

**Written response to the Enterprise and Learning Committee inquiry into
The Teaching and Acquisition of Welsh as a Second Language
November 2010**

Executive Summary

The Welsh Assembly Government welcomes the report and its recommendations. Shortcomings in the teaching of Welsh as a second language have been highlighted on a number of occasions, and the Welsh-medium Education Strategy outlines how the Government will improve standards, so as to ensure that all learners can develop their Welsh-language skills to their full potential. This report, therefore, is extremely timely, and I would like to put on record my appreciation for the work undertaken by members of the Rapporteur Group in collecting the evidence and presenting the findings.

The majority of the recommendations contained in the report fit closely with our current policy direction as outlined in the Welsh-medium Education Strategy, and I am pleased to be able to accept the majority of them. Some require further consideration, but I support the intent of the proposed action. Having such unity of views on what needs to be done to improve standards in the teaching and acquisition of Welsh as a second language is essential if we are to achieve these common objectives.

In accepting the recommendations, I am pleased to be able to indicate that work on implementing many of them is already under way.

The Welsh Assembly Government sets out below its response to the Report's individual recommendations.

Detailed responses to the report's recommendations are set out below:

1. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Assembly Government work closely with local education authorities to implement a clearer definition of the wide range of bilingual schools to ensure a greater consistency across Wales in the planning, development and implementation of bilingual policies.

Response: Accept in principle

Comment: The Welsh Assembly Government will undertake a review of the effectiveness of the *Defining Schools according to Welsh-medium Provision* guidelines by 2015 and will work with local authorities and other partners to consider how best to present the information about the different linguistic outcomes of schools and to ensure that there is consistency across Wales. Local authorities and schools will be urged to consider how best to present clear and accurate information to parents and carers about the expected

linguistic outcomes, according to the definitions. This is already incorporated in the Implementation Programme of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy.

Financial Implications: None.

2. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Government considers assessing the language skills of all pupils earlier in Key Stage 2. We also recommend that the Welsh Government commission research into the current levels of language continuity from one Key Stage to the next and what measures can be taken to address existing problems in transition.

Response: Accept in principle

Comment: As set out in guidance to schools the Welsh Assembly Government encourages an on-going approach to assessment. Within a Key Stage or phase, schools should have in place systems for reviewing and recording individual learner attainment. However, schools should guard against over frequent monitoring and formal recording to avoid a negative impact on teaching and learning. The statutory requirement for formal assessment and reporting is the end of each Key Stage. Teachers must ensure that their end of Key Stage teacher assessments are finalised and recorded for reporting and for national data collection purposes.

Teacher assessment of Welsh second language at the end of Key Stage 2 became a statutory requirement from the school year 2009/10. Schools are required to report to parents on national curriculum level outcomes for all Year 6 pupils. In addition, it became a requirement for Key Stage 2/3 cluster group moderation of teacher assessment to include Welsh second language.

To support these requirements, the Assembly Government is currently working with Key Stage 2/3 cluster groups to strengthen the accuracy and reliability of teacher assessment in the core subjects and Welsh second language at the end of Key Stage 2. The pilot work will be completed by the end of 2010/11. The outcomes of this pilot will inform future national arrangements. This work should lead to greater understanding among teachers of levels of attainment; encourage the sharing of good practice; raise expectations; and improve continuity between the Key Stages within clusters. This process requires time to be rolled out and embedded and for the outcomes to become clear before any further measures are introduced.

The importance of continuity and progression in learning when moving from primary to secondary education is recognised. Secondary schools working with partner primary schools are therefore required to establish a Transition Plan. The Plan must set out how the schools will work together in curriculum planning to secure continuity in learning for pupils moving from Key Stage 2 to Key Stage 3. The accompanying guidance places a particular emphasis on the need to give attention to linguistic continuity.

The Assembly Government has also commissioned Estyn to undertake a review in 2011-12 to identify how effectively funded settings and maintained schools are delivering the Welsh Language Development Area of Learning in the Foundation Phase Framework. If the Area of Learning is achieving its anticipated aims, one of the key outcomes expected will be children transferring to Key Stage 2 with better Welsh language skills resulting in improved end of Key Stage 2 attainment outcomes. The Estyn review will provide the initial evidence in this respect and any recommendations made will need to be considered before further measures are introduced.

