



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Mawrth, 22 Chwefror 2005

Tuesday, 22 February 2005

Cynnwys
Contents

- 4 Penodi i Gyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol
Appointment to the Local Government Partnership Council
- 5 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog
Questions to the First Minister
- 32 Cwestiwn Brys
Urgent Question
- 35 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order
- 36 Datganiad Busnes
Business Statement
- 41 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order
- 42 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Plaleiddiaid (Lefelau Gweddillion Uchaf mewn Cnydau, Bwyddyn a Phorthiant) (Cymru a Lloegr) (Diwygio) 2005
Approval of the Pesticides (Maximum Residue Levels in Crops, Food and Feeding Stuff) (England and Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005
- 44 Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion
Composite Motion: Approval of Orders
- 47 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynllun Taliad Sengl y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin a Chynlluniau Cymorth (Cymru) 2005
Approval of the Common Agricultural Policy Single Payment and Support Schemes (Wales) Regulations 2005
- 62 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cyfrifon ac Archwilio (Cymru) 2005
Approval of the Accounts and Audit (Wales) Regulations 2005
- 70 Penodi Archwilwyr Newydd i Archwilio Cyfrifon Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru
Appointment of the New Auditors of the Accounts of the Auditor General for Wales
- 72 Adroddiad y Prif Swyddog Meddygol
The Chief Medical Officer's Report
- 104 Pumed Adroddiad Blynyddol Cydraddoldeb y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol
The National Assembly's Fifth Equality Annual Report
- 109 Cynnig Trefniadol
Procedural Motion
- 110 Pumed Adroddiad Blynyddol Cydraddoldeb y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol: Parhad
The National Assembly's Fifth Equality Annual Report: Continued
- 122 Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i Reolau Sefydlog
Approval of Changes to Standing Orders

- 123 Atal Rheolau Sefydlog
Suspension of Standing Orders
- 124 Anfon Mesurau i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal
Remitting of Bills to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Penodi i Gyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol
Appointment to the Local Government Partnership Council**

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I **Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod
propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with paragraph 1(1) of Schedule 11 to the Government of Wales Act 1998, appoints Christine Chapman AM (Labour) as National Assembly member of the Local Government Partnership Council for Wales in place of Huw Lewis AM (Labour). *Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â pharagraff 1(1) o Atodlen 11 i Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penodi Christine Chapman AC (Llafur) yn aelod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar Gyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, yn lle Huw Lewis AC (Llafur).* (NDM2291)
(NDM2291)

*Cynnig (NDM2291): O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2291): For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen

Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Statws Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg The Status of the Welsh Language Board

C1 Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y trefniadau i newid statws Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg? OAQ0177(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Bydd Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn uno â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o fis Ebrill 2007. Bwriedir penodi dyfarnydd a fydd yn ymdrin â swyddogaethau rheoliadol y bwrdd o safbwynt goruchwyllo cynlluniau iaith Gymraeg. Yn y lle cyntaf, ar sail ymgynghorol y bydd yn gwneud hyn ond, pan gyfyd cyfle deddfwriaethol, bydd yn gweithio ar sail statudol.

Alun Ffred Jones: A fydd hynny'n golygu creu Deddf iaith newydd ac, os felly, pryd ydych chi'n rhagweld y bydd hynny'n digwydd o gofio anhawster y Llywodraeth i gael deddfwriaeth drwy'r Senedd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Rhaid inni gymryd y cyfle pan ddaw; os gwelwn fwch, rhaid cymryd y siawns. Ni allwch ragweld yn union pryd fydd hynny'n digwydd, ac nid oes gwasgu anferth arnom ychwaith. Heb unrhyw golled o ran y sefyllfa bresennol, bydd y dyfarnydd yn gallu gwneud y gwaith dros dro ar sail anstatudol.

Lisa Francis: First Minister, can you tell me what research has been conducted into the exact role of the *dyfarnydd*, and the effect that his or her appointment will have on the aims of 'Iaith Pawb'? When I asked the Minister with responsibility for culture about that in the short debate on 26 January, he left a couple of my questions unanswered. Therefore, can you detail the person's work

Q1 Alun Ffred Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on the arrangements to change the status of the Welsh Language Board? OAQ0177(FM)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): The Welsh Language Board will merge with the Assembly Government from April 2007. A *dyfarnydd* will be appointed to deal with the board's regulatory functions in overseeing Welsh language schemes. Initially, that will be on an advisory basis, converting to a statutory basis when the legislative opportunity arises.

Alun Ffred Jones: Will that lead to the drafting of a new Welsh language Act and, if so, when do you anticipate that happening, bearing in mind the difficulty that the Government has in getting legislation through Parliament?

The First Minister: We must take the opportunity when it arises; if we see a gap, we must take our chance. You cannot anticipate exactly when that will occur, and there is no great pressure on us either. In the meantime, the *dyfarnydd* will be able to carry out the work on a non-statutory basis in much the same way as things are done at present.

Lisa Francis: Brif Weinidog, a allwch ddweud wrthyf pa ymchwil a wnaed i union rôl y dyfarnydd, ac effaith ei benodi ar nodau 'Iaith Pawb'? Pan holais y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros ddiwylliant am hynny yn y ddadl fer ar 26 Ionawr, gadawodd un neu ddau o'm cwestiynau heb eu hateb. Felly, a allwch ddisgrifio gwaith y person hwnnw a pha bryd y disgwyliwch iddo gael ei

and when you expect it to be completed, considering that the Welsh Language Board will be brought in-house in just over a year's time?

The First Minister: The *dyfarnydd* will be the person executing the regulatory role, that is, of adjudicating Welsh language schemes on their merits or otherwise, in accordance with the terms of the Welsh Language Act 1993. 'Iaith Pawb' also covers that area, but it is distinct in its role. The *dyfarnydd* will have a quasi-judicial, or regulatory, role, whereas, by and large, 'Iaith Pawb' has a promotional role, and we have committed £28 million to its implementation.

Eleanor Burnham: Sut fydd eich Llywodraeth yn sicrhau atebolrwydd drwy'r dyfarnydd, neu bwy bynnag fydd yn rheoli hyn? Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn cyd-weld â mi bod canfyddiad na fydd atebolrwydd cystal ag ydyw ar hyn o bryd unwaith y bydd y materion a'r cwangos hyn oll yn dod i mewn i'r Llywodraeth.

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd yr atebolrwydd yn well. Os corff ar wahân, sef cwango, y soniwech amdano, ar hyn o bryd, mae pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad ac ati yn gallu gofyn i gadeirydd a phrif weithredwr y corff ddod gerbron o bryd i'w gilydd ond, os daw swyddogaethau'r corff yn rhan o swyddogaethau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, bydd yr atebolrwydd hwnnw yn rhan o bob Cyfarfod Llawn, boed yn ystod cwestiynau i mi, neu i'r Gweinidog perthnasol bob tair neu bedair wythnos. Gwneir y newidiadau hyn er mwyn gwella a symleiddio atebolrwydd.

gwblhau, o gofio y bydd Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn cael ei ymgorffori ymhen ychydig dros flwyddyn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Y dyfarnydd fydd y sawl sy'n cyflawni'r rôl reoliadol, hynny yw, dyfarnu ar gynlluniau iaith Gymraeg ar sail eu rhinweddau neu eu diffygion, yn unol ag amodau Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993. Mae 'Iaith Pawb' yn ymdrin â'r maes hwnnw hefyd, ond mae iddo rôl benodol. Rôl led-farnwrol, neu reoliadol, fydd gan y dyfarnydd tra bo rôl hyrwyddo i 'Iaith Pawb', gan mwyaf, ac yr ydym wedi neilltuo £28 miliwn i'w roi ar waith.

Eleanor Burnham: How will your Government ensure accountability via the *dyfarnydd*, or whoever will be regulating this? I am sure that you agree with me that there is a perception that accountability will no longer be as good as it is currently once all these quangos are merged with the Government.

The First Minister: Accountability will be improved. If you are talking about an autonomous body, namely a quango, currently, Assembly committees and so on can request that the chair or chief executive of that body appears before it from time to time, but, if that body's functions become part of the Assembly Government's functions, that accountability will be a part of every Plenary meeting, whether during questions to me, or to the relevant Minister, every three or four weeks. These changes are being made in order to improve and simplify that accountability.

Statws Cymru yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd Wales's Status in the European Union

Q2 Helen Mary Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on Wales's status within the European Union? OAQ0183(FM)

The First Minister: The European Union's constitutional treaty provides, for the first time, new recognition and new rights for Wales and other Governments within the European Union which operate on a regional tier, or which are parts of member states. Wales will benefit directly from these

C2 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar statws Cymru o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd? OAQ0183(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae cytundeb cyfansoddiadol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn cynnig cydnabyddiaeth newydd a hawliau newydd, am y tro cyntaf, i Gymru ac i Lywodraethau eraill yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd sy'n gweithredu ar lefel ranbarthol, neu rai sy'n rhan o aelod

developments in the treaty.

Helen Mary Jones: I am sure that you will acknowledge that one important aspect of Wales's status within the European Union is its economic status. Will you give an assurance today that you will press the UK Government to accept that the decision about the new structural regime for the coming years should be made this June, while Wales still stands a reasonable chance of benefiting, or will you, as usual, be more concerned about not annoying your bosses in London than about fighting for Wales?

The First Minister: 'Unworthy' and 'cheap' are the best possible words that I could use to describe the appalling second half of that question. Imputing low motives to Ministers may be your stock in trade, Helen Mary, but I do not think that it is worthy of you as a frontbench spokesperson for your party. We all recognise that if the decision is made this year, then it opens up possibilities that we have previously only dreamed of. That means that west Wales and the Valleys could continue to have access to structural funds on an equivalent basis to Objective 1 between 2007 and 2013. We have to accept that negotiations on the budget and structural funds are continuing. If the decision can be made during the Luxembourg presidency, in the first half of this year, that would be to everyone's benefit, and it would mean that the structural funds programmes could commence on time, which they did not do last time around. Last time, they commenced halfway through the first year: I think that it was in July 2000 that we were able to get Objective 1 off the ground for the first time. If the decision is made during the British presidency, this will be much less likely. As the presiding country you cannot push your own point of view. That is the problem. If the decision goes through into 2006, there is every chance of a late start, unfortunately.

Irene James: Do you agree that the people of Wales are better off as a result of two terms of Labour Government in Westminster, and a Labour Assembly, and that Wales is an important and integral part

wladwriaethau. Daw budd uniongyrchol i Gymru o'r datblygiadau hyn yn y cytundeb.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn siŵr y cydnabyddwch mai un agwedd bwysig ar statws Cymru yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yw ei statws economaidd. A wnewch roi sicrwydd heddiw y pwyswch ar Lywodraeth y DU i dderbyn y dylid penderfynu ar y trefniadau newydd ar gyfer cronfeydd strwythurol yn y blynyddoedd i ddod fis Mehefin nesaf, tra bo cyfle eithaf o hyd i Gymru gael budd ohonynt, neu a fyddwch, yn ôl eich arfer, yn poeni'n fwy am beidio â digio'ch meistri yn Llundain nag am ymladd dros Gymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: 'Annheilwng' a 'diwerth' yw'r geiriau gorau y gallwn eu defnyddio i ddisgrifio'r ail ran ofnadwy i'r cwestiwn hwnnw. Gallai fod yn arfer gennych briodoli cymhellion gwael i Weinidogion, Helen Mary, ond ni chredaf fod hynny'n deilwng ohonoch fel llefarydd ar y fainc flaen dros eich plaid. Yr ydym oll yn sylweddoli, os penderfynir ar hyn eleni, y cyfyd posibiladau nad ydym ond wedi breuddwydio amdanynt cyn hyn. Mae hynny'n golygu y gallai gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd barhau i gael arian o gronfeydd strwythurol ar sail gyfatebol i Amcan 1 rhwng 2007 a 2013. Rhaid inni dderbyn bod negodiadau ar y gyllideb a'r cronfeydd strwythurol yn parhau. Os gellir penderfynu ar hyn yn ystod llywyddiaeth Lwcsembwrg, yn hanner cyntaf y flwyddyn hon, byddai hynny'n beth llesol i bawb, a golygai y gallai rhaglenni'r cronfeydd strwythurol gychwyn yn brydlon, gan na wnaethant y tro diwethaf. Y tro diwethaf, cychwynasant hanner ffordd drwy'r flwyddyn gyntaf: credaf mai yng Ngorffennaf 2000 y gallasom roi Amcan 1 ar waith am y tro cyntaf. Os penderfynir ar hyn yn ystod llywyddiaeth Prydain, bydd hynny'n llawer llai tebygol. Nid yw'r wlad sy'n llywyddu yn cael hyrwyddo ei safbwynt ei hun. Dyna'r broblem. Os na phenderfynir ar hyn tan 2006, mae pob posibilrwydd y ceir dechrau hwyr, gwaetha'r modd.

Irene James: A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn well ar bobl Cymru o ganlyniad i ddau dymor o Lywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan, a Chynulliad Llafur, a bod Cymru'n rhan bwysig ac annatod o'r DU, ac o'r DU yn

of the UK, and the UK in Europe? Do you agree that the Plaid separatists' agenda and their record in Parliament and the Assembly of voting—[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. If we do not hear the supplementary questions, we will not be able to understand the answers.

Irene James: Do you agree that their record of voting down redistributive Labour policies such as the minimum wage, local government formula changes, tax credits, benefit increases, and of risking £1.2 billion of Objective 1 investment, proves that the nationalists will never meet their conference claims to be the socialist party of Wales?

The First Minister: I do not think that there is any doubt about that. It seems, however, that we have an unruly class in the Chamber this afternoon. People will look at the increases in jobs since devolution five and a half years ago. Wales stands out at the top of the league with a 10 per cent increase in jobs. The next region down is northern Ireland, with a 7.5 per cent increase in jobs. Similarly, figures were given this morning on earnings increases, and earnings in Wales went up by 5.4 per cent in 2004, compared with 4.1 per cent in the UK. There is also the overall principle that you mentioned, namely that we try to get the best out of being a large member state, while being able to paddle our own canoe, and trying to ensure that Wales gets the best deal within the United Kingdom.

Brynle Williams: Do you share my concern that Welsh speakers will be precluded from selecting their native tongue on the new European jobseekers passport, in light of the fact that a massive 35 languages are represented on it?

The First Minister: I was not familiar with that, but what is really important for jobseekers is their chance of getting a job. Given that unemployment has fallen by 42 per cent in Wales since devolution, you have a better chance of getting a job in Wales than in almost any other part of Europe if you lose

Ewrop? A ydych yn cytuno bod agenda ymwahanol Plaid Cymru a'i record yn y Senedd ac yn y Cynulliad o bleidleisio—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Os na chlywn y cwestiynau atodol, ni fyddwn yn gallu deall yr atebion.

Irene James: A ydych yn cytuno bod ei record o bleidleisio yn erbyn polisiau aiddosrannol o eiddo Llafur fel yr isafswm cyflog, newidiadau i fformiwla llywodraeth leol, credydau treth, cynnydd mewn budd-daliadau, a pheryglu gwerth £1.2 biliwn o fuddsoddi drwy Amcan 1, yn dangos na fydd y cenedlaetholwyr byth yn profi eu honiadau yn eu cynhadledd mai hwy yw plaid sosialaidd Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni chredaf fod unrhyw amheuaeth am hynny. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys fod gennym ddsbarth afreolus yn y Siambr y prynhawn yma. Bydd pobl yn ystyried y cynnydd a gafwyd yn nifer y swyddi ers datganoli bum mlynedd a hanner yn ôl. Mae Cymru ar ben y gynghrair gan y cafwyd 10 y cant yn fwy o swyddi. Y rhanbarth nesaf yw Gogledd Iwerddon, lle y cafwyd 7.5 y cant yn fwy o swyddi. Yn yr un modd, cyhoeddwyd ffigurau y bore yma ar y cynnydd mewn enillion, a chododd enillion yng Nghymru 5.4 y cant yn 2004, o'i gymharu â 4.1 y cant yn y DU. Hefyd ceir yr egwyddor gyffredinol y soniasoch amdani, sef y ceisiwn gael y gorau o fod mewn aelod wladwriaeth fawr, tra gallwn rwyfo ein cwch ein hunain, a cheisio sicrhau y caiff Cymru'r fargen orau o fewn y Deyrnas Unedig.

Brynle Williams: A ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder y bydd siaradwyr y Gymraeg yn cael eu hatal rhag dewis eu hiaith frodorol ar y pasport Ewropeaidd newydd i rai sy'n chwilio am waith, yng ngolwg y ffaith bod y nifer aruthrol o 35 o ieithoedd wedi'u cynrychioli arno?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni wyddwn am hynny, ond yr hyn sy'n wirioneddol bwysig i'r rhai sy'n chwilio am waith yw eu cyfle i gael swydd. Gan fod diweithdra wedi gostwng 42 y cant yng Nghymru ers datganoli, ceuch well cyfle i gael gwaith yng Nghymru nag ymron unrhyw ran arall o Ewrop, os collwch

a job or do not have one. That 42 per cent drop in unemployment in Wales since devolution compares with a drop of about 18 per cent in the UK, and the UK has one of the most successful records on job creation in the whole of Europe. Jobseekers in Wales are well looked after.

eich swydd neu os nad ydych mewn gwaith. Mae'r gostyngiad hwnnw o 42 y cant mewn diweithdra yng Nghymru ers datganoli'n cymharu â gostyngiad o tua 18 y cant yn y DU, ac mae'r DU ymysg y rhai sydd â'r record orau o ran creu swyddi yn Ewrop gyfan. Mae'r rhai sy'n chwilio am waith yng Nghymru'n cael gofal da.

Ysbytai Newydd a Mentrau Cyllid Preifat New Hospitals and Private Finance Initiatives

Q3 David Melding: When did the First Minister last meet the Secretary of State for Wales to discuss the use of the private finance initiative to build new hospitals? OAQ0185(FM)

C3 David Melding: Pryd yr oedd y tro diwethaf i'r Prif Weinidog gyfarfod ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru i drafod defnyddio'r fenter cyllid preifat ar gyfer adeiladu ysbytai newydd? OAQ0185(FM)

The First Minister: Capital investment in the Welsh health service will rise from £120 million this year to £309 million over the next three years. Our pragmatic approach to PFI, which has not come up in discussions with the Secretary of State at recent meetings, will continue. We will consider its use where that meets the public interest test. In the meantime, our programme of establishing new community hospitals in Tenby, Porthmadog, Rhondda, Ebbw Vale, Merthyr Tydfil and Holywell, and the big new hospital in Caerphilly, will proceed directly from public funds.

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd y swm o gyfalaf a fuddsoddir yng ngwasanaeth iechyd Cymru'n codi o £120 miliwn y flwyddyn hon i £309 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Bydd ein hymagwedd bragmatig at y fenter cyllid preifat, nad ydyw wedi codi mewn trafodaethau â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol mewn cyfarfodydd diweddar, yn parhau. Ystyriwn ei defnyddio os yw'n ateb y diben o ran y budd cyhoeddus. Yn y cyfamser, bydd ein rhaglen o godi ysbytai cymunedol newydd yn Ninbych-y-pysgod, Porthmadog, Rhondda, Glynebwy, Merthyr Tudful a Threffynnon, a'r ysbyty mawr newydd yng Nghaerffili, yn parhau drwy ddefnyddio arian cyhoeddus yn uniongyrchol.

David Melding: Is it not the case that Labour backbenchers such as Jon Owen Jones have subjected your administration to withering criticism for its ideological rejection of the fuller use of PFI? It is important that we accept the principle that if the NHS in Wales is to be fit for purpose and a world-beater, it needs to use all the sources of funding available to it.

David Melding: Onid yw'n wir bod meincwyr cefn Llafur fel Jon Owen Jones wedi beirniadu'ch gweinyddiaeth yn hallt am ei bod wedi gwrthod gwneud mwy o ddefnydd o PFI ar sail ideolegol? Mae'n bwysig inni dderbyn yr egwyddor y dylai'r GIG yng Nghymru ddefnyddio'r holl ffynonellau arian sydd ar gael iddo os ydyw i fod yn addas i'w ddiben ac i ragori.

The First Minister: I agree with that principle, and that is why we are pragmatic about PFI. However, you also need to be aware that there is considerable pressure under the current Treasury rules to spend more direct capital from the Assembly's resources. Therefore, the present system is doing the pushing not because of anything that we say and not because of ideology, but because the Treasury is keen that we should

Y Prif Weinidog: Cytunaf â'r egwyddor honno, a dyna pam yr ydym yn edrych yn bragmatig ar PFI. Er hynny, dylech fod yn ymwybodol hefyd fod cryn bwysau o dan reolau presennol y Trysorlys i wario mwy o gyfalaf yn uniongyrchol o goffrau'r Cynulliad. Felly, y system bresennol sy'n rhoi'r pwysau, nid oherwydd dim a ddywedwn ni ac nid oherwydd ideoleg, ond am fod y Trysorlys yn awyddus inni wario

spend our capital. Capital expenditure is preferential to revenue expenditure, where you have a choice between the two, and that is critical to decisions regarding PFI. This is one of the reasons why all the hospitals that I mentioned will be built using direct public funds. In the past, when the rules were not as they are now, we used PFI to build hospitals in Baglan, Chepstow and so on.

2.10 p.m.

Peter Law: Would you acknowledge that many PFI schemes have failed and have become financial disasters? They steal the jobs of public-sector workers and affect conditions. Is it not proven that the vast majority of the people of Britain—unlike the Conservatives, who are in a great minority—feel more comfortable when public services are in the hands of public-sector professionals?

The First Minister: Yes, up to a point, but this is not the case when you do not have enough capital available to build. The new St David's Hospital in my constituency has encountered some problems with a two-tier workforce but, by and large, the scheme has worked extremely well. I would not have liked to have seen my constituents deprived of the new hospital built under the private finance initiative, and I am sure that the people served by the new Baglan hospital would feel the same way. There are some problems if you build a behemoth hospital that becomes hopelessly out of date within 20 years and you have interest to pay for another 40 years. You can get into financial difficulties in that way. This can be avoided if you build using public funds and build in a flexible way that anticipates the way in which hospitals will need to be designed in 2025 and 2050.

David Lloyd: Beth yw diben adeiladu uned gardiolegol newydd yng Ngwynedd a'i chadw'n wag tra bo'n rhaid i gleifion lleol fynd heibio'r uned hon i gael triniaeth ym Manceinion, filltiroedd maith i ffwrdd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid dyna'r sefyllfa yn ôl a ddeallaf. Mewn trafodaeth wythnos diwethaf â Derek Griffin, cyfarwyddwr swyddfa

ein cyfalaf. Mae gwariant cyfalaf yn well na gwariant refeniw, os gallwch ddewis rhwng y ddau, ac mae hynny'n hollbwysig o ran penderfyniadau ar PFI. Dyma un o'r rhesymau y bydd yr holl ysbytai y cyfeiriais atynt yn cael eu codi drwy ddefnyddio arian cyhoeddus uniongyrchol. Yn y gorffennol, pan oedd y rheolau'n wahanol, defnyddiasom PFI i godi ysbytai ym Maglan a Chas-gwent ac yn y blaen.

Peter Law: A dderbyniech fod llawer o gynlluniau PFI wedi methu ac wedi troi'n drychineb ariannol? Maent yn dwyn swyddi gweithwyr y sector cyhoeddus ac yn effeithio ar amodau gwaith. Oni phrofwyd bod y mwyafrif helaeth o bobl Prydain—yn wahanol i'r Ceidwadwyr, sy'n lleiafrif bach iawn—yn teimlo'n fwy cyfforddus pan fo gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn nwylo gweithwyr proffesiynol y sector cyhoeddus?

Y Prif Weinidog: Do, i ryw raddau, ond nid felly y mae os nad oes digon o gyfalaf ar gael i godi adeilad. Mae'r Ysbyty Dewi Sant newydd yn fy etholaeth wedi profi rhai anawsterau o gael gweithlu dwy haen ond, at ei gilydd, mae'r cynllun wedi bod yn llwyddiannus dros ben. Ni charaswn weld amddifadu fy etholwyr o'r ysbyty newydd a godwyd o dan y fenter cyllid preifat, ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod y rhai a wasanaethir gan yr ysbyty newydd ym Maglan yn teimlo yr un peth. Mae rhai problemau os codwch ysbyty anferth a aiff yn anobeithiol o hen ffasiwn cyn pen 20 mlynedd a chithau'n gorfod talu llog am 40 mlynedd arall. Gallwch fynd i drafferthion ariannol drwy wneud hynny. Gellir osgoi hynny os codwch ysbyty gan ddefnyddio arian cyhoeddus a'i adeiladu mewn modd hyblyg sy'n achub y blaen ar y modd y caiff ysbytai eu cynllunio yn 2025 a 2050.

David Lloyd: Why build a new cardiac unit in Gwynedd and leave it empty when local patients have to travel many miles to Manchester for treatment and pass this unit on their way?

The First Minister: That is not the situation as I understand it. During a discussion last week with Derek Griffin, the director of the

rhanbarthol y Gogledd, dywedodd wrthyf fod y penderfyniad wedi'i wneud ar y cyd â'r tri ysbyty mawr—Maelor Wrecsam, Glan Clwyd a Gwynedd—i ddatblygu'r uned gardiolegol yn Ysbyty Glan Clwyd. Gwnaed y penderfyniad ym mis Medi ac fe'i derbyniwyd gan bawb. Nid oedd Derek Griffin yn deall pam yr oedd y mater wedi codi unwaith eto yn Chwefror 2005, bron i chwe mis yn ddiweddarach.

Kirsty Williams: Given the limited ability to expand on many of the district general hospital sites in Wales, what plans do you have to carry out an assessment of the suitability of current NHS estates to deliver modern services? Will you consider the development of plans for hospital reprovision, should this be necessary?

The First Minister: This has been done in our examination of how the £309 million capital investment programme will be carried out over the next three years. This is a very substantial amount, and capital investment has been almost trebled. If hospital sites are overcrowded, it will not be possible to use those sites if hospitals are to be doubled in size. There is no major inhibition in that regard. Some hospitals are on campus sites, and others are located in downtown areas that could prove tight if expansion were proposed. I am sure that we will not experience great difficulties in delivering the £309 million capital programme, which, as I said, is almost three times higher than the current level.

north Wales regional office, I was told that a decision had been made jointly by the three major hospitals—Wrexham Maelor, Glan Clwyd and Ysbyty Gwynedd—to develop the cardiac unit in Glan Clwyd Hospital. The decision was made back in September and was accepted by all concerned. Derek Griffin could not understand why the matter had reared its head again in February 2005, almost six months later.

Kirsty Williams: Gan fod llawer o safleoedd ysbytai dosbarth cyffredinol yng Nghymru na ellir ehangu lawer arnynt, pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i asesu pa mor addas yw ystadau presennol y GIG i redeg gwasanaethau modern? A wnewch ystyried datblygu cynlluniau i godi ysbytai newydd, os bydd angen gwneud hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaethom hynny wrth ystyried y dull o gyflawni'r rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf werth £309 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Mae hwn yn swm sylweddol iawn, ac mae'r buddsoddiad cyfalaf wedi'i dreblu bron. Os yw safleoedd ysbytai'n orlawn, ni fydd modd defnyddio'r safleoedd hynny os yw maint ysbytai i gael ei ddyblu. Nid oes unrhyw gyfyngiad mawr yn hynny o beth. Mae rhai ysbytai ar safleoedd campws, ac mae eraill yng nghanol trefi, a gallai hynny fod yn rhwystr i'w hehangu os oedd bwriad i wneud hynny. Yr wyf yn sicr na phrofwfwn anawsterau mawr wrth gyflawni'r rhaglen gyfalaf werth £309 miliwn, sydd, fel y dywedais, bron dair gwaith yn fwy na'r un bresennol.

Cynlluniau Amcan 1 Objective 1 Schemes

Q4 Jeff Cuthbert: Will the First Minister make a statement on the amount committed to Objective 1 schemes in west Wales and the Valleys passing the £1 billion mark? OAQ0204(FM)

The First Minister: Earlier this month, the £1 billion grant milestone was reached. Over 1,300 projects have been supported, representing over £2.3 billion investment in west Wales and the Valleys. These projects have reported the creation and safeguarding of 84,000 gross jobs.

C4 Jeff Cuthbert: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y ffaith bod y swm sydd wedi'i ymrwymo ar gyfer cynlluniau Amcan 1 yn y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd bellach yn fwy na £1 biliwn? OAQ0204(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn gynharach y mis hwn, cyrhaeddwyd y garreg filltir o £1 biliwn o grantiau. Rhoddwyd cymorth i fwy na 1,300 o brosiectau, ac mae hynny'n golygu bod £2.3 biliwn wedi'i fuddsoddi yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd. Mae'r prosiectau hynny wedi datgan eu bod wedi creu a diogelu nifer crynswth o 84,000 o swyddi.

Jeff Cuthbert: Do you agree that by working together with local organisations for economic improvements, the biggest single improvement to the lives of many people in Wales has been achieved? Furthermore, do you agree that the local partnerships set up to organise the implementation of Objective 1 have brought together individuals in their communities, thereby giving a sense of empowerment, and enabled relevant and meaningful local activities to be developed? Finally, do you agree that Objective 1 money will contribute to the skills agenda, leading to long-term and lasting improvements for the people of Wales?

The First Minister: Yes, I do. In talks about priorities during the handover process—as Christine Chapman has now moved on to become a Deputy Minister, and you have taken over as chair of the programme monitoring committee—the question of partnership working will have emerged as a topic for discussion. Getting local authorities and the public and voluntary sectors out of their bunkers, so that they all work in partnership, has been a key achievement of Chris's period as chair of the programme monitoring committee. In many communities, that has led to a new working format, with everybody working towards the same objective. These are areas lagging in prosperity. Why is that? What can we do about it? How can we use this one-off opportunity to ensure that they catch up?

Elin Jones: A ydych yn derbyn bod tua £800 miliwn o'r bloc Cymreig wedi'i wario ar Amcan 1—arian a fyddai wedi'i wario ar addysg, iechyd a gwasanaethau eraill pe bai eich Llywodraeth chi, a Llywodraeth eich rhagflaenydd, wedi llwyddo i berswadio'r Trysorlys i ryddhau cyllid cyfatebol i Gymru yn ôl ein haeddiant?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr hyn y byddwn yn ei dderbyn yw bod Cymru, yn unigryw, wedi derbyn arian y tu hwnt i fformiwla Barnett. Ni ddigwyddodd hynny erioed o'r blaen yng nghyswllt ardaloedd Amcan 1. Llwyddodd Cymru, yn wahanol i unrhyw ran arall o'r Deyrnas Gyfunol, i dorri drwy ffiniau bloc a

Jeff Cuthbert: A ydych yn cytuno bod y gwelliant mwyaf ym mywydau llawer o bobl yng Nghymru wedi'i sicrhau drwy weithio ar y cyd â chyrff lleol er mwyn cael gwelliannau economaidd? At hynny, a ydych yn cytuno bod y partneriaethau lleol a sefydlwyd i drefnu i roi Amcan 1 ar waith wedi dod ag unigolion at ei gilydd yn eu cymunedau, gan beri iddynt deimlo eu bod wedi'u galluogi, a'u bod wedi hwyluso'r gwaith o ddatblygu gweithgareddau lleol perthnasol ac ystyrlon? Yn olaf, a ydych yn cytuno y bydd arian Amcan 1 yn cyfrannu at yr agenda ar sgiliau, gan beri gwelliannau parhaus a thymor hir er mwyn pobl Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydwyf. Mewn trafodaethau am flaenoriaethau yn ystod y broses trosglwyddo—gan fod Christine Chapman wedi symud ymlaen bellach i fod yn Ddirprwy Weinidog, a chithau wedi cymryd drosodd fel cadeirydd pwyllgor monitro'r rhaglen—bydd mater gweithio mewn partneriaeth wedi codi fel testun trafod. Un o'r prif gyflawniadau yn ystod y cyfnod yr oedd Chris yn gadeirydd ar bwyllgor monitro'r rhaglen oedd peri i awdurdodau lleol a'r sectorau cyhoeddus a gwirfoddol ddod at ei gilydd, fel eu bod yn gweithio ar y cyd. Mewn sawl cymuned, mae hynny wedi arwain at ddull newydd o weithio, lle y mae pawb yn ceisio'r un amcan. Mae'r ardaloedd hyn yn llai ffyniannus. Pam y mae hynny? Beth y gallwn ei wneud yn ei gylch? Sut y gallwn achub ar y cyfle unigryw hwn i sicrhau y byddant yn ennill tir?

Elin Jones: Do you accept that some £800 million from the Welsh block has been spent on Objective 1—money which would have been spent on education, health and other services had your Government, and your predecessor's Government, succeeded in persuading the Treasury to release the match funding that Wales deserved?

The First Minister: What I would accept is that Wales, uniquely, received money over and above the Barnett formula. This has never happened before in the case of Objective 1 areas. Wales, unlike other parts of the United Kingdom, managed to break through the confines of the Barnett formula

fformiwla Barnett. Yr ydym wedi manteisio ar dros £0.5 biliwn yn sgîl yr arian ychwanegol hwn. Mae Plaid Cymru wastad yn chwilio am newyddion drwg—am unrhyw gwmwl y tu hwnt i'r leinin euraid—ond nid yw hynny'n golygu dim.

Alun Cairns: Does not this question, and the amount of input, trumpet the Welsh Assembly Government's deficiencies? It should really be focusing on the outputs. Notwithstanding the amount spent on input, what value has been added to the economy? The reality is that people are comparatively worse off now than when we had Objective 1 money. Therefore, it does not matter what you have put in because it is the output that is important. Your policies are obviously failing.

The First Minister: Again, if you look at job figures, you will see that Wales is at the top of the league, with an increase of over 10 per cent in jobs since devolution. None of the other 12 regions or small nations of the United Kingdom come close to that. The nearest figure is an increase of 7.5 per cent in jobs since devolution in Northern Ireland. Likewise, a 42 per cent fall in unemployment in Wales since devolution is much greater than the fall in any other part of the United Kingdom—the nearest is the north-east of England, with a 30 per cent drop. Also, the earnings figures published this morning indicate a 5.4 per cent increase in 2004 in Wales, compared with a 4.1 per cent increase in the United Kingdom as a whole. You need quality and quantity of jobs to make good the long-standing weaknesses of the Welsh economy. We are seeing that happening. Why you ignore those figures, I do not know. No matter how good the figures, you might, if you were a Shakespearean, say that 'even the ranks of Tuscany could scarce forbear to cheer, but Alun Cairns, the Tory, squeezes out a crocodile tear'—or words to that effect. You must look at the figures and ignore your prejudices.

and block. The programme has benefited from over £0.5 billion as a result of this additional funding. Plaid Cymru always looks for bad news—for any cloud beyond its silver lining—but that means nothing.

Alun Cairns: Onid yw'r cwestiwn hwn, a maint y mewnbwn, yn amlygu diffygion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? Dylai ganolbwyntio ar yr allbwn. Heb ystyried y swm a wariwyd ar y mewnbwn, pa werth a ychwanegwyd at yr economi? Y gwir yw bod pobl yn dlotach yn awr mewn cymhariaeth nag yn y cyfnod pan oedd arian Amcan 1 gennym. Felly, nid yw o bwys beth yr ydych wedi'i roi i mewn oherwydd yr allbwn sy'n bwysig. Mae'n amlwg bod eich polisïau'n methu.

Y Prif Weinidog: Unwaith eto, os ystyriwch y ffigurau am swyddi, gwelwch fod Cymru ar frig y gynghrair, gan fod mwy na 10 y cant yn fwy o swyddi ers datganoli. Nid oes yr un arall o'r 12 o ranbarthau neu genhedloedd bach yn y Deyrnas Unedig a ddaw'n agos at hynny. Y ffigur agosaf yw 7.5 y cant o gynnydd yn nifer y swyddi ers datganoli yng Ngogledd Iwerddon. Yn yr un modd, mae'r gostyngiad o 42 y cant mewn diweithdra yng Nghymru ers datganoli yn fwy o lawer na'r gostyngiad mewn unrhyw ran arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig—yr agosaf yw gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr, lle y cafwyd gostyngiad o 30 y cant. Hefyd, mae'r ffigurau am enillion a gyhoeddwyd y bore yma yn dangos cynnydd o 5.4 y cant yn 2004 yng Nghymru, o'i gymharu â chynnydd o 4.1 y cant yn y Deyrnas Unedig gyfan. Rhaid sicrhau cynnydd o ran ansawdd a nifer y swyddi er mwyn cywiro'r gwendidau hirsefydlog yn economi Cymru. Hynny a welwn. Ni wn pam yr ydych yn anwybyddu'r ffigurau hynny. Er cystal y ffigurau, gallech ddweud, pe baech am ddefnyddio geiriau Shakespeare, mai 'prin y gallai hyd yn oed rhengoedd Twsgani ymatal rhag cymeradwyo, ond bod Alun Cairns, y Tori, yn gollwng dagrau crocodeil'—neu eiriau i'r perwyl hwnnw. Rhaid ichi ystyried y ffigurau ac anghofio'ch rhagfarnau.

Morâl Staff yn y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Staff Morale in the Public Services

Q5 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Will the First Minister make a statement on staff morale in the public services? OAQ0192(FM)

The First Minister: The greatest threat to staff morale in the public services lies in the possibility, however remote, of the return of a Conservative administration at Westminster, given your party's plans to privatise the Driver and Vehicle Licensing Agency in Swansea, which employs over 5,000 people, and to halve the budget of the Food Standards Agency, among many other cuts.

Nick Bourne: You are better as a ham Shakespearean actor than you are on political realities. Letting that pass, I turn to your visit to the University Hospital of Wales, when you referred to an acute version of a January problem. We are now halfway through February, and we have the sad death of Mrs Edwards, a 94-year-old widow. I extend my sympathy to her family. She was left waiting for 34 hours on a trolley before she was seen. What comfort do you have for her in relation to your custody of public services?

2.20 p.m.

The First Minister: During my five visits to the accident and emergency unit at the University Hospital of Wales over the past four or five weeks, I have observed that staff are under pressure. However, the staff were not under severe stress on the days of my visits, but they always tell me that I should have been there on the previous Sunday or Thursday, or whenever a particular crisis may have occurred. The important question to ask is whether we have been getting on with making changes over the past four or five weeks, and the answer is 'yes, we are'.

A divert mechanism has now been put in place, so that if there is a serious crisis, and the staff of the University of Wales Hospital cannot cope, they are allowed to shut the hospital, and divert new cases to the Royal Glamorgan Hospital. That mechanism has been used on one occasion, although,

C5 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar forâl staff yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? OAQ0192(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Y bygythiad mwyaf i forâl y staff yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yw'r posibilrwydd, er ei leied, o ddychweliad gweinyddiaeth Geidwadol yn San Steffan, yng ngolwg bwriad eich plaid i breifateiddio'r Asiantaeth Trwyddedu Gyrwyr a Cherbydau yn Abertawe, sy'n cyflogi mwy na 5,000 o bobl, ac i haneru cyllideb yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd, ymysg llawer o doriadau eraill.

Nick Bourne: Yr ydych yn well wrth oractio un o rannau Shakespeare nag yr ydych wrth ymdrin â gwirioneddau gwleidyddol. Gan adael hynny o'r neilltu, trof at eich ymweliad ag Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, pan gyfeiriasoch at fersiwn difrifol o broblem a geir ym mis Ionawr. Yr ydym hanner ffordd drwy fis Chwefror bellach, a gwelsom farwolaeth drist Mrs Edwards, gweddw 94 blwydd oed. Estynnaf fy nghydymdeimlad i'w theulu. Fe'i gadawyd i aros am 34 awr ar droli cyn ei gweld. Pa gysur sydd gennych iddi mewn cysylltiad â'ch gofal am wasanaethau cyhoeddus?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn ystod fy mhum ymweliad â'r uned ddamweiniau ac achosion brys yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru dros y pedair neu bum wythnos diwethaf, gwelais fod staff o dan bwysau. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd y staff o dan bwysau difrifol ar y diwrnodau yr ymwelais, ond dywedant wrthyf bob tro y dylaswn fod yno y dydd Sul neu'r dydd Iau blaenorol, neu ba bryd bynnag y gallai argyfwng penodol fod wedi codi. Y cwestiwn pwysig y dylid ei ofyn yw a ydym wedi bod wrthi'n gwneud newidiadau dros y pedair neu bum wythnos diwethaf, a'r ateb yw 'ydym'.

Mae trefniant dargyfeirio wedi'i roi ar waith bellach, felly os ceir argyfwng difrifol, a staff Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru yn methu ag ymdopi, cânt gau'r ysbyty, a dargyfeirio achosion newydd i Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg. Defnyddiwyd y trefniant hwnnw ar un achlysur, ond, gan fod nifer yr

because of the feast and famine that occurred during the three-hour period that the accident and emergency department of the University Hospital of Wales was shut, there was no need to divert any patients to the Royal Glamorgan Hospital. That is how it goes—there is always a feast-famine pattern in busy accident and emergency units.

The chairs and chief executives of the two local health boards, the trust and the two local authority social services departments are working extremely hard on a strategy to ensure that unusually high increases in demand—which is 9 per cent in the University Hospital of Wales and 5 per cent in other accident and emergency departments in Wales, when the previous form of rise in demand was 1 to 2 per cent—can be dealt with.

Nick Bourne: After your January visit, when you referred to the situation as an acute version of the January problem, Sister Fiona Salter of the University Hospital of Wales said that the staff regarded this as ‘a kick in the teeth’. Routine waits in excess of 40 hours on trolleys are happening, and there are 700 nursing vacancies throughout Wales, half of which are in the Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan area. I repeat the question—what help and what hope can you offer to those people who are suffering long waits on trolleys to get emergency treatment in hospitals in Wales?

The First Minister: The staff regarded what they were told I had said as ‘a kick in the teeth’, rather than what I actually said. For some reason, the newspaper that reported the story added the word ‘just’ before ‘a version of the January problem’, which I never said. The newspaper omitted, as you did, the fact that I said that it was a ‘particularly acute version of the January problem’. The figures tend to support this view. In trying to work out why there has been an increase of 9 per cent in accident and emergency demand in Cardiff, compared with 5 per cent in other accident and emergency departments across Wales, and why the increase in demand at this time of year used to be 1 to 2 per cent, it seems that there are three reasons for this. One reason is that the new out-of-hours service has not settled down very well in

achosion a dderbyniwyd i'r adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru wedi codi a gostwng cymaint yn y tair awr yr oedd ar gau, ni fu'n rhaid dargyfeirio unrhyw gleifion i Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg. Felly y mae—ceir patrwm cyfnewidiol bob tro mewn unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys sy'n brys.

Mae cadeiryddion a phrif weithredwyr y ddau fwrdd iechyd lleol, yr ymddiriedolaeth ac adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol y ddau awdurdod lleol yn gweithio'n galed iawn ar strategaeth i sicrhau bod modd delio â chynnydd anarferol o uchel yn y galw—sef 9 y cant yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru a 5 y cant mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys eraill yng Nghymru, tra arferai'r galw gynyddu rhwng 1 a 2 y cant.

Nick Bourne: Ar ôl eich ymweliad ym mis Ionawr, pan ddywedasoch fod y sefyllfa'n fersiwn difrifol o'r broblem a geir ym mis Ionawr, dywedodd y Brif Nyrs Fiona Salter yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru fod y staff yn ystyried hynny'n 'gic yn eu dannedd'. Mae'n arferol i rai aros yn hwy na 40 awr ar droli, ac mae 700 o swyddi nyrsys gwag ledled Cymru, y mae eu hanner yn ardal Caerdydd a Bro Morgannwg. Ailofynnaf y cwestiwn—pa gymorth a pha obaith y gallwch eu cynnig i'r bobl hynny sy'n aros yn hir ar droliâu i gael triniaeth frys mewn ysbytai yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oedd y staff yn ystyried yr hyn y dywedwyd wrthynt imi ei ddweud yn 'gic yn eu dannedd', yn hytrach na'r hyn a ddywedais mewn gwirionedd. Am ryw reswm, yr oedd y papur newydd a adroddodd yr hanes wedi ychwanegu'r gair 'just' o flaen 'a version of the January problem', ac ni ddywedais hynny erioed. Yr oedd y papur newydd wedi gadael allan y ffaith, fel y gwnaethoch chi, fy mod wedi dweud ei fod yn 'fersiwn arbennig o ddifrifol o'r broblem a geir ym mis Ionawr'. Mae'r ffigurau'n tueddu i ategu'r farn honno. Wrth geisio deall pam y bu 9 y cant yn fwy o alw ar yr adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys yng Nghaerdydd, o'i gymharu â 5 y cant mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys eraill ledled Cymru, a pham yr oedd y cynnydd ar yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn yn

some parts of Wales, including Cardiff, particularly at weekends. The second reason is that we are now telling hospitals that would have stopped undertaking elective surgery in these circumstances to continue with this surgery. Therefore, hospitals are not suspending waiting-list surgery when they have a high number of medical in-patients. The third reason is that delayed transfers of care in Cardiff are increasing, while they are decreasing in the rest of Wales. This is why it is important that the two local authorities, the chairs of the relevant committees and the chief executives or heads of the social services departments, the two local health board chairs and chief executives, and the chief executive and chair of the trust, are now meeting regularly to work out why a 9 per cent increase is occurring in Cardiff, which is double the level of increase elsewhere in Wales.

Nick Bourne: I have asked twice about nursing vacancies and have not received a response. In addition to the nursing vacancies, a ward has been closed in the University Hospital of Wales for eight weeks, because there are not enough nurses to run it. I return again to the question that I asked about nursing vacancies, and its impact on this hospital. What are you doing about it?

The First Minister: The nursing vacancies are a matter to be managed by the new nursing director, whom, I am told, is getting stuck into the problem. The hospital spends £12 million on agency and bank nurses, and it accepts that that figure is far too high. If it can make significant savings in that £12 million bill, it would be able to find the £1.3 million or so required to put nursing staff into the A1 link ward, which is the ward that I think you are referring to. The ward has been refurbished and is ready for use, but it does not have staff to run it at the moment.

arfer bod yn 1 i 2 y cant, gwelwyd bod tri rheswm am hynny, i bob golwg. Un rheswm yw nad yw'r gwasanaeth newydd y tu allan i oriau arferol wedi dod i drefn mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru, gan gynnwys Caerdydd, yn enwedig ar y penwythnosau. Yr ail reswm yw ein bod bellach yn dweud wrth ysbytai a fyddai wedi peidio â rhoi llawdriniaethau dewisol o dan yr amgylchiadau hyn am barhau â'r llawdriniaethau hynny. Felly, nid yw ysbytai'n atal llawdriniaethau ar gyfer rhai ar restrau aros pan fo ganddynt nifer fawr o gleifion mewnol meddygol. Y trydydd rheswm yw bod nifer yr achosion o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yng Nghaerdydd ar gynnydd, tra bo'n gostwng yng ngweddill Cymru. Dyna pam ei bod yn bwysig bod y ddau awdurdod lleol, cadeiryddion y pwyllgorau perthnasol a phrif weithredwyr neu benaethiaid yr adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, cadeiryddion a phrif weithredwyr y ddau fwrdd iechyd lleol, a phrif weithredwr a chadeirydd yr ymddiriedolaeth, yn cwrdd yn rheolaidd yn awr i geisio deall pam y ceir cynnydd o 9 y cant yng Nghaerdydd, gan fod hynny'n ddwywaith yn fwy na'r hyn a geir mewn manau eraill yng Nghymru.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf wedi holi ddwywaith am swyddi nyrsys gwag ac nid wyf wedi cael ateb. Yn ogystal â'r swyddi nyrsys gwag, mae ward wedi'i chau yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru ers wyth wythnos, gan nad oes digon o nyrsys i'w rhedeg. Deuaf yn ôl eto at y cwestiwn a ofynnais am swyddi nyrsys gwag, ac effaith hynny ar yr ysbyty hwn. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud yn ei gylch?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r swyddi nyrsys gwag yn fater i'w drin gan y cyfarwyddwr nyrsio newydd, sy'n mynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon, yn ôl yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddeall. Mae'r ysbyty'n gwario £12 miliwn ar nyrsys asiantaeth a nyrsys cronfa, ac mae'n derbyn bod y ffigur hwnnw'n rhy uchel o lawer. Os gall arbed yn sylweddol ar y bil hwnnw o £12 miliwn, byddai'n gallu dod o hyd i'r swm o tua £1.3 miliwn y mae ei angen i gyflogi nyrsys ar gyfer ward gyswllt A1, sef y ward yr ydych yn cyfeirio ati, yr wyf yn credu. Mae'r ward wedi'i hadnewyddu ac mae'n barod i'w defnyddio, ond nid oes staff i'w rhedeg ar hyn o bryd.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Yr wyf yn dychwelyd at fater morâl staff. Dywed gweithwyr ieched eu bod yn anhapus gyda'ch ymateb i'w pryderon. Yr oeddynt yn hynod o feirniadol o'r hyn a ddywedasoeh ynghylch y sefyllfa yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru ar 25 Ionawr a 1 Chwefror. Bu ichi ddweud ein bod wedi gweld fersiwn arbennig o ddifrifol o'r problemau a geir ym mis Ionawr. Yr ydych wedi dweud heddiw fod problemau yn ychwanegol at y rhai sy'n codi fel arfer ym mis Ionawr wedi dod i'r amlwg. A ydych yn difaru defnyddio'r geiriau hynny, a beth wnewch chi i leddfu pryderon staff?

