

Teaching of Welsh history

November 2019



The National Assembly for Wales is the democratically elected body that represents the interests of Wales and its people, makes laws for Wales, agrees Welsh taxes and holds the Welsh Government to account.

An electronic copy of this document can be found on the National Assembly website: www.assembly.wales/SeneddCWLC

Copies of this document can also be obtained in accessible formats including Braille, large print, audio or hard copy from:

Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee
National Assembly for Wales
Cardiff Bay
CF99 1NA

Tel: **0300 200 6565**

Email: **SeneddCWLC@assembly.wales**

Twitter: **[@SeneddCWLC](https://twitter.com/SeneddCWLC)**

© **National Assembly for Wales Commission Copyright 2019**

The text of this document may be reproduced free of charge in any format or medium providing that it is reproduced accurately and not used in a misleading or derogatory context. The material must be acknowledged as copyright of the National Assembly for Wales Commission and the title of the document specified.

National Assembly for Wales

Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee

Teaching of Welsh History, Culture and Heritage

November 2019



About the Committee

The Committee was established on 28 June 2016. Its remit can be found at: www.assembly.wales/SeneddCCERA

Committee Chair:



Bethan Sayed AM
Plaid Cymru

Current Committee membership:



Mick Antoniw AM
Welsh Labour



John Griffiths AM
Welsh Labour



Delyth Jewell AM
Plaid Cymru



Carwyn Jones AM
Welsh Labour



David Melding AM
Welsh Conservatives

The following Member attended as a substitute during this inquiry.



Dai Lloyd AM
Plaid Cymru

The following Members were also members of the Committee during this inquiry.



Jayne Bryant AM
Welsh Labour



Caroline Jones AM*
Brexit Party



Rhiannon Passmore AM
Welsh Labour

* Sat as a member of UKIP and changed her Political Party in May 2019.

Contents

Recommendations	5
1. Background.....	6
The Committee’s public poll.....	6
Task and Finish Group: The Cwricwlwm Cymreig, history and the story of Wales.....	6
2. The current curriculum.....	9
3. Curriculum for Wales 2022	13
History in the new curriculum	13
4. Reflecting all of our history	18
5. Teaching resources and training	21
5. 1. Resources.....	21
5. 2. Teacher training.....	22
Annex A: Oral evidence.....	26
Annex B: Written evidence.....	27
Annex C: Stakeholder event	28

Recommendations

Recommendation 1. The Welsh Government should remit Estyn to undertake a thematic review of the teaching of Welsh history in schools. The Committee would like evidence of the extent to which schools are meeting the requirements of the GCSE, AS and A level specifications on teaching Welsh content. Page 12

Recommendation 2. The Curriculum for Wales 2022 should include guidance which sets out a common body of knowledge for all pupils studying history. These key events and topics will allow all pupils to have an understanding of how their country has been shaped by local and national events within the context of Welsh, British and international histories..... Page 17

Recommendation 3. The Curriculum for Wales 2022 should have diversity as a core element. There is a risk that the proposed flexibility for schools and teachers may not ensure that all pupils in Wales know the story of our diverse ethnic and religious communities.Page 20

Recommendation 4. To ensure that history is representative of all of Wales' communities and their international connections, the thematic review of history teaching by Estyn, recommended in this report, should assess how diversity is currently taught in schools.Page 20

Recommendation 5. The Welsh Government should consider how they can expand the work of the Ethnic Minorities and Youth Support Team Wales and the Race Council Cymru to all students and teachers in Wales.....Page 20

Recommendation 6. It is vital to ensure that the implementation of the Curriculum for Wales 2022 will be properly supported with teaching materials which reflect the ambition to teach the history of Wales from the local and national perspectives. The Welsh Government should set out how they will ensure that such resources are widely available. Page 24

Recommendation 7. The Welsh Government should set out how they will ensure that initial teacher education and continuous professional development will enable all those teaching history to know how to access and deliver the history of Wales. The Welsh Government should set out their efforts to increase the number of BAME teachers in Wales and how successful they have been. Page 24

Recommendation 8. Histories of Wales' racial and religious diversity should be included in initial teacher education and reflected in teaching materials for the Humanities Area of Learning and Experience..... Page 25

1. Background

1. The Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee has been looking at how Welsh history is currently taught and what the Welsh Government's Curriculum for Wales 2022 means for the teaching of this subject in future.
2. This report will be sent to the Welsh Government to inform their consultation on the Curriculum for Wales 2022. The Welsh Government will respond to the recommendations and the Committee will return to this topic as part of its general scrutiny of Welsh Ministers.