Financial Implications: None

3. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Government commission research into the impact of introducing the Welsh second language GCSE as a core subject in the curriculum.

Response: Accept in principle

Comment: This recommendation appears to confuse curriculum and qualification issues. Welsh is already a statutory part of the Key Stage 4 curriculum; all pupils are required to follow a course of study.

Designating Welsh second language as a core subject would not mean that every learner has to undertake a GCSE qualification in the subject. As with any element of the curriculum at Key Stage 4, core or otherwise, the expectation is that pupils should be entered for an appropriate external examination in all areas of study for which they have been prepared, this may or may not be a GCSE and there is no absolute requirement for examination entry.

Research should be undertaken into possible consequences, intended or otherwise, of making Welsh second language a core subject in the curriculum and therefore included in the Core Subject Indicator. It might also be profitable to look at other methods of producing the incentive to improve standards in Welsh second language.

Financial Implications: No extra financial implications provided that the implementation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy continues to be funded at current or higher levels in the future. The research could be funded from the current programme budget which supports the implementation of the Strategy.

4. The Committee recommends that:

Given that the A* - C results of the short course are significantly lower than the full course, we recommend that the Welsh Government work with its partners and schools to make more room in the curriculum for the full Welsh second language GCSE course to be taught effectively.

Response: Accept in principle

Comment: As with all other subjects in the curriculum, the amount of time given to the study of Welsh second language GCSE is a matter for local determination by schools. However, the Welsh Government agrees that steps need to be taken to ensure that sufficient time is timetabled and will work with its partners to provide best practice guidelines to schools in this respect.

At Key Stage 4, there are full and short GCSE courses available for Welsh second language. The total numbers of entrants for the full and short Welsh second language courses have remained relatively stable over the last 3 years, with approximately 10,000 candidates following the full course and approximately 12,000 following the short course. However, there are two tiers within the qualifications; foundation tier and higher tier. C is the highest grade that can be achieved by candidates sitting the foundation tier examinations. The figures in the report show that more candidates are entered for the short course foundation tier which may be one explanation of the lower attainment of those following the short course. In the short term, the Welsh Assembly Government will seek to take steps to encourage schools to enter more short course candidates for the higher tier so as to increase the opportunities for able pupils to achieve the highest grades. However, the long term aim will be to ensure that the full Welsh second language GCSE or equivalent Level 1-2 qualification is taught at an increasing number of schools, and the GCSE short course phased out.

Financial Implications: None.

5. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Government explore opportunities for further investment into and promotion of more varied Welsh language teaching materials for learners at primary and secondary levels, particularly provision for internet based and Information Technology based learning material. We also recommend that the investment into such resources should not be to the detriment of teaching provision.

Response: Accept

Comment: The Welsh-medium Education Strategy includes an objective to increase and improve the range of teaching and learning resources available to meet the needs of Welsh-medium and Welsh-language learners. The Welsh Assembly Government commissions classroom resources across the whole range of curriculum areas, including Welsh as a subject, for learners of all abilities. The local authorities also prepare resources for teaching Welsh

second language through the *athrawon bro* service, and there are countless resources available. However, it is acknowledged that the resources produced by the *athrawon bro* may seem inferior to resources which are widely available for other subjects on the public market.

The resources commissioned by the Welsh Assembly Government cover all types of media including print, audio-visual, DVD, CD-ROM and online materials. The materials commissioned are prioritised on the basis of an annual evidence-gathering exercise including subject panels of teachers from schools and colleges. Welsh second language resources for pupils aged 3-19 represent over one third of projects commissioned annually. On average, £360k per year has been invested in these resources over the past decade, and in 2009-10, 25 projects were commissioned for learning Welsh, out of a total of 70 projects commissioned for all subjects. In 2009-10, the printed materials generated gross sales of over £100k, with the free access to on-line materials on the National Grid for Learning (NGfL) Cymru also being well used. Recent years have seen a growth in demand for digital materials; approximately one third of materials for learning Welsh are in electronic format or are available free online and this trend is likely to continue in response to teacher demand.

