cynulliad bwerau eisoes i gyflwyno sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU ar unrhyw fater sy'n effeithio ar bobl yng Nghymru.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr ydych yn iawn i dynnu sylw at y ffaith fod y Mesur yn nodi y gallai'r comisiynydd gyflwyno sylwadau i'r Cynulliad ar faterion sydd heb eu datganoli. Y broblem gyda'r Mesur, o dan adran 14(2), yw na chaniateir i'r comisiynydd osod adroddiadau ffurfiol gerbron y Cynulliad ar faterion felly. Dyna ble mae'r anghysondeb gwirioneddol, oherwydd nid oes gweithdrefn ffurfiol. Gall sylw fod yn alwad ffôn.

**John Griffiths:** Wrth gwrs, mae'r trefniadau hyn yn debyg i'r rhai sy'n ymwneud â Chomisiynydd Plant Cymru, ac o gofio'r gymeradwyaeth gyffredinol maent wedi gweithio'n dda. Mae cynnig Swyddfa Cymru o ran y comisiynydd i bobl hŷn yr un fath â'r hyn a geir ar hyn o bryd ac sydd wedi gweithio'n dda o ran y comisiynydd plant. Byddai'r comisiynydd pobl hŷn yn gallu cysylltu â Swyddfa Cymru yn uniongyrchol a chwrrd ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru neu ei is-ysgrifennydd seneddol i gyflwyno sylwadau ac i godi materion. Yna byddent yn cael eu codi gyda Gweinidogion perthnasol y DU ac ymatebion yn dod yn ôl. Mae yna goncordat sy'n rheoli'r berthynas rhwng y

Assembly's relationship with the UK Government regarding non-devolved issues, which has also operated effectively. Therefore, we are confident that the arrangements that will exist will enable the commissioner to operate effectively in terms of non-devolved matters. Brian Gibbons and I are engaged in ongoing and active discussions with the Wales Office to ensure that, when the commissioner is operating, those arrangements will be as effective as possible. In terms of those direct representations on non-devolved issues, we must also note, Jonathan, that the Bill has to sit within the existing constitutional framework. It has been drafted so that any change in the Assembly's functions can be reflected in the commissioner's remit.

Kirsty's amendment 6 seeks to establish that the immediate priority should be the improvement of services for older people. We support this amendment as there is no conflict between the establishment of the commissioner and the improvement of such services. Indeed, the improvement of those services is a top priority. We need a commissioner for older people to help to ensure that the needs of, and the provision for, older people in Wales remain at the top of our public services agenda. The research that we have undertaken and the views of older people themselves tell us that a commissioner for older people will play a vital role in this respect.

On this basis, I welcome the opportunity to discuss this important new Wales-only Bill with the Assembly today. It follows in the footsteps of the legislation that established, in Wales, the first commissioner for children. The commissioner for older people will help to raise the profile of older people and awareness about the services that they receive and the needs that they have. Wales will have a commissioner who will speak up on behalf of older people and be their champion. The commissioner will have many general functions, including promoting awareness of older people's interests, encouraging good practice in their treatment, promoting the provision of opportunities for, and the elimination of discrimination against, older people and keeping under review the

Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y DU ar faterion sydd heb eu datganoli, ac mae hwnnw hefyd wedi gweithredu'n effeithiol. Felly, yr ydym yn hyderus y bydd y trefniadau a fydd ar waith yn galluogi'r comisiynydd i weithredu'n effeithiol ar faterion sydd heb eu datganoli. Mae Brian Gibbons a minnau wrthi'n trafod yn barhaus gyda Swyddfa Cymru i sicrhau y bydd y trefniadau hynny mor effeithiol â phosibl pan fydd y comisiynydd wrth ei waith. O ran y sylwadau uniongyrchol hynny ar faterion nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli, rhaid inni nodi hefyd, Jonathan, fod y Mesur yn gorfod cydweddu â'r fframwaith cyfansoddiadol presennol. Fe'i drafftwyd fel y gall unrhyw newid yn swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad gael ei adlewyrchu yng nghylch gwaith y comisiynydd.

Mae gwelliant 6 gan Kirsty yn ceisio cadarnhau mai gwella gwasanaethau i bobl hŷn ddylai fod yn brif flaenoriaeth ar hyn o bryd. Cefnogwn y gwelliant hwn gan nad oes gwrthdaro rhwng sefydlu'r comisiynydd a gwella gwasanaethau o'r fath. Yn wir, mae gwella'r gwasanaethau hynny yn un o'r prif flaenoriaethau. Mae arnom angen comisiynydd i bobl hŷn i helpu sicrhau bod anghenion pobl hŷn, a'r ddarpariaeth ar eu cyfer, yng Nghymru yn aros ar frig ein hagenda gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae'r ymchwil a wnaed gennym a safbwyntiau pobl hŷn eu hunain yn dweud wrthym y bydd gan gomisiynydd i bobl hŷn ran hanfodol yn hynny.

Ar y sail hon, croesawaf y cyfle i drafod gyda'r Cynulliad heddiw y Mesur pwysig newydd hwn i Gymru yn unig. Mae'n dilyn y ddeddfwriaeth a sefydlodd, yng Nghymru, y comisiynydd cyntaf i blant. Bydd y comisiynydd pobl hŷn yn helpu codi proffil pobl hŷn ac ymwybyddiaeth o'r gwasanaethau a gânt a'r anghenion sydd ganddynt. Bydd gan Gymru gomisiynydd a fydd yn siarad ar ran pobl hŷn ac yn eiriol drostynt. Bydd gan y comisiynydd nifer o swyddogaethau cyffredinol, gan gynnwys cynyddu ymwybyddiaeth am fuddiannau pobl hŷn, annog arferion da wrth eu trin, hyrwyddo darparu cyfleoedd i bobl hŷn a dileu gwahaniaethu yn eu herbyn, ac adolygu'n barhaus ddigonolrwydd ac effeithiolrwydd y gyfraith sy'n effeithio

adequacy and effectiveness of law affecting them. She or he will also be able to review the discharge of functions of certain bodies and to review and monitor the arrangements of certain bodies for dealing with complaints, whistleblowing and advocacy.

Where other avenues of redress have been exhausted and where wider matters of principle are involved, the commissioner will be able to examine individual cases and could support individuals in making a complaint or representation. The Bill was introduced into the House of Lords on 25 May and received its Second Reading yesterday. That is earlier than we anticipated, which is excellent news for the delivery of this key policy commitment. There will be an opportunity for the outcome of today's discussions to influence the parliamentary process.

In conclusion, we are all getting older and we all have a stake in these proposals—though some may have a more immediate and direct stake than others. This is an important new Bill that has attracted a great deal of support in Wales, particularly among older people and their representative organisations. I hope that Members will feel able to support our proposals today.

**Jocelyn Davies:** I propose the following amendments tabled in my name. Amendment 1: delete 'welcomes' and insert 'notes'.

I propose amendment 3. Delete 'endorses' and insert 'notes'.

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets that there is no requirement for the UK Government to respond to the commissioner, or representations, on any matters that are not devolved to the National Assembly.*

I welcome the opportunity to speak in this debate. Plaid Cymru will support the motion, although we have many reservations about the creation of a commissioner for older people. I welcome the idea that older people should be supported and afforded increased opportunities. We want an end to discrimination and elder abuse and we

arnynt. Bydd hefyd yn gallu adolygu sut y mae rhai cyrff yn cyflawni eu swyddogaethau ac adolygu a monitro trefniadau rhai cyrff ar gyfer ymdrin â chwynion, chwythu'r chwiban ac eiriolaeth.

Lle mae dulliau eraill o gael iawn wedi'u hystyried a lle cyfyd egwyddorion mwy cyffredinol, bydd y comisiynydd yn gallu archwilio achosion unigol, a gallai helpu unigolion i wneud cwyn neu sylwadau. Cyflwynwyd y Mesur yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi ar 25 Mai a chafodd ei Ail Ddarlleniad ddoe. Mae hynny ynghynt na'r disgwyl, sy'n newyddion gwych o ran cyflawni'r ymrwymiad polisi allweddol hwn. Bydd cyfle i ffrwyth y trafodaethau heddiw ddylanwadu ar y broses seneddol.

I gloi, yr ydym i gyd yn mynd yn hŷn ac mae gan bob un ohonom ddiddordeb yn y cynigion hyn—er y bydd gan rai ddiddordeb cynt a mwy uniongyrchol nag eraill. Mae hwn yn Fesur newydd pwysig sydd wedi cael cryn gefnogaeth yng Nghymru, yn enwedig ymhlith pobl hŷn a'r sefydliadau sy'n eu cynrychioli. Gobeithio y bydd Aelodau'n teimlo y gallant gefnogi ein cynigion heddiw.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn fy enw i. Gwelliant 1: dileu 'yn croesawu' a rhoi 'yn nodi' yn ei le.

Cynigiau welliant 3. Dileu 'yn cymeradwyo' a rhoi 'yn nodi' yn ei le.

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu nad oes gofyniad ar Lywodraeth y DU i ymateb i'r comisiynydd, neu i sylwadau, ar unrhyw faterion nad ydynt wedi eu datganoli i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.*

Croesawaf y cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl hon. Bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynnig, er bod gennym nifer o amheuon ynglŷn â chreu comisiynydd i bobl hŷn. Croesawaf y syniad y dylai pobl hŷn gael cymorth a mwy o gyfleoedd. Yr ydym am weld terfyn ar wahaniaethu a cham-drin pobl oedranus, a chroesawn y cyfleoedd ychwanegol i bobl



welcome the increased opportunities for older people to influence policymakers at all levels. However, we are concerned that, by creating this commissioner, all older people are being sent a strong message that they are weak, not respected and need a champion to fight their battles for them. That is not true and it must not become a self-fulfilling prophecy.

Some vulnerable older people in Wales are subject to abuse and discrimination and, when this office is established, it must focus on the needs of those without a voice and not become a champion for an already powerful lobby. Plaid Cymru is also concerned that the Bill, as it stands, contains no requirement for the Westminster Government to respond to any report produced by the commissioner. It is important that the commissioner can comment on all matters affecting older people in Wales, even non-devolved matters. There must be an appropriate and formal mechanism for those comments to receive a response. Without that mechanism, to comment is rather meaningless. After all, many of the most significant problems facing older people are non-devolved matters. You will know, Deputy Minister, that the majority of the Members on the subject committee wanted a formal mechanism whereby Westminster would be required to respond.

The committee also heard evidence to support the view that the commissioner should have powers to review any service provided to older people in Wales. Currently, the Bill focuses on public bodies with an ability to look at services if half their income comes from the Assembly's budget. This is an arbitrary figure, which cannot be justified. Clearly, the commissioner should be able to examine services provided to older people in Wales without this needless impediment.

Another concern for Plaid Cymru is the potential duplication of work with that of the Commission for Equalities and Human Rights. We seek assurances of robust procedures that would prevent any duplication. We will support the motion and all the amendments today, but we will press

hŷn ddylanwadu ar y rheini sy'n llunio polisiau ar bob lefel. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn pryderu bod pob person hŷn, drwy greu'r comisiynydd hwn, yn cael neges gref ei fod yn wan, na yw'n cael ei barchu, a bod angen eiriolwr i frwydro drosto. Nid yw hynny'n wir, a rhaid sicrhau na fydd hynny'n broffwydoliaeth sy'n cael ei gwireddu.

Mae rhai pobl hŷn ddiameddiffyn yng Nghymru yn cael eu cam-drin ac yn dioddef oherwydd gwahaniaethu, a phan gaiff y swyddfa hon ei sefydlu rhaid iddi ganolbwyntio ar anghenion y rheini sydd heb lais a pheidio â mynd yn eiriolwr dros lobi sydd eisoes yn bwerus. Mae Plaid Cymru yn pryderu hefyd nad yw'r Mesur, fel y saif, yn cynnwys unrhyw ofyniad i Lywodraeth San Steffan ymateb i unrhyw adroddiad a gynhyrchir gan y comisiynydd. Mae'n bwysig i'r comisiynydd allu gwneud sylwadau ar bob mater sy'n effeithio ar bobl hŷn yng Nghymru, hyd yn oed materion heb eu datganoli. Rhaid cael system briodol a ffurfiol i ymateb i'r sylwadau hyn. Heb system o'r fath, mae gwneud sylwadau braidd yn ddiystyr. Wedi'r cyfan, nid materion wedi'u datganoli yw'r rhan fwyaf o'r problemau mwyaf sy'n wynebu pobl hŷn. Fe wyddoch, Ddirprwy Weinidog, fod y mwyafrif o'r Aelodau ar y pwyllgor pwnc am gael system ffurfiol lle byddai'n ofynnol i San Steffan ymateb.

Gwrandawodd y pwyllgor hefyd ar dystiolaeth i gefnogi'r farn y dylai fod gan y comisiynydd bwerau i adolygu unrhyw wasanaeth a ddarperir i bobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r Mesur yn canolbwyntio ar gyrff cyhoeddus sydd â'r gallu i ystyried gwasanaethau os daw hanner eu hincwm o gyllideb y Cynulliad. Mae hwn yn ffigur mympwyol na ellir ei gyfiawnhau. Yn amlwg, dylai'r comisiynydd fod yn gallu archwilio gwasanaethau a ddarperir i bobl hŷn yng Nghymru heb y rhwystr diangen hwn.

Pryder arall sydd gan Plaid Cymru yw posibilrwydd dyblygu gwaith â gwaith y Comisiwn Cydraddoldebau a Hawliau Dynol. Hoffem gael sicrwydd y bydd gweithdrefnau cadarn a fyddai'n atal unrhyw ddyblygu. Cefnogwn y cynnig a'r holl welliannau heddiw, ond pwyswn ar y Gweinidog i

the Minister to ensure that our concerns are fully addressed during the legislative process. sicrhau ymdrin yn llwyr â'n pryderon yn ystod y broses ddeddfwriaethol.

*Daeth Peter Black i'r Gadair am 4.39 p.m.  
Peter Black took the Chair at 4.39 p.m.*

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 5: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that all non-devolved areas of policy for older people should be a matter for the commissioner for older people in Wales and calls upon the Assembly Government to make representations to the Westminster Government to this effect.*

I propose amendment 6. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that the immediate priority should be the improvement of services for older people.*

4.40 p.m.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats come to this debate with a clear view that our money is most effectively spent on improving front-line services for older people. That is the point behind amendment 6. It is clear that, for example, social service departments could use additional help to support those in residential care. Even running short of our important policy as Welsh Liberal Democrats in favour of free personal care for the elderly, there are still things that could and should be done to improve, for example, the crisis in parts of Wales regarding assistance to residential care homes for the elderly.