The Committee's public poll

3. The Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee ran a public poll during summer 2018, inviting members of the public to select from a list of potential inquiry topics. Nearly 2,500 people participated in the poll. Forty-four per cent voted for "Teaching of Welsh history, culture and heritage in schools".
4. Some of the comments submitted as part of the poll argued that:
 - The current curriculum does not allow for the children of Wales to understand their place in the world as they are not taught about their own history, language and customs.
 - The teaching of Welsh history and culture throughout the curriculum is essential in creating a Welsh identity for school children and young adults. In both Welsh and English language primary and secondary schools, this is a vital element of their education.
5. The National Assembly's Petitions Committee has considered a petition on this subject and has heard contrasting evidence about the teaching of history in Wales. For instance, the Minister for Education has said that Welsh history is prominent in the curriculum currently being taught in schools, and that recent revisions to GCSEs and A levels and the forthcoming new curriculum all mean that pupils are taught about the history of their country.

Task and Finish Group: The Cwricwlwm Cymreig, history and the story of Wales

6. The then Minister for Education and Skills, Leighton Andrews, established an independent task and finish group, chaired by Dr Elin Jones to look at the

teaching of history, the study of Wales and the Cwricwlwm Cymreig. The Group's report, Cwricwlwm Cymreig, history and the story of Wales (September 2013) made twelve recommendations relating to the Welsh dimension in the development of a future curriculum and in relation to the history curriculum in particular.

- 7.** The Group agreed that the history programme of study gave explicit priority to the history of Wales in every period studied at Key Stages 2 and 3 (with the exception of the enquiry into recent history at the end of Key Stage 3). However, the evidence available to the panel suggested that, for a variety of reasons, not all schools met the requirements.
- 8.** The Group believed that whereas there had been a compulsory Welsh history element in the O level, this was removed in the GCSE and this may have diminished the status of Welsh history in the eyes of teachers.
- 9.** The Group did not advocate the replacing of the current History programme of study with a “programme of study for Welsh history” but wanted to see the diet of what was learnt and taught in schools rebalanced to make the centrality of the Welsh element more visible.
- 10.** Amongst the Group's recommendations were that:
 - In the revision of the national curriculum, the programme of study should be structured so as to provide clear guidance on the relationship between local, Welsh, British, European and world history. The aim should be to provide a sound foundation for learners' historical understanding while expanding their horizons.
 - A proportion of Welsh history should be an integrated and compulsory part of every History GCSE specification offered in Wales. (The Welsh Government and the WJEC have since done this.)
- 11.** Although the then Minister, Huw Lewis welcomed the recommendations, he said they would be considered in the broader review of curriculum and assessment, then being carried out by Professor Graham Donaldson.
- 12.** Dr Elin Jones has described her ongoing frustration with the lack of progress in this area since the report of the Group was published in 2013. When giving evidence to the Petitions Committee in May 2018, she said:

“Research conducted 20 years ago by Dr Sian Rhiannon Williams also suggests that only a third of schools teach Welsh history correctly, but

there is no evidence. If it's not being done, why isn't it being done? What are the difficulties? I think the emphasis on results and that competitive element between schools has an impact on that."

2. The current curriculum

13. The Committee looked at what is contained in the current curriculum to better understand what is currently mandated in schools. Within the current curriculum, the History Programme of Study (2008) states that, at Key Stage 2:

“Pupils should develop their historical skills, knowledge and understanding through learning about a range of historical contexts. These should be based primarily on **the local area within the wider context of Wales**, but including examples from Britain and other countries.”

14. It also states that, at Key Stage 3, pupils:

“learn by enquiry about the main political, economic, social and cultural features of selected periods from the histories of Wales and Britain during the last millennium. They place these developments in context by **enquiring into the history of their own locality**, the historical experiences of the countries that make up the British Isles and aspects of European and World history.”

15. New specifications of GCSE History, from September 2017 and AS/A level history, from September 2015 aimed to have a greater focus on Welsh history and Welsh perspectives of history. For instance, the latter states:

“Each of the options in Units 1-4 which cover the history of Wales and England have a distinctive focus on key issues and content of the history of Wales. Teachers should be aware of the importance of integrating, where appropriate, the key issues and content of the history of Wales within the overall programme of learning.”

16. The Committee heard that despite the current requirements, pupils are not being taught Welsh history as intended. A typical comment came from Dr Steven Thompson from Aberystwyth University. He wrote:

“Most of this Welsh history, where it has been studied, has been offered in the context of a “British” history module in which tokenistic Welsh history elements are added, for example the Rebecca riots, the Newport rising, the interwar depression, and so on.