Financial Implications: No extra financial implications provided that the implementation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy continues to be fully funded. Funding for classroom resources is included in the current programme budget which supports the implementation of the Strategy, and is separate from funding for teaching provision.

6. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Government explores the implementation of a more intensive Welsh language course which would prepare post-16 pupils to react to various situations within the work environment.

Response: Accept in principle

Comment: The Welsh Assembly Government agrees that there is potential to develop a bespoke intensive Welsh language course to prepare post-16 pupils to use spoken Welsh at a basic or intermediate level in the workplace. Currently, there are few vocational second language qualifications/units. The WJEC currently offers an AS Level qualification in Applied Welsh second language to enable pupils to learn Welsh in a vocational context. However, take-up of the qualification has been low, with only one centre entering candidates for the qualification in 2010. The WJEC also offers A/AS Level Welsh second language qualifications, and in 2010, 780 candidates entered the AS level qualification, with 496 candidates entering the A level qualification.

The Assembly Government will consider commissioning market research to ascertain the demand for a new AS/A Level in Applied Welsh second

language or an alternative Level 3 qualification before any plans are put in place.

The WJEC *'Iaith ar Waith / Using Language at Work'* units exist mainly for the Welsh-medium sector. The purpose of the units is to reward the competence of an entrant in providing customer service in Welsh, with elements of bilingualism. The intention is to work with the WJEC to develop and expand the units over the next year to include Welsh second-language units, in order to ensure that more learners can apply their vocational skills in Welsh and be rewarded for their Welsh-language skills. This work is already in hand.

Financial Implications: Additional funding would be required for the course development. The delivery of the course could be funded through the Welsh for Adults centres or post-16 providers.

7. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Government explores ways to implement an accredited Welsh language course in post-16 education, with more focus on using Welsh as a vocational skill.

Response: Accept in principle

Comment: Please see comment in response to recommendation 6 above.

Financial Implications: Please see 6 above.

8. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Government commission research into the actions taken by schools to encourage teachers to enrol onto Welsh-medium courses. We also recommend that the Welsh Government considers how best it can provide support and advice to schools and teachers on how to carefully manage resources to accommodate teachers' absence for training purposes.

Response: Accept

Comment: This recommendation appears to confuse Welsh-medium training, which is targeted at practitioners teaching in the Welsh-medium sector, and Welsh-language training, which is targeted at practitioners in the English-medium and bilingual sectors who wish to improve their language skills. In the context of the report, the Welsh Assembly Government has interpreted this recommendation as referring to Welsh-language training.

Ensuring an appropriate workforce to deliver Welsh-medium and Welsh-language provision across all phases of education and training is a key aim of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy. The Strategy contains an objective to

develop a national infrastructure for regional delivery of in-service Continuing Professional Development training that will include different models of training.

The Welsh Assembly Government has begun to pilot a process of working closely with local authorities, namely Pembrokeshire, Carmarthenshire and Ceredigion, to identify and target teachers from English-medium or bilingual primary settings who could benefit from Welsh-language training through the 3-month foundation level Sabbatical Scheme. Plans are afoot to roll out the Sabbatical Scheme from September 2011 so that courses are made available across Wales. As a result, all local authorities will be asked to identify teachers and will be financially supported to release those teachers to attend the 3-month training course. This enables schools to appoint supply teachers to cover the work while the teacher is absent for training purposes. This process will encourage schools and teachers to take advantage of the training on offer. However, as the Report states, there is anecdotal evidence pointing at a shortage of suitably qualified and skilled supply teachers. This will need to be discussed in greater detail with the relevant local authorities.

There has been extensive support and advice to schools and teachers on how to manage resources to accommodate teachers' absence for training purposes carefully. This has been issued by the Workforce Agreement Monitoring Group which has issued guidance on the development of robust strategies to cover for absent teachers, for training and other purposes. Schools who take account of this advice and guidance should not find the provision of suitable quality provision of cover a barrier to the development of their staff.