If we are to have an older people's commissioner, it will only be money well spent if he or she has the powers to be truly effective. As it now stands, this Bill is seriously deficient in a number of respects. That is our view and is also the view of a number of key organisations working in the sector, such as Age Concern. One has to question the timing of the first debate in the House of Lords yesterday rather than welcome it. The Government timetabled this on the very day that consultation finished. It

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 5: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu y dylai pob maes polisi'n ymwneud â phobl hŷn yng Nghymru sydd heb ei ddatganoli fod yn fater i gomisiynydd pobl hŷn Cymru ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyflwyno sylwadau i Lywodraeth San Steffan i'r perwyl hwn.*

Cynigiau welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu mai gwella gwasanaethau ar gyfer pobl hŷn ddylai'r brif flaenoriaeth fod.*

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru ystyried y ddadl hon yn glir ein meddwl mai drwy wella gwasanaethau rheng flaen i bobl hŷn y caiff ein harian ei wario'n fwyaf effeithiol. Dyna ddiben gweliant 6. Mae'n amlwg, er enghraifft, y byddai adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn croesawu cymorth ychwanegol i gefnogi'r rheini mewn gofal preswyl. Hyd yn oed os na weithredir ein polisi pwysig fel Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru o blaid gofal personol am ddim i'r henoed, mae yna bethau o hyd y gellid ac y dylid eu gwneud i leddfu, er enghraifft, yr argyfwng mewn rhannau o Gymru o ran cymorth i gartrefi gofal preswyl i'r henoed.

Os ydym i gael comisiynydd pobl hŷn, dim ond os bydd ganddo ef neu hi y pwerau i fod yn wirioneddol effeithiol y bydd yr arian wedi'i wario'n ddoeth. Fel y saif ar hyn o bryd, mae yn y Mesur hwn ddiffygion difrifol mewn sawl ffordd. Dyna ein barn ni a hefyd farn nifer o sefydliadau allweddol sy'n gweithio yn y sector, megis Age Concern. Rhaid amau amseriad y ddadl gyntaf yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi ddoe, yn hytrach na'i groesawu. Trefnodd y Llywodraeth y ddadl hon ar yr union ddiwrnod y daeth yr

does not, therefore, seem likely that the Government will take the effects of this consultation seriously. This Bill is virtually the same as the draft Bill produced last year; they did not take on board any points made then. It is regrettable that there appears to be no plan for joint scrutiny with the Health and Social Services Committee and the Welsh Affairs Select Committee such as that which took place on the Transport (Wales) Bill. Today's debate and one committee session are inadequate, especially in light of the fact that the Bill ignores the recommendations of the advisory group in several important respects.

Referring to the principle of the Bill, it is only worth having a commissioner if that role can make a real difference to the lives of older people. There are, after all, several other organisations with an inspection role: the ombudsman, the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales, and so on. The Government has made it clear that this role will not duplicate existing powers. It has to supplement them effectively, yet the powers proposed in the Bill as it stands are woefully inadequate. The main argument in favour of a commissioner is the one-stop-shop approach, but we do not have that.

Turning to the deficiencies, the top problems that pensioners attending the citizens advice bureaux have are connected with pensions and benefits. However, the commissioner will not have the power to require UK Government departments to respond on non-devolved issues. What kind of champion for older people will this be if the commissioner cannot deal with, for example, pensions, benefits and the police? That is the reason for our amendment 5.

It is not clear from the Bill how the Welsh Assembly Government will be required to respond to the commissioner's reports. When I asked the Business Minister a question on this earlier this afternoon, she referred to the usual channels; the old boy's network approach is not good enough.

There is also concern about cross-border issues. These often affect older people who live near the border and who have complex

ymgyngori i ben. Felly, nid yw'n ymddango yn debygol y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cymryd effeithiau'r ymgynghori hwn o ddifrif. Mae'r Mesur hwn bron yn union yr un fath â'r Mesur drafft a luniwyd y llynedd; ni dderbyniwyd unrhyw bwyntiau a wnaed bryd hynny. Yn anffodus, ymddengys nad oes unrhyw gynllun i graffu ar y Mesur ar y cyd â'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'r Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig, fel y digwyddodd yn achos Mesur Trafnidiaeth (Cymru). Nid yw'r ddadl heddiw ac un sesiwn bwyllgor yn ddigonol, yn enwedig o gofio bod y Mesur yn anwybyddu argymhellion y grŵp cynghori mewn nifer o ffyrdd pwysig.

I gyfeirio at egwyddor y Mesur, dim ond os gall y rôl honno wneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i fywydau pobl hŷn y bydd yn werth cael comisiynydd. Wedi'r cyfan, mae yna nifer o sefydliadau eraill sydd â rôl archwilio: yr ombwdsmon, Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru, ac ati. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi egluro na fydd y rôl hon yn dyblygu pwerau sy'n bodoli eisoes. Rhaid iddi eu hategu'n effeithiol, ond eto mae'r pwerau a gynigir yn y Mesur fel y saif yn druenus o annigonol. Y brif ddadl o blaid comisiynydd yw cael siop-bopeth, ond nid ydym yn cael hynny.

I droi at y diffygion, mae prif broblemau pensynwyr sy'n mynd i ganolfannau cyngor ar bopeth yn ymwneud â phensiynau a budd-daliadau. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd gan y comisiynydd y pŵer i'w gwneud yn ofynnol i adrannau Llywodraeth y DU ymateb ar faterion sydd heb eu datganoli. Pa fath o eiriolwr dros bobl hŷn fydd y comisiynydd os na all ymdrin â phensiynau, budd-daliadau a'r heddlu, er enghraifft? Dyna'r rheswm dros ein gwelliant rhif 5.

Nid yw'n glir o'r Mesur sut y bydd yn ofynnol i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ymateb i adroddiadau'r comisiynydd. Pan ofynnais gwestiwn i'r Trefnydd ar y mater hwn yn gynharach y prynhawn yma, cyfeiriodd at y dulliau arferol; nid yw rhwydwaith y criw arferol yn ddigon da.

Mae pryder hefyd ynglŷn â materion ar draws ffiniau. Mae'r rhain yn aml yn effeithio ar bobl hŷn sy'n byw ger y ffin a chanddynt

packages of care, some of which are commissioned over the border in England. It is clear that, in failing to deal with these issues, the Labour Party has failed to learn the lessons of the dog's breakfast that it made of the children's commissioner's powers, with children in Wales having to apply to the English commissioner on certain issues.

It is unclear what range of bodies and individuals will be subject to review. Ideally, the commissioner could review any service provided to older people, but this Bill effectively restricts it to public bodies and those services that are subject to Assembly regulations. We need the scope to amend Schedule 2. We increasingly contract out services to a diverse range of private provision. We need to be sure that they are subject to the commissioner's scrutiny. We also have concerns about the lack of provision relating to dignity for older people, and the lack of the right to advocacy enshrined in this Bill.

In conclusion, without significant strengthening, this office risks becoming a toothless tiger. As with so much that emanates from this Labour Government, it is full of hype, but when we get down to the nitty-gritty, the Westminster Government is yet again clasping all of its powers to itself rather than taking a common-sense view of what is best for older people in Wales.

**Val Lloyd:** I remember, back in 2003, the scepticism from the opposition Members that met Labour's commitment to establish the first commissioner for older people. I remember their disdain for the idea and that some Members called it a gimmick. I also remember talking to a group of pensioners in my constituency who were at that time only lukewarm in their support for a commissioner. Last week, I talked to that same group of pensioners and found that they are no longer lukewarm, but full-blooded in their support. So much so that some of them had taken the trouble to attend and speak at meetings in Swansea organised by the Swansea Network+ to discuss the proposals in the Bill and to collect comments from people who will directly benefit from the work of the commissioner. However, today

becynnau gofal cymhleth, rai ohonynt yn cael eu comisiynu dros y ffin yn Lloegr. Mae'n amlwg fod y Blaid Lafur, wrth fethu ymdrin â'r materion hyn, wedi methu dysgu'r gwersi o'r cawl a wnaeth o bwerau'r comisiynydd plant, pan fydd plant yng Nghymru yn gorfod troi at y comisiynydd yn Lloegr ar rai materion.

Nid yw'n amlwg pa gyrff ac unigolion a gaiff eu hadolygu. Yn ddelfrydol, gallai'r comisiynydd adolygu unrhyw wasanaeth a ddarperir i bobl hŷn. Ond mae'r Mesur hwn, i bob diben, yn cyfyngu hyn i gyrff cyhoeddus a'r gwasanaethau hynny sy'n dod dan reoliadau'r Cynulliad. Mae angen inni gael cyfle i ddiwygio Atodlen 2. Yr ydym yn contractio mwy a mwy o wasanaethau i amrywiaeth eang o ddarparwyr preifat. Mae angen inni fod yn siŵr fod y comisiynydd yn craffu ar eu darpariaeth hwythau. Yr ydym yn pryderu hefyd nad oes darpariaeth ynglŷn ag urddas pobl hŷn, ac nad yw'r hawl i eiriolaeth wedi'i hymgorffori yn y Mesur hwn.

I gloi, oni chaiff ei hatgyfnerthu'n sylweddol, mae perygl y bydd y swydd hon yn ddirym. Fel gyda chymaint o'r hyn sy'n deillio o'r Llywodraeth Lafur hon, mae'n llawn brolio, ond pan edrychwn ar y manylion, mae Llywodraeth San Steffan unwaith eto'n cadw'i phwerau iddi'i hun, yn hytrach na defnyddio'i synnwyr cyffredin am yr hyn sydd orau i bobl hŷn yng Nghymru.

**Val Lloyd:** Cofiaf, yn ôl yn 2003, yr amheuaeth a fynegwyd gan Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau ynglŷn ag ymrwymiad Llafur i sefydlu'r comisiynydd cyntaf i bobl hŷn. Cofiaf hwy'n dirmygu'r syniad a bod rhai Aelodau wedi ei alw'n gimmig. Cofiaf hefyd siarad â grŵp o bensiynwyr yn fy etholaeth a oedd bryd hynny'n ddigon llugoer yn eu cefnogaeth i'r comisiynydd. Yr wythnos diwethaf, siaradais â'r un grŵp o bensiynwyr a gweld nad ydynt yn llugoer bellach, ond yn frwd iawn eu cefnogaeth, i'r fath raddau nes bod rhai ohonynt wedi mynd i'r drafferth o fynd i siarad mewn cyfarfodydd yn Abertawe wedi eu trefnu gan Swansea Network+ i drafod y cynigion yn y Mesur, ac i gasglu sylwadau gan bobl a fydd yn elwa'n uniongyrchol o waith y comisiynydd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn trafod Mesur heddiw,

we are discussing a Bill, not a gimmick, and I am pleased to note that there is now more support for the Bill from parts of the opposition.

I am aware of the concerns echoed by other Members in terms of duplication with other Government bodies and confusion pertaining to the boundaries of devolution. I believe that the majority of the concerns raised by Members and those involved in the advisory group have been addressed in the Bill. However, in debating the Bill at such an early stage we are able to ensure maximum input from the Assembly, and I welcome that.

As has been said before, the Bill has plenty in it, but clear areas remain in which the Assembly can develop regulations. That will allow the effective feeding in of views from Assembly Plenary sessions, from committee and from the public consultation.

Fundamentally, the commissioner must act as a signpost for information, guidance and support for older people. However, the commissioner must also work to generate positive perceptions of the role and contribution of the elderly to society, and to break the perception that older people, by virtue of their age, have a lesser role to play in society. I agree with Jenny that promotion of dignity will be an important element in the improvement of services for elderly people.

I would agree with the expressed view that the Bill could be clearer in terms of how the need for assistance is identified and in terms of the role of carers and advocates in supporting older people to access the commissioner. I would like to see the commissioner developing her or his role in a proactive way and not merely reacting to events and issues, although responses to those will have a part to play.

In summary, I echo the expert opinions of those who gave evidence to the Health and Social Services Committee that the commissioner for older people will prove invaluable. The strategy has been called the most innovative strategy ever developed for older people, and this demonstrates the Assembly Government's commitment to

nid gimig, ac yr wyf yn falch sylwi bod mwy o gefnogaeth i'r Mesur erbyn hyn ymhlith rhai aelodau o'r gwrthbleidiau.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon a fynegwyd gan Aelodau eraill ynglŷn â dyblygu gwaith cyrff eraill y Llywodraeth, a dryswch ynglŷn â therfynau datganoli. Credaf fod y Mesur wedi mynd i'r afael â mwyafrif y pryderon a godwyd gan Aelodau a'r rheini sy'n gysylltiedig â'r grŵp cynghori. Fodd bynnag, drwy gael dadl ar y Mesur mor gynnar gallwn sicrhau'r cyfraniad mwyaf posibl gan y Cynulliad, a chroesawaf hynny.

Fel y dywedwyd eisoes, mae'r Mesur yn cwmpasu digon o bethau, ond mae yna feysydd amlwg o hyd lle y gall y Cynulliad ddatblygu rheoliadau. Bydd hynny'n gyfle i gynnwys safbwyntiau o Gyfarfodydd Llawn y Cynulliad, o bwyllgorau ac o ymgynghori cyhoeddus.

Yn y bôn, rhaid i'r comisiynydd fod yn arwyddbost i bobl hŷn at wybodaeth, arweiniad a chymorth. Fodd bynnag, bydd yn rhaid i'r comisiynydd hefyd gynhyrchu cysyniadau cadarnhaol o rôl a chyfraniad pobl hŷn i gymdeithas, a dileu'r cysyniad bod gan bobl hŷn, oherwydd eu hoed, ran lai mewn cymdeithas. Cytunaf â Jenny y bydd hyrwyddo urddas yn elfen bwysig wrth wella gwasanaethau i bobl hŷn.

Cytunaf â'r farn a fynegwyd y gallai'r Mesur fod yn gliriach o ran sut i nodi'r angen am gymorth, ac o ran rôl gofalwyr ac eiriolwyr wrth gynorthwyo pobl hŷn i gysylltu â'r comisiynydd. Hoffwn weld y comisiynydd yn datblygu ei rôl hi neu ef mewn ffordd ragweithiol, nid ymateb i ddigwyddiadau a materion yn unig, er y bydd cyfraniad gan yr ymatebion i'r pethau hynny.

I grynhoi, ategaf safbwyntiau arbenigol y rheini a roddodd dystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, sef y bydd y comisiynydd pobl hŷn yn amhrisiadwy. Yn ôl rhai, hon yw'r strategaeth fwyaf arloesol a ddatblygwyd erioed ar gyfer pobl hŷn, a dengys hyn ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i

delivering a better quality of life for the elderly.

**Jonathan Morgan:** First, I welcome the opportunity to debate what will be an important development for older people in Wales, provided that the powers, influence, and the independence of the commissioner reflect the importance of safeguarding the welfare of older people.