The students who come to study in the department tell us they have studied topics such as the Nazis, the Holocaust, the civil rights

movement, the Russian Revolution, and the Tudors. Quite often we hear the comment that they have studied the Nazis every year over a number of years. Some of the weaker students wish to study those topics again when they arrive at university while the stronger ones are desperate to study something, anything else.

I have done a lot of work with schools in recent years as part of our recruitment strategies. I have been asked to lead sessions on the civil rights movement in America, the women's suffrage movement and other topics. I have never been asked to do anything on Welsh history, and neither have any of my colleagues. Schools do not seem to be teaching Welsh history and so we are not asked to provide sessions on it.

My understanding is that the schools curriculum allows teachers to teach Welsh history but, from our perspective in the Department, they do not seem to be doing so. It seems to us that children across Wales, in English- and Welsh-medium schools, are growing up without any real sense of the history of their own communities and are far more conversant with the history of other countries."

17. The Committee heard concerns that there is a danger of moving to a new system which is much less prescriptive in what has to be taught without knowing about today's teaching. Dr Elin Jones told the Committee "we don't know really what is the basis on which we will be building for this new curriculum. We don't know what teachers are making of the current curriculum".

18. The Committee wrote to the WJEC to ask "Is the WJEC aware of any issues regarding schools' compliance with the requirement in the GCSE specification to teach Wales specific content"? Roderic Gillespie, Chief Executive, responded:

"The WJEC is not aware of any issues regarding compliance with the requirement in the GCSE specification to teach Wales-specific content. Were schools not to do this they would risk candidates not being able to answer specific questions and/or accessing the higher Bands in certain questions."

19. The Committee also wrote to the Minister for Education to ask what information the Welsh Government has on the amount of time that is spent teaching specifically Welsh history at Key Stages 2, 3 and 4 and at GCSE and A level. The Minister replied:

“We do not hold information on the amount of time that is spent teaching specifically Welsh history at the various key stages...

The GCSE History WJEC guidance document for practitioners advises that a substantial proportion of Welsh history should be embedded in the required content for the specification in both Units 1 and 3, and teachers are directed to illustrate their teaching with relevant and appropriate examples that demonstrate both a Welsh perspective and the impact on Wales of these developments...

Learners must choose one Unit on the history of Wales and England to study at AS and at A level.”

20. In response to the Committee’s request to the Minister for Education that she consider tasking Estyn to undertake a thematic review on teaching in this topic area, she replied:

“There is capacity for an additional review on a chosen topic to be carried out in 2019-20. I note the comments made by the Chief Inspector in relation to this issue. I will explore the matter with the Chief Inspector and update you in due course.”

21. In evidence to other Committees, the Minister for Education has disputed the perception that Welsh history and Welsh perspectives of history are not sufficiently covered:

“The programmes of study in our current curriculum are quite clear in both key stage 2 and key stage 3 about what we would expect them to be teaching our children, and I believe the changes to the GCSE and A-level courses also place greater emphasis on Welsh history.”¹

“The impression that is given sometimes is that nothing is taught about Welsh history in our schools. And that’s not true.”²

Our view

The Committee has heard the frustration from teachers, history societies, pupils and academics that children do not know the story of their community or

¹ [Petitions Committee, 17 July 2018](#)

² [Children, Young People and Education Committee, 28 June 2018](#)

country. Often children commented that they learnt more Welsh history in a Welsh language lesson than from their history teacher.

We heard that learning about the wives of Henry VIII, the rise of the Nazis, Stalinism, the two world wars, the slave trade and Parliamentary reforms in the Twentieth century continue to be the most taught topics for a variety of reasons. For instance, resources are more available; those wishing to continue studying history in higher education perceive it as necessary and teachers from outside Wales may not be confident teaching Welsh history.

The Committee was provided with evidence from the WJEC on the required content of the GCSE and AS/A level course. However, the Committee was told that there is still a tendency to teach Welsh history through “stories of Wales” rather than applying the same academic rigour and querying of evidence applied elsewhere.

There is a clear need to have up to date evidence on the content and standard of history teaching in our schools. The Welsh Government should remit Estyn to carry out a thematic review of the teaching of Welsh history in schools to report within a year. Only once there is robust evidence of the nature and extent of the current teaching can assessments be made to inform the delivery of the Curriculum for Wales 2022.

Recommendation 1. The Welsh Government should remit Estyn to undertake a thematic review of the teaching of Welsh history in schools. The Committee would like evidence of the extent to which schools are meeting the requirements of the GCSE, AS and A level specifications on teaching Welsh content.

