# **Answers issued to Members on 30 January 2009**

- [R] signifies that the Member has declared an interest.
- [W] signifies that the question was tabled in Welsh.

#### **Contents**

- 2 Questions to the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government
- 3 Questions to the Minister for Rural Affairs
- 3 Questions to the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport
- 4 Questions to the Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing
- 4 Questions to the Minister for Heritage
- 5 Questions to the Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills
- 15 Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services

# Questions to the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government

**Darren Millar (Clwyd West):** Further to the answer to WAQ53050 what guidance has been issued to Local Authorities regarding the numbers and location? (WAQ53166)

The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government (Brian Gibbons): There has been no guidance issued to local authorities regarding numbers and location, as the decision of allocating the grant is at the discretion of the individual local authority, but all grant payments must comply with the terms and conditions of the public facilities grant.

The terms and conditions of the public facilities grant require local authorities to include information as to the number of public toilets owned by the local authority that are operational, and the number of these that the local authority regards as meeting acceptable standards of safety, hygiene, and accessibility for disabled people and both sexes. In terms of applicant businesses the terms and conditions also require:

- Confirmation that the Authority is reasonably satisfied that all businesses in receipt of an Authority payment under this scheme:
- Allowed public access, free of charge, to the toilet facilities for a number of hours agreed with the Authority;
- Provided such toilet facilities which provided acceptable standards of safety, hygiene, accessibility for disabled people and provision for both sexes;
- Clearly publicised bilingually, with equal prominence given to the English and Welsh languages, the availability of the facilities and the opening hours so that it could be seen clearly by people from the outside of the premises;
- Displayed the bilingual sign designated by the Assembly publicising the Assembly's participation in the scheme.
- Details of methods used by the Authority to assess from time to time the compliance of participating businesses.

**Christine Chapman (Cynon Valley):** Will the Minister make a statement on the process by which small businesses can receive rate relief automatically in Wales? (WAQ53179)

**Brian Gibbons:** Business rate relief in Wales is largely non-application based for all businesses with a rateable value of £6,500 per annum or below. This simple system ensures that all businesses who are eligible, receive the relief to which they are entitled and no relief goes unclaimed.

The enhancement to non-domestic rate relief I introduced from 1 April 2008 in fulfilment of the Assembly Government's 'One Wales' commitment is partly application based. It makes specific provision for public houses, restaurants, petrol filling stations, credit unions and child care providers as they are required to satisfy local authorities that they meet the criteria for relief by completing a notification form when they first apply for the relief from their local authority.

Local authorities also have discretionary powers to grant hardship relief to businesses if they believe that it is in the interests of the local community to do so. The Assembly Government funds 75% of all hardship relief.

**Kirsty Williams** (Brecon and Radnorshire): What progress has the Minister made in developing a strategy to reduce hate crime? (WAQ53182)

**Brian Gibbons:** I launched the draft Community Cohesion Strategy on 12 January 2009. This aims to promote stronger communities within Wales and deal with a wide range of issues some of which will aim to reduce community tensions and resultant hate crime.

# **Questions to the Minister for Rural Affairs**

**Joyce Watson (Mid and West Wales):** Will the Minister be monitoring the progress of, or giving evidence to, the Equality and Human Rights Commission's current inquiry into the employment and recruitment practices in the meat processing sectors in England and Wales? (WAQ53171)

**The Minister for Rural Affairs (Elin Jones):** I am aware of the inquiry being undertaken by the Equality and Human Rights Commission and look forward to their recommendations on how to improve employment and recruitment practices in the meat processing sectors in Wales. I do not expect to be approached to give evidence to this inquiry.

# **Ouestions to the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport**

**Janice Gregory (Ogmore):** By how much have local transport grants increased for each local authority in Wales, year on year, since 1999? (WAQ53176)

# The Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport (Ieuan Wyn Jones):

Please see attached tables, covering Local Transport Packages and Local Transport Services Grant.

a)	Transport	Grant - I	ocal	Transport	Integrated	Packages	(fm)·
αı	Transport	Orani – i	Jucai	Transport	miceraicu	I ackages	\ &III <i>I</i> .

Local Authority	1999-00	2000-01	2001-02	2002-03	2003-04	2004-05	2005-06	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09
Anglesey	-	-	0.200	0.072	1.780	1.370	0.595	0.977	0.250	
Blaenau Gwent	-	0.425	0.710	0.276	0.650	0.360	0.230	-	-	-
Bridgend	0.840	1.900	4.635	2.860	1.920	2.359	0.415	1.000	0.300	0.700
Caerphilly	0.725	1.625	2.160	3.146	1.080	3.040	2.867	1.340	0.030	0.145
Cardiff	1.957	4.849	4.053	7.206	2.227	4.774	2.468	3.796	5.219	7.700
Carmarthenshire	0.235	0.370	0.850	0.665	1.390	1.930	1.350	1.200	0.152	0.429
Ceredigion	0.322	0.916	1.384	1.765	1.075	1.623	1.261	0.835	0.700	-
Conwy	-	0.200	0.750	0.456	0.500	0.512	-	0.050	0.020	-
Denbighshire	0.400	0.600	1.200	1.000	1.060	0.737	0.349	2.037	2.000	2.535
Flintshire	0.500	0.920	0.684	3.375	4.493	3.010	2.420	2.410	3.110	5.854
Gwynedd	0.760	0.415	0.700	1.251	1.360	2.840	2.530	1.900	1.600	1.000
Merthyr Tydfil	0.134	0.285	1.021	0.750	0.900	0.750	0.500	0.170	0.150	0.100
Monmouthshire	-	0.350	0.645	0.160	0.585	0.660	0.350	0.350	0.224	-
Neath P T	0.500	1.165	2.563	2.497	1.400	0.302	0.065	-	-	-
Newport	0.125	0.710	1.185	0.835	0.560	0.590	0.600	0.130	0.370	0.080
Pembrokeshire	-	0.250	0.700	0.700	0.882	0.385	0.376	0.020	-	-
Powys	-	-	0.600	0.925	0.535	0.490	0.155	0.155	0.380	-
Rhondda C T	1.000	1.925	2.493	0.750	1.200	0.400	0.250	0.200	0.500	0.839
Swansea	2.265	2.200	2.300	3.191	7.942	7.485	5.624	5.475	7.930	7.800
Torfaen	-	0.330	0.975	0.575	0.950	1.053	0.859	0.775	0.531	-
Vale of Glam	0.650	0.610	2.778	0.587	1.164	1.066	0.498	0.550	0.500	0.852
Wrexham	1.000	1.075	1.000	0.900	1.257	0.500	0.330	0.200	-	-
Total	11.413	21.120	33.586	33.942	34.910	36.236	24.092	23.570	23.966	28.034