The Government's initial plan to introduce a Bill to create a commissioner for older people, as Val Lloyd outlined, was found in the Government's manifesto of 2003. At the time, it was treated as something of a gimmick. Unless we get this Bill right, older people in Wales will still regard it as a gimmick, unless we can assure them, and that you can assure them, through this Bill, that the commissioner will have the powers, influence and independence that he or she will need to safeguard the wellbeing of older people.

The rationale for doing something to promote the welfare of older people is outlined in the regulatory impact assessment. In the 'Options' section, under the 'Do Nothing' heading, it states that

'This is not a viable option as this would mean that older people's interests would not be properly taken into account, that they would continue to be discriminated against and that their participation and engagement in communities would be poor'.

This sends out a damaging message to older people in Wales, which is that, somehow, a commissioner is needed because that entire group of older people are somehow collectively discriminated against and that they do not get the services and support that they deserve. If you applied that rationale to every group of people in society, you would have a whole army of individual commissioners undertaking work on behalf of certain groups of people. Therefore the way that this has been presented has been fairly poor, to say the least.

4.50 p.m.

We will be supporting the amendments.

sicrhau ansawdd bywyd gwell i'r henoed.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yn gyntaf, croesawaf y cyfle i drafod yr hyn a fydd yn ddatblygiad pwysig ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru, ar yr amod y bydd pwerau, dylanwad, ac annibyniaeth y comisiynydd yn adlewyrchu pwysigrwydd diogelu lles pobl hŷn.

Gwelwyd cynllun cychwynnol y Llywodraeth i gyflwyno Mesur i greu comisiynydd pobl hŷn, fel yr amlinellodd Val Lloyd, ym maniffesto'r Llywodraeth yn 2003. Ar y pryd, cafodd ei drin fel rhyw fath o gimig. Os na wnawn y Mesur hwn yn iawn, bydd pobl hŷn yng Nghymru yn dal i'w ystyried yn gimig, oni fyddwn yn gallu eu sicrhau, drwy'r Mesur, y bydd gan y comisiynydd y pwerau, y dylanwad a'r annibyniaeth y bydd arno ef neu hi eu hangen i ddiogelu lles pobl hŷn.

Amlinellir y rhesymeg dros wneud rhywbeth i hyrwyddo lles pobl hŷn yn yr asesiad effaith reoleiddiol. Yn yr adran 'Opsynau', o dan y pennawd 'Gwneud Dim Byd', mae'n dweud

Nid yw hwn yn ddewis ymarferol oherwydd byddai hyn yn golygu na châi buddiannau pobl hŷn eu hystyried yn briodol, y byddai gwahaniaethu yn eu herbyn yn parhau, ac y byddai eu cyfranogiad a'u hymwneud mewn cymunedau yn wael.

Mae hyn yn anfon neges andwyol i bobl hŷn yng Nghymru, hynny yw, rywsut, fod angen comisiynydd oherwydd gwahaniaethu yn erbyn y grŵp cyfan hwnnw o bobl hŷn, ac nad ydynt yn cael y gwasanaethau a'r gefnogaeth y maent yn eu haeddu. Pe byddech yn cymhwyso'r rhesymeg honno i bob grŵp o bobl mewn cymdeithas, byddai gennych lu o gomisiynwyr unigol yn gwneud gwaith ar ran grwpiau penodol o bobl. Felly, mae hyn wedi ei gyflwyno mewn ffordd ddigon sâl, a dweud y lleiaf.

Byddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliannau. Yn

There is broad agreement among the opposition parties on the confusion caused by the Bill over devolved and non-devolved issues and the role of the commissioner in either situation. The Bill will permit the commissioner to review and examine individual cases, review the discharge of Assembly functions and public services and to make reports, all of which must be within the devolved competence of this institution. Under the Bill, the commissioner cannot examine individual cases that relate to non-devolved matters. So, as Jenny Randerson pointed out, older people with problems and concerns relating to pensions and benefits will be confused as to whom to approach to ask for help.

In terms of submitting reports, the commissioner can only do so, according to clause 14, within the devolved context, and the extent to which the commissioner can make reports will not be extended to non-devolved matters. As pointed out to the Deputy Minister earlier, that is a fundamental inconsistency within the Bill. The commissioner can, under clause 2(3), make representations—such as a simple telephone call to someone in the Assembly—on any matter, be it devolved or non-devolved, but can only lay a formal report on something that is a devolved matter. So, there is a fundamental weakness in the way in which the commissioner can make formal representations. In using the word ‘formal’, I mean the laying of a report for the Assembly to consider.

The Deputy Minister and the Government must understand that, while we are talking about the devolved competence and remit of this institution, the Assembly, under section 30 of the Government of Wales Act 1998, is allowed to take a view on any matter, devolved or non-devolved, affecting Wales. If we want to take a view on pensions, benefits or the reform of the House of Lords, we are allowed to do so, even though we have no powers in those areas. So, to say that the commissioner has to fit in to the devolved context is somewhat illogical, bearing in mind what we are able to do as an institution.

gyffredinol, cytuna'r gwrthbleidiau fod y Mesur yn achosi dryswch o ran materion wedi eu datganoli a materion heb eu datganoli, a rôl y comisiynydd yn y naill sefyllfa neu'r llall. Bydd y Mesur yn caniatáu i'r comisiynydd adolygu ac archwilio achosion unigol, adolygu'r broses o gyflawni swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a gwneud adroddiadau, a rhaid i bob un o'r rheiny fod o fewn gallu datganoledig y sefydliad hwn. O dan y Mesur, ni all y comisiynydd archwilio achosion unigol sy'n ymwneud â materion heb eu datganoli. Felly, fel y nododd Jenny Randerson, bydd pobl hŷn sydd â phroblemau a phryderon am bensiynau a budd-daliadau wedi drysu o ran at bwy i droi am gymorth.

O ran cyflwyno adroddiadau, yr unig ffordd y gall y comisiynydd wneud hynny, yn ôl cymal 14, yw yn y cyd-destun datganoledig, ac ni fydd y graddau y gall y comisiynydd wneud adroddiadau yn ymestyn i faterion heb eu datganoli. Fel y dangoswyd i'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn gynharach, mae hynny'n anghysondeb sylfaenol yn y Mesur. O dan gymal 2(3) gall y comisiynydd gyflwyno sylwadau—fel galwad ffôn syml i rywun yn y Cynulliad—ar unrhyw fater, p'un a yw'n fater wedi ei ddatganoli neu beidio. Ond ar fater wedi ei ddatganoli'n unig y gall gyflwyno adroddiad ffurfiol. Felly, mae gwendid sylfaenol yn y ffordd y gall y comisiynydd gyflwyno sylwadau ffurfiol. Wrth ddefnyddio'r gair 'ffurfiol', golygaf osod adroddiad gerbron i'r Cynulliad ei ystyried.

Rhaid i'r Dirprwy Weinidog a'r Llywodraeth ddeall, wrth sôn am allu wedi ei ddatganoli a chylch gwaith y sefydliad hwn, y caniateir i'r Cynulliad, o dan Adran 30, Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, fynegi barn am unrhyw fater, wedi'i ddatganoli neu heb ei ddatganoli, sy'n effeithio ar Gymru. Os ydym am fynegi barn am bensiynau, budd-daliadau neu ddiwygio Tŷ'r Arglwyddi, caniateir inni wneud hynny, er nad oes gennym unrhyw bwerau yn y meysydd hynny. Felly, mae dweud bod yn rhaid i'r comisiynydd fod yn rhan o'r cyd-destun datganoledig braidd yn afresymegol, o gofio'r hyn y gallwn ei wneud fel sefydliad.

There is a problem with the way in which services are delivered, particularly in the context of border issues. I refer to health services and other services in England. What would the commissioner's role be in those circumstances, as there could be issues that he or she might wish to raise? We know that the advisory group believes that the commissioner should be able to make representations on non-devolved matters directly to the UK. This was supported in the consultation exercise. So, any informal arrangements, to which the Deputy Minister referred, will not satisfy the recommendations.

I believe that the Bill could work, and it could provide for a very robust individual to do a very good job on behalf of older people in Wales. However, it needs a severe amount of tidying up, not least in the way that the commissioner can make reports and representations, and the way in which he or she could take up concerns on behalf of our constituents.

*Daeth y Llywydd i'r Gadair am 4.53 p.m.  
The Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.53 p.m.*

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Protecting and respecting older people will be the core functions of the new older people's commissioner for Wales. The true achievements of the commissioner will be judged on how well public and private service provision meets the needs of older people in Wales, and that is why I too support the Liberal Democrats' amendment 6.

The need for an older people's commissioner in Wales was truly brought home to me yesterday when, as chair of the all-party group for older people and ageing, I hosted an Age Concern seminar on the serious issue of elder abuse in Wales. This issue was recently and vividly portrayed in a BBC television programme called, *Dad*, which was commissioned by Comic Relief. The BBC's Comic Relief is one of the main charities currently raising awareness of elder abuse in the United Kingdom. It also funds vital advocacy services in Cardiff and the Vale. These services are supported by charity money, but they fulfil critical care standards 8.3 and 11.2, which are meant to guarantee

Mae problem am y ffordd y darperir gwasanaethau, yn arbennig yng nghyd-destun materion ffiniau. Cyfeiriai at wasanaethau iechyd a gwasanaethau eraill yn Lloegr. Beth fyddai rôl y comisiynydd o dan yr amgylchiadau hynny, oherwydd gallai fod materion y byddai ef neu hi'n dymuno eu codi? Gwyddom fod y grŵp cynghori'n credu y dylai'r comisiynydd fod yn gallu gwneud sylwadau ar faterion sydd heb eu datganoli'n uniongyrchol i'r DU. Cefnogwyd hyn yn yr ymarfer ymgynghori. Felly, ni fydd unrhyw drefniadau anffurfiol, y cyfeiriodd y Dirprwy Weinidog atynt, yn bodloni'r argymhellion.

Credaf y gallai'r Mesur weithio, ac y gallai ddarparu ar gyfer unigolyn cadarn iawn i wneud gwaith da iawn ar ran pobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae angen ei dacluso gryn dipyn, yn anad dim o ran y ffordd y gall y comisiynydd wneud adroddiadau a sylwadau, a'r ffordd y gallai godi pryderon ar ran ein hetholwyr.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Diogelu a pharchu pobl hŷn fydd prif swyddogaethau'r comisiynydd newydd i bobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Caiff llwyddiannau gwirioneddol y comisiynydd eu barnu yn ôl y graddau y mae darpariaeth gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a phreifat yn diwallu anghenion pobl hŷn yng Nghymru, a dyna'r rheswm yr wyf fi hefyd yn cefnogi gwelliant 6 gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

Tynnwyd fy sylw at yr angen am gomisiynydd pobl hŷn yng Nghymru yn amlwg iawn ddoe pan gynheliais, fel cadeirydd y grŵp trawsbleidiol ar gyfer pobl hŷn a heneiddio, seminar Age Concern ar y mater difrifol o gam-drin pobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Darluniwyd y mater hwn yn fyw iawn yn ddiweddar ar raglen deledu'r BBC o'r enw *Dad*, a gomisiynwyd gan Comic Relief. Comic Relief BBC yw un o'r prif elusennau sydd ar hyn o bryd yn cynyddu ymwybyddiaeth o gam-drin yr henoed yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae hefyd yn ariannu gwasanaethau eiriolaeth hanfodol yng Nghaerdydd a'r Fro. Cefnogir y gwasanaethau hyn gan arian elusennol, ond



residents of care homes access to advocates who will represent their interests. These advocates go into care homes and provide an independent voice to those most in need of it. Many older people within care homes do not have friends or relatives that visit them; therefore, these advocates are their only lifeline, and they are an excellent way of detecting and dealing with abuse. However, the provision of advocates for vulnerable older people in Wales is just one of the many issues that the older people's commissioner could investigate.

Only 4 per cent of older people in Wales reside in care homes—the rest live independently in their homes or with help from the local authority or friends and family. Of these, the majority lead active and comfortable lives. However, the commissioner's role should first be to ensure that issues such as elder abuse and the provision of appropriate advocacy services are available to all older people in Wales.

Everyone in the Chamber, and every person in Wales, will probably require assistance from social services at some stage when they get older. In addition, demographic changes point towards an 11 per cent increase in the number of 60-year-olds in the next 20 years. Usually, when we need social services intervention, we are at an age when we are most vulnerable. As a result, this growing band of older people in Wales will demand top-quality treatment that respects their dignity and individuality.

I applaud the Bill's reference to the United Nations' principles for older people, but I would like some consideration to giving these principles wider recognition. Perhaps the Assembly Government could consider enshrining the principles in an older people's charter for Wales. This would be similar to the patients' charter that already exists, and would give a single point of reference for older people.

Finally, it would be wrong to see the commissioner's role in isolation to the

maent yn cyflawni safonau gofal critigol 8.3 ac 11.2, a fwriedir i warantu bod trigolion cartrefi gofal yn gallu troi at eiriolwyr a fydd yn cynrychioli eu buddiannau. Bydd yr eiriolwyr hyn yn mynd i mewn i gartrefi gofal ac yn darparu llais annibynnol i'r rheini sydd â'i angen fwyaf. Mae nifer o bobl hŷn mewn cartrefi gofal heb ffrindiau neu deulu i ymweld â hwy, felly, yr eiriolwyr hyn yw eu hunig gymorth, ac maent yn ffordd wych i ddarganfod achosion o gam-drin a delio â hwy. Fodd bynnag, dim ond un o'r materion lu y gallai'r comisiynydd pobl hŷn ymchwilio iddynt yw darparu eiriolwyr i bobl hŷn ddiameddiffyn yng Nghymru.

Dim ond 4 y cant o bobl hŷn yng Nghymru sy'n byw mewn cartrefi gofal—mae'r gweddill yn byw'n annibynnol yn eu cartrefi neu gyda chymorth yr awdurdod lleol neu ffrindiau a theulu. O'r rhain, mae'r rhan fwyaf yn byw bywydau llawn a chysurus. Fodd bynnag, sicrhau bod materion fel cam-drin yr henoed a gwasanaethau eiriolaeth priodol ar gael i bob person hŷn yng Nghymru ddylai fod yn rôl gyntaf i'r comisiynydd.

Bydd angen cymorth gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ar bawb yn y Siambr, a phawb yng Nghymru, mae'n siŵr, rywbyrd wrth fynd yn hŷn. Yn ogystal, mae newidiadau demograffig yn awgrymu cynnydd o 11 y cant yn nifer y bobl 60 oed yn ystod yr 20 mlynedd nesaf. Fel rheol, pan fydd arnom angen ymyriad gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, yr ydym o oed lle'r ydym yn fwyaf diameddiffyn. O ganlyniad, bydd y grŵp cynyddol hwn o bobl hŷn yng Nghymru yn mynnu triniaeth o'r radd flaenaf sy'n parchu eu hurddas a'u natur unigol.