Y Prif Weinidog: Fe ddefnyddiais y gair 'difrifol' dair gwaith mewn dwy frawddeg wrth ateb Mike German, a ofynnodd y cwestiwn gwreiddiol, os cofiaf yn iawn. Yr ydych wedi cyfieithu fy ngeiriau i'r Gymraeg, ond yr hyn a ddywedais oedd 'particularly acute' neu, a'ch dyfynnu chi, 'yn arbennig o ddifrifol'. Serch hynny, yr oedd y fersiwn a welodd neu a glywodd nyrsys drwy gyfrwng adroddiadau newyddiadurwyr yn cynnwys y gair 'just', er na ddywedais hynny. Ni chlywsant eich dyfyniad hollol gywir chi. Bu iddynt hefyd gael gwared ar y gair 'arbennig'. Felly, dehonglwyd fy ngeiriau yn anghywir, a derbyniaf fod y nyrsys yn grac ynglŷn â'r hyn a glywsant. Tynnais eu sylw at fy union eiriau yng Nghofnod y Trafodion. Mae'r Cofnod yn hynod ddefnyddiol mewn amgylchiadau o'r fath, gan fod y cynnwys yn glir i bawb.

Mae'n bwysig gofyn a yw nyrsys yn derbyn bod y broblem yn cael ei chymryd o ddifrif. Rhaid sicrhau eu bod yn deall beth sydd wrth wraidd y broblem hon—sydd yn enwedig o ddifrifol yng Nghaerdydd ar yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn—a bod y galw am wasanaethau unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys wedi codi 9 y cant yng Nghaerdydd, a 5 y cant ar draws y wlad yn ystod y cyfnod dan sylw. Fel arfer, mae'r galw dim ond yn cynyddu 1 y cant neu 2 y cant bob gaeaf. Credaf fod hyn wedi digwydd am fod llawdriniaethau dewisol wedi parhau, ac am fod problem blocio gwelyau yn gwaethygu yng Nghaerdydd tra'i bod yn gwella ym mhob ardal arall yng Nghymru. Yn ogystal, nid

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): I return to the issue of staff morale. Health professionals have said that they are unhappy with your response to their concerns. They were highly critical of your analysis of the situation at the University Hospital of Wales on 25 January and 1 February. You said that we had experienced a particularly acute version of the problems usually experienced in January. You said today that there were additional problems to those usually experienced in January. Do you regret using those words, and what will you do to alleviate the concerns of staff?

The First Minister: I used the word 'serious' three times in two sentences in response to Mike German, who asked the original question, if I remember rightly. You provided a translation of my comments, but the words I used were 'particularly acute' or, to quote your translation, 'particularly serious'. However, the version seen or heard by nurses in the media included the word 'just', which I did not use. They did not hear your correct quotation. They had also deleted 'particularly'. This presented the nurses with quite a different interpretation of my words. They were angry because of that, and I have to accept that. I drew their attention to my exact words in the Record of Proceedings. The Record is extremely useful in such circumstances, as its contents are clear for all to see.

It is important to ask whether or not they accept that the issues are being taken seriously. We need to ensure that they understand the root causes of this problem—which is particularly acute in Cardiff at this time of year—and are aware of the fact that there was a 9 per cent increase in demand for accident and emergency services in Cardiff and a 5 per cent increase in other parts of Wales during this period. It is usually the case that demand only increases by around 1 per cent or 2 per cent during the winter months. I believe that this is due to the fact that elective surgery has continued, and that bedblocking is becoming worse in Cardiff while improving in other parts of Wales. In

yw'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol yn gweithredu fel y dylai yng Nghaerdydd, yn enwedig dros benwythnosau.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Y peth hawsaf yn y byd fyddai i chi ymddiheuro i staff ynglŷn â'r canfyddiad eich bod wedi dweud bod y sefyllfa hon yn tueddu i ddiwydd ym mis Ionawr ond ei bod hi ychydig yn waeth eleni. Y pwynt a wnaed gan staff oedd y dylai'r Llywodraeth fod wedi rhagweld y math hwn o gynnydd ac y dylai ei strategaeth allu ymdopi. Dywed y staff nad oes gennych strategaeth hirdymor i ddelio â'r broblem. Gwyddom fod Brian Gibbons wedi ymweld ag ysbytai eraill yn y De. Y broblem yw eich bod yn edrych am atebion tymor byr drwy'r amser, heb sylweddoli bod yn rhaid cael atebion hirdymor i'r broblem hon. Pryd wnewch chi dderbyn hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae trefniadau i gyfeirio achosion nad oes modd i un ysbyty ddelio â hwy i adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys yr ysbyty nesaf—sydd wedi cael ei ddefnyddio unwaith yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru—yn cael eu gweithredu yn awr; yr ydym wedi mynd yn ôl at y sefyllfa yr oedd gennym chwe blynedd yn ôl. Dywedodd prif nyrs wrthyf, er nad oedd rhaid i un claf fynd i Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg tra bod y trefniadau ar waith, fod yr effaith ar forâl nyrsys a staff eraill uned ddamweiniau ac achosion brys Caerdydd yn llethol o dda. Cafodd y drysau eu cau am ddwy neu dair awr, ac felly yr oedd modd iddynt ymdopi gan wybod na fyddai neb arall yn dod i mewn nes eu bod wedi cael gwared ar unrhyw argyfwng ac wedi darganfod gwelyau i gleifion a ddaeth i mewn ar ddydd Sul neu ddydd Llun, sef tua wyth niwrnod yn ôl. Codwyd morâl gan y peirianwaith newydd hwn. Gallwch ddweud bod hwn yn fesur dros dro, ond credaf ei bod hi'n bwysig bod staff ysbytai'n gweld ein bod yn gallu ymateb, a bod awdurdodau lleol a phobl â chyfrifoldeb yn lleol hefyd yn gallu ymateb mewn ffordd newydd, er ein bod wedi mynd yn ôl at system a ddefnyddiwyd chwe blynedd yn ôl.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: You have responded to a short-term issue, whereas what we need is a long-term detailed strategy that can be implemented in order to reduce waiting lists,

in addition, the out-of-hours service is not yet operating as it should in Cardiff, particularly at weekends.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: It would be the easiest thing in the world for you to apologise to the staff for giving the impression that this situation tends to occur in January but somehow happened to be worse this year. The point made by the staff is that the Government should have anticipated this type of increase and that its strategy should be able to cope. Staff say that you have no long-term strategy to deal with the problem. We know that Brian Gibbons has visited other hospitals in south Wales. The problem is that you always look for short-term solutions, without recognising that this problem needs a long-term solution. When will you accept that?

The First Minister: Solutions such as a mechanism to divert any demands that cannot be met at one hospital to the accident and emergency unit at the next hospital—which has been used on one occasion in the south-east Wales area—have been put in place; we have returned to the situation as it was six years ago. A charge nurse told me that although no patients were sent to the Royal Glamorgan Hospital when this mechanism was used, the impact on the morale of nurses and other accident and emergency staff in Cardiff was extremely positive. The doors were closed for two to three hours and, therefore, they were able to cope, knowing that no-one else would come in until one emergency was dealt with and beds found for those admitted on Sunday or Monday, around eight days ago. Morale has been boosted by this mechanism. You may say that this is a temporary measure, but I believe that it is important that hospital staff see how we are able to respond to demand, and that local authorities and those who have responsibility at a local level are also able to respond in a new way to that demand, even though we have gone back to a system used six years ago.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr ydych wedi ymateb i fater tymor byr, tra bo arnom angen strategaeth fanwl dymor hir y gellir ei rhoi ar waith i gwtogi rhestrau aros, fel y bydd

which will mean that hospitals can cope with additional pressures at a particular time of year. Now we are being told that you will come up with some kind of magic formula a few days before your March conference, and that you will make an announcement. Most people and staff see this in a cynical light, as just another attempt to buy political time at a sensitive period for the Labour Party. What we need from you First Minister—*[Interruption.]* It is obvious; it is a few days before your party conference. What do you expect people to think?

2.30 p.m.

What we need from you now, First Minister, is a strategy that is different from your present strategy, which gives the impression that you have lost control of the situation and that you are firefighting from week to week. Every week you come here to try to answer these questions, because you do not have a long-term strategy. The most damning indictment of the lot is the recent report that said that none of the managers in the health service believes anything that you have to say on health anymore, and they all say that your targets will not be met by 2007. Local health boards, the trusts, the community health councils and every professional organisation say that you will not meet your targets. Unless you can come up with that strategy, we will not believe a word that you say on health.

The First Minister: I see that your weekend visit to Caernarfon has not brought you back down to a planet where people live. There is no magic formula, and I do not know why you believe that one will be unveiled at the Labour Party conference. This has nothing to do with staff morale in accident and emergency units.

Where we have top-quality bed management and medical assessment units, it is important that that good practice is spread throughout Wales. The medical assessment unit at the Royal Glamorgan Hospital and the unit that has also just opened in Morriston Hospital are working very well, and they are a Welsh

ysbytai'n gallu ymdopi â phwysau ychwanegol ar adeg benodol o'r flwyddyn. Dywedir wrthym yn awr y byddwch yn dyfeisio rhyw fath o fformiwla hud ychydig ddyddiau cyn eich cynhadledd ym mis Mawrth, ac y byddwch yn gwneud cyhoeddiad. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl ac o staff yn edrych yn sinigaidd ar hynny, gan ei ystyried yn ymgais arall eto i brynu amser gwleidyddol mewn cyfnod sy'n sensitif i'r Blaid Lafur. Yr hyn y mae arnom ei angen gennych chi, Brif Weinidog—*[Torri ar draws.]* Mae'n amlwg; mae ychydig ddyddiau cyn cynhadledd eich plaid. Beth yr dych yn disgwyl i bobl ei feddwl?

Yr hyn y mae arnom ei angen gennych chi'n awr, Brif Weinidog, yw strategaeth sy'n wahanol i'r un sydd gennych ar hyn o bryd, sy'n rhoi'r argraff eich bod wedi colli rheolaeth ar y sefyllfa a'ch bod yn ymateb i broblemau penodol o wythnos i wythnos. Yr ydych yn dod yma bob wythnos i geisio ateb y cwestiynau hyn, gan nad oes gennych strategaeth dymor hir. Y feirniadaeth fwyaf damniol o'r cwbl yw'r adroddiad diweddar a ddywedodd nad oes yr un rheolwr yn y gwasanaeth iechyd sy'n credu unrhyw beth a ddywedwch ar iechyd bellach, ac maent i gyd yn dweud na chyrhaeddir eich targedau erbyn 2007. Mae byrddau iechyd lleol, yr ymddiriedolaethau, y cynghorau iechyd cymuned a phob corff proffesiynol yn dweud na wnewch gyrraedd eich targedau. Os na allwch ddyfeisio strategaeth o'r fath, ni chredwn yr un gair a ddywedwch ar iechyd.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwelaf nad yw'ch ymweliad â Chaernarfon dros y penwythnos wedi dod â chi at eich coed. Nid oes fformiwla hud, ac ni wn pam y credwch y bydd un yn cael ei chyhoeddi yng nghynhadledd y Blaid Lafur. Nid oes a wnelo hyn ddim â morâl staff mewn unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys.

Lle y bo gennym ddull o reoli gwelyau ac unedau asesu meddygol o'r radd flaenaf, mae'n bwysig i'r arferion da hynny gael eu lledaenu ledled Cymru. Mae'r uned asesu meddygol yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg a'r uned sydd newydd agor yn Ysbyty Treforys yn llwyddiannus iawn, a rhywbeth a

invention. The unit at the Royal Glamorgan Hospital was the first in the United Kingdom, and it is regarded as the bee's knees. Doctors and hospital managers from all over the UK visit it to see how it works.

When it comes to dealing with this particular crisis, no-one anticipated the rise in demand seen this year compared with last year; it has always been a consistent rise of 1 to 2 per cent in the past. Suddenly, throughout Wales, probably due to problems with the out-of-hours service and waiting-list targets not being suspended during January, or for other reasons, that demand has increased by 5 per cent. In Cardiff, figures are going in the wrong direction whereas, in the rest of Wales, they are going in the right direction. In Cardiff, demand has increased by 9 per cent because of delayed transfers of care. If you ask all of the professionals concerned, they will tell you that they did not anticipate that. That is why it was then necessary to bring in urgent measures, and I make no apologies for doing so—the divert mechanism, regular meetings and the appointment of an emergency lead controller or co-ordinator for this area, who is now working hard. As I said earlier—I think in answer to Nick Bourne—the nurse director of the A1 link ward is hard at work looking into bringing down that £12 million bill for agency and bank nurses in order to release funds to staff the empty ward.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): We have heard your explanation and your change of tone in the words that you first used in the Chamber when I questioned you about the e-mail from the sister at the University Hospital of Wales. I shall try another set of words that you have used. In an interview given a few weeks ago, to celebrate your five years in office, you said that waiting lists were 'a massive political distraction'. On top of waiting lists, having now had to deal with the crisis in accident and emergency units, not just in the University Hospital of Wales but, as I will tell you in a moment, in the Royal Gwent

ddyfeisiwyd yng Nghymru ydynt. Yr uned yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg oedd y gyntaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ac fe'i hystyrir yn un benigamp. Daw meddygon a rheolwyr ysbytai yno o bob rhan o'r DU i weld sut y mae'n gweithio.

Gyda golwg ar ddelio â'r argyfwng penodol hwn, nid oedd unrhyw un wedi rhagweld y cynnydd yn y galw a gafwyd eleni o'i gymharu â'r llynedd; yn y gorffennol, cafwyd cynnydd o 1 i 2 y cant bob tro. Yn sydyn, ledled Cymru, a hynny, mae'n debyg, o ganlyniad i broblemau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol a pheidio ag atal y targedau ar gyfer rhestrau aros yn ystod mis Ionawr, neu am resymau eraill, mae'r galw wedi codi 5 y cant. Yng Nghaerdydd, mae'r ffigurau'n mynd i'r cyfeiriad anghywir wrth iddynt fynd i'r cyfeiriad iawn yng ngweddill Cymru. Yng Nghaerdydd, cododd y galw 9 y cant oherwydd oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal. Os holwch yr holl weithwyr proffesiynol sy'n gysylltiedig, dywedant wrthyhych nad oeddent wedi rhagweld hynny. Dyna pam y bu'n rhaid cyflwyno mesurau brys wedyn, ac nid ymddiheuraf am wneud hynny—y trefniant dargyfeirio, cyfarfodydd rheolaidd a phenodi rheolwr neu gyd-drefnydd arweiniol brys ar gyfer yr ardal hon, sydd bellach yn gweithio'n galed. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach—wrth ateb Nick Bourne, fe gredaf—mae nyrs gyfarwyddwr ward gyswllt A1 wrthi'n ceisio gostwng y bil o £12 miliwn am nyrsys asiantaeth a nyrsys cronfa er mwyn rhyddhau arian i staffio'r ward wag.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Clywsom eich eglurhad a'r newid goslef yn y geiriau a ddefnyddiasoch gyntaf yn y Siambr pan holais chi am y neges e-bost oddi wrth y brif nyrs yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru. Rhoddaf gynnig ar set arall o eiriau a ddefnyddiasoch. Mewn cyfweiliad a roddwyd ychydig wythnosau'n ôl, i ddatlu'ch pum mlynedd yn eich swydd, dywedasoch fod rhestrau aros yn 'wrthdynciad gwleidyddol mawr'. Yn ogystal â rhestrau aros, a chithau bellach wedi gorfod delio â'r argyfwng mewn unedau argyfwng ac achosion brys, nid yn unig yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru ond, fel y dywedaf wrthyhych mewn eiliad, yn

Hospital, and as well as yesterday's announcement from doctors on the problems in intensive care units in our capital city, can you tell me, First Minister, whether you would also describe these issues as 'a massive political distraction'?

The First Minister: No, the issue of waiting lists being a distraction comes from the fact that they comprise about 10 per cent of NHS activity. However, if you fall down on waiting lists, it tends to give people the impression that you are falling down on the other 90 per cent, even if you are doing extremely well. Given that waiting lists are so easily measured and that the figures are released monthly, everyone concentrates on them. It is perfectly fair; it is all part of the political knockabout, and I understand that. If waiting list numbers are high, then you will use that against us and you will not praise us for what we may be doing for the other 90 per cent of NHS activity. We must accept that, because that is politics, and particularly the politics of the health service. It might be regrettable but that is the world in which we live. We have to accept that we must do well on waiting lists as well as on the other 90 per cent, because waiting lists are important. They are only 10 per cent of the issue, but they are important because they are so easily measurable.

Everything in the health service is important, but some issues get laser-like treatment, while others do not get such close attention. We must try to be responsible across the board. We know that the big health gains in Wales will come, not from what happens inside hospitals, but from what comes outside hospitals, in terms of reduced numbers of smokers and people's reduced consumption of animal fat and milk. That is the way to stop having strokes and heart attacks. However, if you have a stroke or a heart attack, you must be admitted immediately to an accident and emergency department and, if you have problems with your knees or joints or whatever, you will need waiting-list surgery—people deserve that and they will get it.

Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent, ac yn ogystal â'r cyhoeddiad ddoe gan feddygon ynghylch y problemau mewn unedau gofal dwys yn ein prifddinas, a allwch ddweud wrthyf, Brif Weinidog, a alwch y materion hyn yn 'wrthdynamiad gwleidyddol mawr' hefyd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Na wnawn, mae'r mater o alw rhestrau aros yn wrthdynamiad yn codi o'r ffaith eu bod yn cynnwys tua 10 y cant o weithgarwch y GIG. Fodd bynnag, os methir o ran y rhestrau aros, mae hynny'n tueddu i roi'r argraff eich bod yn methu yn y 90 y cant arall, hyd yn oed os ydych yn gwneud yn dda iawn. Gan ei bod mor hawdd mesur rhestrau aros a chan fod y ffigurau'n cael eu cyhoeddi bob mis, mae pawb yn canolbwyntio arnynt. Mae'n gwbl deg; mae hyn i gyd yn rhan o'r colbio gwleidyddol a geir, ac yr wyf yn deall hynny. Os yw niferoedd y rhestrau aros yn uchel, defnyddiwch hynny yn ein herbyn ac ni wnewch ein canmol am yr hyn y gallwn fod yn ei wneud ar gyfer y 90 y cant arall o weithgarwch y GIG. Rhaid inni dderbyn hynny, gan mai peth felly yw gwleidyddiaeth, a gwleidyddiaeth y gwasanaeth iechyd yn enwedig. Gallai fod yn destun gofid ond byd felly yr ydym yn byw yn ddo. Rhaid inni dderbyn bod rhaid inni lwyddo o ran y rhestrau aros yn ogystal â'r 90 y cant arall, gan fod rhestrau aros yn bwysig. Nid ydynt ond yn 10 y cant o'r mater sydd dan sylw, ond maent yn bwysig gan eu bod mor hawdd eu mesur.

Mae popeth yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn bwysig, ond mae rhai materion yn cael eu trin yn fanwl fanwl, tra bo eraill nad ydynt yn denu cymaint o sylw. Rhaid inni geisio bod yn gyfrifol yn gyffredinol. Gwyddom y ceir y cynnydd mwyaf o ran iechyd yng Nghymru o'r hyn a ddigwydd y tu allan i ysbytai, nid y tu mewn iddynt, o ran lleihau nifer yr ysmygwyr a bwyta llai o fraster anifeiliaid ac yfed llai o laeth. Dyna'r modd i osgoi strôc a thrawiad ar y galon. Fodd bynnag, os cewch strôc neu drawiad ar y galon, rhaid eich derbyn ar unwaith i adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys ac, os oes gennych broblemau ar eich pengliniau neu'ch cymalau neu ba beth bynnag, bydd arnoch angen triniaeth drwy fod ar restr aros—mae pobl yn haeddu hynny ac fe'i cânt.

Michael German: None of these answers is satisfactory for the person who has to wait on a trolley for 24 hours, as my colleague, the lord mayor of Cardiff, had to do a few days ago. None of this will bring back the life of the lady who lay on a trolley overnight at the University Hospital of Wales. None of it will deal with the problem, which you have not yet accepted as being a result of your lack of strategy inside hospitals, for the ambulance service, which has ambulances queuing up outside our hospitals. People cannot get ambulances. At one point, all of the ambulances available to the whole of Gwent were parked outside the Royal Gwent Hospital, while the ambulance men were inside, holding their patients on trolleys. What is the difference, therefore, between ‘a massive political distraction’—which I believe is what you are saying waiting lists, and, presumably, these other things are—and the problem facing the people of Wales regarding the health service, which they care so much about?

The First Minister: You must have a solution for 100 per cent of the health service’s problems, and not just 10 per cent. It would not be a good idea for us to devote more resources to the waiting list issue, and divert resources away from accident and emergency units. This winter, for the first time, managers in Wales are coping with the large increase in accident and emergency admissions at the same time as not suspending elective waiting-list surgery, as they have done in past years. I believe that all Members support the decision to press hospital managers not to suspend elective surgery unless absolutely necessary, and usually on the chief executive’s instructions. It is important that they learn to cope—as English hospitals have done—with continuing to perform waiting-list surgery, even during times of maximum pressure, as at this time of year.

Michael German: We have published report after report, all of which are just sitting on shelves, which say that it is not a matter of

Michael German: Ni fydd yr un o’r atebion hynny’n bodloni’r sawl sy’n gorfod aros ar droli am 24 awr, fel y bu’n rhaid i un o’r cymheiriaid, arglwydd faer Caerdydd, ychydig ddyddiau’n ôl. Ni fydd yr un o’r geiriau hyn yn adfer einioes y fenyw a orweddodd ar droli dros nos yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru. Ni fydd yr un gair o hyn yn delio â’r broblem hon, na dderbyniasoch eto ei bod yn ganlyniad i’ch diffyg strategaeth mewn ysbytai, ar gyfer y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, sy’n peri bod ambiwlansiau’n ciwio y tu allan i’n hysbytai. Ni all pobl gael ambiwlansiau. Ar un adeg, yr oedd yr holl ambiwlansiau ar gyfer Gwent gyfan wedi’u parcio y tu allan i Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent, tra oedd y dynion ambiwlans y tu mewn, yn dal eu cleifion ar droliâu. Beth yw’r gwahaniaeth, felly, rhwng ‘gwrthdynciad gwleidyddol mawr’—sef yr hyn y credaf eich bod yn dweud yw rhestrau aros, a’r pethau eraill hyn, gellir cymryd— a’r broblem sy’n wynebu pobl Cymru mewn cysylltiad â’r gwasanaeth iechyd, y maent yn ymboeni cymaint amdano?

Y Prif Weinidog: Rhaid cael ateb ar gyfer 100 y cant o broblemau’r gwasanaeth iechyd, ac nid 10 y cant ohonynt yn unig. Ni fyddai’n syniad da inni neilltuo mwy o adnoddau ar gyfer mater y rhestrau aros, a throi adnoddau oddi wrth unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Y gaeaf hwn, am y tro cyntaf, mae rheolwyr yng Nghymru’n ymdopi â chynnydd mawr yn y nifer a dderbynnir i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys heb atal llawdriniaethau dewisol ar gyfer rhai ar restrau aros, fel y gwnaethant mewn blynyddoedd cynt. Credaf fod yr holl Aelodau’n cefnogi’r penderfyniad i bwysu ar reolwyr ysbytai i beidio ag atal llawdriniaethau dewisol oni bai fod hynny’n gwbl angenrheidiol, ac yn unol â chyfarwyddyd y prif weithredwr fel arfer. Mae’n bwysig iddynt ddysgu ymdopi—fel y gwnaeth ysbytai yn Lloegr—fel y byddant yn dal i roi llawdriniaethau i rai sydd ar restrau aros, hyd yn oed ar adegau y ceir y pwysau mwyaf, fel y ceir ar yr adeg hon o’r flwyddyn.

Michael German: Yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi’r naill adroddiad ar ôl y llall, a’r cwbl ohonynt yn sefyll ar silffoedd, sy’n dweud nad yw’r

resources, but rather the way in which they are used. In that resource usage, it is about our doing the right things in the wrong places or at the wrong times. What will you do to reorganise, and what instruction will you give, so that patients are not kept waiting on trolleys, so that hospital ambulances are not left queuing up outside hospitals but are sent out to collect patients, so that people get the most appropriate care, and so that the increased waiting times for people being discharged from hospitals—particularly at the Royal Gwent Hospital—do not increase?

The First Minister: The divert mechanism that I mentioned, which has now been put in place, is exactly for that reason. It is meant to ensure that the situation that occurred simultaneously at the Royal Gwent Hospital and at the University Hospital of Wales does not recur, where every ambulance in the Cardiff and Newport areas was on the forecourt of those two hospitals respectively. That is unacceptable. Therefore, a divert mechanism is needed to get those ambulances that are responding to 999 calls diverted by the bed bureau, or by some other means, to another hospital that is not under as much pressure. That was activated for the first time during the past eight or nine days. That is an important restoration of flexibility, which ceased some five and a half or six years ago, as I am told.

The other issue is to do with whether we have a strategy. I mentioned in an earlier answer to David Melding that we are trebling the capital investment programme, from £120 million a year to £309 million a year. In that programme, there is every opportunity to put right some of the shortages in capital stock and to ensure that we have the flexibility to deal with waiting lists, accident and emergency departments, public health programmes, and promotional programmes, and to ensure that the people of Wales get the health service that they deserve.

Denise Idris Jones: I have to sit here every Tuesday and Wednesday listening to these continuous criticisms—

mater hwn yn ymwneud ag adnoddau, ond â'r modd y'u defnyddir. Wrth ddefnyddio'r adnoddau hynny, mae'n ymwneud â gwneud y pethau iawn yn y manau anghywir neu ar yr adegau anghywir. Pa gamau a gymerwch i ad-drefnu, a pha gyfarwyddiadau a roddwch, fel na chedwir cleifion i aros ar droliâu, fel na adewir ambiwlansiau ysbyty'n ciwio y tu allan i ysbytai ac yr anfonir hwy i godi cleifion, fel y caiff pobl y gofal mwyaf priodol, ac fel na fydd yr amseroedd aros ar gyfer rhyddhau pobl o ysbytai—yn enwedig Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent—yn cynyddu ymhellach?

Y Prif Weinidog: Dyna union bwrpas y trefniant dargyfeirio a grybwyllais, sydd bellach wedi'i roi ar waith. Ei amcan yw sicrhau na fydd y sefyllfa a gododd yr un pryd yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent ac yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru yn digwydd eto, lle'r oedd pob ambiwlans yn ardaloedd Caerdydd a Chasnewydd ar gwrth blaen eu priod ysbytai. Mae hynny'n annerbyniol. Felly, mae angen trefniant dargyfeirio i beri dargyfeirio'r ambiwlansiau sy'n ymateb i alwadau 999 gan y swyddfa rheoli gwelyau, neu drwy ryw fodd arall, i ysbyty arall nad yw o dan gymaint o bwysau. Defnyddiwyd hwnnw am y tro cyntaf yn ystod yr wyth neu naw diwrnod diwethaf. Mae hynny'n fodd pwysig i adfer hyblygrwydd, a ddaeth i ben tua phump neu chwe blynedd yn ôl, fel y cefais wybod.

Mae'r mater arall yn ymwneud â'r cwestiwn a oes gennym strategaeth. Dywedais mewn ateb cynharach i David Melding ein bod yn treblu maint y rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf, o £120 miliwn y flwyddyn i £309 miliwn y flwyddyn. Yn y rhaglen honno, mae pob cyfle i wneud iawn am rywfaint o'r prinder o ran stoc cyfalaf a sicrhau y gallwn ymdrin yn hyblyg â rhestrau aros, adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, rhaglenni iechyd cyhoeddus, a rhaglenni hyrwyddo, a gofalu y caiff pobl Cymru y gwasanaeth iechyd y maent yn ei haeddu.

Denise Idris Jones: Yr wyf yn gorfod eistedd yma bob dydd Mawrth a dydd Mercher yn gwrando ar y beirniadaethau diddiwedd hyn—

Jonathan Morgan: You do not have to.

Jonathan Morgan: Nid ydych yn gorfod gwneud.

Denise Idris Jones: Yes I do, because it is my duty to do so. I have to hear these continuous criticisms of south Wales hospitals. I see that the leader of the opposition is now laughing. I represent a constituency in which there is a very good hospital, Ysbyty Gwynedd, which serves your constituents, Ieuan Wyn Jones, as well as mine. I was there two weeks ago, and it had good news to share. Let us therefore accept the good news as well as what you want to call your 'criticisms'.

Denise Idris Jones: Ydwyf, gan fy mod dan ddyletswydd i wneud hynny. Yr wyf yn gorfod gwranddo ar y beirniadaethau diddiwedd hyn ar ysbytai yn y De. Gwelaf fod arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn chwerthin yn awr. Cynrychiolaf etholaeth lle y mae ysbyty da iawn, Ysbyty Gwynedd, sy'n gwasanaethu'ch etholwyr chi, Ieuan Wyn Jones, yn ogystal â'm rhai i. Bùm yno bythefnos yn ôl, ac yr oedd ganddo newyddion da i'w rhoi. Felly, gadewch inni dderbyn y newyddion da yn ogystal â'r hyn y dymunwch ei alw'n 'feirniadaeth'.

2.40 p.m.

The First Minister: You will be on a waiting list waiting for them to accept good news about the health service, Denise.

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddwch chi ar restr aros yn aros iddynt dderbyn newyddion da am y gwasanaeth iechyd, Denise.

I have mentioned this before, but it is worth mentioning again. I do not think it good for the morale of hospital staff in Wales to hear only criticism from opposition Members, who have read a story in *The Daily Post* or the *Western Mail* or have seen an article on the BBC. When there is good news, such as the levels of methicillin-resistant staphylococcus aureus in Welsh hospitals being a third lower than those in English hospitals, do we ever hear a word of praise for Welsh hospitals from the three opposition parties? No, I am afraid that we do not. When we hear about the improvement in the infant mortality rate, which used to be higher in Wales than in England but which is now substantially lower, do we ever hear those Members say, 'Oh, that is a good thing and a massive achievement for our staff'? No, they never say that. They cannot bring themselves to do it. When we hear that we have 24-hour access to primary care compared with 48-hour access in England, do they ever say that that is a good thing? No, they do not, and yet, of course, that must be part of the strategy to divert people from inappropriately attending accident and emergency departments.

Yr wyf wedi sôn am hyn o'r blaen, ond mae'n werth sôn amdano eto. Ni chredaf ei bod yn llesol i forâl staff ysbytai yng Nghymru glywed dim ond beirniadaeth gan Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau, sydd wedi darllen stori yn *The Daily Post* neu'r *Western Mail* neu wedi gweld eitem ar y BBC. Pan geir newyddion da, fel y ffaith bod lefelau staffylococws awrëws sy'n gwrthsefyll methisilin yn ysbytai Cymru'n un rhan o dair yn is na'r rhai mewn ysbytai yn Lloegr, a glywn air o glod byth i ysbytai Cymru gan y tair gwrthblaid? Na chlywn, mae arnaf ofn. Pan glywn fod y gyfradd marwolaethau babanod wedi gwella, gan ei bod yn arfer bod yn uwch yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr a chan ei bod yn is o lawer yn awr, a fyddwn byth yn clywed yr Aelodau hynny'n dweud, 'O, mae hynny'n beth da ac yn gyflawniad aruthrol gan ein staff'? Na fyddwn, ni fyddant byth yn dweud hynny. Nid ydynt yn barod i wneud hynny. Pan glywn fod gennym fynediad o fewn 24 awr i ofal sylfaenol o'i gymharu â mynediad o fewn 48 awr yn Lloegr, a fyddant byth yn dweud bod hynny'n beth da? Na fyddant, ac eto, wrth gwrs, rhaid i hynny fod yn rhan o'r strategaeth i atal pobl rhag dod i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys os nad yw'n briodol iddynt wneud hynny.

Dydd Gŵyl Dewi St David's Day

C6 Owen John Thomas: A yw'r Prif Weinidog wedi llwyddo i ddarbwyllio Llywodraeth San Steffan i dderbyn penderfyniad unfrydol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol y dylai Dydd Gŵyl Dewi fod yn ŵyl gyhoeddus? OAQ0193(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni dderbyniodd Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol gais y Cynulliad i ganiatáu gŵyl y banc ychwanegol i Gymru, i ddathlu Dydd Gŵyl Dewi.

Owen John Thomas: A wnewch fynd yn ôl at eich pennaeth yn Llundain a dweud wrtho ein bod am gyflawni geiriau Dewi Sant:

'Byddwch lawen...a gwnewch y pethau bychain'?

Peth bychan fyddai i Tony Blair barchu ein cais, a chyfle fyddai hynny wedyn inni lawenhau. A wnewch dynnu sylw Tony Blair at briodoldeb amserol gwneud y cyhoeddiad hwnnw tra bod Caerdydd yn dathlu ei chanmlwyddiant yn ddinas a'i hanner canmlwyddiant yn brifddinas Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid ydym wedi rhoi'r gorau iddi, ac mae'r trafodaethau yn parhau, ond nid ydynt wedi bod yn llwyddiannus hyd yn hyn.

Q6 Owen John Thomas: Has the First Minister been successful in persuading the Westminster Government to accept the unanimous decision of the National Assembly that St David's Day should be a public holiday? OAQ0193(FM)

The First Minister: The UK Government has rejected the Assembly's request to grant Wales an additional bank holiday to celebrate St David's Day.

Owen John Thomas: Will you go back to your boss in London and tell him that we want to follow the words of St David:

'Be joyful...and do the little things'?

It would be a 'little thing' for Tony Blair to respect our request, which would then give us an opportunity to be joyful. Will you draw Tony Blair's attention to the fact that it would be timely and apt to make such an announcement while Cardiff celebrates its centenary as a city and its fiftieth anniversary as capital city of Wales?

The First Minister: We have not given up on that, and discussions are continuing, but they have not yet proved successful.

Cymru fel Cyrchfan i Ymwelwyr Wales as a Tourist Destination

Q7 Irene James: Will the First Minister make a statement about promoting Wales as a tourist destination? OAQ0202(FM)

The First Minister: We have been successful in our policy of promoting Wales through 'Big Country', which is regarded as an original campaign that has pulled the punters in. We intend it to continue to increase awareness of Wales as a tourism destination and promote tourism growth in Wales, as well as to promote it to new markets in activity tourism and to give a special image of Wales that will continue to draw tourists in during the twenty-first

C7 Irene James: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ynghylch yr hyrwyddo Cymru fel cyrchfan i ymwelwyr? OAQ0202(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Buom yn llwyddiannus yn ein polisi o hyrwyddo Cymru drwy 'Big Country', y bernir ei bod yn ymgyrch ddyfeisgar sydd wedi denu ymwelwyr. Bwriadwn iddi barhau i hybu ymwybyddiaeth o Gymru fel cyrchfan i ymwelwyr ac i hyrwyddo twf twristiaeth yng Nghymru, yn ogystal â'i hyrwyddo mewn marchnadoedd newydd ym maes gweithgareddau i ymwelwyr a chyfleu delwedd arbennig o Gymru a fydd yn dal i

century.

Irene James: Encouraging visitors to holiday in Wales is vital if we are to increase our levels of economic prosperity. Do you agree that, to capitalise on tourism, a reliable, integrated public transport system that accounts for the needs of tourists, and is helpful and informative, acknowledging that tourists have little local knowledge, is necessary in order to ensure that visitors to Wales can confidently experience even the remotest of tourist destinations?

The First Minister: I agree. Staff in tourist information centres should be able to provide that kind of information. They should help you to find a reasonably priced bed-and-breakfast guest house, hotel, caravan or whatever it is that you are looking for, and it is also important that they should know about transport. There is nothing more enjoyable than taking a bus or train to somewhere to commence a walk, taking a walk, and then returning to where you came from on public transport. That is good fun and we must promote that through making good public-transport information available to tourists, whether in information centres or through call centres.

ddenu ymwelwyr yn ystod yr unfed ganrif ar hugain.

Irene James: Mae'n hollbwysig annog ymwelwyr i dreulio eu gwyliau yng Nghymru os ydym i gynyddu ein ffyniant economaidd. A ydych yn cytuno, os ydym i elwa ar dwristiaeth, fod angen system drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus ddibynadwy ac integredig sy'n diwallu anghenion ymwelwyr, ac yn cynnig cymorth a gwybodaeth, gan mai prin yw'r wybodaeth leol sydd gan ymwelwyr, er mwyn sicrhau y gall ymwelwyr â Chymru gyrraedd y cyrchfannau twristaidd mwyaf diarffordd yn hyderus?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn cytuno. Dylai staff mewn canolfannau gwybodaeth i ymwelwyr allu cynnig gwybodaeth o'r fath. Dylent eich helpu i ddod o hyd i lety gwely a brecwast, gwesty neu garafan sy'n rhesymol eu pris, neu ba beth bynnag arall yr ydych yn chwilio amdano, ac mae hefyd yn bwysig iddynt wybod am drafnidiaeth. Nid oes dim mwy pleserus na mynd mewn bws neu drên i rywle sy'n fan cychwyn, a mynd am dro, ac wedyn dychwelyd i'r man cychwyn ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Mae hynny'n ddifyr iawn a rhaid inni hyrwyddo hynny drwy gynnig gwybodaeth dda am drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus i ymwelwyr, boed hynny drwy ganolfannau gwybodaeth neu drwy ganolfannau galwadau.

Canolfan Adsefydlu Cardiaidd Cardiac Rehabilitation Centre

C8 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar gynigion ar gyfer canolfan adsefydlu cardiaidd newydd yn Ysbyty Cyffredinol Gorllewin Cymru, sir Gaerfyrddin? OAQ0184(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mater i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Sir Gaerfyrddin yw penderfynu pa feysydd gwasanaeth y mae'n eu datblygu ar ei safleoedd a phryd i wneud hynny. Clywaf i'r ymddiriedolaeth drafod y prosiect hwn, ond ar raddfa lle nad yw'n galw am gyfalaf y tu hwnt i'r hyn sydd ar gael i'r ymddiriedolaeth.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Os mater i'r ymddiriedolaeth yw'r ganolfan gardiaidd, a

Q8 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Will the First Minister make a statement on proposals for a new cardiac rehabilitation centre at West Wales General Hospital, Carmarthenshire? OAQ0184(FM)

The First Minister: It is for Carmarthenshire NHS Trust to determine which service areas it develops on its sites and when it does so. I understand that the trust has discussed this project, but on a scale that does not require capital beyond that which is available to the trust.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: If the cardiac centre is a matter for the trust, do you accept that

fyddech yn derbyn mai mater i Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru yw'r uned ddialysis yng Nghaerfyrddin a bod mawr angen sicrhau uned newydd ar gyfer y cleifion yno? Mae'r uned bresennol yn llawer rhy fach ar eu cyfer ac mae'r staff yn gweithio o dan amodau anodd iawn. Ni ellir adeiladu'r uned newydd mae'n debyg hyd nes y caiff y ganolfan gardiaidd ei hadeiladu. A wnewch chi ymyrryd yn y mater hwn i sicrhau y caiff cleifion yn sir Gaerfyrddin sydd yn dioddef o afiechydon cardiaidd, neu sydd angen dialysis, y driniaeth y maent yn ei haeddu?

Y Prif Weinidog: Os wyf yn anghywir, ysgrifennaf atoch, ond mae'r fersiwn a glywais i o'r stori honno i'r gwrthwyneb yn llwyr. Clywais eu bod am fwrw ymlaen yn awr gyda chodi'r uned newydd ar gyfer dialysis arenol ond eu bod yn cael eu dal yn ôl oherwydd bod yr ymdrech i gael uned adsefydlu cardiaidd yn arafu'r broses. Edrychaf ar y mater, ac, os wyf yn anghywir, ysgrifennaf atoch.

the dialysis unit in Carmarthen is a matter for Health Commission Wales and that there is a great need to ensure a new unit for those patients? The current unit is much too small for them and staff are working in very difficult conditions. It appears that the new unit cannot be built until the cardiac centre is built. Will you intervene in this matter to ensure that patients in Carmarthenshire who suffer from cardiac disease, or who need dialysis, receive the treatment that they deserve?

The First Minister: If I am incorrect, I will write to you, but I heard a completely different version of that story. I heard that they wish to proceed now with building the new renal dialysis unit but that they are being held back because the effort to get a cardiac rehabilitation unit is slowing down the process. I will look into the matter, and, if I am incorrect, I will write to you.

Gwasanaethau Damweiniau ac Achosion Brys yng Nghaerdydd Accident and Emergency Services in Cardiff

Q9 Jenny Randerson: What is being done to improve accident and emergency services in Cardiff? OAQ0191(FM)

The First Minister: We are improving the ability of accident and emergency services in Cardiff to cope with rising demand. For some reason demand has risen almost twice as fast in Cardiff and the Vale, which has seen an increase of 9 per cent, than in the rest of Wales, which has seen an increase of 5 per cent, and four or five times as fast as in previous years. The probable reason for that is that delayed transfers of care figures are going the wrong way in Cardiff and going the right way elsewhere in Wales. That is why we have introduced the divert mechanism, appointed a south-east Wales emergency care leader and are currently evaluating having a GP sitting in accident and emergency, which we paid for from May to November, to see whether we would want to restore that scheme, because the staff at the accident and emergency department have told me that they found that useful.

C9 Jenny Randerson: Beth sy'n cael ei wneud i wella'r gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys yng Nghaerdydd? OAQ0191(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn gwella gallu gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys yng Nghaerdydd i ymdopi â'r galw cynyddol. Am ryw reswm, mae'r galw wedi cynyddu bron ddwywaith yn gyflymach yng Nghaerdydd a'r Fro, a welodd gynnydd o 9 y cant, nag yng ngweddill Cymru, lle y cafwyd cynnydd o 5 y cant, a phedair neu bum gwaith yn gyflymach nag yn y blynyddoedd blaenorol. Y rheswm tebygol yw bod y ffigurau am oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad anghywir yng Nghaerdydd ac i'r cyfeiriad cywir mewn mannau eraill yng Nghymru. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi cyflwyno'r trefniant dargyfeirio, wedi penodi arweinydd gofal brys ar gyfer y De-ddwyrain ac yn gwerthuso ar hyn o bryd y posibilrwydd o gael meddyg teulu yn yr adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys, y talasom amdano o fis Mai i fis Tachwedd, i ystyried a ydym am ailgychwyn y cynllun hwnnw, gan fod staff yr adran wedi dweud

wrthf eu bod wedi cael hynny'n beth defnyddiol.

Jenny Randerson: With all due respect, rising demand cannot be explained by delayed transfers of care. Delays at accident and emergency units can result from delayed transfers of care, but not rising demand. On Sunday evening, I spent four hours with the ambulance service and saw up to five ambulances at a time queuing outside the accident and emergency department at UHW. The picture that the crews there described to me was of a complex and profound system failure, one much more complicated than just a shortage of beds. It is clear that the accident and emergency department is unable to cope with the rising demand that it faces and that many people attending the department would be more appropriately treated elsewhere. Will you commit to urgently providing the funding required by Cardiff Local Health Board to provide a walk-in centre at the Cardiff Royal Infirmary site to take some of the pressure off the accident and emergency department? Is it not time that we caught up with England in the provision of this modern type of facility?

The First Minister: I must correct you; I understand that they are proposing a double walk-in centre, with the main unit situated at Cardiff Royal Infirmary, using the out-of-hours facility, and a secondary unit at the out-of-hours centre at UHW next door to the accident and emergency unit. I discussed this before Plenary today with Jenny Theed, who is one of the local health board's senior executives. I do not think that the proposal has reached the stage where we can consider it. It is in the system, and we are aware of the proposal, but it has not reached the formal stage. One major concern that has been expressed by the management of the accident and emergency unit is that, while it is all very well to have a walk-in centre next door in the UHW, it cannot lead to a transfer of some of the unit's best and most experienced accident and emergency nurses there to run that centre, as the unit would then be short of really experienced professionals. It might be seen as a less stressful job than working in accident and emergency under the current

Jenny Randerson: Gyda phob dyledus barch, nid oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yw'r rheswm dros y cynnydd yn y galw. Mae oedi mewn unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn gallu bod o ganlyniad i oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal, ond nid i alw cynyddol. Ar nos Sul, treuliais bedair awr gyda'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans a gwelais hyd at bum ambiwlans ar y tro'n ciwio y tu allan i'r adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru. Yr hyn a ddisgrifiwyd imi gan y criwiau oedd methiant cymhleth a sylfaenol yn y system, a oedd yn fwy cymhleth o lawer na phrinder gwelyau'n unig. Mae'n amlwg na all yr adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys ymdopi â'r galw cynyddol y mae'n ei wynebu a bod llawer a ddaw i'r adran y byddai'n fwy priodol eu trin mewn mannau eraill. A wnewch ymrwymo i roi ar frys y cyllid y mae ar Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerdydd ei angen i ddarparu canolfan cerdded i mewn ar safle Ysbyty Brenhinol Caerdydd er mwyn lleihau'r pwysau sydd ar yr adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys? Onid yw'n bryd inni ddilyn Lloegr o ran darparu cyfleusterau modern o'r math hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Rhaid imi'ch cywiro; yr wyf yn deall eu bod yn cynnig canolfan cerdded i mewn ddwbl, gyda'r brif uned yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Caerdydd, yn defnyddio cyfleusterau'r gwasanaeth a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol, ac uned eilaidd yng nghanolfan y gwasanaeth a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru y drws nesaf i'r uned ddamweiniau ac achosion brys. Trafodais hyn cyn y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw gyda Jenny Theed, sy'n un o uwch weithredwyr y bwrdd iechyd lleol. Ni chredaf fod y cynnig wedi cyrraedd man lle y gallwn ei ystyried. Mae yn y system, a gwyddom am y cynnig, ond nid yw wedi cyrraedd y cam ffurfiol. Un o'r pryderon pennaf a fynegwyd gan reolwyr yr uned ddamweiniau ac achosion brys yw, er mai digon derbyniol yw cael canolfan cerdded i mewn y drws nesaf yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, na chaiff hynny arwain at drosglwyddo rhai o'r nyrsys gorau yn yr uned sy'n fwyaf profiadol yn y gwasanaeth damweiniau ac achosion brys i redeg y

circumstances. Therefore, I would want assurances that it would not lead to a worse service being provided in the accident and emergency department, although everyone can see the superficial attractions.

