

THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY FOR WALES:

AUDIT COMMITTEE

**Report presented to the National Assembly for Wales on 28 August 2003 in
accordance with section 102 (1) of the Government of Wales Act 1998**

MANAGEMENT OF THE FURTHER EDUCATION ESTATE IN WALES

CONTENTS	Paragraphs
Introduction	1-2
The condition, functional suitability and utilisation of the estate	3-12
Factors affecting management of the estate	13-25
Role and responsibility of the Council	26-27
Summary of recommendations	28
Concluding comments	29-30
ANNEXES	
Annex A: Relevant Proceedings of the Committee - minutes of evidence (Thursday 27 February 2003)	
Annex B: The Audit Committee	

INTRODUCTION

1. This report is about the quality of the estate owned by further education institutions in Wales, the way it is being managed by those institutions and the strategic oversight exercised by the National Council for Education and Training for Wales (the Council). All but two of the 26 further education institutions in Wales¹ own and occupy significant land and buildings - totalling about 600,000 square metres, with a total value of some £250 million. In the 2000-01 academic year, institutions spent nearly £30 million on their estates.

2. On the basis of a report prepared by the Auditor General for Wales², we took evidence from the Chief Executive of the Council, Steve Martin, and its Director of Finance and Risk, Richard Hirst. (On 31 March 2003, subsequent to our meeting, as part of the restructuring involving the Council and its higher education equivalent, Mr Martin and Mr Hirst resigned from these posts.) Our report focuses on the two main areas which arose from our investigation:
 - the condition, functional suitability and utilisation of the estate; and

 - factors affecting the management of the estate;

We conclude by considering the statutory framework governing the role of the Council and its relationship with institutions which have been self-governing since 1993.

THE CONDITION, FUNCTIONAL SUITABILITY AND UTILISATION OF THE FURTHER EDUCATION ESTATE

Condition

3. Maintaining and improving the condition of the estate is not only a case of preserving an asset but attracting students and the related funding, creating a safe working environment for staff, as well as facilitating effective teaching and

¹ The YMCA and the Workers Educational Association (South)

² Auditor General for Wales (AGW) report on *Management of the Further Education Estate in Wales*, presented to the National Assembly on 13 February 2003

learning. Witnesses acknowledged that they were well aware of the potential impact of poor buildings on the core business of institutions.³ However, nearly one third of the estate (30 per cent) is at best “operational but major repair or replacement needed soon”. The current estimated cost of bringing the condition of the estate up to standard and maintaining it there over ten years is in the order of £80 million. A proportion of this, some £20-40 million, represents the cost of addressing backlog maintenance.⁴

4. Witnesses told us that the condition of the further education estate had improved significantly since institutions moved away from local government ten years ago. For example, a large number of portakabins and other sub-standard buildings had been disposed of.⁵ We note, however, that the lack of consistent data meant that the Auditor General had been unable to benchmark the Council’s view.⁶ Witnesses also pointed to the investment made in the estate by the National Council in the first two years of its existence, amounting to the best part of £30 million.⁷ In terms of the high level of backlog maintenance that has developed, the Council told us that it had repeatedly given clear guidance on the priority that should be given to spending on estates.⁸ For the future, we were told that the Council wanted to look at the issue in the context of all its post-16 responsibilities, including schools and work-based provision.⁹ No doubt this is sensible. However, given the importance of the basic condition of their buildings to the health of institutions, we urge the Council to continue to encourage institutions to address this core issue as a matter of priority.

Functional suitability

5. The Auditor General for Wales reported that 43 per cent of the estate was less than acceptable in terms of functional suitability (relevant factors include location,

³ Q7

⁴ AGW report, paragraphs 2.2 and 2.6

⁵ Qs 11 and 46

⁶ AGW report, paragraph 2.4

⁷ Q5

⁸ Q13

⁹ Qs 12 and 17

amenity and environmental conditions).¹⁰ The Council explained that new patterns of learning such as providing community facilities, distance learning and the increased use of computers meant that improving the estates of institutions could not be solved by simply rationalising the space occupied. However, the Council undertook to do what it could in the way of continuing to offer guidance and to work with institutions to improve the functional suitability of the estate.¹¹

6. We were very concerned to learn that in 2001 there was over £20 million of work required in order to make the further education estate compliant with the Disability Discrimination Act 1995 (DDA). About half of this total related to works which, under the legislation, should already have been carried out.¹² The Council told us that, despite its own efforts in impressing on institutions the priority that this work should take, it could not confirm that these mandatory works had been carried out and it was possible that a number of institutions were therefore in breach of the law. Witnesses explained that funding constraints were the main reason why this was the case, but acknowledged that it was unacceptable for such a situation to persist. They also said that the Council was now asking institutions to give priority to work on meeting the requirements of the DDA and that since 1999-2000 it had been a condition of capital funding that capital plans were produced before resources were released.¹³ We note that, given the slow progress apparently being made in addressing the work needed to comply with the parts of the DDA already in force, it is highly unlikely that work on other categories, due to come into force in October 2004, will be completed in time.¹⁴
7. We are concerned at the possible effects of the lack of progress on this matter on the enrolment of students with disabilities. Although the Council confirmed that there had been no complaints against institutions in this respect, there is no

¹⁰ AGW report, paragraph 2.9 and Figure 6

¹¹ Qs 19-20

¹² AGW report, paragraphs 2.13-2.14 and Appendix 4

¹³ Qs 23-26

¹⁴ Q29

guarantee that students with disabilities are not being deterred from applying to study due to the lack of appropriate facilities.¹⁵

8. We regard this issue - providing a welcoming and accessible environment for all students, including people with disabilities - as being of the utmost importance. We agree with the then Accounting Officer that it is unacceptable that institutions might be breaking the law by not implementing the requirements of the DDA. It was encouraging to hear the then Accounting Officer's clear acknowledgement that the Council should address this issue very firmly, without necessarily waiting for its planned review of funding to take effect.¹⁶ **We recommend that, in terms of meeting their obligations under the Disability Discrimination Act 1995, institutions should, with the support of the Council, as a minimum address immediately and with the utmost urgency those works which should already have been implemented. We further recommend that by December 2003 the Council report back to this Committee on the progress made in addressing the requirements of the DDA.**

Utilisation

9. The Auditor General reported that only five institutions were meeting the Council's unwritten target of 30 per cent for the utilisation of their estate (the degree to which the teaching part of the estate is used, taking account of both the frequency and occupancy of space).¹⁷ Furthermore, results would be even lower if utilisation in the hours outside 9 am to 5 pm were included in the overall measurement of the target.¹⁸ The Council explained exactly how the target was calculated, and that it was often hard to raise performance, even for apparently crowded campuses such as the University of Glamorgan. Other factors that militated against achieving the target included the difficulty of remodelling old buildings to suit new teaching provision, and the need for some institutions to serve large rural areas, or special needs groups.¹⁹ However, the then Accounting

¹⁵ Qs 27-28

¹⁶ Q48

¹⁷ AGW report, paragraph 2.16 and Figure 7

¹⁸ Q33

¹⁹ Qs 32 and 35

Officer said that he was deeply unconvinced by the target, which he described as not particularly helpful. In his view a more sensible approach would be a basket of performance indicators that did more to capture issues facing individual institutions, such as patterns of learning and the communities served, and which would also enable people to compare and contrast their performance with comparable institutions.²⁰ We consider the issue of measuring estates-related performance later in this report.

10. The Council highlighted the recent growth in student numbers, despite the poor condition of parts of the estate, and, by implication, the better use of the estate.²¹ For the future, however, the Council told us that the predicted increase in institutions' annual student intakes mentioned in the Auditor General's report was likely to be accommodated through outreach, new partnerships and the better use of school buildings, rather than simply better use of institutions' estates.²²
11. One of the main aims of targeting utilisation rates is to ensure that institutions are not paying for more estates than they actually need. In that context we were pleased to learn that it was not the case that maintenance funding was going towards maintaining parts of the estate that are never used.²³ Where institutions had been able to rationalise their estates, the Council was confident that they had done this, although, through better use of school buildings, some further rationalisation might be possible in the future.²⁴
12. In the context of current further education provision, the issue of estate utilisation is clearly a complicated one. We recognise that attempting to capture these complexities in a single, relatively simple metric might not be appropriate. However, given the significance of their estates to the core activities of institutions, the fallibilities of the current utilisation measure should not deter institutions from considering whether they are making the most of their estate, or

²⁰ Qs 32-33

²¹ Qs 7 and 34

²² AGW report, paragraph 2.17; Q34

²³ Q35

²⁴ Qs 35 and 38

whether they need it all. We look forward to the Council developing its set of indicators that will enable both it and institutions to assess performance.

FACTORS AFFECTING THE MANAGEMENT OF THE FURTHER EDUCATION ESTATE

Funding and expenditure

13. The Council provides funding to institutions on a formula basis. We were concerned to learn from the Auditor General's report that the resources made available to institutions to bring their estates up to the required standard do not take any account of the age or condition of a particular institution's estate.²⁵ Witnesses explained the rationale behind the formula (based on "weighted student learning units"), and said that, in terms of whether it would be appropriate to target funding at institutions with particular estates needs, there was also a balance to be struck in order to avoid rewarding what might have been previous ineffective management of estates. Targeting of this sort would also need to take account of post-16 provision as a whole.²⁶ An added problem for institutions is that funding is made available to institutions on an annual basis, making longer term estates planning difficult.²⁷ We were heartened to hear that the Council recognised that this could be a problem, and itself advocated a three-year rolling programme, updated each year to facilitate the longer-term planning that estates require.²⁸
14. Witnesses explained that to address these and other problems, the Council was in the process of developing a new, integrated planning and funding system which it intended to introduce from the academic year 2004-05.²⁹ This is potentially an important review, and we agree with the views put to us that it is important that the way any new system is introduced does not destabilise provision unnecessarily, and involves consultation with institutions.³⁰ In the context of its planning and funding review, **we recommend that the Council allocates at least**

²⁵ AGW report, paragraphs 3.2-3.4

²⁶ Qs 16-17 and 41

²⁷ AGW report, paragraph 3.5

²⁸ Qs 41-42

²⁹ Qs 17, 41 and 43

some of its funding for estates according to the identified need of individual institutions.

15. We were interested to note the case studies where institutions had accessed European Funding to enhance the resources available to them.³¹ The then Chief Executive of the Council felt that, although there were some excellent examples of ongoing projects, bringing in £8 million, there was always scope for institutions to do more in terms of accessing European monies. He added that the Council now had a much strengthened specialist resource in the organisation to advise and help institutions through the often complex process of applying for European funding.³² This is a welcome development.

Strategic estates planning

At Council level

16. We asked witnesses how the Council provided strategic guidance on priorities to institutions. Witnesses emphasised that the Council had paid attention to estates matters in the wider context of how to make the best use of all the resources going into post-16 education and training, but acknowledged that more could be done in this area.³³ They pointed to the fact that, for the future, the Council would be giving the new planning and funding arrangements sustained attention, and that investment in estates was an integral part of these arrangements.³⁴
17. In terms of providing guidance on priorities, the Council said that it had given 'indicative' priorities when asking institutions to bid for ring-fenced funds but wanted to move towards greater consistency about its priorities than in the past, to tie in with intentions to give institutions more security of funding.³⁵ We note the then Chief Executive's view that he saw the major priorities as: tackling backlog maintenance and works required to comply with disability legislation. Witnesses

³⁰ Q46

³¹ AGW report, paragraph 3.7 and case studies 5 and 6

³² Qs 51-52

³³ Qs 54, 58 and 62

³⁴ Qs 73-74

³⁵ Qs 21-22 66 and 71

reiterated, however, that the Council and its predecessor had provided ample guidance over the years; its powers in terms of compelling institutions to carry out specific actions were limited, and it preferred to work in partnership with institutions rather than attempting to be too directive.³⁶

18. We were pleased with the reassurance that witnesses gave on the Council's intentions to give estates matters a higher profile generally. However, it is clear that issuing guidance can only achieve so much. In order that this is communicated effectively to institutions and to ensure that more proactive action is taken, **we recommend that the Council signals the weight it attaches to estates matters through the development and publication of its priorities for improving the estate.**

At institution level

19. Institutions were due to submit their estate strategies to the Council by July 2000. Disappointingly, only seven out of 24 institutions met that deadline, five missing it by at least six months. Less than a third (seven) of the strategies were considered satisfactory by the consultants employed by the National Audit Office Wales. Over half of the strategies required further work on certain elements before they might be judged satisfactory, while four strategies were judged to be significantly deficient. No strategies were considered to be better than satisfactory.³⁷
20. The Council felt that one reason for the poor quality of strategies was the general lack of specialist resource, particularly for the smaller institutions.³⁸ This is an important point, to which we return below. However, witnesses agreed that the quality of the strategies submitted to the Council should be better and supported the Auditor General's recommendation that institutions should be required regularly to revisit and update their strategies, in dialogue with the Council.³⁹ More specifically, in terms of helping institutions address the management of their

³⁶ Qs 66-67 and 121

³⁷ AGW report, paragraphs 3.9-3.10 and 3.12-3.13

³⁸ Q79

³⁹ Qs 79-80

estate strategically, witnesses told us that the Council's intention was to develop greater expertise on estates matters at its four regional offices throughout Wales. This would build on an estates training event, which had been held previously. In addition, the Auditor General confirmed that the Council was welcome to use the report which he had commissioned from consultants assessing the quality of the estates strategies of institutions.⁴⁰ **We recommend that institutions review their estates strategies on an annual basis to ensure that they remain up to date, taking into account both the comments made by the consultants engaged by the National Audit Office Wales and the priorities published by the Council.**

Use of management information

21. The Auditor General reported that one factor which hampered both the Council and institutions in terms of effective strategic estates planning was the absence of good quality management information.⁴¹ In recognition of the need for a standardised set of data against which to assess estates performance in both the further and higher education sectors, the relevant Councils for England, Scotland and Wales jointly commissioned projects, first in higher education and subsequently in further education, to establish a set of key estate measures to provide a robust basis against which institutions could measure, and hence improve, their own performance. An important part of these projects is the on-going work to establish agreed estate management definitions so that meaningful comparisons can be made between institutions.⁴²
22. Witnesses told the Committee that the first information from the further education estates statistics project should be available in May 2003.⁴³ Given the current poor state of management information on estates – referred to as a “ragbag” by the then Accounting Officer⁴⁴ - this work is most necessary. He said that the project would produce over 100 indicators (very similar to those developed for higher education sector); while detail of this sort might be appropriate at the institution

⁴⁰ Qs 84-87

⁴¹ AGW report, paragraph 3.17

⁴² AGW report, paragraphs 3.20-3.22 and Figure 9

⁴³ Qs 89 and 100

⁴⁴ Q92

level, for its purposes the Council would select a more manageable smaller subset in order to monitor real improvements to the estate. The Council said that it was important that the indicators were not used crudely, and took account of the different circumstances facing each institution; it was also important that generating the data needed for the indicators was not seen as a chore by institutions, but that the resulting information should be owned by them and used as a catalyst for change.⁴⁵

23. It is difficult to see how either the Council or institutions can plan for improvement if they do not have even basic information on estates matters. We welcome the efforts being made in this area so that, as was outlined to us, dialogue is established in and between institutions, comparing and contrasting performance.⁴⁶ In order that progress can be monitored **we recommend that, using the Further Education Estates Management statistics project as a basis, the Council should set targets for continued improvements to the estate and publish the progress being made.**

Resourcing the estates management function

24. Advice on estates management is provided for both the higher and further education sectors - a total of 39 institutions - by the Council's Property Section, which comprises two professional estates officers. It is clear from the Auditor General's report that resource limitations mean that it cannot always act in a proactive way.⁴⁷ The Council paid tribute to the quality of its estates officers, but acknowledged that this was an insufficient level of resourcing and said that it would be revisiting this issue as part of its planned detailed restructuring.⁴⁸ Given the importance of the sector's estate to its overall performance, **we recommend that the Council reviews the resourcing of its Property Section to ensure it is equipped to deal with the task in hand.**

⁴⁵ Qs 89-90

⁴⁶ Q90

⁴⁷ AGW report, paragraphs 3.23-3.24

⁴⁸ Qs 4, 102 and 113

25. Within institutions, estates responsibilities are discharged in differing ways across the sector and this is not necessarily a reflection of the size of the estate. There is no consistent level to which estate managers are trained or qualified. Of the 24 institutions, five have estates managers with no formal estates-related qualifications. Furthermore, the Auditor General found that not all institutions are making full use of the guidance available to them.⁴⁹ Witnesses confirmed that, although the Council's firm advice to institutions for some time had been to seek professional advice on estates matters, it was still a mixed picture in terms of the expertise available to individual institutions. They reiterated, however, that how best to obtain expert advice - through having their own resource, buying it in or sharing it with others - was a matter for the institutions themselves.⁵⁰ In terms of whether governing bodies were acting in accordance with the guidance given to them, witnesses explained that this was being addressed through regular audit of the corporate governance arrangements of institutions.⁵¹ **We recommend that institutions consider strengthening their estates resources with either an in-house specialist appointment, buying in expertise or collaboration with other institutions.**

ROLE AND RESPONSIBILITY OF THE COUNCIL

26. The Auditor General's report sets out the statutory framework surrounding the relationship between the Council and the institutions. The Council's powers are currently linked to institutions' Financial Memoranda and the scope for direct action is limited to cutting off funding or appointing additional governors to the governing bodies of individual institutions.⁵² Such action is only taken in extreme circumstances and also means that provision of education and training for learners is put at risk. Nevertheless, the Auditor General's report makes it clear that, in many ways, the further education estate, which is owned by the individual institutions, is not up to standard and is therefore hindering effective education

⁴⁹ AGW report, paragraphs 3.26-3.28, 3.30-3.31 and Figures 10 and 11

⁵⁰ Qs 115-116

⁵¹ Q117

⁵² AGW report, paragraph 1.4 and associated box

and training. Throughout the evidence session, witnesses made a number of references to its relationship with institutions, reiterating the independence of institutions and its own relative lack of direct power.⁵³

27. We note the view expressed by the then Accounting Officer that the current framework whereby institutions were able to govern themselves had some advantages and had led to identifiable successes.⁵⁴ However, we also agree with him that the difficulty comes in tackling poor institutional performance.⁵⁵ The nature of the relationship between the Council and institutions and whether the current administrative framework is the right one has been considered by this Committee on two previous occasions.⁵⁶ We are not aware that there has been any significant progress on the recommendation made in both reports, accepted by the Cabinet on each occasion, that the Assembly examine whether the current model for the further education sector remain appropriate.⁵⁷ It is not acceptable for the Assembly Government to accept our recommendations only to take little or no action on them. **We recommend that the Auditor General for Wales advises us on what has happened in response to our recommendation, and whether the Assembly intends to take any more action in the future.**

RECOMMENDATIONS

28. In the light of these findings and conclusions we recommend that:
- i) in terms of meeting their obligations under the Disability Discrimination Act 1995, institutions should, with the support of the Council, as a minimum address immediately and with the utmost urgency those works which should already have been implemented. We further recommend that by December 2003 the Council report back to this Committee on the progress made in addressing the requirements of the DDA.

⁵³ Qs 4, 14, 26, 41, 116-117 and 121-122

⁵⁴ Qs 41 and 122

⁵⁵ Q122

⁵⁶ Audit Committee report 00-07, *Coleg Gwent*, recommendation (xvii) and Audit Committee report 04-02, *Procurement in the Further Education Sector in Wales*, recommendation (viii)

⁵⁷ Qs 122-124

- ii) in the context of its planning and funding review, the Council allocates at least some of its funding for estates according to the identified need of individual institutions;
- iii) the Council signals the weight it attaches to estates matters through the development and publication of its priorities for improving the estate;
- iv) institutions review their estates strategies on an annual basis to ensure that they remain up to date, taking into account both the criticisms made by the National Audit Office Wales' consultants and the priorities published by the Council;
- v) using the Further Education Estates Management statistics project as a basis, the Council should set targets for continued improvements to the estate and publish the progress being made;
- vi) the Council reviews the resourcing of its Property Section to ensure it is equipped to deal with the task in hand;
- vii) institutions consider strengthening their estates resources with either an in-house specialist appointment, buying in expertise or collaborating with other institutions; and
- viii) the Auditor General for Wales advises us on what has happened in response to our previous recommendations concerning the current model for the further education sector, and whether the Assembly intends to take any more action in the future.

CONCLUDING COMMENTS

29. The quality of their estates is central to the ability of further education institutions to deliver their services. We recognise the problems inherited by institutions in 1993 when they took over responsibility for managing their own affairs, and we appreciate the difficulties that institutions face when resources are, as is inevitably the case, limited. However, although we do not dispute the Council's argument

that there has been some progress in improving the estate since incorporation, and we appreciate that growing numbers of students are now being accommodated within it, it is apparent that there is a long way to go before the estate as a whole is of an acceptable quality across the sector. Nor, on the basis of their estates strategies, are we convinced that institutions currently have the expertise or the commitment needed to make real inroads into this problem.

30. Against this background we look to the Council to take the lead in driving forward real improvements. The then Accounting Officer assured us that he expected the Council's intentions for a revised planning and funding system to have a real effect. He also argued persuasively that the further education sector now comprised more than those institutions which were the focus of the Auditor General's report, since it now extended to schools and work-based provision. While we accept the force of these arguments, we also consider it important that changes in responsibility at National Council level do not result in any delays in addressing the issues raised in this report concerning the estates of institutions.



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Pwyllgor Archwilio**

**The National Assembly for Wales
Audit Committee**

**Rheoli Ystâd Addysg Bellach yng Nghymru
Management of the Further Education Estate in Wales**

**Cwestiynau 1-124
Questions 1-124**

**Dydd Iau 27 Chwefror 2003
Thursday 27 February 2003**

Aelodau o'r Cynulliad yn bresennol: Dafydd Wigley (Cadeirydd), Eleanor Burnham, Janet Davies, Janice Gregory, Ann Jones, Elin Jones, Val Lloyd.

Swyddogion yn bresennol: Syr John Bourn, Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru; Gillian Body, Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol Cymru; Ceri Thomas, Swyddog Cydymffurfio Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

Tystion: Steve Martin, Prif Weithredwr Cyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant; Richard Hirst, Cyfarwyddwr Cyllid a Systemau Cyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant.

Assembly Members present: Dafydd Wigley (Chair), Eleanor Burnham, Janet Davies, Janice Gregory, Ann Jones, Elin Jones, Val Lloyd.

Officials present: Sir John Bourn, Auditor General for Wales; Gillian Body, National Audit Office Wales; Ceri Thomas, National Assembly for Wales Compliance Officer.

Witnesses: Steve Martin, Chief Executive, National Council for Education and Training for Wales; Richard Hirst, Director of Finance and Systems, National Council for Education and Training for Wales.

*Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 2 p.m.
The meeting began at 2 p.m.*

[1] **Dafydd Wigley:** Prynawn da.

I remind everybody who is not bilingual that the Committee works in both languages. Earphones are available for translation from Welsh into English, and these may also be useful if people are hard of hearing or have difficulty picking up what is being said.

Croesawaf aelodau'r Pwyllgor, y tystion ac aelodau o'r cyhoedd i'r cyfarfod hwn. Croesawaf hefyd aelodau o swyddfa Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, ac yn arbennig yr archwilydd ei hun, Syr John Bourn. Atgoffaf bawb i ddiffodd ffonau symudol, blipwyr neu unrhyw offer technegol arall a allai ymyrryd ar y system ddarlledu a chyfieithu.

A oes unrhyw ddatganiadau o fuddiant?

[2] **Val Lloyd:** I declare that, until last October, I was governor of Swansea College.

[1] **Dafydd Wigley:** Good afternoon.

Atgoffaf bawb nad ydynt yn ddwyieithog fod y Pwyllgor yn gweithio yn y ddwy iaith. Mae clustffonau ar gael ar gyfer cyfieithiad o'r Gymraeg i'r Saesneg, ac efallai y bydd y rhain hefyd yn ddefnyddiol i bobl trwm eu clyw neu sy'n cael trafferth dilyn yr hyn a ddywedir.

I welcome Committee members, witnesses and members of the public to this meeting. I also welcome members from the Auditor General's office, and particularly the auditor himself, Sir John Bourn. I remind everyone to switch off mobile phones, beepers or any other technical equipment that could interfere with the broadcasting and translation system.

Are there any declarations of interest?

[2] **Val Lloyd:** Datganaf fy mod, tan fis Hydref y llynedd, yn llywodraethwr yng Ngholeg Abertawe.

[3] **Dafydd Wigley:** Derbyniwyd ymddiheuriadau oddi wrth Alison Halford, Alun Cairns a Jocelyn Davies. Croesawaf Elin Jones i'n plith fel dirprwy ar ran Jocelyn Davies.

Symudaf ymlaen i'r ail eitem ar ein hagenda, sef sesiwn cymryd tystiolaeth ar reoli ystâd addysg bellach yng Nghymru. Bydd y Pwyllgor yn cymryd tystiolaeth mewn perthynas ag adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol Cymru ar ran Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru ar reoli ystâd addysg bellach yng Nghymru, ac mae gan aelodau'r Pwyllgor gopi o'r adroddiad. Croesawaf y tystion. A wnewch chi gyflwyno'ch hunain, cyn imi roi ychydig mwy o gefndir?

Mr Martin: Steve Martin ydwyf fi, prif weithredwr Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru.

Mr Hirst: I am Richard Hirst, director of finance of the national council—ELWa.

[4] **Dafydd Wigley:** Croeso ichi i'r Pwyllgor. Byddwn yn cael egwyl tua 3.15 p.m. am ryw bum munud neu 10 ar y mwyaf—cawn weld sut y mae pethau'n symud ymlaen. Cyn imi symud at y cwestiwn cyntaf, dylwn grybwyll y bu'r ddau dyst sydd ger ein bron ymhlith dirprwyaeth a fu ger bron y Pwyllgor fis diwethaf, pan oeddem yn ystyried materion eraill. Mae'r Pwyllgor hwn yn ystyried sut mae'r Llywodraeth neu gyrff sydd yn atebol i'r Cynulliad yn gweithredu o safbwynt effeithioldeb a phriodoldeb ac o safbwynt cael gwerth gorau am arian. Nid yw'n Bwyllgor sydd yn ystyried polisi; mae hynny'n fater ar gyfer Pwyllgorau polisi, a chredaf ei bod yn bwysig inni, fel Pwyllgor, bob amser gofio hynny. Fis diwethaf, pan oeddech chi'ch dau, ymhlith eraill, ger ein bron, yr oedd materion eithaf dadleuol ger ein bron. Efallai fod pwnc heddiw yn llai cynhyrfus, ond, serch hynny, mae'n bwnc pwysig. Rheoli ystâd, sef tiroedd ac adeiladau, y sector addysg bellach yng Nghymru yw'r pwnc, ac yr wyf am ddiolch i swyddogion Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol Cymru am eu gwaith dyfal wrth baratoi'r adroddiad sydd ger ein bron.

Efallai nad yw'r bobl hynny sydd yn dilyn

[3] **Dafydd Wigley:** Apologies have been received from Alison Halford, Alun Cairns and Jocelyn Davies. I welcome Elin Jones, who is deputising for Jocelyn Davies, to the Committee.

I will move on to the second item on the agenda, which is an evidence-taking session on the management of the further education estate in Wales. The Committee will take evidence in connection with the report by the National Audit Office, on behalf of the Auditor General for Wales, on the management of the further education estate in Wales, and Committee members have a copy of that report. I welcome the witnesses. Will you introduce yourselves, before I give a little more background?

Mr Martin: I am Steve Martin, chief executive of Education and Learning Wales.

Mr Hirst: Richard Hirst ydwyf fi, cyfarwyddwr cyllid y cyngor cenedlaethol—ELWa.

[4] **Dafydd Wigley:** I welcome you to the Committee. We will break at approximately 3.15 p.m. for five or 10 minutes at the most—we will see how things progress. Before I move on to the first question, I should mention that the two witnesses before us were part of a delegation that appeared before the Committee last month, when we were considering other matters. This Committee considers how the Government or bodies that are accountable to the Assembly act in terms of effectiveness and propriety and in terms of getting best value for money. It is not a Committee that considers policy; that is a matter for policy Committees, and I believe that it is important that we, as a Committee, always keep that in mind. Last month, when you two, and others, were before us, we were discussing fairly contentious matters. Today's subject may not stir up as much excitement, but it is important nonetheless. The subject is the management of the estate, namely the land and buildings, of the further education sector in Wales, and I thank National Audit Office Wales officials for their hard work in preparing the report that is before us.

Those people following our discussions on

ein trafodaeth ar y teledu, na'r ymwelwyr sydd yma heddiw, wedi cael cyfle i astudio'r papurau sydd ger ein bron, a byddai'n fuddiol imi gyfeirio at brif thema heddiw, sef bod traean o ystâd ein sefydliadau addysg bellach yng Nghymru mewn cyflwr gwael a bod angen eu hatgyweirio. Mae adroddiad Syr John Bourn, Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, yn awgrymu y gall hyn gostio hyd at £80 miliwn dros gyfnod o 10 mlynedd. Hefyd, mae 40 y cant o'r ystâd yn anaddas ar gyfer ei swyddogaeth bresennol, ac efallai y bydd angen cymaint ag £20 miliwn o wariant ychwanegol i ateb gofynion deddfwriaeth anabledd. Materion sydd yn gysylltiedig â hyn fydd testun ein hymholiadau.

Egluraf hefyd—credaf y gall hyn fod o help i'r bobl sydd yn dilyn ein gwaith—fod yr adroddiad sydd ger ein bron yn adroddiad ffeithiol, ac mae'r ffeithiau sydd ynddo yn rhai y mae'r tystion ger ein bron a'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol, Syr John Bourn, wedi cytuno arnynt. Felly nid oes dadlau ynglŷn â'r ffeithiau. Yr hyn yr ydym, fel Pwyllgor, yn ceisio'u darganfod yw'r gwersi sydd i'w dysgu o'r adroddiad ac o'r ffeithiau, ac, ar ôl holi'r tystion, byddwn, fel bob amser, yn llunio adroddiad i'r Llywodraeth ar ein casgliadau. Bydd wedyn yn fater i'r Llywodraeth ymateb i'r argymhellion hynny. Mae'n werth nodi hefyd, yng nghyd-destun addysg bellach, nad yw'r colegau unigol yn atebol i ELWa a Chyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant am eu gweithgareddau o ddydd i ddydd; maent yn sefydliadau annibynnol, ac wedi bod felly ers iddynt symud o fod dan oruchwyliaeth llywodraeth leol yn 1993. Felly, y grym neu'r dylanwad sydd gan y cyngor cenedlaethol dros y sefydliadau yw'r hyn sydd yn deillio o femoranda ariannol rhwng y cyngor a phob sector unigol, sydd yn nodi o dan ba delerau ac amodau y darperir cyllid iddynt. Fodd bynnag, mae gan y cyngor hawl i benodi llywodraethwyr ychwanegol i oruchwyllo rhaglen o welliant, ac mae ganddo hawl hefyd, wrth gwrs, i atal grant, er, mae'n debyg, mai'r dewis niwclear fyddai hynny.

Mae'r adroddiad sydd ger ein bron heddiw yn rhannu'n naturiol i nifer o adrannau, megis cyflwr yr adeiladau, addasrwydd yr adeiladau a'r defnydd a wneir o'r adeiladau. Byddwn

television, and the visitors that are here today, may not have had an opportunity to see the papers before us, and it would be beneficial for me to mention today's main theme, which is that a third of our further education estate in Wales is in poor condition and requires repair work. The report of the Auditor General for Wales, Sir John Bourn, suggests that this could cost as much as £80 million over a period of 10 years. Also, 40 per cent of the estate is not fit for its current purpose, and as much as £20 million in additional spending may be needed to meet disability legislation requirements. The subject of our inquiries today will be matters relating to this.

I also point out—I believe that this could be helpful to those following our work—that the report that we are considering today is a factual report, and that the facts contained in it have been agreed upon by the witnesses before us and by the Auditor General, Sir John Bourn. Therefore, there is no dispute over the facts. What we, as a Committee, will try to identify are the lessons that can be learned from the report and from those facts, and, after questioning the witnesses, we will, as always, draft a report for the Government on our conclusions. It will then be a matter for the Government to respond to those recommendations. It also worth noting, in the context of further education, that the individual colleges are not accountable to ELWa and the National Council for Training and Education for Wales for their day-to-day activities; they are independent institutions, and have been so since transferring from local government supervision in 1993. Therefore, the power or the influence that the national council has over these institutions is that which springs from the financial memoranda between the council and every individual sector, which notes under what terms and conditions finance is provided to them. However, the council has the right to appoint additional governors to oversee an improvement programme and also has the right, of course, to withhold grant, although that would probably be the nuclear option.