Cymeradwyaf gyfeiriad y Mesur at egwyddorion y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar gyfer pobl hŷn, ond hoffwn rywfaint o ystyriaeth i roi mwy o gydnabyddiaeth i'r egwyddorion hyn. Efallai y gallai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ystyried ymgorffori'r egwyddorion mewn siarter i bobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Byddai honno'n debyg i siarter y claf sy'n bodoli eisoes, a byddai'n rhoi man cyfeirio unigryw i bobl hŷn.

Yn olaf, byddai'n anghywir ystyried rôl y comisiynydd ar wahân i'r pecyn dihafal o

unrivalled package of measures that the Assembly Government has delivered for older people. That includes the national care standards, the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales and the Care Council for Wales, along with a pioneering strategy for older people in Wales, as well as free bus passes, free entry to swimming pools, and free entry to the museums and galleries of Wales. These are all examples of Labour in Wales delivering for older people.

fesurau a gyflwynwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Mae hynny'n cynnwys y safonau gofal cenedlaethol, Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru a Chyngor Gofal Cymru, ynghyd â strategaeth arloesol ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru, yn ogystal â thocynnau bws am ddim, mynediad am ddim i byllau nofio, a mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd ac orielau Cymru. Mae pob un o'r rhain yn enghreifftiau o Lafur yng Nghymru yn darparu ar gyfer pobl hŷn.

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Order No. 6.21, extends the time for business until 5.45 p.m..*

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynig iaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, yn ymestyn y cyfarfod tan 5.45 p.m..*

**Y Llywydd:** A oes 10 Aelod yn cefnogi'r cynnig trefniadol? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 yn ei gefnogi. Symudwn felly i bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are 10 Members in support of the procedural motion? I see that at least 10 Members are in support. We therefore move to a vote.

*Cynnig: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen

Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Mesur Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn (Cymru): Parhad The Commissioner for Older People (Wales) Bill: Continued**

**David Lloyd:** The consultation on the older people's strategy, some years ago, revealed recurring themes that were of concern to older people then that are still concerns today. As we have heard, the five main issues were: pension levels, pensioner poverty and benefits; free personal care; the fact that care homes were closing all over the place; the state of the NHS and social services; and the council tax, and recent hikes, made worse by rebanding, have hit people on low and fixed incomes, such as pensioners, the hardest. These consultation responses fed into the report, 'When I'm 64...and more'. Recommendation 2.2 of that report was the appointment of an older people's commissioner for Wales. Another recommendation in that report—recommendation 5.49—was that the Welsh Assembly Government should push for free personal care for the elderly, always accepting that we do not have the powers to implement this recommendation as an Assembly, of course, and, after today's White Paper, we still do not have those powers. However, fully accepting the royal commission's recommendation for free personal care for the elderly would meet with the widespread approval of older people, as several polls have shown.

On the appointment of a commissioner for older people in Wales, if that person has the powers to address the fundamental issues that are of concern to older people—the level of pensions and benefits, free personal care, the NHS, care homes, and council tax—that would be great. It would be a travesty if a commissioner were appointed and could not act to truly and meaningfully change things for the better, in line with the wishes of older people. There is much goodwill and support for the concept. However, in having a commissioner, I hope that we will have

**David Lloyd:** Yr oedd yr ymgynghori ar y strategaeth pobl hŷn, rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, yn datgelu themâu sy'n codi dro ar ôl tro, a oedd yn destun pryder i bobl hŷn bryd hynny ac sy'n destun pryder iddynt heddiw. Fel yr ydym wedi clywed, y pum prif fater oedd: lefelau pensiwn, tlodi a budd-daliadau pensiynwyr; gofal personol am ddim; mae'r ffaith fod cartrefi gofal yn cau ym mhob man; cyflwr y GIG a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol; a'r dreth gyngor, a chodiadau'n ddiweddar, sy'n waeth ar ôl ailfandio, wedi effeithio fwyaf ar bobl ar incwm isel ac incwm sefydlog, megis pensiynwyr. Cafodd yr ymatebion hyn i'r ymgynghori eu cynnwys yn yr adroddiad, 'Pan fwyf yn hen a pharchus...'. Argymhelliad 2.2. yr adroddiad hwnnw oedd penodi comisiynydd pobl hŷn ar gyfer Cymru. Argymhelliad arall yn yr adroddiad hwnnw—argymhelliad 5.49—oedd y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru bwysio am ofal personol am ddim i'r henoed, a bwrw bob amser nad oes gennym y pwerau i weithredu'r argymhelliad hwn fel Cynulliad, wrth gwrs, ac ar ôl Papur Gwyn heddiw, nid oes gennym y pwerau hynny o hyd. Fodd bynnag, byddai derbyn yn llawn argymhelliad y comisiwn brenhinol ynglŷn â gofal personol am ddim i'r henoed yn cael cryn gefnogaeth ymhlith pobl hŷn, fel y dengys nifer o arolygon barn.

Ynglŷn â phenodi comisiynydd pobl hŷn yng Nghymru, os caiff y person hwnnw y pwerau i fynd i'r afael â'r materion sylfaenol sy'n destun pryder i bobl hŷn—lefel pensiynau a budd-daliadau, gofal personol am ddim, y GIG, cartrefi gofal, a'r dreth gyngor—byddai hynny'n wych. Byddai'n warthus pe bai comisiynydd yn cael ei benodi na allai weithredu i newid pethau'n wirioneddol ac yn ystyrllon er gwell, yn unol â dymuniadau pobl hŷn. Mae yna gryn ewyllys da a chefnogaeth i'r cysyniad. Fodd bynnag, o gael comisiynydd, gobeithio y cawn rywun

someone who has the tools to do the job and to make a meaningful difference to people's lives.

**Sandy Mewies:** I had cut my contribution short as I did not think that we would have much time, so I will keep it that way.

5.00 p.m.

Much of what I wanted to say was said by Val Lloyd, and I agree with her that issues have arisen in preparing for this Bill. Many of them have been dealt with, but not all of them, and I am sure that other people will return to them. I see the establishment of the older people's commissioner very much as I saw the establishment of the children's commissioner, which has been a great success. I am sure that this will operate in exactly the same way. One thing that the children's commissioner has done well—which does not always happen—is listen carefully to the views of his constituents, namely children and younger people, and I hope that the commissioner for older people will listen to his or her constituents, namely older people.

I attended a meeting of the Flintshire older people's forum recently, and I was rather puzzled because its members did not look any older than me, which caught me by surprise. I do not go along with the view that you cannot have a powerful lobby. It is right that the most vulnerable have advocates acting on their behalf. It is also right that constituents who are older people also have the right to have their say. They are experts in the services that they need; they use those services all the time, they can recognise the gaps in those services and they can point out, when they are on local authority planning groups and so on, what services should be like. I was very impressed with what they had to say, and it is for that reason that I mention them today.

The children's commissioner has led the way in this. You should listen to those people who use the services, and the people who use the services are older people. Whatever their condition or state, we must provide for the most vulnerable to be heard by providing

sydd â'r offer i wneud y gwaith ac i wneud gwahaniaeth ystyrion i fywydau pobl.

**Sandy Mewies:** Yr oeddwn wedi cwtoegi fy nghyfraniad oherwydd nid oeddwn yn credu y byddai gennym lawer o amser, felly fe'i cadwaf fel hynny.

Mae Val Lloyd eisoes wedi dweud llawer o'r hyn yr oeddwn am ei ddweud, a chytunaf â hi fod problemau wedi codi wrth baratoi ar gyfer y Mesur hwn. Ymdriniwyd â nifer ohonynt, ond nid pob un, ac mae'n siŵr y bydd pobl eraill yn ailedrych arnynt. Ystyriaif y broses o sefydlu'r comisiynydd pobl hŷn yn yr un modd ag yr ystyriaif y broses o sefydlu'r comisiynydd plant, sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiant mawr. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd hyn yn gweithredu yn yr un ffordd yn union. Un peth y mae'r comisiynydd plant wedi'i wneud yn dda—ac nid yw bob amser yn digwydd—yw gwrando'n ofalus ar farn ei etholwyr, sef plant a phobl ifanc, a gobeithio y bydd y comisiynydd pobl hŷn yn gwrando ar ei etholwyr ef neu hi, sef pobl hŷn.

Bûm mewn cyfarfod o fforwm pobl hŷn Sir y Fflint yn ddiweddar, a synnais braidd nad oedd yr aelodau i'w gweld fawr hŷn na fi. Ni chytunaf â'r farn na allwch gael lobi bwerus. Mae'n briodol fod gan y rhai mwyaf diamddiffyn eiriolwyr i weithredu ar eu rhan. Mae hefyd yn briodol fod gan etholwyr sy'n bobl hŷn yr hawl i ddweud eu dweud. Maent yn arbenigwyr yn y gwasanaethau y mae eu hangen arnynt; defnyddiant y gwasanaethau hynny drwy'r amser, gallant adnabod y bylchau yn y gwasanaethau hynny a gallant nodi, pan fyddant yn rhan o grwpiau cynllunio awdurdodau lleol ac ati, pa fath o wasanaethau ddylai gael eu darparu. Gwnaeth yr hyn yr oedd ganddynt i'w ddweud argraff fawr arnaf, a dyna pam yr wyf yn sôn amdanynt heddiw.

Mae'r comisiynydd plant wedi arwain y ffordd yn hyn. Dylech wrando ar y sawl sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaethau, a'r sawl sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaethau yw pobl hŷn. Beth bynnag fo'u cyflwr neu eu sefyllfa, dylem sicrhau bod modd i'r rhai mwyaf diamddiffyn

advocacy and support for them, but we must also hear from others who are using the services and who can tell us when they are good or bad.

**David Melding:** The Health and Social Services Committee held an evidence-taking session on 25 May, and considered, in the light of that evidence, its views on the Bill. I will inform Plenary of some of the issues that were raised; many have already been referred to, but I will highlight the ones that have not yet been covered and which are worthy of some consideration.

At some point soon, we will be starting a selection process for the older person's commissioner. I do not doubt that the Bill will be successful—indeed, I welcome it in advance, as it were. I hope that the appointment process will be as innovative as the procedures used to appoint the children's commissioner. I believe that the Minister is so minded, but it is important that we use a system that is extensive and expansive. For example, a children's conference was used in the process of appointing the children's commissioner, and we should aim to mirror that kind of procedure.

Much has been said on the right to comment on non-devolved issues, and this was a concern in the evidence that we received. However, the concerns can be slightly exaggerated, and it is important that the main focus of the older person's commissioner is on the Assembly's work with regard to public services for older people. While it is right for the person to have the option of raising other issues, it is appropriate for that to be something of a secondary role.

A couple of people have mentioned the 50 per cent rule relating to services provided to older people and that only those organisations that provide that level of service will come under the remit. However, organisations that are only providing 10 or 20 per cent of their services to older people are still in the commissioning process, and that process can be examined by the older person's commissioner. I suspect, therefore, that it is not a complete loophole, but the Minister

gael eu clywed drwy roi eiriolaeth a chefnogaeth iddynt. Ond rhaid inni hefyd glywed gan eraill sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaethau ac sy'n gallu dweud wrthym a ydynt yn dda neu'n wael.

**David Melding:** Cynhaliodd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol sesiwn i gymryd tystiolaeth ar 25 Mai gan ystyried, yng ngoleuni'r dystiolaeth honno, ei farn am y Mesur. Byddaf yn dweud wrth y Cyfarfod Llawn am rai o'r materion a godwyd; cyfeiriwyd at nifer ohonynt eisoes, ond tynnaf sylw at y rhai nad ydynt wedi eu crybwyll eto ac sy'n haeddu cael eu hystyried.

Cyn hir byddwn yn dechrau proses ddethol ar gyfer y comisiynydd pobl hŷn. Nid oes amheuaeth gennyf na fydd y Mesur yn llwyddiannus—yn wir, fe'i croesawaf ymlaen llaw, fel petai. Gobeithio y bydd y broses benodi mor arloesol â'r gweithdrefnau a ddefnyddiwyd i benodi'r comisiynydd plant. Credaf fod y Gweinidog yn tueddu at hynny, ond mae'n bwysig inni ddefnyddio system sy'n helaeth ac yn eang. Er enghraifft, defnyddiwyd cynhadledd plant yn y broses o benodi'r comisiynydd plant, a dylem anelu at adlewyrchu'r math hwnnw o weithdrefn.

Dywedwyd llawer am yr hawl i roi sylwadau am faterion sydd heb eu datganoli, ac yr oedd hyn yn bryder yn y dystiolaeth a gawsom. Fodd bynnag, gellir gorliwio'r pryderon hynny ryw ychydig, ac mae'n bwysig i brif ffocws y comisiynydd pobl hŷn fod ar waith y Cynulliad o ran gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i bobl hŷn. Er ei bod yn briodol i'r person gael rhyddid i godi materion eraill, mae'n briodol i hynny fod yn rôl eilaidd.

Mae ambell un wedi sôn am y rheol 50 y cant, sy'n ymwneud â gwasanaethau a ddarperir i bobl hŷn, ac mai dim ond y sefydliadau hynny sy'n darparu'r lefel honno o wasanaeth a ddaw o fewn y cylch gwaith. Fodd bynnag, mae sefydliadau sy'n darparu dim ond rhwng 10 a 20 y cant o'u gwasanaethau i bobl hŷn yn dal yn rhan o'r broses gomisiynu, a gall y comisiynydd pobl hŷn edrych ar y broses honno. Yr wyf yn amau, felly, nad yw'n fan hollol wan, ond

may want to give us reassurance that that is also his interpretation, which would probably go a long way to answering people's concerns.

The role of the commissioner will also be reviewed after two years of operation of the commissioner for equality and human rights, which should provide an adequate safeguard to ensure that there is not an awful lot of overlapping between their roles. In conclusion, I think that the legislative process has been rushed; that is somewhat unseemly, and should be avoided. However, I do not think that that is the particular responsibility of this Government, and, despite saying that, there was a broad welcome for the present structure of the Bill, and a feeling that the improvements that needed to be made could be done under the Assembly's secondary role. I hope that the Government will be open to our suggestions when we deal with the secondary legislation.

**Denise Idris Jones:** I believe that my constituency of Conwy has the highest proportion of older people in Wales, and a recent survey found that Llandudno is one of the most popular coastal retirement towns in the UK. Therefore, the appointment of a commissioner for older people is an important development for my constituents and for older people across Wales. If we can reflect on the success of the children's commissioner and mirror similar results for older people, there is a lot to look forward to.

Universally welcomed, the Bill should be commended for providing a broad portfolio in which the commissioner will operate, and which is not limited to stereotyped assumptions and assertions of the issues that affect older people, such as health, crime and the fear of crime. Older people are not necessarily vulnerable, and people who are retired make a huge voluntary contribution to society, working through the local community and using their skills and experience to help vulnerable people of all ages.