3. Curriculum for Wales 2022

22. Following Professor Graham Donaldson’s review, *Successful Futures* (2015), the Welsh Government has been working with schools and other stakeholders to develop a new Curriculum for Wales. This will be introduced on a phased basis from September 2022.

23. A *draft version of the new Curriculum for Wales* was published on 30 April 2019. The Welsh Government asked for public feedback on it until 19 July 2019.

History in the new curriculum

24. History will be taught within the Humanities Area of Learning and Experience (AoLE). As well as history, the Humanities AoLE will encompass geography, religious education, business studies and social studies.

25. The draft Humanities AoLE does not provide specific details of what events in history should or must be taught. This is mainly because the new Curriculum for Wales will be purpose-driven rather than content-driven. Currently, while there is detail of what should be taught in the 2008 History programme of study, what is taught in schools is inevitably also influenced by history GCSE and AS/A level specifications as well as the History Programme of Study.

26. The draft Humanities AoLE states that it supports learners to “develop an understanding of Wales and their own understanding of what it means to be Welsh”. It also states that ‘schools and teachers should ... ensure that they select [curricular] content that allows learners to gain a thorough understanding of their locality, of Wales and the wider world’.

27. In the description of what learners should be able to do at various ages within the new curriculum, there are several references to “focusing on my locality, Wales and the wider world in the past and present”.

28. In her evidence to the Petitions Committee, prior to the publication of the draft curriculum, Dr Elin Jones said:

“Donaldson doesn’t provide a basis for teaching the history of Wales as such. It provides a basis to teach humanities. But I have taught humanities myself about 40 years ago, and I didn’t find that I was succeeding to convey those subjects effectively, although primary school teachers very often do that in an excellent manner.”

29. When asked whether she had confidence that the new curriculum would allow for history to be taught in a way that she would want, Dr Jones said:

“I have no confidence in that at all—none at all. I have seen some of the work that’s been done, and the teachers who are working on the curriculum at the moment, and the civil servants with them—they are doing their best. But without clear guidance, and without examples of good practice, and without evidence, they’re in the dark, and I don’t know whether they’ll be any the wiser when they finish this in terms of how to teach history.”

30. In answer to an Oral Assembly Question on 5 June 2019, about the place of Welsh history within the draft new curriculum, the Minister for Education said:

“The principle of *cynefin*, I believe, is one that runs throughout the draft areas of learning and experience, and not confining itself just to the concept of teaching children about Welsh history. I want the story of Wales—its history, its language, its culture, its geography, its contribution to the world—to be a golden thread that runs through every aspect of the curriculum and I don’t think we should be confining ourselves just to the humanities AoLE or one particular subject.”

31. The Owain Glyndwr Society said in written evidence that teachers may be constrained by the lack of prescription in the new curriculum and schools will study different topics in different parts of the country due to their location:

“Pupils living in the valleys of South Wales may well end up with an in-depth knowledge of the coal industry, but will probably have very little knowledge of the slate industry in Gwynedd.”

32. They suggest that teachers may be able to by-pass topics or historical periods if they wish and they are keen to have some “general prescription” so that topics from each of the main periods are covered. They state:

“The new curriculum should have a list of ‘must-haves’, i.e. topics that all the pupils in the country need to be taught so that they have a rounded knowledge of the events that have formed modern-day Cymru.”

33. Similarly, in their written evidence, Dyfodol i’r Iaith state:

“If each individual school is allowed to decide the content that is taught, it is unlikely to have a national flavour. Pupils should leave

schools in Wales with a general corpus of knowledge about the nation in which they were educated, regardless of how generalised it may be due to time constraints. The possible conclusion of the current philosophy is that only the children of Whitland or Carmarthenshire will learn about Hywel Dda's astonishing laws, while only the children of Newport, Blaenau Gwent and Llanidloes will learn about the Chartists."

34. They say that a balance can be struck between prescribing the most significant events that each pupil should know about and teachers' professional freedom.

35. Dyfodol i'r laith state that the "What Matters" statements set out useful general guidelines, but they may be interpreted in more than one way. They say that:

"The challenge will be particularly complex in the humanities, with business studies and social studies being additional elements that will have to be considered. Economic development and the nature of society in any given period are integral to the study of history. Including these elements in statute can impact the time available to teach history in the humanities."

36. They state that the history of Wales has not received adequate attention in the past and that the proposed curriculum must "remedy this situation".

37. The representatives of teaching unions agreed that, although it might go against the spirit of the new curriculum, "guidelines need to be given" on the content of Welsh history teaching. They called for Welsh examples to be used in teaching international events. Mark Cleverly from NASUWT said:

"There has to be an element of prescription. But we also need to be very mindful that, as important as Welsh history is, we mustn't narrow the teaching of history to solely Welsh examples as well, because we must also link Welsh history to the national context and to the international context."