#### b) Local Transport Services Grant:

The Local Transport Services Grant (LTSG) scheme helps local authorities to boost the number and range of subsidised bus and community transport services. Allocations (rounded) to local authorities under the

LTSG scheme are provided in the attached table.

	2002-03	2003-04	2004-05	2005-06	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09
Blaenau Gwent	126,586	150,480	153,648	160,869	164,124	181,584	184,300
Bridgend	321,246	366,795	368,372	385,685	393,488	435,349	467,560
Caerphilly	337,879	397,575	398,545	417,277	425,719	471,008	500,320
Cardiff	466,345	562,590	566,334	592,952	604,948	669,304	767,939
Merthyr Tydfil	119,259	139,365	141,468	148,117	151,115	167,189	179,940
Monmouthshire	298,345	329,175	340,650	356,661	363,877	402,586	407,231
Newport	224,666	271,890	295,942	309,851	316,120	349,750	396,383
Rhondda C T	470,828	549,765	543,584	569,132	580,646	642,417	711,222
Torfaen	199,615	232,560	234,727	245,759	250,731	277,405	281,221
Vale of Glam	295,637	336,870	353,605	370,224	377,714	417,897	445,350
Carmarthenshire	692,201	760,095	777,998	814,564	831,043	919,452	906,929
Neath Port Talbot	373,208	420,660	432,702	453,039	462,204	511,375	532,854
Pembrokeshire	394,091	435,195	442,996	463,817	473,200	523,541	530,467
Swansea	377,858	453,150	465,293	487,162	497,018	549,892	630,432
Conwy	269,800	307,800	317,037	331,938	338,653	374,680	396,389
Denbighshire	266,530	300,960	321,032	336,121	342,921	379,401	391,433
Flintshire	367,171	420,660	433,010	453,361	462,533	511,739	539,584
Gwynedd	488,837	533,520	530,795	555,742	566,985	627,303	615,421
Isle of Anglesey	289,161	315,495	313,688	328,431	335,075	370,722	356,990
Wrexham	289,626	336,870	362,059	379,076	386,745	427,888	456,743
Ceredigion	308,020	337,725	369,669	387,043	394,873	436,882	424,067
Powys	543,090	590,805	636,846	666,778	680,268	752,636	734,825
Total	7,520,000	8,550,000	8,800,000	9,213,600	9,400,000	10,400,000	10,857,600

Between 1998-99 and 2001-02 bus and community transport subsidies were provided through the Bus Subsidy Grant scheme.

# Questions to the Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing

**Mike German (Wales South East):** Will the results of the investigation into the environmental impact of Ffos-y-Fran be used to inform best practice at Ffos-y-Fran itself in addition to future opencast developments or will it only be used to inform best practice for future developments? (WAQ53185)

The Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing (Jane Davidson): The aim of the research, using the extensive data collected from the monitoring of Ffos-y-Fran, is to develop best practice for regulators and developers in the prediction, monitoring and mitigation of impacts arising from mineral extraction. The findings will derive general applications appropriate to Wales, and will be used in the future review and implementation of minerals advice.

Operations at existing sites, as at Ffos y fran, are bound by planning conditions, framed to ensure that impacts do not exceed predetermined thresholds when measured at sensitive locations.

# **Questions to the Minister for Heritage**

**Lesley Griffiths (Wrexham):** How many people are employed in the tourism industry in each local authority area in Wales and how does this compare to 1999? (WAQ53188)

The Minister for Heritage (Alun Ffred Jones): The information you have requested is provided in the attached table.

Employee jobs in tourism-related industries by local authority (Full and Part time)