While the commissioner will obviously deal with public service provision, there are many more causes to champion. Social exclusion and isolation, confidence, the barriers of

efallai y bydd y Gweinidog am roi sicrwydd inni mai dyna yw ei ddehongliad ef hefyd, a fyddai'n debyg yn mynd ymhell i ateb pryderon pobl.

Bydd rôl y comisiynydd hefyd yn cael ei hadolygu ar ôl dwy flynedd o weithredu'r comisiynydd cydraddoldeb a hawliau dynol, a ddylai ddarparu diogelwch digonol i sicrhau nad oes gormod o orgyffwrdd rhwng rôl y ddau. I gloi, credaf i'r broses ddeddfwriaethol gael ei rhuthro; mae hynny ychydig yn anweddaidd, a dylid ei osgoi. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf mai cyfrifoldeb penodol y Llywodraeth yw hyn, ac er imi ddweud hynny, cafodd strwythur presennol y Mesur ei groesawu'n gyffredinol, ac yr oedd teimlad y gellid gwneud y gwelliannau angenrheidiol o dan rôl eilaidd y Cynulliad. Gobeithio y bydd y Llywodraeth yn agored i wrando ar ein hawgrymiadau pan fyddwn yn ymdrin â'r ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Credaf mai yn fy etholaeth i, yng Nghonwy, y mae'r gyfran uchaf o bobl hŷn yng Nghymru, a darganfu arolwg yn ddiweddar mai Llandudno yw un o'r trefi ymddeol arfordirol mwyaf poblogaidd yn y DU. Felly, mae penodi comisiynydd pobl hŷn yn ddatblygiad pwysig i'm hetholwyr i ac i bobl hŷn ledled Cymru. Os gallwn fyfyrion am lwyddiant y comisiynydd plant a sicrhau canlyniadau tebyg i bobl hŷn, mae llawer i edrych ymlaen ato.

Wedi ei groesawu'n gyffredinol, dylai'r Mesur gael ei ganmol am ddarparu portffolio eang y bydd y comisiynydd yn gweithredu o'i fewn, ac nad yw'n gyfyngedig i ragdybiaethau a haeriadau ystrydebol o'r materion sy'n effeithio ar bobl hŷn, fel ieched, troseddu ac ofn troseddu. Nid yw pobl hŷn yn ddiamddiffyn o anghenraid, ac mae pobl sydd wedi ymddeol yn gwneud cyfraniad gwirfoddol enfawr i gymdeithas, gan weithio yn y gymuned leol a defnyddio'u sgiliau a'u profiad i helpu pobl ddiamddiffyn o bob oed.

Er y bydd y comisiynydd yn amlwg yn ymdrin â darpariaeth gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, mae llawer mwy o achosion i'w hyrwyddo. Mae eithrio ac ynysu

perception and the characterisation of older people and their perceived limits in our society are all issues that deserve due attention. However, like the children's commissioner, a commissioner for older people will not just be a sounding board for the Government on policies that affect older people, or a voice for older people; the commissioner will analyse the effect of Government policy on older people in Wales.

We should all welcome this commissioner as a made-in-Wales success story that will give older people across Wales a stronger voice. It is an opportunity not just to raise the concerns of older people, but to champion and celebrate their contribution to our communities, and to engage with them for better and more effective policy making for everyone in Wales.

**Lisa Francis:** My colleague, Jonathan Morgan, is right—an inordinate amount of tidying up needs to be done here. We have already heard concerns about cross-border issues. There is a lack of clarity and coherence, and shortcomings have been pointed out by many organisations, including the College of Occupational Therapists, which has said that older people's complex needs must be met seamlessly to enable them to maintain their valid occupations.

In complex and diverse packages of care, it may be the case that some services are from England and others from Wales. So how, for example, will the commissioner be able to support an older person whose complaint may be against a service in England when it is a Welsh local authority or local health board that will have commissioned that particular service on their behalf? There must be greater clarity on how the commissioner takes forward issues that are relevant to older people, but are not part of the devolved functions—which we heard about earlier—of the National Assembly for Wales. Again, the College of Occupational Therapists, in its response, has recommended that there needs to be a far more formal liaison with the UK Government, either directly via the commissioner, or via the National Assembly on non-devolved issues.

cymdeithasol, hyder, rhwystrau'n ymwneud â chysyniad a chymeriadu pobl hŷn a'u cyfyngiadau tybiedig yn ein cymdeithas i gyd yn faterion sy'n haeddu sylw priodol. Fodd bynnag, fel y comisiynydd plant, bydd y comisiynydd pobl hŷn nid yn unig yn seinfwrdd i'r Llywodraeth ar gyfer polisiau sy'n effeithio ar bobl hŷn, neu'n llais i bobl hŷn; bydd y comisiynydd yn dadansoddi effaith polisi'r Llywodraeth ar bobl hŷn yng Nghymru.

Dylem oll groesawu'r comisiynydd hwn fel llwyddiant wedi ei greu yng Nghymru ac a fydd yn rhoi llais cryfach i bobl hŷn ledled Cymru. Mae'n gyfle nid yn unig i leisio pryderon pobl hŷn, ond i hyrwyddo a dathlu eu cyfraniad i'n cymunedau, ac ymgysylltu â hwy er mwyn llunio polisiau'n well ac yn fwy effeithiol ar gyfer pawb yng Nghymru.

**Lisa Francis:** Mae fy nghyd-Aelod, Jonathan Morgan, yn iawn—mae angen gwneud cryn waith tacluso yma. Yr ydym eisoes wedi clywed pryderon ynghylch problemau ar draws ffiniau. Mae yma ddiffyg eglurder a chydlyniant, ac mae nifer o sefydliadau wedi nodi gwendidau, gan gynnwys Coleg y Therapyddion Galwedigaethol, sydd wedi dweud bod angen diwallu anghenion cymhleth pobl hŷn yn ddi-dor er mwyn eu galluogi i gynnal eu galwedigaethau dilys.

Mewn pecynnau gofal cymhleth ac amrywiol, efallai y bydd rhai gwasanaethau'n cael eu darparu yn Lloegr ac eraill yng Nghymru. Felly sut, er enghraifft, y bydd y comisiynydd yn gallu cynorthwyo person hŷn a all fod yn cwyno yn erbyn gwasanaeth yn Lloegr pan fydd y gwasanaeth penodol hwnnw wedi'i gomisiynu ar ei ran gan awdurdod lleol neu fwrdd iechyd lleol yng Nghymru? Rhaid cael mwy o eglurder ynghylch sut y bydd y comisiynydd yn gweithredu ar faterion sy'n berthnasol i bobl hŷn, ond nad ydynt yn rhan o swyddogaethau datganoledig Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru—y clywsom amdanynt yn gynharach. Eto, mae Coleg y Therapyddion Galwedigaethol, yn ei ymateb, wedi argymhell bod angen trafodaeth lawer mwy ffurfiol gyda Llywodraeth y DU, naill ai'n uniongyrchol drwy'r comisiynydd, neu drwy'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar faterion sydd heb eu datganoli.

The proposal for an older people's commissioner may well be perceived to be entirely laudable, but, as the *Daily Post* recently identified, there can be a temptation, which happens far too often and we must be careful of it. Once a person has been appointed to a position like this, those in authority often develop a state of mind that espouses the attitude, 'All of the problems are now solved; all of that is sorted', and thereafter consigned to the 'out' tray. It is that kind of attitude that we must be wary of.

5.10 p.m.

A watchdog to champion the rights of those who are ill, frail or vulnerable makes a lot of sense, but we must not think that, because of this kind of appointment, other issues that affect older people—the kind of issues that we see on the doorstep and in surgeries—such as inadequate pensions after a lifetime of hard work, long waiting lists for routine surgery, and the increase in anti-social behaviour and lawlessness on our streets, are somehow no longer up for discussion. We should not forget certain issues, for example, the fact that up to 40 per cent of pensioners who are entitled to claim pension credits are still not doing so.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I thank Assembly Members for their contributions to this debate. The proposed Bill will establish a commissioner for older people, which will be a landmark development in promoting policies for older people, and another example of where we, in Wales, are able to set an example, not only to the United Kingdom, but to the rest of Europe and possibly the wider world. The decision to proceed with the older person's commissioner was not taken in isolation, but had the overwhelming support of older people in the consultation that took place.

It would be fair to say, on the basis of the consultation, that the people who are most likely to respond are people who are already engaged with older people on issues affecting them. As people who are already engaged as active champions, at a personal level, for

Gellir tybio bod y cynnig i gael comisiynydd pobl hŷn i'w ganmol yn llwyr. Ond, fel y nododd y *Daily Post* yn ddiweddar, gall temtasiwn godi, sy'n digwydd lawer yn rhy aml a rhaid inni ochel rhagddo. Wedi i rywun gael ei benodi i swydd fel hon, mae'r rhai sydd mewn awdurdod yn aml yn datblygu meddylfryd sy'n coleddu'r agwedd, 'Mae pob problem wedi'i datrys bellach; mae popeth wedi'i ddatrys', ac ar ôl hynny caiff ei roi o'r neilltu. Dyma'r math o agwedd y mae'n rhaid inni ochel rhagddi.

Mae corff gwarchod buddiannau i hyrwyddo hawliau pobl sy'n sâl, yn wan neu'n ddiarffyn yn gwneud llawer o synnwyr. Ond ni ddylem feddwl, oherwydd y math hwn o benodiad, nad yw materion eraill sy'n effeithio ar bobl hŷn—y math o faterion a welwn ar garreg y drws ac mewn cyngorfeydd—fel pensiynau annigonol ar ôl oes o waith caled, rhestrau aros hirfaith am lawdriniaeth arferol, a'r cynnydd mewn ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ac anhrefn ar ein strydoedd, yn faterion i'w trafod mwyach. Ni ddylem anghofio rhai materion penodol, er enghraifft, y ffaith nad yw hyd at 40 y cant o bensiynwyr sydd â'r hawl i gael credydau pensiwn yn gwneud hynny o hyd.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Yr wyf yn diolch i Aelodau'r Cynulliad am eu cyfraniadau i'r ddaid hon. Bydd y Mesur arfaethedig yn sefydlu comisiynydd pobl hŷn, a fydd yn ddatblygiad nodedig yn y broses o hyrwyddo polisiau ar gyfer pobl hŷn, ac yn enghraifft arall o'r ffordd y gallwn ni, yng Nghymru, osod esiamp, nid yn unig i'r Deyrnas Unedig, ond i weddill Ewrop, ac o bosibl i weddill y byd. Ni wnaed y penderfyniad i fwrw ymlaen i benodi comisiynydd pobl hŷn ar ei ben ei hun, ond cafodd gefnogaeth unfrydol pobl hŷn yn yr ymgynghori a gafwyd.

Byddai'n deg dweud, ar sail yr ymgynghori, mai'r bobl sydd fwyaf tebygol o ymateb yw'r rhai sydd eisoes yn ymwneud â phobl hŷn ar faterion sy'n effeithio arnynt. Fel pobl sydd eisoes yn ymgysylltu fel hyrwyddwyr gweithredol, ar lefel bersonol, i bobl hŷn, y



older people, they were the people who felt most strongly that there was a need for additional assistance. Many speakers, including Sandy and Val, mentioned that, when they spoke with older people, this Bill was warmly welcomed without exception.

I cannot agree that the point of the commissioner will be to put a range of issues into the 'out' tray, as Lisa Francis suggested. A key element of the older people's commissioner is to be an independent champion for older people. Indeed, I would say that the contrary is likely to happen: the 'in' tray will gradually increase as the older people's commissioner becomes a more effective instrument to champion the cause of older people in Wales.

People have said that the older people's commissioner will not have a sufficient range of powers and activities. However, considering that the Assembly is effectively responsible for all home country functions, with the exception of the justice system and welfare benefits, clearly the older people's commissioner will be able to make a massive contribution to the quality of life of older people in Wales. We will be able to respond to most of the issues that the older people's commissioner will raise, either directly using the powers that we have in the Assembly or by making representations to our colleagues in Westminster. Reference has already been made to the memorandum of understanding and the concordats that exist in this area. Of course, we also know that the Secretary of State for Wales has indicated that his door will always be open to listen to representations from the older people's commissioner.

People mentioned the issue of pensions, and there is no doubt that this is a key issue for older people. However, I think that we also need to be aware of the positive work that is going on between the Assembly and the Department for Work and Pensions to successfully launch the linkage scheme that will provide a one-stop shop for older people in the area of pensions and related benefit matters. So, the older people's commissioner must be seen as part of a wider strategy. Equally, I am aware that the chief constables of Wales have indicated that they are willing

rhain oedd y bobl a deimlai gryfaf fod angen rhagor o gymorth. Soniodd llawer i siaradwr, gan gynnwys Sandy a Val, pan oeddent yn siarad â phobl hŷn, fod y Mesur hwn yn cael croeso mawr yn ddieithriad.

Ni allaf gytuno mai diben y comisiynydd fydd rhoi ystod o faterion o'r neilltu, fel yr awgrymodd Lisa Francis. Un o elfennau allweddol y comisiynydd pobl hŷn yw bod yn hyrwyddwr annibynnol dros bobl hŷn. Yn wir, byddwn yn dweud mai'r gwrthwyneb sy'n debygol o ddigwydd: bydd y pethau y mae angen rhoi sylw iddynt yn cynyddu'n raddol wrth i'r comisiynydd pobl hŷn ddod yn offeryn mwy effeithiol i hyrwyddo achos pobl hŷn yng Nghymru.

Mae pobl wedi dweud na fydd gan y comisiynydd pobl hŷn ddigon o bwerau a gweithgareddau. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried bod y Cynulliad i bob pwrpas yn gyfrifol am bob swyddogaeth yng Nghymru, ac eithrio'r system cyfiawnder a budd-daliadau lles, yn amlwg bydd y comisiynydd pobl hŷn yn gallu gwneud cyfraniad enfawr i ansawdd bywyd pobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Byddwn yn gallu ymateb i'r rhan fwyaf o'r materion y bydd y comisiynydd pobl hŷn yn eu codi, naill ai'n uniongyrchol drwy ddefnyddio'r pwerau sydd gennym yn y Cynulliad, neu drwy gyflwyno sylwadau i'n cyd-Aelodau yn San Steffan. Cyfeiriwyd eisoes at y memorandwm dealltwriaeth a'r concordatau sy'n bodoli yn y maes hwn. Wrth gwrs, gwyddom hefyd i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ddweud y bydd ei ddrws bob amser ar agor i wrando ar sylwadau gan y comisiynydd pobl hŷn.

Soniodd pobl am bensiynau, ac nid oes amheuaeth nad yw hwn yn fater allweddol i bobl hŷn. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod angen inni hefyd fod yn ymwybodol o'r gwaith cadarnhaol a wneir rhwng y Cynulliad a'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau i lansio'r cynllun cyswllt yn llwyddiannus, a fydd yn darparu siop bopeth i bobl hŷn ym maes pensiynau a materion budd-daliadau cysylltiedig. Felly, rhaid ystyried y comisiynydd pobl hŷn fel rhan o strategaeth ehangach. Yn yr un modd, yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod prif gwnstabiailid Cymru wedi dweud eu bod yn barod i wrando

to listen to older people and their commissioner, should they wish to make approaches to them. I think that many of the concerns are only going around the edges, and show signs of trying to nit pick.

