



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 15 Tachwedd 2006**

**Wednesday, 15 November 2006**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 4      Cadarnhau Penodiad Prif Weithredwr Comisiwn y Cynulliad a Chlerc y Cynulliad  
Confirmation of the Appointment of the Chief Executive of the Assembly  
Commission and Clerk to the Assembly
- 7      Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid  
Questions to the Finance Minister
- 28     Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad  
Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside
- 46     Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig  
Revised Business Statement
- 50     Pwyntiau o Drefn  
Points of Order
- 53     Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25  
Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 24.25
- 55     Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Cynllunio Trafnidiaeth Rhanbarthol (Cymru) 2006  
Approval of the Regional Transport Planning (Wales) Order 2006
- 60     Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf yr Amgylchedd Naturiol a Chymunedau Gwledig  
2006 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2006  
Approval of the Natural Environment and Rural Communities Act 2006  
(Commencement) (Wales) Order 2006
- 66     Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Fferyllol)  
(Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.27(iv), a'r Directions to Local  
Health Boards as to the Statement of Financial Entitlements (Amendment) (No. 2)  
Directions 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29  
Approval of the National Health Service (Pharmaceutical Services) (Amendment)  
(Wales) Regulations 2006 under Standing Order No. 24.27(iv), and the Directions to  
Local Health Boards as to the Statement of Financial Entitlements (Amendment) (No.  
2) Directions 2006 under Standing Order No. 29
- 72     Y Cynnydd a wnaed mewn perthynas â Thri Chynllun Ailgyflunio Rhanbarthol y  
GIG  
Progress made in relation to the Three NHS Regional Reconfiguration Plans
- 100    Cynnig Trefniadol  
Procedural Motion
- 101    Y Cynnydd a wnaed mewn perthynas â Thri Chynllun Ailgyflunio Rhanbarthol y  
GIG: Parhad  
Progress made in relation to the Three NHS Regional Reconfiguration Plans:  
Continued
- 115    Pwynt o Drefn  
Point of Order

116 Dadl Fer: Cefnogi Diwylliant yng Nghymru  
Short Debate: Supporting Culture in Wales

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Cadarnhau Penodiad Prif Weithredwr Comisiwn y Cynulliad  
a Chlerc y Cynulliad**  
**Confirmation of the Appointment of the Chief Executive of the Assembly  
Commission and Clerk to the Assembly**

**Lorraine Barrett:** I propose the following motion in my name and in the names of Dafydd Elis-Thomas, Peter Black, William Graham and Elin Jones. I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*confirms the appointment of Claire Clancy as Clerk to the National Assembly for Wales, constituted by the Government of Wales Act 1998. The terms of appointment anticipate the postholder becoming Chief Executive of the National Assembly for Wales Commission and Clerk to the National Assembly for Wales in accordance with the transitional arrangements contained in paragraph 17 of Schedule 11 to the Government of Wales Act 2006. (NDM3313)*

**Peter Black:** I support the motion.

**John Marek:** I wish to speak against this motion. Allow me to say first of all that I do not know Mrs Clancy, and, if this motion were carried, of course I will work with her and she will have my support. She bears no responsibility for the state of affairs in which we find ourselves, except in terms of the extent to which she knew of the circumstances that led to the advertisement of this position. If an employee is employed to do a job—for example, if someone were employed in a factory to be a rat catcher—and someone were to tell that person, ‘We are going to change your job. You are not going to be a rat catcher anymore; there will be a job of chief rodent operative. The job, by and large, will be the same, but there is one problem: your job will end and you will be made redundant, but you can apply for the new job if you wish’, in anyone’s book, that could lead to a case of constructive dismissal and unfair dismissal. If that employee then resigned and went to an industrial tribunal, there would be no doubt in my mind, nor in

**Lorraine Barrett:** Cynigiaf y cynnig canlynol yn fy enw i ac yn enwau Dafydd Elis-Thomas, Peter Black, William Graham ac Elin Jones. Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*yn cadarnhau penodiad Claire Clancy fel Clerc Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru o dan gyfansoddiad Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Mae telerau'r penodiad yn rhagweld y daw deiliad y swydd yn Brif Weithredwr Comisiwn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Chlerc Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn unol â'r trefniadau trosiannol ym mharagraff 17 Atodlen 11 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006. (NDM3313)*

**Peter Black:** Cefnogaf y cynnig.

**John Marek:** Hoffwn siarad yn erbyn y cynnig hwn. Yn gyntaf, gadewch imi ddweud nad wyf yn adnabod Mrs Clancy, ac os caiff y cynnig hwn ei dderbyn, byddaf, wrth gwrs, yn gweithio gyda hi a chaiff fy nghefnogaeth. Nid yw'n gyfrifol o gwbl am y sefyllfa sydd ohoni, heblaw i'r graddau ei bod yn gwybod am yr amgylchiadau a arweiniodd at hysbysebu'r swydd hon. Os cyflogir gweithiwr i wneud swydd—er enghraifft, pe bai rhywun yn cael ei gyflogi mewn ffatri i ddal llygod mawr—a phe bai rhywun yn dweud wrtho, ‘Yr ydym am newid eich swydd. Ni fyddwch yn dal llygod mawr mwyach; fe fydd yna brif swyddog difa pla. Bydd y swydd yn dal yr un fath, fwy neu lai, ond mae yna un broblem: bydd eich swydd yn dod i ben a byddwch yn ddi-waith, ond mae croeso ichi wneud cais am y swydd newydd’, ym marn unrhyw un gallai hynny arwain at achos o ddiswyddo deongliadol a diswyddo annheg. Pe bai'r cyflogai hwnnw'n ymddiswyddo ac yn mynd i dribiwnlys diwydiannol, ni fyddai gennyf fi, nac unrhyw

anyone else's, I think, that this would be a case of constructive dismissal—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You are now raising matters that are outside the scope of the debate on this motion. I ask you to desist from doing so.

**John Marek:** I will try to keep in order, but I was going to draw a parallel, through the description that I have given, with the process that has led to our having this motion before us. It is the same principle. It is a case of unfair dismissal and constructive dismissal—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I asked you to desist from making allegations regarding issues that are outside the scope of the motion.

**John Marek:** I had thought that you would say that, and I abide by what you say. However, no doubt, I can say what I like to the press outside the Chamber afterwards. I cannot say it here—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You may say whatever you wish to the press at any time, as you have been known to do. That is not a matter for me.

Galwaf bleidlais.

**John Marek:** Point of order.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. There cannot be a point of order.

**John Marek:** Are you asking me to sit down?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. There cannot be a point of order, as I have called for a vote.

**John Marek:** Are you asking me to sit down, Presiding Officer?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have called for a vote, because you—

**John Marek:** Are you therefore asking me to sit down and not to proceed with my speech?

un arall, amheuaeth na fyddai hwn yn achos o ddiswyddo deongliadol—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydych yn codi materion sydd y tu hwnt i gwmpas y ddadl ar y cynnig hwn. Gofynnaf ichi beidio â gwneud hynny.

**John Marek:** Ceisiaf gadw mewn trefn, ond yr oeddwn am dynnu cymhariaeth, drwy'r disgrifiad a roddais, â'r broses a arweiniodd at gael y cynnig hwn ger ein bron. Yr un yw'r egwyddor. Mae'n achos o ddiswyddo annheg a diswyddo deongliadol—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gofynnaf ichi beidio â gwneud honiadau ynghylch materion sydd y tu hwnt i gwmpas y cynnig.

**John Marek:** Yr oeddwn yn meddwl y byddech yn dweud hynny, a derbyniaf yr hyn a ddywedwch. Fodd bynnag, mae'n debyg y gallaf roi fy marn i'r wasg y tu allan i'r Siambr yn ddiweddarach. Ni allaf roi fy marn yma—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gallwch ddweud beth bynnag a fynnwch wrth y wasg unrhyw bryd, fel yr ydych wedi ei wneud. Nid mater i mi yw hynny.

I call for a vote.

**John Marek:** Pwynt o drefn.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni allwch alw pwynt o drefn.

**John Marek:** A ydych yn gofyn imi eistedd?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni allwch alw pwynt o drefn, am fy mod wedi galw pleidlais.

**John Marek:** A ydych yn gofyn imi eistedd, Lywydd?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf wedi galw pleidlais, am eich bod—

**John Marek:** Felly, a ydych yn gofyn imi eistedd a pheidio â pharhau â'm haraith?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You have not taken account of my words twice now. You are the Deputy Presiding Officer and you therefore know the rules of order. I have asked you twice—

**John Marek:** Answer my question. Do you want me to sit down?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have asked you twice not to breach paragraph 17(iii) of the Presiding Officer's protocol on conduct in the Chamber, which was approved unanimously by the whole Assembly. That paragraph obliges me to maintain order in the Chamber and to call to order any Assembly Member who seeks to raise a matter that is outside the scope of the debate or the motion. I have now done so twice, and you have persisted. Therefore, I am now calling for a vote.

**John Marek:** Are you asking me to sit down?

**The Presiding Officer:** No. I am calling for a vote.

**John Marek:** You want me to sit down.

**The Presiding Officer:** Whether or not you resume your seat is a matter for you. I have called for a vote.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydych wedi anwybyddu fy ngeiriau ddwywaith bellach. Chi yw'r Dirprwy Lywydd ac felly fe wyddoch beth yw'r rheolau trefn. Yr wyf wedi gofyn ichi ddwywaith—

**John Marek:** Atebwch fy nghwestiwn. A ydych am imi eistedd?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf wedi gofyn ichi ddwywaith beidio â thorri paragraff 17(iii) o brotocol y Llywydd ar ymddygiad yn y Siambr, a gymeradwywyd yn unfrydol gan y Cynulliad cyfan. Mae'r paragraff hwnnw'n fy ngorfodi i gadw trefn yn y Siambr a chadw trefn ar unrhyw Aelod o'r Cynulliad sy'n ceisio codi mater sydd y tu hwnt i gwmpas y ddadl neu'r cynnig. Yr wyf wedi gwneud hynny ddwywaith bellach, ac yr ydych wedi mynnu parhau. Felly, yr wyf yn galw pleidlais.

**John Marek:** A ydych yn gofyn imi eistedd?

**Y Llywydd:** Nac ydw. Yr wyf yn galw pleidlais.

**John Marek:** Yr ydych am imi eistedd.

**Y Llywydd:** Mater ichi yw penderfynu a ydych am eistedd ai peidio. Yr wyf wedi galw pleidlais.

*Cynnig (NDM3313): O blaid 45, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 1.  
Motion (NDM3313): For 45, Abstain 1, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Member voted against:

Marek, John

Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:  
The following Member abstained:

Isherwood, Mark

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions to the Finance Minister**

### **Fformiwlâu Cyllido ar gyfer Dyrannu Cyllidebau Funding Formulae for Budget Allocations**

**Q1 Lynne Neagle:** Will the Minister make a statement on any work being done to improve funding formulae for budget allocations? OAQ0674(FIN)

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** Budget allocations between the portfolios of the Assembly Government are not made on a formula basis. Some service areas such as health and local government are responsible for maintaining and developing their formulae to allocate resources. At present, substantial work is being carried out on the local government formula.

**Lynne Neagle:** You will know that I, along with other colleagues, am impatient for a

**C1 Lynne Neagle:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am unrhyw waith sy'n cael ei wneud i wella'r fformiwlâu cyllido ar gyfer dyrannu cyllidebau? OAQ0674(FIN)

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Nid yw dyraniadau cyllidebol rhwng portffolios Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cael eu gwneud ar sail fformiwla. Mae rhai meysydd gwasanaeth fel iechyd a llywodraeth leol yn gyfrifol am gynnal a datblygu eu fformiwlâu i ddyrannu adnoddau. Ar hyn o bryd, gwneir gwaith sylweddol ar fformiwla llywodraeth leol.

**Lynne Neagle:** Fe wyddoch fy mod i, a chyd-Aelodau eraill, yn awyddus i gael

review of how we allocate funding, not just to education, though that is most important, but across all areas. You referred to the review that you have undertaken, which I understand will include a review of deprivation and sparsity factors to inform the 2008-09 budget settlement. Could you confirm that it will be a wide-ranging review across all parts of the local government settlement? Could you also update us on what action you are taking as Minister to ensure that you meet the timetable that you have set?

**Sue Essex:** Every year, substantial work is done on elements of the local government formula, as there are large numbers of indicators. Only recently, we changed the nature of the formula to underpin this year's provisional local government settlement.

We are focusing on deprivation and sparsity, because they are both elements of weighting that are included in many elements of the local government formula. Currently, the weighting for deprivation comes to around 24 per cent, and, for sparsity, around 7 per cent. We are trying to underpin those weighting allowances by evidence to see whether they are accurate. It is not always easy, but that work is ongoing. We have put education as a priority in line with the recommendation of the committee, and everyone agrees to that. The other area that I guess will be second is social care, because, again, those two elements are strong there. The work needs to be done, because we are moving towards three-year settlements, and our target is to get that work through by then.

**David Lloyd:** Do you accept that the Barnett squeeze effect on the block grant for Wales means that health and education spending in Wales is now down to the UK average, despite our greater needs?

**Sue Essex:** I am not sure whether the figure on education is exactly as you say it is, Dai. We do not really want to get into the whole argument around the Barnett formula again—

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yes, we do.

adolygiad o'r ffordd yr ydym yn dyrannu arian, nid yn unig i addysg, er mai dyna'r pwysicaf, ond ar draws pob maes. Yr oeddech yn cyfeirio at yr adolygiad a wnaethoch, a deallaf y bydd yn cynnwys adolygiad o ffactorau amddifadedd a theneurwydd y boblogaeth i lywio setliad cyllideb 2008-09. A allech gadarnhau y bydd yr adolygiad yn eang ei gwmpas ar draws pob rhan o'r setliad llywodraeth leol? A allech roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am ba gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd fel Gweinidog i sicrhau eich bod yn bodloni'r amserlen yr ydych wedi ei gosod?

**Sue Essex:** Bob blwyddyn, gwneir gwaith sylweddol ar elfennau yn y fformiwla llywodraeth leol, gan fod yna nifer fawr o ddangosyddion. Dim ond yn ddiweddar y newidiwyd natur y fformiwla gennym i fod yn sail i'r setliad llywodraeth leol dros dro eleni.

Yr ydym yn canolbwyntio ar amddifadedd a theneurwydd y boblogaeth, am eu bod yn bwysoliadau a gynhwysir mewn llawer elfen yn y fformiwla llywodraeth leol. Ar hyn o bryd, y pwysoliad ar gyfer amddifadedd yw tua 24 y cant, a thua 7 y cant ar gyfer teneurwydd y boblogaeth. Yr ydym yn ceisio ategu'r lwfansau pwysoli hynny drwy dystiolaeth i weld a ydynt yn gywir. Nid yw bob amser yn hawdd, ond mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n parhau. Yr ydym wedi rhoi addysg fel blaenoriaeth yn unol ag argymhelliad y pwyllgor, ac mae pawb yn cytuno â hynny. Credaf mai'r maes arall a fydd yn ail fydd gofal cymdeithasol oherwydd, unwaith eto, mae'r ddwy elfen hynny'n gryf. Mae angen gwneud y gwaith, oherwydd yr ydym yn symud at setliadau tair blynedd, a'n targed yw gorffen y gwaith erbyn hynny.

**David Lloyd:** A ydych yn derbyn bod effaith Barnett ar y grant bloc i Gymru yn golygu bod gwariant ar iechyd ac addysg yng Nghymru wedi gostwng i wariant cyfartalog y DU, er bod ein hanghenion yn fwy?

**Sue Essex:** Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw'r ffigur ar addysg a roddwch, Dai, yn gywir. Nid ydym am ddechrau ar y ddadl am fformiwla Barnett eto—

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Ydym.



**Sue Essex:** Well, it does not seem to get you very far, because we always come back to the same point: you do not like it, but we think that it has extreme benefits for Wales. We know that convergence is happening, but it will be over a long time. The reason why convergence funding is happening at all is because of the additional money that the Chancellor has been putting in—in heavy loads over recent years. The issue is whether we are getting the priorities right in our budget, and I feel that we have got them right. It is a difficult choice to make in terms of the breakdown between what we give to local government for education—where the bulk, though not all, of the money is spent—and to health. I think that we have got that right, but perhaps we could take a more fundamental look at it after the elections next May. However, I do not hear anyone saying that we have got those dispositions wrong as a Government.

**David Lloyd:** We have a needs-based formula in health—the Townsend formula—and in local government, and what we find with those formulae is that where there is greater need, you have greater amounts of money, so why not have a needs-based formula for the whole of Wales?

**Sue Essex:** The Barnett formula recognises that we have greater needs. That is how it was set up, with a substantial advantage to Wales. It also recognised that Scotland and Northern Ireland have greater needs. Therefore, to indicate that the formula does not reflect need is disingenuous.

As you heard, Lynne is not happy with the existing formula either, and I understand her reasons. The problem is that people will always have degrees of reservations surrounding any new formula, as I always say. Therefore, your idea that leaving Barnett and going on to some other formula would be like waving some kind of magic wand is not one that I can support.

**Jenny Randerson:** The funding formula for local government this year appeared to throw up a 4.9 per cent increase in funding for

**Sue Essex:** Wel, nid yw'n ymddangos ei bod yn datrys fawr ddim, gan ein bod bob amser yn dychwelyd at yr un pwynt: nid ydych yn ei hoffi, ond credwn ei bod yn fuddiol iawn i Gymru. Gwyddom ein bod yn cydgyfeirio, ond bydd hynny dros gyfnod hir. Y rheswm pam mae gennym arian cydgyfeirio o gwbl yw oherwydd yr holl arian y mae'r Canghellor yn ei neilltuo—mewn symiau mawr dros y blynyddoedd. Y mater yw a ydym yn blaenoriaethu'n gywir o ran ein cyllideb, a chredaf ein bod wedi gwneud hynny. Mae'n ddewis anodd ei wneud o ran y dadansoddiad rhwng yr hyn a roddwn i lywodraeth leol ar gyfer addysg—lle y caiff y rhan fwyaf o'r arian ei wario, er nad y cyfan—ac i iechyd. Credaf ein bod wedi blaenoriaethu hynny'n gywir, ond efallai y gallem ystyried y mater yn fanylach ar ôl yr etholiadau fis Mai nesaf. Fodd bynnag, ni chlywaf neb yn dweud bod setliad y Llywodraeth hon yn anghywir.

**David Lloyd:** Mae gennym fformiwla sy'n seiliedig ar anghenion ym maes iechyd—fformiwla Townsend—ac mewn llywodraeth leol, a'r hyn a welwn gyda'r fformiwlâu hynny yw po fwyaf yr angen, mwyaf o arian a gewch. Felly, pam na chawn ni fformiwla'n seiliedig ar anghenion ar gyfer Cymru gyfan?

**Sue Essex:** Mae fformiwla Barnett yn cydnabod bod gennym fwy o anghenion. Dyna sut y'i bwriadwyd, gyda mantais fawr i Gymru. Yr oedd hefyd yn cydnabod bod gan yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon fwy o anghenion. Felly, mae dweud nad yw'r fformiwla'n adlewyrchu anghenion yn anonest.

Fel y clywsoch, nid yw Lynne yn fodlon ar y fformiwla bresennol ychwaith, a deallaf ei rhesymau. Y broblem yw y bydd gan bobl ryw faint o amheuan am unrhyw fformiwla newydd, fel y byddaf bob amser yn ei ddweud. Felly, nid yw eich syniad o adael Barnett a symud ymlaen at fformiwla arall fel chwifio rhyw fath o ffon hud yn syniad y gallaf ei gefnogi.

**Jenny Randerson:** Ymddengys fod y fformiwla ariannu ar gyfer llywodraeth leol eleni yn dangos cynnydd o 4.9 y cant mewn

Cardiff council, but it was later discovered that that was based on the original figure announced last year, which was incorrect, and you recognised that. The census data had not been fully taken into account, and an additional £2.8 million was granted to Cardiff. Are you planning to amend the tables and increase the funding for Cardiff again this year, in line with the 4.9 per cent increase that you have announced?

2.10 p.m.

**Sue Essex:** I have read your comments on this issue, Jenny, and I found them to be particularly outrageous. I will be corresponding with you on that matter. In terms of whether or not this is correct, I have gone back to my officials, and I have been assured that it is correct. The population amendments referred to previous years—not that last year. If you are looking at a straight comparison between this year's funding and next year's funding, it is based on accurate population figures. From that perspective, every local authority that I have spoken to, other than Cardiff, thinks that they are correct. There are discussions going on between my finance officials and Cardiff council representatives; when Cardiff representatives go back and see what they have done, they will find that the 4.9 per cent is exactly as I said.

**Jenny Randerson:** Minister, the 4.9 per cent increase would give Cardiff considerably more money than you intend to give it. The actual increase is 4 per cent. You can base that on figures from the year before last, or on the figures that you originally announced last year, or you can base it on the corrected figure, but you cannot have it both ways—you cannot call it 4.9 per cent and say that you are basing it on the corrected figure from last year.

**Sue Essex:** I can only tell you what my technical officials tell me, which has been backed up by someone from outside the Assembly. The comparison that I announced is true and correct. To have said anything else—to use someone else's word—would have been misleading. I do not want to mislead people. I will go back and look at it again. I have asked my officials to check it,

cyllid i gyngor Caerdydd. Ond darganfuwyd yn ddiweddarach ei fod yn seiliedig ar y ffigur gwreiddiol a gyhoeddwyd y llynedd, a oedd yn anghywir, fel yr oeddech yn cydnabod. Nid ystyriwyd data'r cyfrifiad yn llawn, a rhoddwyd £2.8 miliwn yn ychwanegol i Gaerdydd. A ydych yn bwriadu diwygio'r tablau a chynyddu'r arian i Gaerdydd eleni eto, yn unol â'r 4.9 y cant o gynnydd a gyhoeddwyd gennych?

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf wedi darllen eich sylwadau ar y mater hwn, Jenny, a chredaf eu bod yn warthus. Byddaf yn gohebu â chi am y mater hwnnw. O ran a yw hynny'n gywir, yr wyf wedi trafod gyda'm swyddogion, ac fe'm sicrhawyd ei fod yn gywir. Yr oedd y diwygiadau o ran y boblogaeth yn cyfeirio at flynyddoedd blaenorol—nid y llynedd. Os edrychwch ar gymhariaeth uniongyrchol rhwng arian eleni ac arian y flwyddyn nesaf, mae'n seiliedig ar ffigurau poblogaeth cywir. O'r safbwynt hwnnw, cred pob awdurdod lleol y bûm yn siarad â hwy, ac eithrio Caerdydd, eu bod yn gywir. Mae trafodaethau ar droed rhwng fy swyddogion cyllid a chynrychiolwyr cyngor Caerdydd; pan fydd cynrychiolwyr Caerdydd yn sylweddoli'r hyn a wnaethant, gwelant fod y 4.9 y cant yn union fel y dywedais.

**Jenny Randerson:** Weinidog, byddai'r cynnydd o 4.9 y cant yn rhoi llawer mwy o arian i Gaerdydd nag y bwriadwch ei roi iddi. Y cynnydd gwirioneddol yw 4 y cant. Gallwch seilio hynny ar ffigurau'r flwyddyn cyn y llynedd, neu ar y ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd gennych yn wreiddiol y llynedd, neu gallwch ei seilio ar y ffigur cywir, ond ni allwch ei chael y ddwy ffordd—ni allwch ddweud 4.9 y cant a dweud eich bod yn seilio hynny ar y ffigur diwygiedig o'r llynedd.

**Sue Essex:** Ni allaf ond ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedodd fy swyddogion technegol wrthyf, sydd wedi ei ategu gan rywun y tu allan i'r Cynulliad. Mae'r gymhariaeth a gyhoeddais yn deg ac yn gywir. Byddai dweud unrhyw beth arall—a defnyddio geiriau rhywun arall—wedi bod y gamarweiniol. Nid wyf am gamarwain pobl. Âf yn ôl i edrych ar hynny eto. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion ei

and they are adamant that 4.9 per cent is a proper representation. However, we will check it again if you are still concerned.

gadarnhau, ac maent yn gwbl sicr fod 4.9 y cant yn gywir. Fodd bynnag, gallwn ei gadarnhau eto os ydych yn dal yn bryderus.

**Y Portffolio Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau  
The Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Portfolio**

**Q2 Karen Sinclair:** What priorities were considered by the Minister when allocating the overall budget for the enterprise, innovation and networks portfolio?  
OAQ0700(FIN)

**C2 Karen Sinclair:** Pa flaenoriaethau a ystyriwyd gan y Gweinidog wrth ddyrannu'r gyllideb gyffredinol ar gyfer y portffolio menter, arloesi a rhwydweithiau?  
OAQ0700(FIN)

**Q3 Brynle Williams:** What discussions has the Minister had with the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks on the overall budget allocation to his portfolio?  
OAQ0696(FIN)

**C3 Brynle Williams:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau ynghylch y dyraniad cyllideb cyffredinol ar gyfer ei portffolio?  
OAQ0696(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** I considered the 'Wales: A Better Country' priorities relating to the enterprise, innovation and networks portfolio.

**Sue Essex:** Ystyriais flaenoriaethau 'Cymru: Gwlad Well' sy'n ymwneud â'r portffolio menter, arloesi a rhwydweithiau.

**Karen Sinclair:** Following discussions that I instigated with the Minister with responsibility for transport, Andrew Davies, and officials at Wrexham County Borough Council, I have warmly welcomed the Minister's commitment to explore, on behalf of the Welsh Assembly Government, all possible options to support the proposed Wrexham-London direct rail link. As you will be aware, such a link would not only benefit the regional economy of north-east Wales, but would bring added inward investment and prosperity to the Welsh economy as a whole. Given the pressing nature of this issue, and the potential benefits for Wrexham and beyond, will you give a commitment that, were it possible for such a link to be supported, you will do all that you can to work with transport officials to ensure that this scheme is brought about?

**Karen Sinclair:** Yn dilyn trafodaethau a gychwynnais gydag Andrew Davies, y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb am drafnidiaeth, a swyddogion yng Nghyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam, yr wyf wedi croesawu ymrwymiad y Gweinidog i archwilio pob dewis posibl i gefnogi'r cyswllt rheilffordd uniongyrchol arfaethedig rhwng Wrecsam a Llundain, ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Fel y gwyddoch, byddai cyswllt rheilffordd o'r fath nid yn unig yn fanteisiol i economi ranbarthol y gogledd-ddwyrain, ond byddai'n dod â buddsoddiad ychwanegol a ffyniant i economi Cymru'n gyffredinol. O gofio bod brys yn y mater hwn, a'r manteision posibl i Wrecsam a thu hwnt, pe bai modd cefnogi cyswllt o'r fath a wnewch ymrwymiad y gnewch bopeth o fewn eich gallu i weithio gyda swyddogion trafnidiaeth i sicrhau bod y cynllun hwn yn gweld golau ddydd?

**Sue Essex:** Yes. I am glad that you brought this to my attention; I know that it is an issue of concern to you. All Members would wish to see this scheme go ahead if possible, as it would be of great benefit to Wrexham and the surrounding area. There is an issue about state aid rules, and Andrew and his team are working hard on that to see whether we can help without infringing those rules. We have

**Sue Essex:** Gwnaf. Yr wyf yn falch ichi ddod â hwn i'm sylw; gwn ei fod yn fater o ofid ichi. Hoffai pob Aelod weld y cynllun hwn yn mynd rhagddo os yw'n bosibl, oherwydd byddai o fudd mawr i Wrecsam a'r ardal o gwmpas. Mae yna broblem o ran rheolau nawdd y wladwriaeth, ac mae Andrew a'i dîm yn gweithio'n galed i weld a allwn helpu heb dorri'r rheolau hynny. Rhaid inni fod yn

to be careful on that front, but I can give you an assurance that, if we find a way through and if we can support it, we will do so.

**Brynle Williams:** Yn yr un modd â Karen Sinclair, yr wyf yn gobeithio, Weinidog, y byddwch yn sicrhau bod yr arian ar gael, a'i fod yn mynd i Wrecsam i gefnogi'r orsaf yn llawn.

**Sue Essex:** It would be a very important service connection, would it not, not just for Wrexham, but for that whole area? As an aside—Karen knows this—in the spatial plan treatment for north-east Wales, on which I lead, Wrexham has been identified as a regional centre. In light of that, it is important to get that connection as it would benefit—as I said—the whole of north-east Wales.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Un o'r problemau yn fy ardal i yw diffyg safleoedd ar gyfer datblygu busnes. Derbynai mai cyfrifoldeb Andrew Davies yw hynny, ond mae safle allweddol, sef safle Ferodo, tu allan i Gaernarfon, ar werth. Mae cwmni wedi dangos diddordeb ynddo, ond mae problemau gyda'r safle o ran llygredd, ac mae helyntion anffodus hefyd o hyd o ran gweithiwr a gafodd y sac. Fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am gyllid, a ydych yn credu y byddai arian cydgyfeiriant o Ewrop ar gael i ddatblygu safle llygredig o'r fath yn y dyfodol?

**Sue Essex:** I cannot give an answer on the detail of what is needed at that site. I agree with your presumption that if you have a brownfield site in a core area for development, which this is—the Menai Straits hub is identified in the Wales spatial plan—we should give that priority. It is an existing workplace and I am sure that local people want to keep that centre, and have it followed through. We have a good record of doing just that in Wales, using funds for reclamation, which were previously held by the Welsh Development Agency, to bring forward schemes. I will ensure that the point is brought to Andrew Davies's attention. If he can add something further, I am sure that he will do so.

**Alun Cairns:** In considering priorities for the

ofalus o hynny, ond os gallwn ddod o hyd i ffordd i ddatrys y broblem, gallaf eich sicrhau y byddwn yn gwneud hynny.

**Brynle Williams:** Like Karen Sinclair, I hope, Minister, that you will ensure that the money is available, and that it goes to Wrexham to fully support the station.

**Sue Essex:** Byddai'n gyswllt gwasanaeth pwysig iawn, oni fyddai, nid yn unig i Wrecsam, ond i'r ardal honno'n gyfan? Ar wahân i hynny—mae Karen yn gwybod hyn—nodwyd Wrecsam fel canolfan ranbarthol yn y cynllun gofodol ar gyfer y gogledd-ddwyrain, a wnaed o dan fy arweiniad i. Yng ngoleuni hynny, mae'n bwysig sicrhau'r cyswllt hwnnw oherwydd byddai'n fanteisiol i'r gogledd-ddwyrain yn gyfan—fel y dywedais.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** One problem in my area is the lack of sites for business development. I accept that that is the responsibility of Andrew Davies, but there is a key site, the Ferodo site, for sale just outside Caernarfon. A company has shown some interest in it, but there are problems at the site with pollution, and there are also some unfortunate troubles regarding sacked workers. As the Minister responsible for finance, do you think convergence funding from Europe would be available in future to develop a polluted site such as this?

**Sue Essex:** Ni allaf roi ateb ynghylch yr hyn y mae angen ar y safle hwnnw. Cytunaf â'ch rhagdybiaeth y dylid rhoi blaenoriaeth i safle tir llwyd mewn ardal ddatblygu graidd, fel yr ardal hon—mae ardal graidd Menai wedi ei nodi yng nghynllun gofodol Cymru. Mae'n weithle sy'n bodoli eisoes ac yr wyf yn siŵr fod pobl leol am gadw'r ganolfan honno, a'i gweld yn cael ei datblygu. Mae gennym hanes da o wneud hynny yng Nghymru, gan ddefnyddio arian ar gyfer adfer, yng ngofal Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru gynt, i ddatblygu cynlluniau. Byddaf yn sicrhau tynnu sylw Andrew Davies at y pwynt. Os gall ychwanegu rhywbeth pellach, yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff hynny.

**Alun Cairns:** Wrth ystyried blaenoriaethau

enterprise portfolio, what consideration did you give to including childcare within it? Traditionally, childcare has come under other portfolios and departments, but do you not recognise that there is a strong economic need to improve childcare? Including it in the enterprise portfolio would send out the right message to business, which we are trying to influence to change its culture and offer flexible working arrangements and childcare facilities so that we can improve with regard to our economic inactivity levels, which are desperately high in some communities.

**Sue Essex:** Thank you, Alun; there were some useful points there. Jane Hutt, as the Minister with responsibility for children, is taking the lead on looking at childcare across the piece, because it is relevant to people taking up training, and when support is needed in the family. I agree that it is part of our economic considerations, and we know that it is an important part of tackling economic inactivity. While I want that to be recognised, I am not sure that it should be included in the enterprise, innovation and networks portfolio. However, Jane is here and will have heard what you said.

I think that employers, perhaps working as a group, particularly where you have an industrial estate or business park, can, together, make a really good contribution with regard to childcare. We need to ensure that planning rules support that and that we think ahead when developing such new areas, so that we make provision for crèche and childcare facilities.

**Kirsty Williams:** As we have heard, the development of transport infrastructure can be a powerful driver for economic development in communities throughout Wales. Network Rail is busily extending the platforms of many of the Valleys stations in south Wales to allow for greater capacity for people to travel up and down the Valleys. That will, hopefully, increase those people's economic opportunities. However, there seems to be some doubt as to whether the platforms will be utilised. Have you had discussions with the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks about making

ar gyfer y portffolio menter, i ba raddau yr ydych wedi ystyried cynnwys gofal plant ynddo? Yn draddodiadol, mae gofal plant wedi dod o dan bortffolios ac adrannau eraill, ond onid ydych yn cydnabod bod angen economaidd cryf am wella gofal plant? Byddai ei gynnwys yn y portffolio menter yn cyfleu'r neges gywir i fusnesau yr ydym yn ceisio dylanwadu arnynt i newid eu diwylliant a chynnig trefniadau gwaith hyblyg a chyfleusterau gofal plant, fel y gallwn wella ein lefelau anweithgarwch economaidd, sy'n ddifrifol uchel mewn rhai cymunedau.

**Sue Essex:** Diolch, Alun; yr oedd gennych rai pwyntiau defnyddiol. Jane Hutt, fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am blant, sy'n arwain y gwaith o edrych ar ofal plant yn gyffredinol, oherwydd mae'n berthnasol i bobl sy'n cael hyfforddiant, a phan fydd angen cymorth yn y teulu. Cytunaf ei fod yn rhan o'n hystyriaethau economaidd, a gwyddom ei fod yn rhan bwysig o leihau anweithgarwch economaidd. Er fy mod am i hynny gael ei gydnabod, nid wyf yn siŵr a ddylid ei gynnwys yn y portffolio menter, arloesi a rhwydweithiau. Fodd bynnag, mae Jane yma, a bydd wedi clywed yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud.

Credaf y gall cyflogwyr, hwyrach drwy weithio fel grŵp, yn enwedig lle bydd ystâd ddiwydiannol neu barc busnes, gyda'i gilydd wneud cyfraniad gwirioneddol i ofal plant. Mae angen i ni sicrhau bod rheolau cynllunio yn ategu hynny a'n bod yn meddwl ymlaen wrth ddatblygu ardaloedd newydd o'r fath, er mwyn inni ddarparu ar gyfer cyfleusterau meithrinfa a gofal plant.

**Kirsty Williams:** Fel yr ydym wedi clywed, gall datblygu seilwaith trafndiaeth fod yn bwysig iawn wrth lywio datblygiadau economaidd mewn cymunedau ledled Cymru. Mae Network Rail wrthi'n ehangu platfformau mewn llawer gorsaf yng Nghymoedd y de i alluogi mwy o bobl i deithio i fyny ac i lawr y Cymoedd. Bydd hynny, gobeithio, yn cynyddu cyfleoedd economaidd y bobl hynny. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys fod ychydig amheuaeth a fydd y platfformau'n cael eu defnyddio. A ydych wedi cael trafodaethau gyda'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau

money available to ensure that the extra carriages that will be needed to transport passengers up and down the Valleys in comfort will be available?

**Sue Essex:** I was au fait with the transport portfolio a few years ago, as the former Minister with responsibility for this; I am not so familiar with it now. However, when I was the Minister responsible, the big drawback to getting extra carriages put on the Valleys lines was that the platforms could not support them. As part of the package of public transport improvements, considerable attention was paid to providing that physical infrastructure. I am not aware of any problem; the big issue for me, with regard to my constituents at the end of the Valleys lines, is whether there is sufficient capacity to allow them to get onto carriages at the stations in Cardiff North.

2.20 p.m.

However, I do not know whether there are problems—I had not thought that there were, and my colleagues from the Valleys are not indicating to the contrary. If there are any problems, please write to me, and Andrew and I will respond.

**John Marek:** Is the Minister aware that one of the amendments to her draft budget contained a request for money for the Wrexham-to-Marylebone railway service, and that Karen Sinclair not only voted against that amendment but, indeed, cannot even be bothered to stay in the Chamber to hear the answer to her question?

**Leighton Andrews:** For God's sake.

**John Marek:** It is not 'For God's sake'; it shows the interest that Members have. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Deputy Presiding Officer has presided over many Plenary meetings, and he knows that whether or not a Member is present is not a matter for the Minister.

**John Marek:** However, can the Minister say

ynghylch darparu arian i sicrhau y bydd y cerbydau ychwanegol ar gael i gludo teithwyr i fyny ac i lawr y Cymoedd yn gyfforddus?

**Sue Essex:** Yr oeddwn yn hollol gyfarwydd â'r portffolio trafniadaeth ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl, fel y cyn Weinidog a oedd yn gyfrifol am hyn; nid wyf mor gyfarwydd ag ef bellach. Fodd bynnag, pan oeddwn yn gyfrifol amdano, y brif anfantaes o ran rhoi mwy o gerbydau ar linellau'r Cymoedd oedd na allai'r platfformau eu cymryd. Fel rhan o'r pecyn gwella cludiant cyhoeddus, rhoddwyd sylw sylweddol i ddarparu'r seilwaith ffisegol hwnnw. Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw broblem; y broblem fawr imi, o ran fy etholwyr ar ddiwedd llinellau'r Cymoedd, yw a oes digon o le iddynt allu mynd ar gerbydau yn y gorsafoddd yng ngogledd Caerdydd.

Fodd bynnag, ni wn a oes unrhyw broblemau—nid oeddwn wedi meddwl bod yna broblemau, ac nid yw fy nghyd-Aelodau o'r Cymoedd yn dangos eu bod yn credu'n wahanol. Os oes unrhyw broblemau, mae croeso ichi ysgrifennu ataf, a bydd Andrew a minnau'n ateb.

**John Marek:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod un o'r diwygiadau yn ei chyllideb ddrafft yn cynnwys cais am arian ar gyfer y gwasanaeth rheilffordd o Wrecsam i Marylebone, a bod Karen Sinclair nid yn unig wedi pleidleisio yn erbyn y diwygiad hwnnw, ond, yn wir, nad yw wedi trafferthu aros yn y Siambr i glywed yr ateb i'w chwestiwn?

**Leighton Andrews:** Er mwyn Duw.

**John Marek:** Nid oes a wnelo hynny ag 'Er mwyn Duw'; mae'n dangos faint o ddi-ddordeb sydd gan Aelodau. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O']

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Dirprwy Lywydd wedi llywyddu nifer o gyfarfodydd Llawn, a gŵyr nad mater i'r Gweinidog yw a yw Aelod yn bresennol ai peidio.

**John Marek:** Fodd bynnag, a all y

whether she has allocated any money to the dualling of the railway line between Wrexham and Saltney junction, or to the electrification of the line between Bidston and Wrexham, which, of course, formed part of the conclusions of the Committee on Rail Infrastructure and Improved Passenger Services passed by the Assembly earlier this year?

**Sue Essex:** These questions should really go to Andrew Davies. I understand that I am the Finance Minister, but the priorities for expenditure in his budget are at Andrew's disposition. I know that the budget is coming before the committee—perhaps it has already, but it will be coming—and it is the committee's job to scrutinise the budget in that way. That is what the Standing Orders say.

On the first point, of course I am aware of the amendment, and my response to Karen's question was framed on what I believe is emerging to be a good scheme. The issue is, as I said, to make the decision one that is not challengeable.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I note your remarks about the Rhymney valley line, and I fully support the plans in place to improve the service. However, will you urge Cardiff City Council to work with Arriva Trains, Network Rail and the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that the bridge over Queen Street is widened, so that the bottleneck that currently is Queen Street station is improved significantly?

**Sue Essex:** This is very much déjà vu territory for me, because this issue goes back to my time as a Cardiff councillor, and even further. The key message in dealing with public transport in this area is that there has to be an integrated approach despite geography and across different transport modes. There has been a major issue with capacity at the Queen Street bridge junction, and I do not know how many times I have sat on a train, waiting outside the junction to get into the station. It really is a priority that this matter is taken forward. I was not aware of an issue with Cardiff council, but I will speak to Andrew about the matter and see what we

Gweinidog ddweud a yw wedi dyrannu unrhyw arian i ddeuoli'r llinell reilffordd rhwng Wrecsam a chyffordd Saltney, neu i drydaneiddio'r llinell rhwng Bidston a Wrecsam a oedd, wrth gwrs, yn rhan o gasgliadau'r Pwyllgor ar y Seilwaith Rheilffyrdd a Gwella Gwasanaethau i Deithwyr a gymeradwywyd gan y Cynulliad yn gynharach eleni?

**Sue Essex:** Dylai'r cwestiynau hyn gael eu rhoi i Andrew Davies mewn gwirionedd. Deallaf mai fi yw'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, ond Andrew sy'n gyfrifol am bennu'r blaenoriaethau gwariant yn ei gyllideb. Gwn fod y gyllideb ar fin cael ei chyflwyno i'r pwyllgor—efallai ei bod eisoes wedi ei chyflwyno, ond mae hynny ar droed—a gwaith y pwyllgor yw craffu ar y gyllideb fel hynny. Dyna a ddywed y Rheolau Sefydlog.

Ar y pwynt cyntaf, wrth gwrs yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r diwygiad, a seiliwyd fy ymateb i gwestiwn Karen ar yr hyn sydd. mi gredaf, yn datblygu'n gynllun da. Y mater dan sylw, fel y dywedais, yw sicrhau gwneud y penderfyniad yn un na ellir ei herio.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Nodaf eich sylwadau ar linell cwm Rhymni, a chefnogaf yn llwyr y cynlluniau sydd ar waith i wella'r gwasanaeth. Fodd bynnag, a fyddwch yn annog Cyngor Sir Caerdydd i weithio gyda Threnau Arriva, Network Rail a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod y bont dros Heol y Frenhines yn cael ei hehangu, er mwyn i'r dagfa sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd yng ngorsaf Heol y Frenhines wella'n sylweddol?

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r sefyllfa hon yn gyfarwydd iawn imi, oherwydd roedd y broblem hon yn bodoli pan oeddwn yn gynghorydd yng Nghaerdydd, a hyd yn oed yn gynharach na hynny. Y neges allweddol wrth ymdrin â chlundiant cyhoeddus yn yr ardal hon yw ei bod yn rhaid gweithredu mewn modd integredig er gwaethaf y ddaearyddiaeth ac ar draws gwahanol fathau o gludiant. Mae maint y gyffordd ar bont Heol y Frenhines wedi bod yn broblem fawr, ac ni wn sawl gwaith yr wyf wedi eistedd ar y trê, yn aros y tu allan i'r gyffordd i fynd i mewn i'r orsaf. Mae angen gweithredu ar hyn fel mater o flaenoriaeth. Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol o

can do.

broblem gyda chyngor Caerdydd, ond fe siaradaf ag Andrew ynghylch hyn i weld beth y gallwn ei wneud.

### **Cynyddu Grym Gwario Increasing the Power of Spending**

**Q4 The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** Will the Minister make a statement on the use of better procurement to increase the power of Welsh Assembly Government spending? OAQ0699(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** It is essential that we improve the value for money that we gain from our expenditure. Value Wales now covers internal Assembly procurement as well as supporting the wider public sector. We look forward to using the available leverage to deliver further efficiency gains as well as wider public service benefits.

**Michael German:** Could you clarify the position with regard to the sums of money allocated to Value Wales to look at issues of schools' delegated budgets and efficiency improvements in those budgets? Last year, you said in a statement that it would be fully funded to the tune of £3.5 million to cover that area, which is the whole of Value Wales. However, when its representatives appeared before the Local Government and Public Services Committee, they seemed unaware that there was any extra funding to do this work. Could you clarify exactly how much has been provided and what instructions were given to Value Wales to carry out that work?

**Sue Essex:** They were looking at the whole budget of £3.5 million. Some £0.5 million is there to support schools. Two members of Value Wales staff were in attendance last week—one is leading on the revenue side, and particularly on schools' individual budgets, and the other is leading on the capital side. That has roughly split the budget in half.

**Leighton Andrews:** Better procurement is often a feature of the Assembly's Audit Committee reports, and it also features quite

**C4 Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddefnyddio trefn gaffael well er mwyn cynyddu grym gwario Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? OAQ0699(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** Mae'n hanfodol inni wella'r gwerth am arian a gawn o'n gwariant. Mae Gwerth Cymru bellach yn cwmpasu trefn gaffael fewnol y Cynulliad yn ogystal ag ategu'r sector cyhoeddus ehangach. Edrychwn ymlaen at ddefnyddio'r trosoledd sydd ar gael i sicrhau mwy o enillion effeithlonrwydd yn ogystal â manteision ehangach i wasanaethau cyhoeddus.

**Michael German:** A allech egluro'r sefyllfa o ran yr arian a roir i Gwerth Cymru i edrych ar gyllidebau dirprwyedig ysgolion a gwelliannau effeithlonrwydd yn y cyllidebau hynny? Mewn datganiad y llynedd, yr oeddech yn dweud y byddai'n cael ei ariannu'n llawn gan £3.5 miliwn i gwmpasu'r maes hwnnw, hynny yw, Gwerth Cymru yn gyfan. Fodd bynnag, pan ymddangosodd ei gynrychiolwyr gerbron y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus, nid oeddent fel pe baent yn gwybod bod arian ychwanegol ar gael i wneud y gwaith hwn. A allech gadarnhau'n union faint a ddarparwyd, a pha gyfarwyddiadau a roddwyd i Gwerth Cymru i wneud y gwaith hwnnw?

**Sue Essex:** Yr oeddent yn edrych ar y gyllideb gyfan o £3.5 miliwn. Mae tua £0.5 miliwn ar gael i gynorthwyo ysgolion. Yr oedd dau aelod o staff Gwerth Cymru yn bresennol yr wythnos diwethaf—mae'r naill yn arwain yr ochr refeniw, ac yn arbennig cyllidebau unigol ysgolion, a'r llall yn arwain yr ochr gyfalaf. Mae hynny'n fras wedi rhannu'r gyllideb yn ddwy.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae trefn gaffael well yn aml yn nodwedd yn adroddiadau Pwyllgor Archwilio'r Cynulliad, ac mae hefyd yn rhan



heavily in the Beecham review. Obviously, better procurement contributes to realising more money to spend, ultimately, on services for our constituents. Are you in a position yet to comment on the outcome of the Beecham review? Would you agree that it is important that that review is driven politically so that we get the best bang for our constituents' bucks?

**Sue Essex:** I will make a statement on the Beecham review next Tuesday, on 21 November. There was so much to respond to in the Beecham review, to be honest. There were an enormous number of recommendations and sensible things to consider. When I make the statement, I hope that you, Leighton, and other people will feel confident that there is enough in that response. It will be only the beginning of taking the whole process through.

To return to procurement, it is an essential component. Of course, this was started way before we asked Jeremy Beecham to come in. It is a tribute to the group that started this off, based in the Swansea office, that it has now developed into Value Wales. I think that £24.6 million has already been saved. There are big sums to be saved in this area, along with achieving more effective delivery, so I feel strongly that procurement will be a major arm of those efficiency savings.

**Elin Jones:** Gan fod gennym gyfrifoldeb dros ddatblygu cynaliadwy, a ydych yn credu y dylai fod yn rheidrydd ac yn ffactor amlwg yn y cytundebau caffael i leihau'r pellter teithio wrth gyflenwi unrhyw nwyddau neu wasanaethau?

**Sue Essex:** We have put a lot of emphasis on that aspect of sustainable procurement, but we are in our infancy in this area. There is no blueprint out there to pick up and follow through. The advice on contracts has been to try to include some of those key elements of sustainability. Last time, you spoke in a different vein on procurement, but if you have any examples of incidents of that not being done properly, or if you have any ideas as to how this could be improved, by all means let me know.

bwysig o adolygiad Beecham. Yn amlwg, mae trefn gaffael well yn cyfrannu at sicrhau bod mwy o arian ar gael, yn y pen draw, i'w wario ar wasanaethau i'n hetholwyr. A ydych mewn sefyllfa eto i roi eich barn am ganlyniad adolygiad Beecham? A fydddech yn cytuno ei bod yn bwysig bod yr adolygiad hwnnw'n cael ei lywio'n wleidyddol fel y gallwn sicrhau'r gwerth gorau am arian i'n hetholwyr?

**Sue Essex:** Byddaf yn gwneud datganiad ar adolygiad Beecham ddydd Mawrth nesaf, 21 Tachwedd. Yr oedd cymaint i ymateb iddo yn adolygiad Beecham, a bod yn onest. Yr oedd nifer enfawr o argymhellion a phethau synhwyrol i'w hystyried. Pan fyddaf yn gwneud y datganiad, gobeithio y byddwch chi, Leighton, a phobl eraill yn teimlo'n hyderus bod digon yn yr ymateb hwnnw. Dim ond dechrau'r gwaith o weithredu'r broses gyfan fydd hwn.

I ddychwelyd at gaffael, mae'n elfen hanfodol. Wrth gwrs, dechreuwyd ar hyn cyn inni ofyn i Jeremy Beecham ymuno â ni. Mae'n deyrnged i'r grŵp a ddechreuodd hyn, yn y swyddfa yn Abertawe, ei fod bellach wedi datblygu'n Gwerth Cymru. Credaf fod £24.6 miliwn wedi ei arbed eisoes. Mae arbedion mawr i'w gwneud yn y maes hwn, ynghyd â sicrhau darparu'n fwy effeithiol,. Felly, yr wyf yn teimlo'n gryf y bydd caffael yn rhan bwysig o'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd hynny.

**Elin Jones:** Given our responsibility for sustainable development, do you think it should be a requirement of procurement contracts, and an obvious element in them, that travelling distances for the supply of any goods or services be reduced?

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydym wedi rhoi cryn bwyslais ar yr agwedd honno ar gaffael cynaliadwy, ond megis dechrau mae'r gwaith yn y maes hwn. Nid oes patrwm ar gael i'w ddilyn. Y cyngor a roddwyd ar gontractau oedd ceisio cynnwys rhai o'r elfennau cynaliadwyedd allweddol hynny. Y tro diwethaf, yr oeddech yn siarad am gaffael mewn cywair gwahanol, ond os oes gennych unrhyw enghreifftiau lle na wnaed hynny'n gywir, neu os oes gennych unrhyw syniadau sut y gellid gwella hyn, mae croeso ichi roi gwybod imi.

**David Melding:** We would all like to see more procurement from Welsh firms, but there seems to be a great deal of inexactitude as to the percentage procured at present, as the figures mix up indigenous companies with multinational or UK companies that have a presence in Wales. Could Value Wales do more promotional activity to encourage small and medium-sized enterprises particularly to enter the procurement process? I do not mean that to fix the system for them, but so that they realise the opportunities that are there.

**Sue Essex:** We do know that that percentage is nearly 50 per cent, but we suspect that that is a higher figure. Outside commentators feel that that is extremely good going, as it is definitely going upwards and, of course, it is good news for the suppliers in Wales. It is the suppliers that need tackling here. We are getting lots of good initiatives through from Value Wales, such as the Welsh purchase card project and collaborative procurement. Lots of things are going on. We must ensure that the Welsh supply side, particularly the small enterprises, can avail themselves of those contracts and can tender properly for them. Andrew leads on this work. It is vital in Wales, because we have so many small and medium-sized—but I emphasise the ‘small’—enterprises. We need to bring them up to speed so that they can get the work.

**David Melding:** Hoffem i gyd weld mwy o gaffael gan gwmnïau yng Nghymru, ond ymddengys fod llawer o anghywirdeb am y ganran a gaiff ei chaffael ar hyn o bryd, gan fod y ffigurau’n cymysgu cwmnïau brodorol a chwmnïau rhyngwladol neu gwmnïau’r DU sydd yng Nghymru. A allai Gwerth Cymru wneud mwy o weithgarwch hyrwyddo i annog busnesau bach a chanolig yn arbennig i ddod i mewn i’r broses gaffael? Ni olygaf hynny er mwyn trefnu’r system ar eu cyfer, dim ond er mwyn iddynt sylweddoli bod y cyfleoedd ar gael.