1999 2000 2001 2002 2003 2004 2005 2006 2007

Wales	89,900	83,600	89,700	85,400	90,000	100,600	100,400	105,300	104,000
Isle of Anglesey	1,600	1,400	1,700	1,700	1,900	2,000	2,400	2,300	2,000
Gwynedd	4,000	3,600	4,600	4,500	5,700	5,900	6,600	6,500	6,500
Conwy	4,800	4,700	5,300	4,900	5,600	6,000	6,300	6,300	6,100
Denbighshire	3,000	3,100	3,500	3,100	3,600	4,300	3,500	4,000	4,000
Flintshire	3,800	3,800	4,300	4,200	4,800	5,100	4,600	4,600	4,400
Wrexham	2,900	3,200	3,400	3,000	3,400	3,900	3,400	3,600	3,500
Powys	3,700	5,800	5,800	4,500	4,800	5,100	5,500	5,800	5,500
Ceredigion	2,200	2,400	3,100	1,800	2,900	2,300	3,500	3,400	3,400
Pembrokeshire	3,700	4,200	5,300	3,500	4,400	3,400	5,600	5,900	6,100
Carmarthenshire	3,500	3,500	4,600	3,300	3,800	3,300	4,700	4,700	4,800
Swansea	8,400	6,100	7,200	7,500	8,800	10,600	9,100	9,100	8,800
Neath Port Talbot	3,000	1,800	2,200	2,400	2,900	3,900	3,300	3,300	3,300
Bridgend Vale of	4,400	3,200	3,400	3,500	2,700	3,800	3,500	4,000	4,000
Glamorgan	4,500	4,400	2,900	3,800	3,300	4,300	4,200	3,800	3,700
Cardiff	14,600	14,000	11,000	14,800	13,500	16,300	16,100	15,200	15,800
Rhondda, Cynon,	5.200	2.500	4.000	5 200	4.100	5 700	4.700	5.500	5 200
Taf	5,300	3,500	4,800	5,300	4,100	5,700	4,700	5,500	5,300
Merthyr Tydfil	1,200	800	1,200	1,100	800	1,500	1,500	1,700	1,600
Caerphilly	3,300	2,600	3,200	2,400	2,300	3,000	2,800	3,600	3,900
Blaenau Gwent	1,500	1,400	1,400	1,100	1,100	1,100	900	1,100	1,100
Torfaen	2,000	1,900	2,000	2,400	1,900	1,800	1,600	2,000	1,900
Monmouthshire	3,800	3,600	3,600	2,900	3,100	2,800	2,600	3,600	3,400
Newport	4,700	4,700	5,000	3,800	4,500	4,400	4,200	5,000	4,900

Source: StatsWales

Notes: Employee jobs figures are as at December of each year until 2005, from 2006 onwards they are as of September each year.

Data for 2007 are not on the same basis as data prior to 2006. Any comparisons between 2006 and earlier years are not valid.

The data for 2007 are provisional.

# Questions to the Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills

**Andrew R.T. Davies (South Wales Central)**: How many schools in Wales do not comply with statutory regulations concerning fire escapes (WAQ53191)

**The Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Hutt):** All Schools in Wales must comply with the Regulatory Reform (Fire Safety) Order 2005 and have an appointed responsible person to ensure the school complies with all Fire Safety Regulations.

**Andrew R.T. Davies (South Wales Central):** How many schools in Wales do not comply with statutory regulations concerning access for disabled people? (WAQ53192)

**Jane Hutt:** All schools in Wales must meet statutory regulations as laid down by the Disability and Discrimination Act 1995.

Guidance as to Disability Access for Local Education Authorities, Governing Bodies, Diocesan Authorities etc., was published in the National Assembly for Wales Circular No: 15/2004, issued March 2004.

Section 28D of the Disability Discrimination Act 1995 placed a duty on LEAs and schools, both maintained and independent, to plan to increase progressively the accessibility of schools to disabled pupils. The duties commenced in October 2003 and regulations made by the Assembly under section 28D required that accessibility strategies and plans be in place by 1 April 2004 to cover a period of 3 years. LEAs and schools are required to review these arrangements, and revise them if necessary and to produce new plans at three yearly intervals.

All new school buildings must be designed to meet the requirements of The Disability Discrimination Act 1995 and 2005(DDA95 and DDA2005) and the Special Educational Needs and Disability Act 2001(SENDA2001).

In order that schools are built to meet the requirements of the above acts there are a number of guidance documents that must be followed.

Adherence is also needed to The Building Regulations 2000. This applies to all new school buildings and extension to existing buildings. Part M of these regulations in particular deals with 'Access to and the use of building'.

**Andrew R.T. Davies (South Wales Central):** Will the Minister make a statement on any discussions she may have had about the recommendations of the National Behaviour and Attendance Review? (WAQ53194)

**Jane Hutt:** The National Behaviour and Attendance (NBAR) Action Plan will be released for the first time at the end of March 2009.

It will be a 'live' document which will be subject to regular amendment and ongoing consultation. In this way it is intended to maintain ongoing dialogue and to allow a flexible approach which can readily adjust to developments in the large number of linked initiatives

We will continue to assess how the response to the NBAR recommendations can build on our other key initiatives, such as the School Effectiveness Framework, 14-19 Learning Pathways, the Pedagogy Initiative and the NEET (Not in Education, Employment or Training) Strategy to ensure that we are putting in place positive and holistic changes which will make a real long term difference to education in Wales.

It is essential that head teachers in Wales have as many options as possible to help them foster an environment in which all members of the school community can thrive and feel respected, safe and secure. This includes the powers necessary to run a safe school, along with clear guidance to ensure that these powers are operated safely and equitably. For this reason the Welsh Assembly Government will consult in 2009 on the introduction of additional powers and associated guidance on discipline and searching for weapons contained in the Education and Inspections Act 2006 and the Violent Crime Reduction Act 2006.

**Andrew R.T. Davies (South Wales Central):** What is the average number of sick days taken by teachers in each Local Education Authority in Wales for each year since 1999? (WAQ53195)

**Jane Hutt:** This information is only available from 2002 onwards. Table 1 contains the average number of days lost due to sickness absence for all teachers. Table 2 contains the average number of days lost due to sickness absence amongst all teachers who took at least one period of sickness absence.

Table 1: Average number of days lost due to sickness absence per teacher 1 January to 31 December

IFΔ	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007
Isle of Anglesey	7	7	7	8	7	8

Gwynedd	7	7	7	7	8	7
Conwy	8	8	6	7	6	6
Denbighshire	7	7	5	8	8	8
Flintshire	9	11	8	6	7	8
Wrexham	5	5	5	4	2	2
Powys	2	2	2	2	2	4
Ceredigion	8	7	6	6	6	5
Pembrokeshire	12	11	14	12	10	10
Carmarthenshire	8	6	8	7	8	7
Swansea	9	9	8	7	9	8
Neath Port Talbot	9	11	10	8	10	9
Bridgend	8	7	14	8	14	14
Vale of Glamorgan	9	10	6	6	3	5
Rhondda Cynon Taf	7	8	7	7	10	13
Merthyr Tydfil	5	9	9	7	5	7
Caerphilly	11	9	8	8	8	9
Blaenau Gwent	9	9	11	10	9	12
Torfaen	9	8	6	6	5	8
Monmouthshire	12	9	6	10	8	10
Newport	12	14	12	14	6	8
Cardiff	7	8	7	7	9	8
Wales	8	8	8	7	8	8

Source: Local authority data collection (STATS3).