Points have been made about border issues, but the Bill specifically clarifies that, where services are commissioned on behalf of people in Wales—even if the service is provided outside Wales—the commissioner will be able to approach the commissioning agency to ensure that action is taken. Therefore, there are provisions in the Bill to deal with the cross-border issue that Lisa Francis and, I think, Jonathan Morgan raised.

David Melding raised an interesting point in that, just as children were involved in the appointment of the children's commissioner, which was a guiding light for the framework for the commissioner for older people, it is important that older people are involved in the appointment of this commissioner. The Assembly Government will be positively disposed towards that. We have made significant progress. The commissioner for older people is, and must be seen as, part of an overall strategy to ensure that the interests of older people are fully integrated into the mainstream policies of the Welsh Assembly Government.

ar bobl hŷn a'u comisiynydd, os ydynt am gysylltu â hwy. Credaf mai dim ond mân gwynion yw nifer ohonynt, a bod yma arwyddion o hollti blew.

Gwnaed pwyntiau ynghylch materion ymylol, ond mae'r Mesur yn egluro'n benodol, lle y comisiynir gwasanaethau ar ran pobl Cymru—hyd yn oed os darperir y gwasanaeth y tu allan i Gymru—y bydd y comisiynydd yn gallu cysylltu â'r asiantaeth gomisiynu i sicrhau cymryd camau. Felly, mae darpariaethau yn y Mesur i ddelio â'r mater trawsffiniol a godwyd gan Lisa Francis, a chan Jonathan Morgan, mi gredaf.

Cododd David Melding bwynt diddorol, sef yn yr un modd ag yr oedd plant yn rhan o'r gwaith o benodi'r comisiynydd plant, a oedd yn arweiniad clir ar gyfer y fframwaith ar gyfer y comisiynydd pobl hŷn, mae'n bwysig i bobl hŷn fod yn rhan o'r gwaith o benodi'r comisiynydd hwn. Bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gadarnhaol o blaid hynny. Yr ydym wedi gwneud cynnydd sylweddol. Mae'r comisiynydd pobl hŷn yn rhan o strategaeth gyffredinol i sicrhau integreiddio buddiannau pobl hŷn yn llawn ym mholisiau prif ffrwd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a rhaid ei ystyried felly.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 1: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val

Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

Ni ddetholwyd gwelliant 2.  
Amendment 2 not selected.

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 3: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 4: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff

Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Williams, Kirsty

Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 5: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 6: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

Cynnig NDM2485 fel y'i diwygiwyd:  
Motion NDM2485 as amended:

*The National Assembly for Wales*

*Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. welcomes the Commissioner for Older People (Wales) Bill which was introduced* *1. yn croesawu'r Mesur Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn (Cymru) a gyflwynwyd yn Nhŷ'r*

*into the House of Lords on 25 May 2005; and Arghwyddi ar 25 Mai 2005; ac*

*2. endorses the commitment to establish a fully independent commissioner for older people in Wales;* *2. yn cymeradwyo'r ymrwymiad i sefydlu comisiynydd pobl hŷn cwbl annibynnol yng Nghymru;*

*3. believes that the immediate priority should be the improvement of services for older people.* *3. yn credu mai gwella gwasanaethau ar gyfer pobl hŷn ddylai'r brif flaenoriaeth fod.*

*Cynnig fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 42, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion: For 42, Abstain 6, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter

Burnham, Eleanor  
 German, Michael  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
 Amended motion carried.*

5.20 p.m.

## **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

### **Polisi Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol: Cynnwys Pobl Ifanc neu eu Hallgáu? Anti-social Behaviour Policy: Bringing Young People in or Shutting them Out?**

**Helen Mary Jones:** I want to address the Assembly on the subject of anti-social behaviour policy. I am grateful for the opportunity to do so, and I have agreed that Mick Bates and Mark Isherwood may have a minute each at the end of my speech, should time allow, to make a short contribution.

Last week, the Joseph Rowntree Foundation published a useful and interesting report called 'Anti-social behaviour strategies: Finding a balance'. This is a powerful piece of evidence, containing some interesting facts about the public's attitudes. For example, four out of five adults are not fearful of young people in their communities, contrary to what some tabloid newspapers would have us believe. The research also, interestingly, shows that the majority of adults favour progressive, community-based approaches to preventing problems over punishing individuals once problems have occurred. Again, that is in contrast to what the tabloid papers would have us believe.

I found the research to be heartening. It cuts through the atmosphere of hostility towards young people and the generation of fear that, sadly, characterised much of the debate around these issues at the recent Westminster elections. I was deeply disturbed by aspects of the tone of that debate, which is one of my reasons for tabling this debate. There is no doubt that there are people in some communities, mostly poor communities, who live in real and justified fear. We all see such cases in our constituency and regional work. We see people whose lives are made a misery by a minority. However, it is a myth that that

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf am annerch y Cynulliad ar bolisi ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i wneud hyn, ac yr wyf wedi cytuno y gall Mick Bates a Mark Isherwood gael munud yr un ar ddiwedd fy araiith, os bydd amser, i wneud cyfraniad byr.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, cyhoeddodd Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree adroddiad defnyddiol a diddorol dan y teitl 'Anti-social behaviour strategies: Finding a balance'. Mae hwn yn ddarn o dystiolaeth bwerus, sy'n cynnwys rhai ffeithiau diddorol am agweddau'r cyhoedd. Er enghraifft, nid yw pedwar oedolyn o bob pump yn ofni pobl ifanc yn eu cymunedau, yn groes i'r hyn a ddywed rhai papurau newydd tabloid. Dengys yr ymchwil, yn ddiddorol iawn, fod y mwyafrif o oedolion o blaid ymagweddau blaengar yn y gymuned tuag at atal problemau yn lle cosbi unigolion ar ôl i broblemau godi. Eto, mae hyn yn groes i'r hyn a ddywed y papurau tabloid.

Yr oedd yr ymchwil yn galonogol, yn fy marn i. Mae'n chwalu'r awyrgylch o elyniaeth tuag at bobl ifanc a chreu ofn a oedd, yn anffodus, yn nodweddu llawer o'r ddadl am y materion hyn yn etholiadau San Steffan yn ddiweddar. Yr oedd agweddau ar naws y ddadl honno, sy'n un o'r rhesymau dros gyflwyno'r ddadl hon, yn fy nghynhyrfu'n fawr. Yn sicr mae yna bobl mewn rhai cymunedau, cymunedau tlawd yn bennaf, sy'n byw mewn ofn gwirioneddol y gellir ei gyfiawnhau. Bydd pob un ohonom yn gweld achosion o'r fath yn ein gwaith etholaethol a rhanbarthol. Gwelwn bobl sy'n

minority always comprises young people—sometimes it is families that cause the problems, and other times it may be those with drug and alcohol problems, yet young people are almost always blamed. Partly as a result of this attitude, in many communities, lives are more restricted by the fear of disorder and crime than by actual crime and disorder itself.

We in the Assembly have a great responsibility to address these issues. I have a particular perspective and experience to bring to the matter. For most of my professional life before becoming an Assembly Member, I worked with young people in communities where anti-social behaviour was, or was believed to be, a problem. My experience illustrates the consistent findings of research: that punishing, excluding and condemning young people does not work, but that listening to them, respecting them and involving them in the rebuilding of their communities does. I will give two brief examples from my experience. I worked in an isolated, hill-top estate in the Valleys where there were high levels of fear of crime, especially among the older residents, and yet there was almost no reported crime and little anti-social behaviour. Older people did not leave their homes after 4 p.m. because they were afraid of teenagers coming home from school, and the young people were sick and tired of being picked on for what they regarded as perfectly normal behaviour, such as playing football and chatting to their mates. The project that I worked with supported young people in volunteering at the pensioners' teas in the community centre, and worked with the local school to bring in older people to talk about their experiences of the war, the depression, the 1926 miners' strike and so on. Gradually, older and younger residents got to know one another, and when the fear of crime was measured on that estate a year later, it was found to have almost disappeared. It was a classic case of misunderstanding being solved by ordinary, day-to-day communication.

dioddef oherwydd lleiafrif. Fodd bynnag, myth yw dweud bod y lleiafrif hwnnw bob amser yn cynnwys pobl ifanc—weithiau, teuluoedd sy'n achosi'r problemau, ac ar adegau eraill efallai mai pobl sydd â phroblemau'n gysylltiedig â chyffuriau ac alcohol ydynt. Ac eto, caiff pobl ifanc eu beio bron bob tro. Yn rhannol o ganlyniad i'r agwedd hon, mewn nifer o gymunedau, caiff bywydau eu cyfyngu yn fwy gan ofn anhrefn a throedd na chan drosedd ac anhrefn gwirioneddol.

Mae gennym ni yn y Cynulliad gyfrifoldeb mawr i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn. Mae gennyf safbwynt a phrofiad penodol i'w cyfrannu yn y mater. Am y rhan fwyaf o'm bywyd proffesiynol cyn dod yn Aelod Cynulliad, yr oeddwn yn gweithio gyda phobl ifanc mewn cymunedau lle yr oedd ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn broblem, neu lle credid ei fod yn broblem. Mae fy mhrofiad yn dangos darganfyddiadau cyson gwaith ymchwil: nad yw cosbi, allgáu a chondemnio pobl ifanc yn gweithio, ond bod gwranddo arnynt, eu parchu a'u cynnwys yn y gwaith o ailadeiladu eu cymunedau yn gweithio. Rhoddaf ddwy enghraifft fer o'm profiad. Bûm yn gweithio ar ystad ynysig ar ben bryn yn y Cymoedd lle yr oedd llawer iawn o ofn troseddu, yn arbennig ymhlith y trigolion hŷn. Ac eto, bach iawn oedd yr achosion o roi gwybod am droseddau ac nid oedd fawr ddim ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Nid oedd pobl hŷn yn gadael eu cartrefi ar ôl 4 p.m am eu bod yn ofni pobl yn eu harddegau wrth iddynt ddod adref o'r ysgol. Ac yr oedd y bobl ifanc wedi alaru ar bobl yn pigo arnynt am wneud yr hyn a oedd, yn eu barn hwy, yn ymddygiad cwbl normal, megis chwarae pêl-droed a sgwrsio â'u ffrindiau. Yr oedd y prosiect y bûm yn gweithio arno yn cefnogi pobl ifanc wrth wirfoddoli i wneud te i'r pensiywyr yn y ganolfan gymunedol, ac yn gweithio gyda'r ysgol leol i drefnu i bobl hŷn fynd yno i siarad am eu profiadau o'r rhyfel, y dirwasgiad, streic y glowyr ym 1926, ac ati. Yn raddol, daeth y trigolion hŷn ac ifanc i adnabod ei gilydd, a phan gafodd ofn troseddu ei fesur ar yr ystad honno flwyddyn yn ddiweddarach, gwelwyd ei fod bron wedi diflannu. Yr oedd yn enghraifft glasurrol o ddatrys camddealltwriaeth drwy gyfathrebu cyffredin o ddydd i ddydd.



On another similar estate at a similar time, there was a different story. There were high levels of crime, including violence and domestic burglary. There were serious tensions in the community, with young people aged between 10 and 25 banned from all activities in the community centre. Graffiti and vandalism were rife, and the peer group of young people was dominated by a small number of very disruptive, violent young men in their late teens who were, sadly, seen as role models by younger children. The project that I was working with spent weeks just sitting on the walls, listening to children and young people. Many were deeply angry at being blamed for what they saw as the bad behaviour of a minority. To quote one young woman, 'Why should I bother to try and be tidy when they shout at us all, even when we haven't done anything?'. Months of persuasion eventually got the community centre to allow us to put on one disco for teenagers, largely staffed by young, off-duty police officers, who were there in case of trouble. The young people set their own rules and they enforced them, including the exclusion of anybody who started to misbehave. Eventually, that led to a weekly youth club, and to young people sitting on the community centre committee and helping to organise events for others. The really difficult young men came to be seen as a nuisance by their peers, not as heroes. All but one of them, who, sadly, ended up in prison, changed their behaviour.

These approaches were characterised by all the relevant agencies—voluntary and statutory—working with the community and committing resources. At the same time that this work was being done with young people, similar work was going on with children and families, work was being done on the physical conditions of the estates, particularly on housing, and, importantly, work was being done on developing visible community policing with which the community could identify. The change that was achieved almost 10 years ago has lasted.

Ar ystad debyg arall ar adeg debyg, yr oedd stori wahanol. Yr oedd lefelau uchel o drosedd, gan gynnwys trais a bwrgeriaeth mewn cartrefi. Yr oedd tensiynau difrifol yn y gymuned, a phobl ifanc rhwng 10 a 25 oed wedi'u gwahardd rhag cymryd rhan ym mhob gweithgaredd yn y ganolfan gymunedol. Yr oedd graffiti a fandaliaeth yn bla, a rheolid y grŵp cyfoedion o bobl ifanc gan nifer fach o ddynion ifanc aflonyddgar a threisgar yn eu harddegau hwyr a ystyrid, yn anffodus, yn batrymau gan blant iau. Yn ystod y prosiect yr oeddwn yn gweithio arno, treuliodd wythnosau yn eistedd ar y waliau, yn gwranddo ar blant a phobl ifanc. Yr oedd llawer yn ddig iawn eu bod yn cael eu beio am ymddygiad drwg gan leiafrif. Meddai un ferch ifanc, 'Pam ddylwn i ymdrechu i fod yn daclus a hwythau'n gweiddi arnom i gyd, hyd yn oed pan na fyddwn wedi gwneud dim byd?' Ar ôl misoedd o berswâd, caniataodd y ganolfan gymunedol yn y pen draw inni gynnal disgo i bobl yn eu harddegau, yn cael ei staffio'n bennaf gan swyddogion ifanc yr heddlu oddi nad oeddent ar ddyletswydd ac a oedd yn bresennol rhag ofn y byddai trafferth. Gosodai'r bobl ifanc eu rheolau eu hunain a'u gorfodi, gan gynnwys eithrio unrhyw un a fyddai'n dechrau camymddwyn. Yn y pen draw, arweiniodd hyn at glwb ieuenctid wythnosol, a phobl ifanc yn eistedd ar bwyllgor y ganolfan gymunedol ac yn helpu trefnu digwyddiadau ar gyfer eraill. Yn y diwedd byddai eu cyfoedion yn edrych ar y dynion ifanc anodd iawn fel niwsans, nid fel arwyr. Newidiodd pob un ohonynt ei ymddygiad, heblaw un, a aeth i'r carchar yn anffodus.