**Sue Essex:** Gwyddom fod y ganran honno bron yn 50 y cant, ond amheurn fod hwnnw’n ffigur uwch. Ym marn sylwebwyr allanol mae hynny’n dda iawn, gan ei fod yn sicr yn cynyddu, ac wrth gwrs mae’n newyddion da i gyflenwyr yng Nghymru. Y cyflenwyr y mae angen mynd i’r afael â hwy yma. Mae Gwerth Cymru yn cyflwyno nifer o fentrau da, megis prosiect cerdyn prynu Cymru a chydgaaffael. Mae nifer o bethau’n mynd ymlaen. Rhaid inni sicrhau y gall cyflenwyr Cymru, yn enwedig busnesau bach, gael budd o’r contractau hynny a thendro amdanynt yn briodol. Andrew sy’n arwain y gwaith hwn. Mae’n hanfodol yng Nghymru, gan fod gennym gynifer o fusnesau bach a chanolig—ond pwysleisiaf y rhai ‘bach’. Mae angen inni sicrhau eu bod yn cael y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf fel y gallant gael y gwaith.

### **Y Portffolio Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio The Social Justice And Regeneration Portfolio**

**Q5 Leanne Wood:** What consideration did the Minister give to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee’s discussions on budget priorities when formulating the overall budget allocation to that portfolio? OAQ0684(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** I take the outcome of any committee discussions on the budgets into careful consideration, and I also listen to the Minister.

**Leanne Wood:** One issue that we discuss regularly in the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee is that of post offices, particularly the post office

**C5 Leanne Wood:** Pa ystyriaeth a roddodd y Gweinidog i drafodaethau’r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ynghylch blaenoriaethau’r gyllideb wrth lunio’r dyraniad cyllideb cyffredinol i’r portffolio hwnnw? OAQ0684(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** Byddaf yn ystyried yn ofalus ganlyniad unrhyw drafodaethau gan bwyllgorau am gyllidebau, a byddaf hefyd yn gwrandao ar y Gweinidog.

**Leanne Wood:** Un mater a drafodir gennym yn rheolaidd yn y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yw swyddfeydd post, yn enwedig y gronfa datblygu

development fund. It is not clear from answers given by the First Minister what you need the UK Government to say for the post office development fund to be re-established. He said last week that he needed greater clarity from the UK Government. Will you write to me outlining the criteria that will be used in deciding when to re-open that fund?

**Sue Essex:** That is a matter for the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration, and I am sure that she is keeping you all informed in committee. I have heard her answer that point many times. I do not think that it requires me to write to you on it, but I should just point out what we are doing in terms of rate relief for rural and urban post offices, which has been widely welcomed in that sector. So, from my perspective, that element will help them. I know that that is not a complete answer, but that will come from Edwina.

2.30 p.m.

**Mark Isherwood:** There was a unanimous call for an increase in the social housing grant from the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee when we discussed the budget in July. It was a plea that, for every £1 invested by the Assembly Government, the social housing sector could provide an additional £1, therefore doubling the bang for the buck. However, last month's draft Assembly budget did not include an increase in the forecast social housing grant. It is still less than it was 10 years ago in absolute terms, and massively less in real terms. How do you explain this to the 17 organisations that make up Housing Forum Cymru, which states that putting housing back at the centre of the political stage, and ensuring that it gets the investment it needs can improve health, drive community development, stimulate economic development, improve life chances and reduce crime? How do you explain this to the Council of Mortgage Lenders, which stated at its annual conference in Cardiff today that affordable housing is crucial to delivering an efficient and competitive economy, but that affordability has become more challenging

swyddfeydd post. Nid yw'n glir o'r atebion a roddwyd gan y Prif Weinidog beth y mae angen i Lywodraeth y DU ei ddweud er mwyn ailsefydlu'r gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post. Yr wythnos diwethaf dywedodd fod angen mwy o eglurder arno gan Lywodraeth y DU. A wnewch chi ysgrifennu ataf yn amlinellu'r meini prawf a ddefnyddir wrth benderfynu pryd y dylid ailagor y gronfa honno?

**Sue Essex:** Mater i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yw hynny, ac yr wyf yn siŵr ei bod yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i bob un ohonoch yn y pwyllgor. Yr wyf wedi ei chlywed yn ateb y pwynt hwnnw droeon. Ni chredaf fod angen imi ysgrifennu atoch ynghylch hynny, ond dylwn gyfeirio at yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud o ran rhyddhad ardrethi i swyddfeydd post gwledig a threfol, sydd wedi ei groesawu'n gyffredinol yn y sector hwnnw. Felly, o'm safbwynt i, bydd yr elfen honno yn gymorth iddynt. Gwn nad yw hwnnw'n ateb llawn, ond cewch hwnnw gan Edwina.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yr oedd galw unfrydol am gynnydd yn y grant tai cymdeithasol gan y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio pan drafodwyd y gyllideb gennym ym mis Gorffennaf. Ple ydoedd i'r sector tai cymdeithasol allu darparu £1 ychwanegol am bob £1 a fuddsoddir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, a thrwy hynny ddyblu'r cyllid a sydd ar gael. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd cyllideb ddrafft y Cynulliad fis diwethaf yn cynnwys cynnydd yn y grant tai cymdeithasol a ragwelwyd. Mae'n is nag ydoedd 10 mlynedd yn ôl mewn termau absoliwt, a llawer iawn yn is mewn termau real. Sut yr ydych yn esbonio hyn i'r 17 o sefydliadau yn Fforwm Tai Cymru, sy'n dweud bod gosad tai yn ôl ar ganol y llwyfan gwleidyddol, a sicrhau eu bod yn cael y buddsoddiad angenrheidiol yn gallu gwella iechyd, hyrwyddo datblygu cymunedol, ysgogi datblygu economaidd, gwella cyfleoedd bywyd a lleihau trosedd? Sut yr ydych yn esbonio hyn wrth y Cyngor Benthycwyr Morgais, a ddywedodd yn ei gynhadledd flynyddol yng Nghaerdydd heddiw fod tai fforddiadwy yn hanfodol i sicrhau economi effeithlon a chystadleuol, ond bod gallu eu fforddio wedi mynd yn fwy

because of a lack of houses being built?

o her oherwydd mai ychydig dai sy'n cael eu hadeiladu?

**Sue Essex:** Housing is very important for people's social wellbeing and for the economic development of this country. However, I remind you of the figures. The social housing grant was just under £60 million in 2004-05, and within three years it has gone up to almost £100 million. I have also injected a considerable sum of money into Wanless extra care housing for the elderly, which is very important and, in the last element of top-up for this year, I have put some more money into the social housing grant for the extra care scheme, which is very popular. I have also put in an additional £1 million for disabled facilities grants, which is about housing and keeping people in their own homes.

**Sue Essex:** Mae tain bwysig iawn i les cymdeithasol pobl ac i ddatblygiad economaidd y wlad hon. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn eich atgoffa am y ffigurau. Yr oedd y grant tai cymdeithasol ychydig o dan £60 miliwn yn 2004-05, ac o fewn tair blynedd mae wedi codi bron i £100 miliwn. Yr wyf hefyd wedi neilltuo symiau mawr o arian ar gyfer tai gofal ychwanegol Wanless i'r henoed, sy'n bwysig iawn. Ac yn yr ychwanegiad olaf am eleni, yr wyf wedi neilltuo rhagor o arian ar gyfer y grant tai cymdeithasol ar gyfer y cynllun gofal ychwanegol, sy'n boblogaidd iawn. Yr wyf hefyd wedi neilltuo £1 filiwn yn ychwanegol ar gyfer grantiau cyfleusterau i bobl anabl, sy'n ymwneud â thai a chadw pobl yn eu cartrefi eu hunain.

### **Y Portffolio Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau The Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Portfolio**

**Q6 The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** What representations has the Minister received regarding the allocation of funding to the education, lifelong learning and skills portfolio? OAQ0690(FIN)

**C6 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Pa sylwadau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael am y cyllid a ddyrennir i'r portffolio addysg, dysgu gydol oes a sgiliau? OAQ0690(FIN)

**Q7 Janet Ryder:** What consideration did the Minister give to the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee's discussions on budget priorities when formulating the overall budget allocation to that portfolio? OAQ0692(FIN)

**C7 Janet Ryder:** Pa ystyriaeth a roddodd y Gweinidog i drafodaethau'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ar flaenoriaethau'r gyllideb wrth lunio'r dyraniad cyllideb cyffredinol i'r portffolio hwnnw? OAQ0692(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** I have received representations from the committee and the Minister on this issue.

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf wedi cael sylwadau gan y pwyllgor a'r Gweinidog am y mater hwn.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** In the year that you were appointed Finance Minister, the higher education funding gap between Wales and England was £26 million, and, between Wales and Scotland, £74 million. The Higher Education Funding Council for Wales, which is a government body, now tells us that the gap has shot up to £40 million in relation to England, and up to £92 million in relation to Scotland. How do you explain the increase?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yn y flwyddyn pan gawsoch eich penodi'n Weinidog Cyllid, yr oedd cyllid addysg uwch yng Nghymru £26 miliwn yn llai na chyllid Lloegr, a £74 miliwn yn llai na chyllid yr Alban. Mae Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru, sy'n un o gyrff y llywodraeth, wedi dweud wrthym bellach fod bwch o £40 miliwn o'n cymharu â Lloegr, a hyd at £92 miliwn o'n cymharu â'r Alban. Sut yr ydych yn esbonio'r cynnydd?

**Sue Essex:** If the figures are correct, England

**Sue Essex:** Os yw'r ffigurau'n gywir, mae

has been putting extra money in. I do not think that we have absolutely accurate figures at the moment; we had this discussion last night. Having scoured through many of these pieces of information, I think that it would still take extra work to get an accurate figure on the difference. The First Minister has signed up to reducing that funding gap, if it exists, but the important thing is to look forward. We are putting extra money into student support, and that needs to be taken into account. We know that the higher education sector has areas of concern, which we discussed last night. So, let us carry on discussing and looking at the figures to see whether we can get some agreement on how to take this forward. The 2007-08 budget comes at the end of a comprehensive spending review period, and you will know how little funding there is to allocate, because the main allocation was done three years ago. I do not remember—although I am not saying that it is not the case—the opposition parties shouting from the rooftops about wanting a huge amount of money to go into higher education, but I may be wrong about that. Let us do what we can this time, sensibly, and when we have the comprehensive spending review there will be a chance to look at the budget in its entirety, and you can make your representations.

**Janet Ryder:** I am amazed to hear you say 'if a gap exists', and that we should keep talking until we agree on the figures. Your Government set the parameters for the HEFCW investigation, and it has reported back. No matter how you read that report, there is, undeniably, a very large funding gap in higher education in Wales, and those institutions are suffering. Wales needs them to lead its economic recovery and to drive it forward as a nation.

You also said that you did not believe that the opposition parties were asking for much in the budget for higher education. They are asking for that funding gap to be addressed this time, so do I take it that you are now agreeing with the opposition parties' request for that funding gap to be addressed in this budget round, to the amount that the opposition leaders are putting to you?

Lloegr wedi bod yn rhoi arian ychwanegol i mewn. Ni chredaf fod ffigurau manwl gywir ar gael gennym ar hyn o bryd; cawsom y drafodaeth hon neithiwr. Ar ôl pori drwy lawer o'r wybodaeth hon, credaf y byddai angen gwneud rhagor o waith o hyd i gael ffigur manwl gywir am y gwahaniaeth. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi ymrwymo i leihau'r bwlch cyllido hwnnw, os oes un, ond y peth pwysig yw edrych ymlaen. Yr ydym yn neilltuo arian ychwanegol ar gyfer cymorth i fyfyrwyr, ac mae angen ystyried hynny. Gwyddom fod pryderon gan y sector addysg uwch, a drafodwyd gennym neithiwr. Felly, gadewch inni barhau i drafod ac ystyried y ffigurau i weld a allwn gael rhyw ar y ffordd i fynd â hyn yn ei flaen. Daw cyllideb 2007-08 ar ddiwedd cyfnod adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, a gwyddoch cyn lleied o arian sydd i'w ddyrannu, oherwydd dyrannwyd y prif swm dair blynedd yn ôl. Ni chofiaf—er nad wyf yn dweud na ddigwyddodd hynny—fod y gwrthbleidiau'n galw'n groch am swm enfawr o arian ar gyfer addysg uwch, ond efallai fy mod yn anghywir ynglŷn â hynny. Gadewch inni wneud yr hyn a allwn y tro hwn, yn synhwyrol, a phan gawn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant bydd cyfle i ystyried y gyllideb yn ei chyfanrwydd, a gallwch wneud eich sylwadau.

**Janet Ryder:** Yr wyf yn rhyfeddu eich clywed yn dweud 'os oes bwlch', ac y dylem barhau i drafod nes inni gytuno ar y ffigurau. Eich llywodraeth chi a bennodd y parametrau ar gyfer ymchwiliad CCAUC, ac mae wedi cyflwyno adroddiad. Pa ffordd bynnag yr ydych yn dehongli'r adroddiad hwnnw, yn ddi-os mae yna fwch mawr iawn o ran cyllido ym maes addysg uwch yng Nghymru, ac mae'r sefydliadau hynny'n dioddef. Mae eu hangen ar Gymru i arwain ei hadfywiad economaidd a'i hyrwyddo fel gwlad.

Dywedasoch hefyd nad oeddech yn credu bod y gwrthbleidiau'n gofyn am lawer yn y gyllideb ar gyfer addysg uwch. Maent yn gofyn ichi fynd i'r afael â'r bwlch cyllido hwnnw y tro hwn, felly, a gaf fi gymryd yn ganiataol eich bod yn cytuno yn awr â chais y gwrthbleidiau ichi fynd i'r afael â'r bwlch cyllido hwnnw yn y cylch cyllidebol hwn, yn ôl y swm y mae arweinyddion y gwrthbleidiau yn ei awgrymu i chi?

**Sue Essex:** They are not putting anything to me. No amounts have been specified; the only person to specify an amount has been me. Let us go back to your assertion that higher education is suffering—as if it were in absolute decline and on its uppers. That is not true. I have quite close contacts with the sector. Cardiff has just done extremely well in the research assessment exercise and we should be proud of that.

Outside funding gap issues, let us be clear that we should not talk down our HE institutions. They are doing a very good job and are scoring highly for research. I will not go through all the indicators, but they are available. As Finance Minister, I have not had representations in droves from HE institutions to say that they are in a really difficult position—[*Interruption.*] I have not had them, Ieuan.

However, we are where we are and the First Minister has signed up to reducing that funding gap. I had a letter at the end of last year and one this year. If you are Finance Minister, people who are desperate about their funding have ways of making that known to you throughout the course of the year. I am only speaking about what is happening.

Let us try to be positive. I think that you misinterpreted or misheard what I said. If we start with your premise and accept that there is a funding gap, we had a discussion last night, without going into detail, about where we might make some progress this year. However, we have a limited amount of money available—unless you are suggesting that we take money from existing budgets. If you are, speak now or forever hold your peace, because we need to know that.

I do not remember you coming forward with pleas about higher education at the beginning of the comprehensive spending review budget round, although I may be wrong. It is when we get the new comprehensive spending review—and this is just a fact of life; I cannot do anything different, even if I wanted to—and when we are looking at all

**Sue Essex:** Nid ydynt yn awgrymu unrhyw symiau imi. Ni phennwyd unrhyw syniadau penodol; fi yw'r unig un sydd wedi pennu swm. Gadewch inni ddychwelyd at eich haeariad fod addysg uwch yn dioddef—fel petai'n dirywio'n llwyr ac yn wynebu cyni mawr. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Mae gennyf gysylltiadau eithaf agos â'r sector. Mae Caerdydd newydd wneud yn hynod dda yn yr ymarfer asesu ymchwil, a dylem ymfalchïo yn hynny.

Ar wahân i broblemau'r bwch cyllido, gadewch inni fod yn glir na ddylem ddirfrio ein sefydliadau AU. Maent yn gwneud gwaith da iawn ac yn cael sgoriau da iawn am waith ymchwil. Nid ymhelaethaf ar yr holl ddangosyddion, ond maent ar gael. Fel y Gweinidog Cyllid, nid yw sefydliadau AU wedi cysylltu â mi yn llu yn dweud eu bod mewn sefyllfa wirioneddol anodd—[*Torri ar draws.*]. Nid ydynt wedi cysylltu, Ieuan.

Fodd bynnag, dyna'r sefyllfa sydd ohoni ac mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi ymrwymo i leihau'r bwch cyllido hwnnw. Cefais yn llythyr ddiwedd y llynedd ac un eleni. Os ydych yn Weinidog Cyllid, mae pobl sy'n poeni'n enbyd am eu cyllid yn dod o hyd i ffyrdd o gyfleu hynny ichi drwy gydol y flwyddyn. Nid wyf ond yn sôn am yr hyn sy'n digwydd.

Gadewch inni geisio bod yn gadarnhaol. Credaf ichi gamddechongli neu gamglywed yr hyn a ddywedais. Os dechreuwn gyda'ch gosodiad chi a derbyn bod yna fwch cyllido, cawsom drafodaeth neithiwr, heb fanylu gormod, ynglŷn â ble y gallem wneud cynnydd eleni. Fodd bynnag, dim ond hyn a hyn o arian sydd ar gael—oni bai eich bod yn awgrymu y dylem gymryd arian oddi wrth gyllidebau cyfredol. Os felly, dywedwch hynny'n awr neu ataliwch o hyn allan, oherwydd mae angen inni wybod hynny.

Nid wyf yn cofio eich bod wedi apelio dros addysg uwch ar ddechrau cylch cyllideb yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, er y gallwn fod yn anghywir. Pan fyddwn yn cael yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr newydd o wariant—ac mae hyn yn anochel; ni allaf wneud dim yn wahanol, hyd yn oed pe dymunwn—a phan fyddwn yn ystyried yr

the funding allocations and the disposition across the piece, that it is your chance, if substantial additional allocations are needed, to make some considerable progress with regard to the sums of money. Unless you are prepared to suggest from where we can take money this year, there is no extra funding—we do not have a magic wand. We can signal an intention. We put money in last year, and that was agreed across the parties; it was not a substantial amount, but it is what we could do last year. Let us look at what we can do this year. If, at the end of that, the sum is substantially less than what is needed, then that can be addressed in the CSR. I think that that is fair.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I am sure that you will agree that basic skills training remains a crucial issue for us in Wales. Do you agree that moneys allocated to the Wales Union Learning Fund to assist in the provision of training in the workplace are well spent?

**Sue Essex:** Yes. I opened one of the centres in Llanishen. We have good responses from trade unions, particularly those that I work with in the public sector, on how we might improve the skills level of their members. Improving the skills of existing workers is a very important issue for Wales. Higher education has a huge role to play in taking that forward in Wales.

2.40 p.m.

**Peter Black:** Accepting your premise that Wales's higher education institutions did well in the last research assessment exercise, and given that we are about to enter into another research assessment exercise shortly, do you not accept that, unless we start to address this funding gap in the next financial year, we will not do as well next time? Furthermore, the decisions on closing this funding gap will get caught up in other decisions relating to student finance, particularly the issue of whether the cap on student tuition fees should be lifted in 2009.

**Sue Essex:** Let us go back to the comparison,

holl ddyraniadau cyllid a'r sefyllfa'n gyffredinol, dyna fydd eich cyfle, os oes angen dyraniadau ychwanegol sylweddol, i wneud cynnydd gwirioneddol o ran y symiau o arian. Oni bai eich bod yn barod i awgrymu o ble y gallwn dynnu arian eleni, nid oes arian ychwanegol—ni allwn wneud yr amhosibl. Gallwn roi arwydd o amcan. Neilltuwyd arian gennym y llynedd, a chytunwyd ar hynny ar draws y pleidiau; nid oedd yn swm mawr, ond dyna'r hyn y gallem ei wneud y llynedd. Gadewch inni ystyried yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud eleni. Os bydd y swm, ar ddiwedd hynny, yn sylweddol is na'r hyn y mae ei angen, yna gellir mynd i'r afael â hynny yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Credaf fod hynny'n deg.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Fe gytunwch, mae'n siŵr, fod hyfforddiant sgiliau sylfaenol yn dal yn fater hollbwysig inni yng Nghymru. A ydych yn cytuno bod arian a ddyrannwyd i Gronfa Ddysgu Undebau Cymru i helpu wrth ddarparu hyfforddiant yn y gweithle yn fuddiol?

**Sue Essex:** Ydwyf, agorais un o'r canolfannau yn Llanisien. Yr ydym yn cael ymateb da gan undebau llafur, yn enwedig y rhai yr wyf yn gweithio gyda hwy yn y sector cyhoeddus, ynglŷn â sut y gallem wella sgiliau eu haelodau. Mae gwella sgiliau'r gweithwyr presennol yn fater pwysig iawn i Gymru. Mae gan addysg uwch ran hynod bwysig i'w chwarae wrth symud hynny ymlaen yng Nghymru.

**Peter Black:** A derbyn eich gosodiad bod sefydliadau addysg uwch Cymru wedi gwneud yn dda yn yr ymarfer asesu ymchwil diwethaf, ac o gofio ein bod ar fin dechrau ymarfer asesu ymchwil arall cyn hir, oni dderbyniwch na fyddwn yn gwneud cystal y tro nesaf oni ddechreuwn fynd i'r afael â'r bwlch cyllido hwn yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf? At hynny, bydd y penderfyniadau ar gau'r bwlch cyllido hwn yn dod yn rhan o benderfyniadau eraill ynglŷn ag ariannu myfyrwyr, yn enwedig y mater a ddylid dileu'r cap ar ffioedd dysgu myfyrwyr yn 2009.

**Sue Essex:** Gadewch inni ddychwelyd at y

which is the area where there is some doubt, Peter, and that is why I used the word 'if'. If you compare us to Oxford and Cambridge, yes, we are way down. However, if you compare us to institutions in Yorkshire, Humberside and north-east England, then that is not the case. We need to be sensible about this. I thought that we had a sensible discussion on this last night. We started to address what we thought was the funding gap last year, and we will do what we can this year. However, as I made clear to colleagues last night, we do not have a large sum of money available—unless you want to take money away from something—as the money has already been allocated. I do not see a great appetite for that, and I can understand that. I am not asking you to come up with suggestions; I am just saying that that is the reality. The issue is what you do in the next comprehensive spending review.

I used to work in a university and I know that the research assessment exercise is important, perhaps more than it should be in some ways, because we want higher education to work within a wider community. I understand the pressures. As soon as you get through one RAE, the head of department starts talking about the next one; it is a kind of treadmill. You are right to say that we should not overlook what the universities have done now, even though, in your view, there was a funding gap. The universities have done extremely well. There is a sum of money available through 'Reaching Higher', which is around the collaboration agenda, which is extremely important in Wales. We have already seen some movement on that. It was slow to take off, but we have seen some movement on that in the last year. To have that sum of money and to have the support to make those essential collaborations, particularly around research bids, will be important for Wales in the future. We are making a start on that, and that was part of what we discussed last night at the leaders' meeting.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** The Minister is right to say that we touched on that issue yesterday—there is a lot more work to be done, as I think

gymhariaeth, sef y mae lle mae amheuaeth, Peter, a dyna pam y defnyddiais y gair 'os'. Os cymharwch ni â Rhydychen a Chaergrawnt, ydym, yr ydym yn is o lawer. Fodd bynnag, os cymharwch ni â sefydliadau yn Swydd Efrog, Glannau Humber a gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr, yna nid yw hynny'n wir. Mae angen inni fod yn synhwyrol ynghylch hyn. Credais ein bod wedi cael trafodaeth synhwyrol ar hyn neithiwr. Dechreusom fynd i'r afael â'r hyn a dybiem oedd y bwch cyllido y llynedd, a byddwn yn gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu eleni. Fodd bynnag, fel yr esboniais wrth gyd-aelodau neithiwr, nid oes gennym swm mawr o arian ar gael—oni bai eich bod am dynnu arian oddi wrth rywbeth—gan fod yr arian eisoes wedi'i ddyrannu. Ni welaf awydd mawr am wneud hynny, a gallaf ddeall hynny. Nid wyf yn gofyn ichi wneud awgrymiadau. Dweud yr wyf mai felly y mae. Y broblem yw beth a wnewch yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr nesaf o wariant.

Arferwn weithio mewn prifysgol a gwn fod yr ymarfer asesu ymchwil yn bwysig, yn bwysicach efallai nag y dylai fod mewn rhai ffyrdd, oherwydd yr ydym am i addysg uwch weithio fewn cymuned ehangach. Gallaf ddeall y pwysau. Cyn gynted ag y daw un asesiad i ben, mae pennaeth yr adran yn dechrau sôn am y nesaf; mae'n ddi-baid. Yr ydych yn iawn i ddweud na ddylem anghofio'r hyn y mae'r prifysgolion wedi'i wneud yn awr, er bod bwch o ran cyllid, yn eich barn chi. Mae'r prifysgion wedi gwneud yn hynod dda. Mae swm o arian ar gael drwy 'Ymgeisio yn Uwch', sy'n ymwneud â'r agenda gydweithredu, sy'n hynod bwysig yng Nghymru. Yr ydym eisoes wedi gweld rhywfaint o symud yn hynny. Yr oedd yn araf i ddechrau, ond yr ydym wedi gweld ychydig symud yn hynny yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Bydd cael y swm hwnnw a'r gefnogaeth i ymgymryd â'r cydweithrediadau hanfodol hynny, yn enwedig o ran ceisiadau ymchwil, yn bwysig i Gymru yn y dyfodol. Yr ydym yn dechrau ar hynny, ac yr oedd hynny'n rhan o'r hyn a drafodwyd gennym neithiwr yng nghyfarfod yr arweinwyr.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Mae'r Gweinidog yn llygad ei lle yn dweud ein bod wedi cyffwrdd â'r mater hwnnw ddoe—mae llawer mwy o waith i'w



that she would accept. Does she not accept that there is a large gap, because these figures are not those of the opposition leaders, or ones produced out of the air, but of HEFCW, and they show that there is a considerable gap with England and an even larger gap with Scotland. The First Minister often says that he does not want a comparison with England, but we are content to make a comparison with Scotland on this occasion, because the gap is even larger. I accept that money is short, but, ultimately, we have to decide whether we want a first-class higher education sector in Wales or not. No matter how good it is—and it is good; there are some excellent people in the sector—there is a growing gap, as the figures demonstrate.

**Sue Essex:** As I said, I think that we need to do more work on like-with-like comparisons. However, if we accept that the gap exists, we can do only what we can do this year. It is not as if there is no money for this, but we will do what we can do. It is important, at the beginning of any comprehensive spending review, that everyone looks forward. The trouble is that there are so many good causes out there, are there not? There are so many things that you want to support and that will be part and parcel of Wales going forward. The 'Reaching Higher' collaboration fund is important and I would not underestimate that, because one way in which our universities will be competitive is by being more joined up and getting the benefits of collaboration. It is rather like the procurement issue that we discussed previously with David. It seems to me, from what I know of where much of this is going in terms of research, that it is not necessarily about having people on your own patch; it is about who you work and collaborate with. We need to get that going and to get Wales recognised. We are part of many international collaborations, and that will be important to keep research assessment exercise ratings high.

**Nick Bourne:** On the other aspect of the education budget that is under scrutiny in this budget round, given the amendment that was carried, Minister, will you confirm that the 1 per cent efficiency cuts—so-called efficiency cuts—that are being required of some schools

wneud, fel y byddai'n derbyn, mi gredaf. Onid yw'n derbyn bod yna fwelch mawr, oherwydd nid ffigurau arweinwyr y gwrthbleidiau yw'r rhain, na rhai di-sail, ond ffigurau CCAUC, a dangosant fod cryn fwelch o'n cymharu â Lloegr a bwelch mwy fyth o'n cymharu â'r Alban. Dywed y Prif Weinidog yn aml nad yw am gymharu â Lloegr, ond yr ydym yn fodlon cymharu â'r Alban y tro hwn, am fod y bwelch hyd yn oed yn fwy. Derbyniaf fod arian yn brin, ond yn y pen draw rhaid inni benderfynu a ydym am gael sector addysg uwch o'r radd flaenaf yng Nghymru ai peidio. Waeth pa mor dda ydyw—ac mae'n dda; mae yna bobl wych yn y sector—mae'r bwelch yn cynyddu, fel y dengys y ffigurau.

**Sue Essex:** Fel y dywedais, credaf fod angen inni wneud mwy o waith ar gymharu pethau tebyg. Fodd bynnag, os derbyniwn fod bwelch, ni allwn ond gwneud ein gorau eleni. Nid yw fel petai dim arian ar gyfer hyn, ond byddwn yn gwneud popeth a allwn. Mae'n bwysig, ar ddechrau unrhyw adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, i bawb edrych ymlaen. Y drafferth yw bod cynifer o achosion da, onid oes? Mae cynifer o bethau yr ydych am eu cefnogi a bydd hynny'n rhan annatod o Gymru yn symud yn ei blaen. Mae'r gronfa gydweithredu 'Ymgeisio'n Uwch' yn bwysig ac ni fyddwn yn tanbriso hynny, oherwydd un ffordd y bydd ein prifysgolion yn gystadleuol yw drwy gydlynw gwaith a chael manteision cydweithredu. Mae'n debyg i fater caffael a drafodwyd gennym o'r blaen gyda David. Ymddengys imi, o'r hyn sy'n hysbys imi am ble mae llawer o'r arian yn mynd o ran ymchwil, nad yw hynny'n golygu o reidrwydd cael pobl yn eich ardal chi; yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw'r rhai yr ydych yn dewis gweithio a chydweithredu â hwy. Mae angen inni gymell hynny a sicrhau bod Cymru'n cael ei chydabod. Yr ydym yn rhan o lawer o gydweithrediadau rhyngwladol, a bydd hynny'n bwysig i gadw bod graddau ymarferion asesu ymchwil yn uchel.

**Nick Bourne:** Ar yr agwedd arall ar y gyllideb addysg y byddwn yn craffu arni yn y cylch cyllidebol hwn, o gofio'r gwelliant a dderbyniwyd, Weinidog, a wnewch chi gadarnhau bod yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd o 1 y cant—y toriadau effeithlonrwydd fel y'u

by some local authorities are causing real hardship? Ysgol Trefonnen in Llandrindod Wells, in my region, for example, is talking about laying off a teacher because of this; that is replicated across Wales. It is a serious issue, so do you not accept that we have to do something about areas where that is happening?

**Sue Essex:** You were strong in saying that you have evidence on the previous question on the HE funding gap, so we have to look at the available evidence on efficiency. I discussed with you some preliminary results that we have on the state of play in Wales, which is a solid piece of work that has been done throughout Wales. There are a few authorities that we feel have not followed the guidance, and a considerable number of authorities that have; there is also a large number of authorities that have not passed the 1 per cent on to schools. We need to look at that a bit more, as we said that we would, in order to ensure that we have the evidence.

Once we have the evidence, we will have to see what the local authorities should do, because you cannot reward local authorities that have not been performing properly. That would be the antithesis of good value for money. That has always been the case. If local authorities have not been doing that work we have told them that it would not be counted. We have the element of support that Value Wales could provide, and I will also be looking at that in detail.

gelwir—y mae rhai awdurdodau lleol yn eu gwneud yn ofynnol i rai ysgolion eu cyflawni yn achosi caledi gwirioneddol? Er enghraifft, mae Ysgol Trefonnen yn Llandrindod, yn fy rhanbarth i, yn ystyried diswyddo athro oherwydd hyn; mae hynny'n digwydd ledled Cymru. Mae'n fater difrifol, felly, oni chytunwch fod yn rhaid inni wneud rhywbeth ynglŷn ag ardaloedd lle mae hynny'n digwydd?

**Sue Essex:** Yr oeddech yn daer wrth ddweud bod gennych dystiolaeth am cwestiwn blaenorol ynghylch y bwch ariannu AU, felly rhaid inni edrych ar y dystiolaeth sydd ar gael am effeithlonrwydd. Trafodais gyda chi rai canlyniadau cychwynnol sydd gennym ar y sefyllfa yng Nghymru, sy'n ddarn cadarn o waith a wnaed ledled Cymru. Teimlwn fod rhai awdurdodau nad ydynt wedi dilyn y canllawiau, a nifer sylweddol o awdurdodau sydd wedi dilyn y canllawiau; mae yna hefyd nifer fawr o awdurdodau nad ydynt wedi trosglwyddo'r 1 y cant i ysgolion. Rhaid inni edrych yn fanylach ar hynny, fel dywedwyd y byddem yn ei wneud, er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym y dystiolaeth.

Pan fydd y dystiolaeth gennym bydd yn rhaid inni weld beth ddylai'r awdurdodau lleol ei wneud, oherwydd ni allwch wobrwyo awdurdodau lleol nad ydynt wedi perfformio'n iawn. Byddai hynny'n groes i werth da am arian. Dyna fu'r sefyllfa o'r cychwyn. Os nad yw awdurdodau lleol wedi bod yn gwneud y gwaith hwnnw, yr ydym wedi dweud wrthynt na fyddent yn cael eu cyfrif. Mae gennym yr elfen gymorth y gallai Gwerth Cymru ei rhoi, a byddaf hefyd yn edrych ar hynny'n fanwl.

### **Arian Wrth Gefn yn y Gyllideb Budget Reserves**

**C8 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr arian wrth gefn sydd yn y gyllideb? OAQ0685(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** It is good financial management to maintain a prudent level of reserves. I will use these to manage unforeseen pressures that arise during the year.

**David Lloyd:** Pa ddarpariaeth arian cyfatebol

**Q8 David Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on the budget reserves? OAQ0685(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** Mae cadw lefel ddarbodus o gronfeydd wrth gefn yn rheolaeth ariannol dda. Defnyddiaf y cronfeydd hyn i reoli pwysau annisgwyl sy'n codi yn ystod y flwyddyn.

**David Lloyd:** What provision of match

i arian Ewrop sydd gennych yn y gyllideb?

funding for European money do you have in the budget?

**Sue Essex:** There is money that is carried forward into the budget, which I think is something like £66 million or £68 million, which we will be using. That is funding of the last resort, as it always has been, so I would not want to emphasise that that is there as an easy access. However, the other area that we are looking at closely, which has been particularly effective in the last few years, under structural funds, is where projects align with our spending pattern, so that we can use those as match funding. That is where there are additional outputs that come through.

**Sue Essex:** Mae yna arian a ddygir ymlaen i'r gyllideb sydd, mi gredaf, tua £66 miliwn neu £68 miliwn, y byddwn yn ei ddefnyddio. Arian yw hwnnw ddefnyddir dim ond pan fetho popeth arall, fel y bu erioed, felly nid wyf am bwysleisio ei bod yn hawdd cael mynd at yr arian hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, y maes arall yr ydym yn edrych arno'n ofalus ac a fu'n arbennig o effeithiol yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, o dan gronfeydd strwythurol, yw lle mae prosiectau'n alinio â'n patrwm gwario, er mwyn inni allu defnyddio'r rheini fel arian cyfatebol. Dyna lle y mae allbynnau ychwanegol sy'n dod drwyddo.

**Alun Cairns:** Minister, following up on the question relating to reserves, there is no doubt that there will be a lot of scepticism about the match funding, particularly for the cohesion funds. What plans do you have to demonstrate additionality to Welsh level? I know that it does not need to be proved at a Welsh level, because it is done on a member-state level, but in the past, when the First Minister was Minister with responsibility for economic development, he said that he was more than happy to show additionality at a Welsh level. That would at least give some transparency, to ensure that the European money was being used for things that would not come out of core budgets.

**Alun Cairns:** Weinidog, gan ddilyn ymlaen o'r cwestiwn yn ymwneud â chronfeydd wrth gefn, bydd llawer o amheuaeth am yr arian cyfatebol, yn arbennig ar gyfer y cronfeydd cydlyniant. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i ddangos ychwanegedd yng Nghymru? Gwn nad oes yn rhaid ei brofi yng Nghymru, oherwydd caiff ei wneud ar lefel yr aelod-wladwriaethau. Ond yn y gorffennol, pan oedd y Prif Weinidog yn Weinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros ddatblygu economaidd, dywedodd ei fod yn fwy na pharod i ddangos ychwanegedd ar lefel Cymru. Byddai hynny o leiaf yn rhoi rhywfaint o eglurder, i sicrhau bod yr arian Ewropeaidd yn cael ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer pethau na fyddent yn dod allan o gyllidebau craidd.

**Sue Essex:** Obviously, I will have to look at that, because the First Minister leads on European issues. You say that there is scepticism, but I do not know how many Plenary meetings I have sat through, in this Chamber and the old Chamber, where there was a cacophony of people saying that there would not be match funding, and that structural fund programmes and Objective 1 programmes would not be met. We have, however, managed those cases. The crucial change—and by far the most sensible change—came when we were much more able to use existing funding streams to provide the match funding. As Finance Minister, I have to say that that provides the most effective use of public money.

**Sue Essex:** Yn amlwg, bydd yn rhaid imi edrych ar hynny oherwydd y Prif Weinidog sy'n arwain ar faterion Ewropeaidd. Dywedwch fod yna amheuaeth, ond ni allaf gofio faint o Gyfarfodydd Llawn yr wyf bod ynddynt, yn y Siambr hon a'r hen Siambr, lle'r oedd pobl yn gwneud twrw gan ddweud na fyddai arian cyfatebol, ac na fyddai rhaglenni cronfa strwythurol ac Amcan 1 yn cael eu cyflawni. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi llwyddo gyda'r achosion hynny. Daeth y newid hanfodol—a'r newid mwyaf synhwyrol o bell ffordd—pan oeddem lawer yn fwy abl i ddefnyddio'r ffrydiau ariannu presennol i ddarparu'r arian cyfatebol. Fel y Gweinidog Cyllid, rhaid imi ddweud mai hynny sy'n sicrhau defnyddio arian cyhoeddus yn fwyaf effeithiol.

**Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad**  
**Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside**

**Lefelau Ailgylchu**  
**Recycling Levels**

**Q1 Nick Bourne:** How is the Minister encouraging local authorities to increase recycling levels? OAQ0949(EPC)

**C1 Nick Bourne:** Sut y mae'r Gweinidog yn annog awdurdodau lleol i gynyddu eu lefelau ailgylchu? OAQ0949(EPC)

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** 'Wise about Waste: The National Waste Strategy for Wales' sets local authorities clear recycling and composting targets. The Assembly Government is providing a range of grants and other initiatives to help local authorities to achieve those targets.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Mae 'Yn Gall gyda Gwastraff: Strategaeth Wastraff Genedlaethol Cymru' yn pennu targedau ailgylchu a chompostio clir ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn darparu amrywiaeth o grantiau a mentrau eraill i helpu awdurdodau lleol i gyflawni'r targedau hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** I am grateful to the Minister for that response and, as he knows, this is an area in which I take a particular interest. Ceredigion and Powys councils in my area have good records, or good records in Welsh terms. I am sure that the Minister would want to join with me in congratulating Cae Post outside Welshpool, where very good work is being done with an electronic system to notify people of recycling. However, Minister, would you look at bringing in more of the carrot—and some of the stick, perhaps—and take evidence from other countries, because we are still lagging well behind what is happening in England, and certainly much further behind other countries in Europe, in Scandinavia and the Netherlands in particular. We need to get recycling levels much higher than they are at the moment.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am yr ymateb hwnnw ac, fel y gŵyr, mae hwn yn faes y mae gennyf ddi-ddordeb arbennig ynddo. Mae record dda gan gynghorau Powys a Cheredigion yn fy ardal i, neu record dda o ran Cymru gyfan. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Gweinidog yn dymuno ymuno â mi i longyfarch Cae Post y tu allan i'r Trallwng, lle gwneir gwaith da iawn gyda system electronig i roi gwybod i bobl am ailgylchu. Fodd bynnag, Weinidog, a fydddech yn ystyried rhoi mwy o'r foronen—a rhywfaint o'r ffon, efallai—a chymryd tystiolaeth o wledydd eraill, oherwydd yr ydym ymhell y tu ôl i'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr o hyd, ac yn sicr, ymhell ar ei hôl hi o safbwynt gwledydd eraill yn Ewrop, yn Llychlyn a'r Iseldiroedd yn arbennig. Rhaid inni sicrhau lefelau ailgylchu sydd lawer yn uwch nag ydynt ar hyn o bryd.

2.50 p.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** We must remember that, at the beginning of the decade, we began from a base of 4 per cent. The target for local authorities for 2006-07 is to achieve at least 25 per cent recycling or composting. Nine authorities have already achieved that figure, and the figure across Wales is 23.12 per cent, so we are well on course to reach the 2006-07 figure. The figure for 2009-10 is 40 per cent, and I expect the approach that has been taken

**Carwyn Jones:** Rhaid inni gofio, ar ddechrau'r degawd, ein bod wedi cychwyn o sylfaen o 4 y cant. Y targed i awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer 2006-07 yw sicrhau o leiaf 25 y cant o ran ailgylchu neu gompostio. Mae naw awdurdod eisoes wedi cyrraedd y ffigur hwnnw, a 23.13 y cant yw'r ffigur ledled Cymru, felly yr ydym ar y trywydd iawn i gyrraedd ffigur 2006-07. Y ffigur ar gyfer 2009-10 yw 40 y cant, a disgwyliaf y bydd y

so far to bear fruit in that regard.

**Janice Gregory:** Will you join me in congratulating school pupils in our county of Bridgend who, following a call from the local radio station, Bridge FM, collected an incredible 150,000 drink cans? They smashed the world record for the longest line of drink cans. Will you also join me in congratulating the pupils of Tynyrheol Primary School in Llangeinor in my constituency who won a £300 prize for collecting a staggering 61 cans per pupil? On a serious note, do you agree that it is such fun schemes, targeting primary-age children, that are crucial in raising awareness of the need to recycle, and that it is such schemes that not only get the children, but their parents to understand what needs to be done?

**Carwyn Jones:** I join you in your congratulations. It is right to say that if children learn good recycling habits when they are young, they will keep those for the rest of their lives. That is why we have the eco-schools project. It is marvellous to hear what is being done with the schools in your constituency, and you are quite right to say that the children tend to teach adults better habits than they themselves would have been taught in school.

**Mick Bates:** The headline after the Audit Commission report on waste and recycling in Wales was:

‘Substantial improvement in performance needed to meet recycling targets.’

The annual increase in recycling has been slowing down. It was only 1.4 per cent in the last figures; it was 4.5 per cent in the figures before those. Your target is to reach 40 per cent by 2010. That is more than double the current rate of recycling. How confident are you that you will meet that 2010 target?

**Carwyn Jones:** The report to which you refer is quite old. We have already increased recycling fivefold this decade. I fully expect

dull a ddefnyddiwyd hyd yma yn dwyn ffrwyth yn hynny o beth.

**Janice Gregory:** A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch disgyblion yn Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr a lwyddodd, ar ôl galwad ffôn gan yr orsaf radio leol, Bridge FM, i gasglu 150,000 o ganiau diod? Chwalwyd record y byd am y rhes hiraf o ganiau yfed. A ymunwch â mi hefyd i longyfarch disgyblion Ysgol Gynradd Tynyrheol yn Llangeinwyr yn fy etholaeth i a enillodd wobr gwerth £300 am gasglu 61 o ganiau y pen? Ar nodyn difrifol, a gytunwch mai cynlluniau hwylus o'r fath, wedi'u targedu at blant ysgol gynradd, sy'n hanfodol i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth am yr angen am ailgylchu, ac mai cynlluniau felly sy'n cael, nid yn unig y plant ond eu rhieni, i ddeall yr hyn y mae angen ei wneud?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ymunaf â chi i'w llongyfarch. Mae'n gywir dweud os bydd plant yn dysgu arferion ailgylchu da pan fyddant yn ifanc y byddant yn cadw'r arferion hynny weddill eu hoes. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi datblygu'r prosiect eco-ysgolion. Mae'n wych clywed am yr hyn a wneir gyda'r ysgolion yn eich etholaeth, ac yr ydych yn iawn i ddweud bod y plant yn tueddu i ddysgu arferion gwell i oedolion nag y byddai'r rheini eu hunain wedi'u dysgu yn yr ysgol.

**Mick Bates:** Y pennawd ar ôl adroddiad y Comisiwn Archwilio ar wastraff ac ailgylchu yng Nghymru oedd:

Bydd angen gwelliant sylweddol mewn perfformiad er mwyn cyrraedd targedau ailgylchu.

Mae'r cynnydd blynyddol mewn ailgylchu wedi bod yn arafu. Yn y ffigurau diwethaf, 1.4 y cant yn unig ydoedd; yn y ffigurau cyn hynny, 4.5 y cant yn unig ydoedd. Eich targed yw cyrraedd 40 y cant erbyn 2010. Mae hynny dros ddwbl y gyfradd ailgylchu bresennol. Pa mor hyderus ydych chi y byddwch yn cyrraedd y targed hwnnw ar gyfer 2010?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'r adroddiad yr oeddech yn cyfeirio ato yn eithaf hen. Yr ydym eisoes wedi cynyddu ailgylchu bum gwaith drosodd

us to be able to reach the 40 per cent target by the end of the decade.

**Mick Bates:** I thought that you were very complacent about that. The first recommendation of the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee referred to the fact that there were doubts that the target would be reached. I hope that you will revisit that and look at the progress that is being made now. I am sure that you agree that the fundamental problem is that, as a society, we continue to produce more waste, such as plastic. Do you believe that companies that make plastic and sell products wrapped in plastic should also be responsible for recycling it, as they are on the continent of Europe?

**Carwyn Jones:** I do not think that a fivefold increase in recycling is a sign of any kind of complacency. With regard to Mick Bates's proposal, it will be important, over the course of the next year or so, to examine the way in which plastic bags are disposed of and, more generally, how to ensure that packaging is minimised, not just in Wales, but across the European Union.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Increased levels of recycling depend largely on an easy system for householders. Will you review the way in which some local authorities manage their recycling? In the Vale of Glamorgan, we now have to wash and squash tins and cans, which I find quite difficult to do. We also cannot put out Tetra cartons for recycling. The easier we make it for people to recycle, the sooner we will reach those targets, so will you keep an eye on the way that local authorities are developing their systems?

**Carwyn Jones:** I agree that it needs to be made as easy as possible for people to recycle on their doorsteps. It will be interesting to see how successful the Vale of Glamorgan council is with that way forward. Clearly, the easiest way to enable people to recycle is to allow them to separate their items and put them in separate bags that are collected regularly. It is a matter of fine judgment after that as to what more you

yn y degawd hwn. Yr wyf yn gwbl hyderus y byddwn yn cyrraedd y targed o 40 y cant erbyn diwedd y degawd.

**Mick Bates:** Yr oeddwn i'n meddwl eich bod yn hunanfodlon iawn ynghylch hynny. Cyfeiriodd argymhelliad cyntaf Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad at y ffaith fod amheuaeth a fyddai'r targed yn cael ei gyrraedd. Gobeithio y byddwch yn ailystyried hynny gan edrych ar y cynnydd a wneir yn awr. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn cytuno mai'r broblem sylfaenol yw'r ffaith ein bod ni, fel cymdeithas, yn parhau i gynhyrchu mwy o wastraff, fel plastig. A ydych yn credu y dylai cwmnïau sy'n cynhyrchu plastig ac yn gwerthu cynnyrch wedi'u lapio mewn plastig fod yn gyfrifol hefyd am ei ailgylchu, fel sy'n digwydd ar gyfandir Ewrop?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid wyf yn credu bod cynnydd o bum gwaith mewn ailgylchu yn arwydd o unrhyw fath o hunanfodddhad. O ran cynnig Mick Bates, bydd yn bwysig, dros y flwyddyn nesaf, i archwilio'r ffordd y gwaredir bagiau plastig, ac yn fwy cyffredinol, sut i sicrhau cyn lleied â phosibl o becynnu, nid yng Nghymru'n unig, ond ar draws yr Undeb Ewropeaidd.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I raddau helaeth mae lefelau ailgylchu uwch yn dibynnu ar system hawdd i berchnogion tai. A fyddwch yn adolygu'r ffordd y mae rhai awdurdodau lleol yn rheoli eu hailgylchu? Ym Mro Morgannwg, rhaid inni yn awr olchi a gwasgu tiniau a chaniau, sy'n ddigon anodd i mi ei wneud. A hefyd ni allwn roi cartonau Tetra i'w hailgylchu. Hawsaf yn y byd fydd ailgylchu i bobl, cyntaf oll y byddwn yn cyrraedd y targedau hynny. Felly, a fyddwch yn cadw llygad ar y ffordd y mae awdurdodau lleol yn datblygu eu systemau?

**Carwyn Jones:** Cytunaf fod angen iddi fod mor hawdd â phosibl i bobl ailgylchu ar garreg eu drws. Diddorol fydd gweld pa mor llwyddiannus fydd cyngor Bro Morgannwg gyda'r ffordd honno ymlaen. Yn amlwg, y ffordd hawsaf i alluogi pobl i ailgylchu yw caniatáu iddynt ddioli eu heitemau a'u rhoi mewn bagiau ar wahân i gael eu casglu'n rheolaidd. Mater o bwysio a mesur yn ofalus wedyn yw faint yn rhagor y disgwylwch i

expect people to do.

**Christine Gwyther:** Squashing cans is a good method of stress relief and I would recommend it to any Member after a Plenary meeting. We have heard from other Members that peer pressure is important in terms of recycling and that children can influence their parents. They can also influence councils, Assembly Members and Ministers. Will you join me in congratulating the young students at Templeton Primary School in Pembrokeshire, who welcomed you to their school recently and showed you and me exactly how we should be recycling?

**Carwyn Jones:** I very much enjoyed my visit to Templeton Primary School with you and the staff and children there. They provided a good example, as do other schools across Wales, of how to enthuse children and to get them thinking about recycling and how to reuse land. We also saw plants there. All of these things can give us hope for a brighter future in terms of being able to reduce the amount of waste that we produce and in terms of recycling more.

bobl ei wneud.

**Christine Gwyther:** Mae gwasgu caniau yn ffordd dda i ryddhau tyndra, a byddwn yn ei argymhell i unrhyw Aelod ar ôl Cyfarfod Llawn. Clywsom gan Aelodau eraill fod pwysau gan gyfoedion yn bwysig o ran ailgylchu ac y gall plant ddylanwadu ar eu rhieni. Gallant hefyd ddylanwadu ar gynghorau, Aelodau'r Cynulliad a Gweinidogion. A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch y myfyrwyr ifanc yn Ysgol Gynradd Tre-deml yn Sir Benfro, a estynnodd groeso i chi i'w hysgol yn ddiweddar i ddangos i chi ac i minnau sut yn union y dylem fod yn ailgylchu?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mwynheais fy ymweliad ag Ysgol Gynradd Tre-deml gyda chi a'r staff a'r plant yno yn fawr iawn. Fel ysgolion eraill ledled Cymru, yr oeddent yn enghraifft dda o'r ffordd i ysbrydoli plant a gwneud iddynt feddwl am ailgylchu a sut i aildddefnyddio tir. Gwelsom blanhigion yno hefyd. Gall yr holl bethau hyn roi gobaith inni am ddyfodol gwell o ran gallu cynhyrchu llai o wastraff ac ailgylchu mwy.

### Tipio Anghyfreithlon Fly-tipping

**Q2 William Graham:** Will the Minister outline how the Clean Neighbourhoods and Environment Act 2005 is being applied in Wales to tackle fly-tipping? OAQ0956(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** The Clean Neighbourhoods and Environment Act 2005 enhances the existing legislative framework for maintaining a clean and safe local environment. In particular, it raises the levels of penalties on conviction for fly-tipping offences, allows for the cost of investigations into waste offences to be recovered, and allows for the seizure of vehicles of unregistered waste carriers.

**William Graham:** You will know that fly-tipping has a serious health risk, as was particularly true of the case where travellers left huge amounts of waste at the corner of the A48 in Marshfield, in the city of

**C2 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu sut y mae Deddf Cymdogaethau Glân a'r Amgylchedd 2005 yn cael ei gweithredu yng Nghymru i fynd i'r afael â thipio anghyfreithlon? OAQ0956(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae Deddf Cymdogaethau Glân a'r Amgylchedd 2005 yn gwella'r fframwaith deddfwriaethol ar gyfer cynnal a chadw amgylchedd lleol glân a diogel. Yn arbennig, mae'n codi lefelau'r cosbau ar bobl sy'n euog o dipio anghyfreithlon, mae'n caniatáu adennill cost ymchwiliadau i droseddau gwastraff, ac yn caniatáu atafaelu cerbydau cludwyr gwastraff sydd heb eu cofrestru.

**William Graham:** Fe wyddoch fod risg ddifrifol i iechyd yn gysylltiedig â thipio anghyfreithlon, ac yr oedd hynny'n arbennig o wir am yr achos lle yr oedd teithwyr wedi gadael llawer iawn mawr o wastraff ar gornel

Newport. Could you suggest further measures that would help councils and law enforcement agencies to more effectively tackle this growing problem?