The report before us today splits naturally into several sections, such as the condition of the buildings, the suitability of the buildings, and the use that is made of the buildings. We

yna'n edrych ar y ffactorau sydd yn effeithio ar reolaeth yr ystâd addysg bellach, megis cyllid a gwariant, cynllunio strategol, defnyddio'r wybodaeth reoli, yr adnoddau ar gyfer rheoli ystadau, a'r modd y defnyddir yr arweiniad sydd ar gael i'r colegau. Yna, yn olaf, byddwn yn ystyried a oes unrhyw wersi cyffredinol a strwythurol i'w dysgu. Bydd cwestiynau gan aelodau'r Pwyllgor yn dilyn y patrwm hwn. Felly, gyda hynny o ragymadrodd, trof at y cwestiwn cyntaf i chi, Mr Martin.

Yr wyf eisoes wedi sôn am y berthynas hyd braich sydd rhyngoch a'r colegau unigol. Mae adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn ei gwneud yn gwbl glir nad yw ystâd addysg bellach yng Nghymru—sydd, wrth gwrs, yn eiddo i'r colegau unigol—mewn cyflwr digon da. Felly, cyn inni droi at y materion ynglŷn â hyn, byddai'n help i'r Pwyllgor pe baech yn nodi beth yn union, yn eich tyb chi, yw eich rôl chi a'ch cyfrifoldeb chi yng nghyd-destun cyflwr yr ystâd.

Mr Martin: Diolch yn fawr, Gadeirydd.

If I may, I would like to talk first about welcoming the report, because it is extremely helpful to us, and we very much look forward to the Committee's report in turn. What is our role in responding to these issues? Well, it was the role of the Further Education Funding Council for Wales before the national council came into existence to make sure that there was adequate guidance available to colleges about how they should discharge the responsibilities which are on them as governing bodies for the estates—for the efficiency and effectiveness of their estates. For that purpose, of course, we have to make sure that there is data available which will help them make those judgments. One thing I would say is that there has been no shortage of advice over the years. A vast amount of advice—estates manuals, guides for governors; a whole range of support—has been provided.

We also provide advice. This was particularly important, I think, in the early years. It is not unimportant now, but in the early years after

will then look at the factors that affect the management of the further education estate, such as finance and expenditure, strategic planning, use of management information, the resources for managing estates, and the way in which the colleges use the guidance that is available to them. Then, finally, we will consider whether there are any general and structural lessons to be learned. Questions from Committee members will follow that pattern. Therefore, with that preamble, I turn to the first question to you, Mr Martin.

I have already mentioned the arm's length relationship that exists between you and the individual colleges. The Auditor General's report makes it completely clear that the further education estate in Wales—which is, of course, the property of individual colleges—is not in a sufficiently good condition. Therefore, before we turn to matters in that regard, it would assist the Committee if you could note what exactly, in your opinion, your role and responsibilities are in the context of the condition of the estate.

Mr Martin: Thank you very much, Chair.

Os caf fi, hoffwn siarad yn gyntaf am groesawu'r adroddiad, oherwydd mae'n hynod o ddefnyddiol i ni, ac edrychwn ymlaen yn fawr at adroddiad y Pwyllgor yn ei dro. Beth yw ein swyddogaeth wrth ymateb i'r materion hyn? Wel, swyddogaeth Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Bellach Cymru oedd hon cyn sefydlu'r cyngor cenedlaethol er mwyn sicrhau bod canllawiau digonol ar gael i golegau ar sut y dylent gyflawni eu cyfrifoldebau fel cyrff llywodraethu ar gyfer yr ystadau—er effeithlonrwydd ac effeithiolrwydd eu hystadau. I'r diben hwn, wrth gwrs, mae'n rhaid i ni sicrhau bod data ar gael a fydd yn eu cynorthwyo i wneud y penderfyniadau hynny. Un peth y byddwn yn ei ddweud yw nad oes diffyg cyngor wedi bod dros y blynyddoedd. Mae llawer iawn o gyngor—llawlyfrau ystadau, canllawiau i lywodraethwyr; ystod eang o gymorth—wedi'i ddarparu.

Yr ydym hefyd yn darparu cyngor. Yr oedd hyn yn bwysig iawn, credaf, yn y blynyddoedd cynnar. Mae'n parhau'n bwysig

incorporation, as colleges got to grips with the duties that go with being responsible for their own affairs, there was a strong effort by the former further education council to give that advice. Our very small estates department, which was commented on in the report, has been incredibly diligent over the years in working with the sector—it is a manageable sector in Wales; there are not a vast number of institutions—to make sure that the institutions are supported in that way.

We also, of course, have a responsibility to make sure that, if there are serious deficiencies in the way in which colleges are governed and managed, we take action. Over the years there has been some strengthening of our powers, but it has not diminished the point that you made in your introduction, Chairman, which is that they are independent institutions. I do not know whether this is the moment for me to say it, but perhaps I could just say that, in fulfilment of that role—in fulfilment of giving that advice and providing that support to governing bodies and to those who run the colleges—we have, we believe, been quite successful. We clearly have not done enough over the years, otherwise there would not be 30 per cent that is in the condition that is described in this report, which is, as you say, agreed between us. However, I think that you have to put that in context. It is a context where that is a better position, in terms of condition, than is the case in England or Scotland. It is in a better condition than, for instance, the NHS estate in Wales, for which I believe the comparable figure is about 34.5 per cent. Now, that is not to be complacent about this, but it does suggest that there are underlying reasons why, in the public sector generally, the condition of our estates is not absolutely everything that we would want it to be. We are confident, moreover, that that 30 per cent is a significantly lower figure than the figure on incorporation. There has been major improvement over the period of the last 10 years.

[5] **Dafydd Wigley:** Yes. I am sure that we will come back to some aspects of that. You, of course, do have responsibility, and you are accountable to the extent that the condition of the estates has an effect, or a bearing, on the

hyd heddiw, ond yn y blynyddoedd cynnar ar ôl ymgorffori, wrth i golegau fynd i'r afael â'r dyletswyddau sydd ynghlwm wrth fod yn gyfrifol am eu hunain, gwnaed ymdrech gref gan y cyn gyngor addysg bellach i roi'r cyngor hwnnw. Mae ein hadran ystadau fach iawn, y cyfeiriwyd ati yn yr adroddiad, wedi bod yn ddiwyd iawn dros y blynyddoedd wrth weithio gyda'r sector—mae'n sector hydrin yng Nghymru; nid oes nifer sylweddol o sefydliadau—i sicrhau bod y sefydliadau yn derbyn cymorth yn y ffordd honno.

Mae gennym hefyd, wrth gwrs, gyfrifoldeb i sicrhau, os ceir diffygion difrifol yn y ffordd y mae colegau yn cael eu llywodraethu a'u rheoli, ein bod yn gweithredu. Mae ein pwerau wedi cryfhau dros y blynyddoedd, ond nid yw hyn wedi tanseilio'r pwynt a wnaethoch yn eich cyflwyniad, Gadeirydd, sef eu bod yn sefydliadau annibynnol. Nid wyf yn gwybod ai dyma'r adeg i ddweud hyn, ond efallai y caf fi ddweud ein bod, wrth gyflawni'r swyddogaeth honno—wrth roi cyngor a darparu'r cymorth i gyrff llywodraethu ac i'r rheini sy'n cynnal y colegau—yn ein barn ni, wedi bod yn weddol llwyddiannus. Nid ydym, yn amlwg, wedi gwneud digon dros y blynyddoedd, fel arall ni fyddai 30 y cant yn y cyflwr a ddisgrifir yn yr adroddiad hwn, sydd, fel yr ydych yn ei ddweud, yn rhywbeth yr ydym yn cytuno yn ei gylch. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod yn rhaid i chi roi hyn yn ei gyd-destun. Y mae'n gyd-destun lle ceir sefyllfa well, o ran cyflwr, o'i chymharu â Lloegr neu'r Alban. Mae mewn gwell cyflwr nag, er enghraifft, ystâd y GIG yng Nghymru, lle credaf fod y ffigur cymharol oddeutu 34.5 y cant. Nawr, nid ydym yn bod yn hunanodlon yn glŷn â hyn, ond mae'n awgrymu bod rhesymau sylfaenol pam, yn y sector cyhoeddus yn gyffredinol, nad yw cyflwr ein hystadau'n union fel yr ydym am iddynt fod. Yr ydym yn hyderus, hefyd, bod 30 y cant yn ffigur sylweddol is na'r ffigur wrth ymgorffori. Bu gwelliannau sylweddol yn ystod y 10 mlynedd diwethaf.

[5] **Dafydd Wigley:** Ie, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn dychwelyd at rai agweddau ar hynny. Mae gennych, wrth gwrs, gyfrifoldeb, ac yr ydych yn atebol i'r graddau bod gan gyflwr ystadau effaith, neu gysylltiad, â

delivery of education and training in Wales. To the extent that it does have a bearing, how do you see the present situation and your responsibilities in being able to influence the condition so as not to undermine the effect that it has on the delivery of education in line with Government policy?

Mr Martin: Well, we accept fully that we have to work with the colleges to make sure that that position is improved. Chairman, you are concentrating on condition now. There are, of course, other areas covered in the report, but on the sheer matter of condition there is clearly an issue of backlog and it is that sort of issue which the national council, on taking up its responsibilities in April 2001, did seek to address immediately. I think that it is worth saying that, in the first two years of the council's existence, it has invested the best part of £30 million, we believe, on estate-related capital investment.

That has included three particular new initiatives—an infrastructure development fund, which is targeted particularly at the issues that are identified in this report, of £4 million; also, investment in new centres of excellence and a series of special investment projects. Those latter two categories, in which we invested some £8.3 million, will actually lever total spending of about £21 million, including £8 million of European funding. So this is a council which has taken this very seriously from the outset, which has put in place a very significant volume of investment—that is, in those two years, more than the previous three years of the outgoing council combined—and, moreover, has now developed ideas, which have been approved by the Minister, for a new planning and funding system, on which it might be useful for me to elaborate at some point in terms of how we see this agenda going forward.

[6] **Dafydd Wigley:** We will come back to that, if we may, a little later. Can I take it from your answer therefore that what you are telling me is that you do regard yourselves as having a responsibility for the condition of the estate because it does have an effect on education?

darpariaeth addysg a hyfforddiant yng Nghymru. I'r graddau fod ganddo gysylltiad, sut ydych yn gweld y sefyllfa bresennol a'ch cyfrifoldebau i allu dylanwadu ar gyflwr fel nad yw'n tanseilio'r effaith y mae'n ei gael ar ddarparu addysg yn unol â pholisi'r Llywodraeth?

Mr Martin: Wel, yr ydym yn derbyn yn llawn bod yn rhaid i ni weithio gyda'r colegau i sicrhau bod y sefyllfa'n gwella. Gadeirydd, yr ydych yn canolbwyntio ar gyflwr yn awr. Mae, wrth gwrs, feysydd eraill yn cael sylw yn yr adroddiad, ond ar fater cyflwr mae'n amlwg bod gwaith cynnal a chadw sy'n aros i gael ei wneud, a dyna'r math o fater y ceisiodd y cyngor cenedlaethol, wrth ymgymryd â'i gyfrifoldebau yn Ebrill 2001, fynd ati i'w ddatrys ar unwaith. Credaf ei bod yn werth dweud, yn nwy flynedd gyntaf y cyngor, ei fod wedi buddsoddi bron i £30 miliwn, yr ydym yn credu, mewn buddsoddiad cyfalaf sy'n gysylltiedig â'r ystâd.

Mae hynny wedi cynnwys tair menter newydd benodol—cronfa datblygu seilwaith, sy'n mynd i'r afael yn benodol â'r materion a nodir yn yr adroddiad hwn, o £4 miliwn; hefyd, buddsoddiad mewn canolfannau rhagoriaeth newydd a chyfres o brosiectau buddsoddi arbennig. Bydd y ddau gategori olaf, lle y bu i ni fuddsoddi tua £8.3 miliwn, mewn gwirionedd yn sicrhau cyfanswm gwariant o oddeutu £21 miliwn, gan gynnwys £8 miliwn o gyllid Ewropeaidd. Felly mae hwn yn gyngor sydd wedi ystyried hyn o ddifrif o'r cychwyn, sydd wedi buddsoddi'n sylweddol iawn—hynny yw, yn y ddwy flynedd dan sylw, yn fwy na thair blynedd flaenorol yr hen gyngor gyda'i gilydd—a, hefyd, mae bellach wedi datblygu syniadau, sydd wedi'u cymeradwyo gan y Gweinidog, ar gyfer system gynllunio a chyllido newydd, ac efallai y byddai'n ddefnyddiol i mi ymhelaethu rhyw bryd o ran sut yr ydym yn gweld yr agenda hon yn symud ymlaen.

[6] **Dafydd Wigley:** Byddwn yn dychwelyd at hynny, os cawn ni, ychydig yn ddiweddarach. Yr wyf yn cymryd o'ch ateb felly mai'r hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud wrthyf yw eich bod yn ystyried bod gennych gyfrifoldeb am gyflwr yr ystâd oherwydd ei bod yn effeithio ar addysg?

Mr Martin: Absolutely. However, as the constitutional arrangements stand, what we cannot do is supplant the individual responsibilities of the statutory providers.

[7] **Dafydd Wigley:** Yes. The mechanisms of exercising that responsibility are obviously limited. Can you give some indication of the feeling that you may have as to the adverse effect that defective estates may have on the delivery of teaching and on the morale of staff and, indeed, on the ability to attract students?

Mr Martin: Well, all of this is in the context of there having been very major growth in the number of students, but that is not to say that things would not be even better if we had a better estate. Clearly, if you are attending—as I have over the years—various classes in further education colleges, you are likely to be a happier person if you are warm and if you have not got rain coming in through the roof and if you have excellent facilities. I think that goes without saying. A visit to one of the poorer facilities, and comparing that within the first few minutes with the many excellent facilities—because the vast majority of the provision is pretty good—is quite stark, and you can see what impact that might have. I think the impact on staff is obvious. In any organisation, to work somewhere that is tiptop, which displays its excellence as soon as you walk through the door because of its physical condition, is a very important consideration. It will enable you to attract and retain people. However, people are dedicated and they have been producing growth. Two years ago, we had 10 per cent growth in one year. We had another 3 per cent growth last year. So colleges have steadily produced these very creditable results, and the student population has grown enormously since incorporation. However, as I say, the contribution that has been made by the improvements that we have seen has, in part, made that possible, and colleges have become much more effective in their use of the estate. They must have done to have achieved that.

Mr Martin: Yn bendant. Fodd bynnag, yng ngoleuni'r trefniadau cyfansoddiadol presennol, yr hyn na allwn ei wneud yw disodli cyfrifoldebau unigol y darparwyr statudol.

[7] **Dafydd Wigley:** Ie. Mae'n amlwg bod y mecanweithiau ar gyfer ymarfer y cyfrifoldeb hwnnw yn gyfyngedig. A allwch roi unrhyw arwydd o'r farn sydd gennych ar yr effaith niweidiol y gall ystadau diffygiol ei gael ar addysgu ac ar ysbryd staff ac, yn wir, ar y gallu i ddenu myfyrwyr?

Mr Martin: Wel, mae hyn i gyd o fewn cyddestun twf sylweddol yn nifer y myfyrwyr, ond nid yw hynny'n golygu na fyddai pethau wedi bod yn well hyd yn oed pe bai gennym well ystâd. Yn amlwg, os ydych yn mynychu—fel yr wyf i wedi bod yn ei wneud dros y blynyddoedd—ddosbarthiadau amrywiol mewn colegau addysg bellach, yr ydych yn debygol o fod yn berson hapusach os ydych yn gynnes ac nad oes glaw yn diferu drwy'r to ac os oes gennych gyfleusterau ardderchog. Credaf fod hynny'n amlwg. Mae ymweld ag un o'r cyfleusterau gwaethaf, a chymharu hynny yn y munudau cyntaf â'r sawl cyfleuster rhagorol—oherwydd mae mwyafrif llethol y ddarpariaeth yn go dda—yn drawiadol iawn, a gallwch weld sut effaith y gallai hynny ei gael. Credaf fod yr effaith ar staff yn amlwg. Mewn unrhyw sefydliad, bydd gweithio yn rhywle penigamp, sy'n arddangos ei ragoriaeth cyn gynted ag y byddwch yn cerdded drwy'r drws oherwydd ei gyflwr ffisegol, yn ystyriaeth bwysig iawn. Bydd yn eich galluogi i ddenu a chadw pobl. Fodd bynnag, mae gan bobl ymroddiad ac maent wedi bod yn cynhyrchu twf. Ddwy flynedd yn ôl, cafwyd twf o 10 y cant mewn blwyddyn. Cafwyd twf o 3 y cant pellach y llynedd. Felly mae colegau wedi bod yn cynhyrchu'r canlyniadau cymeradwy iawn hyn yn gyson, ac mae nifer y myfyrwyr wedi cynyddu'n enfawr ers ymgorffori. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, mae'r cyfraniad sydd wedi'i wneud gan y gwelliannau yr ydym wedi'u gweld, yn rhannol, wedi gwneud hynny'n bosibl, ac mae colegau wedi defnyddio'r ystâd yn llawer mwy effeithiol. Mae'n rhaid eu bod wedi gwneud i gyflawni hynny.

[8] **Dafydd Wigley:** So, quite clearly, there is a degree of priority that has to be given in order to deliver those circumstances and conditions in which the work can be undertaken?

Mr Martin: Absolutely. Could I say, Chair, that the other issue that we have to face—and, of course, we make our case very strongly to the Assembly Government, as the council did previously to the Welsh Office—is that we are always dealing with constraints on the total resources available to us. We are also always dealing with difficult choices and that is reflected in the amount that can be allocated and the terms on which it is allocated.

[9] **Dafydd Wigley:** Right, we will come back to that.

Eleanor, gennych chi y mae'r cwestiynau nesaf.

[10] **Eleanor Burnham:** You have obviously agreed with the Auditor General that much of the estate is in poor condition. I recognise that you believe that the situation is better now than, possibly, 10 years ago. However, given the importance of the buildings to these institutions, how do you think the situation has been allowed to persist? I know that somebody else is going to discuss the lack of management information but, as far as I can see, no real analysis has been done of the exact nature of the difficulties, which may pertain to roofs—flat roofs or whatever. If you do not know what the difficulties are, how can you control or manage these situations?

Mr Martin: Well, we know a lot, and Richard Hirst may want to come in with some of the details because he has lived through this since the incorporation. However, on the notion that we do not have information—we have a vast amount of information. We have regular reports from our estates manager, who is here today, so we are able to ensure that that information is up to date. In many ways, the issue is not about

[8] **Dafydd Wigley:** Felly, yn ddigon amlwg, mae elfen o flaenoriaeth y mae'n rhaid ei rhoi er mwyn darparu'r amgylchiadau a'r amodau hynny sydd eu hangen i gyflawni'r gwaith?

Mr Martin: Yn bendant. A gaf fi ddweud, Gadeirydd, mai'r mater arall sy'n rhaid i ni ei wynebu—ac, wrth gwrs, yr ydym yn cyflwyno ein hachos yn gryf iawn i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, fel y gwnaeth y cyngor yn y gorffennol i'r Swyddfa Gymreig—yw ein bod bob tro yn delio â chyfyngiadau ar gyfanswm yr adnoddau sydd ar gael i ni. Yr ydym wastad yn delio â dewisiadau anodd ac mae hyn yn cael ei adlewyrchu yn y cyfanswm y gellir ei ddyrannu ac o dan ba amodau y mae'n cael ei ddyrannu.

[9] **Dafydd Wigley:** Iawn, byddwn yn dod yn ôl at hynny.

Eleanor, you have the next questions.

[10] **Eleanor Burnham:** Yr ydych yn amlwg wedi cytuno â'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol bod llawer o'r ystâd mewn cyflwr gwael. Yr wyf yn cydnabod eich bod yn credu bod y sefyllfa'n well yn awr nag, efallai, 10 mlynedd yn ôl. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried pwysigrwydd yr adeiladau i'r sefydliadau hyn, sut ydych yn credu y caniatawyd i'r sefyllfa barhau? Gwn fod rhywun arall am drafod y diffyg gwybodaeth rheoli ond, cyn belled ag y gwelaf i, ni chafwyd dadansoddiad o union natur yr anawsterau mewn gwirionedd, a allai ymwneud â thoeau—toeau gwastad neu beth bynnag. Os nad ydych yn gwybod beth yw'r anawsterau, sut allwch reoli neu gadw'r sefyllfaoedd hyn dan reolaeth?

Mr Martin: Wel, gwyddom lawer, ac efallai y bydd Richard Hirst am gyfrannu rhai o'r manylion oherwydd ei fod wedi byw drwy hyn ers yr ymgorffori. Fodd bynnag, o ran y syniad nad oes gennym wybodaeth—mae gennym lawer iawn o wybodaeth. Yr ydym yn derbyn adroddiadau rheolaidd gan ein rheolwr ystadau, sydd yma heddiw, felly gallwn sicrhau bod y wybodaeth honno yn gyfoes. Mewn sawl ffordd, nid yw'r mater yn

not knowing. In the very early days, the funding councils in England and Wales commissioned a major piece of work, which looked at the condition of the estate. It did not pick the organisations apart; they did not go into the buildings and do very detailed survey work. However, they did come up with a broad figure for Wales of about £39 million-worth of work that needed doing. In its early years, the further education council put about £25 million into the worst categories, so that there would be a reasonable basis on which to move forward.

There have been repeated surveys, and a lot of work has been done. What is new, which I think that you are indicating that we may come back to later, is the development of much more meaningful performance indicators by which colleges can benchmark themselves against other colleges.

[11] **Dafydd Wigley:** We will return to that point, and to the point about management information. May I just emphasise the point that we are trying to get at in this run of questioning, namely how have we allowed the situation to develop into the mess in which we are now? You have mentioned resources. Do you want to add anything else to that?

Mr Martin: First, I would challenge the assumption in your question that we have allowed ourselves to get into a mess. The situation has improved significantly. So if there was a problem, we have made it better. The issue is about how we move on and ensure that we complete the job that has already been begun and where substantial progress has been made.

[12] **Eleanor Burnham:** Recognising that funds have been constrained, is it not false economy for any of these institutions now to be facing a huge backlog of maintenance, which, I believe, could be anything from £20 to £40 million?

Mr Martin: It is very important that that is addressed. However, what the national council now wants to do is to look at that in the context of all its post-16 responsibilities.

ymwneud â pheidio â gwybod. Yn y dyddiau cynnar iawn, comisiynodd y cyngorau cyllido yng Nghymru a Lloegr ddarn pwysig o waith, a oedd yn edrych ar gyflwr yr ystâd. Ni ymchwiliodd yn fanwl i'r sefydliadau'n unigol; ni aethant i'r adeiladau a gwneud gwaith arolwg manwl iawn. Fodd bynnag, sefydlwyd ffigur bras ar gyfer Cymru sef bod angen gwneud gwaith gwerth tua £39 miliwn. Yn y blynyddoedd cynnar, neilltuodd y cyngor addysg bellach tua £25 miliwn ar gyfer y categorïau gwaethaf, er mwyn cael sail resymol i symud ymlaen.

Mae sawl arolwg wedi'u cynnal, ac mae llawer o waith wedi'i wneud. Yr hyn sy'n newydd, sef rhywbeth y credaf eich bod yn nodi y byddwn yn dychwelyd ato yn ddiweddarach, yw datblygiad dangosyddion perfformiad llawer mwy ystyrlon er mwyn i golegau allu meincnodi eu hunain yn erbyn colegau eraill.

[11] **Dafydd Wigley:** Byddwn yn dychwelyd at y pwynt hwnnw, ac at y pwynt am wybodaeth reoli. A gaf fi bwysleisio'r pwynt yr ydym yn ceisio'i wneud yn y gyfres hon o gwestiynau, sef yn bennaf sut yr ydym wedi caniatáu i'r sefyllfa ddatblygu i'r llanast presennol? Yr ydych wedi crybwyll adnoddau. A ydych am ychwanegu unrhyw beth arall at hynny?

Mr Martin: Yn gyntaf, byddwn yn herio'r rhagdybiaeth yn eich cwestiwn ein bod wedi caniatáu ein hunain i lithro i lanast. Mae'r sefyllfa wedi gwella'n sylweddol. Felly os oedd problem, yr ydym wedi ei gwella. Mae'r mater yn ymwneud â sut yr ydym am symud ymlaen a sicrhau ein bod yn cwblhau'r gwaith sydd wedi'i ddechrau'n barod a lle mae cynnydd sylweddol wedi'i wneud.

[12] **Eleanor Burnham:** Gan gydnabod bod cronfeydd wedi'u cyfyngu, onid yw'n economeg ffug i unrhyw un o'r sefydliadau hyn wynebu llawer o waith cynnal a chadw sy'n aros i gael ei wneud, a allai, yr wyf yn credu, fod rhwng £20 a £40 miliwn?

Mr Martin: Mae'n bwysig iawn ein bod yn mynd i'r afael â hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn y mae'r cyngor cenedlaethol am ei wneud yn awr yw edrych ar hynny yng nghyd-destun ei

One of the key ways in which we want to get more efficiency and effectiveness is by looking not just at further education in isolation, but by looking at schools, in collaboration with local authorities, and by looking at work-based provision. For instance, approaches have recently been made to us by a very major employer who is very interested in seeing whether we would be interested in using information and communication technology facilities that it has as marginal capacity to offer for learning. What we want to do is to make sure that we plan in future in a much more strategic way. Perhaps it would be useful to come back to how we might go about that later.

holl gyfrifoldebau ôl-16. Un o'r ffyrdd allweddol yr ydym am geisio cael mwy o effeithlonrwydd ac effeithiolrwydd yw drwy edrych nid yn unig ar addysg bellach ar ei ben ei hun, ond drwy edrych ar ysgolion, mewn cydweithrediad ag awdurdodau lleol, a thrwy edrych ar ddarpariaeth yn y gwaith. Er enghraifft, cysylltodd cyflogwr mawr iawn â ni yn ddiweddar sydd â diddordeb mawr mewn canfod a fyddai gennym ddiddordeb mewn defnyddio cyfleusterau technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu sydd ganddo fel gallu ymylol i'w gynnig i addysgu. Yr hyn yr ydym am ei wneud yw sicrhau ein bod yn cynllunio yn y dyfodol mewn ffordd lawer fwy strategol. Efallai y byddai'n ddefnyddiol dychwelyd at ffyrdd o fynd i'r afael â hyn yn ddiweddarach.

[13] **Dafydd Wigley:** Before moving on to functional suitability—and I know that Ann wants to come in on that—I would like to press you on figure 5, which shows that the institutions have not been spending on maintenance at the levels that you expected. In those circumstances, what steps can you take?

[13] **Dafydd Wigley:** Cyn symud ymlaen at addasrwydd swyddogaethol—ac yr wyf yn gwybod bod Ann am gyfrannu yma—hoffwn eich holi am ffigur 5, sy'n dangos nad yw'r sefydliadau wedi bod yn gwario ar gynnal a chadw ar y lefelau yr oeddech yn eu disgwyl. Dan yr amgylchiadau hynny, pa gamau allwch eu cymryd?

Mr Martin: We have given, as the national council, and as the FE council did repeatedly previously, very clear guidance on the priority that should be given to this in repeated circulars. It is a constant theme of visits by our estates officers and so on.

Mr Martin: Yr ydym wedi rhoi, fel y cyngor cenedlaethol, ac fel y gwnaeth y cyngor addysg bellach drosodd a throsodd cyn hynny, ganllawiau clir iawn ar y flaenoriaeth y dylid ei rhoi i hyn mewn cylchlythyrau niferus. Mae'n thema gyson i ymweliadau gan ein swyddogion ystadau ac ati.

[14] **Dafydd Wigley:** But if the guidance is not delivering, as these figures tend to suggest—at least in some cases—what can you do?

[14] **Dafydd Wigley:** Ond os nad yw'r canllawiau yn cyrraedd eu nod, fel y mae'r ffigurau hyn yn tueddu i awgrymu—o leiaf mewn rhai achosion—beth a allwch ei wneud?

Mr Martin: Well, what we can do is to continue to give that advice. In extreme cases, of course, we can take the sorts of measures that you have outlined. The powers available to the council to insist on a college being managed in a different way are quite limited. We have the power to appoint extra governors, to appoint observers—

Mr Martin: Wel, yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud yw parhau i roi'r cyngor hwnnw. Mewn achosion eithriadol, wrth gwrs, gallwch gymryd y math o gamau yr ydych wedi'u hamlinellu. Mae'r pwerau sydd ar gael i'r cyngor i fynnu bod coleg yn cael ei reoli mewn ffordd wahanol yn eithaf cyfyngedig. Mae gennym y pŵer i benodi llywodraethwyr ychwanegol, i benodi arsyllwyr—

[15] **Dafydd Wigley:** Have you done so?

[15] **Dafydd Wigley:** A ydych wedi gwneud hynny?

Mr Martin: We have indeed. We have done it in one case already, and we are about to do it in another case, subject to a meeting of the national council today, which is being asked to ratify it.

The other issue, which is touched upon in the report, is whether there is a case for us to earmark more funding to tackle particular issues. That is not straightforward. I do not know whether you want me to get into that now.

[16] **Dafydd Wigley:** Are you suggesting ring-fencing?

Mr Martin: Well, yes, targeting obviously, and there have been occasions—I talked about the first few years of the FE council, in terms of the backlog of maintenance, where that happened. However, there are interesting arguments about the balance that you should strike between, as it were, rewarding what might have been ineffective management, and penalising those colleges which have managed their affairs well, while bearing in mind at all times our statutory responsibilities to make sure that there is adequate provision and that people are not being educated in unfavourable circumstances.

[17] **Dafydd Wigley:** So, on balance, do you tend towards ring-fencing or against it?

Mr Martin: I think that what we need to do is to revisit this. I think that we need to look at the balance, in this new planning and funding system that the council is now creating, between those things that should be targeted and those things which should be done through a formula. I think that, in dealing with self-governing institutions, you have to have a very strong case and there have to be very special circumstances. It may be that one reaches the view with a particular institution that the level of dereliction has reached the point where targeted action is necessary. However, whether we would want to do that without some very significant other conditions, as it were—and may I say also that it is very important to take this in the context of the wider development of the post-16 estate. What we do not want to do is to go in, because there is a survey that tells you that

Mr Martin: Yr ydym yn wir. Yr ydym wedi gwneud hyn mewn un achos yn barod, ac yr ydym ar fin gwneud hyn mewn achos arall, yn amodol ar gyfarfod y cyngor cenedlaethol heddiw, y gofynnir iddo ei ddilysu.

Y mater arall, a drafodir yn gryno yn yr adroddiad hwn, yw a oes achos i ni glustnodi rhagor o gyllid i fynd i'r afael â materion penodol. Nid yw hynny'n fater syml. Nid wyf yn gwybod a ydych am i mi drafod hyn yn awr.

[16] **Dafydd Wigley:** A ydych yn awgrymu clustnodi cyllid?

Mr Martin: Wel, ydwyf, targedu'n amlwg, ac mae achlysuron wedi bod—siaradais am flynyddoedd cynnar y cyngor addysg bellach, o ran y gwaith cynnal a chadw sy'n aros i gael ei wneud, lle digwyddodd hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae dadleuon diddorol ynglŷn â'r cydbwysedd y dylid ceisio'i gael rhwng, fel petai, gwobrwyo beth allai fod wedi bod yn rheolaeth aneffeithiol, a chosbi'r colegau hynny sydd wedi rheoli eu dyletswyddau'n dda, tra'n cofio drwy'r amser ein cyfrifoldebau statudol i sicrhau bod darpariaeth ddigonol ac nad yw pobl yn cael eu haddysgu dan amgylchiadau anffafriol.

[17] **Dafydd Wigley:** Felly, wrth bwysu a mesur, a ydych o blaid neu yn erbyn clustnodi cyllid?

Mr Martin: Credaf mai'r hyn sydd angen i ni ei wneud yw dod yn ôl at hyn. Credaf fod angen i ni edrych ar y cydbwysedd, yn y system gynllunio a chyllido newydd hon y mae'r cyngor yn ei chreu yn awr, rhwng y pethau hynny y dylid eu targedu a'r pethau hynny y dylid eu gwneud drwy fformiwla. Credaf, wrth ddelio â sefydliadau hunanlywodraethol, bod yn rhaid i chi gael achos cryf iawn ac mae'n rhaid cael amgylchiadau arbennig iawn. Gyda sefydliad penodol, efallai y byddwch o'r farn bod lefel yr esgeulustod wedi cyrraedd y pwynt lle mae angen cymryd camau wedi'u targedu. Fodd bynnag, a fyddem am wneud hynny heb amodau eraill sylweddol iawn, fel petai—ac a gaf fi ddweud hefyd ei bod yn bwysig iawn ystyried hyn yng nghyd-destun datblygiad ehangach yr ystâd ôl-16. Yr hyn nad ydym am ei wneud yw mynd i mewn, oherwydd

there is 30, 40, 50 per cent of poor condition, and to make a very heavy investment in that if, in three years' time, the council foresees the need for a very significant shake-up in terms of the shape of the provision in an area, which might involve new collaborations between schools and colleges, with work-based providers and so on. It is that much more dynamic approach to the whole of the post-16 education and training system that we see as being at the heart of tackling these issues. It is not just about looking at the individual institutions.