Table 2: Average number of days lost due to sickness absence per teacher taking a period of sickness absence, 1 January to 31 December.

LEA	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007
Isle of Anglesey	10	10	10	10	10	10
Gwynedd	12	11	11	11	12	12
Conwy	12	11	8	11	9	9
Denbighshire	11	11	9	12	13	13
Flintshire	14	17	13	9	11	12
Wrexham	9	10	10	12	8	8
Powys	4	4	4	4	4	10
Ceredigion	12	11	11	11	10	9
Pembrokeshire	18	18	15	18	15	15
Carmarthenshire	14	14	12	12	13	11
Swansea	12	12	11	11	11	11
Neath Port Talbot	13	14	14	13	26	15
Bridgend	11	11	*	*	21	21
Vale of Glamorgan	14	19	9	8	6	8
Rhondda Cynon Taf	11	12	16	15	14	18
Merthyr Tydfil	8	17	14	10	6	11
Caerphilly	14	14	11	12	11	13
Blaenau Gwent	14	14	16	14	14	16
Torfaen	15	13	14	17	6	11
Monmouthshire	11	12	6	19	11	15
Newport	12	14	*	*	11	12
Cardiff	11	11	11	10	16	12
Wales	12	13	13	13	12	13

Source: Local authority data collection (STATS3).

**Andrew R.T. Davies (South Wales Central):** Will the Minister make a statement on cooking lessons in primary and secondary schools in Wales? (WAQ53197)

**Andrew R.T. Davies (South Wales Central):** What discussions has the Minister had about the possibility of making cooking classes compulsory at various Key Stages? (WAQ53198)

**Jane Hutt:** Practical food preparation skills are compulsory in the national curriculum requirements for Design and Technology for 7 to 14 year olds. Schools are required to give pupils in Key stages 2 and 3 opportunities to plan and carry out practical food preparation tasks safely and hygienically, and make informed choices about healthy eating. In addition, the Framework for Personal and Social Education (PSE) has Health and Emotional Wellbeing as one of its five key themes, with a clear emphasis placed on diet, food and fitness and the importance of healthy eating.

The consultation on the revised National Curriculum Order for Design and Technology found that a clear majority of respondents supported the proposal to make food a compulsory material. Much positive comment was received about how the inclusion of food would enhance the profile of healthy eating within schools.

Support materials for schools are being produced to accompany the revised school curriculum. Guidance on food and fitness has also been sent to schools as part of this package.

Our Focus-on-Food Cooking Bus has been visiting primary schools in Communities First areas since its launch in June 2006. The Cooking Bus is a specially designed mobile trailer that provides 4-fully fitted kitchens complete with qualified teachers. It provides cooking lessons for pupils, a training session for teachers and a session for parents of young children at each venue. Some 100 schools have benefited from visits so far.

**Andrew R.T. Davies (South Wales Central):** What proportion of Higher Education students fail to graduate or leave their courses early and will the Minister provide figures for each HE institution since 1999? (WAQ53200)

**Jane Hutt:** Data on the number of Higher Education Students who fail to graduate or leave courses early are not available centrally, only numbers of those qualifying.

However the Higher Education Statistics Agency (HESA) annually publish a set of performance indicators at institution level which include non-continuation rates. These can be found on the HESA website at the link below.

http://www.hesa.ac.uk/index.php/content/category/2/32/141/

The non-continuation rates take two forms, drop out rates (tables T3 and T4) and projected outcomes (table T5). The latest data are at the link below.

http://www.hesa.ac.uk/index.php/content/view/1179/141/

Drop-out rates show the number and percentage of full-time entrants from the previous year who are no longer in higher education.

The projected outcomes indicator is based on past progression patterns of students for each institution. Included in this indicator are projections for proportion of full-time first degree students who will neither obtain an award nor transfer.

**Andrew R.T. Davies (South Wales Central):** How many graduates have failed to find employment five years after their graduation? (WAQ53201).

Jane Hutt: Data relating to the employment status of graduates five years after graduation are not available.

The Higher Education Statistics Agency's Destinations of Leavers from Higher Education (DLHE) survey collects information on the employment status of graduates at around 6 months after graduation. There is a follow up destination survey 3 years later and a Statistical Bulletin (published in February 2008) based on this data can be found at the link below.

http://wales.gov.uk/topics/statistics/headlines/post16ed2008/hdw200802286/?lang=en

The headlines (relating to Welsh Higher Education Institutions) from the bulletin are:

- 80 per cent of qualifiers were in employment (65 per cent at 6 months).
- 10 per cent were in work and further study (11 per cent at 6 months).
- 5 per cent were in further study only (14 per cent at 6 months).
- 2 per cent were assumed to be unemployed (5 per cent at 6 months).
- The proportions in each activity were similar to those for qualifiers from all UK HEIs.

**Andrew R.T. Davies (South Wales Central):** What proportion of Full-time Education students fail to graduate or leave their courses early and will the Minister provide figures for FE institution since 1999? (WAQ53202)

**Jane Hutt:** There are three main measures of learner outcomes for the further education sector:

- Learning activity completion: the proportion of learning activities commenced which are completed;
- Learning activity attainment: the proportion of completed learning activities which lead to the attainment of a qualification; and
- Overall learning activity success: the proportion of learning activities commenced which lead to the attainment of a qualification. This combines completion and attainment and was formerly known as 'successful completion' in the further education sector.