In addition, the implementation of the Review of Professional Standards, Performance Management and Continuing Professional Development will encourage the use of a range of more flexible approaches to professional development other than the traditional course. This will include use of on-line training resources, participation in learning communities, peer coaching and mentoring and action-based research and more effective use of existing opportunities for in-service training (INSET) days. We will ensure that these more effective and flexible models of professional development also apply to Welsh-language training opportunities to minimise the barriers to access by teachers and other school staff.

Financial Implications: The Sabbatical Scheme is funded through the current budget which supports the implementation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy. The Sabbatical Scheme is a priority for funding provided that the implementation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy continues to be funded at current or higher levels in the future. The introduction of additional models of training would have financial implications.

9. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Government considers enhancing the provision to deliver training for classroom assistants in the teaching of Welsh as a second language. We recommend that Welsh Language Centres for Adults or the *Geiriau Bach* pilot be considered to deliver this training.

Response: Accept

Comment: The Assembly Government is committed to the provision of training for classroom assistants, and in August 2010, £4million was committed to fund the continued delivery of training for classroom assistants through the *Cam wrth Gam* and *Geiriau Bach* programmes until March 2013. The *Geiriau Bach* course is delivered in 13 groups in 9 locations across Wales, and is open to practitioners who want to improve their Welsh-language skills. Further intensive courses for practitioners such as classroom assistants are under consideration.

Financial Implications: £4million has already been committed for the delivery of training from April 2011 until March 2013.

10. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Government considers the establishment of an intensive Welsh language course for non-Welsh speaking teachers and support staff. We recommend that Welsh Language Centres for Adults be considered to deliver these courses.

Response: Accept in principle

Comment: The Welsh Assembly Government agrees that non-Welsh speaking teachers and support staff should be able to access intensive courses so as to increase the supply of qualified teachers with Welsh-language skills. The Assembly Government is currently prioritising training for practitioners at Key Stage 2 through the Sabbatical Scheme. As outlined in 8 above, the Welsh Assembly Government intends to roll out the Sabbatical Scheme from September 2011 across Wales, and the Welsh for Adults centres will be partners in this delivery.

The Welsh Assembly Government also has plans to pilot a 1-month intensive summer course for those who have completed their Initial Teacher Training and wish to work in English-medium or bilingual primary settings. The aim is to ensure that they have sufficient Welsh-language skills to deliver the National Curriculum.

There are currently no plans to target intensive Welsh-language training at non-Welsh speaking teachers and support staff in secondary schools due to limited resources. Teachers and support staff should be encouraged to register on Welsh for Adults courses across Wales in the short to medium term.

Financial Implications: The Sabbatical Scheme is funded through the current programme budget which supports the implementation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy. The Sabbatical Scheme is a priority for funding provided that the implementation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy continues to be funded at current or higher levels in the future. The introduction of additional models of training would have financial implications and would require careful costing before approval.

11. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Government consider accrediting the *Cynllun Colegau Cymru* Welsh-language programme to provide an additional incentive to teachers to learn Welsh.

Response: Accept

Comment: *Cynllun Colegau Cymru* resources and assessment criteria were reviewed and developed in 2009 via a grant from the Centre for Welsh Medium Higher Education and are available on the *Mantais* website. These have been adopted by the three Initial Teacher Training centres and standards are moderated across the centres. However, *Cynllun Colegau Cymru* remains unaccredited and therefore the Assembly Government plans to work with the planned Coleg Ffederal and the three Initial Teacher Training centres to provide accreditation for this Welsh-language training programme.

The Assembly Government plans to develop a national infrastructure for regional delivery of in-service Continuing Professional Development training. This infrastructure will include different models of training and the Assembly Government will take steps to ensure that all Welsh-language practitioner training included in the infrastructure is accredited.

Financial Implications: None.