**Carwyn Jones:** I do not think that it is a question of increased penalties but that of ensuring that enforcement is appropriate. In particular, we have the Flycatcher data system, which is spread out across England and Wales and used by the Environment Agency to try to understand where the particular risks and sites are that attract fly-tipping. It is important to have stiff penalties but it is also important to ensure that people report fly-tipping incidents when they see them and that there is sufficient intelligence available to the Environment Agency and other prosecuting authorities so that they can take action.

**Janet Ryder:** Fly-tipping is otherwise known as the illegal dumping of waste. Many people in Wrexham view the ongoing dumping of waste in the Hafod tip as illegal. Unfortunately, due to your decision this morning, that illegal process seems to have been given legitimacy and it can be carried on. As part of that decision-making process, you informed me that, on 12 October, you entered the site and inspected it. Could you confirm that you did enter the site?

**Carwyn Jones:** Where can I start, Janet? First, the tipping is not illegal. I came from Wrexham general railway station. I had a driver and an assistant private secretary with me. I entered Johnstown and as you approach the railway bridge in Johnstown in the direction of the dual carriageway, on the right-hand side there is a street called Heol yr Orsaf. If you go up Heol yr Orsaf, which is uphill, the landfill site is on your left-hand side where the road curves away from it. *Laughter.*

However, if you go underneath the railway bridge, on the right-hand side is the entrance to the landfill site, which is quite hidden and you can miss it easily. On the left-hand side is a country lane and a builders' yard, which we went to when we missed the turning. However, if you come back, you can enter the landfill site without challenge; the road

yr A48 ym Maerun, yn ninas Casnewydd. A allwch awgrymu mesurau pellach a fyddai'n helpu cynghorau ac asiantaethau gorfodi'r gyfraith i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem gynyddol hon yn fwy effeithiol?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid wyf yn credu mai mater o gosbau uwch yw hyn, ond yn hytrach sicrhau bod yr orfodaeth yn briodol. Yn arbennig, mae gennym y system ddata Flycatcher, sy'n cwmpasu Cymru a Lloegr ac yn cael ei defnyddio gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd i geisio deall ble mae'r risgiau a'r safleoedd arbennig sy'n denu tipio anghyfreithlon. Mae'n bwysig sicrhau cosbau llym, ond mae'n bwysig hefyd sicrhau bod pobl yn rhoi gwybod am ddiwyddiadau o dipio anghyfreithlon pan fyddant yn eu gweld, a bod digon o wybodaeth ar gael i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ac awdurdodau erlyn eraill i allu gweithredu.

**Janet Ryder:** Mae llawer o bobl yn Wrecsam o'r farn fod tipio gwastraff parhaus yn nhomen Hafod yn anghyfreithlon. Yn anffodus, o ganlyniad i'ch penderfyniad y bore yma, ymddengys bod y broses anghyfreithlon honno'n gyfreithlon ac y gall barhau. Fel rhan o'r broses honno o wneud penderfyniad, dywedasoch wrthyf eich bod wedi mynd i'r safle a'i archwilio ar 12 Hydref. A allwch gadarnhau eich bod mewn mynd i'r safle?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ble mae dechrau, Janet? Yn gyntaf, nid yw'r tipio'n anghyfreithlon. Teithiais o orsaf reilffordd Wrecsam. Yr oedd gennyf yrrwr a dirprwy ysgrifenyddes breifat gyda mi. Euthum i mewn i Johnstown wrth i chi ddynesu at bont y rheilffordd yn Johnstown i gyfeiriad y ffordd ddeuol, ar yr ochr dde mae stryd o'r enw Heol yr Orsaf. Os ewch i fyny Heol yr Orsaf, sydd i fyny'r bryn, mae'r safle tirlenwi ar yr ochr chwith lle mae'r ffordd yn gwyro i ffwrdd. *[Chwerthin.]*

Fodd bynnag, os ewch o dan bont y rheilffordd, mae'r fynedfa i'r safle tirlenwi ar yr ochr dde. Mae wedi'i chuddio a gallwch ei methu yn hawdd. Ar yr ochr chwith mae lôn wledig ac iard adeiladwyr, ac aethom yno ar ôl inni golli'r tro. Fodd bynnag, os ewch yn ôl, gallwch fynd i mewn i'r safle tirlenwi yn ddilyffethair; mae'r ffordd yn gwyro i'r



snakes to the right and then to the left and you enter a flat area, where, at ten o'clock, the landfill site is located.

When you leave the landfill site, turn right and then right again, you enter a lane. On the left-hand side there is a field; on the right-hand side there is barbed wire and trees and the boundary of the landfill site. That road, incidentally, goes uphill. Therefore, yes; I did visit the landfill site.

**Karen Sinclair:** I note that John Marek is not in the Chamber for this important question. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Whether or not a Member is in the Chamber is not a matter for the Minister.

**Karen Sinclair:** Does the Minister share my concern that the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 is well past its sell-by date, as evidenced by the terrible predicament in which people in my constituency have found themselves when trying to fight the case of an old planning permission being reactivated? As you well know, I am talking about Hafod landfill site. This permission was allowed to be reactivated purely because a minimal amount of work had been undertaken in the early days. That cannot possibly be right; environmental thinking has moved on immeasurably since 1995. Can you assure me that, as we take on our new powers, we will quickly find a way to ensure that this sort of loophole is closed?

3.00 p.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** This is currently being considered at an England and Wales level, because primary legislation governs it. In terms of revoking or discontinuing planning permission, as far as the Assembly is concerned, the barrier is exceptionally high; it is much lower for a local authority than it is for the Assembly, or the equivalent Government department in England. I have an example in my constituency of such a planning permission; it is an elderly planning permission, which was reactivated some years later at the Ewenny quarry, and I am sure that there are other examples across Wales. That is why it will be important in

dde ac yna i'r chwith ac ewch i mewn i ddarn gwastad o dir, ac ar y chwith mae'r safle tirlenwi.

Wrth ichi adael y safle tirlenwi, trowch i'r dde ac yna i'r dde eto, ac ewch i mewn i lôn. Mae cae ar yr ochr chwith; mae weiren bigog a choed ar yr ochr dde a therfyn y safle tirlenwi. Mae'r ffordd honno, gyda llaw, yn mynd i fyny'r bryn. Felly, do, bûm yn ymweld â'r safle tirlenwi.

**Karen Sinclair:** Sylwaf nad yw John Marek yn y Siambr ar gyfer y cwestiwn pwysig hwn. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid mater i'r Gweinidog yw presenoldeb Aelod yn y Siambr ai peidio.

**Karen Sinclair:** A yw'r Gweinidog, fel fi, yn pryderu bod Deddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990 wedi dyddio, fel y dangoswyd gan y ffwdan helynt ofnadwy a gafodd pobl yn fy etholaeth i wrth geisio ymladd yr achos lle mae hen ganiatâd cynllunio yn cael ei ailgychwyn? Fel y gwyddoch yn iawn, yr wyf yn siarad am safle tirlenwi Hafod. Caniatwyd ailgychwyn y caniatâd hwn dim ond oherwydd yr ychydig waith a wnaed yn y dyddiau cynnar. Ni all hynny fod yn iawn; mae'r feddylfryd amgylcheddol wedi symud ymlaen yn fawr iawn er 1995. A allwch roi sicrwydd imi, wrth inni dderbyn ein pwerau newydd, y byddwn yn gyflym yn dod o hyd i ffordd i sicrhau bod y math hwn o fwlch dianc yn cael ei gau?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae hyn yn cael ei ystyried ar lefel Cymru a Lloegr ar hyn o bryd, gan mai deddfwriaeth sylfaenol sy'n ei reoli. O ran diddymu neu derfynu caniatâd cynllunio, o ran y Cynulliad mae'r gofynion yn fawr iawn; maent yn llai o lawer ar gyfer awdurdod lleol nag ar gyfer y Cynulliad neu adran gyfatebol y Llywodraeth yn Lloegr. Mae gennyf enghraifft yn fy etholaeth o ganiatâd cynllunio o'r fath; hen ganiatâd cynllunio ydyw, a ailweithredwyd rai blynyddoedd yn ddiweddarach yn chwarel Ewenni, ac yr wyf yn siŵr fod enghreifftiau eraill ledled Cymru. Dyma pam y bydd yn bwysig yn y dyfodol—ac mae gwaith yn

future—and work is moving forward on this—to amend primary legislation in order for such situations to be avoided in the future.

mynd ymlaen ar hyn—i ddiwygio deddfwriaeth sylfaenol er mwyn osgoi sefyllfaoedd o'r fath yn y dyfodol.

### **Dyfodol Tir Mynydd The Future of Tir Mynydd**

**C3 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddyfodol Tir Mynydd? OAQ923(EPC)

**Q3 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the future of Tir Mynydd? OAQ923(EPC)

**Q10 Michael German:** Will the Minister make a statement on the future of Tir Mynydd? OAQ0944(EPC)

**C10 Michael German:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddyfodol Tir Mynydd? OAQ0944(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Bydd Tir Mynydd yn parhau nes bydd gennym gynllun newydd i gymryd ei le.

**Carwyn Jones:** Tir Mynydd will continue until we have a new scheme to take its place.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Ar ddyfodol Tir Mynydd yn y tymor hir, yr ydych wedi dweud y bydd y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn ystyried newid y diffiniad o beth yw tir llai ffafriol yn 2010. A oes unrhyw reswm pam nad oes modd i'r symiau presennol a delir drwy Tir Mynydd barhau hyd at 2010?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** On the future of Tir Mynydd in the long term, you have said that the European Commission will consider changing the definition of what is less favourable land in 2010. Is there any reason why the current sums that are paid through Tir Mynydd cannot be retained until 2010?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'n bosibl, ond, fel y gwyddoch, mae effaith wedyn ar bethau eraill sy'n cael eu talu o dan y cynllun datblygu gwledig. Er enghraifft, mae tri phosibilrwydd. Yn gyntaf, gellid torri yn ôl ar y cynlluniau megis Cyswllt Ffermio, neu'r cynlluniau i newydd-ddyfodiaid ifanc, neu dorri yn ôl ar Dir Gofal neu Dir Cynnal, neu sicrhau bod modiwlleiddio yn cael ei godi. Nid oes modd osgoi hyn, oherwydd y rheolau sydd gennym o Ewrop, ac felly mae'r sefyllfa yn llawer mwy cymhleth na dim ond edrych ar yr arian, a rhoi arian i mewn am flwyddyn.

**Carwyn Jones:** It is possible, but, as you know, that then effects other payments which are made under the rural development plan. For example, there are three possibilities. First, schemes such as Farming Connect could be cut back, or the schemes for young new entrants, or schemes such as Tir Gofal or Tir Cynnal could be cut back, or modulation could be increased. There is no way to avoid this, because of the rules we have from Europe, and therefore the situation is far more complex than just looking at this funding, and putting funding in for a year.

**Michael German:** I know that one of your concerns is that the Tir Mynydd scheme is a socio-economic scheme, and that we should get something in return for the public investment that has been put in; in a sense, that is what agri-environmental schemes are. Is there any reason why, over a period of time—as happened previously with the enhancement scheme for the predecessor hill livestock compensatory allowance scheme—it is not possible to move gradually from a socio-economic scheme to an agri-environmental scheme, in part, by using a similar method of enhancements that we used

**Michael German:** Gwn mai un o'ch pryderon yw bod y cynllun Tir Mynydd yn gynllun cymdeithasol-economaidd, ac y dylem gael rhywbeth yn gyfnewid am yr arian cyhoeddus sydd wedi'i fuddsoddi ynddo; mewn ffordd, dyna yw cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol. A oes unrhyw reswm pam nad yw'n bosibl, dros gyfnod o amser—fel y digwyddodd gynt gyda'r cynllun gwella blaenorol ar gyfer y cynllun lwfans iawndal anifeiliaid tir uchel—symud yn raddol o gynllun cymdeithasol-economaidd i gynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol, yn rhannol drwy ddefnyddio dull gwella tebyg i'r hyn a

in the previous scheme?

**Carwyn Jones:** The enhancements make the scheme light green, if I can put it that way—90 per cent of the money is paid on the basis of it being paid for no return, effectively, as far as the taxpayer is concerned, although, obviously, there is a benefit to the recipient. The aim in 2008 will be to produce a scheme that is environmentally beneficial to the upland areas, and is more easily justifiable than the present scheme. I look forward to working with interested parties and the farming unions to discover what that scheme will look like.

**Brynle Williams:** The Minister has said that taxpayers are not clear on what Tir Mynydd delivers, which is why he wants to cut the budget. However, does the Minister not agree that preventing land abandonment, supporting local businesses, and providing much needed rural employment are the clear public benefits provided by the less-favoured area supplement, and that it is therefore essential that this is maintained for a sustainable countryside?

**Carwyn Jones:** We must remember that the single farm payment is substantially more than Tir Mynydd. The single farm payment is designed as a way of supporting farms and farming. Tir Mynydd, effectively, is a top-up to that, but the basis for the top-up is flawed—that is my view, which has been heard many times. The basis of the top-up is that farmers in upland areas make less money than farmers in lowland areas—we know that that is not correct. I am not suggesting that they make pots of money, but, nevertheless, the basis for a socio-economic payment alone is not made out, and that is why, in order for the scheme to be more robust and more easily defensible, it is important that we have a successor scheme from 2008 onwards.

**Brynle Williams:** However, do you not agree that, if we lose this, because the profitability in the uplands is marginal, between £2,000 and £3,000 will be needed—I believe that those are the figures quoted? The difference is between farmers staying in

ddefnyddiwyd gennym yn y cynllun blaenorol?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'r gwelliannau yn troi'r cynllun yn wyrdd golau, os gallaf ei roi fel hynny—telir 90 y cant o'r arian ar sail ei dalu heb elw, mewn gwirionedd, cyn belled ag y mae'r trethdalwr yn y cwestiwn, er bod buddiant, yn amlwg, i'r derbynnydd. Y nod yn 2008 fydd cynhyrchu cynllun sy'n fuddiol yn amgylcheddol i'r ucheldiroedd, ac y gellir ei gyfiawnhau'n haws na'r cynllun presennol. Edrychaf ymlaen at weithio gyda phartion sydd â diddordeb ac undebau'r ffermwyr i weld beth fydd ffurf y cynllun.

**Brynle Williams:** Mae'r Gweinidog wedi sôn nad yw trethdalwyr yn deall yr hyn y mae Tir Mynydd yn ei sicrhau, a dyma pam mae'n dymuno torri'r gyllideb. Fodd bynnag, onid yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno mai rhwystro tir rhag mynd yn segur, cefnogi busnesau lleol a darparu'r gyflogaeth y mae angen mawr amdani mewn ardaloedd gwledig yw'r buddiannau clir i'r cyhoedd y mae'r tâl atodol i ardaloedd llai ffafriol yn ei sicrhau, ac felly ei bod yn hanfodol ei gynnal er mwyn sicrhau cefn gwlad gynaliadwy?

**Carwyn Jones:** Rhaid inni gofio bod y taliad sengl lawer yn fwy na Tir Mynydd. Cynlluniwyd y taliad sengl fel ffordd i gynorthwyo ffermydd a'r diwydiant ffermio. Mewn gwirionedd, ychwanegiad at hynny yw Tir Mynydd, ond mae'r sail dros yr ychwanegiad yn ddiffygiol—dyna fy marn i, a chlywyd honno lawer gwaith. Y sail dros yr ychwanegiad yw bod ffermwyr yr ucheldir yn gwneud llai o arian na ffermwyr yr iseldir—gwyddom nad yw hynny'n wir. Nid wyf yn awgrymu eu bod yn gwneud llwyth o arian, ond er hynny, nid oes sail dros daliad cymdeithasol-economaidd ar ei ben ei hun. Dyna pam, er mwyn i'r cynllun fod yn fwy cadarn ac yn haws ei amddiffyn, y mae'n bwysig bod gennym gynllun i'w olynu o 2008 ymlaen.

**Brynle Williams:** Fodd bynnag, onid ydych yn cytuno, os collwn y cynllun, am fod proffidioldeb yn yr ucheldir yn ymylol, y bydd angen rhwng £2,000 a £3,000—credaf mai dyna'r ffigurau a ddyfynnwyd? Y gwahaniaeth yw rhwng ffermwyr yn aros yn

the upland areas and coming off the tops, which will eventually lead to land abandonment. It is that fragile, and that margin is ever so small.

**Carwyn Jones:** The figures do not bear that out. We know that the net farm incomes of upland farmers are between £14,000 and £16,000 at present. I concede that it is not an enormous amount of money. Nevertheless, it is much more than what lowland farmers get. The average Tir Mynydd payment for a farmer in a severely disadvantaged area is about £3,100 or £3,200 a year. The effect of the change in the budget on those farmers is that they lose, on average, £800 a year. It is even less for farmers in disadvantaged areas. We are not talking about substantial cuts in funding to farmers in upland areas, especially given the fact that £220 million a year is already paid in farming subsidies to farmers. The amount of money that is paid out to individual farmers is now public knowledge and people can make up their own minds on the issue.

**Kirsty Williams:** First of all, it was the opposition's fault that you took this money out of the budget to pay for higher education, and then the European rules were to blame for the fact that the money was not there. However, the real issue today is that you had decided to cut the Tir Mynydd budget way before these European rules were published. Where is the £12 million, where have you stashed it and when will you return it?

**Carwyn Jones:** All of Kirsty Williams's contentions are correct; that is quite true. However, I noticed that, as far as the Liberal Democrats are concerned, the way in which to deal with the rural development regulation that creates the rural development plan is to ignore it completely and to submit a rural development plan that will inevitably be rejected by the European Union and, as a result, farmers will not get paid a penny. It is important that the Liberal Democrats come into the real world and try to understand the complexities surrounding these issues, rather than simply trying to make political points.

yr ucheldir a gadael yr ardaloedd hynny, a fydd yn arwain yn y pen draw at dir segur. Mae mor fregus â hynny, ac mae'r ffin honno'n fach iawn.

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid yw'r ffigurau yn ategu hynny. Gwyddom fod incwm net ffermwyr ucheldir rhwng £14,000 a £16,000 ar hyn o bryd. Derbyniaf nad yw hynny'n swm enfawr o arian. Er hynny, mae'n fwy o lawer nag a gaiff ffermwyr yr iseldir. Y taliad Tir Mynydd ar gyfartaledd ar gyfer ffarmwr mewn ardal ddifreintiedig iawn yw tua £3,100 neu £3,200 y flwyddyn. Effaith y newid yn y gyllideb ar y ffermwyr hynny yw eu bod yn colli £800 y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd. Mae'n llai na hynny i ffermwyr mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig. Nid ydym yn sôn am doriadau sylweddol yn y cyllid a roddir i ffermwyr ucheldir, yn enwedig o gofio bod £220 miliwn y flwyddyn eisoes yn cael ei dalu i ffermwyr mewn cymorthdaliadau ffermio. Mae'r arian a delir i ffermwyr unigol bellach yn hysbys i bawb, a gall pobl wneud eu penderfyniadau eu hunain ar y mater.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn gyntaf oll, bai'r gwrthbleidiau ydoedd eich bod wedi cymryd yr arian hwn o'r gyllideb i dalu am addysg uwch, a bai'r rheolau Ewropeaidd ydoedd nad oedd yr arian ar gael. Fodd bynnag, y broblem wirioneddol heddiw yw eich bod wedi penderfynu torri'r gyllideb ar gyfer Tir Mynydd ymhell cyn i'r rheolau Ewropeaidd hyn gael eu cyhoeddi. Ble mae'r £12 miliwn, ble yr ydych wedi ei guddio, a phryd y byddwch yn ei ddychwelyd?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae pob un o honiadau Kirsty Williams yn gywir; mae hynny'n eithaf gwir. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi sylwi, o ran y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, mai'r ffordd o ddelio â'r rheoliad datblygu gwledig sy'n creu'r cynllun datblygu gwledig yw ei anwybyddu'n llwyr a chyflwyno cynllun datblygu gwledig a fydd, yn anochel, yn cael ei wrthod gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, ac o ganlyniad ni fydd ffermwyr yn cael yr un geiniog. Mae'n bwysig i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wynebu realiti a cheisio deall y cymhlethdodau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r materion hyn, yn hytrach na cheisio gwneud pwyntiau gwleidyddol yn unig.

### Safleoedd Tirlenwi Landfill Sites

**Q4 Leanne Wood:** Will the Minister make a statement on the development of landfill sites? OAQ0908(EPC)

**C4 Leanne Wood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddatblygu safleoedd tirlenwi? OAQ0908(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** The national waste strategy contains targets to reduce landfill, which includes reducing biodegradable municipal waste under the landfill allowances scheme. The number of active landfill sites in Wales has reduced from 73 to 38 since 2002.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'r strategaeth wastraff genedlaethol yn cynnwys targedau i leihau nifer y safleoedd tirlenwi, sy'n cynnwys lleihau gwastraff trefol bioddiraddadwy o dan y cynllun lwfansau tirlenwi. Mae nifer y safleoedd tirlenwi sydd ar waith yng Nghymru wedi gostwng o 73 i 38 er 2002.

**Leanne Wood:** I am sure that the Minister will be aware of the plan in Cardiff to develop a landfill site on the land north of junction 33 on the M4, which is also the subject of an application for a business park. Does he agree with his ministerial colleague, Andrew Davies, who has supported the plan for the business park rather than using the site for landfill? If so, will he agree to write to Cardiff council, outlining his support for his Cabinet colleague's view?

**Leanne Wood:** Yr wyf yn siŵr fod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r cynllun yng Nghaerdydd i ddatblygu safle tirlenwi ar dir i'r gogledd o gyffordd 33 ar yr M4, sydd hefyd yn destun cais am parc busnes. A yw'n cytuno â'i gyd-Aelod, Andrew Davies, sydd wedi cefnogi'r cynllun ar gyfer y parc busnes yn hytrach na defnyddio'r safle at ddibenion tirlenwi? Os felly, a wnaiff gytuno i ysgrifennu at gyngor Caerdydd, yn amlinellu ei gefnogaeth i farn ei gyd-Aelod?

**Carwyn Jones:** Once again, I am in the difficult position of not being able to comment on any planning application that may come before me for a call-in decision or before either a planning decision committee or a Minister in the future for a final decision to be made. At present, therefore, I am unable to comment on that.

**Carwyn Jones:** Unwaith eto, yr wyf yn y sefyllfa anodd o fethu â gallu gwneud sylwadau am unrhyw gais cynllunio a allai gael ei gyflwyno imi i'w benderfynu ar ôl ei alw i mewn, neu gerbron pwyllgor penderfyniadau cynllunio neu Weinidog yn y dyfodol er mwyn gwneud penderfyniad terfynol. Felly, ar hyn o bryd, ni allaf wneud sylwadau am hynny.

**Glyn Davies:** Do you accept that, in the not-too-long term, the whole principle of landfill will have to disappear in terms of the way in which we deal with rubbish? We are slowly moving down the road towards recycling, but we must have a Government in the National Assembly—be it a Labour Government or a Conservative-led Government—that recognises that landfill is not the way in which to deal with rubbish and that tackles the tough decisions that must be made?

**Glyn Davies:** A ydych yn derbyn y bydd yn rhaid i holl egwyddor tirlenwi ddiffannu cyn hir o ran y ffordd yr ydym yn delio â sbwriel? Yr ydym yn symud yn araf tuag at ailgylchu, ond rhaid inni gael Llywodraeth yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol—boed yn Llywodraeth Lafur neu'n Llywodraeth dan arweiniad y Ceidwadwyr—sy'n cydnabod nad tirlenwi yw'r ffordd i ddelio â sbwriel ac sy'n mynd i'r afael â'r penderfyniadau anodd y mae'n rhaid eu gwneud?

**Carwyn Jones:** First of all, landfill will be with us for some years to come, but we need to reduce it. However, we must remember that there will always be a fraction of rubbish that cannot be recycled or reused and that that will have to be disposed of in some other

**Carwyn Jones:** Yn gyntaf oll, bydd safleoedd tirlenwi gyda ni am rai blynyddoedd i ddod, ond mae angen inni wneud llai o ddefnydd ohonynt. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gofio y bydd rhywfaint o sbwriel na allwn ei ailgylchu na'i

way, either by using energy from waste plants or incinerators. Energy from waste is the preferred option, followed by incineration, and then landfill. If we are serious about reducing the use of landfill and disposing of that residual fraction of rubbish that cannot otherwise be recycled, it will be important not to simply oppose every other application for any other form of rubbish disposal.

ailddefnyddio, ac y bydd yn rhaid ei waredu mewn ffordd arall, naill ai drwy ddefnyddio ynni o weithfeydd gwastraff neu losgyddion. Ynni o wastraff yw'r opsiwn dewisol, yna llosgyddion, ac yna safleoedd tirlenwi. Os ydym o ddifrif ynghylch defnyddio llai o'r safleoedd tirlenwi a gwaredu'r sbwriel hwnnw sy'n weddill ac na ellir ei ailgylchu fel arall, bydd yn bwysig peidio â gwrthwynebu pob cais arall am unrhyw ffordd arall o waredu sbwriel.

### **Y Diwydiant Llaeth The Dairy Industry**

**Q5 Jenny Randerson:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh dairy industry in south Wales? OAQ0942(EPC)

**C5 Jenny Randerson:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddiwydiant llaeth Cymru yn y de? OAQ0942(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** The strategic action plan for the Welsh dairy industry will shortly be issued for consultation and it will set out the activities to be delivered through a partnership consisting of the Assembly Government, the Milk Development Council and the industry.

**Carwyn Jones:** Cyhoeddir y cynllun gweithredu strategol ar gyfer diwydiant llaeth Cymru i ymgynghori arno'n fuan, a bydd yn gosod allan y gweithgareddau a gaiff eu cyflwyno drwy bartneriaeth, sy'n cynnwys Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, y Cyngor Datblygu Llaeth a'r diwydiant.

**Jenny Randerson:** I am concerned that the Dairy Farmers of Britain co-operative has decided to close its plant in Cardiff Central and will be making 50 people redundant. What discussions have you had with dairy farmers about the consolidation of the co-operative's activities in Bridgend, and can you promise us that there will be an overall increase in the number of jobs throughout Wales, even though Cardiff will have seriously lost out?

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf yn pryderu bod y cwmni cydweithredol Dairy Farmers of Britain wedi penderfynu cau ei waith yng Nghanol Caerdydd ac y bydd 50 o bobl yn ddi-waith. Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gyda ffermwyr llaeth ynglŷn ag atgyfnerthu gweithgareddau'r cwmni cydweithredol ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, ac a allwch addo y bydd cynnydd cyffredinol yn nifer y swyddi ledled Cymru, er y bydd Caerdydd wedi colli'n arw?

3.10 p.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** I can assure you that the fact that the jobs are coming to Bridgend has nothing to do with me. I sympathise with those workers who will lose their jobs in Cardiff. It is important to remember that the information that we have says that this is an important strategic decision for the Dairy Farmers of Britain, in order to secure its future, which will, in my view, be of benefit to the whole farming industry. While it is right to say that there are 50 workers in Cardiff who have lost out, generally, it makes the situation rosier as far as the industry is concerned. However, that is not to belittle the

**Carwyn Jones:** Gallaf eich sicrhau nad oes a wnelo'r ffaith fod y swyddi'n dod i Ben-y-bont ar Ogwr ddim byd i'w wneud â mi. Yr wyf yn cydymdeimlo â'r gweithwyr hynny a fydd yn colli eu swyddi yng Nghaerdydd. Mae'n bwysig cofio bod y wybodaeth sydd gennym yn dweud bod hwn yn benderfyniad strategol pwysig i Dairy Farmers of Britain, er mwyn sicrhau dyfodol y cwmni a fydd, yn fy marn i, o fudd i'r holl ddiwydiant ffermio. Er ei bod yn gywir dweud bod 50 o weithwyr yng Nghaerdydd wedi colli eu swyddi, yn gyffredinol mae'n arwain at sefyllfa well o ran y diwydiant. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn

situation in Cardiff.

**Elin Jones:** Gwnaeth uwch-swyddog o adran comisiynydd yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar amaeth gyflwyniad i'r pwyllgor y bore yma. Dywedodd ei bod yn hollbwysig inni gadw diwydiant llaeth cynhenid yn Ewrop ond bod problemau mawr yn hynny o beth ar hyn y bryd. Dywedodd hefyd ei bod yn amser i lywodraethau a'r comisiwn edrych o ddifrif ar waith yr archfarchnadoedd a'r proseswyr llaeth a bod y gwaith hwnnw, ar hyn o bryd, yn ymddangos yn anghystadluel. A fydddech yn cytuno â'r gosodiad hwnnw?

**Carwyn Jones:** Byddwn yn cytuno bod achos i'r Swyddfa Masnachu Teg ystyried y berthynas rhwng y cynhyrchwyr a'r prynwyr a gobeithiaf y bydd hynny'n digwydd yn y dyfodol agos.

**Elin Jones:** A ydych wedi gwneud y cais hwnnw i'r Swyddfa Masnachu Teg drwy Lywodraeth San Steffan? A ydych wedi gwneud cais am ymchwiliad o'r fath yn swyddogol fel Gweinidog amaeth Cymru ar ran ffermwyr llaeth Cymru?

**Carwyn Jones:** O'm cof, credaf fod llythyr wedi mynd i'r Swyddfa Masnachu Teg ond byddai'n rhaid i mi edrych i mewn i hynny er mwyn bod yn sicr. Yr wyf wedi dweud hynny ar lafar sawl gwaith, ond bydd yn rhaid i mi wneud yn siŵr a anfonwyd llythyr âi peidio.

**Lisa Francis:** Minister, last week, we had an interesting debate on the dairy industry and you will have heard the comments of the chair of the National Farmers' Union's milk board regarding the 6 per cent drop in British milk production over the last two years. We heard last week about how dairy farmers cannot afford to invest in their infrastructure and about on-farm costs, high energy costs, increased competition and, as Elin Jones has articulated, how that enables retailers to dictate farm-gate prices. Do you agree with the chair's statement? As the Minister for agriculture, do you agree with him that there needs to be a rationalisation in the industry—that is what he appears to be calling for—so that there are just three or four well-run manufacturing companies in Britain and that

bychanu'r sefyllfa yng Nghaerdydd.

**Elin Jones:** A senior official from the European Union commissioner on agriculture's department gave us a presentation in committee this morning. He said it was vital for us to retain an indigenous dairy industry within Europe, but that there are huge problems at present in that regard. He also said that it was now time for governments and the commission to seriously consider the work of supermarkets and milk producers and that that work, at the moment, appears to be non-competitive. Do you agree with that statement?

**Carwyn Jones:** I would agree that there is a case for the Office of Fair Trading to consider the relationship between producers and purchasers, and I hope that will happen in the near future.

**Elin Jones:** Have you made that application to the Office of Fair Trading through the Westminster Government? Have you officially made that request for a review as the agriculture Minister for Wales on behalf of Welsh dairy farmers?

**Carwyn Jones:** My recollection is that a letter has gone to the OFT, but I would have to look into that to be sure. I have made this point orally on many occasions, but I will have to check whether or not a letter was sent.

**Lisa Francis:** Weinidog, cawsom ddadl ddiddorol yr wythnos diwethaf am y diwydiant llaeth, a byddwch wedi clywed sylwadau cadeirydd bwrdd llaeth Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Amaethwyr ynghylch y gostyngiad o 6 y cant yn y llaeth a gynhyrchwyd ym Mhrydain dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf. Clywsom yr wythnos diwethaf fod ffermwyr llaeth yn methu fforddio buddsoddi yn eu seilwaith, ac am gostau fferm, costau ynni uchel, cystadleuaeth gynyddol ac, fel y soniodd Elin Jones, y ffordd y mae hynny'n galluogi manwerthwyr i bennu prisiau wrth gât y fferm. A gytunwch â datganiad y cadeirydd? Fel y Gweinidog dros amaethyddiaeth, a gytunwch ag ef fod angen rhesymoli'r diwydiant—ymddengys mai dyna y mae'n

those preferably need to be farmer controlled?

**Carwyn Jones:** It is not for me to give an opinion on the commercial structure that the dairy industry should have. I am particularly loath to give a view on how companies should be structured. The prospects of the dairy industry have improved somewhat: the price of milk has gone up, not by a gigantic amount, but by 0.2p per litre recently, which is a step in the right direction. The organic dairy sector is doing exceptionally well, with prices going up to 29p per litre, which places it not far below the price seen during the boom years of the early part of this decade. We know that energy prices have dropped and we know, of course, that dairy calves now have a value, where previously they had none. All these things, taken together, have provided a boost for dairy farmers, although I am sure that they would be the first to say that they could always do with a better price.

galw amdano—er mwyn cael dim ond tri neu bedwar cwmni gweithgynhyrchu sy'n cael eu rhedeg yn dda ym Mhrydain, a'r rheini, o ddewis, yn cael eu rheoli gan ffermwyr?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid fy lle i yw rhoi barn am strwythur masnachol y diwydiant llaeth. Yr wyf yn sicr yn anfodlon rhoi fy marn am y ffordd y dylai cwmnïau gael eu strwythuro. Mae rhagolygon y diwydiant llaeth wedi gwella rywfaint: mae pris llaeth wedi cynyddu, nid rhyw lawer, ond mae wedi cynyddu 0.2c y litr yn ddiweddar, sy'n gam i'r cyfeiriad cywir. Mae'r sector llaeth organig yn gwneud yn eithriadol o dda, a'r prisiau'n codi i 29c y litr, sydd ychydig yn is na'r pris a welwyd yn ystod y blynyddoedd llewyrchus ar ddechrau'r degawd hwn. Gwyddom fod prisiau ynni wedi gostwng a gwyddom, wrth gwrs, fod gwerth nawr i loi llaeth, lle nad oedd iddynt werth o gwbl gynt. Mae'r holl bethau hyn, gyda'i gilydd, wedi rhoi hwb i ffermwyr llaeth, er fy mod yn siŵr mai nhw fyddai'r cyntaf i ddweud y gallent wneud y tro â phris gwell.

#### **Ceir sy'n cael eu Gadael Abandoned Cars**

**Q6 Peter Black:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to tackle the problem of abandoned cars in Wales? OAO0937(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** The Welsh Assembly Government commenced sections of the Clean Neighbourhoods and Environment Act 2005 on 27 October 2007. Those sections enable the speedier removal and disposal of abandoned vehicles.

**Peter Black:** Can you give an assurance that, as this provision is rolled out across Wales and local authorities can use the powers that are available to them to remove abandoned cars, you will be able to monitor to what extent they are recycling the cars that they collect, to try to avoid them being sent to a landfill site?

**Carwyn Jones:** There is a financial incentive not to do that, because, in 2010, there will be stringent financial penalties related to the amount of waste that goes into landfill. In

**C6 Peter Black:** Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â phroblem ceir sy'n cael eu gadael yng Nghymru? OAO0937(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Cychwynnodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru adrannau o Ddeddf Cymdogaethau Glân a'r Amgylchedd 2005 ar 27 Hydref 2007. Mae'r adrannau hynny'n galluogi symud a gwaredu cerbydau sy'n cael eu gadael, a gwneud hynny'n gyflymach.

**Peter Black:** A allwch roi sicrwydd, wrth i'r ddarpariaeth hon gael ei chyflwyno ledled Cymru ac wrth i awdurdodau lleol allu defnyddio'r pwerau sydd ar gael iddynt i symud cerbydau sy'n cael eu gadael, y byddwch yn gallu monitro'r graddau y maent yn ailgylchu'r ceir a gesglir ganddynt, i geisio osgoi anfon y ceir hynny i safle tirlenwi?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae cymhelliant ariannol i beidio â gwneud hynny, oherwydd yn 2010 bydd cosbau ariannol llym yn gysylltiedig â faint o wastraff sy'n cael ei anfon i safleoedd



any event, the scrap metal industry is an established industry and there has always been a high level of recycling when it comes to cars and metal generally. I am confident that the majority of cars that are collected in this way will be recycled to the limit, as they always have been.

**Mark Isherwood:** What help can you give to small businesses that are dismantling end-of-life vehicles that often face uneconomic costs and time delays when submitting planning applications to the Environment Agency?

**Carwyn Jones:** I am not sure that that is entirely to do with this question, unless I misheard it. I did not catch the first part, I am afraid.

**Mark Isherwood:** Within your powers, what help, if any, can you give to small businesses that dismantle end-of-life vehicles and abandoned cars, given that they often face uneconomic costs as they need planning approval to develop or, as is often the case, just to sustain their businesses?

**Carwyn Jones:** I am not aware that this is a problem. Individual planning applications have to be dealt with by local authorities, and car dismantling and recycling businesses have to be situated in appropriate areas. The scrap-metal industry has not suffered a lack of profit in the past; it has been a good business to be in, over the years, and I am sure that that will continue to be the case.

tirlenwi. Beth bynnag, mae'r diwydiant metel sgrap yn ddiwydiant sefydledig ac mae yna lefel uchel erioed o ailgylchu ceir a metel yn gyffredinol. Yr wyf yn hyderus y caiff y rhan fwyaf o geir a gesglir fel hyn eu hailgylchu gymaint â phosibl, fel sydd wedi digwydd erioed.

**Mark Isherwood:** Pa help y gallwch ei roi i fusnesau bach sy'n datgymalu cerbydau diwedd oes ac sydd yn aml yn wynebu costau aneconomaidd ac oedi wrth gyflwyno ceisiadau cynllunio i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid wyf yn siŵr a oes a wnelo hyn yn llwyr â'r cwestiwn hwn, onid wyf wedi ei glywed yn anghywir. Ni chlywais y rhan gyntaf, yn anffodus.

**Mark Isherwood:** O fewn eich pwerau, pa help, os o gwbl, y gallwch ei roi i fusnesau bach sy'n datgymalu cerbydau diwedd oes a cheir sydd wedi eu gadael, o gofio'u bod yn aml yn wynebu costau aneconomaidd gan fod angen cymeradwyaeth gynllunio arnynt i ddatblygu eu busnesau neu, fel y gwelir yn aml, er mwyn cynnal eu busnesau?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol fod hyn yn peri problem. Rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ymdrin â cheisiadau cynllunio unigol, a rhaid i fusnesau sy'n datgymalu ceir a'u hailgylchu fod mewn mannau addas. Nid yw'r diwydiant metel sgrap wedi dioddef oherwydd diffyg elw yn y gorffennol; mae wedi bod yn fusnes llwyddiannus, dros y blynyddoedd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd hynny'n parhau.

### **Datblygu'r Economi Wledig Developing the Rural Economy**

**C7 Alun Ffred Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am lwyddiant polisiau'r llywodraeth ar gyfer datblygu'r economi wledig? OAQ0919(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae gennym lawer o raglenni i hybu'r economi wledig. Mae'r ymrwymadau strategol i'w cael yn y dogfennau, 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu' a 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'.

**Q7 Alun Ffred Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the success of the Welsh Assembly Government's policies for developing the rural economy? OAQ0919(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** We have several programmes to promote the rural economy. The strategic commitments are to be found in 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy' and 'Wales: A Better Country.'

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae'r gwaith a ddatblygir yn y sector bwyd wedi bod yn allweddol i'ch portffolio chi, ond mae ergydion wedi taro'n ddiweddar yng Nghaernarfon, Llangefni, Llangadog, Felin-fach a Felindre. Byddwch yn colli £2 miliwn o'ch cyllideb i gyllideb y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau ymhen dwy flynedd. A ydych chi'n cytuno mai o fewn eich cyllideb chi y dylai'r arian hwnnw aros? Os caiff ei drosglwyddo, a oes modd ei ddiogelu ar gyfer gwaith marchnata bwyd yn hytrach nag inni ei golli yn gyffredinol?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'r grantiau prosesu a marchnata gennym, sy'n rhan o'r cynllun datblygu gwledig, ond, wrth gwrs, bydd peth dadlau ynghylch faint o arian fydd yn y cynllun hwnnw. Er hynny, mae'n bwysig sylweddoli nad yw economi cefn gwlad ar wahân yn llwyr i economi Cymru gyfan. Mae'n bwysig sicrhau ein bod yn hybu'r diwydiant bwyd, sydd wedi tyfu dros y blynyddoedd, er i'r diwydiant yn Lloegr leihau dros yr un cyfnod. Felly, yr wyf yn hyderus fod gennym strwythur yn ei le i helpu'r diwydiant yn y pen draw.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The work being developed in the food sector has been key to your portfolio, but some shocks have been felt recently in Caernarfon, Llangefni, Llangadog, Felin-fach and Felindre. You will lose £2 million from your budget to that of the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks in two years' time. Do you agree that that money should remain within your budget? If it is transferred, is it possible to safeguard this funding for work on food marketing, rather than to lose it generally?

**Carwyn Jones:** We have the processing and marketing grants, which form part of the rural development plan. But of course, there will be some debate about how much funding there will be in that scheme. However, it is important to realise that the rural economy is not completely separate from the economy of the whole of Wales. It is important to ensure that we promote the food industry, which has grown over the years, although the industry in England has contracted over the same period. Therefore, I am confident we have a structure in place to assist the industry ultimately.

### **Blaenoriaethau Cyllidol Financial Priorities**

**C8 Alun Ffred Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei flaenoriaethau cyllidol? OAQ0916(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Maent yn cynnwys rheoli gwastraff, atal llifogydd, Tir Gofal a Thir Cynnal, datblygu technoleg gwybodaeth, y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth, a physgodfeydd.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Yr wyf am fynd â chi i fyd arall yn awr, sef i fyd y cynllun datblygu gwledig. Un cynllun a fu o fewn y cynllun datblygu gwledig dros y tair blynedd diwethaf yw cynllun yng Ngwynedd o'r enw Llwyddo'n Lleol, sy'n hybu mentergarwch ymhlith plant ysgol a phobl ifanc. A ydych chi'n gyfarwydd â'r cynllun hwn, ac, os nad ydych, a wnewch chi edrych arno yn ofalus, gyda golwg ar ei ehangu i weddill ardal Amcan 1, lle bo hynny'n berthnasol?

**Q8 Alun Ffred Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on his financial priorities? OAQ0916(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** They include waste management, flood prevention, Tir Gofal and Tir Cynnal, information technology development, the Forestry Commission, and fisheries.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I wish to refer you to another area now, that is, the rural development plan. One scheme which has been incorporated within the rural development plan over the last three years is the Get on in Gwynedd scheme, which promotes enterprise among schoolchildren and young people. Are you familiar with this scheme, and if you are not, will you consider it carefully with a view to expanding it to the rest of the Objective 1 area, where that is relevant?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid wyf yn gwybod am y cynllun hwnnw, ond hoffwn wybod mwy. Pe baech yn ysgrifennu ataf gyda'r manylion, byddwn yn hapus iawn i edrych arno er mwyn rhoi tipyn o hwb iddo yn y dyfodol.

**Carwyn Jones:** I am not aware of that scheme, but I should like to know more about it. If you write to me with the details, I would be happy to consider it in order to give it a bit of a boost in the future.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Given that the Animal Welfare Act 2006 was enacted on 8 November—I am glad to say—will you make funding for animal welfare a priority?

**Lorraine Barrett:** O gofio bod Deddf Lles Anifeiliaid 2006 wedi dod i rym ar 8 Tachwedd—yr wyf yn falch o ddweud—a fyddwch yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i ddarparu cyllid ar gyfer lles anifeiliaid?

**Carwyn Jones:** Animal welfare is a priority; farm animal welfare has certainly been a priority for some years, and this will now be extended to non-farm animals as well with the passing of the new Act. In order to have a humane level of animal welfare, it will be important to have a reasonable level of funding.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae lles anifeiliaid yn flaenoriaeth; mae lles anifeiliaid fferm wedi bod yn flaenoriaeth ers rhai blynnyddoedd, a chaiff y flaenoriaeth hon yn awr ei hymestyn hefyd i anifeiliaid heblaw anifeiliaid fferm wrth basio'r Ddeddf newydd. Er mwyn sicrhau bod anifeiliaid yn cael gofal caredig, bydd yn bwysig sicrhau lefel resymol o gyllid.

### Targedau Ailgylchu Recycling Targets

**Q9 Eleanor Burnham:** Will the Minister make a statement on funding for recycling targets in Wales? OAQ0939(EPC)

**C9 Eleanor Burnham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyllid ar gyfer targedau ailgylchu yng Nghymru? OAQ0939(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** We have provided some £121.5 million since 2001 to support recycling plans, and we will be providing a further £179.4 million going up to 2010.

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr ydym wedi darparu tua £121.5 miliwn er 2001 i gefnogi cynlluniau ailgylchu, a byddwn yn darparu £179.4 miliwn yn ychwanegol hyd at 2010.

**Eleanor Burnham:** That is to be welcomed, but do you realise that Friends of the Earth has stated that 40 per cent of household waste can be composted? What are you going to do to encourage households to take this up? If composting is introduced, my understanding is that it could reduce the total cost of recycling and, generally, perhaps it could help you to reach your targets quicker.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae hynny i'w groesawu, ond a ydych yn sylweddoli bod Cyfeillion y Ddaear wedi dweud y gellir compostio 40 y cant o wastraff cartrefi? Beth y bwriadwch ei wneud i annog cartrefi i wneud hynny? Os cyflwynir dulliau compostio, deallaf y gallai leihau cyfanswm costau ailgylchu, ac yn gyffredinol efallai y gallai eich helpu i gyrraedd eich targedau'n gyflymach.

3.20 p.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** I compost waste at home, and I hope that you do too. One way of dealing with the problem is to get people to compost at home; another way of doing it is to ensure that items that were not previously composted are composted in the future, one example being food. Indeed, I was recently at

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr wyf fi'n compostio gwastraff gartref, a gobeithio eich bod chi hefyd. Un ffordd o ymdrin â'r broblem yw annog pobl i gompostio gartref; ffordd arall o wneud hynny yw sicrhau bod eitemau nd oeddent yn cael eu compostio gynt yn cael eu compostio yn y dyfodol, gan gynnwys bwyd.

a Bryn Quarry Ltd facility in the Caerphilly constituency where food was composted. However, it is important to realise that compost must have a market and that market for compost must still be robust as it is produced; otherwise, we will end up with compost being made without a market for it.

Yn wir, yr oeddwn nny cyfleuster yn Bryn Quarry Ltd yn etholaeth Caerffili yn ddiweddar lle yr oedd bwyd ei cael ei gompostio. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig sylweddoli ei bod yn rhaid sicrhau marchnad i gompost, a rhaid i'r farchnad gompost honno barhau'n gadarn wrth iddo gael ei gynhyrchu; fel arall, bydd compost yn cael ei gynhyrchu ond ni fydd marchnad ar ei gyfer.

### **Lefel y Môr yn Codi The Rise in Sea Levels**

**Q11 David Melding:** What is the current Welsh Assembly Government estimate for the rise in sea levels along the south Wales coast in the next 25 years and the next 50 years? OAQ0926(EPC)

**C11 David Melding:** Beth yw amcangyfrif cyfredol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer y codi yn lefelau'r môr ar hyd arfordir y de dros y 25 mlynedd nesaf a thros yr 50 mlynedd nesaf? OAQ0926(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** It is not an exact science, as I am sure you will appreciate but, based on the latest research, the current estimates of sea level rise in south Wales is 115mm over the next 25 years, and 315mm over the next 50 years.

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid yw'n wyddor berffaith, fel yr ydych yn sylweddoli, yr wyf yn siŵr. Ond ar sail yr ymchwil ddiweddaraf, yr amcangyfrifon presennol yw y bydd lefel y môr yn y de yn codi 115mm dros y 25 mlynedd nesaf, a 315mm dros yr 50 mlynedd nesaf.

**David Melding:** That is a significant rise even though it is not quite the doomsday scenario that we sometimes hear about. It will still have a big impact on flood defences and on insurance risk. We must calculate this and prepare for it, given that much of the Cardiff area and the Gwent levels, for instance, are vulnerable to flooding, and that flood events are likely to become more common. That must affect the future direction of planning, for instance.

**David Melding:** Mae hynny'n gynnydd sylweddol er nad yw mor ddifrifol â'r sefyllfa y sonnir amdani weithiau. Bydd y cael effaith fawr, er hynny, ar amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd ac ar risg yswiriant. Rhaid inni gyfrifo hyn a pharatoi ar ei gyfer, o gofio bod rhannau helaeth o ardal Caerdydd a gwastatir Gwent, er enghraifft, yn agored i lifogydd, a bod llifogydd yn debygol o ddod yn fwy cyffredin. Rhaid i hynny effeithio ar gyfeiriad cynllunio, er enghraifft, yn y dyfodol.

**Carwyn Jones:** Yes. There are two ways of dealing with this. The first is to put more money into flood defences, which we have done. However, the need for flood defences will increase as the flood risk increases with climate change. The best way to mitigate the problem of flooding in the future is to ensure that we do not build in areas that are at risk of flooding. It is important not to build in areas that cannot be defended. We must assess flood risk and ensure that that can be managed, if possible, before building in areas of flood risk. It is also important to realise that we cannot base our flood-risk assessments on historic flooding; we have to base them on predictions of flooding because

**Carwyn Jones:** Bydd. Mae dwy ffordd i ymdrin â'r sefyllfa. Yn gyntaf, gellid buddsoddi mwy o arian mewn amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd, ac yr ydym wedi gwneud hynny. Y ffordd orau i liniaru problem llifogydd yn y dyfodol yw sicrhau na fyddwn yn adeiladu yn yr ardaloedd lle mae perygl llifogydd. Mae'n bwysig peidio ag adeiladu mewn ardaloedd na ellir eu hamddiffyn. Rhaid inni asesu'r perygl llifogydd a sicrhau y gellir rheoli hynny, os yn bosibl, cyn adeiladu mewn ardaloedd lle mae perygl llifogydd. Mae hefyd yn bwysig sylweddoli na allwn seilio ein hasesiadau o berygl llifogydd ar lifogydd yn y gorffennol; rhaid inni eu seilio ar ragamcanion o lifogydd

of climate change over the next 25 to 50 years.

oherwydd newid yn yr hinsawdd yn ystod y 25 i'r 50 mlynedd nesaf.

### **Effaith Newid yn yr Hinsawdd The Impact of Climate Change**

**Q12 Jocelyn Davies:** Will the Minister make a statement on the impact of climate change on Wales? OAQ0907(EPC)

**C12 Jocelyn Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am effaith newid yn yr hinsawdd ar Gymru? OAQ0907(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** We can expect to see higher sea levels, increased storminess, hotter and dryer summers, and wetter and milder winters. There is a school of thought that if the poles melt, the Gulf stream might stop too and we might have an ice age. That is one possibility. As regards how we deal with it, it is first important to reduce greenhouse gases, However, we know that climate change will occur over the next 50 years regardless of what we do now, so we also have to ensure that we have a plan in place to adapt to climate change. That is why we have a climate change adaptation action plan, which I hope to publish in the next few months and which will set out the proposals for how we seek to adapt. Hopefully, that will be out for consultation soon.

**Carwyn Jones:** Gallwn ddisgwyl gweld lefelau'r môr yn codi, mwy o stormydd, hafau cynhesach a sychach, a gaeafau gwlypach a thecach. Mae rhai'n credu, os bydd y pegynau'n dadlaith, y gallai llif y Gwlff hefyd ddod i ben ac y gallem wynebu oes iâ. Mae hynny'n un posibilrwydd. O ran sut yr ymdriniwn â hynny, mae'n bwysig yn gyntaf inni leihau nwyon tŷ gwydr. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom y bydd newid yn yr hinsawdd yn digwydd yn ystod yr 50 mlynedd nesaf waeth beth a wnawn yn awr, felly, rhaid inni hefyd sicrhau bod cynllun ar waith gennym i addasu i newid yn yr hinsawdd. Dyna pam y mae gennym gynllun gweithredu i addasu ar gyfer newid yn yr hinsawdd. Gobeithiaf gyhoeddi hwn yn ystod y misoedd nesaf i osod allan y cynigion ar gyfer y ffordd y gobeithiwn addasu. Gobeithiwn ymgynghori ar hwnnw'n fuan.

**Jocelyn Davies:** As you mentioned, climate change will bring increased flooding, and we must ensure that the planning regime reflects that new danger. The subject committee received evidence today that planning authorities are experiencing significant problems with the new technical advice note 15. Will you undertake to review that evidence and take appropriate action to ensure that the planning authorities are well equipped to meet the challenges that lie ahead of them?

**Jocelyn Davies:** Fel y crybwyllwyd gennych, bydd newid yn yr hinsawdd yn dod â mwy o lifogydd, a rhaid inni sicrhau bod y system gynllunio yn adlewyrchu'r perygl newydd hwnnw. Clywodd y pwyllgor pwnc dystiolaeth heddiw fod awdurdodau cynllunio'n cael problemau mawr gyda nodyn cyngor technegol newydd 15. A gytunwch i adolygu'r dystiolaeth honno ac i gymryd camau priodol i sicrhau bod adnoddau priodol gan yr awdurdodau cynllunio i ymateb i'r heriau sydd o'u blaenau?