Un o nodweddion yr ymagweddau hyn oedd cael yr holl asiantaethau perthnasol—gwirfoddol a statudol—i weithio gyda'r gymuned ac ymrwymo adnoddau. Tra oedd y gwaith hwn gyda phobl ifanc yn mynd yn ei flaen, yr oedd gwaith tebyg yn mynd rhagddo gyda phlant a theuluoedd, gwaith yn cael ei wneud ar gyflwr ffisegol yr ystadau, yn arbennig ar dai, ac yn bwysicaf oll, yr oedd gwaith yn mynd rhagddo ar ddatblygu dull plismona cymunedol gweledol y gallai'r gymuned uniaethu ag ef. Mae'r newid a gyflawnwyd bron 10 mlynedd yn ôl wedi parhau.

There are similar stories across Wales today. There are communities being supported by statutory and voluntary organisations working together to bring about positive and lasting change. Yesterday, I was privileged to visit the Llanrhymney youth inclusion project in Cardiff, which is taking an innovative approach to working with young people, some of whom have offended and all of whom are perceived to be at risk. It is a model of working in partnership, and has encouraged young people to experience things, and has taken young people who have perhaps never experienced trust into situations where they can develop themselves and their confidence. For example, a group of volunteers was taken to Belarus to paint hospitals and orphanages.

However, the project faces huge challenges, some of which relate to funding. The project has over 20 sources of funding, and therefore it has to work towards 20 sets of targets and has 20 sets of reporting mechanisms. The manager tells me that all her time is spent on that work, which leaves her little time to support her staff and to work with young people. Much of the funding is insecure—staff cannot be sure if they will be in post from one year to the next. Worse, from their point of view, they cannot plan ahead for the young people. Their excellent work is undermined, but it continues.

These community approaches are the way forward. They are not quick fixes—they take time, effort and hard cash—but they work. Anti-social behaviour orders and other punitive approaches often just displace problems, leaving young people isolated and angry and risking making matters worse. Sometimes a line must be drawn, and sometimes action must be taken against individuals, but that line must be drawn at the right time and in the right way.

Community approaches face other barriers to success. I have already mentioned the financial instability and sustainability issues, but there are also issues of policy confusion. Many projects are working to Home Office,

Mae yna hanesion tebyg ledled Cymru heddiw. Caiff cymunedau eu cefnogi gan sefydliadau statudol a gwirfoddol, sy'n gweithio gyda'i gilydd i sicrhau newid cadarnhaol a sefydlog. Ddoe, cefais y fraint o ymweld â'r prosiect cynnwys ieuenctid yn Llanrhymni yng Nghaerdydd, sy'n defnyddio ymagwedd arloesol tuag at weithio gyda phobl ifanc, rai ohonynt wedi troseddu a phob un yn cael ei ystyried mewn perygl. Mae'n batrwm o weithio mewn partneriaeth, ac mae wedi annog pobl ifanc i brofi pethau, ac wedi rhoi pobl ifanc nad ydynt erioed wedi cael profiad o ymddriedaeth mewn sefyllfaoedd lle gallant ddatblygu eu hunain a'u hyder. Er enghraifft, aethpwyd â grŵp o wirfoddolwyr i Belarws i beintio ysbytai a chartrefi plant amddifad.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r prosiect yn wynebu heriau mawr, rai ohonynt yn ymwneud ag ariannu. Mae gan y prosiect fwy na 20 o ffynonellau ariannu, ac felly rhaid iddo weithio tuag at 20 set o dargedau ac mae ganddo 20 set o fecanweithiau adrodd. Dywed y rheolwr wrthyf ei bod yn treulio'i hamser i gyd ar y gwaith hwnnw, sy'n golygu nad oes fawr ddim amser iddi gefnogi ei staff a gweithio gyda phobl ifanc. Mae llawer o'r arian yn ansicr—ni all staff fod yn siŵr a fydd swydd ganddynt o flwyddyn i flwyddyn. Yn waeth byth, o'u safbwynt hwy, ni allant gynllunio ymlaen llaw ar gyfer y bobl ifanc. Mae eu gwaith gwych yn cael ei danseilio, ond mae'n parhau.

Yr ymagweddau cymunedol hyn yw'r ffordd ymlaen. Nid atebion cyflym mohonynt—maent yn golygu amser, ymdrech ac arian—ond maent yn gweithio. Nid yw gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ac ymagweddau cosb eraill yn aml yn gwneud dim ond symud problemau, gan adael pobl ifanc yn ynysig ac yn ddig a pheryglu gwneud y broblem yn waeth. Weithiau, rhaid tynnu llinell, ac weithiau rhaid cymryd camau gweithredu yn erbyn unigolion, ond rhaid tynnu'r llinell honno ar yr adeg gywir ac yn y ffordd gywir.

Mae ymagweddau cymunedol yn wynebu rhwystrau eraill rhag llwyddo. Yr wyf eisoes wedi sôn am yr ansefydlogrwydd ariannol a materion cynaliadwyedd, ond mae dryswch hefyd o ran polisi. Mae llawer prosiect yn

Assembly Government, local government and large voluntary organisation priorities, and trying to do so all at the same time. The projects tell me that they welcome the fact that Assembly and local government priorities in Wales are often different from those of central Government, as they are more community-focused and much less punitive.

At Westminster politicians all too often indulge in rhetoric that scapegoats young people and feeds fear. At all levels and across parties in Wales, there are politicians who understand that community building, fighting poverty and effective community policing are the long-term answers. One might almost say that the Government's Communities First programme is likely to do more to end anti-social behaviour than all the anti-social behaviour orders in the world.

There is consensus in the Assembly around some key issues—for example, we all agree that we need much more in the way of drug rehabilitation. Funds are being found for that, but remain limited. There is also consensus around the need for visible community policing that involves the community. The Assembly Government has influence over policing, but not power. We are hampered in our efforts to build safer communities by the fact that key responsibilities are still held at Westminster. While policing and criminal justice remain non-devolved matters, community safety partnerships, the local organisations charged with building safer communities, will continue to work to a potentially confused agenda in Wales, getting some of their resources and direction from London, and some from the Assembly Government.

I fully acknowledge that the Minister does as much as she can to make the best of the situation, but I submit to the Assembly that ultimately it will not do. In Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales we believe that it is high time

gweithio yn ôl blaenoriaethau'r Swyddfa Gartref, Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, llywodraeth leol a sefydliadau gwirfoddol mawr, ac yn ceisio gwneud hynny i gyd ar yr un pryd. Mae'r prosiectau'n dweud wrthyf eu bod yn croesawu'r ffaith fod blaenoriaethau'r Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru yn aml yn wahanol i flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth ganolog, oherwydd eu bod yn canolbwyntio mwy ar y gymuned ac yn llawer llai cosbol.

Yn San Steffan, mae gwleidyddion yn rhy aml o lawer yn ymroi i rethreg, sy'n rhoi'r bai ar bobl ifanc ac yn cynyddu ofn. Ar bob lefel ac ar draws pob plaid yng Nghymru, mae gwleidyddion sy'n deall mai adeiladu cymunedau, ymladd yn erbyn tlodi a sicrhau dull plismona cymunedol effeithiol yw'r atebion yn y tymor hir. Gellid dweud hyd yn oed fod y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf gan y Llywodraeth yn debygol o wneud mwy i ddod ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol i ben na'r holl orchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn y byd.

Mae consensws yn y Cynulliad ar rai materion allweddol—er enghraifft, yr ydym oll yn cytuno bod angen llawer mwy o adnoddau arnom ar gyfer adsefydlu pobl ar gyffuriau. Yr ydym yn dod o hyd i arian ar gyfer hynny, ond mae'n dal yn fach. Mae consensws hefyd ynghylch yr angen am blismona cymunedol gweledol sy'n cynnwys y gymuned. Mae gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ddylanwad dros blismona, ond nid pŵer. Mae ein hymdrechion i greu cymunedau mwy diogel yn cael eu rhwystro gan y ffaith fod cyfrifoldebau allweddol yn dal yn San Steffan. Er bod plismona a chyfiawnder troseddol yn dal yn faterion sydd heb eu datganoli, bydd partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol, y sefydliadau lleol sy'n gyfrifol am greu cymunedau mwy diogel, yn dal i weithio yn ôl agenda a all fod yn ddryslyd yng Nghymru, gan gael rhywfaint o'u hadnoddau a'u harweiniad o Lundain, a rhywfaint gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Yr wyf yn cydnabod yn llwyr fod y Gweinidog yn gwneud popeth o fewn ei gallu i wneud y gorau o'r sefyllfa, ond awgrymaf i'r Cynulliad na fydd hyn yn ddigon yn y pen draw. Ym Mhlaid Cymru, credwn ei bod yn

that those responsibilities were devolved to enable the Assembly Government to develop a coherent community safety strategy to enable all our citizens to live their lives in peace.

It is regrettable that the White Paper published today is a missed opportunity in this regard, but we will continue to press for this. It is not pie in the sky—we already have a precedent in the devolution of the fire service, which was welcomed across parties.

Those are perhaps issues for the future, but in the meantime all of us in public life in Wales have a duty to challenge the myths and misconceptions about our young people. They are the future of our communities, after all, and the future of our nation. It is a cliché to say so, but it is true. It is all very well for the Prime Minister to talk about developing a culture of respect—I do not think that anyone would disagree with him—but respect must be earned and it must be mutual. How can we expect young people to respect others if we do not show them respect?

**Mick Bates:** We can all sign up to what you just said, Helen. The old saying that ‘prevention is better than cure’ is something that we have to fix this firmly against.

5.30 p.m.

In the minute that I have in which to speak, I would like to emphasise one key point, namely the continuity of funding. So often the projects that Helen described so eloquently are part of an initiative-based funding stream, which may last for a year, three years or are, these days, based on the continual reapplication to lottery funds. I would like to hear a clear statement from the Minister that this good practice that she is developing—and there is no question of that—will be given good, long-term funding. The models of Sure Start and Communities First, with 10-year programmes, are excellent.

We must be careful that anti-social behaviour orders do not become a badge of honour and that they are not issued too easily. The

hen bryd i'r cyfrifoldebau hynny gael eu datganoli i alluogi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddatblygu strategaeth diogelwch cymunedol gydlynol i alluogi ein holl ddinasyddion i fyw eu bywyd mewn heddwch.

Gresyn fod y Papur Gwyn a gyhoeddwyd heddiw wedi colli cyfle yn hyn o beth, ond byddwn yn parhau i bwysu am hyn. Nid breuddwyd gwrach ydyw—mae gennym gynsail eisoes yn y gwaith o ddatganoli'r gwasanaeth tân, a groesawyd gan bob plaid.

Mae'r rheini, efallai, yn faterion ar gyfer y dyfodol, ond yn y cyfamser mae gan bob un ohonom ym mywyd cyhoeddus Cymru ddyletswydd i herio'r mythau a'r camsyniadau ynglŷn â'n pobl ifanc. Hwy yw dyfodol ein cymunedau, wedi'r cyfan, a dyfodol ein cenedl. Mae'n ystrydeb, ond mae'n wir. Mae'n ddigon hawdd i Bif Weinidog y DU sôn am ddatblygu diwylliant o barch—ni chredaf y byddai neb yn anghytuno ag ef—ond rhaid ennill parch a rhaid cael parch o'r ddwy ochr. Sut y gallwn ni ddisgwyl i bobl ifanc barchu eraill os nad ydym ni'n dangos parch tuag atynt hwy?

**Mick Bates:** Gallwn oll gytuno â'r hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud, Helen. Mae'r hen ddywediad ‘gwell rhwystro'r clwy na'i wella’ yn rhywbeth y mae'n rhaid inni osod hyn yn gadarn yn ei erbyn.

Yn ystod y funud sydd gennyf i siarad, hoffwn bwysleisio un pwynt allweddol, sef parhad ariannu. Yn aml iawn, mae'r prosiectau a ddisgrifiwyd mor huawdl gan Helen yn rhan o ffrwd ariannu sy'n seiliedig ar fentrau, a all bara am flwyddyn, tair blynedd neu sydd, erbyn hyn, yn seiliedig ar ail-ymgeisio parhaus am arian loteri. Hoffwn glywed datganiad clir gan y Gweinidog y bydd yr arfer da hwn y mae'n ei ddatblygu—ac nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth ynglŷn â hynny—yn cael ariannu da dros gyfnod hir. Mae modelau Cychwyn Cadarn a Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, sydd â rhaglenni 10 mlynedd, yn ardderchog.

Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus na ddaw gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn rhywbeth i ymfalchïo ynddo ac na chânt

incremental approach, where we have behaviour contracts first and then moving to other things, gives some security to society, because, undoubtedly, there is a fear of crime and we have to have something that offers society as a whole a mechanism to control it.

**Mark Isherwood:** We are often told that it is not crime but the fear of crime that is the problem, but is that not a polite way of saying that the customer is always wrong? In the real world, violent crime recorded by the police in north Wales between 1999 and 2004 was up 127.5 per cent, according to the Home Office, and overall recorded crime was up 40.8 per cent. In a recent survey, 94 per cent of respondents did not believe that crime was going down in north Wales.

Yobbish anti-social behaviour has led to zero-tolerance police blitzes on such activity, such as the current operation Belegorn on Deeside. At the youth justice conference in Llandudno earlier this year, North Wales Police officers told us that they were under Home Office pressure to use anti-social behaviour orders as a first resort when their own policy was to use them as a last resort. Do you agree with the Communities First officer who told me that there is no one-size-fits-all approach and that each case depends on the ability and desire of the individual and his or her family to co-operate?

I am sure that you will also agree that we must give youngsters in trouble a chance to go straight and recognise that much anti-social behaviour is generated not by young people but by adults, such as the family who terrorised my community before anti-social behaviour orders were available. Their use as a first resort in that instance would have saved years of harassment and intimidation.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I thank Helen

eu rhoi yn rhy hawdd. Mae'r ymagwedd gynyddol, lle cawn gonacontractau ymddygiad yn gyntaf ac yna symud ymlaen i bethau eraill, yn rhoi rhywfaint o ddiogelwch i gymdeithas, oherwydd, yn ddi-au, mae yna ofn troseddau a rhaid inni gael rhywbeth sy'n cynnig i gymdeithas yn gyfan fecanwaith i'w reoli.

**Mark Isherwood:** Dywedir yn aml nad troseddu yw'r broblem ond ofn troseddu, ond onid ffordd gwrtais yw hyn o ddweud bod y cwsmer bob amser yn anghywir? Yn y byd go iawn, cafwyd cynnydd o 127.5 y cant yn nifer yr achosion o droseddau treisgar a gofnodwyd gan yr heddlu yn y Gogledd rhwng 1999 a 2004, yn ôl y Swyddfa Gartref, a chynnydd o 40.8 y cant yng nghyfanswm y troseddau a gofnodwyd. Mewn arolwg yn ddiweddar, nid oedd 94 y cant o ymatebwyr yn credu bod nifer y troseddau'n gostwng yn y Gogledd.