Jonathan Morgan: Do you accept that your Government's failure to sort out bedblocking at the Heath hospital, your failure to get to grips with the large number of nurse vacancies within Cardiff and the Vale, and your failure to increase the capacity of the NHS in Cardiff since devolution, despite record increases in Government funding, have all made a major contribution to the crisis that we now face in the accident and emergency unit at the Heath hospital? Would it not be only fair for the Government to, as quickly as possible, put on record its support for what the local health board wants to do with the Cardiff Royal Infirmary site? It would alleviate a huge amount of the pressure that is felt at the accident and emergency unit.

2.50 p.m.

The First Minister: To say that we have not spent money on the health service and on capital programmes in the Cardiff area is completely wrong. Leaving aside the new children's hospital, there is a major new unit for the elderly mentally ill at the Llandough site, and construction of the new ambulatory care centre there has also commenced. These are all major capital projects that will help to ensure that everyone in the Cardiff area who needs health service treatment receives it as they should. You want to say that it is our fault that bedblocking is going on, but we must ask why the bedblocking figures are going the wrong way in Cardiff when they are going the right way in the other 21 local authorities. That needs to be looked at locally.

Your point about nurse vacancies is an

ganolfan honno, gan y byddai'r uned yn brin wedyn o weithwyr proffesiynol gwirioneddol brofiadol. Gellid ystyried bod llai o bwysau wrth wneud y gwaith hwnnw na gweithio yn yr uned ddamweiniau ac achosion brys o dan yr amgylchiadau presennol. Felly, byddwn am gael sicrwydd nad arweiniai at ddarparu gwasanaeth gwaeth yn yr adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys, er y gall pawb weld yr atyniad arwynebol.

Jonathan Morgan: A ydych yn derbyn bod methiant eich Llywodraeth i ddatrys problem y blocio ar welyau yn ysbyty'r Mynydd Bychan, eich methiant i ddelio â'r nifer fawr o swyddi nyrsio gwag yng Nghaerdydd a'r Fro, a'ch methiant i gynyddu capasiti'r GIG yng Nghaerdydd ers datganoli, er bod yr ariannu gan y Llywodraeth yn fwy nag y bu erioed o'r blaen, i gyd wedi cyfrannu'n helaeth at yr argyfwng a wynebwn yn awr yn yr uned ddamweiniau ac achosion brys yn ysbyty'r Mynydd Bychan? Onid y lleiaf y gallai'r Llywodraeth ei wneud, er tegwch, fyddai iddi ddatgan ei chefnogaeth, cyn gynted ag y bo modd, i'r hyn y mae'r bwrdd iechyd lleol yn dymuno'i wneud â safle Ysbyty Brenhinol Caerdydd? Byddai'n codi llawer iawn o bwysau oddi ar yr uned ddamweiniau ac achosion brys.

Y Prif Weinidog: Hollol anghywir yw dweud nad ydym wedi gwario arian ar y gwasanaeth iechyd ac ar raglenni cyfalaf yn ardal Caerdydd. Heb sôn am yr ysbyty plant newydd, mae uned newydd bwysig ar gyfer pobl oedrannus sydd â salwch meddwl ar y safle yn Llandochoau, ac mae'r gwaith o godi'r ganolfan triniaethau dydd newydd yn y fan honno wedi dechrau hefyd. Prosiectau cyfalaf pwysig yw'r rhain i gyd a fydd o gymorth i sicrhau y bydd pawb yn ardal Caerdydd sydd ag angen triniaeth gan y gwasanaeth iechyd yn ei chael fel y dylent. Yr ydych am ddweud mai ni sydd ar fai am y blocio ar welyau, ond rhaid inni ofyn pam y mae'r ffigurau am flocio gwelyau yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad anghywir yng Nghaerdydd tra elont i'r cyfeiriad iawn yn yr 21 o awdurdodau lleol eraill. Rhaid edrych ar hynny'n lleol.

Mae'r pwynt a wnaethoch am swyddi nyrsio

important one. The Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust has said that it accepts that it is grossly excessive for it to spend £12 million a year on agency and bank nurses, and that it must get that figure down. The trust has a new nursing director who is giving urgent attention to how it can reduce that figure to a reasonable level, cut nurse vacancies, and get people on regular staff terms instead of paying extra to employ them on agency and bank terms. If the trust can do that, it will have enough money to staff up the empty ward that has been referred to.

gwag yn un pwysig. Mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro wedi dweud ei bod yn derbyn bod y swm o £12 miliwn y flwyddyn y mae'n ei wario ar nyrsys asiantaeth a nyrsys cronfa yn ormod o lawer, a bod rhaid iddi leihau'r ffigur hwnnw. Mae cyfarwyddwr nyrsio newydd gan yr ymddiriedolaeth sy'n rhoi sylw ar fyrder i'r modd y gall leihau'r ffigur hwnnw i lefel resymol, cwtogi ar nifer y swyddi nyrsio gwag, a chyflogi rhai ar delerau staff arferol yn hytrach na thalu'n ychwanegol iddynt ar delerau asiantaeth neu gronfa. Os gall yr ymddiriedolaeth wneud hynny, bydd ganddi ddigon o arian i staffio'r ward wag y cyfeiriwyd ati.

Bwlio Bullying

C10 Ieuan Wyn Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar sut y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn mynd i'r afael â bwlio? OAQ0179(FM)

Q10 Ieuan Wyn Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on how the Welsh Assembly Government will address bullying? OAQ0179(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Anfonodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ganllawiau yn dwyn y teitl 'Parchu Eraill' at bob awdurdod addysg lleol ac ysgol yng Nghymru ym mis Medi 2003. Yr oedd gwybodaeth yn y canllawiau hyn ar sut i fynd i'r afael â bwlio mewn ysgolion. Ysgrifennodd Jane Davidson, y Gweinidog perthnasol, at bob ysgol ym mis Tachwedd llynedd yn gofyn iddynt gyflwyno eu polisiau gwrthfwlio i ni, er mwyn i ni eu hasesu i weld a ydynt yn gyson â'r canllawiau.

The First Minister: The Assembly Government issued guidance called 'Respecting Others' to all local education authorities and schools in Wales in September 2003. There was information in that guidance on how to tackle bullying in schools. Jane Davidson, the relevant Minister, wrote to every school in Wales in November of last year asking them to submit their anti-bullying policies to us so that we can assess whether they are consistent with that guidance.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Diolchaf i chi am yr ateb hwnnw ar fwlio yng nghyd-destun addysg, ond yr wyf am ofyn cwestiwn ehangach. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn derbyn ei bod yn gwbl annerbyniol i unrhyw ddiwylliant ganiatáu i fwlio ddigwydd, ac eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r ystadegau sy'n dangos bod mwy o achosion neu honiadau o fwlio yng Nghymru nac mewn unrhyw ardal neu wlad arall yn y Deyrnas Gyfunol. Mae gwybodaeth a dderbyniwyd o dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000 yn dangos y bu 50 achos o fwlio honedig ymysg staff y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. A wnewch chi ddatgan heddiw fod bwlio mewn man gwaith yn gwbl annerbyniol ac, yn ychwanegol at y canllawiau a anfonwyd allan ar addysg, a

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I thank you for that reply on bullying in the context of education, but I would like to broaden this question out. I am sure that you would accept that it is totally unacceptable for any culture to permit bullying to happen, and that you are aware of the statistics that demonstrate that there are more incidents or allegations of bullying in Wales than in any other region or country in the UK. Information obtained under the Freedom of Information Act 2000 shows that there were 50 cases of alleged bullying among the staff of the National Assembly. Will you declare today that bullying in the workplace is totally unacceptable and, in addition to the guidance that you issued in relation to education, will you issue general

wnewch chi ddsbarthu canllawiau cyffredinol i ddangos bod bwlio yn annerbyniol ble bynnag y mae'n digwydd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r Cynulliad yn gyflogwr pwysig yng Nghymru gyda rhyw 3,000 neu 3,500 o staff—nid wyf yn cofio ar hyn o bryd faint o weision sifil yn union sydd gennym. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gosod esiampl dda fel cyflogwr. Yn swyddogol, nid myfi ond yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol yw pennaeth y gwasanaeth sifil yng Nghymru, ac mae ef yn ymwybodol o'r sefyllfa ac mae ganddo bolisi cryf iawn yn erbyn bwlio. O ran yr 50 o achosion hyn, yr wyf ar ddeall mai dim ond pedwar honiad ffurfiol a wnaed. Profwyd un gŵyn, o leiaf yn rhannol, ond ni chefnogwyd y tair cwyn arall.

Christine Chapman: Delwyn Tattum, who has done extensive research on the subject, says that children are not born bullies. In many cases they are copying the bullying behaviour of their role models, including adults. It therefore follows that watching how their parents behave will influence how children behave outside the family home, as well as inside it. What can be done to encourage and support parents to set a good example, in the knowledge that the way in which they act will heavily influence their children's behaviour?

The First Minister: My constituent, Delwyn Tattum, is one of the world's leading experts on bullying and he and I have had many discussions, at various social events, about the importance of this subject. His academic career at the education faculty at the University of Wales Institute, Cardiff at Cyncoed was largely concentrated in its latter parts on studying bullying, in a unique way in worldwide terms. He concentrated on getting a strategy that schools can follow in the knowledge that it has been fully and professionally vetted, researched and peer-reviewed. The point that you quote from his work, about kids following the example of adults, is true. It is not easy to get that message across: families are very much independent units, and you cannot have a big brother inside every home trying to prevent aggressive behaviour by parents, which is

guidance to demonstrate that bullying is unacceptable wherever it may occur?

The First Minister: The Assembly is an important employer in Wales with some 3,000 or 3,500 staff—I cannot remember at present exactly how many civil servants we have. It is important that we set a good example as an employer. Officially, it is the Permanent Secretary, and not me, who is the head of the civil service in Wales, and he is aware of the situation and has a strong anti-bullying policy. In terms of those 50 cases, I understand that only four formal allegations were made. One complaint was proven, at least in part, but the other three complaints were not upheld.

Christine Chapman: Mae Delwyn Tattum, sydd wedi ymchwilio'n helaeth i'r pwnc hwn, yn dweud nad yw plant yn cael eu geni'n fwllis. Mewn sawl achos, maent yn efelychu ymddygiad bwlliaidd eu rôl-fodelau, gan gynnwys oedolion. Mae'n dilyn, felly, y bydd gwylio'r modd y mae eu rhieni'n ymddwyn yn dylanwadu ar ymddygiad plant y tu allan i'r cartref, yn ogystal ag yn y cartref. Pa gamau y gellir eu cymryd i annog a helpu rhieni i osod esiampl dda, a hwythau'n gwybod y bydd eu dull o ymddwyn yn dylanwadu'n helaeth ar ymddygiad eu plant?

Y Prif Weinidog: Delwyn Tattum, sy'n un o'm hetholwyr, yw un o arbenigwyr mwyaf y byd ar fwlio ac mae'r ddau ohonom wedi cael sawl trafodaeth, mewn gwahanol ddigwyddiadau cymdeithasol, am bwysigrwydd y pwnc hwn. Ar ddiwedd ei yrfa academiaidd yn y gyfadran addysg yn Athrofa Prifysgol Cymru, Caerdydd yng Nghyncoed bu'n ymwneud yn helaeth ag astudio bwlio, a hynny mewn modd a oedd yn unigryw drwy'r byd. Canolbwyntiodd ar sicrhau strategaeth y gall ysgolion ei dilyn gan wybod bod gweithwyr proffesiynol wedi'i mantoli ac wedi ymchwilio iddi'n drwyadl a'i bod wedi'i hadolygu gan gymheiriaid. Mae'r pwynt a ddyfynnwch o'i waith, ynghylch y ffaith bod plant yn dilyn esiampl oedolion, yn wir. Nid yw'n hawdd cyfleu'r neges honno: mae teuluoedd yn unedau annibynnol i raddau helaeth, ac ni

then picked up by the children, and in turn taken out on other children either in the playground or elsewhere. It is a very difficult message to get across, but we are conscious that it is the root cause of bullying in many cases.

David Davies: A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn bwysig i gadw bwllis ar wahân i fyfyrwyr eraill, ac mai un ffordd o wneud hynny yw i anfon bwllis i ysgolion arbennig, neu 'turnaround schools', fel yr awgrymodd arweinydd y Blaid Geidwadol? A ydych yn cytuno ei bod hi'n bwysig iawn rhoi'r bai ar y bwllis a'u dal yn gyfrifol am yr hyn y maent yn ei wneud?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn siŵr am y syniad o greu uned neu ysgol ar wahân ar gyfer bwllis. Gyda chasgliad felly o fwllis, nid wyf yn siŵr ai ymladd â'i gilydd, dysgu oddi wrth ei gilydd, neu gywiro ymddygiad ei gilydd y byddent. Yr hyn sydd yn bwysig yw bod unrhyw un sydd yn dioddef o ganlyniad i fwllio yn meddu ar yr hunanhyder, a bod ganddynt hyder yn y system, i ddwyn y mater i sylw rhiant, athro, neu'r prifathro. Mae'n rhaid i blant hefyd fod yn hyderus fod yr athro yn gwybod beth i'w wneud ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa. Felly, mae'n bwysig inni geisio creu hyder drwy sicrhau bod polisïau yn erbyn bwllio yn eu lle a bod y prifathro a'r athrawon dosbarth wedi cael hyfforddiant i adnabod y symptomau ac yn gwybod beth i'w wneud pan fo bwllio'n digwydd.

ellir cael 'brawd mawr' ym mhob cartref yn ceisio atal ymddygiad ymosodol ar ran rhieni, a ddilynir wedyn gan y plant, a'i droi tuag at blant eraill yn y maes chwarae neu mewn man arall. Mae'n anodd iawn cyfleu'r neges honno, ond yr ydym yn ymwybodol mai dyna sydd wrth wraidd bwllio mewn sawl achos.

David Davies: Do you agree that it is important to keep bullies away from other students, and that one way of doing that is to send bullies to special schools, or turnaround schools, as the leader of the Conservative Party has suggested? Do you agree that it is important that bullies are blamed and that they are held to account for their actions?

The First Minister: I am not sure about the idea of creating a separate unit or school for bullies. Given such a collection of bullies, I am not sure whether they would fight with each other, learn from one another, or correct one another's behaviour. What is important is that any victim of bullying has the self-confidence, and the confidence in the system, to bring the matter to the attention of a parent, teacher or headteacher. Children also need to be confident that the teacher knows how to tackle the situation. It is therefore important that we try to build that confidence by ensuring that bullying policies are in place and that teachers and headteachers have been trained to identify the symptoms of bullying and know what to do when bullying occurs

Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

Sudan 1

William Graham: Will the Minister for Health and Social Services make a statement on action to ensure effective co-ordination between agencies throughout Wales and the rest of the United Kingdom to identify and remove from the food chain products containing the Sudan 1 dye? EAQ0077(HSS)

William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ddatganiad ar y camau a gymerir i sicrhau cyd-drefnu effeithiol rhwng asiantaethau ledled Cymru a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig i ganfod a thynnu o'r gadwyn fwyd gynhyrchion sy'n cynnwys lliw Sudan 1? EAQ0077(HSS)

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): This matter has

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Bu'r mater

attracted much concern in the media and I am sure that there is much concern among consumers too. The Food Standards Agency is the main organisation responsible for food safety matters. It is working with the food industry and local authorities to ensure that the full extent of the risk is assessed and that any food that is potentially dangerous to the public is removed from shelves.

William Graham: The information seems to be that the FSA expects people to withdraw all possibly contaminated goods by Thursday. Could you comment on whether you think that is realistic, and also on what appears to be an ostensible delay by the FSA? The issue was reported to the agency by Premier Foods on 7 February. The public announcement was not made until 18 February. What statement can you now make to reassure the public that this food dye is not in products other than those that have already been listed, and, more particularly, that, where people have these products, to ensure that they know that they can take them back to the retailer and obtain a full refund?

3.00 p.m.

Brian Gibbons: I cannot give you an answer on the last point in relation to refunds. I will seek further information on that. We must accept that, as the news is cascaded out, through the trade organisations, press releases and the website that gives the full list of possible-risk food, the sellers of these goods will take responsibility, through their duty of care, to inform themselves of their duties to the public and to ensure that the goods are removed from the shelves. Local authorities will have enforcement powers to ensure that that is happening in their own areas.

It is true that, on 7 February, Premier Foods noted that it had received notification that it was possible that a contamination had taken place with regard to an item that was exported to Italy. Once it received that notification, it had to confirm it independently and it probably was not until late in that first week that it received

hwn yn destun llawer o sylw yn y cyfryngau ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod llawer o bryder ymysg defnyddwyr hefyd. Yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd yw'r prif gorff sy'n gyfrifol am faterion sy'n ymwneud â diogelwch bwyd. Mae'n gweithio gyda'r diwydiant bwyd ac awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau yr asesir maint y risg yn llawn ac y bydd unrhyw fwyd a allai fod yn beryglus i'r cyhoedd yn cael ei dynnu oddi ar y silffoedd.

William Graham: Yn ôl y wybodaeth a gafwyd, ymddengys fod yr asiantaeth yn disgwyl i bobl dynnu'n ôl yr holl nwyddau a allai fod wedi'u halogi erbyn dydd Iau. A allwch wneud sylw ynghylch a gredwch fod hynny'n ymarferol, a hefyd ar yr hyn a ymddengys ei fod yn oedi ar ran yr asiantaeth? Gwnaeth Premier Foods roi gwybod i'r asiantaeth am y mater hwn ar 7 Chwefror. Ni roddwyd y datganiad cyhoeddus tan 18 Chwefror. Pa ddatganiad y gallwch ei wneud yn awr i sicrhau'r cyhoedd nad yw'r lliw bwyd hwn mewn cynhyrchion heblaw'r rhai sydd wedi'u rhestru eisoes, ac, yn fwy penodol, os yw'r cynhyrchion hyn gan rywrai, i sicrhau y cânt eu hysbysu bod modd iddynt fynd â hwy'n ôl at yr adwerthwr a chael ad-daliad llawn?

Brian Gibbons: Ni allaf roi ateb i chi ar y pwynt olaf am ad-daliadau. Ceisiaf wybodaeth bellach ar hynny. Rhaid inni dderbyn, wrth i'r newyddion gael eu rhaedru, drwy'r cyrff masnach, datganiadau i'r wasg a'r wefan sy'n rhoi'r rhestr lawn o fwydydd a allai fod yn beryglus, y bydd gwerthwyr y nwyddau hyn yn cymryd cyfrifoldeb, drwy eu dyletswydd gofal, i gael gwybod am eu dyletswyddau tuag at y cyhoedd ac i sicrhau y tynnir y nwyddau oddi ar y silffoedd. Bydd pwerau gorfodi gan awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau y digwydd hynny yn eu hardaloedd.

Mae'n wir bod Premier Foods wedi nodi, ar 7 Chwefror, iddo gael ei hysbysu ei bod yn bosibl bod eitem a allforiwyd i'r Eidal wedi cael ei halogi. Wedi iddo gael ei hysbysu, bu'n rhaid iddo gael cadarnhad annibynnol o hynny ac mae'n debyg na chafodd wybod tan yn ddiweddarach yn yr wythnos gyntaf honno fod y prawf cyntaf yn yr Eidal wedi

notification that the original test from Italy was confirmed. Premier Foods then had to consider what other sources of contamination might exist. Therefore, there was a period of unavoidable delay, simply to confirm the initial findings and to trace the full extent of the possible range of contaminants, because the initial report related to a single export item only.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Pryd yn union y cawsoch wybod am y broblem hon? Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i sicrhau pobl sydd efallai wedi bwyta rhyw ychydig o'r bwydydd hyn nad oes perygl gwirioneddol i'w hiechyd? Mae perygl y bydd pobl yn pryderu'n ormodol wrth i'r straeon gael sylw cynyddol yn y cyfryngau. A allwch roi sicrwydd inni eich bod wedi sicrhau nad oes dim o'r bwydydd hyn wedi mynd i'r gadwyn fwyd yn y sector cyhoeddus?

Brian Gibbons: Like everyone else, I was aware of the media coverage on this issue for most of last week. I took a personal interest in the story on the basis that we would have a question on it today. That was when I was officially briefed on the subject.

On public procurement, I am not in a position to give you that assurance because I do not believe that that information is available in relation to the list of potentially contaminated foods that is available on the Food Standards Agency website and from other sources, for example, press statements.

Kirsty Williams: Given your response to that question, do you think that it would be appropriate to have some mechanism whereby the Food Standards Agency informed you, as the Minister for Health and Social Services in Wales, or your office, directly, as a matter of course of such concerns? Are you concerned that the food standards regime in Britain did not pick up on the fact that this contaminated food stuff had been imported and that we had to rely on a report from the Italian authorities to identify this problem and to alert us to it? If the Food Standards Agency is not there to protect the public and to inform us directly of such concerns, what is it there for?

cael ei gadarnhau. Wedyn, bu'n rhaid i Premier Foods ystyried pa ffynonellau gwybodaeth eraill a allai fod ar gael. Felly, bu cyfnod o oedi anoche, dim ond i gadarnhau'r darganfyddiadau cyntaf ac i olrhain yr holl amrediad posibl o halogion, gan fod yr adroddiad cyntaf yn ymwneud ag un eitem a allforiwyd yn unig.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: When exactly were you told of this problem? What steps are you taking to assure people who may have eaten a little of this food that there is no serious threat to their health? There is a danger that people will become overly concerned as the story attracts increased media coverage. Can you assure us that you have ensured that none of these foods has entered the food chain in the public sector?

Brian Gibbons: Fel pawb arall, yr oeddwn yn ymwybodol o'r sylw a roddwyd i'r mater hwn yn y cyfryngau am y rhan fwyaf o'r wythnos diwethaf. Ymddiddorais yn bersonol yn yr hanes ar y sail y caem gwestiwn arno heddiw. Dyna pryd y cefais fy mriffio'n swyddogol ar y pwnc.

Ynghylch caffael cyhoeddus, nid wyf mewn lle i roi sicrwydd o'r fath i chi gan na chredaf fod gwybodaeth ar gael am y rhestr o fwydydd a allai fod wedi'u halogi sydd ar gael ar wefan yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd ac o ffynonellau eraill, er enghraifft, datganiadau i'r wasg.

Kirsty Williams: Yng ngolwg eich ymateb i'r cwestiwn hwnnw, a gredwch mai priodol fyddai cael rhyw fath o drefniant fel y gallai'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd eich hysbysu chi, fel y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yng Nghymru, neu'ch swyddfa, yn uniongyrchol, fel mater o drefn, am bryderon o'r fath? A ydych yn bryderus am nad oedd y gyfundrefn safonau bwyd ym Mhrydain wedi cael gwybod bod y bwyd halogedig hwn wedi'i fewnforio a'n bod wedi gorfod dibynnu ar adroddiad gan yr awdurdodau yn yr Eidal i ganfod y broblem hon a thynnu'n sylw ati? Os nad diben yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd yw amddiffyn y cyhoedd a rhoi gwybod i ni'n syth am bryderon o'r fath, beth yw ei phwrpas?

Brian Gibbons: On your second point, it is of concern that this contaminant was only picked up as an export item to Italy and that our own internal systems did not pick it up. The FSA has indicated that it is anxious to pursue the matter further and will undertake investigations into why this happened. It has been suggested that the item involved may have been imported into Britain for use in the food chain prior to the regulations of 2003 coming into operation and that this is the loophole by which it entered the food chain. However, that does not answer your legitimate question.

Your point about the FSA informing me directly is reasonable, but, from the information that I have gathered, it is clear that the FSA was doing all that it could legitimately be expected to do with regard to this particular matter, and it has tried to respond in a constructive way, while balancing the necessity of taking appropriate action without creating undue alarm before the facts were firmly established.

Brian Gibbons: Ynghylch yr ail bwynt a wnaethoch, mae'n destun pryder na sylwyd ar yr halogyn hwn ond pan allforiwyd yr eitem i'r Eidal ac nad oedd ein systemau mewnol ni wedi sylwi arno. Mae'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd wedi dweud ei bod yn awyddus i ddilyn y mater ymhellach ac y bydd yn ymchwilio i'r rheswm y digwyddodd hyn. Awgrymwyd ei bod yn bosibl bod yr eitem dan sylw wedi'i mewnforio i Brydain i'w defnyddio yn y gadwyn fwyd cyn i reoliadau 2003 ddod i rym ac mai drwy'r bwlch hwnnw y daeth i'r gadwyn fwyd. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n ateb i'r cwestiwn dilys a ofynasoch.

Mae'r pwynt a wnaethoch am fy hysbysu'n uniongyrchol gan yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd yn un rhesymol, ond, yn ôl y wybodaeth yr wyf wedi'i chasglu, mae'n amlwg bod yr asiantaeth yn gwneud y cwbl y gellid disgwyl yn deg iddi'i wneud mewn cysylltiad â'r mater penodol hwn, ac mae wedi ceisio ymateb yn adeiladol, gan ddal y ddysgl yn wastad rhwng yr angen i gymryd camau priodol a pheidio ag achosi braw di-alw-amdano cyn cadarnhau'r ffeithiau.

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod wedi sylwi, Lywydd, fod Denise Idris Jones—yn anfwriadol, yr wyf yn siŵr—wedi cyfeirio ataf i yn ystod y cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog heddiw. Gan nad oes cyfle o dan y Rheolau Sefydlog i arweinydd yr wrthblaid ateb cwestiynau gan Aelodau Llafur, hoffwn gymryd y cyfle hwn i nodi fy mod yn hynod o gefnogol i Ysbyty Gwynedd ym Mangor, a bod unrhyw ganfyddiad i'r gwrthwyneb yn anghywir.

Y Llywydd: Nid oedd hynny'n bwynt o drefn i mi'n uniongyrchol, ond yr wyf yn sylwi, o bryd i'w gilydd, ar Aelodau yn codi materion gyda Gweinidogion nad ydynt o fewn eu cylch gorchwyl. Nid yw hynny'n arfer da. Fodd bynnag, ni ddymunaf ymyrryd bob tro—gwneir rhai o'r pwyntiau hyn mewn ysbryd o ddadlau gwleidyddol, nad yw'n anarferol yn y Senedd y buoch chi a mi unwaith yn rhan ohoni.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I am sure that you noticed, Presiding Officer, that Denise Idris Jones referred—unintentionally, I am sure—to me during First Minister's questions today. As there is no opportunity under Standing Orders for the leader of the opposition to respond to questions from Labour Members, I would like to take this opportunity to place on record that I am extremely supportive of Ysbyty Gwynedd in Bangor, and that any perception to the contrary is incorrect.

The Presiding Officer: That was not a point of order for me directly, but I notice, from time to time, that Members raise issues with Ministers that are not within their remit. That is not good practice. However, I do not wish to interfere on every occasion—some of these points are made in the spirit of political debate, which is not unusual in the Parliament of which you and I were once members.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): There are some changes to report to this week's business. With your agreement, I will be proposing later this afternoon to suspend Standing Order No. 6.13, in order to bring forward NNDM2305 to remit the Disability Discrimination Bill and the Equality Bill to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, as the last item of business today. Tomorrow, the Finance Minister will make a statement on the location strategy, and the Minister for Health and Social Services will make a statement on the strategy for older people in Wales. There will be no short debate tomorrow. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. Further to this morning's deliberations in the Business Committee, it has been determined, under Standing Order No. 24.6, that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a Subject Committee for extended consideration: the Animals and Animal Products (Import and Export) (Wales) Regulations 2005, the National Health Service (Pharmaceutical Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005, the Public Audit (Wales) Act 2004 (Commencement No. 2 and Transitional Provisions and Savings) Order 2005 and the Products of Animal Origin (Third Country Imports) (Wales) Regulations 2005.

Y Llywydd: A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 gwrthwynebiad. O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4, galwaf felly ar y Trefnydd i gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.

Y Llywydd: Galwaf ar un Aelod o bob grŵp plaid i ymateb yn fyr.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Mae rhai newidiadau i'w hadrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Os cytunwch, byddaf yn cynnig yn ddiweddarach y prynhawn yma y dylid atal Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.13, er mwyn dwyn gerbron cynnig NNDM2305 i anfon y Mesur Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd a'r Mesur Cydraddoldeb i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, fel yr eitem fusnes olaf heddiw. Yfory, bydd y Gweinidog Cyllid yn gwneud datganiad ar y strategaeth leoli, a bydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn gwneud datganiad ar y strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Ni fydd dadl fer yfory. Mae busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad drafft, y gellir ei weld ar we'r Siambr o dan ddogfennau ategol. Ymhellach i'r trafodaethau y bore yma yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, penderfynwyd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.6, nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau is-ddeddfwriaeth a ganlyn i Bwyllgor Pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach: Rheoliadau Anifeiliaid a Chynhyrchion Anifeiliaid (Mewnforio ac Allforio) (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Fferyllol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005, Gorchymyn Deddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 2 a Darpariaethau Trosiannol ac Arbedion) 2005 a Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion sy'n Deillio o Anifeiliaid (Mewnforion Trydydd Gwledydd) (Cymru) 2005.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are at least 10 objections. Under Standing Order No. 5.4, I therefore call the Business Minister to formally propose the business statement.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.

The Presiding Officer: I call one Member from each party group to respond briefly.

Janet Ryder: Plaid Cymru today called for a statement on the andiogram unit, which is lying unused at Ysbyty Gwynedd. It is incredible that this New Labour Government leaves an andiogram unused because it is waiting to build another one in another hospital. Services are few and far between in north Wales and people are often sent to Manchester or Liverpool for treatment. It is not acceptable that the unit is left unused while patients face long journeys out of Wales for treatment. Many questions must be asked about that decision.

Plaid Cymru has also requested a debate on the threat to services in rural areas. As is the case in Denbighshire, education is an example of local authorities being driven by this New Labour Government's policies to restrict and cut services in rural areas. Plaid Cymru firmly believes that every person has a right to access basic services in their own community, to free education, health services and a home. Those rights are increasingly under threat by this New Labour Government's policies. People are being forced to live in urban areas in order to access basic services. If the UK Government had answered the pleas by New Labour in Wales for matched funding for Objective 1, there would be no tight squeeze on the education budgets of counties such as Denbighshire, and rural schools could be properly funded. Plaid Cymru will not support the business statement until those requests are met.

3.10 p.m.

David Melding: You will know that the Conservative group has called for a debate on the issue of the way in which school places are funded, and what we expect in terms of local authorities closing down certain schools to reduce the number of surplus places. A national debate is now required on this issue.

We also call for a debate on the technical advice note 8 regulations as soon as the Government responds to the consultation. In particular, we believe that there should be a

Janet Ryder: Galwodd Plaid Cymru heddiw am ddatganiad ar yr uned andiogramau, sy'n sefyll yn segur yn Ysbyty Gwynedd. Mae'n beth anhygoel bod y Llywodraeth Lafur Newydd hon yn gadael andiogram yn segur gan ei bod yn aros i adeiladu un arall mewn ysbyty arall. Mae gwasanaethau'n brin yn y Gogledd a chaiff pobl eu hanfon yn aml i Fanceinion neu Lerpwl i gael eu trin. Mae'n annerbiniol bod yr uned hon yn cael ei gadael yn segur tra bod cleifion yn wynebu teithiau hir y tu allan i Gymru i gael triniaeth. Rhaid gofyn llawer o gwestiynau am y penderfyniad hwnnw.

Gofynnodd Plaid Cymru hefyd am ddadl ar y bygythiad i wasanaethau mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Fel y gwelwyd yn sir Ddinbych, mae addysg yn un enghraifft o'r modd y mae polisïau'r Llywodraeth Lafur Newydd hon yn gorfodi awdurdodau lleol i gyfyngu a thorri ar wasanaethau mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Mae Plaid Cymru yn credu'n gryf bod hawl gan bawb i gael gwasanaethau sylfaenol yn eu cymuned eu hunain, i gael addysg am ddim, i gael gwasanaethau iechyd ac i gael cartref. Mae'r hawliau hynny o dan fygythiad cynyddol gan bolisïau'r Llywodraeth Lafur hon. Mae pobl yn cael eu gorfodi i fyw mewn ardaloedd trefol er mwyn cael gwasanaethau sylfaenol. Pe byddai Llywodraeth y DU wedi ateb yr apêl gan Lafur Newydd yng Nghymru am arian cyfatebol ar gyfer Amcan 1, ni fyddai cyllidebau addysg siroedd fel sir Ddinbych yn cael eu gwasgu mor dynn, a gellid ariannu ysgolion gwledig yn iawn. Ni wnaiff Plaid Cymru gefnogi'r datganiad busnes hyd nes y caniateir y ceisiadau hynny.

David Melding: Gwyddoch fod grŵp y Ceidwadwyr wedi galw am ddadl ar fater y modd y mae lleoedd ysgol yn cael eu hariannu, a'r hyn a ddisgwyliwn o ran cau rhai ysgolion gan awdurdodau lleol er mwyn gostwng nifer y lleoedd sydd dros ben. Mae angen dadl genedlaethol yn awr ar y pwnc hwn.

Galwn hefyd am ddadl ar reoliadau nodyn cyngor technegol 8 cyn gynted ag y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad. Yn benodol, credwn y dylid cael dadl lawn

full debate on hunting, now that this spiteful and illiberal piece of legislation has been passed at the behest of the Labour Party, rather than the Labour Government. It is still a matter of national importance, which should be debated. As you have not allocated time for the issue, we must oppose the business statement.

Kirsty Williams: The Welsh Liberal Democrats support the call for a debate on the growing crisis in many counties with regard to the provision of schools in rural areas, and issues around surplus places. It is a problem which also affects urban counties.

Given that the crisis at the University Hospital of Wales has now switched from the accident and emergency department to the intensive therapy unit, and given the comment made last night that intensive care doctors are unable to care properly for their patients due to a lack of funding and investment in intensive care facilities at Cardiff, will the Minister for Health and Social Services make a statement on ITU provision in Wales?

Jeff Cuthbert: This side of the Chamber supports the business statement. *[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. We have heard the comments of opposition Members to the business statement in relative silence. I want to hear what the Government's supporters have to say about the statement.

Jeff Cuthbert: I ask the Business Minister to ask the Minister for Economic Development and Transport to make an urgent statement on the decision of St Ives plc to close its factory in Ystrad Mynach in my constituency, with a potential loss of 210 jobs.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I can imagine what will happen in the run-up to the general election. Unfortunately, opposition parties will use the business statement each week. We heard a re-run of a speech from the Plaid Cymru party

ar hela, gan fod y ddeddf sbeityd ac anoddefgar hon wedi'i derbyn bellach ar orchymyn y Plaid Lafur, yn hytrach na'r Llywodraeth Lafur. Mae'n dal i fod yn fater o bwys cenedlaethol, y dylid cael dadl arno. Gan nad ydych wedi neilltuo amser ar gyfer y mater hwnnw, rhaid inni wrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes.

Kirsty Williams: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn cefnogi'r galw am ddadl ar yr argyfwng sy'n codi mewn sawl sir o ran darparu ysgolion mewn ardaloedd gwledig, a materion sy'n ymwneud â lleoedd dros ben. Mae'n broblem sy'n effeithio ar siroedd trefol hefyd.

Gan fod yr argyfwng yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru wedi symud bellach o'r adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys ac i'r uned therapi dwys, ac yng ngolwg y sylw a wnaed neithiwr i'r perwyl na all meddygon gofal dwys ofalu'n briodol am eu cleifion oherwydd prinder cyllid a buddsoddiad mewn cyfleusterau gofal dwys yng Nghaerdydd, a wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ddatganiad ar ddarparu unedau therapi dwys yng Nghymru?

Jeff Cuthbert: Mae'r ochr hon i'r Siambr yn cefnogi'r datganiad busnes. *[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr ydym wedi clywed sylwadau Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau am y datganiad busnes mewn tawelwch cymharol. Dymunaf glywed yr hyn sydd gan gefnogwyr y Llywodraeth i'w ddweud am y datganiad.

Jeff Cuthbert: Gofynnaf i'r Trefnydd ofyn i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth wneud datganiad brys ar benderfyniad St Ives ccc i gau ei ffatri yn Ystrad Mynach yn fy etholaeth, gyda'r posibilrwydd o golli 210 o swyddi.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Gallaf ddychmygu beth fydd yn digwydd yn y cyfnod cyn yr etholiad cyffredinol. Gwaetha'r modd, bydd gwrthbleidiau'n manteisio ar y datganiad busnes bob wythnos. Clywsom ailadrodd araith o

conference in Janet Ryder's contribution.

gynhadledd Plaid Cymru yng nghyfraniad Janet Ryder.

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Business Minister tempts me. [*Laughter.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r Trefnydd yn fy nhemtio. [*Chwerthin.*]

I assure the Business Minister that no Assembly Member of any political party will make a party conference speech in a sensible discussion on the business statement.

Yr wyf yn sicrhau'r Trefnydd na fydd unrhyw Aelod o'r Cynulliad o unrhyw blaid wleidyddol yn gwneud araith o gynhadledd ei blaid mewn trafodaeth synhwyrol ar y datganiad busnes.

Jane Hutt: I am grateful, Llywydd, and I assure you that I will not be tempted down that road. [*Laughter.*]

Jane Hutt: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar, Lywydd, ac yr wyf yn eich sicrhau na chaf fy nhemtio i ddilyn y llwybr hwnnw. [*Chwerthin.*]

In terms of the serious issues raised about facilities in north Wales—I presume you were referring to the Ysbyty Gwynedd situation—this is a matter for the North West Wales NHS Trust and for the north Wales cardiac clinical network, which makes decisions about issues relating to cath labs. I have spoken to the Minister for Health and Social Services about this issue, and he is prepared to include this issue in his ministerial report to the Health and Social Services Committee in order to identify and clarify points in relation to the role of the clinical network and its decisions in north Wales.

Gyda golwg ar y materion difrifol a godwyd am gyfleusterau yn y Gogledd—cymeraf eich bod yn cyfeirio at y sefyllfa yn Ysbyty Gwynedd—mae hyn yn fater i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd-orllewin Cymru ac i rwydwaith clinigol cardiaidd gogledd Cymru, sy'n penderfynu ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â labordai cathetrau. Yr wyf wedi siarad â'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am y mater hwn, ac mae'n barod i'w gynnwys yn ei adroddiad gweinidogol i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol er mwyn canfod ac egluro pwyntiau sy'n ymwneud â rôl y rhwydwaith clinigol a'i benderfyniadau yn y Gogledd.

The issues raised by David and Kirsty about managing school places are essentially a matter for local education authorities. Guidance previously agreed by the Assembly is in the public domain on the way in which this issue is handled in rural areas and across Wales. The Wales spatial plan, which the Assembly has supported, also takes into account issues regarding declining birth rates. I do not intend to schedule time for a debate on this issue, because it is principally a matter for local education authorities, and the guidance has been approved.

Mae'r materion a gododd David a Kirsty am reoli lleoedd ysgol yn rhai i awdurdodau addysg lleol yn y bôn. Mae canllawiau a gytunwyd gan y Cynulliad ar sut i drafod y mater hwn mewn ardaloedd gwledig a ledled Cymru wedi cael eu cyhoeddi. Mae cynllun gofodol Cymru, a gefnogwyd gan y Cynulliad, hefyd yn rhoi sylw i faterion sy'n ymwneud â chyfraddau geni is. Ni fwriadaf neilltuo amser ar gyfer dadl ar y mater hwn, gan ei fod yn un i awdurdodau addysg lleol yn bennaf, ac mae'r canllawiau wedi cael eu cymeradwyo.

On TAN 8, David, the consultation on the draft came to an end in November. I understand that Carwyn Jones agreed, and promised the committee, that he would report back on the consultation responses at the next Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee meeting. That is the appropriate place to discuss technical advice

Ynghylch TAN 8, David, daeth yr ymgynghori ar y drafft i ben ym mis Tachwedd. Deallaf fod Carwyn Jones wedi cytuno, ac wedi addo i'r pwyllgor, y bydd yn adrodd yn ôl ar yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad yng nghyfarfod nesaf Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad. Dyna'r man priodol i drafod

notes. However, I am prepared to schedule time for a further debate on energy policy, which is important. I will confirm at the next Business Committee meeting when that debate is likely to take place.

On the merry-go-round that we saw this weekend regarding the hunting ban—which is a non-devolved matter—I am happy to note the comments from the League Against Cruel Sports. It said that Saturday was a good day for the welfare of British wildlife. It is important to note the impact on Wales's wildlife. On Kirsty's points, I have already commented on managing school places. You have chosen to use your minority party debate time tomorrow to look at accident and emergency services. I am sure that you will also address other issues relating to the health service. Pressures have been fully discussed and debated, and the First Minister has responded to them this afternoon.

You raised an important point, Jeff, regarding the situation of an important workforce in your community. I have been assured by the Minister that he will meet you later regarding that workforce at St Ives.

nodiadau cyngor technegol. Er hynny, yr wyf yn barod i neilltuo amser ar gyfer dadl bellach ar bolisi ynni, gan ei fod yn bwysig. Cadarnhaf yng nghyfarfod nesaf y Pwyllgor Busnes pa bryd y mae'r ddadl honno'n debygol o ddigwydd.

Ynghylch y miri a welsom y penwythnos hwn ynghylch y gwaharddiad ar hela—sy'n fater nas datganolwyd—yr wyf yn falch o nodi sylwadau'r Gynghrair yn erbyn Chwaraeon Creulon. Dywedodd fod dydd Sadwrn yn ddiwrnod da er lles bywyd gwyllt ym Mhrydain. Mae'n bwysig nodi'r effaith ar fywyd gwyllt yng Nghymru. Ynghylch y pwyntiau a wnaeth Kirsty, yr wyf eisoes wedi gwneud sylw am reoli lleoedd ysgol. Yr ydych wedi dewis defnyddio'r amser ar gyfer eich dadl plaid leiafrifol yfory i drafod gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch hefyd yn ymdrin â materion eraill sy'n ymwneud â'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Cafwyd trafod a dadlau cynhwysfawr ar y pwysau a geir, ac mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi ymateb iddynt y prynhawn yma.

Gwnaethoch godi pwynt pwysig, Jeff, am sefyllfa gweithlu pwysig yn eich cymuned. Cefais sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog y gwnaiff gwrrd â chi'n ddiweddarach ynghylch y gweithlu hwnnw yng ngwaith St Ives.

Cynnig: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 25.

Motion: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 25.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny

Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Alun Cairns: I raise a point of order in relation to the Freedom of Information Act 2000. In the Economic Development and Transport Committee meeting on 19 January, the Minister and his officials mentioned that they were concerned about the gross value added data that had been published, and had written to the Office for National Statistics seeking to reconcile some differences to what they believe may be the case. Having asked them, at that meeting, to publish the information, and then having tabled a question under the Freedom of Information Act 2000, I raise a point of order relating to the Minister's response. The question was tabled on 19 January, asking the Minister to publish all communications, copies of letters, records of telephone calls and memos relating to communications between his office and the ONS. The Minister duly responded on 31 January—slightly outside the timescale, but I have no issue about that—saying that he would write to me in due course. I then received a letter from the Minister on 10 February, stating that:

'I can inform you that neither I nor my private office has communicated with the Office for National Statistics'.

My point is that the Minister has chosen to interpret 'his office', meaning the wider responsibilities within the economic development department, as his private office. If that is the case, he is using that as a technicality to refuse to publish the information. I have tabled an additional question, which I expect would force him to

Alun Cairns: Codaf bwynt o drefn mewn cysylltiad â Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000. Yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth ar 19 Ionawr, dywedodd y Gweinidog a'i swyddogion eu bod yn bryderus am y data ar werth ychwanegol crynswth a gyhoeddwyd, a'u bod wedi ysgrifennu at y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol gan geisio cysoni rhai gwahaniaethau rhyngddynt a'r hyn y credent ei fod yn gywir. Gan fy mod wedi gofyn, yn y cyfarfod hwnnw, iddynt gyhoeddi'r wybodaeth, ac wedi cyflwyno cwestiwn wedyn o dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000, codaf bwynt o drefn mewn cysylltiad ag ymateb y Gweinidog. Cyflwynwyd y cwestiwn ar 19 Ionawr, yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog gyhoeddi'r holl negeseuon, copïau o lythyrau, cofnodion o alwadau ffôn a memoranda ynghylch cyfathrebu rhwng ei swyddfa ef a'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol. Ymatebodd y Gweinidog yn ei dro ar 31 Ionawr—ychydig yn hwyrach na'r gofyn, ond nid yw hynny'n peri tramgwydd i mi—gan ddweud y byddai'n ysgrifennu ataf gyda hynny. Cefais lythyr wedyn oddi wrth y Gweinidog ar 10 Chwefror, yn datgan:

Gallaf eich hysbysu nad wyf fi na'm swyddfa breifat wedi bod mewn cysylltiad â'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol.

Y pwynt sydd gennyf yw bod y Gweinidog wedi dewis dehongli ystyr 'ei swyddfa ef', sy'n golygu'r cyfrifoldebau ehangach yn yr adran datblygu economaidd, fel pe bai'n golygu ei swyddfa breifat. Os felly, mae'n defnyddio hynny fel rheswm technegol i wrthod cyhoeddi'r wybodaeth. Yr wyf wedi cyflwyno cwestiwn ychwanegol, y

publish the information. However, this clearly does not conform with the guidance laid down in the Assembly, which says that, if there is a reason for clarification, requests should be clarified—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I am aware of everything that is written in Assembly guidance—I do not need to be reminded. However, I fail to discern what exactly is a matter for me in this point of order. The content of answers given by Ministers to Assembly Members is not a matter for me. My understanding is that further discussions have taken place over the whole question of the Freedom of Information Act 2000 and its impact on our activity. I have referred to this matter on several occasions, and do not wish to return to it now, as I believe that it is to be discussed further by the Business Committee soon. Therefore, as far as this issue is concerned, the Minister has provided a reply. It may not be the reply that the Member expected, but that is often the case.

3.20 p.m.

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Plaleiddiaid (Lefelau Gweddillion Uchaf mewn Cnydau, Bwyd a Phorthiant) (Cymru a Lloegr) (Diwygio) 2005
Approval of the Pesticides (Maximum Residue Levels in Crops, Food and Feeding Stuffs) (England and Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhifau 24.25, 25.13 a 25.14:

1. yn cymeradwyo'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Plaleiddiaid (Lefelau Gweddillion Uchaf mewn Cnydau, Bwyd a Phorthiant) (Cymru a Lloegr) (Diwygio) 2005, y gosodwyd copiâu o'r atodlenni yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Chwefror 2005; a

2. yn nodi'r memorandwm esboniadol ar gyfer y rheoliadau hyn a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at

disgwyliaf y byddai'n ei orfodi i gyhoeddi'r wybodaeth. Er hynny, mae'n amlwg nad yw hyn yn cydymffurfio â'r canllawiau a osodwyd yn y Cynulliad, sy'n datgan, os oes rheswm dros ofyn am eglurhad, y dylid egluro ceisiadau—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Gwn am bopeth sydd wedi'i ysgrifennu yng nghanllawiau'r Cynulliad—nid oes angen fy atgoffa. Fodd bynnag, ni allaf weld beth yn union sy'n fater i mi yn y pwynt o drefn hwn. Nid yw cynnwys atebion a roddir gan Weinidogion i Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn fater i mi. Yr wyf yn deall y bu trafodaethau pellach ar holl gwestiwn Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000 a'i heffaith ar ein gweithgareddau. Yr wyf wedi cyfeirio at y mater hwn ar sawl achlysur, ac ni ddymunaf fynd yn ôl ato'n awr, gan fy mod yn credu y bydd y Pwyllgor Busnes yn ei drafod ymhellach cyn hir. Gan hynny, gyda golwg ar y mater hwn, mae'r Gweinidog wedi rhoi ateb. Efallai nad hwnnw oedd yr ateb yr oedd yr Aelod yn ei ddisgwyl, ond felly y mae'n aml.