**Carwyn Jones:** I look forward to receiving that evidence. It is right to say that TAN 15 has not been widely understood, if I can put it that way, since its inception, but the Environment Agency has now issued guidance to all its officers in Wales, and a letter will also be sent to local authorities informing them of slight changes to the TAN. A full review would normally take three years to complete after the initial publication

**Carwyn Jones:** Edrychaf ymlaen at gael y dystiolaeth honno. Mae'n briodol dweud nad yw Nodyn Cyngor Technegol 15 wedi ei ddeall yn helaeth, os gallaf ei roi fel hynny, ers ei gyflwyno, ond mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd bellach wedi cyhoeddi canllawiau i bob un o'i swyddogion yng Nghymru, ac anfonir llythyr hefyd at awdurdodau lleol i ddweud wrthynt am fân newidiadau yn y Nodyn Cyngor Technegol.

of the final TAN. That does not mean that Wales needs to review the guidance that often.

Fel arfer byddai adolygiad llawn yn cymryd tair blynedd i'w gwblhau ar ôl cyhoeddi'r Nodyn terfynol am y tro cyntaf. Nid yw hynny'n golygu bod angen i Gymru adolygu'r canllawiau mor aml â hynny.

### **Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig Revised Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose a revised business statement in accordance with Standing Order Nos. 5.4 and 5.5. The draft statement can be found on the Chamberweb, under 'supporting documents'.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau ddatganiad busnes diwygiedig yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhif 5.4 a 5.5. Gellir gweld y datganiad drafft ar we'r Siambr, o dan 'dogfennau ategol'.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes diwygiedig? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 gwrthwynebiad. Felly, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gynnig y datganiad busnes diwygiedig yn ffurfiol.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the revised business statement? I see that there are at least 10. Therefore, I ask the Minister to formally propose the revised business statement.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales adopts the revised business statement.*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes diwygiedig.*

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I thank the Minister for bringing forward a revised business statement, but that is as far as my welcome for it goes. Although several requests were made by all the opposition parties yesterday, not a single one of those requests has been accommodated. The three amendments to the business statement have nothing to do with Government business; they relate to the National Assembly's pension scheme, to Members' pay and allowances, and to the periodic timetable.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am gyflwyno datganiad busnes diwygiedig, ond nid wyg yn ei groesawu ddim mwy na hynny. Er bod nifer o geisiadau gan bob un o'r gwrthbleidiau ddoe, ni weithredwyd ar yr un o'r ceisiadau hynny. Nid oes a wnelo'r tri gwelliant i'r datganiad busnes â busnes y Llywodraeth mewn unrhyw ffordd; maent yn ymwneud â chynllun pensiwn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, tâl a lwfansau Aelodau, a'r amserlen gyfnodol.

We are most disappointed by the fact that you have not accommodated our request for a statement on the remarks of the Secretary of State for Wales regarding the procedure for approving Orders in Council made by the Assembly. Despite your best efforts yesterday and your rhetorical flourish, your answers were particularly unconvincing. I will quote one phrase that you used yesterday. You said that,

Yr ydym yn siomedig iawn nad ydych wedi derbyn ein cais am ddatganiad ar sylwadau Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynglŷn â'r weithdrefn ar gyfer cymeradwyo Gorchmynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor a wneir gan y Cynulliad. Er eich holl ymdrechion ddoe a'ch rhwysg rhethregol, ni lwyddodd eich atebion i'n darbwylllo o gwbl. Dyfynnaf un ymadrodd a ddefnyddiwyd gennych ddoe. Meddech,

'it is all about mandate and the democratic process'.

'mae'n ymwneud yn gyfan gwbl â mandadu a'r broses ddemocrataidd'.

That is why we want a statement. What is meant by 'mandate'? Under what circumstances will the Secretary of State for Wales consider a request by a properly elected Assembly Government that has a democratic mandate to ask for Orders in Council? All that we have heard from the Secretary of State is what he would refuse even before that election has been called. He is an arrogant Secretary of State, and we want the First Minister to explain how the new Act will operate under a Labour Government in Westminster.

**Lisa Francis:** Yr ydym eisiau canu'r gloch, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Y Llywydd:** Cewch ofyn am ganu'r gloch ar ôl i'ch sylwadau gael eu clywed.

**Lisa Francis:** I wish to reiterate the comments of the leader of the opposition regarding our request about a statement on arrangements with Westminster regarding Orders in Council post May 2007. The Business Minister's apparent reluctance to come forward with a statement means that we must lend credence to Lord Richard's prediction, which we heard about last week, of a possible constitutional crisis. We are seeking an assurance and clarification, which I do not think is too much to ask. Perhaps Peter Hain's comments have upset and embarrassed the Government. Perhaps that is why you feel that you cannot come forward to offer an oral statement. I will just remind you of what Lord Richard said.

'In a situation in which the Assembly Government is firm on what it wanted and the Westminster Parliament did not fully agree, then the Assembly Government would be put in the extremely difficult position of either losing the Order totally or having to back down on the extent of legislation which it was convinced it needed.'

Mr Hain's comments last week in respect of the proposal for proportional representation in local government seem to endorse what Lord Richard has said. I therefore ask you to reconsider that. What are you afraid of in not

Dyna pam yr ydym am gael datganiad. Beth a olygir wrth 'fandadu'? O dan ba amgylchiadau y bydd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn ystyried cais gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad sydd wedi ei hethol yn briodol a chanddi fandad democrataidd i ofyn am Orchmynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor? Y cyfan a glywsom gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yw'r hyn y byddai'n ei wrthod hyd yn oed cyn y caiff yr etholiad hwnnw ei alw. Mae'n Ysgrifennydd Gwladol trahaus, ac yr ydym am i'r Prif Weinidog esbonio sut y bydd y Ddeddf newydd yn gweithredu o dan Lywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan.

**Lisa Francis:** We request that the bell be rung.

**The Presiding Officer:** You may ask for the bell to be rung after your comments have been heard.

**Lisa Francis:** Hoffwn ail-bwysleisio sylwadau arweinydd yr wrthblaid am ein cais am ddatganiad ar drefniadau gyda San Steffan ynglŷn â Gorchmynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor ar ôl mis Mai 2007. Mae amharoddrwydd ymddangosiadol y Trefnydd i wneud datganiad yn golygu ei bod yn rhaid inni gredu'r hyn yr oedd yr Arglwydd Richard yn ei ragweld, fel y clywsom yr wythnos diwethaf, sef argyfwng cyfansoddiadol posibl. Yr ydym yn gofyn am sicrwydd ac esboniad, ac yn fy marn i nid yw hynny'n gofyn gormod. Efallai bod sylwadau Peter Hain wedi cynhyrfu'r Llywodraeth ac wedi achosi embaras iddi. Efallai mai dyna pam yr ydych yn teimlo na allwch gynnig datganiad ar lafar. Hoffwn eich atgoffa o'r hyn a ddywedodd yr Arglwydd Richard.

Mewn sefyllfa lle y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gadarn am yr hyn yr oedd am ei gael a lle nad oedd Senedd San Steffan yn llwyr gytuno, yna byddai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad mewn sefyllfa anodd iawn, naill ai o golli'r Gorchymyn yn llwyr neu orfod ildio o ran graddau'r ddeddfwriaeth yr oedd yn argyhoeddedig fod arni ei hangen.

Ymddengys fod sylwadau Mr Hain yr wythnos diwethaf am y cynnig ar gyfer cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol mewn llywodraeth leol yn cadarnhau'r hyn a ddywedodd yr Arglwydd Richard. Felly, gofynnaf ichi

offering such a statement?

**Kirsty Williams:** It was obvious from the comments made by the business managers in yesterday's Plenary what the expectations of the Business Minister were, and she has failed to deliver. I appreciate the difficulties in which she finds herself following the comments made by Peter Hain. It seems that Mr Hain wants his penny and his bun, but, as we know, you cannot have both in life, so what is an ambitious man to do? When he is on this side of the Severn bridge, it seems that Mr Hain is more than happy to espouse the workings of the Assembly and the changes that will come next May, but when he finds himself on the other side of the Severn bridge, he has a deputy leadership contest to consider, and the opportunity to Hoover up those backbench Labour votes. As I said, what is an ambitious man to do? I suggest that the Business Minister listens to the concerns of Members in the Chamber, stops worrying about her colleague, Peter Hain, and explains how she and the First Minister expect the new arrangements to work post May next year.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not believe that the Business Minister has responsibility for matters relating to the Secretary of State for Wales. The Secretary of State will be here himself later this month. If you wish to be called to ask questions of him, I will be pleased to do so.

3.30 p.m.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I suggest that Kirsty stops worrying about the Secretary of State for Wales—that comment is also directed at Ieuan and Lisa—and stops overstating her political sensitivities. Clearly, you do not know what you are going to do with the new powers after May 2007. We know what we will do—we will have a Measure to eradicate child poverty. If the First Minister issued a statement on every lecture and every political speech made outside the Chamber between now and May, we would never get any business done, would we? I rest my case. You do not need a statement. You need to concentrate, as we are doing, on what we will achieve with our new

ailystyried hynny. Beth sydd gennych i'w ofni drwy beidio â chynnig datganiad felly?

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr oedd disgwyliadau'r Trefnydd yn amlwg o'r sylwadau a wnaed gan y rheolwyr busnes yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddoe, ac mae wedi methu â'u cyflawni. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli'r anawsterau sy'n ei hwynebu yn dilyn y sylwadau a wnaed gan Peter Hain. Ymddengys fod Mr Hain am gael ei geiniog a'i gacen, ond fel y gwyddom, ni allwch gael y ddau mewn bywyd, felly beth y gall dyn uchelgeisiol ei wneud? Pan fydd yr ochr hon i bont Hafren, ymddengys fod Mr Hain yn fwy na pharod i fod yn rhan o weithrediadau'r Cynulliad a'r newidiadau a gaiff eu cyflwyno fis Mai nesaf. Ond pan fydd yr ochr arall i bont Hafren, mae ganddo gystadleuaeth i'w hystyried am ddirprwy arweinydd a'r cyfle i sicrhau pleidleisiau Llafur y meinciau cefn. Fel y dywedais, beth y gall dyn uchelgeisiol ei wneud? Awgrymaf y dylai'r Trefnydd wrando ar bryderon Aelodau yn y Siambr, yn hytrach na phryderu am ei chyd-Aelod, Peter Hain, ac y dylai egluro sut y mae hi a'r Prif Weinidog yn disgwyl i'r trefniadau newydd weithio ar ôl mis Mai y flwyddyn nesaf.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni chredaf fod y Trefnydd yn gyfrifol am faterion yn ymwneud ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru. Bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yma ei hun yn ddiweddarach y mis hwn. Os hoffech gael eich galw i'w holi, byddaf yn ddigon bodlon gwneud hynny.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Awgrymaf y dylai Kirsty roi'r gorau i bryderu am Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru—mae'r sylw hwnnw wedi'i gyfeirio at Ieuan a Lisa hefyd—a rhoi'r gorau i orddatgan ei sensitifeddu gwleidyddol. Yn amlwg, ni wyddoch beth y byddwch yn ei wneud gyda'r pwerau newydd ar ôl mis Mai 2007. Gwyddom beth y byddwn ni yn ei wneud—bydd gennym Fesur i ddileu tlodi ymhlith plant. Pe byddai'r Prif Weinidog yn rhoi datganiad am bob darlith a phob araith wleidyddol a wneir y tu allan i'r Siambr rhwng nawr a mis Mai, ni fyddem byth yn cyflawni dim, na fyddem? Dyna ddiwedd fy nadl. Nid oes angen datganiad arnoch. Mae angen ichi ganolbwyntio, fel y gwawn ni, ar



powers and let us have that debate here in the Chamber.

Finally, it is not true that I did not respond—my largesse is considerable. I agreed to defer a debate on tourism, because the party business managers said that it was not appropriate to have that debate now, and I rearranged business, with some difficulty. I agreed to that, Ieuan. You must appreciate that. I also agreed to a debate on climate change, did I not, Lisa? I came back to Lisa and said that we would have a debate on the Stern report on climate change. Jocelyn Davies, understandably, asked for a statement on carbon monoxide poisoning, and the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration will make an oral statement on that. I agreed to those, and to written statements. However, I rest my case: it is for us in the Chamber to debate what we will do post May 2007. We are going to eradicate child poverty: are you?

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi derbyn gais i ganu'r gloch. O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.24, rhaid i o leiaf dri Aelod wneud cais i'r gloch gael ei chanu. A oes tri Aelod yn cefnogi'r cais? Gwelaf fod. Glerc, canwch y gloch.

yr hyn y byddwn yn ei gyflawni gyda'n pwerau newydd a gadael inni gael y ddadl honno yma yn y Siambr.

Yn olaf, nid yw'n wir nad ymatebais—mae fy haelioni yn sylweddol. Cytunais i ohirio dadl ar dwristiaeth, am i reolwyr busnes y blaidd ddweud nad oedd yn briodol cynnal y ddadl honno ar hyn o bryd, ac aildrefnais y busnes, gyda chryn anhawster. Cytunais i hynny, Ieuan. Rhaid ichi werthfawrogi hynny. Cytunais hefyd i gael dadl ar newid yn yr hinsawdd, oni wneuthum, Lisa? Atebais Lisa drwy ddweud y byddem yn cael dadl ar adroddiad Stern ar newid yn yr hinsawdd. Gofynnodd Jocelyn Davies, yn ddealladwy, am ddatganiad ar wenwyno carbon monocsid, a bydd y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn gwneud datganiad llafar ar hynny. Cytunais i'r rheini, ac i ddatganiadau ysgrifenedig. Fodd bynnag, dyna ddiwedd fy nadl: ein cyfrifoldeb ni yn y Siambr yw cael dadl ar yr hyn y byddwn yn ei wneud ar ôl mis Mai 2007. Yr ydym ni yn mynd i ddileu tlodi ymhlith plant: ydych chi?

**The Presiding Officer:** I have received a request to ring the bell. Under Standing Order No. 6.24, at least three Members must request that the bell be rung. Are there three Members who support the request? I see that there are. Clerk, please ring the bell.

*Cynnig: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*

*Motion: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John

Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Melding, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order**

**Jeff Cuthbert:** My point of order relates to the debate on NHS regional reconfiguration later this afternoon. Amendment 2 begins:

‘instructs the Assembly Government to halt’.

My understanding is that while the Assembly can call upon or urge the Executive to do something, it cannot instruct the Executive to do something. I would be grateful for your ruling with regard to whether or not my understanding is correct. I would also be grateful for your ruling with regard to what the consequences would be for the Executive were it not follow such instruction in the event of this amendment’s being carried.

**Leighton Andrews:** Further to that point of order, Jeff Cuthbert has raised an important point, but I want to focus particularly on the word ‘halt’ in respect of the reconfiguration process. A reconfiguration process is under way in several parts of Wales, and it is dependent upon the provision of certain hospital and other facilities. Is the amendment seriously suggesting that construction work should stop on some of the hospital projects that are currently under way, such as Ysbyty Cwm Rhondda in Llwynypia? Surely, that is the implication of that amendment. Is it not irresponsible of the opposition to make such a proposal?

3.40 p.m.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Further to that point of order, I am quite surprised that Jeff Cuthbert raised this, bearing in mind that, hitherto, the Table Office has been perfectly happy to

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae a wnelo fy mhwynt o drefn â’r ddadl ar ailgyflunio rhanbarthol y GIG yn ddiweddarach y prynhawn yma. Mae gwelliant 2 yn dechrau:

‘yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i atal’.

O’r hyn a ddeallaf, er y gall y Cynulliad alw ar y Weithrediaeth neu ei hannog i wneud rhywbeth, ni all gyfarwyddo’r Weithrediaeth i wneud dim. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar am eich dyfarniad a yw fy nealltwriaeth yn gywir ai peidio. Byddwn hefyd yn ddiolchgar am eich dyfarniad beth fyddai’r canlyniadau i’r Weithrediaeth pe na byddai’n dilyn y cyfarwyddyd hwinnw os derbynnir y gwelliant hwn.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yn ychwanegol at y pwynt o drefn hwinnw, mae Jeff Cuthbert wedi codi pwynt pwysig, ond yr wyf am ganolbwyntio’n arbennig ar y gair ‘atal’ yn y broses ailgyflunio. Mae proses ailgyflunio yn mynd ymlaen mewn llawer rhan o Gymru, ac mae’n dibynnu ar ddarparu cyfleusterau penodol mewn ysbytai a chyfleusterau eraill. A yw’r gwelliant yn awgrymu o ddifrif y dylid atal gwaith adeiladu ar rai o’r prosiectau sy’n mynd ymlaen mewn ysbytai ar hyn o bryd, megis Ysbyty Cwm Rhondda yn Llwynypia? Onid dyna yw goblygiad y gwelliant hwinnw? Onid yw’n anghyfrifol i’r gwrthbleidiau wneud cynnig o’r fath?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yn ychwanegol at y pwynt o drefn hwinnw, yr wyf yn synnu’n fawr fod Jeff Cuthbert wedi codi hyn, o gofio bod y Swyddfa Gyflwyno, hyd yn hyn, wedi

accept—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The leader of the opposition, with respect, is not the Table Office. I am the Table Office, and I will rule on this matter. If the leader of the opposition has any submissions to make to me about the substance of the point of order I will listen, but it is not for him to purport to be the Presiding Officer.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I will make this point, Presiding Officer. There have been tabled in the past amendments and motions in the names of various individuals and parties in this place that have proposed that the Assembly instruct or call for or demand various things. My understanding of the effect of the amendment is quite simple: it is permissive; it does not demand the Government to carry that out—[AN ASSEMBLY MEMBER: ‘It says “instructs”.’] Yes, this is a very important point. This is a permissive amendment. When this Assembly was first established in 1999 it decided to delegate all the functions of the Assembly to the First Minister. Under the Government of Wales Act 1998, under which we currently operate, that means that is open to the opposition, if it wishes—although it has not exercised the right—to withdraw the delegation to the First Minister. That is the only sanction that it would have in such circumstances. Subject to that, it is my view that any motion carried by this Assembly should be permissive. I ask you to consider that submission also.

**Huw Lewis:** Further to that point of order, I, too, seek your guidance. The leader of the opposition has said it: powers have been delegated by this body to the Executive. Given that, for the organisation that delegated the powers to give instructions is surely the incorrect way to proceed. If there is a democratic mandate for change, the obvious and honourable route would be through motions of no confidence, rather than the opposition becoming the Government for a few minutes and then retreating to the opposition benches.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Further to that point of

bod yn ddigon bodlon derbyn—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid arweinydd y gwrthbleidiau, gyda phob parch, yw'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno. Fi yw'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno, a fi fydd yn dyfarnu ar y mater hwn. Os oes gan arweinydd y gwrthbleidiau unrhyw gyflwyniadau i'w gwneud imi am sylwedd y pwynt o drefn, fe wrandawaf, ond nid yw'n briodol iddo honni mai ef yw'r Llywydd.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Gwnaf y pwynt hwn, Lywydd. Yn y gorffennol, cyflwynwyd gwelliannau a chynigion yn enwau amrywiol unigolion a phleidiau yn y lle hwn sydd wedi cynnig y dylai'r Cynulliad gyfarwyddo, mynnu neu alw am amrywiol bethau. Mae fy nealltwriaeth o effaith y gwelliant yn eithaf syml: mae'n oddefol; nid yw'n mynnu bod y Llywodraeth yn cyflawni hynny— [AELOD CYNULLIAD: ‘Mae'n dweud “cyfarwyddo”.’] Ydy, mae hwn yn bwynt pwysig iawn. Mae hwn yn welliant goddefol. Pan sefydlwyd y Cynulliad hwn gyntaf yn 1999, penderfynodd ddirprwyo holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad i'r Prif Weinidog. O dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 yr ydym yn gweithredu dani ar hyn o bryd, golyga hynny bod modd i'r gwrthbleidiau, os mynnant—er nad ydynt wedi arfer yr hawl—dynnu'r ddirprwyaeth i'r Prif Weinidog yn ôl. Dyna'r unig gosb a fyddai ganddynt mewn amgylchiadau o'r fath. Yn ddarostyngedig i hynny, credaf y dylai unrhyw gynnis a dderbynnir gan y Cynulliad hwn fod yn oddefol. Gofynnaf ichi ystyried y cyflwyniad hwnnw hefyd.

**Huw Lewis:** Yn ychwanegol at y pwynt o drefn hwnnw, yr wyf fi hefyd yn gofyn am eich arweiniad. Mae arweinydd y gwrthbleidiau wedi ei ddweud eisoes: mae pwerau wedi'u dirprwyo gan y corff hwn i'r Weithrediaeth. O gofio hynny, onid yw'n amhriodol i'r sefydliad a ddirprwyodd y pwerau roi cyfarwyddiadau. Os oes mandad democrataidd ar gyfer newid, y llwybr amlwg ac anrhydeddus fyddai drwy gynigion o ddiffyg, yn hytrach na sefyllfa lle mae'r gwrthbleidiau'n dod yn Llywodraeth am ychydig funudau ac wedyn yn dychwelyd i feinciau'r gwrthbleidiau.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Yn ychwanegol at y pwynt

order, I am sure that there are many cases in public law where delegated powers are still exercised by those who delegate. May I assume that, as these amendments appear on the agenda, they are in fact in order?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I wish to make it clear that it is for me to determine what is in order. It is not for Members to state that something is in order. We are not here receiving submissions to judge in chambers. Mike German, you may make a point, provided that it relates to this point of order.

**Michael German:** It is further to this point of order. When you make your judgment and comments, I would like you to comment in particular on the phrase that appears under all delegation motions, which is to the effect that nothing in the motion will run contrary to the pre-eminence of the Assembly as a whole.

I would be grateful if you would say whether you think that phrase, which was put in very deliberately from the beginning of the National Assembly for Wales, has any meaning or purpose whatsoever in continuing to appear after all these motions.

**Nick Bourne:** Further to that point of order, in making your ruling—and I recognise that it is entirely a matter for you—will you bear in mind the previous occasions on which, unchallenged, instructions have been given to the Government, and, to be fair to the Government, have been carried out? For that reason, there is no question, as I see it, of the amendment's being out of order.

**The Presiding Officer:** The position is as follows: the amendments are in order as tabled because amendments of this kind have been accepted previously by the Table Office. A precedent—whatever one may think of it—has been set. I have ruled on these matters in the past, and I have stated that I expect all Assembly Members to comply with Assembly resolutions. However, it is not for me, as the Presiding Officer, to interpret whether compliance has been achieved. That must remain a constitutional and a political matter. As regards the situation in future, I will not seek to bind my

o drefn hwnnw, yr wyf yn siŵr bod llawer o achosion mewn cyfraith gyhoeddus lle y caiff pwerau a ddirprwywyd eu harfer o hyd gan y rhai sy'n dirprwyo. A allaf gymryd, gan fod y gwelliannau hyn yn ymddangos ar yr agenda, eu bod mewn gwirionedd mewn trefn?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Hoffwn egluro mai fy nghyfrifoldeb i yw penderfynu beth sydd mewn trefn. Nid cyfrifoldeb Aelodau yw dweud a yw rhywbeth mewn trefn ai peidio. Nid ydym yma i dderbyn cyflwyniadau i roi dyfarniad arnynt. Mike German, gallwch wneud pwynt, ar yr amod ei fod yn ymwneud â'r pwynt o drefn hwn.

**Michael German:** Mae'n ychwanegol at y pwynt o drefn hwn. Pan wnewch eich dyfarniad a'ch sylwadau, hoffwn ichi roi sylwadau, yn arbennig, ar y frawddeg sy'n ymddangos o dan bob cynnig i ddirprwyo, sef sicrhau na fydd dim byd yn y cynnig yn groes i oruchafiaeth y Cynulliad cyfan.

Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ddweud a ydych yn credu bod i'r frawddeg honno, a ychwanegwyd yn fwriadol iawn o ddechrau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, unrhyw ystyr neu ddiben o gwbl drwy barhau i ymddangos ar ôl y cynigion hyn.

**Nick Bourne:** Yn ychwanegol at y pwynt o drefn hwnnw, wrth wneud eich dyfarniad—a chydnabyddaf mai mater i chi yw hynny yn llwyr—a gofiwch yr achlysuron blaenorol lle y rhoddwyd cyfarwyddiadau heb eu herio i'r Llywodraeth, a'r Llywodraeth, i fod yn deg i'r Llywodraeth, wedi eu dilyn? Am y rheswm hwnnw, nid oes amheuaeth, hyd y gwelaf fi, nad yw'r gwelliant allan o drefn.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'r sefyllfa fel a ganlyn: mae'r gwelliannau mewn trefn fel y'u cyflwynwyd am fod gwelliannau fel hyn wedi'u derbyn gynt gan y Swyddfa Gyflwyno. Mae cynsail wedi ei gosod—waeth beth yw eich barn ohoni. Yr wyf wedi gwneud dyfarniad ar y materion hyn yn y gorffennol, ac yr wyf wedi dweud fy mod yn disgwyl i bob Aelod Cynulliad gydymffurfio â phenderfyniadau'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, nid fy nghyfrifoldeb i, fel y Llywydd, yw dehongli a fu cydymffurfio. Rhaid i hwnnw fod yn fater cyfansoddiadol a gwleidyddol o hyd. O ran y sefyllfa yn y dyfodol, ni fyddaf

successor. However, my views on this have been made very clear outside the Chamber.

When we adopted a resolution to seek maximum separation between the Executive and the legislature, within the framework of the 1998 Act, we were stating an aspiration for us to perform as a body with a separate Executive and legislature within it. These motions muddy the waters in that regard but, since they have been accepted, I have no alternative but to rule that these amendments are in order. However, as to their outcome, their efficacy and their constitutional usefulness, I will say nothing.

**John Marek:** Point of order. Last week, after the result of the vote on the business statement was announced to be 29 in favour and 29 against, you said that you would, in accordance with convention, cast your vote against the motion, but with a heavy heart. The Record of Proceedings did not report your statement. I consider this to be a serious issue. It is not open to Record staff to include or omit statements made by the Chair, or by any Member, without a clear set of guidelines, so that members of the public clearly understand how the Record is compiled—[*Interruption.*] I wish that Labour Members would listen, instead of barracking all the time. I ask you to consult the Business Committee and issue guidance for Record staff, so that there is clarity as to the nature of the composition of the Record.

**The Presiding Officer:** As I said in my response to your e-mail this morning, this is not a point of order.

### **Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25 Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 24.25**

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

yn ceisio rhwymo fy olynnydd. Fodd bynnag, mae fy safbwyntiau ar hyn wedi eu gwneud yn glir iawn y tu allan i'r Siambr.

Pan benderfynwyd y byddem yn ceisio gwahanu'r Weithrediaeth a'r ddeddfwrfa gymaint â phosibl, o fewn fframwaith Deddf 1998, yr oeddem yn nodi dyhead inni berfformio fel corff gyda Gweithrediaeth ar wahân a deddfwrfa o'i mewn. Mae'r cynigion hyn yn peri dryswch yn y cydestun hwnnw, ond gan eu bod wedi eu derbyn, nid oes gennyf ddewis ond dyfarnu bod y gwelliannau hyn yn briodol. Fodd bynnag, o ran eu canlyniad, eu heffeithiolrwydd a'u defnyddioldeb cyfansoddiadol, ni ddywedaf ddim.

**John Marek:** Pwynt o drefn. Yr wythnos diwethaf, ar ôl cyhoeddi canlyniad y bleidlais ar y datganiad busnes, sef 29 o blaid a 29 yn erbyn, dywedasoch y byddech, yn unol â'r confensiwn, yn pleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig, ond gyda chalon drom. Ni chofnododd Cofnod y Trafodion eich datganiad. Credaf fod hwn yn fater difrifol. Nid oes hawl gan staff y Cofnod i gynnwys neu hepgor datganiadau a wneir gan y Cadeirydd, na chan unrhyw Aelod, heb gyfres glir o ganllawiau, er mwyn i'r cyhoedd ddeall yn glir sut y caiff y Cofnod ei lunio—[*Torri ar draws.*] Byddai'n dda gennyf pe bai Aelodau Llafur yn gwrando, yn hytrach na gwawdio o hyd. Gofynnaf ichi ymgynghori â'r Pwyllgor Busnes a chyhoeddi canllawiau ar gyfer staff y Cofnod, er mwyn cael eglurder am natur cyfansoddi'r Cofnod.

**Y Llywydd:** Fel y dywedais yn fy ymateb i'ch e-bost y bore yma, nid pwynt o drefn yw hwn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

- the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:*
- Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:*
- 1.a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 7 November 2006 on the draft the Contaminated Land (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*
- 1.a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Tachwedd 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Tir Halogedig (Cymru) 2006; a*
- b) approves that the Contaminated Land (Wales) Regulations 2006 are made in accordance with:*
- b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Tir Halogedig (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*
- i) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 24 October 2006;*
- i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Hydref 2006;*
- ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 24 October 2006;*
- ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Hydref 2006;*
- iii) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 7 November 2006;*
- iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Tachwedd 2006;*
- 2.a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 7 November 2006 on the draft the Radioactive Contaminated Land (Modification of Enactments) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*
- 2.a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Tachwedd 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Tir a Halogwyd yn Ymbelydrol (Addasu Deddfiadau) (Cymru) 2006, a*
- b) approves that the Radioactive Contaminated Land (Modification of Enactments) (Wales) Regulations 2006 are made in accordance with:*
- b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Tir a Halogwyd yn Ymbelydrol (Addasu Deddfiadau) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*
- i) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 24 October 2006;*
- i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Hydref 2006; a*
- ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 24 October 2006; and*
- ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Hydref 2006; a*
- iii) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 7 November 2006. (NDM3315)*
- iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3315)*

*Cynnig (NDM3315): O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3315): For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick

Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Cynllunio Trafnidiaeth Rhanbarthol (Cymru) 2006  
Approval of the Regional Transport Planning (Wales) Order 2006**

**The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation  
and Networks (Andrew Davies):** I propose  
that

**Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a  
Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiau  
fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*considers the principle of the Regional Transport Planning (Wales) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 17 October 2006. (NDM3316)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 7 November 2006 in relation to the draft the Regional Transport Planning (Wales) Order 2006; and*

*2. approves that the draft the Regional Transport Planning (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 17 October 2006;*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 17 October 2006; and*

*c) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 7 November 2006. (NDM3317)*

**Janet Davies:** Plaid Cymru will support this Order. We are aware of the excellent work that is already done by the regional transport consortia, especially South East Wales Transport Alliance and South West Wales Integrated Transport Consortium. With the regional transport plans, I look forward to a greater co-ordination in planning than has previously happened at the local authority level. I do not think that the Welsh Assembly Government has made reasonable progress on producing improvements to transport; it has not put in place developments that it has talked about. However, the Transport (Wales) Act 2006 provides a framework for a big step forward in service improvements, making services reliable and comprehensive enough to attract motorists onto public transport and to provide access to services, education and employment for everyone in Wales.

I am satisfied that the points raised by Plaid

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Cynllunio Trafnidiaeth Rhanbarthol (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Hydref 2006. (NDM3316)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Tachwedd 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Cynllunio Trafnidiaeth Rhanbarthol (Cymru) 2006; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Cynllunio Trafnidiaeth Rhanbarthol (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Hydref 2006;*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Hydref 2006; ac*

*c) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3317)*

**Janet Davies:** Bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r Gorchymyn hwn. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r gwaith ardderchog a wneir eisoes gan y consortia trafndiaeth rhanbarthol, yn arbennig Cynghrair Trafnidiaeth De-Ddwyrain Cymru a Chonsortium Trafnidiaeth Integredig De-Orllewin Cymru. O ran y cynlluniau trafndiaeth rhanbarthol, edrychaf ymlaen at fwy o gydgyssylltu wrth gynllunio nag a gafwyd gynt ar lefel awdurdodau lleol. Ni chredaf fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi gwneud cynnydd rhesymol wrth sicrhau gwelliannau mewn trafndiaeth; nid yw wedi rhoi datblygiadau ar waith hyd y gwn i. Fodd bynnag, mae Deddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006 yn darparu fframwaith ar gyfer cam mawr ymlaen o ran gwella gwasanaethau, gan sicrhau bod gwasanaethau'n ddigon dibynadwy a chynhwysfawr i ddenu modurwyr at gludiant cyhoeddus a darparu mynediad i wasanaethau, addysg a chyflogaeth i bawb yng Nghymru.

Yr wyf yn fodlon y caiff y pwyntiau a



Cymru during the consultation will be covered in the guidance, and I look forward to seeing the guidance being published.

**Kirsty Williams:** We will be supporting this Order, and I welcome the opportunity for the strategic planning of regional transport to be promoted; it will, perhaps, be more cohesive than in the past. Will the Minister outline how the regional consortia will work with each other to look at issues of mutual concern? People often travel greater distances than just within one regional consortium area, so consortia will need to work in conjunction to ensure that longer journeys across Wales—north to south, east to west—are properly looked at.

3.50 p.m.

**The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies):** On Kirsty Williams's first point, this piece of legislation falls out of the Transport (Wales) Act 2006. This Order allows us to place a duty on the four transport consortia, including Taith, the north Wales transport consortium, which, I think, was missed out by Janet Davies. The regional transport plans will sit under the all-Wales transport strategy, so the all-Wales issues will be taken up by the all-Wales transport strategy, and the regional elements on transport planning will be taken forward by the four transport consortia. Therefore, at an all-Wales level and at a regional level, there will be an inter-relationship. Similarly, we are also appointing a transport co-ordinator for each of the transport consortia areas whose work will not only be to work with the consortia and stakeholders on a regional level but also at an all-Wales level, to give that greater integration.

One is tempted to respond to Janet Davies's comments about inadequate transport delivery. The sum of £500 million of my £1.4 billion budget will be spent on transport this year. We have had a 25 per cent increase in rail use on the Wales and borders rail

godwyd gan Blaid Cymru yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad eu cwmpasu yn y canllawiau, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld cyhoeddi'r canllawiau.

**Kirsty Williams:** Byddwn yn cefnogi'r Gorchymyn hwn, a chroesawaf y cyfle i hyrwyddo'r gwaith o gynllunio trafndiaeth ranbarthol yn strategol; bydd, efallai, yn fwy cydlynol nag yn y gorffennol. A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu'r modd y bydd y consortia rhanbarthol yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd i ystyried materion sy'n peri pryder i bawb? Bydd pobl yn aml yn teithio ymhellach nag o fewn ardal un consortiwm rhanbarthol yn unig, felly bydd angen i'r consortia weithio ar y cyd i sicrhau bod teithiau hirach ledled Cymru—o'r gogledd i'r de, o'r dwyrain i'r gorllewin—yn cael eu hystyried yn briodol.

**Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies):** O ran pwynt cyntaf Kirsty Williams, nid yw'r darn hwn o ddeddfwriaeth yn rhan o Ddeddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006. Mae'r Gorchymyn hwn yn ein galluogi i osod dyletswydd ar y pedwar consortia trafndiaeth, gan gynnwys Taith, consortiwm trafndiaeth y gogledd, a hepgorwyd, mi gredaf, gan Janet Davies. Bydd y cynlluniau trafndiaeth rhanbarthol yn dod o dan strategaeth trafndiaeth Cymru gyfan, er mwyn i strategaeth trafndiaeth Cymru gyfan ymdrin â materion ar draws Cymru gyfan, ac er mwyn i'r elfennau rhanbarthol yn y broses o gynllunio trafndiaeth gael eu hyrwyddo gan y pedwar consortia trafndiaeth. Felly, ar lefel Cymru gyfan ac ar lefel ranbarthol, fe fydd rhyngberthynas. Yn yr un modd, yr ydym hefyd yn penodi cydgysylltydd trafndiaeth ar gyfer pob ardal consortia trafndiaeth a fydd yn gyfrifol am weithio gyda'r consortia a rhanddeiliaid ar lefel Cymru gyfan a lefel ranbarthol, er mwyn cael mwy o integreiddio.

Mae'n demtasiwn ymateb i sylwadau Janet Davies fod y drafnidiaeth a ddarperir yn annigonol. Caiff £500 miliwn o'm cyllideb o £1.4 biliwn ei wario ar drafnidiaeth eleni. Yr ydym wedi gweld cynnydd o 25 y cant yn nifer y bobl sy'n defnyddio trenau ar

franchise in the last three years—10 per cent over the last two years. Wales and London are the only parts of the UK where the long-term decline in bus use has been halted. If that is small or slow delivery, I do not understand what Janet means by that phrase.

fasnachfaint rheilffyrdd Cymru a'r gororau yn ystod y tair blynedd diwethaf—10 y cant yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf. Cymru a Llundain yw'r unig ardaloedd yn y DU lle y mae'r dirywiad hirdymor yn nifer y bobl sy'n defnyddio bysiau wedi ei atal. Os dyna yw ystyr darpariaeth fach neu araf, nid wyf yn deall yr hyn y mae Janet yn ei olygu wrth y frawddeg honno.

I pay tribute to the work done on the development of this plan by the former Environment, Planning and Transport Committee, chaired by our former colleague, Richard Edwards. I also pay tribute to the work that Sue Essex did when she was the Minister responsible for transport. That was the Assembly, as an institution and as a legislature, working at its best. I am delighted that we are now seeing the process coming full circle with, hopefully, the passing of this important piece of legislation.

Yr wyf yn rhoi teyrnged i'r gwaith sydd wedi ei wneud i ddatblygu'r cynllun hwn gan Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth, o dan gadeiryddiaeth ein cyn gyd-Aelod, Richard Edwards. Yr wyf yn rhoi teyrnged hefyd i'r gwaith a wnaed gan Sue Essex pan oedd yn Weinidog dros drafnidiaeth. Enghraifft oedd hynny o'r Cynulliad, fel sefydliad ac fel deddfwrfa, yn gweithio ar ei orau. Yr wyf wrth fy modd ein bod yn gweld y broses yn tynnu i'w therfyn bellach yn sgîl pasio'r darn pwysig hwn o ddeddfwriaeth, gobeithio.

*Cynnig (NDM3316): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3316): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary

Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3317): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3317): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy

Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf yr Amgylchedd Naturiol a Chymunedau  
 Gwledig 2006 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2006  
 Approval of the Natural Environment and Rural Communities Act 2006  
 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2006**

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the Natural Environment and Rural Communities Act 2006 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 17 October 2006. (NDM3318)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 24 October 2006 in relation to the draft the Natural Environment and Rural Communities Act 2006 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2006; and*

*2. approves that the draft the Natural Environment and Rural Communities Act 2006 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 17 October 2006. (NDM3319)*

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Deddf yr Amgylchedd Naturiol a Chymunedau Gwledig 2006 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Hydref 2006. (NDM3318)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Hydref 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf yr Amgylchedd Naturiol a Chymunedau Gwledig 2006 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2006; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf yr Amgylchedd Naturiol a Chymunedau Gwledig 2006 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Hydref 2006. (NDM3319)*

The purpose of these regulations is to bring into force part 6 of the Natural Environment and Rural Communities Act 2006. Part 6 of the Act aims to clarify and limit the circumstances in which rights of way in the countryside can be claimed for use by motor vehicles. This will help to create more certainty in this regard.

**Brynle Williams:** The Welsh Conservative group will be supporting this motion, but, as I pointed out yesterday, there are concerns about serious damage being done to sites of special scientific interest and other environmentally sensitive sites. We have an example on the Horseshoe Pass on Llandysilio mountain where, I believe—and this is no joke—the damage done can be seen from space. North Wales Police regularly try to catch those responsible, and it is something that we must continue to do.

Frequent damage is also done to our green lanes and bridle paths, mostly by motorised vehicles. Obviously, the Act will curtail such damage. However, policing is the main problem. As you are well aware, four-by-four vehicles, motorcycles and so forth are cutting these places to bits, and spoiling them for everyone else, such as walkers and people on horseback.

I mentioned yesterday the opportunity for private landowners, as well as the Forestry Commission and local authorities to develop dedicated facilities for motor vehicles. This needs looking into—there is a vast opportunity there. I know that we have the 28-day rule for much planning activity. I have mentioned motorcycles many times to the motorcycle manufacturers. I believe that noise pollution is the biggest problem in terms of having scramble tracks and various places to go. Our colleagues from the Valleys have said many times that off-road motorcycles are doing untold damage in the Valleys. The Government and councils should work much closer with land owners and motor vehicle organisations to address this issue.

I could go on for a while, but I will not. However, I hope that the Minister will make

Diben y rheoliadau hyn yw dod â rhan 6 o Ddeddf Amgylchedd Naturiol a Chymunedau Gwledig 2006 i rym. Nod rhan 6 o'r Ddeddf yw egluro a chyfyngu'r amgylchiadau lle y gellir hawlio hawliau tramwy yng nghefn gwlad at ddefnydd cerbydau modur. Bydd hyn yn helpu creu mwy o sicrwydd yn y cyswllt hwnnw.

**Brynle Williams:** Bydd grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn, ond fel yr eglurais ddoe, mae pryder bod difrod difrifol yn cael ei achosi i safleoedd o ddiddordeb gwyddonol arbennig a safleoedd amgylcheddol sensitif eraill. Mae gennym enghraifft ar Fwlch yr Oernant ar fynydd Llandysilio lle mae'r difrod a wnaed, mi gredaf—ac nid jôc mo hyn—i'w weld o'r gofod. Mae Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn rheolaidd yn ceisio dal y rhai sy'n gyfrifol, ac mae'n rhywbeth y mae'n rhaid inni barhau i'w wneud.

Caiff difrod aml ei achosi hefyd i'n lonydd gwyrdd a'n llwybrau ceffyl, yn bennaf gan gerbydau modur. Yn amlwg, bydd y Ddeddf yn cyfyngu difrod o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, plismona yw'r brif broblem. Fel y gwyddoch yn iawn, mae cerbydau gyriant pedair olwyn, beiciau modur ac ati yn torri'r lonydd hyn yn ddarnau ac yn eu difetha i bawb arall, megis cerddwyr a phobl ar gefn ceffyl.

Soniais ddoe am y cyfle i dirfeddianwyr preifat, yn ogystal â'r Comisiwn Coedwigaeth ac awdurdodau lleol, ddatblygu cyfleusterau penodol ar gyfer cerbydau modur. Mae angen ymchwilio i hyn—mae yma gyfle helaeth i ddatblygu. Gwn fod gennym y rheol o 28 diwrnod ar gyfer y rhan fwyaf o weithgareddau cynllunio. Yr wyf wedi sôn droeon wrth gynhyrchwyr am feiciau modur. Credaf mai llygredd sŵn yw'r broblem fwyaf o ran cael traciau sgrialu ac amrywiol fannau i fynd iddynt. Mae ein cyd-Aelodau yn y Cymoedd wedi dweud droeon fod cerbydau modur oddi ar y ffordd yn gwneud difrod ofnadwy yn y Cymoedd. Dylai'r Llywodraeth a chynghorau weithio lawer yn agosach gyda thirfeddianwyr a sefydliadau cerbydau modur i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn.

Gallwn ddal i siarad am dipyn, ond ni wnaf hynny. Fodd bynnag, gobeithio y bydd y

a commitment to work with the relevant bodies that I have spoken to, so that motor vehicle enthusiasts can be steered off green lanes and bridle ways, and onto dedicated sites, and that we can put something back into the community, by bringing business to the local rural environment.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Can you clarify, Minister, whether this commencement Order will apply to householders, who currently, by custom and practice, gain vehicular access to their properties over privately owned land also designated as a common, where this land borders the boundary of their properties? If this is the case, will householders—and many in my constituency will be affected—need to take any immediate legal action?

**Mick Bates:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats will support this Order. While there is much publicity about the damage caused by vehicular access to the countryside, this clarifies and restricts access. However, there is also much good practice. I bring to your attention, Minister, the work of the countryside recreational access group, which completes major conservation projects to ensure that access is well looked after and well maintained. While we have legislation, we must also ensure that a good mechanism exists to improve access and to ensure that damage is limited to places of legal access, and that good, voluntary practice—like that of CRAG—is used as an exemplar for people to move forward. CRAG has recently done terrific work, for example, in the Brecon Beacons National Park, where, through voluntary labour, it has constructed a bridge, the capital for which was provided by the local county council.

I have one point of clarification on this. Often, these routes are accessed from metalled roads, which are under the control of the local council, usually under class 3. There is some dispute at times about the damage caused to the council road by water running off these routes, whatever they are now—restricted byways, or whatever. At some stage—perhaps not today—could the Minister give guidance on who is responsible for repairing the damage caused by run-off

Gweinidog yn ymrwymo i weithio gyda'r cyrff perthnasol yr wyf wedi siarad â hwy, er mwyn gallu llywio'r rheini sy'n frwd dros gerbydau modur oddi ar lonydd gwyrdd a llwybrau ceffyl ac i safleoedd penodol, ac y gallwn roi rhywbeth yn ôl i'r gymuned drwy ddod â busnes i'r amgylchedd gwledig lleol.

**Gwenda Thomas:** A allwch egluro, Weinidog, a yw'r Gorchymyn cychwyn hwn yn gymwys i ddeiliaid cartrefi sydd ar hyn o bryd, yn ôl arfer a defod, yn cyrraedd eu heiddo mewn cerbyd dros dir sy'n eiddo preifat ac sydd wedi ei ddynodi hefyd yn dir comin, pan fydd y tir hwnnw ar y ffin â ffin eu heiddo? Os felly, a fydd angen i ddeiliaid cartrefi—a bydd hyn yn effeithio ar nifer yn fy etholaeth—gymryd unrhyw gamau cyfreithiol ar fyrder?

**Mick Bates:** Bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn cefnogi'r Gorchymyn hwn. Er bod llawer o gyhoeddusrwydd ynghylch y difrod a achosir gan gerbydau i gefn gwlad, mae hyn yn egluro ac yn cyfyngu mynediad. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o arfer da yma hefyd. Tynnaf eich sylw, Weinidog, at waith y grŵp mynediad hamdden cefn gwlad, sy'n cwblhau prosiectau cadwraeth mawr i sicrhau gofalu am fynediad a'i gynnal yn dda. Er bod gennym ddeddfwriaeth, rhaid inni hefyd sicrhau bod dull da ar gael i wella mynediad a sicrhau cyfyngu difrod i ardaloedd lle mae mynediad cyfreithiol, a bod arferion gwirfoddol da—fel arferion CRAG—yn cael eu defnyddio fel patrwm enghreifftiol er mwyn i bobl symud ymlaen. Mae CRAG wedi gwneud gwaith rhyfeddol yn ddiweddar, er enghraifft ym Mharc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog, lle mae wedi adeiladu pont, drwy lafur gwirfoddol. Darparwyd y cyfalaf ar ei chyfer gan y cyngor sir lleol.

Mae gennyf un pwynt i'w egluro yn hyn o beth. Yn aml, cyrhaeddir y llwybrau hyn oddi ar ffyrdd ag wyneb metlin sydd o dan reolaeth y cyngor lleol, fel rheol o dan ddsbarth 3. Bydd ychydig anghydfod ar adegau ynghylch y difrod a achosir i ffordd y cyngor gan ddŵr sy'n llifo oddi ar y llwybrau hyn, beth bynnag y'u gelwir erbyn hyn—cilffyrdd cyfyngedig, neu beth bynnag. A all y Gweinidog, rywbyrd—efallai nad heddiw—roi canllawiau ynglŷn â phwy sy'n

from these routes onto council roads?

gyfrifol am atgyweirio'r difrod a achosir gan ddŵr sy'n llifo o'r llwybrau hyn ar ffyrdd cyngor?

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** From a legal point of view, in terms of run-off on the public highway, the Highways Authority would, primarily, be the body responsible if there is any nuisance caused to a farmer's land. I will not start to give legal advice here, but that would be the usual situation.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** O safbwynt gwleidyddol, o ran dŵr ffo ar y briffordd gyhoeddus, yr Awdurdod Priffyrdd fyddai'r corff sy'n bennaf cyfrifol am ymdrin ag unrhyw niwsans a achosir i dir ffermwr. Nid wyf am ddechrau rhoi cyngor cyfreithiol yma, ond dyna fyddai'r sefyllfa arferol.

On Brynle's point, it is important to realise what this legislation does; it is not to enforce action against off-roaders—that is a separate matter—but it seeks to clarify the different types of access available, and seeks to ensure that people do not inappropriately use particular rights of way that are not appropriate for cars.

O ran pwynt Brynle, mae'n bwysig sylweddoli beth y mae'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn ei wneud; hynny yw, nid gorfodi camau gweithredu yn erbyn gyrwyr oddi ar y ffordd—mater ar wahân yw hynny—ond mae'n ceisio egluro'r gwahanol fathau o fynediad sydd ar gael, ac mae'n ceisio sicrhau nad yw pobl yn defnyddio hawliau tramwy penodol nad ydynt yn addas ar gyfer ceir mewn modd amhriodol.

On Gwenda's point, some three years ago now, if I remember, we passed legislation quickly, as a result of a situation in Rosemary Butler's constituency, where money was being demanded for people to access their houses over common land owned by someone who had bought the lordship of the manor, if I remember rightly. That legislation was passed under executive procedure with the agreement of all parties in the Chamber, and that restricted the lord of the manor's ability to charge for crossing the land. On whether this will affect people who cross common land at present to access their property, sections 66 and 67 of the Act, which we are bringing into force with these regulations, restrict the creation of new public rights of way for mechanically propelled vehicles.

O ran pwynt Gwenda, os cofiaf yn iawn, bu inni basio deddfwriaeth yn gyflym, ryw dair blynedd yn ôl, o ganlyniad i sefyllfa yn etholaeth Rosemary Butler, lle y mynnwyd arian er mwyn i bobl gael mynediad i'w tai eu hunain dros dir comin a oedd yn eiddo i rywun a oedd wedi prynu arglwyddiaeth y faenor, os cofiaf yn iawn. Pasiwyd y ddeddfwriaeth honno o dan y weithdrefn weithredol gyda chytundeb yr holl bleidiau yn y Siambr, a chyfyngodd hynny ar allu arglwydd y faenor i godi tâl am groesi'r tir. Ar y cwestiwn a fydd hyn yn effeithio ar bobl sy'n croesi tir comin ar hyn o bryd i gael mynediad i'w heiddo, mae adrannau 66 a 67 o'r Ddeddf yr ydym yn dod â hwy i rym gyda'r rheoliadau hyn yn cyfyngu creu hawliau tramwy cyhoeddus newydd ar gyfer cerbydau peiriannol.

4.00 p.m.

They extinguish any existing unrecorded public rights of way for mechanically propelled vehicles, with certain exceptions, such as if the main lawful use of the way for the five years preceding commencement has been by mechanically propelled vehicles. That is one possible exemption if there is a problem where, basically, a right of way has been used for five years or more. It is

Maent yn diddymu unrhyw hawliau tramwy cyhoeddus presennol sydd heb eu cofnodi ar gyfer cerbydau peiriannol, gyda rhai eithriadau, megis ai cerbydau peiriannol fu'r prif ddefnydd cyfreithlon o'r ffordd am y pum mlynedd cyn cychwyn. Dyna un eithriad posibl os oes problem lle mae'r hawl tramwy, yn y bôn, wedi ei defnyddio am bum mlynedd neu fwy. Mae'n anodd rhoi ateb

difficult to give a definitive answer for an individual's circumstance, but I would not anticipate that this legislation would cause problems for people who have historically accessed their properties in this way for a number of years.

pendant ar gyfer amgylchiadau unigolyn, ond byddwn yn rhagweld y byddai'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn achosi problemau i bobl sydd, yn hanesyddol, wedi cael mynediad i'w heiddo fel hyn ers nifer o flynyddoedd.

*Cynnig (NDM3318): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3318): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*



*Cynnig (NDM3319): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*  
*Motion (NDM3319): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*  
*Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Fferyllol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.27(iv), a'r Directions to Local Health Boards as to the Statement of Financial Entitlements (Amendment) (No. 2) Directions 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29 Approval of the National Health Service (Pharmaceutical Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006 under Standing Order No. 24.27(iv), and the Directions to Local Health Boards as to the Statement of Financial Entitlements (Amendment) (No. 2) Directions 2006 under Standing Order No. 29**

**Y Llywydd:** Cynigir trafod y ddwy eitem nesaf gyda'i gilydd, oni bai bod Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad.