Mae ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol iobaidd wedi arwain at ymgyrchoedd dim goddefgarwch gan yr heddlu yn erbyn gweithgareddau o'r fath, fel ymgyrch Belegorn ar Lannau Dyfrdwy ar hyn o bryd. Yn y gynhadledd ar gyfiawnder ieuenctid yn Llandudno yn gynharach eleni, dywedodd swyddogion Heddlu Gogledd Cymru wrthym fod y Swyddfa Gartref yn rhoi pwysau arnynt i ddefnyddio gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol fel dewis cyntaf, er mai eu polisi hwy eu hunain oedd eu defnyddio pan fyddai popeth arall yn methu. A gytunwch â'r swyddog Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a ddywedodd wrthyf nad oes un ymagwedd sy'n addas i bawb, a bod pob achos yn dibynnu ar allu a dyhead yr unigolyn a'i deulu ef neu hi i gydweithredu?

Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch hefyd fod yn rhaid inni roi cyfle i bobl ifanc sydd mewn trafferth i droi dalen newydd a chydabod mai oedolion, nid pobl ifanc, sy'n creu llawer o ymddwyn gwrthgymdeithasol, megis y teulu a fyddai'n brawychu fy nghymuned i cyn bod gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ar gael. Byddai eu defnyddio fel dewis cyntaf yn yr achos hwnnw wedi arbed saith mlynedd o aflonyddu a bygwth.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):**

Mary for bringing this subject as a short debate to the Assembly Chamber. I hope that there is a consensus across parties about the issue of anti-social behaviour policy. We should always be looking for the best in people, particularly our young people, and we should not demonise the young when we talk about these issues. It is very easy to blame youngsters for society's ills and to stereotype them, but the vast majority of young people want to live peaceably and to be good neighbours and responsible citizens. We must also remember that young people are the group most at risk from many sorts of crime and that it is they who are largely targeted by drug pushers. The vulnerability of young people must be recognised by us as politicians. Our commitment to building safer communities across Wales embraces them as young people and what they want from society.

We have to recognise that about a quarter of crime is committed by people under 18 and that the broader community has a right to be protected. We must acknowledge that there is anti-social behaviour, which can make life miserable for individuals and communities. However, a very small number of young people are involved in this anti-social behaviour and it cannot always be linked to the young; we only have to look at other people who make others' lives a misery across the country. Would you like to have seven rusting cars in the garden next door to you and to be fearful of rats and what is happening in people's back gardens? That is also anti-social behaviour.

My view on ASBOs, I think, is well known. I see them as being very much a last resort, as an ASBO is an exceptionally serious conviction. If broken, it can result in a custodial sentence. There are issues about ASBOs being issued under civil law but ending up in the criminal justice system as a result of being broken. They are not to be taken lightly and we would only wish them to be issued as a last resort, and that is the way in which Welsh police forces have tackled this by intervening, across the board, lower down the scale by way of the acceptable

Diolch i Helen Mary am ddod â'r pwnc hwn fel dadl fer gerbron Siambr y Cynulliad. Gobeithio bod consensws ar draws y pleidiau ynglŷn â pholisi ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Dylem bob amser fod yn edrych am y gorau mewn pobl, yn enwedig ein pobl ifanc, ac ni ddylem gythreulio'r ifanc wrth drafod y materion hyn. Mae'n hawdd iawn beio pobl ifanc am ddrygau cymdeithas a'u hystredebu, ond mae'r mwyafrif helaeth o bobl ifanc am fyw bywyd heddychlon a bod yn gymdogion da a dinasyddion cyfrifol. Rhaid inni gofio hefyd mai pobl ifanc yw'r grŵp sydd fwyaf mewn perygl oherwydd nifer o fathau o droseddau, ac mai hwy sy'n cael eu targedu'n bennaf gan y rheiny sy'n gwerthu cyffuriau. Rhaid i ni fel gwleidyddion gydnabod natur ddiamddiffyn pobl ifanc. Mae ein hymrwymiad i greu cymunedau mwy diogel ledled Cymru yn eu cynnwys hwy fel pobl ifanc a'r hyn y maent am ei gael gan gymdeithas.

Rhaid inni gydnabod bod tua chwarter y troseddau'n cael eu cyflawni gan bobl o dan 18 oed a bod gan y gymuned ehangach hawl i gael ei diogelu. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn bodoli sy'n gallu gwneud bywyd yn ddiflas iawn i unigolion a chymunedau. Fodd bynnag, nifer fach iawn o bobl ifanc sy'n gysylltiedig â'r ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol hwn, ac ni ellir ei gysylltu â'r ifanc bob amser; dim ond edrych ar bobl eraill sy'n gwneud bywydau pobl eraill yn hunllef ledled y wlad sydd angen. A hoffech chi gael saith car rhydlyd yn yr ardd drws nesaf ichi ac ofni llygod mawr a'r hyn sy'n digwydd yng ngerddi cefn pobl eraill? Mae hynny hefyd yn ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol.

Mae fy marn i am GYG yn hysbys iawn, mi gredaf. Fe'u hystyriaf i raddau helaeth yn ddewis olaf pan fydd popeth arall yn methu, gan fod GYG yn gollfarn ddifrifol iawn. Os caiff ei dorri, gall arwain at ddedfryd o garchar. Mae dadlau ynglŷn â'r ffaith fod GYG yn cael eu rhoi o dan gyfraith sifil ond yn cyrraedd y system cyfiawnder troseddol yn y pen draw am iddynt gael eu torri. Ni ddylid gwneud yn fach ohonynt, a dim ond pan fydd popeth arall yn methu y byddem am eu gosod. Dyna'r ffordd y mae heddluoedd Cymru wedi mynd i'r afael â hyn drwy

behaviour contracts, as Mick mentioned, and in line with other ways of doing this. Much good practice is emerging on anti-social behaviour. Anti-social behaviour co-ordinators in community safety partnerships across Wales have introduced excellent warning systems as well as the behaviour contracts.

We must do everything possible to avoid excluding our children from society. That is an issue for us. Everything done by children's services should enable young people to realise their potential in adulthood as fulfilled citizens. The all-Wales youth offending strategy, published last July, set this out. The basic principle of the strategy is that the most effective way of preventing youth offending and securing the welfare of children and young people in Wales is to stop them entering the youth justice system in the first place. Together with the Youth Justice Board for England and Wales, the Assembly Government has been closely involved with a wide variety of youth crime diversionary schemes throughout Wales. Youth inclusion programmes are a good example of this. They are aimed at 13 to 16-year-olds engaged in crime or identified as being at risk of offending, truancy or social exclusion. The programme gives young people somewhere safe to go where they can learn new skills, take part in activities with others and get help with their education and career guidance. There are currently six youth inclusion programmes in Wales, and each one targets the 50 most-at-risk young people in their area.

Splash Cymru is another excellent scheme that provides exciting activities for young people aged 9 to 17 over half-term and Christmas holidays. Around 3,000 Welsh youngsters currently take part in the scheme.

Community safety partnerships take the lead locally on a multi-agency basis, and the Assembly Government is providing them

ymyrryd, yn gyffredinol, ar raddfa lai drwy'r contractau ymddygiad derbyniol, fel y crybwyllodd Mick, ac yn unol â ffyrdd eraill o wneud hyn. Mae llawer o arferion da yn dod i'r amlwg ym maes ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Mae cydgysylltwyr ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol mewn partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol ledled Cymru wedi cyflwyno systemau rhybuddio ardderchog yn ogystal â'r contractau ymddygiad.

Rhaid inni wneud popeth a allwn i osgoi eithrio ein plant o gymdeithas. Mae hynny'n bwysig inni. Dylai popeth a wneir gan wasanaethau plant alluogi pobl ifanc i wireddu eu potensial fel dinasyddion bodlon pan fyddant yn oedolion. Yr oedd strategaeth troseddwr ifanc Cymru gyfan, a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Gorffennaf y llynedd, yn gosod hyn allan. Egwyddor sylfaenol y strategaeth yw mai'r ffordd fwyaf effeithiol i atal troseddau ymhlith pobl ifanc a diogelu lles plant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru yw drwy eu hatal rhag mynd i mewn i'r system cyfiawnder ieuenctid yn y lle cyntaf. Ar y cyd â Bwrdd Cyfiawnder Ieuenctid Cymru a Lloegr, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi bod yn gysylltiedig ag amrywiaeth eang o gynlluniau gwyrhoeddu troseddau ieuenctid ledled Cymru. Mae rhaglenni cynhwysiant ieuenctid yn enghraifft dda o hyn. Maent yn anelu at bobl ifanc 13 i 16 oed sy'n troseddu neu sydd wedi'u nodi fel rhai sydd mewn perygl o droseddu, triwanta neu gael eu heithrio'n gymdeithasol. Mae'r rhaglen yn darparu man diogel i bobl ifanc fynd, lle gallant ddysgu sgiliau newydd, cymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau gydag eraill a chael helpu gyda'u haddysg ac arweiniad gyrfaoedd. Mae chwe rhaglen cynhwysiant ieuenctid yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd, bob un yn targedu'r 50 o bobl ifanc sydd fwyaf mewn perygl yn eu hardal.

Mae Splash Cymru yn gynllun ardderchog arall sy'n darparu gweithgareddau cyffrous i bobl ifanc rhwng 9 a 17 oed yn ystod gwyliau hanner tymor a gwyliau'r Nadolig. Mae tua 3,000 o bobl ifanc yng Nghymru yn cymryd rhan yn y cynllun ar hyn o bryd.

Mae partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol yn arwain yn lleol ar sail aml-asiantaeth, ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhoi llawer o

with significant funds to assist with youth diversionary schemes. We are also supporting two significant On Track projects in Rhondda Cynon Taf and Bridgend, which work with children aged between 4 and 11 and their families, and a range of professionals are involved in that.

There are always funding issues around this kind of work. We have to recognise that we need to engage with young people much more. I always feel quite sad when I see what has happened to the youth service over the past 20 years and the use of youth clubs. We must start to prioritise this as a Government, which we have tried to do, and across local government, and activities must be focused in that area. Young people want somewhere to go where they can control their own environment and be engaged in various activities.

It is too easy to forget the positive contribution that young people can make, and Helen Mary alluded to this. In Carway in the Gwendraeth valley, for example, young people worked in partnership with other agencies to refurbish the village hall, and now they have somewhere to go that they can call their own. Youngsters in Tredegar got together to mount a four-week winter activities programme to keep them occupied during the dark evenings. A youth action group in Swansea is helping older people in the Penlan area to feel safer in their homes. The group is supported by the Safer Swansea partnership. Members distribute leaflets, clear gardens of undergrowth to prevent would-be thieves from hiding there, and hand out property marking kits and personal alarms.

I was privileged last week to be involved in the voluntary sector awards, and young people were there doing their bit. This is what young people are doing in Wales. A minority is doing things differently, but we must ensure that we do not demonise the whole group.

I have always made it clear in the Chamber that I would welcome the devolution of the

arian iddynt helpu gyda chynlluniau gwyro ieuencid. Yr ydym hefyd yn cefnogi dau brosiect On Track pwysig yn Rhondda Cynon Taf ac ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, sy'n gweithio gyda phlant rhwng 4 ac 11 oed a'u teuluoedd, ac mae ystod o weithwyr proffesiynol yn gysylltiedig â hynny.

Mae materion ariannu bob amser yn gysylltiedig â'r math hwn o waith. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod angen ymgysylltu lawer yn fwy â phobl ifanc. Byddaf bob amser yn teimlo'n drist wrth weld yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd i'r gwasanaeth ieuencid dros yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf a defnyddio clybiau ieuencid. Rhaid inni ddechrau rhoi blaenoriaeth i hyn fel Llywodraeth, fel yr ydym wedi ceisio'i wneud, ac ar draws llywodraeth leol, a rhaid i weithgareddau ganolbwyntio ar y maes hwnnw. Mae pobl ifanc am gael rhywle i fynd lle gallant reoli eu hamgylchedd eu hunain a chymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau amrywiol.

Mae'n rhy hawdd anghofio'r cyfraniad cadarnhaol y gall pobl ifanc ei wneud, a chyfeiriodd Helen Mary at hyn. Yng Ngharwe yng Nghwm Gwendraeth, er enghraifft, bu pobl ifanc yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth ag asiantaethau eraill i adnewyddu neuadd y pentref, a bellach mae ganddynt rywle i fynd sy'n benodol iddynt hwy. Daeth pobl ifanc yn Nhredeg ar ei gilydd i lunio rhaglen bedair wythnos o weithgareddau'r gaeaf i'w diddanu yn ystod y nosweithiau tywyll. Mae grŵp gweithredu ieuencid yn Abertawe yn helpu pobl hŷn yn ardal Pen-y-lan i deimlo'n fwy diogel yn eu cartrefi. Caiff y grŵp ei gefnogi gan bartneriaeth Abertawe Mwy Diogel. Bydd aelodau'n dosbarthu tafenni, yn clirio llystyfiant o erddi i atal lladron rhag cuddio yno, ac yn dosbarthu pecynnau marcio eiddo a larymau personol.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, cefais y fraint o fod yn rhan o wobrau'r sector gwirfoddol, ac yr oedd pobl ifanc yno yn cyfrannu. Dyma'r hyn y mae pobl ifanc yn ei wneud yng Nghymru. Mae lleiafrif yn gwneud pethau'n wahanol, ond rhaid inni sicrhau nad ydym yn cythreulio'r grŵp cyfan.

Yr wyf bob amser wedi pwysleisio yn y Siambr y byddwn yn croesawu datganoli'r



police, as the fire and ambulance services are already devolved. It would be nice if we had control there. The Welsh police chiefs have shown in their evidence to the Welsh Affairs Select Committee what they think about anti-social behaviour orders and how they should be used, and it is quite clear that that is not the view that emanated from the Home Office on this issue.

heddlu, gan fod y gwasanaethau tân ac ambiwlans eisoes wedi'u datganoli. Byddai'n dda pe bai gennym reolaeth yno. Mae swyddogion yr heddlu yng Nghymru wedi dangos yn eu tystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig beth yw eu barn am orchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a sut y dylid eu defnyddio, ac mae'n ddigon clir nad dyna'r farn a ddaeth o'r Swyddfa Gartref ar y mater hwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Gobeithiaf y gallwn barhau i gael dadleuon byr yr un mor safonol â'r un a gafwyd heddiw o dan ein gweithdrefnau newydd. Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

**The Presiding Officer:** I hope that we can continue to have short debates that are of the same high quality as we have seen today under our new procedures. That concludes today's proceedings.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.38 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.38 p.m.*

#### **Aelodau a'u Pleidiau Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)

Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)