38. Dr Elin Jones was asked if there are certain events which are so important they have to be taught. She replied that rather than identifying certain "turning points" it is better to "say that there are certain key periods in Welsh history when there are developments that are central to the formation of an individual identity in Wales".

39. Those who spoke to the Committee agreed that it would be challenging to compile a list of events which should be seen as “core” at the same time as preserving the proposed flexibility of the new curriculum. Wyn Thomas from Dyfodol I’r Iaith was willing to suggest some topics which should be taught to all pupils. He said:

“I am doubtful of this idea of being non-prescriptive. I do think that we must be prescriptive about certain elements of our history that are too important for children not to study during their historical studies. And I would refer to the laws of Hywel Dda and the schools of Griffith Jones, for example.”

40. The Committee also heard of concerns from teaching unions about the way the new curriculum is structured into AoLEs and the possible dilution of history as an academic discipline. Mark Cleverly from NASUWT said teachers have expressed concerns:

“As they are moving into a humanities-based curriculum, whereby they’re trying to split curriculum time and availability of teachers and other resources in order to meet the needs of how they perceive the curriculum to be. Now, that worries me, and it worries NASUWT, because, obviously, it’s going to have a long-term impact on the status of history and history teaching, particularly when you get into teaching post 14 at GCSE and advanced level.”

41. Ioan Rhys Jones, UCAC, said it is “crucially important” to have history specialists in all schools. He said:

“There is one teacher training college at the moment that intends to scrap all elements of geography and history and have one religious education expert, in order to provide initial teacher training, and they’ll be teaching children from three through to 18. That would be disastrous.”

42. Mark Cleverly also stressed the need to have specialist history teachers. He said:

“We also need to ensure that specialist teaching will be retained and to dispel the myth that we’re all teachers of history, and that all humanities teachers can teach history equally well.”

Our view

The Committee has heard concerns about the nature and the content of the proposals for teaching history as part of an Area of Learning and Experience in the Curriculum for Wales 2022. Moving to a system of teaching AoLEs rather than individual subjects may dilute history as an academic discipline. Teaching unions stressed the need for history teachers to continue to be employed rather than “humanities” teachers. There is a danger that the academic rigour of the subject will be lost. Academics also spoke of the need to maintain history as a separate subject in order to foster enthusiasm for the discipline early on in schools.

There was a recognition that the new curriculum could offer opportunities to enhance the teaching of Welsh history, but this was caveated by the need to have “certain guarantees” in future. The proposals to move from “content to concept” in the new curriculum have created a tension between the desire to give flexibility to schools and teachers and the need to be prescriptive in what is taught.

There was agreement across all of the evidence presented to the Committee that there should be core topics which all children should be taught. Those who contributed to this inquiry said that at the end of studying history pupils should have a common knowledge of key events in our national story. These should be set out in guidance and supported by sufficient resources and training such that teachers feel confident in setting these topics in their national, British and international contexts.

The proposals for flexibility in the new curriculum, if implemented effectively, arguably allow for greater scope to teach Welsh history than the current requirements in the GCSE and AS/A level specifications. However, if the new curriculum is being described as a “vision for Wales”, then it is necessary for all pupils to learn a common set of topics and events which have shaped the nation in which they grew up.

Recommendation 2. The Curriculum for Wales 2022 should include guidance which sets out a common body of knowledge for all pupils studying history. These key events and topics will allow all pupils to have an understanding of how their country has been shaped by local and national events within the context of Welsh, British and international histories.

4. Reflecting all of our history

43. The Committee heard from Gaynor Legall, from the Heritage and Cultural Exchange project, that “there needs to be a fundamental change... from the Welsh Government, in the way that it looks at the curriculum, in the way that it looks to develop its citizens of Wales, and recognise that the citizens of Wales are not all white skinned” and that black and minority ethnic people have made a historical contribution to Wales.

44. Uzo Iwobi from Race Council Cymru argued that Black History should be specified as part of the new curriculum, it should not be optional. She said that leaving the decision of whether or not to teach black history to teachers and schools was not good enough. She told the Committee:

“I do think, to be sure that this is captured, it needs to be nailed down. We need to nail our colours to that mast and say—just like sexuality is included specifically and will be covered—that the stories and contributions to the history of Wales and Wales’s development as a society will not be complete if we don’t tell the stories of the black, Asian and minority-ethnic servicemen.”