12. The Committee recommends that:

Guidance should be provided to school governing bodies and headteachers on how they can develop a “bilingual ethos” in their schools. This guidance should focus on increasing the understanding of accountability and responsibility, and co-operation between schools, Local Education Authorities, the Welsh Language Board and the Welsh Government. The Welsh Government may wish to use Treorchy Comprehensive School as a model of good practice.

Response: Accept in principle

Comment: The Assembly Government appreciates that some school governing bodies and head-teachers need further support to improve the “bilingual ethos” in their schools. Clarity needs to be provided on what is

expected when referring to a “bilingual ethos” e.g. school governing bodies and head-teachers are expected to do more than simply provide bilingual signs and websites.

From September 2010, the Estyn Common Inspection Framework looks at 10 quality indicators under three key questions. There is a range of aspects for each quality indicator. The Welsh language will be one of the indicators in Key Questions 1 and 2 on which schools and providers will be judged. Estyn has published supplementary guidance for inspecting Welsh language in schools; however, the document is aimed at inspectors and is not for general use or circulation.

The Assembly Government will consider ways of working with Estyn and other partners to improve the guidance and support available. The Schools Effectiveness Framework also encourages schools to work more closely together to enable good practice to be shared.

Financial Implications: None.

13. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Government considers using the School Effectiveness Framework to build bridges between Welsh-medium schools and English-medium schools to develop professional learning communities and share Welsh language teaching expertise.

Response: Accept

Comment: Teaching and learning practices are the most significant factors in learning outcomes and are central to all that we are aiming to achieve within the School Effectiveness Framework. That is why the Welsh Assembly Government is developing Professional Learning Communities (PLCs).

To date, this has involved working with local authorities and nearly 1,000 schools including Welsh-medium, English-medium, schools with a religious character from the primary, secondary and special sector. All PLCs have a clear focus on improving learner outcomes. While improving literacy and numeracy levels and reducing the impact of poverty on educational attainment are identified as the key areas for attention it is anticipated that PLCs will be used by practitioners in a range of contexts to improve learning. It is for schools to decide the focus of the PLC based upon the analysis of data and evidence. However PLCs will provide a tool for schools and local authorities to share Welsh language expertise. By the end of March 2011, we expect all consortia and local authorities to be involved in PLC work and all schools to be running PLCs within, between and across schools. To support this, we will be launching support materials developed by teachers for teachers.

Financial Implications: None. The current work on PLCs is being funded from the School Effectiveness Framework budget and covers all schools in all settings.

14. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Government explore ways of working with the Welsh Language Board, the WJEC and the Urdd to promote the benefits of the Welsh language effectively amongst non-Welsh speaking parents, particularly the significant number of parents who are reluctant to encourage their children to learn Welsh.

Response: Accept

Comment: The Welsh-medium Education Strategy includes an objective to improve the communication of clear information to parents and carers about the nature of both the language provision and the language ethos of various settings and schools. The Welsh Assembly Government will work with partners, including the Welsh Language Board and local authorities to ensure that parents are provided with clearer information about the various linguistic outcomes of schools and about the benefits of Welsh-language skills. The Welsh Assembly Government will also provide information on how parents could learn Welsh with their children on a bespoke Welsh for the Family course offered by one of the Welsh for Adults centres.

There are a number of partners involved in providing opportunities to use the Welsh language in a social context, such as the Urdd, the Mentrau Iaith and the Welsh Language Board. Both the Department for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills and the Department for Heritage will need to work closely with these partners to ensure clear and consistent messages are communicated about the benefits of the Welsh language and the opportunities to use the language as a living language.

Financial Implications: None for establishing collaboration. There would be additional costs, above the current level of funding to support the Welsh-medium Education Strategy, for grant-funding specific projects which may emerge as a result of collaboration.

15. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Government collaborate with S4C and the WJEC to develop new Welsh second language learning programmes which incorporate popular culture and are relevant to modern society. We also recommend that these programmes be broadcast through all media outlets available to S4C to ensure that Welsh second language learners have instant access to learning resources.

Response: Accept

Comment: The Welsh Assembly Government welcomes this proposal. It is important to emphasise that S4C has a wider role than that of broadcaster, and has a role to play in making the language relevant to a wide range of people. Its contribution to Welsh Assembly Government strategies to support the language is extremely valuable and this recommendation helps to underline that fact.