**The Presiding Officer:** It is proposed that the next two items be debated together, unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*considers the principle of the National Health Service (Pharmaceutical Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 7 November 2006. (NDM3320)*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Fferyllol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3320)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*approves that the National Health Service (Pharmaceutical Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006 are made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 7 November 2006. (NDM3321)*

*yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Fferyllol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3321)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 29.3 (iii):*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3 (iii):*

*considers the principle of the Directions to Local Health Boards as to the Statement of Financial Entitlements (Amendment) (No. 2) Directions 2006, a draft of which was laid in the Table Office on 7 November 2006. (NDM3322)*

*yn ystyried egwyddor the Directions to Local Health Boards as to the Statement of Financial Entitlements (Amendment) (No. 2) Directions 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3322)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 29.3 (iii):*

*approves the Directions to Local Health Boards as to the Statement of Financial Entitlements (Amendment) (No.2) Directions 2006, which were laid in the Table Office on 7 November 2006. (NDM3323)*

This legislation will introduce a new dispensary services quality scheme for dispensing general practitioners. This scheme is part of the outcome of UK negotiations that have taken place between the General Practitioners Committee and relevant health organisations. The motion under item 9 makes the necessary amendments to give effect to those changes in the statement of financial entitlements, under which general practitioners are paid.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Plaid Cymru will support the regulations. I ask the Minister whether it is possible for him to provide a timetable for the Government's response to the consultation on the control of entry for dispensing and pharmacy licences, which was closed on November 2005, and which relates, although indirectly, to this matter.

**Carl Sargeant:** We welcome the regulations before us today, which relate to the fees and charges payable to doctors for the provision of drugs or appliances under pharmaceutical services. Minister, do you agree that it is a GP's duty to promote good health, to prevent illness and to improve quality of life? Do you also agree that the decision made by the National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence regarding the Alzheimer's disease drugs, Aricept, Exelon and Reminyl, is damning and disgraceful? Will you look at recommendations to allow GPs to provide these drugs for those who suffer from Alzheimer's disease, which is a dreadful disease, in order to help them and their families?

**The Presiding Officer:** I call on Jenny Randerson.

**Jenny Randerson:** I have nothing to say on

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3 (iii):*

*yn cymeradwyo the Directions to Local Health Boards as to the Statement of Financial Entitlements (Amendment) (No. 2) Directions 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3323)*

Bydd y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn cyflwyno cynllun ansawdd newydd ar gyfer gwasanaethau gweinyddu i ymarferwyr fferyllol cyffredinol. Mae'r cynllun hwn yn rhan o ganlyniad cyd-drafodaethau'r DU rhwng y Pwyllgor Ymarferwyr Cyffredinol a'r sefydliadau iechyd perthnasol. Mae'r cynnig o dan eitem 9 yn gwneud y gwelliannau angenrheidiol er mwyn gweithredu'r newidiadau hynny yn y datganiad o hawliau ariannol ar gyfer talu ymarferwyr cyffredinol.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog a yw'n bosibl iddo ddarparu amserlen ar gyfer ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r ymgynghoriad ar reoli mynediad ar gyfer trwyddedau gweinyddu a fferyllol, a gaeodd ym mis Tachwedd 2005. Mae'n ymwneud, er yn anuniongyrchol, â'r mater hwn.

**Carwyn Jones:** Croesawn y rheoliadau ger ein bron heddiw, sy'n ymwneud â'r ffioedd a'r taliadau sy'n daladwy i feddygon am ddarparu cyffuriau neu gyfarpar o dan wasanaethau fferyllol. Weinidog, a ydych yn cytuno mai dyletswydd meddyg teulu yw hybu iechyd da, atal salwch a gwella ansawdd bywyd? A gytunwch hefyd fod y penderfyniad a wnaed gan y Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Iechyd a Rhagoriaeth Glinigol ar y cyffuriau clefyd Alzheimer, Aricept, Exelon a Reminyl, yn ddamniol ac yn warthus? A edrychwch ar argymhellion i ganiatáu i feddygon teulu ddarparu'r cyffuriau hyn i bobl sy'n dioddef gan y clefyd Alzheimer, sy'n glefyd ofnadwy, i'w eu helpu hwy a'u teuluoedd?

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf ar Jenny Randerson.

**Jenny Randerson:** Nid oes gennyf ddim i'w

this, Presiding Officer.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** The control of entry is something on which we are anxious to make progress. The consultation has finished, as Helen Mary said, and, all things being equal, we genuinely would have liked to have been able to make progress on this matter. However, issues such as what is going on in England in relation to similar contracts and the difficulties that we have had regarding the oxygen contract have created real capacity problems for my officials in terms of dealing with this. Community Pharmacy Wales regularly raises this issue with me and I am anxious for these regulations to move forward as quickly as possible, but, clearly, there are mechanical or logistical issues that we need to address.

On the point that Carl raised, this has been a great disappointment. Unfortunately, the problem is not with the NICE decision, but with the fact that the evidence of clinical effectiveness is sadly not there. I have been reading the literature and I remember there being great excitement when these drugs for dementia first started to come onto the market; it had the potential to be a life-enhancing, once-in-a-generation breakthrough. Sadly, the clinical and research evidence does not underpin that and we are in this disappointing situation because the NICE evaluation is based on clinical evidence. It is a sad fact that, unfortunately, the initial promise has not come into fruition. For us, as a Government, it would have been so much better had we been able to provide the life-enhancing change that the drugs promised. Equally, I am sure, from an economic point of view, that it would make much greater sense if we were to make available to patients drugs that are effective and really can make a difference, rather than denying such drugs to patients. It is on the grounds of minimal clinical effectiveness and minimal cost effectiveness that NICE has come to this decision. We find ourselves in a sad situation, but I do not think that there is anything worse than making false promises to people, when the bulk of the research evidence does not substantiate that. Other than that, I think that there is unanimous support for these

ddweud am hyn, Lywydd.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Mae rheoli mynediad yn rhywbeth yr ydym yn awyddus i weithredu arno. Mae'r ymgynghoriad wedi dod i ben, fel y dywedodd Helen Mary, ac os bydd popeth yn gyfartal, byddem yn wirioneddol wedi hoffi gallu symud ymlaen ar y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae materion megis yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr mewn perthynas â chontractau tebyg, a'r anawsterau a gawsom o ran y contract ocsigen, wedi creu problemau adnodau gwirioneddol i'm swyddogion wrth ddelio â hyn. Mae Fferylliaeth Gymunedol Cymru yn codi'r mater hwn yn rheolaidd gyda mi, ac yr wyf yn awyddus i'r rheoliadau hyn symud yn eu blaen mor gyflym â phosibl. Ond yn amlwg, mae yna faterion mecanyddol neu logistaidd y mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â hwy.

Ar y pwynt a gododd Carl, mae hyn wedi bod yn siom fawr. Yn anffodus, nid penderfyniad NICE yw'r broblem, ond y ffaith nad yw'r dystiolaeth o effeithiolrwydd clinigol ar gael, yn anffodus. Yr wyf wedi bod yn darllen y llenyddiaeth, a chofiaf y cyffro mawr pan ddaeth y cyffuriau hyn ar gyfer dementia ar werth am y tro cyntaf; yr oedd iddynt y potensial o fod yn ateb unwaith mewn oes a fyddai'n gwella bywydau. Yn anffodus, nid yw'r dystiolaeth glinigol ac ymchwiliol yn ategu hynny, ac yr ydym yn y sefyllfa siomedig hon am fod gwerthusiad NICE yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth glinigol. Mae'n ffaith drist nad yw'r addewid cychwynnol, yn anffodus, wedi dwyn ffrwyth. I ni, fel Llywodraeth, byddai wedi bod gymaint yn well pe baem wedi gallu darparu'r gwelliant hwn mewn bywyd yr oedd y cyffuriau yn ei addo. Yn yr yn modd, yr wyf yn siŵr, o safbwynt economaidd, y byddai lawer yn fwy o synhwyrol pe bai'n darparu i gleifion gyffuriau sy'n effeithiol ac sy'n gallu gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol, yn hytrach na gwrthod cyffuriau felly i gleifion. Daeth NICE i'r penderfyniad hwn oherwydd yr effeithiolrwydd clinigol lleiaf posibl a'r effeithiolrwydd cost lleiaf posibl. Yr ydym mewn sefyllfa druenus, ond ni chredaf fod dim yn waeth na rhoi addewidion gwag i bobl, pan nad yw'r rhan fwyaf o'r dystiolaeth ymchwil yn cadarnhau hynny. Heblaw am hynny, credaf fod cefnogaeth unfrydol i'r

resolutions and I would formally urge all Members to support them. cynigion hyn, a byddwn yn annog pob Aelod yn ffurfiol i'w cefnogi.

*Cynnig (NDM3320): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM3320): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3321): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM3321): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3322): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM3322): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff

Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3323): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3323): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian

Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.08 p.m.  
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.08 p.m.*

## **Y Cynnydd a wnaed mewn perthynas â Thri Chynllun Ailgyflunio Rhanbarthol y GIG**

### **Progress made in relation to the Three NHS Regional Reconfiguration Plans**

Motion (NDM3314): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3314): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*notes the progress made in securing the reconfiguration of acute health services in the different parts of Wales, as set out in 'Designed to Deliver: Shaping our Acute Hospitals in Mid and West Wales' for mid and west Wales, 'Designed for North Wales: A vision for the health community and a plan for the major hospital services' for north Wales, and 'Reshaping your local Health Services: Developing a Plan for South East Wales' for south-east Wales.*

*yn nodi'r cynnydd a wnaed o ran sicrhau bod gwasanaethau iechyd aciwt mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru yn cael eu hailgyflunio, fel y nodwyd yn y 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi: Pennu Ffurf Ein Hysbytai Acíwt yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru' ar gyfer Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru, 'Cynllun Gogledd Cymru: Gweledigaeth ar gyfer y gymuned iechyd a chynllun ar gyfer gwasanaethau'r prif ysbytai' ar gyfer Gogledd Cymru, a 'Llunio eich Gwasanaethau Iechyd lleol: Datblygu Cynllun ar gyfer De Ddwyrain Cymru' ar gyfer de-ddwyrain Cymru.*



Amendment 1 in the names of Jocelyn Davies, Lisa Francis and Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets that the reconfiguration process does not reflect the aspiration of 'Designed for Life', which stipulated the need for a holistic approach and the need to develop political and public consensus.*

Amendment 2 in the names of Jocelyn Davies, Lisa Francis and Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*instructs the Assembly Government to halt the current partial reconfiguration process and to produce, by the end of February 2007, new guidance for local health boards and NHS trusts that:*

*a) ensures consultations are held with communities across Wales to identify and prioritise health and social care needs and any subsequent reconfiguration proposals are supported by those communities;*

*b) ensures that any reconfiguration plans should include detailed, costed, timetabled plans for the development of primary and community services;*

*c) ensures that the plans for the provision of secondary care fully take into account the geography of Wales, the impact of distance on healthcare, and the need to provide full hospital services serving populations of 150,000 or less, where the rural nature of much of Wales makes that necessary;*

*d) ensures that the needs of the most deprived communities and those with the highest health need are fully addressed by any plans to reconfigure services; and*

*e) ensures that any plans to reconfigure health services fully address the need to integrate health and social services.*

Gwelliant 1 yn enwau Jocelyn Davies, Lisa Francis a Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu nad yw'r broses ailgyflunio'n adlewyrchu nod 'Cynllun Oes', a oedd yn nodi'n benodol bod angen sicrhau dull holistaidd a chonsensws gwleidyddol a chyhoeddus.*

Gwelliant 2 yn enwau Jocelyn Davies, Lisa Francis a Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i atal y broses ailgyflunio rhannol sydd ar waith ar hyn o bryd ac, erbyn diwedd mis Chwefror 2007, llunio canllawiau newydd i'r byrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG sydd:*

*a) yn sicrhau yr ymgynghorir â chymunedau ledled Cymru er mwyn nodi a blaenoriaethu anghenion iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol a bod y cymunedau hynny'n cefnogi unrhyw gynigion ailgyflunio a fydd yn dilyn;*

*b) yn sicrhau y dylai unrhyw gynlluniau ailgyflunio gynnwys cynlluniau manwl sy'n nodi'r gost a'r amserlen ar gyfer datblygu gwasanaethau sylfaenol a chymunedol;*

*c) yn sicrhau bod y cynlluniau ar gyfer darparu gofal eilaidd yn llwyr ystyried daearyddiaeth Cymru, effaith pellter ar ofal iechyd, a'r angen i ddarparu gwasanaethau ysbyty cyflawn i wasanaethu poblogaethau o 150,000 neu lai, lle y bo natur wledig rhan helaeth o Gymru'n mynnu hynny;*

*d) yn sicrhau yr ymdrinnir ag anghenion y cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig a'r rheini sydd â'r anghenion mwyaf o ran iechyd yn llawn mewn unrhyw gynlluniau i ailgyflunio gwasanaethau; a*

*e) yn sicrhau bod unrhyw gynlluniau i ailgyflunio gwasanaethau iechyd yn llwyr ystyried bod angen integreiddio gwasanaethau iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the names of Jocelyn Davies, Lisa Francis and Kirsty Williams.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enwau Jocelyn Davies, Lisa Francis a Kirsty Williams.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*notes the progress made in securing the reconfiguration of acute health services in the different parts of Wales, as set out in 'Designed to Deliver: Shaping our Acute Hospitals in Mid and West Wales' for mid and west Wales, 'Designed for North Wales: A vision for the health community and a plan for the major hospital services' for north Wales, and 'Reshaping your local Health Services: Developing a Plan for South East Wales' for south-east Wales. (NDM3314)*

*yn nodi'r cynnydd a wnaed o ran sicrhau bod gwasanaethau iechyd aciwt mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru yn cael eu hailgyflunio, fel y nodwyd yn y 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi: Pennu Ffurff Ein Hysbytai Acíwt yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru' ar gyfer Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru, 'Cynllun Gogledd Cymru: Gweledigaeth ar gyfer y gymuned iechyd a chynllun ar gyfer gwasanaethau'r prif ysbytai' ar gyfer Gogledd Cymru, a 'Llunio eich Gwasanaethau Iechyd lleol: Datblygu Cynllun ar gyfer De Ddwyrain Cymru' ar gyfer de-ddwyrain Cymru. (NDM3314)*

We are coming to the end of the initial phase of the consultation on acute service reconfigurations, following the publication of 'Designed for Life', and the broad patterns of the immediate future for the NHS in Wales are beginning to emerge. We are now moving on from the broader framework of change to the stage at which we are beginning to deal with more detailed operational implications. That process must continue to build on the high levels of public and clinical engagement to date and translate the hundreds of millions of pounds that have been made available to deliver change into a detailed, costed and timetabled plan for implementation. It has taken us 18 months to get to where we are as part of the longer 10-year programme to deliver world-class health services, which we have outlined in 'Designed for Life'. It is inconceivable that we would now turn the clock back on what has been achieved and effectively postpone action until we are at the other side of the Assembly elections.

Yr ydym yn dod i ddiwedd cyfnod cychwynnol yr ymgynghoriad ar ailgyflunio gwasanaethau aciwt, ar ôl cyhoeddi 'Cynllun Oes', ac mae patrymau cyffredinol y dyfodol agos ar gyfer y GIG yng Nghymru yn dechrau dod i'r amlwg. Yr ydym yn symud ymlaen o'r fframwaith ehangach o newid i'r cam lle yr ydym yn dechrau ymdrin â goblygiadau gweithredol manylach. Rhaid i'r broses honno barhau i adeiladu ar y lefelau uchel o ymgysylltu cyhoeddus a chlinigol hyd yma, a throi'r miliynau o bunnoedd a ryddhawyd i sicrhau newid yn gynllun manwl lle mae'r a'r amserlen wedi eu nodi ar gyfer gweithredu. Mae wedi cymryd 18 mis inni gyrraedd y fan hon fel rhan o'r rhaglen 10 mlynedd hwy i ddarparu gwasanaethau iechyd o'r radd flaenaf, fel yr amlinellwyd gennym yn 'Cynllun Oes'. Mae'n amhosibl credu y byddem yn awr yn troi'r cloc yn ôl ar yr hyn a gyflawnwyd, ac yn gohirio unrhyw weithredu mewn gwirionedd tan ar ôl etholiadau'r Cynulliad.

Today, I am announcing the outcome of the consultation process to date. Virtually everything that I will announce has been agreed by local partners in trusts, local health boards, medical committees and community health councils. In that sense, I am simply

Heddiw, yr wyf yn cyhoeddi canlyniad y broses ymgynghori hyd yma. Mae partneriaid lleol mewn ymddiriedolaethau, byrddau iechyd lleol, pwyllgorau meddygol a chynghorau iechyd cymuned wedi cytuno ar bron popeth y byddaf yn ei gyhoeddi. Yn yr

reporting the outcomes that have been passed on to me as information through our system, rather than any ministerial determination that I have made. In one instance, there has been 100 per cent local agreement on this matter, and I will be outlining that as well.

4.10 p.m.

In mid and west Wales, agreement has been reached on the proposals relating to the networking of secondary care through three service delivery units in the region. This will provide care for a population of approximately 300,000 patients, and we have been advised that this is the basis on which resilient, sustainable service delivery will be provided. In Swansea, there is a higher level of agreement on the need to move forward so that a single superhospital that will service the general hospital needs of Swansea will be a centre of regional excellence in the Swansea bay and south Wales area in general, while continuing to provide a range of pan-south-Wales services, such as those for burns and plastics. While the site of the hospital remains to be decided, this new hospital will be linked to new clinical investment that is taking place in research and the biosciences, which promises to put that hospital at the leading edge of what is best in healthcare, not just in Wales, but possibly at the UK level. I can therefore confirm today that this element of the reconfiguration plan will go ahead as agreed.

In the Bro Morgannwg area, the current configuration of services will largely continue, strengthened by increased work on the intermediate care sector and through developments such as the primary care resource centres at Port Talbot and Briton Ferry. I can also confirm today that this will proceed.

In Carmarthenshire, Pembrokeshire and Ceredigion, the project board's two preferred options for reconfiguration of hospital services have attracted little public support during the consultation period. Agreement was secured, however, on the basic proposition that change needed to take place. In line with the challenge in the foreword to 'Designed to Deliver', alternative options

ystyr honno, yr wyf yn syml yn cofnodi'r canlyniadau a drosglwyddwyd i mi fel gwybodaeth drwy ein system, yn hytrach nag unrhyw benderfyniad gweinidogol a wneuthum. Mewn un enghraifft, bu cytundeb lleol o 100 y cant ar y mater hwn, a byddaf yn amlinellu hynny hefyd.

Yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, daethpwyd i gytundeb ar y cynigion yn ymwneud â rhwydweithio gofal eilaidd drwy dair uned darparu gwasanaethau yn y rhanbarth. Bydd y cytundeb hwn yn darparu gofal i boblogaeth o ryw 300,000 o gleifion, ac fe'n cynghorwyd mai dyma'r sail ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau cynaliadwy, cadarn. Yn Abertawe, mae mwy o gytundeb ar yr angen i symud ymlaen fel y bydd un ysbyty gwych, a fydd yn gwasanaethu'r anghenion ysbyty cyffredinol yn Abertawe, yn ganolfan ragoriaeth ranbarthol ym mae Abertawe ac ardal y de yn gyffredinol, gan ddarparu amrywiaeth o wasanaethau i dde Cymru i gyd, megis y rhai ar gyfer llosgiadau a phlastigau. Er na phenderfynwyd eto ar ei safle, bydd yr ysbyty newydd hwn yn gysylltiedig â buddsoddiad clinigol newydd ym maes ymchwil a'r biowyddorau, sy'n addo rhoi'r ysbyty hwnnw ar y brig o ran yr hyn sydd orau mewn gofal iechyd, nid yn unig yng Nghymru, ond o bosibl ar lefel y DU. Gallaf gadarnhau heddiw felly y bydd yr elfen hon o'r cynllun ailgyflunio yn mynd rhagddi fel y cytunwyd.

Yn ardal Bro Morgannwg, bydd y gwaith presennol o ailgyflunio gwasanaethau yn parhau i raddau helaeth, ond yn cael ei gryfhau gan fwy o waith yn y sector gofal canolradd a thrwy ddatblygiadau fel y canolfannau adnoddau gofal sylfaenol ym Mhort Talbot a Llansawel. Gallaf gadarnhau hefyd heddiw y bydd hyn yn mynd rhagddo.

Yn sir Gaerfyrddin, sir Benfro a Cheredigion, nid yw'r ddau opsiwn dewisol gan fwrdd y prosiect ar gyfer ailgyflunio gwasanaethau ysbyty wedi denu llawer o gefnogaeth y cyhoedd yn ystod y cyfnod ymgynghori. Sicrhawyd cytundeb, fodd bynnag, ar y cynnig sylfaenol, sef bod angen gwneud newidiadau. Yn unol â'r her yn y rhagair i 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi', mae dewisiadau

have emerged. New proposals are based on retaining the present three general hospitals at Glangwili, Withybush and Bronglais, but to link them and get them to work together as three hospitals more closely in a network than heretofore was the case.

A planning forum is being proposed to move this agenda forward, as well as the wider integrated health and social care agenda. This will also work through the implications of the consultation for services such as maternity and paediatrics services, which are particularly important in Ceredigion. In the meantime, we have already achieved a great deal: the new hospital at Tenby is open, and the south Pembrokeshire hospital is near completion. We await the business plans for new developments in Ceredigion—for example, in Cardigan, where some of the more difficult planning hurdles seem to have been overcome. There is significant capital investment to update cardiac services at Bronglais, and approval has been given for the new accident and emergency department and an MRI scanner at Withybush, and the theatres, the accident and emergency department, the cardiac department and renal units at Glangwili are moving forward positively. In Llanelli, we are awaiting the business case for the phase 2 project for breast care, which is worth £5.2 million, as well as the business case for the short-stay surgical facility.

A strong message from the consultation is that there are too many health bodies covering the counties of Carmarthenshire, Pembrokeshire and Ceredigion. All but one of the local bodies have agreed that a single south-west Wales trust is needed to bring forward the proposed three-hospital solution. An independently chaired and directed project board is proposed to take this proposal forward. I will be asking for practical plans for a single trust to be completed for consideration by the Assembly Government that will be in place after May's election, and that consideration be given to the issues that were raised in the consultation exercise.

eraill wedi dod i'r amlwg. Seilir cynigion newydd ar gadw'r tri ysbyty cyffredinol yng Nglangwili, Llwynhelyg a Bron-glais, ond i'w cysylltu a'u cael i gydweithio fel tri ysbyty yn agosach mewn rhwydwaith nag oedd yn wir yn flaenorol.

Bwriedir cynnal fforwm cynllunio i symud yr agenda hon yn ei blaen, yn ogystal â'r agenda iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol integredig ehangach. Bydd hyn hefyd yn gweithio drwy oblygiadau'r ymgynghori ar gyfer gwasanaethau fel gwasanaethau mamolaeth a phediatreg, sydd yn arbennig o bwysig yng Ngheredigion. Yn y cyfamser, yr ydym eisoes wedi gwneud llawer: mae'r ysbyty newydd yn Ninbych-y-pysgod ar agor, ac mae ysbyty de sir Benfro bron yn barod. Yr ydym yn aros am y cynlluniau busnes ar gyfer datblygiadau newydd yng Ngheredigion—er enghraifft, yn Aberteifi, lle mae'n ymddangos bod y rhwystrau cynllunio mwyaf anodd wedi eu goresgyn. Gwnaed buddsoddiad cyfalaf sylweddol i ddiweddarau gwasanaethau cardiaidd ym Mron-glais. Rhoddwyd cymeradwyaeth ar gyfer yr adran damweiniau ac achosion brys newydd a sganiwr MRI yn Llwynhelyg, ac mae'r ystafelloedd llawdriniaeth, yr adran damweiniau ac achosion brys, adran y galon a'r unedau arenol yng Nglangwili yn symud yn eu blaenau yn gadarnhaol. Yn Llanelli, yr ydym yn disgwyl yr achos busnes ar gyfer y prosiect cam 2 ar gyfer gofal y fron, sy'n werth £5.2 miliwn, yn ogystal â'r achos busnes ar gyfer y cyfleuster llawfeddygol cyfnod byr.

Neges gref o'r ymgynghoriad yw bod gormod o gyrff iechyd ar gyfer siroedd Caerfyrddin, Penfro a Cheredigion. Mae pob un o'r cyrff lleol namyn un wedi cytuno bod angen un ymddiriedolaeth yn y de-orllewin i symud ymlaen yr ateb a arfaethir o gael tri ysbyty. Bwriedir cael bwrdd prosiect yn cael ei gadeirio a'i gyfarwyddo'n annibynnol i weithredu'r cynnig hwn. Byddaf yn gofyn am i gynlluniau ymarferol ar gyfer un ymddiriedolaeth gael eu cwblhau i'w hystyried gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a fydd ar waith ar ôl etholiad mis Mai, ac am roi ystyriaeth i'r materion a godwyd yn yr ymarfer ymgynghori.

In north Wales, the main recommendation that the three general hospitals should continue to be the main focus of hospital service delivery has been supported and enhanced by community network clinical services, which will be the key to continuous improvement. I therefore confirm that outcome and give it the go ahead today.

There has also been agreement to close the hospitals at Abergele and HM Stanley following a consideration of clinical safety and the poor physical state of the building fabric. As long as minimal governance standards are maintained, these closures will not take place until alternative provision has been made, and double running will be made available from the Wanless fund to facilitate this. There has been intense debate about the future of hospital services at Llandudno. There have been criticisms regarding the lack of detail about the future vision for that hospital, which Denise Idris Jones has raised in the Chamber on many occasions, as colleagues will know. Over the summer, I also visited Llandudno General Hospital and I had the opportunity to meet staff and patients.

Following further local discussions with Conwy and Clwyd community health councils, the original process has been amended to provide a new focus on describing and planning for the future of Llandudno General Hospital as a modern diagnostic treatment and rehabilitation centre. That will also include a review of Llandudno General Hospital's role in the delivery of breast surgery services in north Wales. At the same time in north Wales, work is proceeding on the building of new community hospitals at Porthmadog and Holywell in line with the unanimous resolution passed in the Chamber just a month or so ago.

In south-east Wales, the consultation on 'Gwent Clinical Futures' is continuing until 8 December, with a view to recommendations coming forward early in the new year. The boards of north Glamorgan and Pontypridd and Rhondda trusts have agreed to have an open discussion on a possible trust merger. This proposal is at an early stage but the initial reaction has been positive. At the same

Yn y gogledd, mae'r prif argymhelliad y dylai'r tri ysbyty cyffredinol barhau i fod yn brif ganolbwynt darparu gwasanaethau ysbyty wedi ei gefnogi a'i wella gan wasanaethau clinigol rhwydwaith cymunedol, sef yr allwedd i welliant parhaus. Felly, yr wyf yn cadarnhau'r canlyniad hwnnw ac yn rhoi sêl bendith iddo heddiw.

Cafwyd cytundeb hefyd i gau'r ysbytai yn Abergele a HM Stanley ar ôl ystyried diogelwch clinigol a chyflwr ffisegol gwael yr adeilad. Cyhyd ag y cynhelir safonau llywodraethu gofynnol, ni chânt eu cau nes bydd darpariaeth amgen wedi ei threfnu, a bydd gweithredu dwbl ar gael o gronfa Wanless i hwyluso hyn. Bu dadlau dwys am ddyfodol gwasanaethau ysbyty yn Llandudno. Beirniadwyd y prinder manylion am y weledigaeth ar gyfer yr ysbyty hwnnw yn y dyfodol, a godwyd gan Denise Idris Jones yn y Siambr ar lawer achlysur, fel y gŵyr cyd-Aelodau. Dros yr haf, ymwelais ag Ysbyty Cyffredinol Llandudno hefyd a chefais y cyfle i gwrdd â staff a chleifion.

Yn dilyn trafodaethau lleol pellach gyda chynghorau cymuned Conwy a Chlwyd, mae'r broses wreiddiol wedi ei diwygio i roi ffocws newydd ar ddisgrifio a chynllunio ar gyfer dyfodol Ysbyty Cyffredinol Llandudno fel canolfan fodern ar gyfer triniaeth ddiagnostig ac adsefydlu. Bydd hynny hefyd yn cynnwys adolygiad o rôl Ysbyty Cyffredinol Llandudno wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau llawdriniaeth y fron yn y gogledd. Ar yr un pryd yn y gogledd, mae gwaith yn mynd ymlaen ar adeiladu ysbytai cymuned newydd Porthmadog a Threffynnon yn unol â'r cynnig a dderbyniwyd yn unfrydol yn y Siambr tua mis yn ôl.

Yn y de-ddwyrain, mae'r ymgynghori ar 'Gwent Clinical Futures' yn parhau tan 8 Rhagfyr, gyda'r nod o gyflwyno argymhellion yn fuan yn y flwyddyn newydd. Mae byrddau ymddiriedolaethau gogledd Morgannwg a Phontypridd a Rhondda wedi cytuno i gael trafodaeth agored ar y posibilrwydd o uno'r ymddiriedolaethau. Dechrau mae'r cynnig hwn, ond mae'r

time, a bid for a new MRI scanner at Prince Charles Hospital in Merthyr has been approved, and I am awaiting the business cases for the new accident-and-emergency department, a new town hospital in Merthyr and a new primary care facility at Treharris, which I expect within the next three to four months.

Progress continues to be made on providing new community hospitals and a range of similar facilities in the Cynon valley, Ystrad Mynach, Llwynypia and Ebbw Vale.

Substantial progress is being made in the modernisation of health services in line with the vision and aspirations of 'Designed for Life' that we will have world-class health services in Wales by 2015. It is inconceivable that this work should now be brought to a halt, that the futures of the hospitals in south Wales should be again thrown into the melting pot, that the plans for a new superhospital in Swansea should be put on hold, that the uncertainty about the future of Llandudno hospital should continue for a further indeterminate period, and that the record building programme in our most deprived communities and the linked developments in boosting primary care services, such as those in Neath Port Talbot, and salaried GP services in Rhondda Cynon Taf, Caerphilly and the Gwent Valleys should all halt on the back of the amendments.

We have been through a difficult consultation exercise and, while some consultation exercises are yet to be completed, we must move forward. I am grateful to the thousands of people who have taken the time and effort to partake in these consultation exercises. In view of the outcome, no-one can argue that the main concerns of this consultation exercise have not been taken on board and have not been largely incorporated into these emerging proposals.

This is not the time to stand still; it is time to move forward. It is time not to stop the clock but to continue to build world-class health services in Wales.

ymateb cychwynnol wedi bod yn gadarnhaol. Ar yr un pryd, mae cais am sganiwr MRI yn Ysbyty'r Tywysog Siarl ym Merthyr wedi ei gymeradwyo, ac yr wyf yn disgwyl yr achosion busnes dros yr adran newydd ar gyfer damweiniau ac achosion brys, ysbyty tref newydd ym Merthyr a chyfleuster gofal sylfaenol newydd yn Nhreharris. Yr wyf yn disgwyl y rhain o fewn y tri neu bedwar mis nesaf.

Parhau mae'r cynnydd ar ddarparu ysbytai cymunedol newydd ac ystod o gyfleusterau tebyg yng nghwm Cynon, Ystrad Mynach, Llwynypia a Glynebwy.

Gwneir cynnydd sylweddol gyda'r gwaith o foderneiddio gwasanaethau iechyd yn unol â gweledigaeth a dyheadau 'Cynllun Oes', sef y bydd gennym wasanaethau iechyd o'r radd flaenaf yng Nghymru erbyn 2015. Mae'n annirnadwy y dylai'r gwaith hwn yn awr ddod i ben, y dylai dyfodol ysbytai yn y de unwaith eto fod yn ansicr, y dylai'r cynlluniau ar gyfer uwch-ysbyty newydd yn Abertawe gael eu hatal, y dylai'r ansicrwydd ynglŷn â dyfodol ysbyty Llandudno barhau am gyfnod amhenodol pellach, ac y dylai'r rhaglen adeiladu orau erioed yn ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig a'r datblygiadau cysylltiedig i hybu gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol, megis y rheini yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot, a gwasanaethau meddygon teulu cyflogedig yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, Caerffili a Chymoedd Gwent, i gyd gael eu hatal yn sgîl y gwelliannau.

Yr ydym wedi mynd drwy gyfnod ymgynghori anodd, ac er bod rhai ymgynghoriadau heb eu cwblhau eto, rhaid inni symud ymlaen. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r miloedd o bobl sydd wedi rhoi o'u hamser ac wedi ymdrechu i gymryd rhan yn yr ymgynghoriadau hyn. O ran y canlyniad, ni all neb ddadlau nad ystyriwyd prif bryderon yr ymgynghori hwn ac na chawsant eu hymgorffori i raddau helaeth yn y cynigion hyn sy'n datblygu.

Nid nawr yw'r amser i sefyll yn ein hunfan; mae'n amser symud ymlaen. Nid nawr yw'r amser i stopio'r cloc, ond i barhau i adeiladu gwasanaethau iechyd o'r radd flaenaf yng Nghymru.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I intend to impose a three-minute time limit on Members, as many people wish to speak, and I imagine that there will be many different voices in the house on this issue.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I propose the following amendments in the names of Jocelyn Davies, Lisa Francis and Kirsty Williams. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets that the reconfiguration process does not reflect the aspiration of 'Designed for Life', which stipulated the need for a holistic approach and the need to develop political and public consensus.*

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*instructs the Assembly Government to halt the current partial reconfiguration process and to produce, by the end of February 2007, new guidance for local health boards and NHS trusts that:*

*a) ensures consultations are held with communities across Wales to identify and prioritise health and social care needs and any subsequent reconfiguration proposals are supported by those communities;*

*b) ensures that any reconfiguration plans should include detailed, costed, timetabled plans for the development of primary and community services;*

*c) ensures that the plans for the provision of secondary care fully take into account the geography of Wales, the impact of distance on healthcare, and the need to provide full hospital services serving populations of 150,000 or less, where the rural nature of much of Wales makes that necessary;*

*d) ensures that the needs of the most deprived communities and those with the highest health need are fully addressed by any plans to reconfigure services;*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Bwriadaf osod terfyn amser o dair munud ar Aelodau, oherwydd bod nifer o bobl am siarad, a dychmygaf y bydd llawer o leisiau gwahanol yn y tŷ ar y mater hwn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enwau Jocelyn Davies, Lisa Francis a Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu at y ffaith nad yw'r broses ailgyflunio'n adlewyrchu nod 'Cynllun Oes', a oedd yn nodi'n benodol bod angen sicrhau dull holistaidd a chonsensus gwleidyddol a chyhoeddus.*

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i atal y broses ailgyflunio rhannol sydd ar waith ar hyn o bryd ac, erbyn diwedd mis Chwefror 2007, i lunio canllawiau newydd i'r byrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG sydd*

*a) yn sicrhau yr ymgynghorir â chymunedau ledled Cymru er mwyn nodi a blaenoriaethu anghenion iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol a bod y cymunedau hynny'n cefnogi unrhyw gynigion ailgyflunio a fydd yn dilyn;*

*b) yn sicrhau y dylai unrhyw gynlluniau ailgyflunio gynnwys cynlluniau manwl sy'n nodi'r gost a'r amserlen ar gyfer datblygu gwasanaethau sylfaenol a chymunedol;*

*c) yn sicrhau bod y cynlluniau ar gyfer darparu gofal eilaidd yn llwyr ystyried daearyddiaeth Cymru, effaith pellter ar ofal iechyd, a'r angen i ddarparu gwasanaethau ysbyty cyflawn i wasanaethu poblogaethau o 150,000 neu lai, lle bo natur wledig rhan helaeth o Gymru'n mynnu hynny;*

*d) yn sicrhau yr ymdrinnir yn llawn ag anghenion y cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig a'r rheini sydd â'r anghenion mwyaf o ran iechyd mewn unrhyw gynlluniau i ailgyflunio gwasanaethau;*

*e) ensures that any plans to reconfigure health services fully address the need to integrate health and social services.*

*e) yn sicrhau bod unrhyw gynlluniau i ailgyflunio gwasanaethau iechyd yn llwyr ystyried bod angen integreiddio gwasanaethau iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol.*

In listening to the Minister's speech, I began to believe that he had participated in a completely different process from that in which I participated, and I am deeply concerned to see that level of complacency. If all is well, as the Minister says, I am astounded that he and other Labour Members voted for the motion that was passed unanimously in the Chamber on 3 October, which stated that,

Wrth wrando ar araith y Gweinidog, yr oeddwn yn dechrau credu ei fod wedi cymryd rhan mewn proses gwbl wahanol i'r un y bûm i'n cymryd rhan ynndi, ac mae gweld cymaint o hunanfodhad yn peri pryder mawr imi. Os yw popeth yn iawn, fel y dywed y Gweinidog, yr wyf yn synnu ei fod ef ac Aelodau eraill o'r Blaid Lafur wedi pleidleisio dros y cynnig a dderbyniwyd yn unfrydol yn y Siambr ar 3 Hydref, a oedd yn dweud bod,

'the National Assembly

'Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

1. believes that no reconfiguration of hospital services should take place without adequately planned community provision; and

1. yn credu na ddylai gwasanaethau ysbytai gael eu hailgyflunio heb ddarpariaeth gymunedol wedi'i chynllunio'n ddigonol; ac

2. believes that before any reconfiguration occurs there must be genuine public consultation, with the views of local communities not only listened to but taken on board'.

2. yn credu bod yn rhaid cael gwir ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus cyn i unrhyw ailgyflunio ddigwydd, gyda safbwyntiau cymunedau lleol nid yn unig yn cael gwrandawriad ond yn cael eu hystyried'.

Why vote for that and then say that everything is fine with the current reconfiguration procedures? I am at a loss. We expected this debate and we, as opposition parties, agreed to its deferment because we expected the Minister to respond to that resolution that was unanimously passed. He has not done so. He has stood here and told us that everything is fine. I will refer to the two specific amendments.

Pam y pleidleisiodd dros hynny a dweud wedyn fod popeth yn iawn gyda'r gweithdrefnau ailgyflunio cyfredol? Yr wyf ar goll yn lân. Yr oeddem yn disgwyl y ddatl hon, a chytunwyd gennym ni, y gwrthbleidiau, i'w gohirio oherwydd ein bod yn disgwyl i'r Gweinidog ymateb i'r cynnig hwnnw a dderbyniwyd yn unfrydol. Nid yw wedi gwneud hynny. Mae wedi sefyll yma a dweud wrthym fod popeth yn iawn. Cyfeiriaf at y ddau welliant penodol.

4.20 p.m.

The Wanless report makes it clear that the whole service needs to be reconfigured, and not just acute hospital services. It is also clear about the need to develop political and public consensus. I agree with the Minister that some changes have been broadly agreed and supported, and we would not want to stop those specific changes from going ahead. However, those specific changes do not amount to a national change plan, which is

Mae adroddiad Wanless yn ei gwneud yn glir fod angen ailgyflunio'r gwasanaeth cyfan, ac nid gwasanaethau ysbyty aciwt yn unig. Mae hefyd yn glir am yr angen am ddatblygu consensws gwleidyddol a chyhoeddus. Cytunaf â'r Gweinidog fod cytundeb ynglŷn â rhai newidiadau a chefnogaeth gyffredinol iddynt, ac ni fyddem am atal y newidiadau penodol hynny rhag mynd rhagddynt. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r newidiadau penodol hynny



what we thought we had agreed to when we signed up to 'Designed to Deliver'. If there is a consistent theme throughout much of this process, it is that, in many parts of Wales, this process has been divisive and, far from creating a holistic consensus, it has made it more difficult in the longer term to drive change forward. Hence, amendment 1.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Do you agree that the other consistent theme in this debate is that there has been no development of the political consensus that Wanless called for or a public consensus? The debate has not been led, and it has pitched community against community.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I can do nothing other than agree with you. I find it extraordinary that Members of the Government party, who, in their own communities, have been vociferous in opposing the change, will now, I presume, vote in favour of this complacent motion tabled by the Government.

On amendment 2, we are trying to put into force the motion that everyone voted for. We are not suggesting that the process should be stopped and started again. Where there is consensus for individual developments and individual changes, there is no reason why that could not go ahead.

**Leighton Andrews:** Will you give way?

**Helen Mary Jones:** I will in a moment, if I have time, as you know. We are not saying this lightly. We know that it creates uncertainty, but this process has been so flawed and has produced such a negative reaction in some parts of Wales that it cannot continue as it is, and it certainly cannot be said to be delivering national change. This is despite the best efforts of highly committed individuals in health bodies, of course. There has been such a defensive reaction from health bodies in some parts of Wales that the public's trust has broken down, and Members in the Labour group know this as well as we do. Trust has broken down, and it is no wonder when, for example, Carmarthenshire Community Health Council—the voice of the community—made it clear some weeks ago

yn gyfystyr â chynllun newid cenedlaethol, sef yr hyn yr oeddem yn credu inni gytuno arno wrth ymrwymo i 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi'. Os oes yna thema gyson yn y rhan fwyaf o'r broses hon, y thema honno, mewn llawer rhan o Gymru, yw fod y broses hon wedi bod yn un gynhenus a'i bod, ymhell o greu consensws cyfannol, yn y pen draw wedi ei gwneud yn anos sicrhau newid. Dyna'r rheswm felly dros welliant 1.

**Jonathan Morgan:** A gytunwch mai'r thema gyson arall yn y ddadl hon yw na chafwyd y consensws gwleidyddol yr oedd Wanless yn galw amdano, na chonsensws cyhoeddus? Nid yw'r ddadl wedi ei harwain, ac mae wedi golygu bod cymunedau benben â'i gilydd.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ni allaf ond cytuno â chi. I mi mae'n anghredadwy fod Aelodau o blaid y Llywodraeth sydd, yn eu cymunedau eu hunain, wedi gwrthwynebu'r newid yn gadarn, yn awr, mi dybiaf, yn mynd i bleidleisio o blaid y cynnig hunanfodlon a gyflwynwyd gan y Llywodraeth.

O ran gwelliant 2, yr ydym yn ceisio rhoi ar waith y cynnig y pleidleisiodd pawb drosto. Nid ydym yn awgrymu y dylid atal y broses a'i dechrau eto. Lle mae consensws dros ddatblygiadau unigol a newidiadau unigol, nid oes rheswm pam na allai hynny fynd yn ei flaen.

**Leighton Andrews:** A ildiwch?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Fe wnaif yn y funud, os bydd gennyf amser, fel y gwyddoch. Nid ydym yn dweud hyn yn ysgafn. Gwyddom ei fod yn creu ansicrwydd, ond mae'r broses hon wedi bod mor ddiffygiol ac wedi ennyn cymaint o ymateb negyddol mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru fel na all barhau fel y mae. Ac yn sicr ni ellir dweud ei bod yn darparu newid cenedlaethol er gwaethaf ymdrechion unigolion hollol ymroddedig mewn cyrff iechyd, wrth gwrs. Cafwyd cymaint o ymateb amddiffynnol gan gyrff iechyd mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru nes mae'r cyhoedd wedi colli ymddiriedaeth, a gŵyr aelodau o'r grŵp Llafur hyn cystal â ninnau. Collwyd ymddiriedaeth, ac nid yw'n syndod, er enghraifft, bod Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned Sir Gaerfyrddin—llais y gymuned—wedi

that it would not support the removal of emergency surgery from Prince Philip Hospital, and it is now being badgered to change its decision. That happened just last week. There are real issues with trust. Trust has been damaged by this process in many parts of Wales, and those issues need to be addressed.

The Minister needs to set out guidelines that will enable those NHS bodies to develop a relationship of trust, to listen to as well as to tell communities, and to work with them to help them to identify, understand and work out how to meet challenges, instead of presenting them with a fait accompli, time and again. Rebuilding that trust will not be easy, but we must believe that it is possible. People are not stupid. They do not want 1970s-style services, and they will not accept change unless they can see the benefits. While people are seeing benefits in some parts of Wales, I have no doubt that they are not in other parts of Wales. Hence, our amendment setting out the need for costed timetabled plans for full community services.

The Minister rightly makes references to community hospitals. Where there are new developments, we welcome them, but community services go far beyond that. There is nothing in this process that deals with the need to interface with social care, for example, and we still have grave concerns about the way in which the process addresses the needs of the poorest communities and the need to provide appropriate hospital services in rural areas.

If it would suit Leighton Andrews, I will give way to him now.

**Leighton Andrews:** The first sentence in amendment 2 is clear. It instructs the Assembly Government,

‘to halt the current partial reconfiguration process and to produce, by the end of February 2007, new guidance for local health

gwneud yn glir ychydig wythnosau'n ôl na fyddai'n cefnogi'r cynnig i symud llawdriniaeth frys o Ysbyty Tywysog Philip, ac mae bellach yn cael ei annog i newid ei benderfyniad. Dim ond yr wythnos diwethaf y digwyddodd hynny. Mae yna broblemau gwirioneddol o ran ymddiriedaeth. Mae'r broses hon wedi peri i bobl golli ymddiriedaeth mewn llawer rhan o Gymru, ac mae angen mynd i'r afael â'r problemau hynny.

Mae angen i'r Gweinidog bennu canllawiau a fydd yn galluogi'r cyrff GIG hynny i ennyn ymddiriedaeth, i wrando ar gymunedau yn ogystal â dweud wrthynt, ac i weithio gyda hwy i'w helpu i nodi, deall a gweithio allan sut i ymateb i heriau, yn hytrach na'u cyflwyno gyda fait accompli, dro ar ôl tro. Ni fydd yn hawdd ailennyn yr ymddiriedaeth honno, ond rhaid inni gredu ei bod yn bosibl. Nid yw pobl yn dwp. Nid ydynt am gael gwasanaethau o'r 1970au, ac ni fyddant yn derbyn newid oni allant weld y manteision. Er bod pobl yn gweld manteision mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru, nid oes gennyf amheuaeth nad ydynt yn eu gweld mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Dyna'r rheswm, felly, dros ein gwelliant sy'n gosod allan yr angen am gynlluniau wedi'u hamserlenni a'u costio ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymunedol llawn.

Mae'r Gweinidog yn cyfeirio at ysbytai cymuned, a hynny'n gywir. Lle y mae datblygiadau newydd, fe'u croesawn, ond mae gwasanaethau cymunedol yn mynd ymhellach na hynny. Nid oes dim yn y broses hon sy'n delio â'r angen am ryngwyneb â gofal cymdeithasol, er enghraifft, ac yr ydym yn pryderu'n fawr o hyd am y ffordd y mae'r broses yn mynd i'r afael ag anghenion y cymunedau tlotaf a'r angen am ddarparu gwasanaethau ysbyty priodol mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

Os byddai'n gyfleus i Leighton Andrews, ildiaf iddo yn awr.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'r frawddeg gyntaf yng ngwelliant 2 yn glir. Mae'n cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad,

‘i atal y broses ailgyflunio rhannol sydd ar waith ar hyn o bryd, ac erbyn diwedd mis Chwefror 2007 i lunio canllawiau newydd i'r

boards and NHS trusts’.

It seems that any local health board or NHS trust observing that guidance must review every scheme that it has under way. That includes the new hospital in Llwynypia, the new community facilities, new GP services as well as any new health centres that they are building.

**Helen Mary Jones:** The Presiding Officer ruled earlier that the interpretation of the motion would be up to the Minister, but I repeat that we have worded the amendment carefully in such a way that, where there are individual—[*Interruption.*] Do you wish to make another intervention, Leighton Andrews, or are you prepared to listen to my response?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. We have run out of time now. There is five minutes for speeches plus a minute for interventions. That is it, I am afraid.

**Helen Mary Jones:** May I have a sentence to conclude?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** One sentence.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I would just like to reiterate that this process is flawed and is too negative to go on as it is. Individual developments could still take place, and it is beyond me to understand how Members of the Labour Party could vote in favour of the motion on 3 October and yet refuse to vote for the motion today, which would put that resolution into effect. If that is not political grandstanding and hypocrisy, I do not know what is.

**Deputy Presiding Officer:** We will now have speeches of three minutes exactly and no more. Seventeen Members have indicated that they wish to speak, and we will be here until 7 p.m. unless we make progress.

**Sandy Mewies:** I support the motion and oppose the amendments, particularly amendment 2. I have a new hospital coming

byrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau’r GIG.’

Ymddengys fod yn rhaid i unrhyw fwrdd iechyd lleol neu ymddiriedolaeth GIG sy’n dilyn y canllawiau hynny adolygu pob cynllun sydd ganddynt ar waith. Mae hynny’n cynnwys yr ysbyty newydd yn Llwynypia, y cyfleusterau cymunedol newydd, gwasanaethau meddygon teulu newydd yn ogystal ag unrhyw ganolfannau iechyd newydd sy’n cael eu hadeiladu ganddynt.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Dywedodd y Llywydd yn gynharach mai cyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog fyddai dehongli’r cynnig, ond ailadroddaf ein bod wedi geirio’r gwelliant yn ofalus yn y fath fodd fel, pe bai unrhyw unigolyn—[*Torri ar draws.*] A hoffech wneud ymyriad arall, Leighton Andrews, neu a ydych yn barod i wrando ar fy ymateb?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae’r amser wedi dod i ben. Mae pum munud ar gyfer areithiau ac un funud ar gyfer ymyriadau. Dyna ni, mae’n ddrwg gennyf.

**Helen Mary Jones:** A allaf gael brawddeg i gloi?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Un frawddeg.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Hoffwn ailadrodd bod y broses hon yn ddiffygiol ac yn rhy negyddol i fynd rhagddi fel y mae. Gellid cael datblygiadau unigol o hyd, ac ni allaf ddeall sut y gallai Aelodau o’r Blaid Lafur bleidleisio o blaid y cynnig ar 3 Hydref ac eto wrthod pleidleisio dros y cynnig heddiw, a fyddai’n rhoi’r cynnig hwnnw ar waith. Mae hynny’n amlwg yn rhagrith ac yn rhodres.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cawn areithiau yn awr o dair munud union a dim mwy. Mae 17 o Aelodau wedi arwyddo eu bod am siarad, a byddwn yma tan 7 p.m. oni symudwn ymlaen.

**Sandy Mewies:** Yr wyf yn cefnogi’r cynnig ac yn gwrthwynebu’r gwelliannau, yn enwedig gwelliant 2. Mae ysbyty newydd yn

to Holywell. Work has started on it, which is much needed and long awaited. That project was rejected out of hand by a Conservative Government, and delivered by Labour in the Assembly. My understanding is that this wonderful facility, fought for by local people for many years, would be brought to a halt should this amendment be carried, regardless of what has just been said, which was obviously not thought-out.

The Minister knows how strongly I feel that any new health service provider should be holistic and integrated with related services. The many discussions that we have had recently on the consultation process on Flint Community Hospital—which, as you know, I feel is flawed and should be stopped—have made that clear. However, to stop ongoing work at Holywell would be preposterous.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Will you take an intervention?

**Sandy Mewies:** No.

What amazes me is the enthusiasm that the opposition, particularly the Conservatives, seems to have for the NHS. This is the same party that closed hospitals throughout Wales when it was in power, and closed most of the military hospitals in the UK, which they forgot to mention in recent arguments about the medical treatment of military personnel.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Will you give way?

**Sandy Mewies:** What part of 'no' did you not understand?

They have always been opportunist, but they now surpass themselves in jumping onto any passing bandwagon. In my constituency, I have seen Conservative wannabes trying to present themselves as politicians who played a role in bringing our new hospital to Holywell. That is not true. Even worse, they have done their best to scaremonger with a petition calling for the existing cottage hospital to remain open while the town's new £11 million-plus hospital is built.

dod i Dreffynnon. Mae'r gwaith wedi dechrau arno, a bu angen mawr ac aros hir amdano. Gwrthodwyd y prosiect hwnnw'n llwyr gan Lywodraeth Geidwadol, a'i ddarparu gan Lafur yn y Cynulliad. Deallaf y byddai'r cyfleuster arbennig hwn y mae pobl leol wedi bod yn ymladd drosto ers blynyddoedd lawer yn cael ei atal pe câi'r gwelliant hwn ei dderbyn, waeth beth a ddywedwyd yn gynharach. Nid oedd llawer o feddwl wedi ei iddo yn amlwg.

Gŵyr y Gweinidog fy nheimpladau cadarn y dylai unrhyw ddarparwr gwasanaeth iechyd newydd fod yn gyfannol ac wedi'i integreiddio â gwasanaethau cysylltiedig. Mae'r trafodaethau niferus a gawsom yn ddiweddar ar y broses ymgynghori ar Ysbyty Cymuned y Fflint—fel y gwyddoch, credaf ei bod yn ddiffygiol ac y dylid ei hatal—wedi gwneud hynny'n glir. Fodd bynnag, byddai atal gwaith sy'n mynd ymlaen yn Nhreffynnon yn hurt.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A wnewch chi dderbyn ymyriad?