45. Ginger Wiegand, from Ethnic Minorities & Youth Support Team Wales (EYST), said:

“Not all people are going to agree on what Welsh history is and what it means... there needs to be a common agreement about what that is. It needs to be inclusive and it needs to include all of the histories.”

46. The tension between allowing flexibility and mandating core topics in the new curriculum came up again, with reference to the need to reflect dynamic Welsh cultures in a multi-racial society. In this context, it was felt by those who spoke to the Committee that there should be some areas of the curriculum that are mandatory, otherwise some teachers may feel that black history, for example, is not relevant to their local area.

47. Ginger Wiegand said:

“We need to represent the various communities and populations of Wales in our curriculum. And if we don’t include that as something that’s mandatory, then we will have missed an opportunity going forward.”

48. There was concern that teachers are not equipped to teach diverse histories. For instance, EYST’s focus groups of learners found that the pupils were critical of teacher’s superficial knowledge of diverse histories.

49. Abu-Bakr Madden Al-Shabazz from Race Council Cymru said that there is a “serious deficit” of black teachers in schools in Wales. Gaynor Legall spoke about the need to have a teaching workforce which reflects the diversity of the population and the importance of the Welsh Government’s role in developing teaching materials which are a “fair and full representation”, she said:

“I think the challenge around that is providing the teachers and schools in areas where there are very few black people with the teaching materials that they need to develop the curriculum, and to help them to make the links.”

50. Black and ethnic minority learners commenting on the current curriculum, in a workshop facilitated by EYST, said that there is nothing in the curriculum about being black and Welsh. It is assumed that black and minority ethnic people are “from somewhere else”. In order to counteract this in the new curriculum, Gaynor Legall spoke about the importance of people across Wales knowing about each other’s communities. She said:

“I want the kids who live in the docks to know about North Wales... as much as I want the people in Harlech to know about the docks and the coal industry... because it’s about Wales. This is our country and we need to know the total of how we got here, and, more importantly, how we are going to move forward. And we can only move forward together.”

51. She went on to call for an evaluation to ensure that schools are providing a representation of the diversity of the peoples of Wales.

Our view

The Committee heard concerns about the teaching of our diverse history in schools both now and under the new curriculum. The Committee heard that the current and previous content of history lessons has been overly Euro-centric. The Committee was told of the need to unpick the complexities of Wales’ relationships with countries in the United Kingdom and across the world.

Reflecting the wider story of Wales will potentially reduce racism and promote understanding. Young people told EYST that a “whitewashed curriculum

distorts the ethnic minority pupils' sense of self-worth and their white peers understanding of their place and value in the world".

The Committee endorses the work done by EYST and Race Council Cymru to investigate students' perceptions of race and history and their efforts to widen the curriculum. This work should be built upon and extended.

Recommendations in this report about widening the curriculum will not take effect immediately. For this reason, it is important that measures are taken to broaden what pupils study and their perceptions in the here and now.

The history of Wales is diverse and multicultural, that fact has to be embedded in the Curriculum for Wales 2022.

Recommendation 3. The Curriculum for Wales 2022 should have diversity as a core element. There is a risk that the proposed flexibility for schools and teachers may not ensure that all pupils in Wales know the story of our diverse ethnic and religious communities.

Recommendation 4. To ensure that history is representative of all of Wales' communities and their international connections, the thematic review of history teaching by Estyn, recommended in this report, should assess how diversity is currently taught in schools.

Recommendation 5. The Welsh Government should consider how they can expand the work of the Ethnic Minorities and Youth Support Team Wales and the Race Council Cymru to all students and teachers in Wales.

5. Teaching resources and training

5.1. Resources

52. In relation to the current curriculum, the Committee heard that there is a lack of availability of Wales-specific teaching resources. In their written evidence, UCAC state that history teachers tend to be keen to “visualise a clear educational pathway through a variety of bespoke resources”, and this may not be possible given the flexible nature of the new curriculum. They state that only a certain amount of appropriate resources exist for the teaching of Welsh history, although there have been improvements. They say:

“Some will see this as a constraint. Given that many will see the step of placing of Welsh history at the heart of the curriculum as a revolutionary change, consideration may need to be given to supporting these teachers by placing an emphasis on appropriate, Wales-centred resources. Certainly, this would be especially true in considering any change to the specification for qualifications.”

53. The Owain Glyndwr Society said in their written evidence that if resources are not readily available then teachers may revert to using their “tried and tested” materials and opportunities for studying topics on local medieval history, for example, would be lost. Gareth Jones argued that the tokenistic approach to teaching Welsh history in schools is partly a result of the lack of appropriate resources and at this should not continue with the new curriculum:

“If resources are readily available from the Welsh dimension, showing the Welsh dimension, then they will be used more, but in the past a lot of the resources were, I wouldn’t say Anglo-centric, but they were British-viewing rather than specifically Welsh-viewed. I think the biggest thing that’s needed is some exemplar materials to show what is it people need to deliver the new curriculum properly.”