S4C has also welcomed this recommendation. Provision for learners is an area on which S4C would like to have further discussion with the Welsh Assembly Government and other partners.

Financial Implications: None

16. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Government work with the Welsh Language Board to prepare and issue guidance for schools to recognise the different degrees of bilingualism. We also recommend that any guidance issued should include an appropriate inspection grade, in line with those grades provided for sustainable development and international relations.

Response: Accept in Principle

Comment: Guidance on recognising different degrees of bilingualism could be incorporated in the guidance proposed in recommendation 12 above.

Financial Implications: None

17. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Government considers the feasibility of implementing a Bilingual Friendly Schools Initiative, which would place an emphasis on a whole school approach to bilingualism.

Response: Accept in principle

Comment: The Assembly Government is currently considering the potential for establishing an 'Investing in Welsh' award. The purpose of the award would be to:

- raise the standards and attainment in Welsh second language as a subject; and
- to strengthen the bilingual ethos of schools or clusters of schools.

It would reward individual and clusters of schools for supporting Welsh in and beyond the classroom. Local authorities could be invited to nominate a school or a cluster of schools in their authority to be part of the initial pilot through the School Effectiveness Framework. By working in clusters, it would be possible

to share ideas and experiences, and schools that are 'weak' or 'lacking confidence' could benefit from the collaboration.

Financial Implications: No extra financial implications provided that the Welsh-medium Education Strategy continues to be funded at current or higher levels in the future. Funding for pilot programmes could be earmarked from the programme budget which supports the implementation of the Strategy.

18. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Government explore a graduated system of rewarding competence of English-Welsh bilingualism suitable for primary, secondary and tertiary education.

Response: Reject

Comment: The Welsh Assembly Government acknowledges that bilingual competence is important. However, under the new Common Inspection Framework, Estyn will judge Welsh language outcomes and provision rather than 'bilingualism'. The priority is to improve standards in Welsh second language to ensure that pupils can use the language before we consider plans to recognise and develop their 'bilingual' competence.

The current distinction between 'Welsh' and 'Welsh second language' can be an obstacle to meaningful progress in Welsh language skills. While a continuum for adult learning would be reasonably straightforward, it is more challenging in the context of pupils and schools. Although the Welsh Assembly Government rejects the recommendation to explore a graduated system for rewarding competence of English-Welsh bilingualism, the Assembly Government does intend to undertake further research and modelling work over the coming years to consider the feasibility of introducing a language continuum which would encompass all educational phases.

Financial Implications: No extra financial implications provided that the Welsh-medium Education Strategy continues to be funded at current or higher levels in the future. Funding for the research and modelling work in relation to a language continuum could be earmarked from the programme budget which supports the implementation of the Strategy.

19. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Government, in conjunction with its partners, oversee and monitor the development and promotion of local and national bilingual education strategies and ensure that schools across Wales are provided with the necessary support and advice to ensure that all education policies are compatible with bilingual provision. We also recommend that the views of schools in Wales are represented on the proposed Welsh Language Commissioner's Advisory Panel.

Response: Accept

Comment: The Welsh-medium Education Strategy seeks to ensure that a stronger framework and policy infrastructure is established and developed on a local and national level to enable forward planning across all phases of Welsh-medium and bilingual education and training.

Strategic Aims 1 and 2 of the Strategy are concerned with improving this planning. The supporting Implementation Programme details the steps to be taken to address the current weaknesses in planning provision across Wales, and include working closely with local authorities and schools through the School Effectiveness Framework; the 14-19 partnerships; Colegau Cymru; and with the planned Coleg Ffederal. The Assembly Government will monitor Welsh in Education Strategic Plans, which will encompass local authorities' planning of Welsh-medium school places and bilingual strategies.