[18] **Dafydd Wigley:** We will come back to some strategic questions later. Ann, would you like to move on?

[19] **Ann Jones:** Thank you, Chair. On functional suitability, the Auditor General reports that a total of 43 per cent of institutions' estates are below an acceptable standard in terms of functional suitability. So what do you think are the main challenges for institutions to ensure that this situation can be improved?

Mr Martin: First of all, I think that there is a major issue around changing patterns of learning. This is not at all straightforward and it feeds, if I may say so, also into the issue of the utilisation of space. It has a number of dimensions. First, in terms of the use of work spaces and classrooms and so on, the pattern that I guess that most of us grew up with and are familiar with is not the one which you see in many colleges now at their best. The first thing that a college wants to show you now is its learning resource centre, with banks of computers and people working in new ways. We have had a very significant increase in recent years in the number of people who are engaged in distance learning. There are some very good examples in north Wales if I may say so, of a network of colleges being created by Llandrillo, where there is a very new pattern emerging and where you cannot easily disinvest from the pattern that you have on your main site.

If there is ever a flavour of an argument that all these things could be solved by simply rationalising on one estate, when we are talking about a pattern of drawing people in

bod arolwg sy'n dweud wrthyhych bod 30, 40, 50 y cant mewn cyflwr gwael, a buddsoddi'n drwm iawn yn hynny pe bai'r cyngor, mewn tair blynedd, yn rhagweld yr angen am ad-drefnu sylweddol iawn o ran ffurf y ddarpariaeth mewn ardal, a allai gynnwys cydweithio o'r newydd rhwng ysgolion a cholegau, gyda darparwyr yn y gwaith ac ati. Yr ydym o'r farn bod yr agwedd lawer fwy deinamig honno at yr holl system addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16 yn ganolog wrth fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn. Mae llawer mwy iddi nag edrych ar sefydliadau unigol yn unig.

18] **Dafydd Wigley:** Dychwelwn at rai cwestiynau strategol yn ddiweddarach. Ann, a ydych am symud ymlaen?

[19] **Ann Jones:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. O ran addasrwydd swyddogaethol, mae'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn adrodd bod cyfanswm o 43 y cant o ystadau'r sefydliadau yn is na'r safon dderbyniol o ran addasrwydd swyddogaethol. Felly beth gredwch yw'r prif heriau i sefydliadau fel y gallant sicrhau y gellir gwella'r sefyllfa hon?

Mr Martin: Yn gyntaf, credaf fod patrymau newidiol dysgu yn fater pwysig. Nid yw hyn yn syml o gwbl ac mae'n ymwneud hefyd, os caf fi ddweud, â'r mater o ddefnyddio lle. Mae iddo nifer o ddimensiynau. Yn gyntaf, o ran defnyddio lleoedd gwaith ac ystafelloedd dosbarth ac ati, nid y patrwm y credaf y cawsom ni i gyd ein magu gydag ef a'r un mwyaf cyfarwydd i ni yw'r patrwm a welir mewn sawl coleg ar eu gorau bellach. Y peth cyntaf y mae coleg am ei ddangos i chi'n awr yw ei ganolfan adnoddau dysgu, gyda chronfeydd o gyfrifiaduron a phobl yn gweithio mewn ffyrdd newydd. Yr ydym wedi gweld cynnydd sylweddol iawn yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf yn nifer y bobl sy'n cymryd rhan mewn dysgu o bell. Ceir rhai enghreifftiau da iawn yng ngogledd Cymru os caf fi ddweud, o rwydwaith o golegau yn cael eu creu gan Llandrillo, lle mae patrwm newydd iawn yn ymddangos a lle na allwch ddadfuddsoddi'n hawdd iawn o'r patrwm sydd gennych ar eich prif safle.

Os oes dadl fyth y gellid datrys hyn i gyd drwy resymoli yn syml ar un ystâd, wrth i ni drafod patrwm o ddenu pobl i fewn o ystod eang ac amrywiol o gefndiroedd, darparu

from a wide, diverse range of backgrounds, providing support in the workplace, providing distance learning, providing community facilities—and I think that Llandrillo's benchmark is that nobody should be more than 15 miles away from a learning centre—that immediately means that some of these issues become rather more complex and less susceptible to a very simple metric.

[20] **Ann Jones:** What steps are you taking as a council then to help institutions overcome the challenges that you have just outlined? Are you disseminating best practice, for example? Is the Llandrillo model being disseminated as best practice, and are you assisting people to follow it?

Mr Martin: We are certainly continuing and will continue to issue best practice and to provide workshops and seminars where we think that is useful, working with the colleges. It is not something that we do to them; it is something that we do with them. There is a network of estates managers, working with their own estates people, who address these sorts of issues.

We will certainly continue to give guidance. My own view—and it is my own view; the report has been in the public domain for two weeks, I have not had the opportunity to discuss it with my council yet and certainly would want to do that after today and when you produce your report—

[21] **Dafydd Wigley:** If you have any comments arising from that, please send in any supplementary evidence that you want to give.

Mr Martin: All that I was going to say was that the way in which the council would approach this in future I believe ought to be to look at whether there should be not only more targeting, but whether we should actually be more consistently directive. I think that one of the issues over the years—and I think that this goes back, Chairman, to your question about why is it not better, if I can rephrase your question a little—

cymorth yn y gweithle, darparu dysgu o bell, darparu cyfleusterau cymunedol—a chredaf mai meincnod Llandrillo yw na ddylai neb fod fwy na 15 milltir i ffwrdd o ganolfan addysgu—sy'n golygu'n syth y daw rhai o'r materion hyn yn fwy cymhleth ac yn llai tebygol o gael eu heffeithio gan fetrig syml iawn.

[20] **Ann Jones:** Felly pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd fel cyngor i gynorthwyo sefydliadau i oresgyn yr heriau yr ydych newydd eu hamlinellu? A ydych yn lledaenu arferion gorau, er enghraifft? A yw model Llandrillo yn cael ei ledaenu fel arferion gorau, ac a ydych yn cynorthwyo pobl i'w ddilyn?

Mr Martin: Yr ydym yn sicr yn parhau a byddwn yn dal ati i ddefnyddio arferion gorau a darparu gweithdai a seminarau lle yr ydym yn credu bod hynny'n ddefnyddiol, gan weithio gyda'r colegau. Nid yw'n rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei wneud iddynt hwy; mae'n rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei wneud gyda hwy. Mae rhwydwaith o reolwyr ystadau, yn gweithio gyda'u pobl ystadau eu hunain, sy'n mynd i'r afael â materion cyffelyb.

Byddwn yn sicr yn parhau i roi canllawiau. Fy marn bersonol i—a fy marn bersonol i yw hon; mae'r adroddiad wedi bod yn un cyhoeddus am bythefnos, ac nid wyf wedi cael y cyfle i'w drafod gyda'm cyngor eto ac yn sicr byddwn am wneud hynny ar ôl heddiw a phan fyddwch yn cynhyrchu eich adroddiad—

[21] **Dafydd Wigley:** Os oes gennych unrhyw sylwadau am hynny, a fyddechystal ag anfon unrhyw dystiolaeth atodol yr ydych am ei rhoi.

Mr Martin: Y cwbl yr oeddwn am ei ddweud oedd y dylai'r modd y byddai'r cyngor yn mynd i'r afael â hyn yn y dyfodol, yn fy marn i, edrych nid yn unig ar a ddylid targedu mwy, ond a ddylai mewn gwirionedd fod yn fwy cyson gyfarwyddol. Credaf mai un o'r materion dros y blynyddoedd—a chredaf fod hyn yn mynd yn ôl, Gadeirydd, at eich cwestiwn ynglŷn â pham nad yw'n well, os caf fi aralleirio eich cwestiwn ychydig—

[22] **Dafydd Wigley:** It is a matter of perspective.

Mr Martin: Although a huge amount of investment has been made—it is about £150 million from the two councils over 10 years, and all that has levered in a lot of other money—I think that there has been a bit of an element of stop/go about it over the years. Things have come and gone. There was a year in the late 1990s, for instance, when there was an abandonment of a separate capital line because it was thought that private finance would be the way in which to get the money through the door to make the improvements. However, I do think, for instance in relation to the disability works that need to be done and the backlog of maintenance, that we ought to have a better and more consistent focus over the years on that, instead of what has often been a couple of years of a particular priority followed by a couple of years of another priority.

[23] **Ann Jones:** You touched on the Disability Discrimination Act 1995 and that is what I wanted to come on to because I want to refer you to paragraphs 2.12 to 2.14 of the report, where it is stated that in 2001 it was estimated that over £20 million-worth of work would be needed to meet the requirements of the Act. I have to say that I am alarmed at the apparently slow progress that has been made in terms of institutions' compliance with disability regulations. Can you confirm today for the benefit of this Committee whether all the works in categories A and B have been carried out as they should have been?

Mr Martin: I am afraid that I cannot. They have not been. Colleges are being pressed—for the last two years, the council has asked them to give priority to this work. It has not been completed. We are receiving reports about the nature of their plans. Some of them talk about completing the work within three or four years. One college is saying that unless there is significant additional investment it will take longer than that.

[24] **Dafydd Wigley:** Are they not in breach of the law?

[22] **Dafydd Wigley:** Mae'n fater o safbwynt.

Mr Martin: Er bod swm sylweddol o fuddsoddi wedi'i wneud—mae oddeutu £150 miliwn gan y ddau gyngor dros 10 mlynedd, ac mae hynny i gyd wedi denu llawer mwy o arian o goffrau eraill—credaf fod rhywfaint o atal/mynd wedi perthyn iddo dros y blynyddoedd. Mae pethau wedi mynd a dod. Yr oedd blwyddyn ar ddiwedd yr 1990au, er enghraifft, lle y gadawyd llinell gyfalaf ar wahân oherwydd y farn mai cyllid preifat fyddai'r ffordd o gael arian drwy'r drws i wneud gwelliannau. Fodd bynnag, credaf, er enghraifft o ran y gwaith anabledd sydd angen ei wneud a'r gwaith cynnal a chadw sy'n aros i gael ei wneud, y dylem ganolbwyntio'n well ac yn fwy cyson dros y blynyddoedd ar hynny, yn hytrach na threulio ychydig flynyddoedd ar flaenoriaeth benodol cyn treulio yr ychydig o flynyddoedd nesaf yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i rywbeth arall.

[23] **Ann Jones:** Yr ydych wedi crybwyll Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd 1995 a dyna'r hyn yr wyf am ei drafod oherwydd fy mod am gyfeirio at baragraffau 2.12 i 2.14 yr adroddiad, lle nodir yn 2001 yr amcangyfrifwyd y byddai angen cyflawni gwerth dros £20 miliwn o waith i fodloni gofynion y Ddeddf. Mae'n rhaid i mi ddweud fy mod yn bryderus am y cynnydd araf yn ôl pob ymddangosiad sydd wedi'i wneud o ran cydymffurfiaeth sefydliadau gyda rheoliadau anabledd. A allwch gadarnhau heddiw er budd y Pwyllgor hwn a yw'r holl waith yng nghategoriâu A a B wedi'i gyflawni fel y dylai?

Mr Martin: Ni allaf wneud hynny, yn anffodus. Nid ydynt wedi eu cyflawni. Mae colegau dan bwysau—am y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, mae'r cyngor wedi gofyn iddynt roi blaenoriaeth i'r gwaith hwn. Nid ydyw wedi'i gwblhau. Yr ydym yn derbyn adroddiadau am natur eu cynlluniau. Mae rhai ohonynt yn siarad am gwblhau'r gwaith o fewn tair neu bedair blynedd. Mae un coleg yn dweud os nad oes buddsoddiad ychwanegol sylweddol y bydd yn cymryd mwy na hynny.

[24] **Dafydd Wigley:** Onid ydynt yn torri'r gyfraith?

Mr Martin: They could be in some circumstances, yes.

[25] **Dafydd Wigley:** Are you satisfied that there could be circumstances where there are colleges that come under your general purview acting in breach of the law?

Mr Martin: I cannot possibly be satisfied with that, which is why I am saying that I believe—first of all, the council has required them to give priority to it. What I am saying is that I think there is an issue now about raising the tempo of that and insisting that that work be completed. I have to say also that colleges are having to make very difficult decisions about how they apportion their funds between a range of demands. What the council, of course, is having to do is to, as I said earlier, make choices about how it allocates resources. It cannot do it for everything. We have given them a volume of resource for capital that is significantly higher than it has been in previous years, but it is clearly unacceptable if there is a persistence of a situation where people are not acting in accordance with the law.

[26] **Ann Jones:** I have to say that, on categories A and B, I feel that some of them are issues that do not require a large outlay of capital—they are things like signing for car parks and so on. It worries me that that work has not been carried out because it should have been carried out. We have known about the Disability Discrimination Act for some time. Given that, are there any institutions on-line to complete the work in categories C and D by October 2004?

Mr Martin: We have asked them to give priority to the work in the more severe categories. That is the absolutely crucial thing—where there are really serious issues, they have to be given priority. What we have done is that we have had a group working with our estates manager to produce a template for prioritising the work. Some things can be done quite simply, as you say; other things need to be done sequentially. There is an issue, and I think that it is an

Mr Martin: Efallai eu bod dan rai amgylchiadau, yn wir.

[25] **Dafydd Wigley:** A ydych yn fodlon y gellid bod rhai amgylchiadau lle mae colegau o fewn eich cylch cyffredinol yn torri'r gyfraith?

Mr Martin: Nid oes posibl i mi fod yn fodlon gyda hynny, a dyna pam fy mod yn dweud fy mod yn credu—yn gyntaf, bod y cyngor wedi mynnu eu bod yn rhoi blaenoriaeth iddo. Yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud yw fy mod yn credu bod pwnc trafod yn awr ynglŷn â chodi tempo hynny a mynnu bod y gwaith yn cael ei gwblhau. Mae'n rhaid i mi ddweud hefyd bod colegau yn gorfod gwneud penderfyniadau anodd iawn ynglŷn â sut maent yn dosrannu eu harian rhwng ystod o ofynion. Yr hyn y mae'r cyngor, wrth gwrs, yn gorfod ei wneud, fel y soniais eisoes, yw gwneud dewisiadau ynglŷn â sut mae'n dyrannu adnoddau. Ni all wneud hyn gyda phopeth. Yr ydym wedi rhoi iddynt gronfa o adnoddau cyfalaf sy'n sylweddol uwch na'r blynyddoedd a fu, ond mae'n amlwg yn annerbyniol os oes sefyllfa barhaus lle nad yw pobl yn gweithredu'n unol â'r gyfraith.

[26] **Ann Jones:** Mae'n rhaid i mi ddweud, o ran categorïau A a B, fy mod yn teimlo nad yw rhai ohonynt yn gofyn am wariant cyfalaf mawr—pethau fel llofnodi am feysydd parcio ac ati. Mae'n fy mhoeni nad yw'r gwaith wedi'i gyflawni oherwydd dylai fod wedi'i gyflawni. Yr ydym wedi bod yn ymwybodol o'r Ddeddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd ers cryn amser. O ystyried hynny, a oes unrhyw sefydliadau a fydd yn cwblhau'r gwaith yng nghategoriâu C a D erbyn Hydref 2004?

Mr Martin: Yr ydym wedi gofyn iddynt roi blaenoriaeth i'r gwaith yn y categorïau caletaf. Dyna'r peth hollol hanfodol—lle ceir materion difrifol iawn, mae'n rhaid rhoi blaenoriaeth iddynt. Yr hyn yr ydym wedi'i wneud yw cael grŵp i weithio gyda'n rheolwyr ystadau i gynhyrchu templed ar gyfer blaenoriaethu gwaith. Gellir gwneud rhai pethau'n eithaf syml, ond fel y dywedoch; mae angen gwneud pethau eraill mewn trefn. Mae'n destun pryder, a chredaf

underlying concern that some of our smaller colleges in particular—it is not universal—do struggle in terms of the management resource that needs to be devoted to these things, and it is touched on in the report, to do all that they can. We have a special duty to help them. This group has produced guidance on prioritisation and we will expect plans to reflect that. I should say that since 1999-2000 both councils—the outgoing council and the new council—have required that capital plans are produced before we release resources. It is a condition of funding that they follow those plans as they have been submitted to us. So we have a mechanism there by which we can ensure that what we insist is done, is done, as a condition of funding—as the Chair says, the option of not funding things is rather nuclear and we have to try to work with the grain.

[27] **Ann Jones:** What impact do you think that these delays and, in fact, the lack of work—work that in my view should have been undertaken—have had on the enrolment of students with disabilities? There is no excuse for not having done this work. Are we not fulfilling equal opportunities requirements to ensure that these students get a fair crack at further education?

Mr Martin: I am sure that Richard Hirst may have some details to add here. First of all, it is not the case that nothing has been done, although clearly it is not acceptable that people are not meeting statutory requirements. However, there has been a lot of work in this area. A lot of it is linked to wider issues. If you have a very unsatisfactory building and if you have a backlog of maintenance, it clearly makes sense to take forward the work on disability access and so on at the same time as you are tackling that work. So, it is not just a stick-on; it is something that you have to do. Clearly, when you are designing a new building, it is a very much easier task than it is when you are trying to adapt an old building. As you know from this report, a lot of the buildings are pretty old.

Mr Hirst: We are certainly not aware, either

ei fod yn bryder sylfaenol bod rhai o'n colegau llai yn benodol—nid yw'n gyffredinol—yn brwydro o ran yr adnoddau rheoli sydd angen eu neilltuo i'r pethau hyn, a chrybwyllir hyn yn yr adroddiad, i wneud popeth o fewn eu gallu. Mae gennym ddyletswydd arbennig i'w cynorthwyo. Mae'r grŵp hwn wedi cynhyrchu canllawiau ar flaenoriaethu a byddwn yn disgwyl i gynlluniau adlewyrchu hynny. Dylwn ddweud bod y ddau gyngor ers 1999-2000—yr hen gyngor a'r cyngor newydd—wedi mynnu bod cynlluniau cyfalaf yn cael eu cynhyrchu cyn i ni ryddhau adnoddau. Mae'n amod cyllido eu bod yn dilyn y cynlluniau hynny a gyflwynwyd i ni. Felly mae gennym fecanwaith ar waith fel y gallwn sicrhau bod yr hyn yr ydym yn ei fynnu'n cael ei wneud, yn cael ei wneud, fel amod cyllido—fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd, mae'r opsiwn o beidio â chyllido pethau yn eithaf niwclear ac mae'n rhaid i ni geisio gweithio gyda'r graen.

[27] **Ann Jones:** Pa effaith yr ydych yn ei gredu y mae'r oedi hyn ac, mewn gwirionedd, y diffyg gwaith—gwaith a ddylai fod wedi'i wneud yn fy marn i—wedi'i gael ar gofrestrriad myfyrwyr ag anableddau? Nid oes esgus dros beidio â gwneud y gwaith hwn. Onid ydym yn bodloni gofynion cyfle cyfartal i sicrhau bod y myfyrwyr hyn yn cael pob chwarae teg o ran addysg bellach?

Mr Martin: Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd gan Richard Hirst fanylion i'w hychwanegu yma. Yn gyntaf, nid yw'n wir nad oes dim wedi'i wneud, er yn amlwg nid yw'n dderbyniol nad yw pobl yn bodloni gofynion statudol. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o waith wedi'i wneud yn y maes hwn. Mae llawer o'r gwaith yn gysylltiedig â materion ehangach. Os oes gennych adeilad anfoddfaol iawn ac os oes gennych waith cynnal a chadw sy'n aros i gael ei wneud, mae'n amlwg yn gwneud synnwyr i ddatblygu'r gwaith ar fynediad i'r anabl ac ati ar yr un adeg ag y byddwch yn mynd i'r afael â'r gwaith. Felly, nid ychwanegiad yn unig yw hyn; mae'n rhywbeth y mae'n rhaid i ni ei wneud. Yn amlwg, wrth i chi gynllunio adeilad newydd, mae'n dasg llawer haws na cheisio addasu hen adeilad. Fel y gwyddoch o'r adroddiad hwn, mae nifer o'r adeiladau yn eithaf hen.

Mr Hirst: Nid ydym yn sicr yn ymwybodol,

through the complaints procedure that we have in place—whereby, if individuals have complaints against colleges they can come to us—or through legal action being taken, of any incidents where students or potential students have complained about their inability to access any of our colleges' buildings. That is not to say that there have not been any, but we are certainly not aware of any.

[28] **Ann Jones:** Is it not the case that students, whether they have a mobility problem or a sight or hearing impairment, will not come forward if a building does not appear to have a disabled parking space, a ramp into the front of the building or any other form of disabled entrance? They will not even start to look at the prospectus of courses. Is there not an obligation to have undertaken the work outlined in lists A and B? It is alright to say that no-one has come forward to make a complaint, but how many are not even getting as far as the doors of the institution because they feel that it is a no-go area for them because the institutions have not completed the work that should have undertaken?

Mr Hirst: Clearly, one cannot answer that negative, as it were. We do not know how many students do not come forward, although I would say that, in our current funding, we direct a specific amount of money towards students with learning difficulties and disabilities. That applies across all institutions, so there is a heavy commitment in each institution to provide education for those students. We are talking about a general culture across the sector where those students are positively encouraged, so I would be surprised and disappointed if that were the case.

[29] **Ann Jones:** I think that with students who have a disability, sometimes with a little forethought, they can be as independent as any other student without the special resources. I think that institutions have failed them if they have not carried out the work in A and B yet. If they have not undertaken the simple work in A and B, there is no hope that the Cs and Ds will be in place by 2004.

[30] **Dafydd Wigley:** Ychwanegaf at hynny.

naill ai drwy'r weithdrefn gwyno sydd gennym ar waith—lle, os oes gan unigolion gwynion yn erbyn colegau, y gallant ddod atom ni—neu drwy gamau cyfreithiol a gymerwyd, o unrhyw achosion o fyfyrwyr neu ddarpar fyfyrwyr yn cwyno am eu hanallu i gael mynediad i unrhyw un o adeiladau ein colegau. Nid yw hyn yn golygu nafu achosion, ond yn sicr nid ydym yn ymwybodol ohonynt.

[28] **Ann Jones:** Onid yw'n wir na fyddai myfyrwyr, os oes ganddynt broblem symudedd neu nam ar y clyw neu ar y golwg, yn dod ymlaen os nad yw'n ymddangos bod gan adeilad fan parcio i'r anabl, ramp i flaen yr adeilad neu fynedfa anabl o unrhyw fath? Ni fyddant hyd yn oed yn dechrau edrych ar brospectws cyrsiau. Onid oes rhwymedigaeth i fod wedi cyflawni'r gwaith a amlinellir yn rhestrau A a B? Mae'n iawn dweud nad oes unrhyw un wedi dod ymlaen i wneud cynw, ond faint o bobl nad ydynt hyd yn oed yn cyrraedd mor bell â drws y sefydliad oherwydd eu bod yn teimlo ei fod yn ardal waharddedig iddynt oherwydd nad yw'r sefydliadau wedi cwblhau'r gwaith a ddylai fod wedi'i gyflawni?

Mr Hirst: Yn amlwg, ni all unrhyw un ateb y cwestiwn hwn yn negyddol, fel petai. Nid ydym yn gwybod faint o fyfyrwyr nad ydynt yn dod ymlaen, er y buaswn yn dweud, yn ein cyllid presennol, ein bod yn cyfeirio swm penodol o arian tuag at fyfyrwyr ag anabledau ac anawsterau dysgu. Mae hyn yn wir ym mhob sefydliad, felly mae ymrwymiad cadarn ym mhob sefydliad i ddarparu addysg i'r myfyrwyr hynny. Yr ydym yn siarad am ddiwylliant cyffredinol ar draws y sector lle'r anogir y myfyrwyr hynny'n bositif, felly byddai'n syndod ac yn siom gennyf pe bai hynny'n wir.

[29] **Ann Jones:** Credaf y gall myfyrwyr sydd ag anabled, weithiau gyda rhywfaint o ragddarpariaeth, fod mor annibynnol ag unrhyw fyfyrwr arall heb yr adnoddau arbennig. Credaf fod sefydliadau wedi eu methu os nad ydynt wedi cyflawni'r gwaith yn A a B eto. Os nad ydynt wedi cyflawni'r gwaith syml yn A a B, nid oes gobaith i feisydd C a D fod ar waith erbyn 2004.

[30] **Dafydd Wigley:** I will add to that. I

Ystyriaaf y mater hwn yn un difrifol iawn. Nid mater o ddewis yw gweithredu o fewn fframwaith deddf gwlad. Mae'n fater cwbl sylfaenol a hanfodol. Buaswn yn meddwl, Mr Martin, ei bod yn gwbl resymol i chi gynnwys, fel amod i dalu grant i'r sefydliadau hyn, bod rhaid iddynt weithredu o fewn fframwaith deddf gwlad a bod hynny'n amod sylfaenol i dderbyn y grant. Dylent sylweddoli bod y Senedd wedi gosod blaenoriaethau i edrych ar ôl gofynion pobl anabl ers 1995 a bod cyfnod digonol wedi mynd heibio iddynt roi trefn ar eu hunain ac i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd. A yw hynny'n rhesymol?

Mr Martin: That is very reasonable, which is why the council has repeatedly stressed that this requirement exists and why we are now getting the detailed plans, not just on the disability issues, but more generally and why, as I said earlier, we would intend now to be more prescriptive in terms of what we expect them to produce. As I say, I do think that we have a duty to be more focused and, I think, as you say, in particular where something is a matter of law and of right, that puts it in a different category from the general duty that they might have to maintain their estates.

[31] **Dafydd Wigley:** Diolch yn fawr. Trown yn awr at y defnydd a wneir o'r ystadau.

[32] **Elin Jones:** Mae gennyf ychydig o gwestiynau ar y defnydd o'r ystâd. Mae gan y cyngor darged o ddefnydd o 30 y cant o'r ystâd, ond dim ond pump o'r sefydliadau sy'n cyrraedd y targed hwn. Felly, cwestiwn syml i ddechrau: pam mai dim ond pump o'r sefydliadau sy'n cyrraedd y gyfradd hon?

Mr Martin: Well, first of all, it is worth just thinking about the mathematics of it because, actually, a 30 per cent target is quite steep. It is quite difficult because it is the product of the amount of space, the number of people using that space, and the time in which that space is used. So, to give an example, it is measured between 9 a.m. and 5 p.m. from Monday to Friday. So, if you have a classroom that holds 20 people, and it is only

consider this matter to be a very serious one. Acting within the framework of the law of the land is not a matter of choice. It is a completely fundamental and crucial matter. I would have thought, Mr Martin, that it is completely reasonable for you to include, as a condition on payment of grants to these institutions, that they act within the law of the land and that that is a basic condition of receiving the grants. They should realise that Parliament has set priorities to look after the requirements of disabled people since 1995 and that sufficient time had passed for them to get their act together and ensure that that happens. Is that reasonable?

Mr Martin: Mae hynny'n rhesymol iawn, a dyna pam bod y cyngor wedi pwysleisio dro ar ôl tro bod y gofyniad hwn yn bodoli a pham ein bod yn awr yn cael y cynlluniau manwl, nid yn unig ar y materion anabled, ond yn fwy cyffredinol a pham, fel y dywedais yn gynharach, y byddem yn bwriadu bod yn fwy cyfarwyddol o ran yr hyn yr ydym yn disgwyl iddynt ei gynhyrchu. Fel y dywedaf, credaf fod gennym ddyletswydd i ganolbwyntio fwy a, chredaf, fel y dywedoch, yn arbennig os yw rhywbeth yn fater o gyfraith a hawl, bod hynny'n ei osod mewn categori gwahanol i'r dyletswydd cyffredinol sydd ganddynt efallai i gynnal a chadw eu hystadau.

[31] **Dafydd Wigley:** Thank you very much. We will now turn to the utilisation of the estates.

[32] **Elin Jones:** I have a few questions on the utilisation of the estate. The council has a target of utilisation of 30 per cent of the estate, but only five of the institutions meet that target. So, a simple question to begin with: why is this percentage only met by five of the institutions?

Mr Martin: Wel, yn gyntaf, mae'n werth ystyried mathemateg y peth oherwydd, mewn gwirionedd, mae targed o 30 y cant yn eithaf uchelgeisiol. Mae'n gymharol anodd oherwydd ei fod yn gynnrych maint y lle, nifer y bobl sy'n defnyddio'r lle, a'r amser y defnyddir y lle. Felly, i roi enghraifft, fe'i mesurir rhwng 9 a.m. a 5 p.m. o ddydd Llun i ddydd Gwener. Felly, os oes gennych ystafell ddosbarth sy'n dal 20 o bobl, ac mai am

used for half the day—sorry, let us say 60 per cent of the day—and, on average, it has 10 students in it, which is perfectly possible particularly if you are dealing with groups with special needs or small classes and so on, and that is increasingly the case, that gives you a utilisation rate of 30 per cent. I think that it is quite interesting. If I could take an example from higher education that will be familiar to some of you, the University of Glamorgan has a utilisation rate somewhere in the mid to high 20s. It is one of the most crowded campuses, where there is a real challenge to provide facilities. Even when you have shaped the estate properly, you are using good timetabling and all the rest of it, 30 per cent is quite a tough assignment. I go back to the point that I made earlier as well: there are new types of learning that people are trying to provide whereby facilities are going out to communities and are not just on one campus—I will use the Llandrillo example again as it is most developed there, but there are others. I was asked earlier, I think by Eleanor Burnham, whether there was a case for saying that the Llandrillo practice with community colleges was actually a good model. Well, I think that it is an excellent model. However, its impact is to lower the utilisation rate.

[33] **Elin Jones:** Ond, os ydych yn gosod targed o 30 y cant, byddwn yn disgwyl y byddech chi, fel cyngor, yn disgwyl bod y targed hwnnw'n cael ei gwrdd. Mae'n ymddangos fel eich bod yn dadlau y dylid gostwng y targed hwnnw i fod yn fwy realistig ar gyfer y sefydliadau. Yr wyf eisiau gofyn un cwestiwn arall, sy'n codi o'ch hateb: nid oeddwn wedi ystyried mai rhwng 9 a.m. a 5 p.m. yn unig y mae'r targed hwn yn cael ei fesur. Mae defnydd y tu hwnt i hynny ar gyfer y sefydliadau. Pam nad yw hi'n briodol felly i gynnwys y defnydd tu hwnt i'r oriau hynny wrth fesur?

Mr Martin: Two things: first, I have to say that I am deeply unconvinced by the target. It is a historic target and what we are moving towards is a set of performance indicators that I think are going to be much more sensible. Indeed, that work is commended in

hanner diwrnod yn unig y defnyddir hi—mae'n ddrwg gennyf, gadewch i ni ddweud 60 y cant o'r diwrnod—ac, ar gyfartaledd, bod 10 myfyriwr yn yr ystafell, sy'n berffaith bosibl yn enwedig os ydych yn delio â grwpiau ag anghenion arbennig neu ddosbarthiadau bach ac ati, ac mae hyn yn digwydd fwyfwy, mae hyn yn rhoi cyfradd defnydd o 30 y cant. Credaf fod hynny'n eithaf diddorol. Os caf fi gymryd enghraifft o addysg uwch a fydd yn gyfarwydd i rai ohonoch, mae gan Brifysgol Morgannwg gyfradd defnydd yn yr ugeiniau canol i uchel. Mae'n gampws sydd ymhlith y mwyaf gorlawn, lle ceir gwir her i ddarparu cyfleusterau. Hyd yn oed ar ôl i chi lunio'r ystâd yn iawn, a'ch bod yn defnyddio amserlenni da a phopeth arall, mae 30 y cant yn darged eithaf anodd. Cyfeiriaf yn ôl at y pwynt a wneuthum yn gynharach hefyd: mae mathau newydd o ddysgu y mae pobl yn ceisio'u darparu lle mae'r cyfleusterau yn mynd allan i gymunedau yn hytrach na bod ar un campws yn unig—yr wyf am ddefnyddio Llandrillo fel enghraifft eto am fod y mae'r syniad wedi'i ddatblygu fwyaf yno, ond mae enghreifftiau eraill. Gofynnwyd i mi'n gynharach, credaf gan Eleanor Burnham, a oedd achos dros ddweud bod ymarfer Llandrillo gyda cholegau cymuned yn fodel da mewn gwirionedd. Wel, credaf ei fod yn fodel rhagorol. Fodd bynnag, ei effaith yw lleihau'r gyfradd defnyddio.