**Sandy Mewies:** Na wnaif.

Yr hyn sy'n fy synnu yw'r brwdfrydedd, mae'n ymddangos, gan y gwrthbleidiau, yn enwedig y Ceidwadwyr, dros y GIG. Dyma'r blaid a gaeodd ysbytai ledled Cymru pan oedd mewn grym, ac a gaeodd y rhan fwyaf o'r ysbytai milwrol yn y DU, rhywbeth y maent wedi anghofio'i grybwyll mewn dadleuon yn ddiweddar am driniaeth feddygol i bersonél milwrol.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A ildiwch?

**Sandy Mewies:** Yr wyf wedi dweud 'na' wrthy ch unwaith.

Maent bob amser wedi bod yn blaid sy'n gweld ei chyfle, ond mae bellach yn rhagori ar hynny ac yn dilyn pob llif. Yn fy etholaeth i, yr wyf wedi gweld Ceidwadwyr sydd am wneud eu marc yn ceisio portreadu eu hunain fel gwleidyddion a gyfrannodd at y gwaith o ddod â'n hysbyty newydd i Dreffynnon. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Yn waeth na hynny, maent wedi gwneud eu gorau i godi bwganod gyda deiseb sy'n galw am gadw'r ysbyty bwthyn presennol ar agor tra bydd ysbyty newydd y

Considering that the truth of the situation is that in-patient services are being transferred to Lluesty Hospital, a few hundred yards away, and that the number of beds will increase, what is the point of that petition?

Before I am accused of opportunism, I will just point out that it was a Liberal Democrat councillor who made that point and who called the petition 'misleading', while the North East Wales NHS Trust said that it was unsure of the purpose of the petition, as there are no plans to close the cottage hospital before the new hospital is opened. The trust says that the petition is, frankly, pointless. Therefore, Minister, do you agree that people in my constituency and throughout Wales should be made aware that the Conservatives' new-found enthusiasm for the NHS will never lead to the delivery of services? It never did in the past. Labour in the Assembly is the party that will deliver.

**Lisa Francis:** I speak to the amendments in my own name and in the names of Kirsty Williams and Jocelyn Davies. I will confine my comments to the situation in my region of Mid and West Wales.

The precursor, or foundation stone, to the consultation document, 'Designed to Deliver', was the mid and west Wales 'The Case for Change' document. That focused on redesign not relocation. It stated that redesign would offer high-quality alternatives, expanding options for developing new services that would meet local needs and expectations. That ideology was not properly followed through in the 'Designed to Deliver' consultation document, which outlined options that would have led to the downgrading of services currently offered in hospitals of district general status, as well as the relocation of some acute services to places that would involve many patients travelling by road distances of up to three and a half hours in mid and west Wales, quite often in an emergency.

The consultation document stated that the

dref, sy'n werth dros £11 miliwn, yn cael ei adeiladu. O gofio mai'r gwir yw bod gwasanaethau cleifion mewnol yn cael eu trosglwyddo i Ysbyty Lluesty, ychydig gannoedd o lathenni i ffwrdd, ac y bydd nifer y gwelyau'n cynyddu, beth yw diben y ddeiseb honno?

Cyn imi gael fy nghyhuddo o achub ar y cyfle, cyfeiriaf at y ffaith mai cynghorydd o blaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a wnaeth y pwynt hwnnw ac a ddywedodd fod y ddeiseb yn 'gamarweiniol'. Ond dywedodd Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru ei bod yn ansicr ynglŷn â diben y ddeiseb, gan nad oedd cynlluniau i gau'r ysbyty bwthyn cyn agor yr ysbyty newydd. Dywed yr ymddiriedolaeth fod y ddeiseb, mewn gwirionedd, yn ddibwrpas. Felly, Weinidog, a gytunwch y dylid gwneud pobl yn fy etholaeth i a ledled Cymru yn ymwybodol na fydd brwdfrydedd newydd ymhlith y Ceidwadwyr dros y GIG byth yn arwain at ddarparu gwasanaethau? Ni wnaeth hynny erioed yn y gorffennol. Llafur yn y Cynulliad yw'r blaid a fydd yn cyflawni.

**Lisa Francis:** Cyfeiriaf at y gwelliannau yn fy enw i ac yn enwau Kirsty Williams a Jocelyn Davies. Cyfyngaf fy sylwadau i'r sefyllfa yn fy rhanbarth i, sef Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru.

Rhagflaenydd, neu garreg sylfaen, y ddogfen ymgynghori 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi', oedd dogfen canolbarth a gorllewin Cymru 'The Case for Change'. Yr oedd honno'n canolbwyntio ar ailgynllunio, nid adleoli. Dywedai y byddai ailgynllunio'n cynnig dulliau amgen o safon uchel, gan ehangu'r dewisiadau ar gyfer datblygu gwasanaethau newydd a fyddai'n diwallu anghenion a disgwyliadau lleol. Ni ddilynwyd yr ideoleg honno'n briodol yn y ddogfen ymgynghori 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi', a oedd yn amlinellu dewisiadau a fyddai wedi arwain at gwtogi gwasanaethau a gynigir ar hyn o bryd mewn ysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth, yn ogystal â symud rhai gwasanaethau aciwt i fannau a fyddai'n golygu y byddai'n rhaid i nifer o gleifion deithio hyd at dair awr a hanner ar y ffordd yng nghanol a gorllewin Cymru, a hynny'n aml iawn mewn argyfwng.

Dywedai'r ddogfen ymgynghori fod yr

review was driven fundamentally by clinical sustainability and not by money, yet it is abundantly clear that detailed and costed options were lacking in the document.

4.30 p.m.

When asked about proposals, the chief executive of the Pembrokeshire Local Health Board, while acknowledging that the ambulance service would be one area that would require greater investment if these proposals came through, stated that the additional expense to the ambulance service will not be costed until the consultation period has ended.

Currently, in Ceredigion, it is difficult for health professionals to arrange ambulances for patient transfer. That is the situation there. It is not unknown for them to have to resort to calling 999 when an ambulance is needed urgently.

While this document articulated the fact that geography and the current pattern of hospital provision meant unequal access to services, and highlighted the importance of safety, quality, speed of delivery and effectiveness, the proposals completely disregarded the geographical isolation of many patients, towns and villages in mid and west Wales. They did not take into account the effect that the changes would have on patients and on the treatment received, to such an extent—and I have stated this many times in the Chamber—that I believe that the consultation document was fundamentally flawed, ill researched and lightweight from the outset.

As has been stated, people have responded to this consultation in droves. However, the truth is that to expect them to do so when such pathetic and paltry information was provided—it amounted to nothing more than a collection of ideas without predicated outcomes based on any reliable evidence—was an insult to their intelligence. Dr Dearden of the Welsh GP Committee of the British Medical Association commented that the proposals had high managerial input but were very light in looking at the effects that

adolygiad yn cael ei lywio yn y bôn gan gynaliadwyedd clinigol, nid gan arian. Eto i gyd mae'n gwbl eglur bod diffyg dewisiadau manwl, wedi'u costio yn y ddogfen.

Pan ofynnwyd iddo am gynigion, dywedodd prif weithredwr Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Sir Benfro, er ei fod yn cydnabod y byddai'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn un maes lle y byddai angen mwy o fuddsoddi pe bai'r cynigion hyn yn gweld golau ddydd, na fyddai'r gost ychwanegol i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn cael ei chostio nes i'r cyfnod ymgynghori ddod i ben.

Ar hyn o bryd, yng Ngheredigion, mae'n anodd i weithwyr iechyd proffesiynol drefnu cerbydau ambiwlans i drosglwyddo cleifion. Dyna'r sefyllfa yno. Nid yw'n anarferol iddynt ffonio 999 pan fydd angen ambiwlans ar frys.

Er bod y ddogfen hon wedi mynegi'r ffaith fod daearyddiaeth a phatrwm presennol y ddarpariaeth o ran ysbytai yn golygu mynediad anghyfartal i wasanaethau, ac er iddi dynnu sylw at bwysigrwydd diogelwch, safon, cyflymder y ddarpariaeth ac effeithiolrwydd, yr oedd y cynigion yn anwybyddu'n llwyr y ffaith fod nifer o gleifion, trefi a phentrefi wedi'u hynysu'n ddaearyddol yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin. Nid oeddent yn ystyried yr effaith a gâi'r newidiadau ar gleifion ac ar y driniaeth a gaent, i'r fath raddau—ac yr wyf wedi dweud hyn lawer gwaith yn y Siambr—fod y ddogfen ymgynghori yn ei hanfod yn ddiffygiol yn fy marn i, na wnaed digon o ymchwil a'i bod o'r cychwyn cyntaf yn ddisylwedd.

Fel y dywedwyd, mae lluo bobl wedi ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad hwn. Fodd bynnag, y gwir yw bod disgwyl iddynt wneud hynny pan ddarparwyd gwybodaeth mor druenus a diwerth—nid oedd yn ddim mwy na chasgliad o syniadau heb ganlyniadau priodolledig yn seiliedig ar unrhyw dystiolaeth ddibynadwy—yn sarhad ar eu deallusrwydd. Dywedodd Dr Dearden o Bwyllgor Meddygon Teulu Cymru, Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain fod rheolwyr wedi cyfrannu llawer at y cynigion ond prin

they might have on patients. He further stated that, despite a commitment to increase community services, it was surprising and concerning to find that there was no specific discussion in the document about district, community or public health nursing. How does this fit in with the decline in the number of district nurses witnessed in recent years? The Royal College of Nursing, in its response to the consultation, made a comparison with Scotland, where the Kerr report discussed detailed evidence surrounding the centralisation of services and specifically outlined the core services that would need to be provided by rural general district hospitals. Such a straightforward approach would have benefited this consultation enormously, but it was missing.

I will finish by mentioning Bronglais Hospital in Ceredigion. Bronglais, which is in Aberystwyth, has a blood bank, and the maternity unit is the main user of that bank. If this service is reconfigured as a midwife-led unit, less use will be made of the blood bank. That, coupled with the loss of the night surgery service, could be used to justify the loss of a service to deal with serious trauma or surgical emergencies arriving at the accident and emergency service—that applies to both adults and children. Where does that leave accident and emergency services at Aberystwyth? I think that it is the thin end of the wedge. Where does it leave recruitment and retention of medical staff?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You need to wind up.

**Lisa Francis:** I have been lobbied by dozens of parents of sick children who rely on Bronglais's open-door policy. These are the parents of children who have chronic illnesses and special needs.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Lisa, you need to wind up.

**Lisa Francis:** I would just like to add that this debate is not about statistics, but about human beings. I will be pleased to support the joint opposition amendments.

oedd yr ymchwilio i'r effeithiau y gallent eu cael ar gleifion. Dywedod hefyd, er gwaethaf ymrwymiad i gynyddu gwasanaethau cymunedol, ei bod yn syndod ac yn bryder gweld nad oedd unrhyw drafodaeth benodol yn y ddogfen am nyrsio ardal, nyrsio cymunedol na nyrsio ym maes iechyd cyhoeddus. Sut mae hyn yn cyd-fynd â'r gostyngiad yn nifer y nyrsys ardal a welwyd yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf? Gwnaeth Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys, yn ei ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad, gymhariaeth â'r Alban, lle yr oedd adroddiad Kerr yn trafod tystiolaeth fanwl am ganoli gwasanaethau, ac amlinellodd yn benodol y gwasanaethau craidd y byddai angen i ysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth gwledig eu darparu. Byddai dull uniongyrchol felly wedi bod yn fuddiol iawn i'r ymgynghoriad hwn, ond yr oedd ar goll.

Fe orffennaf drwy sôn am Ysbyty Bron-glais yng Ngheredigion. Mae gan Fron-glais yn Aberystwyth fanc gwaed, a'r uned famolaeth sy'n ei ddefnyddio'n bennaf. Os caiff y gwasanaeth hwn ei ailgyflunio fel uned o dan arweiniad bydwragedd, gwneir llai o ddefnydd o'r banc gwaed. Gellid defnyddio hynny, ynghyd â cholli'r gwasanaeth meddygfa nos, i gyfiawnhau colli gwasanaeth i ddelio ag argyfyngau trawma neu lawfeddygol difrifol yn y gwasanaeth damweiniau ac achosion brys—mae hynny'n berthnasol i oedolion a phlant. Beth mae hynny'n ei olygu i wasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn Aberystwyth? Credaf mai dechrau'r broblem yw hyn. Beth fydd y sefyllfa o ran recriwtio a chadw staff meddygol?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben.

**Lisa Francis:** Yr wyf wedi fy lobio gan ddwsinau o rieni plant sâl sy'n dibynnu ar y polisi drws agored ym Mron-glais. Rhieni plant sydd â salwch cronig ac anghenion arbennig yw'r rhain.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn, Lisa, mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben.

**Lisa Francis:** Hoffwn ychwanegu nad yw hon yn drafodaeth hon am ystadegau'n unig, ond mae'n ymwneud hefyd â bodau dynol. Byddaf yn falch cefnogi gwelliannu'r

gwrthbleidiau.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I should say for the benefit of Members—as I have noticed a few quizzical faces—that it is not that I have been asleep; I have allowed Lisa five minutes because there are only two speakers from that party. Similarly, the first speaker for the Liberal Democrats will also have five minutes. However, everyone else will have strictly three minutes.

**Catherine Thomas:** We all know that the vision and aim of ‘Designed for Life’ is to produce a world-class health service in Wales. For this to happen, some change is inevitable. However, I cannot support change that would take away key services from my constituents in Llanelli. I want to see both Llanelli’s Prince Philip Hospital and Glangwili Hospital in Carmarthen develop, as my constituents are served by both. Therefore, some of the options contained within ‘Designed to Deliver’ could never have secured my support. I have made my views very clear to my constituents. They not only have had to battle against some of the options in ‘Designed to Deliver’, but have fought and continue to fight against the recommendations in a review by the local health board of surgical provision in Carmarthenshire NHS Trust. In this review, and in ‘Designed to Deliver’, it is recommended that emergency surgery be removed from Llanelli and located at Glangwili. That is completely unacceptable, especially when one considers the population of Llanelli—it has a catchment area of 110,000 people—and the heavy industry that still exists there, given the dangers of such work.

That service can mean the difference between life and death. The people of the Llanelli constituency have spoken out, and I have been proud to stand alongside them in public meetings as their Assembly Member and also as a member of the committee for the improvement of hospital services. I have also supported a petition to retain services at Llanelli, which has now secured nearly 40,000 signatures, such is the strength of feeling about this. Let me make it clear that while I welcome the fact that recommendations are not being railroaded

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dylwn ddweud er lles Aelodau—gan imi sylwi bod rhai ohonoch yn edrych yn syn—nad wyf wedi bod yn cysgu; yr wyf wedi caniatáu i Lisa siarad am bum munud am mai dim ond dau siaradwr sydd o’r blaid honno. Yn yr un modd, caiff siaradwr cyntaf y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol bum munud hefyd. Fodd bynnag, dim ond tair munud a gaiff pawb arall.

**Catherine Thomas:** Gwyddom i gyd mai gweledigaeth a nod ‘Cynllun Oes’ yw cynhyrchu gwasanaeth iechyd o’r radd flaenaf yng Nghymru. Er mwyn gwneud hyn, mae rhywfaint o newid yn anochel. Fodd bynnag, ni allaf gefnogi newid a fyddai’n mynd â gwasanaethau allweddol o’r hetholaeth i yn Llanelli. Yr wyf am weld Ysbyty’r Tywysog Philip yn Llanelli ac Ysbyty Glangwili yng Nghaerfyrddin yn datblygu, am fod y ddau yn gwasanaethu fy etholwyr. Felly, ni allwn byth gefnogi rhai o’r dewisiadau yn ‘Cynllunio i Gyflenwi’. Yr wyf wedi mynegai fy marn yn glir wrth fy etholwyr. Nid yn unig y maent wedi gorfod brwydro yn erbyn rhai o’r dewisiadau yn ‘Cynllunio i Gyflenwi’, ond buont yn brwydro ac maent yn parhau i frwydro yn erbyn yr argymhellion mewn adolygiad o’r ddarpariaeth lawfeddygol yn Ymddiriedolaeth GIG sir Gaerfyrddin gan y bwrdd iechyd lleol. Yn yr adolygiad hwn, ac yn ‘Cynllunio i Gyflenwi’, argymhellir y dylid symud llawdriniaeth frys o Lanelli i Langwili. Mae hynny’n gwbl annerbyniol, yn enwedig pan ystyriwch boblogaeth Llanelli—mae ganddi dalgyrch o 110,000 o bobl—a’r diwydiannau trwm sy’n parhau i fodoli yno, o ystyried peryglon gwaith o’r fath.

Gall y gwasanaeth hwnnw olygu’r gwahaniaeth rhwng byw a marw. Mae pobl etholaeth Llanelli wedi lleisio’u barn, a bûm yn falch o’u cefnogi mewn cyfarfodydd cyhoeddus fel eu Haelod Cynulliad a hefyd fel aelod o’r pwyllgor ar gyfer gwella gwasanaethau ysbytai. Yr wyf hefyd wedi cefnogi deiseb i gadw gwasanaethau yn Llanelli, sydd â bron 40,000 o lofnodion erbyn hyn, cymaint yw’r gwrthwynebiad i hyn. Gadewch imi wneud yn glir fy mod yn croesawu’r ffaith nad yw argymhellion yn cael eu gorfodi’n gyflym a bod cynnig i



through and that there is a proposal to set up a planning forum in mid and west Wales, there are certain options that I will never be able to support, whether it is before or after the election.

We need to bring as many services as possible closer to the communities that they serve, and to engage the communities that we serve in the design and monitoring of services. Most of all, we need to listen to the people whom we serve. For that reason, I will not support the amendments, especially amendment 2, which would halt the preparation of a business case for phase 2 of the breast care unit at Prince Philip Hospital, which has been lobbied for locally for several years. These are the people whom I will listen to, and whom I represent, and they will be very interested in the views and the actions of some Assembly Members today.

**Jenny Randerson:** The Minister says that it is inconceivable that an amendment calling for the halt of the reconfiguration proposals until February 2007 could be carried by the Assembly. Minister, you—via your official—have written to Powys Local Health Board telling them not to do it until after the election. In case you have forgotten, the election is not until May. Therefore, if it is all right for Powys to defer its proposals until after May, why is it not all right for the rest of Wales to defer this until February to enable better guidance to be given to LHBs and trusts? It strikes me that there is a case of double standards here.

I want to clarify the issue about partial reconfiguration—there are two fundamental problems. One is with the way in which reconfiguration in most areas has only been about secondary care, and has not taken account of community care and primary care. Indeed, the ‘Designed to Deliver’ document acknowledges that there are many unanswered questions. In north Wales, the fact that there are many unanswered questions has been ignored, as far as I can see. It does not engender confidence in the public if you say that this is how you will deal with hospital services, and that there are many unanswered questions about what you

sefydlu fforwm cynllunio yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, ond mae rhai dewisiadau na allaf byth eu cefnogi, p'un a fydd hynny cyn neu ar ôl yr etholiad.

Mae angen inni ddod â chynifer â phosibl o wasanaethau yn nes at y cymunedau y maent yn eu gwasanaethau, ac ymgysylltu â'r cymunedau a wasanaethwn yn y gwaith o ddylunio a monitro gwasanaethau. Yn anad dim, mae angen inni wrando ar y bobl a wasanaethwn. Am y rheswm hwnnw, ni fyddaf yn cefnogi'r gwelliannau, yn enwedig gwelliant 2, a fyddai'n atal y gwaith o baratoi achos busnes ar gyfer cam 2 o uned gofal y fron yn Ysbyty'r Tywysog Philip, y bu llobio drosto'n lleol ers sawl blwyddyn. Dyma'r bobl y byddaf yn gwrandio arnynt ac yr wyf yn eu cynrychioli, a bydd ganddynt ddi-ddordeb mawr ym marn a gweithredoedd rhai o Aelodau'r Cynulliad heddiw.

**Jenny Randerson:** Dywed y Gweinidog ei bod yn anhredadwy y gallai gwelliant yn galw am atal y cynigion ailgyflunio tan fis Chwefror 2007 gael ei dderbyn gan y Cynulliad. Weindog, yr ydych—drwy eich swyddog—wedi ysgrifennu at Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys i ddweud wrtho am beidio â gwneud hynny tan ar ôl yr etholiad. Rhag ofn eich bod wedi anghofio, ni chynhelir yr etholiad tan fis Mai. Felly, os yw'n iawn i Bowys ohirio'i gynigion tan ar ôl mis Mai, pam na all gweddill Cymru ohirio hyn tan fis Chwefror er mwyn rhoi arweiniad gwell i BILlau ac ymddiriedolaethau? Mae'n ymddangos i mi fod hwn yn achos o safonau dwbl.

Hoffwn egluro mater ailgyflunio rhannol—mae yma ddwy broblem sylfaenol. Mae'r naill yn ymwneud â'r ffordd y mae ailgyflunio yn y rhan fwyaf o ardaloedd wedi ymwneud â gofal eilaidd yn unig, a heb ystyried gofal cymunedol a gofal sylfaenol. Yn wir, mae'r ddogfen 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi' yn cydnabod bod nifer o gwestiynau heb eu hateb. Hyd y gwelaf, yn y gogledd anwybyddwyd y ffaith fod llawer o gwestiynau heb eu hateb. Nid yw'n magu hyder ymhlith y cyhoedd os dywedwch mai dyma'r ffordd y byddwch yn ymdrin â gwasanaethau ysbytai, a bod llawer o gwestiynau heb eu hateb am yr hyn y

will do instead. That is why there is a reference to partial reconfiguration. To be fair, I visited Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust a few weeks ago, and it has learned the lessons of the mess elsewhere in Wales, and will bring forward a document in the near future that will deal with primary and secondary care—I do not know what its contents will be, but it will not be about a partial reconfiguration.

Whether you like it or not, Minister, there is a fear and perception among the public, and even among health professionals, that reconfiguration is not about improving the quality of services but an excuse for cost cutting and to balance the budget. Local health boards and trusts have only themselves to blame in many respects, because they have often dressed-up cost-cutting measures as improvements in the past.

4.40 p.m.

The second fundamental problem with the proposals is the way in which the consultation has been done. It is a complete denial of the meaning of the word 'consultation' in many people's eyes. I am not saying that they are not prepared to listen, but people think that they are not prepared to listen. To be fair, in west Wales, alternatives were put forward, but that has not always been the case in other places, and not all the alternatives have been properly worked through. Therefore, people have lost any confidence that they ever had. To be honest, Minister, one advantage of this little breathing space that we are offering you is that it gives you the opportunity to rethink how you carry out public consultation in order to bring back a little bit of credibility to the concept.

There are other issues that need to be taken forward as part of this amendment. Over the summer, I visited a number of hospitals—Glan Clwyd, Wrexham Maelor, Prince Charles, Bronglais, Aberaeron, Nevill Hall, Morriston and so on. I went specifically to hear what people were saying on all sides of the argument and to listen to people's views. Tremendous damage is being done at the moment by this process. Hospital reconfiguration must go hand in hand with

byddwch yn ei wneud yn lle hynny. Dyna pam mae yna gyfeiriad at ailgyflunio rhannol. A bod yn deg, ymwelais ag Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro rai wythnosau'n ôl, ac mae wedi dysgu gwersi'r llanast a wnaed mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Bydd yn cyflwyno dogfen yn y dyfodol agos a fydd yn ymdrin â gofal sylfaenol a gofal eilaidd—ni wn beth fydd y cynnwys, ond ni fydd yn ymwneud ag ailgyflunio rhannol.

P'un a ydych yn ei hoffi ai peidio, Weinidog, mae ofn a chanfyddiad ymhlith y cyhoedd, a hyd yn oed ymhlith gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol, nad yw ailgyflunio'n ymwneud â gwella safon gwasanaethau, ond yn esgus i dorri costau a mantoli'r gyllideb. Byrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau eu hunain sydd ar fai, oherwydd maent wedi cyflwyno mesurau i dorri costau fel gwelliannau yn y gorffennol.

Yr ail broblem sylfaenol gyda'r cynigion yw'r ffordd y gwnaed yr ymgynghori. I lawer o bobl, mae'n gwadu ystyr y gair 'ymgynghori' yn llwyr. Nid wyf yn dweud nad ydynt yn barod i wrando, ond mae pobl yn credu nad ydynt yn barod i wrando. A bod yn deg, cyflwynwyd dewisiadau gwahanol yn y gorllewin, ond nid felly bob amser mewn lleoedd eraill, ac nid ystyriwyd yr holl ddewisiadau gwahanol yn drylwyr. Felly, mae pobl wedi colli unrhyw hyder a oedd ganddynt erioed. A bod yn onest, Weinidog, un o fanteision yr ychydig amser ychwanegol hwn yr ydym yn ei gynnig ichi yw ei fod yn rhoi'r cyfle ichi ailystyried sut y byddwch yn rhoi'r ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus ar waith er mwyn rhoi rhywfaint o hygyrdd eto i'r cysyniad.

Mae materion eraill y mae angen eu hyrwyddo fel rhan o'r gwelliant hwn. Yn ystod yr haf, ymwelais â nifer o ysbytai—Glan Clwyd, Wrecsam Maelor, Tywysog Siarl, Bron-glais, Aberaeron, Neville Hall, Treforys, ac ati. Euthum yn arbennig i glywed barn pobl ar ddwy ochr y ddadl ac i wrando ar sylwadau pobl. Mae'r broses hon yn achosi llawer o niwed ar hyn o bryd. Rhaid i'r gwaith o ailgyflunio ysbytai fynd law yn llaw â chynnydd yn y ddarpariaeth

increased primary and community provision. That was the clear message that came across. Exactly how the reconfiguration will happen must be spelt out for people, rather than our going forward on a wing and a prayer.

From Singleton to Llandudno, from Bronglais to Bronllys, this is now seen as a hospital closure programme, rather than a health service improvement and modernisation programme. It will be difficult to rebuild credibility. We are giving you the opportunity of a breathing space in which to try to do that. If you do not take advantage of that, it will be a golden opportunity wasted.

**Carl Sargeant:** It is interesting that, today, the opposition is trying to wriggle out of its amendment, which quite clearly gives the instruction to halt, whereby Mark Isherwood is keen to stop the progress of the Holywell Community Hospital, and Helen Mary Jones is keen to stop progress in the Llanelli area. It is pretty disgraceful.

In light of the changes in population, workforce, technology and the estate, and the huge medical advancements made in recent times, a review of secondary care services in north Wales is both timely and necessary. In my response to 'Designed for North Wales', I broadly welcomed the proposals put forward. However, in order for the people of Alyn and Deeside to be best served, there are two important concerns that must be at the forefront of any decision making.

First, the evidence suggests that current usage of hospitals is unnecessarily high, and that the focus of the provision of care should shift towards using out-of-hospital care as the norm. 'Designed for North Wales' acknowledges that and states that:

'This means that some services will move closer to patients' own communities'.

It also states:

'This will be achieved in part by hospital-based services ... becoming more responsive to the needs of patients in primary and community care.'

syllfaenol a chymunedol. Dyna oedd y neges glir. Rhaid esbonio'n glir wrth bobl sut yn union y bydd y gwaith ailgyflunio yn digwydd, yn hytrach na mentro a gobeithio am y gorau.

O Singleton i Landudno, o Fron-glais i Fronllys, gwelir hyn bellach fel rhaglen i gau ysbytai, yn hytrach na rhaglen i wella a moderneiddio'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Bydd yn anodd adfer hygrededd. Yr ydym yn rhoi'r ychydig amser ichi wneud hynny. Os na fyddwch yn manteisio ar y cyfle hwnnw, byddwch wedi gwastraffu cyfle euraid.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae'n ddiddorol bod yr wrthblaid yn ceisio cefnu ar ei gwelliant heddiw, sy'n rhoi cyfarwyddyd clir i atal, lle mae Mark Isherwood yn awyddus i rwystro datblygiad Ysbyty Cymunedol Treffynnon, a Helen Mary Jones yn awyddus i rwystro datblygiad yn ardal Llanelli. Mae'n ddigon cywilyddus.

Yng ngoleuni'r newidiadau yn y boblogaeth, y gweithlu, technoleg a'r ystad, a'r datblygiadau meddygol enfawr a wnaed yn ddiweddar, mae adolygiad o wasanaethau gofal eilaidd yn y gogledd yn amserol ac yn angenrheidiol. Yn fy ymateb i 'Cynllun Gogledd Cymru', ar y cyfan yr oeddwn yn croesawu'r cynigion a gyflwynwyd. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn i bobl Alun a Dyfrdwy gael eu gwasanaethu yn y ffordd orau, mae dwy broblem bwysig y mae'n rhaid eu hystyried wrth wneud unrhyw benderfyniadau.

Yn gyntaf, mae'r dystiolaeth yn awgrymu bod y defnydd a wneir o ysbytai ar hyn o bryd yn ddiangen o uchel, ac y dylid symud y ffocws o ddarparu gofal at ofal y tu allan i'r ysbyty. Mae 'Cynllun Gogledd Cymru' yn cydnabod hynny ac yn dweud:

'Mae hyn yn golygu y bydd rhai gwasanaethau'n symud yn nes at gymunedau cleifion'.

Mae hefyd yn dweud:

'Bydd hyn yn digwydd wrth i wasanaethau ysbytai .... fod yn fwy ymatebol i anghenion cleifion o fewn gofal cychwynol ac yn y gymuned.'

Therefore, before any hospital closures or the cessation of certain treatments within a hospital context are undertaken, the primary care centres and community care bodies must be in place and fully functional. There is absolutely no place for a transition period during which treatments are not fully available either in hospitals or in the primary or community care context.

**Janet Ryder:** Do you not agree that a great deal of the care that is planned for north Wales is dependent on the right social care being ready and waiting in the community? Do you not also agree that it is incredibly hard to find any consultation or joint working with social services departments across north Wales to ensure that they have the capacity and plans to develop this care, and that, on those grounds alone, these plans are flawed?

**Carl Sargeant:** I remember making representations to the Minister about consultation in north Wales. He accepted that there were issues, and he extended the process in order for consultation on 'Designed for North Wales' with community health trusts and other bodies in the area.

The communities of Buckley, Connah's Quay and Hope in Alyn and Deeside in particular have been promised new primary healthcare centres, and as you know I have been keen to seek assurances that these practices will be in place at the earliest possible moment. I cannot support the reorganisation of secondary healthcare in north Wales until these primary healthcare centres are up and running and fully functional.

Attention to services for all Flintshire residents must be paramount in any decision-making as there is no access to any secondary care hospital within our community. For this reason, I seek assurances that there will be no reduction in the number of beds at Deeside Community Hospital, which serves the people of my constituency, Alyn and Deeside.

My major concern is that, in order for the old hospitals to function fully in their new roles,

Felly, cyn y caiff unrhyw ysbytai eu cau neu cyn y daw triniaethau penodol mewn ysbytai i ben, rhaid i'r canolfannau gofal sylfaenol a'r cyrff gofal cymunedol fod ar waith ac yn gwbl weithredol. Nid oes cyfle o gwbl am gyfnod pontio pan na fydd triniaethau ar gael yn llawn naill ai mewn ysbytai neu yng nghyd-destun gofal sylfaenol neu ofal cymunedol.

**Janet Ryder:** Oni chytunwch fod llawer o'r gofal a gynllunnir ar gyfer y gogledd yn ddibynnol ar y cwestiwn a yw'r gofal cymdeithasol cywir ar gael yn y gymuned? Oni chytunwch hefyd ei bod yn eithriadol o anodd dod o hyd i unrhyw ymgynghori neu gydweithio ag adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ledled y gogledd i sicrhau bod ganddynt yr adnoddau a'r cynlluniau i ddatblygu'r gofal hwn, ac ar y sail honno'n unig bod y cynlluniau hyn yn ddiffygiol?

**Carl Sargeant:** Cofiaf gyflwyno sylwadau i'r Gweinidog ynglŷn ag ymgynghori yn y gogledd. Derbyniodd fod problemau, ac ehangodd y broses er mwyn ymgynghori am 'Cynllun Gogledd Cymru' gydag ymddiriedolaethau iechyd cymunedol a chyrrff eraill yn yr ardal.

Addawyd canolfannau gofal iechyd sylfaenol newydd i gymunedau Bwcle, Cei Connah a'r Hob yn Alun a Dyfrdwy yn benodol, ac fel y gwyddoch, bŵm yn awyddus i gael sicrwydd y bydd y practisau hyn ar waith cyn gynted â phosibl. Ni allaf gefnogi'r gwaith o ad-drefnu gofal iechyd eilaidd yn y gogledd nes bydd y canolfannau gofal iechyd sylfaenol hyn wedi'u sefydlu ac yn hollol weithredol.

Rhaid i'r sylw a roddir i'r gwasanaethau a gaiff holl drigolion sir y Fflint fod yn rhan hollbwysig o unrhyw broses o wneud penderfyniadau, gan nad oes unrhyw ysbyty gofal eilaidd yn ein cymuned. Oherwydd hyn, hoffwn gael sicrwydd na fydd unrhyw leihad yn nifer y gwelyau yn Ysbyty Cymuned Glannau Dyfrdwy, sy'n gwasanaethu pobl fy etholaeth i, Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy.

Fy mhrif bryder yw hyn:er mwyn i'r hen ysbytai allu gweithredu'n llawn yn eu rolau

with their new priorities for care provision, the necessary structures must be put in place before the change of roles commences. These necessary structures might include new staffing structures and new technological investments, along with the adaptation of the estate's capital assets so that the new roles can be carried out effectively.

Both of these issues must be addressed as a matter of urgency. We have a great opportunity to transform the provision of healthcare in north Wales and make huge improvements, but we must get the foundations right.

**Mark Isherwood:** I start by stating, on the record, that I have always publicly supported Holywell Hospital, and will continue to do so. My only regret is that the number of beds in the new hospital represents a big cut on the number of beds in Flint and Holywell. To say otherwise, under the protection of parliamentary privilege, is absolutely disgraceful; it represents the backdrop of the culture that you come from in that corrupt local party. [*Interruption.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I have not heard anything that is out of order. It would be quite wrong for Mark to call a person—an Assembly Member—corrupt. Calling a party corrupt is not out of order, although I will reflect on it.

**Mark Isherwood:** Clwyd Community Health Council stated that the public remains sceptical that the transfer of work from secondary care into the primary care setting will be properly resourced and planned. It sees little evidence of clinical governance and resourcing having been discussed in any great depth, and concludes that it is unable to support the proposals as they currently stand.

Community health councils in Conwy have now declared broad support for the changes, but provided that no services will be transferred from hospitals without sufficient capacity being available.

Campaigners who oppose the plans to downgrade Llandudno hospital and close St

newydd, gyda'u blaenoriaethau newydd ar gyfer darparu gofal, mae'n rhaid sefydlu'r strwythurau angenrheidiol cyn dechrau newid y rolau. Gallai'r strwythurau angenrheidiol hyn gynnwys strwythurau staffio newydd a buddsoddiadau technolegol newydd, ynghyd â chynllun i addasu asedau cyfalaf yr ystad fel y gellir cyflawni'r rolau newydd yn effeithiol.

Rhaid mynd i'r afael â'r ddau fater hyn ar fyrder. Mae gennym gyfle gwych i drawsnewid y ddarpariaeth gofal iechyd yn y gogledd a gwneud gwelliannau anferth, ond rhaid inni gael y sylfeini'n gywir.

**Mark Isherwood:** Dechreuaf drwy ddweud a chofnodi fy mod bob amser wedi cefnogi Ysbyty Treffynnon yn gyhoeddus, a byddaf yn parhau i wneud hynny. Fy unig bryder yw bod nifer y gwelyau yn yr ysbyty newydd yn golygu gostyngiad sylweddol yn nifer y gwelyau yn y Fflint a Threffynnon. Byddai dweud yn wahanol, o dan ddiogelwch braint seneddol, yn hollol warthus; mae'n dangos cefndir y diwylliant sydd gennych yn y blaid leol lygredig honno. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid wyf wedi clywed dim sydd allan o drefn. Byddai'n anghywir i Mark alw person—Aelod o'r Cynulliad—yn llygredig. Nid yw galw plaid yn llygredig allan o drefn, er y byddaf yn ystyried hynny.

**Mark Isherwood:** Dywedodd Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned Clwyd fod y cyhoedd yn amau o hyd a gaiff y broses o drosglwyddo gwaith o ofal eilaidd i'r lleoliad gofal sylfaenol ei hariannu a'i chynllunio'n briodol. Nid oes llawer o dystiolaeth fod llywodraethu clinigol ac adnoddau wedi'u trafod yn fanwl o gwbl, a daw i'r casgliad na all gefnogi'r cynigion fel y maent ar hyn o bryd.

Mae cynghorau iechyd cymuned yng Nghonwy bellach wedi datgan cefnogaeth gyffredinol i'r newidiadau, ar yr amod na chaiff unrhyw wasanaethau eu trosglwyddo o ysbytai heb sicrhau bod digon o adnoddau ar gael.

Mae ymgyrchwyr sy'n gwrthwynebu'r cynlluniau i israddio ysbyty Llandudno a

Asaph and Abergele hospitals have described this as a climb down. Llandudno Hospital League of Friends told us this morning that it hopes to join campaigners from Prestatyn, Blaenau Ffestiniog and across Wales at the rally at the Assembly next Wednesday against the Assembly Government's disastrous community hospital closure programme.

Agreement to reconsider breast surgery at Llandudno only happened after inaccuracies and omissions in the 'Designed for North Wales' document were highlighted by consultant surgeon, Christopher Davies. As the Llandudno Hospital League of Friends states:

'acute bed capacity is already inadequate to meet demand and further reduction will...lead to deterioration in...the health system in the region'.

**Denise Idris Jones** *rose*—

**Mark Isherwood:** I do not have time, Denise; I have had enough from your party today.

The league of friends adds that:

'if this happens in North Wales, the responsibility will be with the Welsh Assembly Government'.

The Assembly Government claims to support care closer to home, recognising that the burden of disease is changing as people live longer. However, we see instead a pattern of bed losses, cuts, closures and centralisation. It is Assembly Government policy that dictates how much money the local health boards and NHS bodies have to spend and exactly how that money is spent. It must not be allowed to pass the buck any longer. Ministers must stop theorising about local health care being as easy as a trip to the supermarket.

Public consultation has been rushed through, with people often unaware that meetings

chau ysbytai Llanelwy ac Abergele wedi dweud bod y cynghorau iechyd cymuned wedi troi yn eu carn. Dywedodd Cynghrair Cyfeillion Ysbyty Llandudno wrthym y bore yma eu bod yn gobeithio ymuno ag ymgyrchwyr o Brestatyn a Blaenau Ffestiniog ac ymgyrchwyr eraill o bob cwr o Gymru yn y rali yn y Cynulliad ddydd Mercher nesaf yn erbyn rhaglen drychinebus Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gau ysbytai cymuned.

Dim ond ar ôl i'r llawfeddyg ymgynghorol, Christopher Davies, dynnu sylw at y gwallau a'r wybodaeth sydd heb ei chynnwys yn y ddogfen 'Cynllun Gogledd Cymru' y cytunwyd i ailystyried cynnal llawdriniaethau'r fron yn Llandudno. Fel y dywedodd Cynghrair Cyfeillion Ysbyty Llandudno:

mae nifer y gwelyau aciwt eisoes yn annigonol i fodloni'r galw, a bydd gostyngiad pellach...yn arwain at ddirywiad yn...y system iechyd yn y rhanbarth.

**Denise Idris Jones** *a gododd*—

**Mark Isherwood:** Nid oes gennyf amser, Denise; yr wyf wedi clywed digon gan eich plaid heddiw.

Mae'r cynghrair cyfeillion yn ychwanegu:

os bydd hyn yn digwydd yn y gogledd, Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fydd yn gyfrifol am hynny.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn honni ei bod yn cefnogi gofal yn nes at gartrefi, gan gydnabod bod baich y afiechyd yn newid wrth i bobl fyw'n hŷn. Fodd bynnag, yn hytrach gwelwn batrwm o ostyngiad yn nifer y gwelyau, toriadau, ysbytai'n cau a chael eu canoli. Polisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sy'n pennu faint o arian sydd gan fyrddau iechyd lleol a chyrrff y GIG i'w wario a sut yn union y caiff yr arian hwnnw ei wario. Ni ddylid caniatáu iddi fwrw'r cyfrifoldeb mwyach. Rhaid i weinidogion roi'r gorau i ddamcaniaethu bod gofal iechyd lleol mor syml â thaith i'r archfarchnad.

Mae ymgynghori cyhoeddus wedi ei wthio drwodd ar frys, a phobl yn aml heb wybod

were even being held. Only one person attended a meeting in Mold and just two people in Holywell. The meeting in Marchwiel had to be cancelled due to poor demand and only five people attended the meeting in Wrexham. Independent research in north Wales confirmed that 86 per cent were unaware that local health boards were holding public consultations, but 89 per cent said that they would attend these meetings if they were aware of them.

This consultation has ignored the recruitment freeze affecting nurses, which affected newly qualified nurses in Wrexham this month. *[Interruption.]*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This could become bad-tempered. We have to have a decent debate. I intervened on Mark due to circumstances in the Chamber. I think that he has 30 seconds left.

**Mark Isherwood:** It has ignored concerns by the Royal College of Nursing Cymru about the shortage of district nurses, community public health nurses and social care services. It has ignored concerns by the Welsh Local Government Association that the current care system is unsustainable. It has ignored concerns expressed by Care Forum Wales that the Welsh Assembly Government underfunding has reduced nursing care capacity. *[Interruption.]*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Mark Isherwood:** It failed to consult our hospices, which state that it:

‘is folly to cut beds for an ageing population’.

They will be in the Assembly on 28 November.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Your time is up. I call Jeff Cuthbert.

4.50 p.m.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Thank you, Deputy Presiding

bod cyfarfodydd yn cael eu cynnal hyd yn oed. Dim ond un person a fu mewn cyfarfod yn yr Wyddgrug a dau yn Nhreffynnon. Bu'n rhaid canslo'r cyfarfod ym Marchwiail oherwydd diffyg diddordeb a dim ond pum person a fu yn y cyfarfod yn Wrecsam. Cadarnhaodd ymchwil annibynnol yn y gogledd nad oedd 86 y cant yn ymwybodol bod byrddau iechyd lleol yn cynnal ymgynghoriadau cyhoeddus, ond dywedodd 89 y cant y byddent yn mynychu'r cyfarfodydd hyn pe byddent yn gwybod amdanynt.

Mae'r ymgynghori hwn wedi anwybyddu'r penderfyniad i rewi prosesau recriwtio sy'n effeithio ar nyrsys, ac yr oedd hynny'n effeithio ar nyrsys newydd gymhwyso yn Wrecsam y mis hwn. *[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Gallai hyn droi'n gas. Rhaid inni gael trafodaeth weddus. Torrais ar draws Mark oherwydd amgylchiadau yn y Siambr. Credaf fod ganddo 30 eiliad ar ôl.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae wedi anwybyddu pryderon Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys Cymru ynghylch y diffyg nyrsys ardal, nyrsys iechyd cyhoeddus cymunedol a gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol. Mae wedi anwybyddu pryderon Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru na ellir cynnal y system ofal bresennol. Mae wedi anwybyddu pryderon Fforwm Gofal Cymru fod y tanariannu gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi gostwng capasiti gofal nyrsio. *[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae wedi methu ag ymgynghori â'n hosbisau, sy'n dweud:

mai ffolineb yw lleihau nifer y gwelyau ar gyfer poblogaeth sy'n heneiddio.

Byddant yn y Cynulliad ar 28 Tachwedd.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae eich amser ar ben. Galwaf ar Jeff Cuthbert.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd;

Officer; I will try to be calm.

In the Caerphilly constituency, we completed our proposals for the reconfiguration of hospital and community services some time ago. We secured public support for the new models of care, through a process of open dialogue and debate. Indeed, the additional investment, and the case for change, is introducing higher and more demanding clinical standards. It is then vital that the public understands the changes as delivering modern, safe, flexible, community-based healthcare, backed up by twenty-first century hospital services. The outcome of talks with interested groups and local communities on the borough's reconfiguration of local services has been positive. Their views shaped the selection of options and the subsequent preferred solutions. The public remains strongly in favour of modern services, delivered flexibly and professionally.

A new £130 million local general hospital for the borough, to be built in Ystrad Fawr at Ystrad Mynach, is widely welcomed. It is right that this is seen as the heart of the current reconfiguration proposals. My constituents will understand that this important development could be at risk if amendment 2 is carried. My constituents understand plain English, and know what 'instructs to halt plans' means. This scheme, along with the new hospital for Blaenau Gwent, are flagship schemes, taking place within broader reconfiguration proposals in the Gwent area, which are currently the subject of a formal 'Clinical Futures' consultation, which is due to end in a few weeks' time.

The health service plan for south-east Wales underlines the need for reconfiguration. The demographic trends of Caerphilly borough point to an ageing population, with one in three people being 45 years or older, a 15 per cent drop in children aged four or under, and one in five households currently living on £10,000 a year or less. As a result, the borough will need far more health and social services delivered in the community. This needs to be focused on health promotion,

ceisiaf beidio â gwylltio.

Yn etholaeth Caerffili, cwblhawyd ein cynigion ar gyfer ailgyflunio gwasanaethau ysbyty a gwasanaethau cymuned beth amser yn ôl. Sicrhawyd cefnogaeth y cyhoedd ar gyfer y modelau gofal newydd, drwy broses o ddeialog a thrafodaeth agored. Yn wir, mae'r buddsoddiad ychwanegol, a'r achos dros newid, yn dod â safonau clinigol uwch a mwy heriol. Felly, mae'n hanfodol i'r cyhoedd ddeall bod y newidiadau'n sicrhau gofal iechyd modern, diogel a hyblyg yn y gymuned, yn cael ei ategu gan wasanaethau ysbyty'r unfed ganrif ar hugain. Mae canlyniadau sgysiau gyda grwpiau sydd â diddordeb a chymunedau lleol ar ailgyflunio gwasanaethau lleol yn y fwrdeistref wedi bod yn gadarnhaol. Llywiodd eu safbwyntiau y broses o ddewis opsiynau a'r atebion dewisol o ganlyniad i hynny. Mae'r cyhoedd yn dal yn gadarn o blaid gwasanaethau modern sy'n cael eu darparu mewn modd hyblyg a phroffesiynol.

Mae croeso mawr i ysbyty cyffredinol lleol newydd gwerth £130 miliwn i'r fwrdeistref, a gaiff ei adeiladu yn Ystrad Fawr yn Ystrad Mynach. Mae'n briodol fod hyn yn cael ei ystyried fel canolbwynt i'r cynigion presennol ar gyfer ailgyflunio. Bydd fy etholwyr yn deall y gallai'r datblygiad pwysig hwn fod mewn perygl os caiff gwelliant 2 ei dderbyn. Mae fy etholwyr yn deall iaith glir, ac maent yn deall ystyr 'cyfarwyddo i atal cynlluniau'. Mae'r cynllun hwn, ynghyd â'r ysbyty newydd ar gyfer Blaenau Gwent, yn gynlluniau blaenllaw, sy'n digwydd o fewn cynigion ehangach i ailgyflunio yn ardal Gwent. Y rhain yw testun yr ymgynghoriad 'Dyfodol Clinigol' ffurfiol ar hyn o bryd, a ddaw i ben ymhen ychydig wythnosau.

Mae cynllun y gwasanaeth iechyd ar gyfer y de ddwyrain yn tanlinellu'r angen am ailgyflunio. Mae tueddiadau demograffig bwrdeistref Caerffili yn dangos poblogaeth sy'n heneiddio, gydag un person o bob tri yn 45 oed neu'n hŷn, gostyngiad o 15 y cant yn nifer y plant pedair oed neu iau, ac un o bob pum cartref yn byw ar £10,000 y flwyddyn neu lai. O ganlyniad, bydd angen i'r fwrdeistref ddarparu llawer mwy o wasanaethau iechyd a gwasanaethau



supporting independent living in the community, and placing the management of chronic diseases, such as diabetes and respiratory conditions, at the heart of the new structures. However, at the end of the day, feeling confident that your healthcare will be modern, reliable and secure is fundamental to the principles on which the NHS was founded. Delivering services that are modern and free at the point of use is essential if we are to keep high levels of confidence in the NHS.

**Janet Ryder:** Much has been made today about plans being stopped. What people in north Wales want is a guarantee from the Minister that the current capital needs of the present trusts—in Glan Clwyd and Gwynedd hospitals, which have great capital needs—will not be stopped, and do not have to be found through this reconfiguration. That is what people in north Wales feel is driving the reconfiguration there. We have not had the assurance from the Minister about that capital money. If you have taken part in any of the discussions, you will know that that has been the tone of the feeling that has come through from people who have been speaking—the trusts need these plans to go ahead to release the money for their services now, not to develop new services in the future.

It is interesting that these plans are supposed to represent what people want, and are supposed to represent the present needs of health communities. You said yourself, Minister, on 1 February in the Chamber that,

‘No community hospital will close in Wales if it continues to meet the needs of its health community.’

I am sure that you are aware of what the Royal College of Nursing says about Abergele Hospital; it makes clear that,

‘Abergele Hospital benefits tremendously from only dealing with elective care. Infection rates are significantly lower than the national average because non-elective patients are not admitted to hospital as acute

cymdeithasol yn y gymuned. Mae angen i hyn ganolbwyntio ar hybu iechyd, cynorthwyo pobl i fyw’n annibynnol yn y gymuned, a gosod y gwaith o reoli clefydau cronig, fel diabetes a chyflyrau anadlol, wrth wraidd y strwythurau newydd. Fodd bynnag, yn y pen draw, mae teimlo’n hyderus y bydd eich gofal iechyd yn fodern, yn ddibynadwy ac yn ddiogel yn hanfodol i’r egwyddorion y sefydlwyd y GIG arnynt. Mae darparu gwasanaethau modern yn rhad ac am ddim yn hanfodol er mwyn cynnal lefelau uchel o hyder yn y GIG.

**Janet Ryder:** Soniwyd llawer heddiw am atal cynlluniau. Yr hyn y mae pobl yn y gogledd am ei gael yw sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog na chaiff anghenion cyfalaf presennol yr ymddiriedolaethau presennol—yn ysbytai Glan Clwyd a Gwynedd, lle mae anghenion cyfalaf sylweddol—eu hatal, ac na fydd yn rhaid eu hariannu drwy’r broses ailgyflunio hon. Dyna y mae pobl yn y gogledd yn teimlo sy’n arwain y broses ailgyflunio yno. Nid ydym wedi cael y sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog ynghylch y cyllid cyfalaf hwnnw. Os ydych wedi cymryd rhan yn unrhyw rai o’r trafodaethau, byddwch yn gwybod mai dyna yw’r argraff sydd gan bobl sydd wedi bod yn siarad—bod ar yr ymddiriedolaethau angen i’r cynlluniau hyn fynd rhagdynt er mwyn rhyddhau’r arian ar gyfer eu gwasanaethau yn awr, nid er mwyn datblygu gwasanaethau newydd yn y dyfodol.

Mae’n ddiddorol bod y cynlluniau hyn i gynrychioli’r hyn y mae pobl am ei gael, a’u bod i gynrychioli anghenion presennol cymunedau iechyd. Dywedasoeh eich hun, Weinidog, ar 1 Chwefror yn y Siambr,

‘Ni fydd yr un ysbyty cymuned yng Nghymru yn cau os yw’n parhau i ddiwallu anghenion ei gymuned iechyd.’

Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol o’r hyn y mae Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys yn ei ddweud am Ysbyty Abergele; mae’n gwneud yn glir,

bod Ysbyty Abergele yn elwa’n sylweddol o fod yn delio â gofal dewisol yn unig. Mae cyfraddau heintiau lawer yn is na’r cyfartaledd cenedlaethol gan na chaiff cleifion nad ydynt yn cael gofal dewisol eu

admissions. If this site is closed, infection rates are likely to increase, causing a higher number of failed joint replacements and increased revision requirements. Subsequently this will result in higher unit cost both to the trust and to the patient.'

It is the Royal College of Nursing saying that. It also says that,

'beds on the acute site are extremely unlikely to remain specifically set aside or ring-fenced for this particular type of care. As pressure to use these beds for other reasons increases this will in turn increase the cancellation of surgery due to lack of beds.'

That is the basic fear in north Wales. We are seeing services being withdrawn and put into the acute centres, like Glan Clwyd, Gwynedd and Wrexham Maelor hospitals. Those services will not be available in the community and no-one has given us assurances.

As regards Llandudno hospital, it has already been said that acute and coronary services will be moved from that site. Unfortunately, the community health council has agreed to that; it has also agreed to look at developing the breast care services there. I hope that your assurance to Denise that that hospital will be safe does manifest itself, Minister, because if there is any doubt that the future of Llandudno hospital is unsafe, then the tens of thousands of people who signed petitions in north Wales to keep that hospital will be extremely unhappy.

To return to the premise that these plans are supposed to show what people want—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I am afraid not.