All three measures are derived and sourced from the Lifelong Learning Wales Record (LLWR).

In 2006/07, the learning activity completion rate for the further education sector in Wales was 87 per cent and the learning activity attainment rate and learning activity success rate were 70 per cent and 60 per cent respectively.

Table 1 details 2006/07 learning activity completion rates for all further education institutions in Wales. It also details learning activity completion rates for the preceding three years. Note that the learning activity completion rate has remained relatively static for the last four years at 86/87 per cent.

Due to methodological issues, attainment and success rates were not derived from the LLWR until 2006/07. As such, robust institution-level data is not available.

Table 2 is sourced from the Individualised Student Record (ISR) which preceded the LLWR as the main source for data for the further education sector in Wales. It details qualification aim completion rates for all further education institutions in Wales from 1999/2000 to 2002/03.

Note that, whilst the methodologies underpinning the qualification aim completion rates and the learning activity completion rates are similar, the rates are sourced from different data-collections and should not be directly compared.

Table 1: Learning Activity Completion Rates by FE institution - 2003/04 to 2006/07

Source: Lifelong Learning Wales Record (LLWR)

Institution	2003/04	2004/05	2005/06	2006/07
Barry College	83%	80%	81%	78%
Bridgend College	85%	82%	84%	84%
Coleg Sir Gar	86%	83%	82%	80%
Coleg Ceredigion	83%	88%	88%	86%
Deeside College	89%	87%	89%	92%
Coleg Glan Hafren	77%	86%	88%	91%
Gorseinon College	81%	83%	47%	88%
Coleg Gwent	88%	87%	89%	89%
Coleg Llandrillo	90%	87%	86%	85%
Coleg Llysfasi	91%	90%	92%	92%
Coleg Meirion Dwyfor	88%	84%	89%	87%
Merthyr Tydfil College (1)	81%	87%	84%	89%
Pembrokeshire College	88%	87%	83%	82%
Coleg Morgannwg	98%	80%	83%	85%
Coleg Powys	89%	90%	90%	91%
St David's Sixth Form College	87%	85%	87%	92%
Swansea College	89%	89%	89%	89%
Welsh College of Horticulture	90%	91%	95%	87%
Yale College	89%	89%	88%	88%
Ystrad Mynach College	87%	87%	90%	91%
WEA (South)	86%	83%	83%	85%
YMCA	95%	97%	97%	99%
Coleg Menai	82%	81%	85%	80%
Neath Port Talbot College	83%	82%	81%	87%
Coleg Harlech / WEA (North)	87%	83%	83%	74%
Total	86%	86%	86%	87%

<sup>(1)</sup> Merthyr Tydfil College merged with the University of Glamorgan during 2005/06.

Table 2: Qualification Aim Completion Rates by FE institution - 1999/2000 to 2002/03 Source: Individualised Student Record (ISR)

Institution	1999/2000	2000/01	2001/02	2002/03
Aberdare College (1)	68%	75%	77%	
Barry College	81%	77%	81%	81%
Bridgend College	81%	82%	85%	86%
Coleg Sir Gar	82%	80%	81%	84%
Coleg Ceredigion	83%	82%	87%	82%
Deeside College	80%	82%	82%	83%
Coleg Glan Hafren	77%	78%	76%	75%
Gorseinon College	76%	79%	69%	73%
Coleg Gwent	86%	86%	86%	88%
Coleg Llandrillo	82%	80%	80%	84%
Coleg Llysfasi	80%	79%	89%	86%
Coleg Meirion Dwyfor	85%	86%	87%	81%
Merthyr Tydfil College	71%	69%	66%	78%
Pembrokeshire College	84%	88%	89%	91%
Pencoed College (2)	79%	•	•	
Coleg Morgannwg (1)	68%	80%	81%	76%
Coleg Powys	88%	86%	91%	91%
St David's Sixth Form College	78%	87%	85%	87%
Swansea College	73%	83%	90%	90%

Welsh College of Horticulture	91%	91%	94%	88%
Yale College	85%	87%	88%	88%
Ystrad Mynach College	79%	79%	81%	84%
Coleg Harlech (3)	95%	94%		
WEA (North) (3)	82%	81%		
WEA (South)	87%	87%	88%	85%
YMCA	94%	94%	95%	95%
Coleg Menai	80%	81%	79%	76%
Neath Port Talbot College	74%	80%	83%	77%
Coleg Harlech / WEA (North) (3)			81%	76%
Total	81%	83%	84%	84%

<sup>(1)</sup> From 2002/03 Aberdare College merged with Pontypridd College in 2001/02. Following the merger, the college renamed itself Coleg Morgannwg.

**Andrew R.T. Davies (South Wales Central):** How many students have graduated from HE institutions since 1999 and will the Minister provide figures for each Higher Education institution? (WAQ53203)

**Jane Hutt:** The table shows numbers of undergraduates qualifying from Welsh Higher Education Institutions by year of qualification and level of study. Undergraduate qualifications are split into first degrees and other undergraduate qualifications. 'First Degrees' are qualifications such as BA, BSc etc. and 'Other Undergraduate' are higher education qualifications below degree level such as HND, foundation courses etc.