[33] **Elin Jones:** However, if you set a target of 30 per cent, I would expect that you, as a council, would expect that target to be met. It seems that you are arguing that that target should be lowered to become more realistic for the institutions. I wish to ask another question, which arises from your answer: I had not considered that this target is only measured between 9 a.m. and 5 p.m. There is utilisation outside those hours. Why is it not appropriate, therefore, to include the utilisation outside those hours when measuring?

Mr Martin: Dau beth: yn gyntaf, mae'n rhaid i mi ddweud nad ydwyf wedi fy argyhoeddi o gwbl gyda'r targed. Mae'n darged hanesyddol a'r hyn yr ydym yn symud tuag ato yw cyfres o ddangosyddion perfformiad a fydd yn llawer mwy synhwyrol

the NAO's report. Secondly, of course, you are quite right, we want facilities to be used around the clock, if you like, and certainly into the evening and early in the morning. If you start adding that on, with the sorts of usage that you realistically get in those hours, you will get an even lower figure. I do think that I have to say that trying to apply one simple metric to measure the use of these buildings is not particularly helpful. I think that having a basket of performance indicators so that people can compare and contrast their performances with comparable institutions is much better. That is where we are heading. Higher education is a few years ahead. Because of the work, we pushed for this to be extended across Great Britain to further education as well. We will have the first results of that new set of indicators in the spring—in May: that is our target date. I have to say that I still think that there are too many of them and I think that when it comes down to ourselves setting targets and so on we would like to be looking at probably a more restricted group of targets. However, it is not straightforward and I do not think that we will ever get to a situation whereby one simple measure is more than the beginning of a discussion about what is relevant to that particular institution, its pattern of learning, the communities that it serves and so on.

[34] **Elin Jones:** Gan dderbyn bod targed o 30 y cant o ran y cyfraddau defnyddio sydd gennym ni ar hyn o bryd, yr ydych wedi cyfeirio'n barod at y twf yn y niferoedd o fyfyrwyr ac mae rhagamcan o dwf pellach o rhyw 2 y cant yn y niferoedd hynny. Sut yr ydych yn credu y mae sefydliadau yn mynd ati i geisio cynyddu eu defnydd o'r ystâd bresennol i gwrdd â'r twf hwnnw yn y niferoedd o fyfyrwyr yn hytrach na chwilio am ffyrdd o adeiladu canolfannau newydd?

Mr Martin: Well, there has been, of course, a significant improvement in utilisation rates on the main sites as a result of the massive growth that there has been in students since incorporation. There is no doubt about that. There has been a relatively modest increase in the scale of the accommodation, and there

yn fy marn i. Yn wir, cymeradwyir y gwaith hwn yn adroddiad y SAG. Yn ail, wrth gwrs, yr ydych yn hollol gywir, yr ydym am weld cyfleusterau yn cael eu defnyddio ddydd a nos, os dymunwch, ac yn sicr min nos ac yn gynnar yn y bore. Os ydych yn dechrau ychwanegu hyn, gyda'r mathau o ddefnydd a geir yn realistig gennych yn ystod yr oriau hynny, byddwch yn cael ffigur is hyd yn oed. Credaf fod yn rhaid i mi ddweud nad yw ceisio defnyddio un metrig syml i fesur defnydd yr adeiladau hyn yn ddefnyddiol iawn. Credaf fod cael basged o ddangosyddion perfformiad fel y gall pobl gymharu a chyferbynnu eu perfformiad â sefydliadau cymharol yn llawer gwell. At hyn yr ydym yn anelu. Mae addysg uwch ychydig flynyddoedd o'n blaenau. Oherwydd y gwaith, bu i ni geisio sicrhau bod hyn yn cael ei ymestyn ledled Prydain i addysg bellach hefyd. Bydd gennym ganlyniadau cyntaf y gyfres newydd o ddangosyddion yn y gwanwyn—ym mis Mai: dyna'r dyddiad yr ydym yn anelu ato. Mae'n rhaid i mi ddweud fy mod yn parhau i feddwl bod gormod ohonynt a chredaf pan fydd yn rhaid i ni osod ein targedau ein hunain ac ati yr hoffem edrych ar grŵp mwy cyfyngedig o dargedau o bosibl. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hyn yn syml ac nid wyf yn credu y byddwn fyth yn cyrraedd sefyllfa lle mae un mesur syml yn fwy na dechrau trafodaeth am yr hyn sy'n berthnasol i'r sefydliad penodol hwnnw, ei batrwm dysgu, y cymunedau y mae'n eu gwasanaethu ac ati.

[34] **Elin Jones:** Accepting that we currently have a target of 30 per cent in terms of the utilisation rate, you have already referred to the growth in the number of students and it is predicted that there will be a further growth of around 2 per cent in those numbers. How do you think institutions are going about trying to increase their utilisation of the present estate to meet that growth in student numbers, rather than looking for ways of building new centres?

Mr Martin: Wel, cafwyd, wrth gwrs, gynnydd sylweddol mewn cyfraddau defnyddio ar y prif safleoedd o ganlyniad i'r twf enfawr a fu mewn myfyrwyr ers ymgorffori. Nid oes amheuaeth am hynny. Bu cynnydd cymharol ym maint y llety, a bu cynnydd enfawr yn nifer y myfyrwyr. Wrth

has been an absolutely massive increase in the number of students. Looking to the future, I would question whether the most significant growth is going to come from those existing sites. I think that it is likely to come from outreach, from new partnerships and from the better use of school buildings. One of the issues that I think we need to look at post-16—it is not straightforward—is how we can get a better collective use in new partnerships, which also, of course, has the added benefit of opening up a much wider curriculum offering for people. The ambition of the council, using this new planning and funding system that I have just been no more than outlining, is to make sure that we have those partnerships in place so that the best opportunities are being offered to learners, with the incidental benefit, if you like, that it is also making better use of the total public funded estate. To treat all the institutions as individual ones and to just keep funding them on that basis is not going to give the most productive outcome. I do not want to stray into policy matters, but I think that one of the key ambitions of these reforms is to bring these areas—work-based learning, schools, colleges and adult and continuing education—together so that there can be proper planning and utilisation beyond those traditional boundaries.

[35] **Elin Jones:** Mae'n amlwg fod gennyh chi amheuo yn glŷn â'r targed o 30 y cant a sut y caiff y targed hwnnw ei fesur. Ond, mae'r ffaith mai dim ond pump o'r sefydliadau sy'n dod yn agos i gwrdd â'r targed hwnnw yn adlewyrchiad—mae'n rhaid ei fod i ryw raddau—o ddiffyg defnydd o rannau eithaf helaeth o'r ystâd. A yw hynny'n gallu arwain dyn i feddwl fod yna arian cynnal a chadw yn mynd tuag at gynnal a chadw darnau o'r ystâd nad ydynt yn cael eu defnyddio o gwbl neu am ganran eithaf sylweddol o'r amser?

Mr Martin: Not a vast amount of the estate is not being used. The issue is the intensity with which it is being used—how many hours a day it is being used and how many people are occupying the space. Historically, there has been quite a lot of remodelling to do. We know that a couple of colleges—Glynlifon comes to mind—have an inheritance of old buildings, often listed

edrych tua'r dyfodol, byddwn yn cwestiynu a ddaw'r twf mwyaf sylweddol o'r safleoedd hynny sy'n bodoli ar hyn o bryd. Credaf ei fod yn debygol o ddod o waith ymestyn allan, o bartneriaethau newydd ac o well defnydd o adeiladau ysgol. Un o'r materion y mae angen i ni edrych arno yn fy marn i o ran ôl-16—nid yw'n fater syml—yw sut y gallwn sicrhau gwell defnydd cyfunol mewn partneriaethau newydd, sydd hefyd, wrth gwrs, â'r fantais ychwanegol o greu cwricwlwm llawer ehangach i'w gynnig i bobl. Uchelgais y cyngor, drwy ddefnyddio'r system gynllunio a chyllido newydd hon, yr wyf ond wedi ei hamlinellu, yw sicrhau bod gennym y partneriaethau hyn ar waith er mwyn gallu cynnig y cyfleoedd gorau i ddysgwyr, gyda'r sgil-fantais, os dymunwch, ei fod hefyd yn gwneud gwell defnydd o'r ystâd gyfan a gyllidir gan arian cyhoeddus. Nid yw trin pob sefydliad fel un unigol a pharhau i'w cyllido ar y sail honno'n unig yn mynd i sicrhau'r canlyniad mwyaf cynhyrchiol. Nid wyf am fynd ar gyfeiliorn a thrafod materion polisi, ond credaf mai un o brif uchelgeisiau y diwygiadau hyn yw dod â'r meysydd hyn ynghyd—dysgu yn y gwaith, ysgolion, colegau ac addysg oedolion a pharhaus—er mwyn gallu cynllunio a defnyddio'r ystâd yn iawn y tu hwnt i'r ffiniau traddodiadol hynny.

[35] **Elin Jones:** It is clear that you have doubts about the target of 30 per cent and how that target will be measured. However, the fact that only five of the institutions come close to meeting that target is a reflection—it is bound to be to some extent—of the lack of utilisation of quite considerable parts of the estate. Can that lead one to think that maintenance funding is going towards maintaining parts of the estate that are never used or are not used for quite a substantial percentage of the time?

Mr Martin: Nid oes rhan fawr o'r ystâd yn segur. Y pwnc dan sylw yw i ba raddau y mae'n cael ei defnyddio—sawl awr y dydd y mae'n cael ei defnyddio a faint o bobl sy'n defnyddio'r lle. Yn hanesyddol, bu'n rhaid gwneud cryn dipyn o ailfodelu. Yr ydym yn gwybod bod un neu ddau o golegau—daw Glynlifon i'r meddwl—wedi etifeddu hen adeiladau, adeiladau rhestredig yn aml, lle

buildings, where any kind of sensible utilisation rates and so on are really just very difficult to achieve. Most of our colleges do use most of the systems that could be used to get the best use out of their existing space. That is not to say that it is perfect—of course it is not—but they are using software that helps them to timetable to maximise usage.

There is also, of course, the agenda set by the Assembly Government, by which we, in exercising our role on behalf of the Assembly Government, say to them, look, you must be more sensitive to the individual learner, you must take learning out to people, you must not just expect people to turn up at your doorstep and we want you to reach out into the community with new facilities. All of those things, it seems to me, mean that some of the traditional assumptions that you might have made about a rather fixed quantum of estate are challenged.

For instance, let us take Powys as an example: you have a number of sites at Coleg Powys, which is in a deeply rural area. You could probably get the utilisation rate up quite well if you said, right, we are going to stick it all in one place, we will get as many people to that place as we can and we will timetable it so that we are using the rooms all day. However, that would not be a very sensitive form of provision. It would actually, I suspect, mean that we get much lower rates of access than we have now. I think that it is significant that, if you look at the institution that is the outlier in these figures, it is St David's Sixth Form College, which is a school or a sixth form college, if you like. Sorry, I should not say 'school'—it is a sixth form college. However, it is in a conventional building. It is a very successful institution, but it is not seeking to do what the majority of our colleges are doing. It is doing it in a city environment and it has a relatively settled curriculum. It does not have to deal with all the sensitivities, if you like, of serving a rural area or perhaps a lot of special needs groups and so on, which actually make the utilisation of space a complex business. If you really wanted to get this right you would comprehensively remodel the estates. You

mae unrhyw fath o gyfraddau defnyddio synhwyrol ac ati yn anodd iawn i'w cyflawni. Mae mwyafrif ein colegau yn defnyddio'r rhan fwyaf o'r systemau y gellid eu defnyddio i sicrhau'r defnydd gorau o'r lle sydd ganddynt. Nid yw hynny'n golygu bod hon yn sefyllfa berffaith—wrth gwrs nad ydyw—ond maent yn defnyddio meddalwedd sy'n eu cynorthwyo i lunio amserlen i sicrhau'r defnydd mwyafrif.

Mae hefyd, wrth gwrs, yr agenda a osodwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, lle yr ydym ni, drwy ymarfer ein swyddogaeth ar ran Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn dweud wrthynt, edrychwch, mae'n rhaid i chi fod yn fwy sensitif i'r dysgwr unigol, mae'n rhaid i chi fynd â dysgu at y bobl, mae'n rhaid i chi wneud mwy na disgwyl i bobl ddod atoch chi ac yr ydym am i chi gyrraedd y gymuned gyda chyfleusterau newydd. Mae'r holl bethau hynny, ymddengys i mi, yn golygu bod rhai o'r rhagdybiaethau traddodiadol y gallech fod wedi'u gwneud am gwantwm eithaf penodol yr ystâd yn cael eu herio.

Er enghraifft, gadewch i ni ddefnyddio Powys fel enghraifft: mae gennych nifer o safleoedd yng Ngholeg Powys, sydd mewn ardal wledig iawn. Mae'n debyg y byddai modd i chi gynyddu'r gyfradd ddefnyddio yn sylweddol pe baech yn dweud, iawn, yr ydym am roi popeth ar un safle, a chael cymaint o bobl â phosibl i'r safle hwnnw a llunio amserlen er mwyn defnyddio'r ystafelloedd drwy'r dydd. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddai hon yn ddarpariaeth sensitif iawn. Byddai mewn gwirionedd, yr wyf yn amau, yn arwain at gyfraddau mynediad llawer is na'r hyn sydd gennym yn awr. Credaf ei bod yn arwyddocaol, os edrychwch ar y sefydliad sydd ar wahân yn y ffigurau hyn, sef Coleg Chweched Dosbarth Dewi Sant, sy'n ysgol neu goleg chweched dosbarth, os dymunwch. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ni ddylwn ddweud 'ysgol'—mae'n goleg chweched dosbarth. Fodd bynnag, mae mewn adeilad confensiynol. Mae'n sefydliad llwyddiannus iawn, ond nid yw'n ceisio gwneud yr hyn y mae'r mwyafrif o'n colegau'n ei wneud. Mae'n ei wneud mewn amgylchedd dinas ac mae ganddo gwricwlwm cymharol sefydlog. Nid yw'n gorfod delio â'r holl sensitifwrydd, os dymunwch, o wasanaethu ardal wledig neu efallai nifer o grwpiau anghenion

would say, right, we will attempt, as best we can, to have something really fit for the twenty-first century and that ought to be our ambition. We want to look at that, as I say, across all the providers, not just the FE colleges on their own. There will be some limitations on the extent to which that can be done, unless you go in for wholesale replacement. Even when you have done that, changing patterns of learning will mean that you will still have to adapt and change what you have introduced.

Mr Hirst: May I just add to that? You asked about the maintenance costs, and I think that, yes, if you have more estate than you need there is an additional maintenance cost. It is difficult sometimes to rationalise that estate if you are talking about perhaps a building on a campus—can you separate it off from the rest of the campus? However, institutions look actively at rationalising estate where it is feasible to do so and there are examples—Coleg Ceredigion and Coleg Sir Gâr—where they have rationalised sites. Where it is possible to do so, institutions are doing that, but sometimes it can be difficult to do that with individual buildings. You may be able to mothball them, but you may not be able to dispose of them.

[36] **Dafydd Wigley:** Janet, you wanted to pick up on something there?

[37] **Janet Davies:** Yes. Mr Martin, when you were looking at different ways of getting students involved—outreach—you mentioned school buildings. I am aware that local comprehensive schools in my area have some really good schemes going whereby the sixth formers go off to further education colleges for two or three days a week. However, what concerns me is that, if you are looking at this the other way around—and I do not know whether this is what you meant—in terms of bringing students into school buildings, do you not come up against some problems because there are real concerns about children's safety in school

arbennig ac ati, sydd mewn gwirionedd yn gwneud y defnydd o le yn fusnes cymhleth. Pe byddech am wneud hyn yn iawn mewn gwirionedd byddech yn ailfodelu'r ystadau yn gyfan gwbl. Byddech yn dweud, iawn, byddwn yn ceisio, hyd eithaf ein gallu, cael rhywbeth cwbl addas ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain a dyna ddylai'n huchelgais fod. Yr ydym am edrych ar hynny, fel y dywedaf, ymhlith yr holl ddarparwyr, nid y colegau addysg bellach yn unig. Bydd rhai cyfyngiadau ar i ba raddau y gellid gwneud hynny, os nad ydych yn ail-wneud y cyfan. Hyd yn oed ar ôl gwneud hynny, bydd patrymau dysgu newidiol yn golygu y bydd yn rhaid i chi addasu o hyd a newid yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i gyflwyno.

Mr Hirst: A gaf fi ychwanegu at hynny? Bu i chi ofyn am y costau cynnal a chadw, a chredaf, ie, os oes gennych fwy o ystâd nag sydd ei hangen arnoch ceir costau cynnal a chadw ychwanegol. Mae weithiau'n anodd ad-drefnu'r ystâd os ydych yn siarad efallai am adeilad ar gampws—a allwch ei wahanu oddi wrth weddill y campws? Fodd bynnag, mae sefydliadau wrthi'n ddiwyd yn edrych ar ad-drefnu ystâd os yw'n ymarferol gwneud hynny a cheir enghreifftiau—Coleg Ceredigion a Choleg Sir Gâr—lle maent wedi ad-drefnu safleoedd. Os yw'n bosibl gwneud hynny, mae sefydliadau'n gwneud hynny, ond weithiau gall fod yn anodd i wneud hynny gydag adeiladau unigol. Efallai y gallwch eu rhoi heibio, ond efallai na allwch gael gwared arnynt.

[36] **Dafydd Wigley:** Janet, yr oeddech am wneud sylw ar rywbeth yma?

[37] **Janet Davies:** Oeddwn. Mr Martin, pan yr oeddech yn edrych ar wahanol ffyrdd o gynnwys myfyrwyr yn y broses—ymestyn allan—bu i chi grybwyll adeiladau ysgol. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod gan ysgolion cyfun lleol yn fy ardal rai cynlluniau da iawn ar waith lle mae'r myfyrwyr chweched dosbarth yn mynychu colegau addysg bellach am ddeuddydd neu dridiau'r wythnos. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sy'n fy mhoeni yw, os ydych yn edrych ar y sefyllfa hon o safbwynt gwahanol—ac nid wyf yn sicr ai dyna'r hyn yr oeddech yn ei olygu—o ran dod â myfyrwyr i adeiladau ysgol, onid ydych yn wynebu problemau oherwydd bod pryderon

these days? I do not know if that is what you meant, but it seemed that there could be a problem and a major obstacle there.

Mr Martin: Yes, clearly there would be a problem. However, I think that problems are to be solved where they can be, and a lot of schools are, of course, open to adults outside normal hours. Indeed, there are many schools that offer, for instance, attendance at A-level and AS-level courses to adults. So the issues do exist. What I was talking about specifically, however, was really 16 to 19 provision where the range of offering that can be made to people is obviously going to be much wider and there are already some fantastic examples of this. A collegium in Cardiff, in the Ely area, is looking at using the college resource alongside school resources. It has been running for some years now and it is offering a much better curriculum choice to people and achieving therefore much higher staying-on rates. It has—planned properly and systematically—the potential to get much better use for the total publicly funded stock that we are using in education than planning for individual institutions on their own.

[38] **Dafydd Wigley:** No doubt that is something that we will return to at some other stage and perhaps in some other forum. Before moving on to the next section, may I suggest, Mr Martin, that, if indeed you are looking in a root and branch way at how education facilities in the round can best be used, the question of using resources such as school buildings may be taken into account in order to get a better utilisation of the stock, and it may lead to you being able to dispose of some stock that is not currently being used in an effective manner, if you are taking into account using the other available stock in some of these other directions.

Mr Martin: That could certainly be the case.

[39] **Dafydd Wigley:** Good.

[40] **Eleanor Burnham:** I thought I had a

gwirioneddol am ddiogelwch plant yn yr ysgol yn yr oes sydd ohoni? Ni wn ai dyna'r oeddech yn ei olygu, ond ymddengys y gallai fod problem a rhwystr sylweddol yna.

Mr Martin: Ie, yn amlwg byddai problem. Fodd bynnag, credaf y dylid datrys problemau lle bo hynny'n bosibl, ac mae nifer o ysgolion, wrth gwrs, ar agor i oedolion y tu allan i oriau arferol. Yn wir, mae nifer o ysgolion yn cynnig, er enghraifft, gyrsiau safon Uwch a safon Uwch Atodol i oedolion. Felly mae'r materion hyn yn bodoli. Yr hyn yr oeddwn yn siarad amdano'n benodol, fodd bynnag, oedd darpariaeth 16 i 19 mewn gwirionedd lle mae'r amrywiaeth a gynigir i bobl yn amlwg yn mynd i fod yn llawer ehangach ac mae enghreifftiau gwych o hyn yn barod. Mae colegiwm yng Nghaerdydd, yn ardal Trelái, yn ystyried defnyddio adnoddau'r coleg ochr yn ochr ag adnoddau ysgol. Bu ar agor am nifer o flynyddoedd bellach ac mae'n cynnig dewis cwricwlwm llawer gwell i bobl ac yn cyflawni cyfraddau aros-ymlaen llawer uwch oherwydd hynny. Mae ganddo—wedi'i gynllunio'n drylwyr ac yn systematig—y potensial i sicrhau defnydd llawer gwell o'r holl stoc a gyllidir yn gyhoeddus yr ydym yn ei ddefnyddio mewn addysg na chynllunio ar gyfer sefydliadau unigol ar eu pennau eu hunain.

[38] **Dafydd Wigley:** Nid oes amheuaeth fod hyn yn rhywbeth y byddwn yn dod yn ôl ato rywbryd eto ac efallai mewn ffordd arall. Cyn symud ymlaen at yr adran nesaf, a gaf fi awgrymu, Mr Martin, os ydych mewn gwirionedd yn edrych mewn ffordd waelodol ar sut y gall cyfleusterau addysg gael eu defnyddio orau, gellid ystyried y cwestiwn o ddefnyddio adnoddau fel adeiladau ysgol er mwyn gwneud gwell defnydd o'r stoc, a gallai eich arwain at allu cael gwared ar rywfaint o'r stoc nad yw'n cael ei ddefnyddio'n effeithiol ar hyn o bryd, os ydych yn ystyried defnyddio gweddill y stoc sydd ar gael mewn rhai o'r cyfeiriadau eraill hyn.

Mr Martin: Gallai hyn yn sicr fod yn wir.

[39] **Dafydd Wigley:** Da iawn.

[40] **Eleanor Burnham:** Yr oeddwn yn

question, Chair. Have I looked at the wrong schedule?

[41] **Dafydd Wigley:** I do not think that you have a question on this.

Yr ydym am droi yn awr at y ffactorau sy'n effeithio ar reolaeth ystâd addysg bellach. Mae'r adnoddau, Mr Martin, yr ydych chi yn eu darparu ar gyfer y colegau yn amlwg yn ffactor sylfaenol sy'n effeithio ar eu gallu i ofalu am eu hadeiladau. Daeth yn dipyn o sioc i mi ddeall o'r adroddiad, ac yr ydwyf yn edrych ar baragraffau 3.4 a 3.5, nad ydych yn cymryd i ystyriaeth gyflwr adeiladau unrhyw goleg wrth benderfynu faint o gyllid i'w ddarparu i'r coleg hwnnw. Pam yn enw pob rheswm nad ydych yn gwneud hyn? Sut y gallwch ddisgwyl i'r colegau gynllunio ar gyfer y tymor hir heb fod yna ddarpariaeth benodol sydd yn cydnabod eu hanghenion adeiladau?

Mr Martin: First of all, for the last three or four years, there has been a change in the way in which the formula worked for capital so that it is allocated in a way which is related to what is called weighted learning units. So that those courses which cost more, as it were, in terms of capital facilities to put on—for instance land-based provision—are rewarded at a higher level, double the level in that case, of the normal learning units. The issues here I think are balanced. I have to say, as I answer this question, that it is an open issue about what view the national council will want to take about this going forward as part of its new planning and funding system, so it is a very timely moment to be having this debate.

As I said earlier, the view of the Further Education Funding Council—having undertaken this major survey right at the beginning of incorporation—was to try to get colleges to some kind of minimum-based level of comparability, if you like, with a combination of funding for backlog maintenance—as I say, £25 million in the first few years—in direct proportion, as it were, to the identified problem. It also then had a system of bidding for a while, whereby people were able to come in and say, 'look,

credu fod gennyf gwestiwn, Gadeirydd. A wyf wedi edrych ar yr amserlen anghywir?

[41] **Dafydd Wigley:** Ni chredaf fod gennych gwestiwn ar hyn.

We are now going to turn to the factors that affect the management of the further education estate. The resources, Mr Martin, that you provide for the colleges are obviously a fundamental factor affecting their ability to look after their estates. It came as quite a shock for me to learn from the report, and I am looking at paragraph 3.4 and 3.5, that you do not take into consideration the condition of the buildings of any college in deciding upon how much funding to provide for that college. Why, in the name of all reason, do you not do that? How do you expect colleges to plan for the long term without there being specific provision that acknowledges their building needs?

Mr Martin: Yn gyntaf, am y tair neu bedair blynedd diwethaf, bu newid yn y ffordd y mae'r fformiwla yn gweithio ar gyfer cyfalaf fel ei fod yn cael ei ddyrannu mewn ffordd sy'n gysylltiedig â'r hyn a elwir yn unedau dysgu wedi'u pwysoli. Er mwyn sicrhau bod y cyrsiau hynny sy'n costio mwy, fel petai, o ran cyfleusterau cyfalaf i'w cynnig—er enghraifft darpariaeth ar y tir—yn cael eu gwobrwyo ar lefel uwch, ddwywaith y lefel yn yr achos hwn, yr unedau dysgu arferol. Credaf fod cydbwysedd rhwng y materion hyn. Mae'n rhaid i mi ddweud wrth i mi ateb y cwestiwn hwn, ei fod yn fater agored ynglŷn â pha farn y bydd y cyngor cenedlaethol am ei chymryd ynglŷn â mynd a hyn ymlaen fel rhan o'i system gynllunio a chyllido newydd, felly mae'r ddadl hon yn amserol.

Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, barn y Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Bellach—ar ôl cynnal yr arolwg pwysig hwn ar ddechrau'r ymgorffori—oedd ceisio cael colegau ar ryw fath o lefel gymharedd isaf, os dymunwch, gyda chyfuniad y cyllid ar gyfer gwaith cynnal a chadw sy'n aros i gael ei wneud—fel y dywedaf, £25 miliwn yn y blynyddoedd cyntaf—yn gwbl gymesur, fel petai, â'r broblem a nodwyd. Yr oedd ganddo hefyd bryd hynny system ar gyfer cyflwyno cynigion am gyfnod, lle yr oedd pobl yn gallu

we want to refashion the estate in this way, will you help us?'. There was investment in that. I have to say that you also have to go back to the spirit of the times, if you like. At the time of incorporation and subsequently, it was intended that the corporations should have the maximum possible freedom to govern themselves and to take responsibility for their own affairs. There is also a very strong argument, given the demonstrable success of some colleges in tackling these issues with a lot of use of their own resources by generating reserves through their success in recruitment and so on—which has been very successful in reshaping their estates; there are many excellent examples of this across Wales—as to whether you should, if you like, reward those who have chosen to use their money in other ways. It is not simple, because at the end of the day we are there to look after the interests of the learners and we must make sure that those are addressed.

If you ask me to predict, I would say that we are likely to have a system under the new planning and funding arrangements that is a mixture of targeted and formula funding. Formula funding, with appropriate weightings for different types of provision, does maximise discretion and enables the colleges to plan their own affairs properly. I hope, incidentally, that we can give them those allocations with a much greater degree of forward certainty about at least the minimum that they will get, so that they can plan properly. Annuality has been a problem down the years and one of the features of the new planning and funding system is a proposal for three-year funding. We have not yet had approval for three-year funding and there are issues for the Assembly itself about how it sees that and whether it wants to stick to the annuality rules. I would say though that the Learning and Skills Council in England has now been given significant freedom over three years so that there can be a longer time horizon for planning.

[42] **Dafydd Wigley:** Can I just be clear that what you are advocating is a rolling three-year programme that would be updated each year?

dod i mewn a dweud, 'edrychwch, yr ydym am ailwampio'r ystâd yn y modd hwn, a wnewch chi ein cynorthwyo?'. Buddsoddyd yn hynny. Mae'n rhaid i mi ddweud bod yn rhaid i chi hefyd fynd yn ôl at ysbryd y cyfnod, os mynnwch. Yn y cyfnod ymgorffori ac wedi hynny, y bwriad oedd i'r corfforaethau gael y rhyddid mwyaf posibl i lywodraethu eu hunain ac i gymryd cyfrifoldeb am eu busnes eu hunain. Ceir dadl gref iawn hefyd, o ystyried llwyddiant amlwg rhai colegau wrth fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn drwy ddefnyddio llawer o'u hadnoddau eu hunain drwy gynhyrchu cronfeydd wrth gefn yn dilyn eu llwyddiant wrth recriwtio ac ati—sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus iawn wrth ail-lunio eu hystadau; mae sawl enghraifft ragorol o hyn ledled Cymru—o ran a ddylech, os mynnwch, wobrwyo y rheini sydd wedi dewis defnyddio eu harian at ddibenion eraill. Nid yw hyn yn syml, oherwydd yn y pen draw yr ydym yma i ofalu am fuddiannau dysgwyr ac mae'n rhaid i ni sicrhau ein bod yn eu diwallu.

Pe ofynnech i mi ragweld, byddwn yn dweud ein bod yn debygol o gael system ar waith dan y trefniadau cynllunio a chyllido newydd sy'n gymysgedd o ariannu wedi ei dargedu ac yn ôl fformiwla. Mae ariannu yn ôl fformiwla, gan bwysoli mathau gwahanol o ddarpariaeth yn briodol, yn gwneud yn fawr o ryddid ac yn galluogi i golegau gynllunio eu busnes eu hunain yn drylwyr. Gobeithiaf, gyda llaw, y gallwn roi iddynt y dyraniadau hynny gyda llawer mwy o sicrwydd am y dyfodol o ran y swm isaf y byddant yn ei gael o leiaf, fel y gallant gynllunio'n iawn. Mae cyllido blynyddol wedi bod yn broblem dros y blynyddoedd ac un o nodweddion y system gynllunio a chyllido newydd yw cynnig am gyllid tair blynedd. Nid ydym eto wedi derbyn cymeradwyaeth ar gyfer cyllid tair blynedd ac mae goblygiadau i'r Cynulliad ei hun o ran ei farn ar hynny ac a yw am gadw at reolau cyllido blynyddol. Dywedwn fod y Cyngor Dysgu a Sgiliau yn Lloegr wedi cael digon o ryddid bellach dros dair blynedd fel y gellir neilltuo rhagor o amser i gynllunio.

[42] **Dafydd Wigley:** A gaf fi fod yn glir mai'r hyn yr ydych yn ei gymeradwyo yw rhaglen tair-blynedd dreigl a fyddai'n cael ei diweddarau bob blwyddyn?

Mr Martin: Yes.

[43] **Dafydd Wigley:** I think that there would be a lot of sympathy with that approach—although I am probably straying outside my rules here—if the comprehensive spending review approach permitted it; that sometimes is the problem on that. To be clear, what is the latest position with regard to the funding review mentioned in paragraph 3.6?

Mr Martin: We submitted proposals to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning in the latter part of last year. We have received approval of those principles. We have presented this in detail to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee and if this Committee would like to have details we have plenty of papers that you can have—including summaries, you will be pleased to know. The next stage is the tough bit. We have got agreement to the principles, and there are—perhaps I could give you a simplified description of the new system, because it is really quite different from anything that has existed up to now. There are two elements to the system. It is not just a funding system; it is not just a funding formula. It is a planning framework and a funding system. The word ‘planning’ is very important, because there is a prior decision to be made by the council about what it actually wants to use the money for.

So it is not just a case of saying there is a college there and we will give them some money provided that they put on the following kinds of courses. It is actually about asking, what is the pattern of provision we want? The council intends to base those decisions in a very sound understanding of the needs of Wales, of the needs of learners, and of the needs of businesses, where there are skills issues at stake, so that we have a much more intelligent rolling understanding nationally, regionally and locally about what it is that we need to purchase. Of course, if you are looking at the needs of Wales and the needs of business, you are not just looking at the needs today; you are looking at the needs over the next 10 years. That is a very different approach.

Mr Martin: Ie.

[43] **Dafydd Wigley:** Credaf y byddai llawer o gydymdeimlad gyda'r dull hwnnw—er fy mod mae'n siŵr yn gwyro oddi wrth y rheolau yma—pe bai'r dull adolygu gwariant cynhwysfawr yn caniatáu hynny; dyna'r broblem gyda hynny weithiau. I fod yn glir, beth yw'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf o ran yr adolygiad cyllid a grybwyllir ym mharagraff 3.6?