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order Nos. 24.25, 25.13 and 25.14:

1. approves the draft Pesticides (Maximum Residue Levels in Crops, Food and Feeding Stuffs) (England and Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005 and schedule copies of which were laid in Table Office on 10 February 2005; and

2. notes the explanatory memorandum for these regulations laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 15

Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 15 Chwefror 2005. February 2005. (NDM2292)
(NDM2292)

Cynnig (NDM2292): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2292): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.

Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion
Composite Motion: Approval of Orders

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn. **The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf fod **The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25: *the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:*

1. a) *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Chwefror 2005, ar y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Halogion mewn Bwyd (Cymru) 2005; a* 1. a) *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office, on 8 February 2005, on the draft regulations, the Contaminants in Food (Wales) Regulations 2005; and*

b) *yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Halogion mewn Bwyd (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:* b) *approves that the Contaminants in Food (Wales) Regulations 2005 are made in accordance with:*

i) *y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Ionawr 2005;* i) *the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 26 January 2005;*

ii) *atodiadau 1a, 1b, 1c ac 1d i'r arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2005;* ii) *the regulatory appraisal annex 1a, 1b, 1c and 1d laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2005;*

iii) *y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2005;* iii) *the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2005;*

2. a) *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Chwefror 2005 ar y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Darpariaethau Malltod) (Cymru) 2005; a* 2. a) *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 8 February 2005 on the draft Order, the Town and Country Planning (Blight Provisions) (Wales) Order 2005; and*

b) *yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Gwlad a Thref (Darpariaethau Malltod) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:* b) *approves that the Town and Country Planning (Blight Provisions) (Wales) Order 2005 is made in accordance with:*

i) *y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Ionawr 2005; a* i) *the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 26 January 2005; and*

ii) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 02 Chwefror 2005;* ii) *the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 2 February 2005;*

3. a) *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Chwefror 2005, ar y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol* 3. a) *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 8 February 2005 on the draft regulations, the National Health Service (General Medical*

*(Contractau Gwasanaethau Meddygol Services Contracts) (Prescription of Drugs
Cyffredinol) (Rhagnodi Cyffuriau Etc.) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations
etc)(Cymru) (Diwygio) 2005; a 2005; and*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau'r b) approves that the National Health Service
Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Contractau (General Medical Services Contracts)
Gwasanaethau Meddygol Cyffredinol) (Prescription of Drugs Etc.) (Wales)
(Rhagnodi Cyffuriau etc)(Cymru) (Diwygio) (Amendment) Regulations 2005 are made in
2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag: accordance with:*

*i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y i) the draft regulations laid in the Table
Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Ionawr 2005; a Office on 26 January 2005; and*

*ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table
Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 02 Chwefror 2005; Office on 2 February 2005;*

*4. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor 4. a) considers the report of the Legislation
Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno Committee laid in the Table Office on 8
ar 8 Chwefror 2005, ar y rheoliadau drafft, February 2005 on the draft regulations, the
Rheoliadau Diogelwch Bwyd (Hylendid Food Safety (General Food Hygiene)
Bwyd Cyffredinol) (Diwygio)(Cymru) 2005; (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and
a*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau b) approves that the Food Safety (General
Diogelwch Bwyd (Hylendid Bwyd Food Food Hygiene) (Amendment) (Wales)
Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael Regulations 2005 are made in accordance
eu gwneud yn unol ag: with:*

*i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y i) the draft regulations laid in the Table
Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Ionawr 2005; a Office on 26 January 2005; and*

*ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table
Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Chwefror 2005; Office on 2 February 2005;*

*5. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor 5. a) considers the report of the Legislation
Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno Committee laid in the Table Office on 8
ar 8 Chwefror 2005, ar Orchymyn drafft February 2005 on the draft Order, the Care
Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif Standards Act 2000 (Commencement No. 21)
21) 2005; a Order 2005; and*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Deddf b) approves that the Care Standards Act
Safonau Gofal 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 21) 2005 2000 (Commencement No. 21) Order 2005 is
yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r Gorchymyn made in accordance with the draft Order
drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar laid in the Table Office on 26 January 2005;
26 Ionawr 2005;*

*6. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor 6. a) considers the report of the Legislation
Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno Committee laid in the Table Office on 1
ar 1 Chwefror 2005 ar y rheoliadau drafft, February 2005 on the draft regulations, the
Rheoliadau Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref Town and Country Planning (Costs of
(Costau Ymchwiliadau etc) (Swm Dyddiol Inquiries etc.) (Standard Daily Amount)
Safonol) (Cymru) 2005; a (Wales) Regulations 2005; and*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cynllunio b) approves that the Town and Country
Gwlad a Thref (Costau Ymchwiliadau etc) Planning (Costs of Inquiries etc.) (Standard*

(Swm Dyddiol Safonol) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag: *Daily Amount) (Wales) Regulations 2005 are made in accordance with:*

i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 19 Ionawr 2005; *i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 19 January 2005;*

ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 19 Ionawr 2005; a *ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 19 January 2005; and*

iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2005. (NDM2293) *iii) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2005. (NDM2293)*

*Cynnig (NDM2293): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2293): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun

Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynllun Taliad Sengl y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin
 a Chynlluniau Cymorth (Cymru) 2005
 Approval of the Common Agricultural Policy Single Payment and Support
 Schemes (Wales) Regulations 2005**

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol y gwelliannau canlynol i NDM2294: gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gwelliannau 3 a 4 yn enw David Melding a gwelliant 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Tynnaf sylw Aelodau at y ffaith i bum gwelliant gael eu cyflwyno i'r cynnig ar egwyddor y Gorchymyn hwn. Mae'r pump yn ymddangos ar agenda'r Cyfarfod Llawn, ond ni chyhoeddwyd gwelliant 4, sef yr ail yn enw David Melding, ar y fewnwyd na'r rhyngwyd oherwydd camgymeriad gweinyddol. Ymddireuraf am hynny.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Common Agricultural Policy Single Payment and Support Schemes (Wales) Regulations 2005, a copy of which was laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 15 February 2005. (NDM2294)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales approves that the Common Agricultural Policy Single Payment and Support Schemes (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 15 February 2005. (NDM2295)

The Presiding Officer: I have selected the following amendments to NDM2294: amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendments 3 and 4 in the name of David Melding, and amendment 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams. I draw Members' attention to the fact that five amendments have been tabled to the motion on the principle of the Order. The five appear on the Plenary agenda, but amendment 4, which is the second in the name of David Melding, has not been published on the internet or the intranet because of an administrative error. I apologise for that.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Cymorth a Thaliad Sengl y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Cymru) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 15 Chwefror 2005. (NDM2294)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Cymorth a Thaliad Sengl y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 15 Chwefror 2005. (NDM2295)

The purpose of the regulations is to ensure the effective administration of the new single payment scheme and other support schemes in Wales under the common agricultural policy. These schemes came into force on 1 January this year. The European legislation contains much of the detail of these schemes, which the regulations complement. They confirm where we choose to exercise the discretion available to us under the European legislation, including specifying dates and qualifying thresholds for operation of the new single payment scheme. For example, the regulations confirm that the National Assembly for Wales is the competent authority, that the minimal holding size will be 0.3 hectares, and that the 10-month period should start on 1 October.

Of the five amendments to the motion on the principle of the regulations, amendments 1 and 3 are strikingly similar in seeking to ensure that the payments are made at the earliest opportunity. They are superfluous as that is precisely what we have always stated that we want to do, and we are still on target to do that. I cannot, therefore, support those amendments.

On amendment 2, under the commission's rules, farmers who have participated in specified agri-environment and organic schemes can apply to have their single payment entitlement enhanced where their participation has had an adverse effect on their historic CAP subsidy. Those farmers who converted without support fall outside the European legislation. However, given the fact that there will be some farmers who received support to convert to organic farming, we want to ensure that they are not prejudiced with the introduction of these new regulations.

I cannot support amendment 5 because the European rules specify that payments must be based on determined animals and land-supporting subsidies over 2000-02. This means that they had to meet the rules sufficiently to receive a payment. Single payment entitlement can be adjusted to ignore penalties imposed during that period,

Pwrpas y rheoliadau yw sicrhau y bydd y cynllun taliad sengl newydd a'r cynlluniau cymorth eraill yng Nghymru o dan y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin yn cael eu gweinyddu'n effeithiol. Daeth y cynlluniau hyn i rym ar 1 Ionawr eleni. Yn y ddeddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd y ceir llawer o fanylion y cynlluniau hyn, ac fe'i hategir gan y rheoliadau. Maent yn cadarnhau ym mhle yr ydym yn dewis arfer y disgrisiwn sydd ar gael i ni o dan y ddeddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd, gan gynnwys pennu dyddiadau a throthwyon cymhwyso ar gyfer gweithredu'r cynllun taliad sengl newydd. Er enghraifft, mae'r rheoliadau'n cadarnhau mai Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yw'r awdurdod cymwys, mai'r maint lleiaf ar gyfer ffermydd fydd 0.3 hectar, ac y dylai'r cyfnod 10 mis ddechrau ar 1 Hydref.

O'r pum gwelliant i'r cynnig ar egwyddor y rheoliadau, mae gwelliannau 1 a 3 yn hynod debyg o ran ceisio sicrhau y gwneir y taliadau ar y cyfle cynharaf. Maent yn ddiangen gan mai hynny'n union y dywedasom erioed ein bod yn dymuno ei wneud, ac yr ydym yn dal i fod mewn sefyllfa i wneud hynny. Gan hynny, ni allaf gefnogi'r gwelliannau hynny.

Ynghylch gwelliant 2, o dan reolau'r comisiwn, mae ffermwyr sydd wedi cymryd rhan mewn cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol ac organig penodol yn cael ymgeisio am yr hawl i gael taliad sengl mwy os yw'r ffaith eu bod wedi cymryd rhan wedi cael drwg effaith ar y cymhorthdal y maent wedi arfer ei gael o dan y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin. Nid yw'r ddeddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd yn berthnasol i'r ffermwyr hynny a drosglwyddodd heb gael cymorth. Fodd bynnag, gan fod rhai ffermwyr wedi cael cymorth i droi at ffermio organig, yr ydym am sicrhau na wahaniaethir yn eu herbyn pan gyflwynir y rheoliadau newydd hyn.

Ni allaf gefnogi gwelliant 5 gan fod y rheolau Ewropeaidd yn mynnu bod rhaid seilio taliadau ar gymorthdaliadau a bennwyd ar gyfer anifeiliaid a chadw tir yn ystod 2000-02. Mae hynny'n golygu bod rhaid iddynt gyd-fynd â'r rheolau'n ddigonol er mwyn cael taliad. Gellir newid swm y taliad sengl y gellir ei hawlio er mwyn diystyru

but, where there was not an eligible claim, the European rules do not provide for any adjustments. It is important, therefore, that there is an eligible claim before we can apply any discretion to future payments.

Helen Mary Jones: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

ensures that the single payments are made to farmers at the earliest opportunity.

I propose amendment 2. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that farmers who have reduced their stocking rate in order to convert into organic production, or enter an agri-environment scheme, should not be adversely affected by the introduction of the new single payment.

Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales will support the principle of the regulations and the regulations themselves. It is important that they are passed today as a matter of urgency to enable the process to move on, and the Minister can rely on our support in that regard.

I will comment briefly on our amendments. The Minister said that our amendment 1 is superfluous because he has frequently stated that he intends to ensure that these payments are made on time. I would respectfully submit that the Minister frequently states all manner of things, and I believe that the industry would be much more securely reassured by a proper Assembly resolution that would bind the Minister. I do not doubt his commitment but I sometimes doubt his attention to detail, and an amendment in this regard would ensure that the payments were made as soon as possible.

I do not expect the Minister to shift on this issue, but I ask him to comment in his response on a specific concern regarding payments and the fact that the rural payment agency in England has already told farmers that they have to wait until February 2006.

cosbau a osodwyd yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, ond, mewn achosion lle na chafwyd hawliad cymwys, nid yw'r rheolau Ewropeaidd yn darparu ar gyfer unrhyw newidiadau eraill. Rhaid bod hawliad cymwys wedi'i wneud, felly, cyn y gallwn gymhwyso unrhyw ddisgresiwn at daliadau yn y dyfodol.

Helen Mary Jones: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig.

yn sicrhau bod y taliad sengl yn cael ei wneud i ffermwyr ar y cyfle cyntaf.

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu na ddylai'r taliad sengl newydd effeithio'n andwyol ar ffermwyr sydd wedi gostwng eu lefelau stocio er mwyn trosglwyddo i gynhyrchu'n organig neu i gychwyn ar gynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol.

Bydd Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn cefnogi egwyddor y rheoliadau a'r rheoliadau eu hunain. Mae'n bwysig eu derbyn heddiw fel mater o fryd fel y gall y broses fynd yn ei blaen, a gall y Gweinidog ddibynnu ar ein cefnogaeth yn hynny o beth.

Gwnaf sylwadau byr ar ein gwelliannau. Dywed y Gweinidog fod gwelliant 1 o'n heiddo'n ddiangen gan ei fod wedi dweud yn aml ei fod yn bwriadu sicrhau y gwneir y taliadau hyn yn brydlon. Awgrymaf gyda pharch fod y Gweinidog yn aml yn dweud pob math o bethau, a chredaf y byddai'r diwydiant yn llawer tawelach ei feddwl o gael penderfyniad priodol gan y Cynulliad a fyddai'n rhwymo'r Gweinidog. Nid wyf yn amau nad yw wedi ymrwymo i hyn ond yr wyf weithiau'n amau a yw'n rhoi digon o sylw i fanylion, a byddai gwelliant mewn cysylltiad â hyn yn sicrhau y gwneid y taliadau cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

Nid wyf yn disgwyl i'r Gweinidog newid ei farn am y mater hwn, ond gofynnaf iddo wneud sylw yn ei ymateb am destun pryder penodol mewn cysylltiad â thaliadau a'r ffaith bod yr asiantaeth taliadau gwledig yn Lloegr eisoes wedi dweud wrth ffermwyr y

Can the Minister comment on what effect that may have on payments made in Wales from the national reserve as these issues are being handled at a UK level? I will reserve the right to intervene, if the Minister will allow me, as I am not sure that he heard that question.

On amendment 2—

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister always listens during debates.

Helen Mary Jones: I humbly apologise, but his responses sometimes suggest that he does not. However, I accept that I am, of course, mistaken.

I am grateful for the Minister's clarification regarding the issue relating to organic farmers. We understand that payment can only be applicable when people are part of a specific scheme. When I originally raised this issue with the Minister the position was clear in terms of the agri-environment scheme, but it was less clear in terms of those who have been supported to go organic. Therefore, I am grateful for the Minister's clarification on that. Can he give us more detail about what he will do to ensure that organic farmers are aware that they are now entitled to apply for the payment, because the original information sent out by his office, whether by accident or design, implied that they were not?

We will support the Conservatives' amendments 3 and 4. However, we will not support the Liberal Democrats' amendment 5, mainly because of the wording. I urge the Minister to commit today to ensuring that no farmer who has made a genuine mistake purely in terms of paperwork in the reference years will be penalised.

Finally, I am sure that the Minister will acknowledge that this is an anxious time for the industry. It has supported the process of change and the Minister's approach to the issue, as we have. However, once these regulations have been passed, I urge the Minister to give serious personal attention to ensuring that he gets the detail right and that

bydd yn rhaid iddynt aros tan fis Chwefror 2006. A all y Gweinidog wneud sylw am yr effaith bosibl o hynny ar daliadau a wneir yng Nghymru o'r gronfa genedlaethol gan fod y materion hyn yn cael eu trafod ar lefel y DU? Cadwaf yr hawl i ymyrryd, os gwnaiff y Gweinidog adael i mi, gan nad wyf yn sicr iddo glywed y cwestiwn hwnnw.

Ynghylch gwelliant 2—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog yn gwranddo bob amser yn ystod dadleuon.

Helen Mary Jones: Ymddiheuraf yn laes, ond mae ei ymatebion yn rhoi lle i gredu weithiau nad ydyw. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn derbyn, wrth gwrs, fy mod wedi camgymryd.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr eglurhad a roddodd y Gweinidog am y mater sy'n ymwneud â ffermwyr organig. Deallwn na ellir ond gwneud taliad os yw rhywun yn rhan o gynllun penodol. Pan godais y mater hwn yn gyntaf gyda'r Gweinidog, yr oedd y sefyllfa'n glir o ran y cynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol, ond yr oedd yn llai clir mewn cysylltiad â'r rhai a gafodd gymorth i droi at ffermio organig. Felly, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eglurhad y Gweinidog ar hynny. A all roi rwyf o fanylion i ni am yr hyn a wnaiff i sicrhau bod ffermwyr organig yn gwybod bod hawl ganddynt bellach i ymgeisio am y taliad, gan fod y wybodaeth wreiddiol a ddosbarthwyd gan ei swyddfa, boed drwy ddamwain neu o fwriad, yn awgrymu nad oedd yr hawl honno ganddynt?

Cefnogwn welliannau 3 a 4 o eiddo'r Ceidwadwyr. Fodd bynnag, ni chefnogwn welliant 5 o eiddo'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, a hynny oherwydd y geiriad yn bennaf. Anogaf y Gweinidog i ymrwymo heddiw i sicrhau na chosbir unrhyw ffermwr a wnaeth gamgymeriad gonest yn y gwaith papur ar gyfer y blynyddoedd cyfeirio.

Yn olaf, yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff y Gweinidog gydnabod mai cyfnod pryderus yw hwn i'r diwydiant. Mae wedi cefnogi'r broses newid a dull y Gweinidog o ymdrin â'r mater hwn, fel y gwnaethom ni. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl derbyn y rheoliadau hyn, anogaf y Gweinidog i roi sylw manwl i hyn ei hun er mwyn gofalu y caiff y manylion yn

he takes the most flexible and sensitive approach possible under the European regulations. All the opposition parties have supported the Minister's approach thus far, and we hope to be able to continue to do so. However, we must reserve the right to be highly critical if, having got the principle right, he proceeds, as I am afraid he so often does, to get the detail wrong because of lapses in attention.

Brynle Williams: I propose the following amendments in the name of David Melding. Amendment 3: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls upon the Welsh Assembly Government to make every effort to ensure that payments are made on time.

I propose amendment 4: add as new point at the end of the motion:

calls upon the Welsh Assembly Government to put in place appropriate support mechanisms to assist farmers in this important transitional period.

I wish to declare an interest as a working farmer. I am pleased to see the opposition parties putting down a marker regarding the importance of payments being made on time. To put the issue in perspective, if you work in a bank, for example, you expect to be paid on a certain day of the month. The same should apply here. If farmers complete all forms properly, they should receive their money on the dates that are given. If we do not honour this commitment, farmers will get into debt and fall behind with other financial commitments. It is imperative that this transitional period of changing from the current system to the single farm payment is implemented as effectively and as smoothly as possible.

3.30 p.m.

I turn to amendment 4. When there has been a delay in payments in the past, many financial institutions have taken advantage of the situation by charging excessive interest rates, over and above the agreed working

gywir ac y bydd yn ymdrin â hyn yn y modd mwyaf hyblyg a sensitif posibl o dan y rheoliadau Ewropeaidd. Mae'r holl wrthbleidiau wedi cefnogi dull y Gweinidog o weithredu hyd yma, a gobeithiwn allu parhau i wneud hynny. Er hynny, rhaid inni gadw'r hawl i fod yn dra beirniadol os bydd, ar ôl cael yr egwyddor yn gywir, yn camgymryd ynghylch y manylion oherwydd diffyg sylw, fel y gwnaiff yn aml, mae arnaf ofn.

Brynle Williams: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw David Melding. Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wneud pob ymdrech i sicrhau bod y taliadau yn cael eu gwneud ar amser.

Cynigiaf welliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi mecanweithiau cymorth priodol yn eu lle er mwyn helpu ffermwyr yn ystod y cyfnod pontio pwysig hwn.

Dymunaf ddatgan buddiant fel un sy'n gweithio fel ffermwr. Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod y gwrthbleidiau'n nodi mor bwysig yw gwneud taliadau'n brydlon. Er mwyn gweld y mater yn ei wir oleuni, os ydych yn gweithio mewn banc, er enghraifft, yr ydych yn disgwyl cael eich talu ar ddiwrnod penodol yn y mis. Dylai'r un peth fod yn wir am y mater hwn. Os yw ffermwyr yn cwblhau'r holl ffurflenni'n iawn, dylent gael eu harian ar y dyddiadau a roddir. Os na chyflawnwn yr ymrwymiad hwn, bydd ffermwyr yn mynd i ddyled ac yn mynd ar ôl o ran eu hymrwymiaid ariannol eraill. Mae'n hollbwysig y bydd y cyfnod pontio hwn o newid o'r system bresennol i'r taliad sengl yn cael ei gyflawni yn y dull mwyaf effeithiol a didrfferth posibl.

Trof at welliant 4. Pan gafwyd oedi wrth dalu yn y gorffennol, gwnaeth llawer o sefydliadau ariannol fanteisio ar y sefyllfa drwy godi cyfraddau llog gormodol, a oedd yn fwy na'r gyfradd llog a gytunwyd ar gyfer

overdraft interest rate. Many farmers had to get letters from the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs to simply access funds because of the disruption to their cash flow. We must ensure that contingency plans are available to all who need them. I also advise Members that farmers presently in receipt of, for example, the sheep annual premium, will get their payments in the next couple of weeks, but could wait at least a further 12 months before any payment is due. I urge you, Minister, to ensure that this transitional period is dealt with as effectively as possible. Once again, you must remember that we have a fragile industry that is going through a major transition in its history.

Mick Bates: I propose amendment 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that the scheme is unnecessarily restrictive as farmers who make an error in the reference years could see any penalty repeated throughout the life of the claim period.

I am grateful for your opening statement, Minister, because I think that it included a recognition that the single farm payment is one of the most fundamental and historic changes that we will see in the administration of the CAP; it will change the industry over the next 10 years. I have great admiration for the staff in our divisional offices, who have dealt sympathetically and supportively with many farmers in helping them to deal with the complexity of this new scheme and the problems that it has thrown up. I am surprised that the Minister has not recognised that the five amendments deal directly with many of the problems that have affected the industry through this serious change.

On amendment 2, which refers to organic farmers and agri-environment schemes, the Minister has failed to recognise that article 40 can make it clear to farmers who have entered an agri-environment scheme that they can put forward a hardship claim that would allow them to move their reference years and take their entitlement prior to their

gorddrafft busnes. Bu'n rhaid i lawer o ffermwyr gael llythyrau gan Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig i gael arian oherwydd yr amharu ar eu llif ariannol. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod cynlluniau wrth gefn ar gael i bawb y mae arnynt eu hangen. Hysbysaf Aelodau hefyd y bydd ffermwyr sydd ar hyn o bryd yn derbyn y premiwm blynyddol defaid, er enghraifft, yn cael eu taliadau yn yr wythnosau nesaf, ond y gallent orfod disgwyl o leiaf 12 mis pellach cyn y bydd unrhyw daliad yn ddyledus. Pwysaf arnoch, Weinidog, i sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â'r cyfnod pontio hwn yn y modd mwyaf effeithiol posibl. Unwaith eto, rhaid ichi gofio bod gennym ddiwydiant bregus sy'n mynd drwy newid mawr yn ei hanes.

Mick Bates: Cynigiau welliant 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu bod y cynllun yn cyfyngu'n ddiangen gan y gallai ffermwyr sy'n gwneud camgymeriad gyda'r blynyddoedd cyfeirio gael eu cosbi dro ar ôl tro drwy gydol y cyfnod hawlio.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich datganiad agoriadol, Weinidog, gan y credaf fod cydnabyddiaeth ynddo i'r ffaith mai'r taliad sengl yw un o'r newidiadau mwyaf sylfaenol a hanesyddol a welwn yn y dull o weinyddu'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin; bydd yn newid y diwydiant dros y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Mae gennyf feddwl mawr o'r staff yn ein swyddfeydd rhanbarthol, sydd wedi ymdrin yn gydymdeimladol ac yn gefnogol â llawer o ffermwyr wrth eu helpu i ymdrin â chymhlethdod y cynllun newydd hwn a'r problemau a gododd yn ei sgîl. Yr wyf yn synnu nad yw'r Gweinidog wedi cydnabod bod y pum gwelliant yn ymdrin yn uniongyrchol â llawer o'r problemau sydd wedi effeithio ar y diwydiant drwy'r newid pwysig hwn.

Ynghylch gwelliant 2, sy'n cyfeirio at ffermwyr organig a chynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol, nid yw'r Gweinidog wedi cydnabod bod erthygl 40 yn gallu egluro i ffermwyr a ymunodd â chynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol y gallant gyflwyno hawliad oherwydd caledi a ganiatâi iddynt newid eu blynyddoedd cyfeirio a chymryd yr hyn yr

destocking. One must remember, Minister, that destocking often occurred as a result of encouragement from the Government. While we would all say that the perfect sight of hindsight would be a great quality to possess, there must be an interpretation that allows flexibility, and I believe that that is contained in these regulations.

Similarly, on amendment 5—Plaid Cymru has rejected this amendment, although I am not certain to which part of the wording it objects—I know that the Minister is aware, as I have raised this issue with him before, that farmers may have received penalties during the reference years for insignificant administrative errors, and, in some cases, those errors were beyond their control. Farmers have lost money, and they accepted money within those reference years, but to be penalised over and over again during the life of the single farm payment is totally unjust. I consider this to be almost a case of double jeopardy: the punishment was taken and yet it is repeated through the life of the SFP.

Helen Mary Jones: To clarify, in case I was unclear, we will abstain on the amendment because we are not sure that an Assembly resolution is the place for a theoretical statement that includes words such as 'could'. However, we are sympathetic to the situation that you outline, and it is a matter of concern, particularly where those errors are purely technical.

Mick Bates: Thank you for that clarification, Helen. I am aware that staff have worked tirelessly to ensure that there is a flexible interpretation, and that people are looking at this matter. I have contacted officials in Brussels, and I am told that this interpretation is against the spirit of the regulations. I know that a word such as 'spirit' is difficult to define, but I think that it is intended that where the entitlement was there, and where penalties have been incurred during the reference years, there should be flexibility to allow farmers to receive the entitlement in terms of quota. I hope that the Minister will review that and ensure that payments are made on a fair and

oedd ganddynt hawl iddo cyn dadstocio. Rhaid cofio, Weinidog, fod dadstocio wedi digwydd yn aml o ganlyniad i anogaeth gan y Llywodraeth. Er y byddai pawb yn falch o feddu ar synnwyr trannoeth, rhaid cael dehongliad sy'n caniatáu hyblygrwydd, a chredaf fod hynny i'w gael yn y rheoliadau hyn.

Yn yr un modd, ynghylch gwelliant 5—mae Plaid Cymru wedi gwrthod y gwelliant hwn, er nad wyf yn sicr pa ran o'r geiriad y mae'n ei gwrthwynebu—gwn fod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol, gan fy mod wedi codi'r mater hwn gydag ef o'r blaen, fod ffermwyr a allai fod wedi cael cosbau yn ystod y blynyddoedd cyfeirio oherwydd gwallau gweinyddol dibwys, ac, mewn rhai achosion, yr oedd y gwallau hynny y tu hwnt i'w rheolaeth. Mae ffermwyr wedi gwneud colled, ac wedi derbyn arian o fewn y blynyddoedd cyfeirio hynny, ond cwbl annheg yw eu cosbi dro ar ôl tro yn ystod oes y taliad sengl. Ystyriaf fod hyn yn ymylu ar fod yn enghraifft o erlyniad dwbl: cymerwyd y gosb ac eto fe'i haildroddir ar hyd oes y taliad sengl.

Helen Mary Jones: Er mwyn egluro, rhag ofn nad oeddwn yn glir, ymataliwn ar y gwelliant gan nad ydym yn sicr mai penderfyniad gan y Cynulliad yw'r lle i ddatganiad damcaniaethol sy'n cynnwys geiriau fel 'gallai'. Er hynny, yr ydym yn cydymdeimlo ar fater y sefyllfa a ddisgrifiwch, ac mae'n peri pryder, yn enwedig os yw'r gwallau hynny'n gwbl dechnegol.

Mick Bates: Diolch i chi am yr eglurhad hwnnw, Helen. Gwn fod staff wedi gweithio'n ddiflino i sicrhau y ceir dehongliad hyblyg, a bod pobl yn ystyried y mater hwn. Yr wyf wedi cysylltu â swyddogion ym Mrwsel, a dywedwyd wrthyf fod y dehongliad hwn yn groes i ysbryd y rheoliadau. Gwn mai anodd yw diffinio gair fel 'ysbryd', ond credaf mai'r bwriad yw, os oedd hawl yn bod, ac os cafwyd cosbau yn ystod y blynyddoedd cyfeirio, y dylid cael hyblygrwydd fel y caiff ffermwyr dderbyn yr hawliad o ran y cwota. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn adolygu hynny ac yn sicrhau y gwneir taliadau'n deg ac yn gyfiawn.

just basis.

On payments being made on time, there are two critical issues that the Minister failed to address. One is the efficiency of checks that will have to take place on all applicants. As the ruling stands, if all those checks are not completed by the opening of the payment window, no payments will be made. We need an assurance from you, Minister, that your officials will ensure, regardless of the percentage of checks undertaken, that people can be paid on time.

You should clearly state that, where a farmer has cross-border land and the Rural Payments Agency in England is not ready to make payments, we in Wales will make those payments—that you will direct your department to pay those cross-border farmers whose payments may be delayed because the English department is not ready to make their payments.

There is also justifiable concern about the future of the single farm payment, and we want to hear from the Minister on that. We are aware that the expansion of the European Union may mean a reduction in the budget, and, while we have anxieties about this, it would also be reassuring to know that the Minister is lobbying to keep our historic base and that we will not transfer to the system implemented in England.

Glyn Davies: Like Brynle, I declare that I am a partner in a farming business and will be a recipient of the single farm payment.

All political parties have generally supported the Minister's decisions in terms of dealing with this fundamental change in the way in which the industry is supported. My points build on comments made by other Members and are based on issues that constituents have brought to me, to which I hope the Minister will give serious consideration.

My first point has been mentioned several times already, namely the date on which the payments will be made. I have heard the

Ynghylch talu'n brydlon, mae dau fater hollbwysig nad ymdriniodd y Gweinidog â hwy. Un ohonynt yw effeithlonrwydd yr archwiliadau y bydd yn rhaid eu gwneud o'r holl ymgeiswyr. Yn ôl y dyfarniad, os na chwblheir yr holl archwiliadau hynny erbyn dechrau'r cyfnod talu, ni wneir taliadau. Rhaid inni gael sicrwydd gennyh, Weinidog, y bydd eich swyddogion yn sicrhau, beth bynnag fo canran yr archwiliadau a wneir, y gellir talu pobl yn brydlon.

Dylech ddatgan yn glir, os oes tir gan ffermwr o boptu i'r ffin ac os nad yw'r Asiantaeth Taliadau Gwledig yn Lloegr yn barod i wneud taliadau, y byddwn ni yng Nghymru'n gwneud y taliadau hynny—y byddwch yn cyfarwyddo'ch adran i dalu'r ffermwyr hynny sydd â thir o boptu i'r ffin y gallai eu taliadau fod wedi'u gohirio am nad yw'r adran yn Lloegr yn barod i wneud ei thaliadau.

Mae pryder dilys hefyd ynghylch dyfodol y taliad sengl, a dymunwn glywed barn y Gweinidog am hynny. Gwyddom y gallai'r gyllideb leihau o ganlyniad i ehangu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, ac, er ein bod yn bryderus ynghylch hynny, byddai hefyd yn braf cael gwybod bod y Gweinidog yn llobio i gadw ein sylfaen hanesyddol ac na fyddwn yn troi at y system a weithredir yn Lloegr.

Glyn Davies: Fel Brynle, datganaf fy mod yn bartner mewn busnes ffermio ac y byddaf yn derbyn y taliad sengl.

Mae'r holl bleidiau gwleidyddol wedi rhoi cefnogaeth gyffredinol i benderfyniadau'r Gweinidog ar gyfer ymdrin â'r newid sylfaenol hwn yn y dull o gynorthwyo'r diwydiant. Mae'r pwyntiau a wnaeth yn ymhelaethu ar sylwadau a wnaeth Aelodau eraill ac maent yn seiliedig ar faterion y mae etholwyr wedi'u dwyn i'm sylw, y gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn eu hystyried o ddifrif.

Mae'r pwynt cyntaf sydd gennyf wedi'i grybwyll sawl gwaith eisoes, sef y dyddiad y gwneir y taliadau. Clywais y Gweinidog yn

Minister state on many occasions that he will pay at the earliest possible date in the window, and I accept that that is his and the Government's intention. However, we now know that, in England, the payments will not be made until February at least, and that it may well be later than that. One of the essential aspects in terms of being able to make those payments is an agreement across the United Kingdom on the national reserve. We will not look kindly on the Minister if he comes to us in November and says that, because of difficulties and delays in settling the national reserve question at this stage, he will not be able to make the payment. The time to exert pressure to sort out the conditions under which he will be able to make the payments and when he intends to do so, is now.

Mick Bates spoke about the proportionality of penalty. Those of us who work in the industry know that there have been serious penalties for relatively minor indiscretions. I have no time for a farmer who deliberately fills in a form incorrectly, but I am talking here about people who have made a relatively small mistake. The rules make it clear that, in such cases, payment cannot be made, and that has always seemed to me to be disproportionate. However, because we have now gone down the route of considering the historic basis for making payments—which we all supported—this punishment, as others have said, will apply every year in the future, at least to an extent of about a third. That seems to take this disproportional penalty too far.

On setting aside reference years, in terms of an entire year and calculating a historic payment because something unfortunate has happened, whether that be foot and mouth disease or personal illness, and on setting aside individual schemes, the Minister is clearly bound by rules—there is no point in suggesting that he should not follow the rules under which he operates, because he would not be able to do that—but, on the latter two points in particular, where the Minister has discretion and flexibility, they should be used with sensitivity. We have gone through huge, fundamental change in terms of the way in which the industry is

datgan ar lawer achlysur y gwnaiff dalu ar y dyddiad cynharaf posibl yn y cyfnod talu, a derbyniaf mai hynny yw ei fwriad ef a'r Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom na wneir y taliadau yn Lloegr tan fis Chwefror ar y cynharaf, ac y gallai fod yn hwyrach na hynny. Un o'r agweddau hollbwysig o ran gallu gwneud y taliadau hynny yw cael cytundeb ledled y Deyrnas Unedig ar y gronfa genedlaethol. Ni fyddwn yn teimlo'n garedig tuag at y Gweinidog os daw atom ym mis Tachwedd a dweud na fydd yn gallu gwneud y taliad oherwydd yr anawsterau a'r oedi wrth ddatrys mater y gronfa genedlaethol ar y pryd. Hon yw'r adeg y dylid pwysu am gael pennu'r amodau y bydd yn gallu gwneud y taliadau odanynt a'r adeg y mae'n bwriadu gwneud hynny.

Soniodd Mick Bates am gosbau cymesur. Mae'r rhai ohonom sy'n gweithio yn y diwydiant yn gwybod bod cosbau trwm wedi'u gosod am lithriadau cymharol ddibwys. Nis oes gennyf unrhyw feddwl o ffermwyr sy'n llenwi ffurflen yn anghywir o fwriad, ond yr wyf yn sôn yn awr am rai a wnaeth gamgymeriad cymharol fach. Mae'r rheolau'n nodi, mewn achosion o'r fath, na ellir gwneud taliad, ac mae hynny wedi ymddangos yn anghymesur i mi erioed. Fodd bynnag, gan ein bod bellach wedi dilyn y llwybr o ystyried y sail hanesyddol i wneud taliadau—y gwnaethom oll ei chefnogi—bydd y gosb hon, fel y dywedodd eraill, yn cael ei gosod bob blwyddyn yn y dyfodol, hyd tuag un rhan o dair o leiaf. Ymddengys fod hynny'n mynd â'r gosb anghymesur hon yn rhy bell.

Ynghylch diystyru blynyddoedd cyfeirio, o ran ystyried blwyddyn gyfan a chyfrifo taliad hanesyddol am fod rhywbeth anffodus wedi digwydd, boed yn glwy'r traed a'r genau neu'n salwch personol, ac ynghylch diystyru cynlluniau penodol, mae'n amlwg bod y Gweinidog wedi'i rwymo gan reolau—nid oes diben awgrymu na ddylai ddilyn y rheolau y mae'n gweithredu odanynt, gan na allai wneud hynny—ond, ynghylch y ddau bwynt diwethaf yn benodol, lle y mae disgrisiwn a hyblygrwydd ar gael i'r Gweinidog, dylid eu harfer yn sensitif. Aethom drwy newid anferth, sylfaenol o ran y dull o gynorthwyo'r diwydiant, ac, yn

supported, and, generally speaking, we have won the goodwill of everyone. The last thing that we want now is for a whole series of people to be treated unfairly and to find a degree of growth in antipathy towards a scheme that everyone should support.

3.40 p.m.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): To reiterate the situation with regard to organic farmers and those farmers within the agri-environment schemes, it will be important for them to prove that they have suffered adverse financial effects as a result of the steps that they took in entering the schemes. Many of them may not be able to do that, because they will have received payment via the organic farming scheme and the organic conversion scheme. However, where farmers can show it, we will have the discretion to treat them favourably.

In terms of the dates of payments, I remind Members that the payment window opens on 1 December and remains open until 30 June. The payments must be made within that window, and I want them to be made as soon as possible. Members will be aware of the announcement made by the Rural Payments Agency in England, but it does not directly affect our ability to pay; we remain on course to do so because of the work done and the structure that has been put in place in Wales. It is correct to say that the calculation of the national reserve may have an effect on payments across the United Kingdom. We are aware of that, and I have already been in negotiation with my fellow Ministers across the UK on it. Scotland and Northern Ireland are in a similar situation, as they are also unaffected by the RPA's announcement. We are exploring a number of ways in which payments could still be made at the earliest possible opportunity when the window opens, and that work is ongoing.

On Glyn Davies's point about penalties, under certain circumstances, as I said earlier, it is possible for us to ignore penalties

gyffredinol, yr ydym wedi ennyn ewylllys da ym mhawb. Y peth diwethaf yr ydym am ei weld yn awr yw trin nifer fawr o bobl yn annheg a chanfod bod rhywfaint o ddrwgdeimlad yn codi tuag at gynllun y dylai pawb ei gefnogi.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Er mwyn datgan eto beth yw'r sefyllfa o ran ffermwyr organig a'r ffermwyr sydd yn y cynlluniau amaeth-amgylchedd, bydd yn rhaid iddynt brofi eu bod wedi dioddef drwg effeithiau ariannol o ganlyniad i'r camau a gymerasant wrth ymuno â'r cynlluniau. Mae'n bosibl bod llawer ohonynt na fyddant yn gallu gwneud hynny, gan y byddant wedi cael taliad drwy'r cynllun ffermio organig a'r cynllun i ffermwyr sy'n troi'n organig. Fodd bynnag, os yw ffermwyr yn gallu profi hynny, bydd disgresiwn ar gael i ni i'w trin yn ffafriol.

Ynghylch dyddiadau'r taliadau, yr wyf yn atgoffa Aelodau bod y cyfnod talu'n dechrau ar 1 Rhagfyr ac yn parhau tan 30 Mehefin. Rhaid gwneud y taliadau o fewn y cyfnod hwnnw, ac yr wyf am iddynt gael eu gwneud cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Gŵyr Aelodau am y cyhoeddiad a wnaeth yr Asiantaeth Taliadau Gwledig yn Lloegr, ond nid yw hynny'n effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar ein gallu i dalu; yr ydym yn dal i fod mewn lle i wneud hynny oherwydd y gwaith a wnaed a'r trefniadau a roddwyd ar waith yng Nghymru. Cywir yw dweud y gallai'r dull o gyfrifo'r gronfa genedlaethol effeithio ar daliadau ledled y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o hynny, a bûm yn negodi eisoes ar hynny gyda'm cyd-Weinidogion ledled y DU. Mae'r Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon mewn sefyllfa debyg, gan nad yw cyhoeddiad yr Asiantaeth Taliadau Gwledig wedi effeithio arnynt hwythau ychwaith. Er gwaethaf hynny, yr ydym yn ymchwilio i sawl modd y gellid gwneud taliadau ar y cyfle cynharaf posibl ar ddechrau'r cyfnod hwnnw, ac mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n mynd rhagddo.

Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaeth Glyn Davies am gosbau, o dan rai amgylchiadau, fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mae modd inni

incurred during the reference period. Where farmers have incurred a penalty of more than 20 per cent, their claim would be ineligible, and it would therefore not be possible for us to apply discretion in those circumstances. However, where farmers have received penalties of less than 20 per cent, it would be open to us to be flexible in terms of determining their entitlement over the three-year reference period. If a farmer has received a penalty during that three-year period, it does not necessarily follow that that penalty will be repeated thereafter. The scheme before the Assembly today is intended to remain in place until 2013, and there is certainly no pressure in Wales to proceed with a hybrid payment system or a system based on the size of farms.

In terms of hardship, there will be people whose reference period will be prejudiced by the fact that they have been adversely affected by situations, such as foot and mouth disease, and there are methods of dealing with that, such as considering how those people can be assisted through allocations via the reserve and so on. Those people should not suffer as a result of having fewer animals during one or more of those reference years through circumstances beyond their control. We are taking a significant step today towards moving away from the suggestion that farmers should be supported according to the number of animals that they keep, and moving towards the kind of support based on what the public wants, which is a farming industry that is environmentally effective, more economically stable and is ultimately far better able to compete with the rigours and requirements of the European and world markets.

ddiystyru cosbau a gafwyd yn ystod y cyfnod cyfeirio. Os yw ffermwyr wedi cael cosb o fwy nag 20 y cant, ni fyddai eu hawliad yn un cymwys, ac felly ni fyddai'n bosibl inni arfer disgrisiwn o dan yr amgylchiadau hynny. Fodd bynnag, os yw ffermwyr wedi cael cosbau o lai nag 20 y cant, byddai lle inni fod yn hyblyg o ran pennu eu hawliad dros y cyfnod cyfeirio o dair blynedd. Os cafodd ffermwr gosb yn ystod y cyfnod tair blynedd hwnnw, nid yw o reidrwydd yn dilyn y bydd y gosb honno'n cael ei hailosod wedi hynny. Mae'n fwriad i'r cynllun sydd gerbron y Cynulliad heddiw barhau tan 2013, ac, yn sicr, nid oes unrhyw bwysau yng Nghymru i droi at system daliadau gymysg neu system sy'n seiliedig ar faint ffermydd.

O ran caledi, mae rhai a fydd o dan anfantais am eu bod, yn ystod eu cyfnod cyfeirio, wedi profi trafferthion, fel clwy'r traed a'r genau, a cheir dulliau i ymdrin â hynny, er enghraifft, drwy ystyried sut y gellir cynorthwyo'r bobl hynny drwy roi dyraniadau o'r gronfa ac yn y blaen. Ni ddylai'r bobl hynny ddiodeff am fod ganddynt lai o anifeiliaid yn ystod un neu ragor o'r blynyddoedd cyfeirio hynny oherwydd amgylchiadau a oedd y tu hwnt i'w rheolaeth. Yr ydym yn cymryd cam pwysig heddiw oddi wrth y syniad y dylid cynorthwyo ffermwyr yn ôl nifer yr anifeiliaid y maent yn eu cadw, a thuag at y math o gymorth sy'n seiliedig ar yr hyn y mae'r cyhoedd yn ei ddymuno, sef diwydiant ffermio sy'n amgylcheddol effeithiol, yn fwy sefydlog yn economaidd ac yn llawer mwy galluog yn y pen draw i gystadlu'n unol â gofynion llym y marchnadoedd Ewropeaidd a rhyngwladol.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 1: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
German, Michael

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue

Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 2: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Jocelyn
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

Gwelliant 3: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.

Amendment 3: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 20, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 4: For 20, Abstain 1, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val

Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
The following Member abstained:

Jones, Elin

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 16, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 5: For 16, Abstain 7, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.

Amendment defeated.

*Cynnig (NDM2294): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2294): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cynnig (NDM2295): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2295): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cyfrifon ac Archwilio (Cymru) 2005
Approval of the Accounts and Audit (Wales) Regulations 2005**

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I **Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Cynigiad
propose that fod

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Accounts and Audit (Wales) Regulations 2005, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2005. (NDM2296)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee, laid in the Table Office on 8 February 2005, in relation to the draft regulations the Accounts and Audit (Wales) Regulations 2005; and

2. approves that the Accounts and Audit (Wales) Regulations 2005 are made in accordance with:

a) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 13 January 2005; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 13 January 2005. (NDM2297)

Mark Isherwood: I apologise for the delay in rising to speak; I was concentrating on another matter.

The Welsh Conservatives will support any regulations that encourage good corporate governance by promoting effective internal control and risk management, and that bring local authorities in line with best practice in the private and public sectors. However, on regulations considering audit and accounts, we are concerned by the statement, made under point 20 of the regulatory appraisal, that there may be some additional project management or set-up costs for local authorities. It appears that, yet again, the Welsh Assembly Government has not undertaken proactive research into the costs involved, and that this may therefore end up as yet another unfunded burden on council-tax payers. What work has been undertaken, and what figures have actually been projected, rather than hypothesised?

3.50 p.m.

Questions were also raised over point 25 of

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cyfrifon ac Archwilio (Cymru) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2005. (NDM2296)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Chwefror 2005, mewn perthynas â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Cyfrifon ac Archwilio (Cymru) 2005; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cyfrifon ac Archwilio (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Ionawr 2005; a

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Ionawr 2005. (NDM2297)

Mark Isherwood: Ymddiheuraf am yr oedi wrth godi i siarad; yr oeddwn yn canolbwyntio ar fater arall.

Bydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn cefnogi unrhyw reoliadau sy'n cymell llywodraethu corfforaethol da drwy hybu rheolaeth fewnol effeithiol a rheoli ar risg, ac sy'n cysoni'r arferion mewn awdurdodau lleol â'r arferion gorau yn y sectorau preifat a chyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, ynghylch y rheoliadau ar gyfer archwilio a chyfrifon, mae'r hyn a ddywedir o dan bwynt 20 yn yr arfarniad rheoliadol, i'r perwyl ei bod yn bosibl y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn mynd i rai costau ychwanegol ar gyfer sefydlu neu reoli prosiectau, yn peri pryder i ni. Unwaith eto, mae'n ymddangos nad yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi mynd ati i ymchwilio i'r costau sy'n gysylltiedig â hyn, ac felly y gallai hyn droi'n faich arall sydd heb ei ariannu ar ysgwyddau talwyr y dreth gyngor. Pa waith a wnaed, a pha ffigurau sydd wedi'u hamcangyfrif, yn hytrach na'u rhagdybio.

Codwyd cwestiynau hefyd ynghylch pwynt

the regulatory appraisal, which states that:

‘Local authorities have been given greater control over their own decisions under the new Act’.

There is therefore a need to ensure that robust frameworks are in place to ensure financial accountability and control, and for the preparation and audit of the annual statement of accounts. This is especially so in light of the stated purpose of these regulations: to bring authorities up to date with best practice in internal audit. We strongly support enhanced local democracy, but that must be subject to objective and independent external controls.

The Institute of Internal Auditors states that:

‘Internal auditing is an independent, objective assurance and consulting activity designed to add value and improve an organisation’s operations. It helps an organisation accomplish its objectives by bringing a systematic, disciplined approach to evaluate and improve the effectiveness of risk management, control and governance processes’.