**Christine Chapman:** It is worth reminding ourselves, in this debate, what reconfiguration is about: it is about establishing better services. There is a danger of oversimplifying the issue to parochial

derbyn i'r ysbyty i gael gofal aciwt. Os caiff y safle hwn ei gau, mae cyfraddau heintiau'n debygol o gynyddu, gan arwain at gynnydd yn nifer y llawdriniaethau cymalau newydd sy'n methu a chynnydd mewn gofynion adolygu. O ganlyniad, bydd hyn yn arwain at gostau uned uwch i'r ymddiriedolaeth ac i'r claf.

Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys sy'n dweud hynny. Mae hefyd yn dweud,

bod gwelyau ar y safle aciwt yn annhebygol iawn o gael eu cadw'n benodol neu eu neilltuo ar gyfer y math penodol hwn o ofal. Wrth i'r pwysau gynyddu i ddefnyddio'r gwelyau hyn am resymau eraill, bydd hyn yn ei dro yn cynyddu nifer y llawdriniaethau sy'n cael eu canslo oherwydd diffyg gwelyau.

Dyna'r ofn sylfaenol yn y gogledd. Yr ydym yn gweld gwasanaethau'n cael eu diddymu a'u symud i'r canolfannau aciwt, fel ysbytai Glan Clwyd, Gwynedd a Wrecsam Maelor. Ni fydd y gwasanaethau hynny ar gael yn y gymuned, ac nid oes neb wedi rhoi sicrwydd inni.

O ran ysbyty Llandudno, dywedwyd eisoes y bydd gwasanaethau aciwt a choronaidd yn symud o'r safle hwnnw. Yn anffodus, mae'r cyngor iechyd cymuned wedi cytuno i hynny; mae hefyd wedi cytuno i edrych ar ddatblygu gwasanaethau gofal y fron yno. Gobeithio y bydd eich sicrwydd i Denise y bydd yr ysbyty hwnnw'n ddiogel yn cael ei wireddu, Weinidog, oherwydd os bydd unrhyw amheuaeth nad yw dyfodol ysbyty Llandudno yn ddiogel, yna bydd y degau o filoedd o bobl a lofnododd ddeisebau yn y gogledd i gadw'r ysbyty hwnnw yn anhapus iawn.

I ddychwelyd at y gynsail bod y cynlluniau hyn i fod i ddangos beth y mae pobl am ei gael—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw hynny'n bosibl.

**Christine Chapman:** Mae'n werth atgoffa ein hunain, yn y ddadl hon, o'r hyn y mae ailgyflunio'n ei olygu: mae'n golygu sefydlu gwasanaethau gwell. Mae perygl o orsymleiddio'r mater i fuddiannau cyfyng na

interests that will not bring about the changes that we want to see. In terms of south-east Wales, and more specifically the Merthyr and Rhondda Cynon Taf health community, we should not prejudge the proposal that will be submitted at the end of this year. I will be making a considered response based upon the evidence of what is clinically effective, sustainable in the long term and best for patients in my constituency.

On the hospital serving the Merthyr and Cynon area, given that it represents people with some of the greatest health inequalities in Wales, Prince Charles Hospital requires considerable investment. It has a big role to play in meeting those health needs. I ask the Minister to give assurances on its future, given the negative stories that are circulating at the moment, which are deeply upsetting for staff—who we need at the front line to deliver these excellent services. I eagerly await the proposals on changes in this area, so that I can examine them.

We need to remember that the royal colleges advised that a critical mass of 300,000 people is required to provide throughput of patients to generate sufficient procedures to retain clinicians' expertise and specialities. Where this may not be possible, the guidance is that hospitals serving smaller populations should work closely with adjacent services. We cannot ignore such guidance, and, in this sense, I agree with what Jonathan Morgan and Jenny Randerson said yesterday. It will be interesting to see if that approach is consistent with the way that this debate pans out, or whether we end up with clinical standards and advice being exalted one day and binned the following, by way of supporting amendment 2.

Turning to amendment 2, the opposition wants full hospital services serving each population of 150,000. I am curious to know what they define as 'full hospital services'.

**Helen Mary Jones** *rose*—

**Christine Chapman:** Do they mean every service provided by a hospital? In that case,

fyddant yn sicrhau'r newidiadau yr ydym am eu cael. O ran y de ddwyrain, ac yn fwy penodol cymuned iechyd Merthyr a Rhondda Cynon Taf, ni ddylem ragfarnu'r cynnig a gaiff ei gyflwyno ddiwedd y flwyddyn eleni. Byddaf yn cyflwyno ymateb pwylllog yn seiliedig ar y dystiolaeth o'r hyn sy'n effeithiol yn glinigol, yn gynaliadwy yn yr hirdymor ac sydd orau i'r cleifion yn fy etholaeth.

O ran yr ysbyty sy'n gwasanaethu ardal Merthyr a Chynon, o gofio'i fod yn cynrychioli pobl sydd â rhai o'r anghydraddoldebau iechyd mwyaf yng Nghymru, mae angen buddsoddiad sylweddol yn Ysbyty'r Tywysog Siarl. Mae ganddo rôl bwysig i'w chwarae i ddiwallu'r anghenion iechyd hynny. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog roi sicrwydd am ei ddyfodol, o ystyried y straeon negyddol sydd ar led ar hyn o bryd, sy'n peri gofid mawr i staff—y mae arnom angen y rheini yn y rheng flaen i ddarparu'r gwasanaethau ardderchog hyn. Edrychaf ymlaen at gael cyfle i archwilio'r cynigion ar newidiadau yn yr ardal hon.

Mae angen inni gofio bod y colegau brenhinol wedi dweud bod angen màs critigol o 300,000 o bobl i ddarparu digon o gleifion i greu gweithdrefnau digonol i gadw arbenigeddau a phrofiad clinigwyr. Lle na fydd hyn yn bosibl, yr arweiniad yw y dylai ysbytai sy'n gwasanaethu poblogaethau llai weithio'n agos gyda gwasanaethau cyfagos. Ni allwn anwybyddu arweiniad felly ac, yn y cyd-destun hwn, cytunaf â'r hyn a ddywedodd Jonathan Morgan a Jenny Randerson ddoe. Bydd yn ddiddorol gweld a yw'r dull hwnnw'n gyson â'r ffordd y mae'r ddadl hon yn datblygu, ynteu a fydd safonau a chyngor clinigol yn cael eu canmol heddiw a'u hatal yfory, drwy gefnogi gwelliant 2.

I droi at welliant 2, mae'r gwrthbleidiau am weld gwasanaethau ysbyty cyflawn yn gwasanaethu pob poblogaeth o 150,000. Yr wyf yn awyddus i gael gwybod beth mae 'gwasanaethau ysbyty cyflawn' yn ei olygu.

**Helen Mary Jones** *a gododd*—

**Christine Chapman:** A ydynt yn golygu pob gwasanaeth a ddarperir gan ysbyty? Os felly,

they are naive, as you cannot have every single specialty at every setting. That would be dangerous. If someone has a very specialised need, such as a constituent who I met recently with a very atypical condition, surely what they want is the best service available from the best clinicians in that field, whose expertise is not diluted by seeing an inadequate number of patients. The opposition is misleading people if it expects that that level of specialist care can be provided at every location. Would opposition members not want the best possible care for someone who is close to them?

maent yn naïf, gan na ellir cael pob arbenigedd ym mhob lleoliad. Byddai hynny'n beryglus. Os oes gan rywun angen arbenigol iawn, fel etholwr y cyfarfûm ag ef yn ddiweddar a oedd â chyflwr annodweddiadol iawn, onid yr hyn sydd ei angen arnynt yw'r gwasanaeth gorau sydd ar gael gan y clinigwyr gorau yn y maes hwnnw nad yw eu harbenigedd yn cael ei wanhau drwy fethu gweld nifer digonol o gleifion. Mae'r gwrthbleidiau'n camarwain pobl os ydynt yn disgwyl y gellir darparu'r lefel honno o ofal arbenigol ym mhob lleoliad. Oni fyddai aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau'n awyddus i weld y gofal gorau posibl yn cael ei roi i rywun agos?

### Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.21, extends today's Plenary meeting until 6.00 p.m.*

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, yn ymestyn Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw tan 6.00 p.m.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Are there 10 Members in support of this proposal? I see that there are.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** A oes 10 Aelod yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn? Gwelaf fod.

*Cynnig: O blaid 35, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.*

*Motion: For 35, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Elin

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Lewis, Huw

Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

5.00 p.m.

**Y Cynnydd a wnaed mewn perthynas â Thri Chynllun Ailgyflunio Rhanbarthol  
 y GIG: Parhad**  
**Progress made in relation to the Three NHS Regional Reconfiguration Plans:  
 Continued**

**Eleanor Burnham:** I hope that ‘Designed for North Wales’ will not turn out to be designed for disaster. I believe that there has been a lack of meaningful dialogue and consultation. Surely, the care and dignity of the patient should be at the centre of healthcare in a civilised society such as ours. Wanless is only a tool, not a bible. I believe, very strongly, that it has not factored in many issues that are extremely relevant, such as demographic changes, transport, which is particularly pertinent and troublesome in north Wales, out-of-hours services and the ambulance service. The other night, I went to hear concerns about the new neo-natal unit at Wrexham Maelor Hospital; it is of great concern that families with youngsters, or older patients, will have to be transported from Wrexham Maelor to Ysbyty Glan Clwyd. That is just not on because the transport is not there. Bearing in mind what Christine Chapman has just said—it was a laudable sentiment about wanting the best care—best care does not just mean the best possible specialists; surely, it also means having the nearest possible care to your home as well as quality care. If you have to be transported 50 miles after having had care from the best possible specialists, and then other things come into play because people have to be transported, that is a very big issue. With those few words—

**Eleanor Burnham:** Gobeithio na fydd ‘Cynllun Gogledd Cymru’ yn gynllun ar gyfer trychineb. Credaf fod diffyg trafodaeth ystyrllon ac ymgynghori wedi bod. Onid gofal ac urddas y claf ddylai fod yn ganolog i ofal iechyd mewn cymdeithas wâr fel ein cymdeithas ni? Offeryn yn unig yw Wanless, nid beibl. Credaf, yn gryf iawn, nad yw wedi cynnwys nifer o faterion sy’n berthnasol iawn, megis newidiadau demograffig, cludiant, sy’n arbennig o bwysig a thrafferthus yn y gogledd, gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau a’r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Y noson o’r blaen, euthum i glywed y pryderon am yr uned newydd-enedigaeth yn Ysbyty Maelor Wrecsam; mae pryder mawr y bydd angen i deuluoedd sydd â phlant, neu gleifion hŷn gael eu cludo o Ysbyty Maelor Wrecsam i Ysbyty Glan Clwyd. Nid yw hynny’n bosibl gan nad yw’r cludiant ar gael. O gofio’r hyn mae Christine Chapman newydd ei ddweud—yr oedd yn ddatganiad canmoladwy am fod am gael y gofal gorau—nid yw’r gofal gorau yn golygu’r arbenigwyr gorau posibl yn unig; mae hefyd yn golygu cael y gofal agosaf posibl at eich cartref yn ogystal â gofal o safon. Os oes angen ichi gael eich cludo 50 milltir ar ôl cael gofal gan yr arbenigwyr gorau posibl, a phethau eraill yn codi wedyn am fod angen i bobl gael eu symud, mae hynny’n ystyriaeth fawr iawn. Gyda’r ychydig eiriau hynny—

**Janet Ryder:** Will you give way?

**Eleanor Burnham:** No, I do not have enough time.

MRSA, for instance, is a big issue. Surely, before we do something like this, we need to consider clearing up the infection rates, because that plays a big part in our modern service.

**Elin Jones:** ‘Distance decay’ yw’r term y mae rhai pobl yn dechrau ei ddefnyddio i ddisgrifio’r dirywiad i’r claf o ganlyniad i orfod teithio yn bell i gael triniaeth. Cynhyrchodd yr Academi Colegau Meddygol Brenhinol adroddiad yn gynharach eleni ar ddarpariaeth ysbytai gwledig. Yn yr adroddiad hwnnw, dywed:

‘centralising hospital care...has a disproportionate impact upon those patients who live at greater distances from their hospitals;...so called “distance decay”’.

Trafodasom dipyn ar ‘distance decay’ yn ystod y drafodaeth ar niwrolawdriniaeth ddoe. Mae’r un pryder yn wir am y newidiadau a argymhellwyd yn ‘Cynllunio i Gyflenwi’, yn enwedig y cynnig i symud gwasanaethau o Lwynhelyg a Bronglais a’u darparu yn bellach o’r cleifion. Crybwyllodd yr ymddiriedolaeth yng Ngheredigion bryderon ynglŷn â ‘Cynllunio i Gyflenwi’, ac mae’n amcangyfrif ei bod yn cymryd tair awr i drosglwyddo claf, mewn argyfwng, o ward ym Mronglais i ward yng Nglangwili. Mae’r cyfnod o amser hwnnw yn rhy hir ac yn risg y mae’r clinigwyr eu hunain yn gwrthod ei dderbyn, heb sôn am y bobl leol a wasanaethir gan ysbyty Bronglais. Yr wyf yn falch o gydnabod ac i dderbyn bod y Gweinidog wedi cydnabod y prynhawn yma bod mater penodol o gonsyrn ynglŷn â darparu gwasanaethau mamolaeth a phediatrig yng Ngheredigion.

Mae ‘Cynllunio i Gyflenwi’ yn seiliedig ar y syniad bod angen poblogaeth o 300,000 i gynnal gwasanaethau ysbyty cyffredinol llawn. Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at y ffigur hwnnw eto’r prynhawn yma. Ysgrifennais at y Gweinidog yn y gwanwyn i ofyn iddo egluro tarddiad y ffigur hwnnw. Â phob

**Janet Ryder:** A ildiwch?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Na wnaif, nid oes gennyf ddigon o amser.

Mae MRSA, er enghraifft, yn fater pwysig iawn. Oni ddylem, cyn gwneud rhywbeth fel hyn, ystyried gwella’r cyfraddau heintio, am fod hynny’n rhan fawr o’n gwasanaeth modern.

**Elin Jones:** ‘Distance decay’ is the term that some people are beginning to use to describe the deterioration of the patient as a result of having to travel long distances to receive treatment. The Academy of Medical Royal Colleges produced a report on provision in rural hospitals earlier this year. In that report, it states:

‘centralising hospital care...has a disproportionate impact upon those patients who live at greater distances from their hospitals;...so called “distance decay”’.

We discussed distance decay to some degree during the debate yesterday on neurosurgery. The same concerns apply to the changes proposed in ‘Designed to Deliver’, particularly the proposal to move services from Withybush and Bron-glais and taking them further away from patients. The trust in Ceredigion raised concerns about ‘Designed to Deliver’, and it calculates that it would take three hours to transfer a patient, in an emergency, from a ward in Bron-glais to a ward in Glangwili. That amount of time is too long and it is a risk that clinicians themselves refuse to accept, not to mention the local people who are served by Bron-glais hospital. I am pleased to acknowledge and to accept that the Minister has acknowledged this afternoon that there is a specific issue of concern regarding the provision of maternity and paediatric services in Ceredigion.

‘Designed to Deliver’ is based on the idea that a population of 300,000 is needed to support the services in a full general hospital. The Minister has referred to this figure once again this afternoon. I wrote to the Minister in the spring to ask him to explain where this figure comes from. To be fair, he wrote back

chwarae teg i'r Gweinidog, ysgrifennodd yn ôl ataf a'm cyfeirio at y ddogfen a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Mawrth eleni gan Goleg Brenhinol Llawfeddygon Lloegr, 'Delivering High-quality Surgical Services for the Future'. Rhoddodd gyfeirnod i mi hyd yn oed ac, ar dudalen 27, mae'r ddogfen yn cyfeirio at boblogaeth o 300,000. Fodd bynnag, ar dudalen 28, yn yr un ddogfen, mae Coleg Brenhinol Llawfeddygon Lloegr yn mynd ymlaen i gydnabod bod rhai ardaloedd â phoblogaethau o 150,000 ar hyn o bryd sy'n cael eu gwasanaethu gan ysbytai cyffredinol llawn. Ar dudalen 28 o'r adroddiad hwn, dywed:

'Often there are such distances between sites that networking is not possible, and providing outreach services to different hospitals within the Trust is difficult...The College would strongly urge the government to consider the plight of rural hospitals and act accordingly to protect them.'

Dywed y Coleg Brenhinol Llawfeddygon Lloegr, felly, na fydd y model *one-size-fits-all* o gael poblogaeth o 300,000—ac yr wyf yn gobeithio bod Christine Chapman yn gwrando ar hyn—yn addas ar gyfer ysbytai gwledig.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Sadly, your time has run out.

**Christine Gwyther:** Whether you love it or loathe it, 'Designed to Deliver' provided an opportunity for the widest possible public debate on the future of our health services in west Wales. Health professionals, service users and members of the public came together in massive numbers to engage in the process in a series of public meetings. I engaged fully in that process, unlike every single opposition AM in Pembrokeshire, who came nowhere near a single public meeting, much to their disgrace.

**Lisa Francis:** Will you give way?

**Christine Gwyther:** I really do not think so; you were not there at the time, so why should I listen to you now.

and referred me to a document which was published in March this year by the Royal College of Surgeons of England, 'Delivering High-quality Surgical Services for the Future'. He even gave me a page reference, and on page 27 the document refers to a population of 300,000. However, on page 28 in the same document, the Royal College of Surgeons of England goes on to acknowledge that some areas with populations of 150,000 are currently served by full general hospitals. On page 28 of this document, it states:

'Often there are such distances between sites that networking is not possible, and providing outreach services to different hospitals within the Trust is difficult...The College would strongly urge the government to consider the plight of rural hospitals and act accordingly to protect them.'

The Royal College of Surgeons of England, therefore, states that the one-size-fits-all model of having a population of 300,000—and I hope Christine is listening to this—is not suitable for rural hospitals.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yn anffodus, daeth eich amser i ben.

**Christine Gwyther:** P'un a ydych yn ei hoffi ynteu'n ei gasáu, yr oedd 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi' yn gyfle i gael y drafodaeth gyhoeddus ehangaf bosibl ar ddyfodol ein gwasanaethau iechyd yn y gorllewin. Daeth gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol, defnyddwyr gwasanaethau ac aelodau'r cyhoedd at ei gilydd yn eu heidiau i gymryd rhan yn y broses mewn cyfres o gyfarfodydd cyhoeddus. Cymerais ran lawn yn y broses honno, yn wahanol i bob AC o'r gwrthbleidiau yn Sir Benfro, na ddaethant yn agos i'r un cyfarfod cyhoeddus, sy'n gywilydd arnynt.

**Lisa Francis:** A ildiwch?

**Christine Gwyther:** Nid wyf yn credu hynny'n wir; nid oeddech yno ar y pryd, felly pam y dylwn wrando arnoch yn awr.

More than 3,000 people opposed two proposals set out in 'Designed to Deliver'. The first was to centralise acute services in a superhospital somewhere in the Whitland area, and the second was to build on services at West Wales General Hospital, while reducing services at Withybush and Bronglais. During the Pembrokeshire programme of public meetings, another option emerged; this was the popularly branded option 3, which became crystallised in Pembrokeshire community health council's credible and commendable document, 'The People's Vision'.

It was not just Pembrokeshire constituents who did not like the options set out in 'Designed to Deliver'; those in Carmarthen did not like them either. Carmarthen town council stated that,

'the two options proposed do not appear to address the needs of the service, and a third alternative needs consideration. The Town Council agrees with Christine Gwyther AM that both options are unpalatable and that a third way should be found'.

I welcome the current programme of capital investment in my constituency. Some excellent developments are coming on stream, including new accident and emergency units for Withybush and Glangwili, a new MRI scanner at Withybush, and a new renal and cardiac unit at Glangwili. MRI scanners are coming to both hospitals. South Pembrokeshire hospital is due to be opened soon. I will not vote for any opposition amendment that threatens this investment and unravels these vital improvements to the service for my constituents.

Before this afternoon's point of order was made, I thought that the opposition amendment might have been well-meaning, but I do not think so any longer. I see it for what it really is: a trick to give the illusion of dynamic opposition. Helen Mary Jones gave the game away when she said, 'We don't mind, because the Minister can interpret the amendments any way he chooses'. This is the party that is supposed to be ready for Government in Wales—it is absolutely pathetic and craven, and this is an example of

Gwrthwynebodd dros 3,000 o bobl ddau gynnig a nodwyd yn 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi'. Y cyntaf oedd canoli gwasanaethau aciwt mewn uwch ysbyty rywle yn ardal Hendy-gwyn, a'r ail oedd adeiladu ar y gwasanaethau yn Ysbyty Cyffredinol Gorllewin Cymru, a chyfyngu ar y gwasanaethau yn Llwynhelyg a Bron-glais. Yn ystod rhaglen Sir Benfro o gyfarfodydd cyhoeddus, cyflwynwyd dewis arall; sef y dewis 3 fel y cyfeiriwyd ato'n gyffredinol, a grisialwyd yn nogfen gredadwy a chymeradwy cyngor iechyd cymuned Sir Benfro, sef 'The People's Vision'.

Nid etholwyr Sir Benfro yn unig a oedd yn anfodlon â'r dewisiadau sydd wedi eu gosod allan yn 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi'; nid oedd etholwyr Caerfyrddin yn fodlon arnynt ychwaith. Meddai cyngor tref Caerfyrddin,

nid yw'n ymddangos bod y ddau ddewis sy'n cael eu cynnig yn diwallu anghenion y gwasanaeth, ac mae angen ystyried trydydd dewis. Cytuna'r Cyngor Tref â Christine Gwyther AC fod y ddau ddewis yn annerbyniol a bod angen cael trydedd ffordd.

Croesawaf y rhaglen bresennol o fuddsoddiad cyfalaf yn fy etholaeth. Mae rhai datblygiadau ardderchog yn digwydd, gan gynnwys unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys newydd i Llwynhelyg a Glangwili, sganiwr MRI newydd yn Llwynhelyg, ac uned arennol a chardiaidd newydd yng Nglangwili. Mae sganwyr MRI yn dod i'r ddau ysbyty. Caiff ysbyty De Sir Benfro ei agor cyn bo hir. Ni fyddaf yn pleidleisio dros unrhyw welliant gan y gwrthbleidiau a fydd yn bygwth y buddsoddiad hwn ac yn dadwneud y gwelliannau hanfodol hyn i wasanaeth fy etholwyr.

Cyn i'r mater o drefn gael ei wneud y prynhawn yma, yr oeddwn y credu y gallai gwelliant y gwrthbleidiau fod yn llawn bwriadau da, ond nid dyna fy marn bellach. Gallaf ei weld am yr hyn ydyw mewn gwirionedd: twyll ydyw i gyfleu'r syniad o wrthbleidiau deinamig. Datgelodd Helen Mary Jones y cyfan pan ddywedodd, 'Nid oes wahaniaeth gennym, gan y gall y Gweinidog ddehongli'r gwelliannau fel y myn'. Dyma'r blaid sydd i fod yn barod i Lywodraethu Cymru—mae'n hollol bathetig a llwfr, ac



gutter politics.

We need to protect services at the local level, but we cannot afford to be parochial, and the Pembrokeshire community health council's excellent document protects services—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Sadly, time has run out.

**Kirsty Williams:** The motion before us refers specifically to 'Designed to Deliver', but the Minister will be more than aware that Powys's 'Doing More, Doing Better' is the document that ran alongside that process, and the website states that it should be read in conjunction with 'Designed to Deliver'.

Any consensus that was beginning to develop around 'Doing More, Doing Better' regarding the broad direction in which that document was taking us has been blown out of the water by the actions of Powys Local Health Board. As a result of that document, the communities served by Builth, Bronllys, Knighton and Llanidloes hospitals have had their hopes cruelly crushed, and their faith in that organisation has been completely destroyed. In its discussion of 'Doing More, Doing Better', the plans for closures did not form part of a number of options that were placed before the community; there was no mention of the double funding that they seem to enjoy in north Wales to develop services alongside existing services until they are ready to take over. It was not there for my constituents, Carl; I am glad for your constituents, but not for mine. There was nothing but cuts.

The local care teams, referred to in the new document, that are supposed to take the place of my community hospitals have already been widely rejected by GPs in the county. We do not have the community staff to deliver the model that the trust advocates. There has been no meaningful consultation with the county council in Powys, whose social services department will have to pick up the slack. I understand that the county council is so concerned that its chief

mae hyn yn enghraifft o wleidyddiaeth y gwter.

Rhaid inni ddiogelu gwasanaethau ar lefel leol, ond ni allwn fforddio bod yn blwyfol, ac mae dogfen ardderchog cyngor iechyd cymuned Sir Benfro yn diogelu gwasanaethau—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yn anffodus, daeth yr amser i ben.

**Kirsty Williams:** Cyfeiria'r cynnig ger ein bron yn benodol at 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi', ond bydd y Gweinidog yn llwyr ymwybodol mai dogfen 'Doing More, Doing Better' gan Bowys yw'r ddogfen a oedd yn cyd-fynd â'r broses honno, ac mae'r wefan yn dweud y dylid ei darllen ar y cyd â 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi'.

Mae unrhyw gytundeb ar 'Doing More, Doing Better' a oedd yn dechrau datblygu o ran y cyfeiriad cyffredinol yr oedd y ddogfen honno yn ein tywys wedi ei chwalu gan weithredoedd Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys. O ganlyniad i'r ddogfen honno, mae gobeithion y cymunedau a wasanaethir gan ysbytai Llanfair-ym-Muallt, Bronllys, Trefyclo a Llanidloes wedi eu chwalu, ac mae eu ffydd yn y sefydliad hwnnw wedi ei ddinistrio'n llwyr. Yn ei drafodaethau ar 'Doing More, Doing Better', nid oedd y cynlluniau i gau ysbytai yn rhan o nifer o ddewisiadau a gyflwynwyd i'r gymuned; nid oedd sôn o gwbl am yr ariannu dwbl y maent i'w gweld yn ei fwynhau yn y gogledd i ddatblygu gwasanaethau yn gyfochrog â gwasanaethau presennol nes y byddant yn barod i gymryd yr awenau. Nid oedd hynny ar gael i'm hetholwyr i, Carl; yr wyf yn falch dros eich etholwyr chi, ond nid fy rhai i. Ni chafwyd dim ond toriadau.

Mae'r timau gofal lleol, y cyfeirir atynt yn y ddogfen newydd ac sydd i ddisodli fy ysbytai cymunedol eisoes wedi eu gwrthod yn helaeth gan feddygon teulu yn y sir. Nid oed gennym y staff cymunedol i ddarparu'r model a gaiff ei arddel gan yr ymddiriedolaeth. Ni fu dim ymgynghori ystyrion â'r cyngor sir ym Mhowys, a bydd eu hadran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn gorfod gwneud iawn am y diffygion. Deallaf fod y cyngor sir mor bryderus fel y daeth ei

executive recently came to see Ann Lloyd, the director of NHS Wales, to discuss his concerns.

There has been no consultation with the surrounding district general hospitals, which, again, will be adversely affected when my GPs cannot admit their patients to community hospital beds and have no other choice but to send them to Abergavenny Glangwili, Hereford or Shrewsbury, and there was no consultation with the ambulance service, which will have to get them there. It cannot tell me how many beds will be in my hospitals after these plans are implemented, where the services will be located or how it is going to pay for any of it.

5.10 p.m.

My constituents know that services cannot be placed in aspic and that, as medical practice changes and develops, they have to change and develop with it. The community in Builth Wells met a year ago tomorrow to discuss these plans and it agreed that the way forward for Builth was an integrated health and social care model. The chief executive agreed that that was the way forward; indeed, I came to the Chamber and asked the Minister here and in writing whether he would agree with this model. He said 'yes'. Less than a year later, my constituents in Builth are told that their hospital is to close and that there is no health and social care centre. The consultation that has taken place in Powys has been a farce and the goodwill of all has been lost.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Your time has come to an end. I call on Gwenda Thomas.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I recognise the progress made on reconfiguration within the Bro Morgannwg NHS Trust area. However, I will focus my contribution on the future of primary care services where cross-boundary administration covers the provision of health services. I have long held the view that primary healthcare for the part of the upper Aman valley that lies in my constituency should be administered by Neath Port Talbot Local Health Board and the Bro Morgannwg

brif weithredwr i weld Ann Lloyd, cyfarwyddwr GIG Cymru, yn ddiweddar i drafod ei bryderon.

Ni fu dim ymgynghori â'r ysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth cyfagos. Pan fydd fy meddygon teulu yn methu anfon eu cleifion i welyau ysbytai cymunedol heb unrhyw ddewis arall ond eu hanfon i'r Fenni, Glangwili, Henffordd neu Amwythig, bydd hynny'n effeithio'n andwyol ar yr ysbytai hynny, ac ni fu dim ymgynghori â'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, a fydd yn gorfod eu cludo yno. Ni all ddweud wrthyf faint o welyau fydd yn fy ysbytai ar ôl gweithredu'r cynlluniau hyn, ble y caiff y gwasanaethau eu lleoli na sut y mae am dalu am unrhyw ran ohono.

Gŵyr fy etholwyr na all gwasanaeth fod yn ddigyfnawid a bod yn rhaid iddynt newid a datblygu wrth i arferion meddygol newid a datblygu. Cyfarfu'r gymuned yn Llanfair-ym-Muallt flwyddyn yn ôl i drafod y cynlluniau hyn, a chytunodd mai'r ffordd ymlaen i Lanfair-ym-Muallt oedd model integredig o iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Cytunodd y prif weithredwr mai dyma'r ffordd ymlaen; yn wir, deuthum i'r Siambr a gofyn i'r Gweinidog yma ac yn ysgrifenedig a fyddai'n cytuno â'r model hwn. Dywedodd y byddai. Lai na blwyddyn yn ddiweddarach, caiff fy etholwyr yn Llanfair-ym-Muallt wybod bod eu hysbyty am gau ac nad oes canolfan iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Mae'r ymgynghori a ddigwyddodd ym Mhowys wedi bod yn ffars a chollwyd ewyllys da pawb.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Daeth eich amser i ben. Galwaf ar Gwenda Thomas.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Yr wyf yn cydnabod y cynnydd a wnaed ar ailgyflunio yn ardal Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Bro Morgannwg. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am ganolbwyntio fy nghyfraniad ar ddyfodol gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol lle mae gweinyddiaeth drawsffiniol yn cwmpasu gwasanaethau iechyd. Yr wyf wedi credu ers cryn amser y dylai gofal iechyd sylfaenol dros y rhan o ddyffryn Aman sydd yn fy etholaeth i gael ei weinyddu gan Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Castell-

NHS Trust. That would ensure that the health provision boundary is coterminous with that of Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council. That would facilitate partnership working between the LHB, the local authority and Neath Port Talbot Council for Voluntary Services. It would also provide some clarity of responsibility for service delivery on health and social care and for voluntary sector provision for my constituents in that area.

It is important to raise this issue this afternoon as we discuss the reconfiguration of health services, as the proposal to amalgamate existing NHS trusts into one trust covering Carmarthenshire, Ceredigion and Pembrokeshire will isolate some upper Aman valley communities even further. While I am aware of your present position regarding the reconfiguration plans for mid and west Wales, Minister, I am sure that you will agree that this consultation provides an opportunity for serious consideration of how primary care resources can best be utilised in the future in the Neath Port Talbot part of the upper Aman valley.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae Gwenda Thomas wedi rhoi ei bys ar y broblem sy'n bodoli o ran yr ymgynghoriad hwn. Fel y dywedodd yn gwbl glir, ni allwch ystyried darpariaeth yn y sector eilaidd heb ystyried darpariaeth yn y sector sylfaenol. Nid yw'r ymgynghoriad hwn wedi rhoi unrhyw fath o ystyriaeth i'r math o ddarpariaeth y gellid ei chynnig yn y gymuned i bobl yn y sector sylfaenol. Yn waeth na hynny, yn y canolbarth a'r de-orllewin, mae'r ymgynghoriad hwn, o'r cychwyn, wedi pegynnu barn drwy roi'r argraff i bobl y byddant yn colli gwasanaethau o'u hysbytai. Mae hyn wedi creu sefyllfa lle mae'r holl drafodaeth wedi bod ynglŷn ag arbed a diogelu'r gwasanaethau hynny.

A wnewch dderbyn bod yn rhaid ichi, yn y lle cyntaf, ddweud wrth bobl beth fydd y ddarpariaeth yn eu cymunedau yn y sector sylfaenol cyn y gallwch ddechrau sôn am newid y ddarpariaeth sy'n bodoli yn y sector eilaidd?

nedd Port Talbot ac Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Bro Morgannwg. Byddai hynny'n sicrhau bod ffin y ddarpariaeth iechyd yn cyd-fynd â ffin Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot. Byddai hynny'n hwyluso gweithio mewn partneriaeth rhwng y BILl, yr awdurdod lleol a Chyngor Gwasanaethau Gwirfoddol Castell-nedd Port Talbot. Byddai hefyd yn sicrhau rhywfaint o eglurder o ran cyfrifoldeb dros ddarparu gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol a darpariaeth y sector gwirfoddol i'm hetholwyr yn yr ardal honno.

Mae'n bwysig codi'r mater hwn y prynhawn yma wrth inni drafod ailgyflunio gwasanaethau iechyd, gan y bydd y cynnig i uno ymddiriedolaethau GIG presennol yn un ymddiriedolaeth i gwmpasu Sir Gaerfyrddin, Ceredigion a Sir Benfro yn ynysu rhai cymunedau ym mlaenau dyffryn Aman hyd yn oed fwy. Er fy mod yn ymwybodol o'ch barn bresennol, Weinidog, am y cynlluniau ailgyflunio ar gyfer y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod yr ymgynghori hwn yn gyfle i ystyried o ddifrif y ffordd orau i ddefnyddio adnoddau gofal sylfaenol yn y dyfodol yn rhan Castell-nedd Port Talbot o ddyffryn Aman.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gwenda Thomas has put her finger on the problem that exists in terms of this consultation. As she said quite clearly, you cannot consider provision in the secondary sector without considering provision within the primary sector. This consultation has not given any consideration to the kind of provision that could be offered in the community to people within the primary sector. Even worse, in mid and west Wales, this consultation from the outset has polarised opinion by giving people the impression that they will lose services from their hospitals. That has created a position whereby the whole discussion has been about saving and safeguarding those services.

Will you accept that, in the first place, you must tell people what the provision will be in their communities in terms of primary care before you can talk about changing the provision that currently exists in the secondary sector?

Bydd pobl yn Abertawe yn synnu ein bod wedi trafod symud y ddarpariaeth o Abertawe i Gaerdydd ddoe a'ch bod wedi dod yn ôl atom heddiw a dweud y byddwch yn darparu uwch ysbyty yn Abertawe—credaf ichi ddweud y byddai'n *state-of-the-art superhospital*. Bydd pobl Abertawe yn ei chael yn anodd credu eich bod yn symud darpariaeth o Abertawe i Gaerdydd ar y naill law tra eich bod, ar y llaw arall, yn sôn am adeiladu ysbyty yno. Tybed a fydd unrhyw fath o ddarpariaeth arbenigol ar ôl yn Abertawe erbyn ichi adeiladau'r ysbyty hwnnw. Mae hynny'n effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar fy etholwyr i yn Nwyrain Caerfyrddin a Dinefwr.

I gloi, oherwydd mae'r amser yn prysur ddiflannu, rhaid i bobl ystyried yn ddifrifol a ydynt yn defnyddio rhagoriaeth glinigol fel esgus i beidio ag edrych ar elfennau eraill yn y gwasanaeth, gan ddweud mai dyna'r unig beth i'w ystyried bob tro. Fel yr esboniodd Elin Jones, nid dyna'r unig ystyriaeth. Nid wyf am eiliad yn awgrymu y dylid anwybyddu hynny, ond nid dyna'r unig elfen o'r ddadl y dylid ei hystyried. Ni fu dim ffydd yn y broses ymgynghorol hon, ac mae'r broses wedi creu'r canlyniadau, yn anffodus. Nid yw hynny wedi arwain at ganlyniadau a fydd yn cynnig gwasanaeth gwell i'm hetholwyr yn Nwyrain Caerfyrddin a Dinefwr.

**Huw Lewis:** The health service in Merthyr and Rhymney is in far better shape now than it was in 1999. Apart from the record numbers of doctors and nurses treating patients, we have a new primary care hospital coming to Merthyr town, and a large-scale ongoing capital investment programme that I hope will give us a new accident-and-emergency department and a new MRI scanner very soon.

However, the NHS in Wales is facing an explosion of new drugs and technologies, and a constantly evolving demographic. The reconfiguration of acute health services in Wales, as first outlined in 'Designed for Life', was a bold response to that challenge. However, I worry that this bold response has not been replicated in some of the reorganisation programmes locally and regionally. People in Merthyr and Rhymney

The people of Swansea will be surprised that we were discussing yesterday moving the provision from Swansea to Cardiff and that you have come forward today to say that you will provide a superhospital in Swansea—I think you called it a state-of-the-art superhospital. The people of Swansea will find it difficult to believe that you are moving provision from Swansea to Cardiff on the one hand while you talk about building a hospital there on the other. Will there be any kind of specialist provision left in Swansea by the time you have built that hospital? That directly affects my constituents in Carmarthen East and Dinefwr.

In conclusion, because time is quickly running out, people must seriously consider whether they are using clinical excellence as an excuse not to consider other elements in the service, by saying that that is the only consideration always. As Elin Jones explained, that is not the only consideration. I am not suggesting for one second that that should be ignored, but that is not the only element in the debate that should be considered. There has been no confidence in this consultation process, and the process has led to these outcomes, unfortunately. That has not lead to outcomes which will offer a better service to my constituents in Carmarthen East and Dinefwr.

**Huw Lewis:** Bellach, mae cyflwr y gwasanaeth iechyd ym Merthyr a Rhymni dipyn yn well nag ydoedd yn 1999. Ar wahân i'r niferoedd uchaf erioed o feddygon a nyrsys yn trin cleifion, mae gennym ysbyty gofal sylfaenol newydd yn dod i dref Merthyr a rhaglen fawr o fuddsoddi cyfalaf parhaus a fydd, gobeithio, yn rhoi adran damweiniau ac achosion brys newydd a sganiwr MRI newydd inni yn fuan iawn.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r GIG yng Nghymru yn wynebu datblygiad aruthrol ym maes cyffuriau a thechnolegau newydd ynghyd â demograffeg sy'n newid. Ymateb cadarn i'r her honno oedd ailgyflunio gwasanaethau iechyd aciwt Cymru fel yr amlinellwyd yn 'Cynllun Oes'. Fodd bynnag, pryderaf nad yw'r ymateb cadarn hwn wedi'i efelychu yn rhai o'r rhaglenni ad-drefnu lleol a rhanbarthol. Dylai pobl ym Merthyr a

should be excited about the idea of health reorganisation. This should be our opportunity to address once and for all the health inequalities blighting my community, but I am afraid that people are not excited; indeed, many of them are scared and confused. They are worried that Prince Charles Hospital in Merthyr does not have a secure future, and, far from the vision of delivering care closer to home, people are worried that they may have to travel to hospitals in Cardiff or Llantrisant for routine hospital appointments.

The crux of the matter is that people have not been given a dynamic vision of what the future of healthcare will mean to them in their area. Changing the way in which people receive treatment of any kind is a difficult process, and that is why the patient must be at the heart of any such change—not just fully informed, but fully consulted. The patient's opinion should not only be noted but acted upon. It is, after all, their health service. The people of Merthyr and Rhymney have not been engaged as fully as they should have been. The local newspaper has been filled with stories painting a very bleak picture of the future for local health services, yet a meaningful response from local health officials has not been forthcoming in any way. The consultation process has spread insecurity where it should have offered reassurance. It has failed to engage with the people who matter the most: the patients.

With such experience at a local level, I have certain sympathies with parts of amendment 2, as tabled by the opposition coalition, but it calls for a step back and yet more planning. The people of Merthyr and Rhymney may be disappointed with the process that they have faced so far, but they will not accept any more procrastination—many of them just do not have the time. While I regret how elements of the reorganisation have unfolded locally, I cannot support any delay in action proposed by the opposition.

My concluding message is that reorganisation is not just a good idea; it is vital. Communities such as mine have been waiting for change. Let us remember that. Merthyr and Rhymney score bottom, or near bottom

Rhymni fod wedi'u cyffroi ynghylch y syniad o ad-drefnu maes iechyd. Dylai hyn fod yn gyfle inni fynd i'r afael, unwaith ac am byth, â'r holl anghydraddoldebau iechyd sy'n fwrn ar fy nghymuned, ond pryderaf nad yw pobl yn cyffroi; yn wir, mae nifer yn ofnus ac wedi'u drysu. Pryderant nad oes gan Ysbyty'r Tywysog Siarl ym Merthyr ddyfodol diogel, ac yn hytrach na'r weledigaeth o ddarpariaeth iechyd yn nes at y cartref, mae pobl yn pryderu y gallai fod rhaid iddynt deithio i ysbytai yng Nghaerdydd neu Lantrisant am apwyntiadau ysbyty cyffredin.

Byrdwn y peth yw nad oes gweledigaeth ddeinamig wedi'i rhoi i bobl o'r hyn y bydd dyfodol gofal iechyd yn ei olygu iddynt hwy yn eu hardal. Mae newid y ffordd y bydd pobl yn cael triniaeth o unrhyw fath yn broses anodd, a dyna pam y dylid rhoi cleifion wrth wraidd newid o'r fath—nid rhoi'r holl wybodaeth yn unig, ond ymgynghori'n llawn â hwy hefyd. Yn ogystal â nodi barn cleifion, dylid gweithredu arni hefyd. Eu gwasanaeth iechyd hwy ydyw, wedi'r cyfan. Nid ymgysylltwyd mor llawn ag y dylid â phobl Merthyr a Rhymni. Mae'r papur newydd lleol wedi bod yn llawn straeon sy'n darlunio dyfodol llwm iawn i wasanaethau iechyd lleol, er na chafwyd ymateb ystyrllon gan swyddogion iechyd lleol o gwbl. Mae'r broses ymgynghori wedi esgor ar ansicrwydd yn hytrach na chynnig sicrwydd. Mae wedi methu ag ymgysylltu â'r bobl bwysicaf: sef y cleifion.

Gyda phrofiad o'r fath ar lefel leol, mae gennyf rywfaint o gydymdeimlad â rhannau o welliant 2, a gyflwynwyd gan glymblaid y gwrthbleidiau, ond mae'n galw am gam yn ôl a mwy byth o gynllunio. Hwyrach fod pobl Merthyr a Rhymni yn anfodlon â'r broses hyd yma, ond ni fyddant yn derbyn mwy o oedi—nid oes gan lawer ohonynt yr amser mewn gwirionedd. Er fy mod yn gresynu at y modd y mae elfennau o'r ad-drefnu wedi datblygu'n lleol, ni allaf gefnogi unrhyw oedi a gynigir gan y gwrthbleidiau.

Fy neges i gloi yw nad syniad da yn unig yw ad-drefnu; mae'n hanfodol. Mae cymunedau fel fy nghymuned i wedi bod yn aros am newid. Rhaid inni gofio hynny. Daw Merthyr a Rhymni ar y gwaelod, neu'n agos i'r

across Wales—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I am sorry, but your time has run out.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** Thank you for the debate. These are very important issues, and, by and large, the debate was even-tempered, even though it began to boil over on one or two occasions.

We need to recognise what the Wanless report said, because some people have thrown the accusation around that the reconfiguration is somehow about saving money, and that that is negative. That is precisely what Wanless told us to do—if we do not reconfigure how the health service is run in Wales, it will not be sustainable either on clinical or on financial grounds. Therefore, I have no apology to make if one of the reasons why the reconfiguration has taken place is financial sustainability. This is precisely what Wanless told us, and, indeed, it is at the heart of ‘Designed for Life’.

5.20 p.m.

**Janet Ryder:** Do you agree, Minister, that services need to be offered in a new way? People are concerned that reconfiguration will go ahead, but that no new services will be offered, because all the money saved will be needed to provide some of the services that remain.

**Brian Gibbons:** This is extraordinary. The proposals relating to Abergele, quite apart from clinical governance concerns about the hospital, will bring services back from Shrewsbury. That has to be a good thing. The fact that I am going to north Wales in a few months’ time to launch the DEXA scanner shows that these are new services for people in north Wales; they were never there before. There is a cancer centre at Ysbyty Glan Clwyd that was never there before. I think that Janet has got to see that the cup is at least a quarter full on this occasion.

Elin Jones is right—and Christine Gwyther touched on the same point—about what the Royal College of Surgeons said on the 300,000 people and the 150,000 people, but

gwaelod, ledled Cymru—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Terfn. Mae’n flin gennyf ond daeth eich amser i ben.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Diolch am y ddadl. Mae’r materion hyn yn bwysig iawn, ac ar y cyfan yr oedd y ddadl yn un synhwyrol er iddi ddechrau mynd yn danbaid unwaith neu ddwy.

Rhaid inni gydnabod yr hyn a ddywedodd adroddiad Wanless, oherwydd i rai wneud y cyhuddiad bod yr ailgyfluniad yn ymwneud ag arbed arian, a bod hynny’n beth negyddol. Dyna’n union y dywedodd Wanless wrthym am ei wneud—os nad ydym yn ailgyflunio’r modd y rheolir y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru, ni fydd yn gynaliadwy yn glinigol nac yn ariannol. Felly, nid oes gennyf ymddiheuriad i’w wneud os cynaliadwyedd ariannol yw un o’r rhesymau dros yr ailgyflunio. Dyma’n union a ddywedodd Wanless wrthym, ac yn wir, dyma sydd wrth wraidd ‘Cynllun Oes’.

**Janet Ryder:** Oni chytunwch, Weinidog, fod angen cynnig gwasanaethau mewn ffordd newydd? Mae pobl yn pryderu y bydd yr ailgyflunio’n mynd rhagddo ond na fydd gwasanaethau newydd yn cael eu cynnig, oherwydd bydd angen yr arian a arbedwyd i ddarparu rhai o’r gwasanaethau sydd ar ôl.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae hyn yn rhyfeddol. Bydd y cynigion sy’n ymwneud ag Abergele, heb sôn am y pryderon am lywodraethu clinigol yn yr ysbyty, yn dod â gwasanaethau yn ôl o Amwythig. Rhaid bod hynny’n beth da. Mae’r ffaith fy mod yn mynd i’r gogledd ymhen ychydig fisoedd i lansio’r sganiwr DEXA yn dangos eu bod yn wasanaethau newydd i bobl yn y gogledd; nid oeddent yno o’r blaen. Mae yna ganolfan canser yn Ysbyty Glan Clwyd nad oedd yno o’r blaen. Credaf y dylai Janet weld bod y cwpan o leiaf yn chwarter llawn y tro hwn.

Mae Elin Jones yn gywir—a soniodd Christine Gwyther am yr un pwynt—ynghylch yr hyn a ddywedodd Coleg Brenhinol y Llawfeddygon am y 300,000 o

what we propose, through a three-hospital and one-system solution is a genuine attempt to address that. It is recognition that a single hospital will not address the needs of the 300,000 plus people in the former Dyfed area. Our way of tackling that is not to have a single big hospital, but to have three linked hospitals. That option did not go to consultation, but it did emerge from the consultation. I do not understand how people can say that we were not listening, or that the proposals did not change in the light of a new option appearing, which was not on the consultation paper in the first place. I do not think that that does justice to the people or the effect that the consultees had at this time.

**Elin Jones:** People do not care so much about the management structures of the three hospitals in Dyfed as about accessibility to services, and the really concerning fact that there is a three-hour transfer time for emergency patients from Bronglais to Carmarthen. In the case of caesarean sections, that journey would be far too great a clinical risk.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This is meant to be an intervention, Elin.

**Elin Jones:** Yes. I hope that you accept that point, Minister.

**Brian Gibbons:** I do accept that point, which is why we are saying that this is the end of stage 1. Particularly in relation to your community, stage 2 follows on from the work that the planning forum will do. As you acknowledged, addressing that issue is one of the big challenges for the planning forum.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will you take an intervention on that point?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yes, if the Deputy Presiding Officer will allow it.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I will.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You talked about the management of the provision in the old Dyfed area, but I am somewhat surprised that

bobl a'r 150,000 o bobl. Ond mae'r hyn a gynigiwn, drwy ddull tri ysbyty ac un system, yn ymgais wirioneddol i fynd i'r afael â hynny. Mae'n gydnabyddiaeth na fydd un ysbyty yn unig yn diwallu anghenion y 300,000 a mwy o bobl yn hen ardal Dyfed. Ein dull ni o fynd i'r afael â hynny yw peidio â chael un ysbyty mawr ond, yn hytrach, tri ysbyty cysylltiedig. Nid ymgynghorwyd ynghylch y dewis hwnnw, ond deilliodd o'r ymgynghoriad. Nid wyf yn deall sut y gall pobl ddweud nad oeddem yn gwranddo, neu nad oedd y cynigion yn newid yng ngoleuni dewis newydd nad oedd ar y papur ymgynghori yn y lle cyntaf. Ni chredaf fod hynny'n gwneud cyfiawnder â'r bobl na'r effaith a gafodd y rhai yr ymgynghorwyd â hwy bryd hynny.

**Elin Jones:** Nid yw strwythurau rheoli'r tri ysbyty yn Nyfed yn gymaint o bryder i bobl ag yw hwylustod y gwasanaethau, ac mae'r ffaith ei bod yn cymryd tair awr i drosglwyddo cleifion brys o Fron-glais i Gaerfyrddin yn bryder o'r mwyaf. Yn achos llawdriniaethau Cesaraid, byddai'r daith honno'n ormod o risg glinigol.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Ymyriad yw hyn i fod, Elin.

**Elin Jones:** Ie. Gobeithio y derbyniwch y pwynt hwnnw, Weinidog.

**Brian Gibbons:** Derbyniaf y pwynt. Dyna pam yr ydym yn dweud mai diwedd cyfnod 1 yw hyn. Yn enwedig o ran eich cymuned chi, mae cam 2 yn dilyn y gwaith y bydd y fforwm cynllunio yn ei wneud. Fel yr oeddech yn ei gydnabod, un o heriau mawr y fforwm cynllunio fydd mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A gymerwch chi ymyriad ar y pwynt hwnnw?

**Brian Gibbons:** Gwnaf, os bydd y Dirprwy Lywydd yn ei ganiatáu.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gwnaf.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Soniech am reoli'r ddarpariaeth yn hen ardal Dyfed, ond yr wyf yn synnu braidd nad ydych wedi siarad am

you have not spoken about the management of the commissioning of those services. Surely you cannot look at provision on its own without also looking at commissioning.

**Brian Gibbons:** I am amazed that you have asked that question, given that you are Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee, and that I pointed out that we are moving to regional commissioning in relation to the main health communities in Wales. Clearly, that will be one way in which this issue will be addressed. Where there are strengths in local partnership commissioning, that arrangement will continue. Regional commissioning also needs to take place, so that is presumably the situation in the old Dyfed/south-west Wales with the new service configuration.

I was interested in Mark Isherwood's comments, because when I went to Holywell hospital, I was pleased to meet Mr and Mrs Saunders, who are very much at the forefront of the campaign to have that hospital built. They told me that they had waited 30 years for that hospital. I wonder who was in power for most of those 30 years. It certainly was not Welsh Labour. Similarly, I understand—

**Mark Isherwood:** Will you give way?

**Brian Gibbons:** I will, in a second.

I understand the point that Christine Chapman and Huw Lewis made about the situation in Merthyr and the upper Cynon valley, and the local communities. This is why it is important that organisations such as the Merthyr and Cynon fora become more dynamic, as well as working with community health councils. I know that the Cynon forum is doing so and that the local health board engages with the Merthyr forum, but the full potential of these organisations should be tapped as a mechanism for making sure that services are delivered in line with local expectations. If there is agreement to move towards having a joint trust, it will give more assurance to people that the wider range of complex procedures will be available to people in Merthyr, extending right down to the hospital in Llantrisant. As Huw said, the

reoli'r broses o gomisiynu'r gwasanaethau hynny. Does bosibl y gallwch edrych ar y ddarpariaeth ar ei phen ei hun heb edrych ar y broses gomisiynu?

**Brian Gibbons:** Synnaf eich bod yn gofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw, a chithau'n Gadeirydd ar y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, a minnau wedi dweud ein bod yn symud tuag at gomisiynu rhanbarthol o ran y prif gymunedau iechyd yng Nghymru. Yn amlwg, bydd hynny'n un ffordd o fynd i'r afael â'r mater. Pan fydd cryfderau mewn gwaith comisiynu partneriaethau lleol, bydd y trefniadau hynny'n parhau. Mae'n rhaid i gomisiynu rhanbarthol hefyd ddigwydd, felly, mae'n debyg mai dyna yw'r sefyllfa yn hen ardal Dyfed/y de-orllewin gyda'r cyfluniad gwasanaeth newydd.