Mr Martin: Cyflwynasom gynigion i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ddiwedd y llynedd. Yr ydym wedi derbyn cymeradwyaeth i'r egwyddorion hynny. Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno hyn yn fanwl i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes a phe bai'r Pwyllgor hwn yn dymuno gweld y manylion mae gennym ddigon o bapurau y gallwch eu cael—gan gynnwys crynodebau, byddwch yn falch o glywed. Y cam nesaf yw'r un anodd. Yr ydym wedi cytuno ar yr egwyddorion, ac mae—efallai y gallaf roi disgrifiad syml i chi o'r system newydd, oherwydd y mae'n eithaf gwahanol i unrhyw beth arall sydd wedi bodoli hyd yma. Mae gan y system ddwy elfen. Mae mwy iddi na system gyllido yn unig; mae'n fwy na fformiwla cyllido. Mae'n fframwaith cynllunio a system gyllido. Mae'r gair ‘cynllunio’ yn bwysig iawn, oherwydd mae'n rhaid i'r cyngor wneud penderfyniad ymlaen llaw am yr hyn y mae am ddefnyddio'r arian ar ei gyfer mewn gwirionedd.

Felly nid yw'n fater o ddweud bod coleg yno ac y byddwn yn rhoi ychydig o arian iddynt a bwrw eu bod yn cynnal y mathau canlynol o gyrsiau. Mae'n ymwneud mewn gwirionedd â gofyn, beth yw'r patrwm darpariaeth yr ydym am ei weld? Mae'r cyngor yn bwriadu seilio'r penderfyniadau hynny ar ddealltwriaeth gadarn iawn o anghenion Cymru, anghenion dysgwyr, ac anghenion busnesau, lle bo materion sgiliau yn y fantol, er mwyn i ni gael dealltwriaeth dreigl llawer mwy deallus yn genedlaethol, yn rhanbarthol ac yn lleol am yr hyn sydd angen i ni ei brynu. Wrth gwrs, os ydych yn edrych ar anghenion Cymru ac anghenion busnes, nid ydych yn edrych ar anghenion heddiw yn unig; yr ydych yn edrych ar anghenion dros y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Mae honno yn ymagwedd

wahanol iawn.

Now, the second element—the funding system to serve that—will kick in slightly later. The planning system is starting this year; we will not get it all right this year, but we are beginning to make that effort. From the academic year 2004-05, we will begin to introduce the new funding system. The work that is going on between now and summer and autumn is very detailed modelling of how this new system will work. I can go on; I can give you more details if you want them, but it is a radical departure, and it is the context within which we will be addressing these problems.

[44] **Dafydd Wigley:** I think that the details you refer to might be submitted in any written supplementary memoranda that you want to give. It certainly would be helpful to the Auditor General and his team, and they would be very grateful for that.

There is one matter that you did touch on, which is the change of spirit, possibly, in 1993. Janet, have you got something on that?

[45] **Janet Davies:** Yes. Perhaps this seems almost like going off on a bit of a tangent, Mr Martin, but there was a massive, radical change in 1993. Before that you had the county councils, which often saw it as quite a sort of macho thing to build something major with a further education college. Maybe the money was not always most wisely spent, or the buildings were not that wonderful, but there was money going in and there were things happening. That changed in 1993. It seems to me that it has taken an awfully long time, really, for the sector to actually recover from this massive change. There were lots of people who were very unhappy about it—a lot of the staff were unhappy about it. However, what you are talking about, it seems to me now, is a more gradual sort of change to achieve particular aims. Would you feel that a more gradual sort of change to these sorts of systems is possibly better than something as earth-shaking as what happened to them in 1993?

Yn awr, bydd yr ail elfen—y system gyllido i wasanaethu hynny—yn dechrau ychydig wedi hynny. Mae'r system gynllunio yn cychwyn eleni; ni fyddwn yn gwneud popeth yn iawn eleni, ond yr ydym yn dechrau gwneud yr ymdrech. O flwyddyn academaidd 2004-05, byddwn yn dechrau cyflwyno'r system gyllido newydd. Mae'r gwaith a gyflawnir rhwng nawr a'r haf a'r hydref yn fodol manwl iawn o sut y bydd y system newydd hon yn gweithio. Gallaf fynd ymlaen; gallaf roi rhagor o fanylion i chi os ydych yn dymuno, ond mae'n newid cyfeiriad radical, a byddwn yn mynd i'r afael â'r problemau hyn o fewn y cyd-destun hwn.

[44] **Dafydd Wigley:** Credaf y gellid cyflwyno'r manylion yr ydych yn cyfeirio atynt mewn unrhyw femoranda atodol ysgrifenedig yr ydych am eu cyflwyno. Byddai'n sicr yn ddefnyddiol i'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol a'i dîm, a byddent yn ddiolchgar iawn amdano.

Mae un mater na fu i chi ei drafod, sef y newid ysbryd, o bosibl, yn 1993. Janet, a oes gennych rywbeth i'w gyfrannu ar hynny?

[45] **Janet Davies:** Oes. Efallai fod hyn yn ymddangos bron fel dilyn trywydd gwahanol, Mr Martin, ond bu newid enfawr, radical yn 1993. Cyn hynny yr oedd gennych y cynghorau sir, a oedd yn aml yn ystyried adeiladu rhywbeth pwysig gyda choleg addysg bellach yn gam gwrol iawn. Efallai na wariwyd yr arian yn ddoeth iawn bob amser, neu efallai nad oedd yr adeiladau mor wych â hynny, ond yr oedd arian yn cael ei fuddsoddi ac yr oedd pethau'n digwydd. Newidiodd hynny yn 1993. Ymddengys i mi ei bod wedi cymryd amser hir iawn, mewn gwirionedd, i'r sector adfer yn sgil y newid enfawr hwn. Yr oedd llawer o bobl a oedd yn anhapus gyda'r newid—yr oedd llawer o'r staff yn anhapus gyda'r newid. Fodd bynnag, mae'r hyn yr ydych yn siarad amdano, ymddengys i mi'n awr, yn newid mwy graddol i gyflawni nodau penodol. A fydddech yn teimlo bod newid mwy graddol i'r mathau hyn o systemau yn well o bosibl na rhywbeth mor ysgytwol â'r hyn a ddigwyddodd iddynt yn 1993?

Mr Martin: Well, before I answer that specific question, may I just say that I think whatever the merits or demerits of what happened in 1993, which I guess would fall into the category of a policy question—

[46] **Dafydd Wigley:** Yes, I am afraid so.

Mr Martin: Nineteen out of the 24 institutions, we are in no doubt at all, have significantly better estates than they had at the time of incorporation. We have got rid of an awful lot of rubbish over that period; a lot of portakabins and sub-standard provision. That is a success story; there is no question about that. That leaves five institutions. Of them, in three cases, we think that the situation has not changed much and in two we think that it has actually got worse. However, the general picture is an encouraging one of improvement for the majority of the sector.

In terms of your question about whether we should go forward in a more gradual way, the council's thinking on this is to be very radical in terms of what it needs to achieve for learners and new patterns of learning, and to set that vision out, but then to move towards that in terms of the way the funding system operates in a way that does not destabilise existing provision except where it is not good enough—I mean, clearly, one has to address that immediately if that is the case. My firm belief, and you see this in any walk of life, whether it is in the public or private sector or whatever, is that if you give those who are responsible for managing a period—if you say over five years this is the plan we are working to, this is where we want to get to—people will change their behaviours. What we are not intending to do is to have an overnight change in the funding formula which will destabilise provision, and therefore we will be doing very, very careful modelling in consultation, and, almost certainly, some quite deep cushioning and dampening so that that system comes in gradually over time.

[47] **Dafydd Wigley:** Thank you. The question of finance bears heavily on the disability dimension, Ann.

Mr Martin: Wel, cyn i mi ateb y cwestiwn penodol hwnnw, a gaf fi ddweud fy mod yn credu, beth bynnag fo rhinweddau neu wendidau yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn 1993, a fyddai'n cael eu cynnwys yng nghategori cwestiwn polisi mae'n debyg—

[46] **Dafydd Wigley:** Byddai, gwaetha'r modd.

Mr Martin: Nid oes gennym amheuaeth o gwbl bod gan 19 o'r 24 sefydliad ystadau llawer gwell nag oedd ganddynt adeg yr ymgorffori. Yr ydym wedi cael gwared ar domen o ysbwriel ers hynny; nifer o gabanau a darpariaeth is-safonol. Mae hynny yn llwyddiant ysgubol; nid oes amheuaeth am hynny. Mae hynny'n gadael pum sefydliad. O'r rhain, mewn tri achos, credwn nad yw'r sefyllfa wedi newid llawer ac mewn dau achos credwn eu bod wedi gwaethygu hyd yn oed. Fodd bynnag, mae'r darlun cyffredinol yn un calonogol o welliannau i'r mwyafrif yn y sector.

O ran eich cwestiwn am a ddylem fynd ymlaen yn fwy graddol, bydd barn y cyngor ar hyn yn radical iawn o ran beth y mae angen ei gyflawni i ddysgwyr a phatrymau dysgu newydd, ac i esbonio'r weledigaeth honno, ond yna i symud tua'r nod hwn o ran y ffordd y mae'r system gyllido yn cael ei gweithredu mewn ffordd nad yw'n ansefydlogi'r ddarpariaeth gyfredol ac eithrio lle nad yw'n ddigon da—credaf, yn amlwg, fod yn rhaid i rywun fynd i'r afael â hyn ar unwaith os mai dyna'r sefyllfa. Credaf yn gryf, ac mae hyn yn wir ym mhob agwedd ar fywyd, yn y sector cyhoeddus neu'r sector preifat neu beth bynnag, os ydych yn rhoi i'r rhai hynny sy'n gyfrifol am reoli cyfnod—os ydych yn dweud dros bum mlynedd mai dyma'r cynllun yr ydym yn gweithio iddo, dyma lle'r ydym am gyrraedd—bydd pobl yn newid eu hymddygiad. Yr hyn na fwriadwn ei wneud yw newid y fformiwla cyllido dros nos a fyddai'n ansefydlogi darpariaeth, ac felly byddwn yn modelu'n ofalus iawn, iawn mewn ymgynghoriad, a, bron yn sicr, yn clustogi a lleddfu'n eithaf dwys er mwyn cyflwyno'r system yn raddol dros amser.

[47] **Dafydd Wigley:** Diolch. Mae'r cwestiwn ynghylch cyllid yn berthnasol iawn i'r dimensiwn anabled, Ann.

[48] **Ann Jones:** Yes, I think that it does. We have gone over the disability issue, but will your review of funding take account of the institutions' needs in terms of work that is needed now to satisfy disability legislation?

Mr Martin: I think, going back to my earlier answers, whatever we were doing—even if we did not have this system coming in—we would need to address that. Indeed, given its urgency and given its statutory nature, I think that the council will—I am in no doubt at all—want to address it very firmly and not wait for the full impact of that new system.

[49] **Ann Jones:** Okay, good. Thank you.

[50] **Dafydd Wigley:** Janet, do you want to carry on the questioning?

[51] **Janet Davies:** Yes. Could I refer Mr Martin to case studies five and six on page 18? There we have examples of two institutions that have successfully accessed European funds to improve their estates. Do you think that the institutions as a whole are making the most of potential access to these European funds?

Mr Martin: You can always do more. I think that I can add to that list. There is a lot going on; those are two excellent examples. There are eight projects currently—Bridgend, Coleg Sir Gâr, Gorseinon, Llysfasi, Coleg Menai, Pembrokeshire, Ystrad Mynach and Neath Port Talbot—where they already have projects either completed or in train. That is since 2001. Those are the projects that are levering in, as I said, total funding of £21 million—£8 million of which is European funding. So, it is total spend of £21 million; £8 million of that is European; £6.3 million has come from the council, and we think that that is a pretty good strike rate. The rest of the money has come from other sources, including college reserves.

[48] **Ann Jones:** Ydyw, credaf ei fod. Yr ydym wedi rhoi sylw i'r mater anabledd, ond a fydd eich adolygiad cyllid yn ystyried anghenion y sefydliadau o ran y gwaith sydd angen ei gyflawni'n awr i fodloni'r ddeddfwriaeth anabledd?

Mr Martin: Credaf, gan gyfeirio'n ôl at fy atebion cynharach, beth bynnag yr oeddem yn ei wneud—hyd yn oed os nad oeddem am gyflwyno'r system hon—y byddem angen mynd i'r afael â hynny. Yn wir, o ystyried ei frys ac o ystyried ei natur statudol, credaf y bydd y cyngor—nid oes gennyf amheuaeth o gwbl—am fynd i'r afael â hyn yn gryf ac ni fydd am ddisgwyl tan effaith lawn y system newydd.

[49] **Ann Jones:** Iawn, da iawn. Diolch.

[50] **Dafydd Wigley:** Janet, a ydych am barhau gyda'r cwestiynau?

[51] **Janet Davies:** Ydw. A gaf fi gyfeirio Mr Martin at astudiaethau achos pump a chwech ar dudalen 18? Mae gennym enghreifftiau yma o ddau sefydliad sydd wedi llwyddo i gael gafael ar gronfeydd Ewropeaidd i wella eu hystadau. A gredwch fod y sefydliadau ar y cyfan yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfle posibl i gael gafael ar y cronfeydd Ewropeaidd hyn?

Mr Martin: Gallwch wneud mwy bob amser. Credaf y gallaf ychwanegu at y rhestr honno. Mae llawer yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd; mae'r rhain yn ddwy enghraifft ragorol. Mae wyth prosiect ar waith ar hyn o bryd—Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, Coleg Sir Gâr, Gorseinon, Llysfasi, Coleg Menai, Sir Benfro, Ystrad Mynach a Chastell-nedd Port Talbot—lle mae prosiectau naill ai wedi'u cwblhau neu mewn trefn. Mae hynny ers 2001. Dyma'r prosiectau sy'n denu, fel y dywedais, gyfanswm cyllid o £21 miliwn—mae £8 miliwn o hynny yn gyllid Ewropeaidd. Felly, mae cyfanswm y gwariant yn £21 miliwn; mae £8 miliwn ohono'n arian Ewropeaidd; mae £6.3 miliwn wedi dod o'r cyngor, a chredwn fod hynny'n gyfradd lwyddo dda iawn. Daeth gweddill yr arian o ffynonellau eraill, gan gynnwys arian wrth gefn y colegau.

[52] **Janet Davies:** So, clearly, you are doing quite a lot as a council to assist them. Could I also ask, are you also giving them guidance, because we have had one fairly memorable example in this Committee, which happened before the Committee came into being, of where things did go rather drastically wrong.

Mr Martin: Yes. I think we are talking here about European regional development grant funding of course, which is much easier, I have to say, to get right than European structural funding. ESF is a minefield. We are very heavily engaged ourselves in sponsoring projects there, and it requires the application of a resource quite disproportionate to anything else we do to get it right. There are perils here. We believe in the case of these projects—it could be famous last words, but I hope not—that it is proceeding in the way that one would hope. However, you are absolutely right, and the previous council, I recall, did issue guidance about the use of European funding, and advice was always available. We now have a much strengthened specialist European resource in the organisation to advise and help colleges through that.

[53] **Dafydd Wigley:** Can we turn now to what I regard as a vitally important aspect of the report, which is the strategic planning of the estates? Before I ask Ann to come in, can I just underline the importance of this? I must say that the implication of paragraph 3.8, and figure 8 on page 19, causes me considerable alarm. It says that there is little evidence that estates matters figure in the council's strategic thinking and that, of the strategies of 24 colleges, no less than 17 of these are less than satisfactory, to use the terminology, and not one can be described as above average, still less as excellent. With that as background, over to you, Ann. I am seriously concerned about this aspect.

[54] **Ann Jones:** Given the Chair's lead into that, and recognising that the council has many issues to consider, do you not think that the lack of strategic attention on estates found

[52] **Janet Davies:** Felly, yn amlwg, yr ydych yn gwneud llawer fel cyngor i'w cynorthwyo. A gaf fi ofyn hefyd, a ydych yn rhoi canllawiau iddynt hefyd, oherwydd yr ydym wedi cael un enghraifft gofiadwy yn y Pwyllgor hwn, a ddigwyddodd cyn sefydlu'r Pwyllgor, lle yr aeth pethau o le yn ddifrifol.

Mr Martin: Do. Credaf ein bod yn siarad yma am gyllid grant datblygu rhanbarthol Ewrop, sy'n llawer haws, mae'n rhaid i mi ddweud, i'w weithredu'n gywir na chyllid strwythurol Ewropeaidd. Mae'r CSE yn ddrysfa. Yr ydym yn weithgar iawn ein hunain yn noddï prosiectau yno, ac mae'n gofyn am ddefnyddio adnoddau y tu hwnt i unrhyw beth arall yr ydym yn ei wneud i'w gael yn iawn. Mae peryglon yma. Credwn yn achos y prosiectau hyn—efallai y bydd y geiriau hyn yn dod yn ôl i'm plagio, yr wyf yn gobeithio na fyddant—ei fod yn mynd yn ei flaen yn y ffordd y byddem yn dymuno iddo'i wneud. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn hollol gywir, a chyhoeddodd y cyngor diwethaf, yr wyf yn cofio, ganllawiau am ddefnyddio cyllid Ewropeaidd, ac yr oedd cyngor ar gael bob amser. Mae gennym adnodd Ewropeaidd arbenigol wedi'i gryfhau'n sylweddol yn y sefydliad i gynghori a chynorthwyo colegau drwy hynny.

[53] **Dafydd Wigley:** A gawn ni droi ein sylw yn awr at yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ystyried fel agwedd hanfodol bwysig ar yr adroddiad, sef cynllun strategol yr ystadau? Cyn i mi ofyn i Ann gyfrannu, a gaf fi danlinellu pwysigrwydd hyn? Mae'n rhaid i mi ddweud bod goblygiadau paragraff 3.8, a ffigur 8 ar dudalen 19, yn peri cryn fraw i mi. Mae'n dweud nad oes llawer o dystiolaeth fod materion ystadau yn ymddangos yn syniadau strategol y cyngor ac, o strategaethau 24 coleg, mae 17 o'r rhain yn llai na boddhaol, adefnyddio'r derminoleg, ac ni ellir disgrifio'r un ohonynt yn uwch na'r cyfartaledd, heb sôn am fod yn rhagorol. O ystyried y cefndir hwnnw, ymlaen atoch chi Ann. Yr wyf yn wirioneddol bryderus am yr agwedd hon.

[54] **Ann Jones:** O ystyried rhagair y Cadeirydd i hynny, a chydabod bod gan y cyngor sawl mater i'w hystyried, a ydych yn credu bod y diffyg sylw strategol i ystadau yn

in this report is a serious omission?

Mr Martin: Well, the Chairman reminded us at the beginning that the facts in the report are agreed. I think that this is a judgment rather than a fact and I think to base from a look at the minutes a judgment about whether the council has devoted attention to this does not bear much scrutiny, frankly. I have already outlined the special measures that the council took, as soon as it was in business, to address these issues. There has been an updating of the estates manual and guidance, and the council has devoted an enormous amount of time—which certainly is evidenced in the minutes—to thinking about the new pattern of learning networks and how it will go about supporting those, and not least to the biggest thing that the council is tackling, which is the introduction of this new planning and funding system which gives a much more strategic approach to these issues than they have ever had. So, I think that I would have to depart really very sharply from that judgment. I think that it is very unfair, and I do not think that any more detailed investigation—

[55] **Dafydd Wigley:** Excuse me, Ann, for cutting across; I know that you want to come back on this, but I am quoting directly from the report:

‘little evidence that estates matters figure in the council’s strategic thinking.’

This is, is it not, Mr Martin, an agreed report? Did you dispute that?

Mr Martin: In fact, I would describe it as a judgment.

[56] **Dafydd Wigley:** Did you dispute that part of it?

Mr Martin: I cannot recall.

[57] **Ann Jones:** Do you think that you give a strong lead from the council to institutions on paying attention to their estates?

Mr Martin: Yes, we do. We have given repeated guidance. The estates handbook and

yr adroddiad hwn yn esgeulustod difrifol?

Mr Martin: Wel, mae’r Cadeirydd wedi ein hatgoffa ar y dechrau bod cydsyniad am ffeithiau’r adroddiad hwn. Credaf mai barn yn hytrach na ffaith yw hyn a chredaf nad yw seilio barn ar sail edrych ar y cofnodion a barnu a yw’r cyngor wedi neilltuo sylw i hyn yn dangos llawer o waith archwilio, a siarad yn blwmp ac yn blaen. Yr wyf wedi amlinellu’r mesurau arbennig a gymerodd y cyngor, yn syth ar ôl bwrw i’w waith, i fynd i’r afael â’r materion hyn. Mae llawlyfr a chanllawiau’r ystadau wedi’u diweddarau, ac mae’r cyngor wedi neilltuo llawer o amser—sy’n sicr yn amlwg yn y cofnodion—i feddwl am batrwm rhwydweithiau dysgu newydd a sut y bydd yn cynorthwyo’r rheini, a’r peth mwyaf y bydd y cyngor yn mynd i’r afael ag ef, sef cyflwyno ei system gynllunio a chyllido newydd sydd ag agwedd lawer mwy strategol at y materion hyn nag y bu iddynt erioed. Felly, credaf y bydd yn rhaid i mi ymneilltuo fy hun yn gyflym iawn o’r farn hon. Credaf nad yw’n deg o gwbl, ac ni chredaf y byddai ymchwiliad mwy manwl yn—

[55] **Dafydd Wigley:** Mae’n ddrwg gennyf, Ann, am dorri ar draws; yr wyf yn gwybod eich bod am ddod yn ôl at hyn, ond yr wyf yn dyfyntu’n uniongyrchol o’r adroddiad:

‘nad oes llawer o dystiolaeth bod materion ystadau yn ymddangos yn syniadaeth strategol y cyngor.’

Mae hwn, onid yw, Mr Martin, yn adroddiad y cytunwyd arno? A oeddech yn anghydweld â hynny?

Mr Martin: A dweud y gwir, byddwn yn ei ddisgrifio fel barn.

[56] **Dafydd Wigley:** A oeddech yn anghydweld â’r rhan honno ohono?

Mr Martin: Nid wyf yn cofio.

[57] **Ann Jones:** A ydych yn meddwl eich bod yn rhoi arweiniad cryf gan y cyngor i sefydliadau o ran talu sylw i’w hystadau?

Mr Martin: Ydym, yr ydym. Yr ydym wedi rhoi canllawiau dro ar ôl tro. Mae’r llawlyfr

management and guidance to governors and so on has repeated the core messages about the estates. May I just say, on the point about this text, if there is an issue that we should have picked up on and which we should have asked for elaboration about and we did not, then I apologise.

[58] **Dafydd Wigley:** It is an agreed report, and not just in terms of the facts, is it not? I will ask Sir John to come in on that in a moment.

Mr Martin: Yes, okay, but I would not want to make that a dispute between us. What I am saying is that I am in no doubt whatsoever, from everything that the council has done and from the moment that it was set up, that it has paid sustained attention to this issue. However, it has paid a lot of that attention in the context of a much wider agenda going forward about how to make the best use of all the resources that are going into post-16 education and training.

[59] **Ann Jones:** So how do you square the fact that paragraph 3.8 of the report—and it is an agreed report—states that:

‘Council minutes reveal that estates matters are rarely discussed.’

That is a direct quote from the report. So how can you say that there is a strong lead there, if your council rarely discusses the matters?

Mr Martin: Well, that is a fact. The minutes themselves would not record in detail every aspect, for instance, of the discussion about how to allocate money in the year. The reasons for that, and the reason the minutes would not say that, is because there are detailed papers that do say that. They state that these are the issues, that this is how the pattern of investment should be. Certainly, in terms of the things that I have been describing in terms of the council’s special effort to invest in the estate, that is well evidenced in the papers that have been before the council.

ystadau a rheolaeth a chanllawiau i lywodraethwyr ac ati wedi ailadrodd y neges graidd am yr ystadau. A gaf fi ddweud, ar y pwynt ynglŷn â'r testun hwn, os oes mater y dylem fod wedi'i drafod ac y dylem fod wedi gofyn am fanylder amdano ond na wnaethom, yna ymddiheuraf.

[58] **Dafydd Wigley:** Mae'n adroddiad y cytunwyd arno, ac nid yn unig o ran y ffeithiau, onid yw? Byddaf yn gofyn i Syr John gyfrannu ar hyn yn y man.

Mr Martin: Ie, iawn, ond ni fyddwn am wneud hynny'n anghydfod rhyngom. Yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud yw nad oes gennyf amheuaeth o gwbl, o'r hyn oll y mae'r cyngor wedi'i wneud ac o'r funud y'i sefydlwyd, ei fod wedi talu sylw parhaus i'r mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, y mae wedi rhoi llawer o'r sylw hwnnw yng nghyd-destun agenda lawer ehangach sydd yn mynd yn ei blaen ynglŷn â sut i wneud y defnydd gorau o'r holl adnoddau sy'n cael eu buddsoddi yn addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16.

[59] **Ann Jones:** Felly sut yr ydych yn egluro'r ffaith bod paragraff 3.8 yr adroddiad hwn—ac mae'n adroddiad y cytunwyd arno—yn nodi:

‘Mae cofnodion y Pwyllgor yn datgelu nad yw materion ystadau'n cael eu trafod yn aml.’

Mae hwnnw'n ddyfyniad uniongyrchol o'r adroddiad. Felly sut y gallwch ddweud bod arweiniad cryf yma, os nad yw eich cyngor yn trafod y materion hyn yn aml iawn?

Mr Martin: Wel, mae hynny'n ffaith. Ni fyddai'r cofnodion eu hunain yn cofnodi pob manylyn ar bob agwedd, er enghraifft, o'r trafodaethau am sut i ddyrannu arian yn ystod y flwyddyn. Y rhesymau am hynny, a'r rheswm na fyddai'r cofnodion yn nodi hynny, yw oherwydd bod papurau manwl i wneud hynny. Maent yn nodi mai'r rhain yw'r materion, mai dyma sut y dylai'r patrwm buddsoddi fod. Yn sicr, o ran y pethau yr wyf wedi'u disgrifio ynghylch ymdrech arbennig y cyngor i fuddsoddi yn yr ystâd, mae tystiolaeth gref o hynny yn y papurau sydd wedi'u cyflwyno gerbron y cyngor.

[60] **Dafydd Wigley:** Sir John, did you want to comment on this?

Sir John Bourn: Only to say, as Mr Martin has himself said, that when we discussed the report with him and his staff, no questions were raised with us about paragraph 3.8.

[61] **Dafydd Wigley:** I am grateful for that. Ann, have you finished?

[62] **Ann Jones:** No. You are now saying that the council takes a strong lead on estates management when the report quite clearly states that it does not, and it is an agreed report. I was going to ask about whether you should be more proactive in terms of estate management, but you obviously feel that you are doing sufficient work. As we see further on in the report, with consideration to institutions' strategies, they feel that help and support was lacking. So given that you now feel that you have taken a strong lead on the estates matters, to what extent do you think that the institutions feel that help and support would not have gone amiss?

Mr Martin: I did not for a moment want to suggest that we are doing enough. Like every organisation, we are having to make choices ourselves about what we do. We have been reducing our staff, not increasing them, as I think you are probably aware. As we go into further restructuring of the organisation—which is all going to be around the new planning and funding system—one of the issues is to ask ourselves, in discharging that, what staff do we need? What services should we provide ourselves? Which services should we get from outside? We have a very small property section—a very excellent property section—and into the discussion about our future, which is likely to be with still fewer people, we will play to what extent we can do more in this area.

However, there is more than one way to do this. It does not necessarily mean that it all has to be done in-house. I would certainly

[60] **Dafydd Wigley:** Syr John, a oeddech chi am wneud sylw ar hyn?

Syr John Bourn: Dim ond i ddweud, fel y mae Mr Martin ei hun wedi ei ddweud, pan fu inni drafod yr adroddiad gydag ef a'i staff, na ofynnwyd cwestiynau i ni am baragraff 3.8.

[61] **Dafydd Wigley:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny. Ann, a ydych chi wedi gorffen?

[62] **Ann Jones:** Na. Yr ydych bellach yn dweud bod y cyngor yn chwarae rôl flaenllaw ym maes rheoli ystadau pan fo'r adroddiad yn datgan yn hollol glir nad yw'n gwneud hynny, ac mae'n adroddiad sydd wedi ei gytuno arno. Yr oeddwn am ofyn i chi ynglŷn ag a ddylech fod yn fwy rhagweithiol o ran rheoli'r ystâd, ond yr ydych yn amlwg o'r farn eich bod yn gwneud gwaith digonol. Fel y gwelwn maes o law yn yr adroddiad, mewn perthynas â strategaethau'r sefydliadau, teimlant y bu diffyg cymorth a chefnogaeth. Felly o ystyried eich bod bellach yn teimlo eich bod wedi cymryd rôl flaenllaw ym materion ystadau, i ba raddau y credwch fod y sefydliadau'n teimlo y byddai cymorth a chefnogaeth wedi bod yn dderbyniol?

Mr Martin: Nid oeddwn am awgrymu am eiliad ein bod yn gwneud digon. Fel pob sefydliad, yr ydym yn gorfod gwneud penderfyniadau ein hunain am yr hyn a wnawn. Yr ydym wedi bod yn lleihau nifer ein staff, yn hytrach na'i gynyddu, fel y tybiaf yr ydych yn ymwybodol. Wrth inni ddechrau ailstrwythuro'r sefydliad ymhellach—sydd i gyd yn mynd i fod yn seiliedig ar y system gynllunio a chyllido newydd—un o'r materion yw gofyn i ni'n hunain, pa staff sydd eu hangen arnom i gyflawni hynny? Pa wasanaethau y dylasem eu darparu ein hunain? Pa wasanaethau y dylasem ni eu cael o'r tu allan? Mae gennym adran eiddo fach iawn—adran eiddo wych iawn—a byddwn yn cynnwys i ba raddau y gallwn wneud mwy yn y maes hwn yn y drafodaeth am ein dyfodol, sy'n debygol o gynnwys llai fyth o bobl.

Fodd bynnag, mae mwy nag un ffordd o wneud hyn. Nid yw o reidrwydd yn golygu bod yn rhaid gwneud y cyfan yn fewnol.

accept that there is always more that we could do and, to the great credit of our property staff, they are covering two sectors and we are now also asking them to take an interest in this much wider agenda. We have to be engaged in a dialogue with local authorities about schools because of the shared responsibilities, to an extent, post-16. We have the whole area of private provision and work-based provision, which is another resource that we are responsible for funding. We certainly have to review, as part of what is going to be very urgent work to restructure the organisation now that we know what that new planning and funding system is likely to be, and this is a crucial part of that. What I cannot tell you is what the outcome will be.

[63] **Dafydd Wigley:** Yes, so that underlines the need for a strategy.

[64] **Eleanor Burnham:** I just want to ask a brief question to Mr Martin. Given the difficulties to which you have just alluded, how do you think that your partners, present and future, when you discuss changing modes of further education and so on—you referred to not just the colleges but possibly the schools and local authorities—can be confident that you are going to be able to fulfil your role adequately?

Mr Martin: It is our job to fulfil our role. What I am saying is that, as we move into that new system, we have to make sure that we have the expertise that we need, or can secure it from wherever it needs to be secured, to do that job. As I said in response to the first question, our duty is not to run the institutions, it is to provide support, to provide guidance, to make sure that there is adequate data and to make sure that we take action in terms of directing what should happen where we are able to do so, or take remedial action if something is not happening where we believe that it should be happening. Clearly, going forward, we must look at that across the whole of the post-16 sector, and at the assumptions that were made by the old funding council. I have to say that the only resource that we inherited for estates in terms of professional advice were the two posts and a secretary that we have now and we have not

Buaswn yn sicr yn derbyn bod mwy y gallem ei wneud bob amser ac, er clod mawr i'n staff eiddo, maent yn cwmpasu dau sector ac yr ydym bellach hefyd yn gofyn iddynt gymryd diddordeb yn yr agenda lawer ehangach hon. Mae'n rhaid i ni drafod ysgolion gydag awdurdodau lleol oherwydd y cyfrifoldebau a rannwn, i ryw raddau, ym maes ôl-16. Mae gennym yr holl faes darpariaeth breifat a darpariaeth seiliedig mewn gwaith, sef adnodd arall yr ydym yn gyfrifol am ei gyllido. Yn sicr, rhaid inni adolygu, fel rhan o'r hyn a fydd yn waith brys iawn i ailstrwythuro'r sefydliad gan ein bod bellach yn gwybod sut fydd y system gynllunio a chyllido newydd yn debygol o edrych, ac mae hyn yn rhan annatod o hynny. Yr hyn ni allaf ei ddweud wrthy ch yw beth fydd y canlyniad.