The case of *AK Sutton v. Flintshire County Council* raised several questions, including how a public-sector body’s internal auditor should operate, and what should happen in practice. The various published best-practice guidelines, professional standards, corporate policies, and local government financial standing orders all emphasise the importance of internal audit independence. In a truly independent internal audit service, one would look for evidence that the work of the internal auditor is not unduly interfered with, or influenced by, any other person, that people with executive and/or operational responsibility are not involved in writing internal audit reports, that the internal auditor is able to report findings without fear or favour, and that the internal auditor has free access to all documents and personnel in the organisation, as well as key external parties, such as external auditors, the police, and other regulatory agencies.

25 yn yr arfarniad rheoliadol, sy’n datgan bod:

awdurdodau lleol wedi cael mwy o reolaeth dros eu penderfyniadau eu hunain o dan y Ddeddf newydd.

Oherwydd hynny, rhaid gofalu bod fframweithiau cadarn wedi’u sefydlu i sicrhau atebolrwydd a rheolaeth ariannol, ac i baratoi ac archwilio’r datganiad cyfrifon blynyddol. Mae hynny’n arbennig o bwysig yng ngolwg pwrpas honedig y rheoliadau hyn, sef sicrhau’r arferion gorau diweddaraf ar gyfer archwilio mewnol mewn awdurdodau. Yr ydym yn bleidiol iawn i ddemocratiaeth leol well, ond rhaid i honno fod yn agored i reolaethau allanol gwrthrychol ac annibynnol.

Dywed Sefydliad yr Archwilwyr Mewnol fod:

archwilio mewnol yn weithgarwch annibynnol a gwrthrychol a gyflawnir drwy ymgynghori a chynnig sicrwydd, sydd â’r bwriad o ychwanegu gwerth a gwella gweithrediadau’r corff. Mae’n helpu’r corff i gyflawni ei amcanion drwy werthuso a hybu effeithiolrwydd y prosesau rheoli risg, rheoli a llywodraethu mewn modd trefnus a disgybledig.

Cododd sawl cwestiwn yn achos *AK Sutton* yn erbyn *Cyngor Sir y Fflint*, gan gynnwys y modd y dylai’r archwilydd mewnol weithredu mewn corff yn y sector cyhoeddus, a’r hyn a ddylai ddigwydd yn ymarferol. Mae’r gwahanol ganllawiau a gyhoeddwyd ar yr arferion gorau, safonau proffesiynol, polisiau corfforaethol, a rheolau ariannol sefydlog llywodraeth leol i gyd yn nodi ei bod yn bwysig i archwilio mewnol fod yn annibynnol. Mewn gwasanaeth archwilio mewnol gwirioneddol annibynnol, byddai rhywun am weld tystiolaeth sy’n dangos nad yw unrhyw un arall wedi ymyrryd â gwaith yr archwilydd mewnol, neu wedi dylanwadu arno, mewn modd amhriodol, nad yw rhai sydd â chyfrifoldeb gweithredol ac/neu weithrediadol yn ymwneud ag ysgrifennu adroddiadau archwilio mewnol, y gall yr archwilydd mewnol adrodd ar ddarganfyddiadau’n ddiuedd, a bod yr archwilydd mewnol yn

cael rhwydd hynt i weld yr holl ddogfennau a staff yn y corff, yn ogystal â phartion allanol pwysig, fel archwilwyr allanol, yr heddlu, ac asiantaethau rheoleiddio eraill.

Most of the internal audit standards and best-practice publications cover all of the above requirements of independence. However, the most fundamental one that is omitted is that the public-sector internal auditor must not be in the pay of the people whom he or she audits. Internal auditing should be an arm's-length function, managed, employed and funded from outside the organisation that it audits, rather than the current situation, in which poachers can appoint gamekeepers, and gamekeepers can be accountable to poachers.

Currently, many difficulties can arise in delivering a truly independent internal audit function. Internal audit independence often functions effectively when junior personnel are the subject of internal audit findings, usually resulting in disciplinary action, and sometimes in dismissal. However, when chief or senior officers are implicated and are under investigation, the internal auditor's independence is frequently compromised by his or her having to report to those officers who are subject to investigation.

Internal audit can be used as a tool to rid organisations of individuals perceived as being problematic by chief or senior officers. Chief or senior officers can use critical internal audit reports to subvert and/or attack colleagues within the organisation, and the scope of the role and duties of the internal auditor can be confined to a low-level, tick-and-check operation, which does not raise too many challenging questions at a senior level within the organisation.

The internal audit function must therefore cease to be managed, employed and funded from within the public-sector bodies that the internal auditors are responsible for auditing, and instead must be managed, employed and funded as an independent arm of the Welsh Assembly Government.

Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r safonau archwilio mewnol a'r cyhoeddiadau ar arferion gorau yn ymdrin â phob un o'r gofynion uchod am annibyniaeth. Fodd bynnag, yr un mwyaf sylfaenol sydd wedi'i hepgor yw na ddylai archwilydd mewnol yn y sector cyhoeddus gael ei gyflogi gan y sawl y mae'n ei archwilio. Dylai archwilio mewnol fod yn swyddogaeth hyd braich, a gaiff ei rheoli, ei defnyddio a'i hariannu o'r tu allan i'r corff y mae'n ei archwilio, yn hytrach na'r sefyllfa a geir ar hyn o bryd, lle y gall potswyr benodi ciperiaid, a lle y gall ciperiaid fod yn atebol i botswyr.

Ar hyn o bryd, gall llawer o anawsterau godi wrth gyflawni swyddogaeth archwilio mewnol sy'n wirioneddol annibynnol. Yn aml, bydd archwilio mewnol yn gweithio'n effeithiol o ran ei annibyniaeth pan fydd darganfyddiadau'r archwiliad mewnol yn ymwneud â staff is, gan arwain fel arfer at gamau disgyblu, ac weithiau at ddiswyddo. Fodd bynnag, pan fydd prif neu uwch swyddogion yn gysylltiedig neu'n destun ymchwiliad, bydd annibyniaeth yr archwilydd mewnol yn cael ei pheryglu gan ei fod yn gorfod adrodd i'r swyddogion hynny sy'n destun i'r ymchwiliad.

Gellir defnyddio archwilio mewnol fel arf i wared cyrff rhag unigolion y mae prif neu uwch swyddogion yn eu hystyried yn rhy broblemus. Gall prif neu uwch swyddogion ddefnyddio adroddiadau archwilio mewnol sy'n feirniadol i danseilio ac/neu ymosod ar gydweithwyr yn y corff, a gellir cyfyngu ar rôl a swyddogaethau'r archwilydd mewnol fel mai gwaith syml ar ffurf ticio a gwirio a wneir ganddo, nad yw'n codi gormod o gwestiynau ymestynnol ar lefel uwch yn y corff.

Felly, rhaid rhoi'r gorau i reoli, defnyddio ac ariannu'r swyddogaeth archwilio mewnol o'r tu mewn i'r cyrff sector cyhoeddus y mae'r archwilwyr mewnol yn gyfrifol am eu harchwilio, a'i rheoli, ei defnyddio a'i hariannu yn lle hynny fel cangen annibynnol o Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Karen Sinclair: Will you give way?

Karen Sinclair: A wnewch chi ildio?

The Presiding Officer: Order. I do not believe that Mark Isherwood is giving way.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni chredaf fod Mark Isherwood yn ildio.

Mark Isherwood: I will if there is time.

Mark Isherwood: Gwnaf hynny os oes digon o amser.

The Presiding Officer: You have 20 seconds left.

Y Llywydd: Mae gennych 20 eiliad ar ôl.

Mark Isherwood: It must also be subject to a mechanism for internal reporting to the National Assembly on the work and performance of the internal audit function. As has been stated, we will support these regulations as a necessity. I will now give way.

Mark Isherwood: Rhaid iddi fod yn ddarostyngedig hefyd i drefniant ar gyfer adrodd yn fewnol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar waith a pherfformiad y swyddogaeth archwilio mewnol. Fel y dywedwyd, cefnogwn y rheoliadau hyn am fod yn rhaid wrthynt. Ildiaf yn awr.

The Presiding Officer: Order. You cannot; you are out of time.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni chewch; mae'ch amser ar ben.

Jenny Randerson: The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome increased local democracy, as well as increased rights for the electorate of the local democracy. I particularly welcome the extension, in regulation 13, of the time available for public inspection of the accounts from 15 days to 20 days. In fact, one could have gone for a longer period without incurring any great inconvenience.

Jenny Randerson: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu mwy o ddemocratiaeth leol, yn ogystal â'r hawliau ychwanegol i etholwyr y ddemocratiaeth leol. Croesawaf yn enwedig yr ymestyn, yn rheoliad 13, ar yr amser sydd ar gael i'r cyhoedd gael gweld y cyfrifon o 15 niwrnod i 20 niwrnod. Mewn gwirionedd, galleid dewis cyfnod hwy heb beri anhwylystod mawr.

It is clear that the Freedom of Information Act 2000 will have a tremendous impact on government at all levels. Local electors will demand more information throughout the year, and introducing new regulations of this type brings the auditing process, for local government, national parks and so on, much more in line with that new view. An important point to note is that the information on, for example, Members' allowances will become more accessible for people to view and to make a judgment on, and it will no longer be possible, as is necessary, for local authorities to alter their accounts once they have been approved and issued for inspection. In the past, that has been a relatively common practice, but those accounts can now be altered only with the auditor's permission. Therefore, with some small reservations, the Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome this new approach to

Mae'n amlwg y bydd Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000 yn cael effaith aruthrol ar lywodraeth ar bob lefel. Bydd etholwyr lleol yn mynnu cael mwy o wybodaeth drwy gydol y flwyddyn, a thrwy gyflwyno rheoliadau newydd o'r math hwn, bydd y broses archwilio, ar gyfer llywodraeth leol, parciau cenedlaethol ac yn y blaen, yn llawer mwy cyson â'r sefyllfa newydd honno. Un pwynt pwysig y dylid ei nodi yw y bydd yn llawer haws i bobl gael gweld gwybodaeth am lwfansau Aelodau, er enghraifft, a mynegi barn arni, ac na fydd modd bellach i awdurdodau lleol newid eu cyfrifon, fel y bo angen, ar ôl eu cymeradwyo a'u dosbarthu i'w gweld. Yn y gorffennol, bu hynny'n arfer eithaf cyffredin, ond dim ond o gael caniatâd yr archwilydd y gellir newid y cyfrifon hynny bellach. Felly, gyda rhai mân amheuan, mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r dull newydd hwn o

local authority auditing.

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): Thank you, Jenny, for those points. The main thrust of these regulations is to make them the responsibility of the full council, which will be a fundamental change in government. I thank you, therefore, for your points.

As to your points, Mark, as always, you leave me speechless, because most of what you say is not at all relevant to the matter in hand.

Mark Isherwood *rose*—

The Presiding Officer: Order. Before we get into an argument about this matter, this is a debate on the principle of the regulations and by our practice, such debates are wide ranging.

Sue Essex: They are wide-ranging debates, but off the edge of humanity as we know it is not what I would call wide ranging.

Nick Bourne and Mark Isherwood *rose*—

Sue Essex: All right, that was a little tongue-in-cheek, but there is a distinction to be made and, whereas you might define this as going through the realms of the internal auditor, I do not consider repeating the whole Flintshire debate to be relevant—

Mark Isherwood: Will you give way?

Sue Essex: I will not take an intervention, Mark.

Mark Isherwood *rose*—

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister is not giving way, and no-one referred to Flintshire, as far as I heard.

Sue Essex: Can I just—[*Interruption.*]

That is quite an affront to the people that have to face that kind of situation.

I am trying to make the point that, when

archwilio awdurdodau lleol.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Diolch i chi, Jenny, am y pwyntiau hynny. Yr hyn sy'n bwysicaf yn y rheoliadau hyn yw y byddant yn gyfrifoldeb i'r cyngor llawn, a bydd hynny'n newid sylfaenol i lywodraeth. Gan hynny, diolchaf i chi am y pwyntiau a wnaethoch.

Gyda golwg ar y pwyntiau a wnaethoch chi, Mark, fe'i caf yn anodd dweud dim, fel y digwydd bob tro, gan fod y rhan fwyaf o'r hyn a ddywedwch yn gwbl amherthnasol i'r mater dan sylw.

Mark Isherwood *a gododd*—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Cyn inni fynd i ddadlau ynghylch y mater hwn, mae hon yn ddadl ar egwyddor y rheoliadau ac, yn ôl ein harfer, mae dadleuon o'r fath yn rhai eang eu cwmpas.

Sue Essex: Dadleuon eang eu cwmpas ydynt, ond nid rhai eang eu cwmpas a alwn rai nad ydynt yn perthyn i'r byd hwn.

Nick Bourne a Mark Isherwood *a godasant*—

Sue Essex: O'r gorau, yr oedd hynny braidd yn ysmala, ond rhaid gwahaniaethu ac, er y gallech chi ddweud mai trafod maes yr archwilydd mewnol yr oeddech, ni chredaf mai perthnasol yw ailadrodd yr holl ddadl am sir y Fflint—

Mark Isherwood: A wnewch ildio?

Sue Essex: Ni dderbyniaf ymyriad, Mark.

Mark Isherwood *a gododd*—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw'r Gweinidog yn ildio, ac ni chyfeiriodd neb at sir y Fflint, hyd y clywais i.

Sue Essex: A gaf—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Mae hynny'n eithaf sarhad ar y rhai sy'n gorfod wynebu sefyllfa o'r fath.

Y pwynt yr wyf yn ceisio'i wneud yw, pan

these regulations, or the possibility of considering these regulations, came before the Local Government and Public Services Committee, they were not identified as ones that the committee wished to discuss. If there are basic reservations—which I suspect will not be the case when I read over your remarks—it is important that the committee is used. There is no point in matters coming before the committee, Mark, if neither you nor your party uses that opportunity to scrutinise them. These are good regulations, as Jenny says, and they are widely welcomed, and they will allow a different approach to how local government deals with council audit regulations.

ddaeth y rheoliadau hyn, neu'r posibilrwydd o ystyried y rheoliadau hyn, gerbron Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus, nas nodwyd yn rhai yr oedd y pwyllgor yn dymuno eu trafod. Os oes amheuon sylfaenol—ac yr wyf yn amau y gwelaf nad oes pan ddarllenaf eich sylwadau—mae'n bwysig defnyddio'r pwyllgor. Nid oes diben i faterion ddod gerbron y pwyllgor, Mark, os na wnewch chi na'ch plaid achub ar y cyfle i graffu arnynt. Rheoliadau da yw'r rhain, fel y dywed Jenny, a rhoddwyd croeso cyffredinol iddynt, a byddant yn caniatáu i lywodraeth leol ddelio â rheoliadau ar archwilio cynghorau mewn modd gwahanol.

*Cynnig (NDM2296): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2296): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan

Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2297): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2297): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl

Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Penodi Archwilwyr Newydd i Archwilio Cyfrifon
 Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru
 Appointment of the New Auditors of the Accounts of
 the Auditor General for Wales**

Janet Davies: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with section 94(1) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, appoints KTS Owens Thomas as the auditors of the accounts of the Auditor General for Wales. (NDM2298)

Janet Davies: Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn unol ag adran 94(1) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penodi KTS Owens Thomas yn archwilydd cyfrifon Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru. (NDM2298)

4.00 p.m.

We recommend that KTS Owens Thomas Ltd be appointed as auditor to the Auditor General for Wales for the next three years, following competitive tendering. I will explain the situation briefly so that everyone can understand what this motion is about. The Assembly is required, under section 94 of the Government of Wales Act 1998, to appoint an auditor of the accounts of the Auditor General for Wales. This section also states that the function may not be delegated, and it is therefore a decision for the whole Assembly. The Auditor General for Wales is responsible for the audit of the accounts of the Assembly and other public bodies in Wales for which he has a statutory responsibility. He also carries out examinations into the economy, efficiency and effectiveness shown by these bodies in the use of their resources to discharge their functions. Under the provisions of the Public Audit (Wales) Act 2004, from 1 April 2005, the Auditor General will take on additional functions, including statutory responsibility for the audit of NHS bodies and the appointment of local government body auditors. The appointment of the AGW's auditors is for the initial three years, commencing with the financial year 2004-05. It will be renewable for a further two years at

Yr ydym yn argymhell y dylid penodi KTS Owens Thomas Cyf yn archwilydd i Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf, ar ôl tendro cystadleuol. Egluraf y sefyllfa'n fyr fel y gall pawb ddeall ystyr y cynnig hwn. O dan adran 94 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, mae'n ofynnol i'r Cynulliad benodi archwilydd cyfrifon Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru. Mae'r adran hon yn datgan hefyd na ellir dirprwyo'r swyddogaeth hon ac, felly, mae'n benderfyniad sydd i'w wneud gan y Cynulliad cyfan. Mae Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru yn gyfrifol am archwilio cyfrifon y Cynulliad a chyrrff cyhoeddus eraill yng Nghymru y mae ganddo gyfrifoldeb statudol drostynt. Mae hefyd yn ymchwilio i'r ddarbodaeth, yr effeithlondeb a'r effeithiolrwydd a amlygir gan y cyrrff hyn wrth ddefnyddio eu hadnoddau i gyflawni eu swyddogaethau. O dan ddarpariaethau Deddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004, o 1 Ebrill 2005, bydd yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn ymgymryd â swyddogaethau ychwanegol, gan gynnwys cyfrifoldeb statudol dros archwilio cyrrff y GIG a thros benodi archwilwyr cyrrff llywodraeth leol. Penodir archwilwyr Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru am dair blynedd i ddechrau, gan ddechrau yn y flwyddyn ariannol 2004-05. Gellir

the Assembly's discretion. The audit work will cover that year and lead to an audit opinion on the accounts of the Office of the Auditor General for Wales. A copy of the certified audited accounts, together with the auditor's report on them, will be laid before the Assembly in accordance with section 94 of the Government of Wales Act 1998. The audit work for 2005-06 and beyond will take account of the expanded role of the Office of the Auditor General for Wales arising from the Public Audit (Wales) Act 2004.

adnewyddu'r penodiad am ddwy flynedd ychwanegol yn ôl disgrisiwn y Cynulliad. Bydd y gwaith archwilio'n ymdrin â'r flwyddyn honno ac yn arwain at ddatgan barn gan yr archwilydd am gyfrifon Swyddfa Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru. Gosodir copi o'r cyfrifon wedi'u harchwilio a'u hardystio, ynghyd ag adroddiad yr archwilydd arnynt, gerbron y Cynulliad yn unol ag adran 94 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Bydd y gwaith archwilio ar gyfer 2005-06 ac wedyn yn rhoi sylw i'r rôl ehangach a fydd gan Swyddfa Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru yn sgîl Deddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004.

Y Llywydd: Nid oes neb am siarad ar y cynnig hwn, felly symudwn i bleidlais.

The Presiding Officer: No-one wishes to speak to the motion, therefore we move to a vote.

*Cynnig (NDM2298): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2298): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy

Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.02 p.m.
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.02 p.m.*

Adroddiad y Prif Swyddog Meddygol The Chief Medical Officer's Report

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendments 3 and 4 in the name of David Melding, and amendments 5 and 6 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gwelliannau 3 a 4 yn enw David Melding a gwelliannau 5 a 6 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. welcomes the publication of the chief medical officer's report, 'Health Status Wales 2004-05', which was placed on the internet on 3 February 2005;

1. yn croesawu cyhoeddiad adroddiad y prif swyddog meddygol, 'Statws Iechyd Cymru 2004-05', a osodwyd ar y rhyngwrwyd ar 3 Chwefror 2005;

2. recognises that the report provides baseline data against which the progress towards better health can be monitored; and

2. yn cydnabod bod yr adroddiad yn darparu data llinell sylfaen y gellir ei ddefnyddio i fonitro cynnydd tuag at well iechyd; a

3. endorses the report's call for Health Challenge Wales becoming the focus for a renewed national effort to achieve new health targets and reduce health inequalities in Wales. (NDM2299)

3. yn ategu cais yr adroddiad i Her Iechyd Cymru ddod yn ganolbwynt ymdrech genedlaethol bellach i gyrraedd targedau iechyd newydd ac i leihau anghydraddoldebau iechyd yng Nghymru. (NDM2299)

The Assembly Government's strategic agenda, 'Wales: A Better Country', focuses on better health as one of its four key objectives. This is correct, because the health of our people is key to the success of Wales as a country, to producing a vibrant

Mae agenda strategol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, 'Cymru: Gwlad Well', yn canolbwyntio ar iechyd gwell fel un o'i phedwar prif amcan. Mae hyn yn beth cywir, gan fod iechyd ein pobl yn hollbwysig i lwyddiant Cymru fel gwlad, er mwyn cael

workforce, and to creating a more prosperous economy. Equally, ensuring a more prosperous and fair economy can have a massive impact on improving the health of the people of Wales.

The chief medical officer published this report on 2 February. It is the first in a new series of reports and provides an objective snapshot of the state of the nation's health in the context of Health Challenge Wales and outlines a new range of health targets announced in 2003-04, which give direction and drive to Health Challenge Wales and the broader health agenda in Wales. The report also provides more detailed examinations of three key areas of health, namely respiratory disease, sexual health, and levels of physical activity.

The report shows that there have been positive developments over the past decade or so. Death rates declined by 14 per cent between 1999 and 2002, with a rise in life expectancy to 80.1 years for women and 75.5 years for men. Conception rates among teenagers have continued to fall since the peak in 1998, with a 14 per cent decline in conception among women under 20 years of age and a 20 per cent decline in conception among women under 18 years of age.

The targets set in 1997 for cervical cancer, coronary heart disease and strokes have all been effectively met. Some of the amendments before us refer to performance against these targets. This is an important issue and we recognise that more needs to be done, because there has been less progress than we would have liked in several of these areas. I will come back to that later.

Death rates are higher in Wales than in England, with the burden of morbidity and illness in every local authority being worse than the overall average in England. That generates a massive challenge for our health and social care systems. There are also significant and unacceptable geographical variations in mortality rates across Wales. Mortality rates in local authorities such as Merthyr Tydfil are in the order of 50 per cent

gweithlu brwdfrydig a chreu economi fwy ffyniannus. Yn yr un modd, drwy sicrhau economi decach a mwy ffyniannus, gellir gwella iechyd pobl Cymru'n aruthrol.

Cyhoeddodd y prif swyddog meddygol yr adroddiad hwn ar 2 Chwefror. Hwn yw'r cyntaf mewn cyfres newydd o adroddiadau ac mae'n cynnig cipolwg gwrthrychol ar gyflwr iechyd y genedl yng nghyd-destun Her Iechyd Cymru ac yn nodi set newydd o dargedau iechyd a gyhoeddwyd yn 2003-04, sy'n gyrru ac yn llywio Her Iechyd Cymru a'r agenda ehangach ar iechyd yng Nghymru. Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn cynnig archwiliad manylach o dri maes iechyd pwysig, sef clefydau anadlu, iechyd rhywiol, a lefelau gweithgarwch corfforol.

Dengys yr adroddiad fod datblygiadau pendant wedi bod dros y deng mlynedd diwethaf, fwy neu lai. Gwnaeth cyfraddau marwolaethau ostwng 14 y cant rhwng 1999 a 2002, ac mae'r disgwyliad einioes wedi codi i 80.1 mlynedd ymysg menywod ac i 75.5 mlynedd ymysg dynion. Mae cyfraddau cenhedlu ymysg rhai yn eu harddegau wedi disgyn yn barhaus oddi ar eu huchafbwynt yn 1998, gyda gostyngiad o 14 y cant yn y cenhedlu ymysg menywod o dan 20 mlwydd oed a gostyngiad o 20 y cant yn y cenhedlu ymysg menywod o dan 18 mlwydd oed.

Mae'r targedau a osodwyd yn 1997 ar gyfer canser ceg y groth, clefyd coronaidd y galon a thrawiadau i gyd wedi'u cyrraedd i bob pwrpas. Mae rhai o'r gwelliannau sydd ger ein bron yn cyfeirio at berfformiad yn ôl y targedau hyn. Mae hyn yn fater pwysig a derbyniwn fod angen gwneud rhagor, gan y bu llai o gynnydd yn nifer o'r meysydd hyn nag y dymunem. Deuaf yn ôl at hynny'n ddiweddarach.

Mae cyfraddau marwolaethau'n uwch yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr, ac mae baich yr afiachusrwydd a'r salwch ym mhob awdurdod lleol yn waeth na'r cyfartaledd cyffredinol yn Lloegr. Mae hynny'n creu her aruthrol i'n systemau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Ceir gwahaniaethau sylweddol ac annerbyniol hefyd yn y cyfraddau marwolaethau rhwng gwahanol ardaloedd ledled Cymru. Mae'r cyfraddau

higher than in other local authorities, such as Ceredigion, and the life expectancy of men in Merthyr is five years less—for women it is three years less—than in the best local authorities in Wales.

The diagnosis of sexually transmitted diseases is increasing. There is also a huge amount to do to encourage people to partake more vigorously in physical activity. We need to respond to these issues not by asking what the health service can do for you, but what the health service can do with you. Two new issues have emerged: the emphasis on shared responsibility for health and the need for a new, proactive approach to prevent ill health in the first place. This is a big task and it will be achieved by working with a wide range of partners to improve the social and economic environment in which most of our disadvantaged people live.

We need to encourage organisations, including Government, to help us to create conditions that will help people to improve their health, and encourage, support and stimulate people to make the necessary changes to their lifestyle to rise to Health Challenge Wales. That is the way to make a real difference. At the heart of Health Challenge Wales are the key messages of creating a positive cultural bias towards healthy lifestyles, and of taking increased responsibility for one's health. We need to encourage people to be physically active and to eat a balanced diet, and we need to reduce risk-taking behaviour such as smoking.

We have a prime opportunity to make progress on smoking through the work of the Committee on Smoking in Public Places, chaired by Val Lloyd. For that reason, it is too early for us to support amendment 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams, as it largely pre-empts the conclusions of that committee's work. The Welsh Assembly Government has already responded to the wider health challenge by promoting Health Challenge Wales and a wide range of other measures, such as the 'Climbing Higher' strategy, which is supported by the Minister

marwolaethau mewn awdurdodau lleol fel Merthyr Tudful tua 50 y cant yn uwch nag mewn awdurdodau lleol eraill, fel Ceredigion, ac mae disgwyliad einioes dynion ym Merthyr Tudful yn bum mlynedd yn llai—mae'n dair blynedd yn llai i fenywod—nag yn yr awdurdodau lleol gorau yng Nghymru.

Canfyddir mwy o glefydau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol. Mae gwaith mawr i'w wneud hefyd o ran annog pobl i gymryd rhan yn fwy egniol mewn gweithgarwch corfforol. Rhaid inni ymateb i'r materion hyn nid drwy ofyn beth y gall y gwasanaeth iechyd ei wneud drosoch chi, ond beth y gall y gwasanaeth iechyd ei wneud gyda chi. Mae dau fater newydd wedi codi: y pwyslais ar gyfrifoldeb ar y cyd dros iechyd a'r angen am ddull newydd, rhagweithiol o atal iechyd gwael yn y lle cyntaf. Gorchwyl mawr yw hwn ac fe'i cyflawnir drwy weithio gydag amrywiaeth mawr o bartneriaid i wella'r amgylchedd cymdeithasol ac economaidd y mae'r rhan fwyaf o'n pobl ddifreintiedig yn byw ynddo.

Rhaid inni annog cyrff, gan gynnwys Llywodraeth, i'n helpu i greu amgylchiadau a fydd yn helpu pobl i wella eu hiechyd, ac i annog, cynorthwyo a symbylu pobl i wneud y newidiadau y mae eu hangen yn eu ffordd o fyw er mwyn ateb Her Iechyd Cymru. Felly y gwneir gwir wahaniaeth. Yr hyn sydd wrth wraidd Her Iechyd Cymru yw'r neges am greu gogwydd pendant o ran arferion at ddilyn ffyrdd o fyw iach, ac am ymgymryd â mwyfwy o gyfrifoldeb dros eich iechyd eich hun. Rhaid inni annog pobl i fod yn gorfforol weithgar ac i ddilyn deiet cytbwys, a rhaid inni leihau ymddygiad sy'n golygu mentro i beryglon fel ysmegu.

Mae gennym gyfle gwych i wneud cynnydd ar ysmegu drwy waith y Pwyllgor ar Ysmegu mewn Mannau Cyhoeddus, a gadeirir gan Val Lloyd. Oherwydd hynny, mae'n rhy fuan inni gefnogi gwelliant 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams, gan ei fod yn achub y blaen i raddau helaeth ar gasgliadau gwaith y pwyllgor hwnnw. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru eisoes wedi ymateb i'r her fwy cyffredinol o ran iechyd drwy hyrwyddo Her Iechyd Cymru ac amrywiaeth mawr o fesurau eraill, fel strategaeth 'Dringo'n Uwch', a hyrwyddir gan y Gweinidog dros

for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Brian, you argue that ensuring healthy lifestyles will take the pressure off the national health service in Wales, but will not leading healthy lifestyles mean people living longer, which will mean that they will need more services from the national health service, not fewer?

Brian Gibbons: Not necessarily. Although people may live longer, there is growing evidence of a pattern of morbidity compression. If people look after themselves during their early years, the extent of morbidity in their final years may be less than is the case by following current practice. Therefore, I do not think that Rhodri Glyn's point is necessarily true. It may be true, but there is an equally strong argument for it not being true.

The Welsh Assembly Government is also providing new money to local health alliances so that they can be at the forefront of promoting joint working to deliver Health Challenge Wales locally. We have announced a new set of Health Challenge Wales projects that will be led by the voluntary sector.

A number of the amendments deal with failure to achieve targets announced in 1997. These amendments largely restate what is said in the report. The report recognises that there is a clear need to revisit these targets and to propose a more realistic set of targets that have been devised in consultation with a wide range of partnerships and community organisations. The targets will then be more in line with what can be achieved within the context of improving the health of the people of Wales. As these amendments merely reiterate what is in the report, I cannot call on the Assembly to support them.

In conclusion, much has been done to improve health across Wales, not only by the health service, but through the wider agenda that is being promoted by the Assembly Government in terms of creating a healthier, prosperous and more equal Wales.

Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Brian, yr ydych yn dadlau y bydd sicrhau ffyrdd o fyw iach yn fodd i leihau'r pwysau ar y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru, ond oni fydd pobl yn byw'n hwy oherwydd ffyrdd o fyw iach, fel y bydd arnynt angen rhagor o wasanaethau gan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, nid llai?

Brian Gibbons: Nid o reidrwydd. Er y gallai pobl fyw'n hwy, ceir mwyfwy o dystiolaeth o batrwm o gywasgu afiachusrwydd. Os yw pobl yn gofalu amdanynt eu hunain yn ystod eu blynyddoedd cynnar, gallent brofi llai o afiachusrwydd yn eu blynyddoedd olaf nag y byddent o ddilyn yr arferion presennol. Felly, ni chredaf fod y pwynt a wnaeth Rhodri Glyn yn gywir o reidrwydd. Gallai fod yn gywir, ond mae dadl yr un mor gryf i'r gwrthwyneb.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn darparu arian newydd hefyd i gynghreiriau iechyd lleol fel y gallant fod ar flaen y gad wrth hyrwyddo gwaith ar y cyd i roi Her Iechyd Cymru ar waith yn lleol. Cyhoeddassom set newydd o brosiectau o dan Her Iechyd Cymru a arweinir gan y sector gwirfoddol.

Mae nifer o'r gwelliannau'n ymdrin â methiant i gyrraedd targedau a gyhoeddwyd yn 1997. Mae'r gwelliannau hyn yn ailddatgan yr hyn a ddywedir yn yr adroddiad i raddau helaeth. Mae'r adroddiad yn derbyn ei bod yn amlwg bod angen ailystyried y targedau hyn a chynnig set o dargedau sy'n fwy realistig ac a ddyfeisir drwy ymgynghori ag amrywiaeth mawr o bartneriaethau a chyrrff cymunedol. Bydd y targedau'n fwy cyson wedyn â'r hyn y gellir ei gyflawni yng nghyd-destun gwella iechyd pobl Cymru. Gan nad yw'r gwelliannau ond yn ailadrodd yr hyn a geir yn yr adroddiad, ni allaf alw ar y Cynulliad i'w cefnogi.

I derfynu, gwnaed llawer i wella iechyd ledled Cymru, nid yn unig gan y gwasanaeth iechyd, ond drwy'r agenda fwy cyffredinol a hyrwyddir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad er mwyn creu Cymru sy'n iachach, yn fwy ffyniannus ac yn fwy cyfartal.

4.10 p.m.

Jonathan Morgan: You said that you will not support the amendments because many of them deal with targets, but one of the Conservative amendments refers specifically to asthma. Do you not think that you should respond positively to that amendment's call for a higher priority to be given to asthma, not only among older people, but among younger people in particular?

Brian Gibbons: As you know, the Assembly Government is already developing a respiratory action plan, which covers this issue as well as the various aspects of the new general practitioner contract that deal with chronic disease management. Therefore, this action is in hand, and your amendment offers nothing new.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu'r canlynol ar ddiwedd pwynt 2:

ond yn nodi bod y cynnydd tuag at fodloni'r targedau iechyd wedi bod yn siomedig, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd lle ceir amddifadedd mawr.

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn mynegi â phryder nad oes unrhyw arwydd o leihad mewn anghydraddoldebau iechyd er 1997, ac yn galw ar i fformiwla Townsend gael ei rhoi ar waith yn llawn.

Yr wyf yn rhyfeddu at resymeg y Gweinidog. Mae am wrthod y gwelliannau gan eu bod yn ategu'r hyn sydd yn yr adroddiad, ond mae am inni dderbyn yr adroddiad. Os ydym yn derbyn yr adroddiad, mae'n rhaid ein bod hefyd yn derbyn gwelliannau sydd yn ailadrodd cynnwys yr adroddiad. Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi bod nifer o dargedau iechyd heb eu cyrraedd a bod yr ymgais i'w cyrraedd wedi bod yn siomedig. Mae'n nodi bod hynny'n arbennig o wir mewn ardaloedd tlawd. Ni ddeallaf pam na all y Gweinidog gefnogi gwelliant sydd yn nodi'r ffaith syml honno. Mae'n rhaid bod y Cynulliad, ar draws y pleidiau,

Jonathan Morgan: Dywedasoeh na wnewch gefnogi'r gwelliannau gan fod llawer ohonynt yn ymwneud â thargedau, ond mae un o welliannau'r Ceidwadwyr yn cyfeirio'n benodol at asthma. Oni chredwch y dylech ymateb yn gadarnhaol i'r alwad a geir yn y gwelliant hwnnw am roi blaenoriaeth uwch i asthma, nid yn unig ymysg pobl hŷn, ond ymysg pobl iau'n benodol?

Brian Gibbons: Fel y gwyddoch, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eisoes yn datblygu cynllun gweithredu ar anhwylderau anadlu, sy'n ymdrin â'r mater hwn yn ogystal â'r gwahanol agweddau ar y contract newydd i ymarferwyr cyffredinol sy'n delio â rheoli clefydau cronig. Felly, cymerwyd y camau hynny, ac nid yw'ch gwelliant yn cynnig unrhyw beth newydd.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: at the end of point 2 add the following:

but notes that progress towards achieving health targets has been disappointing, especially in areas of high deprivation.

I propose amendment 2. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

expresses with concern that there is no sign of any reduction since 1997 in health inequalities, and calls for the Townsend formula to be implemented in full.

The Minister's logic amazes me. He will not support the amendments because they restate what is in the report, but he is asking us to accept the report. Surely, if we accept the report, we must also accept amendments that restate the content of the report. The report notes that several health targets have not been met and that the efforts made to meet them have been disappointing. It notes that that is particularly true in poorer areas. I do not understand why the Minister cannot support an amendment that notes that simple fact. Surely the Assembly is united, across the parties, in its effort to improve health in those poorer areas. Surely we accept that

yn unedig yn yr ymgais i wella iechyd yn yr ardaloedd tlawd hynny. Yr ydym yn derbyn bod tlodi, ansawdd tai a diffyg gwasanaethau mewn rhai o'r ardaloedd hyn, yn cyfrannu'n uniongyrchol at lefelau afiechyd. Felly, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ailystyried cefnogi gwelliant 1.

Mae gwelliant 2 yn ymwneud â'r ffaith bod anghysondeb mewn lefelau afiechyd yng Nghymru. Mae hynny wedi'i gadarnhau, nid mewn unrhyw ddatganiadau gan y gwrthbleidiau, ond mewn adroddiad gan Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree, sef 'Monitoring Poverty and Social Exclusion 2003', sydd yn datgan yn glir:

'There is no sign of any reduction since 1997 in the health inequalities which leave people with low incomes more likely to suffer serious health-related problems.'

Felly, gobeithiwn y bydd y Blaid Lafur yn derbyn y gwelliant hwn. Mae'n gyson ag athroniaeth wleidyddol y Blaid Lafur ar hyd y blynyddoedd. Ni fyddai gan Aneurin Bevan broblem gyda'r math hwn o welliant, ac nid wyf yn siŵr pam mae gan y Gweinidog broblem gydag ef, ag eithrio'r ffaith mai Plaid Cymru sydd wedi'i gynnig.

Mae adroddiad y prif swyddog meddygol yn ymwneud, fel dywedodd y Gweinidog, â thri maes yn benodol: afiechydon anadlu, iechyd rhyw ac ymarfer corff. Gwnaeth y Gweinidog bwynt mawr o'r ffaith bod gan y Llywodraeth agenda o hyrwyddo bywyd iach. Yr ydym i gyd yn cefnogi'r agenda, wrth reswm: yr ydym am i bobl Cymru fyw bywyd iachach, fwyta'n iachach a gwneud mwy o ymarfer corff. Fodd bynnag, gwneuthum ymyriad ar y pwynt hwn, a gofynnaf eto iddo ystyried a fydd hyn yn lleihau'r pwysau ar y gwasanaeth iechyd cenedlaethol. Mae'r holl bobl broffesiynol yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yr wyf fi wedi siarad â hwy wedi dweud wrthyf y bydd yr agenda hon yn cynyddu'r pwysau ar y gwasanaeth iechyd oherwydd, os yw pobl yn byw yn hirach, bydd y gwasanaeth yn gwneud triniaethau ar bobl yn eu 80au a'u 90au yn hytrach na'u gwneud yn eu 60au a'u 70au. Wrth i bobl fynd yn hŷn, pa mor iach bynnag y maent, bydd y pwysau ar y gwasanaeth

poverty, the quality of housing, and a lack of services in some of these areas, contributes directly to levels of ill health. I therefore ask the Minister to reconsider his refusal to support amendment 1.

Amendment 2 deals with the fact that there are inconsistencies in levels of ill health in Wales. That has been confirmed, not by any statements from opposition parties, but in a report by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation, namely 'Monitoring Poverty and Social Exclusion 2003', which clearly states:

Nid oes unrhyw arwydd o ostyngiad er 1997 yn yr anghydraddoldebau iechyd sy'n peri bod rhai ag incwm isel yn fwy tebygol o brofi problemau difrifol mewn cysylltiad ag iechyd.

We therefore hope that the Labour Party will accept this amendment. It is consistent with the Labour Party's political philosophy over the years. Aneurin Bevan would not have had a problem with an amendment of this kind, and I am not sure why the Minister has a problem with it, other than the fact that it was proposed by Plaid Cymru.

The chief medical officer's report, as the Minister said, deals with three specific areas: respiratory diseases, sexual health and physical exercise. The Minister emphasises the fact that the Government has an agenda to promote healthy living. We all support this agenda, of course: we want the people of Wales to live healthier lives, eat more healthily and to do more exercise. However, I intervened on this point, and I ask him again to consider whether this will lessen the pressure on the NHS. All the national health service professionals that I have spoken to say that this agenda will increase the pressure on the NHS, because, if people live longer, they will be treating people in their 80s and 90s rather than in their 60s and 70s. As people get older, however healthy they are, the pressure on the NHS and social services will increase. I do not disagree with what the Government is trying to do—we have supported this—but I do not want to see the Government trying to deceive itself and the

iechyd gwladol a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn cynyddu. Nid wyf yn anghytuno â'r hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio'i wneud—yr ydym wedi cefnogi hyn—ond nid wyf am weld y Llywodraeth yn ceisio twyllo'i hunan a phobl Cymru fod hyn rywsut yn mynd i arwain at lai o bwysau ar y gwasanaeth iechyd.

Jeff Cuthbert: Do you accept that, if we do not tackle, through health promotion, issues such as childhood and teenage obesity now and do nothing to encourage healthy lifestyles, we will have an explosion of type 2 diabetes in 10 to 15 years' time, which will place a great burden on the health service for the duration of these people's lives?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Derbyniaf hynny, a phe baech wedi gwrandao ar yr hyn a ddywedais wrth y Gweinidog, byddech yn gwybod ein bod yn cefnogi'r agenda hon, ond nid wyf am i'r argraff gael ei roi bod hyrwyddo bywyd iach ac ymarfer corff yn mynd i leihau'r pwysau ar y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Ni wnaiff hynny—bydd y pwysau'n cynyddu. Gellid atal rhai afiechydon rhag datblygu mewn pobl ifanc, ac mae hynny i'w groesawu, ond bydd arddel bywyd iach yn golygu y bydd pobl yn byw yn hirach, a fydd yn cynyddu'r pwysau ar y gwasanaeth iechyd.

Brian Gibbons: Not necessarily.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Wel, dyna mae'r bobl broffesiynol yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn dweud wrthym, a dylech fod yn ymwybodol o hynny.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn dangos yn glir fod Cymru yn dal i fod mewn sefyllfa lle mae pobl yn ein cymunedau tlotaf yn dioddef lefelau uwch o afiechyd. Gobeithiwn yr ewch i'r afael â hynny, Weinidog, ac fe'ch sicrhaf y cewch ein cefnogaeth os y gwnewch.

Jonathan Morgan: I propose the following amendments in the name of David Melding. Amendment 3: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls for respiratory diseases, especially

people of Wales that this will somehow lead to less pressure on the health service.

Jeff Cuthbert: A ydych yn derbyn, os nad awn i'r afael yn awr â materion fel gordewdra ymysg plant a rhai yn eu harddegau, drwy hybu iechyd, ac os na wnawn ddim i hyrwyddo ffyrdd o fyw iach, y cawn gynnydd mawr mewn diabetes math 2 ymhen 10 i 15 mlynedd, a fydd yn rhoi baich mawr ar ysgwyddau'r gwasanaeth iechyd ar hyd oes y bobl hyn?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I accept that, and had you listened to what I said to the Minister, you would know that we support this agenda, but I do not want the impression to be given that promoting a healthy lifestyle and exercise will lessen the pressure on the NHS and social services. It will not—the pressure will increase. The development of some illnesses in young people could be prevented, and that is to be welcomed, but living a healthier lifestyle will mean that people live longer, which will increase the pressure on the health service.

Brian Gibbons: Nid o reidrwydd.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Well, that is what health professionals are telling us, and you should be aware of that.

This report clearly demonstrates that Wales is still in a situation whereby the people in our poorest communities suffer higher levels of illness. We hope that you will get to grips with that, Minister, and I assure you that you will have our support if you do.

Jonathan Morgan: Cynigiâf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw David Melding. Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar i afiechydon y system anadlu, yn

asthma in young people, to be given higher priority.

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

expresses concern that the majority of health targets have not been met and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to review the targets.

In proposing these amendments, I put on record our thanks to the chief medical officer for her work and for this thorough report, although it makes for grim reading in many ways. I will focus on two particular concerns, to which our two amendments refer: first, the prevalence of asthma among young people and the related number of hospital stays during 1996 to 2001, and, secondly, the issue of the targets to which the Government was working towards, and the new set of targets that have been established since the review took place.

In terms of the prevalence of asthma, it is astonishing that the number of hospital stays during that five-year period, among the five to 14 and 15-year-old category, was virtually static. There was no real improvement in bringing down the number of hospital stays required for young people and teenagers who were suffering from asthma. According to Asthma UK, for nine out of 10 asthma sufferers, symptoms should be controllable and individuals should be able to lead healthy, active lives without needing emergency care. We should be raising a number of questions as a result of this report about access to treatment for asthma sufferers, what we are doing to reduce the prevalence of asthma in young people, and how the move towards healthier lifestyles and greater rates of exercise among young people can be used to combat the prevalence of asthma.

The Government should be doing much more in connection with the National Institute for Clinical Excellence to examine patients' right to high-quality care. In its own guidelines, there is an astonishing lack of NICE involvement in setting standards for

enwedig asthma mewn pobl ifanc, gael mwy o flaenoriaeth.

Cynigïaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn mynegi pryder nad yw'r rhan fwyaf o'r targedau iechyd wedi eu bodloni eto, ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i adolygu'r targedau.

Wrth gynnig y gwelliannau hyn, datganaf ein diolch i'r prif swyddog meddygol am ei gwaith ac am yr adroddiad cynhwysfawr hwn, er ei fod yn ddeunydd enbyd i'w ddarllen ar lawer ystyr. Canolbwyntiaf ar ddau fater sy'n peri pryder yn benodol, y cyfeirir atynt yn ein dau welliant: yn gyntaf, yr achosion mynych o asthma ymysg pobl ifanc a nifer yr arosiadau mewn ysbytai mewn cysylltiad â hynny yn ystod y cyfnod o 1996 i 2001, ac, yn ail, mater y targedau y bu'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio eu cyrraedd, a'r set dargedau newydd a bennwyd ers yr adolygiad.

Gyda golwg ar amllder yr achosion o asthma, mae'n syfrdanol bod nifer yr arosiadau mewn ysbytai yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw o bum mlynedd, yng nghategori'r rhai rhwng pump a 14 a 15 mlwydd oed, wedi aros yn ei unfan bron. Ni chafwyd unrhyw wir welliant o ran gostwng nifer yr arosiadau mewn ysbytai y mae eu hangen ar gyfer pobl ifanc a rhai yn eu harddegau sy'n dioddef gan asthma. Yn ôl Asthma UK, yn achos naw o bob 10 o'r rhai sy'n dioddef gan asthma, dylai fod yn bosibl rheoli'r symptomau a dylai unigolion allu byw bywyd iach a gweithgar heb fod angen gofal brys. Dylem godi sawl cwestiwn o ganlyniad i'r adroddiad hwn am fynediad i driniaeth ar gyfer rhai sy'n dioddef gan asthma, y camau a gymerwn i leihau amllder yr achosion o asthma ymysg pobl ifanc, a sut y gellir defnyddio'r newid tuag at ffyrdd o fyw iachach a mwy o ymarfer corff ymysg pobl ifanc i wrthweithio amllder yr achosion o asthma.

Dylai'r Llywodraeth wneud llawer mwy ar y cyd â'r Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Ragoriaeth Glinigol i ystyried hawl cleifion i gael gofal o ansawdd da. Yn ei chanllawiau ei hun, mae'n syndod cyn lleied o ran y mae'r sefydliad yn ei chwarae wrth bennu

asthma patients. In addition, how, for example, is the 'British Guideline on the Management of Asthma 2004'—which is a recent report—being used by the Assembly Government to set priorities for funding to help reduce the prevalence of asthma in young people? The Minister mentioned in his opening remarks that the Government is considering some kind of action plan that will be used as guidance to manage respiratory problems, and, in particular, asthma. We have had almost six years of devolution, and little work has been done on this key area, regardless of the fact that the prevalence of asthma is increasing. There is real concern in this regard. When you look at the information in the chief medical officer's report, particularly in relation to physical activity—for example, 82 per cent of 15-year-old boys do not undertake the amount of physical activity required—there is a link between levels of asthma and the way in which we encourage young people to take up the recommended amount of physical activity. We need to look at these two issues seriously if we are to combat respiratory problems, and particularly asthma, among young people.