54. Dr Elin Jones was asked to comment on the Wales-specific resources available for teaching, she suggested local history societies had a lot to offer and that the Cwricwlwm Cymreig report had recommended “history champions” to promote good practice. She said:

“I commissioned resources to teach Welsh history and teach history in the schools of Wales for many years. They did not get used by very many schools. There are good resources out there. There are good resources

on the web. They are not promoted commercially in the way resources that teach English history in schools in Wales have been promoted over the last five or six years, possibly longer. So, there needs to be investment, in producing appropriate resources for the new curriculum, but they would be locally appropriate resources.”

5. 2. Teacher training

55. All of those who gave evidence to the Committee stressed the need for teachers to have access to continuous professional development as well as suitable resources for teaching Welsh history now and under the new curriculum.

56. In their written evidence, UCAC expressed concerns about the “ability and willingness” of teachers to teach history from a Welsh perspective, as not all teachers are Welsh. They said:

Not all teachers are experts in Welsh history, that they have not all studied the history of their country while attending universities across the border, and that some are uncomfortable/reluctant about teaching extensive aspects of this subject area to their pupils. This is reflected in the ‘tokenism’ evident in the WJEC specification. Teachers need extensive training to ensure that they have sufficient confidence and initiative, as well as plentiful opportunities to share good practice and resources.

57. They also said that the secondary sector face a challenge in changes to educational practice and that upskilling will be necessary to implement the curriculum. They say:

“It is inevitable that there will be costs associated with this, and is it vital that sufficient time is allocated to the upskilling process.”

58. They also state that time will be needed for research given that there are concerns about teachers’ knowledge of local history, and this is seldom addressed in initial teacher education. UCAC also state that it may be challenging for a teacher wishing to move to another school or area as they will have to reconsider their schemes of work completely. Mark Cleverly called for specialist training and warned that not all humanities teachers can teach history equally well but they will need to be trained to do so.

59. The Owain Glyndwr Society said in written evidence that the intention of the curriculum is for schools to study local topics which would then lead into regional,

national, British, European or world matters – “But it will very much depend on the ability of their teachers to develop suitable schemes of work”.

60. Ginger Wiegand, EYST, also spoke of the learners who had questioned the competency of teachers to teach history that was not within the canon of white British and white Welsh history. She commented on the need for teacher training, she said There is some evidence that there’s very little attention given to ethnic or racial diversity, currently, in initial teacher training, So, there is an opportunity to use this new curriculum to ensure that that is addressed”. Of initial teacher education, Uzo Iwobi said:

“I do think that we need to have a comprehensive input into presentations to teachers and the people in the teaching profession. I think the local education authorities have a real key role to play. I think the consortia in commissioning work have to explore that if you don’t empower teachers to understand black history themselves, and to be committed to teaching it in a positive way, then, that is, ultimately, going to have a very adverse consequence.”

61. She told the Committee that “teachers have told us that they don’t know half what they ought to know, and they feel totally restrained because they don’t feel competent to deliver these sessions. It’s a matter of resources”.

Our view

The Committee heard that not all teachers are experts in Welsh history and their locality. The challenge of moving towards a Humanities Area of Learning and Experience may prove even harder if teachers lack the resources to deliver the history of their locality and, in turn, relate it to the Welsh and international story.

The Committee heard anecdotal evidence that the lack of Welsh-centred learning resources has resulted in tokenistic teaching of Welsh history. There was an acknowledgement that teachers are prone to use “off the shelf” materials due to lack of time and these are rarely Wales-specific.

Moving away from the current British approach to teaching history with Welsh examples tagged on, will require considerable investment in preparing new schemes of work, possibly relying on partnerships with local historical societies to deliver them. There is very little detail about how and when the teaching resources will be developed to support the new curriculum but there is general

agreement that without these resources then pupils can expect more of the same.

The Committee was told of pupils' concerns about the confidence and competency of teachers to deliver a more inclusive history. There was a recognition that if it is taught authentically then it has the potential to reduce racism and ignorance of other cultures, however, there is a superficiality in the current teaching that involves a tokenistic teaching of slavery and a presentation of black history in an international, rather than national context.