[63] **Dafydd Wigley:** Ie, felly mae hynny'n pwysleisio'r angen am strategaeth.

[64] **Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf am ofyn cwestiwn byr i Mr Martin. O ystyried yr anawsterau yr ydych newydd gyfeirio atynt, sut y tybiwch y gall eich partneriaid, rhai'r presennol a'r dyfodol, pan yr ydych yn trafod newid moddau addysg bellach ac ati—cyfeiriasoch nid yn unig at y colegau ond yr ysgolion ac awdurdodau lleol o bosibl—fod yn hyderus eich bod yn mynd i allu cyflawni'ch rôl yn ddigonol?

Mr Martin: Ein swydd yw cyflawni ein rôl. Yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud yw, wrth inni symud at y system newydd, rhaid i ni sicrhau bod gennym yr arbenigedd sydd ei hangen arnom, neu ein bod yn gallu ei sicrhau o ble bynnag y mae angen ei sicrhau, i wneud y gwaith hwnnw. Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i'r cwestiwn cyntaf, nid ein dyletswydd ni yw rhedeg y sefydliadau, ond yn hytrach darparu cefnogaeth, darparu canllawiau, i sicrhau bod data digonol a sicrhau ein bod yn gweithredu o ran cyfarwyddo yr hyn ddylai ddigwydd lle gallwn wneud hynny, neu gymryd camau gweithredu adferol os nad yw rhywbeth yn digwydd lle credwn y dylai fod yn digwydd. Yn amlwg, wrth symud ymlaen, rhaid i ni edrych ar y sector ôl-16 cyfan, ac ar y tybiaethau a wnaed gan yr hen gyngor cyllido. Rhaid imi ddweud mai'r unig adnodd y bu inni ei etifeddu ar gyfer ystadau o ran cyngor proffesiynol oedd y ddwy swydd a'r

changed that so far, but we clearly need to review that as part of this new planning and funding system.

[65] **Dafydd Wigley:** I think that we will be reassured to hear that. I want to move on. Val, will you ask your questions now?

[66] **Val Lloyd:** I will stay a bit longer with paragraph 3.8, Mr Martin, particularly the phrase

‘does not provide guidance on priorities to institutions.’

That would mean to me that you have an absence of an overarching strategy. Bearing that in mind, how have you reassured yourself that institutions have been using the funding that you provide wisely, also bearing in mind that, in response to the first question, you said to the Chair that you did consider that things had to be fit for purpose.

Mr Martin: Well, we have given indicative priorities. I was indicating earlier that we may want to turn the screw on those a little more. Reviewing the last 10 years—as you can imagine, I have been doing so with even more vigour as we approached today—there is a pattern, I think, under which there has been strong pressure on the institutions and on successive councils to address particular priorities, and those priorities have changed. I think that the issue of priorities means nothing if it is not sustained over a period. Just as we want to be able to provide some security of funding over a three-year period as a minimum, I believe that we also need to be consistent about the priorities. There is no point in saying to people, ‘there are 10 things that we want you to do’ and then have a different 10 things a couple of years later. Clearly, there are policy issues that come into that, because policies change over time as well. However, today, and in our planning as we move into this new system, I see the major priorities being tackling the backlog of maintenance, except in those cases where that would be a waste of resources because we see a new pattern of provision emerging, and also

ysgrifennydd sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd ac nid ydym wedi newid hynny hyd yma, ond mae’n amlwg bod yn rhaid i ni adolygu hynny fel rhan o’r system gynllunio a chyllido newydd hon.

[65] **Dafydd Wigley:** Credaf y byddwn yn dawelach ein meddyliau o glywed hynny. Yr wyf am symud ymlaen. Val, a wnewch chi ofyn eich cwestiynau yn awr?

[66] **Val Lloyd:** Arhosaf gyda pharagraff 3.8 ychydig yn hirach, Mr Martin, yn enwedig y cymal

‘nid yw’n darparu arweiniad ar flaenoriaethau i sefydliadau.’

Byddai hynny yn golygu i mi nad oes gennych strategaeth gyffredinol. O gofio hynny, sut yr ydych wedi sicrhau’ch hun bod sefydliadau wedi bod yn defnyddio’r cyllid yr ydych yn ei ddarparu yn ddoeth, gan gofio hefyd, yn yr ymateb i’r cwestiwn cyntaf, ichi ddweud wrth y Cadeirydd eich bod yn ystyried bod yn rhaid i bethau fod yn addas i’w pwrpas.

Mr Martin: Wel, yr ydym wedi awgrymu blaenoriaethau. Yr oeddwn yn nodi yn gynharach ein bod o bosibl am fanylu ychydig mwy ar y rheini. O adolygu’r 10 mlynedd diwethaf—fel y gallwch ddychmygu, yr wyf wedi bod yn gwneud hynny hyd yn oed yn fwy diwyd wrth inni agosáu at heddiw—credaf fod patrwm, lle bu pwysau mawr ar y sefydliadau a’r cynghorau olynol i fynd i’r afael â blaenoriaethau penodol, ac mae’r blaenoriaethau hynny wedi newid. Credaf nad yw’r mater o flaenoriaethau yn golygu unrhyw beth os nad yw’n cael ei gynnal dros gyfnod o amser. Yn union fel yr ydym yn dymuno gallu darparu rhywfaint o sicrwydd cyllid dros gyfnod o dair blynedd o leiaf, credaf hefyd fod angen inni fod yn gyson ynglŷn â’r blaenoriaethau. Nid oes diben dweud wrth bobl, ‘mae 10 peth yr ydym am ichi eu gwneud’ ac yna cael 10 peth gwahanol rai blynyddoedd yn ddiweddarach. Yn amlwg, mae materion polisi sy’n gysylltiedig â hynny, oherwydd mae polisiau hefyd yn newid dros amser. Fodd bynnag, heddiw, ac yn ein cynllunio wrth inni symud at y system newydd hon, credaf mai’r prif flaenoriaethau yw mynd i’r

those statutory issues that have already been flagged up, particularly in relation to disability.

afael â'r gwaith cynnal a chadw sy'n aros i gael ei wneud, ac eithrio yn yr achosion hynny lle byddai hynny yn wastraff adnoddau oherwydd ein bod yn gweld patrwm newydd o ddarpariaeth yn ymddangos, a hefyd y materion statudol hynny sydd eisoes wedi eu hamlygu, yn enwedig mewn perthynas ag anabledd.

[67] **Val Lloyd:** Would not a clearer lead earlier on have ensured, as we heard earlier on from a colleague, that compliance would have been achieved earlier, as it should have been, and that you would not have had such a backlog? I accept what you say about not throwing good money after bad and maintaining stock that you are going to perhaps dispose of or change.

[67] **Val Lloyd:** Oni fyddai arweiniad cliriach yn gynharach wedi sicrhau, fel y clywsom ynghynt gan gydweithiwr, y byddai cydymffurfiaeth wedi ei chyflawni yn gynharach, fel y dylai fod wedi digwydd, ac na fyddai cymaint o waith cynnal a chadw yn aros i gael ei wneud gennyh? Derbynaf yr hyn a ddywedwch am beidio â gwastraffu arian da ar stoc gwael ac ar gynnal a chadw stoc yr ydych o bosibl yn mynd i'w waredu neu ei newid.

Mr Martin: Well, the councils—both the outgoing FE council and the national council—have given guidance. As I said, there has been no shortage of guidance. I think that the issue is about a systematic and long-term approach to how provision is shaped and supported. That is what the new planning and funding system is intended to achieve, so as to provide the best opportunities for learners and the most efficient and effective use of the money that we are spending. Should we have been more directive? Well, I go back to the fact that we have a model that does say 'here are statutory bodies, independent corporations, responsible for their own affairs'. So, for instance, if there is legislation, if there is an issue about making sure that they do not have a backlog of maintenance, it is not, it seems to me, unreasonable to assume that, as independent, self-governing bodies, they will address those issues. So we have supported them and we have guided them, but I think that it is acknowledged in the Auditor General's report that we are not in a position—except in quite extreme circumstances—to say thou must.

Mr Martin: Wel, mae'r cyngorau—y cyngor addysg bellach sy'n dirwyn i ben a'r cyngor cenedlaethol—wedi rhoi canllawiau. Fel y dywedais, ni fu prinder canllawiau. Credaf fod y mater yn ymwneud ag agwedd drefnus a hirdymor at sut y caiff darpariaeth ei llunio a'i chefnogi. Dyna'r hyn y bwriedir i'r system gynllunio a chyllido ei gyflawni, fel y gellir darparu'r cyfleoedd gorau i ddysgwyr a'r defnydd mwyaf effeithlon ac effeithiol o'r arian a wariwn. A ddylem fod wedi bod yn fwy cyfarwyddiadol? Wel, dychwelaf at y ffaith bod gennym fodel sydd yn dweud 'dyma gyrrff statudol, corfforaethau annibynnol, sy'n gyfrifol am eu busnes eu hunain'. Felly, er enghraifft, os oes deddfwriaeth, os oes mater ynglŷn â sicrhau nad oes ganddynt waith cynnal a chadw yn aros i gael ei wneud, nid yw, yn fy nhyb i, yn afresymol i dybio y byddant, fel cyrrff annibynnol, hunan-lywodraethol, yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny. Felly yr ydym wedi eu cefnogi ac yr ydym wedi eu harwain, ond credaf ei fod yn cael ei gydnabod yn adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol nad ydym mewn sefyllfa—ac eithrio dan amgylchiadau eithaf eithafol—i'w gorchymyn.

[68] **Dafydd Wigley:** Val, have you finished?

[68] **Dafydd Wigley:** Val, a ydych wedi gorffen?

[69] **Val Lloyd:** Yes, on this section, thank you, Chair.

[69] **Val Lloyd:** Ydw, ar yr adran hon, diolch, Gadeirydd.

[70] **Dafydd Wigley:** Janice, would you like to come in?

[70] **Dafydd Wigley:** Janice, a hoffech chi gymryd yr awenau?

[71] **Janice Gregory:** Thank you, Chair. Mr Martin, on page 21, the Auditor General recommends that the council should signal:

[71] **Janice Gregory:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Mr Martin, ar dudalen 21, mae'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn argymhell y dylai'r cyngor gyfleu:

'the weight it attaches to estates matters through the development and publication of its priorities for improving the estate'.

'y pwyslais y mae'n ei roi ar faterion yn ymwneud ag ystadau drwy ddatblygu a chyhoeddi ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer gwella'r ystâd'.

Could you expand on your previous answers, and tell us how you plan to tackle that particular recommendation? Indeed, you do not appear to have—in your corporate plan—any targets, so can you tell us if you will be setting targets for the institutions to improve the management of their estates?

A allech ymhelaethu ar eich atebion blaenorol, a dweud wrthym sut yr ydych yn bwriadu mynd i'r afael â'r argymhelliad penodol hwnnw? Yn wir, nid yw'n ymddangos bod gennych—yn eich cynllun corfforaethol—unrhyw dargedau, felly a allwch ddweud wrthym a fyddwch yn gosod targedau i'r sefydliadau i wella rheolaeth eu hystadau?

Mr Martin: First, in terms of setting priorities, I think that we have begun the process. In the infrastructure development fund, the extra £4 million that the national council put in place in its first year, there were the sort of targeted priorities that I think that we do need for the future. If I could just indicate what those were: that there would be general improvement in the quality of buildings; that the amount of sub-standard accommodation, especially mobile classrooms, would be dealt with—this was a bidding system, it was an example of asking people to come forward with their proposals for making improvements; for rationalisation of the estate; for improving accessibility for people with disabilities, which features as one of the categories; for improving environmental and energy efficiency and for reducing running costs. That is an indication. I have already indicated very clearly that my personal view—but I need to discuss this with the council, obviously, and to consider your recommendations as a Committee—is that we ought to have a more systematic approach to that, which is consistent over time. I think that we would also be looking to the Assembly Government to work with us on that, so that the policy steers that we are given are also consistent. I do—I am a bit of a bore about this—feel very, very strongly

Mr Martin: Yn gyntaf, o ran gosod blaenoriaethau, credaf ein bod wedi dechrau'r broses. Yn y gronfa datblygu seilwaith, y £4 miliwn ychwanegol a roddodd y cyngor cenedlaethol yn ei flwyddyn gyntaf, yr oedd y math o flaenoriaethau wedi eu targedu y credaf sydd eu hangen arnom at y dyfodol. Os gallwn ddynodi beth oedd y rheini: y byddai gwelliant cyffredinol yn ansawdd yr adeiladau; y byddem yn mynd i'r afael â faint o'r llety sy'n is na'r safon dderbyniol, yn enwedig ystafelloedd dosbarth symudol—system gynnig oedd hon, yr oedd yn enghraifft o ofyn i bobl ddod ymlaen â'u cynigion i wneud gwelliannau; ar gyfer rhesymoli'r ystâd; ar gyfer gwella mynediad i bobl ag anableddau, sy'n ymddangos fel un o'r categorïau; ar gyfer gwella effeithlonrwydd ynni ac amgylcheddol ac ar gyfer lleihau costau gweithredu. Mae hynny'n arwydd. Yr wyf eisoes wedi nodi'n glir iawn mai fy marn bersonol—ond mae'n rhaid imi, yn amlwg, drafod hyn gyda'r cyngor, ac ystyried eich argymhellion fel Pwyllgor—yw y dylem gael agwedd fwy trefnus at hynny, sy'n gyson dros amser. Credaf y byddem hefyd yn gofyn i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad weithio gyda ni ar hynny, fel bod y cyfarwyddiadau llywio polisi a roddir i ni hefyd yn gyson. Teimlaf—ac yr wyf yn gallu bod braidd yn syrffedus

that we will not get the full fruits of this new system, including its benefits for the estate, unless we get some longer term certainty about patterns of funding. If we are into stop/go it will not work.

[72] **Dafydd Wigley:** That point comes through loud and clear.

[73] **Janice Gregory:** Can we assume from your response then, Mr Martin, that perhaps the estates strategy will be an item on the agenda of the council meetings? Right through this, it appears that it is not, you know, up there at the top of your agenda. Your response to me is that you have obviously identified the areas, with the help of the Auditor General's report. Is this something that you consistently now discuss in council meetings, to keep your eye on the ball?

Mr Martin: First of all, the council is going to be giving very sustained attention—it is a standing item in terms of reports at all its meetings—to the introduction of the new planning and funding arrangements, and a series of issues will be coming to the council about how the building blocks of that develop. One of them, clearly flagged up in the proposals, is that part of our strategic investment capacity—one of the four blocks of funding is strategic investment—is about investment in estates. It is there already. We have now got to populate that with what that means in practice.

[74] **Dafydd Wigley:** You are giving Janice the assurance that she was seeking?

Mr Martin: Indeed I am.

[75] **Dafydd Wigley:** I am grateful.

[76] **Janice Gregory:** I am too; thank you.

[77] **Dafydd Wigley:** We will take a break.

*Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 3.20 p.m. a 3.35 p.m.
The meeting was adjourned between 3.20 p.m. and 3.35 p.m.*

[78] **Dafydd Wigley:** Welcome back. We now move on to the strategic estates planning

am hyn—yn gryf iawn, iawn na fyddwn yn cael manteision llawn y system newydd hon, gan gynnwys ei buddiannau i'r ystâd, oni bai ein bod yn cael rhywfaint o sicrwydd mwy hirdymor am batrymau cyllido. Ni fydd yn gweithio gyda chyllido anghyson.

[72] **Dafydd Wigley:** Mae'r pwynt hwnnw'n cael ei gyfleu'n glir ac yn amlwg.

[73] **Janice Gregory:** A gawn dybio o'ch ymateb felly, Mr Martin, y bydd y strategaeth ystadau efallai yn eitem ar agenda cyfarfodydd y cyngor? Drwy gydol hyn, mae'n ymddangos nad yw, fe wyddoch, ar frig eich agenda. Eich ymateb i mi yw eich bod yn amlwg wedi nodi'r meysydd, gyda chymorth adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol. A yw hyn yn rhywbeth yr ydych bellach yn ei drafod yn gyson yng nghyfarfodydd y cyngor, i gadw'ch llygad ar y mater?

Mr Martin: Yn gyntaf oll, mae'r cyngor yn mynd i roi sylw parhaus iawn—mae'n eitem sefydlog o ran adroddiadau yn ei gyfarfodydd i gyd—i'r gwaith o gyflwyno trefniadau cynllunio a chyllido newydd, a bydd cyfres o faterion yn dod i'r cyngor am sut y bydd sylfeini hwnnw yn datblygu. Un ohonynt, sydd wedi ei nodi'n amlwg yn y cynigion, yw bod rhan o'n gallu i fuddsoddi'n strategol—mae un o'r pedwar bloc cyllido yn fuddsoddiad strategol—yn ymwneud â buddsoddi mewn ystadau. Mae eisoes yn ei le. Mae'n rhaid inni bellach ei gyfuno gyda'r hyn y mae hynny yn ei olygu'n ymarferol.

[74] **Dafydd Wigley:** Yr ydych yn rhoi i Janice y sicrwydd yr oedd hi yn ei geisio?

Mr Martin: Yn wir yr wyf.

[75] **Dafydd Wigley:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar.

[76] **Janice Gregory:** Yr wyf innau hefyd; diolch.

[77] **Dafydd Wigley:** Cymerwn egwyl.

[78] **Dafydd Wigley:** Croeso yn ôl. Symudwn yn awr at gynllunio ystadau yn

at an institutional level. I have made my feelings about this matter in general felt fairly strongly. I think that Val will take on the questioning.

[79] **Val Lloyd:** Thank you, Chair. Considering paragraphs 3.10 to 3.13, Mr Martin, your most recent exercise when you asked institutions to submit their estate strategies was not by any measure, I believe, a success. Strategies were late in being delivered and were judged by the NAO's consultant to be poor. Why do you think that that was?

Mr Martin: I think that it is a sign that a number of institutions find this genuinely difficult. There are figures elsewhere that show that some have only recently got specialist resource—some still have not got it—and they do find it very tough. The fact that there are so many that require further work, at one level, is not unexpected. I think that what is of more concern is not whether they require further work—we would certainly want them all to be in the category that does not exist here, which would be 'good'. I do not think that it would be reasonable to expect everyone to achieve excellence all the time, but certainly they ought to be good and we need to work with them to secure that.

I do think that there is a major issue about the resource that smaller colleges have; I have touched on that before and I think that the sort of wider partnerships that are needed to achieve that are particularly important. There are some very good examples of that already. I know of at least one college—there may well be others—that has an arrangement with a local authority whereby it procures its expert advice from a substantial local authority department. I think that we do need to spread that best practice and to insist that information is provided. I personally find it unacceptable, as chief executive, that we have so many occasions where information is not submitted. I was particularly disappointed that the NAO did not get all the information that it needed. That cannot be acceptable.

[80] **Val Lloyd:** So, given the poor quality of

strategol ar lefel sefydliadol. Yr wyf wedi datgan fy nheimpladau am y mater hwn yn gyffredinol yn eithaf cryf. Credaf y bydd Val yn parhau â'r holi.

[79] **Val Lloyd:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Gan ystyried paragraffau 3.10 i 3.13, Mr Martin, credaf nad oedd eich ymarfer mwyaf diweddar pan ofynnoch i sefydliadau gyflwyno eu strategaethau ystâd yn llwyddiant ar unrhyw gyfrif. Cafodd strategaethau eu cyflwyno'n hwyr a dyfarnodd ymgynghorydd y SAG eu bod yn wael. Pam y digwyddodd hynny yn eich tyb chi?

Mr Martin: Credaf ei fod yn arwydd bod llawer o sefydliadau yn cael hyn yn wirioneddol anodd. Mae ffigurau mewn lleoedd eraill sy'n dangos mai dim ond yn ddiweddar y mae rhai wedi cael adnoddau arbenigol—mae rhai yn dal heb eu cael—ac maent yn ei chael hi'n anodd iawn. Nid yw'r ffaith bod cynifer angen gwaith pellach, ar un lefel, yn annisgwyl. Credaf mai'r hyn sy'n peri mwy o bryder yw nid y ffaith bod angen gwaith pellach arnynt—byddem yn sicr am iddynt oll fod yn y categori nad yw'n bodoli yma, sef 'da'. Ni chredaf y byddai'n rhesymol disgwyl pawb i gyflawni rhagoriaeth drwy'r amser, ond yn sicr dylent fod yn dda ac mae angen inni weithio gyda hwy i sicrhau hynny.

Credaf fod mater pwysig ynglŷn â'r adnoddau sydd gan golegau llai; yr wyf eisoes wedi crybwyll hynny a chredaf fod y math o bartneriaethau ehangach sydd eu hangen i gyflawni hynny yn arbennig o bwysig. Mae eisoes rhai enghreifftiau da iawn o hynny. Gwn am o leiaf un coleg—mae'n bosibl fod rhai eraill—sydd â threfniant gydag awdurdod lleol lle mae'n caffael ei gyngor arbenigol oddi wrth adran awdurdod lleol sylweddol. Credaf fod angen inni ledaenu'r arfer gorau hwnnw a mynnu bod gwybodaeth yn cael ei darparu. Yr wyf yn bersonol o'r farn ei bod yn annerbyniol, fel prif weithredwr, bod gennym gynifer o achosion lle na chyflwynwyd gwybodaeth. Cefais siom yn arbennig na chafodd y SAG yr holl wybodaeth oedd ei hangen arni. Ni all hynny fod yn dderbyniol.

[80] **Val Lloyd:** Felly, o ystyried ansawdd

the strategies, why were more institutions not encouraged to revise and resubmit them?

Mr Martin: There is an issue of the threshold. There are seven that are satisfactory. We certainly would not disagree with this overall assessment of the quality of the strategies and there is continued feedback. Discussions go on between our estates officers and the institutions and we certainly agree with one of the other recommendations, which is that these strategies have to be revisited. They have to be updated and they have to be rolled forward. So we would intend to be in dialogue with the individual institutions and to require them, as they take forward their capital programmes and their estates work, to update those strategies regularly.

However, I do think that one of the things that we have to give further thought to, with them, is what is going to produce success. There is absolutely no point, it seems to me, in us just berating them and saying where they should do better, if we have a number of colleges which, in terms of their scale, and the resources that they can deploy, are going to find that impossible. I do not think that that is very productive; we would want to work with them. I am very pleased, for instance, that there are examples of some further education institutions working collaboratively with higher education institutions that have scale and expertise. There is work going on, for instance, between Coleg Menai and the University of Wales, Bangor. The Higher Education Funding Council for Wales is actually supporting and providing funding for that, so that some of their overheads, including estates, can be worked through together.

[81] **Dafydd Wigley:** As a matter of interest—if I could just intervene there—is there any role to co-operate beyond the boundaries of education? There are aspects of estate that we have looked at as a Committee, in the health sector and in other sectors, where there may be some expertise. I do not know. Has that ever been considered?

Mr Martin: It may have been—I am looking to Richard to know whether there has been

gwael y strategaethau, pam na anogwyd mwy o sefydliadau i'w hadolygu a'u hailgyflwyno?

Mr Martin: Mae'r trothwy yn fater. Mae saith sy'n foddhaol. Yn sicr, ni fyddem yn anghytuno gyda'r asesiad cyffredinol hwn o ansawdd y strategaethau ac mae atborth parhaus. Cynhelir trafodaethau rhwng ein swyddogion ystadau a'r sefydliadau ac yr ydym yn sicr yn cytuno gydag un o'r argymhellion eraill, sef bod yn rhaid ailystyried y strategaethau hyn. Rhaid eu diweddarau a'u datblygu. Felly byddem yn bwriadu trafod â'r sefydliadau unigol a gofyn iddynt, wrth iddynt ddatblygu eu rhaglenni cyfalaf a'u gwaith ystadau, ddiweddarau'r strategaethau hynny yn rheolaidd.

Fodd bynnag, credaf mai un o'r pethau y mae'n rhaid inni ei ystyried ymhellach, gyda hwy, yw beth sy'n mynd i arwain at lwyddiant. Nid oes diben o gwbl, yn fy nhyb i, inni ddweud y drefn wrthynt a dweud lle y dylent wneud yn well, os oes gennym nifer o golegau sydd, o ran eu maint, a'r adnoddau y gallant eu defnyddio, yn mynd i gael hynny'n amhosibl. Ni chredaf fod hynny yn gynhyrchiol iawn; byddem am weithio gyda hwy. Yr wyf yn falch iawn, er enghraifft, bod enghreifftiau o rai sefydliadau addysg bellach yn cydweithio â sefydliadau addysg uwch sydd â maint ac arbenigedd. Mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo, er enghraifft, rhwng Coleg Menai a Phrifysgol Cymru, Bangor. Mae Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru mewn gwirionedd yn cefnogi ac yn darparu cyllid ar gyfer hynny, fel y gellir mynd i'r afael â rhai o'u costau, gan gynnwys ystadau, ar y cyd.

[81] **Dafydd Wigley:** Fel mater o ddiddordeb—os caf ymyrryd yma—a oes unrhyw rôl i gydweithio y tu hwnt i ffiniau addysg? Mae agweddau ar yr ystâd yr ydym wedi edrych arnynt fel Pwyllgor, yn y sector ieuchyd a sectorau eraill, lle mae'n bosibl bod rhywfaint o arbenigedd. Wn i ddim. A yw hynny erioed wedi cael ei ystyried?

Mr Martin: Efallai ei fod—yr wyf yn edrych at Richard i wybod a fu unrhyw beth. Credaf

anything. I certainly think that it is worth thinking about. I guess that there would be a question mark over whether very general expertise would help much beyond basic fabric, given the points not just about the condition of the estate, but it being functional.

[82] **Dafydd Wigley:** Yes, sure.

Mr Hirst: I am not aware of anything on the estate. There is certainly a procurement initiative right across the public sector in Wales at the moment, led by the Assembly, but I am not aware of any similar initiative on the estate.

[83] **Dafydd Wigley:** Well, perhaps it is a thought to keep in the back of our minds. I beg your pardon, Val, for interrupting.

[84] **Val Lloyd:** That is all right; it is all part of the same line of questioning. You have outlined this a little and gone a little way towards telling us this, Mr Martin, but could you let us know what you intend to do to help institutions address the challenges that they face?

Mr Martin: Well, I think that one of the key things that we need to do is to look at these issues in the round. They will produce better strategies if a number of preconditions are met, it seems to me. The first is about expertise, clearly, wherever that is to be secured and in whatever partnerships. Secondly, it does require that the institutions themselves have effective corporate governance, and the guidance that we have issued does say what governors of bodies should be asking about estates and what the requirements should be. We even suggest to them in the guidance what questions they might ask of their officers. So, we need to redouble our efforts there. I do think that it links to our own capacity. That point was made earlier—whether we employ people or buy in resource to help. However, as I said before, there is very little point in us just blaming them. I think that we have to insist on a high standard, and we have to be realistic about how particular institutions are going to address that. My own view—borne out by this survey and, indeed, by a number,

ei fod yn sicr yn werth ei ystyried. Tybiaf y byddai amheuaeth ynghylch a fyddai arbenigedd cyffredinol iawn o gymorth mawr y tu hwnt i adeiledd sylfaenol, o ystyried y pwyntiau nid yn unig am gyflwr yr ystâd, ond ei bod yn ymarferol.

[82] **Dafydd Wigley:** Ie, siŵr iawn.

Mr Hirst: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw beth ar yr ystâd. Yn sicr mae menter gaffael ledled y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd, dan arweiniad y Cynulliad, ond nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw fenter debyg ar yr ystâd.

[83] **Dafydd Wigley:** Wel, efallai ei fod yn syniad i'w gadw yng nghefn ein meddyliau. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Val, am dorri ar draws.

[84] **Val Lloyd:** Popeth yn iawn; mae'r cyfan yn dilyn yr un trywydd o gwestiynau. Yr ydych wedi amlinellu hyn ychydig ac wedi mynd ychydig o'r ffordd at ddweud hyn wrthym, Mr Martin, ond a allech ddweud wrthym beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud i gynorthwyo sefydliadau i fynd i'r afael â'r heriau maent yn eu hwynebu?

Mr Martin: Wel, credaf mai un o'r pethau allweddol sydd angen inni ei wneud yw edrych ar y materion hyn yn eu cyfanrwydd. Mae'n ymddangos i mi y byddant yn cynhyrchu strategaethau gwell os yw nifer o ragamodau'n cael eu bodloni. Mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud ag arbenigedd, yn amlwg, lle bynnag y mae hwnnw i gael ei sicrhau ac ym mha bynnag bartneriaethau. Yn ail, rhaid bod gan y sefydliadau eu hunain lywodraeth gorfforaethol effeithiol, a bod y canllawiau yr ydym wedi eu cyhoeddi yn dweud beth y dylai llywodraethwyr cyrff fod yn ei holi am ystadau a beth ddylai'r argymhellion fod. Yr ydym hyd yn oed yn awgrymu wrthynt yn y canllawiau pa gwestiynau y gallent eu gofyn i'w swyddogion. Felly, mae angen inni gynyddu'n hymdrechion yno. Credaf fod hyn yn cysylltu â'n capasiti ni ein hunain. Gwnaed y pwynt hwnnw yn gynharach—a ydym yn cyflogi pobl neu'n prynu adnoddau i gynorthwyo. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais ynghynt, nid oes llawer iawn o ddiben inni roi'r bai arnynt hwy yn unig. Credaf fod yn rhaid inni fynnu safon uchel, a rhaid inni fod

but not all, of the institutions where the estate has not improved significantly, if at all, since incorporation—is that it is clearly beyond some institutions to do it without that. I do not think that it is just a governance issue; it is about scale, and the weight that you need to do this well.

[85] **Val Lloyd:** I see in paragraph 3.14 that you are planning a training event to emphasise certain issues and lessons. Do you think that this one-off event is going to be sufficient for institutions to learn from past mistakes and improve, going forward?

Mr Martin: No. I mean, one event cannot possibly do everything you need to do, but that is what is on the stocks, and we do need to do that. One of the key focuses of that does need to be around the information that will come out of the new performance indicators.

If I could just develop one of the thoughts about the new planning and funding system, this is work in progress, so I am reporting to you, as it were, developing thinking. However, we see a very much enhanced role for our regional offices. We have four regional offices: Bedwas in south-east Wales; Swansea; Newtown and St Asaph. As part of this system, I think that actually, in trying to do this across the whole of Wales, although we do need ourselves some concentration of expertise, there is also an issue about what needs to happen in the region, where people who are close to the institutions can work with them and can work with their partners.

We have some tough issues ahead of us in terms of prioritising our own running costs. However, clearly, if the system is to work, not just in respect of estates, but more generally, there must be a very close relationship, particularly in terms of expressing need and in developing ideas about what the pattern of provision should be. Within the framework that the national

yn realistig am sut mae sefydliadau arbennig yn mynd i fynd i'r afael â hynny. Yn fy marn i—sy'n cael ei chadarnhau gan yr arolwg hwn ac, yn wir, gan nifer, ond nid pob un, o'r ystadau lle nad yw'r ystâd wedi gwella'n sylweddol, os o gwbl, ers ymgorffori—mae'n amlwg ei bod y tu hwnt i allu rhai sefydliadau i'w wneud heb hynny. Ni chredaf mai mater yn ymwneud â llywodraethu yn unig yw hwn; mae'n ymwneud â maint, a'r grym sydd ei angen amoch i wneud hyn yn dda.

[85] **Val Lloyd:** Gwelaf ym mharagraff 3.14 eich bod yn cynllunio digwyddiad hyfforddi i bwysleisio materion a gwersi penodol. A ydych yn credu bod yr un digwyddiad hwn yn mynd i fod yn ddigon i sefydliadau ddysgu o gangymeriadau'r gorffennol a gwella, wrth symud ymlaen?

Mr Martin: Na. Hynny yw, nid yw'n bosibl i un digwyddiad wneud popeth yr ydych am ei wneud, ond dyna beth sydd ar y gweill, ac mae angen inni wneud hynny. Mae angen i un o'r ffocysau allweddol fod ar y wybodaeth fydd yn deillio o'r dangosyddion perfformiad newydd.

Pe bawn yn gallu datblygu un o'r syniadau am y system gynllunio a chyllido newydd, mae hwn yn waith sy'n mynd rhagddo, felly yr wyf yn adrodd i chi, fel petai, syniadau datblygol. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn rhagweld rôl lawer mwy i'n swyddfeydd rhanbarthol. Mae gennym bedair swyddfara rhanbarthol: Bedwas yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru; Abertawe; y Drenewydd a Llanelwy. Fel rhan o'r system hon, credaf mewn gwirionedd, wrth geisio gwneud hyn ledled Cymru gyfan, er bod angen cyfeirio arbenigedd arnom i ryw raddau, mae hefyd mater ynglŷn â beth ddylai ddigwydd yn y rhanbarth, lle gall pobl sy'n agos at y sefydliadau weithio gyda hwy a gweithio gyda'u partneriaid.