4.20 p.m.

Of the 15 targets set for 2002, 10 were missed. That is very disappointing, but it points to a problem. There were 15 targets, 10 were missed, then there was a review, a wide-ranging consultation process, an expert panel and a new set of targets. That is like saying, 'We have a set of targets, we cannot meet them, but never mind, we could introduce another set of targets as well'. We now need to take stock and look at what is achievable. Are you taking a scattergun approach? Are you trying to hit a range of targets without focusing on any? It is not just about focusing on those that are easily achievable, because that would lack courage, and you need to have courage and ambition in setting rigorous targets. However, are you lacking a focus on those targets which really will be achievable within the next 10 years? After reading the chief medical officer's report, and reading between the lines in some respects, I fear that the new targets could be just as unachievable as the previous ones.

safonau ar gyfer cleifion sy'n dioddef gan asthma. Hefyd, pa ddefnydd a wneir, er enghraifft, o'r 'British Guideline on the Management of Asthma 2004'—sy'n adroddiad diweddar—gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i bennu blaenoriaethau ar gyfer ariannu i helpu i leihau amllder yr achosion o asthma ymysg pobl ifanc? Dywedodd y Gweinidog yn ei sylwadau agoriadol fod y Llywodraeth yn ystyried rhyw fath o gynllun gweithredu a ddefnyddir fel canllaw i reoli problemau anadlu, ac, yn benodol, asthma. Cawsom bron chwe blynedd o ddatganoli, ac ychydig o waith a wnaed yn y maes allweddol hwn, er bod achosion o asthma yn dod yn fwy cyffredin. Mae hyn yn destun pryder gwirioneddol. Os edrychwch ar y wybodaeth yn adroddiad y prif swyddog meddygol, yn enwedig honno sy'n ymwneud â gweithgarwch corfforol—er enghraifft, nid yw 82 y cant o fechgyn 15 mlwydd oed yn ymgymryd â maint y gweithgarwch corfforol y mae ei angen—gwelwch fod cysylltiad rhwng lefelau asthma a'r modd yr ydym yn annog pobl ifanc i ymgymryd â maint y gweithgarwch corfforol a argymhellir. Rhaid inni ystyried y ddau fater hyn o ddifrif os ydym i wrthweithio problemau anadlu, ac yn enwedig asthma, ymysg pobl ifanc.

O'r 15 targed a osodwyd ar gyfer 2002, methwyd â chyrraedd 10 ohonynt. Mae hynny'n siomedig iawn, ond mae'n dangos bod problem. Yr oedd 15 o dargedau, methwyd 10 ohonynt, wedyn cafwyd adolygiad, a phroses ymgynghori bellgyrhaeddol, a phanel o arbenigwyr a set dargedau newydd. Mae hynny'n debyg i ddweud, 'Mae gennym set dargedau, ni allwn eu cyrraedd, ond pa ots, gallem gyflwyno set dargedau arall hefyd'. Bydd yn rhaid inni bwysu a mesur ac ystyried yr hyn y gellir ei gyflawni. A ydych yn anelu'n rhy eang? A ydych yn ceisio taro amryw o dargedau heb ganolbwyntio ar yr un ohonynt? Nid yw'n fater o ganolbwyntio ar y rhai hawdd eu cyrraedd yn unig, gan mai peth gwangalon fyddai hynny, a rhaid ichi wrth ddewrder ac uchelgais wrth bennu targedau ymestynnol. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn canolbwyntio'n ddigonol ar y targedau hynny y gellir eu cyrraedd o fewn y 10 mlynedd nesaf? Ar ôl darllen adroddiad y prif swyddog meddygol,

You must look at this issue and be honest in terms of whether these targets can be met.

In conclusion, Health Challenge Wales is a good idea. However, it is full of aspirations and nice ideas. It must include money and a hard-hitting strategy. Unless those elements are in place, the targets will not be met.

Kirsty Williams: I propose the following amendments. Amendment 5: add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes that the target to reduce deaths from lung cancer has not been met and believes that this is further reason for the Assembly to be given powers to ban smoking in public places.

I propose amendment 6. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes the failure to meet the majority of the health gain targets for 2002 and calls on the Assembly Government to work harder to meet the new health targets.

I will first address amendment 6. We should not be surprised at the picture painted for us by the chief medical officer. It is a disappointing picture, but it is a reality that many of us have discussed over the last five years in the Assembly. The most disappointing aspect is the lack of progress identified by the chief medical officer against so many of the targets that the Government has set for itself.

As the Minister pointed out in his opening speech, health gain is one of the primary goals that the Welsh Labour Government has set for itself. As the chief medical officer says, we have failed in many areas and we must make more progress. With regard to the targets that were set, we are failing in terms of targets for lung cancer rates in women, deaths of women from breast cancer, and heart disease among people aged under 65. In terms of accidental deaths, suicide rates and low birth-weight, the targets have not been met. The situation is getting worse in

a darllen rhwng y llinellau ar sawl ystyr, mae arnaf ofn y gallai'r targedau newydd fod yr un mor anghyraeddadwy â'r rhai blaenorol. Rhaid ichi ystyried y mater hwn a bod yn onest o ran y gallu i gyrraedd y targedau hyn.

I gloi, mae Her Iechyd Cymru yn syniad da. Er hynny, mae'n llawn dyheadau a syniadau dymunol. Rhaid iddi gynnwys arian a strategaeth bendant. Os na cheir yr elfennau hynny, ni chyrhaeddir y targedau.

Kirsty Williams: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol. Gwelliant 5: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi na lwyddwyd i gwrdd â'r targed i leihau nifer y marwolaethau o ganser yr ysgyfaint ac yn credu bod hyn yn rheswm arall pam y dylai'r Cynulliad gael y grym i wahardd ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus.

Cynigiau welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi na lwyddwyd i gwrdd â'r rhan fwyaf o'r targedau gwella iechyd ar gyfer 2002 ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i weithio'n galetach i gwrdd â'r targedau iechyd newydd.

Ymdriniaf yn gyntaf â gwelliant 6. Ni ddylem synnu at y darlun a gyflewyr i ni gan y prif swyddog meddygol. Mae'n ddarlun siomedig, ond hon yw'r wir sefyllfa y mae llawer ohonom wedi'i thrafod dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf yn y Cynulliad. Yr agwedd fwyaf siomedig yw'r diffyg cynnydd a ganfu'r prif swyddog meddygol mewn cysylltiad â chynifer o'r targedau y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'u gosod iddi'i hun.

Fel y nododd y Gweinidog yn ei araith agoriadol, cynnydd mewn iechyd yw un o'r prif nodau y mae Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru wedi'u gosod iddi'i hun. Fel y dywed y prif swyddog meddygol, yr ydym wedi methu mewn sawl maes a rhaid inni wneud mwy o gynnydd. Gyda golwg ar y targedau a osodwyd, yr ydym yn methu o ran y targedau ar gyfer cyfraddau canser yr ysgyfaint ymysg menywod, marwolaethau ymysg menywod oherwydd canser y fron, a chlefyd y galon ymysg rhai o dan 65 oed. Ni chyrhaeddwyd y targedau ar gyfer marwolaethau damweiniol,

terms of low birth-weight—more women are delivering low birth-weight babies than was previously the case, which has huge consequences, not only for services in neonatal departments, but in terms of the ongoing prospects for those babies throughout their lives.

Targets for reducing smoking among girls, and targets for dental caries among children have not been met. Across the whole range of targets, for young and old alike, and across many diseases and many conditions, we are not making the progress set by the chief medical officer and the Government. We cannot simply say that we did not meet these targets, so they should be adjusted next time in favour of achievable targets. There was a reason why these goals were identified in the first place, and we cannot switch them every time that we fail to make progress.

I now turn to amendment 5. The report is strong on issues around respiratory disease. This is a hugely important issue, not just to those individuals who are suffering greatly. Respiratory diseases can be incredibly debilitating and can have an effect on people's daily lives, but there is a huge drain on resources in the NHS, particularly in the acute sector. It is no happy coincidence that Wanless looked at this specifically in terms of identifying the huge number of hospital beds and days taken up by people suffering from respiratory disease, and the unnecessary use of resources in the acute sector. We have to find ways of treating patients with these conditions more appropriately in their own communities. We have not made the progress that we are capable of making. Progress has been demonstrated by some innovative projects in Wales, but it has not been spread across the principality in terms of treating these conditions locally, which would mean better services, provided more locally, and not the drain and use of acute beds that has been identified in the report.

That means that we must take action on smoking. For the Minister to stand up and say that it is all right because we have the Committee on Smoking in Public Places,

cyfraddau hunanladdiad a phwysau geni isel. Mae'r sefyllfa o ran pwysau geni isel yn gwaethygu—mae mwy o fenywod yn geni plant â phwysau isel nag o'r blaen, ac mae canlyniadau dybryd i hynny, nid yn unig i wasanaethau mewn adrannau i blant newydd-enedigol, ond o ran y rhagolygon i'r plant hynny ar hyd eu hoes.

Ni chyrrhaeddwyd targedau ar gyfer lleihau ysmegu ymysg merched, nac ar gyfer pydredd yn nannedd plant. Yn yr holl dargedau, ar gyfer yr hen a'r ifanc fel ei gilydd, ac ar gyfer llawer o glefydau ac anhwylderau, nid ydym yn gwneud y cynnydd a bennwyd gan y prif swyddog meddygol a'r Llywodraeth. Ni allwn ddweud ein bod wedi methu'r targedau hyn, a'i gadael ar hynny, gan ddweud y dylid eu newid y tro nesaf fel y gellir eu cyrraedd. Yr oedd rheswm dros bennu'r nodau hynny yn y lle cyntaf, ac ni allwn eu newid bob tro y methwn â gwneud cynnydd.

Trof yn awr at welliant 5. Mae'r adroddiad yn ymdrin yn helaeth â materion sy'n ymwneud â chlefydau anadlu. Mae hwn yn bwnc pwysig dros ben, nid yn unig i'r rhai hynny sy'n dioddef yn fawr ganddynt. Gall clefydau anadlu fod yn wanychol iawn a gallant effeithio ar fywyd pob dydd pobl, ond ceir treth anferth ar adnoddau yn y GIG, yn enwedig yn y sector aciwt. Nid cyddigwyddiad ydyw bod Wanless wedi ystyried y mater hwn yn benodol, wrth nodi'r nifer anferth o welyau a diwrnodau mewn ysbytai a gymerir gan rai sy'n dioddef gan glefydau anadlu, a'r defnydd diangen o adnoddau yn y sector aciwt. Rhaid inni ganfod dulliau o drin cleifon sydd â'r anhwylderau hyn yn fwy priodol yn eu cymunedau. Ni wnaethom y cynnydd y gallwn ei wneud. Mae rhai prosiectau arloesol yng Nghymru wedi dangos cynnydd, ond ni ledaenwyd hynny ar draws y dywysogaeth fel y gellir trin yr anhwylderau hyn yn lleol, a fyddai'n golygu cynnig gwell gwasanaethau yn fwy lleol, heb y dreth ar adnoddau a'r defnydd o welyau aciwt a nodwyd yn yr adroddiad.

Oherwydd hynny, rhaid inni gymryd camau ar ysmegu. Nodweddiadol ohonom fel Cymry yw bod y Gweinidog yn sefyll ar ei draed ac yn dweud bod popeth yn iawn gan

which will guide us, is stereotypically Welsh—'It is all right; we will have another committee'. We made the decision years ago: the Assembly voted to ban smoking in public places. The committee is worth while, but only to the extent that it saves Labour's blushes, because its colleagues in London will not give us the powers to act here. They will not give us the legislation and the opportunity in Westminster to have what we want in Wales.

Val Lloyd: I am concerned to hear you say that the committee was set up merely to save Labour's blushes. I am sure that I speak for the other committee members, who would feel quite put down by that remark. We have worked intensely hard, and have also taken on board the views of the public, who have given freely of their time to let us know their views, in writing and in coming to give us evidence, and you do them an injustice.

Kirsty Williams: I am sorry if you feel that way. I am not criticising the hard work that you and your fellow members of the committee, and the people who have participated in the process, have done; I am saying that it was unnecessary. You and your colleagues could perhaps have been spending your time considering another equally worthy issue. The Assembly voted to ban smoking in public places, and we should act on that vote rather than set up a committee to look at the issue again. The Assembly has already made the decision, and we should act on it.

Finally, I turn to the dual approach. Rhodri Glyn is arguing about how many angels you can get on the head of a pin, in saying that health promotion is bad because it means that we will potentially have to treat people when they are older. The demands will not necessarily be greater or less than at present; they may be different. However, we cannot afford to ignore this agenda, as pointed out by Wanless, Black, and Acheson, over many years. All these reports have said that we must tackle this agenda. I would recommend to Rhodri Greer's work, *Territorial Politics and Health Policy: UK Health Policy in*

fod gennym Bwyllgor ar Ysmygu mewn Mannau Cyhoeddus, a fydd yn ein harwain—'Mae popeth yn iawn; cawn bwyllgor arall'. Penderfynasom flynyddoedd yn ôl: pleidleisiodd y Cynulliad i wahardd ysmygu mewn mannau cyhoeddus. Mae'r pwyllgor yn un buddiol, ond dim ond i'r graddau y mae'n arbed wyneb Llafur, gan na wnaiff ei gymheiriaid yn Llundain roi inni'r pwerau angenrheidiol i weithredu yma. Ni roddant inni'r ddeddfwriaeth a'r cyfle yn San Steffan i wireddu ein dymuniad yng Nghymru.

Val Lloyd: Mae'n ofid imi'ch clywed yn dweud mai dim ond i arbed wyneb Llafur y sefydlwyd y pwyllgor. Yr wyf yn siŵr fy mod yn mynegi barn aelodau eraill y pwyllgor, a deimlai eu bod wedi'u bychanu braidd gan y sylw hwnnw. Yr ydym wedi gweithio'n galed iawn, ac wedi ystyried barn aelodau'r cyhoedd hefyd, sydd wedi rhoi o'u hamser i roi gwybod inni am eu barn, drwy ysgrifennu a thrwy ddod atom i gynnig tystiolaeth, ac yr ydych yn gwneud cam â hwy.

Kirsty Williams: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf os ydych yn teimlo felly. Nid wyf yn beirniadu'r gwaith da a wnaethoch chi a'ch cyd-aelodau ar y pwyllgor, a'r rhai a gymerodd ran yn y broses; yr wyf yn dweud ei fod yn ddiangen. Efallai y gallasech chi a'ch cyd-aelodau dreulio'ch amser yn ystyried mater arall a fyddai'r un mor deilwng. Pleidleisiodd y Cynulliad i wahardd ysmygu mewn mannau cyhoeddus, a dylem weithredu ar sail y bleidlais honno yn hytrach na sefydlu pwyllgor i ailystyried y mater. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi penderfynu eisoes, a dylem weithredu ar sail hynny.

Yn olaf, trof at y dull gweithredu deuol. Mae Rhodri Glyn yn gwastraffu ei anadl wrth ddweud mai peth drwg yw hybu iechyd gan ei fod yn golygu y gallem orfod trin pobl pan fônt yn hŷn. Ni fydd mwy neu lai o alw nag sydd ar hyn o bryd, o reidrwydd; gallai fod yn wahanol. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn fforddio anwybyddu'r agenda, fel y mae Wanless, Black, a Acheson wedi nodi, dros flynyddoedd lawer. Mae'r holl adroddiadau hyn wedi dweud bod rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r agenda hon. Cymeradwyaf i Rhodri waith Greer, *Territorial Politics and Health Policy: UK Health Policy in Comparative*

Comparative Perspective, which commends the Assembly for the twin-track approach that it has taken regarding focusing on health intervention and prevention.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Will you give way?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Kirsty has run out of time.

Val Lloyd: Like previous speakers, I welcome the report, and the opportunity that it has given us to focus on specific issues, especially sexual health. Working with young people in order to better educate and inform them is crucial, as it is young people who are most at risk in this regard. I am pleased with the funding that young people's partnerships have received from the Assembly, which has contributed to the development of innovative sexual health promotion initiatives across communities.

In Swansea, the 'Sex and the City' project has been launched, which is geared towards recognising the needs of young people. This drop-in service, which is run in the city centre, has proven to be especially well used. This project complements the vital work of the Swish centre, which is the only centre in Wales to offer social care to those with HIV. I am sure that, in view of the statistics in the report, my concerns will be shared should funding be removed locally for such services.

The integration of existing family planning and genito-urinary medicine services into a single sexual health service will maximise the opportunity for preventive health checks and early diagnosis. Underpinning the strategy are health professionals who are able to develop a fast and effective service that takes account of the value of education and health promotion. They are, therefore, not only dealing with the here and now, but also with the future. Expansion of the role of nurse practitioners in this service is a key to delivering a batch of services.

4.30 p.m.

The scheme offered at Cardiff Royal

Perspective, sy'n canmol y Cynulliad ar y dull gweithredu deuol a fabwysiadodd o ran canolbwyntio ar ymyrryd ac atal mewn cysylltiad ag iechyd.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A wnewch chi ildio?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae amser Kirsty ar ben.

Val Lloyd: Yn yr un modd â siaradwyr blaenorol, croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn, a'r cyfle a roddodd inni ganolbwyntio ar faterion penodol, ac iechyd rhywiol yn enwedig. Mae'n hollbwysig gweithio gyda phobl ifanc er mwyn eu haddysgu a'u hysbysu'n well, gan mai pobl ifanc sydd yn y perygl mwyaf yn hyn o beth. Yr wyf yn fodlon ar y cyllid a gafodd partneriaethau pobl ifanc gan y Cynulliad, gan fod hynny wedi cyfrannu at y gwaith o ddatblygu mentrau arloesol i hybu iechyd rhywiol mewn cymunedau.

Yn Abertawe, lanswyd prosiect 'Sex and the City', sydd â'r amcan o gydnabod anghenion pobl ifanc. Gwnaed defnydd eithriadol o helaeth o'r gwasanaeth galw heibio hwn, sy'n cael ei redeg yng nghanol y ddinas. Mae'r prosiect hwn yn ategu gwaith hanfodol canolfan Swish, sef yr unig ganolfan yng Nghymru sy'n cynnig gofal cymdeithasol i'r rhai sydd â HIV. Yr wyf yn sicr, yng ngolwg yr ystadegau yn yr adroddiad, y byddai eraill yn pryderu fel minnau pe câi cyllid ei dynnu'n ôl yn lleol ar gyfer gwasanaethau o'r fath.

Drwy integreiddio'r gwasanaethau cynllunio teuluol a meddygaeth genhedlol-wrinol presennol yn un gwasanaeth iechyd rhywiol, bydd modd manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfle i gynnig archwiliadau iechyd ataliol a diagnosis cynnar. Mae'r strategaeth hon yn dibynnu ar allu gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol i ddatblygu gwasanaeth cyflym ac effeithiol sy'n rhoi sylw i werth addysg a gwaith hybu iechyd. Felly, maent yn delio â'r hyn a ddigwydd yn y dyfodol, yn ogystal â'r sefyllfa bresennol. Drwy ehangu rôl ymarferwyr nyrsio yn y gwasanaeth hwn, bydd modd darparu set o wasanaethau.

Mae'r cynllun a gynigir yn y clinig

Infirmary's genito-urinary medicine clinic by nurse practitioners has brought practical benefits in terms of service delivery, with more efficient booking systems and a combination of open-access and appointment clinics. Relevant services provided across a range of sectors are proactive in sending a positive message to young people, although I agree that, undoubtedly, we have a way to go. It is, however, a step in the right direction and, as the Minister mentioned, the figures show that underage conceptions have decreased noticeably. That indicates that campaigns have acted as a catalyst to modify behaviour and improve prevention.

A recent study by the University of Wales Swansea found that 95 per cent of nurses agree that public-health issues—notably sexual health—are a key part of their role, an one which they would like to see extended. However, while many nurses are keen to deliver sexual awareness through personal and social education lessons and youth advisory sessions, the study found many obstacles, such as a lack of personnel and, in some cases, a lack of support from management. Will the Minister look into the obstacles facing school nurses in this regard so that we can be sure that we are delivering a comprehensive package of sexual health promotion?

David Melding: As Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee, I commend the work of our chief medical officer, Dr Ruth Hall, who has now served in post for seven or eight years and who is about to leave to fill a senior appointment in England. I am sure that we all wish her well, and we are most grateful for the way in which her excellent advice has informed our debates throughout the period of devolved government in Wales.

I suspect that the Minister may well agree with me that one of the grimmest statistics referred to in the chief medical officer's report is that 12 per cent of people in Wales state their health as not being good. That compares with 9 per cent who so classify themselves in England. In England and

meddygaeth genhedlol-wrinol yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Caerdydd gan ymarferwyr nyrsio wedi dod â budd ymarferol o ran darparu gwasanaethau, gyda systemau trefnu apwyntiadau mwy effeithlon a chyfuniad o glinigau sy'n cynnig mynediad agored ac apwyntiadau. Mae gwasanaethau perthnasol mewn amryw o sectorau'n cyfleu neges gadarnhaol i bobl ifanc, er fy mod yn cytuno bod gennym gryn waith o'n blaen, yn sicr. Er hynny, mae'n gam i'r cyfeiriad iawn ac, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae'r ffigurau'n dangos bod nifer yr achosion o genhedlu dan oed wedi gostwng yn sylweddol. Dengys hynny fod ymgyrchoedd wedi bod yn fodd i newid ymddygiad ac i wella gwaith atal.

Mewn astudiaeth ddiweddar gan Brifysgol Cymru Abertawe, canfuwyd bod 95 y cant o nyrsys yn cytuno bod materion sy'n ymwneud ag iechyd cyhoeddus—iechyd rhywiol yn neilltuol—yn rhan allweddol o'u rôl, ac yn un y carent weld ei hystemyn. Serch hynny, er bod llawer o nyrsys yn awyddus i hyrwyddo ymwybyddiaeth rywiol drwy wersi addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol a sesiynau cynghori pobl ifanc, canfu'r astudiaeth fod llawer o rwystrau, fel prinder staff ac, mewn rhai achosion, diffyg cefnogaeth gan y rheolwyr. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymchwilio i'r rhwystrau sy'n wynebu nyrsys ysgol yn hyn o beth fel y gallwn sicrhau ein bod yn cynnig dulliau cynhwysfawr o hybu iechyd rhywiol?

David Melding: Fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, canmolaf waith ein prif swyddog meddygol, Dr Ruth Hall, sydd bellach wedi gwasanaethu yn ei swydd am saith neu wyth mlynedd ac sydd ar fin ymadael i gymryd swydd uwch yn Lloegr. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod ni oll yn dymuno'n dda iddi, a'n bod yn dra diolchgar am y modd y mae ei chynghor rhagorol wedi goleuo ein dadleuon drwy gydol cyfnod llywodraeth ddatganoledig yng Nghymru.

Yr wyf yn amau ei bod yn ddigon posibl y bydd y Gweinidog yn cytuno â mi pan ddywedaf mai un o'r ystadegau mwyaf digalon y cyfeirir ato yn adroddiad y prif swyddog meddygol yw'r 12 y cant o bobl Cymru sy'n datgan nad yw eu hiechyd yn dda. Mae hynny'n cymharu â 9 y cant yn

Wales, seven of the nine worst counties are in Wales, and they are particularly concentrated in the Valleys areas of Rhondda Cynon Taf, Merthyr, Caerphilly, Neath Port Talbot and Blaenau Gwent, where, typically, over 15 per cent of people regard their health as not being good. I know that Brian Gibbons will realise that a key indicator of future health is how you rate your health at the moment, and those who do not think that their health is particularly good are at considerable risk of presenting with serious ill health in the relatively near future. That is, therefore, a key indicator of what people think about their health and wellbeing.

Also, the long-term illness statistics are pretty grim, with 23 per cent of people in Wales having some form of limiting long-term illness. That compares with 18 per cent in England, so it is considerably worse, although it is fair to point out that, if you look at regions such as the north-east of England, the situation is similar. There is, therefore, a definite socio-economic dimension to this matter. However, all local authority areas in Wales are performing in this indicator worse than the English average, so we must take this public health issue seriously. In all that I have heard so far, and since devolution in 1999, there has been a genuine consensus in the Assembly that the socio-economic aspects of health and the public health agenda need to be put at the top of the list of our considerations. It is always, however, a dual strategy, as Kirsty Williams was right to point out: we will never stop needing acute medicine and the range of community and primary health care. Even if we sort out some chronic conditions, which would bring a benefit to many people in poorer areas almost akin to providing clean water for under-fives and the transformation in health that that achieved, they would still present with all sorts of health concerns that there will probably be more interventions to help them with in 30 or 40 years' time.

Therefore, we are not going to get away from needing a broad range of tertiary, secondary and primary healthcare. The old view held by

Lloegr. Yng Nghymru a Lloegr, mae saith o'r naw sir waethaf yng Nghymru, ac mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn ardaloedd y Cymoedd, sef Rhondda Cynon Taf, Merthyr Tudful, Caerffili, Castell-nedd Port Talbot a Blaenau Gwent, lle y mae'n arferol i fwy na 15 y cant o'r bobl farnu nad yw eu hiechyd yn dda. Gwn y bydd Brian Gibbons yn sylweddoli mai un dangosydd allweddol o iechyd yn y dyfodol yw eich barn am eich iechyd ar y pryd, ac mae'r rhai na chredant fod eu hiechyd yn arbennig o dda mewn cryn berygl o brofi afiechyd difrifol yn y dyfodol cymharol agos. Felly, mae hynny'n ddangosydd allweddol o farn pobl am eu hiechyd a'u lles.

Hefyd, mae'r ystadegau am salwch hirdymor yn eithaf digalon, gan fod 23 y cant o bobl Cymru'n dioddef gan ryw fath o salwch cyfyngol hirdymor. Mae hynny'n cymharu â 18 y cant yn Lloegr, felly mae'n waeth o lawer, er mai teg yw nodi, os ystyriwch ranbarthau fel gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr, fod y sefyllfa'n debyg. Gan hynny, mae elfen gymdeithasol-economaidd bendant i'r mater hwn. Er hynny, mae'r holl ardaloedd awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru'n perfformio'n waeth yn ôl y dangosydd hwn na'r cyfartaledd yn Lloegr, felly rhaid inni ymdrin o ddifrif â mater iechyd cyhoeddus. Ym mhopeth a glywais hyd yma, ac ers datganoli yn 1999, bu consensws gwirioneddol yn y Cynulliad y dylai'r agweddau cymdeithasol-economaidd ar iechyd a'r agenda iechyd cyhoeddus fod yn flaenaf yn ein hystyriaethau. Strategaeth ddeuol ydyw bob amser, fodd bynnag, fel y nododd Kirsty Williams: ni fydd ein hangen am feddygaeth aciwt a'r amrediad o ofal iechyd cymunedol a sylfaenol byth yn dod i ben. Hyd yn oed os cawn drefn ar rai o'r anhwylderau cronig, a ddeuai â budd i lawer o bobl mewn ardaloedd tlotach a fyddai bron gymaint â'r budd a ddaeth drwy ddarparu dŵr glân i rai dan bump oed a'r trawsnewid mewn iechyd a sicrhawyd drwy hynny, byddent yn dal i ofyn sylw i bob math o bryderon sy'n gysylltiedig ag iechyd y bydd mwy o driniaethau ar eu cyfer, mae'n debyg, ymhen 30 neu 40 mlynedd.

Felly, bydd arnom angen amryw o fathau o ofal iechyd trydyddol, eilaidd a sylfaenol o hyd. Yr hen safbwynt a arddelwyd gan rai

the likes of Aneurin Bevan in the 1950s was that if you spent a certain amount of money you would be over the hill and onto a certain plateau of good health. It is not going to work quite like that.

I was also concerned that only 30 per cent of adults take regular exercise. I am now in the 70 per cent bracket I fear, like many people, creeping—I am now galloping, alas—into middle age. They lose the habits that they may have had in early adulthood—that has happened in terms of my exercise routine. We need to get people back on track and tell them how to exercise in blocks of 10 minutes. We must not tell people that they must take part in heavy exercise five times a week as that will demoralise them before they start. We need practical ways of encouraging people.

While I welcome the fact that death rates are falling in all age groups, there is one exception, namely the 15 to 44 age group. I am worried about that and I think that it reflects the fact that we have been particularly unsuccessful in meeting targets for accidents, suicides and mental health. That group is quite badly affected. Accidents are one of the biggest causes of premature death in that age group and we need to consider that.

Finally, a lot of work must be carried out on reducing the level of pedestrian injuries in the group aged up to 14 years. This must start with motorists driving at reasonable speeds. If that is done, the figure would be halved. We must get that across to people. I welcome the fact that carers and their mental health is recognised. I commend the work of the CMO and I hope that the Government keeps on the course of taking public health seriously.

Janice Gregory: I will keep my contribution brief. Like other Members, I found this report interesting reading. I also found it encouraging that 65 per cent of people in Wales were reporting that their health was good. However, the most telling figure was the number of people who found that their

tebyg i Aneurin Bevan yn y 1950au oedd, pe byddech yn gwario swm penodol o arian, y byddai'r gwaethaf drosodd ac y ceid iechyd da am byth wedyn. Nid felly'n union y bydd yn gweithio.

Yr oeddwn yn bryderus hefyd mai dim ond 30 y cant o oedolion sy'n gwneud ymarfer corff yn rheolaidd. Mae arnaf ofn fy mod bellach ymhlith y 70 y cant, fel y mae llawer, wrth iddynt lithro—yr wyf fi'n carlamu bellach, gwaetha'r modd—i'w canol oed. Collant yr arferion a allasai fod ganddynt pan oeddent yn oedolion ifanc—digwyddodd hynny o ran fy nhrefn ymarfer i. Rhaid inni roi pobl ar ben ffordd eto a dweud wrthynt sut i ymarfer fesul 10 munud. Ni ddylem ddweud wrth bobl fod rhaid iddynt gymryd rhan mewn ymarferiadau trwm bum gwaith yr wythnos gan y byddai hynny'n eu digalonni cyn iddynt ddechrau. Mae arnom angen dulliau ymarferol i annog pobl.

Er fy mod yn croesawu'r ffaith bod cyfraddau marwolaethau'n gostwng yn yr holl grwpiau oedran, mae un eithriad, sef y grŵp oedran rhwng 15 a 44. Pryderaf ynghylch hynny a chredaf ei fod yn adlewyrchu'r ffaith inni fod yn dra aflwyddiannus wrth gyrraedd targedau ar gyfer damweiniau, hunanladdiad ac iechyd meddwl. Mae cryn ddrwg effaith ar y grŵp hwnnw. Damweiniau yw un o brif achosion marwolaethau cyn pryd yn y grŵp oedran hwnnw a rhaid inni ystyried hynny.

Yn olaf, rhaid gweithio'n galed i ostwng lefel yr anafiadau i gerddwyr yn y grŵp hyd at 14 oed. Rhaid dechrau ar hynny drwy sicrhau y bydd modurwyr yn gyrru ar gyflymder rhesymol. Drwy wneud hynny, câi'r ffigur ei haneru. Rhaid inni gyfleu'r neges honno. Croesawaf y gydnabyddiaeth i ofalwyr a'u hiechyd meddwl. Canmolaf waith y Prif Swyddog Meddygol a gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn dal ati wrth gymryd iechyd cyhoeddus o ddifrif.

Janice Gregory: Bydd fy nghyfraniad yn un byr. Fel Aelodau eraill, cefais yr adroddiad hwn yn un diddorol. Fe'm calonogwyd hefyd am fod 65 y cant o bobl Cymru'n datgan bod eu hiechyd yn dda. Fodd bynnag, y ffigur mwyaf dadlennol oedd y nifer a ganfu nad oedd eu hiechyd yn dda. Fel y dywedodd

health was not good. As David Melding mentioned, these people live in the Valleys, in the most deprived areas. They still appear at the bottom of the list and their health is not good. I know that I do not have to labour that point with the Minister as he represents an area of great deprivation, as I do.

Many aspects of the report were important, but, like Val Lloyd, I will concentrate on sexual health. Like other Members, I welcome the decrease in teenage conceptions and I hope that our public information message on that is getting through. However, I am concerned about the increase in sexually transmitted infections among men and women in the 16 to 24 age group. I know that I do not have to tell the Minister about the devastation and the ongoing problems, including infertility, that chlamydia can cause, and I ask him, as I have done previously, to include the simple chlamydia test in the cervical smear test for women in this age group who are sexually active.

Similarly, contracting anogenital warts is distressing. They cannot be cured and yet their prevalence is increasing, which shows that our sexual health and prevention programmes are not reaching the people who we need to reach. I speak to young people, health professionals and youth workers and I fear that our message is not getting through.

Kirsty Williams: I welcome your comments regarding sexual health. Do you agree that it is not only to teenagers that we need to address sexual health messages and that we need to consider categories such as newly single people in their 40s and 50s who might not have been hearing sexual health promotion messages for many years but who now perhaps find themselves at a greater risk than they were previously?

Janice Gregory: I agree with Kirsty's comments. There is no doubt that people, especially those of my generation, were given one message when they were in their late teens and early 20s, when they may have been in a settled relationship, but if they are

David Melding, mae'r bobl hynny'n byw yn y Cymoedd, yn yr ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig. Maent yn dal i fod ar waelod y rhestr ac nid yw eu hiechyd yn dda. Gwn nad oes raid imi rygnu ar y pwynt hwnnw gyda'r Gweinidog gan ei fod yn cynrychioli ardal ddifreintiedg iawn, fel yr wyf fi.

Yr oedd sawl agwedd ar yr adroddiad yn bwysig, ond, fel Val Lloyd, canolbwyntiaf ar iechyd rhywiol. Fel Aelodau eraill, croesawaf y gostyngiad yn y cenhedlu ymysg rhai yn eu harddegau a gobeithiaf fod ein neges hysbysrwydd cyhoeddus ar hynny'n cyrraedd y nod. Er hynny, pryderaf ynghylch y cynnydd yn yr heintiadau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol ymysg dynion a menywod yn y grŵp oedran 16 i 24. Gwn nad oes raid imi ddweud wrth y Gweinidog am y niwed a'r problemau parhaus, gan gynnwys anffrwythlondeb, y gall clamidia eu hachosi, a gofynaf iddo, fel y gwneuthum o'r blaen, gynnwys y prawf clamidia syml ym mhrawf ceg y groth ar gyfer menywod yn y grŵp oedran hwn sy'n cael cyfathrach rywiol.

Yn yr un modd, mae cael dafadennau rheffroledol yn rhywbeth sy'n peri gofid. Ni ellir eu gwella ac eto maent yn dod yn fwyfwy cyffredin, a dengys hynny nad yw ein rhaglenni atal ac iechyd rhywiol yn cyrraedd y rhai y mae angen inni eu cyrraedd. Byddaf yn siarad â phobl ifanc, gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol a gweithwyr ieuenctid ac mae arnaf ofn nad yw ein neges yn cyrraedd y nod.

Kirsty Williams: Croesawaf eich sylwadau ynghylch iechyd rhywiol. A ydych yn cytuno nad rhai yn eu harddegau yw'r unig rai y dylem gyfleu negeseuon am iechyd rhywiol iddynt a bod rhaid inni ystyried categorïau fel rhai sy'n sengl o'r newydd yn eu 40au a'u 50au nad ydynt efallai wedi clywed negeseuon yn hybu iechyd rhywiol ers blynyddoedd lawer ond sydd bellach, o bosibl, yn eu cael eu hunain mewn mwy o berygl nag o'r blaen?

Janice Gregory: Cytunaf â sylwadau Kirsty. Nid oes amheuaeth nad oedd rhai yn fy nghenedlaeth i'n benodol wedi cael un neges pan oeddent yn eu harddegau hwyr a dechrau eu 20au, pan oeddent mewn perthynas sefydlog, o bosibl, ond, os ydynt

now coming out of that, we need to give these people the same message.

4.40 p.m.

This message also needs to be conveyed in schools. I am given to understand that, in many local education authorities, sexual health matters are only given one hour per term. I find that unacceptable as our teenagers are capable of being given more information in school. I am the mother of two daughters and think that teenagers will take most notice in school and in our youth centres. That is where we need to concentrate the information that is given to our young people. I agree with Val Lloyd that the school nurse has a real role to play, as do well-informed teachers. I would hope, therefore, that we will see a decrease in the incidence of STIs.

Minister, I ask that you have discussions with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, Jane Davidson, and look at the issue concerning an hour per term, if that is a correct assessment, as I am given to understand. Our young people should have appropriate information and discussions in school. I ask again for consideration to be given to including the chlamydia test in the cervical smear test.

Eleanor Burnham: I would also like to wish Ruth Hall well because she was our community doctor when I used to take my children to the local community centre, and she was absolutely brilliant.

Although the Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome the chief medical officer's report, we are dismayed by the picture that it paints. Like many other Members this afternoon, I will comment on sexual health. The report shows that sexually transmitted infections occur most frequently among people aged under 25, and the numbers diagnosed with chlamydia continue to rise alarmingly. The numbers have doubled in the last decade and it is now the most common female STI, with the prevalence of undiagnosed chlamydia infection believed to be extremely high, often leading to infertility. Recent rises in the incidence of gonorrhoea are believed to

yn sengl eto, rhaid inni roi'r un neges i'r bobl hynny.

Mae angen cyfleu'r neges hon mewn ysgolion hefyd. Yn ôl a ddeallaf, dim ond un awr y tymor a neilltuir ar gyfer materion sy'n ymwneud ag iechyd rhywiol mewn rhai awdurdodau addysg lleol. Mae hynny'n annerbiniol yn fy marn i gan y gellir rhoi mwy o wybodaeth i rai yn eu harddegau yn yr ysgol. Yr wyf yn fam i ddwy o ferched a chredaf y bydd rhai yn eu harddegau'n cymryd y sylw mwyaf yn yr ysgol ac mewn canolfannau ieuencid. Yn y manau hynny y dylem gynnig y rhan fwyaf o'r wybodaeth i bobl ifanc. Cytunaf â Val Lloyd fod rôl bwysig i'r nyrs ysgol, ac athrawon gwybodus. Gobeithiaf, felly, y gwelwn ostyngiad yn amllder yr achosion o heintiadau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol.

Weinidog, gofynnaf ichi gael trafodaethau â'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, Jane Davidson, ac ystyried y mater sy'n ymwneud â'r un awr y tymor, os yw hynny'n asesiad teg, fel yr wyf wedi cael ar ddeall. Dylai ein pobl ifanc gael gwybodaeth a thrafodaethau priodol yn yr ysgol. Gofynnaf eto ichi ystyried cynnwys y prawf clamydia ym mhrawf ceg y groth.

Eleanor Burnham: Carwn innau ddymuno'n dda i Ruth Hall gan mai hi oedd ein meddyg cymunedol pan arferwn fynd â'm plant i'r ganolfan gymunedol leol, ac yr oedd yn wych.

Er bod Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n croesawu adroddiad y prif swyddog meddygol, gresynwn at y darlun a gyfleir ganddo. Fel sawl Aelod arall y prynhawn yma, yr wyf am sôn am iechyd rhywiol. Dengys yr adroddiad fod heintiadau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol yn digwydd amlaf ymysg rhai o dan 25 oed, ac mae'r nifer y canfyddir bod clamydia arnynt yn dal i godi'n frawychus. Mae'r niferoedd wedi dyblu yn y degawd diwethaf a hwnnw bellach yw'r haint mwyaf cyffredin a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol ymysg menywod, a chredir bod yr achosion o heintiadau clamydia sydd heb eu canfod yn niferus dros

reflect an increase in less safe sexual behaviour—the rate is three times as high as it was in 1995—and the cases of diagnosed HIV continue to rise and predominantly affect young adults, with 900 reported as diagnosed with HIV by the end of June 2004.

Sexual health is a major area of concern. Britain has a higher rate of teenage pregnancy than any other developed nation except the USA. Whether it is through improved education or communication strategies, as has been discussed, young people must be made more aware of the risks of sexually transmitted diseases. My small experience of working with disaffected 14 to 16-year-olds was quite alarming. Many of them had had abortions, sometimes twice or three times, and I believe that we need to have more appropriate cool messages, whether we like it or not. Youngsters often feel that the messages should come from their peers—well-informed and possibly trained peers—as opposed to grown ups.

The Liberal Democrats believe that we must develop a much more adequate and better funded national service framework for sexual-health promotion, screening and treatment services. We must also improve access to sexual health through the genito-urinary clinics, the services that they provide and the premises in which they are provided. Many youngsters tell me that there is a long wait for some of these vital services. Improving services for people with HIV is essential, including the development of self-care programmes. It is important that we target sexually appropriate health messages in the media at key groups, be they teenagers or, as Kirsty mentioned, the newly single in their 30s, 40s, 50s, or whatever age.

We further believe that we must deliver more

ben, ac mae'r rhain yn arwain yn aml at anffrwythlondeb. Credir bod y cynnydd diweddar yn nifer yr achosion o hadlif yn adlewyrchu cynnydd mewn ymddygiad rhywiol llai diogel—mae'r gyfradd yn dair gwaith yn uwch nag yr oedd yn 1995—ac mae'r achosion o HIV a ganfuwyd yn dal i godi ac yn effeithio'n bennaf ar oedolion ifanc, a, hyd at ddiwedd Mehefin 2004, adroddwyd bod 900 y canfuwyd bod HIV arnynt.

Mae iechyd rhywiol yn faes sy'n peri pryder mawr. Ym Mhrydain y mae'r gyfradd uchaf o feichiogi ymysg rhai yn eu harddegau o'r holl wledydd datblygedig heblaw UDA. Pa un a wneir hyn drwy well addysg neu strategaethau cyfathrebu, fel y trafodwyd, rhaid peri i bobl ifanc fod yn fwy ymwybodol o beryglon clefydau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol. Yr oedd yr ychydig brofiad a gefais a weithio gyda rhai 14 i 16 oed sydd wedi dadrithio'n eithaf brawychus. Yr oedd llawer ohonynt wedi cael erthyliaidau, ddwywaith neu dair mewn rhai achosion, a chredaf fod rhaid inni gael negeseuon mwy deniadol a phriodol, pa un a ydym yn hoffi hynny ai peidio. Mae pobl ifanc yn teimlo'n aml y dylai'r negeseuon ddod oddi wrth eu cyfoedion—rhai gwybodus sydd wedi'u hyfforddi, o bosibl—yn hytrach nag oedolion.

Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn credu bod rhaid inni ddatblygu fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol llawer mwy digonol sydd wedi'i ariannu'n dda i hybu iechyd rhywiol a gwasanaethau trin. Rhaid inni wella'r mynediad i iechyd rhywiol hefyd drwy'r clinigau cenedlol-wrinol, y gwasanaethau a ddarparant a'r adeiladau lle y'u darperir. Dywed llawer o bobl ifanc wrthyf fod rhaid aros yn hir i gael rhai o'r gwasanaethau hanfodol hyn. Mae'n hollbwysig gwella gwasanaethau ar gyfer rhai sydd â HIV, gan gynnwys datblygu rhaglenni hunanofal. Mae'n bwysig inni gyfeirio negeseuon rhywiol briodol am iechyd yn y cyfryngau at grwpiau allweddol, boed hwy'n rhai yn eu harddegau neu, fel y dywedodd Kirsty, yn rhai sy'n sengl o'r newydd yn eu 30au, eu 40au, eu 50au, neu ba bynnag oedran.

Credwn ymhellach fod rhaid inni ddarparu

appropriate sex education. We must accelerate the roll-out of national chlamydia screening, as has been alluded to. We must give a much higher priority to contraceptive services, make advice on the full range of options available in GP surgeries, ensure the provision of free condoms in surgeries and from other sexual health service providers, and improve access to emergency contraception, including in a pharmacy setting. We have discussed this on many occasions. Pharmacies and pharmacists are qualified and are close to the people who need their help.

As the CMO's report highlights, many of us are still not undertaking enough physical activity, with women doing less than men, and older people doing less than younger people. Exercise is a vital part of our life, and taking responsibility for it is a key element. Falling exercise levels arise from an increase in sedentary occupations—we are proponents of that; I know that I do not exercise enough—expansion of car ownership and the lack of facilities for exercise. The Welsh Assembly Government has helped with the free swimming scheme, which we have discussed ad infinitum, but there is a lack of facilities for many people, particularly in rural areas. We need to tackle that and place more focus than ever on walking and cycling. Many cycling routes are being developed but they are often half a mile or a mile long at most—where do they go to?

We must ensure that there are mandatory hours of exercise or sport in the curriculum. Not everybody is able to participate in a sport, but the exercise element needs to be there. We need a firmer, long-term strategy to ensure that, in planning the development of our communities, more opportunities for cycling, particularly, are used and integrated at the design stage of public transport as well as in other designs.

Jeff Cuthbert: One of the biggest challenges facing Wales is the rising tide of ill health and obesity. Everything a country can hope to achieve depends on the health and fitness

addysg rhyw fwy priodol. Rhaid inni roi'r gwasanaethau sgrinio clamydia ar waith yn gyflymach ledled y wlad, fel y clywsom. Rhaid inni roi blaenoriaeth lawer uwch i wasanaethau atal cenhedlu, cynnig cyngor ar yr holl ddewisiadau sydd ar gael ym meddygfeydd meddygon teulu, a sicrhau bod condomau ar gael am ddim mewn meddygfeydd ac oddi wrth eraill sy'n darparu gwasanaethau iechyd rhywiol, a gwella mynediad i atal cenhedlu brys, gan ddefnyddio fferyllfeydd. Yr ydym wedi trafod hyn lawer gwaith. Mae fferyllfeydd a fferyllwyr yn gymwys ac maent yn agos at y rhai y mae arnynt angen cymorth ganddynt.

Fel y dengys adroddiad y prif swyddog meddygol, mae dal llawer ohonom ddim yn ymgymryd â digon o weithgarwch corfforol, ac mae menywod yn gwneud llai na dynion, a phobl hŷn yn gwneud llai na phobl iau. Mae ymarfer corff yn rhan hanfodol o'n bywyd, ac mae'n hollbwysig inni fod yn gyfrifol yn hyn o beth. Mae'r gostyngiad yn lefelau ymarfer yn deillio o gynnydd yn nifer y swyddi eisteddog—yr ydym yn hyrwyddo hynny; gwn nad wyf yn ymarfer ddigon—diffyg cyfleusterau ar gyfer ymarfer, a'r ffaith bod mwy o bobl yn berchen ar geir. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi helpu drwy'r cynllun nofio am ddim, a drafodwyd gennym yn ddiddiwedd, ond mae llawer sydd heb gyfleusterau digonol, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â hynny a rhoi mwy o bwyslais nag erioed ar gerdded a seiclo. Datblygir llawer o lwybrau seiclo ond maent yn aml yn hanner milltir neu'n filltir o hyd ar y mwyaf—i ble y maent yn mynd?

Rhaid inni sicrhau y ceir oriau ymarfer gorfodol neu chwaraeon yn y cwricwlwm. Nid yw pawb yn gallu cymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon, ond rhaid cael elfen o ymarfer. Rhaid wrth strategaeth hirdymor gadarnach er mwyn sicrhau, wrth gynllunio datblygiad ein cymunedau, y ceir mwy o gyfleoedd i seiclo, yn benodol, a'u bod wedi'u cynnwys mewn cynlluniau ar gyfer trafniadaeth gyhoeddus ac mewn cynlluniau eraill hefyd.

Jeff Cuthbert: Un o'r heriau mwyaf sy'n wynebu Cymru yw'r cynnydd mewn afiechyd a gordewdra. Mae popeth y gall gwlad obeithio ei gyflawni'n dibynnu ar

of its population and, today, we face an unparalleled demographic shift in terms of a rise in the elderly population combined with growing childhood obesity. Our new generation could be the first for generations to have a life expectancy that is shorter than that of its parents.