**Qualifiers from Welsh Higher Education Institutions (a)** 

999/2000	2000/01	2001/02	2002/03	2003/04	2004/05	2005/06	2006/07
655	675	725	720	855	835	790	965
660	640	580	635	760	665	730	680
1,250	1,375	1,420	1,545	1,640	1,710	1,720	1,980
2,335	2,310	2,010	2,305	2,250	2,515	2,705	2,475
570	775	790	870	880	860	770	730
340	280	280	275	315	375	340	395
395	315	285	235	265	230	220	245
1,765	1,680	1,650	1,680	1,675	1,875	1,865	1,710
Ź	,	,	,	Ź	,	,	,
1 385	1 445	1 505	1 080	1 565	1 470	1 505	1,545
1,505	1,115	1,505	1,000	1,505	1,170	1,505	1,5 15
3 285	3 510	3 195	3 520	3 415	4 500	4 280	4,435
5,205	3,510	5,175	5,520	5,115	1,500	1,200	1,155
1 070	1 960	1 000	1 955	1 9/15	2 165	2 220	2,325
1,770	1,000	1,000	1,033	1,043	2,103	2,320	2,323
	655 660 1,250 2,335 570	655 675 660 640 1,250 1,375 2,335 2,310 570 775 340 280 395 315 1,765 1,680 1,385 1,445 3,285 3,510	655     675     725       660     640     580       1,250     1,375     1,420       2,335     2,310     2,010       570     775     790       340     280     280       395     315     285       1,765     1,680     1,650       1,385     1,445     1,505       3,285     3,510     3,195	655     675     725     720       660     640     580     635       1,250     1,375     1,420     1,545       2,335     2,310     2,010     2,305       570     775     790     870       340     280     280     275       395     315     285     235       1,765     1,680     1,650     1,680       1,385     1,445     1,505     1,080       3,285     3,510     3,195     3,520	655       675       725       720       855         660       640       580       635       760         1,250       1,375       1,420       1,545       1,640         2,335       2,310       2,010       2,305       2,250         570       775       790       870       880         340       280       280       275       315         395       315       285       235       265         1,765       1,680       1,650       1,680       1,675         1,385       1,445       1,505       1,080       1,565         3,285       3,510       3,195       3,520       3,415	655       675       725       720       855       835         660       640       580       635       760       665         1,250       1,375       1,420       1,545       1,640       1,710         2,335       2,310       2,010       2,305       2,250       2,515         570       775       790       870       880       860         340       280       280       275       315       375         395       315       285       235       265       230         1,765       1,680       1,650       1,680       1,675       1,875         1,385       1,445       1,505       1,080       1,565       1,470         3,285       3,510       3,195       3,520       3,415       4,500	655         675         725         720         855         835         790           660         640         580         635         760         665         730           1,250         1,375         1,420         1,545         1,640         1,710         1,720           2,335         2,310         2,010         2,305         2,250         2,515         2,705           570         775         790         870         880         860         770           340         280         280         275         315         375         340           395         315         285         235         265         230         220           1,765         1,680         1,650         1,680         1,675         1,875         1,865           1,385         1,445         1,505         1,080         1,565         1,470         1,505           3,285         3,510         3,195         3,520         3,415         4,500         4,280

<sup>(2)</sup> Pencoed College merged with Bridgend College in 1999/2000

<sup>(3)</sup> Coleg Harlech merged with WEA (North) in 2000/01 to form Coleg Harlech / WEA (North)

University of Wales College of								
Medicine (b) Royal Welsh	440	485	445	540	525	0	0	0
College of Music and Drama	85	105	145	130	65	115	125	140
All Welsh HEIs (Excludes the OU)	15,135	15,445	14,910	15,390	16,060	17,310	17,370	17,630
The Open University	340	375	355	325	305	380	380	325
Total (Welsh HEIs and the OU)	15,470	15,825	15,265	15,715	16,365	17,690	17,755	17,955
<u> </u>				-	-		-	

	1000/2000	2000/01	2001/02	2002/02	2002/04	2004/05	2005/06	2006/07
Other undergraduate	1999/2000	2000/01	2001/02	2002/03	2003/04	2004/05	2005/06	2006/07
University of	;							
Wales College,								
Newport	1,125	1,175	1,195	1,385	1,195	1,110	775	980
Glyndŵr	, -	,	,	,	,	, -		
University	365	450	395	365	830	580	580	600
University of								
Wales Institute,								
Cardiff	590	525	700	660	720	625	445	375
University of	1.660	1.605	1 (15	1.500	1.260	2.710	1 400	1 200
Glamorgan	1,660	1,605	1,645	1,500	1,260	2,710	1,430	1,300
Swansea Matropolitan								
Metropolitan University	380	250	280	620	300	400	390	365
•	360	230	200	020	300	400	390	303
Trinity College, Carmarthen	0	0	0	0	5	15	40	120
The University of	U	U	U	U	3	13	40	120
Wales, Lampeter	*	*	15	40	90	100	165	255
University of			13	40	90	100	103	233
Wales,								
Aberystwyth	60	135	155	155	140	120	130	115
University of								
Wales, Bangor	185	155	125	160	250	330	260	270
University of								
Wales, Cardiff	10	*	15	55	5	540	170	210
University of								
Wales, Swansea	270	235	240	570	375	370	1,025	1,140
University of								
Wales College of								
Medicine (b)	145	130	275	230	520	0	0	0
Royal Welsh								
College of Music	00	20	25	10	*	10	1.5	_
and Drama	90	30	35	10	*	10	15	5
All Welsh HEIs								
(Excludes the OU)	4,885	4,690	5,070	5,750	5,690	6,920	5,425	5,730
The Open								
University	310	460	505	655	615	750	510	540
-	213	.03	202	000	010	,	210	2.3
Total (Welsh HEIs							<b>5</b> 0 40	, <b></b> .
and the OU)	5,195	5,150	5,575	6,405	6,305	7,670	5,940	6,270

	1999/2000	2000/01	2001/02	2002/03	2003/04	2004/05	2005/06	2006/07
All Undergraduates								
University of Wales College,								
Newport Glyndŵr	1,780	1,850	1,920	2,105	2,045	1,945	1,565	1,950
University University of Wales Institute,	1,030	1,085	975	1,000	1,590	1,245	1,310	1,280
Cardiff University of	1,835	1,895	2,120	2,205	2,360	2,335	2,165	2,355
Glamorgan Swansea Metropolitan	4,000	3,915	3,655	3,805	3,510	5,225	4,130	3,775
University	950	1,025	1,070	1,490	1,180	1,260	1,160	1,095
Trinity College, Carmarthen	340	280	280	275	320	390	385	515
The University of Wales, Lampeter University of Wales,	400	320	295	275	355	325	385	500
Aberystwyth	1,825	1,815	1,805	1,835	1,815	1,995	1,995	1,830
University of Wales, Bangor University of	1,570	1,600	1,630	1,245	1,815	1,805	1,765	1,820
Wales, Cardiff	3,295	3,515	3,210	3,575	3,420	5,040	4,450	4,645
University of Wales, Swansea University of	2,240	2,095	2,115	2,425	2,220	2,535	3,345	3,465
Wales College of Medicine (b) Royal Welsh	585	610	725	770	1,045	0	0	0
College of Music and Drama	175	130	180	135	70	125	140	145
All Welsh HEIs (Excludes the OU)	20,020	20,135	19,980	21,140	21,750	24,230	22,800	23,360
The Open University	645	835	860	980	920	1,130	895	865
Total (Welsh HEIs and the OU)	20,665	20,975	20,840	22,120	22,670	25,360	23,690	24,225

Source: HESA Student Record

**Andrew R.T. Davies (South Wales Central):** How many FE students are studying courses on a part-time basis and will the Minister provide figures for each FE institution for each year since 1999? (WAQ53204)

**Jane Hutt:** The total numbers of students enrolled at Welsh FE institutions and pursuing courses on a part-time basis are given in Tables 1 and 2 by individual institution and by academic year.

<sup>(</sup>a) Data are rounded to the nearest 5. Data less than 5 but greater than 0 are suppressed and represented by '\*'.

<sup>(</sup>b) The University of Wales College of Medicine merged with Cardiff University in 2004.

Table 1 is sourced from the Individualised Student Record (ISR) and gives learner numbers for Further Education institutions in Wales from 1999/2000 to 2002/03.

Table 2 is sourced from the Lifelong Learning Wales Record (LLWR) and gives learner numbers for Further Education institutions in Wales from 2003/04 to 2006/07.

Although the methodologies underpinning the learner numbers of Table 1 and the provider-learner numbers of Table 2 are similar, they are based on different data sources and the two time series are not precisely comparable.

Table 1: Numbers of part-time(1) learners enrolled at FE institutions 1999/2000-2002/03

Source: Individualised Student Record (ISR)

Institution	1999/2000	2000/01	2001/02	2002/03
Aberdare College (2)	2,039	2,157	2,301	•
Barry College	6,021	5,826	6,115	6,279
Bridgend College (3)	10,782	10,502	12,774	11,680
Coleg Ceredigion	2,966	2,998	3,033	3,512
Deeside College	11,000	12,328	14,313	13,755
Coleg Glan Hafren	8,277	7,890	9,713	9,626
Gorseinon College	2,109	2,553	2,821	2,895
Coleg Gwent	24,345	25,173	26,868	29,449
Coleg Harlech (4)	334	379		
Coleg Harlech / WEA (North) (4)	•		4,304	5,549
Coleg Llandrillo	14,518	15,891	20,109	20,155
Coleg Llysfasi	3,249	3,963	4,607	4,542
Coleg Meirion Dwyfor	1,682	1,442	1,508	1,744
Coleg Menai	7,307	7,844	7,923	8,894
Merthyr Tydfil College	2,171	2,432	2,844	3,314
Coleg Morgannwg (2)	•			10,719
Neath Port Talbot College	10,951	10,763	11,697	11,552
Pembrokeshire College	8,695	8,980	8,985	9,310
Pencoed College (3)	640			
Pontypridd College (2)	7,505	8,470	9,166	
Coleg Powys	6,205	6,100	7,366	8,114
St David's Sixth Form College	40	75	38	78
Coleg Sir Gar	10,206	10,228	11,096	10,618
Swansea College	14,020	13,214	14,304	15,058
Welsh College of Horticulture	2,712	3,418	4,337	4,100
WEA (North) (4)	2,709	2,949		
WEA (South)	4,945	5,615	5,732	7,344
Yale College	9,347	9,320	10,493	11,104
YMCA	1,037	1,360	1,602	1,637
Ystrad Mynach College	6,550	6,745	8,553	8,848
Total	182,362	188,615	212,602	219,876

<sup>(1)</sup> In this table, part-time figures include all modes of attendance excluding those identified as full-time in the ISR support manual. Some learners pursuing work-based learning programmes at FE institutions are included in these figures.

<sup>(2)</sup> Aberdare College and Pontypridd College are identified separately up to 2001/02. Following their merger to form Coleg Morgannwg, figures are given for the combined college from 2002/03.

<sup>(3)</sup> Learner numbers at Pencoed College are included within the figures for Bridgend College from 2000/01 following their merger.

<sup>(4)</sup> Coleg Harlech merged with WEA (North) in 2000/01 to form Coleg Harlech / WEA (North). Learner numbers for the combined body are given from 2001/02.

 $\textbf{Table 2: Numbers of part-time} (1) \ \ \textbf{learners enrolled at FE institutions 2003/04-2006/07}$ 

Source: Lifelong Learning Wales Record (LLWR)

Institution	2003/04	2004/05	2005/06	2006/07
Barry College	5,985	6,115	6,080	5,810
Bridgend College	10,960	11,055	10,090	9,020
Coleg Ceredigion	2,940	3,210	3,265	3,025
Deeside College	12,170	12,820	13,840	19,050
Coleg Glan Hafren	9,470	10,250	11,520	10,500
Gorseinon College	2,795	3,120	3,390	3,870
Coleg Gwent	28,320	25,915	25,900	24,920
Coleg Harlech / WEA (North)	4,985	4,935	4,650	4,695
Coleg Llandrillo	18,090	17,510	17,245	16,415
Coleg Llysfasi	3,665	3,550	3,985	3,940
Coleg Meirion Dwyfor	2,450	3,035	3,300	2,250
Coleg Menai	7,520	6,195	7,270	6,740
Merthyr Tydfil College (2)	3,115	2,625	2,320	
Coleg Morgannwg	10,350	9,620	9,250	9,110
Neath Port Talbot College	11,540	9,345	11,380	11,235
Pembrokeshire College	8,375	8,375	8,740	8,415
Coleg Powys	5,925	6,115	6,290	5,230
St David's Sixth Form College	60	25	30	150
Coleg Sir Gar	9,780	8,655	7,995	6,935
Swansea College	14,235	11,985	13,345	12,695
Welsh College of Horticulture	3,960	4,075	4,135	3,560
WEA (South)	6,680	6,695	6,620	6,515
Yale College	11,745	12,030	11,060	10,280
YMCA	1,840	3,125	3,465	3,415
Ystrad Mynach College	8,535	8,455	8,170	7,915
Total provider-learners (3)	205,480	198,825	203,330	195,695
Total unique learners (4)	192,915	186,930	189,300	179,475

<sup>(1)</sup> Part-time students in this table are those with fewer than 450 guided learning hours across the academic year and who are not pursuing a work-based learning programme.

#### **Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services**

**Christine Chapman (Cynon Valley):** What investment has the Welsh Assembly Government made in dentistry in each LHB area in Wales since 1999? (WAQ53208)

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart): The table below details the recurrent investment in each LHB area in Wales since the introduction of the new Dental contract in April 2006. In addition, a budget for Dental Vocational Training costs is held centrally, which is issued non-recurrently to LHBs, dependant on the number of annually agreed training places.

<sup>(2)</sup> Merthyr Tydfil College merged with the University of Glamorgan during 2005/06.

<sup>(3)</sup> Sum of learner numbers at each FE institution, including multiple-counting of any learners enrolled at more than one institution.

<sup>(4)</sup> Count of unique learner identifiers, removing any multiple-counting of learners enrolled at more than one institution.

	Final Allocation 2006-07 £m	Final Allocation 2007-08 £m	Final Allocation 2008-09 £m	Provisional Allocation 2009-10 (excluding DDRB uplift not yet agreed) £m
Caerphilly LHB	6.354	6.596	6.878	6.878
Blaenau Gwent LHB	3.188	3.304	3.439	3.439
Torfaen LHB	3.123	3.241	3.378	3.378
Monmouth LHB	3.364	3.493	3.643	3.643
Newport LHB	5.907	6.131	6.392	6.392
Vale Of Glamorgan LHB	3.876	4.029	4.207	4.207
Rhondda Cynon Taff LHB	7.933	8.250	8.620	8.620
Merthyr Tydfil LHB	1.684	1.757	1.842	1.842
Cardiff LHB	15.428	16.001	16.670	16.670
South-East Wales Region	50.857	52.802	55.069	55.069
Powys LHB	4.738	4.920	5.132	5.132
Ceredigion LHB	3.338	3.451	3.583	3.583
Pembrokeshire LHB	3.313	3.423	3.551	3.551
Carmarthenshire LHB	8.004	8.270	8.580	8.580
Swansea LHB	10.171	10.565	11.024	11.024
Neath/Port Talbot LHB	5.102	5.305	5.542	5.542
Bridgend LHB	5.967	6.197	6.465	6.465
Mid and West Wales Region	40.633	42.131	43.877	43.877
Anglesey LHB	1.785	1.853	1.932	1.932
Gwynedd LHB	4.195	4.336	4.500	4.500
Conwy LHB	3.227	3.344	3.481	3.481
Denbighshire LHB	4.472	4.655	4.869	4.869
Flintshire LHB	4.487	5.224	5.439	5.439
Wrexham LHB	4.044	4.201	4.384	4.384
North Wales Region	22,210	23.613	24.605	24.605
Total	113.700	118.546	123.551	123.551

Prior to the new Dental contract in 2006-07, dental expenditure was paid via the Dental Practice Board on a claims basis and the spend information is not available from the Dental Practice Board to LHB level.

**Jonathan Morgan (Cardiff North):** Please provide a complete list of contacts, formal and informal, between you or your officials, including name, title and date, and of Mr James Steers and/or members of his Neuroscience Review Group between 1st July 2008 and 6th August 2008? (WAQ53210)

**Edwina Hart:** In relation to formal correspondence between James Steers and the Welsh Assembly Government, I refer you to the Welsh Assembly Government Disclosure Log (no. 2017). There was no formal correspondence with members of the Welsh Neuroscience Expert Review Group during the period identified.

It is not possible to provide complete information in relation to informal communication, I had no contact with Mr James Steers or members of his group between 1st July 2008 and 6th August 2008.

**Gareth Jones (Aberconwy):** What plans does the Welsh Assembly Government have to measure the effect on success rates for IVF of the mandatory adoption of single embryo transfer in the absence of any change from the current policy of one fresh cycle of IVF to a full implementation of NICE CG11? (WAQ53212)

**Edwina Hart:** I refer you to my answer to WAQ53175.

**Gareth Jones (Aberconwy):** How many cycles of IVF/ICSI are provided in each of the four Tertiary Centres across Wales? (WAQ53213)

Edwina Hart: Please see my answer to WAQ53174.

**Gareth Jones (Aberconwy):** Will the Minister make a statement on what steps are being taken to move towards full implementation of the NICE Fertility Guideline? (WAQ53214)

Edwina Hart: Please see my answer to WAQ53173.

**Gareth Jones (Aberconwy):** Will the Minister make a statement on progress made in implementing the NICE Fertility Guideline in full across Wales? (WAQ53215)

Edwina Hart: Please see my answer to WAQ53172.