Ensuring that teachers have the confidence and materials necessary to teach Welsh history needs to start with their initial teacher education. There is no "curriculum" for initial teacher education courses, although all such programmes must meet accreditation criteria set by the Welsh Government. However, the new curriculum demands a profound shift in the way humanities subjects will be taught. There needs to be a recognition that teachers who have studied in other countries and those moving to new areas will not be immediately familiar with the history of their localities.

Considerable support will be needed to ensure that the teaching of Welsh history is not undermined by a lack of suitable resources, teacher training and a opportunities for teachers to create relevant schemes of work. The Committee will be seeking detailed information on the funding allocations for implementing these and other changes to the Curriculum.

Although the subject of how the new curriculum will be examined did not arise as part of this inquiry, the Committee will keep a watching brief on developments in this area. Given that schools will be encouraged to promote the concept of "cynefin", it is vital that we have a better understanding of how children will be assessed fairly on their varying programmes of study.

Recommendation 6. It is vital to ensure that the implementation of the Curriculum for Wales 2022 will be properly supported with teaching materials which reflect the ambition to teach the history of Wales from the local and national perspectives. The Welsh Government should set out how they will ensure that such resources are widely available.

Recommendation 7. The Welsh Government should set out how they will ensure that initial teacher education and continuous professional development will enable all those teaching history to know how to access and deliver the history of Wales. The Welsh Government should set out their efforts to increase the number of BAME teachers in Wales and how successful they have been.

Recommendation 8. Histories of Wales' racial and religious diversity should be included in initial teacher education and reflected in teaching materials for the Humanities Area of Learning and Experience.

Annex A: Oral evidence

The Committee heard from the following individuals and organisations at our meetings. The transcripts of these meetings are available on our website:

<http://record.assembly.wales/Search/?type=2&meetingtype=445>

Date	Name and Organisation
26 June 2019	Dr Elin Jones Mark Cleverley, NASUWT Ioan Rhys Jones, UCAC Gareth Jones, Secretary, Owain Glyndŵr Society Eryl Owain, Welsh History Campaign Wyn Thomas, Dyfodol i'r Iaith Ginger Wiegand, Ethnic Minorities & Youth Support Team Wales (EYST Wales) Gaynor Legall, The Heritage & Cultural Exchange
18 July 2019	Uzo Iwobi, Race Council Cymru Abubakar Madden Al Shabbaz, Race Council Cymru Vernesta Cyril OBE, Race Council Cymru Carl Connikie, Race Council Cymru

Annex B: Written evidence

The Committee received written evidence from the following individuals and organisations. This is available on our website:

<http://senedd.assembly.wales/mgConsultationDisplay.aspx?ID=375>

- Dr Steve Thompson
- Dr Elin Jones
- UCAC
- Owain Glyndwr Society
- Dyfodol i'r Iaith

Annex C: Stakeholder event

The Committee held a stakeholder event on “The teaching of Welsh history, culture and heritage in schools” at the National Waterfront Museum, Swansea on 21 February 2019 with the following in the attendance:

<http://senedd.assembly.wales/mgConsultationDisplay.aspx?ID=375>

Name	Organisation
Anna ap Robert	Coleg Ceredigion
Anna Davies	Gower College Swansea
Catrin Verrall	Qualifications Wales
Cliona O'Neill	HEFCW
Dai Thomas	Cwmni2
Danny Kilbride	TRAC
Elaine Edwards	Dyfodol i'r Iaith
Eleri Evans	National Museum Wales
Elfed Wyn Jones	Petitioner
Dr Elin Jones	
Elizabeth New	Aberystwyth University
Eryl Owain	Welsh History Campaign
Gareth Wynford Jones	Owain Glyndŵr Society
Professor Huw Pryce	Bangor University
Ioan Rhys Jones	UCAC
Professor Martin Johnes	Swansea University
Michelle Gosney	Estyn
Neil Butler	NASUWT
Neris Morris	Swansea Gower College
Nia Williams	National Museum Wales
Paul M Roberts	Torfaen County Borough Council
Rob Humphreys	Open University in Wales
Rocio Cifuentes	Director / CEO Ethnic Minorities & Youth Support Team Wales (EYST Wales)
Sara Huws	Cardiff University's Library Services

Dr Sarah Morse	The Learned Society of Wales
Sian Llewellyn	WJEC
Sian Rhiannon Williams	Member of Labour history and Women's Archive of Wales history societies.
Silyn Roberts	Cyngor Sir Ceredigion/ERW
Dr Steve Thompson	Aberystwyth University
Toni Schiavone	Welsh History Campaign
Uzo Iwobi	Race Council Cymru
Wyn Thomas	Dyfodol i'r Iaith
Zoe Howells	Historical Association's Secondary Committee