In my constituency, 15 per cent of the population report their health as not good. Over 26 per cent have a limiting, long-term illness, and mortality rates in Caerphilly are among the highest in Wales. There is a long trend of ill health in our communities, but, through initiatives such as Health Challenge Wales, we can help to reverse that trend. We, as representatives, have a duty to facilitate and encourage young people and adults to adopt healthier lifestyles. Only by focusing on that can we seek to turn the tide of inherent ill health that is blighting our communities. No matter how much money we plough into the NHS in Wales, much can be achieved by taking preventative steps now that will enable our young people to make the most of their lives and not be blighted by conditions such as diabetes, heart disease and asthma.

We are not talking about major changes to a person's way of life. Simply using the stairs instead of the lift or escalator can make a big difference to someone's long-term health. At present, only 30 per cent of Wales's adult population meets the recommended level of activity, which is 30 minutes a day of moderate exercise. It is much worse in the case of women, with only 24 per cent undertaking this basic level of activity. Our young people are in the same situation, or worse, with only 39 per cent of boys, and a worryingly low 18 per cent of girls, taking part in one hour of moderate exercise.

Simple actions such as stopping smoking and cutting down on fatty foods and alcohol can have long-term benefits, but the key message is that any activity, whatever it may be, is better than none at all. Existing action, new action, big steps or small steps all improve health and help to ward off the big killers such as heart disease, type 2 diabetes and

iechyd a ffitrwydd ei phobl a, heddiw, wynebwn newid demograffig digyffelyb o ran cynnydd yn nifer yr henoed ynghyd â gordewdra cynyddol ymysg plant. Mae'n bosibl mai ein cenhedlaeth newydd fydd y gyntaf ers cenedlaethau i fod â disgwyliad einioes sy'n fyrrach nag un ei rhieni.

Yn fy etholaeth i, mae 15 y cant o'r boblogaeth yn datgan nad yw eu hiechyd yn dda. Mae mwy na 26 y cant o'r bobl â salwch cyfyngol hirdymor, ac mae cyfraddau marwolaethau yng Nghaerffili ymysg yr uchaf yng Nghymru. Mae traddodiad o iechyd gwael yn ein cymunedau, ond, drwy fentrau fel Her Iechyd Cymru, gallwn helpu i wrthdroi'r traddodiad hwnnw. Yr ydym ni, fel cynrychiolwyr, o dan ddyletswydd i hwyluso ac i annog pobl ifanc ac oedolion i fabwysiadu ffyrdd o fyw iachach. Dim ond drwy ganolbwyntio ar hynny y gallwn geisio troi'r llanw o iechyd gwael cynhenid sy'n andwyo ein cymunedau. Ni waeth pa faint o arian a fuddsoddwn yn y GIG yng Nghymru, mae llawer y gellir ei gyflawni drwy gymryd camau ataliol yn awr a fydd yn galluogi ein pobl ifanc i fyw bywyd llawn a pheidio â chael eu handwyo gan anhwylderau fel diabetes, clefyd y galon ac asthma.

Nid ydym yn sôn am newidiadau mawr ym mywyd rhywun. Gall rhywun weld gwahaniaeth mawr yn ei iechyd hirdymor dim ond drwy ddefnyddio'r grisiau yn lle lifft neu risiau symudol. Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond 30 y cant o oedolion yng Nghymru sy'n cyflawni'r gweithgarwch a argymhellir, sef 30 munud y dydd o ymarfer cymedrol. Mae'n waeth o lawer yn achos menywod, gan mai dim ond 24 y cant ohonynt sy'n ymgymryd â gweithgarwch ar y lefel sylfaenol hon. Mae ein pobl ifanc yn yr un sefyllfa, neu sefyllfa waeth, gan mai dim ond 39 y cant o fechgyn, a 18 y cant o ferched, sy'n ffigur poenus o isel, a gymer ran mewn ymarfer cymedrol am un awr.

Gellir cael buddion tymor hir o gamau syml fel rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu a bwyta llai o fwydydd brasterog ac yfed llai o alcohol, ond y brif neges yw bod unrhyw weithgarwch, beth bynnag y bo, yn well na dim o gwbl. Mae camau a gymerir yn awr ac yn y dyfodol, camau mawr neu gamau bach, i gyd yn gwella iechyd ac yn helpu i atal prif

breast and colon cancer. Thirty minutes of any sort of activity, five days a week, can return such benefits.

As chair of the all-party group for healthy living in the Assembly, I am aware of how hard the group has been working, together with Health Challenge Wales, to raise the profile of the need for lifestyle changes. That culminated in the Assembly's first healthy living day on 2 February. Many Assembly Members took part and it gave a strong message to the people of Wales that Assembly Members were serious about the need for health improvements and that adopting healthier lifestyles could be fun, exciting and relaxing. Members should be aware that moves are afoot to make the healthy living day an annual occurrence. The message is clear—healthy lifestyles is an issue for all parties and all people and we, as Assembly Members, have a duty to our constituents to get behind that message and support initiatives that will encourage young and old to get active.

4.50 p.m.

Lisa Francis: The report states that sexually transmitted infections are increasing, with rates highest in people under the age of 25 and, as many Members have already outlined, this includes rising numbers of HIV cases, with an increasing proportion becoming infected through heterosexual sex. In response to written questions that I have asked you, Minister, you stated that the strategic framework for promoting sexual health was launched in 2000 and was aimed at improving the sexual health of the population by ensuring that people have access to better sexual health information. What evaluation has been done regarding the effectiveness of recent publicity campaigns? As we have also heard today, sexual health is still regarded by many as a taboo subject, which causes much embarrassment. There are still huge barriers to overcome for people who need access to these particular services.

achosion marwolaeth fel clefyd y galon, diabetes math 2 a chanser y fron a'r coluddyn mawr. Mae 30 munud o weithgarwch o unrhyw fath, pum niwrnod yr wythnos, yn gallu dod â buddion o'r fath.

Fel cadeirydd y grŵp trawsbleidiol ar fyw'n iach yn y Cynulliad, gwn pa mor galed y mae'r grŵp wedi gweithio, ar y cyd â Her Iechyd Cymru, i dynnu sylw at yr angen am newidiadau i ffyrdd o fyw. Arweiniodd hynny at ddiwrnod byw'n iach cyntaf y Cynulliad ar 2 Chwefror. Cymerodd llawer o Aelodau'r Cynulliad ran, a dangosodd hynny'n glir i bobl Cymru fod Aelodau'r Cynulliad o ddifrif ynghylch yr angen i wella iechyd ac yn credu bod mabwysiadu ffyrdd o fyw iachach yn fodd i ymlacio a phrofi hwyl a chyffro. Dywedaf wrth Aelodau fod camau wedi'u cymryd i wneud y diwrnod byw'n iach yn ddigwyddiad blynyddol. Mae'r neges yn glir—mae ffyrdd o fyw iach yn fater i bob plaid a pherson, ac mae gennym ni fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad, ddyletswydd tuag at ein hetholwyr i ategu'r neges honno a chefnogi mentrau a fydd yn cymell yr hen a'r ifanc i ymarfer.

Lisa Francis: Dywed yr adroddiad fod heintiadau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol ar gynydd, a bod y cyfraddau ar eu huchaf ymysg rhai dan 25 oed ac, fel y mae sawl Aelod wedi nodi eisoes, mae hyn yn cynnwys nifer cynyddol o achosion o HIV, y mae cyfran gynyddol ohonynt yn ganlyniad i heintio drwy gyfathrach wahanrywiol. Mewn ymateb i gwestiynau ysgrifenedig a ofynnais i chi, Weinidog, dywedasoch fod y fframwaith strategol ar gyfer hybu iechyd rhywiol wedi'i lansio yn 2000 ac mae ei amcan oedd gwella iechyd rhywiol y boblogaeth drwy sicrhau bod gwell gwybodaeth ar gael i bobl am iechyd rhywiol. Pa gamau a gymerwyd i werthuso effeithiolrwydd yr ymgyrchoedd cyhoeddusrwydd a gafwyd yn ddiweddar? Fel y clywsom heddiw, hefyd, mae llawer yn dal i weld iechyd rhywiol yn bwnc na ddylid sôn amdano, sy'n peri iddynt deimlo'n annifyr iawn. Mae rhwystrau mawr o hyd yn wynebu'r rhai y mae arnynt angen derbyn y gwasanaethau hyn.

In another written answer to me, you also stated that a service and financial framework target has been set to ensure that people have access to sexually transmitted infection testing within two working days, and you anticipate that the target will be met by March 2006. How close are you to achieving this target, and is there a need to review your priorities and the availability of access to sexual health services in Wales? As my colleague, Jonathan Morgan, outlined earlier, is it not better to focus on what is realistically achievable? Despite the creation of a national sexual health programme in 2001 to support the implementation of the strategic framework for promoting sexual health in Wales, in the last two years—and this is worrying—the table I received from you, Minister, shows that the amount of spending on sexual health has decreased by £5,000. That might not seem like a vast amount of money in the general scheme of things, but why has the amount decreased when sexual health is clearly not improving?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr wyf yn croesawu'n fawr y ffaith bod yr adroddiad hwn wedi cael ei gyhoeddi, oherwydd gall roi ffocws pwysig i'n trafodaeth ni. Yn ogystal â rhoi gwybodaeth ddefnyddiol, mae'r adroddiad yn nodi'r targedau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio'u cyrraedd. Mae'r Llywodraeth a'r prif swyddog meddygol yn cymryd risg wrth gyhoeddi'r adroddiad hwn oherwydd wrth gyhoeddi ffigurau ac ystadegau, rhaid i'r Llywodraeth nodi ei thargedau ac, yn naturiol, fe ddaw yn agored i'r feirniadaeth nad yw'n gallu cyrraedd y targedau hynny. Fel y clyswom gan nifer o siaradwyr heddiw, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi methu â chyrraedd y targedau hynny, ac mae'r gwrthbleidiau felly'n rhydd i ymosod.

I roi hynny o'r neilltu am funud, mae'r drafodaeth heddiw, ar wahân i ambell glec wleidyddol—ac mae hynny i'w ddisgwyl—wedi dangos bod Aelodau yn deall pwysigrwydd y pwnc ac yn credu bod cynnwys yr adroddiad yn gyfraniad pwysig i'r ddadl. Ategaf bwynt Rhodri Glyn Thomas ein bod wrth gwrs yn cytuno bod angen i bobl gymryd mwy o gyfrifoldeb dros eu hiechyd, a derbyniwn mai nid mater i'r

Mewn ateb ysgrifenedig arall a roesoch i mi, dywedasoch fod targed gwasanaeth a fframwaith ariannol wedi'i osod i sicrhau bod modd i bobl gael profion heintiadau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol o fewn dau ddiwrnod gwaith, a'ch bod yn rhagweld y cyrhaeddir y targed hwnnw erbyn Mawrth 2006. Pa mor agos yr ydych at gyrraedd y targed hwn, ac a oes angen adolygu'ch blaenoriaethau a argaeledd gwasanaethau iechyd rhywiol yng Nghymru? Fel y nododd fy nghyd-Aelod, Jonathan Morgan, yn gynharach, onid gwell yw canolbwyntio ar yr hyn y gellir ei gyflawni'n ymarferol? Er bod rhaglen iechyd rhywiol genedlaethol wedi'i chreu yn 2001 i ategu'r gwaith o weithredu'r fframwaith strategol ar gyfer hybu iechyd rhywiol yng Nghymru, yn y ddwy flynedd diwethaf—ac mae hyn yn peri pryder—mae'r tabl a gefais gennych, Weinidog, yn dangos bod £5,000 yn llai wedi'i wario ar iechyd rhywiol. Efallai nad yw hynny'n ymddangos yn swm mawr o arian yn nhrefn pethau, ond pam y gwariwyd llai gan ei bod yn amlwg nad yw iechyd rhywiol yn gwella?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I warmly welcome the fact that this report has been published, because it can provide an important focus for our discussion. As well as providing useful information, the report outlines the Government's targets. The Government and the chief medical officer are taking a risk in publishing this report because, if you publish figures and statistics, the Government must then set out its targets and, therefore, invites the criticism that it cannot achieve those targets. As we have heard from a number of speakers today, the Government has failed to reach those targets, and the opposition parties are therefore free to attack.

To put that to one side for a moment, today's discussion, with the exception of a little political knockabout—and that is to be expected—has shown that Members are aware of the importance of this issue and believe that the report's content has made an important contribution to the debate. To reiterate Rhodri Glyn Thomas's comments, we obviously agree that people should take more responsibility for their own health, and

Llywodraeth yn unig yw hynny, ond i feddygon a nyrsys, ac i unigolion eu hunain.

Os byddwn yn cyrraedd sefyllfa lle mae mwy o bobl yn byw yn hwy, bydd y gost i'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn cynyddu. Os edrychwch ar drefn gyllido gwasanaeth iechyd unrhyw wlad, fe welwch fod costau iechyd pum mlynedd cyntaf a 10 mlynedd olaf oes person yn llawer uwch nag yn ystod y blynyddoedd yn y canol. Mae hynny'n wir ym mha bynnag wlad yr ydych yn byw ynddi. Felly, nid gwahaniaeth barn rhwng Rhodri a'r Gweinidog neu bwy bynnag arall sy'n ceisio dadlau ydyw—mae'n ffaith syml. Mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn defnyddio'r math hwnnw o ystadegyn fel pêl-droed wleidyddol, ond yn hytrach yn derbyn y ffaith bod hyn yn wir ym mhob gwlad. Nid oes dewis hawdd yn y maes hwn. Nid ydym yn arbed arian drwy hybu iechyd, ond sicrhau bod pobl yn byw yn hwy ac yn iachach.

Yr wyf am gyfeirio at fater nas cyfeiriwyd ato hyd yma, sef y ffaith bod ystadegau damweiniau—yn arbennig ymysg pobl ifanc—yn rhyfeddol o uchel. Wrth gymharu ystadegau Ewropeaidd gyda'r hyn sy'n digwydd yng ngwledydd Prydain a Chymru, mae'n glir taw damweiniau yw prif achos marwolaeth yn aml ymysg pobl hyd at 40 neu 45 oed. Hoffwn dynnu sylw at dudalen 13, lle cydnabyddir bod damweiniau yn gyffredin iawn yn achosi marwolaeth ymysg pobl hyd at 40 oed. Fodd bynnag, ar dudalen 25, dywed yr adroddiad fod nifer y marwolaethau yn sgîl damweiniau yn gymharol fach, ac y gall amrywio o flwyddyn i flwyddyn. Mae'r gyfradd yn gymharol isel os ystyrir yr ystod oedrannau, ond mae'r gyfradd yn uchel ymysg plant a phobl ifanc. Beth yw strategaeth y Llywodraeth i geisio lleihau nifer y damweiniau sy'n digwydd?

Wrth sôn am bobl ifanc neu bobl yn eu harddegau, damweiniau ceir yw un o brif achosion marwolaeth, ond yr hyn sy'n bennaf cyfrifol am anafiadau difrifol neu farwolaeth ymysg plant yw damweiniau yn y cartref. Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn debygol o'u cymryd i geisio gostwng nifer y damweiniau sy'n digwydd? A oes ganddo

we accept that this is an issue for doctors and nurses and for individuals, not only for the Government.

If we have a situation where more people live longer, the cost to the health service will increase. If you look at how any country funds its health service, you will see that the health costs during the first five years and last 10 years of a person's life are far higher than in the years in between. This is the case wherever you may live. Therefore, this is not a difference of opinion between Rhodri and the Minister, or anyone else who may be participating in the debate—it is a simple fact. It is important that we do not use that kind of statistic as a political football, but rather accept the fact that that is the situation the world over. There is no soft option in this area. We do not save money by promoting health, but rather ensure that people live a longer and healthier life.

I will refer to an issue which has not hitherto been referred to, namely the fact that accident statistics—especially among young people—are surprisingly high. Comparing European statistics with those for the countries of Britain and Wales, it is clear that accidents are the main cause of death among people up to the age of 40 or 45. I draw your attention to page 13, where it is acknowledged that accidents are a common cause of death among people up to the age of 40. However, on page 25, it says that the number of deaths as a result of accidents is relatively low, and that it can vary from one year to the next. The rate is relatively low when the age ranges are taken into account, but it is high among children and young people. What strategy does the Government have to reduce the number of accidents that occur?

In referring to young people or teenagers, it should be noted that a high number of deaths occur as a result of car accidents, whereas serious injury or death among children are primarily caused by domestic accidents. What steps is the Minister likely to take in an attempt to reduce the number of such accidents? Can he give us any information on

wybodaeth i ni o ran sut y cyflawnir hynny erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf?

how this will be achieved by next year?

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I agree with Ieuan Wyn that this has been a good debate without much political acrimony. It has been a constructive engagement on an important issue. I agree with everyone who paid positive tributes to Ruth Hall, the chief medical officer, who is due to finish in her post. There is no doubt that she has made a massive contribution to the state of public health in Wales. It is a tribute to her professionalism that she has been able to stand above the political fray and be accepted as an authoritative speaker in her professional capacity. It is also fair to say that she is in a line of successful chief medical officers in Wales who have carried out their duty in an exemplary manner. The person who succeeds Dr Ruth Hall will face a tremendous challenge.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cytunaf ag Ieuan Wyn mai dadl dda fu hon heb lawer o ddrwgdeimlad gwleidyddol. Bu'n drafodaeth adeiladol ar bwnc pwysig. Cytunaf â phawb a dalodd deyrnged i Ruth Hall, y prif swyddog meddygol, sy'n dod i ddiwedd ei chyfnod yn y swydd. Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw wedi cyfrannu'n aruthrol at gyflwr iechyd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Teyrnged i'w phroffesiynoldeb hi yw ei bod wedi gallu sefyll uwchlaw'r ffraeo gwleidyddol a chael ei derbyn fel siaradwr awdurdodol yn rhinwedd ei swydd. Teg hefyd yw dweud ei bod mewn olyniaeth o brif swyddogion meddygol llwyddiannus yng Nghymru sydd wedi cyflawni eu dyletswydd yn rhagorol. Bydd y sawl a fydd yn olynu Dr Ruth Hall yn wynebu her aruthrol.

A tremendous number of points have been raised in the debate and, even with seven minutes left, I will not be able to respond to them all. Turning to the amendments, if they do not add something new to what there is already, there does not seem to be any point in supporting them. Some of the amendments will not add anything of substance given the content of the chief medical officer's report. We must accept the first round of targets from 1997 or so. In many ways, it was not a very inclusive process that set these targets, and there were often, if you like, desktop targets, which were not unreasonable targets in themselves. Achieving those targets would have been commendable.

Codwyd nifer fawr iawn o bwytiau yn y ddadl ac, er bod saith munud ar ôl, ni fyddaf yn gallu ymateb iddynt i gyd. Gan droi at y gwelliannau, os nad ydynt yn ychwanegu rhywbeth newydd at yr hyn sydd yno eisoes, nid yw'n ymddangos bod fawr o ddiben eu cefnogi. Mae rhai gwelliannau na fyddant yn ychwanegu dim o sylwedd yng ngolwg cynnwys adroddiad y prif swyddog meddygol. Rhaid inni dderbyn y set cyntaf o dargedau o tua 1997. Ar lawer ystyr, nid oedd y broses o bennu'r targedau hynny'n un gynhwysol iawn, a'r hyn a gafwyd yn aml, os caf ei roi fel hyn, oedd targedau a bennwyd wrth ddesg, nad oeddent yn dargedau afresymol ohonynt eu hunain. Byddai cyrraedd y targedau hynny'n dra chanmoladwy.

5.00 p.m.

One lesson that we have learned from considering the delivery of these targets is that the mechanism used for setting them needs to be reviewed, and the report deals in some detail with the new methodology that we have adopted in trying to set these new targets. They are more realistic, but, also, they have been produced as a consequence of engagement with the wide range of stakeholders who will be involved.

Un wers a ddysgasom wrth ystyried ein gallu i gyrraedd y targedau hyn yw bod angen adolygu'r dull a ddefnyddir i'w gosod, ac mae'r adroddiad yn ymdrin yn eithaf manwl â'r fethodoleg newydd yr ydym wedi'i mabwysiadu wrth geisio gosod y targedau newydd hyn. Maent yn fwy realistig, ond, hefyd, fe'u lluniwyd o ganlyniad i ymwneud â'r amrywiaeth mawr o randdeiliaid a fydd yn gysylltiedig.

Janet and Lisa asked whether or not we are setting too wide a target. The report states that we fit five key areas—children, old people, mental health, coronary heart disease, and so forth. Within those, we have tried to pick a couple of key targets that would act as good proxies to deliver in these crucial, wider areas. Therefore, that criticism is not entirely fair. We can have hundreds of targets or we can try to have several key, crucial, focused targets in the main areas of ill health.

Jonathan Morgan: Do you accept, however, that those targets are still quite broad, Minister? For example, the health inequalities target for cancer is:

‘to improve cancer mortality in all groups and at the same time aim for a more rapid improvement in the most deprived groups’.

Brian Gibbons: They are quite broad. However, the other target that is mentioned is a reduction in the overall rate of cancer across Wales. Therefore, those two targets must be linked together; it is not just the wider one, but also reducing the specific rate of cancer in Wales. They must be taken as a whole package.

Several Members referred to sexual health, and many points were well made. Janice’s point on chlamydia screening with cervical cytology is worth considering. The strategy that we are pursuing is that chlamydia screening should be part of the family-planning process, and should be integral to it. I do not know whether or not a particular advantage is to be had in linking it to cervical cytology, as opposed to the family-planning strategy that we are pursuing, but it may be worthwhile considering that, and we may ask officials to give some information on that. On your point about one hour of sexual health education per term in schools, that needs to be raised with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, and I am willing to do that.

Gofynnodd Janet a Lisa a yw’r targed yr ydym yn ei osod yn rhy fras ai peidio. Dywed yr adroddiad ein bod yn pennu pum maes allweddol—plant, hen bobl, iechyd meddwl, clefyd coronaidd y galon, ac yn y blaen. Oddi mewn i’r rhain, yr ydym wedi ceisio dewis un neu ddau o dargedau allweddol a fyddai’n dangos a ydym yn mynd â’r maen i’r wal yn y meysydd ehangach, hollbwysig hyn. Felly, nid yw’r feirniadaeth honno’n hollol deg. Gallwn gael cannoedd o dargedau neu gallwn geisio cael sawl targed penodol, hollbwysig, allweddol ym mhrif feysydd iechyd gwael.

Jonathan Morgan: A ydych yn derbyn, er hynny, fod y targedau hynny’n rhai eithaf bras o hyd, Weinidog? Er enghraifft, y targed o dan anghydraddoldebau iechyd ar gyfer cancer yw:

‘lleihau’r nifer sy’n marw o ganser ym mhob grŵp ac ar yr un pryd ymdrechu i sicrhau gwelliant cyflymach ymhlith y grwpiau mwyaf difreintiedig’.

Brian Gibbons: Maent yn eithaf bras. Er hynny, y targed arall a grybwyllir yw gostyngiad yn y gyfradd cancer gyffredinol ledled Cymru. Felly, rhaid cysylltu’r ddau darged hynny â’i gilydd; nid yr un mwy bras yn unig a geir, ond hefyd yr un penodol ar gyfer gostwng y gyfradd cancer yng Nghymru. Rhaid eu hystyried gyda’i gilydd.

Mae sawl Aelod wedi cyfeirio at iechyd rhywiol, a gwnaed sawl pwynt da. Mae’r pwynt a wnaeth Janice am sgrinio clamydia gyda sytolog serfigol yn werth ei ystyried. Y strategaeth a ddilynwn yw y dylai sgrinio clamydia fod yn rhan annatod o’r broses cynllunio teulu. Ni wn a oes mantais benodol i’w chael o’i gysylltu â sytolog serfigol, yn hytrach na’r strategaeth cynllunio teulu a ddilynwn, ond gallai fod yn fuddiol ystyried hynny, a gallem ofyn i swyddogion roi ychydig o wybodaeth am hynny. Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaethoch am un awr o addysg iechyd rhywiol y tymor mewn ysgolion, rhaid codi hynny gyda’r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, ac yr wyf yn barod i wneud hynny.

Lisa and others mentioned the money being spent on sexual health, and how it is being spent. My predecessor, Jane Hutt, made a statement in December on the future direction of sexual health services in Wales, on the basis of a major review that took place. Dr Marion Lyons has been provided with something like £0.5 million to move forward the reconfiguration of sexual health services in Wales. If you look at the Minister's statement, you will see that extra funds are being attracted into this particular area of work, rather than just the pure headline figure that you quoted.

Lisa Francis: Perhaps I did not make myself clear; I was concerned that the money appears to have gone down nationally. What implications will that have for the future of the programmes that you mention?

Brian Gibbons: You have to consider all the different initiatives, because this has been approached in several different ways, so, in addition to the reconfiguration of services, money is also available for local services, bringing together the £14 million to £15 million that is available into sexual health and family planning. Hopefully, all that will mean that there is a real increase in the resources going into it. The figures relating to chlamydia, particularly the increase in incidences of gonorrhoeal disease, are frightening. We must get cracking to try to sort that out.

Someone said that Health Challenge Wales did not have money behind it. However, well over £35 million, through various headings, is available, designed to support Health Challenge Wales as a mainstream programme. Therefore, there is a high level of commitment from the Assembly Government to deliver that.

Finally, it may be a matter of angels dancing on the head of a pin, Rhodri Glyn, but there is no doubt that, if people continue to live longer as they do now, a massive burden of ill health will be created. The challenge for us, through the older people's strategy and the wide range of other initiatives that we are implementing, is for people not to age in the same way and, hopefully, by doing that, we will see the pattern of morbidity in

Cyfeiriodd Lisa ac eraill at yr arian a warir ar iechyd rhywiol, a'r modd y caiff ei wario. Gwnaeth fy rhagflaenydd, Jane Hutt, ddatganiad ym mis Rhagfyr ar gyfeiriad gwasanaethau iechyd rhywiol yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol, ar sail adolygiad pwysig a oedd wedi'i gynnal. Rhoddwyd tua £0.5 miliwn i Dr Marion Lyons i fwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith o ad-drefnu gwasanaethau iechyd rhywiol yng Nghymru. Os darllenwch ddatganiad y Gweinidog, gwelwch fod arian ychwanegol yn mynd at y maes gwaith hwn, yn ychwanegol at y ffigur yn y pennawd y gwnaethoch ei ddyfynnu.

Lisa Francis: Efallai nad wyf wedi egluro hyn yn iawn; yr oeddwn yn pryderu am fod yr arian wedi gostwng yn genedlaethol, i bob golwg. Pa oblygiadau a fydd yn hynny i ddyfodol y rhaglenni y cyfeiriwch atynt?

Brian Gibbons: Rhaid ystyried yr holl wahanol fentrau, gan fod hyn wedi'i drin mewn sawl modd gwahanol, felly, yn ogystal â'r gwaith o ad-drefnu gwasanaethau, mae arian ar gael hefyd ar gyfer gwasanaethau lleol, ar ôl cyfuno'r £14 miliwn i £15 miliwn sydd ar gael mewn gwasanaethau iechyd rhywiol a chynllunio teulu. Gobeithio y bydd cynnydd gwirioneddol yn yr adnoddau a aiff at hynny yn sgîl yr holl bethau hyn. Mae'r ffigurau sy'n ymwneud â chlamydia, yn enwedig y cynnydd yn amllder yr achosion o hadlif, yn peri braw. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw.

Dywedodd rhywun nad oedd arian yn gefn i Her Iechyd Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae ymhell dros £35 miliwn ar gael, o dan wahanol benawdau, i gynnal Her Iechyd Cymru fel rhaglen brif ffrwd. Felly, mae ymrwymiad cryf ar ran Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyflawni hynny.

Yn olaf, efallai mai siarad yn yr awyr yw hyn, Rhodri Glyn, ond nid oes amheuaeth, os deil pobl i fyw'n hwy fel y maent yn awr, y ceir baich anferth o iechyd gwael. Yr her i ni, drwy'r strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn a'r amrywiaeth mawr o fentrau eraill yr ydym yn eu rhoi ar waith, yw peri na fydd pobl yn heneiddio yn yr un modd a, gobeithio, drwy wneud hynny, y gwelwn batrwm lle y caiff afiachusrwydd ei gywasgu. Er hynny, rhaid

compression. However, we must recognise that, as our health services improve, there will be many instances in which expenditure will increase. If we have better coronary heart disease risk-factor identification, we will have to pay for more angiograms and heart bypass surgery. If we have better diabetes investigation, we will have more eye screening, and renal disease will be fixed up. There is, therefore, a cost to providing better health. I thank everyone for their positive engagement in this important debate.

inni gydnabod y ceir sawl enghraifft, wrth i'n gwasanaethau iechyd fynd yn well, lle y bydd mwy o wariant. Os gallwn ganfod yn well y ffactorau sy'n creu perygl o glefyd coronaidd y galon, bydd yn rhaid inni dalu am ragor o angiogramau a llawdriniaethau dargyfeiriol ar y galon. Os cawn well ymchwil i ddiabetes, cawn ragor o brofion ar y golwg, a gellir gwella clefydau arenol. Gan hynny, mae cost ynghlwm wrth wella iechyd. Diolchaf i bawb am gymryd rhan yn gadarnhaol yn y ddadl bwysig hon.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.

Amendment 1: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

Gwelliant 2: O blaid 9, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 39.

Amendment: For 9, Abstain 5, Against 39.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Davies, Jocelyn
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun

Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Brynle

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick
Burnham, Eleanor
German, Michael
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 3: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John

Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 15, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 4: For 15, Abstain 9, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, David
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Lloyd, David
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 20, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 32.
 Amendment 5: For 20, Abstain 1, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, Jocelyn
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
 The following Member abstained:

Davies, David

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 6, Ymatal 18, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 6: For 6, Abstain 18, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 German, Michael

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine

Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.

Cynnig (NDM2299): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2299): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff

Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

5.10 p.m.

**Pumed Adroddiad Blynyddol Cydraddoldeb y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol
 The National Assembly's Fifth Equality Annual Report**

Gwenda Thomas: Cynigiaf fod

Gwenda Thomas: I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.6, yn nodi pumed adroddiad blynyddol cydraddoldeb y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol: 'Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru: Trefniadau i Hyrwyddo Cyfle Cyfartal—Blwyddyn Ariannol 2003-04', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 6.6, notes the National Assembly's fifth equality annual report: 'National Assembly for Wales: Arrangements to Promote Equality of Opportunity—Financial Year 2003-04', which was laid in the Table Office and e-

Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 15 Chwefror 2005. (NDM2300)

I welcome the fact that the Panel of Chairs will be discussing proposals this afternoon to protect Plenary time for discussing committee reports.

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn i'r Cynulliad heddiw; mae'n amlinellu'r camau a gymerwyd gan y Cynulliad i gyflawni ei ddyletswydd i hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal i bawb. Hwn yw'r adroddiad llawn cyntaf ar waith y pwyllgor yn yr ail Gynulliad. Mae'r ddyletswydd i hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal, a nodir yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn rhan bwysig o'r weledigaeth ar gyfer llywodraeth ddatganoledig yng Nghymru. Bu gwaith y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yn allweddol o ran cyflawni'r ddyletswydd honno.

Mae'r adroddiad yn cwmpasu blwyddyn ariannol 2003-04. Mae rhan gyntaf yr adroddiad yn ymwneud â gwaith y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, ac mae'r ail ran yn ymwneud â gwaith Swyddfa'r Llywydd, a elwir bellach yn Wasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad. Mae'r rhan olaf, sy'n ffurfio trwch yr adroddiad, yn amlinellu gwaith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Carwn ddiolch yn fawr i wahoddedigion sefydlog y pwyllgor am eu cyfraniad, sef y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol, y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd, y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal, Stonewall Cymru a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Bu eu cyfraniad at waith y pwyllgor drwy gydol y flwyddyn yn amhrisiadwy. Carwn ddiolch hefyd i'r unigolion a'r sefydliadau eraill sydd wedi rhoi o'u hamser i roi cyngor a thystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor.

Yn olaf, carwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog, Edwina Hart, a oedd yn gyfrifol am faterion cyfle cyfartal ar ran y Cabinet tan yn ddiweddar. Yr wyf fi, a gweddill y pwyllgor yr wyf yn siŵr, yn ddiolchgar iawn am ei chefnogaeth ac am ei hymrwymiad at waith y pwyllgor. Edrychaf ymlaen at gydweithio â Jane Hutt, y Gweinidog newydd â chyfrifoldeb dros gyfle cyfartal, a gwn ei bod yn benderfynol o barhau â gwaith da Edwina er mwyn rhoi'r agenda gydraddoldeb ar

mailed to Assembly Members on 15 February 2005. (NDM2300)

Croesawaf y ffaith y bydd Panel y Cadeiryddion yn trafod cynigion y prynhawn yma i gadw amser yn y Cyfarfod Llawn i drafod adroddiadau pwyllgorau.

I am delighted to present this report to the Assembly today; it outlines the steps taken by the Assembly in fulfilling its duty to promote equality of opportunity for all. This is the first full report on the committee's work in the second Assembly. The duty to promote equality of opportunity, which is set out in the Government of Wales Act 1998, is a key aspect of the vision for devolved government in Wales. The work of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity has been vital in fulfilling that duty.

The report covers the financial year 2003-04. The first part of the report deals with the work of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, and the second part covers the work of the Presiding Office, now called the Assembly Parliamentary Service. The final part, which makes up the bulk of the report, outlines the Assembly Government's work.

I wish to thank the committee's standing invitees for their contribution, namely the Commission for Racial Equality, the Disability Rights Commission, the Equal Opportunities Commission, Stonewall Cymru and the Welsh Language Board. Their contribution to the committee's work throughout the year has been invaluable. I also wish to thank the other individuals and organisations that have given of their time to provide advice and evidence to the committee.

Finally, I wish to thank the Minister, Edwina Hart, who, until recently, was the Cabinet Minister responsible for equality of opportunity issues. I, and the rest of the committee I am sure, are most appreciative of her support and commitment to the committee's work. I look forward to working with Jane Hutt, the new Minister responsible for equality of opportunity, who I know is determined to continue Edwina's good work in implementing the equality agenda.

waith.

The committee considered a wide range of issues in 2003-04, including matters relating to the Assembly's internal processes, the operation of organisations under the Assembly's remit, and issues relating to the wider community in Wales. I will take this opportunity to draw attention to some of the key areas that the committee considered and, hopefully, set out how we are taking them forward.

The previous Committee on Equality of Opportunity conducted a review of service provision for Gypsies and travellers. That report was laid before the Assembly just prior to the Assembly election. The Assembly Government's response was subsequently received, and the committee set up a working group to monitor its implementation. I can assure the Assembly that that group continues to be assiduous in its task.

As its first policy review in the second Assembly, the committee identified the need to assess how successful the Assembly was in terms of mainstreaming equality. Consultations and evidence gathering began in the summer of 2003, and continued throughout the year. As you will know, the committee's report has now been published, and the Government's responses received. That, however, will be a matter for next year's report.

The year 2003 was European Year of Disabled People and I am pleased to say that the committee was able to play a small part in promoting events to celebrate it in Wales. We also heard from some of the young people involved in organising the First International Congress of Young Disabled People, which was held in Swansea. Plans to follow up issues identified by the young people as priorities for improving their lives are well under way. Again, that is a matter for next year's report.

The committee responded to the UK consultations on a framework for the legal recognition of same-sex couples, and on the implementation of the European employment directive against ageism. It held discussions

Ystyriodd y pwyllgor amrywiaeth mawr o bynciau yn 2003-04, gan gynnwys materion a oedd yn ymwneud â phrosesau mewnol y Cynulliad, gwaith cyrff sy'n atebol i'r Cynulliad, a materion sy'n ymwneud â'r gymuned ehangach yng Nghymru. Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i dynnu sylw at rai o'r prif feysydd a ystyriwyd gan y pwyllgor gan nodi, gobeithio, sut yr ydym yn ymdrin â hwy.

Cynhaliodd y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal blaenorol adolygiad o'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir ar gyfer Sipsiwn a theithwyr. Gosodwyd yr adroddiad hwnnw gerbron y Cynulliad ychydig cyn etholiad y Cynulliad. Cafwyd ymateb gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad wedyn, a sefydlodd y pwyllgor weithgor i gadw golwg ar y gweithredu arno. Gallaf sicrhau'r Cynulliad fod y grŵp hwnnw'n dal i gyflawni ei orchwyl yn selog.

Ar gyfer ei adolygiad polisi cyntaf yn yr ail Gynulliad, canfu'r pwyllgor yr angen i asesu pa mor llwyddiannus y bu'r Cynulliad wrth brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb. Dechreuwyd ymgynghori a chasglu tystiolaeth yn haf 2003, gan barhau â hynny drwy'r flwyddyn. Fel y gwyddoch, mae adroddiad y pwyllgor wedi'i gyhoeddi bellach, a chafwyd ymatebion gan y Llywodraeth. Bydd hynny'n fater i adroddiad y flwyddyn nesaf, fodd bynnag.

Yr oedd 2003 yn Flwyddyn Ewropeaidd Pobl Anabl ac yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod y pwyllgor wedi gallu chwarae rhan fach wrth hyrwyddo digwyddiadau i'w dathlu yng Nghymru. Clywsom hefyd gan rai o'r bobl ifanc a fu â rhan mewn trefnu Cyngres Ryngwladol Gyntaf Pobl Anabl Ifanc, a gynhaliwyd yn Abertawe. Mae cynlluniau i ymdrin â phynciau a nodwyd fel blaenoriaethau gan y bobl ifanc yn mynd rhagddynt yn dda. Unwaith eto, mae hynny'n fater i adroddiad y flwyddyn nesaf.

Ymatebodd y pwyllgor i'r ymgynghoriadau yn y DU ar fframwaith ar gyfer cydnabod cyplau o'r un rhyw o dan y gyfraith, ac ar weithredu'r gyfarwyddeb cyflogaeth Ewropeaidd yn erbyn oedraniaeth.

with the Welsh Local Government Association about its equality unit's annual report, and considered an early draft of the National Assembly for Wales's race equality scheme. It is disappointing that that early draft was not up to standard, as it meant that precious time was lost in developing that important tool in pushing the equality agenda forward. I am glad to say that problems with the Assembly's race equality scheme now seem to be behind us. I look forward to the results that I am sure will accrue from the revised scheme.

In terms of our future work, we have identified a number of key issues to focus on: the implementation of the responses to the 'Mainstreaming Equality' report, follow-up work on the review of service provision for Gypsies and travellers, our new policy review on access to services for young disabled people, increasing diversity in public appointments and in local government, the implications of a single equality body, and asylum issues. The committee has also considered the annual reports of the Commission for Racial Equality, the Disability Rights Commission, and the Equal Opportunities Commission. The key themes from each of the commissions' reports are included in the committee's annual report.

In considering the annual report of the Welsh Assembly Government, the committee was pleased to receive the assurances of the Minister and the Permanent Secretary that future reports would not merely produce a list of activities, but would report on the outcomes, both expected and achieved. The intention to consider a fuller audit of equality activity, together with a report on the basis of measuring equality and outcomes against clear objectives and inputs, is welcomed.

Whereas the current report is an improvement on what has gone before, there remains a lack of consistency of reporting

Cynhaliodd drafodaethau â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru am adroddiad blynyddol ei huned gydraddoldeb, ac ystyriodd ddrafft cynnar o gynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Testun siom yw nad oedd y drafft cynnar hwnnw'n foddhaol, oherwydd collwyd amser yn sgîl hynny wrth ddatblygu'r arf pwysig hwnnw i hyrwyddo'r agenda gydraddoldeb. Mae'n dda gennyf ddweud bod y problemau a fu ynglŷn â chynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol y Cynulliad wedi'u datrys, i bob golwg. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld y canlyniadau a geir, yr wyf yn siŵr, o'r cynllun diwygiedig.

O ran ein gwaith yn y dyfodol, yr ydym wedi nodi sawl pwnc allweddol y byddwn yn canolbwyntio arnynt: rhoi ar waith yr ymatebion i'r adroddiad 'Prif Ffrydio Cydraddoldeb', gwaith dilynol ar yr adolygiad o'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir ar gyfer Sipsiwn a theithwyr, ein hadolygiad polisi newydd ar fynediad i wasanaethau ar gyfer pobl anabl ifanc, cael mwy o amrywiaeth mewn penodiadau cyhoeddus ac mewn llywodraeth leol, y goblygiadau o gael un corff cydraddoldeb, a materion sy'n ymwneud â lloches. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae'r pwyllgor wedi ystyried adroddiadau blynyddol y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol, y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd, a'r Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal. Mae'r themâu allweddol yn adroddiadau pob un o'r comisiynau wedi'u cynnwys yn adroddiad blynyddol y pwyllgor.

Wrth ystyried adroddiad blynyddol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yr oedd y pwyllgor yn falch o gael sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog a'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol nad rhestr o weithgareddau'n unig a geid mewn adroddiadau yn y dyfodol, ac y ceid adroddiad ar y canlyniadau, y rhai a ddisgwyliwyd a'r rhai a gafwyd. Croesewir y bwriad i ystyried cael archwiliad llawnach o weithgareddau sy'n ymwneud â chydaddoldeb, ynghyd ag adroddiad ar y sail ar gyfer mesur cydraddoldeb a chanlyniadau yn ôl amcanion a mewnbynnau clir.

Er bod yr adroddiad cyfredol yn well na'r hyn a gafwyd o'r blaen, mae diffyg cysondeb o hyd o ran adrodd rhwng is-adrannau polisi

across Welsh Assembly Government policy divisions, and there are distinct gaps in the information provided. In many respects, the report undersells the Government's achievements. For example, Ministers had reported a lot of activity in implementing the committee's recommendations regarding Gypsies and travellers, but these are not reflected in the report. As members of the committee pointed out, the extensive economic development and transport portfolio is a key element in delivering equality, and they would have liked to see more activity reported in this area.

This report has been presented jointly by the Minister and the Permanent Secretary. When it was considered at committee, concern was expressed about mixing the reporting of matters for which Ministers are politically accountable and the reporting of administrative and staffing issues. I am glad to say that total agreement was reached that future reports will include a report on Assembly Government policy, signed off by the Minister responsible for equality, and a separate report from the Permanent Secretary on staffing issues. I am grateful to all concerned that we were able to reach this agreement.

I know that members of the committee and the Minister are in accord that the Welsh Assembly Government part of this report can be improved with the introduction of clear objectives and outputs. I hope to see such changes in place next year. In the longer term, it is hoped that these objectives will be based on a clear mainstreaming equality strategy, to be developed as part of the response to the committee's report, 'Mainstreaming Equality'. In the meantime, I commend this report to you and hope that we will have an interesting debate on it and on the wider issues of equality of opportunity. The Business Minister and I will respond jointly to the debate; I will pick up points relating to the work of the committee and the Minister will respond to issues raised about the work of the Assembly Government.

5.20 p.m.

Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ac mae bylchau amlwg yn y wybodaeth a ddarparwyd. Ar lawer ystyr, mae'r adroddiad yn canmol rhy ychydig ar gyflawniadau'r Llywodraeth. Er enghraifft, yr oedd Gweinidogion wedi adrodd ar lawer o weithgareddau wrth roi ar waith argymhellion y pwyllgor ynghylch Sipsiwn a theithwyr, ond ni sonnir amdanynt yn yr adroddiad. Fel y nododd aelodau'r pwyllgor, mae'r portffolio datblygu economaidd a thrafnidiaeth, sy'n un helaeth, yn elfen allweddol wrth sicrhau cydraddoldeb, a byddent wedi hoffi gweld adrodd ar fwy o weithgareddau yn y maes hwn.

Cyflwynwyd yr adroddiad hwn ar y cyd gan y Gweinidog a'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol. Pan ystyriwyd ef yn y pwyllgor, mynegwyd pryder ynghylch y modd y cymysgwyd yr adrodd ar faterion y mae Gweinidogion yn wleidyddol atebol amdanynt a'r adrodd ar faterion gweinyddol a rhai sy'n ymwneud â staff. Mae'n dda gennyf ddweud bod pawb wedi cytuno y bydd adroddiadau yn y dyfodol yn cynnwys adroddiad ar bolisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, wedi'i lofnodi gan y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am gydraddoldeb, ac adroddiad ar wahân gan yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â staff. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i bawb sy'n gysylltiedig ein bod wedi gallu dod i'r cytundeb hwn.

Gwn fod aelodau'r pwyllgor a'r Trefnydd yn teimlo'n unfryd y gellir gwella rhan Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o'r adroddiad hwn drwy gyflwyno amcanion ac allbynnau clir. Gobeithiaf weld newidiadau o'r fath y flwyddyn nesaf. Yn y tymor hwy, gobeithir y bydd yr amcanion hyn yn seiliedig ar strategaeth glir ar gyfer prif ffrydio cydraddoldeb, sydd i'w datblygu fel rhan o'r ymateb i adroddiad y pwyllgor, 'Prif Ffrydio Cydraddoldeb'. Yn y cyfamser, cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad hwn i chi a gobeithiaf y cawn ddadl ddiddorol arno ac ar y materion mwy cyffredinol sy'n ymwneud â chyfle cyfartal. Bydd y Trefnydd a minnau'n ymateb i'r ddadl ar y cyd; ymdriniaf fi â phwyntiau sy'n ymwneud â gwaith y pwyllgor a bydd y Trefnydd yn ymateb i faterion a godir ynghylch gwaith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I am mindful of the time. We must have a motion if it is the wish of the Assembly that we overrun. I invite the Business Minister to propose a motion.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r amser. Rhaid inni gael cynnig os yw'r Cynulliad yn dymuno inni or-redeg. Gwahoddaf y Trefnydd i roi cynnig gerbron.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Order No. 6.21, extends today's Plenary session until no later than 6 p.m..

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, yn estyn Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw hyd 6 p.m. fan bellaf.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Do at least 10 Members support that motion? I see that they do. In my view, this is not an abuse of our procedure and, therefore, I allow this motion and call a vote.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A oes o leiaf 10 Aelod sydd o blaid y cynnig hwnnw? Gwelaf fod. Yn fy marn i, nid yw hyn yn gamddefnydd o'n gweithdrefnau ac, felly, caniatâf y cynnig hwn a galw pleidlais.

*Cynnig: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.
Motion: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Member voted against:

Jones, Helen Mary

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Pumed Adroddiad Blynyddol Cydraddoldeb y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol: Parhad
The National Assembly's Fifth Equality Annual Report: Continued

Helen Mary Jones: Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales will support this motion in the context that it is a motion to note, but I stress that that does not by any means imply a wholehearted endorsement of the report in its entirety.

I have had the opportunity to comment in detail on the finer points of the report. Ministers and the committee Chair may feel that I have commented ad nauseam, so I will refrain from commenting in detail today but will speak briefly about the overall issue of the nature of the Government's part of this report. In doing so, I will reinforce, perhaps a little less courteously, some of the points that have been made by the Chair of the committee. The Government's part of this report is disappointing. It tells us about some of what has been done, namely actions and outputs, but, as the Chair has already said, it does not even cover that comprehensively. Neither does it tell us anything about the intended outcomes of those actions, how those intended outcomes were measured, whether they were measured at all and what the success rates are.

Over the past five years, we in the Assembly have acknowledged that changing the culture of this body and public life throughout Wales to take into account the promotion of equality of opportunity will require an enormous culture change. I will extend the metaphor of turning around an oil tanker, which is frequently used, as some questions remain to be answered. For example, who is the captain in this turning-around process? Obviously the Minister has some responsibility but so has the First Minister and so have we all as National Assembly Members. Are all the senior officers of this oil tanker—in this case, the Ministers and senior officials—fully informed about the reason for the change of course, and are they signed up to it? Do the crew and petty officers understand the implications of the change of course for their work? This report suggests that they do not, certainly not across all divisions. What are the disciplinary

Helen Mary Jones: Gwnaiff Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales gefnogi'r cynnig hwn gan mai cynnig i nodi ydyw, ond pwysleisïaf nad yw hynny'n golygu ein bod yn llwyr gymeradwyo'r adroddiad yn ei gyfanrwydd o bell ffordd.