Mae gennym rai materion dyrys o'n blaenau o ran blaenoriaethu ein costau gweithredu ni ein hunain. Fodd bynnag, yn amlwg, os yw'r system yn mynd i weithio, nid yn unig o ran ystadau, ond yn fwy cyffredinol, rhaid bod perthynas agos iawn, yn enwedig o ran mynegi angen a datblygu syniadau ar beth ddylai'r patrwm darpariaeth fod. O fewn y fframwaith a amlinellir gan y cyngor

council sets out, it will be the region that is working with the networks of providers to bring out change. I think that we must locate the work that we do on the FE estate within that context.

[86] **Janet Davies:** Do you think that it would be useful to use GVA Grimley's report? The consultants employed by the National Audit Office did a very detailed report; are you planning to use that?

Mr Martin: If we are allowed to. I do not think that that is our decision and perhaps that is an issue that the National Audit Office itself wishes to address. We would be delighted to make use of that report and would very much like to.

[87] **Dafydd Wigley:** Do you have a problem with that, Sir John?

Sir John Bourn: I have no problem with that at all, Chair.

[88] **Dafydd Wigley:** Good, I am sure that it will be made available in that case and I hope that it will be helpful for you, Mr Martin. Thank you.

We now move on to issues that we touched upon at the beginning of this session, that is, management information. Janice, I think that you are going to take this on.

[89] **Janice Gregory:** Mr Martin, one factor that hampers both the council and institutions in terms of effective strategic estates planning is the absence of good management information. This is undoubtedly a problem. Could you please update us with progress on the further education estates management statistics project? I am glad that we have had coffee, Chair, by the way; I would never have got that out otherwise.

Mr Martin: FEEMS is what we affectionately call it. It is on track. As I said earlier, we are issuing the requirement for the information of the new system now. We expect to have the first information by May and to be able to begin to analyse it and work with colleges on that. I am in danger of going

cededlaethol, y rhanbarth fydd yn gweithio gyda'r rhwydweithiau o ddarparwyr i weithredu newid. Credaf fod yn rhaid inni roi'r gwaith a wnawn ar yr ystâd addysg bellach yn y cyd-destun hwnnw.

[86] **Janet Davies:** A fyddai'n ddefnyddiol defnyddio adroddiad GVA Grimley yn eich tyb chi? Gwnaeth yr ymgynghorwyr a gyflogwyd gan y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol adroddiad manwl iawn; a ydych yn bwriadu defnyddio hwnnw?

Mr Martin: Os cawn ni. Ni chredaf mai ein penderfyniad ni yw hwnnw ac efallai fod hwnnw'n fater y mae'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol ei hun yn dymuno mynd i'r afael ag ef. Byddem yn falch o ddefnyddio'r adroddiad hwnnw a byddem yn hoffi gwneud hynny'n fawr iawn.

[87] **Dafydd Wigley:** A oes gennych broblem gyda hynny, Syr John?

Syr John Bourn: Nid oes gennyf broblem gyda hynny o gwbl, Gadeirydd.

[88] **Dafydd Wigley:** Da iawn, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn cael ei ryddhau felly ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd o gymorth i chi, Mr Martin. Diolch.

Symudwn yn awr at faterion y buom yn sôn yn fyr amdanynt ar ddechrau'r sesiwn hwn, sef, gwybodaeth reoli. Janice, credaf eich bod yn mynd i arwain y drafodaeth.

[89] **Janice Gregory:** Mr Martin, un ffactor sy'n llesteirio'r cyngor a'r sefydliadau o ran cynllunio ystadau sy'n strategol ac yneffeithiol yw absenoldeb gwybodaeth reoli dda. Heb os nac oni bai mae hon yn broblem. A allech chi roi'r newyddion diweddaraf inni am y prosiect ystadegau rheoli ystadau addysg bellach? Gyda llaw, yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi cael coffi, Gadeirydd; ni fuaswn erioed wedi gallu dweud hynny fel arall.

Mr Martin: FEEMS yw'r hyn yr ydym yn ei alw o ddydd i ddydd. Mae'n mynd rhagddo yn ôl y disgwyl. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, yr ydym yn cyhoeddi'r gofyniad am wybodaeth y system newydd yn awr. Disgwyliwn gael y wybodaeth gyntaf erbyn mis Mai ac y byddwn yn gallu dechrau ei

over some ground that I covered earlier, so I will try to give a shorthand version. However, I still feel—I mean, I can see that it is very useful to have a wide range of about 120 indicators that people can benchmark themselves against, but I have a genuine problem about how, when it comes down to setting strategic targets and managing, you can really do that with 121 indicators. Indeed, with regard to the selection of 21, I think, in figure 9 in the report, I would find it very difficult to manage an organisation if we had headline targets and indicators. That does not mean that you should not have them, but I think that a lot of this is about detailed work within colleges. I think that some of these are very important; if I may pick them out, the ratio of net useable internal area to gross internal area is a very important one, as is the total property cost per square metre of net internal area. There are three or four that you can pick out and say that that is beginning to look like the core of what is really important in these indicators. However, I do go back to what I said before, which is that we also need to stress the word ‘indicator’, because the circumstances of individual institutions, the communities that they serve and the way in which their provision is changing means that what these become is a benchmark against which you can begin to have a dialogue about whether that represents best practice or not. You cannot just take this and say that you are below the line, you are below the average and therefore you are bad.

[90] **Janice Gregory:** If I may say so, historically, there has not been a mechanism or regular monitoring, has there? So are you unhappy with the fact that you now have a system of gathering information? From what I understand of what you are saying, you like the fact that you can gather information now, but perhaps there is too much information being requested. That is surely not a bad thing, is it?

Mr Martin: I am not against it; I am saying that, from that, in terms of setting targets—and there were questions about setting targets and so on earlier—I do not see us setting

dadansoddi a gweithio gyda cholegau ar hynny. Yr wyf mewn perygl o ailadrodd rhai pethau y soniais amdanynt ynghynt, felly ceisiaf roi fersiwn cryno. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn dal i deimlo—hynny yw, gallaf weld ei fod yn ddefnyddiol iawn cael ystod eang o tua 120 o ddangosyddion y gall pobl gymharu eu hunain â hwy, ond mae gennyf broblem go iawn gyda sut, pan ddaw hi at osod targedau strategol a rheoli, y gallwch wneud hynny go iawn gyda 121 o ddangosyddion. Yn wir, mewn perthynas â'r detholiad o 21, tybiaf, yn ffigur 9 yr adroddiad, y byddwn yn ei chael hi'n anodd rheoli sefydliad pe bai gennym brif dargedau a dangosyddion. Nid yw hynny'n golygu na ddylech eu cael, ond credaf fod llawer o hyn yn ymwneud â gwaith manwl mewn colegau. Credaf fod rhai o'r rhain yn bwysig iawn; os caf gyfeirio atynt yn unigol, mae cymhareb arwynebedd mewnlol defnyddiadwy net i arwynebedd mewnlol crynswth yn un bwysig iawn, fel y mae cyfanswm cost yr eiddo y fetr sgwâr o'r arwynebedd mewnlol net. Mae tri neu bedwar y gallwch gyfeirio atynt a dweud bod hynny yn dechrau ymddangos fel craidd yr hyn sy'n wirioneddol bwysig yn y dangosyddion hyn. Fodd bynnag, dychwelaf at yr hyn a ddywedais ynghynt, sef bod angen inni hefyd bwysleisio'r gair 'dangosydd', oherwydd mae amgylchiadau sefydliadau unigol, y cymunedau a wasanaethant a'r modd y mae eu darpariaeth yn newid yn golygu eu bod yn datblygu i fod yn feincnod y gallwch ei ddefnyddio fel sail i drafod a yw hynny'n cynrychioli arfer gorau ai peidio. Ni allwch gymryd hwn a dweud eich bod o dan y llinell, eich bod yn is na'r cyfartaledd ac felly eich bod yn wael.

[90] **Janice Gregory:** Os caf fi ddweud, yn y gorffennol, ni fu mecanwaith na monitro rheolaidd, naddo? Felly a ydych yn anhapus â'r ffaith fod gennych system o gasglu gwybodaeth erbyn hyn? O'r hyn a ddeallaf o'r hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud, yr ydych yn hoffi'r ffaith eich bod bellach yn gallu casglu gwybodaeth, ond efallai fod galw am ormod o wybodaeth. Nid yw hynny'n beth gwael, does bosibl?

Mr Martin: Nid wyf yn ei wrthwynebu; yr wyf yn dweud, o hynny, o safbwynt gosod targedau—a chafwyd cwestiynau am osod targedau ac ati yn gynharach—nid wyf yn ein

targets for 121 things or 21 things. If this exercise became a form that people sigh about and say, 'Oh God, we've got to do the FEEMS form this year', and does not become a dynamic part of the management of institutions, then it will not work. It will be an absolute failure. Therefore, it is not just about us receiving the information. In one sense, that is the least important part of it. The most important part of it is the dialogue that goes on in a college and between colleges, whereby they are comparing and contrasting their performance—which we facilitate with events; we have the standing group where we are talking to them all the time—and of governors being equipped with a much better set of indicators themselves to probe where their institutions sit, if you like, on the spectrum. This is one of the reasons why we pushed this in Wales and we had a much bigger sample than anywhere else when we were piloting moving towards these new arrangements. This was quite deliberate, because we want them to take it seriously and we are very concerned that it should not be seen as another form-filling exercise but that they should own it, that this is the information that they as managers and colleges want to have. We can then select from that the things about which we want to be more specific and set targets and so on.

[91] **Janice Gregory:** You said that it is on track for May 2003. When do you expect to see some benefits in terms of improvements on the estates? Do you have a timeframe in mind?

Mr Martin: That is a tough one. Immediately, at one level, I hope that the existence of the information immediately opens eyes as to where there is an obvious problem. If you are managing anything and you see that you are way out of line with some benchmark, then you immediately start asking questions. However, if you are asking me what percentage improvement there will be in the estate in two years' time as a result of these indicators, I would have to say that I choose to duck the question. This is a process—producing these indicators is part of a management process, and one of the things

rhagweld yn gosod targedau ar gyfer 121 o bethau neu 21 o bethau. Pe bai'r ymarfer hwn yn datblygu i fod yn ffurflen y mae pobl yn ochneidio amdani ac yn dweud, 'O Dduw, mae'n rhaid i ni wneud y ffurflen FEEMS eleni', ac nad yw'n dod yn rhan ddeinamig o'r gwaith o reoli sefydliadau, yna ni fydd yn gweithio. Bydd yn fethiant llwyr. Felly, nid yw'n ymwneud yn unig â ni yn derbyn y wybodaeth. Mewn un ystyr, dyna'r rhan leiaf pwysig ohono. Y rhan bwysicaf ohono yw'r cyfathrebu sy'n digwydd mewn coleg a rhwng colegau, lle maent yn cymharu ac yn gwrthgyferbynnu eu perfformiad—ac yr ydym yn hwyluso hyn gyda digwyddiadau; mae gennym y grŵp sefydlog lle yr ydym yn siarad â hwy drwy'r amser—a llywodraethwyr yn cael cyfres llawer gwell o ddangosyddion i ymchwilio i safle eu sefydliadau, os hoffwch chi, ar y sbectrum. Dyma un o'r rhesymau pam i ni annog hyn yng Nghymru ac i ni gael sampl llawer mwy nag yn unrhyw le arall pan oeddem yn treialu trosglwyddo i'r trefniadau newydd hyn. Yr oedd hyn yn hollol fwiadol, oherwydd yr ydym am iddynt ei gymryd o ddifrif ac yr ydym yn awyddus iawn na ddylai gael ei ystyried fel ymarfer llenwi ffurflen arall ond y dylent fod yn berchen arno, mai hon yw'r wybodaeth y maent hwy fel rheolwyr a cholegau am ei chael. Gallwn yna ddethol o hynny y pethau yr ydym am fod yn fwy manwl yn eu cylch a gosod targedau ac ati.

[91] **Janice Gregory:** Dywedasoch fod hyn yn mynd rhagddo yn ôl y disgwyl at y targed, sef Mai 2003. Pryd yr ydych yn disgwyl gweld rhai buddiannau o ran gwelliannau ar yr ystadau? A oes gennych amserlen mewn golwg?

Mr Martin: Dyna un anodd. Ar unwaith, ar un lefel, yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd bodolaeth y wybodaeth yn rhoi agoriad llygad yn syth ynghylch ym mhle ymae problem amlwg. Os ydych yn rheoli unrhyw beth ac yr ydych yn gweld eich bod yn gwyro oddi wrth ryw feincnod, yna yr ydych yn dechrau holi cwestiynau ar unwaith. Fodd bynnag, os ydych yn gofyn i mi pa ganran o welliant fydd yn yr ystâd ymhen dwy flynedd o ganlyniad i'r dangosyddion hyn, byddai'n rhaid i mi ddweud fy mod yn dewis osgoi'r cwestiwn. Proses yw hon—mae cynhyrchu'r dangosyddion hyn yn rhan o broses reoli, ac

that we must do is to decide, as part of that new planning and funding system, how we use this to drive the kind of changes that we want. It is going to make a big improvement to that capacity.

[92] **Janice Gregory:** The whole idea of your having this information is so that you can use it wisely—surely that would be the whole idea of your having this information. Yes, it is going to be a new system, yes, there is not, historically, a system that you can currently work with, but I would have hoped that you would have had some type of vision as to what you would do with the information once you have had it, and to roll it out to your other institutions. I am just a little concerned—I am sure that you did not mean ducking the question—but I would have hoped that this would have had some relevance to you and that you could use it in the wisest way.

Mr Martin: Yes, indeed it does. Sorry, my point was a very specific one about saying exactly what the outcome will be in terms of what happens to the estate. I am not at all trying to avoid the general question, which is a very fair one. We do have a strategic approach to using this. This is the core of how we will address these issues as part of that new planning and funding system that I have described. However, even while we are working on that and bringing that on board, our estates officers will be working on this with the institutions. We will be drawing these matters to the attention of the council, which itself is properly insistent that we should have a much sharper set of performance indicators. You can imagine the ragbag that we have inherited and now that we have some ways in which the council itself can judge how it is performing, I would imagine that it would want to have something about the utilisation of the capital assets that it funds.

[93] **Janice Gregory:** Would you use any of this information to set any type of targets for the institutions?

Mr Martin: We could well do. However, I think we need to study that. We need to look

un o'r pethau sy'n rhaid i ni ei wneud yw penderfynu, fel rhan o'r system gynllunio a chyllido newydd honno, sut yr ydym yn defnyddio hyn i weithredu'r math o newidiadau yr ydym yn eisiau eu gweld. Mae'n mynd i wella'r gallu hwnnw yn fawr.

[92] **Janice Gregory:** Holl bwrpas cael y wybodaeth hon yw eich bod yn gallu ei defnyddio'n ddoeth—siawns mai dyna fyddai'r holl bwrpas ichi gael y wybodaeth hon. Ydy, mae'n mynd i fod yn system newydd, na, nid oes, yn hanesyddol, system y gallwch weithio gyda hi ar hyn o bryd, ond buaswn wedi gobeithio y byddech wedi cael rhyw fath o weledigaeth am yr hyn y byddech yn ei wneud â'r wybodaeth o'i chael, ac i'w dosbarthu i'ch sefydliadau eraill. Yr wyf yn gofidio ychydig—yr wyf yn siŵr nad oeddech yn bwriadu osgoi'r cwestiwn—ond buaswn wedi gobeithio y byddai hyn wedi bod yn berthnasol i chi i ryw raddau ac y gallech ei defnyddio yn y modd doethaf.

Mr Martin: Ydy, yn sicr mae hynny'n wir. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, yr oedd fy mhwynt yn un penodol iawn ynglŷn â dweud yn union beth fydd y canlyniad o ran beth sy'n digwydd i'r ystâd. Nid wyf yn ceisio osgoi'r cwestiwn cyffredinol, sydd yn un teg iawn, o gwbl. Mae gennym ddull strategol o ddefnyddio hyn. Dyma yw craidd sut y byddwn yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn fel rhan o'r system gynllunio a chyllido newydd honno yr wyf wedi ei disgrifio. Fodd bynnag, hyd yn oed tra'n bod yn gweithio ar honno ac yn cyflwyno hynny, bydd ein swyddogion ystadau yn gweithio ar hyn gyda'r sefydliadau. Byddwn yn dwyn y materion hyn at sylw'r cyngor, sydd ei hun yn mynnu'n gywir y dylasem gael set lawer fwy manwl o ddangosyddion perfformiad. Gallwch ddychmygu'r gymysgfa yr ydym wedi ei hetifeddu a chan fod gennym bellach rai ffyrdd y gall y cyngor ei hun feirniadu sut y mae'n perfformio, buaswn yn dychmygu y byddai am gael rhywbeth am ddefnydd yr asedau cyfalaf y mae'n eu hariannu.

[93] **Janice Gregory:** A fyddech yn defnyddio unrhyw ran o'r wybodaeth hon i osod unrhyw fath o dargedau i'r sefydliadau?

Mr Martin: Gallewch wneud hynny, yn sicr. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod angen i ni astudio

at what is going to be the most productive use of this. What I am indicating is that I think it will be a small subset of high level targets.

[94] **Dafydd Wigley:** That is a recommendation, is it not? That comes out in paragraph 3.22.

Mr Martin: Yes, but I think what I am saying is that we want to do this in the context of that wider development. Let me give you an example: if we set the wrong target, you can produce some very perverse behaviours. If we set a target now—this is theoretical—but if we were to set a target that is based on the historic 30 per cent, we could actually choke off some of the most exciting and important things that are happening. So you have to be very careful when you set targets.

[95] **Dafydd Wigley:** Well, can we assume that, when we are setting targets, we are setting sensible and right targets and not ones that are going to trip you up? Sorry, Janice, for cutting across.

[96] **Janice Gregory:** No, that is fine, Chair. I am just wondering about the smaller institutions that now, all of a sudden, have to fill in the FEEMS forms and which possibly do not have the resources and the expertise to collect all the data required. Can you tell us a bit more about what assistance you will provide for them?

Mr Martin: I am not aware that they will have a problem. I mean, we have worked with the colleges to develop this system. They say that they want it.

[97] **Janice Gregory:** I am sure they do.

Mr Martin: One would hope that they will do that. I think that there is an issue—and this is always an issue that causes a degree of controversy—about how economies of scale can be achieved in the management of colleges. That does not necessarily mean that they have to merge and so on, although that is

hynny. Mae angen i ni edrych ar beth fydd y defnydd mwyaf cynhyrchiol o hyn. Yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud yw y credaf y bydd yn is-set bach o dargedau lefel uchel.

[94] **Dafydd Wigley:** Onid yw hwnnw'n argymhelliad? Mae hwnnw i'w weld ym mharagraff 3.22.

Mr Martin: Ydyw, ond credaf mai'r hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud yw ein bod am wneud hyn yng nghyd-destun y datblygu ehangach hwnnw. Gadewch i mi roi enghraifft i chi: os ydym yn gosod y targed anghywir, gallwch achosi rhai ymddygiadau gwrthnysig iawn. Pe baem yn gosod targed yn awr—mae hyn yn ddamcaniaethol—ond pe baem yn gosod targed sy'n seiliedig ar y 30 y cant hanesyddol, gallem mewn gwirionedd lesteirio rhai o'r pethau mwyaf cyffrous a phwysig sy'n digwydd. Felly mae'n rhaid i chi fod yn ofalus iawn pan ydych yn gosod targedau.

[95] **Dafydd Wigley:** Wel, a allwn dybio, pan ydym yn gosod targedau, ein bod yn gosod targedau call a chywir ac nid rhai sy'n mynd i'ch baglu? Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Janice, am dorri ar draws.

[96] **Janice Gregory:** Na, popeth yn iawn, Gadeirydd. Yr wyf yn meddwl am y sefydliadau llai sydd bellach, yn ddisymwth, yn gorfod llenwi'r ffurflenni FEEMS ac nad ydynt o bosibl yn meddu ar yr adnoddau a'r arbenigedd i gasglu'r holl ddata sydd ei angen. A allwch ddweud ychydig mwy wrthym am ba gymorth y byddwch yn ei ddarparu iddynt?

Mr Martin: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol y byddant yn cael anhawster. Hynny yw, yr ydym wedi gweithio gyda'r colegau i ddatblygu'r system hon. Dywedant eu bod ei heisiau.

[97] **Janice Gregory:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eu bod.

Mr Martin: Byddai dyn yn gobeithio y byddant yn gwneud hynny. Credaf fod mater—ac mae hwn bob amser yn fater sy'n achosi rhywfaint o ddadlau—o ran sut y gellir cyflawni arbedion maint yn y gwaith o reoli colegau. Nid yw hynny o reidrwydd yn golygu bod yn rhaid iddynt gyfuno ac ati, er

the option that some might choose and there are indeed merger proposals around. However, we need to find ways to minimise it. It is not just in this area. It is about a whole range of areas, of human resource policies and so on and of understanding legislation. One of the major issues facing colleges—and I am not using this as any kind of excuse for what has not happened on the Disability Discrimination Act—is simply that of understanding the legislation. I know of at least one institution where, when new legislation comes out, it has been the principal who has been sitting down and trying to understand it. Well, that is clearly dopey.

[98] **Dafydd Wigley:** No doubt you can give a lead there.

[99] **Janice Gregory:** We have established that nothing was in place prior to this. So why has it taken so long for the council to attempt to address this issue?

Mr Martin: There have been indicators: we referred to one earlier. What we have not had is a comprehensive set of indicators of this kind. It started in higher education in the mid 1990s, the development work, and higher education has been running the new system for about three years. We were particularly instrumental—all credit to the former Further Education Funding Council—in pushing for a similar approach in further education. Why has it taken so long? Well, that is a very good question. An area in which I worked many years ago was the health service, where the absence of decent management information since the establishment of the NHS was a fairly extraordinary thing to come across. However, I think that the other reason why it had not been developed in this very full way is because of the extent to which the funding councils have intervened and directed, if you like, has definitely grown. There is no question that the way in which incorporation was expected to work was largely about not taking an interest, because, clearly, a lot of interest was taken by the funding council and there was an attempt to invest and do backlog maintenance and all the rest of it, but it was all a bit ad hoc. It was done on the assumption that, at the end of the day, the

bod hynny yn opsiwn y bydd rhai yn ei ddewis o bosibl ac, yn wir, mae cynigion i gyfuno mewn bodolaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae angen i ni ganfod ffyrdd o gyfyngu arno gymaint â phosibl. Nid yn y maes hwn yn unig y mae. Mae'n ymwneud ag ystod gyfan o feysydd, o bolisiau adnoddau dynol ac ati ac o ddeall deddfwriaeth. Un o'r prif faterion sy'n wynebu colegau—ac nid wyf yn defnyddio hwn fel unrhyw fath o esgus dros beth a ddigwyddodd yn achos y Ddeddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd—yw, yn syml, y mater o ddeall deddfwriaeth. Gwn am o leiaf un sefydliad lle, pan fo deddfwriaeth newydd yn cael ei rhyddhau, mai'r pennaeth sydd wedi bod yn eistedd i lawr ac yn ceisio ei deall. Wel, mae hynny'n amlwg yn wirion.

[98] **Dafydd Wigley:** Mae'n siŵr y gallwch roi arweiniad yn y fan honno.

[99] **Janice Gregory:** Yr ydym wedi gweld nad oedd dim ar waith cyn hyn. Felly pam ei bod wedi cymryd cymaint o amser i'r cyngor geisio mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn?

Mr Martin: Cafwyd dangosyddion: cyfeiriasom at un yn gynharach. Yr hyn nad ydym wedi ei gael yw cyfres gynhwysfawr o ddangosyddion o'r math hwn. Dechreuodd ym maes addysg uwch yng nghanol yr 1990au, y gwaith datblygu, ac mae addysg uwch wedi bod yn gweithredu'r system newydd ers tua thair blynedd. Yr oeddem yn arbennig o flaenllaw—pob clod i'r cyn Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Bellach—wrth frwydro am ddull tebyg mewn addysg bellach. Pam ei fod wedi cymryd cyhyd? Wel, mae hwnnw yn gwestiwn da iawn. Maes y bûm yn gweithio ynddo flynyddoedd lawer yn ôl oedd y gwasanaeth iechyd, lle yr oedd absenoldeb gwybodaeth reoli foddhaol ers sefydlu'r GIG yn rhywbeth gweddol anghyffredin i'w ddarganfod. Fodd bynnag, credaf mai'r rheswm arall pam na chafodd ei ddatblygu yn y modd cyflawn iawn hwn yw oherwydd bod y graddau y mae'r cynghorau cyllido wedi ymyrryd a chyfarwyddo, os hoffwch chi, yn bendant wedi tyfu. Nid oes amheuaeth bod y modd y disgwyliwyd i ymgorffori weithio, i raddau helaeth, yn ymwneud â pheidio â pheidio â chymryd diddordeb, oherwydd, yn amlwg, cymerwyd llawer o ddiddordeb gan y cyngor cyllido a bu ymgais i fuddsoddi a chyflawni gwaith

colleges, as self-governing institutions, would be looking after their own affairs and that they were the best judges of that and should not need fuss too much.

[100] **Janice Gregory:** How did the indicators developed for the further education sector—you just mentioned that it started in higher education—compare with those for the higher education sector? Are there significant differences between the indicators? Do they have 121 as well?

Mr Martin: My colleagues are just getting the full details for you.

Mr Hirst: I am reliably informed that they are very similar. They are comparable. There are a few minor differences.

[101] **Dafydd Wigley:** If you would like to submit a note, we would be glad to have it. We will move on to the resourcing of the estates management function in the council.

[102] **Eleanor Burnham:** On page 22, paragraph 3.23 to 3.24 set out the wide range of responsibilities held by the council's property section. Given the importance of the estate to further education, perhaps you might not actually consider your organisation to be adequately resourced. What is your comment on that?

Mr Martin: Ultimately, it has to be our organisation's job to make choices within whatever is the total of resources that we have. We cannot duck that and blame someone else for that. We must prioritise. What has happened, of course, is that two professional estate officers, however excellent they are, not only have to deal, as they have historically, with further and higher education, but also now with a much wider agenda. I am in no doubt at all that that is an insufficient resource. What I do not know, going forward, are two things. First, we are having to prioritise across a wide range of our

cynnal a chadw oedd yn aros i gael ei wneud ac yn y blaen, ond yr oedd y cyfan yn eithaf ad hoc. Fe'i gwnaed ar y rhagdybiaeth y byddai'r colegau, yn y pen draw, fel sefydliadau hunanlywodraethol, yn gofalu am eu busnes eu hunain ac mai hwy oedd y rhai gorau i farnu ar hynny ac na ddylent boeni'n ormodol.

[100] **Janice Gregory:** Sut yr oedd y dangosyddion a ddatblygwyd ar gyfer y sector addysg bellach—bu i chi grybwyll funud yn ôl i hyn ddechrau ym maes addysg uwch—yn cymharu â rhai'r sector addysg uwch? A oes gwahaniaethau sylweddol rhwng y dangosyddion? A oes ganddynt hwy 121 hefyd?

Mr Martin: Mae fy nghydweithwyr yn ceisio darganfod y manylion llawn ar eich cyfer.

Mr Hirst: Yr wyf ar ddeall gan ffynhonnell ddibynadwy eu bod yn debyg iawn. Maent yn gyffelyb. Mae rhai mân wahaniaethau.

[101] **Dafydd Wigley:** Os hoffech gyflwyno nodyn, byddem yn falch o'i gael. Symudwn ymlaen at y gwaith o ddarparu adnoddau i'r swyddogaeth rheoli ystadau yn y cyngor.

[102] **Eleanor Burnham:** Ar dudalen 22, mae paragraff 3.23 i 3.24 yn nodi'r amrywiaeth eang o gyfrifoldebau sydd gan adran eiddo'r cyngor. O ystyried pwysigrwydd yr ystâd i addysg bellach, efallai nad ydych mewn gwirionedd yn ystyried bod gan eich sefydliad adnoddau digonol. Beth sydd gennych i'w ddweud am hynny?

Mr Martin: Yn y pen draw, cyfrifoldeb ein sefydliad yw gwneud dewisiadau o fewn beth bynnag yw cyfanswm yr adnoddau sydd gennym. Ni allwn osgoi hynny a rhoi'r bai ar rywun arall am hynny. Rhaid i ni flaenoriaethu. Yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd, wrth gwrs, yw bod dau swyddog ystâd proffesiynol, pa mor wych bynnag ydynt, nid yn unig yn gorfod ymdrin, fel y maent wedi yn y gorffennol, ag addysg bellach ac addysg uwch, ond hefyd, bellach, ag agenda lawer ehangach. Nid oes gennyf amheuaeth o gwbl bod hwnnw yn adnodd annigonol. Yr hyn na wn, wrth symud ymlaen, yw dau beth. Yn

activities. Clearly, this is a very important issue and we need to ensure that we are tackling it properly. Secondly, I would not like to prejudge what the best way of getting that extra resource is. Does it all take the form of people who we employ or do we have specialist property advisers or do we seek to get some of this resource from other agencies who have that input? It may well be that we need to do some more direct employing. I do not what the answer to that is—that is part of the detailed restructuring that we will be doing over the coming months.

[103] **Dafydd Wigley:** We will be watching that with interest.

[104] **Eleanor Burnham:** Right, so the fact that you only have two estate officers obviously has an impact on the fact that you, according to the details, only have on-site visits amounting to one day in each institution every two years. Do you consider that to be proactively addressing the estate issues in these institutions?

Mr Martin: It does not work too badly where the institution has really got a grip on things and is doing pretty well. There are some examples—I know that, of the estate strategies, only seven were found to be satisfactory, but there are nonetheless some really excellent examples of the work that is going on on the ground to deliver improvements in estates, and they are manifest as soon as you go to the institution.

[105] **Eleanor Burnham:** However, if you consider, for instance, in paragraph 3.24, the fact that, apparently, Capita was brought in to review conditions of service and compliance to the Disability Discrimination Act 1995, we have already seen that that has not happened adequately.

Mr Martin: I think that there are, if I may say, two separate issues here. I do think that it is reasonable for us to insist that, where

gyntaf, yr ydym yn gorfod blaenoriaethu ar draws amrywiaeth eang o'n gweithgareddau. Yn amlwg, mae hwn yn fater pwysig iawn ac mae angen i ni sicrhau ein bod yn mynd i'r afael ag ef yn y modd cywir. Yn ail, ni fyddwn yn dymuno rhagfarnu beth yw'r fforddorau o gael yr adnodd ychwanegol hwnnw. A yw'r cyfan ar ffurf pobl yr ydym yn eu cyflogi neu a oes gennym ymgynghorwyr eiddo arbenigol neu a ydym yn ceisio cael rhywfaint o'r adnodd hwn gan asiantaethau eraill sydd â'r mewnbwn hwnnw? Mae'n ddigon posibl bod angen i ni wneud mwy o gyflogi uniongyrchol. Ni wn beth yw'r ateb i hynny—mae hynny'n rhan o'r ailstrwythuro manwl y byddwn yn ei wneud dros y misoedd nesaf.

[103] **Dafydd Wigley:** Byddwn yn gwyllo hynny â diddordeb.

[104] **Eleanor Burnham:** O'r gorau, felly mae'r ffaith mai dim ond dau swyddog ystâd sydd gennych yn amlwg yn effeithio ar y ffaith, yn ôl y manylion, mai dim ond cyfanswm o un diwrnod ymhob sefydliad bob dwy flynedd sydd i'ch ymweliadau â safleoedd. A ydych yn ystyried bod hynny'n enghraifft o fynd i'r afael â materion ystâd yn y sefydliadau hyn yn rhagweithiol?

Mr Martin: Nid yw'n gweithio'n rhy ddrwg lle mae'r sefydliad wedi mynd i'r afael â phethau'n iawn ac yn gwneud yn eithaf da. Mae rhai enghreifftiau—gwn, o'r strategaethau ystâd, mai dim ond saith ohonynt oedd yn foddhaol, ond, serch hynny, mae rhai enghreifftiau gwych o'r gwaith sy'n mynd rhagddo yn y sefydliadau i sicrhau gwelliannau mewn ystadau, ac maent yn amlwg cyn gynted ag yr ydych yn ymweld â'r sefydliad.

[105] **Eleanor Burnham:** Fodd bynnag, os ydych yn ystyried, er enghraifft, ym mharagraff 3.24, y ffaith bod Capita, mae'n debyg, wedi cael ei alw i mewn i adolygu amodau gwasanaeth a chydymffurfiaeth â Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd 1995, yr ydym eisoes wedi gweld nad yw hynny wedi digwydd yn ddigonol.