Yr oedd gennyf ddiddordeb yn y sylwadau a wnaed gan Mark Isherwood, oherwydd pan euthum i ysbyty Treffynnon, yr oeddwn yn falch o gwrrd â Mr a Mrs Saunders, sy'n ffigyrau blaenllaw yn yr ymgyrch dros adeiladu'r ysbyty hwnnw. Yr oeddent yn dweud wrthyf eu bod wedi aros 30 mlynedd am yr ysbyty hwnnw. Tybed pwy oedd mewn grym am y rhan fwyaf o'r 30 blynedd hynny. Nid Llafur Cymru ydoedd, bid siŵr. Yn yr un modd, deallaf—

**Mark Isherwood:** A ildiwch?

**Brian Gibbons:** Gwnaf, mewn eiliad.

Deallaf y pwynt a wnaed gan Christine Chapman a Huw Lewis ynghylch y sefyllfa ym Merthyr a blaenau Cwm Cynon a'r cymunedau lleol. Dyna pam ei bod yn bwysig i sefydliadau fel fforymau Merthyr a Chynon fod yn fwy deinamig, yn ogystal â gweithio gyda chynghorau iechyd cymuned. Gwn fod fforwm Cynon yn gwneud hynny a bod y bwrdd iechyd lleol yn ymgysylltu â fforwm Merthyr, ond dylid manteisio ar botensial llawn y sefydliadau hyn fel modd i sicrhau darparu gwasanaethau'n unol â disgwyliadau lleol. Os bydd cytundeb i symud at ymddiriedolaeth ar y cyd, bydd yn rhoi sicrwydd pellach i bobl y bydd yr ystod ehangach o weithdrefnau cymhleth ar gael i bobl ym Merthyr, ac yn ymestyn i'r ysbyty yn Llantrisant. Fel y dywedodd Huw, bydd yr arian ar gael os daw achos busnes boddhaol



money will be available if a satisfactory business case comes forward for the accident-and-emergency department at the town hospital in Treharris, and for the upgrading of services in the wake of the closure of St Tydfil's. That will radically change people's quality of life.

**Mark Isherwood:** Will you join me in also giving credit to Dr Martin Parry, who helped to launch the campaign 30 years go and who has been a steadfast supporter over the 30 years, while noting that Dr Martin Parry is the retired chairman of the Delyn Conservative Association?

**Brian Gibbons:** We should congratulate all those who have campaigned for a local hospital on their commitment and loyalty. As an Assembly Government, we are glad that we have delivered for Holywell, regardless of whether it was a Conservative campaign.

i'r amlwg ar gyfer yr adran damweiniau ac achosion brys yn ysbyty'r dref yn Nhrefharris ac ar gyfer uwchraddio gwasanaethau yn sgîl cau Ysbyty'r Santes Tudful. Bydd hynny'n newid ansawdd bywyd pobl yn aruthrol.

**Mark Isherwood:** A ymunwch â mi hefyd i roi clod i Dr Martin Parry am helpu lansio'r ymgyrch 30 blynedd yn ôl ac a fu'n gefnogwr selog dros y 30 blynedd, gan nodi mai cyn gadeirydd Cymdeithas Ceidwadwyr Delyn yw Dr Martin Parry.

**Brian Gibbons:** Dylem longyfarch pawb a fu'n ymgyrchu dros ysbyty lleol am eu hymrwymiad a'u teyrngarwch. Fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yr ydym yn falch ein bod wedi gwireddu dyheadau Treffynnon, fel ymgyrch Geidwadol ai peidio.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 1: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 2: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM3314): to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*notes the progress made in securing the reconfiguration of acute health services in the different parts of Wales, as set out in 'Designed to Deliver: Shaping our Acute Hospitals in Mid and West Wales' for mid and west Wales, 'Designed for North Wales: A vision for the health community and a plan for the major hospital services' for north Wales, and 'Reshaping your local Health Services: Developing a Plan for South East Wales' for south-east Wales.*

Cynnig (NDM3314): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn nodi'r cynnydd a wnaed o ran sicrhau bod gwasanaethau iechyd aciwt mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru yn cael eu hailgyflunio, fel y nodwyd yn y 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi: Pennu Ffurf Ein Hysbytai Acíwt yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru' ar gyfer Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru, 'Cynllun Gogledd Cymru: Gweledigaeth ar gyfer y gymuned iechyd a chynllun ar gyfer gwasanaethau'r prif ysbytai' ar gyfer gogledd Cymru, a 'Llunio eich Gwasanaethau Iechyd lleol: Datblygu Cynllun ar gyfer de-ddwyrain Cymru' ar gyfer de-ddwyrain Cymru.*

*Cynnig (NDM3314): O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 20.  
Motion (NDM3314): For 29, Abstain 0, Against 20.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I know that Carl wants to raise a point of order. I will see whether I can avoid points of order between you and Mark Isherwood, as that would extend Plenary. I have taken advice since the original comment was made that the Labour Party is corrupt. [*Interruption.*] Order. I will now give you the benefit of the advice that I have received, which will be subject to reading the Record. Had Mark Isherwood called Carl Sargeant himself corrupt, that would have been quite out of order, so I will look again at the Record to see whether he said anything of that nature. However, I believe that Mark Isherwood called the Labour Party that Carl belongs to 'corrupt'. If that is the case, we have previous examples of comments ruled as being out of order. The example that I have been given is that of the Conservative Party being called 'vermin'. That was ruled not to be in order. I therefore believe that I have to rule in the same way.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gwn fod Carl am godi pwynt o drefn. Rhaid i mi ystyried a allaf osgoi pwyntiau o drefn rhyngoch chi a Mark Isherwood, gan y byddai hynny'n ymestyn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Yr wyf wedi cael cyngor ers gwneud y sylw gwreiddiol fod y Blaid Lafur yn llwgr. [*Torri ar draws.*] Trefn. Dyma i chi yn awr y cyngor a gefais, a bydd yn amodol ar ddarllen y Cofnod. Pe byddai Mark Isherwood wedi galw Carl Sargeant ei hun yn llwgr, byddai hynny wedi bod allan o drefn, felly, edrychaf eto ar y Cofnod i weld a ddywedodd unrhyw beth o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod Mark Isherwood wedi galw'r Blaid Lafur y mae Carl yn aelod ohoni yn 'llwgr'. Os felly, mae gennym enghreifftiau blaenorol o ddyfarnu bod sylwadau allan o drefn. Yr enghraifft a roddwyd imi oedd bod y Blaid Geidwadol wedi ei galw'n 'wehilion'. Barnwyd bod hynny allan o drefn. Credaf, felly, ei bod yn rhaid imi ddyfarnu yn yr un modd. Mae

Calling the Labour Party 'corrupt' is also out of order, and I therefore ask Mark Isherwood to withdraw that statement.

**Mark Isherwood:** The comment did not refer to the entire Labour Party; I think that I used the term 'local Labour Party'. It is a concern that has been expressed to me by many people—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I want to hear what Mark Isherwood says, and I wish to hear it clearly.

5.30 p.m.

**Mark Isherwood:** I wanted to clarify what I said, but I accept the ruling that the word would be considered out of order and, therefore, I withdraw it.

galw'r Blaid Lafur yn 'llwgr' hefyd allan o drefn, a gofynnaf felly i Mark Isherwood dynnu'r datganiad hwnnw'n ôl.

**Mark Isherwood:** Nid oedd y sylw yn ymwneud â'r Blaid Lafur yn ei chyfanrwydd; credaf imi ddefnyddio'r term 'y Blaid Lafur leol'. Mae'n bryder a fynegwyd imi gan nifer—[AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf am glywed beth a ddywedodd Mark Isherwood, a hoffwn ei glywed yn glir.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yr oeddwn am egluro'r hyn a ddywedais, ond derbynïaf y byddai'r gair yn cael ei ystyried yn amhriodol, ac felly yr wyf yn ei dynnu'n ôl.

## Dadl Fer Short Debate

### Cefnogi Diwylliant yng Nghymru Supporting Culture in Wales

**Denise Idris Jones:** I have agreed to give a minute each to Eleanor Burnham, Ann Jones, Owen John Thomas and Lisa Francis. As the topic of my short debate, I have chosen the Assembly and culture provision, subsidy and policy.

We in Wales are very proud of our culture and rightly so, as we have much to be proud of. Our culture is based on quality; it is essentially artistic, creative and intellectual. It is not founded on historical events, or the power struggles of those ambitious to be kings and queens, and, perhaps, politicians. It is not based on flummery, on the trappings of position and authority, and it is not based on the buying power of the newly rich, who purchase objects of so-called 'art' to enhance their prestige. In Wales, traditionally, culture is not part of the establishment; we have had little of that. Here, traditionally, culture is from the bottom up, that is, it comes from the raw base of the social structure, along its veins, sideways. For that base in Wales we have a wonderful word, 'gwerin', which means 'the ordinary people'—it is not the same as 'peasantry'.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Yr wyf wedi cytuno i roi munud yr un i Eleanor Burnham, Ann Jones, Owen John Thomas a Lisa Francis. Fel pwnc ar gyfer fy nadl fer, yr wyf wedi dewis y Cynulliad a'r ddarpariaeth diwylliant, cymorthdaliadau a pholisïau.

Yr ydym ni yng Nghymru yn falch iawn o'n diwylliant, a hynny'n briodol, gan fod gennym lawer i ymfalchio ynddo. Mae ein diwylliant yn seiliedig ar ansawdd; mae'n artistig, yn greadigol ac yn ddeallusol yn y bôn. Nid yw'n seiliedig ar ddigwyddiadau hanesyddol, na brwydrau pŵer y rheini sydd ag uchelgais i fod yn frenhinoedd a breninesau ac, efallai, yn wleidyddion. Nid yw'n seiliedig ar lymru, ar safle nac awdurdod, ac nid yw'n seiliedig ar bŵer prynu'r rheini sydd newydd ddod yn gyfoethog, sy'n prynu gwrthrychau 'celf' o ryw fath i gynyddu eu bri. Yng Nghymru, yn draddodiadol, nid yw diwylliant yn rhan o'r sefydliad; ychydig iawn o hynny a welwyd. Yma, yn draddodiadol, mae diwylliant yn rhywbeth o'r bôn i'r brig, hynny yw, daw o sylfaen grai'r strwythur cymdeithasol, ar hyd ei wythiennau, wysg ei ochr. Mae gennym air arbennig ar gyfer y sylfaen honno yng

Nghymru sef ‘y werin’, sy’n golygu ‘pobl gyffredin’—nid yw hynny yr un fath â ‘phobl wladaidd’.

Two characteristics mark the traditional culture of Wales. It comes out of the lives of ordinary people and it is based on quality and excellence. We have two eisteddfodau in Wales, the national and the international, and both, together, symbolise our belief in culture. The National Eisteddfod is local and peripatetic, travelling each year to a new home in a new community, and symbolises our tradition of community, and of localised commitment. The International Eisteddfod at Llangollen, that miracle of survival, stands for our belief that culture, as artistry and soul, links all the people of the world.

Mae dwy nodwedd i ddiwylliant traddodiadol Cymru. Mae’n deillio o fywydau pobl gyffredin ac mae’n seiliedig ar ansawdd a rhagoriaeth. Mae gennym ddwy eisteddfod yng Nghymru, y genedlaethol a’r rhyngwladol, ac mae’r ddwy, gyda’i gilydd, yn symboleiddio ein cred mewn diwylliant. Mae’r Eisteddfod Genedlaethol yn lleol ac yn gylchynol, yn teithio i gartref newydd mewn cymuned newydd bob blwyddyn, ac mae’n symboleiddio ein traddodiad o gymuned, ac o ymrwymiad lleol. Mae’r Eisteddfod Gydwladol yn Llangollen, y wyrth honno o oroesi, yn symbol o’n cred bod diwylliant, fel celfyddyd ac enaid, yn cysylltu pobl ar draws y byd.

We invented the word ‘eisteddfod’—there is no such word in English. The origins of eisteddfodau in Wales go back many centuries, to the days when our princes and grand families, such as the Rhys and Philips families, the Salusburys of Denbigh, and the Watkin Wynnes, took musicians, bards and players of the *telyn* and *crwth* into their houses and listened to them create and perform. These were families that sent their children to Oxford to be educated, that spoke English, Welsh, French and possibly Latin. Yet they did not drop their Welshness, but nurtured it. They paid their poets to write: their patronage was not mercenary, but artistic. Out of the competition among bards to create the best-quality work came the competitive local event, the eisteddfod. Even before that, the gwerin had their songs and poems. The *noson lawen* brought rural communities together for an evening of singing, poetry, creation and jocularly.

NI a fathodd y gair ‘eisteddfod’—nid oes gair tebyg yn Saesneg. Mae tarddiad eisteddfodau yng Nghymru yn mynd yn ôl ganrifoedd lawer, i’r dyddiau pan fyddai ein tywysogion a’n teuluoedd mawreddog, megis y Salusburys o Ddinbych, a’r Watkin Wynnes, yn gwahodd cerddorion, beirdd a chwaraewyr y delyn a’r crwth i’w tai ac yn gwranddo arnynt yn creu ac yn perfformio. Byddai’r teuluoedd hyn yn anfon eu plant i gael eu haddysg yn Rhydychen, ac yn siarad Saesneg, Cymraeg, Ffrangeg a Lladin efallai. Serch hynny, ni wnaethant anghofio eu Cymreictod. Yn hytrach, yr oeddent yn meithrin y Cymreictod hwnnw. Byddent yn talu eu beirdd i ysgrifennu: yr oedd eu nawdd yn artistig yn hytrach na’n ariangar. O’r gystadleuaeth ymhlith beirdd i greu’r gwaith gorau y deilliodd y digwyddiad cystadleuol lleol, yr eisteddfod. Hyd yn oed cyn hynny, yr oedd gan y werin ei chaneuon a’i barddoniaeth ei hun. Yr oedd y noson lawen yn dwyn ynghyd gymunedau gwledig i fwynhau noson o ganu, barddoni, creu a digrifwch.

Many Welsh-language poets of the last 200 years were ordinary working people. They were farmers, clerks, masons, and smiths. They had a craft of work and a craft of writing. In England, with a few exceptions—Shakespeare, for example—writers went to the universities. Wordsworth went to Cambridge and Samuel Johnson went to

Yr oedd nifer o feirdd Cymraeg y 200 mlynedd diwethaf yn bobl gyffredin dosbarth gweithiol. Yr oeddent yn ffermwyr, yn glercod, yn seiri maen ac yn ofaint. Yr oedd ganddynt grefft o ran eu gwaith ac ysgrifennu. Yn Lloegr, gyda rhai eithriadau—Shakespeare, er enghraifft—byddai ysgrifenydd yr un fath â’r prifysgolion.

Oxford. However, John Ceiriog Hughes stayed in the Ceiriog valley, and wrote such lyrical verse as:

‘Ond mae ‘nghalon yn y mynydd  
efo’r grug a’r adar man.’

Another artisan, John Williams, the blacksmith from Porthmadog, known as Ioan Madog, wrote in an englyn of great power:

‘Gwaed y groes a gwyd y graith  
Na welir mo’ni eilwaith’.

This is our tradition, and this is the heart of our culture: on the ground, in the workplace, among our *cymrodor*, in the community, and, essentially, in the mind, in the body, on the lips; in the quick brain—not in buildings, not in museums and galleries, and not in the structures of authority.

I am proud that we in Welsh Labour have understood all this. The lyricism on the lips of Aneurin Bevan is part of our culture, combining the beauty of art with the beauty of moral conviction. In this Government we have taken our financial resources and distributed them fairly and rationally to the cultural pulse points of Wales. We have been generous with the National Eisteddfod, and we have helped the International Eisteddfod. Our total culture budget for 2006-07 is £113 million, rising to £122 million in 2008-09. We are spending the money of the people, and I believe that we are spending it as they would wish.

The term ‘gwlad y gân’ is no misnomer. We in Wales have produced an extraordinary number of singers of the highest quality. From Geraint Evans to Bryn Terfel, they have graced the opera houses of the world. We put £4 million a year into the Welsh National Opera, by far the largest subsidy to any one artistic group in Wales. Every penny of it is well spent. This opera company is the jewel in our crown. It has conductors of international reputation and performs productions that are elaborate and that, sometimes, take a risk—not afraid to break

Bu Wordsworth yng Nghaer-grawnt a Samuel Johnson yn Rhydychen. Fodd bynnag, arhosodd John Ceiriog Hughes yn nyffryn Ceiriog, ac ysgrifennodd benillion telynegol fel:

But my heart is in the mountain  
with the heather and the little birds.

Ysgrifennodd grefftwr arall, John Williams, y gof o Borthmadog, a oedd yn adnabyddus fel Ioan Madog, mewn englyn pwerus iawn:

The blood of the cross raises the scar  
which will not be seen again.

Dyna yw ein traddodiad, a dyna yw gwraidd ein diwylliant: ar lawr gwlad, yn y gweithle, ymhlith ein *cymrodorion*, yn y gymuned, ac, yn ei hanfod, yn y meddwl, yn y corff, ar y gwefusau; yn y meddwl chwim—nid mewn adeiladau, nac amgueddfeydd ac orielau, ac nid mewn strwythurau awdurdod.

Yr wyf yn falch ein bod ni yn y Blaid Lafur yng Nghymru wedi deall hyn oll. Mae’r delynegiaeth ar wefusau Aneurin Bevan yn rhan o’n diwylliant, yn cyfuno harddwch celfyddyd â harddwch argyhoeddiad moesol. Yn y Llywodraeth hon, yr ydym wedi cymryd ein hadnoddau ariannol ac wedi eu dosbarthu’n deg ac yn rhesymol i ganolfannau diwylliannol Cymru. Yr ydym wedi bod yn hael wrth yr Eisteddfod Genedlaethol, ac yr ydym wedi helpu’r Eisteddfod Gydwladol. Cyfanswm ein cyllideb ddiwylliant am 2006-07 yw £113 miliwn, yn codi i £122 miliwn yn 2008-09. Yr ydym yn gwario arian y bobl, a chredaf ein bod yn ei wario fel y byddent yn dymuno i ni ei wneud.

Nid yw’r term ‘gwlad y gân’ yn gamenwi. Yr ydym wedi cynhyrchu nifer rhyfeddol o gantorion o’r safon uchaf yng Nghymru. O Geraint Evans i Bryn Terfel, maent wedi perfformio ar lwyfannau tai opera ledled y byd. Yr ydym yn rhoi £4 miliwn y flwyddyn i Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru, y cymhorthdal mwyaf o bell ffordd a roddir i un grŵp artistig yng Nghymru. Caiff pob ceiniog ohono ei gwario’n dda. Ymfalchiwn yn y cwmni opera hwn. Mae ganddo arweinyddion sydd ag enw da yn rhyngwladol, ac mae’n perfformio cynyrchiadau coeth sydd

new ground. Always, quality—even perfection—is the aim. We are pleased to have the internationally respected Terry Hands running things at Clwyd Theatr Cymru, which received £1.7 million in revenue grant for the year 2004-05.

Our national anthem speaks of ‘Gwlad beirdd a chantorion’—land of bards and singers. This may be an oversimplification now, but this is our tradition. The bardic tradition still lives in Welsh and English, in some quantity. A surprisingly large number of new books in Welsh are published each year. Welsh writing in English is also making great strides, following the transfer of responsibility from the Arts Council of Wales to the Welsh Books Council. Additional money has been made available following the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee’s report on Welsh writing in English. These developments are due in no small part to the help of the Welsh Books Council in Aberystwyth, whose editorial, design and sales units are market-based and of high professional standards. We allocate some £3.4 million per annum to the Welsh Books Council, £2.3 million of which is distributed in grants for publishing in both languages. The Academi in Cardiff is financed to the tune of some £600,000 per year, to promote Welsh writing and publicise new books.

I have argued that we in this Government are getting it about right in the distribution of cultural subsidies. Quality work needs support and patronage. We cannot leave market forces to prevail. We have to put our money where our souls are. We have to recognise the old Welsh tradition of excellence in the field of culture and nurture it, but at the same time we have to recognise that we are in a dynamic, temporal world. Time passes and things change; the shock of the new must not freeze us into rejection. If culture is not changing, it is dying.

We have our Glyn, our Big Brother; we have Tom Jones, apparently forever. There is

weithiau’n fentrus—nid yw’n ofni torri tir newydd. Y nod bob amser yw safon—perfffeithrwydd hyd yn oed. Yr ydym yn falch o gael Terry Hands, a gaiff ei barchu’n rhyngwladol, yn rhedeg Clwyd Theatr Cymru, a gafodd £1.7 miliwn o grant refeniw am y flwyddyn 2004-05.

Mae ein hanthem genedlaethol yn sôn am ‘Gwlad beirdd a chantorion’. Efallai fod hyn yn gorsymleiddio pethau erbyn hyn, ond dyna yw ein traddodiad. Mae’r traddodiad barddol yn fyw o hyd yn Gymraeg ac yn Saesneg, i ryw raddau. Cyhoeddir nifer rhyfeddol o lyfrau Cymraeg newydd bob blwyddyn. Mae ysgrifennu Cymreig yn Saesneg hefyd yn gwneud cynnydd mawr, yn dilyn trosglwyddo cyfrifoldeb o Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru i Gyngor Llyfrau Cymru. Neilltuwyd arian ychwanegol yn dilyn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon ar ysgrifennu Cymreig yn Saesneg. Mae a wnelo’r datblygiadau hyn yn bennaf â’r help a gafwyd gan y Cyngor Llyfrau Cymraeg yn Aberystwyth, sydd â’i unedau golygyddol, cynllunio a gwerthiant yn seiliedig ar y farchnad ac yn gweithredu yn unol â safonau proffesiynol uchel. Yr ydym yn neilltuo tua £3.4 miliwn y flwyddyn i Gyngor Llyfrau Cymru, y dosberthir £2.3 miliwn ohono mewn grantiau ar gyfer cyhoeddiadau yn y ddwy iaith. Rhoddir tua £600,000 y flwyddyn i Academi yng Nghaerdydd i hyrwyddo ysgrifennu Cymraeg ac i roi cyhoeddusrwydd i lyfrau newydd.

Yr wyf wedi dadlau ein bod ni, yn y Llywodraeth hon, yn dosbarthu cymorthdaliadau diwylliannol yn gywir ar y cyfan. Mae angen rhoi cymorth a nawdd i waith o safon. Ni allwn adael i rymoedd y farchnad drechu. Rhaid inni roi ein harian lle mae ein henaid. Rhaid inni gydnabod yr hen draddodiad Cymreig o ragoriaeth ym maes diwylliant a’i meithrin. Ond ar yr un pryd, rhaid inni gydnabod ein bod mewn byd deinamig, amserol. Mae amser yn mynd heibio ac mae pethau’n newid; rhaid inni beidio â gwrthod pethau oherwydd eu bod yn newydd. Os nad yw diwylliant yn newid, mae’n marw.

Mae gennym Glyn, ein Brawd Mawr; mae gennym Tom Jones, am byth mae’n debyg.

always the new wave. Technology drives forward at an increasing pace. However, my son William still says to me on a Friday night, ‘Dwi’n mynd i’r pictiwrws, Mam, hefo nghariad’—‘I am going to the pictures, Mum, with my girlfriend’.

Dance and film need to be valued and supported. In Llandudno, we have two music and dance groups that are bringing on youngsters. In three years’ time, they might be on the west end stage in the virile musical scene.

5.40 p.m.

Therefore, in Wales, we have much to be proud of. We have a tradition based on quality, but we are not hidebound by tradition. We shall use quality as our yardstick to evaluate the present and to frame the future.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae’n anodd gwybod sut mae dilyn hynny. Teimlaf yn gryf ein bod yn gweithio’n galed dros ein diwylliant Cymreig. Ddydd Sadwrn, yr oeddwn yn yr Ŵyl Gerdd Dant yn Rhosllannerchrugog—bûm yno drwy’r dydd ac am y rhan fwyaf o’r nos. Fel y dywedodd Denise, mae’n dangos yn union sut mae’r diwylliant Cymreig yn dod o’r werin, yn enwedig diwydiant cyfrwng Cymraeg. Teimlaf yn gryf y dylem wneud ein gorau i sicrhau bod Eisteddfod Genedlaethol Cymru yn edrych allan i’r byd oherwydd bod tipyn o ansawdd yn yr Eisteddfod, fel y crybwyllodd Denise. Teimlaf yn fawr y dylem fod yn amlieithog yn yr Eisteddfod oherwydd, pan ystyriwch Eisteddfod Gerddorol Rhyngwladol Llangollen, fe welwch mai nod yr Eisteddfod honno yw edrych allan i’r byd. Credaf fod Denise yn iawn i ddweud y dylem wneud ein gorau i gadw’r ansawdd ym mhob agwedd ar y diwylliant effeithiol sydd gennym yng Nghymru.

**Ann Jones:** I thank Denise for this important debate. It is important that we recognise the culture within our country. We have a lot to celebrate, as you said throughout your speech. However, we also need to ensure that we handle this sensitively and we have to realise that we are now a multicultural society. I am proud of my culture and, in

Mae yna don newydd bob amser. Mae technoleg yn mynd rhagddi yn gynyddol gyflym. Fodd bynnag, mae fy mab William yn dal i ddweud wrthyf ar nos Wener, ‘Dwi’n mynd i’r pictiwrws, Mam, hefo nghariad’.

Mae angen gwerthfawrogi dawns a ffilm a’u cefnogi. Yn Llandudno, mae gennym ddau grŵp cerddoriaeth a dawns sy’n meithrin pobl ifanc. Ymhen tair blynedd, efallai y byddant yn troedio llwyfan y west end mewn sioe gerdd.

Felly, yng Nghymru, mae gennym lawer y gallwn ymfalchio ynddo. Mae gennym draddodiad sy’n seiliedig ar safon, ond nid ydym yn gaeth i draddodiad. Byddwn yn defnyddio safon fel ffon fesur i werthuso’r presennol ac i lywio’r dyfodol.

**Eleanor Burnham:** It is difficult to know how to follow that. I feel strongly that we are working hard for our Welsh culture. On Saturday, I attended the Gŵyl Cerdd Dant in Rhosllannerchrugog—I was there all day and for most of the evening. As Denise said, it shows exactly how Welsh culture has emanated from the ordinary people, particularly culture through the medium of Welsh. I feel strongly that we should do our best to ensure that the National Eisteddfod of Wales looks outwards on the world because there is great quality in the Eisteddfod, as Denise said. I strongly feel that we should be multilingual in the Eisteddfod because, when you consider the Llangollen International Musical Eisteddfod, you see the aim of that Eisteddfod to look outwards at the wider world. I think Denise is quite right to say that we should do our best to retain that quality in all aspects of the effective culture that we have in Wales.

**Ann Jones:** Diolch Denise am y ddadl bwysig hon. Mae’n bwysig inni gydnabod y diwylliant yn ein gwlad. Mae gennym lawer i’w ddathlu, fel yr oeddech yn ei ddweud drwy gydol eich araith. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni hefyd sicrhau ein bod yn ymdrin â hyn mewn ffordd sensitif, a rhaid inni sylweddoli ein bod bellach yn gymdeithas



particular, my social history culture, which is why I have supported Huw Lewis's call for a museum of people's history. Ordinary working-class men and women have helped to fashion our culture over the decades and centuries—think of the Penrhyn lockouts, the ladies of Llangollen and many more—and we should be ready to recognise this and other cultural events across our country. Wales is more than just a land of song and of men in shorts playing rugby; it is also a land of success in other sporting spheres, such as football, swimming, and cycling. All of these are now coming to the fore. We should be proud of any sportsperson who bravely flies the flag of Wales; we should be proud to support them and include them in our culture.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae gan Gymru amrywiaeth o ffynonellau i ddenu pobl i weld a gwerthfawrogi ein hetifeddiaeth gyfoethog. Mae gennym hanes cyffrous a diddorol, fel y dywedodd Ann. Mae gennym dirluniau hardd ac amrywiol, llenyddiaeth mewn dwy iaith, traddodiadau radicalaidd, sefydliadau cenedlaethol, amgylchedd adeiledig hardd, a chanu gyda chorau a chantorion o fri. Beth yw buddsoddiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn hyn? Yr ateb yw dim ond 1 y cant o'i holl gyllideb. Os credwn fod ein diwylliant yn bwysig, dylem fuddsoddi ynddo. Pe bai Llywodraeth radicalaidd yma fis Mai nesaf, gwelem hynny, ond ni welir hynny dan y Llywodraeth hon, yn anffodus.

**Lisa Francis:** Thank you for a wonderful debate, Denise. I fully endorse your comments about the Eisteddfod. Like anyone who went through the Welsh primary school system, that was my first experience of the Eisteddfod. It was important because it gave us confidence and discipline. That discipline, in turn, helped us, if we could not achieve perfection, to strive to make a huge effort. It is that effort that is an important part of our culture. It is also our wider culture that is the jewel in the crown for Wales. You mentioned Welsh writing in English; I reiterate my comments to the Minister this morning in committee about the need to get that joint marketing strategy up and running. While we celebrate the classics and our wonderful

aml-ddiwylliant. Yr wyf yn falch o'm diwylliant i, ac yn arbennig fy niwylliant hanes cymdeithasol, a dyma pam yr wyf wedi cefnogi cais Huw Lewis am amgueddfa ar gyfer hanes pobl. Mae dynion a merched cyffredin dosbarth gweithiol wedi helpu llunio ein diwylliant dros y degawdau a'r canrifoedd—ystyriwch y cau allan ym Mhenrhyn, merched Llangollen a llawer mwy—a dylem fod yn barod i gydnabod hyn a digwyddiadau diwylliannol eraill ledled ein gwlad. Mae Cymru yn fwy na gwlad y gân lle mae dynion mewn siorts yn chwarae rygbi; mae hefyd yn wlad sydd wedi llwyddo mewn meysydd chwaraeon eraill, fel pêl-droed, nofio a seiclo. Mae'r chwaraeon hyn yn dod i'r amlwg yn awr. Dylem fod yn falch o unrhyw un sy'n chwifio baner Cymru ym maes chwaraeon; dylem fod yn falch i'w cefnogi a'u cynnwys yn ein diwylliant.

**Owen John Thomas:** Wales has a variety of sources to draw people to see and appreciate our rich tradition. As Ann said, we have an exciting and interesting history. We have beautiful and varying landscapes, literature in two languages, radical traditions, national institutions, a beautiful built environment, and singing by highly regarded choirs and singers. What is the Assembly Government's investment in this? The answer is, only 1 per cent of its whole budget. If we believe our culture is important, we should invest in it. If we have a radical Government here next May, we will see that, but it is not the case under this Government, unfortunately.

**Lisa Francis:** Diolch am ddadl arbennig, Denise. Yr wyf yn cefnogi eich sylwadau ynglŷn â'r Eisteddfod yn gyfan gwbl. Fel unrhyw un a aeth drwy'r system ysgol gynradd yng Nghymru, dyna oedd fy mhrofiad cyntaf o'r Eisteddfod. Yr oedd yn bwysig oherwydd yr oedd yn rhoi hyder a disgyblaeth inni. Yn ei thro, helpodd y ddisgyblaeth honno ni, os nad oeddem yn gallu cyrraedd perffeithrwydd, i ymdrechu hyd eithaf ein gallu. Mae'r ymdrech honno'n rhan bwysig o'n diwylliant. Ymfalchïwn yn ein diwylliant ehangach yng Nghymru hefyd. Soniech am ysgrifennu Cymreig yn Saesneg; hoffwn ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedais wrth y Gweinidog y bore yma yn y pwyllgor ynglŷn â'r angen am sicrhau bod y gyd-strategaeth

history, it is important to support new developments in our culture, which means supporting new writing.

Finally, our culture in Wales is largely untapped. We need to work across all of the portfolios to make the most of that so that the wider world recognises just what we have to offer.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh):** Yn anffodus, nid wyf yn mynd i'r pictiwrws gyda fy nghariad ar nos Wener mwyach.

However, I thank you, Denise, for stimulating this short debate on supporting culture. You are right that culture defines what we are—it defines us as individuals, as communities, and as a nation. What would Wales be without its music, literature, sport, visual arts, and yr iaith Gymraeg—from Thomas Jones, the painter, to Tom Jones, the singer? Ann Jones and Denise mentioned the crucial role of 'y werin' in Welsh culture. We think back not just to the support and the writing that has come from ordinary working people, but also to the financial hardship that those people endured in order to make voluntary contributions. We think back to everything from the slate workers in north Wales, to the coal miners making penny contributions out of meagre wages to build miners' institutes and libraries. Culture was very much at the heart of the culture of 'y werin'.

These days, we are far more fortunate. Culture contributes to the quality of life on several levels—there is enjoyment and the satisfaction of simply attending a cultural event, or taking part, and, increasingly these days, culture provides employment and economic security for many people. I am proud of the investment—both capital and revenue—that the Assembly Government has made in culture; it is one of the Assembly Government's many success stories. We have significantly increased spending on culture since devolution. If you take a broad view of culture, namely, supporting the arts, museums, libraries, archives, heritage, and yr iaith Gymraeg, that spending has more than

farchnata honno yn mynd rhagddi. Er ein bod yn dathlu'r clasuron a'n hanes arbennig, mae'n bwysig cefnogi datblygiadau newydd yn ein diwylliant, sy'n golygu cefnogi ysgrifennu newydd.

Yn olaf, mae ein diwylliant yng Nghymru heb ei gyffwrdd i raddau helaeth. Mae angen inni weithio ar draws pob portffolio i wneud y gorau o hynny er mwyn i'r byd mawr yn gyfan gydnabod yr hyn sydd gennym i'w gynnig.

**The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh):** Unfortunately, I no longer go to the cinema with my girlfriend on a Friday night.

Fodd bynnag, diolch ichi, Denise, am ysgogi'r ddadl fer hon ar gefnogi diwylliant. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle bod diwylliant yn ein diffinio—mae'n ein diffinio fel unigolion, fel cymunedau, ac fel gwlad. Beth fyddai Cymru heb ei cherddoriaeth, ei llenyddiaeth, ei chwaraeon, ei chelfyddydau gweledol, a'r Gymraeg—o Thomas Jones, yr arlunydd, i Tom Jones, y canwr? Soniodd Ann Jones a Denise am rôl hanfodol y werin yn niwylliant Cymru. Cofiw'n nid yn unig y gefnogaeth a'r llenyddiaeth a ddaeth gan bobl weithiol gyffredin, ond hefyd y caledi ariannol a wynebai'r bobl hynny er mwyn gwneud cyfraniadau gwirfoddol. Cofiw'n am bopeth o'r gweithwyr llechi yn y gogledd i'r glowyr a oedd yn cyfrannu ceiniog o'u cyflogau prin i adeiladu sefydliadau glowyr a llyfrgelloedd. Yr oedd diwylliant yn rhan greiddiol o ddiwylliant y werin.

Erbyn hyn, yr ydym lawer yn fwy ffodus. Mae diwylliant yn cyfrannu at ansawdd bywyd ar lawer lefel—yr ydym yn mwynhau mynychu digwyddiad diwylliannol, neu gymryd rhan ynddo, ac yn cael boddhad o hynny, ac yn gynyddol erbyn hyn mae diwylliant yn darparu cyflogaeth a diogelwch economaidd i lawer. Yr wyf yn falch o'r buddsoddiad—yn gyfalaf ac yn refeniw—y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi'i wneud mewn diwylliant; mae'n un o lwyddiannau niferus Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi cynyddu gwariant ar ddiwylliant yn sylweddol ers datganoli. Os edrychwch ar ddiwylliant yn gyffredinol, sef cefnogi'r celfyddydau, amgueddfeydd, llyfrgelloedd,

doubled since 1999, from around £50 million to over £103 million in 2006-07. Owen John gave us some fine words about the lack of culture spending; as a result of opposition amendments to last year's budget planning round, spending on culture was cut below the Assembly Government's proposals. Let us see what happens in this year's budget.

**Lisa Francis:** I am grateful to you for giving way—you are far more generous than many of your other colleagues today.

We are where we are with the budget, as I said this morning. Do you not accept that? Do you not think that you should have reconsidered making an announcement about what you intend to spend on the Merthyr project two weeks ago?

**Alun Pugh:** Absolutely not. Frankly, people who live in Merthyr Tydfil, and those who live across that Heads of the Valleys corridor, have not had the cultural investment in their infrastructure that many other parts of Wales have had in recent years. That was an enormous vote of confidence by Welsh Labour in the Heads of the Valleys area; it has been enormously welcomed by people, not just in Merthyr Tydfil, but at the top of the Cynon valley, right across to the top of Blaenau Gwent.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr ydych yn beio bawb a phopeth am y ffaith nad yw Merthyr wedi cael hyn a'r llall. Fodd bynnag, y gwir amdani yw bod Merthyr wedi bod o dan lywodraeth leol Lafur am dros 80 mlynedd, ac wedi cael Aelodau Seneddol Llafur ers dros 80 mlynedd. Dyna'r hyn sydd o'i le yn Merthyr, a dyna'r gwendid—y Blaid Lafur.

**Alun Pugh:** You will find that the Labour Party has not been in power for the majority of the twentieth century. However, I am proud that we are rectifying that missing link in cultural expenditure. Our total accumulative spend on culture, since devolution, is of the order of £670 million.

We support culture, as a Labour Government, for several reasons. First, we celebrate Wales

archifau, treftadaeth a'r Gymraeg, mae'r gwariant hwnnw wedi mwy na dyblu er 1999, o ryw £50 miliwn i dros £103 miliwn yn 2006-07. Cawsom eiriau coeth gan Owen John am ddiffyg gwariant ar ddiwylliant; o ganlyniad i welliannau'r gwrthbleidiau i gylch cynllunio'r gyllideb y llynedd, cwtogwyd gwariant ar ddiwylliant i lai na chynigion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Gadewch inni weld beth ddaw o'r gyllideb eleni.

**Lisa Francis:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am ildio—yr ydych lawer yn fwy hael na nifer o'ch cyd-Aelodau eraill heddiw.

Mae sefyllfa'r gyllideb fel y mae, fel y dywedais y bore yma. Oni dderbyniwch hynny? Oni chredwch y dylech fod wedi ailystyried gwneud cyhoeddiad am yr hyn y bwriadwch ei wario ar brosiect Merthyr bythefnos yn ôl?

**Alun Pugh:** Ddim o gwbl. Y gwir amdani yw nad yw pobl sy'n byw ym Merthyr Tudful, a'r rheini sy'n byw ar draws coridor Blaenau'r Cymoedd, wedi gweld yr un buddsoddiad diwylliannol yn eu seilwaith ag a welodd llawer rhan arall o Gymru yn ddiweddar. Yr oedd hynny'n arwydd pwysig o hyder gan Lafur Cymru yn ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd; mae wedi cael croeso cynnes gan bobl, nid yn unig ym Merthyr Tudful ond ym mhen uchaf cwm Cynon, hyd at ben uchaf Blaenau Gwent.

**Owen John Thomas:** You blame everyone and anyone for what Merthyr has not had. However, the truth is that Merthyr has been under Labour local government control for over 80 years, and has had Labour Members of Parliament for over 80 years. That is what is wrong in Merthyr, and that is the weakness—the Labour Party.

**Alun Pugh:** Ni fu'r Blaid Lafur mewn grym am y rhan fwyaf o'r ugeinfed ganrif. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch ein bod yn unioni'r gadwyn goll honno o ran gwariant ar ddiwylliant. Yr ydym wedi gwario cyfanswm cronol o ryw £670 miliwn ar ddiwylliant ers datganoli.

Yr ydym yn cefnogi diwylliant, fel Llywodraeth Lafur, am lawer rheswm. Yn

as a culturally rich, bilingual country. We have big festivals, such as the Faenol festival, the national eisteddfod, and Brecon jazz. As Ann Jones said, the wonderful success of the Llangollen International Eisteddfod does so much for international relations. There is also the Hay literature festival, as well as the many local festivals that the Assembly Government supports via the Arts Council of Wales, which add significantly to local vibrancy, promoting local culture and performers, boosting local economies.

5.50 p.m.

On literature, the support that the Assembly Government has provided to Academi has helped to foster Welsh authors and writers, while the Welsh Books Council has helped to produce and sell a wide range of books. I am very pleased with the positive figures on the growth of books in Welsh and English and I am very pleased that the Library of Wales series, as well as being a storming cultural success, appears to be a commercial success as well. Much credit is due to Dai Smith, who has lead on this project, and Parthian who publish this series. Last week's launch means that there are now nine titles in that series, and while the national curriculum for Wales is not a matter for me, obviously, I look forward to the day when these sorts of books appear on syllabuses of examination bodies such as the Welsh Joint Education Committee.

A second reason for supporting culture is to promote Wales and its distinctive culture internationally. This ensures that our cultural talent is recognised and nurtured. Wales's presence at international events ranges from the Venice Biennale to the Chicago craft fair. Enabling international events to take place in Wales is also important—we think of prestigious events such as Artes Mundi or the Dylan Thomas literary prize, and how successful they have been. Indeed, the First Minister and I met with William Wilkins this morning to discuss how we can build Artes Mundi into the forthcoming cultural Olympiad.

gyntaf, yr ydym yn dathlu Cymru fel gwlad ddwyieithog sy'n llawn diwylliant. Mae gennym wyliau mawr, megis gŵyl y Faenol, yr eisteddfod genedlaethol, a jazz Aberhonddu. Fel y dywedodd Ann Jones, mae llwyddiant ardderchog Eisteddfod Gydwladol Llangollen yn holl bwysig o ran cysylltiadau rhyngwladol. Mae gŵyl lenyddiaeth hefyd yn y Gelli, yn ogystal â'r llu o wyliau lleol a gefnogir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad drwy Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, sy'n bwysig i ychwanegu at fywiogrwydd lleol, hyrwyddo diwylliant a pherfformwyr lleol, hybu economïau lleol.

O ran llenyddiaeth, mae cefnogaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i Academi wedi helpu meithrin awduron ac ysgrifenyddwyr Cymraeg, ac mae Cyngor Llyfrau Cymru wedi helpu cynhyrchu a gwerthu amrywiaeth eang o lyfrau. Yr wyf yn falch iawn â'r ffigurau cadarnhaol am y twf mewn llyfrau Cymraeg a Saesneg, ac yr wyf yn falch iawn bod cyfres Llyfrgell Cymru, yn ogystal â bod yn llwyddiant diwylliannol ysgubol, yn ôl pob tebyg, yn llwyddiant masnachol hefyd. Rhaid diolch i Dai Smith, arweinydd y prosiect hwn, a Parthian sy'n cyhoeddi'r gyfres hon. Yn dilyn achlysur lansio'r wythnos diwethaf, mae naw teitl yn y gyfres honno erbyn hyn, ac er nad yw cwricwlwm cenedlaethol Cymru yn fater i mi, yn amlwg, edrychaf ymlaen at y diwrnod pan fydd y mathau hyn o lyfrau yn rhan o feysydd llafur cyrff arholi megis Cyd Bwyllgor Addysg Cymru.

Ail reswm dros gefnogi diwylliant yw er mwyn hyrwyddo Cymru a'i diwylliant arbennig yn rhyngwladol. Mae hyn yn sicrhau y caiff ein doniau diwylliannol eu cydnabod a'u meithrin. Mae presenoldeb Cymru mewn digwyddiadau rhyngwladol yn amrywio o Biennale yn Venice i ffair grefftiau Chicago. Mae galluogi digwyddiadau rhyngwladol i gael eu cynnal yng Nghymru hefyd yn bwysig—meddyliwn am ddigwyddiadau clodwiw megis Artes Mundi neu wobwr lenyddol Dylan Thomas, a'u llwyddiant. Yn wir, cefais i a'r Prif Weinidog gyfarfod gyda William Wilkins y bore yma i drafod sut y gallwn gynnwys Artes Mundi o fewn yr Olympiad diwylliannol nesaf.

A third reason for supporting culture is that it preserves and promotes Wales's historic environment and collections. We present and maintain these as best as we possibly can. The funding of Wales's historic heritage through Cadw, the National Library of Wales and Amgueddfa Cymru has increased significantly since devolution. Recently, I announced that I would make £150,000 available for a feasibility study into a new national gallery and contemporary art space, following the publication earlier this year of a consultant's report on the display of art in Wales.

Most importantly, in supporting culture, I have sought to ensure that the best of Wales's activity and artwork is accessible to the public across the nation. The survey of attendance, participation and attitudes to the arts in Wales shows that there are significant differences in participation and attendance across socioeconomic groups. For example, 80 per cent of socioeconomic groups A and B have attended arts events, compared with some 50 per cent of categories D and E. We know that those living in Communities First areas are less likely to participate and attend than the population of Wales generally, which is clearly an issue for anyone who is concerned about social justice.

I am proud that the Assembly Government, in its first term, provided free access to our national museums. I am pleased with the initiatives that the arts council has adopted at my request, to encourage greater participation, especially in deprived communities, for example, the Nights Out scheme, which works particularly well in Communities First areas, and schemes such as the outstanding Clwyd Theatr Cymru mobile theatre, which has performed in leisure centres and areas where access to a theatre is unusual. It is also important to record this afternoon that you can get to see our national opera company for a fiver. That is an important artistic investment too.

Last week, we were talking about the display

Trydydd rheswm dros gefnogi diwylliant yw'r ffaith ei fod yn gwarchod ac yn hyrwyddo amgylchedd a chasgliadau hanesyddol Cymru. Yr ydym yn eu cyflwyno a'u cynnal gystal ag y medrwn. Mae'r cyllid a ddarperir i dreftadaeth hanesyddol Cymru dwy Cadw, Llyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru ac Amgueddfa Cymru wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol ers datganoli. Yn ddiweddar, cyhoeddais y byddwn yn rhyddhau £150,000 ar gyfer astudiaeth dichonoldeb o oriel a chanolfan genedlaethol newydd ar gyfer celfyddyd gyfoes, yn dilyn cyhoeddi adroddiad gan ymgynghorydd yn gynharach eleni am arddangos celf yng Nghymru.

Yn anad dim, wrth gefnogi diwylliant, yr wyf wedi ceisio sicrhau bod y goreuon o blith gweithgarwch a chelfwaith Cymru yn gyfleus i'r cyhoedd ledled y wlad. Dengys yr arolwg o bresenoldeb, cyfranogiad ac agweddau at y celfyddydau yng Nghymru fod gwahaniaethau sylweddol o ran cyfranogiad a phresenoldeb ar draws grwpiau economaidd-gymdeithasol. Er enghraifft, mae 80 y cant o grwpiau economaidd-gymdeithasol A a B wedi mynychu digwyddiadau celfyddydol, o'u cymharu â thua 50 y cant o gategoriâu D ac E. Gwyddom fod y rheini sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn llai tebygol o gyfranogi a mynychu na phoblogaeth Cymru'n gyffredinol, sy'n amlwg yn bryder i unrhyw un sy'n ymwneud â chyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

Yr wyf yn falch fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn ei thymor cyntaf, wedi darparu mynediad am ddim i'n hamgueddfeydd cenedlaethol. Yr wyf yn falch o'r mentrau y mae cyngor y celfyddydau wedi'u mabwysiadu ar fy nghais, i annog mwy o gyfranogi, er enghraifft, y cynllun Noson Allan, sy'n arbennig o lwyddiannus mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, a chynlluniau megis theatr deithiol eithriadol Clwyd Theatr Cymru, sydd wedi perfformio mewn canolfannau hamdden ac ardaloedd lle nad yw'n arferol mynd i'r theatr. Mae hefyd yn bwysig cofnodi'r prynhawn yma y gallwch weld ein cwmni opera cenedlaethol am bum punt. Mae hynny'n fuddsoddiad artistig pwysig hefyd.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oeddem yn sôn am

of work, and I have made some £100,000 in funding available to the Isle of Anglesey County Council for the Sir Kyffin Williams gallery at Oriol Ynys Môn. Major work will soon be under way to turn Ffotogallery in Margam into a national centre for the development of photography. Major refurbishment work will also soon start at Oriol Mostyn, which is in Denise's constituency. Substantial progress has been made in developing Wales's network of theatres, which now includes the Aberystwyth Arts Centre, the new Theatr Galeri at Caernarfon, the Riverfront at Newport, Theatr Brycheiniog in Brecon, Theatr Mwldan in Cardigan, which has had substantial investment, and the Torch Theatre in Milford Haven, which will also receive substantial investment.

I recently announced a £750,000 investment for English-language theatre. This will initially involve upgrading the production capacity of Wales's existing production and touring companies, including Clwyd Theatr Cymru, the Wales Theatre Company, establishing a new production company at the merged Sgript Cymru and Sherman Theatre, and establishing a small team to commission and produce new work for the stage. I believe that this investment in the network of theatres, the development of a professional approach to commissioning and the production and touring of new material will significantly strengthen the theatre and significantly strengthen Wales's cultural identity.

One of the key challenges in supporting culture is to ensure that the Assembly Government's spending on culture meets the objectives set out in 'Wales: A Better Country'. The Culture Board is currently considering proposals for a new culture strategy. This will set out a new vision for culture to refresh the Assembly Government's first culture strategy, 'Creative Future: Cymru Creadigol'. I hope that the strategy will draw on good practice from across the world and that it will also reflect the lessons emerging from 'Making the Connections' and the Beecham review. I believe that collaboration between those responsible for the promotion of culture in all its forms and those involved in the

arddangos gwaith, ac yr wyf wedi darparu cyllid o tua £100,000 i Gyngor Sir Ynys Môn ar gyfer oriel Syr Kyffin Williams yn Oriol Ynys Môn. Bydd rhaglen waith gynhwysfawr yn dechrau'n fuan i droi Ffotogallery ym Margam yn ganolfan genedlaethol ar gyfer datblygu ffotograffiaeth. Bydd gwaith adnewyddu pwysig hefyd yn dechrau'n fuan yn Oriol Mostyn, sydd yn etholaeth Denise. Gwnaed cynnydd sylweddol wrth ddatblygu rhwydwaith theatrau Cymru, sydd bellach yn cynnwys Canolfan Gelfyddydau Aberystwyth, Theatr Galeri newydd yng Nghaernarfon, Glan yr Afon yng Nghasnewydd, Theatr Brycheiniog yn Aberhonddu, Theatr Mwldan yn Aberteifi, lle buddsoddwyd yn sylweddol, a Theatr y Torch yn Aberdaugleddau a fydd hefyd yn cael buddsoddiad sylweddol.

Yn ddiweddar cyhoeddais fuddsoddiad o £750,000 mewn theatr Saesneg. I ddechrau, caiff capasiti cynhyrchu cwmnïau cynhyrchu a theithio presennol Cymru ei uwchraddio, gan gynnwys Clwyd Theatr Cymru, Cwmni Theatr Cymru, caiff cwmni cynhyrchu newydd ei sefydlu yn Sgript Cymru a Theatr Sherman ar ôl eu huno, a chaiff tîm bach ei sefydlu i gomisiynu a chynhyrchu gwaith newydd i'r llwyfan. Credaf y bydd y buddsoddiad hwn yn y rhwydwaith theatrau, y broses o ddatblygu dull proffesiynol o gomisiynu a'r deunydd newydd a gaiff ei gynhyrchu a'i gyflwyno ar deithiau yn atgyfnerthu'r theatr yn sylweddol, ac yn atgyfnerthu hunaniaeth ddiwylliannol Cymru yn sylweddol.

Un o'r prif heriau wrth gefnogi diwylliant yw sicrhau bod gwariant Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar ddiwylliant yn bodloni'r amcanion a nodwyd yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'. Mae'r Bwrdd Diwylliant wrthi ar hyn o bryd yn ystyried cynigion ar gyfer strategaeth ddiwylliant newydd. Bydd y strategaeth hon yn gosod allan weledigaeth newydd ar gyfer diwylliant i adfywio strategaeth ddiwylliant gyntaf Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, 'Cymru Greadigol'. Gobeithio y bydd y strategaeth yn ystyried arfer da o bob cwr o'r byd, ac y bydd hefyd yn adlewyrchu'r gwersi sy'n deillio o 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' ac adolygiad Beecham. Credaf y bydd cydweithredu rhwng y rheini sy'n gyfrifol am hyrwyddo diwylliant ar bob ffurf

development of tourism and economic development, including the cultural industries, such as film, video and DVD, will work to the long-term benefit of the people and the economy of Wales.

a'r rheini sy'n ymwneud â datblygu twristiaeth a datblygu economaidd, gan gynnwys y diwydiannau diwylliannol, megis ffilm, fideo a DVD, o fudd hirdymor i bobl Cymru a'i heconomi.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.55 p.m.*

*The meeting ended at 5.55 p.m.*

#### **Aelodau a'u Pleidiau**

#### **Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)

Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)