Cefais gyfle i wneud sylwadau manwl am y manylion sydd yn yr adroddiad. Efallai fod Gweinidogion a Chadeirydd y pwyllgor yn teimlo fy mod wedi siarad am hynny hyd at syrffed, felly ymataliaf rhag gwneud sylwadau manwl heddiw a siaradaf yn fyr am fater cyffredinol natur rhan y Llywodraeth o'r adroddiad hwn. Wrth wneud hynny, ategaf, mewn modd ychydig yn llai cwrtais efallai, rai o'r pwyntiau a wnaed gan Gadeirydd y pwyllgor. Mae rhan y Llywodraeth o'r adroddiad hwn yn siomedig. Dywed wrthym am rai o'r pethau a wnaed, sef camau gweithredu ac allbynnau, ond, fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd eisoes, nid yw hyd yn oed yn ymdrin â hynny mewn modd cynhwysfawr. Ni ddywed wrthym ychwaith am ganlyniadau arfaethedig y camau gweithredu hynny, am y modd y mesurwyd y canlyniadau arfaethedig hynny, a fesurwyd hwy o gwbl a pha lwyddiant a geir.

Dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf, yr ydym ni yn y Cynulliad wedi derbyn y bydd angen newid diwylliant aruthrol er mwyn newid diwylliant y corff hwn a bywyd cyhoeddus ledled Cymru fel y gellir hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal. Ymhelaethaf ar y trosiad o droi tancer olew yn ei hól, a ddefnyddir yn aml, gan fod rhai cwestiynau heb eu hateb o hyd. Er enghraifft, pwy yw'r capten yn y broses o droi? Mae'n amlwg bod y Trefnydd yn gyfrifol i ryw raddau ond felly hefyd y mae'r Prif Weinidog a ninnau i gyd fel Aelodau o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. A yw holl uwch swyddogion y dancer olew hon—y Gweinidogion a'r uwch swyddogion yn yr achos hwn—wedi'u hysbysu'n llawn am y rheswm dros newid cwrs, ac a ydynt yn cytuno arno? A yw'r criw a'r is-swyddogion yn deall yr hyn y mae'r newid cwrs yn ei olygu iddynt yn eu gwaith? Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn rhoi lle i gredu nad ydynt, nid yn yr holl is-adrannau'n sicr. Pa gamau disgyblu a

sanctions for any crew member attempting to subvert the change of course? I am not advocating the walking of the plank, but the history of the progression of equal opportunities suggests that, at some point, enforcement is needed as well as encouragement. We see little commitment from the Government to that.

The Assembly has been proud of the almost unanimous cross-party political consensus on these issues. We have all been pleased to endorse them. I would like us to be able to keep that up, but my patience is beginning to wear thin. I am not questioning the Minister's personal commitment nor that of some of her colleagues—no-one can doubt it, and the Chair has already referred to Edwina Hart's work as Minister with responsibility for equality as well as social justice. However, if, as a member of the public, all I had to go on was this report and not, for example, the in-depth discussions that we have had in the Committee on Equality of Opportunity with various Ministers, I would be asking some pretty serious questions about how deep that commitment ran. Neither am I saying that nothing has been done in the year covered by this report, but the report does not demonstrate what has been done, whether it has been done well and whether it has worked.

I do not believe that anybody, least of all the Minister, needs to be reminded that we are talking about a statutory responsibility that applies to the whole of the Assembly, and I would hate to see the National Assembly Government, let alone the whole Assembly, being taken to judicial review for a specific failure to act. Without the evidence of what actions have been taken—and this report should form an important part of that evidence—I am beginning to believe that that is a genuine possibility. It is not only my patience that is running out; people in many of our communities who are highly concerned with this issue are beginning to ask some of the same questions. In the coming year, we will give the Minister strong support to drive forward a meaningful mainstreaming agenda, and we understand the size of the challenge. However, I reserve the right, if next year's Government report is

gymerir yn erbyn unrhyw aelod o'r criw sy'n ceisio gwyrddroi'r cwrs newydd? Nid wyf yn dadlau y dylid gyrru unrhyw un i'r môr, ond mae hanes y cynnydd o ran cyfle cyfartal yn awgrymu y bydd angen gorfodaeth, ar ryw adeg, yn ogystal ag anogaeth. Ychydig o ymrwymiad a welwn i hynny ar ran y Llywodraeth.

Mae'r Cynulliad wedi ymfalchïo yn y consensws trawsbleidiol unfrydol bron a gafwyd ar y materion hyn. Buom oll yn falch o'u cefnogi. Byddai'n dda gennyf pe gallem ddal at hynny, ond mae fy amynedd yn dechrau pallu. Nid wyf yn amau ymrwymiad personol y Trefnydd a rhai o'i chyd-Weinidogion—ni all neb amau hynny, ac mae'r Cadeirydd wedi cyfeirio eisoes at y gwaith a wnaeth Edwina Hart fel y Gweinidog a chanddi gyfrifoldeb dros gydraddoldeb yn ogystal â chyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, pe byddwn i, fel aelod o'r cyhoedd, yn gorfod dibynnu ar yr adroddiad hwn yn unig ac nid, er enghraifft, y trafodaethau manwl a gawsom yn y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal gyda gwahanol Weinidogion, byddwn yn amheus iawn ynghylch graddau'r ymrwymiad hwnnw. Nid wyf yn dweud ychwaith na wnaed dim yn y flwyddyn a drafodir yn yr adroddiad hwn, ond nid yw'r adroddiad yn dangos yr hyn a wnaed, a wnaed ef yn dda ac a yw wedi llwyddo.

Ni chredaf fod angen atgoffa unrhyw un, a'r Trefnydd yn anad neb, ein bod yn trafod cyfrifoldeb statudol sy'n berthnasol i'r Cynulliad cyfan, a byddai'n gas gennyf weld Llywodraeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, heb sôn am y Cynulliad cyfan, yn dod yn destun arfarniad barnwrol am fethiant penodol i weithredu. Gan nad oes tystiolaeth o'r camau a gymerwyd—a dylai'r adroddiad hwn fod yn rhan bwysig o'r dystiolaeth honno—yr wyf yn dechrau credu bod hynny'n bosibilrwydd gwirioneddol. Nid fy amynedd i'n unig sy'n pallu; mae pobl mewn sawl cymuned sy'n dra phryderus ynghylch y mater hwn yn dechrau gofyn rhai o'r cwestiynau hyn. Yn y flwyddyn sydd i ddod, rhoddwn gefnogaeth gryf i'r Trefnydd i hyrwyddo agenda ystyrllon ar brif ffrydio, a sylweddolwn fod yr her yn un fawr. Fodd bynnag, cadwaf yr hawl, os bydd adroddiad y Llywodraeth y flwyddyn nesaf cyn

as poor as this year's, to torpedo the Government's equality tanker below the waterline. I will not be content again to be associated with a report that looks—I stress, 'looks'; that may not be how it is—complacent at best and, at worst, dismissive of the issues. This will not do.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I am mindful of the time. We should finish all business today, but I appeal for brief speeches. Four more speakers wish to contribute.

Christine Chapman: Devolution has provided us with a real opportunity to serve Wales better than it has been served in recent decades. It is clearly important that we remember that the Assembly works for all the people of Wales and that we develop policies accordingly. Establishing true equality for all, and mainstreaming that equality, is one of the prime vehicles for achieving this, which is why today's debate is important. I welcome the attention that this report has given to race equality, and several examples of excellent work are highlighted, including consulting with black and minority ethnic stakeholders to identify opportunities for promoting good race relations during the opening ceremony for the new Assembly Chamber. That is a good example of how we are ensuring that equality is at the centre of our democracy.

We often pay attention to those areas that have relatively large minority ethnic populations, but not as much to those areas where minority communities are perhaps more dispersed and isolated. However, isolation is a key factor, and racism in areas where there are fewer people of black and minority ethnic background has a greater effect due to the increased isolation of its victims. Where there are tiny pockets of black and minority ethnic communities that are dispersed, the potential for their isolation and alienation is greater, and the fear and hurt inflicted upon the victim more penetrating. That, in turn, bestows a greater degree of power on the perpetrator. I recently hosted a public meeting in the Cynon Valley,

waethed â'r un a gafwyd eleni, i anfon torpido o dan y dŵr tuag at long cydraddoldeb y Llywodraeth. Ni fyddaf yn fodlon cael fy nghysylltu eto ag adroddiad sy'n ymddangos—a phwysleisiaf y gair 'ymddangos'; efallai nad felly y mae—yn ddifater ar y gorau ac, ar y gwaethaf, yn ddiystyriol o'r materion dan sylw. Ni wnaiff hyn y tro.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r amser. Dylem allu gorffen yr holl fusnes heddiw, ond apelïaf am areithiau byr. Mae pedwar siaradwr eto sy'n dymuno cyfrannu.

Christine Chapman: Mae datganoli wedi rhoi cyfle gwirioneddol inni wasanaethu Cymru'n well nag y'i gwasanaethwyd yn y degawdau diwethaf. Mae'n amlwg yn bwysig inni gofio bod y Cynulliad yn gweithio dros holl bobl Cymru a'n bod yn datblygu polisiau'n unol â hynny. Sicrhau gwir cydraddoldeb i bawb, a phrif ffrydio'r cydraddoldeb hwnnw, yw un o'r prif gyfryngau i gyflawni hynny, a dyna pam y mae'r ddadl hon heddiw'n un bwysig. Croesawaf y sylw a roddwyd yn yr adroddiad hwn i gydraddoldeb hiliol, a thynnir sylw at sawl enghraifft o waith rhagorol, gan gynnwys ymgynghori â rhanddeiliaid du a lleiafrifol ethnig i ganfod cyfleoedd i hyrwyddo cysylltiadau hiliol da yn ystod y seremoni agoriadol ar gyfer Siambr newydd y Cynulliad. Mae hynny'n enghraifft dda o'r modd yr ydym yn sicrhau lle canolog i gydraddoldeb yn ein democratiaeth.

Yr ydym yn aml yn rhoi sylw i'r ardaloedd hynny lle y ceir poblogaethau lleiafrifol ethnig cymharol fawr, ond nid cymaint i'r ardaloedd hynny lle y gallai cymunedau lleiafrifol fod yn fwy gwasgaredig ac ar wahân. Fodd bynnag, mae arwahanrwydd yn ffactor allweddol, ac mae hiliaeth mewn ardaloedd lle y mae llai o bobl o gefndir du a lleiafrifol ethnig yn cael mwy o effaith am fod y rhai sy'n dioddef ganddi wedi'u hynysu i raddau mwy. Os ceir cymunedau pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig sy'n fach ac yn wasgaredig, mae mwy o bosibilrwydd iddynt gael eu hynysu a'u dieithrio, ac mae'r boen a'r ofn a barir i'r dioddefwr yn brathu'n ddyfnach. Mae hynny, yn ei dro, yn rhoi mwy o bŵer i'r troseddwr. Llywyddais

at which the Member of the European Parliament for London, Claude Moraes, spoke to discuss racism in the Valleys. When I organised the event, many people felt that it was a pointless meeting because they believed that racism was not a serious issue in the Valleys. However, a significant number of black and minority ethnic people living in the Valleys attended the meeting and, judging by their contributions, they certainly did not view racism in the Valleys as an issue that did not warrant attention. One of the main issues highlighted was the need to instil the values of tolerance and awareness in our young people, both at home and in school. However, it is not just about young people. We must also do a great deal of work with older people. Despair was shown in the meeting about elements of the right-wing press, which is fanning the flames of racism and intolerance, and we must keep our eye on that.

To tackle racism, we must not merely treat its consequences; the subject demands a much deeper and more probing approach. I am pleased with the progress that we are making and that the Committee on Equality of Opportunity is looking specifically now at these issues. We have progressed a great deal, but we must not become complacent. The Assembly must continue to strengthen our good race relations in Wales.

Jenny Randerson: It is important to read this report, bearing in mind that whether you look at equality from the point of view of women, ethnic minorities, disabled people or from the point of view of sexual orientation, there is a mountain to climb. We tend to become a little complacent here, looking around the Chamber and seeing a position of equality for men and women, but we must remember that there is no representative from an ethnic minority in the Assembly. This year, we celebrate the thirtieth anniversary of the Sex Discrimination Act 1975, but progress has been painfully slow. Recently, a report by the Equal Opportunities Commission said that there was a 1 per cent improvement, but building on a low base, in terms of women's representation in the workforce. The under-utilisation of women's skills has left most women locked into the

mewn cyfarfod cyhoeddus yng Nghwm Cynon yn ddiweddar, lle y bu'r Aelod o Senedd Ewrop dros Lundain, Claude Moraes, yn siarad ar destun hiliaeth yn y Cymoedd. Pan drefnais y digwyddiad, yr oedd llawer yn teimlo mai cyfarfod dibwrpas ydoedd gan eu bod yn credu nad oedd hiliaeth yn bwnc pwysig yn y Cymoedd. Fodd bynnag, daeth nifer sylweddol o bobl dduon a lleiafrifol ethnig sy'n byw yn y Cymoedd i'r cyfarfod ac, a barnu yn ôl eu cyfraniadau, yr oeddent yn sicr yn credu bod hiliaeth yn y Cymoedd yn bwnc a oedd yn teilyngu sylw. Un o'r prif faterion y tynnwyd sylw atynt oedd yr angen i feithrin goddefgarwch ac ymwybyddiaeth fel gwerthoedd ymysg ein pobl ifanc, yn y cartref ac yn yr ysgol. Nid â phobl ifanc yn unig y mae a wnelo hyn, fodd bynnag. Rhaid inni wneud llawer o waith hefyd gyda phobl hŷn. Mynegwyd anobaith yn y cyfarfod ynghylch elfennau yn y wasg asgell dde, sy'n ennyn hiliaeth ac anoddefgarwch, a rhaid inni gadw golwg ar hynny.

Er mwyn mynd i'r afael â hiliaeth, rhaid ymdrin â mwy na'i chanlyniadau'n unig; mae'r mater hwn yn gofyn dull gweithredu llawer dyfnach a phellgyrhaeddol. Yr wyf yn fodlon ar y cynnydd a wnawn a bod y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yn ystyried y materion hyn yn awr. Gwnaethom lawer o gynnydd, ond rhaid inni beidio â mynd yn ddifater. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad barhau i gryfhau ein cysylltiadau hiliol da yng Nghymru.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'n bwysig darllen yr adroddiad hwn, gan gofio, pa un a ydych yn ystyried cydraddoldeb o safbwynt menywod, lleiafrifoedd ethnig, pobl anabl neu o safbwynt tueddiad rhywiol, fod gwaith aruthrol i'w wneud. Tueddwn i fynd ychydig yn ddifater yn y fan hon, wrth edrych o'n cwmpas yn y Siambr a gweld sefyllfa lle y mae dynion a menywod yn gyfartal, ond rhaid inni gofio nad oes unrhyw gynrychiolydd o leiafrif ethnig yn y Cynulliad. Eleni, dathlwn ddengmlwyddiant ar hugain Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Rhyw 1975, ond bu'r cynnydd yn boenus o araf. Yn ddiweddar, dywedwyd mewn adroddiad gan y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal fod gwelliant o 1 y cant wedi bod, ond bod hynny o fan cychwyn isel, o ran cynrychiolaeth menywod yn y gweithlu. Oherwydd y defnydd annigonol o sgiliau menywod, mae'r rhan

four Cs—caring, catering, cleaning and clerical work. In the Assembly, outside the Chamber, I fear that that is often true.

5.30 p.m.

I will concentrate specifically on the Assembly Government aspect of this report. At first glance, it is quite impressive. A lot of steps have been taken, but it is just a shopping-list approach, and it lacks analysis, as Helen Mary said. I am concerned about the variability from one civil service directorate to another. I am aware of developments which are not listed; for example, culture is intrinsic in changing elements in respect of equality, but there is very little to suggest that on the list. I know that there is a lot more being done by the culture division, but no analysis has been undertaken.

I also noticed that several directorates refer to support for events such as Welsh woman of the year. That event is important in terms of creating role models, but most people are concerned with the nitty-gritty of daily life. CADW refers in its report to access audits, but what did it do following those audits? Did it improve access? Did it provide grants for improving access to specific ancient monuments?

In the health sphere, I am concerned that cuts are threatened in the grant for Clybiau Plant. These clubs not only provide opportunities for children from all backgrounds, but they also provide vital childcare for working mothers and fathers, and provide an equality background. Therefore, some policy decisions do not fit into the framework of action mapped out in the Government's proposals.

I am also concerned about the continuing staffing problems in the Assembly's equality unit. I am aware that it is a complex issue, but it is time that the problem was sorted out. I am concerned that the advertising of posts is not always appropriate. We are told that this issue is being addressed, but I have been told that for two years. We still have not seen

fwyaf ohonynt wedi'u clymu wrth waith ym meysydd gofal, arlwyo, glanhau a chlercio. Yn y Cynulliad, y tu allan i'r Siambr, ofnaf mai felly y mae mewn llawer achos.

Canolbwyntiaf yn benodol ar yr agwedd ar yr adroddiad hwn sy'n ymwneud â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Ar yr olwg gyntaf, y mae'n eithaf trawiadol. Mae llawer o gamau wedi'u cymryd, ond dull 'rhestr siopa' yn unig ydyw, a cheir diffyg dadansoddi, fel y dywedodd Helen Mary. Yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch yr amrywiaeth o un gyfarwyddiaeth gwasanaeth sifil i'r llall. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o ddatblygiadau nas rhestrir; er enghraifft, mae diwylliant yn greiddiol i newid elfennau mewn perthynas â chydaddoldeb, ond ychydig iawn sydd ar y rhestr i awgrymu hynny. Gwn fod llawer mwy yn cael ei wneud gan yr adain ddiwylliant, ond nid ymgwymerwyd ag unrhyw ddadansoddiad.

Sylwais hefyd fod sawl cyfarwyddiaeth yn cyfeirio at gefnogi digwyddiadau megis Cymraes y flwyddyn. Mae'r digwyddiad hwnnw'n bwysig o ran creu modelau rôl, ond y mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn poeni am hanfodion bywyd bob dydd. Cyfeiria CADW yn un o'i adroddiadau at archwiliadau mynediad, ond beth a wnaeth y corff hwnnw yn dilyn yr archwiliadau hynny? A fu iddo wella mynediad? A ddarparodd grantiau i wella mynediad i henebion penodol?

Ym maes iechyd, yr wyf yn pryderu bod bygythiad o doriadau yn y grant i Glybiau Plant. Mae'r clybiau hyn nid yn unig yn darparu cyfleoedd i blant o bob cefndir, ond y maent hefyd yn darparu gofal plant sy'n hanfodol i famau a thadau sy'n gweithio, ac yn darparu cefndir o gydraddoldeb. Felly, mae rhai penderfyniadau polisi nad ydynt yn cydweddu â'r fframwaith gweithredu a bennwyd yng nghynigion y Llywodraeth.

Yr wyf hefyd yn pryderu ynghylch y problemau staffio parhaus yn uned cydraddoldeb y Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod hwn yn fater cymhleth, ond mae'n bryd ei datrys. Yr wyf yn pryderu nad yw'r ffordd yr hysbysebwr swyddi bob amser yn briodol. Dywedir wrthym fod y mater hwn yn cael sylw, ond dyna'r hanes ers dwy

a sea change in the way that posts are advertised so that they are not just read by the usual suspects who happen to take the *Western Mail* and a small number of other newspapers. I am also concerned that training may not be filtering down to all staff. I am aware that new staff receive training, and that there are obligations to existing staff, but how much of those obligations are fulfilled? Until we train all staff in the Assembly, we will not see a successful outcome.

Certain organisations and issues crop up time and again in terms of the shopping-list approach. For example, the All Wales Ethnic Minority Association is cited in numerous situations, but is the association serving the whole of the black and minority ethnic population? I am not sure that that is the appropriate way ahead for every aspect of equality issues.

In conclusion, I welcome the fact that the Minister, who is new in post, gave a commitment to the committee that the Assembly Government's approach next year would be more analytical and would focus on outcomes. I hope that we will see a great improvement in the approach by then.

Mark Isherwood: The Welsh Assembly Government's equality report for 2003-04, annexed to this report, was in itself more of an annex to a report than anything you could hang your hat on. In future, the Government must report on the basis of measuring equality outcomes against clear and specified objectives and inputs. I am pleased to add 'specified' to the report. However, I am disappointed that one of my proposed additions to the report has been excluded from the final draft. This stated that consideration should be given to including customer satisfaction data in this process. Only our customers—those facing barriers to access and inclusion—are in a position to measure our success in mainstreaming equality in everything that we do.

Section 7 of the statement on this report refers to holding Ministers directly to account for delivering equality. This will guide the remainder of my comments, in the

flynedd. Yr ydym eto i weld newid sylweddol yn y ffordd yr hysbysebwr swyddi, fel nad yr un bobl sy'n digwydd prynu'r *Western Mail* a nifer bychan o bapurau eraill, sy'n eu darllen. Yr wyf hefyd yn bryderus efallai nad yw hyfforddiant yn cyrraedd yr holl staff. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod staff newydd yn cael eu hyfforddi, a bod rhwymedigaethau tuag at staff presennol, ond faint o'r rhwymedigaethau hyn a wireddir? Hyd nes ein bod yn hyfforddi holl staff y Cynulliad, ni welwn ganlyniad llwyddiannus.

Mae rhai mudiadau a materion yn codi'u pennau dro ar ôl tro yn nhermau'r agwedd rhestr siopa. Er enghraifft, nodir Cymdeithas Lleiafrifoedd Ethnig Cymru Gyfan mewn sawl sefyllfa, ond a yw'r gymdeithas yn gwasanaethu'r boblogaeth ddu ac ethnig lleiafrifol yn ei chyfanrwydd? Nid wyf yn sicr ai dyma'r ffordd briodol ymlaen ar gyfer pob agwedd ar faterion cydraddoldeb.

I derfynu, yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith bod y Gweinidog, sy'n newydd i'r swydd, wedi rhoi ymrwymiad i'r pwyllgor y byddai dull gweithredu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn fwy dadansoddol y flwyddyn nesaf ac y byddai'n canolbwyntio ar ganlyniadau. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y gwelwn welliant mawr yn y dull gweithredu erbyn hynny.

Mark Isherwood: Nid oedd adroddiad cydraddoldeb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer 2003-04, a atodwyd i'r adroddiad hwn, mewn gwirionedd yn fawr fwy o atodiad i adroddiad ynddo'i hun. Yn y dyfodol, rhaid i'r Llywodraeth adrodd ar sail mesur canlyniadau cydraddoldeb yn erbyn amcanion a mewnbynnau clir a phenodol. Fodd bynnag, cefais fy siomi bod un o'r ychwanegiadau a gynigiais i'r adroddiad wedi'i hepgor o'r drafft terfynol. Yr oedd hwn yn datgan y dylid ystyried cynnwys data ynghylch boddhad cwsmeriaid yn y broses hon. Dim ond ein cwsmeriaid—y rhai sy'n wynebu rhwystrau rhag mynediad a chynhwysiant—sydd mewn sefyllfa i fesur ein llwyddiant wrth brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb ym mhopeth a wneir gennym.

Mae adran 7 y datganiad ar yr adroddiad hwn yn cyfeirio at ddal Gweinidogion yn uniongyrchol gyfrifol am sicrhau cydraddoldeb. Bydd hyn yn tywys gweddill

hope that warm words will be turned into positive action over two key issues that are referred to in this report—mainstreaming equality and the annual report of the children’s commissioner. Page 5 of this report refers to gender balance in local authorities as part of our mainstreaming equality review. We must consider this in the context of the Assembly’s definition of mainstreaming as one in which equality informs all aspects of the work of every individual in an organisation. In our Plenary debate on 18 January on the Welsh Assembly Government’s response to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity’s report on mainstreaming equality, I said that,

‘Recommendation 21 requires the local government equality standard to become a formal performance indicator for local authorities. We are told that this will need to be discussed with local government. What is the action plan, and where are the target dates? We all know that it needs to be discussed, but what does this mean in practice?’.

In her response, the Minister, Jane Hutt, stated that the Welsh Local Government Association has a strong equality unit and equality lead, and that she would be taking that recommendation forward. The proof of the pudding is in the eating, Minister. As Helen says, we are working on a cross-party basis to overcome barriers to access and inclusion. Therefore, Minister, how will you respond to the discriminatory, and possibly illegal, treatment of my wife, who is a Flintshire county councillor, by Flintshire County Council and the leader of the Welsh Local Government Association? My wife was referred to by two council officers two weeks ago as ‘Mrs Isherwood’. She asked them how they would address a male councillor, and they gave the same answer, separately, that they would be referred to as ‘councillor’. Therefore, confidentially, she asked the monitoring officer, without making any complaint against any named persons, for all councillors to be addressed equally. She herself was never the issue. She prefers to be known by her Christian name. However, her comments were wrongly

fy sylwadau, yn y gobaith y bydd geiriau teg yn cael eu troi’n weithredu cadarnhaol mewn perthynas â dau fater allweddol y cyfeirir atynt yn yr adroddiad hwn—prif ffrydio cydraddoldeb ac adroddiad blynyddol y comisiynydd plant. Mae tudalen 5 yr adroddiad hwn yn cyfeirio at gydbwysedd rhwng y ddau ryw mewn llywodraeth leol, fel rhan o’n hadolygiad ar brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb. Rhaid i ni ystyried hyn yng nghyd-destun diffiniad y Cynulliad o brif ffrydio, sef lle y mae cydraddoldeb yn llywio pob agwedd ar waith pob unigolyn mewn sefydliad. Yn ein dadl yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 18 Ionawr ar ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ar brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb, dywedais:

‘Mae argymhelliad 21 yn mynnu y bydd safon cydraddoldeb llywodraeth leol yn dod yn ddangosydd perfformiad ffurfiol i awdurdodau lleol. Dywedir wrthym y bydd yn rhaid trafod hynny gyda llywodraeth leol. Pa gynllun gweithredu a geir, ac erbyn pa bryd y cwblheir hynny? Yr ydym oll yn gwybod y bydd yn rhaid ei drafod, ond beth yw ystyr hynny’n ymarferol?’.

Yn ei hymateb, dywedodd y Gweinidog, Jane Hutt, fod gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru uned gydraddoldeb gref ac arweiniad cryf ar gydraddoldeb, ac y byddai’n bwrw ymlaen â’r argymhelliad. Yn y bwyta mae’r prawf, Weinidog. Fel y dywed Helen, yr ydym yn gweithio ar sail drawsbleidiol i oresgyn rhwystrau rhag mynediad a chynhwysiant. Felly, Weinidog, sut fyddwch yn ymateb i’r driniaeth gamwahaniaethol, ac anghyfreithlon o bosibl, a gafodd fy ngwraig gan Gyngor Sir y Fflint ac arweinydd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru? Cyfeiriwyd at fy ngwraig gan ddau o swyddogion y cyngor bythefnos yn ôl fel ‘Mrs Isherwood’. Gofynnodd hi iddynt sut y byddent yn cyfeirio at gynghorydd gwrywaidd, ac fe roes y ddau yr un ateb, ar wahân, sef fel ‘cynghorydd’. Felly, yn gyfrinachol, gwnaeth gais i’r swyddog monitro, heb wneud unrhyw gŵyn yn erbyn unrhyw berson, na’u henwi, ar i bob cynghorydd gael eu cyfarch yn gyfartal. Nid sut y câi hi ei hun ei chyfarch oedd gwreiddyn y mater. Mae’n well ganddi hi gael ei hadnabod wrth ei henw cyntaf. Fodd

leaked, and apparently misrepresented, and ended up on the front page of the local newspaper with a huge picture and a misquotation.

I understand from the Equal Opportunities Commission Cymru and the Assembly's local government department that this could breach legislation in three separate areas. Comments published in the press by the Flintshire County Council and WLGA leader condemning my wife are a betrayal of his duty under this report to mainstream equality in local government. He stated:

'the whole thing is ridiculous, yet it is costing the council tax payer money to deal with, and she is getting hung up on whether we are called Mr, Mrs or Councillor'.

Words cost nothing, Councillor Aldridge, but discriminatory and disgraceful leaks from your authority do not.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You can illustrate by examples, Mark, but the debate is about the Assembly's equality arrangements.

Mark Isherwood: You will know from the report that there are extensive—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Carry on, because time is short.

Mark Isherwood: What action will the Minister take to help this person understand the meaning of mainstreaming equality? Furthermore, what action will she take concerning the continuing abuse of Mr Messham, who was sexually abused as a child in the north Wales care homes system, and was one of the first whistleblowers, triggering investigations that led to the Waterhouse inquiry? On 27 January, in a joint meeting of the Health and Social Services Committee, the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, and the Committee on Equality of Opportunity on the children's commissioner's annual report, Peter Clarke responded to a question from

bynag, datgelwyd ei geiriau yn anghywir, ac i bob golwg camliwiwyd y mater, nes iddo ymddangos ar dudalen flaen papur newydd lleol gyda llun mawr a dyfyniad anghywir.

Yr wyf yn deall oddi wrth Gomisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal Cymru ac adran llywodraeth leol y Cynulliad y gallai hyn fod yn groes i ddeddfwriaeth mewn tri gwahanol faes. Mae sylwadau a gyhoeddwyd yn y wasg gan Gyngor Sir y Fflint ac arweinydd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, wrth iddo gondemnio fy ngwraig, yn bradychu ei ddyletswydd dan yr adroddiad hwn i brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb mewn llywodraeth leol. Dywedodd ef:

mae'r mater yn ymfydrwydd llwyr, eto i gyd mae'n costio arian trethdalwyr y cyngor i ymdrin ag ef, ac mae hi'n gwneud mor a mynydd ynghylch cael ein galw'n Mr, yn Mrs neu'n Gynghorydd.

Mae geiriau'n rhad, y Cynghorydd Aldridge, ond nid felly'r datgeliadau camwahaniaethol a gwarthus o'ch awdurdod chi.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae hawl gennych roi esiamplau, Mark, ond am drefniadau cydraddoldeb y Cynulliad y mae'r ddadl.

Mark Isherwood: Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r adroddiad bod llawer—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ewch ymlaen, does dim llawer o amser.

Mark Isherwood: Pa gamau a gymerir gan y Gweinidog i helpu'r person hwn i ddeall ystyr prif-ffrydio cydraddoldeb? Yn ogystal â hynny, pa gamau a gymerir ganddi ynglŷn â'r cam-drin parhaus ar Mr Messham, a gafodd ei gam-drin yn rhywiol fel plentyn yn system cartrefi gofal gogledd Cymru, ac a oedd yn un o'r rhai cyntaf i ddatgelu camarfer, gan ysgogi archwiliadau a arweiniodd at archwiliad Waterhouse? Ar 27 Ionawr, mewn cydgyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio a'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, ar adroddiad blynyddol y comisiynydd plant, ymatebodd Peter Clarke i gwestiwn gennyf drwy ddatgan

me by stating that adults who suffered abuse as children would be seen as complainants and that the legislation allows them to do this retrospectively. Mr Messham was cleared last month at Chester Crown Court on all benefit fraud charges, brought, not by the Benefits Agency, but by North Wales Police and Flintshire County Council, with the chairman of the North Wales Police Authority and the Flintshire County Council secretary giving evidence for the Crown. The solicitor representing Mr Messham told me this weekend that he received death threats because of his involvement in this case. The resident judge, the Recorder of Chester, has now granted leave for me to obtain a transcript of this case—[*Interruption.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I have various assistant Deputy Presiding Officers on my left-hand side. You need to get back to the Assembly's equality arrangements, Mark; you have only about 20 seconds left.

Mark Isherwood: Therefore, in the spirit of the Assembly's agenda for real equality and justice for all, when will the Welsh Assembly Government tackle these obstacles to mainstreaming equality in north Wales, finally putting people before party?

5.40 p.m.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I was pleased to be able to put this report on the action taken in 2003-04 before you in my new role as Minister with responsibility for equal opportunities. The report is about how we are promoting equality and tackling discrimination, and I particularly thank Gwenda Thomas and members of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity for their clear and constructive contributions when the Permanent Secretary and I attended the committee to present the report. When I attended that meeting, I prefaced my contribution, as you know, Helen Mary, with the comment that I see this as a real challenge for all Members, but also for me in taking on this role, namely to ensure that

y byddai oedolion a ddioddefodd gamdriniaeth pan oeddent yn blant yn cael eu hystyried yn achwynwyr, a bod y gyfraith yn caniatáu iddynt wneud hyn yn adolygol. Yn Llys y Goron, Caer, fis diwethaf, cliriwyd Mr Messham o bob cyhuddiad mewn perthynas â thwyll budd-daliadau a ddygwyd gerbron nid gan yr Asiantaeth Budd-daliadau, ond gan Heddlu Gogledd Cymru a Chyngor Sir y Fflint, gyda chadeirydd Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru ac ysgrifennydd Cyngor Sir y Fflint yn rhoi tystiolaeth ar ran y Goron. Dywedodd y cyfreithiwr a oedd yn cynrychioli Mr Messham wrthyf y penwythnos hwn ei fod wedi derbyn bygythiadau yn erbyn ei fywyd, oherwydd ei gysylltiad â'r achos hwn. Mae'r barnwr preswyl, Cofiadur Caer, bellach wedi rhoi caniatâd i mi gael trawsgrif o'r achos hwn—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae gen i sawl Dirprwy Lywydd cynorthwyol ar yr ochr chwith i mi. Mae angen i chi ddychwelyd at drefniadau cydraddoldeb y Cynulliad, Mark, Dim ond rhyw 20 eiliad sydd ar ôl gennych.

Mark Isherwood: Felly, yn ysbryd agenda'r Cynulliad ar gyfer gwir gydraddoldeb a chyfiawnder i bawb, pa bryd fydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn mynd i'r afael â'r rhwystrau hyn i brif-frydio cydraddoldeb yng ngogledd Cymru, gan o'r diwedd roi buddiannau pobl o flaen buddiannau plaid?

Y Gweinidog Busnes (Jane Hutt): Yr oedd yn bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn ar y camau a gymerwyd yn 2003-04 ger eich bron yn fy swyddogaeth newydd fel Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb am gyfleoedd cyfartal. Mae'r adroddiad yn dangos sut yr ydym yn hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb ac yn mynd i'r afael â chamwahaniaethu, ac rwy'n diolch yn arbennig i Gwenda Thomas ac aelodau'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal am eu cyfraniadau eglur ac adeiladol pan fu'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol a minnau'n bresennol yn eu pwyllgor i gyflwyno'r adroddiad. Fel y gwyddoch, Helen Mary, gwneuthum rai sylwadau ar ddechrau fy nghyfraniad, gan ddweud fy mod yn ystyried hyn yn her wirioneddol i'r holl Aelodau, ond hefyd yn her i minnau wrth

mainstreaming bites, that we embed this and that we move the tanker on.

We recognise that much progress has been made, and I recognise that from having been the first Chair of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity five years ago. Part of capturing all that progress is ensuring that every director and member of the senior civil service, as well as every Minister, is engaged in mainstreaming equality across the Welsh Assembly Government. It has been difficult to capture all that, but, in future, I intend to work closely with the Committee on Equality of Opportunity and Assembly officials, particularly with regard to mainstreaming Assembly Government policies and projects across the board. As Gwenda Thomas said in her opening remarks, it is the audit of our activities across Government that will provide the evidence of positive outcomes. That is what we will be judged on in terms of delivery. We will seek to be at the forefront of promoting equality of opportunity in Wales.

Progress has clearly been made, much of which there is not time to recognise today, but which includes, for example, economic development, where we have mainstreamed equality into our policies and programmes, such as the Potentia project, which is providing support to under-represented groups to start their own businesses as part of the entrepreneurship action plan. That is key in involving ethnic minorities, disabled people and older people, as well as younger and lone parents. It is also key, as Jenny mentioned with regard to training and monitoring, as part of the race equality scheme. We will now have specialist training rolled out throughout the Assembly, and having been able to respond to the committee's mainstreaming equality report and the second race equality scheme, I think that we are on the brink, Helen Mary, Jenny and Christine, of a major sea change in how we deliver. We must deliver with our partners, and this is about the commitment of the Assembly and officials to how we mainstream equality, and it is also about creating a working environment in which policies and services are developed and

ymgymryd â'r rôl hon, sef i sicrhau bod prif-ffrydio yn cymryd gafael, yn gwreiddio, a'n bod ninnau wedyn yn symud ymlaen.

Rydym yn cydnabod y gwnaed llawer o gynnydd, ac yr wyf yn cydnabod hynny, gan i mi fod yn Gadeirydd cyntaf y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal bum mlynedd yn ôl. Un ffordd o wneud y gorau o'r holl gynnydd hwnnw yw sicrhau bod pob cyfarwyddwr ac aelod o'r uwch-wasanaeth sifil, yn ogystal â phob Gweinidog, yn cyfrannu tuag at brif-ffrydio cydraddoldeb ar draws Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru drwyddi draw. Bu'n anodd gwneud hynny, ond yn y dyfodol yr wyf yn bwriadu gweithio'n agos gyda'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal a swyddogion y Cynulliad, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â phrif-ffrydio polisïau a phrosiectau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gyffredinol. Fel y dywedodd Gwenda Thomas yn ei sylwadau agoriadol, archwilio'n gweithgareddau ar draws y Llywodraeth gyfan fydd yn darparu tystiolaeth o ganlyniadau cadarnhaol. Ar sail hynny y bernir ein llwyddiant. Byddwn yn ceisio bod ar flaen y gad wrth hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal yng Nghymru.

Yn amlwg fe wnaed cynnydd, nad oes amser i gydnabod llawer ohono heddiw, ond mae'n cynnwys, er enghraifft, datblygu economaidd, lle'r ydym wedi prif-ffrydio cydraddoldeb yn ein polisïau a'n rhaglenni, megis prosiect Potentia, sy'n darparu cefnogaeth i grwpiau a dangynrychiolir i ddechrau eu busnesau eu hunain fel rhan o'r cynllun gweithredu entrepreneuriaeth. Mae'r prosiect hwnnw'n allweddol o ran cynnwys lleiafrifoedd ethnig, pobl anabl a phobl hŷn, yn ogystal â rhieni iau a sengl. Mae hefyd yn allweddol, fel y crybwyllwyd gan Jenny, mewn perthynas â hyfforddi a monitro, fel rhan o'r cynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol. Bydd hyfforddiant arbenigol bellach yn cael ei gynnal drwy'r Cynulliad cyfan, a chan ein bod wedi cael cyfle i ymateb i adroddiad y pwyllgor ar brif-ffrydio cydraddoldeb, yr wyf o'r farn, Helen Mary, Jenny a Christine, ein bod ar fin gweld newid mawr yn ein ffordd o gyflawni pethau. Rhaid i ni wneud hynny gyda'n partneriaid, ac y mae hyn yn ymwneud ag ymroddiad y Cynulliad a'r swyddogion i'r ffordd yr ydym yn prif-ffrydio cydraddoldeb, ac y mae hefyd yn ymwneud â chreu amgylchedd gwaith lle y datbygir ac y cyflawnir polisïau a

delivered in the way that we can meet groups throughout Wales. In fact, Jenny, we are funding several organisations and ventures, such as international women's day. Last year, there were events in Cardiff alone, and we are now spreading that throughout Wales, including into north Wales, and I think that we will see many minority ethnic groups benefiting from that.

I do not want to comment on your points, Mark, as I feel that they were wholly irrelevant and inappropriate. I am glad to meet, with the support of the leader of the Welsh Local Government Association, all the local government equality champions and to work with them to ensure that we work through this with our partners.

In conclusion, I intend future annual reports to be presented as a proper audit of Assembly Government action to promote equality of opportunity. I have already told my Cabinet colleagues that this issue will be a regular item on the Cabinet agenda, and that is a key expression of mainstreaming at the highest level in terms of the Welsh Assembly Government. I hope that I will be able to return to Plenary a year from now and present an equality report and mainstreaming strategy that we will be proud of in Wales.

Gwenda Thomas: Most of Helen Mary Jones's points were aimed at the Welsh Assembly Government part of the report, but making a point with courtesy does not always mean that it is made with less effect. I am sure that my remarks will be taken into account by the Welsh Assembly Government as seriously as her remarks will be.

Christine Chapman mentioned important issues, and I suggest that the revised race equality scheme will be more effective in dealing with some of those issues. Jenny, your points were, more or less, aimed at the Welsh Assembly Government part of the report, but I am sure that you will agree that continuing to campaign for equal pay will be an important part of the committee's work.

gwasanaethau fel y gallwn gwrdd â grwpiau ledled Cymru. Yn wir, Jenny, rydym yn ariannu sawl mudiad a menter, megis Diwrnod Rhyngwladol y Menywod. Y llynedd, dim ond yng Nghaerdydd y cynhaliwyd digwyddiadau, ond yr ydym bellach yn ymestyn hynny ledled Cymru, gan gynnwys i'r Gogledd, a chredaf y byddwn yn gweld llawer o grwpiau ethnig lleiafrifol yn elwa o hynny.

Nid wyf eisiau gwneud sylwadau ar eich pwyntiau, Mark, gan y teimlaf eu bod yn gwbl amherthnasol ac amhriodol. Byddaf yn falch o gyfarfod, gyda chefnogaeth arweinydd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth leol Cymru, holl hyrwyddwyr cydraddoldeb llywodraeth leol, ac i gydweithio â hwy i sicrhau ein bod yn gweithio drwy hyn gyda'n partneriaid.

I derfynu, bwriadaf yn y dyfodol i adroddiadau blynyddol gael eu cyflwyno fel archwiliad cywir o waith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb cyfle. Yr wyf eisoes wedi dweud wrth fy nghyd-aelodau o'r Cabinet y bydd y mater hwn yn ymddangos yn rheolaidd ar agenda'r Cabinet, a bod hyn yn fynegiant allweddol o brif-ffrydio yn nhermau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd modd i mi ddychwelyd i'r Cyfarfod Llawn ymhen y flwyddyn i gyflwyno adroddiad cydraddoldeb a strategaeth ar brif-ffrydio y gallwn fod yn falch ohonynt yng Nghymru.

Gwenda Thomas: Yr oedd y rhan fwyaf o'r pwyntiau a wnaed gan Helen Mary Jones wedi'u hanelu at y rhan o'r adroddiad sy'n ymwneud â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ond nid yw gwneud pwynt yn gwrtais bob amser yn golygu bod ei effaith yn llai. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn rhoi'r un sylw i fy sylwadau i ag a roir i'r sylwadau a wnaed ganddi hi.

Crybwyllwyd materion pwysig gan Christine Chapman, ac yr wyf yn awgrymu y bydd y cynllun cydraddoldeb hil diwygiedig yn fwy effeithiol wrth ymdrin â rhai o'r materion hynny. Jenny, yr oedd eich sylwadau chi, fwy neu lai, wedi'u hanelu at ran Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o'r adroddiad, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch y bydd parhau i ymgyrchu dros dâl cyfartal yn rhan bwysig o waith y pwyllgor.

There is a serious point to what Mark Isherwood said, although the way that he said it may not have been acceptable. I suppose that he is making the point that mainstreaming equality issues is as important to individuals as it is to groups or communities of interest. I take that as a serious point.

All the comments made this afternoon will help the committee in its activities in the coming year. The next motion to be proposed this afternoon is important, as the change in Standing Orders, if agreed by the Assembly, will mean that the committee will examine the report on the new Equality Bill, once it has been published, and the Disability Discrimination Bill. I welcome the motion that will make it possible for those Bills to be referred to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity.

Mae pwynt difrifol i'r hyn a ddywedodd Mark Isherwood, er efallai nad oedd y ffordd y mynegwyd ef ganddo'n dderbyniol. Yr wyf yn cymryd ei fod yn gwneud y pwynt fod prif-ffrydio materion cydraddoldeb yn un mor bwysig i unigolion ag y mae i grwpiau neu gymunedau budd. Yr wyf yn ystyried hynny'n bwynt difrifol.

Bydd yr holl sylwadau a wnaed y prynhawn yma'n gymorth i'r pwyllgor yn ei weithgarwch yn ystod y flwyddyn i ddod. Mae'r cynnig nesaf a roir gerbron y prynhawn yma'n bwysig, gan y bydd y newid i'r Rheolau Sefydlog, os cytunir arno gan y Cynulliad, yn golygu y bydd y pwyllgor yn archwilio'r adroddiad ar y Mesur Cydraddoldeb newydd. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cynnig a fydd yn ei gwneud yn bosibl cyfeirio'r Mesurau hynny i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal.

*Cynnig (NDM2300): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2300): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David

Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Llywydd i'r Gadair am 5.46 p.m.
 The Presiding Officer took the Chair at 5.46 p.m.*

Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i Reolau Sefydlog Approval of Changes to Standing Orders

Jenny Randerson: I propose that

the National Assembly acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 37:

1. considers the report of the Business Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 February;

2. approves the amendments to Standing Orders set out in the report of the Business Committee which was laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2004; and

3. resolves that the revisions shall take immediate effect, except for the revisions to Standing Order No. 10, which shall take effect from 20 March 2005. (NDM2301)

Y Llywydd: Gwelaf nad oes unrhyw un yn dymuno siarad, felly awn yn syth at y bleidlais. Yr wyf yn atgoffa Aelodau fod angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair i dderbyn y cynnig.

Jenny Randerson: Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan adran 46(6) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 37:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror;

2. yn cymeradwyo'r gwelliannau i'r Rheolau Sefydlog a nodir yn Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2004; ac

3. yn penderfynu y bydd y newidiadau yn dod i rym yn syth, ac eithrio'r newidiadau i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 10, a ddaw i rym ar 20 Mawrth 2005. (NDM2301)

The Presiding Officer: I see that no-one wishes to speak, so we will move to the vote. I remind Members that a two-thirds majority is required for the motion to be carried.

*Cynnig (NDM2301): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
 Motion (NDM2301): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Bourne, Nick

Burnham, Eleanor
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Marek, John
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Atal Rheolau Sefydlog Suspension of Standing Orders

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I **Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigaf fod
 propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 37.5, suspends that part of Standing Order No. 6.13 which requires a motion to be tabled at least five working days before it is to be debated, to allow NNDM2305 to be considered in Plenary on Tuesday, 22 February 2005. (NDM2306)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 37.5, yn atal dros dro y rhan honno o Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.13 sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol i gynnig gael ei gyflwyno o leiaf 5 niwrnod gwaith cyn y dyddiad y mae i gael ei drafod, er mwyn caniatáu i NNDM2305 gael ei ystyried yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Mawrth 22 Chwefror 2005. (NDM2306)

Y Llywydd: Mae angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair i dderbyn y cynnig hwn hefyd.

The Presiding Officer: A two-thirds majority is also required for this motion to be carried.

*Cynnig (NDM2306): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2306): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Anfon Mesurau i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal
The Remitting of Bills to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity**

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf fod

propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. remits the Disability Discrimination Bill and, when published, the Equality Bill to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity for further consideration; and

1. yn anfon y Mesur Gwahaniaethu ar sail Anabledd a'r Mesur Cydraddoldeb, ar ôl i hwnnw gael ei gyhoeddi at y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal i'w trafod ymhellach; ac

2. requests the Committee on Equality of Opportunity to report to the Assembly as soon as may be. (NNDM2305)

2. yn gofyn i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal adrodd i'r Cynulliad cyn gynted ag y bo modd. (NNDM2305)

Cynnig (NNDM2305): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NNDM2305): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwendia
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

Williams, Kirsty

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Y Llywydd: Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben. **The Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.50 p.m.

The meeting ended at 5.50 p.m.

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau

Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)