Mr Martin: Credaf fod, os caf ddweud, ddau fater ar wahân yma. Credaf ei bod yn rhesymol i ni fynnu, lle mae gan golegau

colleges have a statutory duty—and they have many statutory duties: health and safety, equal opportunities, disability discrimination and so on—they will discharge their statutory duties, just as we would expect as an organisation to discharge our statutory duties. I think that the issue now is how, in going forward, we provide not just enough support for the further education colleges, but for this much more ambitious programme—if you think about it, if we are preparing plans for the future, locally and regionally, which may involve quite significant reshaping of provision, that requires, whatever deficiencies there might be now, a huge new demand on us, and we have to secure the resource to do that.

ddyletswydd statudol—ac mae ganddynt lawer o ddyletswyddau statudol: iechyd a diogelwch, cyfle cyfartal, gwahaniaethu ar sail anabled ac ati—y byddant yn cyflawni eu dyletswyddau statudol, yn yr un modd ag y byddem ni'n disgwyl, fel sefydliad, cyflawni ein dyletswyddau statudol. Credaf mai'r mater yn awr yw sut, wrth symud ymlaen, yr ydym yn darparu nid yn unig digon o gefnogaeth i'r colegau addysg bellach, ond ar gyfer y rhaglen lawer mwy uchelgeisiol hon—os meddyliwch amdano, os ydym yn paratoi cynlluniau ar gyfer y dyfodol, yn lleol ac yn rhanbarthol, a fydd o bosibl yn cynnwys ail-lunio darpariaeth yn sylweddol, mae hynny'n gofyn am, beth bynnag fo'r diffygion ar hyn o bryd, bwysau newydd enfawr arnom, a rhaid i ni sicrhau'r adnoddau i wneud hynny.

[106] **Eleanor Burnham:** Okay, but if some of these estates are in such a bad state, why does the council not perhaps suggest that some of them should actually be bulldozed and have a new build, which is far less costly? Also, can you clarify something that I have not quite got my head around yet? I have been visiting lots of different schools, as we all do, and I am quite concerned because the situation seems quite muddled to me. What is ELWa's responsibility for the estates of schools now, because that is something that I am really concerned about?

[106] **Eleanor Burnham:** O'r gorau, ond os yw rhai o'r ystadau hyn mewn cyflwr cynddrwg, pam nad yw'r cyngor efallai yn awgrymu y dylai rhai ohonynt mewn gwirionedd gael eu dymchwel a chael adeilad newydd, sy'n llawer llai costus? Hefyd, a wnewch chi egluro rhywbeth yr wyf wedi methu â'i ddeall hyd yn hyn? Yr wyf wedi bod yn ymweld â llawer o ysgolion gwahanol, fel y gwnawn ni oll, ac yr wyf yn eithaf pryderus oherwydd mae'r sefyllfa yn ymddangos yn eithaf dryslyd i mi. Beth yw cyfrifoldeb ELWa dros ystadau ysgolion bellach, oherwydd mae hynny'n rhywbeth sy'n destun pryder mawr i mi?

[107] **Dafydd Wigley:** That is outside the purview of this report.

[107] **Dafydd Wigley:** Mae hynny y tu allan i gwmpas yr adroddiad hwn.

[108] **Eleanor Burnham:** Is it really?

[108] **Eleanor Burnham:** Ydy hynny'n wir?

[109] **Dafydd Wigley:** Yes. It is outside the report's purview, other than if you are going to see the schools as a means of advancing your agenda—

[109] **Dafydd Wigley:** Ydy. Mae y tu allan i gwmpas yr adroddiad, oni bai eich bod yn mynd i edrych ar yr ysgolion fel modd o ddatblygu'ch agenda—

[110] **Eleanor Burnham:** Yes, because Steve has obviously been discussing that, but I am concerned that there is no clarity there at the moment. We cannot discuss that, can we?

[110] **Eleanor Burnham:** Ydw, oherwydd mae Steve yn amlwg wedi bod yn trafod hynny, ond yr wyf yn gofidio nad oes eglurder yno ar hyn o bryd. Ni allwn drafod hynny, allwn ni?

[111] **Dafydd Wigley:** We cannot go into that in detail.

[111] **Dafydd Wigley:** Ni allwn drafod hynny'n fanwl.

Mr Martin: I can give you half a sentence.

Mr Martin: Gallaf roi hanner brawddeg i chi.

[112] **Dafydd Wigley:** Give us half a sentence then. I am conscious of the time, as some people are keeping their eye on the clock.

[112] **Dafydd Wigley:** O'r gorau, dewch â hanner brawddeg i ni. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r amser, oherwydd mae rhai pobl yn cadw llygad ar y cloc.

Mr Martin: On the question of the advice, there is dialogue. Ultimately, as I say, the estate is a matter for the corporations. Clearly, if we think that they were being perverse in maintaining a building that it would be better to bulldoze, then we could give them that advice, and I am sure that we have done so over the years. However, it is not straightforward. You have to make sure that you have the resource to replace it, if replace it is what you are going to do. We have two examples of major inherited buildings—Glynllifon, and Gelli Aur in Camarthenshire—where it took some years to sell them. They are listed buildings and are actually quite difficult to off-load, but the principle has to be right.

Mr Martin: Ar fater cyngor, mae cyfathrebu. Yn y pen draw, fel y dywedaf, mater i'r corfforaethau yw'r ystâd. Yn amlwg, os credwn iddynt fod yn wrthnysig wrth gynnal a chadw adeilad y byddai'n well ei ddymchwel, yna gallem roi'r cyngor hwnnw iddynt, ac yr wyf yn sicr ein bod wedi gwneud hynny dros y blynyddoedd. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n syml. Rhaid i chi sicrhau bod gennych yr adnodd i godi rhywbeth yn ei le, os mai dyna yr ydych yn mynd i'w wneud. Mae gennym ddwy enghraifft o adeiladau pwysig a etifeddwyd—Glynllifon, a Gelli Aur yn Sir Gaerfyrddin—lle cymerodd hi rai blynyddoedd i'w gwerthu. Maent yn adeiladau rhestredig ac maent mewn gwirionedd yn eithaf anodd i'w gwaredu, ond rhaid i'r egwyddor fod yn gywir.

[113] **Eleanor Burnham:** Finally Chair, with your indulgence, what action do you plan to take in response to the Auditor General's recommendation that the council review resourcing of its property section, because, obviously, the finance is a huge issue?

[113] **Eleanor Burnham:** Yn olaf Gadeirydd, os caniatewch i mi, pa gamau gweithredu yr ydych yn bwriadu eu cymryd mewn ymateb i argymhelliad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol y dylai'r cyngor adolygu'r modd y darperir adnoddau i'w adran eiddo, oherwydd, yn amlwg, mae'r cyllid yn fater enfawr?

Mr Martin: This is already in play as part of restructuring, and the way in which we will take the organisation forward to deliver the new planning and funding arrangements. So it is an integral part of how we will address this report.

Mr Martin: Mae hyn eisoes ar waith fel rhan o waith ailstrwythuro, a'r modd y byddwn yn datblygu'r sefydliad i weithredu'r trefniadau cynllunio a chyllido newydd. Felly mae'n rhan annatod o sut y byddwn yn mynd i'r afael â'r adroddiad hwn.

[114] **Dafydd Wigley:** Janet, do you want to move the questioning on?

[114] **Dafydd Wigley:** Janet, a ydych am barhau â'r cwestiynau?

[115] **Janet Davies:** Mr Martin, I will turn to something that Eleanor has touched a bit on, namely the resourcing of the function in institutions themselves. About 18 months ago, we looked at the Auditor General's report on procurement in the further education sector in Wales, and we saw that there was a dearth of procurement officers and that that was holding back the sector in

[115] **Janet Davies:** Mr Martin, yr wyf am droi fy sylw at rywbeth y mae Eleanor eisoes wedi sôn amdano, sef darparu adnoddau i'r swyddogaeth yn y sefydliadau eu hunain. Tua 18 mis yn ôl, edrychasom ar adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol ar gaffael yn sector addysg bellach Cymru, a gwelsom fod prinder swyddogion caffael a bod hynny'n rhwystro'r sector rhag gwella perfformiad yn

improving performance there. So, having seen in paragraphs 3.26 to 3.28 that there are three institutions with no dedicated estates managers, and that some of the others do not have any formal qualifications, to what extent is the lack of a dedicated, qualified estates manager in particular institutions hampering their progress in management?

Mr Martin: Our firm advice to them for some time has been that they ought to have professional advice. Whether that comes from having their own dedicated person, or by buying in a resource, or by sharing a resource, is a matter to be determined by the college. Whether or not they have a dedicated estates manager on their premises, and it is a mixed picture, is not the whole story. Some secure resources in other ways other than having their own dedicated staff. However, I have to say, I find it inconceivable that they could manage these affairs properly without regular access to a professional resource.

[116] **Janet Davies:** Yes, and particularly with, perhaps, some of the bigger colleges where they are on several campuses, it would seem that it would be very, very difficult just to manage with regular access rather than having a dedicated manager. Is it possible for you to do anything to facilitate these kinds of improvements and to work with them to get, perhaps, a minimum level of expertise among the managers where they exist?

Mr Martin: Well, there has been, I think, progressive success over the years. I mean, it is implicit in the model of governance that we are operating within that we do operate by persuasion. I do not think that we have any power to make it a condition of funding that they have a dedicated estates manager, although we might well make it a condition of funding that they do certain work with the money we give them. We will continue to preach that message, and I have no doubt that the production of this report, and indeed the production of this Committee's report, will give us a further weapon in that campaign.

[117] **Janet Davies:** Well, it would certainly be somewhat of an overkill if you were to effect their finances on that one; I think that

y maes hwnnw. Felly, o weld ym mharagraffau 3.26 i 3.28 bod tri sefydliad heb reolwyr ystadau penodol, ac nad oes gan rai o'r gweddill gymwysterau ffurfiol, i ba raddau y mae prinder rheolwr ystadau cymwys, penodol mewn sefydliadau arbennig yn amharu ar eu cynnydd yn y gwaith rheoli?

Mr Martin: Y cyngor pendant yr ydym wedi bod yn ei roi iddynt ers cryn amser yw y dylent gael cyngor proffesiynol. Y coleg sydd i benderfynu a yw hynny'n deillio o neilltuo unigolyn ei hunan, neu drwy brynu adnodd i mewn, neu drwy rannu adnodd. Waeth a oes ganddynt reolwr ystadau penodol ar eu safle ai peidio, ac mae'n ddarlun cymysg, nid dyma'r stori gyfan. Mae rhai yn sicrhau adnoddau mewn ffyrdd eraill ar wahân i gael eu staff penodol eu hunain. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i mi ddweud, ni allaf gredu y gallent reoli'r materion hyn yn briodol heb fynediad rheolaidd i adnodd proffesiynol.

[116] **Janet Davies:** Yn wir, yn enwedig yn achos, efallai, rhai o'r colegau mwyaf lle maent wedi eu gwasgaru ar draws sawl campws, byddai'n ymddangos y byddai'n anodd iawn, iawn gwneud y tro â mynediad rheolaidd yn unig yn hytrach na chyda rheolwr penodol. A yw'n bosibl i chi wneud rhywbeth i hwyluso'r mathau hyn o welliannau a gweithio gyda hwy i gael, efallai, lefel ofynnol o arbenigedd ymhlith y rheolwyr lle maent yn bodoli?

Mr Martin: Wel, credaf fod llwyddiant cynyddol wedi bod dros y blynyddoedd. Hynny yw, mae ymhlyg yn y model o lywodraethu y gweithredwn arni ein bod yn gweithredu drwy berswâd. Ni chredaf fod gennym unrhyw rym i fynnu bod ganddynt reolwr ystadau penodol fel amod cyllido, er mae'n bosibl y gwnawn ef yn amod cyllido eu bod yn gwneud gwaith penodol gyda'r arian a roddwn iddynt. Byddwn yn parhau i bregethu'r neges honno, ac nid oes gennyf amheuaeth y bydd cynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn, ac, yn wir, cynhyrchu adroddiad y Pwyllgor hwn, yn rhoi arf pellach i ni yn yr ymgyrch honno.

[117] **Janet Davies:** Wel, byddai'n sicr yn mynd dros ben llestri braidd pe baech yn gweithredu eu cyllidebau ar sail hynny;

there is too much overkill going on around the world at the moment anyway, but that is right outside the Audit Committee's remit. What is the council doing to ensure that all institutions make use of the full range of guidance that is available?

Mr Martin: Well, one of the things that our auditors do is to look at corporate governance. They will be looking for evidence that the governors are acting in accordance with the guidance that we give them. That is part of a regular cycle of audit, and we make sure that we follow up those recommendations. We have management reports—we do not just go in, come out and forget about it; we get those reports and we then have follow-up visits and so on. That does have an impact. There is no doubt that the quality of corporate governance has steadily improved over the years since incorporation.

[118] **Dafydd Wigley:** Diolch yn fawr. A gaf fi, felly, grynhoi gyda chwestiwn neu ddau fy hun i ddod â phethau i derfyn?

Mae gan gynllun strategol y Cynulliad darged y bydd pob sefydliad sy'n darparu addysg yn addas i'r pwrpas, ac yn cael eu cynnal a'u cadw'n dda, erbyn 2010. Pa mor effeithiol, yn eich barn chi, yw'r cyngor yn yr ymdrech i gyrraedd y targed hwnnw?

Mr Martin: It is an ambitious target. It will require sustained investment from public and other sources to achieve it. It is not out of sight in this sector; if the council can maintain and, hopefully, improve the level of its investment in its first two years, we will be making a significant impact on that. I think one of the key things is the front-loading of that; I think that a situation where we have an extensive backlog of maintenance is not the best basis on which to move forward. I repeat that, except where we are absolutely convinced that there is really no long-term future for a building, that has to be an early priority, alongside the disability work that we were discussing.

credaf fod gormod o fynd dros ben llestri yn digwydd o gwmpas y byd ar hyn o bryd beth bynnag, ond mae hynny y tu allan i gylch gorchwyl y Pwyllgor Archwilio yn llwyr. Beth mae'r cyngor yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod pob sefydliad yn gwneud defnydd llawn o'r ystod lawn o ganllawiau sydd ar gael?

Mr Martin: Wel, un o'r pethau mae ein harchwilwyr yn ei wneud yw edrych ar lywodraethu corfforaethol. Byddant yn edrych am dystiolaeth bod y llywodraethwyr yn gweithredu yn unol â'r canllawiau a roddwn iddynt. Mae hynny'n rhan o gylch archwilio rheolaidd, a sicrhawn ein bod yn gweithredu'r argymhellion hynny. Mae gennym adroddiadau rheoli—nid ydym yn mynd i mewn, yn dod allan ac yn anghofio amdano; yr ydym yn cael yr adroddiadau hynny ac yna yr ydym yn trefnu ymweliadau dilynol ac ati. Mae hynny yn cael effaith. Nid oes amheuaeth fod ansawdd llywodraethu corfforaethol wedi gwella'n gyson dros y blynyddoedd ers ymgorffori.

[118] **Dafydd Wigley:** Thank you very much. May I, therefore, summarise with one or two questions of my own to bring things to a close?

The Assembly's strategic plan contains a target that all education-providing institutions will be suitable for purpose and well maintained by 2010. How effective, in your opinion, is the council in the effort to achieve that target?

Mr Martin: Mae'n darged uchelgeisiol. Bydd angen buddsoddiad cyson o ffynonellau cyhoeddus a ffynonellau eraill i'w gyrraedd. Nid yw y tu hwnt i'r sector hwn; os gall y cyngor gynnal a, gobeithio, gwella lefel ei fuddsoddiad yn ei ddwy flynedd gyntaf, byddwn yn gwneud effaith sylweddol ar hynny. Credaf mai un o'r pethau allweddol yw buddsoddi'n drwm yn y cyfnod cychwynnol; ni chredaf mai sefyllfa lle mae gennym lawer o waith cynnal a chadw yn aros i gael ei wneud yw'r sail orau i symud ymlaen arni. Dywedaf eto, ac eithrio lle yr ydym yn hollol argyhoeddedig nad oes dyfodol hirdymor i adeilad, fod yn rhaid i honno fod yn flaenoriaeth gynnar, ochr yn ochr â'r gwaith anabled y buom yn ei drafod.

[119] **Dafydd Wigley:** Ond yr ydych yn gweithio i gyrraedd y targed hwnnw?

Mr Martin: We certainly must work to that target, and we must, of course, year on year—and I hope we will get some of that long-term security about funding I have been repeatedly describing—put to the Assembly Government what we believe is the level of investment that is necessary to achieve that.

[120] **Dafydd Wigley:** Mae hynny'n ddigon teg. Felly, a gaf symud ymlaen i ofyn, o ystyried adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn ei gyfanrwydd, beth ydych chi'n ei weld yn awr fel eich blaenoriaethau chi?

Mr Martin: Well, I think that there are a number of priorities, and I will try to stick to my own strictures that you should never have more than a few priorities. I think that the crucial message is about utilising the FEEMS—we have been prominent across Great Britain in getting that introduced—and making sure that it is accessible, not just to front-line managers, but also to governing bodies. We ourselves should think very carefully as a council about being clearer and more consistent over a period of years than has historically been the case—bear in mind that the council has only been around for 18 months or so—and ensure that we do press the case for the sorts of investment that will mean that we have a really excellent estate. I think that there is a danger, inevitably, that we concentrate on the 30 per cent that is wrong. However, there has been, I believe, a success story, certainly in Wales relative to England and Scotland, in terms of the position that we have reached with the condition of the estate. We need to build on that, but we also need—and this is where the target for 2010 is particularly ambitious in my mind—to do all that at the same time as patterns of learning are going to change quite quickly. So, it is going to be a bit of a moving target. However, it must be the ambition to have something that we are all proud of and that is fit for purpose. If the other public services, such as the NHS, can keep up with us in that process, they will be doing well.

[119] **Dafydd Wigley:** But you are working to achieve that target?

Mr Martin: Rhaid i ni'n bendant weithio tuag at y targed hwnnw, a rhaid i ni, wrth gwrs, flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn—ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y byddwn yn cael rhywfaint o'r sicrwydd hirdymor hwnnw am gyllido yr wyf wedi bod yn ei ddisgrifio dro ar ôl tro—gyflwyno i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad lefel y buddsoddiad sydd ei hangen, yn ein barn ni, i gyflawni hynny.

[120] **Dafydd Wigley:** That is fair enough. Therefore, may I move on to ask, considering the Auditor General's report in its entirety, what do you now see as your priorities?

Mr Martin: Wel, credaf fod nifer o flaenoriaethau, a cheisiaf lynu at fy rheolau fy hun na ddylech fyth gael mwy nag ychydig o flaenoriaethau. Credaf fod y neges hanfodol yn ymwneud â defnyddio'r FEEMS—yr ydym wedi bod yn flaenllaw ledled Prydain yn y gwaith o gael honno wedi ei chyflwyno—a gwneud yn siŵr ei bod ar gael, nid yn unig i reolwyr rheng-flaen, ond hefyd i gyrff llywodraethu. Dylasem ni ein hunain feddwl yn ofalus iawn fel cyngor am fod yn fwy eglur a chyson dros gyfnod o flynyddoedd nag yr ydym wedi bod yn y gorffennol—cofiwch mai dim ond am tua 18 mis y mae'r cyngor wedi bod mewn bodolaeth—a sicrhau ein bod yn pwyso am y mathau o fuddsoddiad a fydd yn golygu bod gennym ystâd hynod ragorol. Credaf fod perygl, yn anochel, ein bod yn canolbwyntio ar y 30 y cant sydd yn anghywir. Fodd bynnag, credaf y bu llwyddiant yng Nghymru, yn sicr, o'i chymharu â Lloegr a'r Alban, o safbwynt y sefyllfa yr ydym wedi ei chyrraedd o ran cyflwr yr ystâd. Mae angen i ni adeiladu ar hynny, ond mae hefyd arnom angen—a dyma lle mae'r targed ar gyfer 2010 yn arbennig o uchelgeisiol yn fy marn i—gwneud hynny oll ar yr un pryd oherwydd mae patrymau dysgu yn mynd i newid yn weddol gyflym. Felly, mae'n mynd i fod yn darged sy'n symud. Fodd bynnag, rhaid mai'r uchelgais yw cael rhywbeth yr ydym oll yn falch ohono ac sy'n addas i'w bwrpas. Os gall y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus eraill, megis

y GIG, gadw i fyny â ni yn y broses honno, byddant yn gwneud yn dda.

[121] **Dafydd Wigley:** Mae hwnnw'n ddatganiad pellgyrhaeddol iawn. A ydych yn hyderus y gallwch drosglwyddo'r blaenoriaethau hyn i'r sefydliadau ac a ydych yn siŵr bod gennych ddull o sicrhau eu bod yn mabwysiadu a gweithredu y blaenoriaethau hyn o fewn y sefydliadau?

[121] **Dafydd Wigley:** That is a very far-reaching statement. Are you confident that you can transfer these priorities to the institutions and are you sure that you have a method of ensuring that they adopt and act on these priorities within the institutions?

Mr Martin: Yes, but the relationship with colleges is one whereby we will co-operate with them and we will want to take them with us. If people are seriously backsliding, we will address it. The national council has used powers that have not been used before where we are not happy with the way in which colleges are being managed. However, we do not want to wave big sticks: we want to work with people as part of these much wider partnerships to make sure that we have a really excellent estate and that we are offering really excellent provision across the whole of post-16 education, not just further education.

Mr Martin: Ydw, ond mae'r berthynas â cholegau yn un lle byddwn yn cydweithio â hwy a byddwn am eu perswadio i fynd gyda ni. Os bydd pobl yn syrthio'n ôl yn ddifrifol, byddwn yn mynd i'r afael â hynny. Mae'r cyngor cenedlaethol wedi defnyddio pwerau na ddefnyddiwyd o'r blaen lle nad ydym yn fodlon gyda'r modd y caiff colegau eu rheoli. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym am fod yn ormesol: yr ydym am weithio gyda phobl fel rhan o'r partneriaethau llawer ehangach hyn i sicrhau bod gennym ystâd wirioneddol wych a'n bod yn cynnig darpariaeth wirioneddol wych ar draws addysg ôl-16 i gyd, nid addysg bellach yn unig.

[122] **Dafydd Wigley:** Dyma'r cwestiwn olaf. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cydnabod bod yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol wedi canfod nifer o broblemau sylweddol yn y sector addysg bellach o safbwynt yr ystâd. Nid dyma'r tro cyntaf inni ddod ar draws problemau yn y sector addysg bellach. Ar ddau achlysur blaenorol—mewn adroddiadau ar Goleg Gwent ac ar gaffaeliad yn y sector addysg bellach—mae'r Pwyllgor hwn wedi gofyn y cwestiwn hwn: a yw'r model presennol ar gyfer y sector addysg bellach, sef model o golegau hunan-lywodraethol annibynnol, yn dal yn un priodol? Bu inni argymhell adolygiad o hyn, ac mae'r Llywodraeth wedi derbyn yr argymhelliad, ond nid oes fawr o olwg ei fod yn symud yn ei flaen. A oes rhywbeth yn cael ei wneud ynglŷn â hyn a beth yw eich barn ar y mater?

[122] **Dafydd Wigley:** This is the last question. I am sure that you will acknowledge that the Auditor General has found many significant problems in the further education sector in terms of the estate. This is not the first time that we have come across problems in the further education sector. On two previous occasions—in reports on Coleg Gwent and on procurement in the further education sector—this Committee has raised this question: is the current model for the further education sector, namely a model of independent self-governing colleges, still appropriate? We recommended a review of this, and the Government has accepted the recommendation, but it does not seem to be moving forward. Is something being done about this and what is your opinion on the matter?

Mr Martin: I think that I have probably said something like this before the Committee in the past: I think that the model actually works pretty well most of the time in most circumstances. Where it does not work very well is, where performance is sub-optimal—quite seriously sub-optimal—over a long

Mr Martin: Credaf ei bod yn debygol fy mod, yn ôl pob tebyg, wedi dweud rhywbeth tebyg gerbron y Pwyllgor yn y gorffennol: credaf fod y model yn gweithio'n eithaf da mewn gwirionedd y rhan fwyaf o'r amser o dan y mwyaftrif o amgylchiadau. Lle nad yw'n gweithio'n dda iawn, pan fo

period, to get change quickly. You can get there and we are getting there. There are some examples that I have given where we have used our powers and so on where they are beginning to produce significant change. However, it is very indirect. I think that there is a danger in wholly abandoning a model that is actually quite successful most of the time with most colleges. I think that it is about adapting it, and my own personal view is that the areas to target—and I do not have a quick answer to this; it is not straightforward—are those powers that will enable us to act quickly. I actually think that the long-term answer to this is in our planning and funding system. It is not in the use of policing powers and coming to the Assembly and dissolving institutions in a way that just causes a huge amount of fuss and takes ages—it would actually take ages. I think it is about a strategic pattern of investment by the council, which makes clear the quality of provision it is going to provide—that is at the centre of its strategic thinking—and which supports those who are struggling for a period if they cannot get it right, but which is actually prepared to move the money somewhere else. I think that the ultimate thing that concentrates minds is that we are prepared to do that as part of this new system over time.

[123] **Dafydd Wigley:** I am sure that that is right and, within whichever system we were operating, that would be the case, but the point that I was making was this: twice, recommendations have been made to review the structure to see whether, in fact, it is an appropriate structure. In the Audit Committee report on procurement in further education in Wales, there was a specific recommendation that the Assembly examine whether the current model of further education colleges as independent, self-governing bodies remains appropriate and the Government's response was 'accepted'. What I am asking is, is there anything happening on that agenda? I accept everything that you have said so far, but is there anything happening with regard to the review of that structure?

perfformiad yn is na'r optimwm—yn ddifrifol is na'r optimwm—dros gyfnod hir, yw gweithredu newid yn gyflym. Gallwch gyflawni hynny ac yr ydym ni'n ei gyflawni. Mae rhai enghreifftiau yr wyf wedi eu rhoi lle yr ydym wedi defnyddio ein pwerau ac ati lle maent yn dechrau cynhyrchu newid sylweddol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n anuniongyrchol iawn. Credaf ei bod hi'n beryglus cefnu'n llwyr ar fodel sydd mewn gwirionedd yn eithaf llwyddiannus y rhan fwyaf o'r amser yn achos y mwyafrif o golegau. Credaf fod hyn yn ymwneud â'i addasu, a fy safbwynt personol yw mai'r meysydd i'w targedu—ac nid oes gennyf ateb cyflym i hyn; nid yw'n syml—yw'r pwerau hynny fydd yn ein galluogi i weithredu'n gyflym. Credaf fod yr ateb hirdymor i hyn, mewn gwirionedd, yn ein system gynllunio a chyllido. Nid yw yn y defnydd o bwerau rheoli ac yn dod i'r Cynulliad a diddymu sefydliadau mewn modd sydd ond yn creu llawer iawn o ffwdan ac yn cymryd oesoedd—byddai'n cymryd oesoedd mewn gwirionedd. Credaf ei fod yn ymwneud â phatrwm strategol o fuddsoddi gan y cyngor, sy'n gwneud ansawdd y ddarpariaeth y mae'n mynd i ddarparu yn glir—mae hynny yn greiddiol i'w feddwl strategol—ac mae'n cefnogi'r rheini sy'n ymroi am gyfnod os nad ydynt yn gallu ei gael yn iawn, ond sydd mewn gwirionedd yn barod i symud yr arian i rywle arall. Credaf mai'r peth sylfaenol sy'n canolbwyntio meddyliau yw ein bod yn barod i wneud hynny fel rhan o'r system newydd hon dros amser.

[123] **Dafydd Wigley:** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod hynny'n iawn ac, o fewn pa bynnag system yr oeddem yn gweithredu, dyna fyddai'r achos, ond y pwynt yr oeddwn yn ei wneud oedd hyn: ddwywaith, mae argymhellion wedi eu gwneud i adolygu'r strwythur i weld a ydyw, mewn gwirionedd, yn strwythur priodol. Yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio ar gaffael mewn addysg bellach yng Nghymru, yr oedd argymhelliad penodol y dylai'r Cynulliad archwilio a yw'r model presennol o golegau addysg bellach fel cyrff hunan-lywodraethol, annibynnol yn dal i fod yn briodol a 'derbyniwyd' oedd ymateb y Llywodraeth. Yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ofyn yw, a oes rhywbeth yn digwydd ar yr agenda honno? Derbyniaf bopeth yr ydych wedi ei ddweud hyd yma, ond a oes rhywbeth yn

digwydd mewn perthynas ag adolygu'r strwythur hwnnw?

Mr Martin: There was some discussion immediately after that report was produced. The changes would require, of course, primary legislation, and there has not been detailed consideration subsequent to those early exchanges. It is not really for me to answer, but I think that the Assembly Government would probably say that it is considering this in the context of the opportunities that there are for primary legislation. What I would welcome would be that we continue to explore how the model should change so that, if those opportunities become available, we can take them. However, I do not actually have a simple formula for what that should be. It is not straightforward.

[124] **Dafydd Wigley:** Y pwynt oedd y dylai fod ystyriaeth yn digwydd, a chredaf ei bod yn bwysig, efallai, i ni fynd yn ôl at y Llywodraeth o ganlyniad i'r ymchwiliad hwn i ddilyn hynny i fyny gyda'r Llywodraeth. Mae'n ddigon teg i chi ddweud mai mater i'r Llywodraeth yw hwn.

Diolchaf i chi. Mae wedi bod yn ddiwrnod hir ichi; deallaf i chi fod gyda Phwyllgor arall y bore yma. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r ddau ohonoch am ddod ger ein bron ac am ateb ein cwestiynau. Yr ydym yn sylweddoli bod nifer o bethau y buasech yn hoffi eu gwneud, ond nid yw'r pwerau gennych bob amser.

Bydd trawsgrifiad drafft o'r trafodaethau hyn yn cael ei anfon atoch i chi wirio ei gywirdeb ffeithiol cyn iddo gael ei gyhoeddi fel rhan o'n cofnodion. Bydd y trawsgrifiad yn cael ei gynnwys fel atodiad i adroddiad y Pwyllgor pan y'i cyhoeddir.

Mr Martin: Bu rhywfaint o drafod yn union ar ôl i'r adroddiad hwnnw gael ei gynhyrchu. Byddai'r newidiadau yn gofyn am, wrth gwrs, ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol, ac nid oes ystyriaeth fanwl wedi bod yn dilyn y trafodaethau cynnar hynny. Nid fy lle i yw ateb hynny, ond credaf y byddai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dweud, yn ôl pob tebyg, ei bod yn ystyried hyn yng nghyd-destun y cyfleoedd sy'n bodoli i ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Yr hyn y byddwn yn ei groesawu fyddai ein bod yn parhau i archwilio sut y dylai'r model newid fel, os yw'r cyfleoedd hynny'n codi, y gallwn fanteisio arnynt. Fodd bynnag, nid oes gennyf mewn gwirionedd fformiwla syml ar gyfer beth ddylai hynny fod. Nid yw'n syml.

[124] **Dafydd Wigley:** The point was that consideration should be happening, and I think that it is important, perhaps, that we go back to the Government as a result of this inquiry to follow that up with the Government. It is fair enough for you to say that this is a matter for the Government.

I thank you both. It has been a long day for you; I understand that you were with another Committee this morning. I am grateful to both of you for coming before us and for answering our questions. We realise that there are a number of things that you would like to do, but you do not always have the powers.

A draft transcript of these discussions will be sent to you for you to check its factual accuracy before it is published as part of the minutes. The transcript will be included as an annex to the Committee's report when it is published.

*Daeth y sesiwn cymryd tystiolaeth i ben am 4.17 p.m.
The evidence-taking session ended at 4.17 p.m.*

THE AUDIT COMMITTEE

The National Assembly's Audit Committee ensures that proper and thorough scrutiny is given to the Assembly's expenditure. In broad terms, its role is to examine the reports on the accounts of the Assembly and other public bodies prepared by the Auditor General for Wales; and to consider reports by the Auditor General for Wales on examinations into the economy, efficiency and effectiveness with which the Assembly has used its resources in discharging its functions. The responsibilities of the Audit Committee are set out in detail in Standing Order 12.

The membership of the Committee as appointed on 3 June 2003:

Janet Davies (Plaid Cymru) - Chair
Leighton Andrews (Labour)
Mick Bates (Liberal Democrat)
Alan Cairns (Conservative)
Jocelyn Davies (Plaid Cymru)
Christine Gwyther (Labour)
Denise Idris-Jones (Labour)
Mark Isherwood (Conservative)
Val Lloyd (Labour)
Carl Sargeant (Labour)

Further information about the Committee can be obtained from:

Adrian Crompton
Clerk to the Audit Committee
National Assembly for Wales
Cardiff Bay
CF99 1NA
Tel: 02920 898264
Email: Audit.comm@wales.gsi.gov.uk