The Strategy also acknowledges that robust linguistic progression through every phase of education offers the best conditions for developing future bilingual citizens. The term 'bilingual provision' is used to refer to a wide range of teaching and learning settings which include varying amounts of Welsh language in the delivery, and there is a need to ensure that local needs are supported. However, the linguistic outcomes of these different types of provision will vary significantly, and bilingual provision does not always ensure that an individual becomes bilingual.

The Welsh Language Commissioner's Advisory Panel will be appointed by Welsh Ministers. In appointing members to the Advisory Panel, the Welsh Ministers will have to comply with appointment regulations which may make provisions about the knowledge and experience which members of the Panel are required to have. The need for Advisory Panel members to have knowledge and experience with regard to the views of schools in Wales can be considered as the appointment regulations are prepared and as appointments are made. In addition, under the proposed Welsh Language (Wales) Measure, the Welsh Ministers will establish a Welsh Language Partnership Council to give advice, or make representations to the Welsh Ministers in relation to the Welsh Language Strategy adopted under section 78 of the Government of Wales Act 2006. In appointing to the Council, the Welsh Ministers will take account of potential members' experience of matters relating to the Welsh language. The need for Council members to have experience with regard to the views of schools in Wales can be considered as appointments to the Council are made.

Financial Implications: No extra financial implications provided that the Welsh-medium Education Strategy continues to be funded at current or higher levels in the future.

20. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Government commission further research into the practice of employing peripatetic Welsh teachers to help bridge the transition between Key Stages 2 and 3 as used by Treorchy Comprehensive School and explore opportunities to share best practice with English-medium schools throughout Wales.

Response: Accept in principle

Comment: The *athrawon bro*, who are specialist teachers of Welsh, have undertaken an important role in supporting Welsh and Welsh second language study since the 1990s. Their main role is to support the provision of Welsh second language, but the nature and range of their functions vary from authority to authority. Their responsibilities cover sample lessons, preparing appropriate teaching materials, providing advice on teaching methodologies and providing training courses for teachers. In some authorities, the *athrawon bro* are used as peripatetic Welsh teachers, in particular, to bridge the transition between Key Stages 2 and 3.

A fact-finding review of the Welsh-language support service to schools provided by the local authorities, and delivered mainly by the *athrawon bro*, was commissioned in February 2010. The final report will be published by January 2011 and will make recommendations to the Welsh Assembly Government on how local authorities could use *athrawon bro* more effectively and develop and share resources and training.

There are also other examples of clusters of schools who have appointed a member of staff to be responsible for pupils during the transition between Key Stage 2 and 3. All examples of good practice need to be identified and shared through the Schools Effectiveness Framework.

Financial Implications: No extra financial implications provided that the *athrawon bro* service continues to be fully funded. The *athrawon bro* service is currently funded from the Better Schools Fund and the Welsh Language Board with match funding from the local authorities.

21. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Government continue to provide adequate financial support to the *Geiriau Bach* project beyond 2011 and that it explore commissioning further pilots across Wales. We also recommend that the Welsh Government be pro-active in providing regular feedback and the necessary support to existing and future projects.

Response: Accept

Comment: Please see response to 9 above with regard to the commitment to fund the *Geiriau Bach* project beyond 2011.

The University of Wales Trinity Saint David, which manages *Geiriau Bach* and promotes the course through its website and termly newsletter, is holding taster sessions in a further 7 locations during October/November 2010.

Financial Implications: £4million has already been committed for the delivery of training until March 2013.

22. The Committee recommends that:

The Welsh Assembly Government ensures that the conclusions and recommendations of our report will be reflected in the implementation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy.

Response: Accept

Comment: The Welsh Assembly Government welcomes the report and the recommendations made by the Committee. The implementation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy is being monitored internally by a Project Board, which meets on a quarterly basis. An external Advisory Panel will also be established to advise me on the implementation of the Strategy and an annual report on progress will be published. I will ensure that the conclusions and recommendations of this report are appropriately reflected in the implementation of the Strategy. Plans to evaluate the Welsh-medium Education Strategy will take into account the recommendations of this Enterprise and Learning Committee report and will provide an opportunity to investigate further many of the issues that have been raised in the report.

Financial Implications: None.

Leighton Andrews, the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning.